

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MARCH 08, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 08, 2023, 9:40 AM

FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING. THIS MEETING OF THE ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE IS NOW CALLED TO ORDER. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION'S WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING ON ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON WITH THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. AT THIS TIME, COULD WE HAVE THE ROLL CALL?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: YES. GOOD MORNING. CHAIR GLOVER?

FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR CHAVEZ? CHAVEZ.

CINDY CHAVEZ, V. CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

4

5 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN? QUORUM IS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

16

17 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM ON OUR AGENDA IS

18 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. THAT INCLUDES 2A THROUGH 2I. ARE THERE

19 ANY MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE WISHING TO PULL AN ITEM? SEEING

20 NONE. IS THERE ANY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO HAS SENT IN

21 ANYTHING OR WANT TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH

24 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED

25 ON THIS ITEM.



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** OKAY. I WOULD ENTERTAIN A MOTION. OKAY.
3 AND A SECOND? WE HAVE A MOTION BY CHAVEZ, A SECOND BY RONEN.
4 ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. NO NEED TO DO THE
7 ROLL CALL SINCE WE'RE IN-PERSON WE'LL SIMPLY NEED TO STATE
8 THAT THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT?

9

10 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** IF THAT'S THE CASE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** IT IS THE CASE.

13

14 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER] OKAY. ALL IN FAVOR? AYE.
15 OPPOSED? OKAY. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
16 PRESENT. ON TO OUR NEXT ITEM ON THE AGENDA. WHICH IS 3A, MTC
17 RESOLUTION 4565 GRANT FUNDING FOR MTC TO BAIFA FOR REGIONAL
18 EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANT HOUSING PRESERVATION PRIORITY SITE
19 PROGRAM AND AUTHORITY TO THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO TAKE
20 ACTIONS ON IMPLEMENTATION OF THE GRANT. AND WE HAVE WITH US
21 TODAY, I THINK SAMOYA? DID I PRONOUNCE THAT RIGHT?

22

23 **SOMAYA ABDELGANY:** HELLO COMMITTEE THANK YOU FOR HAVING ME HERE
24 TODAY. MY NAME IS SOMAYA, I AM THE PRESERVATION PROGRAM
25 COORDINATOR FOR THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. AND I



MARCH 08, 2023

1 AM EXCITED TO SPEAK TO YOU TODAY ABOUT TWO SPECIFIC PROGRAMS
2 WITHIN THE REGIONAL EARLY ACTION PLANNING GRANT FOR WHICH
3 WE'RE SEEKING APPROVAL TO TRANSFER FUNDS FROM MTC TO BAHFA FOR
4 THE ADMINISTRATION OF THOSE PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE. CONTEXT
5 ABOUT HOW WE GOT HERE, THERE HAVE BEEN AS YOU ALL KNOW MULTI-
6 YEAR PLANNING EFFORTS THAT ARE NOW CONVERGING AT THIS
7 IMPLEMENTATION OPPORTUNITY THROUGH STATE FUNDING. SO, PLANNED
8 BAY AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED IN FALL OF 2021, AND INCLUDED
9 SEVERAL HOUSING STRATEGIES AROUND PRESERVING EXISTING
10 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND PRODUCING NEW HOUSING FOR RESIDENTS AT
11 ALL INCOME LEVELS. WE HAD THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
12 ALLOCATION, SIXTH CYCLE ADOPT WINTER 2021 THAT IDENTIFIES
13 40,000 UNITS THAT NEED TO BE BUILT AROUND THE REGION TO MEET
14 OUR CYCLE NEEDS. WE HAVE THE REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL
15 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM LAUNCHED THROUGH ABAG IN 2020 AND HAS BEEN
16 HIGHLY SUCCESSFUL IN PROVIDING LOCAL JURISDICTIONS WITH
17 HOUSING ELEMENT SUPPORT AND OTHER HOUSING POLICY SUPPORT OVER
18 THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS AND FINALLY THE BAY AREA HOUSING
19 FINANCE AUTHORITY ESTABLISHED BY STATE LEGISLATION IN 2019
20 COMPLETED ITS FIRST ROUND OF STAFFING IN 2020 AND LAUNCHED. WE
21 HAVE TWO SPECIFIC PROGRAMS WE WOULD LIKE TO TALK TO YOU ABOUT
22 TODAY HOUSING PRESERVATION PILOT AND PRIORITY SITES PILOT IN
23 CASE THIS SOUNDS FAMILIAR TO YOU IT HAS BEEN PRESENTED TO
24 SEVERAL MTC COMMITTEES ARE IN 2022 INCLUDING THE PROGRAMMING
25 AND ALLOCATIONS, AND THE JOINTS MTC PLANNING AND ABAG



MARCH 08, 2023

1 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. SO, THAT'S A GOOD SIGN IF YOU CAN
2 REMEMBER A LOT OF THE STUFF THAT I'M ABOUT TO SHARE. NEXT
3 SLIDE. FOR THOSE WHO HAVEN'T HEARD ABOUT REAP IN THE PAST IT'S
4 A \$600 MILLION STATEWIDE GRANT PROGRAM TO METROPOLITAN
5 PLANNING ORGANIZATIONS THERE IS A \$103 MILLION FORMULA
6 ALLOCATION TO MTC FOR THE BAY AREA OVERALL GOAL THE GRANT
7 PROGRAM IS TO ACCELERATE PROGRESS TOWARDS HOUSING EQUITY AND
8 CLIMATE GOALS GENERAL ALLOWABLE USES OF FUNDS FOR PLANNING
9 EFFORTS CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT IMPLEMENT SUSTAINABLE
10 COMMUNITIES STRATEGIES WHICH IN OUR CASE PLAN 2050
11 ADMINISTERED BY HCD IN COLLABORATION WITH THE OFFICE OF
12 PLANNING AND RESEARCH AND STRATEGIC GROWTH COUNCIL AND THE
13 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD. THE PRINCIPLES ACCELERATE
14 INFILL DEVELOPMENT FACILITIES HOUSING SUPPLY CHOICE AND
15 AFFORDABILITY AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING AND
16 REDUCING VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND PROGRAMS ARE FUNDED MUST
17 DO ALL THREE. MILESTONES ALREADY COMPLETED, WE RECEIVED
18 COMMISSION APPROVAL OF STAFF'S PROPOSAL OF \$103 MILLION IN
19 REAP FUNDS IN NOVEMBER 2022 STAFF SUBMITTED OUR APPLICATION
20 WITH THE STATE HOUSING COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT IN DECEMBER OF
21 2022. WE'RE NOW AT THE PROGRAM DESIGN REFINEMENT AND COMMITTEE
22 APPROVAL STAGE PART OF WHICH TODAY'S ACTION IS INCLUDED AND
23 AFTER THAT WE WILL BE EXECUTING A STANDARD AGREEMENT WITH HCD
24 FOR THESE FUNDS, AND HCD'S DEADLINE FOR US TO ENCUMBER FUNDS
25 AND COMMIT IS JUNE 30TH, 2026 AND DISBURSE -- SORRY --



MARCH 08, 2023

1 ENCUMBRANCE BY JUNE 2024 DISBURSEMENT BY JUNE 2026. NEXT
2 SLIDE. WE'RE PROPOSING TO USE THE \$300 MILLION FOR A MIX OF
3 TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING USES ON THE TRANSPORTATION SIDE
4 THERE IS THE COMMUNITY CHOICE PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION AND
5 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION. ON THE HOUSING
6 SIDE FOCUS OF TODAY'S DISCUSSION IS THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
7 REGIONAL GROWTH FRAMEWORK IMPLEMENTATION COMPRISED OF THREE
8 DISTINCT PROGRAMS. FIRST CONTINUATION AND EXPANSION OF THE
9 AGENCY'S SUCCESSFUL REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE
10 PROGRAM TO LOCAL HOUSING AND JURISDICTIONS LAUNCHED BY HCD
11 FIRST REAP TO ABAG IN 2020. SECOND PROGRAM TWO NEW AFFORDABLE
12 HOUSING PILOTS, WHICH ARE HIGHLIGHTED IN TODAY'S PRESENTATION,
13 AND THESE ARE THE HOUSING PRESERVATION PILOT AND PRIORITY
14 SITES PREDEVELOPMENT PILOT BEING IMPLEMENTED IN PARTNERSHIP
15 WITH THE RECENTLY LAUNCHED BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY
16 OR BAHFA. IMPORTANTLY THIS WOULD REQUIRE A TRANSFER OF \$43
17 MILLION IN REAP 2.0 FUNDING FROM MTC AS THE STATE'S NPO
18 GRANTEE TO THE BAHFA ADMINISTRATOR WHICH WE HOPE TO ACHIEVE
19 THROUGH TODAY'S ACTION. NEXT SLIDE. BEFORE I DIG INTO THE PRO
20 PROGRAMS, I WOULD LIKE TO CONTEXTUALIZE BAHFA'S ROLE IN REAP
21 2.0. IT WAS ESTABLISHED BY ASSEMBLY BILL 1487 IN 2019 AND
22 BAHFA'S MANDATE IS TO RAISE ADMINISTER AND ALLOCATE REGIONAL
23 FUNDING FOR PROTECTION AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRESERVATION AND NEW
24 PRODUCTION. THIS IS WHAT THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PILOTS INTEND
25 TO DO LAUNCHING FIRST PILOT IN 2022 NOW POISED WITH SKILLS



MARCH 08, 2023

1 NEEDED TO EXECUTE THE REAP 2.0 AFFORDABLE HOUSING PILOTS. WHAT
2 ARE THOSE TWO PILOTS? IF I COULD GET THE NEXT SLIDE? WE HAVE
3 THE HOUSING PRESERVATION PILOT FOR \$15 MILLION. THIS WOULD
4 PROVIDE OVER THE COUNTER CAPITAL FINANCING TO NON-PROFIT
5 DEVELOPERS AND COMMUNITY LAND TRUSTS FOR ACQUISITION AND
6 REHABILITATION OF OCCUPIED RESIDENTIAL BUILDINGS. IT WOULD
7 PREVENT DISPLACEMENT OF AT LEAST 60 FAMILIES BY CONVERTING
8 THESE PROPERTIES INTO PERMANENTLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING. IT WOULD
9 ALLOW US TO BEGIN TO FULFILL THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
10 COMMITMENT TO TAKE THE LEAD ON PRESERVATION. IT WOULD BUILD
11 UPON THE EXISTING BAY AREA PRESERVATION PILOT WHICH WAS MTC'S,
12 SORT OF, FIRST FORAY INTO THE PRESERVATION SPACE AND IS
13 ADMINISTERED IN PARTNERSHIP WITH COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
14 FINANCING INSTITUTIONS AS WAS RECENTLY REVISED BASED ON EARLY
15 FEEDBACK FROM POTENTIAL BORROWERS. SO WE'RE TAKING ALL OF
16 THOSE LESSONS TO DEVELOP A NEW IN-HOUSE CAPITAL FUND THAT
17 STRIKES BALANCE BETWEEN CAPITAL FUNDS AND BUILDING EQUITY WITH
18 COMMUNITY OWNERSHIP MODELS. IF I COULD GET TO THE NEXT SLIDE
19 PLEASE. THE SECOND PROGRAM IS A PRIORITY SITES PILOT FOR \$28
20 MILLION AND THIS WOULD BE A PREDEVELOPMENT LOAN PROGRAM TO
21 HELP LAUNCH PROJECTS RESULTING ANYWHERE FROM 750 TO 3,000
22 AFFORDABLE HOUSING BRIDGING UP TO \$2 BILLION INTO THE REGION
23 BY LEVERAGING BAHFA'S EXPERTISE AND PRERECALL DEVELOPMENT
24 FUNDING FOR PROJECTS. ESTABLISH A NETWORK OF REGIONALLY
25 SIGNIFICANT LOCALLY NOMINATED PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT SITES AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 TRANSFORM SURPLUS PUBLIC LAND, CREATING A PIPELINE FOR
2 POTENTIAL FUTURE BAHFA AND OTHER LOCAL AND STATE FUNDING
3 OPPORTUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE. IN TERMS OF PREPROGRAM GUIDELINES
4 APPROVAL THERE IS CURRENTLY A PARALLEL PROCESS HAPPENING WITH
5 OUR COMMUNITIES AND BOARD. WE WENT TO THE ADVISEE COMMITTEE IN
6 FEBRUARY, TO DISCUSS GUIDELINES AND WE PLAN TO GO TO THE BAHFA
7 OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE TOMORROW TO FURTHER SEEK APPROVAL FOR
8 RECOMMENDATION TO THE BAHFA BOARD MARCH 22ND. THIS IS ALL
9 PENDING HCD APPROVAL OF OUR PROPOSED PROGRAM THAT WAS
10 SUBMITTED TO THEM IN DECEMBER WHICH THEY HAVE COMMITTED TO
11 DOING BY MARCH 31ST OF 2023. SO WITH ALL OF THOSE APPROVALS IN
12 PLACE LAUNCH NOFA THIS SUMMER FOR THE TWO PROGRAMS AND
13 POTENTIALLY EARLIER FOR THE PRIORITY SITES PROGRAM. NEXT
14 SLIDE. SO ULTIMATELY TODAY'S ACTION IS SEEKING MTC'S
15 AUTHORIZATION TO TRANSFER FUNDING AND PROGRAMMATIC
16 RESPONSIBILITY FOR THE \$43 MILLION IN REAP 2.0 PROCEEDS TO
17 BAHFA TO ADMINISTER THE HOUSING PRESERVATION AND PRIORITY
18 SITES PILOTS. AND WITH THAT, THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION.
19 AND HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS. THROUGHOUT CHAIR.

20

21 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION. DO WE
22 HAVE ANY COMMISSIONER QUESTIONS? YES, VICE CHAIR?

23



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR GLOVER. I KNOW ONE
2 OF THE OBJECTIVES OF REAP 2.0 IS TO REDUCE VMT COULD YOU TELL
3 US ABOUT HOW THE TWO PROGRAMS ARE GOING TO BE DOING THAT?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THERE ARE GEOGRAPHIES THAT WE HAVE DESIGNATED, WE
6 HAVE SOME GEOGRAPHIES THAT WE HAVE DESIGNATED AS BEING
7 ELIGIBLE FOR THESE PROGRAMS WE HAVE MAPPED OUT AS PART OF
8 THOSE GEOGRAPHIES LOW VMT AREA SO ANY AREA THAT HAS VMT PER
9 CAPITA OF 15 MILES OR LESS WHICH IS AVERAGE FOR THE BAY AREA
10 WOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR THIS PROGRAM IN ORDER TO MEET THE
11 REDUCING VMT REQUIREMENT IN THE SAME VEIN REDUCING VMT AND
12 INFILL WE'RE TARGETING GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FROM PLANNED BAY
13 AREA INCLUDING PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND TRANSIT PRIORITY
14 AREAS WITHIN A HALF MILE BUFFER OF TRANSIT.

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. THAT'S THE ONLY PLACE THAT'S GOING
17 TO BE ELIGIBLE FOR THESE TWO PROGRAMS ARE THOSE TWO
18 GEOGRAPHIES?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** CORRECT. AND WE HAVE AN ASTERISK IF YOU ARE OUTSIDE
21 OF THOSE GEOGRAPHIES BUT CAN PROVIDE SOME DOCUMENTATION AT THE
22 PROJECT LEVEL THAT YOU ARE REDUCING VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED
23 THAT WE WOULD BE ABLE TO CONSIDER THAT ON A PROJECT BY PROJECT
24 BASIS BUT YOU ARE IMMEDIATELY ELIGIBLE IF YOU ARE IN THOSE
25 GEOGRAPHIES THIS HAS COME UP FOR EXAMPLE, IN CERTAIN AREAS



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THAT MAYBE DON'T HAVE AS GREAT TRANSIT ACCESS AND HAVE MAYBE
2 THE ARGUMENT THAT IF YOU CREATE HOUSING FOR FOLKS TO LIVE AND
3 WORK IN THE SAME CITY WOULD YOU BE REDUCING VEHICLE MILES
4 TRAVELED BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT COMMUTING FROM HOURS AWAY IF RR
5 AWAY F THEY CAN QUANTIFY THAT WE'LL LOOK AT THAT BUT GENERALLY
6 THE LOW VMT AREAS AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES.

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I WANT TO ADD TO THE POINT.
9 ALIX BOCKELMAN, DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR POLICY. THIS
10 FRIDAY THE JOINT PLANNING AND ADMIN COMMITTEE WILL BE HEARING
11 A PRESENTATION WITH MORE DETAIL ON THE PRIORITY SITES
12 NOMINATION CRITERIA, WHICH I THINK WILL GET INTO MORE DETAIL
13 ABOUT WHAT SOME OF YOU ARE ASKING VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. AND
14 THAT IS, AFTER THAT CONVERSATION ON FRIDAY, IT'S SUPPOSED TO
15 GO TO THE FULL MTC COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AS WELL AS THE ABAG
16 EXECUTIVE BOARD. I WANTED TO ADD THAT.

17

18 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I THINK, AS YOU CAN PROBABLY TELL BY MY
19 QUESTIONING I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE HONOR THAT PURPOSE
20 OF THE PROGRAM AND THAT WE'RE USING THIS TO ADVANCE OUR
21 REGIONAL PLAN AND WE HAVE IDENTIFIED GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. SO
22 I'M HOPING WE CAN KIND OF BE CONSISTENT ABOUT TARGETING THAT.
23 I WOULD LOVE TO SEE A MAP OF LOW VMT AREAS IN THE BAY AREA I
24 HAVE BEEN WANTING TO SEE THAT MAP FOREVER BECAUSE IT'S
25 MENTIONED A BUNCH OF OUR STUFF AND OTHERS. SO IF SOMEONE COULD



MARCH 08, 2023

1 ACCEPTED THAT TO ME THAT WOULD BE TERRIFIC. THANK YOU VERY
2 MUCH.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** HAPPY TO PROVIDE THAT.

5

6 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS? COMMISSIONER
7 RONEN?

8

9 **HILLARY RONEN:** MY QUESTION IS SIMILAR IN ANSWER, BUT I WANT TO
10 MENTION HOW EXCITING THIS IS, YAY, TO FINALLY HAVE THE FUNDS,
11 TO HAVE BAHFA PRESERVE AND BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING. IT'S VERY
12 MONUMENTAL, HOWEVER BECAUSE IT'S ONLY 43 MILLION AND HOPEFULLY
13 IT WILL BE MORE EVERY SINGLE YEAR, I'M JUST -- I'M -- I THINK
14 I WAS ON BAHFA, I THINK I WILL STILL BE. BUT I'M VERY MUCH
15 LOOKING FORWARD TO THE DISCUSSION THAT ALIX WAS DISCUSSING
16 ABOUT THE DETAILS. BUT I JUST WANTED TO JUST TAKE A MOMENT TO
17 CELEBRATE. THIS IS REALLY, REALLY WONDERFUL. THANK YOU SO
18 MUCH.

19

20 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** OKAY. CHAIR PEDROZA?

21

22 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR GLOVER. I ECHO AROUND THE
23 PILOTS HOW DO WE TELL THE STORY OF WHAT WE ACHIEVED. IT WOULD
24 BE GREAT TO TRACK OUTCOMES THAT WE PRODUCE THAT WOULD BE ABLE
25 TO HELP TELL THE STORY TO GREAT POTS BUT ALSO PULL UP WHAT



MARCH 08, 2023

1 SUCCESSES BUT ALSO WHAT'S NOT WORKING EITHER FOR INTENDED
2 PURPOSES. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT REPORT COME BACK.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YES. ONE THING ABOUT THIS FUNDING IS IT HAS REPORTING
5 REQUIREMENTS AS A MASTER REQUIREMENT WE'RE GOING TO BE
6 TRACKING HOW MANY UNITS WERE PRESERVED, PRODUCED, AND
7 UNDERSTANDING HOW MANY YOU KNOW, TRYING TO QUANTIFY THE
8 REDUCTION OF VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED AND ALL OF THESE THINGS SO
9 WE SHOULD HAVE SOME, AS FAR AS WE CAN FOR HCD, WE SHOULD HAVE
10 THAT DATA TO BACK US UP.

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOU MENTIONED HCD. I WOULD LOVE TO HAVE A
13 LARGER CONVERSATION ABOUT THEM, I THINK THEY'RE AN INCREDIBLE
14 PARTNER IN THIS DILEMMA WE'RE IN BUT THAT PARTNERSHIP DOES
15 NEED TO BE ENHANCED IN THE FUTURE.

16

17 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** ANY OTHER? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** REITERATE WHAT THE CHAIR SAID. PLEASE, BECAUSE
20 THIS IS SO IMPORTANT TO US, AND THE DATA, SO WHAT WORKS AND
21 WHAT NEEDS TO WORK BETTER. I WANT TO POINT OUT ONE THING TOO,
22 THE INTERACTION BETWEEN TRANSIT AND THESE DEVELOPMENTS, WE
23 JUST HAD AN SB35 PROJECT PRESENTED TO US, GREAT, LOW-INCOME,
24 EXTRA LOW-INCOME, HOWEVER, HIGH SPEED RAIL HAS DESIGNATED THE
25 SITE FOR STREET LEVEL PARKING. SO, THIS IS TROUBLESOME TO SAY



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THE LEAST. I THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THOSE PARTNERSHIPS THAT
2 WE ALWAYS TALK ABOUT, THE INTERACTION, ARE NOTED AND BOTH
3 HOUSING AND TRANSIT ARE WORKING TOGETHER. SO, THANK YOU VERY
4 MUCH.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU SO MUCH.

7

8 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** VICE CHAIR CHAVEZ?

9

10 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
11 REPORT AND THE GOOD WORK. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT HOW WE WOULD
12 DELINEATE PROJECTS THAT ARE GETTING DEVELOPED BECAUSE OF THIS
13 MONEY VERSUS PROJECTS THAT ARE ALREADY MOVING FORWARD THAT THE
14 MONEY ENHANCES?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** INTERESTING QUESTION. I THINK THAT IN TERMS OF THE
17 PRIORITY SITES PILOT, I THINK BOTH PROGRAMS ARE REALLY GOING
18 TO REWARD PROJECTS THAT HAVE OTHER FUNDING TO LEVERAGE AGAINST
19 OURS JUST IN TERMS OF DEMONSTRATING READINESS. THAT, LIKE,
20 THAT OUR DOLLARS ARE HELPING THEM GET ACROSS THE FINISH LINE.
21 SO I THINK THAT THE INCLUSION OF OTHER FUNDS -- IF I'M
22 UNDERSTANDING YOUR QUESTION CORRECTLY STOP ME IF I'M NOT --
23 THE INCLUSION OF FUNDS FROM OTHER SOURCES WE'RE SEEING AS AN
24 ASSET THAT'S ALLOWING FOLKS TO GET ACROSS THE FINISH LINE WITH
25 THESE DOLLARS. BUT IN TERMS OF, I GUESS, IS THERE A SCENARIO



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THAT YOU'RE THINKING OF IN WHICH THE PROJECT WOULD HAPPEN
2 WITHOUT US?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** WELL, FRANKLY, SO, JUST KIND OF TWO BIG CONCERNS
5 I'LL SHARE WITH MY COLLEAGUES. ONE IS THAT I AM VERY
6 INTERESTED IN KNOWING HOW NEW PROGRAMS CONSENT AND DRIVE
7 DEVELOPMENT. AND, SO, RIGHT NOW, FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE COMMUNITY
8 THAT I LIVE IN, WE HAVE A NUMBER OF SHOVEL READY PROJECTS, AND
9 EVERYBODY IS EXCITED TO PUT IN THEIR \$4 TO GET IT TO BE FULLY
10 FUNDED. SO THEN IT'S, YOU KNOW, IT WOULD HAVE HAPPENED,
11 BECAUSE WE WOULD HAVE GOTTEN \$4 FROM SOMEWHERE, PRESUMABLY, SO
12 WHAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT IS OUR ABILITY TO DEMONSTRATE THAT
13 THIS NEW MECHANISM IS ACTUALLY INCENTING A DESIGN THAT WE
14 HAVEN'T SEEN ALREADY VERSUS ONE MORE APPLICATION FOR SOMEONE
15 TO FILL OUT AND GET A LITTLE MORE MONEY FOR A PROJECT THAT
16 WOULD HAPPEN ANYWAY.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** FOLKS GENERALLY BECAUSE OF THE WAY PRESERVATION
19 PROJECTS WORK AND THE WAY THEY'RE TAKING ADVANTAGE OF
20 OPPORTUNITIES AS THEY ARISE ON THE MARKET THEY'RE NOT LOOKING
21 FOR PRESERVATION PROJECTS UNLESS THERE IS FUNDING TO GO OUT
22 AND ACQUIRE THOSE PROPERTIES. ON THE PRESERVATION SIDE THERE
23 IS LOCAL DEVELOPERS THAT ARE EXCITED TO HEAR ABOUT THIS
24 INCENTIVIZING AND ACTUALLY GO OUT AND LOOK FOR PROPERTIES THEY
25 COULD USE THIS FUNDING TO GO OUT AND BUY AND STABILIZE AS



MARCH 08, 2023

1 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. IN THE CASE OF PROJECTS THAT ARE AWAITING
2 FUNDING AND PREDEVELOPMENT AND ARE AWAITING FOR FUNDING, WE
3 HAVE A PIPELINE PROJECT AROUND PROJECTS HAVE BEEN SITTING FOR
4 YEARS IT'S NOT NECESSARILY JUST A NEED TO SUBMIT APPLICATION
5 THIS IS A PREDEVELOPMENT FUND SO THESE ARE FUNDS THAT WOULD
6 COME IN EVEN BEFORE THEY HAVE GOT -- THEY'RE NECESSARILY NEAR
7 CONSTRUCTION. THE CLOSER THEY ARE TO CONSTRUCTION THE MORE WE
8 WANT TO ACCELERATE THAT PROCESS AND MAKE IT HAPPEN SOONER. IT
9 IS CATALYZING. I MAY NOT BE SPEAKING TO THIS ELOQUENTLY, AND I
10 WOULD WELCOME BACKUP FROM KATE WHO IS THE EXPERT.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YOU'RE DOING FINE. I WOULD JUST SAY TO MY
13 COLLEAGUES, I THINK ON THE REHABILITATION SIDE, I THINK THAT
14 IS AN EXCELLENT POINT AND IT'S ACTUALLY SOMETHING THAT I
15 HADN'T THOUGHT ABOUT SO THANK YOU FOR THAT. THAT'S SUPER
16 HELPFUL. AS IT RELATES TO THE PREDEVELOPMENT FUNDS, I THINK WE
17 KNOW, IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE COMMUNITY, THAT THAT WORKS,
18 HAVING THEM. SO, I THINK THAT'S REALLY GREAT, BUT I DON'T
19 THINK THAT'S INNOVATIVE. I THINK IT'S OPPORTUNISTIC, WHICH I
20 THINK IS FINE TOO. SO, WHICH IS FINE. I JUST THINK WHAT WOULD
21 BE HELPFUL TO UNDERSTAND IS WHERE WE CAN ACTUALLY LEARN
22 SOMETHING THAT WE DON'T ALREADY KNOW, AND SO THAT'S ONE BIG
23 PIECE. AND, SO FRANKLY IT'S NOT A LOT OF MONEY, RELATIVE TO
24 THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. SO THE OTHER THING IS THAT, I KNOW
25 ALL OF US ARE DISCIPLINED ABOUT, NO IT SHOULD BE IN MY



MARCH 08, 2023

1 DISTRICT, IN MY AREA. IN THESE INSTANCES IT WOULD BE BETTER TO
2 GO DEEP THAN GOING BROAD. THAT'S GOING TO REQUIRE TOLERANCE
3 FROM US. OTHERWISE, I THINK THE POINT ALFREDO ASKED ABOUT IS
4 HOW ARE WE ABLE TO DEMONSTRATE THE IMPACT AND THE IMPACT
5 WOULDN'T HAVE HAD BUT FOR THIS. THAT'S FROM A LEARNING
6 PERSPECTIVE I WAS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND. ON THE REHAB SIDE
7 YOU'RE RIGHT THERE IS NOT NEARLY ENOUGH DOLLARS FOR THAT.
8 ANYWAY, I THINK THIS IS VERY EXCITING. AND REALLY, I THINK,
9 COLLEAGUES, I DO NOT LIKE TO SAY NOT IT MEANING THAT I DON'T
10 WANT TO -- I'M NOT NECESSARILY TRYING TO SEE THESE COME TO
11 SANTA CLARA COUNTY, BUT I THINK GOING DEEP AND UNDERSTANDING
12 THAT DOING THAT ON THE REHAB SIDE IN TERMS OF WHAT IS IT THAT
13 -- WHAT DOES IT TAKE TO GET THEM PURCHASED AND AVAILABLE AND
14 THEN THE OTHER THING I WOULD REQUEST IS THAT WE'RE TAKING A
15 LOOK AT OUR HOUSING AUTHORITY PARTNERSHIPS SO WE'RE ABLE TO
16 MARY SECTION-EIGHT VOUCHERS PARTICULARLY FOCUS ON PROJECT
17 BASED VOUCHERS ABLE TO EITHER PRESERVE NATURALLY AFFORDABLE
18 HOUSING AND THEN PROTECT IT THAT WOULD BE GREAT IN TERMS OF
19 LEARNING HOW OTHERS AS WE THINK ABOUT DOING IT. ONE OF THE
20 THINGS I GET WORRIED ABOUT IS MONEY GETTING SUCKED UP INTO
21 THINKING PLANNING FEELING AND NOT BEING ABLE TO SEE THE DOOR
22 WITH PEOPLE GOING IN. AND SO THAT'S WHY I'M HOPEFUL THAT THIS
23 PREWORK WILL ACTUALLY DEMONSTRATE THAT WE REGIONALLY HAVE THE
24 CAPACITY TO USE MONEY FOR SOMETHING BEYOND PLANNING, AND THAT



MARCH 08, 2023

1 WE SEE FAMILIES IN THE DOOR AND WE CAN USE THE LESSONS
2 LEARNED. THANK YOU. THAT'S REALLY HELPFUL.

3

4 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER?

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR YOUR
7 COMMENTS. IT REMINDS ME, WE JUST YESTERDAY HAD AN IMPORTANT
8 MEETING WHERE WE SET ASIDE MONEY FOR PREDEVELOPMENT FOR A
9 HOMEKEY SITE. I THINK ONE OF THE ISSUES THAT I BROUGHT UP,
10 BACKGROUND AND DEVELOPMENT WAS A PERCENTAGE OF OVERALL COST
11 GOING TO THE PREDEVELOPMENT WAS ABOUT 40% OF THE OVERALL
12 BUDGET OF THE PROJECT. SO, I THINK I'M ALL FOR THE
13 PREDEVELOPMENT PIECE, BUT I THINK WE NEED GUARDRAILS. BECAUSE
14 YOU WILL NEVER GET TO THAT DOOR IF YOU ARE SPENDING THAT MUCH
15 MONEY IN THAT PREDEVELOPMENT. AND NOT TO BE THE

16

17 **SPEAKER:** DEBBIE DOWNER.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT:** DEBBIE DOWNER HERE. BUT I THINK IN THE NORTH BAY
20 WE HAVE REACHED THE POINT IN TIME WHERE THE COST OF A TYPICAL
21 TWO BEDROOM UNIT NOW DOES NOT PAY FOR ITSELF ANY LONGER, A LOT
22 OF THOSE PROJECTS THAT WERE APPROVED ON THE PROJECT SIDE ON
23 THE MARKET RATE SIDE ARE NOT GOING TO BE BUILT BECAUSE THERE'S
24 NO WAY THEY CAN GET TRADITIONAL FINANCING WITH THOSE DEEP
25 POCKETS WHO ARE WILLING TO MAKE THAT INVESTMENT, JUST THROWING



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THAT OUT THERE, OVERALL THE SHAPE OF THINGS IS CYCLICAL. AND
2 ACCORDING TO THE FED YESTERDAY WE'RE GOING TO BE DEALING WITH
3 EVEN MORE OF THIS THAT MEANS UNAFFORDABILITY OF THOSE MARKET
4 RATE UNITS IS GOING TO SPREAD THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA EVEN
5 PLACES THAT HAVE THE HIGHER CURRENT RENTS IN THE FUTURE.

6

7 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AT THIS TIME WE'LL SEE IF WE
8 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS? IF ANYTHING CAME IN WRITTEN?
9 OR IS THERE ANYONE WISHING TO SPEAK?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
12 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM. AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
13 THEIR HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME.

14

15 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THIS IS, ACTUALLY, A
16 GOOD NEWS -- A GOOD ACTION BEFORE US TODAY. SO, IF I COULD
17 ENTERTAIN A MOTION AND A SECOND? OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION BY
18 ABE-KOGA, AND SECOND BY CHAVEZ. ROLL CALL? OR ALL IN FAVOR?

19

20 **SPEAKERS:** AYE.

21

22 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** OPPOSE? OKAY. THAT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.
23 OKAY. WE'LL HAVE TO GET USED TO --

24



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR. I'M SORRY, JUST FOR CLARITY
2 FOR THOSE ON THE BROADCAST, IT PASSED UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
3 MEMBERS PRESENT AT ROLL CALL.

4

5 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** YES. OKAY. MOVING ON, OUR NEXT ITEM ON
6 THE AGENDA IS PUBLIC COMMENTS. IS THERE -- HAVE WE RECEIVED
7 ANYTHING IN PRIOR TO 5:00 YESTERDAY?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
10 WRITING, AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
11 RAISED AT THIS TIME.

12

13 **FEDERAL GLOVER, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO, WE'LL MOVE TO OUR NEXT ITEM
14 WHICH IS ADJOURNMENT. WE ARE ADJOURNED TO OUR NEXT MEETING
15 WHICH WILL BE HELD ON WEDNESDAY APRIL 12TH, SAME TIME, SAME
16 PLACE. WE'RE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

17



NTT

Broadcasting Government