

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2025, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS  
6 MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS  
7 MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. REMOTE  
8 PARTICIPANTS WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND  
9 FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON AT THE  
10 APPROPRIATE TIME TO SPEAK. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE  
11 CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.  
12 ROLL CALL VOTE FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. AGENDA ITEM ONE ROLL CALL  
13 PLEASE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

24

25 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.



1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

3

4 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE AMBUEHL? ABSENT. ANDERSEN?

5

6 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

9

10 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

13

14 **PAT BURT:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE FLEMING?

19

20 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE GIACOPINI?

21

22 **DOREEN GIACOPINI:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. EXCUSE ME.

25 COMMISSIONER LEE?



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

5

6 **MATT MAHAN:** HERE MANFREE?

7

8 **AMBER MANFREE:** HERE FROM 1195 THIRD STREET NAPA NOTICED

9 LOCATION.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. GREAT TEAMWORK HERE. MASHBURN?

12 MELGAR? ABSENT. MILEY? ABSENT. PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE RAMOS?

15

16 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE FROM 1195 THIRD STREET IN NAPA.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF IS ABSENT.

19 QUORUM IS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE'LL -- WE WILL SKIP OVER ITEMS

22 2 AND 3 SINCE WE TOOK CARE OF THESE ITEMS DURING THE BATA

23 MEETING AND I'M GOING TO REARRANGE THE AGENDA A LITTLE TO MOVE

24 ITEMS 4 AND 5 TO THE END OF OUR MEETING. WE'LL TAKE CARE OF

25 THE CLOSED SESSION. ACTUALLY, WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE THAT



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 CLOSED SESSION UNTIL JANUARY.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'M -- WE'RE NOT REARRANGING THE -- I JUST  
4 WANTED TO CLARIFY FOR THE RECORD, WE'RE NOT REARRANGING, WE  
5 GOING TO DELAY ITEM 4 AND 5 TO JANUARY. CORRECT?

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. BUT LET'S TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON --

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON 4, 5.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RIGHT. ANY RAISED -- IF THERE IS ANY  
14 PUBLIC COMMENT FOR ITEM FOUR OR FIVE, WOULD YOU PLEASE RAISE  
15 YOUR HAND OR APPROACH THE PODIUM? I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN  
16 WRITING FOR THE THIS ITEM, I HAVE SEE NO RAISED HANDS AND NO  
17 ONE HAS APPROACHED PODIUM.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT, YOU HAVE A QUESTION?

20

21 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** I DO. REGARDING THE CONTINUATION OR  
22 POSTPONEMENT OF THESE ITEMS ON THE CLOSED SESSION UNTIL  
23 JANUARY, AND IS THAT THE JANUARY, THE SCHEDULED JANUARY 28TH  
24 COMMISSION MEETING?

25



1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

2

3 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** SO THAT, IS ALSO THE WEEK OF THE U.S.

4 CONFERENCE OF MAYOR'S WINTER MEETING IN DC, AND I IMAGINE A

5 NUMBER OF MAYORS MIGHT BE IN ATTENDANCE THERE. MAYBE WE

6 ARRANGE TO REMOTELY JOIN, THAT IS THE DATE THAT THIS WOULD BE

7 CONTINUED TO?

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

10

11 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** OKAY. JUST WANT SO YOU HAVE THAT IN

12 MIND FOR QUORUM PURPOSES.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY.

15

16 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ITEM SIX, CHAIR'S REPORT. I HAVE

19 NOTHING TO REPORT. ITEM SEVEN, POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT.

20 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIR CARINA L LIEU, WILL YOU PLEASE

21 GIVE YOUR REPORT?

22

23 **CARINA LIEU:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSION. I'M CARINA LIEU, CHAIR

24 OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. MY REPORT IS GOING TO INCLUDE

25 BOTH THE REPORTS FROM THE OCTOBER MEETING AND THE NOVEMBER



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 MEETING. BECAUSE WE WEREN'T ABLE TO MAKE IT TO THE LAST  
2 MEETING. SO, BEAR WITH ME, AS IT WILL BE JUST A LITTLE BIT  
3 LONGER THAN NORMAL. AT THE OCTOBER 28TH, 2025 MEETING, WE  
4 RECEIVED AN UPDATE ON THE 2025 LEGISLATIVE SCORECARD, AS WELL  
5 AS A PREVIEW OF THE DRAFT PLAN BAY AREA 2050+ AND DRAFT  
6 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. AT OUR NOVEMBER 19TH, 2025 MEETING, WE  
7 RECEIVED AN UPDATE ON THE COMMUNITY ACTION RESOURCE AND  
8 EMPOWERMENT OR CARE PROGRAM, AS WELL AS AN OVERVIEW OF THE  
9 DRAFT 2026 MTC AND ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM. SO, AS FAR AS  
10 THE LEGISLATIVE UPDATES THAT WE RECEIVED FROM DIRECTOR LONG,  
11 WE TALKED ABOUT SB63 FUNDING AND OVERSIGHT. COUNCIL MEMBERS  
12 EXPRESSED CONCERN ABOUT THE DELAYED IMPLEMENTATION OF SB63  
13 FUNDING, WHICH IS NOT SET TO BEGIN UNTIL 2027. A \$750 MILLION  
14 SHORTFALL IS ANTICIPATED NEXT FISCAL YEAR PROMPTING AGENCIES  
15 TO SEEK LOANS, AND MEMBERS EMPHASIZE THE NEED FOR STRONGER  
16 OVERSIGHT OR MORE CERTAINTY IN SECURING REGIONAL  
17 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE. IN REGARDS TO BROWN ACT MODERNIZATION  
18 AND ACCESS, SB707 WAS PRAISED, BECAUSE IT WOULD ENABLE MORE  
19 REMOTE PARTICIPATION FOR BOTH PUBLIC OFFICIALS AND COMMUNITY  
20 MEMBERS, ESPECIALLY THOSE WITH DISABILITIES. MEMBERS EMPHASIZE  
21 THE IMPORTANCE OF ENSURING EQUITABLE ACCESS FOR LOW-INCOME  
22 INDIVIDUALS, THE NEED FOR PLAIN LANGUAGE IN LEGISLATIVE  
23 DOCUMENTS WAS ALSO HIGHLIGHTED. CAP-AND-TRADE ALLOCATION AND  
24 HIGH SPEED RAIL. MEMBERS RAISED CONCERNS ABOUT RECENT CHANGES  
25 TO CAP-AND-TRADE FUNDING SHIFTING FROM PERCENT BASE THE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ALLOCATIONS TO FIXED PRIORITY TIERS. HIGH SPEED RAIL NOW  
2 RECEIVES THE FIRST \$1 BILLION -- \$1 BILLION ANNUALLY,  
3 REGARDLESS OF TOTAL FUND SIZE, RAISING EQUITY CONCERNS.  
4 ACCORDING TO ONE MEMBER'S RESEARCH, ONLY THREE OF THE PAST TEN  
5 YEARS HAVE CAP-AND-TRADE REVENUES EXCEEDED \$4 BILLION IN TOTAL  
6 FUNDING, MAKING THE NEW STRUCTURE LESS FAVORABLE FOR OTHER  
7 PROGRAMS THAT ARE LOWER ON THE PRIORITY LIST. ONE MEMBER  
8 QUESTIONED VIABILITY OF HIGH SPEED RAIL ALTOGETHER SUGGESTING  
9 FUNDS COULD BE REDIRECTED INTO MORE PRESSING REGIONAL AND  
10 LOCAL NEEDS. IN REGARDS TO DRAFT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AND  
11 DRAFT IMPLEMENTATION PLAN REVIEW, THERE WAS AN EMPHASIS ON  
12 JUST THE GREATER NEED FOR CLARITY, EQUITY, AND RESPONSIVENESS.  
13 KEY THEMES INCLUDED A CALL FOR A DISPLACEMENT STUDY, STRONGER  
14 TENANT PROTECTIONS, AND REGIONAL COORDINATION IN LIGHT OF  
15 LOOMING FEDERAL BENEFIT CUTS. MEMBERS HIGHLIGHTED THE URGENCY  
16 OF STREAMLINING OUTDATED AND BURDENSOME REGULATIONS THAT DELAY  
17 HOUSING AND INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS. QUESTIONS OVER RELIANCE  
18 ON ADU'S FOR RHNA COMPLIANCE. THEY STRESS THE IMPORTANCE OF A  
19 GREAT ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT WITH HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION,  
20 ENSURING LIVING WAGE JOB CREATION, IMPROVING COORDINATION  
21 AMONG TRANSIT AGENCIES. ENVIRONMENTAL RESILIENCE, PARTICULARLY  
22 IN THE FACE OF SEA LEVEL RISE AND GOODS MOVEMENT  
23 VULNERABILITIES WAS ALSO A PRIORITY. MEMBERS ADVOCATED FOR A  
24 MORE INSPIRATIONAL AND INCLUSIVE VISION THAT COULD SERVE AS A  
25 BAY AREA MODEL WHILE CALLING FOR BETTER STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ESPECIALLY WITH LABOR AND COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS AND  
2 FINALLY THEY PRAISE INNOVATIVE TOOLS LIKE DOORWAY HOUSING  
3 PORTAL AND ENCOURAGE CONTINUED INVESTMENT IN DIGITAL ACCESS  
4 OPEN SPACE PRESERVATION AND BEHAVIORAL STRATEGIES LIKE  
5 EFFECTIVE TDM. IN REGARDS TO THE CARE PROGRAM UPDATE COUNCIL  
6 MEMBERS WERE VERY, VERY SUPPORTIVE OF THE CARE PROGRAM.  
7 ADVISORY MEMBERS EMPHASIZED THE IMPORTANCE OF DELIVERING  
8 PROJECTS EFFICIENTLY WHILE ENSURING TRANSPARENCY AND  
9 ACCOUNTABILITY. THEY DID REQUEST CLEAR BREAKDOWNS OF  
10 ADMINISTRATIVE COSTS VERSUS CONSTRUCTION COST, AND HAVING  
11 STRONGER OVERSIGHT OF OUTREACH EFFORTS AND HAVING VERIFIABLE  
12 STANDARDS FOR COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT. COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT,  
13 THERE WAS, AGAIN, STRONG SUPPORT FOR MEANINGFUL PARTICIPATION  
14 THAT COMES WITH THE CARE PROGRAM. PEOPLE STRESSED THE NEED FOR  
15 INTEGRATING SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOLS AND CBTP'S AND ALIGNING  
16 WITH EXISTING COMMUNITY EVENTS AND PLANNING EFFORTS. THE  
17 LAUNCH OF THE POWER BUILDING AND ENGAGEMENT ACTION LAB IN 2026  
18 WAS WELCOMED AS A STEP TOWARDS DEEPER GRASSROOTS INVOLVEMENT.  
19 IN TERMS OF PROGRAM DESIGN FEEDBACK UNDERSCORE NEED FOR BETTER  
20 COORDINATION ACROSS AGENCIES AND PROGRAMS TO MAXIMIZE IMPACT  
21 AND AVOID DUPLICATION. MEMBERS ENCOURAGE COLLABORATION WITH  
22 HOUSING AUTHORITIES AND OTHER ENTITIES TO SUPPORT UNFUNDED  
23 PROJECTS AND ENSURE THAT INVESTMENTS LEAD TO LASTING CHANGE.  
24 EQUITY REMAINED A CENTRAL FOCUS WITH CALLS TO PRIORITIZE  
25 UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES, SUPPORT SMALLER COMMUNITY-BASED



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ORGANIZATIONS AND PREPARE FOR POTENTIAL POLITICAL SHIFTS THAT  
2 COULD AFFECT PROGRAM STABILITY. AND, LASTLY, REGARDING THE  
3 DRAFT 2026 MTC AND ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM, WE RECEIVED A  
4 PRESENTATION BY GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN AND IN REGARDS TO BAY  
5 PASS TRANSIT ACCESS AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT, BAY PASS  
6 CONTINUES TO RECEIVE STRONG SUPPORT, ESPECIALLY FOR YOUTH,  
7 COMMUNITY COLLEGE STUDENTS, AND LOW-INCOME WORKERS. COUPLE  
8 COUNCIL MEMBERS EMPHASIZED ITS SUCCESS IN BOOSTING RIDERSHIP  
9 AND EDUCATIONAL RETENTION AND CALLED FOR BROADER INCLUSION OF  
10 SCHOOLS AND HOUSING COMMUNITIES. CONCERNS WERE RAISED ABOUT  
11 FRAGMENTED TRANSIT SERVICE, LACK OF SCHOOL BUS INTEGRATION AND  
12 THE NEED FOR COORDINATED WORKFORCE TRAINING TO BUILD THE NEXT  
13 GENERATION OF TRANSIT WORKERS. ON HOUSING AFFORDABILITY,  
14 HOUSING AFFORDABILITY WAS A MAJOR CONCERN WITH CALLS TO  
15 ADDRESS SUPPLY CONSTRAINTS, STREAMLINE DEVELOPMENT APPROVALS  
16 AND BALANCE COMMUNITY BENEFITS WITH DEVELOPER FEASIBILITY.  
17 COUNCIL MEMBERS DISCUSSED THE NEED FOR BETTER COORDINATION  
18 WITH HOUSING PARTNERS AND QUASI GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS,  
19 ESPECIALLY IN LIGHT OF LOOMING SECTION EIGHT VOUCHER LOSSES.  
20 ADDITIONALLY, RHNA METHODOLOGY AND PLANNING SUPPORT WERE  
21 HIGHLIGHTED AS PRIORITIES FOR FUTURE STATE FUNDING. ON ACTIVE  
22 TRANSPORTATION AND FUNDING STRATEGIES, THERE WAS STRONG  
23 CONSENSUS ON THE IMPORTANCE OF BIPARTISAN FEDERAL ADVOCACY,  
24 ESPECIALLY AMID THREATS TO TRANSIT FUNDING AND ACTIVE  
25 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS. COUNCIL MEMBERS URGED A UNIFIED



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 INCLUSIVE MESSAGE TO APPEAL ACROSS POLITICAL LINES AND PROTECT  
2 FORMULA BASED FUNDING STREAMS. STAFF EMPHASIZED THE NEED TO  
3 ROOT ADVOCACY IN SOUND POLICY AND MAINTAIN BALANCE ACROSS  
4 COMPETING PUBLIC PRIORITIES, LIKE HEALTH CARE, HOUSING, AND  
5 MOBILITY, WHILE SAFEGUARDING CRITICAL FUNDING, LIKE SECTION  
6 EIGHT AND TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS FUNDED BY THE HIGHWAY TRUST  
7 FUND. I WANTED TO SHARE THAT THIS WILL BE THE POLICY ADVISORY  
8 COUNCIL ENDS ON DECEMBER 31ST, 2025. AND IN LIGHT OF THAT AT  
9 YESTERDAY'S MEETING, WE DID CREATE AN ACTION ITEM THAT  
10 PROVIDES RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE NEW MTC ABAG ADVISORY COUNCIL.  
11 THESE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE LESSONS LEARNED FROM OUR COUNCIL  
12 MEMBERS. WE FORMED AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE TO PRESENT A SET OF  
13 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE COUNCIL, AND THE COUNCIL APPROVED THAT  
14 SET OF RECOMMENDATIONS AND ADDED SOME MORE LANGUAGE TO IT,  
15 WHICH STAFF IS WORKING ON COMBINING. AND YOU WILL BE ABLE TO  
16 SEE THAT AS A COMMISSION IN JANUARY. SO, WE'RE GRATEFUL FOR  
17 THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADVISE THE COMMISSION, AND FOR YOU TAKING  
18 OUR VALUABLE INPUT INTO CONSIDERATION. THIS HAS BEEN AN  
19 IMMENSE LEARNING EXPERIENCE FOR MANY OF US. AND, SO, WE THANK  
20 YOU. AND WE HOPE THAT WE GET TO CONTINUE WORKING WITH YOU  
21 AGAIN IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANKS CARINA. APPRECIATE YOUR  
24 COMMENTS. ALWAYS VERY THOROUGH, AND WE APPRECIATE YOUR  
25 SERVICE. AS WELL. OKAY. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT?

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. THERE  
4 IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ROLAND  
5 LEBRUN. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** TWO MINUTES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TWO MINUTES. MR. LEBRUN, GO AHEAD AND  
10 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** YES, THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR. AND YOU KNOW, I WISH I  
13 HAD RAISED MY HAND EARLIER, TO DO A MIC CHECK, BECAUSE WE'RE  
14 HAVING TO HAVE ACCESS SO I DON'T KNOW HOW THIS IS WORKING OUT  
15 ANYWAY. THE MAIN POINT I WANT TO BRING TO YOUR ATTENTION IS  
16 THAT THE REFINERY CLOSERS ARE GOING TO HAVE A PROFOUND IMPACT  
17 ON CAP-AND-TRADE REVENUE. AND THAT, IN TURN, IS BASICALLY  
18 GOING TO BE AFFECTING THE PROJECTS THAT ARE DOWN, YOU KNOW,  
19 THE FOOD LINE. AND WE REALLY HAVE GOT TO START THINKING ABOUT  
20 WHAT'S GOING HAPPEN HERE. BECAUSE, RIGHT NOW, WE ARE PIVOTING  
21 FROM 0-EMISSIONS BY 2035 TO GOING BACK TO FOSSIL FUELS UNTIL  
22 2050, AND BY THE WAY EUROPE IS DOING THE SAME THING, AND THE  
23 QUESTION IS WHERE WILL THIS FUEL BE COMING FROM? IT'S NOT  
24 GOING TO BE COMING FROM THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, AND WE HAVE  
25 GOT TO START THINKING FORWARD ABOUT HOW WE MIGHT GENERATE CAP-



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 AND-TRADE REVENUES EVEN THOUGH THESE FUELS ARE NO LONGER BEING  
2 REFINED IN CALIFORNIA. THANK YOU

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED  
5 HANDS.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. MOVING TO ITEM EIGHT  
8 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. ANDY.

9

10 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK AND MEMBERS OF THE  
11 COMMISSION. I'LL JUMP RIGHT INTO SOME OF THE UPDATES. THE  
12 FIRST THING I WANT TO DO IS PUT OUT A GREAT THANK YOU TO ALL  
13 OF THE FOLKS THAT HAVE BEEN WORKING ON CLIPPER FOR A LONG  
14 TIME. JASON WEINSTEIN AND HIS TEAM HAVE BEEN JUST REALLY  
15 WORKING 24/7 FOR THE LAST MANY YEARS. I ALSO WANT TO THANK  
16 ALIX FOR A LOT OF HER SUPPORT AND HELP IN KEEPING THE  
17 LEADERSHIP GOING, AND OF COURSE, ALL OF OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS.  
18 WE WERE ABLE TO CELEBRATE. CHAIR NOACK JOINED MAYOR LURIE,  
19 SENATOR WIENER, ALL OF OUR AGENCY REPRESENTATIVES, INCLUDING  
20 OUR CLIPPER CONTRACTOR, CUBIC, A LOT OF THE ADVOCATES WERE  
21 THERE AS WELL THE EMBARCADERO CENTER WHERE WE OPENED UP THE  
22 NEW SYSTEM. I'M THE FIRST TO ACKNOWLEDGE WE HAVE A LOT OF  
23 THINGS TO WORK ON. THERE ARE BUGS, AS THERE ALWAYS ARE, BUT  
24 WE'RE PAYING GOOD ATTENTION TO IT. WE'RE KEEPING THE ENERGY  
25 FOCUSED ON WHERE THE PROBLEMS ARE AND TRYING TO SOLVE THEM.



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 THEY ARE IN VARIOUS DIFFERENT PLACES. BUT I'M PROUD TO SAY  
2 WE'RE GETTING A LOT OF BENEFIT OUT OF THE TAP AND RIDE  
3 FEATURES, AND OF COURSE, A LOT OF THE DISCOUNTS AND TRANSFERS  
4 THAT WE WERE HOPING TO GET. SO, PROGRESS IS ON THE WAY. JUST A  
5 REMINDER, THE TRANSITION WILL TAKE PLACE OVER SEVERAL MONTHS  
6 IN TERMS OF MOVING PEOPLE FROM CLIPPER ONE SYSTEM TO CLIPPER2.  
7 SO THAT WILL STILL BE GOING ON AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO PROVIDE  
8 UPDATES AS THAT PROGRESS CONTINUES. MOVING ON, WE HAVE AN ITEM  
9 HERE ABOUT THE BAY AREA RECEIVING A SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF  
10 FUNDING FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND THE SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES  
11 PROGRAM. SO, ON DECEMBER 10TH, THE STATE, OUT OF THE CAP-AND-  
12 TRADE, CAP AND INVEST AUCTIONS BROUGHT TO THE BAY AREA ABOUT  
13 270 MILLION, REALLY 33% OF THE FUNDING THAT WAS AWARDED AND  
14 PROJECTS ARE AROUND THE REGION SAN FRANCISCO, ALAMEDA,  
15 OAKLAND, MOUNTAIN VIEW, SAN JOSE, IT SUPPORTS 800 AFFORDABLE  
16 HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES, AS WELL AS WORKING ON OTHER THINGS THAT  
17 ARE AROUND, REALLY, THE SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY STRATEGIES IN  
18 TERMS OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS. I KNOW WE LIKE TO HEAR ABOUT NEW  
19 MONEY COMING INTO THE REGION, SO THE NEXT ITEM TALKS ABOUT THE  
20 CLEAN VEHICLE PROGRAM WHERE WE RECEIVED ABOUT \$140 MILLION FOR  
21 VARIOUS TRANSIT AGENCIES IN EASTERN CONTRA COSTA, LIVERMORE,  
22 VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, MARIN COUNTY, NAPA, SAN  
23 FRANCISCO, SANTA CLARA, IT REALLY DOES, I THINK, REFLECT THE  
24 FACT THAT WE ARE A NINE-COUNTY REGION AND WE'RE WORK HARD AT  
25 MAKING SURE THAT THE MONEY COMES TO US, THAT'S FOR CLEAN AIR



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 VEHICLES. IT FUNDS HYBRID BUSES AND OTHER THINGS. SO, GOOD  
2 NEWS THERE. I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER MASHBURN. THE NEXT  
3 ITEM IS THE OPENING OF THE SOLANO 80 EXPRESS LANES. THEY  
4 OPENED UP YESTERDAY AND HE'S ALREADY BEEN A PAYING CUSTOMER.  
5 SO, THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. [LAUGHTER] IT WAS A BARGAIN, A  
6 DOLLAR 50, GOOD TO SEE. LOOK, THAT'S A REALLY INTERESTING  
7 PROGRAM. WE WERE REALLY SUCCESSFUL WHEN WE OPPOSED UP THE 880  
8 CORRIDOR IN ALAMEDA, AT THREE PLUS, WHERE IT REALLY MAKES THE  
9 RELIABILITY AND OPERATIONS WORK BETTER. SAN MATEO FOLLOWED  
10 SUIT ON 101. IN SOLANO WE HAVE A THREE PLUS CARPOOL NOW THAT'S  
11 OPENED UP AND THE PLACE WE'RE EXPERIMENTING THERE IS FOR  
12 PRICING ALSO ON THE WEEKENDS. SO WE HAVE GOT A THREE-YEAR  
13 PILOT WHERE WE WANT TO INVESTIGATE THE BENEFITS OF THAT. WE  
14 HAVE ASSURED SOLANO THAT WE'RE GOING TO PAY CLOSE ATTENTION TO  
15 HOW TO OPERATES AND I LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING THAT WORK  
16 THROUGHOUT. MOVING ON, THANKS TO YOUR HARD WORK, STARTING IN  
17 JANUARY 2026, THE FIRST PHASE OF BATA'S TOLL INCREASE WILL  
18 TAKE PLACE. A LOT OF PUBLIC INFORMATION IS OUT ON THE STREET  
19 ALREADY. BRIDGE TOLLS WILL RISE FROM \$8 TO 850. JUST AS A  
20 REMINDER, THAT'S SPECIFICALLY FOR REHABILITATION OF THE  
21 BRIDGES AND MAKING SURE THAT THEY STAY IN GOOD CONDITION ON A  
22 PAY AS YOU GO BASIS AS OPPOSED TO BORROWING MONEY AND MAKING  
23 IT MORE EXPENSIVE. SO, WE CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THE DEPARTMENT  
24 TO TRY TO MAKE THAT MONEY WORK. WE TALKED QUITE A BIT LAST  
25 MONTH ABOUT -- THIS MONTH, ACTUALLY, ABOUT DRAFT PLANNED BAY



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 AREA 2050. JUST A REMINDER, THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD CLOSES  
2 DECEMBER 18TH. SO WE'LL BE BACK IN THE NEW YEAR TALKING ABOUT  
3 INPUT THAT WE RECEIVED FROM THE PUBLIC, AND OF COURSE, WE  
4 ASSURE YOU WE'RE PAYING ATTENTION TO THE CONCERNS AND THE  
5 IDEAS THAT WERE BROUGHT FORWARD BY THE COMMISSION. SO, WE LOOK  
6 FORWARD TO MORE WORK THERE. ON FRIDAY, DECEMBER 5TH, CHAIR  
7 NOACK AND OUR CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER, NICK ROETHEL WERE ALONG  
8 -- WERE AT THE COMTON EXECUTIVE BOARD CHRISTMAS EVENT AND MTC  
9 WAS NAMED THE PUBLIC AGENCY OF THE YEAR ON BEHALF OF MTC AND  
10 ABAG. WE WERE HONORED TO RECEIVE THIS AWARD. IT'S FOR  
11 OUTSTANDING EXCELLENCE, LEADERSHIP, INNOVATION AND IMPACT IN  
12 SERVING THE COMTON COMMUNITY WHICH IS THE CONFERENCE OF  
13 MINORITY TRANSPORTATION OFFICIALS OF NORTHERN CALIFORNIA. SO,  
14 THAT WAS A NICE EVENT. I WANTED TO, SORT OF, CLOSE THOUGH IN  
15 RECOGNIZING THAT THIS IS THE LAST TIME WE'LL BE HERE THIS YEAR  
16 AND WANTED TO THANK YOU ALL ON THE COMMISSION FOR WHAT ADVICE  
17 AND ATTENTION TO DETAIL YOU PUT. I ASSURE YOU, THE STAFF IS  
18 REALLY RECEIVING THE INFORMATION THAT WE GET, AND WE LOOK  
19 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU AGAIN NEXT YEAR. SO, THANK YOU.  
20 AND HAVE A GOOD HOLIDAY SEASON AND BE WITH YOUR FAMILIES,  
21 PLEASE. [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE, I



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED PODIUM.

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY GREAT. THANKS. ITEM NINE IS

4 COMMISSIONER COMMENT. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS?

5 OKAY. I'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM TEN, WHICH IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

6 INCLUDES ITEMS 10A THROUGH 10H. ANYBODY NEEDING TO PULL OR

7 COMMENT ON THOSE? NO? OKAY. CAN I GET A MOTION AND A SECOND ON

8 THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION TO APPROVE, ABE-KOGA.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SECOND, MOULD MOULTON-

13 PETERS?

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MOTION AND SECOND. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC

16 COMMENT.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVING IN WRITING NO ONE HAS

19 APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **BOARD CLERK:** MOULTON-PETERS?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ABE-KOGA?

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EXCUSE ME. COMMISSIONER AHN?

11

12 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSON?

15

16 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EZZY ASHCRAFT?

19

20 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

23

24 **PAT BURT:** AYE.

25



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

6

7 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER LEE?

10 COMMISSIONER LEE? THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

11

12 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MANFREE? YOU'RE MUTED, COMMISSIONER

15 MANFREE. BUT YOU'RE MOUTHING.

16

17 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OKAY. COMMISSIONER MASHBURN?

20

21 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MELGAR? IS ABSENT. MILEY? IS ABSENT.

24 PAPAN?

25



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
8 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 11,  
11 THE FIRST COMMITTEE REPORT, PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS.  
12 COMMISSIONER FLEMING, WOULD YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT?

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES, THANK YOU, CHAIR. WE'RE ON TO AGENDA  
15 ITEM 11, THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET ON  
16 DECEMBER 10TH, 2025 AND REFERRED EIGHT ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION  
17 FOR APPROVAL. SIX OF WHICH WERE ON CONSENT CALENDAR AND TWO  
18 OTHERS ARE AS FOLLOWS: AGENDA ITEM 11A, MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER  
19 4614 REVISED, 4615 REVISED, 4660 REVISED, 4733, AND 4734.  
20 ALLOCATION OF \$95.58 MILLION IN RM3 CAPITAL FUNDS TO 20.4 TO  
21 WET AT, 42.39 TO SFMTA, 16.733 MILLION TO CITY OF UNION CITY,  
22 10 MILLION TO CITY OF RICHMOND I'LL MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC  
23 RESOLUTIONS 4614, 4615, 4660, 4733 AND 4734.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** IT'S BEEN APPROVAL



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** AHN SECONDS.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:**

5

6 **SPEAKER:** FLEMING MADE THE MOTION SO WE JUST NEED A SECOND.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** PUBLIC COMMENTS?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING IN WRITING NO ONE HAS APPROACHED  
11 THE PODIUM AND NO RAISED HANDS IN ZOOM.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY FLEMING SECOND PAPAN. NOACK?

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

24

25 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.



1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

3

4 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSON?

7

8 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

11

12 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

15

16 **PAT BURT:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

23

24 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

25



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. LEE?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

6

7 **MATT MAHAN:** YES. MANFREE? MASHBURN? MELGAR? ABSENT. MILEY

8 ABSENT. PAPAN?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

13

14 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

17 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** EXCELLENT. THAT MOVES US TO ITEM 11B MTC

20 RESOLUTION 4728 REVISED, 2028 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION

21 IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM PROJECTS TOTALING APPROXIMATELY \$142

22 MILLION IN PROGRAMMING FOR THE BAY AREA I'LL MOVE APPROVAL OF

23 MTC RESOLUTION FRENCH 28 REVISED AND ASK FOR A SECOND.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IS THERE ANY COMMENTS? IS THERE PUBLIC  
5 COMMENT?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO HANDS  
8 IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

25



1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSON?

4

5 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

8

9 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

12

13 **PAT BURT:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

20

21 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. LEE? MAHAN?

24 MANFREE? MASHBURN? MELGAR? ABSENT. MILEY? ABSENT. PAPAN?

25



1 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

4

5 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
8 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. SORRY. I THOUGHT YOU WERE CONTINUING  
11 ON. SO, WE'RE ON TO ITEM 12A, WHICH IS MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER  
12 4703 REVISED. THIS ITEM WOULD APPROVAL FISCAL YEAR 2025, '26  
13 OPERATING CAPITAL BUDGETS AMENDMENT ONE. DEREK, YOU'RE GOING  
14 TO PRESENT?

15

16 **DEREK HANSEL:** I'M ACTUALLY GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO ELIZABETH  
17 RAMOS WHO YOU HEARD FROM EARLIER.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WAS GOING TO GO WITH ELIZABETH.

20

21 **DEREK HANSEL:** SHE'S SMARTER.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IT MAKES SENSE. ELIZABETH, PLEASE.

24

25 **ELIZABETH RAMOS:** GOOD MORNING THANK YOU. ELIZABETH RAMOS



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF BUDGETS AND FINANCIAL PLANNING ANALYSIS.  
2 HERE TO PRESENT AMENDMENT NUMBER ONE TO THE MTC OPERATING  
3 CAPITAL BUDGET WHICH WAS ADOPTED BY THE COMMISSION BACK IN  
4 JUNE THIS AMENDMENT INCORPORATES STRATEGIC UPDATES TO MTC'S  
5 PROGRAMS AS WELL AS REFLECTS EVOLVING FUNDING REALITY AND  
6 PROGRAMMATIC NEEDS AND REGIONAL PRIORITIES. BEFORE I BEGIN  
7 THIS PRESENTATION I WANT TO TAKE A SECOND TO THANK BOTH THE  
8 BUDGETS FOR FINANCIAL PLANNING ANALYSIS TEAM AS WELL AS OUR  
9 MANY PARTNERS ACROSS THE AGENCY THAT WORK WITH US THROUGHOUT  
10 THE YEAR TO DEVELOP THIS BUDGET. NEXT SLIDE. KEY CHANGES TO  
11 THIS BUDGET INCLUDE BOTH THE INTRODUCTION OF A NEW POSITION  
12 THAT DOES INCREASE THE HEAD COUNT TO 430. THIS POSITION IS FOR  
13 THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PROGRAM TO SUPPORT REGIONAL CLIMATE  
14 ADAPTATION INITIATIVES AND IT WAS APPROVED BY ABAG BOARD LAST  
15 MONTH AND NOW IT'S HERE FOR YOUR APPROVAL BEFORE WE CAN  
16 CONTINUE WITH THIS POSITION. IT ALSO INCLUDES SOME UPDATES TO  
17 THE ERP PROJECT, AS WELL AS THAT BAHFA TRANSFER THAT I  
18 MENTIONED EARLIER, SO IT'S REFLECTED NOW ON THE MTC FOR  
19 TRANSFERRING THE FUNDING THIS'S GOING TO BE RECEIVED, AGAIN,  
20 FROM PHILANTHROPIC AND EXCHANGE FUND LOCAL FUNDING. THEN IT  
21 ALSO INCLUDES SOME CHANGES THAT ARE SUBSTANTIAL TO THE CLIPPER  
22 PROGRAM, AS WELL AS THE BAY AREA FORWARD PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE,  
23 PLEASE. THANK YOU. THE OVERALL CHANGE TO THIS BUDGET IS AN  
24 INCREASE OF 5.4 MILLION THIS IS A RESULTING SURPLUS OF 6.5  
25 MILLION. BUT, AGAIN, 6 MILLION OF THAT IS BECAUSE WE'RE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 TRANSFERRING FUNDING OVER TO BAHFA FOR THEIR MIXED INCOME LOAN  
2 FUND PROGRAM. AND THERE IS AN OVERALL DECREASE ON EXPENSES  
3 WHICH REFLECTS A REDUCTION OF THAT 6.5, AND THERE IS AN  
4 INCREASE TO SALARIES AND BENEFITS TO REFLECT SOME POSITION  
5 ALLOCATIONS AND SOME ORGANIZATIONAL CHANGES, WHICH ARE LARGELY  
6 OFFSET BY VACANCY SAVINGS. BUT OVERALL THE BUDGET DOES REMAIN  
7 BALANCED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY ONE OF THE SUBSTANTIAL  
8 CHANGES I MENTIONED EARLIER IS FOR THE CLIPPER BUDGET. WE ARE  
9 SEEING AN INCREASE TO CONTINUE OPERATIONS AS WE TRANSITION  
10 FROM CLIPPER ONE TO CLIPPER2, WE HEARD EARLIER THAT CLIPPER2  
11 LAUNCHED LAST WEEK AND TO MITIGATE SOME OF THOSE PARALLEL  
12 OPERATIONS WE'RE GOING TO INCREASE THE BUDGET AND LOOK TO SEE  
13 HOW WE CAN ALSO MITIGATE IMPACTS TO TRANSIT OPERATORS. STAFF  
14 ARE PROPOSING TO OFFSET UP TO 5.8 MILLION IN OPERATOR COSTS BY  
15 USING ELIGIBLE FUND SOURCES AND WE'RE ALSO REDUCING THE  
16 CAPITAL BUDGET BY 2.8 MILLION TO HELP SUPPORT SOME OF THOSE  
17 OPERATIONAL COSTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND FOR THE BAY AREA  
18 FORWARD PROGRAM, WE DID RECEIVE SOME EXCITING NEWS. WE DID  
19 RECEIVE A \$20 MILLION FEDERAL PROTECT GRANT FOR THE RESILIENT  
20 STATE ROUTE 37 PROGRAM, WHICH IS ADVANCING MAJOR INVESTMENTS  
21 IN EQUITY CONNECTIVITY AND CLIMATE RESILIENCE. WE'RE ALSO  
22 RECEIVING ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR THE WEST OAKLAND LINK PROJECT  
23 AND RECONCILED SOME EXISTING BUDGETS. OVERALL THIS CHANGE  
24 REFLECTS A LIFE TO DATE CAPITAL BUDGET INCREASE OF 24.8  
25 MILLION. ALL RIGHT. LAST SLIDE, PLEASE. AND STAFF ARE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 RECOMMENDING THAT THE COMMISSION APPROVE RESOLUTION 4703  
2 REVISED, WHICH APPROVES THE MTC FISCAL YEAR '25/'26 OPERATING  
3 AND CAPITAL BUDGET AMENDMENT. I'M JOINED TODAY BY COLLEAGUES  
4 BOTH ON ZOOM AND IN-PERSON IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS? COMMISSIONER  
7 ASHCRAFT?

8

9 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. JUST A BRIEF  
10 QUESTION. THANK YOU VERY NICE REPORT BOTH OF YOUR REPORTS. SO  
11 ON PAGE THREE PROPOSE THE FY 2025, 2026 OPERATING BUDGET  
12 AMENDMENT NUMBER TWO DOWN AT THE BOTTOM UNDER TRANSFERS IS \$6  
13 MILLION DONATION FROM CHAN ZUCKERBERG INITIATIVE PASSED  
14 THROUGH BAHFA THAT'S GREAT. 6 MILLION GOES A LONG WAY. DO WE  
15 KNOW IF YOU ANTICIPATE THAT WE WILL CONTINUE RECEIVING SIMILAR  
16 FUNDING FROM THE CHAN ZUCKERBERG INITIATIVE IN THE FUTURE?  
17 BECAUSE WHAT I KNOW FROM COLLEAGUES WHO ARE AND HAVE  
18 PREVIOUSLY SERVED IN THAT ORGANIZATION, IS THAT THERE ARE SOME  
19 CHANGES? WELCOME. THANK YOU.

20

21 **DANIEL SAVER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, DANIEL SAVER, DEPUTY  
22 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR HOUSING AND ENERGY. THE SHORT ANSWER IS  
23 NO. WE DO NOT EXPECT TO CONTINUE TO RECEIVE FUNDING AT THAT  
24 SCALE FROM THE CHAN SUCKER BERG INITIATIVE MOVING FORWARD. I  
25 THINK AS YOU HEARD FROM SOME COLLEAGUES THIS GRANT WAS MADE AS



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 PART OF A WIND DOWN OF A LOT OF THE HOUSING INVESTMENTS THAT  
2 THEY HAVE BEEN MAKING OVER THE LAST TEN YEARS. SO PART OF THE  
3 PURPOSE OF WHAT WE'RE DOING WITH THIS FUNDS AND THE PITCH WE  
4 MADE TO THEM WAS TO HAVE THIS NEW MIXED INCOME FINANCING  
5 PROGRAM TRANSITION OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS TO BECOME ITS  
6 OWN SELF-SUSTAINING FINANCING PROGRAM. SO THE IDEA WOULD BE TO  
7 TAKE PROCEEDS FROM THE LOANS FROM THESE FUNDS THEN PLOW THEM  
8 BACK INTO THE PROGRAM.

9

10 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU FOR THAT.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS? YES COMMISSIONER ABE-  
13 KOGA?

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I APPRECIATE THE REPORT. I  
16 HAVE BEEN CONCERNED ABOUT -- AND I KNOW WE JUST LAUNCHED THE  
17 NEW CLIPPER PROGRAM, BUT SHOULD HAVE -- HAVE BEEN CONCERNED  
18 ABOUT INCREASES AND COST OF THE CLIPPER PROGRAM AND FRANKLY  
19 WHEN WE WERE ON OUR TRIP TO ASIA WE SAW ALTERNATIVE TO FARE  
20 COLLECTION MODELS SO WAS JUST WONDERING WHAT ARE WE DOING WHAT  
21 ARE OUR OPTIONS TO LOOKING AT ALTERNATIVES THAT MIGHT BE MORE  
22 COST EFFECTIVE. I WAS IMPRESSED WITH SOME OF THE THINGS I SAW  
23 AND AGAIN THE QUESTION IS LIKE WHY DON'T WE HAVE THOSE HERE  
24 AND ACTUALLY GOT SOME FEEDBACK ABOUT THE COMPANY THAT RUNS  
25 CLIPPER BUT YES WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND BETTER WHAT THE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 OPTIONS ARE. I THINK THERE IS MORE AND MORE INCREASING OPTIONS  
2 AND WHAT OUR FLEXIBILITY IS IN LOOKING AT ALTERNATIVES TO LOOK  
3 AT MORE COST EFFECTIVENESS.

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I'LL GIVE IT A SHOT. MOST  
6 OF THE ADDITIONAL COST IS ASSOCIATED WITH HAVING TO KEEP  
7 CLIPPER ONE OPEN LONGER. SO HOPEFUL THEY IMPACT IS BEHIND US.  
8 IN TERMS OF NEW OPPORTUNITIES, YOU ALL INVESTED IN A PROGRAM  
9 THAT'S GET A 10-YEAR LIFE. IT HAS AN AWFUL LOT OF THE MODERN  
10 CONVENIENCE. IT STARTS TO ROLL OUT OVER TIME. THAT'S KIND OF  
11 WHAT WE AS A REGION HAVE DECIDED TO INVEST IN. BUT WE ALWAYS  
12 DO PAY ATTENTION TO NEW OPPORTUNITIES AND IMPROVEMENTS. YOU  
13 KNOW, I REFLECT A LITTLE BIT ON THE FACT THAT TWO THINGS  
14 HAPPENED SINCE WE, SORT OF, WERE FINISHING OUT THE FIRST  
15 CLIPPER PROGRAM. THE MOBILE PHONE OPPORTUNITY CAME TO US AND  
16 WE WERE ABLE TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS IN THE FIRST CONTRACT. IT WAS  
17 NOT CONTEMPLATED AT THE TIME, AND THAT WAS A BIG WIN. THE TAP  
18 AND PAY ISSUE, ALSO WHEN WE STARTED THE CLIPPER2 PROCUREMENT,  
19 THERE WAS NO OPPORTUNITY IN THAT SPACE BECAUSE AMERICA HAD  
20 REALLY ADOPTED THE CONTACTLESS CARDS THAT HAPPENED DURING IT  
21 AND WE AT LEAST HAD OPTION TO ADD THAT SO THAT WAS ATTEMPT TO  
22 KEEP UP WITH CHANGES. THERE IS ALSO A LOT OF TOOL SETS IN THE  
23 NEW CLIPPER ENVIRONMENT THAT ALLOW US TO CONNECT WITH OTHER  
24 SERVICES THAT I THINK WILL REPLICATE SOME OF THE THINGS THAT  
25 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT IF WE CAN COMES TO TERMS OF AGREEMENTS



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 WITH THE LYFT AND OTHER, YOU KNOW, TOOLS LIKE THAT. LOOK, WE  
2 DO STRUGGLE IN THE REGION BY HAVING LESS CONTROL OVER THE  
3 WHOLE SYSTEM THAN ASIA DOES. BUT WE CERTAINLY ARE CONTINUING  
4 TO TRY TO PAY ATTENTION TO CHANGES AND WE'LL MAKE IMPROVEMENTS  
5 AS BEST WE CAN. BUT IT WAS A PRETTY SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT  
6 THAT YOU MADE AND IT IS THE CURRENT TECHNOLOGY AROUND THE  
7 NATION.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AND WHAT YEAR ARE WE AT IN THE CONTRACT?

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I THINK WE JUST GOT STARTED, BASICALLY, YEAH,  
12 FOR C2.

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SO WE'RE IN YEAR 1 OF 10?

15

16 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH.

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, YES, I DO HOPE WE KEEP OUR EYES  
23 OPEN THROUGHOUT AND IT'S NICE TO KNOW THAT HAVE BEEN ONGOING  
24 MODIFICATIONS HERE BUT TECHNOLOGY IS MOVING SO QUICKLY. THAT  
25 WOULD BE GREAT. QUESTION ONE, WHAT HAPPENS TO THOSE WHO HAVE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 THE ANTIQUATED CLIPPER CARD AT THIS TIME WHAT DOES THEIR  
2 FUTURE LOOK LIKE?

3

4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THE FUTURE IS THEY WILL WORK IN SECOND  
5 GENERATION THERE IS CONVERSION THAT WILL HAPPEN THAT'S WHAT  
6 HAPPENS OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS WHILE WE CONVERTS YOUR  
7 EXISTING CARD APPLE WALLET OR GOOGLE ANDROID PLATFORM OVER TO  
8 CLIPPER2 THERE IS TRANSITION PROCESS BUT THAT DECISION WE MADE  
9 EARLY ON WHICH IS DIFFERENT THAN THE OTHER PROPERTY WAS TO  
10 MAKE SURE THE CARD COULD BE TRANSFERRABLE TO THE NEW PROGRAM.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** THE SECOND QUESTION CAME UP AT OUR BOARD MEETING I  
13 WATCHED THE HESITATION IN DEVELOPING PARTNERSHIP WITH THE  
14 RIDE-SHARE COMPANY IS THAT WE WANT PEOPLE TO BE ON PUBLIC  
15 TRANSIT UNDERSTANDING IT MIGHT BE LAST MILE TYPE OF THING BUT  
16 LET'S BE HESITANT THIS WE DO WANT TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO BE ON  
17 PUBLIC TRANSIT FIRST AND FOREMOST.

18

19 **ANDREW FREMIER:** GOOD POINT I PROBABLY SHOULDN'T HAVE LEAD WITH  
20 THAT AS THE OPTION BUT JUST TO THE POINT WE CAN SET UP  
21 AGREEMENTS AND CONTINUE TO WORK WE ARE INTERESTED IN FIRST  
22 LAST MILE IN CERTAIN CASES FOR SURE BUT NOT IMPACTING MAJOR  
23 TRANSIT. I APPRECIATE THAT.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS? PUBLIC COMMENT?



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. THERE  
3 ARE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ADINA  
4 LEVIN FOLLOWED BY ROLAND LEBRUN. TWO MINUTES.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN SERVING AS CHAIR OF THE REGIONAL  
7 NETWORK MANAGEMENT ADVISORY GROUP, BUT SPEAKING FOR MYSELF  
8 HERE AND ALSO WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA HAT, AND ACTUALLY  
9 REPORTING ON THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY  
10 GROUP WITH A LOT OF SUPPORT AND APPRECIATION FOR THE MAJOR  
11 STEP FORWARD THAT CLIPPER2 SYSTEM REPRESENTS FOR THE REGION  
12 TO, OVER TIME, ADD CONVENIENCE WITH THE FREE AND REDUCED PRICE  
13 TRANSFERS AND OPEN PAYMENT FEATURES AND OTHER FEATURES. THAT  
14 SAID, WITH REGARD TO THE INCREASED COST RELATED TO THE LAUNCH  
15 AND THE TIMELINE, I PERSONALLY HAVE EXPERIENCED SOME OF THE  
16 PROBLEMS WHERE, FOR EXAMPLE, ON THE CALTRAIN SERVICE, THE  
17 READERS WERE TAKING MANY, MANY SECONDS TO READ, WHICH CAUSES A  
18 PROBLEM ON THE TRAINS AND THEY WERE HAVING TROUBLE READING THE  
19 CREDIT AND DEBIT CARDS, IN THE FIRST SEVERAL DAYS AS WELL AND  
20 ANY OF THE ISSUES THAT ARE DEEMED TO BE THE RESPONSIBILITY OF  
21 THE CONTRACTOR, WOULD ENCOURAGE NEGOTIATION TO BE DONE TO HOLD  
22 THE CONTRACTOR ACCOUNTABLE FOR ELEMENTS OF THE SYSTEM THAT DID  
23 NOT INITIALLY WORK AS MISSED RESPECT FOR THE PUBLIC FUNDING  
24 THAT IS GOING INTO THIS, WHICH SHOULD RESULT IN A WELL  
25 FUNCTIONING SYSTEM. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ROLAND LEBRUN?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. SO, VERY BRIEFLY, WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO  
5 IS TO -- FOR THE BOARD TO ENCOURAGE THE VENDOR TO INCENTIVIZE  
6 THEM TO INVEST IN AI TO IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND  
7 PRIMARILY THE WAIT TIME. AND, QUITE FRANKLY, IF BURGER KING  
8 CAN DO THIS FOR THEIR DRIVE-THRU, I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO  
9 ENCOURAGE TO DO THE SAME THING FOR HALF A MILLION PEOPLE WHO  
10 USE CLIPPER IN THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED  
13 HANDS.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. CAN I HAVE A MOTION?

16

17 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** EZZY ASHCRAFT MOVES APPROVAL.

18

19 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. CAN I GET A SECOND?

20

21 **PAT BURT:** BURT SECONDS.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH I HAVE GOT A COMBINATION.

24

25 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** WE COULD HAVE --



1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER] FIRST BY ASHCRAFT SECOND MASHBURN  
3 NOT A COMBINED MASHCRAFT NAME. IT'S GOING TO HAUNT ME FOREVER.  
4 ROLL CALL VOTE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

11

12 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES ABE-KOGA?

13

14 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

17

18 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

21

22 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ASHCRAFT?

25



1 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** BURT?

4

5 **PAT BURT:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

12

13 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE IS ABSENT. LEE?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN? MANFREE?

20

21 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR IS ABSENT. MILEY IS

24 ABSENT. PAPAN? RAMOS?

25



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY  
4 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. EVERY TIME WE DO A VOTE, MY  
7 THING GOES OFF. AGENDA ITEM 12B IS SENATE BILL 63 -- SB63  
8 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE UPDATE. AND REBECCA LONG WILL  
9 GIVE US THIS INFORMATIONAL ITEM.

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF I DON'T MIND I WOULD  
12 LIKE TO MAYBE MAKE A COUPLE OPENING COMMENTS THEN LET REBECCA  
13 DO THE HEAVY LIFTING. LOOK, I JUST WANT TO TAKE A MINUTE TO,  
14 SORT OF, TEE UP THE ITEM. I WANT TO NOTE THAT THIS IS AN  
15 INFORMATION ITEM AND THERE IS NO ACTION BEING REQUESTED OF THE  
16 COMMISSION AT THIS TIME. THE GOAL IS REALLY TO PROVIDE YOU  
17 WITH A COMPREHENSIVE OVERVIEW OF SB63 WHICH WILL OFFICIALLY  
18 BECOME LAW JANUARY 1ST, 2026. WE'RE GOING TO GO THROUGH AN  
19 OUTLINE OF THE BILL'S EXPENDITURE PLAN AND OVERSIGHT  
20 PROVISIONS, SUMMARY OF THE NEW RESPONSIBILITIES THAT ARE  
21 IMPOSED ON THE ENTIRE MTC AND THE NEW PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE  
22 MEASURE DISTRICT. WE HAVE BEEN REFERRING TO IT AS THE  
23 DISTRICT. IS A NEW AND SEPARATE LEGAL ENTITY ESTABLISHED BY  
24 SB63 AND IT'S JUST ONE MORE HAT YOU ALL GET TO WEAR DURING THE  
25 NEXT YEAR AND IT'S GOVERNED BY THE SAME BOARD THAT GOVERNS THE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 COMMISSION. THIS MEANS THAT EACH OF THE COMMISSIONERS HERE  
2 WILL BE PART OF THE NEW ENTITY IN JUST A COUPLE OF WEEKS. THE  
3 FIRST MEETING, I THINK, IS JANUARY 7TH. YOU'RE ALSO GOING TO  
4 HEAR AN OVERVIEW OF THE POLLING RESULTS FROM THE POLL THAT WAS  
5 CONDUCTED BY EMC RESEARCH IN OCTOBER REGARDING A POTENTIAL  
6 PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE. THESE RESULTS WERE SHARED WITH  
7 THE MTC ABAG JOINT LEGISLATION COMMITTEE LAST MONTH. BUT WE  
8 WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT ALL COMMISSIONERS WERE ABLE TO HEAR  
9 FROM THIS AND HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO SEEK THE RESULTS. STAFF  
10 FROM EMC RESEARCH ARE PRESENT IN CASE YOU HAVE ANY TECHNICAL  
11 QUESTIONS. AND LOOKS LIKE I WAS CORRECT, THREE WEEKS FROM  
12 TODAY IS JANUARY 7TH. WE ANTICIPATE THE DISTRICT WILL HOLD ITS  
13 FIRST MEETING IN ADDITION TO ADOPTING PROCEDURES AND  
14 COMPLETING OTHER NECESSARY ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS, STAFF  
15 ANTICIPATES THAT THE DISTRICT BOARD WILL BE ASKED TO CONSIDER  
16 WHETHER THE DISTRICT SHOULD PROCEED TOWARDS PLACEMENT OF A  
17 PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE ON THE NOVEMBER 2026 BALLOT,  
18 WHICH WILL BE A VERY BIG DECISION TO MAKE. AND I WOULD LIKE TO  
19 TURN IT OVER TO REBECCA LONG OF OUR STAFF.

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, ANDY. AND GOOD MORNING. I THINK IT'S  
22 STILL MORNING, CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONERS. I'M REBECCA LONG  
23 DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. NEXT SLIDE. SB63  
24 AUTHORIZES A MEASURE ON THE NOVEMBER 2026 BALLOT IN THE FIVE  
25 COUNTIES OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO,



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 AND SANTA CLARA TO PREVENT MAJOR SERVICE CUTS ON BART,  
2 CALTRAIN, SAN FRANCISCO MUNI AND AC TRANSIT AMONG OTHER THINGS  
3 WHICH WE'LL TALK ABOUT. THE REVENUE MECHANISM IS A 14-YEAR  
4 SALES TAX WHICH WILL GENERATE APPROXIMATELY 980 MILLION  
5 ANNUALLY AND A TAX RATE OF A HALF CENT IN FOUR OF THE COUNTIES  
6 AS SHOWN ON THE SLIDE AND A \$0.01 IN SAN FRANCISCO. BEYOND THE  
7 TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING FOR THOSE FOUR OPERATORS, THE  
8 MEASURE ALSO PROVIDES FLEXIBLE FUNDING TO FOUR OF THE FIVE  
9 COUNTIES THAT CAN BE SPENT ON TRANSIT OPERATIONS, TRANSIT  
10 CAPITAL, AND HOLE ROAD REPAIR ON ROADS THAT ARE SERVED BY  
11 FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT. AND LAST BUT NOT LEAST, THERE IS AN  
12 IMPORTANT FUNDING COMMITTED TO IMPROVING THE RIDER EXPERIENCE  
13 WHICH I'LL TOUCH ON IN MORE DETAIL. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE  
14 ILLUSTRATES THE ESTIMATED ANNUAL FUNDING THE MEASURE PROVIDES  
15 TO THOSE FOUR LARGE OPERATORS, WHICH COMPRISES 60% OF THE  
16 TOTAL MEASURE PROCEEDS. STARTING IN THE FIRST FULL FISCAL YEAR  
17 OF THE MEASURE, WHICH IS FISCAL YEAR '27, '28, BART'S  
18 ESTIMATED TO RECEIVE ABOUT 310 MILLION, MUNI \$155 MILLION,  
19 CALTRAIN 70 MILLION AND AC TRANSIT 50 MILLION. NEXT SLIDE. AS  
20 YOU ARE WELL AWARE, THE SB63 EXPENDITURE PLAN WAS THE RESULT  
21 OF EXTENSIVE NEGOTIATIONS REGARDING HOW EACH COUNTY'S PORTION  
22 OF THE TAX COULD BE USED. THIS CHART ILLUSTRATES THE FLEXIBLE  
23 FUNDING REMAINING FOR LOCAL COUNTY PRIORITIES. THIS FUNDING IS  
24 WHAT REMAINS AFTER FUNDS ARE FIRST USED FOR TRANSIT SERVICE  
25 NEEDS WITHIN EACH COUNTY, RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS AND



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 ADMINISTRATION. NEXT SLIDE. ON THE RIDER FOCUS THE  
2 IMPROVEMENTS RECEIVE ABOUT 45 MILLION A YEAR IN THAT FIRST  
3 FULL YEAR OF THE MEASURE. SLIGHTLY LESS THAN 5%. AND THESE GO  
4 TOWARDS INITIATIVES THAT YOU'RE VERY FAMILIAR WITH TO IMPROVE  
5 THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND MAKE TRANSIT MORE AFFORDABLE,  
6 ACCESSIBLE, FASTER, AND EASIER TO USE. SO, AGAIN, IT'S THE  
7 FARE INTEGRATION PROGRAMS, ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS, AND  
8 THEN A COMBINED POT FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY, WHICH IS, YOU KNOW,  
9 GETTING BUSES OUT OF TRAFFIC AND THEN THE MAPPING AND  
10 WAYFINDING PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. SB63'S EXPENDITURE PLAN ALSO  
11 ALLOCATES FUNDING TO SOME SMALLER OPERATORS THAT PROVIDE LOCAL  
12 BUS SERVICE IN THE EAST BAY. FEEDER SERVICE TO BART, ACCESS TO  
13 SAN FRANCISCO FROM THE NORTH BAY, FROM GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT,  
14 AND FERRY AND EXPRESS BUS OPTIONS IN HIGH TRAFFIC BAY BRIDGE  
15 CORRIDOR. AND YOU CAN SEE THE ANNUAL AMOUNTS SHOWN HERE. NEXT  
16 SLIDE. SO, THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES MTC'S RESPONSIBILITIES IN  
17 SB63, AS MENTIONED, AND THERE IS QUITE A BIT OF DETAIL IN THE  
18 STAFF SUMMARY SHEET ON THE DISTRICT'S RESPONSIBILITIES, BUT  
19 EVEN BEFORE, YOU KNOW, ANY BALLOT MEASURE IS CONSIDERED AND  
20 APPROVED BY VOTERS, THERE ARE SOME RESPONSIBILITIES THAT MTC  
21 HAS. SO, STARTING WITH A RIDERSHIP STUDY THAT'S ACTUALLY DUE  
22 NEXT -- AT THE END OF MARCH, NEXT YEAR, AND PHASE ONE OF THE  
23 FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REVIEW. AND THEN POST ELECTION, MTC WOULD  
24 BE REQUIRED TO CONDUCT A PHASE TWO MULTI-YEAR FINANCIAL  
25 EFFICIENCY REVIEW AND PROVIDE ONGOING OPERATOR OVERSIGHT AS A



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1    CONDITION OF ALLOCATING THE FUNDS. AND, SO, FOR THE TRANSIT  
2    OPERATING REVENUE, THOSE FUNDS ARE ACTUALLY TRANSFERRED FROM  
3    THE DISTRICT TO MTC FOR ALLOCATION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE  
4    SUMMARIZES THE SCOPE OF THE PHASE ONE FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY  
5    STUDY. THE GIST OF THE STUDY IS TO SUMMARIZE STEPS THAT  
6    OPERATORS HAVE ALREADY TAKEN TO CUT COSTS, OPPORTUNITIES TO  
7    IMPROVE SERVICE, AND ENHANCE THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE WITHOUT  
8    NEW REVENUE. SO, WITHIN EXISTING RESOURCES, AND THEN ALSO A  
9    REVIEW OF DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITIES ON OPERATOR OWNED LAND  
10    THAT CAN SUPPORT RIDERSHIP AND GENERATE VALUE. NEXT SLIDE.  
11    THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES THE TIMELINE OF THE PHASE ONE STUDY.  
12    STEP ONE IS THE FORMATION OF THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE WHICH IS  
13    WELL UNDER WAY. NEXT THE CONSULTANT NELSON/NYGAARD WAS  
14    APPROVED BY THE ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE LAST WEEK. AND THEY  
15    MUST SUBMIT A DRAFT ANALYSIS TO THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE BY  
16    APRIL 1ST. SO THIS IS DEFINITELY ON A TIGHT TIMELINE AND WE DO  
17    ANTICIPATE BRINGING THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE REPRESENTATIVES TO  
18    THE COMMISSION NEXT MONTH. THEN OPERATORS RECEIVED THE  
19    RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE ACTUALLY HAS TO  
20    ADOPT. THERE CAN BE SOME BACK AND FORTH FROM THE OVERSIGHT  
21    COMMITTEE AND CONSULTANT BUT OPERATORS HAVE TO TAKE ACTION TO  
22    IDENTIFY THE STRATEGIES THAT THEY PLAN TO IMPLEMENT BY JULY  
23    1ST. NEXT SLIDE. PHASE TWO IS QUITE A BIT MORE COMPLEX AND  
24    WILL NOT TAKE PLACE, AGAIN, INDEPENDENTLY AFTER A MEASURE IS  
25    APPROVED BY VOTERS AND THE CONSULTANT FOR THAT WORK WILL BE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 SELECTED THROUGH A SEPARATE PROCUREMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SO  
2 TRANSIT AGENCY OVERSIGHT WAS A MAJOR THEME DURING THE  
3 LEGISLATIVE PROCESS AND IS A BIG COMPONENT OF SB63. ALL  
4 AGENCIES ARE SUBJECT TO A MAINTENANCE OF EFFORT REQUIREMENT,  
5 SUMMARIZED ON THE RIGHT OF THE SLIDE AND THAT IS REALLY TO  
6 ENSURE THAT AGENCIES DON'T SUPPLANT EXISTING REVENUE THAT'S  
7 GOING TOWARDS TRANSIT OPERATIONS, YOU KNOW, POTENTIALLY DIVERT  
8 THAT TO CAPITAL BUT RATHER USE THE MEASURE TO PROTECT EXISTING  
9 SERVICE AND POTENTIALLY IMPROVE EXISTING OPERATIONS. IN  
10 ADDITION, BART, IMMUNE MUNI, AND AC TRANSIT AND CALTRAIN ARE  
11 SUBJECT TO EXTRA OVERSIGHT GIVEN SIGNIFICANT REVENUE THAT  
12 THEY'RE RECEIVING AND FINANCIAL SITUATION THEY'RE IN AND THAT  
13 INCLUDES COMPLIANCE WITH COST SAVINGS MEASURES THAT WOULD BE  
14 IDENTIFIED IN THE PHASE TWO REVIEW AS WELL AS BEING SUBJECT TO  
15 THE COUNTY INITIATED OVERSIGHT THROUGH SPECIAL AND AD-HOC  
16 COMMITTEE THAT COUNTIES CAN TAKE ACTION TO PUT INTO PLACE AND  
17 THAT I AD-HOC COMMITTEE COMPRISED OF MTC COMMISSIONERS THAT  
18 REPRESENT THE JURISDICTION OF THE TRANSIT AGENCY FUNDED IN THE  
19 MEASURE. NEXT SLIDE. THE NEXT TWO SLIDES ARE REALLY A HIGH-  
20 LEVEL TIMELINE, CERTAINLY NOT EXHAUSTIVE, BUT THEY HIGHLIGHT  
21 SPECIFIC DEADLINES IN THE STATUTE OVER THE NEXT YEAR AND A  
22 HALF THAT APPLY TO A POTENTIAL MEASURE AND INVOLVE  
23 RESPONSIBILITIES OF BOTH MTC AND THE NEW DISTRICT. KEY POINT  
24 IS THAT BOTH BODIES HAVE DISTINCT RESPONSIBILITIES. NEXT  
25 SLIDE. AND THEN WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. ONGOING



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 RESPONSIBILITY THAT MTC HAS WITH RESPECT TO SB63 IS TO INFORM  
2 THE PUBLIC, AS A GOVERNMENT AGENCY, OF COURSE WE'RE COMMITTED  
3 TO PROVIDING FACTUAL IMPARTIAL INFORMATION TO VOTERS. THIS  
4 SLIDE JUST SHOWS THE WORK PRODUCTS THAT ARE PLANNED OR UNDER  
5 DEVELOPMENT AND WE WOULD HAVE A LANDING PAGE, YOU KNOW, ON OUR  
6 WEB SITE, WITH THIS INFORMATION. NEXT SLIDE. CONSISTENT WITH  
7 THE GOAL OF A MORE HARMONIZED TRANSIT SYSTEM AS EMBODIED BY  
8 OUR MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT, WE BELIEVE IT'S IMPORTANT  
9 THAT BAY AREA AGENCIES THAT ARE FUNDED BY THIS MEASURE  
10 COMMUNICATE TO THE PUBLIC IN A COORDINATED MANNER. SO WE'RE IN  
11 CONVERSATION WITH ALL THE AGENCIES ALREADY ABOUT THE MATERIALS  
12 THAT WE'RE DEVELOPING, WE'RE MAKING SURE THAT THEY AGREE WITH  
13 THE WAY THAT WE'RE REPRESENTING THEIR SITUATION AND THE  
14 BENEFITS OF THE MEASURE, AND DOING THAT IN A CONSISTENT WAY.  
15 NEXT SLIDE. OKAY. SO NOW WE'RE GOING TO PIVOT. AND I'M GOING  
16 TO GIVE A HIGH-LEVEL OVERVIEW OF THE EMC PRESENTATION ON THEIR  
17 POLL. JUST A REMINDER, THE LEG COMMITTEE HEARD A LENGTHIER  
18 PRESENTATION, AND EMC RESEARCH STAFF ARE HERE IF YOU HAVE  
19 TECHNICAL QUESTIONS I CAN'T ANSWER. NEXT SLIDE. OKAY. SO THIS  
20 SLIDE JUST SUMMARIZES THE POLL STATS. IT WAS A VERY LARGE  
21 POLL. 2800 TOTAL RESPONSES WITH A MARGIN OF ERROR OF JUST  
22 2.3%. 500 INTERVIEWS CONDUCTED IN EACH COUNTY, EXCEPT IN SAN  
23 FRANCISCO WHERE A SPLIT SAMPLE WAS CONDUCTED IN ORDER TO TEST  
24 HOW VOTERS WOULD REACT IF THAT I THEY HEARD ABOUT A LOCAL TAX  
25 MEASURE TO FUND MUNI AND REGIONAL MEASURE. SPOILER ALERT, THE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 POLL FOUND THE MAKE ANY DIFFERENCE AND INITIAL SUPPORT IN SAN  
2 FRANCISCO WAS 62% WITHOUT THE SAN FRANCISCO LOCAL MEASURE, 56%  
3 AFTER, BUT THAT WAS ALL WITHIN THE MARGIN OF ERROR. NEXT  
4 SLIDE. KEY FINDINGS HIGHLIGHTED HERE, OPTIMISM HAS MUNICIPAL -  
5 - IMPROVED, AND WE HAVE A SLIDE COMING UP THAT ILLUSTRATES THE  
6 DRAMATIC SHIFT THERE RATINGS OF PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM HAVE  
7 IMPROVED AND MORE PEOPLE RATE IT FAVORABLY TODAY THAN THEY DID  
8 THIS YEAR THAN THEY DID TWO YEARS AGO AND THEN THERE WERE A  
9 LOT OF QUESTIONS ASKED ABOUT WHAT'S IMPORTANT TO VOTERS ABOUT  
10 DIFFERENT ELEMENTS OF THE MEASURE AND BASICALLY EVERY  
11 DESCRIPTION THAT WAS INCLUDED IN THE MEASURE AS FAR AS WHAT IT  
12 DOES WERE CONSIDERED VERY IMPORTANT. SO VOTERS ARE VERY  
13 INTERESTED IN THE OUTCOMES AND SUPPORT, OVERALL, IS ABOVE A  
14 MAJORITY, HOWEVER GIVEN THE SIGNIFICANT ONGOING CONCERNS ABOUT  
15 COST OF LIVING, TAXES, TRUST IN GOVERNMENT, SUPPORT IS WELL  
16 BELOW 2/3. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS JUST ILLUSTRATES THE CHANGE  
17 AND THE INCREASED OPTIMISM. THE BLUE IS VOTERS WITHIN THE FIVE  
18 COUNTIES AND HOW THEY FEEL ABOUT THE REGION, ARE WE GOING ON  
19 THE RIGHT STRATEGIC OR THE WRONG TRACK, AND, SO, YOU CAN SEE  
20 STARTING IN KIND OF EARLY 2024, WHICH I THINK WAS JANUARY,  
21 WHEN WE DID ANOTHER POLL, REALLY BEEN ON A PRETTY SIGNIFICANT  
22 UPSWING. AND NOW AT ABOUT 55% THINK WE'RE GOING ON THE RIGHT  
23 TRACK. NEXT SLIDE. IN AN OPEN-ENDED QUESTION, EMC, YOU KNOW,  
24 CODED THESE BASED ON HOW FOLKS RESPONDED, HOUSING IS STILL,  
25 YOU KNOW, THE TOP CONCERN AMONG VOTERS. SO, YOU KNOW, THIS IS



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 -- IT SAYS AFFORDABLE HOUSING, THAT'S REALLY COST OF HOUSING,  
2 RIGHT? HOMELESSNESS, RIGHT BEHIND THAT, COST OF LIVING. SO,  
3 YOU KNOW, IT'S VERY CLEAR THAT AFFORDABILITY IS, INDEED, A TOP  
4 CONCERN IN THE BAY AREA AND SOUND LIKE NATION-WIDE. NEXT  
5 SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS HOW RESPONSES VARIED DEPENDING ON  
6 FREQUENCY OF TRANSIT USAGE. ON THE FAR LEFT YOU SEE THE  
7 AVERAGE TRANSIT USAGE ACROSS THE FIVE COUNTIES WHERE ABOUT ONE  
8 IN FOUR LIKELY VOTERS RIDE TRANSIT AT LEAST WEEKLY WITH  
9 ANOTHER 36 RIDING IT OCCASIONALLY FOR A TOTAL OF 60% ARE  
10 TRANSIT USERS. AS YOU WOULD EXPECT SAN FRANCISCO VOTERS RIDE  
11 TRANSIT MOST OFTEN WITH AT LEAST HALF RIDING WEEKLY WHEREAS  
12 SANTA CLARA ONLY 14% OF VOTERS ARE CURRENTLY -- OR LIKELY  
13 VOTERS ARE CURRENTLY RIDING TRANSIT WEEKLY. NEXT SLIDE. ONE  
14 NOTABLE FIND FROM THIS POLL IS THAT 84% OF VOTERS IN THE FIVE  
15 COUNTIES THINK TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT, WHICH IS A FIVE POINT  
16 INCREASE FROM TWO YEARS AGO. AND 11 POINT INCREASE IN  
17 INTENSITY AMONG THOSE WHO THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT. YOU ARE  
18 NOT SEEING ALL OF THE CROSS TAGS, AGAIN, IN THIS DECK, BUT  
19 WHAT WE SAW IN A PRETTY SIGNIFICANT WAY WAS THAT THOSE WHO  
20 RIDE TRANSIT REGULARLY ARE MORE SUPPORTIVE OF THE MEASURE.  
21 NEXT SLIDE. SO, WITH THAT BACKDROP, WE GET TO THE POLL'S KEY  
22 RESULT WHICH IS THAT SUPPORT FOR AN SB63 ENABLED MEASURE IS AT  
23 56% WITH ABOUT 44% OPPOSED. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS SLIDE BREAKS  
24 DOWN THAT REGIONAL TOTAL BY SUBGROUP. AND, AGAIN, THIS ONE  
25 DOES ILLUSTRATE AT THE TOP THERE, BASED ON HOW OFTEN THE VOTER



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 RIDE TRANSIT, AND THEN BELOW IS COUNTY OF RESIDENCE. A  
2 REMINDER THAT THE ACTUAL VOTE IS A SUMMATION OF TOTAL VOTES  
3 CAST, NOT IN THE DISTRICT, THE FIVE COUNTY DISTRICT, NOT  
4 COUNTY BY COUNTY AND WE DO SEE BIG DIFFERENCE IN SUPPORT  
5 COMPARING WEEKLY RIDERS AT 71% SUPPORT VERSUS THOSE WHO NEVER  
6 RIDE AT 41%. AT THE COUNTY LEVEL DIFFERENCES ARE WITHIN 10%  
7 WITH ALAMEDA COUNTY VOTERS HIGHEST AT 60% SUPPORT IN SANTA  
8 CLARA CURRENTLY LOWEST AT 50%. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SHOWS  
9 THE PROGRESSION OF SUPPORT AFTER MORE INFORMATION IS PROVIDED  
10 AND THEN AFTER VOTERS HEAR AN ARGUMENT AGAINST. YOU DON'T SEE  
11 A TON OF MOVEMENT, BUT THE FINAL SUPPORT LEVEL RESTS AT 54%.  
12 NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE, AGAIN, SHOWS THAT PROGRESSION BY  
13 COUNTY, AND JUST SEEING, YOU KNOW, WHERE FOLKS ARE AFTER  
14 HEARING THAT ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND ARGUMENT AGAINST. NEXT  
15 SLIDE. SO, IN SUMMARY, THE POLL FOUND THAT VOTERS PERCEPTIONS  
16 OF TRANSIT HAVE IMPROVED AND THERE IS A REAL RECOGNITION OF  
17 HOW IMPORTANT IT IS TO THE REGION, THEY STRONGLY SUPPORT THE  
18 OUTCOMES OF A MEASURE BUT ALL SAID SUPPORT IS CURRENTLY WELL  
19 BELOW THE 2/3 THRESHOLD REQUIRED FOR DISTRICT LED MEASURE.  
20 NEXT SLIDE. SO THAT WAS A LOT OF INFORMATION BUT THERE IS A  
21 LOT OF ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ABOUT SB63 IN THE STAFF REPORT  
22 SO HOPEFUL THEY IS A GOOD RESOURCE. I ALSO DID WANT TO NOTE  
23 THAT ATTACHMENT A IS A ONE-PAGE SUMMARY OF THE EXPENDITURE  
24 PLAN BASED ON FISCAL YEAR '27/'28 FORECAST. WITH RESPECT TO  
25 NEXT STEPS, AS ANDY MENTIONED, WE ANTICIPATE HOLDING THE FIRST



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 MEETING OF THE NEW DISTRICT ON JANUARY 7TH WHERE THE DISTRICT  
2 WILL BE ASKED TO CONSIDER WHETHER IT SHOULD PROCEED TOWARD  
3 PLACEMENT OF A PUBLIC TRANSIT REVENUE MEASURE ON THE NOVEMBER  
4 2026 BALLOT. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. AND I'M HAPPY TO  
5 ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANKS REBECCA. COMMISSIONER  
8 ASHCRAFT?

9

10 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** HI. THAT YOU MISS LONG. GREAT  
11 PRESENTATION. I JUST HAVE WON QUESTION ABOUT THE POLLING. SO,  
12 YOU GAVE US THE PERCENTAGES OF YES AND NO VOTERS. WERE THERE  
13 NO UNDECIDED'S?

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER]

16

17 **REBECCA LONG:** THAT IS A GREAT QUESTION. IT WAS VERY FEW. THE  
18 I'M GOING TO LOOK TO EMC. YES THEY'RE NODDING. IT WAS  
19 VIRTUALLY NONE. [LAUGHTER]

20

21 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** WOW. YEAH?

22

23 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

24

25 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** IS THAT GOOD NEWS, THAT THEY'RE AWARE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 OF THE MEASURE?

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COME ON UP.

4

5 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** YEAH, COME ON UP.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** NO.

8

9 **ANDREW FREMIER:** HERE YOU GO. RIGHT HERE.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. SARAH LEVATT WITH EMC RESEARCH. NICE TO  
12 SEE YOU. THE QUESTION ABOUT UNDECIDED THIS IS PRETTY TIP CAM  
13 WHAT WE SEE IN POLLING ABOUT TAX MEASURES OFTEN VOTERS REACT  
14 TO THE QUESTION WE'RE ASKING THEM AND WE ARE ASKING THEM AS IF  
15 IT'S A BALLOT AND WANTING THEM TO GIVE US AN INDICATION. SO  
16 NOT VERY MANY UNDECIDED'S. WE SEE A LOT IN POLLING AROUND TAX  
17 MEASURES RIGHT NOW IN PARTICULAR PEOPLE ARE PRETTY SOLIDLY IN  
18 THEIR CAMPS RIGHT FROM THE START.

19

20 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** DOES THAT MEAN THEY'RE LESS PERSUADABLE  
21 THEN?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** NOT NECESSARILY IT'S MORE THAT GENERALLY STARTING  
24 FROM A POSITION THAT'S RELATED TO BOTH THEIR OPINIONS ABOUT  
25 THE TOPIC AND ABOUT TAXES, COST OF LIVING, ET CETERA ALL OF



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 THE OTHER ITEMS THAT THEY KIND OF BRING UP IN THIS ANSWERS TO  
2 POLLS. I DON'T WANT TO GO INTO THE PERSUASION SIDE OF THIS  
3 IT'S NOT THE ROLE HERE BUT I WILL SAY IT DOESN'T NECESSARILY  
4 INDICATE ANYTHING ABOUT A FUTURE ELECTORATE IN A DIFFERENT  
5 OPINION ENVIRONMENT WITH MORE INFORMATION.

6

7 **MARILYN EZZY ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

10

11 **MATT MAHAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. APPRECIATE IT. SADLY, I HAVE GOT  
12 TO RUN IN A MINUTE. I'LL TRY TO FRAME THIS AS A QUESTION BUT  
13 WITH CONTEXT THAT'S COUNTY IS POLLING THE WORST STILL ABOVE  
14 WATER BUT IN THE LOWEST POSITION ON THE CHART. I GUESS I HAVE  
15 A QUESTION/COMMENT ABOUT THE ROLE MTC MIGHT PLAY IN BRINGING  
16 THE BEST RESEARCH AND THINKING AND CASE STUDIES FROM AROUND  
17 THE WORLD TO BEAR ON ENABLING MAYBE THOSE WHO MAY BE ENGAGED  
18 IN THIS MEASURE MAYBE MORE IMPORTANTLY, THE TRANSIT AGENCIES  
19 AND OPERATORS, WHICH MANY OF US, MANY OF US SERVE ON BOARD  
20 ACCIDENT OR OTHERWISE HAVE SOME INFLUENCE ON, WHAT IS THE KIND  
21 -- WHAT ARE THE INVESTMENTS THAT WILL PUT US IN A MUCH BETTER  
22 POSITION ON THE OTHER END OF THIS ASSUMING IT WERE TO PASS. IN  
23 CONVERSATIONS DOWN IN THE SOUTH BAY WITH VTA HAS BEEN WHAT  
24 WOULD IT LOOK LIKE TO TRANSFORM OUR AGENCY THAT IN 14 YEARS WE  
25 DON'T NEED TO RENEW IT? BECAUSE THE RIDERSHIP IS UP, THE COST



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 PER PASSENGER TRIP IS DOWN, AND THE UNDERLYING BUSINESS MODEL  
2 IS MORE SUSTAINABLE. AND I JUST FEEL THAT MTC MAY HAVE A  
3 UNIQUE ROLE TO PLAY IN FACILITATING THAT CONVERSATION,  
4 BRINGING TOGETHER GREAT RESEARCH AND CASE STUDY. I THINK A LOT  
5 OF THE AREAS AROUND SAFE AND CLEAN INITIATIVES AND FARE  
6 ENFORCEMENT AND INNOVATION AND PUBLIC PRIVATE PARTNERSHIPS, I  
7 MEAN THERE IS A LOT TODAY, A LOT DIFFERENT CATEGORIES AND  
8 STRATEGIES. BUT SETTING ASIDE OUR ROLE HERE IS NOT TO SAY HOW  
9 DO WE PASS A MEASURE. THAT'S NOT OUR ROLE WE'RE PLAYING. BUT I  
10 JUST GO TO THE ENTIRE REGION FOR US TO ELEVATE MORE  
11 SUBSTANTIVE VISION AND COMMITMENT. WHERE WE'RE GOING. I KNOW  
12 WE HAVE PLAYED THAT ROLE JUST THINK NEXT YEAR PARTICULARLY  
13 FIRST HALF THE YEAR IT'S GOING TO BE IMPORTANT THAT WE'RE  
14 HAVING THAT CONVERSATION CURIOUS HOW MUCH YOU HAVE THOUGHT  
15 ABOUT MTC'S ROLE IN THAT REGIONAL CONVERSATION?

16

17 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER I COULD START THEN REBECCA OR  
18 ALIX CAN JUMP IN I THINK THAT'S A GOOD OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO  
19 JUMP IN AND DO SOMETHING. WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT THE FACT THAT  
20 THIS MEASURE IS TEMPORARY AND WE HAVE SEEN HOW LONG IT TAKES  
21 TO GET REGIONAL UNANIMITY AROUND VERY CHALLENGING ITEMS AND WE  
22 ALSO RECOGNIZE FROM THE START THAT NEW BUSINESS MODEL IS  
23 NECESSARY AND THAT CLOCK STARTS TICKING RIGHT AWAY ESPECIALLY  
24 CONSIDERING THERE WILL BE A PAY BACK PERIOD TOO FOR THE BRIDGE  
25 LOAN WE'RE WORKING ON SO I APPRECIATE THE INPUT YOU GAVE AND I



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 THINK IT FITS NICELY UPON INTO THINKING HOW WE PUT OUR HEAD  
2 TOGETHER TO CREATE A BUSINESS MODEL SO HOPEFULLY WE DON'T HAVE  
3 TO CONTINUE TO COME BACK TO THE SALES TAX MODEL AND FIND A WAY  
4 TO MAKE THE SYSTEM REALLY WORK. LOOK TO BEING MY LEFT FOR  
5 OTHER FOLKS IDEAS.

6

7 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I WAS GOING TO ADD TO THAT PHASE ONE OF THE  
8 FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY STUDY REALLY FOCUSED ON FOUR OPERATORS  
9 BUT IT'S GOING TO LOOK AT OPPORTUNITY TO DO THINGS BETTER AND  
10 MORE EFFICIENTLY SO SOME OF THAT MIGHT BE APPLICABLE TO EVEN  
11 OTHER OPERATORS THAT ARE NOT AMONG THE FOUR OPERATORS. SO  
12 THAT'S ONE I THINK TECHNICAL RESOURCE AND I THINK OBVIOUSLY WE  
13 CAN LOOK FOR OTHER COORDINATION WITH THE NON-FOUR OPERATORS AS  
14 MIGHT BE APPROPRIATE.

15

16 **MATT MAHAN:** GREAT. AS ONE OF THE NON-FOUR OPERATORS I THINK WE  
17 WOULD STILL LOVE TO BE IN THAT CONVERSATION AND LEARN AS MUCH  
18 AS WE CAN. APPRECIATE. LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING THE  
19 CONVERSATION. THANK YOU ALL. HAPPY HOLIDAYS. SORRY TO DUCK OUT  
20 EARLY.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER] COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** YEAH, I WANT TO UPLIFT THE STAFF'S WORK ON THE  
25 RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS. YOU LOOK AT DOUBLING THE CAPACITY



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 OF CLIPPER START, 100,000 FOR LOW-INCOME RIDERS. I THINK  
2 THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. AND PEOPLE ARE TRYING TO GET TO THEIR  
3 JOBS AND MEDICAL APPOINTMENTS SO I THINK MAKING THAT  
4 INVESTMENT IS CRITICAL. YOU KNOW, SOMETIMES -- I WAS JUST  
5 TALKING I SIT ON THE CALTRAIN, SAMTRANS ONE OF THE ISSUES  
6 CONSISTENTLY ARISES IT'S NOT A NEGATIVE AGAINST STAFF WE TALK  
7 IN NUMBERS I THINK SOMETIMES WE NEED TO TALK IN STORIES. THIS  
8 IS A SLIDE I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT SLIDE IT'S PREVENTING  
9 SERVICE CUTS SO WE'RE HAVING CONVERSATIONS AT OUR AGENCIES OF  
10 IF THIS MEASURE, YOU KNOW, I DON'T WANT TO SPEAK TO THE  
11 MEASURE, BUT IF WHAT'S BEFORE US TODAY DOES NOT PASS, THERE  
12 ARE VERY GRAVE IMPLICATIONS. AND, SO, ONE OF THE THINGS I  
13 WOULD ENCOURAGE STAFF TO DO IS TO REALLY TALK ABOUT, OR INFORM  
14 US, IN THE BODY THAT'S GOING TO BE FORMED, ABOUT WHAT DO  
15 SERVICE CUTS LOOK LIKE. IS IT TAKING CALTRAIN TO, YOU KNOW,  
16 TWO HOURS EVERY TIME IT -- YOU KNOW, EVERY TIME IT GOES FROM  
17 STATION TO STATION, OR TRAINS -- EXCUSE ME -- I THINK REALLY  
18 TELLING THE STORY OF PEOPLE IN THEIR ORDINARY LIVES AND WHAT  
19 THESE SERVICE CUTS -- I MEAN --

20

21 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'M NOT. WHAT I CAN'T DO IS I COUNTY FATHOM US  
24 NOT HAVING BART WORK. BART IS SO INTEGRAL TO THE REGION. AND I  
25 THINK ABOUT BART, I THINK ABOUT WHAT IT MEANS --



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I THINK WE'RE GETTING INTO --

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** NO I'M SPEAKING TO THE MERITS OF BART I'M NOT  
5 SPEAKING TO THE BALLOT MEASURE.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** WE'RE ON -- I THINK WE'RE GETTING OFF TRACK.  
8 SORRY.

9

10 **DAVID CANEPA:** THROUGH THE CHAIR -- THROUGH COUNSEL, MY  
11 UNDERSTANDING IS I'M NOT SPEAKING TO THE MEASURE. I'M SPEAKING  
12 TO THE OPERATORS. IS THAT CORRECT?

13

14 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** RIGHT. I MEAN, I THINK AS WE'RE ALL  
15 CLEAR, IT IS NOT MTC'S ROLE TO ADVOCATE FOR OR AGAINST ANY  
16 POTENTIAL MEASURE, BUT IF WE'RE TALKING ABOUT GENERAL POLICY  
17 ISSUES RELATING TO REGIONAL TRANSIT, WE CAN DO THAT. I DO  
18 THINK THAT THE CAUTION IS APPROPRIATE BECAUSE WE WANT TO MAKE  
19 SURE THAT WE'RE CAREFUL IN OUR CONVERSATION CHOOSING --

20

21 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. THROUGH COUNSEL, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.  
22 I THINK BART IS A WORLD CLASS SYSTEM. I THINK BART GETS THE  
23 MOST VULNERABLE PEOPLE TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO, AND IT ALSO  
24 GETS COMMUTERS. AND SO WHEN I LOOK AT THESE ISSUES AND WHEN I  
25 LOOK AT WHAT THE CURRENT SYSTEM IS PROVIDING FOR PEOPLE, THE



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 OPPORTUNITY TO GO FROM CALTRAIN TO BART TO AC TRANSIT, THOSE,  
2 SORT OF, THINGS ARE REALLY CRITICALLY IMPORTANT JUST TO THE --  
3 TO THE AVERAGE PERSON. I DON'T TAKE THAT -- TAKE THAT FOR  
4 GRANTED. AND, SO, I THINK WHAT'S BEFORE US TODAY REALLY SHEDS  
5 IMPORTANT LIGHT IN TERMS OF WHAT PEOPLE ARE THINKING. AND I  
6 THINK WE CAN'T -- WE CAN'T -- WE CAN'T ACKNOWLEDGE THE FACT  
7 THAT POLLING IS A MOMENT IN TIME, OR THE SURVEY IS A MOMENT IN  
8 TIME, BUT IT'S A SURVEY THAT GIVES US VERY, VERY IMPORTANT  
9 INFORMATION TO WHAT THE INSIGHT OF WHAT COMMUNITIES ARE  
10 FEELING ABOUT TRANSIT. AND, SO, WITH THAT, I KNOW THERE IS A  
11 LOT MORE WORK TO DO, BUT I REALLY WANT TO RECOGNIZE EMC. I  
12 WANT TO RECOGNIZE OUR STAFF. I WANT TO THANK YOU, ANDY AND  
13 REBECCA, BUT THIS IS CRITICALLY IMPORTANT WORK. AND LET ME  
14 TALK ABOUT A LITTLE BIT, JUST, AND I'LL CLOSE BY SAYING THIS;  
15 MY UNDERSTANDING, THIS IS THROUGH STAFF, SB63 HAS BEEN  
16 CHAPTERED AND IT'S BEEN SIGNED BY THE GOVERNOR. AND THAT'S  
17 CORRECT, RIGHT?

18

19 **REBECCA LONG:** THAT'S CORRECT.

20

21 **DAVID CANEPA:** THE LEGISLATOR, THE LEGISLATOR THROUGH THE STATE  
22 OF CALIFORNIA, THEY VOTED TO PUT THIS MEASURE ON THE BALLOT.  
23 IS THAT CORRECT? NO?

24

25 **REBECCA LONG:** NO. THEY AUTHORIZE THE DISTRICT OR CITIZEN



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 INITIATIVE TO THE MEASURE ON THE BALLOT.

2

3 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. SO  
4 MADAM CHAIR THANK YOU FOR THE TIME AND I APPRECIATE YOU GIVING  
5 ME THE ABILITY TO MAKE COMMENTS.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO REITERATE MAYOR MAHAN'S COMMENTS  
10 HERE IN PHASE ONE. WE HAVE THE CONSULTANT ON AND AS WAS  
11 MENTIONED DURING THE ADMIN COMMITTEE, WE HAVE A VERY GOOD  
12 RESOURCE IN THE MGO REPORT THAT WE DID INITIALLY, WHICH REALLY  
13 WAS, AS WAS NOTED, THE MORE WE CAN RECOMMEND TO OUR OPERATORS  
14 AS WE MOVE FORWARD HERE IN OPPORTUNITIES THAT EXIST  
15 THROUGHOUT, THE IDEA, THE DISCUSSION WAS, HOPEFULLY, WHATEVER  
16 HAPPENS HERE, FUNDING SOMEHOW BALANCE PRESIDENCY OUT. AND WE  
17 KNOW CERTAIN OPERATORS ARE RAISING FEES RIGHT NOW AND ALL OF  
18 THAT. SO, YES, I DO HOPE MTC CAN TAKE THE LEAD. WE DO IN OUR  
19 REGIONAL MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. WE HAVE COME UP -- THEY'RE  
20 ACTUALLY ACTIVATING DIFFERENT THINGS FROM THE BLUE RIBBON  
21 TRANSIT RECOVERY PLAN, AND IT'S VERY EXCITING TO SEE ALL OF  
22 THAT. SO, AS WE MOVE FORWARD HERE AND AS MTC TAKES THIS  
23 PORTION OF THE LEGISLATION, I DO HOPE, IN PHASE ONE, WE CAN  
24 LEVERAGE WHAT WAS IN THIS REPORT AND A LOT OF GREAT  
25 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE OPERATORS THEMSELVES SO THAT WE CAN



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 SEE WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE REGION AND SEE HOW, HOPEFULLY,  
2 IMPROVEMENTS ARE HAPPENING. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ANY ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS? NO? OKAY. IS  
5 THERE ANY WRITTEN OR PUBLIC COMMENTS IN GENERAL?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITE FOR THIS  
8 ITEM. I DO HAVE A FEW PUBLIC SPEAKERS. THE FIRST IS ZANE  
9 KRAEMER. MISS KRAEMER, GO AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM. I  
10 BELIEVE THE MIC IS ON NOW.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IS THAT -- OKAY. THE MIC IS ON. YOU CAN GO  
13 THERE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** JANE KRAEMER. INTERESTING DISCUSSION THAT TRIGGERS A  
16 THOUGHT IN MY HEAD. THERE IS A CONSIDERABLE AMOUNT OF PEOPLE  
17 OUT IN THE PUBLIC WHO, INDIVIDUALLY, WILL NOT BENEFIT FROM A  
18 TAX MEASURE ON SUPPORTING, LET'S SAY, BART. BUT THEY SAY, AND  
19 THEY WOULD LIKE TO THINK THAT THEY WILL FOLLOW-THROUGH ON IT,  
20 THAT IF A TAX MEASURE BENEFITS OTHERS WHO OTHERWISE WOULD NOT  
21 BE ABLE TO PROFIT FROM SOME ACTIVITY OR PROJECT, THEY WILL  
22 VOTE FOR THE MEASURE. AND I THINK MAYBE THAT WILL UP YOUR  
23 PERCENTAGE POINTS TO WHERE YOU NEED TO GET THE MEASURE PASSED.  
24 IT'S JUST A THOUGHT.

25



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IN THE ZOOM SPACE, WE HAVE  
4 ADINA LEVIN, FOLLOWED BY ROLAND LEBRUN.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** HELLO. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION ON THE  
7 CONTENT AND PROCESS OF THE BALLOT MEASURE. AND WHILE IT IS  
8 TRUE THAT MTC, AS AN INSTITUTION, AND AGENCIES ARE STRICTLY  
9 PRECLUDED FROM -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ON THE MEASURE, THERE IS  
10 QUITE A LOT IN TERMS OF COMMUNICATION AND ESPECIALLY IN  
11 EXECUTION THAT CAN BE HELPFUL THAT POLLING THAT SHOWED THAT  
12 WHEN SOMEONE GOES FROM RIDING TRANSIT RARELY TO RIDING IT  
13 OCCASIONALLY, YOU KNOW WHAT THAT DOES AS A SIDE EFFECT FOR  
14 PUBLIC SUPPORT IS REALLY BREAKING. SO EVERYTHING THAT CAN BE  
15 DONE IN BOTH THE EXECUTION OF THAT CLIPPER ROLL OUT THAT GETS  
16 US OPEN PAYMENT AND FREE AND REDUCED PRICE TRANSFER  
17 PRESIDENCY, THAT INCREASED RIDERSHIP AND CONVENIENCE,  
18 EXECUTING ON THE RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS, AND THEN REALLY  
19 STEPPING UP THE GAME ON COMMUNICATING THE IMPROVEMENTS TO THE  
20 TRANSIT NETWORK ARE -- YOU KNOW, THAT IS SOMETHING THAT IS,  
21 YOU KNOW, BOTH GOOD BREAD AND BUTTER PUBLIC COMMUNICATIONS,  
22 AND ESPECIALLY HELPFUL IN THE COMING YEAR. WITH REGARD TO WHAT  
23 MAYOR MAHAN SAID, HE MAY HAVE GONE, BUT IN THE INTEREST OF  
24 HIMSELF AND TO OTHER SANTA CLARA COUNTY LEADERS, IN TAKING A  
25 DATA-DRIVEN AND QUANTIFIED APPROACH, VTA HAS SOME REALLY



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 EXCELLENT BUT CURRENTLY RATHER QUALITATIVE STRATEGIES FOR, YOU  
2 KNOW, NEARLY DOUBLING SERVICE OF VTA AND FREE TRANSIT  
3 PRIORITY, AND TAKING A MORE QUANTIFIED APPROACH IS SOMETHING  
4 THAT CAN BE REALLY HELPFUL IN DELIVERING AND COMMUNICATES. AND  
5 THIS IS SOMETHING THAT ADVOCATES ARE WORKING TO HELP  
6 COMMUNICATION AND SUPPORT, AS WELL.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ROLAND LEBRUN.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO RAISE MY CONCERN THAT  
11 IS CURRENTLY A COMPLETE LACK OF VTA OVERSIGHT, ESPECIALLY WHEN  
12 WE COME TO THE -- THE CURRENT POLLING SHOWS THAT VTA WOULD BE  
13 EXTREMELY UNLIKELY TO PASS ANOTHER HALF-CENT SALES TAX MEASURE  
14 ON THEIR OWN. IN CLOSING, I BELIEVE THAT THE BEST WAY TO  
15 ADDRESS THIS ISSUE WOULD BE TO TRANSFER RESPONSIBILITY FOR  
16 MEGA PROJECT DELIVERY TO ANOTHER ENTITY, JUST LIKE  
17 RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE BAY PROJECT EVENTUALLY LANDED IN MTC'S  
18 LAP. THANK YOU. AND HAPPY HOLIDAYS, MERRY CHRISTMAS, AND HAPPY  
19 NEW YEAR WHERE I COME FROM.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL PUBLIC  
22 COMMENTS.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. GREAT. THIS WAS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM.  
25 AND SO NO ACTION IS REQUIRED BY THE COMMISSION AT THIS TIME.



DECEMBER 17, 2025

1 MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR, WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE THAT TO  
2 THE JANUARY MEETING. SO, WE WILL -- SO, WILL 4 AND 5, AND, SO,  
3 I GOT TO KEEP PAGING FORWARD, WE'LL GO ON TO AGENDA ITEM 13,  
4 WHICH IS GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO RAISED HANDS IN  
7 THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED PODIUM, AND THERE ARE --  
8 NOTHING WAS RECEIVED IN WRITING.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO ITEM FOUR IS  
11 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN  
12 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE BAY  
13 AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO ON  
14 WEDNESDAY JANUARY 28TH, 2026. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL  
15 BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. AND WE'RE ADJOURNED. HAPPY  
16 HOLIDAYS TO EVERYBODY.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HAPPY HOLIDAYS. [ADJOURNED]