

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



September 11, 2020

1                                   **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**  
2           **JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE**  
3                                   **COMMITTEE**  
4                                   **FRIDAY, SEPTEMBER 11, 2020, 9:15 AM**

5  
6   **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. WELCOME TO  
7 THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE.  
8 OUR FIRST ORDER OF BUSINESS IS THE ROLL CALL. AND CONFIRM WE  
9 HAVE A QUORUM. MTC, MARTHA DOES MTC HAVE A QUORUM?

10  
11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CAN WE START BY ROLLING THE ANNOUNCEMENT,  
12 FIRST?

13  
14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES. ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. IT'S  
15 SO EXCITING. DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED  
16 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR. PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF THE  
17 GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20, WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN  
18 REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING WILL BE WEBCAST ON  
19 THE MTC WEB SITE. I WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS,  
20 STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK  
21 CLEARLY AND RESTATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR  
22 REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM AND WEBCAST WITH THEIR  
23 CAMERAS ENABLED ARE REMINDED THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO  
24 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING  
25 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only.



September 11, 2020

1 OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE  
2 TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST  
3 FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. AND IT IS REQUESTED THAT  
4 PUBLIC SPEAKERS RESTATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS, BUT  
5 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
6 WISHING TO ADDRESS THIS BODY WERE ASKED TO SUBMIT COMMENTS IN  
7 WRITING AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED  
8 WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE  
9 RECORD BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE  
10 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO  
11 DO ON THE REFERENCED AGENDA ITEM OR ANY TOPIC THEY CHOOSE.  
12 SPEAKERS SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT  
13 THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL  
14 ACTION ITEMS. THE CHAT FEATURE IS ACTIVE, HOWEVER, PLEASE BE  
15 AWARE THAT ANYTHING TYPED INTO THE CHAT WILL BE SUBJECT TO  
16 PUBLIC DISCLOSURE. THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT AVAILABLE TO  
17 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE  
18 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT'S AN EXCITING  
21 CLIP. AT THIS TIME, JESSE, ARE YOU CHAIRING FOR ABAG AND IF  
22 YOU ARE DO YOU WANT TO GO AHEAD AND CONFIRM AN ABAG QUORUM?

23

24 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** YES MR. CHAIR, MR. CASTRO CAN YOU  
25 PLEASE CONFIRM WHETHER A QUORUM IS PRESENT OR CALL THE ROLL.



September 11, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I'LL CALL THE ROLL. CHAIR ARREGUIN?

3

4 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR CORTESE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MACKENZIE?

11

12 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** PRESENT.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MITCHOFF?

15

16 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER PERALEZ?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RABBIT IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR  
23 RAMOS? I SEE HER, SHE IS MUTED. AND VICE MAYOR ROMERO?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.



September 11, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MARTHA DO YOU WANT TO DO ROLL  
5 CALL FOR MTC.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. COMMISSIONER CORTESE? COMMISSIONER  
8 GIOCAPINI NON-VOTING?

9

10 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MACKENZIE?

13

14 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT IS ABSENT.

17 COMMISSIONER SLOCUM IS ABSENT. SPERING?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** PRESENT.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER STRACNER NON-VOTING? ABSENT.

22 MTC HAS A QUORUM.

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** JESS I'LL GO BACK TO YOU THIS IS  
25 MTC COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. AND ALSO YOUR CONSENT CALENDAR.



September 11, 2020

1

2 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MR. CASTRO CAN YOU PLEASE READ THE  
3 ABAG COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM  
6 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG  
7 BOARD IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE  
8 PER DIEM AN AMOUNT OF \$100 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING  
9 FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK  
10 YOU. THANK YOU.

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH WE'LL GO TO  
13 ITEM THREE ABAG CONSENT CALENDAR CONSISTING OF ONE ITEM  
14 APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF JULY 10, 2020 MEETING I'LL  
15 ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

16

17 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SO MOVED MACKENZIE.

18

19 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MOVED BY PIERCE SECONDED BY  
20 MACKENZIE. ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION? I SEE NO RAISED HANDS.  
21 WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK ON THE  
22 APPROVAL OF ABAG'S MINUTES FOR JULY 10, 2020 PLEASE RAISE YOUR  
23 HAND. DO I NOT SEE ANY RAISED HANDS. MR. CASTRO ANY SUBMITTED  
24 COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

25



September 11, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO SUBMITTED COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.

2

3 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. MOTION  
6 CARRIES.

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** OKAY MOTION CARRIES. THANK YOU.  
9 BACK TO YOU CHAIR SPERING.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESS. MTC, ITEM FOUR  
12 CONSENT CALENDAR. ANY ITEMS HERE YOU WOULD LIKE TO DISCUSS? IF  
13 NOT I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

14

15 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** SO MOVED MR. CHAIR, MACKENZIE.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SECOND? CONNOLLY, ARE YOU  
18 SECONDING THE ITEM?

19

20 **DAMON CONNOLLY:** YES.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MARTHA ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE RECEIVED.

25



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** TAKE THE ROLL PLEASE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LET'S MOVE TO ITEM  
6 NUMBER FIVE THIS IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT  
7 SUMMER 2020 ENGAGEMENT AND PROPOSED REVISIONS. DAVE, THIS IS  
8 MY THIRD TIME SEEING THIS THIS WEEK, AND THERE IS MANY PEOPLE  
9 ON THIS MEETING THAT IT'S GOING TO BE THEIR SECOND TIME IN TWO  
10 DAYS IN LESS THAN 24 HOURS. BUT I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF, JUST  
11 DOING A GREAT JOB WITH THE PRESENTATION. A LOT OF GOOD  
12 QUESTIONS AT RPC. GOOD MEETING. GOOD DIALOGUE. APPRECIATE IT.  
13 WITH THAT, DAVE ARE YOU GOING TO KICK THIS OFF?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** COMMISSIONER SPERING, THIS IS MATT MALONEY, SECTION  
16 DIRECTOR, REGIONAL PLANNING. WE HAVE A ROBUST AGENDA TODAY, AS  
17 COMMISSIONER SPERING JUST DESCRIBED. WE ARE GOING TO BE  
18 SHOWING YOU SOME THINGS TODAY THOUGH THAT NOBODY ELSE IS  
19 SEEING, AND SPOTLIGHTING THE POLL RESULTS IN A BIT. I WANT TO  
20 SET THIS UP TO PRODUCE THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL  
21 BLUEPRINT. THIS IS A CULMINATION OF TWO AND A HALF YEARS OF  
22 PLANNING AND POLICY ANALYSIS, STARTING BACK WITH THE HORIZON  
23 PROCESS, AND THROUGH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. FOCUS HAS BEEN  
24 CREATING A MORE COMPREHENSIVE REGIONAL PLAN GROUNDED IN  
25 RESILIENT AND EQUITABLE STRATEGIES. AS THIS IS A MAJOR





September 11, 2020

1 MILESTONE FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THAT WILL GUIDE ANALYSIS  
2 OVER THE COMING MONTHS THIS ITEM WILL BE PRESENTED IN THREE  
3 PARTS TODAY. SO FIRST, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROJECT MANAGER  
4 DAVE VAUTIN AND PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT PRINCIPLE LESLIE LARA-  
5 ENRIQUEZ WILL PRESENT AN INFORMATION ITEM ON SECOND ROUND OF  
6 ENGAGEMENT AND ALSO UNDERSCORING HOW INPUT FROM THAT EFFORT IS  
7 INFORMING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT RECOMMENDATIONS. AS YOU KNOW  
8 COVID-19 HAS REQUIRED STAFF TO QUICKLY ALTER OUR IN-PERSON  
9 ENGAGEMENT PLANS AND SHIFTING TO CONDUCT BEING THE DRAFT  
10 BLUEPRINT ENGAGEMENT ENTIRELY REMOTELY SO WE ARE ABLE TO USE  
11 TECHNOLOGIES LIKE ZOOM TO CONDUCT ALL OF THE IN-PERSON PLAN  
12 ENGAGEMENT VIRTUALLY INCLUDING PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS  
13 COMMUNITY GROUPS OFFICE HOURS AND TOWN HALL MEETINGS. IN TOTAL  
14 WE COLLECTED 3400 COMMENTS FROM 6700 PARTICIPANTS IN THE  
15 PROCESS. STAFF OUTLINING REMAINING CHALLENGES NOT RESOLVED IN  
16 THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. STAFF WILL REVIEW EACH CHALLENGE AND  
17 OUTLINE SPECIFIC STRATEGY REVISIONS THAT WILL IMPROVE THE  
18 OUTCOMES OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT STAFF WILL OUTLINE THE  
19 PROPOSED REVISIONS TO THE GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AND THE REGIONAL  
20 GROWTH FORECAST FOR THE FINAL PHASE OF ANALYSIS. SECOND MTC  
21 STAFF URSULA VOGLER WILL PRESENT THE NEXT ITEM OF INFORMATION  
22 WHICH IS REVIEW OF THE RESULTS OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050  
23 STATISTICALLY VALID POLL. POLL WAS CONDUCTED OVER A TWO WEEK  
24 PERIOD STARTING IN LATE JULY AND WE HOPE THIS WILL PROVIDE  
25 INSIGHT ON KEY REGIONAL ISSUES AND THE 25 STRATEGIES



September 11, 2020

1 INTEGRATED INTO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY  
2 FOR QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS BEFORE THE FINAL AND THIRD ACTION  
3 ITEM AND THAT'S WHERE STAFF WILL REQUEST THE COMMITTEES REFER  
4 THE REVISED STRATEGIES AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN THE FINAL  
5 BLUEPRINT ALONG WITH GROWTH FORECAST TO THE COMMISSION AND  
6 ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR APPROVAL LATER THIS MONTH. SO WITHOUT  
7 FURTHER ADO, HERE ARE DAVE AND LESLIE WHEN WILL PRESENT THE  
8 DRAFT BLUEPRINT PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT OUTCOMES AND THE PROPOSED  
9 REVISIONS. >DAVE VAUTIN: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD  
10 MEMBERS.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** DAVID, AS YOU'RE GOING THROUGH THIS,  
13 IF YOU GET A CHANCE TO JUST PAUSE AND WHERE YOU THINK IT'S  
14 APPROPRIATE, TAKE A BREAK IN CASE PEOPLE HAVE QUESTIONS. THIS  
15 IS A LOT OF INFORMATION. USE YOUR DISCRETION TO WHERE YOU CAN  
16 MAYBE TAKE A BREAK. >DAVE VAUTIN: CERTAINLY, WE CAN DO THAT.  
17 I'LL ASK THE TECHNICAL STAFF TO PULL UP THE SLIDE DECK,  
18 PLEASE. SO AS MATT MENTIONED WE'RE PLEASED TO BE HERE TODAY TO  
19 SHARE HOW PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT RESULTS INFORMED THE STAFF  
20 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE REVISED STRATEGIES, GROWTH  
21 GEOGRAPHIES, AND THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST FOR PLANNED BAY  
22 AREA 2050. NEXT SLIDE. TODAY'S MILESTONE AS MATT MENTIONED  
23 REALLY BUILDS ON TWO AND A HALF YEARS OF WORK FROM THE HORIZON  
24 INITIATIVE, INTO THE BLUEPRINT PHASE FOR PLANNED BAY AREA  
25 2050, AND I JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THIS WAS A TEAM



September 11, 2020

1 EFFORT THAT RELIED ON OVER 20 DIFFERENT PLANNERS, OUTREACH  
2 PROFESSIONALS, MODELERS AND MORE TO HELP GET US TO THIS  
3 JUNCTURE. WE ACKNOWLEDGE THIS IS A LENGTHY PRESENTATION AND I  
4 APOLOGIZE TO SOME OF YOU WHO JUST HEARD IT YESTERDAY AFTERNOON  
5 BUT THERE IS A LOT OF IMPORTANT INFORMATION. THIS IS A \$1.4  
6 TRILLION PLAN COVERING FOUR DISTINCT TOPIC AREAS AND WE'RE  
7 TRYING TO COVER A LOT OF GROUND. AS YOU KNOW HORIZON WAS  
8 FOCUSED ON FINDING STRATEGIES THAT WERE RESILIENT TO  
9 UNCERTAINTY AND ADVANCE EQUITY AND RECENT MONTHS HAVE  
10 INDICATED HOW THOSE TWO OBJECTIVES ARE ESSENTIAL FOR OUR  
11 REGION IN THE MONTHS AND YEARS AHEAD. THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WAS  
12 FOUNDED ON THOSE STRATEGIES THAT APPROVED THE MOST RESILIENT  
13 AND THE MOST EQUITABLE IN THE HORIZON PROCESS. PACKAGING  
14 TOGETHER 25 STRATEGIES ACROSS ALL FOUR ELEMENTS OF PLANNED BAY  
15 AREA 2050. AND AFTER THE APPROVAL OF THE STRATEGIES AND GROWTH  
16 GEOGRAPHIES BY THE COMMISSION AND THE BOARD IN FEBRUARY, WE  
17 SPENT THE SPRING ANALYZING POTENTIAL OUTCOMES IN ADDITION  
18 UPDATING THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST TO ACCOUNT FOR THOSE  
19 COVID AND RECESSION IMPACTS. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS SUMMER WE HAD  
20 AN OPPORTUNITY TO SHARE THE FORECASTED OUTCOMES WITH THE  
21 PUBLIC AND SEEK WAYS TO ADD, REMOVE, OR MODIFY STRATEGIES IN  
22 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT TO MOVE FURTHER TOWARDS THE PLAN'S VISION  
23 OF A MORE CONNECTED, AFFORDABLE, DIVERSE, HEALTHY AND VIBRANT  
24 REGION FOR ALL. NOW WE'RE READY TO DIVE INTO THE ANALYSIS OF  
25 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT DRIVEN BY THE VOICES OF THE COMMUNITIES



September 11, 2020

1 ACROSS THE BAY AREA WITH NEW AND IMPROVED STRATEGIES. NEXT  
2 SLIDE. IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE IT'S NOT THE FINAL ACTION  
3 ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THAT WILL OCCUR ROUGHLY ONE YEAR  
4 FROM NOW, WHEN THE FINAL PLAN, FINAL EIR AND FINAL  
5 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN ARE PUBLISHED AND UP FOR APPROVAL THIS IS  
6 A CRITICAL MILESTONE THAT WILL INFORM THE OUTCOMES THAT WE'LL  
7 BRING FORWARD TO ALL OF YOU IN THE NEW YEAR AND ASK FOR YOUR  
8 CONSIDERATION AT THAT TIME TO ADVANCE THE EIR AS THE PREFERRED  
9 ALTERNATIVE. PROPOSED ACTION TODAY WOULD ENABLE US TO STUDY  
10 MORE EQUITABLE AND MORE RESILIENT PACKAGE OF STRATEGIES THAN  
11 EVER BEFORE CUTTING ACROSS THE FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN THAT  
12 YOU'RE ALL WELL AWARE OF, TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE  
13 ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT. THERE IS A GREAT DEAL OF  
14 MATERIAL ON THE STRATEGIES, IN ATTACHMENT I OF YOUR PACKET,  
15 ALONG WITH THE REFRESHED GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES IN ATTACHMENT H  
16 AND THE FINAL REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST IN ATTACHMENT G.  
17 TOGETHER THESE IMPROVEMENTS WILL HELP US ADDRESS THE BIG FIVE  
18 CHALLENGES THAT WE SHOWCASED IN JULY. INSUFFICIENT AFFORDABLE  
19 HOUSING, CONGESTION AND TRANSIT CROWDING, DISPLACEMENT RISK,  
20 CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND A CONTINUED JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE THAT  
21 WERE NOT FULL ADDRESSED IN THE BLUEPRINT. AND CARRY FORWARD  
22 AREAS OF SUCCESS SIGNIFICANT DRAFT BLUEPRINT LIKE PROTECTING  
23 98 PERCENT OF HOMES FROM SEA LEVEL RISE, REDUCING TRANSIT COST  
24 FOR OUR LOWER INCOME POPULATIONS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERScore  
25 WHAT A STRATEGY IS, AND WHAT IT IS NOT IN THE CONTEXT OF THE



September 11, 2020

1 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BLUEPRINT. THESE ARE NOT LEGISLATIVE  
2 ADVOCACY GOALS, THEY'RE NOT NEAR TERM POLICY PRESCRIPTIONS,  
3 THEY ARE IDEAS, IDEAS FOR CITIES, COUNTIES, THE REGION AND THE  
4 STATE TO COLLABORATIVELY ADVANCE OVER THE NEXT 30 YEARS. AND  
5 WE'LL EXPLORE WHICH STRATEGIES TO ACCELERATE ON, AND WHICH  
6 STRATEGIES REQUIRE NEAR TERM ACTION AND WHAT THAT MIGHT BE  
7 THROUGH THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN EFFORT, AS PART OF PLANNED BAY  
8 AREA 2050, AND THAT WILL KICK OFF LATER THIS FALL. SO YOUR  
9 ACTIONS TODAY WILL ALLOW US TO FURTHER STUDY THESE POLICY  
10 IDEAS TO DEMONSTRATE HOW WE CAN MOVE THE NEEDLE FURTHER AS A  
11 REGION AND GET TOWARDS THE PLAN VISION. SO WITH THAT, I'M  
12 GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO LESLIE TO HIGHLIGHT HOW WE CONDUCT  
13 ENGAGEMENT WITH THE PUBLIC STAKEHOLDERS, LOCAL JURISDICTION,  
14 AND MORE. NEXT SLIDE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU DAVE AND GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. STAFF  
17 CONDUCTED THE SECOND ROUND OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT FOR THE  
18 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLAN UPDATE PROCESS STARTING IN LATE  
19 SPRING THROUGH AUGUST 10TH. AND JUST FOR A BIT OF CONTEXT, AS  
20 YOU KNOW, SB 375 REQUIRES US TO DO THREE ROUNDS OF PUBLIC  
21 ENGAGEMENT AND THE FIRST ROUND TOOK PLACE LAST FALL, AND IT  
22 INCLUDED 37 POP-UP WORKSHOPS THROUGHOUT THE REGION AS WELL AS  
23 THE MAYOR OF BAYVILLE ONLINE TOOL AND WE RECEIVED CLOSE TO  
24 10,000 COMMENTS ON THOSE EFFORTS WHICH HELPED US NARROW DOWN  
25 STRATEGIES THAT WE INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. PURPOSE OF



September 11, 2020

1 THIS SECOND ROUND OF OUTREACH WAS TO SOLICIT FROM THE PUBLIC  
2 OUR PARTNERS AND THE STAKEHOLDERS ON THE FIVE REMAINING  
3 CHALLENGES SIGNIFICANT DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND AS DAVE MENTIONED  
4 EARLIER, WE WILL CONDUCT A THIRD ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT NEXT  
5 SPRING AND THIS ROUND WILL FOCUS ON THE DRAFT PLAN DOCUMENT.  
6 WE KICKED OFF RIGHT AROUND THE TIME WHEN WE ALL BEGAN TO  
7 SHELTER IN PLACE AND THE PANDEMIC BEGAN WHICH MEANT WE HAD TO  
8 QUICKLY PIVOT AND TRANSITION ALL OF OUR IN-PERSON ENGAGEMENT  
9 EFFORTS TO THE VIRTUAL WORLD. BUT THIS VIRTUAL FIRST APPROACH  
10 TRULY ALLOWED US THE OPPORTUNITY TO TRY NEW INNOVATIVE  
11 TECHNOLOGIES WHILE AT THE SAME TIME TRYING TO REACH A BROADER  
12 AUDIENCE AND WITHIN JUST A FEW WEEKS WE PLANNED AND  
13 IMPLEMENTED A COMPREHENSIVE SUITE OF ENGAGEMENT APPROACHES  
14 THAT WOULD ALLOW THE PUBLIC, REGARDLESS OF ACCESS TO THE  
15 INTERNET, THE OPPORTUNITY TO PARTICIPATE IN THIS SECOND ROUND  
16 OF OUTREACH. NEXT SLIDE. SO WE RELEASED THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT IN  
17 EARLY JULY AND WE TOOK COMMENTS THROUGH AUGUST 10TH. WE HELD  
18 25 ONLINE AND PHONE EVENTS, WITH 18 OF THOSE EVENTS HAPPENING  
19 IN THE SPAN OF LESS THAN THREE WEEKS FROM LATE JULY TO EARLY  
20 AUGUST. WE HELD NINE COUNTY FOCUSED WORKSHOPS. AND I DO WANT  
21 TO PAUSE BRIEFLY AND THANK ALL OF THE MTC COMMISSIONERS AND  
22 ABAG BOARD MEMBERS WHO ATTENDED THE WORKSHOPS. WE ALSO  
23 CONDUCTED FIVE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS, THREE OF THOSE WERE  
24 CONDUCTED IN LANGUAGES OTHER THAN ENGLISH, WE HAD ONE IN  
25 MANDARIN, ONE IN CANTONESE AND ONE IN SPANISH. AND WE ALSO



September 11, 2020

1 HELD THREE STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOPS SPECIFICALLY FOR OUR LOCAL  
2 JURISDICTION PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS. WE HAD A DIGITAL  
3 TRIBAL SUMMIT AND IN LATE SPRING WE HELD SEVEN FOCUS GROUPS  
4 WITH OUR COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION PARTNERS IN ADDITION  
5 ONLINE EVENTS WE OFFERED SEVERAL OTHER OPPORTUNITIES FOR THE  
6 PUBLIC TO PARTICIPATE INCLUDING A TELEPHONE LISTENING LINE AND  
7 ONLINE COMMENT FORM, OFFICE HOURS FOR OUR LOCAL JURISDICTION  
8 PARTNERS AND WE HOSTED AN ONLINE SURVEY AND CONDUCTED A  
9 STATISTICALLY VALID POLL. DURING OUR EVENTS WE INTERVIEWED  
10 PLANNED BAY AREA AND INTRODUCED OUTCOMES OF THE BLUEPRINT WITH  
11 A BRIEF ANIMATED VIDEO AND DURING THE SECOND PART OF THE  
12 MEETING WE CONDUCTED AN INTERACTIVE POLL TO GAUGE PARTICIPANTS  
13 SUPPORT FOR NEW OR MODIFIED STRATEGIES AND ASKED PARTICIPANTS  
14 TO PRIORITIZE THE CHALLENGES TO IDENTIFIED WHICH NEEDED TO BE  
15 ADDRESSED MOST URGENTLY IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. I ALSO WANT TO  
16 MENTION THAT THE POLL WE CONDUCTED DURING OUR EVENTS MIRRORED  
17 OUR ONLINE SURVEY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE PROMOTED ALL OF OUR  
18 ENGAGEMENT EFFORT IN VARIOUS WAYS, INCLUDING OUR WEB SITE,  
19 SOCIAL MEDIA CHANNELS, WE ALSO DID A PRESS RELEASE THAT MADE  
20 THE FRONT PAGE OF THE CHRONICLE, AS YOU CAN SEE HERE ON THIS  
21 SLIDE. WE DID A PAID DIGITAL PROMOTIONAL CAMPAIGN AND SENT E-  
22 MAIL BLASTS AND DIRECT E-MAILS TO OUR PARTNERS TO GET THE WORD  
23 OUT ON THE DIGITAL WORKSHOPS AS WELL AS PROMOTE OUR ONLINE  
24 SURVEY. WE PROMOTED OF THE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS VIA DIRECT  
25 MAIL TO OUR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN THROUGHOUT THE REGION. ALSO



September 11, 2020

1 THROUGH NEXT DOOR AND ONE OF OUR POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL  
2 MEMBERS HELPED US REACH OUT TO THE UNHOUSED COMMUNITY. IN ALL  
3 OUR PROMOTION EFFORTS RESULTED IN 19,000 PAGE VIEWS ON OUR WEB  
4 SITE AND OVER 83,000 ONLINE ENGAGEMENTS INCLUDING EVERYTHING  
5 FROM REGISTRATION IN OUR WORKSHOPS, LIKE COMMENTS, SHARES, AND  
6 CLICKS ON SOCIAL MEDIA AS WELL AS E-MAIL COMMUNICATIONS. NEXT  
7 SLIDE. AS MATT MENTIONED EARLIER, IN TOTAL WE HAD OVER 7600  
8 PEOPLE PARTICIPATE IN OUR ENGAGEMENT ACTIVITIES, AND WE  
9 RECEIVED OVER 3400 COMMENTS. I DO WANT TO NOTE THAT  
10 PARTICIPATION DURING THIS ROUND OF OUTREACH WAS MUCH MORE  
11 ROBUST THAN IN THE PAST. MAJORITY OF PARTICIPANTS STAYED FOR  
12 THE ENTIRE EVENT WHEREAS IN PERSON THEY MAY ATTEND FOR 20  
13 MINUTES PROVIDE US WITH THEIR COMMENTS THEN LEAVE. MOST FOLKS  
14 STUCK AROUND FOR THE FULL TWO HOURS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO  
15 NOW, WE'RE GOING TO SHIFT GEARS, AND I'M GOING TO SHARE THE  
16 RESULTS OF WHAT WE HEARD, AND THEN DAVE WILL PRESENT HOW THE  
17 FEEDBACK INFORMED OF THE PROPOSED REVISIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN  
18 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, WE ASKED  
19 PARTICIPANTS TO PRIORITIZE THE CHALLENGES REMAINING TO  
20 IDENTIFY WHICH NEEDED TO BE ADDRESSED MOST URGENTLY IN THE  
21 FINAL BLUEPRINT. NOW THE RESULTS THAT YOU SEE HERE ON THE  
22 SLIDE ARE ONLY FROM THE ONLINE SURVEY, THE DIGITAL WORKSHOPS,  
23 AND THE TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS. THIS DOES NOT INCLUDE THE  
24 STATISTICALLY VALID POLL WHICH WILL BE PRESENTED LATER. AS YOU  
25 CAN SEE HERE, THE CHALLENGE THAT CAME IN AT NUMBER ONE WAS





September 11, 2020

1 HOUSING UNAFFORDABILITY FOLLOWED BY GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS,  
2 CONGESTION, AND CROWDING, THE JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE AND THE  
3 PRIORITY NUMBER FIVE WAS THE DISPLACEMENT RISK. I WANT TO  
4 MENTION THAT ALL OF THE RESULTS FROM OUR SURVEY AND THE  
5 COMMENTS THAT WE HEARD FROM ALL OF OUR ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS ARE  
6 POSTED ON OUR WEB SITE AT PLANNEDBAYAREA.ORG UNDER THE "YOUR  
7 COMMENTS" TAB. I WANT TO MENTION STAFF DID READ OUTREACH  
8 COMMENTS THAT ROSE TO THE TOP FOR EACH CHALLENGE, AND THOSE  
9 ARE SUMMARIZED IN ATTACHMENT B OF YOUR PACKET. FOR THE  
10 REMAINDER OF THIS PART OF THE PRESENTATION WE'LL PRESENT THE  
11 CHALLENGES IN THE ORDER THEY ARE RANKED HERE. NEXT SLIDE  
12 PLEASE. FIRST, AND THE CHALLENGE THAT INDISPUTABLY ROSE TO THE  
13 TOP WAS HOUSING AFFORDABILITY. WHILE THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
14 STRATEGIES MADE PROGRESS ON THIS FRONT STAFF FOUND HUNDREDS OF  
15 THOUSANDS OF RESIDENTS WOULD STILL -- PRESENTED FOLKS WITH NEW  
16 OR MODIFIED STRATEGIES THEY COULD VOTE ON AS WELL AS GAVE THEM  
17 THE OPPORTUNITY TO INPUT THEIR OWN SUGGESTED STRATEGIES. AND  
18 FOR THIS PARTICULAR QUESTION WE HAD OVER 4300 RESPONDENTS AND  
19 AS YOU CAN SEE HERE THE TOP TWO VOTE-GETTERS WERE INVESTING  
20 AND CONSTRUCTING AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND EXPANDING CAPACITY FOR  
21 NEW HOUSING IN WELL-RESOURCED COMMUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
22 OUR STAFF, AND PARTICULARLY OUR PLANNING STAFF, TRULY VALUES  
23 THE PUBLIC'S INPUT, SO WE WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT SOME OF THE  
24 COMMENTS THAT HELPED SHAPE STAFF'S REVISIONS FROM THE HUNDRED  
25 THAT WE RECEIVED. FOR THIS SPECIFIC CHALLENGE, WE RECEIVED



September 11, 2020

1 OVER 560 COMMENTS AND A LOT OF WHAT WE HEARD UNDER THIS  
2 CHALLENGE WAS RELATED TO ADDRESSING WEALTH DISPARITY SUCH AS  
3 PAYING PEOPLE A LIVABLE WAGE SO THEY CAN AFFORD TO STAY IN  
4 THEIR HOMES AND IMPLEMENT BEING A UNIVERSAL BASIC INCOME SO  
5 FOLKS CAN AFFORD TO STAY IN THEIR COMMUNITY. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE  
6 VAUTIN: I'LL NOTE, AT THE END OF THE STRATEGY SECTION  
7 PRESENTATION FOR CHAIR SPERING'S REQUEST WE'LL HAVE A CHANCE  
8 FOR CLARIFYING QUESTIONS BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO THE REMAINING  
9 SECTION OF THE PRESENTATION. SO, ON THIS FIRST CHALLENGE OF  
10 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, YOU KNOW, GIVEN THE STRONG PUBLIC FEEDBACK  
11 THAT THE REGION'S NUMBER ONE CHALLENGE BY FAR IS HOUSING, AND  
12 PARTICULARLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE HAVE PROPOSED AN EXPANSIVE  
13 SET OF STRATEGY REVISIONS FOR THE AFFORDABLE GUIDING  
14 PRINCIPLE. AT THE CENTER OF THESE REVISIONS IS THE CONCEPT  
15 THAT HOUSING IS A HUMAN RIGHT, AND THAT WE NEED TO TREAT IT  
16 LIKE CRITICAL INFRASTRUCTURE. THINGS LIKE ROADS AND BRIDGES  
17 ARE ESSENTIAL FOR GETTING AROUND, IT'S ALSO ESSENTIAL THAT  
18 PEOPLE HAVE A ROOF OVER THEIR HEADS. AND WHILE THE DRAFT  
19 BLUEPRINT INCREASED THE AMOUNT OF DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE  
20 HOUSING BY A FACTOR OF FIVE, FROM 100,000 UNITS TO MORE THAN  
21 500,000 UNITS, THAT DIDN'T COME CLOSE TO MEETING THE REGIONAL  
22 NEEDS. SO IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WE PROPOSED TO EXPAND THE NEW  
23 REVENUE ASSUMPTIONS FROM A WIDE SUITE OF LOCAL, REGIONAL,  
24 STATE, AND FEDERAL AND OTHER SOURCES TO A MUCH GREATER DEGREE.  
25 GENERATING 110 BILLION FOR MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION,



September 11, 2020

1 AND 120 BILLION MORE FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRESERVATION. THIS  
2 APPROACH ADVANCES TWO CORE TENANTS IN PARALLEL, THAT WE WANT  
3 TO ADVANCE FAIR HOUSING, WITH MORE PRODUCTION IN HISTORICALLY  
4 EXCLUSIVE HIGH RESOURCE AREAS, BUT ALSO, PRESERVE EXISTING OR  
5 UNSUBSIDIZED OR SOME CALL IT NATURALLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING SO  
6 THAT EXISTING LOW INCOME AND COMMUNITIES OF COLOR ARE NOT  
7 DISPLACED. WITH THOSE MUCH MORE ROBUST FUNDING LEVELS WE  
8 BELIEVE WE WILL BE ABLE TO HOUSE ALL LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS BY  
9 2050 INCLUDING OUR CURRENTLY UNHOUSED POPULATION WHICH YOU  
10 WILL SEE IN THE POLL WAS A MAJOR ISSUE OF CONCERN FOR BAY AREA  
11 RESIDENTS. THAT'S NOT ALL, THOUGH, WE ARE ALSO WORKING TO  
12 TACKLE THE INCOME SIDE OF THE AFFORDABILITY EQUATION BRINGING  
13 BACK A UNIVERSAL BASIC INCOME STRATEGY, THAT WAS FEATURED IN  
14 THE HORIZON INITIATIVE AS A TENT POLE FOR THE EXPANDED ECONOMY  
15 ELEMENT. AND WITH THESE LOWER HOUSING COSTS AND INCREASED  
16 INCOMES, WE BELIEVE WE CAN MAKE MORE HEADWAY IN THE FINAL  
17 BLUEPRINT TOWARDS HOUSING AFFORDABILITY. LASTLY WE KNOW THAT  
18 NON-TRADITIONAL TACTICS ARE GOING TO BE REQUIRED TO EXPEDITE  
19 ACTION BUILDING ON THE STREAMLINING STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT  
20 BLUEPRINT WE HAVE INCORPORATED A NEW STRATEGY TO ACCELERATING  
21 AND DEVELOPMENT PUBLIC LAND. WE ARE DOING THIS WEAVING IN MORE  
22 GREEN SPACE TO INCLUDE COMMUNITIES WHERE THERE ARE PARKS,  
23 TRAILS AND RECREATION ELEMENTS AND THAT'S FEATURED IN THE  
24 ENVIRONMENTAL ELEMENT OF THE PLAN. NEXT SLIDE.  
25



September 11, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** THE NEXT CHALLENGE THAT ROSE TO THE TOP WAS THE  
2 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ONLY GETS US  
3 HALFWAY TO OUR STATUTORY CLIMATE TARGET. SO WE ASKED HOW TO  
4 MAKE FURTHER PROGRESS IN REDUCING EMISSIONS. FOR THIS QUESTION  
5 WE HAD OVER 4200 RESPONDENTS AND THE TOP TWO VOTE-GETTERS WERE  
6 REQUIRING EMPLOYERS TO IMPLEMENT MANDATORY WORK FROM HOME  
7 POLICIES THERE WAS SUPPORT FOR THAT IN THE COMMENTS AS WELL AS  
8 EXPANDING VEHICLE AND ELECTRIC CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE  
9 FACILITIES ESPECIALLY FOR LOWER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE.  
10 FOR THIS CHALLENGE, WE RECEIVED OVER 750 COMMENTS, DEFINITELY  
11 THE MOST OUT OF ALL THE CHALLENGES, AND THESE ARE SOME OF THE  
12 COMMENTS THAT WE WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT, FOR EXAMPLE, "INCREASE  
13 DENSITY TO MAKE MASS TRANSIT MORE EFFECTIVE AND EFFICIENT  
14 WHICH LOWERS THE VEHICLE MILES THAT CAUSE GREENHOUSE GASSES."  
15 NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE VAUTIN: SO WITH THE CLIMATE TARGET AT THE  
16 CORE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 MAKING FURTHER HEADWAY ON THIS  
17 CHALLENGE IS ESPECIALLY CRITICAL. FAILURE TO ACHIEVE THE  
18 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGET WILL RESULT IN THE BAY AREA LOSING AT  
19 LEAST \$100 MILLION OF STATE TRANSPORTATION MONEY EVERY YEAR  
20 STARTING IN 2022. AND EVEN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WHICH HAD NO  
21 HIGHWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS A FOCUSED ROBUST GROWTH AND MODERN  
22 COULDN'T GET THERE AND THAT'S WHY WE'RE TAKING I CALL  
23 "EVERYTHING INCLUDING THE KITCHEN SINK APPROACH" THROWING ALL  
24 STRATEGIES AT THIS PROBLEM TO TACKLE THIS INCREDIBLY DIFFICULT  
25 TARGET. GOOD NEWS IS THERE IS PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR BOLD ACTION



September 11, 2020

1 ON CLIMATE CHANGE AND THE REVISIONS HERE REFLECT WHAT WE HAVE  
2 HEARD FROM THE PUBLIC IT ALL STARTS WITH ELECTRIFICATION  
3 EXPANDING THE AMOUNT OF TRANSPORTATION FUNDING WE PUT TOWARDS  
4 ELECTRIFICATION BY A FACTOR OF EIGHT WITH A SPECIAL EMPHASIS  
5 ON STEEPER DISCOUNTS FOR LOWER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS TO ENSURE OUR  
6 ELECTRIFICATION APPROACH DOESN'T JUST BENEFIT THOSE AT THE  
7 HIGHER END OF THE INCOME SPECTRUM. SECOND WE HAVE GONE BOLD ON  
8 TELECOMMUTING AS WELL IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND THERE IS  
9 STRONG SUPPORT FROM STAKEHOLDERS AND CITIES AND THE PUBLIC AS  
10 WELL. INCORPORATING A NEW STRATEGY THAT BY YEAR 2035 MAJOR  
11 OFFICE SPACE EMPLOYERS WOULD WORK TOWARDS A 60 PERCENT  
12 TELECOMMUTE SHARE FOR A TYPICAL WORK DAY. AGAIN WE KNOW THE  
13 STRATEGY ON ITS OWN IS NOT GOING TO ACHIEVE EQUITABLE OUTCOMES  
14 THAT'S WHY IT'S IMPORTANT TO PAIR IT WITH HIGH SPEED INTERNET  
15 SUBSIDIES AND RELATED INFRASTRUCTURE TO TARGET AND ADDRESS  
16 KNOWN DISPARITIES. A NOTE OF CAUTION HERE IS VERY IMPORTANT.  
17 LESS THAN A QUARTER OF ALL TRIPS IN THE BAY AREA ARE COMMUTE  
18 TRIPS STOLE COMMUTING IS A GOOD PIECE OF THE PUZZLE MOVES US  
19 IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION BUT IS NOT A PAN SEE A THIRD, WE PRICED  
20 THE REGION'S LIMITED ROADWAY CAPACITY AS AN ESSENTIAL PART OF  
21 MAKING PROGRESS ON GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSION IN THE DRAFT  
22 BLUEPRINT INCLUDING PEAK AND ALTERNATIVE MODES. BECAUSE WE  
23 HAVE INTEGRATED NEW HIGHWAY STRATEGIES INTO THE FINAL  
24 BLUEPRINT TO ADDRESS CONGESTED CORRIDORS EXPANDING ADDITIONAL  
25 CORRIDORS SEVERED BY RAIL ALTERNATIVES IS ESSENTIAL TO REDUCE



September 11, 2020

1 GREENHOUSE GAS MISS. AND WE RECOGNIZE EQUITY HERE AND HAVE  
2 INCLUDED MEANS-BASED FARES IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT MINIMIZING  
3 IMPACTS FOR LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS AND RESULTS IN THE LION'S  
4 SHARE OF TOLL REVENUE COMING FROM HIGHER INCOME HOUSEHOLDS  
5 FOURTH WE HAVE CONTINUED TO REFINE THE HOUSING AND ECONOMY  
6 STRATEGIES TO EEK OUT A BIT MORE IN TERMS OF EMISSIONS  
7 REDUCTION FOCUSING MORE ON TRANSIT-RICH HIGH RESOURCE AREAS WE  
8 HAVE INTEGRATED NON-TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES INTO THE  
9 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT OF COURSE UNDER STATE LAW WE CAN'T TAKE  
10 CREDIT FOR ANY OF THOSE STRATEGIES SB 375 FOCUSES ONLY ON  
11 EMISSIONS, EMISSIONS FROM CARS AND LIGHT DUTY TRUCKS. WE HAVE  
12 INCORPORATED FROM HOMES AND BUSINESS FACILITIES BECAUSE WE  
13 THOSE ACCOUNT FOR SECOND HIGHEST SOURCE OF CARBON EMISSIONS IN  
14 THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS GRAPHIC HERE SHOWS OUR HIGH  
15 LEVEL GAME PLAN ON HOW TO GET TO THE REALLY DIFFICULT 19  
16 PERCENT TARGET AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE WE HAVE NOT YET  
17 CONDUCTED ANALYSIS ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT THIS IS LEVELED TO  
18 HELP UNDERSTAND THE RELATIVE MAGNITUDE OF THESE DIFFERENT  
19 STRATEGIES. WE THINK WITH THE STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN TODAY'S  
20 TACT THAT WE CAN JUST BARELY GET TO THE 19 PERCENT TARGET WITH  
21 THE STRATEGIES IN PLAY. LET ME WALK THROUGH THE GRAPHIC. TO  
22 GIVE YOU A SENSE OF WHAT MOVES THE NEEDLE. IT ALL STARTS WITH  
23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 SOME HAVE ASKED WHAT IF WE JUST  
24 READOPTED THE LAST PLAN HOW FAR WOULD THAT GET US? WITH GAS  
25 PRICE NOT GOING UP AS ANTICIPATED THE PREVIOUS PLAN WHICH DID



September 11, 2020

1 MEET THE GHG TARGET AT THE TIME WOULD ONLY ACHIEVE A ONE POINT  
2 REDUCTION FAR FROM THE 19 PERCENT TARGET THIS LEAVES AN 18  
3 POINT GAP SO IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT WE ACHIEVED EIGHT POINTS  
4 MORE OF REDUCTION DRIVEN PRIMARILY BY TWO KEY STRATEGY PRICING  
5 THE REGION'S FREEWAYS, AND REDUCING SPEED LIMITS TO A MORE  
6 OPTIMAL SPEED FOR EMISSIONS. THAT GOT US TO A NINE POINT  
7 RESULT. IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT PHASE WE'RE CONTINUING TO WORK  
8 WITH THE STATE TO BETTER ALIGN THE COST OF DRIVING WITH OTHER  
9 METROPOLITAN AREAS TO LEVEL THE PLAYING FIELD WHICH SHOULD  
10 MOVE US CLOSER TO THE TARGET BUT STILL LEAVE A SEVEN POINT GAP  
11 THAT'S WHERE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT STRATEGIES YOU HEARD ABOUT  
12 TODAY IN. THE TELECOMMUTING REQUIREMENTS ELECTRIFICATION  
13 FUNDING AND MORE NEED TO MOVE US NOT ONLY TO THE TARGET BUT  
14 PAST IT BECAUSE WE NEED TO OFFSET TWO POINTS OF EMISSIONS  
15 INCREASES CAUSED BY THE REGION'S ROADWAY INVESTMENTS. NEXT  
16 SLIDE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THE NEXT CHALLENGE THAT ROSE TO THE TOP WAS  
19 CONGESTION AND CROWDING. AND THE FINDINGS FROM THE DRAFT  
20 BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS SHOWED SOME KEY CORRIDORS MADE PROGRESS IN  
21 THESE TWO AREAS BUT OTHERS DID NOT. WE ASKED THE PUBLIC HOW  
22 NEW OR EXPANDED STRATEGIES WOULD BETTER ADDRESS TRAFFIC  
23 CONGESTION AND TRANSIT OVERCROWDING IN THE FUTURE. AND FOR  
24 THIS QUESTION WE HAD OVER 4400 RESPONDENTS. AS YOU CAN SEE  
25 HERE, THE TOP TWO VOTE-GETTERS WERE REDESIGNING TRANSIT TO



September 11, 2020

1 OFFER A SEAMLESS EXPERIENCE AND EXPANDING REGIONAL RAIL  
2 SERVICES TO NEW COMMUNITIES AND INCREASING THE FREQUENCY OF  
3 THAT SERVICE. IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THERE IS EQUALLY LITTLE  
4 SUPPORT FOR WIDENING HIGHWAYS AND EXPANDING INTERCHANGES AS  
5 THERE IS FOR IMPLEMENTING ALL LANE TOLLING ON THE FREEWAYS.  
6 NEXT SLIDE. WE RECEIVED OVER 450 COMMENTS FOR THIS CHALLENGE,  
7 AND THE THEMES THAT ROSE TO THE TOP INCLUDED STRONG SUPPORT  
8 FOR COORDINATING IMPROVING TRANSIT SERVICE AS WELL AS STRONG  
9 SUPPORT FOR PRIORITIZING COMPLETE STREETS. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE  
10 VAUTIN: MANY OF THE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES IN THE FINAL  
11 BLUEPRINT WERE INFORMED BY COMMISSION ACTION IN LATE JULY  
12 WHICH IDENTIFIED REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY ASSUMPTIONS WE WORKED  
13 TO WEAVE PROJECTS INTO STRATEGIES THAT CREATED AN INTEGRATED  
14 NETWORK FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT I WANT TO UNDERScore STRICTEST  
15 FOR THE TRANSPORTATION PORTION OF THE PLAN DUE TO FEDERAL AND  
16 STATE REQUIREMENTS JUST TO HIGHLIGHT A FEW OF THE KEY  
17 REVISIONS FROM THE DRAFT WE HAVE DOUBLED DOWN ON MORE FUNDING  
18 FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS INCLUDING THOSE FREQUENCY BOOSTS FOR  
19 ALL PDAS AND OTHER OVER CROWDED SYSTEMS AND FUNDING FOR  
20 EXPANSIONS NEW RAIL LINES TO PLACES LIKE THE TRI-VALLEY  
21 DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE NORTH SAN JOSE AND CUPERTINO DOWNTOWN SAN  
22 FRANCISCO AND ACROSS THE BAY BRIDGE AND DUMBARTON CORRIDORS.  
23 EXPANDING ON THE POPULAR SEAMLESS STRATEGY WAS ALSO A KEY AREA  
24 FOR REVISIONS IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT GOING BEYOND TRIP  
25 PLANNING AND FARE PAYMENT TO INCLUDE SCHEDULE COORDINATION





September 11, 2020

1 WITH ROUGHLY 10 TO 15 TIMED TRANSFER HUBS ACROSS THE BAY AREA  
2 AND IT'S A GOOD EXAMPLE THIS WOULD BE DIRIDON STATION IN SAN  
3 JOSE. FINAL BLUEPRINT INCLUDES FUNDING FOR BIKING AND WALKING  
4 THANKS TO COMMITMENTS BY COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES WHO  
5 HELPED PUSH US OVER 10,000 MILES OF PROTECTED BIKE LANES AND  
6 PATHS IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WHICH HELPS TO ADDRESS THE  
7 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS FROM THOSE LOCAL TRIPS AS TRAFFIC  
8 CONGESTION. AND WE HAVE INTEGRATED LIMITS INVESTMENTS IN  
9 HIGHWAYS AND IMPROVEMENT IN EXPRESS LANES AND TACKLING  
10 BOTTLENECK IMPACTING ON THE CLIMATE WITH THE EXPANDING CLIMATE  
11 STRATEGIES LAID OUT EARLIER. THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS AND  
12 STRATEGIES NESTED WITHIN IS INCLUDED IN ATTACHMENT A. WHEN WE  
13 SAY BIG, WE MEAN REALLY BIG, \$2 BILLION PLUS PROJECTS IN FACT  
14 WE TRIED TO FIT ALL OF THE BILLION DOLLARS PROJECTS ON THE  
15 SLIDE AND THEY JUST DON'T FIT THIS IS NOT ENOUGH ROOM. SO,  
16 I'LL HIGHLIGHT KEY INVESTMENTS REGION WIDE, THE EXPRESS BUS  
17 AND EXPRESS LANE NETWORK SET OF IMPROVEMENTS TO EXISTING BUS  
18 LINES NEW PREMIUM SERVICES AND EXPRESS LANES THAT CUT ACROSS  
19 MANY COUNTIES TO PROVIDE THAT CONGESTION FREE ALTERNATIVE BY  
20 EXPRESS BUS. IN THE SOUTH BAY SOME OF THE KEY MULTI-BILLION  
21 DOLLARS INVESTMENTS INCLUDE PROJECTS LIKE BART TO SILICON  
22 VALLEY PHASE TWO DIRIDON STATION AND SEPARATIONS ON THE  
23 CALTRAIN LINE STEVEN'S CREEK AND MODERNIZATION FROM DIRIDON TO  
24 SAN JOSE TO SPEED IT UP AND GET IT MOVING FASTER. ON SAN  
25 FRANCISCO AND -- SAN FRANCISCO AND LONG THE PENINSULA TO



September 11, 2020

1 IMPROVE FREQUENCIES HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO. IN TERMS OF  
2 TRANSBAY PROJECTS FINAL PLAN INCLUDES TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING  
3 AS WELL AS BART CORE CAPACITY AND RAPID TRANSIT LINE KEY  
4 PROJECTS INCLUDE VALLEY LINK AND IMPROVEMENTS TO AC TRANSIT  
5 SYSTEM TO ADVANCE EQUITY WITH LOCAL AND RAPID SERVICES IN  
6 NORTH BAY LARGEST PROJECT THERE WOULD BE THE ELEVATION AND  
7 RESILIENCE IMPROVEMENTS STATE ROUTE 37 CORRIDOR. AND SINCE  
8 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT BIG PROJECTS I WOULD BE REMISS IF I DIDN'T  
9 TALK ABOUT THE BIGGEST PROJECT IN THE STATE WHICH IS  
10 CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED RAIL OF COURSE AN \$80 BILLION PLUS  
11 PROJECTS FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO LOS ANGELES. MUCH OF THE  
12 FUNDING FROM HIGH SPEED RAIL WILL COME FROM THE STATE THERE  
13 ARE PROJECTS THAT WILL HELP ADVANCE HIGH SPEED IMPLEMENTATION  
14 INCLUDING THE REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING ASSUMPTIONS ALONG  
15 THE CALTRAIN CORRIDOR FROM SAN FRANCISCO ALL THE WAY DOWN  
16 THROUGH SANTA CLARA COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THE NEXT CHALLENGE IS THE JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE  
19 WHICH WAS SOMEWHAT REDUCED BY THE STRATEGIES INCLUDED IN THE  
20 DRAFT BLUEPRINT, BUT THERE IS DEFINITELY NEED FOR ADDITIONAL  
21 PROGRESS ON THIS FRONT. SO WE ASKED HOW MORE AMBITIOUS  
22 ECONOMIC STRATEGIES COULD SHIFT JOBS CLOSER TO EXISTING  
23 HOUSING-RICH COMMUNITIES. AND WE HAD OVER 4200 RESPONDENTS FOR  
24 THIS QUESTION. AND THE TOP TWO STRATEGIES WERE PROVIDING TAX  
25 SUBSIDIES FOR EMPLOYERS TO RELOCATE MIDDLE WAGE JOBS CLOSER TO



September 11, 2020

1 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND EXPANDING BUSINESS INCUBATOR PROGRAMS  
2 TO INCLUDE SMALL BUSINESS IN COMMUNITIES. THERE IS SUPPORT FOR  
3 INCUBATOR PROGRAMS IN THE COMMENTS. THIS IS DATA FROM THE  
4 ONLINE SURVEY, THE DIGITAL WORKSHOPS AND TELEPHONE TOWN HALLS  
5 IT DOESN'T INCLUDE THE STATISTICALLY VALID POLL. NEXT SLIDE.  
6 FOR THIS QUESTION, WE RECEIVED OVER 550 COMMENTS WHICH  
7 INCLUDED COMMENTS LIKE BUSINESSES SHOULD BE GIVEN TAX  
8 INCENTIVES TO DISTRIBUTE THEMSELVES TO MORE EQUITABLE PAY,  
9 ACCESS TO BETTER PAYING JOBS, JOB TRAINING FOR BETTER PAYING  
10 JOBS. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE VAUTIN: WE RECOGNIZE HOW HARD THIS  
11 CHALLENGE WILL BE TO OVERCOME IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT IN FACT  
12 IN THE POST COVID ERA WHERE TELECOMMUTING MAY BE MORE COMMON  
13 THAN EVER BEFORE IT CAN ALSO LEAD TO SMALLER OFFICE FOOTPRINTS  
14 AND NEED FOR LESS BUILDING OF OFFICE COMPLEX. DESPITE ALL THAT  
15 WE'RE GIVING IT ANOTHER TRY IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AS THE  
16 STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT WERE TOO BIG TO MAKE MUCH HEADWAY ON  
17 THIS PROBLEM FIRST RECOGNIZING BROADER SUPPORT FOR CARROT-  
18 BASED APPROACH WE HAVE ELIMINATED THE REGIONAL IMPACT  
19 STRATEGIES INCREASED TAX ASSUMPTIONS AND USED THOSE REVENUE TO  
20 PAY FOR TAX INCENTIVES TO PAY FOR GROWTH IN HOUSING-RICH  
21 TRANSIT AREAS SUCH AS EAST BAY BART STATIONS SECOND EXPANDED  
22 THE BUSINESS INCUBATOR PROGRAM TO INCLUDE JOB CENTERS WHICH  
23 CAN HELP ADDRESS RACIAL AND ECONOMIC INEQUITIES PERVASIVE  
24 ACROSS THE BAY AREA AND WHILE THE PLAN INCLUDES HUNDREDS OF  
25 BILLIONS FOR INFRASTRUCTURE IT HAD NOT YET INTEGRATED



September 11, 2020

1 INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING TO HELP PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS WITH  
2 NON-TRANSPORTATION NEEDS WHICH ARE QUITE SIZABLE. SOME WILL  
3 NOT GROW WITHOUT PUBLIC SECTOR INVESTMENT. NEXT SLIDE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THE CHALLENGE THAT CAME IN AT NUMBER FIVE WAS THE  
6 DISPLACEMENT RISK CHALLENGE DISSIPATE EXPANDED RENTER  
7 PROTECTIONS AND ADDITIONAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING THE DRAFT  
8 BLUEPRINT FOUND THE RISK FOR DISPLACEMENT CONTINUES TO GROW  
9 OVER TIME. SO WE ASKED HOW CAN NEW OR EXPANDED STRATEGIES  
10 FURTHER ENSURE THAT LOW INCOME RESIDENTS IN COMMUNITIES OF  
11 COLOR ARE NOT ULTIMATELY DISPLACED TO AREAS WITH LIMITED  
12 ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY. NOW FOR THIS QUESTION WE HAD OVER 4400  
13 RESPONDENTS AND THE TWO STRATEGIES THAT ROSE TO THE TOP WERE  
14 EXPANDING INVESTMENT IN THE PRESERVATION OF PERMANENTLY  
15 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND ENSURING AMPLE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS  
16 BUILT IN COMMUNITIES MOST AT-RISK OF DISPLACEMENT. NEXT SLIDE.  
17 FOR THIS CHALLENGE, WE RECEIVED NEARLY 500 COMMENTS, AND  
18 AROUND THIS CHALLENGE WE ALSO ALREADY HAVE A LOT OF COMMENTS  
19 ABOUT ADDRESSING A WEALTH DISPARITIES. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE  
20 VAUTIN: WE WORKED TO PLACE EQUITY AT THE CORE OF ALL OF THE  
21 STRATEGIES IN THE BLUEPRINT BUT WE REALIZED AT THE CONCLUSION  
22 OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT PHASE WE WEREN'T GOING FAR ENOUGH WITH  
23 SOME STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THE LEGACY OF DECADES OF RACIAL AND  
24 ECONOMIC EXCLUSION. SO WE HAVE MADE SOME KEY REVISIONS HERE  
25 RELATED TO DISPLACEMENT RISK BUT ALSO GOING BEYOND IT ALL



September 11, 2020

1 STARTS WITH NEW PROGRAMS IN THE HOUSING ELEMENT OF THE FINAL  
2 BLUEPRINT TO GROW PATHWAYS TO ECONOMIC SECURITY THROUGH  
3 MORTGAGE RENTAL AND SMALL BUSINESS ASSISTANCE IN COMMUNITIES  
4 OF COLOR. SECOND, THE PRESERVATION STRATEGIES PREVIOUSLY  
5 HIGHLIGHTED CAN HELP TO ENABLE MANY MORE LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS  
6 TO REMAIN IN PLACE AND HOPEFULLY BRING DOWN THIS ELEVATED  
7 METRIC FOR DISPLACEMENT RISK IN THE NEXT CYCLE. THIRD, WE HAVE  
8 CREATED A NEW STRATEGY TO DIRECTLY INVEST IN LOW INCOME  
9 COMMUNITIES OF COLOR BY FUNDING THEM DIRECTLY AND ENABLING  
10 THEM TO PRIORITIZE THE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS THAT THEY  
11 WANT TO PRIORITIZE MOST. AND LASTLY, WE HAVE ADDED FUNDING TO  
12 THE RENTER PROTECTION STRATEGY TO COMPARE STRICT RENT CONTROL  
13 AND LEGAL AID TO ENFORCE STRATEGIES FOR TENANTS. NEXT SLIDE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** OUR COLLEAGUES WILL BE PRESENTING THE RESULTS OF THE  
16 STATISTICALLY VALID POLL IN MAINTAIN BUT WE WANT TO PROVIDE A  
17 QUICK PREVIEW THE RESULTS IN OUR ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS.  
18 STATISTICALLY VALID POLL ENGAGED SUPPORT FOR THE STRATEGIES  
19 INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT SO THIS IS NOT AN APPLES TO  
20 APPLES COMPARISON SINCE WE PROPOSED FOLKS WITH NEW OR REVISED  
21 STRATEGIES. BUT WE WERE ABLE TO GLEAN SIMILARITIES AND  
22 DIFFERENCES WITHOUT A DOUBT IN BOTH EFFORTS HOUSING IS THE TOP  
23 CONCERN AND AS YOU CAN SEE HERE OTHER SIMILARITIES INCLUDE  
24 STRONG SUPPORT FOR SEAMLESS TRANSIT AND COMPLETE STREETS.  
25 THERE WAS LIMITED SUPPORT FOR ALL LANE TOLLING IN BOTH EFFORTS



September 11, 2020

1 AND THEN SUPPORT FOR EV INCENTIVES AND BUSINESS INCUBATORS.  
2 AND THE DIFFERENCES WERE MINOR, BUT THERE WAS STILL A COUPLE.  
3 THERE WAS GREATER SUPPORT IN THE POLL, THE STATISTICALLY VALID  
4 POLL FOR REBUILDING INTERCHANGES AND FOR EXPANDING JOB  
5 TRAINING. NEXT SLIDE. >DAVE VAUTIN: PER CHAIR SPERING'S  
6 REQUEST AT THE END OF THIS SLIDE WE'LL PAUSE FOR QUESTIONS ON  
7 THE STRATEGIES BEFORE MOVING TO THE REMAINING SLIDES ON THE  
8 GEOGRAPHIES AND NEXT STEPS. TO SUMMARIZE WHAT YOU JUST HEARD,  
9 THESE REVISIONS REFLECT THE CORE OF THE CHANGES IN THE FINAL  
10 BLUEPRINT PHASE WHERE WE BUILD ON THE FOUNDATION FROM THE  
11 DRAFT BLUEPRINT AND GO FROM 25 STRATEGIES IN THE DRAFT TO 35  
12 STRATEGIES IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT WITH THAT SAME FOCUS FROM  
13 HORIZON. EQUITY, AND RESILIENCE. SO, AGAIN JUST TO RECAP FOR  
14 THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF THE PLAN, KEY REVISIONS WHERE  
15 THOSE NEW COMMUNITY LEAD, UPGRADES FOR TRANSFER HUBS TO  
16 FURTHER EXPAND THE SEAMLESS VISION, 100 BILLION PLUS IN NEW  
17 NEXT GENERATION TRANSIT NETWORK IMPROVEMENTS WITH EXPRESS  
18 BUSES CONNECTING EVERY BAY AREA COUNTY NEW SOUTH BAY RAIL  
19 LINES NEW RAIL CROSSING VALLEY LINK CONNECTION AND BEYOND  
20 10,000 MILES OF BIKE INFRASTRUCTURE AND ADDRESSING KEY  
21 BOTTLENECK HOUSING ON THE FRONT THAT VASTLY EXPANDED FUNDING  
22 FOR PRESERVATION AND PRODUCTION AND THE TARGET ON RENTAL  
23 ASSISTANCE AND APPROACHES TO PRODUCE AFFORDABLE HOUSING  
24 FASTER. ON THE ECONOMY FRONT A 500 THERE A MONTH UNIVERSAL  
25 BASIC INCOME NEW JOB TRAINING PROGRAMS NEW INTERNET SUBSIDIES



September 11, 2020

1 NEW TAX INCENTIVES TO ENCOURAGE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT -- OFFICE  
2 DEVELOPMENT IN HOUSING COMMUNITIES INDUSTRIAL LENSES AND  
3 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT REFINEMENTS TO SEA LEVEL RISE PROTECTIONS  
4 EXPANDED RETROFITS EXPANDED FOR NEW AND MODERNIZED PARKS AND  
5 BOLD NEW CLIMATE INITIATIVES IT'S THROUGH THESE SET OF ACTIONS  
6 WE'RE WORKING TO MAKE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FINAL BLUEPRINT  
7 FULLY LIVE UP TO THE ADOPTED VISION. I'LL PAUSE THERE AND SEE  
8 IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS. IS

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU LESLIE AND DAVE. LET'S  
11 SEE IF WE HAVE QUESTIONS BEFORE WE MOVE ON. I WANT TO ASK  
12 DAVE, WHEN I SEE COMMENTS LIKE "REDESIGN TRANSIT AND SEAMLESS"  
13 WHAT'S THE EXPECTATION? ARE YOU SEEING ANY FRUSTRATION WITH  
14 THE NUMBER OF TRANSIT AGENCIES? OR, HOW DO WE INTERPRET THAT  
15 STATEMENT, "REDESIGN TRANSIT"? >DAVE VAUTIN: WITH REGARDS TO  
16 THAT STRATEGY, I THINK WE'RE TRYING TO LEAVE IT OPEN FOR THE  
17 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE TO FURTHER IDENTIFY THOSE ACTIONS. I  
18 THINK THE CHALLENGES WE SEE ARE MORE ABOUT CONNECTIONS BETWEEN  
19 SYSTEMS, AND NOT NECESSARILY WHETHER THEY'RE -- WHAT NUMBER OF  
20 AGENCIES THERE ARE, BUT THE FACT THAT THEY NEED TO BE  
21 SEAMLESSLY TIMED AND TRANSFERS BETWEEN THEM THOUGHTFULLY  
22 OPTIMIZED SO THAT WAY WE HAVE THE BEST RIDERSHIP EXPERIENCE.

23



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. COMMITTEE  
2 MEMBERS, I DON'T SEE ANY HANDS RAISED. OH NICK JOSEFOWITZ.  
3 COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ?

4

5 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. 60 -- THE REQUIREMENT TO HAVE  
6 60 PERCENT OF OFFICE WORKERS STAY AT HOME EVERY DAY, IT FEELS  
7 LIKE IT'S INCREDIBLE -- IT'S SORT OF AN INCREDIBLY INTRUSIVE  
8 WAY OF SORT OF GETTING AT THE GOAL YOU'RE TRYING TO GET AT  
9 WHICH IS PRESUMABLY REDUCE TRIPS. AND IT FEELS LIKE, YOU KNOW,  
10 THERE ARE OTHER EXAMPLES, WHICH YOU EVEN MENTION IN YOUR -- IN  
11 OTHER AREAS LIKE "TRIP CAPS" FOR INSTANCE, OR, YOU KNOW,  
12 PARKING SPACE CAPS, OR THINGS LIKE THAT. WHICH WOULD GIVE  
13 PEOPLE THE OPTION OF CARPOOLING OR TAKING TRANSIT OR BIKING TO  
14 WORK, OR WALKING TO WORK. IF THEY WANTED TO GO INTO, WHO, AND  
15 NOT FORCING PEOPLE TO STAY IN THEIR HOMES THREE DAYS A WEEK,  
16 IF THEY WORK IN AN OFFICE. >DAVE VAUTIN: LET ME CLARIFY A FEW  
17 THINGS. I THINK THAT'S A FAIR COMMENT, JUST TO PROVIDE  
18 CONTEXT, WE ACTUALLY INCLUDED TRIP CAPS IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT  
19 AND THAT WASN'T ENOUGH TO GET US TO THE TARGET. SO WE HAVE TO  
20 TRY TO GO FURTHER IF WE'RE GOING TO GET TO THIS AMBITIOUS  
21 TARGET WE'RE NOT SAYING THIS IS A PRESCRIPTIVE THING WHERE  
22 EVERY EMPLOYEE WOULD WORK THREE DAYS A WEEK AND TWO DAYS FROM  
23 HOME. THERE WERE GOALS WHERE SOME EMPLOYEES WILL COME INTO THE  
24 OFFICE MORE SOME WILL COME IN LESS. THERE ARE DIFFERENT WAYS  
25 IT COULD BE OPERATIONALIZED. OUR GOAL HERE IS WE GOT A LOT OF





September 11, 2020

1 FEEDBACK THAT A 14 PERCENT TELECOMMUTE SHARE WHICH IS OUR  
2 PROJECTIONS FOR THE OVERALL REGION IF WE DON'T INTERVENE WAS  
3 TOO LOW. PEOPLE WANTED US TO DO MORE AND WITH THIS 60 PERCENT  
4 REQUIREMENT ON MAJOR OFFICE EMPLOYERS WE THINK WE COULD GET  
5 THE OVERALL MODE SHARE TO ABOUT 25 PERCENT OF WORKERS. SO  
6 THAT'S WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO WORK TOWARDS.

7

8 **COM. NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I MEAN, I JUST GOT TO SAY, LIKE, IT  
9 REALLY DOESN'T SIT WITH ME, AT ALL. LIKE, I THINK -- YOU KNOW,  
10 YOU COULD JUST RAMP UP THE TRIP CAP AND MAKE IT MORE  
11 AGGRESSIVE FOR LARGE EMPLOYERS IF YOU WANTED TO DEAL WITH  
12 THIS. YOU KNOW I'M JUST CONCERNED -- I THINK THAT LIKE, SOME  
13 ASPECTS OF TELECOMMUTING ARE REALLY POWERFUL, BUT YOU DON'T  
14 WANT TO END UP IN A SITUATION WHERE LIKE, YOU KNOW, THE  
15 WEALTHY OFFICE WORKERS ARE JUST KIND OF, YOU KNOW, LOUNGING AT  
16 HOME IN THEIR HOMES IT'S ALMOST FUTILE AND EVERYONE ELSE HAS  
17 TO GO INTO WORK AND WE'RE KIND OF CREATING THIS INCREDIBLY TWO  
18 TIERED SYSTEM. AND SO I JUST REALLY FEEL THAT WE CAN -- IF  
19 WE'RE -- SO MANY OF THESE PROGRAMS ARE VERY, VERY BOLD, THAT  
20 WE COULD TAKE SOMETHING LIKE A TRIP CAP PROGRAM OR A PARKING  
21 SPACE PROGRAM -- OR FOCUS BEING ON PARKING SPACES, AND REALLY  
22 RATCHET THOSE PROJECTS UP IN A WAY THAT PROVIDES PEOPLE WITH  
23 LOTS OF OPTIONS FOR HOW TO LEAD THEIR LIVES.

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. MAYOR LICCARDO. SAM.



September 11, 2020

1

2 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU JIM. HEY, APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK AND  
3 THE PRESENTATION. YOU DESCRIBED \$15 BILLION FOR INVESTMENT FOR  
4 HIGH SPEED RAIL. CAN I ASK YOU TO BE AS SPECIFIC AS POSSIBLE -  
5 - AND OBVIOUSLY I KNOW NONE OF IT IS ACTUALLY DESIGNATED FOR  
6 HIGH SPEED RAIL. IT'S DESIGNATED FOR OTHER PROJECTS WHETHER  
7 IT'S MAJOR STATION IN SAN FRANCISCO OR SAN JOSE, OR CALTRAIN,  
8 GRADE SEPARATIONS OR WHATEVER IT MIGHT BE, ELECTRIFICATION,  
9 BUT IS THERE ANY PART OF THAT 15 BILLION THAT SPECIFICALLY  
10 SERVES TO GET HIGH SPEED RAIL OVER THE PACHECO PASS AND INTO  
11 THE LOCATION AT DIRIDON WHERE IT CAN FINALLY CONNECT WITH ALL  
12 OF THE REGIONAL RAIL SYSTEMS AT THAT STATION, WHICH WOULD BE  
13 BART, CALTRAIN, ACE, CAPITAL RAIL, ALL THE SYSTEMS, MINDING  
14 FROM HIGH SPEED RAIL THAT'S A \$13 BILLION PROGRAM THAT THEY'RE  
15 TRYING TO SOLVE AND RIGHT NOW THEY HAVE ZERO FOR T THEY MADE  
16 VERY CLEAR TO ME THAT THAT TRAIN IS NOT GOING TO COME TO THE  
17 BAY AREA UNLESS THERE IS A REGIONAL COMMITMENT TO HELP SOLVE  
18 THAT PROBLEM OF HOW TO GET HIGH SPEED RAIL OVER THE PACHECO  
19 PASS TO THAT LOCATION, WHERE IT CAN CONNECT WITH ALL THOSE  
20 REGIONAL TRAIN SYSTEMS, AND BLUNTLY, WE ARE IN A POLITICAL  
21 BATTLE WITH LA, AND POINT SOUTH, BECAUSE IF WE'RE NOT GOING TO  
22 COMMIT REGIONALLY TO THAT, I CAN GUARANTEE YOU LA IS, AND THEY  
23 HAVE GOT A BIG BOND AND THEY'RE READY TO DO IT. SO MY CONCERN  
24 IS AS WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THIS REGIONAL MEASURE THAT WE HOPE  
25 WILL HAPPEN SOON, IF WE DON'T HAVE SOMETHING IN IT THAT SAYS



September 11, 2020

1 WE NEED HIGH SPEED RAIL, AND WE ARE GOING TO HELP GET HIGH  
2 SPEED RAIL HERE TO THOSE REGIONAL CONNECTIONS, IT WILL BE A  
3 CHALLENGE, AND ALL THE MONEY I'M SEEING, AT LEAST SO FAR -- I  
4 DON'T ACTUALLY SEE ANY EXPLICIT MENTION OF COMMITMENT IN THAT,  
5 ANYWHERE SOUTH MORGAN HILL, GILROY, PACHECO, ANYTHING, THAT  
6 GETS IT HERE. AM I MISTAKEN ABOUT THAT OR IS THERE SOMETHING  
7 IN THAT THAT YOUR POINTING TO THAT ACTUALLY HELPS? >DAVE  
8 VAUTIN: YOU'RE CORRECT THAT A NUMBER OF THE INVESTMENTS THAT  
9 BENEFIT BOTH CALTRAIN AND HIGH SPEED RAIL, DOWNTOWN EXTENSION,  
10 DIRIDON STATION, THESE DIFFERENT PROJECTS IN SAN FRANCISCO,  
11 SAN MATEO, AND SANTA CLARA COUNTIES, THE PROJECT I WOULD POINT  
12 TO THAT COULD BENEFIT HIGH SPEED RAIL MOST IN TERMS OF WHAT  
13 YOU'RE DESCRIBING SOUTH SAN JOSE WOULD BE GRADE SEPARATIONS  
14 WHICH COULD ADDRESS SOME OF THE NEEDS BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND  
15 GILROY. BUT TO BE CLEAR ON THE PACHECO PASS TUNNEL WOULD NOT  
16 BE USED BY CALTRAIN THERE IS NO COBENEFIT WE HAVE NOT INCLUDED  
17 DIRECT INVESTMENT IN THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL ASPECT.

18

19 **SAM LICCARDO:** MY CONCERN IS -- AND I'M TRYING TO PULL UP THE  
20 ATTACHMENT NOW WITH A PAGE NUMBER. AS YOU LOOK AT THE  
21 STRATEGIES, STRATEGY T11 EXPANDING AND MODERNIZING THE  
22 REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK, HIGH SPEED RAIL ISN'T EVEN IN IT.  
23 CERTAINLY, THERE IS BART, THERE IS CENTRAL VALLEY BAY AREA  
24 VALLEY LINK, THERE IS ALTAMONT CORRIDOR, SO THERE ARE PLENTY  
25 OF REGIONAL SYSTEMS THAT CONNECT THE BAY AREA TO THE REST OF



September 11, 2020

1 THE STATE, BUT NO MENTION OF HIGH SPEED RAIL. AND I AM  
2 CONCERNED BOTH ABOUT THE LANGUAGE AND ABOUT THE DOLLARS.  
3 [LAUGHTER] -- THAT BASED ON MY CONVERSATIONS WITH HIGH SPEED  
4 RAIL AUTHORITY TEAM, IF WE'RE NOW COMMITTING THE DOLLARS  
5 THAT'S A PRETTY CLEAR INDICATION THAT SACRAMENTO SHOULD SIMPLY  
6 POINT THE TRAIN SOUTH RATHER THAN NORTH. AND SO, IS THERE SOME  
7 -- YOU DESCRIBED THE -- THE GRADE SAPS BUT IT'S TRUE THERE ARE  
8 MANY BILLIONS OF GRADE SEPARATIONS THAT ARE NEEDED UP-AND-DOWN  
9 THAT CORRIDOR AND YOU COULD FIND THEMSELVES FAR FROM THE  
10 COMMUNITY WHERE HIGH SPEED RAIL IS, THE KEY CONNECTION OF  
11 GETTING HIGH SPEED TO BART AND CALTRAIN AND EVERYTHING ELSE,  
12 IS THERE SOME WAY TO ACTUALLY POINT OUR DOLLARS IN A WAY THAT  
13 GETS HIGH SPEED RAIL HERE? >DAVE VAUTIN: COMMISSIONER --

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** DAVE, THIS IS THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE  
16 DIRECTOR, I WANT TO MAKE A COUPLE OF OVERARCHING COMMENTS THEN  
17 DAVE MAYBE CAN PICK IT UP. I THINK THE IMPORTANT THING HERE,  
18 PARTICULARLY, COMMISSIONER LICCARDO, AS YOU'RE MENTIONING, THE  
19 PACHECO PASS, AND ITS \$13 BILLION PRICE TAG, WE HAVE DONE, AS  
20 MTC STAFF, I THINK, AN EXTRAORDINARILY JOB TRYING TO DEFINE  
21 THE ENVELOPE OF REGIONAL -- OF REASONABLE FINANCIAL RESOURCES  
22 THAT CAN BE AT OUR DISPOSAL, AND I WOULD SAY, THIS STAFF IN  
23 PARTICULAR HAS STRETCHED THE BORDERS OF THAT ENVELOPE AS FAR  
24 AS WE CAN. SO THERE IS NO MORE MONEY TO ENVISION IN THIS PLAN,  
25 I BELIEVE, THAT'S DEFENSIBLE. UNLESS WE'RE GOING TO GO TO



September 11, 2020

1 EXTRAORDINARILY HIGHER PRICING MECHANISMS. YOU KNOW, OR OTHER  
2 ELEMENTS. SO, IF THERE ARE TO BE A HIGH SPEED RAIL SPECIFIC  
3 COMMITMENT, IT MEANS TRANSFERRING INVESTMENTS FROM SOMETHING  
4 ELSE. I WOULD SAY, AS WELL, THAT, AGAIN, THE -- YOU KNOW, HIGH  
5 SPEED RAIL, FOR DECADES I WORKED ON IT. WHEN I WAS AT MTC AND  
6 BEFORE I LEFT, TALKING ABOUT NECESSARY PARTICIPANTS TO DELIVER  
7 THIS EXTRAORDINARILY STATEWIDE INVESTMENT, BUT THE BOOK END  
8 CONCEPT OF, YOU KNOW, THE BAY AREA AND THE GREATER LA AREA, IN  
9 PUTTING IN A SET OF INVESTMENTS, VERY OFTEN THAT AS DAVE SAID,  
10 COBENEFITS BECAUSE HIGH SPEED RAIL IS AN OVERLAY TO EXISTING  
11 TRANSPORTATION CORRIDORS BOTH NORTH AND SOUTH HAS BEEN SORT OF  
12 THE DRIVING STRUCTURE OF HOW THESE REGIONS HAVE WORKED TO PUT  
13 IN INVESTMENTS IN THE PAST. SO, I THINK THE WORK THAT WE HAVE  
14 DONE, AND WE CERTAINLY CAN DO A MUCH BETTER JOB OF LIFTING UP  
15 TODAY WHERE THE COBENEFIT ADJUSTMENTS EXIST IN OUR PLAN SO  
16 THAT CAN BE A CLEARER MESSAGE TO THE STATE OF THE INVESTMENTS  
17 THAT WE ARE DOING TO HELP SUPPORT IT. I THINK THAT'S A VERY  
18 FAIR POINT ON THAT CORE IN TERMS OF COMMUNICATION. BUT I JUST  
19 WANTED TO SAY THAT WE'RE WORKING IN SORT OF A ZERO SUM  
20 BOUNDARY HERE IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, THE LEVEL OF INVESTMENT,  
21 A SIGNIFICANT HIGH SPEED RAIL ONLY INVESTMENT WOULD REPRESENT.  
22 I THINK THE CALTRAIN GRADE SEPARATIONS THAT WE HAVE  
23 HIGHLIGHTED WITHIN THE PLAN, YOU KNOW, IS THE ARENA WHERE,  
24 DEPENDING ON HOW THEY'RE STAGED, YOU KNOW, CERTAINLY WOULD BE  
25 AN ADDITIONAL SPECIFICITY WE COULD POINT TO IN TERMS OF



September 11, 2020

1 PROVIDING THESE COBENEFIT INVESTMENTS TO HIGH SPEED RAIL. SO,  
2 I DON'T KNOW, DAVE, IF THERE IS ANYTHING ELSE YOU WANT TO ADD  
3 TO THAT?

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DID YOU WANT TO COMMENT ON THAT?

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** THERESE, I PRETTY MUCH APPRECIATE THE POINT. MY  
8 CONCERN IS TWOFOLD. ONE IS, IN ATTACHMENT I WHERE WE DESCRIBE  
9 THE STRATEGIES AND I'M SORRY I CAN'T BE ON THE CAMERA RIGHT  
10 NOW I HAVE TERRIBLE INTERNET CONNECTION HERE IN THE HEART OF  
11 SILICON VALLEY. \$78 BILLION IS ALLOCATED, THE LARGEST SHARE IS  
12 ALLOCATED, THESE LARGER RAIL INVESTMENTS AND THE WORDS HIGH  
13 SPEED RAIL DOESN'T APPEAR IN THAT. THAT'S CONCERN NUMBER ONE.  
14 AS YOU MENTION, WE COULD DEFINITELY BRAND BETTER IN TERMS OF  
15 ARE DESCRIBING WHAT THESE ARE, BUT IN A MORE SUBSTANTIVE LEVEL  
16 WHAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT IS WE'RE CHECK THE BOX BY SAYING IT  
17 WILL GO INTO CALTRAIN GRADE SEPARATIONS, I APPRECIATE AND  
18 VALUE MY COLLEAGUES ON THE CALTRAIN BOARD, BUT I ALSO KNOW THE  
19 CALTRAIN STAFF IS IT THE SAMTRANS STAFF AND IF THE PRIORITY IS  
20 GOING TO BE GETTING GRADE SEPARATION IN MENLO PARK FOR  
21 EXAMPLE, THAT'S NOT GOING TO HELP HIGH SPEED RAIL CONNECT TO  
22 BART OR CALTRAIN OR THE ALTAMONT EXPRESS OR CAPITAL CORRIDOR  
23 BECAUSE THERE IS ONLY WAY PLACE YOU CAN DO THAT AND THAT'S  
24 FURTHER SOUTH. NOT ALL THESE ENDPOINT INVESTMENTS ARE CREATED  
25 EQUALLY. THERE ARE SOME THAT ARE ACTUALLY GETTING HIGH SPEED



September 11, 2020

1 RAIL INTO THE BAY AREA BUT OTHERS ARE GOING TO HAVE TO FOLLOW  
2 OVER TIME. IT'S GOING TO REQUIRE PHASING. IT'S NOT TO GET IT  
3 TO PACHECO IT'S TO GET IT TO THAT POINT WHERE IT CONNECTS TO  
4 DIRIDON AND THAT CREATES -- TO THE SOUTH, WE CAN CERTAINLY USE  
5 THAT FUNDING TO DIRECT THERE BUT IT'S NOT OBVIOUS TO ME THAT  
6 SAMTRANS STAFF WHICH RUNS CALTRAIN IS GOING TO PRIORITIZE  
7 THOSE INVESTMENT IN MORGAN HILL TO GET HIGH SPEED RAIL TO  
8 THOSE CONNECTIONS IF ALL WE'RE GOING TO SAY IS THIS IS MONEY  
9 FOR CALTRAIN. I GUESS WHAT I'M GETTING TO IS WE NEED BETTER  
10 DEFINITION IF THOSE ARE INTENDED TO HELP US GET HIGH SPEED IN  
11 THE BAY AREA I THINK IT WOULD BE BEST TO -- I APPRECIATE  
12 EVERYONE'S TIME TO RIFF OFF THIS. I WOULD LIKE AT SOME POINT  
13 IN THE MOTION SUGGEST AN AMENDMENT THAT MIGHT GET LANGUAGE IN  
14 THERE THAT FOCUSES ON THAT VERY IMPORTANT CHALLENGE.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SAM, THIS ITEM IS ON THE AGENDA  
17 FOR INFORMATION ONLY TODAY.

18

19 **SAM LICCARDO:** OKAY. I'M SORRY.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THAT'S FINE. BUT YOU RAISED A  
22 REALLY GOOD POINT THAT MANY OF THE IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE BEING  
23 MADE IS KIND OF GOING TO BE THE FRAMEWORK FOR HIGH SPEED RAIL  
24 OR AT LEAST TO FACILITATE IT BUT WE DON'T IDENTIFY IT IN SUCH  
25 A WAY AND I THINK BOTH THERESE, DAVE, AND MATT HAVE HEARD YOU,



September 11, 2020

1 SO MAYBE THEY CAN MASSAGE THIS A LITTLE BIT BETWEEN NOW AND  
2 THE COMMISSION MEETING, AND JUST SEE IF WE CAN -- AND IT WOULD  
3 BE GOOD, SAM, YOU SAID YOU WERE GOING TO MAKE AN AMENDMENT TO  
4 THE MOTION, MAYBE YOU CAN TELL US WHAT THAT IS NOW SO AT LEAST  
5 WE HAVE AN IDEA OF WHAT YOU'RE THINKING.

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. REALLY, AND I GUESS IT DEPENDS HOW  
8 YOU CHARACTERIZE THE DOLLARS THAT ARE DESCRIBED IN THE  
9 ATTACHMENT J, WHICH IS THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT. AND SO MY  
10 UNDERSTANDING IS, DEPENDING WHETHER IT'S THE 4.1 BILLION OR I  
11 BELIEVE IT'S A NUMBER NORTH OF 6 BILLION THAT WOULD BE  
12 ALLOCATED FOR CALTRAIN GRADE SEPARATIONS, THAT ESSENTIALLY  
13 THERE BE LANGUAGE THAT SAYS THAT THOSE INVESTMENTS SHOULD BE  
14 FOCUSED AND PRIORITIZED ON GETTING HIGH SPEED RAIL INTO THE  
15 BAY AREA, AND THOSE CALTRAIN SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS THAT SERVE  
16 THAT DUAL PURPOSE.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY.

19

20 **SAM LICCARDO:** I'M HAPPY TO WORK ON SOMETHING MORE SPECIFIC AND  
21 BETTER, PERHAPS MORE -- THAT YOU GET THE GENERAL IDEA.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ABSOLUTELY. AND I APPRECIATE YOU  
24 CLARIFYING IT. BECAUSE I THINK EVERYBODY THAT'S INVOLVED IN  
25 THIS COMMITTEE NEEDS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT ISSUE IS, AND SO,





September 11, 2020

1 NO, THAT'S GOOD CLARIFICATION. SO, THERESE, DAVE, AND MATT,  
2 YOU GUYS HAVE KIND OF HEARD, YOU KNOW, WHAT THE INTENT IS  
3 THERE, SO LET'S GIVE THAT SOME THOUGHT BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN IT  
4 COMES TO THE COMMISSION.

5

6 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU CHAIRMAN.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THERESE, DID YOU WANT TO SAY  
9 ANYTHING? I WAS GOING TO GO TO CARLOS.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** NO. I WAS JUST GOING TO SAY, WE CERTAINLY  
12 CAN.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MAYOR LICCARDO I APPRECIATE YOU  
15 CLARIFYING THAT. BECAUSE I THINK IT'S AN IMPORTANT STEP TO GET  
16 TO WHERE YOU WANT TO GO. THANKS SAM. CARLOS, YOU HAVE BEEN  
17 PATIENT.

18

19 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I WAS GLAD TO HEAR SAM. I HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT  
20 THE CONGESTED PRICING IN ALL LANE TOLLING, CALL THEM  
21 OPPORTUNITIES AND POTENTIAL HURDLES. SO I SEE YOUR STRATEGY T5  
22 IS IMPLEMENTED PER MILE TOLLING ON CONGESTED FREEWAYS WITH  
23 TRANSIT ALTERNATIVES, IT SEEMS AS IF THE ALL LANE TOLLING  
24 SCORED REALLY LOW IN THE SURVEY, THE SURVEYS YOU DID DURING  
25 THIS PROCESS. I MEAN, APPROPRIATELY PRICING OUR TRANSPORTATION



September 11, 2020

1 OPTIONS IS IMPORTANT, BUT I ALSO FEEL THAT THE CONGESTION  
2 PRICING, ALL LANE TOLLING, OPTION, HAVE HUGE EQUITY  
3 IMPLICATIONS AND WE'RE TRYING TO GET AT THAT THROUGH  
4 INCREASING THE TRANSIT ALTERNATIVES, BUT MOST OF OUR TRANSIT  
5 ALTERNATIVES GO FROM TO CBD. AND LOWER INCOME CLASS DON'T  
6 PARTICULARLY LIVE IN THIS DISTRICT SO THAT IS A CONCERN THEY  
7 HAVE ABOUT THIS -- HOW WE IMPLEMENT THOSE CONGESTION PRICING  
8 TOLLING PIECE AND MAYBE DAVE YOU COULD EXPLAIN TO ME BECAUSE I  
9 KNOW THE FIRST TIME I HEARD ABOUT THIS THE ALL LANE TOLLING  
10 WAS MAYBE FOUR OR MY MONTHS AGO WHEN IT WAS EXPLAINED IN THE  
11 RPC MEETING MAYBE LONGER. MAYBE YOU CAN EXPLAIN THE ALL LANE  
12 TOLLING PIECE THAT'S GOING TO AFFECT ALL THOSE ON THE ROAD NOT  
13 JUST THOSE WHO PREFER TO GO ON AN EXPRESS LANE. COULD YOU  
14 SPANDED MORE HOW -- EXPLAIN THE ALL LANE TOLLING PIECE AND THE  
15 EQUITY INVOLVEMENT? >DAVE VAUTIN: THANKS FOR THE QUESTION.  
16 JUST TO SET A LITTLE BIT OF CONTEXT, WE HAVE BEEN EXPLORING  
17 ALL LANE TOLLING AS A PLANNING STRATEGY THIS IS NOT  
18 IMPLEMENTING ANYTHING ON THE ROADS IT'S ABOUT IDENTIFYING THE  
19 ACTIONS TO GET TO VERY AMBITIOUS CLIMATE STATE TARGETS. ALL  
20 LANE TOLLING STRATEGY HAS BEEN STUDIED FOR OVER A YEAR AND A  
21 HALF WE HAVE STUDIED HORIZON AND CONGEST RELIEF FOR THAT  
22 PROCESS AND IDENTIFIED THE NEED FOR EQUITY MITIGATIONS TRANSIT  
23 IS A PART OF THAT BUT ONLY A PART OF THE PUZZLE WHAT'S  
24 IMPORTANT FOR EQUITY IS THE MEANS-BASED TOLLS COMPONENT OF IT  
25 WHICH WAS INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT, AND WE ACTUALLY



September 11, 2020

1 FOUND THAT WITH THAT STRATEGY IN PLAY, OF THE IMPACTS TO LOW  
2 INCOME HOUSEHOLDS WERE MUCH REDUCED THEY WERE AT ROUGHLY ONE  
3 PENNY FOR EVERY MILE DRIVEN ON THE AVERAGE FOR THE REGION  
4 VERSUS MANY PENS FOR THE HIGHER INCOME TRAVELERS SO WE'RE ABLE  
5 TO OFFSET A LOT OF THOSE PROVIDE ROBUST DISCOUNTS FOR  
6 CARPOOLING OFF PEAK TRAFFIC WE KNOW A LOT OF LOWER MECHANIC  
7 WORKERS DON'T WORK AT PEAK TRAFFIC HOURS THEY'RE AT SHIFTS  
8 THROUGHOUT VARIOUS TIMES OF THE DAY SO WE HAVE LOWER TOLLS FOR  
9 THOSE TIMES OF DAY. OUR STRATEGY IS NOT TO IMPROVE ANYTHING  
10 BUT TO STUDY IT MORE TO ENSURE EVERY MORE ROBUST EQUITY  
11 MITIGATIONS SO IF THE POLICY WAS ADVANCED A DECADE FROM NOW WE  
12 WOULD KNOW WHAT SORT OF ACTIONS NEED TO OCCUR AT THE SAME  
13 TIME. I THINK THE LAST THING TO NOTE IS THE ALL LANE TOLLING  
14 STRATEGY, OBVIOUSLY TOLLING BY ITSELF GENERATING YOU IN  
15 REVENUE, IT'S GOT ABOUT A THIRD OF SUPPORT IN THE POLL, THAT  
16 YOU WILL SEE IN A FEW MINUTES BUT WE DIDN'T ASK AT ALL IN  
17 FAVOR OF THE THINGS THAT THE TOLLING WOULD FUND, THE TRADEOFF  
18 ASSOCIATED AND THE TOLL LANE FUNDING GENERATES MILLIONS OF  
19 DOLLARS IN TRANSIT INVESTMENTS THAT ARE BROADLY SUPPORTED BY  
20 THE PUBLIC AND THAT WE HAVE INCORPORATED IN THE FINAL  
21 BLUEPRINT SO THESE THINGS HAVE TO COME AS A PACKAGE WITH  
22 WITHOUT THE REVENUE WE CAN'T INCLUDE THE PROJECT. IT'S  
23 COMPLIMENTARY AND WE SEE IF THE STRATEGY IS APPROVED IT'S  
24 DOING A COLLABORATIVE MULTI-YEAR STUDY WITH A WIDE SET OF



September 11, 2020

1 STAKEHOLDERS TO MAKE SURE WE'RE LOOKING AT ALL OF THE PROS AND  
2 CONS OF THE APPROACH.

3

4 **CARLOS ROMERO:** COULD YOU DIRECT ME BY E-MAIL TO THE  
5 INFORMATION RELATED TO YOUR ANALYSIS OF HOW THIS WOULD EFFECT  
6 LOWER INCOME FOLKS. I YOU READ THAT. AND I WOULD LOVE TO FIND  
7 OUT WHERE THE WORK IS. >DAVE VAUTIN: CERTAINLY WE CAN SEND YOU  
8 THE LINK TO THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT.

9

10 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I THINK IT'S CLEAR THAT WELL ESTABLISHED  
11 CAPITALIZED FIRMS WITH TENS OF THOUSANDS OF EMPLOYEES HAVE  
12 ALREADY SAID THAT THEY WANT VERY MUCH TO MOVE TO A CERTAIN  
13 PERCENTAGE OF A TELECOMMUTING PLATFORM WHETHER IT'S 50 PERCENT  
14 OR 40 PERCENT, I KNOW AS A CITY, WE'RE AGGRESSIVELY LOOKING AT  
15 OUR TDM POLICIES AND ORDINANCES THAT WE PLAN TO APPROVE IN THE  
16 NEXT 2 TO 3 MONTHS THAT ARE INDEED TRYING TO FACTOR A  
17 TELECOMMUTING PIECE INTO THAT, IS A GOAL IN ACTUALLY MAKING IT  
18 MANDATORY, 50 PERCENT IS REALLY HIGH. OBVIOUSLY IT'S  
19 ASPIRATIONAL BUT I THINK IT MAKES SENSE TO TRY TO MOVE IN THAT  
20 DIRECTION AND I'M GLAD DAVE THAT YOU HEARD THAT BECAUSE OVER  
21 SEVERAL MEETINGS PEOPLE INCLUDING MYSELF HAVE BROUGHT ISSUE  
22 THAT ISSUE UP, AND I THINK INTEGRATING IT IS PRETTY AGGRESSIVE  
23 BUT I THINK IT MAKES A LOT OF SENSE. IN WITH THAT IS THE ISSUE  
24 OF -- AND CINDY CHAVEZ BROUGHT UP THIS YESTERDAY AT THE RPC  
25 MEETING IS WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT HOW WE ADDRESS THE FIBER



September 11, 2020

1 INFRASTRUCTURE AND THE KIND OF DUALITY OF WHO HAS ACCESS TO  
2 THE INTERNET AND THE CLOUD, AND THE HIGH SPEED FASHION, I'M  
3 SURPRISED TO HEAR THAT SAM SAID, SOMETIMES TOUTED HEART OF  
4 SILICON VALLEY, BUT AREAS LIKE EAST PALO ALTO, WEST OAKLAND,  
5 YOU KNOW, OTHER AREAS, WHERE IT'S GOOD TO KNOW WHERE THAT  
6 INFRASTRUCTURE ISN'T THERE, THAT IS A CRITICAL PIECE TO  
7 IMPLEMENTING, TO HAVING THIS HAPPEN, AND TO IMPLEMENTING IT IN  
8 A WAY THAT'S EQUITABLE FOR BOTH LOW INCOME FOLKS, STUDENTS,  
9 WE'RE IN A HIGHLY RICH EDUCATIONAL BASIN IN THE NINE COUNTY  
10 AREA OF FOLKS CAN BE DOING THAT ONLINE. SO I JUST WANT TO  
11 EMPHASIZE THAT THE FIBER INFRASTRUCTURE PIECE AND HOW WE CAN  
12 THINK ABOUT MOVING THAT FORWARD IS PART AND PARCEL OF MOVING  
13 THE TELECOMMUNICATIONS NUMBERS UP AND MAKING IT AN EQUITABLE  
14 APPROACH. SO. THANK YOU. THANK YOU CARLOS. JAKE?

15

16 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** YES, MR. CHAIR. JUST A QUICK WORD IN SUPPORT  
17 OF SAM BRINGING UP THIS QUESTION FROM THE SOUTHERN EXTREMITIES  
18 OF OUR REGION IN TERMS OF THE CONNECTION WITH HIGH SPEED RAIL,  
19 AND JUST AS A NORTH BAY COMMISSIONER, AND PARTICULARLY  
20 INVOLVED IN THE STATE ROUTE 37 RESILIENCY PROJECT, THE  
21 POSSIBLE CONNECTIVITIES OF THE SNAIL RAIL SYSTEM WITH OUR MAIN  
22 LINES OVER AT CORDELIA JUNCTION, AND THIS IS TO ME, IN TERMS  
23 OF THE STATE RAIL PLAN, HAS BEEN RECOGNIZED, AND I JUST --  
24 WELL I'M -- YOU KNOW, YOU CAN GET INTO THE WEEDS, I REALIZE  
25 I'M AT GRADE CROSSINGS AT MENLO PARK, AND DISCUSSIONS LIKE



September 11, 2020

1 THAT, IT SEEMS TO ME VERY IMPORTANT AS WE LOOK TOWARDS 2050 TO  
2 MAKE SURE THAT WE RECOGNIZE AND INCLUDE THESE CONNECTIVITIES,  
3 WHETHER THEY BE AT THE SOUTH END OF THE REGION, OR AT THE  
4 NORTH END. THANKS MR. CHAIR.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVE, ARE YOU READY TO MOVE ON?

7

8 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MR. CHAIR?

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES?

11

12 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** I CAN'T RAISE MY HAND.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SORRY JESS. GO AHEAD.

15

16 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** I WANT TO PICK UP ON COMMISSIONER  
17 JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS ABOUT THE 60 PERCENT TELECOMMUTING  
18 MANDATE. AND I APPRECIATE YOU HAVE INCREASED THE AMOUNT OF  
19 TELECOMMUTING IN YOUR ASSUMPTIONS BASED ON SOME OF THE  
20 COMMENTS THAT WE HAD OVER THE SUMMER AROUND JUST MAJOR  
21 EMPLOYERS WHO ARE ALREADY REQUIRING THAT THEIR EMPLOYEES WORK  
22 FROM HOME, AND THE TRANSITION THAT WE'RE SEEING ALREADY DURING  
23 THE SHELTERING IN PLACE OF PEOPLE WORKING REMOTELY. I DO AGREE  
24 THAT IT'S A VERY AMBITIOUS GOAL, AND I WANT TO MEET THE GOAL  
25 IN TERMS OF INCENTIVES FOR EMPLOYERS TO PARTICIPATE BUT I WANT



September 11, 2020

1 THINK ABOUT WHAT OTHER ALTERNATIVES AND INCENTIVES WE'RE  
2 PROVIDING TO EMPLOYEES TO NOT DRIVE TO THEIR PLACE OF WORK IF  
3 THEY ARE GOING TO GO TO WORK. SO, YEAH, OBVIOUSLY TRIP CAPS IS  
4 ONE APPROACH, MORE ROBUST CARPOOLING PROGRAMS BUT REALLY WHERE  
5 WE LOCATE HOUSING CLOSE TO JOBS. AND THE TRANSIT CONNECTIONS  
6 TO THOSE JOB SECTORS IS IMPORTANT AS WELL. SO, I KNOW THAT  
7 THERE IS A STRATEGY AROUND TDM, AND I THINK WE NEED TO THINK  
8 MORE AGGRESSIVELY IN OUR TDM PROGRAM. I REALLY THINK THAT, YOU  
9 KNOW, MAJOR EMPLOYERS SHOULD PROVIDE FREE SUBSIDIZED TRANSIT  
10 PASSES FOR THEIR EMPLOYEES. WE NEED TO LOOK AT PARTNERSHIPS  
11 WITH RIDE-SHARE COMPANIES, FIRST AND LAST MILE OPTIONS, I  
12 THINK ALL OF THOSE THINGS ARE GOING TO BE IMPORTANT TO  
13 ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO NOT DRIVE, OR IF THEY DO NEED TO GO TO  
14 WORK, IF WE'RE NOT ABLE TO REACH THAT 60 PERCENT, HOW ARE WE  
15 MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE NOT ADDING MORE CARS ON THE ROAD? I  
16 THINK THAT'S A CRITICAL PIECE ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE. SO I  
17 WANT TO JUST HIGHLIGHT THAT, THAT A MORE ROBUST TDM PROGRAM  
18 NEEDS TO BE PART OF THE CONVERSATION, NOT JUST TELECOMMUTING  
19 AND I KNOW A GREAT DEAL OF WORK HAS BEEN DONE BY MTC IN THIS  
20 AREA BUT I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO LOOK AT NOT JUST  
21 MANDATE BUT MAYBE WE NEED TRANSPORTATION IMPACT FEES TO  
22 SUBSIDIZE THOSE TYPES OF PROGRAMS OR MAYBE IT'S GOING TO COME  
23 TO REGIONAL SOURCES BUT I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT PIECE AND  
24 LASTLY AS WAS NOTED, THE BROADBAND AND WIRELESS CONNECTIVITY  
25 ISSUE IS IMPORTANT WE'RE SEEING INEQUITIES IN WHO CAN WORK



September 11, 2020

1 FROM HOME AND ACCESS INTERACT IS IMPACTING NOT JUST WORKING  
2 BUT WITH FAMILIES WHO NEED TO DO DISTANCE LEARNING. THANK YOU.  
3  
4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YOU -- THANK YOU DAVE. ARE YOU  
5 READY TO MOVE ON? >DAVE VAUTIN: YES. WE HAVE ABOUT TEN MORE  
6 SLIDES AND THEN WE'LL BE READY TO WRAP UP THIS ITEM. NEXT  
7 SLIDE PLEASE. NEXT SLIDE. ALL RIGHT. I THINK WE'RE WAITING FOR  
8 THE POWERPOINT TO ADVANCE HERE. SO THIS NEXT SECTION OF THE  
9 PRESENTATION WILL PIVOT AWAY FROM THE STRATEGIES THAT WE HAVE  
10 BEEN FOCUSED ON, WHICH ARE REALLY FOUNDATIONAL TO PLANNED BAY  
11 AREA 2050, AND THAT'S WHERE WE MADE MOST OF THE CHANGES SINCE  
12 YOUR FEBRUARY ACTION. WE'RE ALSO ASKING FOR APPROVAL OF THE  
13 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES WHICH ARE PLACES ASSUMED FOR FUTURE HOUSING  
14 AND JOB GROWTH IN THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. SO IN TERMS OF CHANGES  
15 SINCE FEBRUARY WE HAVE INTEGRATED NEW PDAS APPROVED BY THE  
16 ABAG BOARD IN JULY AS WELL AS 2020 DATA FOR TRANSIT-RICH AREAS  
17 AND HIGH RESOURCE AREAS AND WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT YOU  
18 REAFFIRM THE FEBRUARY 2020 DEFINITION OF GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES  
19 WITH HOUSING THAT INCORPORATES HOUSING AND SELECT TRANSIT-RICH  
20 HIGH RESOURCE AREAS IN COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE NOT NOMINATED A  
21 SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF PDAS THIS GROWTH PATTERN LIKE THE DRAFT  
22 BLUEPRINT PROTECTS THE AREAS OUTSIDE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES  
23 AND ALL OUR REGION'S UNMITIGATED HIGH HAZARD AREAS IN GROWTH.  
24 LASTLY AT YESTERDAY'S MEETING WE IDENTIFIED A SLIGHT MAPPING  
25 GLITCH FOR UNINCORPORATED NAPA PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS AND





September 11, 2020

1 WE WILL FIX THAT FOR THE MAPS GOING FORWARD TO THE COMMISSION  
2 LATER IN THE MONTH. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE ASKING FOR APPROVAL OF  
3 THE FINAL REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST INCLUDING ADJUSTMENTS FOR  
4 COVID-19 AND THE 2020 RECESSION. WE PREVIOUSLY SHARED THIS IN  
5 JULY AND IT WAS OUT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE SUMMER WE  
6 RECEIVED NO SIGNIFICANT PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS AND IN  
7 ACCORDANCE WITH THE VIA SETTLEMENT WE'RE ASKING FOR APPROVAL  
8 AT THIS TIME AS THE FORECAST FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 GOING  
9 FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. SO AT THE END OF THE DAY AS WE THINK  
10 ABOUT ALL OF THESE STRATEGIES AND THE FINANCIAL SIDE OF THE  
11 PLAN, THIS IS HOW IT STACKS UP. THESE PIE CHARTS REFLECT THE  
12 FOUR ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN, THE EXISTING REVENUES THAT ARE  
13 STREAMS AVAILABLE FROM FEDERAL, STATE, REGIONAL LOCAL SOURCES  
14 TODAY AS WELL AS ASSUMPTIONS. YOU CAN SEE THERE ARE  
15 SIGNIFICANT FINANCIAL GAPS ESPECIALLY FOR HOUSING, ECONOMY,  
16 AND ENVIRONMENT. WE WORK TO MAKE THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT AS  
17 VISIONARY AS POSSIBLE GIVEN FEDERAL AND STATE RULES FOR FISCAL  
18 CONSTRAINT AND IT INTEGRATED NEW REVENUES RANGING FROM A  
19 FUTURE MEGA MEASURE TO PRICING STRATEGIES THAT HELP PAY FOR  
20 MANY OF THOSE LARGE REGIONAL RAIL PROJECTS FEATURED TODAY.  
21 WITHOUT THOSE NEW REVENUE MONEYS, WE WOULD CERTAINLY NOT BE  
22 ABLE TO BE AS BOLD AS WE HAVE ON THE TRANSPORTATION FRONT. ALL  
23 COMBINED, WE'RE LOOKING AT A 1.4 TRILLION DOLLAR PLAN FOR THE  
24 NEXT 30 YEARS WITH JUST UNDER 600 BILLION FOR TRANSPORTATION  
25 400 BILLION FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND 400 BILLION FOR



September 11, 2020

1 ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION. NEXT SLIDE.  
2 LASTLY I'LL TURN TO NEXT STEPS ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050.  
3 ALTHOUGH WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS REGIONAL PLAN FOR A  
4 NUMBER OF YEARS NOW, THERE ARE STILL SOME MILESTONES AHEAD THE  
5 FINAL BLUEPRINT ANALYSIS WILL STRETCH THROUGH THE REST OF THIS  
6 YEAR. WE WILL BEGIN OUR EIR SCOPING PROCESS AND DEVELOPMENTS  
7 THIS FALL KICKING OFF THE SIGNATURE PIECE OF THE PUZZLE WHICH  
8 IS THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN LATER IN THE FALL HOPING TO RETURN  
9 WITH THAT ITEM TO ALL OF YOU IN NOVEMBER AND WORKING TOWARDS A  
10 DECEMBER ACTION ON THE FINAL BLUEPRINT OUTCOMES WHICH WILL  
11 MOVE US INTO THAT FINAL PHASE OF DEVELOPING THE EIR AND PLAN  
12 DOCUMENT. NEXT SLIDE. WE WANT TO VISUALIZE PLANS IN THE  
13 OPERATIONAL WORLD ONE OF THE WAYS IS THROUGHOUT REGIONAL  
14 HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION PROCESS RHNA. ABAG METHODOLOGY HAS  
15 CONSIDERED WHAT ROLE THE PLAN SHOULD PLAY IN THE RHNA PROCESS  
16 AND IN AUGUST THEY CAME TO A CONSENSUS THAT THE 2050 HOUSEHOLD  
17 PROJECTIONS COULD START AS A PLAN FOR THE RHNA METHODOLOGY.  
18 WHERE IS THE FOCUS OF THE 30 YEAR TRENDS OF COUNTY ASK  
19 SUBCOUNTY LEVELS RHNA WILL DEFINITELY INTO THE NEAR TERM EIGHT  
20 YEAR ALLOCATIONS AT THE JURISDICTION LEVEL AND THAT INFORMS  
21 HOUSING ELEMENTS ACROSS THE REGION. WHEN AVAILABLE IN  
22 DECEMBER, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT DATA CAN BE INTEGRATED INTO THE  
23 DRAFT RHNA METHODOLOGY PENDING ABAG BOARD DIRECTION ON THIS IN  
24 THE FALL. NEXT SLIDE. AND AS WE TALKED ABOUT IN THE  
25 PRESENTATION TODAY, ANOTHER IMPLEMENTATION AREA IS REALLY THE



September 11, 2020

1 FINAL CHAPTER OF THE PLAN, THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR EACH OF  
2 THE 30 YEAR STRATEGIES THAT EFFORT WILL IDENTIFY ONE OR MORE  
3 ACTIONS FOR MTC AND ABAG TO ADVANCE IN PARTNERSHIP WITH  
4 PUBLIC, PRIVATE, AND NON-PROFIT SECTORS I WANT TO UNDERSCORE  
5 THE PARTNERSHIP ASPECT OF THIS MANY OF THE STRATEGIES ARE NOT  
6 NECESSARILY AT CENTER OF OUR WHEELHOUSE BUT WE CAN PLAY A ROLE  
7 WHEN WE PARTNER WITH OTHER ENTITIES IN THE REGION TO ADVANCE  
8 TOWARDS THIS VISION. THESE ACTIONS COULD RANGE FROM STUDIES,  
9 TO CONVENINGS, TO LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACY OR OTHER PILOT  
10 PROGRAMS. AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO A COLLABORATIVE PROCESS ONE  
11 THAT INVOLVES ALL OF YOU, ONE THAT STRETCHES THROUGH MID-2021  
12 TO DEVELOP THIS IMPLEMENTATION PLAN AND WE'LL OTHER THAN WITH  
13 UPDATES ON THIS IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AGAIN,  
14 I JUST WANT TO APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO  
15 DO THIS DEEP DIVE ON PLANNED BAY AREA THIS MORNING. WE WERE  
16 HAPPY TO SHARE HOW PUBLIC FEEDBACK REALLY DROVE A LOT OF THE  
17 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT WE'RE BRINGING FORWARD AND WE DO ASK FOR  
18 YOUR APPROVAL TO MOVE FORWARD THE STRATEGIES GEOGRAPHIES AND  
19 REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST TO THE ABAG COMMISSION AND BOARD AS  
20 OUTLINED IN THE RESOLUTIONS.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** ANY FINAL COMMENTS, BOARD MEMBERS  
23 BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO THE NEXT ITEM THERE? OKAY. I'M NOT SEEING  
24 ANY. ARE THERE -- MARTHA A THERE ARE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

25



September 11, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THERE ARE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
2 WITH THEIR HANDS -- OH, THEY'RE RAISING THEM NOW. AND PUBLIC  
3 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM WAS ADDED TO ATTACHMENT D, IF IT WAS  
4 RECEIVED BEFORE 5:00 P.M. SO FIRST UP FROM THE PUBLIC IS  
5 BEVEN. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. HOW MUCH TIME DO THEY  
6 HAVE SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I AM BEVAN, AND I SERVE ON THE  
11 BOARD OF DIRECTORS AND I WANT TO THANK THE MTC FOR  
12 PRIORITIZING THE NEW TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING IN PLANNED BAY  
13 AREA. WE DID SOME POLLING RECENTLY AS WE HAD AN AGENDA ITEM  
14 THIS PAST MONTH AND EVEN AS WE ARE FOCUSING ON RECOVERING FROM  
15 COVID-19, 79 PERCENT OF THOSE POLLS SAID THAT WE NEED TO DEAL  
16 WITH THE LONG-TERM TRANSPORTATION FIXES THAT WE HAVE WAITED  
17 TOO LONG FOR, AND THEN WHEN WE SPECIFICALLY DESCRIBED WHAT THE  
18 NEW TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING WOULD REPRESENT, 80 PERCENT OF THE  
19 MEGA REGION AND 84 PERCENT OF THE BAY AREA SUPPORTED IT. YOU  
20 KNOW, THE NEW TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING HAS BEEN IDENTIFIED IN  
21 YOUR FINDINGS AS THE MOST COST EFFECTIVE TRANSIT MEGA  
22 EXPANSION PROJECT AND WE'RE WORKING HARD WE EXPECT TO HAVE AN  
23 RFP OUT ON THE STRATEGY WITH ENGAGEMENT OUTREACH TRAVEL DEMAND  
24 PLANNING EARRING AND ENVIRONMENTAL WORK. WE INCLUDE IN THAT  
25 WORK AN EQUITY VISION WHICH IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT HAVING THAT



September 11, 2020

1 LENS AND LOOKING AT WHAT DOES SOCIAL EQUITY MEAN FOR A PROJECT  
2 THAT'S GOING TO CARRY FORWARD FOR THE NEXT TWO GENERATIONS. I  
3 WANT TO SAY THANK YOU TO THE MTC MEMBERS AND STAFF AND WE LOOK  
4 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ON PLANNED BAY AREA AND TO  
5 SHEPHERDING FORWARD A NEW TRANSBAY RAIL CROSSING SO WE CAN  
6 LOOK FORWARD TO A SEAMLESS TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA. THANK YOU  
7 VERY MUCH. YOU.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MARTHA.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ADINA. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
12 YOURSELF.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS  
15 BAY AREA. I'M GLAD TO SEE THAT SEAMLESSNESS HAS SHOWN UP IN  
16 THE QUANTITATIVE POLLING AND THE OTHER REALLY EXCITING ROBUST  
17 OUTREACH FROM MTC AS SOMETHING THAT'S EXTREMELY POPULAR AND  
18 HIGHLY DESIRED BY THE PUBLIC, AND WE REALLY HOPE THAT THE  
19 REGION CAN WORK ON MAKING THE CHANGES THAT WILL BE NEEDED TO  
20 DELIVER THAT FOR TRANSIT RIDERS. IN THE OTHER AREAS ABOUT  
21 REDUCING GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS AND PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION,  
22 SEAMLESS BAY AREA HAS BEEN WORKING ON A NEW STUDY THAT WILL BE  
23 OUT NEXT WEEK LOOKING AT THE IMPORTANCE, NOT ONLY OF  
24 SEAMLESSNESS, BUT OF HAVING TRANSIT SERVICE BE AVAILABLE.  
25 MTC'S FARE INTEGRATION STUDY SHOWED THAT INTEGRATING FARES



September 11, 2020

1 WOULD GENERATE MORE DEMAND THAT WOULD REQUIRE ADDITIONAL  
2 SERVICE LEVELS TO DELIVER, AND WE BELIEVE THAT DELIVERING A  
3 WORLD CLASS SYSTEM AFTER COVID AND TO RECOVER FROM COVID WILL  
4 REQUIRE INTEGRATING THE SYSTEM IN TERMS OF FARES AND SCHEDULES  
5 AND OTHER STRATEGIES INCLUDING LAND USE BY A PREREQUISITE FOR  
6 THAT WILL BE HAVING A LEVEL OF SERVICE THAT WOULD REQUIRE  
7 RUNNING TRANSIT TO BE CONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE. HAVING A SERVICE  
8 AND SEAMLESS SYSTEM WILL WORK WELL TOGETHER WE LOOK FORWARD TO  
9 FOLLOWING UP WITH STAFF ON DETAILS OF THIS WITH REGARD TO OUR  
10 COMMENTS BEFORE THIS COMES TO THE FULL COMMISSION. THANK YOU.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT MARTHA?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS ROLAND. ROLAND GO AHEAD AND  
15 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS ROLAND LEBRON SAN  
18 JOSE. FIRST UP, I'M NOT SEEING A CLOCK HERE -- ANYWAY --  
19 UNLESS I MISSED IT, I DID NOT SEE ANYTHING ABOUT TRADE  
20 CORRIDORS. SO THE QUESTION TO THE CHAIR IS, DID WE CONSIDER  
21 THE IMPACT OF GOODS MOVEMENTS TO OUR TRANSPORTATION  
22 INFRASTRUCTURE? WITH REGARDS TO MAYOR LICCARDO'S COMMENT, I  
23 THINK THE PLAN DID NOT IDENTIFY THE FACT THAT THE COYOTE  
24 VALLEY IS EFFECTIVELY THE ALTAMONT PASS OF THE SOUTH, AND I'LL  
25 BE BACK UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS LATER AND SHARE WITH YOU



September 11, 2020

1 WHAT I THINK HAPPENED HERE. WITH REGARDS TO REDUCING GHGS, YOU  
2 KNOW, TO BE HONEST, ANY KIND OF SOLUTION THAT SAYS OH WE KNOW  
3 WE'RE GOING TO GO BACK AND HAVE A SPEED LIMIT OF 55 MILES AN  
4 HOUR ON THE FREEWAY IS GOING TO FLY -- THAT'S NOT GOING TO  
5 HAPPEN. THE SOLUTION IS TO FOLLOW THE FRENCH AND HAVE A TARGET  
6 FOR 100 PERCENT ELIMINATION OF FOSSIL FUELS IN THE NEXT 20  
7 YEARS. AND I WOULD START -- I WOULD SUGGEST THAT WE START  
8 FOCUSING ON THE PRIVATE SHUTTLE THAT IS CAUSING SO MUCH  
9 DISCOUNT IN SAN FRANCISCO AND INCENTIVE THEM TO TRANSFER TO  
10 FULLY ELECTRIC BUSES, BECAUSE IN TURN, ONCE THE PRIVATE SECTOR  
11 SWITCHES TO ELECTRIFICATION, THAT WILL DRIVE DOWN THE COST OF  
12 PUBLIC OPERATOR BUSES. BECAUSE MILLION DOLLARS IS JUST NOT  
13 GOING TO WORK.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS RODNEY. I BELIEVE YOU'RE  
18 UNMUTED.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS RODNEY,  
21 MEMBER OF THE HOUSING METHODOLOGY COMMITTEE. I WANT TO THANK  
22 STAFF FOR THEIR WORK ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THUS FAR AND FOR  
23 THE IMPRESS OF PRESENTATION. HOWEVER AS HAS BEEN ALLUDED TO BY  
24 COMMENTS BEFORE I WOULD LIKE TO ENCOURAGE STAFF TO MOVE  
25 FORWARD WITH BOLDER JUSTICE STRATEGIES THAT WILL SERVE MORE



September 11, 2020

1 AFFORDABLE HOUSING STRENGTHEN TENANT PROTECTIONS AND PROTECT  
2 LOW INCOME RENTERS AND PEOPLE OF COLOR IN THE NEAR FUTURE AS  
3 WE GRAPPLE WITH THE ECONOMIC RAMIFICATIONS OF COVID-19 WHILE  
4 MANY STRATEGIES OUTLINED IN THE BLUEPRINT SO FAR ARE  
5 FORECASTED TO AFFORDABILITY METRICS THEY STILL APPEAR TO FALL  
6 SHORT TO ADDRESS THE NEEDS. MOST SPECIFIC WITH REGARD TO  
7 DISPLACEMENT AND GENTRIFICATION TO LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES OF  
8 COLOR LEFT AS THE BLUEPRINT APPEARS TO PRODUCE FURTHER  
9 GENTRIFICATION IN DISPLACEMENT OF THESE COMMUNITIES AS ALSO  
10 ALLUDED TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION IS INTRICATELY LINKED  
11 TO SOLVING OUR REGION'S TRANSPORTATION AND CLIMATE CRISIS,  
12 PARTICULARLY PRODUCTION IN HIGH RESOURCE AREAS IS NOT ONLY  
13 GOOD POLICY BUT IT'S CRITICAL TO ADDRESSING OUR RACIAL  
14 INEQUITY AND RACIAL SEGREGATION PARTICULARLY IN INCLUSIONARY  
15 COMMUNITIES THE PLAN MUST MANDATE AND PUT FORWARD BOLD  
16 STRATEGIES THAT MANDATE THESE COMMUNITIES IN PARTICULAR TO  
17 RECEIVE FAIR SHARE IN GROWTH SO OUR REGION IS ABLE TO RESPOND  
18 TO THE TRANSPORTATION AND CLIMATE CRISIS IN RECOGNITION OF  
19 COVID LASTLY I WANT TO POINT OUT WHILE WE RECOGNIZE THE IMPACT  
20 OF THE DEVASTATING WILDFIRES THAT WE'RE ALL GRAPPLING WITH  
21 CURRENTLY ON OUR REGION IN PARTICULAR I THINK IT'S CRITICAL  
22 THAT WE THINK CREATIVELY AND BOLDLY ABOUT HOW WE MOVE FORWARD  
23 AS A REGION HOW WE MAINTAIN OUR RESILIENCE HOW WE PLAN DEAR.  
24  
25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT'S TIME.





September 11, 2020

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HOW WE GROW EQUITABLY.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS UH.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS I'M LESLIE GORDON PROGRAM  
9 MANAGER OF URBAN HABITAT. WORKING TO PROGRESS LOW INCOME  
10 COMMUNITIES OF COLOR AND WE WORK WITH MTC AND ABAG TO SHAPE  
11 PLANNED BAY AREA SINCE ITS FIRST ROUND ABOUT TEN YEARS AGO. I  
12 WANT TO EXPRESS APPRECIATION FOR ALL THE WORK STAFF HAVE PUT  
13 INTO THE BLUEPRINT SO FAR AND I AM PARTICULARLY GRATIFIED TO  
14 SEE STRATEGIES FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRESERVATION STRATEGY  
15 THAT INCLUDES PRESERVING UNSUBSIDIZED AFFORDABLE HOUSING  
16 THROUGH PARTNERSHIPS WITH TENANTS COMMUNITY LAND TRUSTS,  
17 COOPS, AND NON-PROFIT DEVELOPERS. I AM EXCITED ABOUT SEEING  
18 EXPANDING SERVICES TO TENANTS TO HELP THEM STAY IN PLACE AS  
19 WELL AS STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THE CONSEQUENCES OF RACIST  
20 BLENDING PRACTICES IN COMMUNITIES OF COLOR AND AT A HIGHER  
21 LEVEL WE'RE EXCITED TO SEE COMMUNITY OWNERSHIP MODELS TO BE  
22 INCLUDED IN THIS ITERATION OF THE PLAN AND URBAN HABITAT AND  
23 OUR PARTNERS LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH MTC AND ABAG TO PLAN  
24 FOR IMPLEMENTATION OF THESE STRATEGIES. WE'RE HAPPY TO SEE  
25 RENEWED INTEREST IN PUBLIC LAND AND INSTITUTIONALLY OWNED LAND



September 11, 2020

1 BUT I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THE NEED TO PRIORITIZE DEEPLY  
2 AFFORDABLE HOUSING ON THESE LANDS WHICH IS A LITTLE BIT  
3 UNCLEAR IN THE UPDATES. AND IT'S -- THESE LENDS A KEY  
4 OPPORTUNITY FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN ADDITION GREEN SPACE  
5 BECAUSE WE CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF LOWER LAND PRICES. CONTINUE  
6 TO SHIFT MORE GROWTH INTO HIGH RESOURCE AREAS AND AWAY FROM  
7 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS IF WE WANT TO SERIOUSLY ADDRESS THE  
8 DISPLACEMENT PROBLEM THAT SHOWS UP AGAIN AND AGAIN IN THE PLAN  
9 ANALYSIS. AND AS RODNEY SAID THIS WOULD ALSO BETTER ALIGN WITH  
10 AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING MANDATES AND THE PLAN'S  
11 OVERALL EQUITY, INCLUSIVITY AND VIBRANCY GOALS. THANK YOU FOR  
12 YOUR TIME.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS MATT. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
17 YOURSELF.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. JUST A COUPLE OF THINGS. I AM HERE FOR THE  
20 SIERRA CLUB. I PARTICIPATED IN THE REGIONAL ADVISE ROW WORKING  
21 GROUP, AND I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR THE INCREASED FOCUS ON  
22 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE. IT'S REALLY WELCOME. AND IN MY SECOND  
23 AND FINAL COMMENT IS THE PLAN ITSELF, OVERALL, DOESN'T LOOK  
24 READY FOR ADOPTION. IF IT DOESN'T HIT THE 19 PERCENT GHG  
25 REDUCTION TARGET THAT THE AIR RESOURCES BOARD HAS ASSIGNED,



September 11, 2020

1 THEN I THINK THAT IT'S NOT READY, AND IT NEEDS TO FURTHER  
2 CONSIDERATION ON WHAT TO DO TO CUT THE GHGS FROM DRIVING CARS  
3 AND LIGHT TRUCKS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU MATT.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP, GREENBELT ALLIANCE. GO AHEAD AND  
8 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS ZOEY, THE DIRECTOR OF SPECIAL PROJECTS AT  
11 GREENBELT ALLIANCE. FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO APPLAUD MTC STAFF ON  
12 BEING SO RESPONSIVE TO COMMENTS AND PUBLIC FEEDBACK AND ADDING  
13 SO MANY INNOVATIVE STRATEGIES IT'S A BIG LIST AND I AM  
14 IMPRESSED BY STRATEGIES LISTED. I AM CONCERNED ABOUT FIRE  
15 REDUCTION BEYOND RETROFIT. AS WE'RE ALL AWARE THE THREAT OF  
16 WILDFIRE IS DIRECTLY IMPACTING OUR ENTIRE REGION. I APPRECIATE  
17 THAT THE URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES ARE MENTIONED AS A STRATEGY  
18 BUT WE INCREASE TO INCREASE AND STRENGTHEN THE URBAN GROWTH  
19 BOUNDARIES ESPECIALLY RELATED TO FIRE REDUCTION STRATEGY  
20 WILDFIRE DO NOT DISTINGUISH BETWEEN MUNICIPAL BOUNDARIES SO  
21 COORDINATION IS IMPERATIVE. WILDFIRE PREVENTION FUEL REDUCTION  
22 AND VEGETATION MANAGEMENT AND PRESCRIBED FIRES ADDITIONALLY OF  
23 THE BLUEPRINT SHOULD INCLUDE URBAN GREETING STRATEGY THAT  
24 UTILIZES MULTI-BASED INFRASTRUCTURE TO PROTECT INLAND UPSTREAM  
25 COMMUNITIES FROM FLOODING. I APPRECIATE THE ADDED STRATEGIES



September 11, 2020

1 OF INCREASING OPEN SPACE BUT I THINK ALL ADDITIONAL OPEN SPACE  
2 SHOULD HAVE MULTIPLE RESILIENCE BENEFITS AS WELL. LASTLY, I AM  
3 CONCERNED THE BLUEPRINT BARELY MEETS THE STATE-MANDATED CARB  
4 ORDINARY EMISSIONS. WE NEED TO THINK BIGGER AND BOLDER. I  
5 WOULD LIKE TO RECOMMEND THAT YOU REVIEW LOS ANGELES 2020  
6 TRANSPORTATION SIGN WHICH GOES BEYOND CURRENT MANDATES AND THE  
7 PLAN WHICH HAS FOCUS ON WATER MANAGEMENT AND LANDSCAPING  
8 STRATEGIES. BLUEPRINT SHOULD IMPLEMENT CLIMATE CHANGE  
9 MITIGATION AND PUBLIC SAFETY INCORPORATED INTO ALL ASPECTS  
10 ADVANCING EQUITABLE OUTCOMES FOR RESIDENTS PRIORITIZING NEEDS  
11 OF DISADVANTAGED RESIDENTS AND COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. THANK  
12 YOU VERY MUCH.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AIR DISTRICT PLANNING AND CLIMATE PLANNING  
17 PROTECTION DIVISION. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** YES. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES. GO AHEAD.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. THANKS. I'M HENRY HILKEN I AM PLANNING MANAGER  
24 AT THE BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT GOOD MORNING  
25 CHAIR SPERING COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. I WANT TO



September 11, 2020

1 EXPRESS THE AIR DISTRICT SUPPORT FOR THIS WORK. TRANSPORTATION  
2 IS THE LARGEST SOURCE OF GREENHOUSE GASSES AND AIR POLLUTION  
3 IN THE BAY AREA, AND WE JUST HAVE HAPPENED TO LOOK OUT THE  
4 WINDOW THIS WEEK TO SEE THE NEXUS BETWEEN CLIMATE CHANGE AND  
5 AIR POLLUTION. THIS IS THE FOURTH YEAR IN A ROW WE HAVE HAD  
6 RECORD BREAKING HISTORIC POOR AIR QUALITY DRIVEN BY WILDFIRES.  
7 THIS WEEK SHINING A SPOTLIGHT ON HOW URGENT YOUR EFFORTS ARE.  
8 IT'S CRITICALLY IMPORTANT TO REDUCING GREENHOUSE GASSES IN THE  
9 BAY AREA AND AIR POLLUTION IN OF THE BAY AREA ESPECIALLY IN  
10 MOST IMPACTED COMMUNITIES. THERE ARE LOTS OF GREAT STRATEGIES  
11 IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STAFF IS BRINGING TO YOU TODAY MANY  
12 DISCUSSED ALREADY INCREASED FUNDING FOR EV CHARGING  
13 TELECOMMUTING, CORE TRANSIT, FARES, SEAMLESS CONNECTIONS,  
14 AFFORDABLE HOUSING FREEWAY TOLLING CONCEPT AND I WANT TO ECHO  
15 COMMENTS MADE TODAY THAT AS WE EXPLORE THE CONCEPTS, THE  
16 PRICING STRATEGIES THAT REALLY MINIMIZE IMPACTS TO LOW INCOME  
17 HOUSEHOLDS IS CRITICAL. WE'RE ESPECIALLY EXCITED ABOUT THE NEW  
18 STRATEGY T TWO TRANSPORTATION LEAD ENHANCEMENT IN COMMUNITIES  
19 OF CONCERN THAT DOVETAILS WITH STRATEGIES IN OUR WEST OAKLAND  
20 COMMUNITY ACTION PLAN SO THAT'S A VERY EXCITING STRATEGY  
21 INCLUDING THE COMMUNITY TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS IN THE  
22 COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. SO I WANT TO EXPRESS OUR SUPPORT IN  
23 THE MONTHS AND YEARS AHEAD TO HELP ADOPT PLANNED BAY AREA AND  
24 OFFER OUR SUPPORT IN IMPLEMENTING PLANNED BAY AREA AS WELL.  
25 THANK YOU.



September 11, 2020

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MARTHA HOW MANY MORE  
3 SPEAKERS?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ONE. LAST ONE. RICH, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
6 YOURSELF.

7

8 **RICHARD HEDGES:** HI. GOOD MORNING. YES. I DECIDED TO SPEAK  
9 BECAUSE ROLAND WHETTED MY INTEREST. ONE OF MY INTEREST HAS  
10 ALSO BEEN GOODS MOVEMENT. AND I WANTED TO POSE THIS QUESTION.  
11 I-880 IS FILLED WITH TRUCKS COMING FROM WAREHOUSES AND  
12 RECENTLY THERE WAS AN ARTICLE IN THE SAN FRANCISCO CHRONICLE  
13 THAT HIGHLIGHTED MOVEMENT BACK FROM ALAMEDA CORRIDOR FOR LARGE  
14 COMPANIES TO BUY INDUSTRIAL BUILDINGS AND THEY HIGHLIGHTED  
15 AMAZON'S FULFILLMENT CENTERS AND BIG GROCERY AS ONE OF THE  
16 MAJORS. BUT HAVE WE THOUGHT ABOUT, IN THE PLAN, ESPECIALLY FOR  
17 GREENHOUSES, THE RETURN TO NEAR PORT WAREHOUSING? AND WHAT  
18 EFFECT THAT WILL HAVE ON OUR GREENHOUSE GAS PROJECTIONS? THANK  
19 YOU.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THAT'S THE LAST  
22 SPEAKER, MARTHA?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THAT WAS OF THE LAST SPEAKER.

25



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. DAVE DID YOU WANT TO  
2 COMMENT VERY BRIEFLY ON THE FREIGHT CORRIDOR COMMENT? >DAVE  
3 VAUTIN: CERTAINLY. I MEAN A COUPLE OF THINGS TO KEEP IN MIND  
4 THERE. THERE ARE A SERIES OF DIFFERENT GOODS MOVEMENT  
5 INVESTMENTS INCLUDED IN THE KIND OF OTHER REGIONAL, LOCAL, AND  
6 PRIORITY PROJECTS STRATEGIES, I ENCOURAGE THE COMMENTERS TO  
7 TAKE A LOOK THERE INCLUDING THE INVESTMENTS THROUGH THE PORT  
8 OF OAKLAND WHICH IS KEY GOODS MOVEMENT HUB. IT'S ESSENTIAL WE  
9 MAKE THESE HIGHWAYS TO ADDRESS GOODS MOVEMENT GHG IS FOR CARS  
10 AND LIGHT DUTY CARS AND TRUCKS ONLY WHILE WE'RE STRONG  
11 SUPPORTERS OF ELECTRIFYING TRUCKS AND BUSSES AND OTHER SORTS  
12 OF EMISSIONS, OUR STRATEGY MUST BE FOCUSED VERY PRECISELY ON  
13 CARS AND LIGHT DUTY TRUCKS.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU DAVID. ALL RIGHT,  
16 WITH THAT I WANT TO GO AHEAD AND MOVER ON TO 5B. IS THAT  
17 CORRECT? AND I WANT IT THANK MATT, DAVE, AND LESLIE, GREAT  
18 PRESENTATION. I WANT TO THANK ALL OF THE MTC STAFF BEHIND THE  
19 SCENES. THIS IS A TREMENDOUS EFFORTS. SO THANK ALL OF YOU. AND  
20 SO WITH THAT LET'S MOVE ON TO ITEM B, AND URSULA, ARE YOU  
21 GOING TO BRING THIS WITHIN FORWARD? IS ARE YOU COMING OUT OF  
22 THE VINEYARD?

23

24 **URSULA VOGLER:** YES, I AM. THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. GOOD  
25 MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS EFFORT COMMISSION. I AM HERE



September 11, 2020

1 TO WALK YOU THROUGH THE RESULT OF OUR POLL ON THE PLANNED BAY  
2 AREA 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT I'LL ASK STAFF TO BRING UP THE  
3 PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE TURNING IT OVER TO SARAH I'M  
4 GOING ON GO OVER THE PURPOSE OF THE POLL AND ITS METHODOLOGY.  
5 OUR MAIN GOAL FOR THE POLL WAS TO GET INPUT ON THE STRATEGIES  
6 IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT. FOCUSING ON THE POTENTIAL STRATEGY  
7 REVISIONS IN THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT THE POLL FOCUSED ON INPUT  
8 FROM ALL OF THE STRATEGIES IN ADDITION THE POLL AIMED TO  
9 PROVIDE UNDERSTANDING ON THE PERCEPTIONS OF THE BAY AREA  
10 INCLUDING REGIONAL VERSUS LOCAL CONTROL AND ALSO PUBLIC  
11 AWARENESS AND FAVORIBILITY OF THE PLAN. POLL WAS CONDUCTED IN  
12 LATE JULY AND EARLY AUGUST DURING MONTH FOUR OF THE SHELTER IN  
13 PLACE MANDATE WHICH LIKELY AFFECTED THE POLL AS THE PUBLIC IS  
14 FOCUSED ON HEALTH AND NOT TRAVELING AROUND THE BAY AREA AS  
15 PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC. DATA COLLECTION CONCLUDED BEFORE THE  
16 START OF THE FIRES IN MID-AUGUST. NEXT SLIDE. THE PARAMETERS  
17 OF THE POLL INCLUDED RANDOM EXAMPLES OF RESIDENT IN THE NINE  
18 COUNTY BAY AREA POLL CONDUCTED IN ENGLISH, CHINESE AND  
19 SPANISH. SURVEY WAS CONDUCTED USING A COMP INDICATION OF LAND  
20 LINE, CELL PHONE AND ONLINE INTERVIEWING TO ENSURE A BROAD AND  
21 DIVERSE SAMPLE. TO ENSURE THE ABILITY TO LOOK AT THE DATA FOR  
22 EACH COUNTY OR SUBREGION SEPARATELY WE CONDUCTED A MINIMUM OF  
23 400 INTERVIEWS PER COUNTY OR SUBREGION. MARIN AND SONOMA  
24 COUNTIES AND NAPA AND SOLANO COUNTIES WERE COMBINED INTO TWO  
25 SUBREGIONS DUE TO LOWER COUNTY POPULATION LEVELS. OVERALL





September 11, 2020

1 RESULTS ARE WEIGHTED PROPORTIONATELY TO REPRESENT THE NINE  
2 COUNTY BAY AREA. WE RECEIVED ALMOST 3,000 COMPLETES WHICH  
3 INCLUDED BOTH PHONE INTERVIEWS AND COMPLETED ONLINE SURVEYS.  
4 WHERE APPLICABLE WE COMPARED THE RESULTS WITH PRIOR PLANNED  
5 BAY AREA POLLS. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO SARAH  
6 WHO WILL WALK THROUGHOUT RESULTS OF THE POLL.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU URSULA AND GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. MY NAME  
9 IS SARAH L PRINCIPLE WITH EMC RESEARCH HAPPY TO BE HERE  
10 SPEAKING WITH YOU THIS MORNING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO A QUICK  
11 OVERVIEW OF WHAT WE'RE GOING TO SEE HERE AND AS WAS REFERRED  
12 TO IN THE PRIOR PRESENTATION MUCH OF WHAT WE LEARNED HERE IN  
13 THIS POLL IS VERY COMPLIMENTARY TO WHAT YOU LEARNED IN THE  
14 OTHER PIECES OF OUTREACH, THE VERY ROBUST OUTREACH PROCESS  
15 THERE IS A LITTLE BIT OF DIFFERENTIATION BUT IT'S QUITE  
16 COMPLIMENTARY TO WHAT YOU'RE HEARING IN YOUR OUTREACH  
17 COMPONENT. BIG PICTURE OVERVIEW HERE THEN LOOK AT THE DATA.  
18 FIRST OF ALL THE RESIDENTS OF THE BAY AREA HAVE REMAINED  
19 CONCERNED ABOUT HOMELESSNESS AND HOUSING AVAILABILITY EVEN IN  
20 THE CURRENT COLOR OF HEALTH AND THE ECONOMY. EVEN AS YOU HAVE  
21 SEEN IN THE PRIOR PLANNED BAY AREA SURVEYS THERE IS A STRONG  
22 PREFERENCE FOR REGIONAL APPROACH FOR PLANNING BUT WE SEE MIXED  
23 PREFERENCES WHETHER HOUSING PLANNING SHOULD BE AT THE REGIONAL  
24 OR LOCAL LEVEL. IN TERMS OF PLANNED BAY AREA ITSELF THERE IS  
25 NOT A WHOLE LOT OF WIDESPREAD KNOWLEDGE WHEN WE LOOK AT THE



September 11, 2020

1 GENERAL POPULATION OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 NOW. WHEN IT'S  
2 DESCRIBED AS A STRATEGY FOR THE BAY AREA'S FUTURE ON ISSUES  
3 LIKE TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE ENVIRONMENT AND THE ECONOMY,  
4 THE MAJORITY OF RESIDENTS DO REACT POSITIVELY TO THE GENERAL  
5 IDEA OF PLANNED BAY AREA. WE ALSO FOUND THAT MOST OF THE  
6 STRATEGIES THAT WE TESTED FROM THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT ARE  
7 SUPPORTED BY A MAJORITY OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS SIMILAR TO WHAT  
8 YOU SAW IN THE OUTREACH. WE SEE STRONG SUPPORT FOR MOST OF THE  
9 THINGS THAT WERE INCLUDED IN THAT DRAFT DOCUMENT. NEXT SLIDE  
10 PLEASE. A QUICK OVERVIEW OF THE SURVEY RESPONDENTS BEFORE WE  
11 DIVE INTO THE DATA. GENERALLY RESPONDENTS ARE REPRESENTATIVE  
12 OF THE BAY AREA POPULATION WE CONDUCTED MINIMUM OF 400  
13 INTERVIEWS IN EACH COUNTY OR REGION MAP ON THE LEFT SHOWS THE  
14 DISTRIBUTION AFTER WE WEIGHTED THE DATA BACK TO THE  
15 APPROPRIATE PROPORTIONS FOR EACH COUNTIES WE'RE ALSO SHOWING A  
16 QUICK OVERVIEW WE WENT OUTSIDE OF JUST VOTERS IN THIS POLL TO  
17 INCLUDE NON-VOTERS AS WELL, ABOUT A THIRD OF OUR RESPONDENTS  
18 WERE NOT REGISTERED TO VOTE. WE ALSO HAVE A MIX OF HOMEOWNERS  
19 AND RENTERS AND AT THE BOTTOM WE ASKED QUESTION ABOUT PRE  
20 COVID TRAVEL MODES TO UNDERSTAND RESPONSES TO SOME OF THE  
21 QUESTIONS AND WE SEE I'M SURE YOU'RE ALL FAMILIAR THREE  
22 QUARTERS OF THE POPULATION GENERALLY DRIVES ALONE AT LEAST A  
23 COUPLE OF TIMES A WEEK ABOUT A QUARTER SAID THEY USED SOME  
24 FORM OF TRANSIT AS YOU GET TO THE QUESTIONS ABOUT  
25 TRANSPORTATION AND TRANSIT USE WE THOUGHT THOSE NUMBERS WOULD



September 11, 2020

1 BE IMPORTANT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND NEXT SLIDE ONE MORE TIME.  
2 SO FIRST OF ALL GENERAL ISSUE ENVIRONMENT. YOU KNOW, ARE  
3 THINGS IN THE BAY AREA GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION OR OFF  
4 TRACK. THIS IS A FAIRLY STANDARD POLLING QUESTION WHEN WE ASK  
5 IT HERE IN THIS POLL BEFORE WE GIVE INFORMATION ABOUT WHAT  
6 WE'RE SURVEYING ABOUT IT'S A GENERAL OPENING QUESTION WE SEE  
7 42 PERCENT SAY THINGS ARE GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION 51  
8 PERCENT OFF ON THE WRONG TRACK. NEXT SLIDE. LOOKING AT THAT  
9 OVERTIME WE WENT BACK TO PRIOR SURVEYS THAT HAVE BEEN DONE AND  
10 THAT ARE AVAILABLE, THE BLUE RIGHT IS RIGHT DIRECTION REDLINE  
11 IS WRONG TRACK YOU SEE THE POLL THERE ON THE RIGHT AS 42  
12 PERCENT RIGHT DIRECTION 51 PERCENT WRONG TRACK THIS IS A  
13 QUESTION WE HAVE ASKED A LOT ACROSS THE ENTIRE BAY AREA AND  
14 YOU SEE IT FLIP BACK AND FORTH IN TERMS OF THE MAJORITY. 2020  
15 HAS BEEN A VOLATILE YEAR IN TERMS OF A LOT OF THINGS. WE SAW  
16 IN THE FEW MONTHS FOLLOWING THE SHELTER IN PLACE ORDER, WE SAW  
17 A BIG BOUNCE IN PEOPLE FEELING LIKE THINGS HERE ARE GOING  
18 PRETTY WELL ESPECIALLY SORT OF PUTTING THAT IN THE CONTEXT OF  
19 HOW THE BAY AREA WAS DOING AND COVID RESPONSE AS COMPARED WITH  
20 OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY. YOU KNOW, AND POTENTIALLY OTHER  
21 COUNTRIES AND THEN AS IT STRETCHES ON WE ARE SEEING THOSE  
22 NUMBERS SORT OF GO BACK ABOUT TO WHERE THEY WERE PRIOR TO THE  
23 MARCH ELECTION. SO, YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY THIS ISN'T EVERY DATA  
24 POINT EVER BUT WE ARE SEEING SOME VOLATILITY IN THIS AND THE  
25 GENERAL MOOD IS JUST SOMETHING TO CONTEXT LIES SOME OF THE



September 11, 2020

1 RESULTS FOR A LOT OF POLLING YOU WANT TO KNOW SORT OF ARE  
2 PEOPLE IN A GOOD OR BAD MOOD AS WE START ASKING THEM SPECIFIC  
3 QUESTIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE ASKED SOME QUESTIONS ABOUT  
4 WHAT ISSUES THEY'RE CONCERNED ABOUT ON A SCALE FROM 1 TO 7,  
5 WHERE SEVEN IS EXTREMELY CONCERNED. HOW CONCERNED ARE THEY  
6 WITH EACH OF THESE ISSUES GIVEN IN RANDOM ORDER AND ASKED  
7 ABOUT LEVEL OF CONCERN ON EACH ONE INDEPENDENTLY WHAT WE SAW  
8 IS HOMELESSNESS AND HOUSING CONTINUE TO BE SIGNIFICANT  
9 CONCERNS FOR BAY AREA RESIDENTS LOOKING BACK WE DON'T HAVE  
10 DETAILED TRACKING IN THIS DECK BUT WE HAVE LOOKED BACK OVER  
11 PRIOR SURVEYS THAT YOU HAVE DONE AND THAT HAVE BEEN DONE AND  
12 THAT'S VERY CONSISTENT OVER THE PAST YORE OR TWO. HOMELESSNESS  
13 HOUSING AVAILABILITY HOUSING AFFORDABILITY HAVE BEEN VERY HIGH  
14 CONCERNS FOR PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA THAT CONTINUES TO BE THE  
15 CASE. WE ALSO SEE VERY STRONG CONCERNS ABOUT PUBLIC HEALTH AND  
16 THE LOCAL ECONOMY. YOU KNOW, THAT CERTAINLY ARE RISING AS WE  
17 CONTINUE TO ENDURE THROUGH THIS PANDEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND THE  
18 IMPACT IT'S HAVING ON THE ECONOMY AND INCOME. WE ALSO SEE SOME  
19 OF THE OTHER KIND OF THINGS THAT HAVE POPPED UP IN THE PUBLIC  
20 VIEW RECENTLY, RISING AS WELL. YOU KNOW, WE STILL SEE TRAFFIC,  
21 SAFETY OF TRANSIT RIDING ON THE LIST, BUT IN A MOMENT, AS  
22 URSULA REFERRED TO, YOU KNOW, WE DID THIS SURVEY IN THE  
23 CONTEXT OF FOUR MONTHS OF REDUCED TRAVEL AND CERTAINLY WE'RE  
24 SEEING SOME IMPACT OF THAT IN TERMS OF WHEN THEY THINK ABOUT  
25 THE BIGGEST ISSUES FACING THE AREA TODAY. WE ASKED QUESTIONS



September 11, 2020

1 ON HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. IN THE BLUE THERE SHOULD BE A  
2 REGIONAL PLAN GUIDING DEVELOPMENT IN THE AREA RED LOCAL CITIES  
3 AND COUNTIES SHOULD PLAN ON THEIR OWN IN BAY AREA WE ASKED TO  
4 CHOOSE ONE OR THE OTHER AND THERE IS A CENTER IN THE GRAY BAR  
5 WE'RE SEEING 51 PERCENT SAYING THERE SHOULD BE REGIONAL  
6 HOUSING PLANNING 44 PERCENT CHOSE LOCAL PLANNING WHEN WE LOOK  
7 AT PRIOR POLLS MTC HAS CONDUCTED ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA. IT'S  
8 BEEN FLIP ON WHETHER HOUSING SHOULD BE REGIONAL AND LOCAL.  
9 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FOR TRANSPORTATION, YOU HAVEN'T ASKED THIS  
10 AS MANY TIMES BUT IT'S BEEN VERY CONSISTENT. REGIONAL  
11 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL AS TRANSPORTATION DONE BY  
12 INDIVIDUAL COUNTIES AND LOCAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. THIS  
13 NEXT SECTION TALKS MORE SPECIFICALLY ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA.  
14 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO WE FIRST ASKED BEFORE WE TOLD THEM WHAT  
15 IT WAS, WE ASKED THEM IF THEY HAD HEARD ANYTHING ABOUT PLANNED  
16 BAY AREA JUST TO UNDERSTAND SORT OF WHAT'S THE BASE OF  
17 KNOWLEDGE, WHO IS COMING INTO THIS THINKING THEY KNOW WHAT IT  
18 IS IN THE FIRST PLACE AND WE SEE 11 PERCENT SAID THEY HAD  
19 HEARD A LOT OR A LITTLE ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA RECENTLY JUST  
20 TWO PERCENT SAID THEY HAD HEARD A LOT. MOST PEOPLE SAID I  
21 HAVEN'T HEARD ANYTHING ABOUT THAT. WHEN WE LOOKED AT THE FOLKS  
22 WHO SAID THEY HAVE HEARD SOMETHING THE MAJORITY HAVE A  
23 POSITIVE OPINION OF PLANNED BAY AREA SORT OF COMING INTO T  
24 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THEN, FOR EVERYONE INCLUDING PEOPLE  
25 WHOSE THEY HAD HEARD SOMETHING, WE READ THEM A BRIEF



September 11, 2020

1 DESCRIPTION OF WHAT PLANNED BAY AREA IS. IT'S ON THE LEFT IN  
2 GRAY, THE COMPREHENSIVE STRATEGY FOR THE BAY AREA'S FUTURE ON  
3 ISSUES LIKE TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, ENVIRONMENT AND THE  
4 ECONOMY AND IN THE NINE COUNTY SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA IT'S  
5 UPDATED EVERY FOUR YEARS A FOUR YEAR EFFORT OF THE ELECTED  
6 OFFICIALS AROUND THE REGION THE GOAL OF THE PLAN IS TO MAKE  
7 THE REGION AFFORDABLE, CONNECT, DIVERSE, AND VIBRANT FOR ALL  
8 BASED ON THAT DESCRIPTION OF PLANNED BAY AREA WE THEN SAID DO  
9 YOU HAVE A FAVORABLE OR UNFAVORABLE OPINION OF PLANNED BAY  
10 AREA. SET OF BARS ON THE LEFT, SAY 76 PERCENT HAVE A FAVORABLE  
11 IMPRESSION OF PLANNED BAY AREA AFTER HEARING THAT BRIEF  
12 DESCRIPTION 16 PERCENT UNFAVORABLE, THE BARS ON THE RIGHT  
13 ASKED ABOUT STRATEGIES AND ASKED THE SAME QUESTION ABOUT  
14 FAVORABLE OR UNFAVORABLE DEPENDING ON FILLED IN DETAIL WOULD  
15 THEY CHANGE THEIR MIND AS WE GO THROUGH THE STRATEGIES, WE SEE  
16 MANY OF THEM ARE STRONGLY FAVORED, SOME AREN'T AS STRONGLY  
17 FAVORED BUT WHEN YOU PUT IT ALL TOGETHER AND SAY NOW THAT YOU  
18 HAVE HEARD MORE WE SEE CONSISTENT SUPPORT FOR THIS GENERAL  
19 CONCEPT OF A REGIONAL PLAN FOR HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, THE  
20 ENVIRONMENT AND THE ECONOMY IN THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE  
21 PLEASE. SO, THE FINAL SECTION HERE GOES THROUGH THE STRATEGIES  
22 THAT WE TESTED. SO WE TESTED MORE THAN TWO DOZEN STRATEGIES  
23 ACROSS THE FOUR PLAN ELEMENTS, THE RESPONDENTS WERE ASKED ONLY  
24 IF THEY SUPPORTED OR OPPOSED EACH STRATEGY AS IT WAS DESCRIBED  
25 WITHOUT ADDITIONAL INFORMATION OR DISCUSSION ON ANY OF THE



September 11, 2020

1 DETAILS. SO AS OPPOSED TO WHAT WAS DONE IN THE OTHER OUTREACH  
2 YOU WERE JUST LOOKING AT WHERE IT WAS A LONGER FORMAT MEETING,  
3 THERE WERE MORE OPPORTUNITIES FOR DISCUSSIONS AND QUESTIONS IN  
4 A QUANTITATIVE POLL WE REALLY HAVE TO COME UP WITH A WAY TO  
5 DESCRIBE EACH STRATEGY THAT'S BRIEF ENOUGH THAT WE CAN DO IT  
6 ON THE PHONE AS WELL AS THEY CAN READ IT ONLINE, AND THEY CAN  
7 GIVE OUR REACTION TO WHAT WE'RE DESCRIBING. FOR THE MOST PART  
8 WE TRIED TO GIVE A STRAIGHT FORWARD PLAIN ENGLISH DESCRIPTION  
9 OF EACH STRATEGY AND ASKED FOR SUPPORT OR OPPOSITION. WE DON'T  
10 HAVE THE DEPTH OF DETAIL THAT YOU MIGHT HERE IN A QUALITATIVE  
11 STRATEGY OR IN YOUR OUTREACH WHERE YOU HAVE OPPORTUNITIES FOR  
12 DISCUSSION AND DEBATE. I WOULD ALSO SAY THAT SOME OF THE  
13 STRATEGIES THAT WE TESTED IN THE POLL HERE HAD MORE DETAILS  
14 ABOUT THE SORT OF COST BENEFIT RELATIONSHIP. THOSE WITH MORE  
15 EXPLICIT INFORMATION ABOUT THE ASSOCIATED FINANCIAL COSTS OR  
16 WHAT I'LL CALL CONVENIENCE COST, IMPACT ON THE PEOPLE, DID  
17 TEND TO GARNER LOWER SUPPORT THAN THOSE THAT INCLUDED MUCH OF  
18 THIS INFORMATION. WE EXPECTED THIS AND WE THINK IT'S AN  
19 IMPORTANT THING TO HAVE IN MIND AS YOU CONSIDER HOW TO FRAME  
20 DISCUSSIONS OF THE VARIOUS STRATEGIES THAT MITT ULTIMATELY BE  
21 INCLUDED AS YOU DISCUSSED IN THE PRIOR AGENDA ITEM, YOU KNOW,  
22 THE COSTS ARE GOING TO BE NECESSARY FOR SOME OF THE BENEFITS  
23 AND IN THE WAY THAT WE TESTED THE STRATEGIES THEY WEREN'T  
24 ALWAYS DIRECTLY CONNECTED SO WE WANT TO KEEP THAT IN MIND AS  
25 WE LOOK THROUGH WHAT WAS STRONG ARE OR NOT IN RELATION TO HOW



September 11, 2020

1 WE POSITION THEM. I WOULD ALSO REMIND YOU AS URSULA SAID IN  
2 THE BEGINNING THE STRATEGIES WERE INCLUDED IN THE DRAFT  
3 BLUEPRINT SO THERE WASN'T MODIFICATION OR OPPORTUNITIES FOR  
4 ADJUSTMENT THAT HAPPENED IN THE OUTREACH OR ANY ADDITIONAL  
5 STRATEGIES OR ANY OF THE THINGS THAT HAVE SORT OF COME ALONG  
6 AFTER THAT POINT. IT REALLY WAS BASED ON THE INITIAL DRAFT.  
7 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE SORT OF SPLIT THESE INTO FOUR  
8 CATEGORIES. AND EACH CATEGORY OF STRATEGIES WAS GIVEN TO EACH  
9 RESPONDENT AS A RANDOMIZED LIST AND THEY WERE ASKED TO REACT  
10 TO EACH ONE AND WE'RE SHOWING THEM RANKED BY ORDER OF SUPPORT  
11 ON THE SLIDES BUT IN REALITY THEY GOT THEM IN A RANDOMIZED ARE  
12 THE. STARTING WITH PLAN STRATEGIES ABOUT HOUSING YOU CAN SEE  
13 SIGNIFICANT SUPPORT FOR ALL OF THE STRATEGIES THAT WERE  
14 RELATED TO HOUSING THAT WE TESTED. BLUE IS THE SUPPORT, THE  
15 RED IS THE OPPOSE, AND YOU CAN SEE ON THE RIGHT WE HAVE  
16 INCLUDED A TOTAL OF SUPPORT COLUMN THAT ASIDE UP THE TWO  
17 CATEGORIES STRONGLY IN SUPPORT. BUILDING MORE PERMANENT  
18 AFFORDABLE HOUSING INCENTIVES TO HOUSING IN UNDERUTILIZED LAND  
19 REQUIREMENTS TO MAKE SOME NEW UNITS AFFORDABLE, LIMITING  
20 RESIDENTIAL REBATE INCREASES, REDUCED FEES, AND STREAMLINE  
21 APPROVALS ALL OF THESE SUPPORTED BY MERELY OR OVER THREE  
22 QUARTERS OF THE POPULATION THEY SERVED GENERAL HOUSING  
23 STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TRANSPORTATION WE HAVE SPLIT  
24 THESE INTO TRANSIT AND THE NEXT ONE WILL BE ROADS JUST SO THAT  
25 WE COULD HAVE A DIGESTIBLE AMOUNT OF INFORMATION ON THE SLIDE.





September 11, 2020

1 BUT YOU SEE THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES, AGAIN, FAIRLY WELL  
2 SUPPORTED. AND REALLY AMONG THE STRONGEST OF ALL OF THE  
3 STRATEGIES WE TESTED, MODERNIZING AND EXPANDING THE REGIONAL  
4 RAIL NETWORK INCLUDING BART AND CALTRAIN. SO A LOT OF WHAT'S  
5 IN SEAMLESS IS ENCAPSULATED HERE REQUIREMENTS FOR BUS AND  
6 TRAIN AGENCIES TO COORDINATE SCHEDULED FARE STRUCTURES AND  
7 PAYMENTS STRONGLY SUPPORTED IMPROVING BUS SERVICE FREQUENCY  
8 AND MORE RAPT TRANSIT LINE SUPPORTED. WE REDUCED NUMBER OF BUS  
9 AND TRAIN AGENCIES BY CONSOLIDATING AGENCIES AND SERVICES  
10 RELATIVE TO A CONVERSATION YOU WERE HAVING EARLIER WE SEE  
11 SUPPORT ISN'T AS STRONG FOR THAT DESCRIPTION BUT IT IS STRONG  
12 FOR REQUIRING MORE COORDINATED SCHEDULES, STRUCTURES AND  
13 PAYMENT SYSTEMS. RELEVANT TO THE CONVERSATION YOU HAD EARLIER  
14 IT MAY NOT BE ABOUT THE NUMBER OF AGENCIES BUT IT IS ABOUT HOW  
15 DOES IT SORT OF PRESENT TO THE PUBLIC IN TERMS OF COORDINATION  
16 AND ABILITY TO REALLY MOVE AROUND THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE  
17 PLEASE. THE OTHER PART OF TRANSPORTATION HERE, STREETS AND  
18 ROADS ELEMENT, WE SEE A STRONG SUPPORT FOR MANY OF THESE AS  
19 WELL, BUILDING IMPROVE THE SIDEWALKS CROSSWALKS AND BIKE LINES  
20 REDUCING BOTTLENECK BY REBUILDING INTERCHANGES ON THAT ONE  
21 JUST TO ECHO THE POINT THAT WAS MADE IN THE OUTREACH  
22 PRESENTATION, THAT WAS SOMETHING THAT WAS MORE -- SORT OF CAME  
23 UP HIGHER FROM THE PUBLIC POLLING THAN IT DID IN THE OUTREACH.  
24 I WOULDN'T SAY IT'S SORT OF DIRECTIONALLY DIFFERENT BUT WHEN  
25 YOU'RE ASKING THE GENERAL PUBLIC THEY DO SEE BENEFITS TO THAT



September 11, 2020

1 KIND OF APPROACH COMPLIMENTARY TO A LOT OF THE OTHER  
2 IMPROVEMENTS YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. WHEN WE GET INTO SOME OF  
3 THESE STRATEGIES THAT INCLUDE CONVENIENCE OR FINANCIAL COST WE  
4 DO START TO SEE A LITTLE BIT OF REDUCED SUPPORT OR INCREASED  
5 OPPOSITION, LOWERING SPEED LIMITS TO INCLUDE SAFETY 51S  
6 SUPPORT BUILDING EXPRESS LANES AND THE PER MILE FEE FOR  
7 DRIVERS ON HIGH TRAFFIC FREEWAYS WHERE TRANSIT OPTIONS ARE  
8 AVAILABLE 35 PERCENT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER WE  
9 COULDN'T GIVE THEM ANY MORE INFORMATION WE COULDN'T PLACE  
10 THESE IN LARGER CONTEXT NOR COULD WE RELATE A LOT OF BENEFITS  
11 TO THE COST DIRECTLY CONTAINED TO A SINGLE QUESTION. SO I  
12 THINK IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THE CONTEXT AS WELL AS THINK  
13 ABOUT, AS YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT BEFORE, YOU KNOW, FOR ALL OF  
14 THESE STRATEGIES THERE IS GOING TO BE HAVE TO BE -- THIS WILL  
15 HELP YOU KIND OF UNDERSTAND HOW ARE PEOPLE POTENTIALLY GOING  
16 TO HEAR IT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE STRATEGIES ABOUT THE ECONOMY.  
17 SIGNIFICANTLY SUPPORTED BY A MAJORITY, JOB TRAINING PROGRAMS,  
18 AGAIN, ONE OF THE ELEMENTS YOU SAW IN THE OUTREACH, MENTORING  
19 FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE TO SUPPORT NEW SERVICES AND FINANCIAL  
20 NEEDS CHILD SUPPORT SUBSIDIES INCREASING -- OFFICE DEVELOPMENT  
21 INCENTIVES TO ENCOURAGE DEVELOPMENT NEAR PUBLIC TRANSIT AS  
22 WELL AS PREVENTION OF INDUSTRIAL AND MANUFACTURING BUSINESSES  
23 FROM CONVERSION. SO WE SEE AGAIN STRONG SUPPORT FOR STRATEGIES  
24 THAT SUPPORT THE ECONOMY AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND  
25 FINALLY CLIMATE CHANGE IN THE ENVIRONMENT. WE ALSO SEE GOOD



September 11, 2020

1 SUPPORT FOR MANY OF THESE STRATEGIES ABOUT CLIMATE CHANGE IN  
2 THE ENVIRONMENT PROTECTING AGRICULTURAL LAND REQUIRING  
3 EMPLOYERS TO LIMIT IN-PERSON OFFICE WORK WHEN TELECOMMUTING OR  
4 WORKING FROM HOME IS AVAILABLE. IF YOU WANT TO NOTE WE DIDN'T  
5 INCLUDE THE 60 PERCENT COMPONENT MORE RECENTLY DESCRIBED IN  
6 THE OUTREACH BECAUSE WOE WANTED TO MAKE SURE WE WERE GETTING  
7 REACTION TO THE CONCEPT AS OPPOSED TO JUST THE NUMBER  
8 GENERALLY A CONCEPT HAVING A WAY TO LIMIT IN-PERSON OFFICE  
9 WORK SEEMS TO BE SOMETHING PEOPLE ARE VERY INTERESTED IN,  
10 REDUCING EMISSIONS, LIKE THINGS LIKE ENCOURAGING PURCHASING  
11 ELECTRIC VEHICLES PROTECTING COMMUNITIES AND BUSINESSES FROM  
12 SEA LEVEL RISE YOU SEE AS WELL AND HERE AT THE BOTTOM LIMITING  
13 SPEED TO 55 MILES AN HOUR TO REDUCE EMISSIONS AGAIN MORE  
14 CHALLENGING SUPPORTED BY 39 PERCENT BUT ANOTHER ONE THE  
15 CONTEXT WE PRESENT IT IN, MAKES IT A LITTLE BIT A CHALLENGE TO  
16 REALLY COMMUNICATE WHAT THE REAL BENEFITS THERE ARE. NEXT  
17 SLIDE PLEASE. I THINK THAT MIGHT HAVE BEEN THE LAST SLIDE OF  
18 DATA. YEAH. THAT'S ALL I HAVE. AND I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY  
19 QUESTIONS. I'M NOT SURE HOW YOU WANT TO PROCEED THROUGH THAT.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** LET'S SEE WHO IS STILL AWAKE AND  
22 SEE IF ANY HANDS GO UP. ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS. SEEING NO  
23 HANDS. MARTHA DO YOU HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

24



September 11, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I THINK MEMBER MITCHOFF IS WAVING HER  
2 HAND.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY I THOUGHT SHE WAS JUST  
5 WAVING HI TO ME. GO AHEAD KAREN GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** I MISS YOU JIM IT'S SO NICE TO TALK TO YOU.  
8 I'M ALWAYS THE ONE THAT POINTS OUT AND I THINK WE WANT TO  
9 THINK OF THESE THINGS AS POSITIVE BUT THAT'S SOMEWHAT  
10 SUPPORTIVE IN MOST OF THOSE CASE IT IS SEEMS TO ME -- MAYBE  
11 I'M WRONG -- I NEED TO GO BACK AND LOOK, THE PERCENTAGE WAS  
12 HIGHER FOR SUPPORTIVE AS OPPOSED TO SUPPORT. I'M ALWAYS  
13 DUBIOUS WHEN YOU PUT THE STRONGLY SUPPORT WITH THE SOMEWHAT  
14 SUPPORT AND ASSUME THAT THAT'S ALL SUPPORT. IT'S JUST A  
15 COMMENT I WANT TO HAVE -- SHARE WITH YOU ALL. THANK YOU.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANYBODY ELSE?  
18 OKAY. URSULA, DO YOU HAVE ANY CLOSING COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?

19

20 **URSULA VOGLER:** NO, CHAIR SPERING.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
23 HAND RAISED.

24

25 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY MARTHA GO AHEAD.



September 11, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MATT GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU  
3 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** IT SAYS TOLLING INFORMATION AT THE REGIONAL ADVISING  
6 WORKING GROUP EARLIER THIS WEEK. THANK YOU.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** URSULA ANSWER?

9

10 **URSULA VOGLER:** WE DID NOT PRESENT THIS TO OUR RAWG. NO.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DO YOU THINK THEY WOULD  
13 APPRECIATE COUNTY THAT. [LAUGHTER] THIS WHOLE PRESENTATION.

14

15 **URSULA VOGLER:** WE TAKE OFFENSE AT THAT. [LAUGHTER]

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. CARLOS. I  
18 SAW YOUR HAND.

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** JUST FOLLOWING UP ON KAREN MITCHOFF'S POINT,  
21 COULD SOMEONE EXPLAIN ACTUALLY WHAT THE SOMEWHAT SUPPORT MEANS  
22 IN THESE SURVEYS. I THINK IT IS IMPORTANT FOR US TO UNDERSTAND  
23 THE INTENSITY OF THAT SUPPORT. AND I'M UNCLEAR. SO IF YOU  
24 COULD EXPLAIN THAT.

25



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SARAH DO YOU WANT TO TAKE THAT  
2 ON.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SURE I'M HAPPY TO. THOSE QUESTIONS, FIRST OF ALL THE  
5 SCALE WE GAVE THE RESPONDENTS WAS A FOUR POINT SCALE, SUPPORT,  
6 STRONGLY SUPPORT, OPPOSE, STRONGLY OPPOSE. ON THE PHONE THEY  
7 GAVE THE RESPONSES IF THEY DIDN'T KNOW WE ACCEPTED THE  
8 RESPONSE AS A NO. IF THEY SKIPPED THE QUESTION THEY WERE  
9 RECORDED AS A NO. I THINK THE POINT SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF MADE  
10 IS AN EXCELLENT ONE THAT INTENSITY DOES MATTER. YOU KNOW, I  
11 THINK THE WAY THEY TEND TO CONTEXT LIES RESPONSES WITH  
12 INTENSITY IS THE PEOPLE IN THE MOST EXTREME POSITIONS STRONGLY  
13 SUPPORT AND STRONGLY OPPOSE THAT ARE MOST LIKELY GOING TO BE  
14 THE PEOPLE YOU MIGHT HEAR FROM IN PUBLIC COMMENT AND OUTREACH,  
15 THE PEOPLE MOST LIKELY TO TAKE ACTION IN SUPPORT OR OPPOSITION  
16 OF SOMETHING, VERSUS THE PEOPLE WHO ARE IN THE CENTRAL  
17 CATEGORY OF SOMEWHAT OPPOSE OR SOMEWHAT SUPPORT WHERE WHEN WE  
18 ASK THEM THEY HAVE AN OPINION BUT IT MIGHT NOT BE AS STRONGLY  
19 HELD THEY MIGHT NOT BE LIKELY TO STEP UP AND SPEAK OR TAKE  
20 ACTION ON A PARTICULAR PLAN. YOU'RE NOT REALLY -- THIS ISN'T  
21 AN ELECTION QUESTION SO IT'S A LITTLE DIFFERENT THAN ARE THEY  
22 GOING TO VOTE YES OR NO. THAT'S NOT WHAT WE'RE ASKING HERE. I  
23 THINK THE POINT OF LOOKING AT THAT INTENSITY AS ANOTHER  
24 INDICATOR OF STRENGTH OF FEELING IS CERTAINLY A GOOD ONE AND  
25 WHY WE INCLUDED IN THE DECK BOTH THE BREAK OUT OF STRONGLY AS



September 11, 2020

1 WELL AS CONTEXT ON THE SCREEN AND EVERYONE DIDN'T HAVE TO  
2 SPEND THE PRESENTATION TRYING TO DO THE MATH. IT'S IMPORTANT  
3 TO KEEP IN MIND AS YOU CONSIDER THE STRATEGIES AND HOW YOU  
4 DISCUSS AND TALK ABOUT THEM. THAT THERE IS CERTAINLY  
5 DIFFERENCE IN INTENSITY IN SOME OF THEM PARTICULARLY ON THE  
6 TRANSPORTATION AND ECONOMY STRATEGIES. HOUSING STRATEGIES ARE  
7 REALLY THE ONLY ONE THAT DIDN'T HAVE AS MUCH VARIATION AND  
8 INTENSITY. YEAH.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.  
11 HOPEFULLY THAT GAVE CLARITY TO THAT ISSUE. I DON'T SEE ANY  
12 OTHER HANDS I WOULD LIKE TO KEEP MOVING ALONG IF WE CAN GO TO  
13 6A, AND DAVE, ARE YOU GOING TO PRESENT THIS? >DAVE VAUTIN: WE  
14 HAVE NO PRESENTATION FOR THIS ITEM. THIS IS RELATED TO WHAT  
15 YOU JUST HEARD IN THE LAST TWO ITEMS.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH. WHAT I WANT TO ASK -- MAYOR  
18 LICCARDO RAISED SOME ISSUES HERE. SO THIS IS AGENDAIZED FOR  
19 ACTION. AND SO, IS THIS WHERE -- I MEAN, HOW ARE YOU GOING TO  
20 ADDRESS HIS ISSUE IF WE TAKE ACTION ON THIS TODAY THE WAY IT'S  
21 PRESENTED?

22

23 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THERESE, CHAIR SPERING. I SUGGEST  
24 COMMISSIONER LICCARDO COULD MAKE HIS MOTION AS PART OF THIS  
25 ACTION. WE WOULD THEN TAKE THAT AS STAFF DIRECTION, MAKE



September 11, 2020

1 MODIFICATIONS PRIOR TO COMMISSION ACTION AT THE END OF THE  
2 MONTH. IS.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. MAYOR LICCARDO ARE YOU  
5 STILL ON HERE?

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** YES, I AM.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SAM, THIS WOULD BE THE PLACE, IF  
10 YOU CAN STATE THAT AGAIN, OR AT LEAST GET IT CLOSE?

11

12 **SAM LICCARDO:** I'M HAPPY TO WORK ON IT JUST GIVE ME A MINUTE  
13 AND I'LL GIVE YOU SOMETHING MORE PRECISE. MY APOLOGIES. I'LL  
14 BE BACK UP AFTER THE PRESENTATION. THANK YOU.

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SAM? SAM?

17

18 **SAM LICCARDO:** YES?

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH, THERE IS NO PRESENTATION.

21

22 **SAM LICCARDO:** FORGIVE ME. I'M SORRY. ALL RIGHT.

23





September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** STATE THE CHANGES. AND YOU KNOW,  
2 JUST GIVE US THE GIST OF WHAT YOU WANT TO ADD TO THE MOTION SO  
3 WE CAN GO AHEAD AND GET WORKING ON IT.

4

5 **SAM LICCARDO:** SURE. THANKS FOR THE OPPORTUNITY, JIM. I GUESS  
6 IT WOULD BE THAT, THAT, TO REFOCUS FUNDING SET ASIDE ALONG THE  
7 CALTRAIN CORRIDOR FOR INVESTMENTS THAT PRIORITIZE BRINGING  
8 HIGH SPEED RAIL INTO THE BAY AREA. AND, I CAN CERTAINLY GO  
9 INTO GREATER DETAIL, AND OFFER STAFF SOME SUGGESTIONS OFFLINE,  
10 BUT THAT WOULD BE THE GENERAL GIST, IF YOU'RE LOOKING FOR  
11 SOMETHING MORE SPECIFIC, I'M HAPPY TO GIVE IT A SHOT, BUT I  
12 THINK IT WOULD PROBABLY BE BETTER TO TRY THAT OFFLINE.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH SAM, I THINK THAT'S PRETTY  
15 GENERIC AND GIVES US SOMETHING TO WORK ON BETWEEN NOW AND WHEN  
16 IT COMES TO THE COMMISSION. SO THERESE OR DAVID, OR MATT, ANY  
17 COMMENT. IS THIS SOMETHING WE CAN WORK ON?

18

19 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THAT SUFFICES THE BOUNDARIES THAT WE COULD  
20 WORK ON WITH RESPECT TO SPECIFIC RECOMMENDATIONS.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY.

23

24 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** WAS THAT A MOTION, MR. CHAIR?

25



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH. AND -- YES, THAT WOULD BE  
2 INCLUDED IN MOVING THE ITEM THAT'S BEFORE US. AND YOU KNOW,  
3 JESS WILL TAKE A VOTE FOR THE ABAG AND WE'LL TAKE ONE FROM  
4 MTC. BUT -- AND SAM, JUST INCLUDE THE BLUEPRINT ACTION PLAN  
5 THAT WAS PRESENTED WITH THE AMENDED CHANGE THAT YOU HAVE  
6 REQUESTED.

7

8 **SAM LICCARDO:** YES I WOULD MAKE THE MOTION TO INCLUDE ALL THAT  
9 WITH THE LANGUAGE I MENTIONED.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. SO IS THERE A SECOND?

12

13 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** THERE IS A SECOND, MACKENZIE.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MARTHA IS THERE ANY PUBLIC  
16 COMMENTED ON THIS ITEM? I THINK WE HAVE ALREADY TAKEN PUBLIC  
17 COMMENT ON THE PLAN.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SORRY. I WAS ON MUTE. THERE WAS ONE PUBLIC  
20 COMMENT SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM. IT WAS FROM NORTH BAY COUNTY  
21 TRANSPORTATION -- SORRY. MY COMPUTER IS FREEZING ME. BUT IT'S  
22 POSTED ONLINE AND IT WAS E-MAILED TO COMMITTEE MEMBERS AND  
23 COMMISSIONERS LAST NIGHT. AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE  
24 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

25



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** BRING THEM ON GIVE THEM ONE  
2 MINUTE SO WE CAN MOVE THIS ITEM.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROLAND, GO AHEAD.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. AND I GOT GOOD NEWS FROM MAYOR LICCARDO,  
7 WE DON'T HAVE TO WAIT FOR THE HIGH SPEED RAIL AUTHORITY TO  
8 BRING HIGH SPEED RAIL FROM CENTRAL VALLEY WE CAN ACTUALLY  
9 START HIGH SPEED RAIL BETWEEN SAN FRANCISCO AND GILROY RIGHT  
10 NOW AS SOON AS IT IS ELECTRIFIED. AND THE REASON WE CAN DO  
11 THIS IS BECAUSE NONE OF THAT SECTION OF THE LINE EXCEEDS 125  
12 MILES AN HOUR. AND UNDER THE CALIFORNIA STATUTE, SPECIFICALLY  
13 CPU C-SECTION 185032, SUBSECTION B, CALTRAIN, OR ANYBODY ELSE  
14 HAVE GOT ANYTHING THEY NEED TO GET THE JOB DONE, AND I WOULD  
15 STRONGLY APPRECIATE IF YOU COULD SUPPORT THAT APPROACH, SO  
16 THAT WE CAN START SHOWING THE REST OF CALIFORNIA HOW WE'RE  
17 GOING TO GET HIGH SPEED RAIL GOING IN CALIFORNIA. THANK YOU.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I DON'T THINK  
20 WE'RE TAKING ANY ACTION. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. MARTHA  
21 COULD YOU TAKE THE ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE?

22

23 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** MR. CHAIRMAN, CAN I ASK A QUESTION?

24



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OH SCOTT I'M SORRY. I DIDN'T SEE  
2 YOUR HAND.

3

4 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** NO. I'M ASKING A QUESTION. THE QUESTION I  
5 HAVE IS, WHAT'S -- I'M JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT SAM'S  
6 DOING. SO THERE WAS A LOT OF PROJECTS ON THE PENINSULA THAT  
7 SAM IS NOW SAYING THAT WE MAY REPRIORITIZE TO AT LEAST GETTING  
8 HIGH SPEED RAIL OVER THE PACHECO, IS THAT CORRECT?

9

10 **SAM LICCARDO:** MAYBE I COULD REFRAME A LITTLE BIT. I APOLOGIZE.  
11 BECAUSE IT WAS SO BROAD, I CAN UNDERSTAND HOW IT MAY BE TOO  
12 SWEEPING. I RECOGNIZE THERE ARE CLEARLY CALTRAIN PRIORITIES  
13 THAT NEED TO BE FUNDED SPECIFICALLY FOR CALTRAIN THERE IS SOME  
14 DUAL USE INVESTMENTS SUCH AS GRADE SEPARATIONS WHERE  
15 STRATEGICALLY INVESTING THOSE IN LOCATIONS MAY BE MORE  
16 CONDUCIVE TO BRINGING HIGH SPEED RAIL THAN IN OTHER LOCATIONS.  
17 AND YOU KNOW, WITHOUT GETTING INTO DETAILS I'M HAPPY TO  
18 PRESENT SOMETHING MORE SPECIFIC WHEN THE COMMISSION MEETS, BUT  
19 CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, I DON'T THINK WE NEED TO GET FAR INTO THE  
20 WEEDS. I THINK THE BASIC ISSUE IS WE NEED TO DEMONSTRATE TO  
21 HIGH SPEED RAIL THAT WE ARE COMMITTED TO PROVIDING SOME  
22 REGIONAL SOURCE FOR HIGH SPEED RAIL TO GET HERE.

23

24 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** FIRST OF ALL THAT'S -- YOU KNOW, IT MAKES  
25 SENSE THAT WE WOULD GET IT OVER PACHECO, IT'S KIND OF LIKE THE



September 11, 2020

1 DONUT HOLE OF THE PROJECT, RIGHT? YOU'RE DOING ALL THESE  
2 IMPROVEMENTS ON ONE END AND YOU HAVE GOT THE TRAIN ON THE  
3 OTHER END AND YOU DON'T DO ANYTHING IN THE MIDDLE, YOU'RE IN A  
4 KIND OF A PROBLEM. I UNDERSTAND THAT. WHAT I DON'T UNDERSTAND  
5 IS, DOES THIS STILL LEAVE IT IN PROGRAM TWO?

6

7 **SAM LICCARDO:** MY MOTION IS NOT TO MOVE MONEY FROM ONE PROGRAM  
8 TO ANOTHER. I KNOW THAT GETS STICKY PARTICULARLY WITH  
9 CONSTRAINTS. IT'S MORE TO MAKE SURE THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL IS  
10 CALLED OUT. THROUGHOUT THE PLAN.

11

12 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** YEAH SAM THANK YOU FOR ALLOWING ME TO GET  
13 CLARIFICATION.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SCOTT WAS THAT IT?

16

17 **DIR. SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THAT IS IT, MR. CHAIR.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH AND WHAT I WAS HOPING MAYOR  
20 LICCARDO WOULD DO IS JUST KIND OF, YOU KNOW, MAKE THE MOTION,  
21 SO WE CAN HAVE A LITTLE FURTHER DEFINITION AT THE COMMISSION  
22 MEETING. SO WE CAN -- I DON'T THINK HE'S MAKING A  
23 RECOMMENDATION OF ANYTHING IN PARTICULAR OF ANYTHING BEING  
24 MOVED RIGHT NOW. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO BE INCLUDED IN THE  
25 MOTION SO WE CAN MOVE FORWARD WITH DISCUSSION TO THE



September 11, 2020

1 COMMISSION. WITH THAT MARTHA IF YOU'RE READY CAN YOU TAKE THE  
2 ROLL OF MTC COMMITTEE MEMBERS?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE] IT PASSES  
5 UNANIMOUSLY.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY THANK YOU. JESSE, CAN YOU GO  
8 AHEAD AND CALL FOR THE ROLL FOR THE ABAG MEMBERS VOTE?

9

10 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** YES. I WOULD LIKE TO PRESENT A  
11 MOTION SIMILAR TO MTC MOTION TO REFER ABAG RESOLUTION 162020  
12 TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR APPROVAL.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

15

16 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MOVED BY HAGGERTY SECONDED BY  
17 MACKENZIE. ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION FROM THE ABAG MEMBERS? IF  
18 NOT THEN WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC  
19 COMMENT? IF SO PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR PRESS STAR NINE.  
20 SEEING NO RAISED HANDS. MR. CASTRO IF WE COULD PLEASE CALL THE  
21 ROLL?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES  
24 UNANIMOUSLY. THANK YOU.

25



September 11, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU JESS. NEXT ITEM IS  
2 PUBLIC COMMENTS. DO WE HAVE ANY MARTHA?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC  
5 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** GIVE THEM ONE MINUTE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROLAND GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** SO THIS IS ROLAND. SO IN ONE MINUTE, YOU KNOW THAT  
12 CHAIR HAGGERTY HAS BEEN VERY VOCAL ABOUT CONNECTING THE BAY  
13 AREA TO SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY, AND MAYOR LICCARDO RAISED MULTIPLE  
14 ISSUES WITH WHAT'S GOING ON IN THE SOUTH BAY. SO IN WRAPPING  
15 UP WHAT I WOULD LIKE IS FOR EVERYBODY TO GOOGLE THE SAN JOSE  
16 SAN FRANCISCO, OAKLAND, COMBINED STATISTICAL AREA PSA. IT WILL  
17 EXPLAIN TO YOU, AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL, THAT THE FEDS ARE JUST  
18 USING STATISTICAL DATA HAS DISCOVERED WE HAVE GOT A MASSIVE  
19 PLANNING PROBLEM HERE. BECAUSE WE'RE NOT PLANNING FOR ALL THE  
20 GROWTH THAT IS TAKING PLACE RIGHT NEXT DOOR TO US AND ALL THAT  
21 GROWTH IS CONNECTING TO THE BAY AREA ON THE EAST SIDE OF THE  
22 ALTAMONT PASS AND INTO THE SOUTH LIKE COYOTE VALLEY AND I AM  
23 ASKING THAT YOU START WORKING ON LEGISLATION THAT'S GOING TO  
24 BASICALLY ALIGN OUR PLANNING BOUNDARIES WITH THE COMBINED --

25



September 11, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROLAND THAT'S TIME --

2

3 I'M DONE. WITH THE COMBINED STATISTICAL AREA. THANK YOU.

4

5 **>>JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU ROLAND. THAT'S PUBLIC