

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MAY 10, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, MAY 10TH, 2024, 12:00 PM

CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: WE'RE GOING TO START OUR REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE OF MAY 10TH 2024. I'M DAVID RABBITT, CHAIR, ALONG WITH SUE NOACK, OUR VICE CHAIR. CALLING THE MEETING TO ORDER. ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR RABBITT?

CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: HERE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: NOACK?

V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK: HERE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AHN?

EDDIE AHN: CANEPA? IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: EDISON IS ABSENT. GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.



MAY 10, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER LI, NON-VOTING?

3

4 **JANICE LI:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? IS
7 ABSENT. MEMBER SHAW?

8

9 **DIANE SHAW:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. SPERING? IS ABSENT. WE DON'T
12 HAVE A QUORUM. CAN WE DEPUTIZE COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES? [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** I ASSUME YOU'RE ASKING HER.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** I THOUGHT YOU WERE ASKING THE CHAIR.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE HAVE A QUORUM CAN COMMISSIONER PAPAN
23 DEPUTIZED.

24



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. APPRECIATE
2 THAT. THE MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE MEMBERS OF
3 THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE
4 OR DIAL STAR NINE AND WE WILL CALL UPON YOU. VOTE TO BE TAKEN?
5 WE'RE MOVING TO 2A REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER --
6 ADINA LEVIN IS HERE, CHAIR OF OUR CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP.
7 ADINA.

8

9 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET'S SEE, SO, THE REGIONAL
10 NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP MET SINCE YOUR LAST
11 MEETING, AND WE RECEIVED A PRESENTATION THAT I THINK THAT THIS
12 BODY IS GOING TO RECEIVE TODAY ON AN APPROACH FOR INITIAL
13 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES THAT ARE
14 INTENDED TO PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO THE EXPERIENCE OF TRANSIT
15 RIDERS AND AN OVERVIEW OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN THE REGION. IT
16 IS REALLY GOOD TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE THAT GLOBAL OVERVIEW IN
17 ADDITION TO THE GOOD AGENCY BY AGENCY DATA THAT WE HAVE. THERE
18 WERE MANY COMMENTS IN THE CUST- [INDISCERNIBLE] ADVISORY
19 GROUP, AND I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A FEW THEMES THAT CAME OUT OF
20 THAT CONVERSATION. RIDERSHIP, OVERALL, AND TRANSIT RIDERSHIP
21 ARE VERY IMPORTANT. METRICS FOR ACCESS AND THAT'S ABOUT THE
22 NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT HAVE ACCESS TO TRANSIT SHOULD COVER AND
23 CONSIDER THE SHARE OF POPULATION WITH ACCESS TO, NOT ONLY TO
24 JOBS, BUT NOT ONLY TO JOBS, BUT ALSO HEALTH CARE AND EDUCATION
25 AND OTHER KEY DESTINATIONS. I THINK A NUMBER OF THE AGENCIES



MAY 10, 2024

1 HAVE BEEN TRACKING THOSE KINDS OF ACCESS METRICS, AND THERE IS
2 SOME GOOD PRACTICES TO USE FOR THOSE ACCESS GOALS,
3 COMPETITIVENESS WITH DRIVING IN COST AND TIME IS IMPORTANT.
4 THERE WERE COMMENTS ABOUT WANTING TO SEE IMPROVED METRICS
5 RELATING TO PARATRANSIT AND ACCESSIBILITY FOR SENIORS AND
6 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. WE'RE HOPING THAT COORDINATED PLAN,
7 THIS IS COMING FORWARD, WILL HAVE MORE ON THAT, WHICH IS SNAG
8 OUR MEMBERS OF OUR DISABILITY AND SENIOR COMMUNITY HAVE BEEN
9 WANTING TO SEE, AND, LASTLY ON THIS TOPIC, QUALITATIVE AND
10 QUANTITATE AND I HAVE QUALITATIVE METRICS ON THIS TOPIC ARE
11 IMPORTANT WITH HOW PEOPLE ARE FEELING ABOUT SAFETY WITH LAW-
12 ENFORCEMENT INCLUDING POSITIVE AND NEGATIVE ASPECTS TO SAFETY
13 AS IT RELATES TO LAW-ENFORCEMENT, AND WE'RE EXCITED TO SEE
14 METRICS BEING A LIVING PROCESS WITH DATA METRICS CHANGING OVER
15 TIME STARTING WITH ACCESS, AND MOVING ON TO COLLECTING AND
16 REPORTING ON THINGS THAT ARE MEANINGFUL TO THE PERFORMANCE OF
17 OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. IN ADDITION WE GOT A REPORT
18 ON THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN 25 PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY
19 WHICH IS THE GOAL OF STANDARDIZING ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES AND
20 PROGRAMS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND THE COMMUNITY
21 MEMBERS ON THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP APPRECIATED THE
22 DIRECTION OF THIS INITIATIVE AND ALSO UNDER MTC AND AGENCIES
23 TO ELIMINATE THE NEED TO RECERTIFY PEOPLE WHO HAVE PERMANENT
24 DISABILITIES AND THERE IS VALUE IN COLLECTING UPDATED
25 INFORMATION ABOUT SOMEBODY'S TRAVEL NEEDS SOMEONE MAY BE USING



MAY 10, 2024

1 A WHEELCHAIR BUT MAY HAVE SOMEWHAT DIFFERENT TRAVEL NEEDS BUT
2 IF SOMEONE IS PERMANENTLY DISABLED THEY SHOULDN'T NEED TO JUMP
3 THROUGH HOOPS TO SHOW THAT, YES, I'M DISABLY BLIND AND AM
4 PERMANENTLY BLIND. WITH THAT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

5

6 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU ADINA FOR THE THOROUGH REPORTS
7 YOU PROVIDE US. APPRECIATE IT. LOOKING TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR
8 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS OR CONCERNS ON THE REPORT? PLEASE,
9 COMMISSIONER SHAW?

10

11 **DIANE SHAW:** I WANT TO SAY I REALLY DO APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS,
12 AND ESPECIALLY WITH THE LOOK TO THE DISABLED COMMUNITY.
13 BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING THAT'S SOMETIMES NOT REALLY
14 FOCUSED ON AND SO I'M REALLY GLAD TO SEE A FOCUS THERE. SO,
15 THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** YEAH, NO AGREE. THANK YOU. ANY PUBLIC
18 COMMENT ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM MARTHA

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
21 THIS ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO
22 SPEAK.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR REAL QUICK?

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** YES, PLEASE.

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** YES. I APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION ON PEOPLE WITH
4 DISABILITIES. I THINK WE REALLY NEED TO LOOK AT REDUNDANCIES
5 IN PLANS, AS FAR AS ACCESS GOES. BECAUSE WE CONSTANTLY GET
6 ALERTED, THE ELEVATOR IS OUT, THE ESCALATOR IS OUT. WE NEED TO
7 BE CONCERNED AS TO ALTERNATIVES FOR PEOPLE, PARTICULARLY IN
8 WHEELCHAIRS. I KNOW CALTRAIN HAD AN ISSUE, AND SOMEONE
9 ACTUALLY HAD TO GO ALL THE WAY HOME BECAUSE THEY COULDN'T GET
10 OUT OF THE HILLSDALE STATION AND JUST BE AWARE THE NEXT STEP
11 IS BUILT IN REDUNDANCIES.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS CONSENT CALENDAR,
14 ITEMS 3A THROUGH 3G, I BELIEVE THAT'S SEVEN ITEMS I'LL LOOK TO
15 MY COLLEAGUES FOR COMMENTS QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS ON THE
16 CONSENT CALENDAR?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** MOVE THE MOTION.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** MOTION AND SECOND. BEFORE WE TAKE OUR
21 VOTE I'LL ASK MARTHA IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT TODAY.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO ONE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR AND NO
24 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** ROLL CALL VOTE WE HAVE A MOTION AND
2 SECOND ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RABBITT.

5

6 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOACK.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AHN?

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? IS

19 ABSENT. MEMBER SPERING? IS ABSENT. DEPUTIZED MEMBER PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

24 PRESENT.

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GRIT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. -- GREAT.
2 MOVING TO 4A, THE 511 TRAVELER INFORMATION PROGRAM UPDATE AND
3 A COUPLE DIFFERENT CONTRACTS, AS WELL, AND I BELIEVE WE HAVE
4 ALYSHA NACHTIGALL. PARDON ME. LAST NAME IS RABBITT. ANY OTHER
5 NAME --

6
7 **SPEAKER:** YES MY NAME HAS A 52 EXTRA CONSONANTS.

8
9 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** [LAUGHTER] YEAH.

10
11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON CHAIR RABBITT AND VICE CHAIR NOACK I'M
12 ALYSHA NACHTIGALL, ACTING ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OVERSEEING MTC'S
13 511 PROGRAM. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PRESENT TODAY.
14 I'M SHARING 511 PROGRAM'S CURRENT STATUS ACTIVITIES, AND I
15 HAVE A REQUEST FOR CONTRACT AUTHORITY LISTED IN THE SUMMARY
16 SHEET. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. MTC'S TRAVELER INFORMATION SERVICES
17 HAVE COME A LONG WAY IN THE PAST 30 YEARS. THIS SLIDE SHOWS
18 THE EVOLUTION. MTC HAS BURDEN PROVIDING TRAVELER INFORMATION
19 SERVICES IN THE BAY AREA SINCE 1993 WHEN MTC WAS SELECTED BY
20 THE USDOT FOR A FIELD OPERATIONAL TEST NAMED TRAV INFO, YOU
21 MIGHT REMEMBER THE PREDECESSOR OF 511 PROVIDED INFORMATION VIA
22 TRAVELER INFORMATION CENTER 817-1717. 511 LAUNCHED IN 2010
23 INITIALLY AS A PHONE SERVICE THEN A WEB SITE WAS ADDED. OVER
24 TEN YEARS DISSEMINATION CHANNELS INCLUDING AN APP MOBILE WEB
25 PAGES SOCIAL MEDIA AND REGIONAL SIGNAGE WERE ADDED. IN 2018 WE



MAY 10, 2024

1 SHIFTED IN A NEW DIRECTION FOR 511 FOCUSING ON DELIVERY OF
2 DATA TO THIRD PARTY TRAVELER INFORMATION PROVIDERS. NOW IN
3 2024, THE 511 TRAVELER INFORMATION PROGRAM CONTINUES TO EXCEL
4 IN THE DELIVERY OF ITS THREE KEY PRINCIPLES. ONE, PROVIDING
5 DATA TO THE PRIVATE AND PUBLIC SECTOR. TWO PROVIDING
6 INFORMATION TO THE PUBLIC DURING TRANSPORTATION EMERGENCIES,
7 AND, THREE, PROVIDING MEANINGFUL TIME HE TRAVELER INFORMATION
8 TO THE SF BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE 511 SYSTEM IS
9 COMPLEX. THIS SLIDE ATTEMPTS TO SIMPLIFY THE SYSTEM AT A
10 GLANCE. THERE ARE FOUR KEY AREAS STARTING FROM THE TOP I'M
11 GOING TO EXPLAIN EACH ONE FROM LEFT TO RIGHT. FIRST, THERE ARE
12 THE TRADITIONAL FUNCTIONS OF 511. THE BIG GREEN ARROWS ON THE
13 LEFT SHOW THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF DATA COLLECTED BY 511. THE
14 TOP GREEN ARROW IS THE TRAVELER ALERTED DATA MANAGED BY THE
15 STAFF 511 OPERATIONS CENTER AND STORED IN A DATABASE
16 REPRESENTED BY THE TOP PURPLE CYLINDER. THE MIDDLE GREEN ARROW
17 SHOWS THE TRANSIT SCHEDULE DATA COLLECTED GTFS, AND THE ONLINE
18 TRANSIT DATA MANAGER. THIS STATIC DATA IS THEN HOUSED IN A
19 PURPLE REGIONAL TRANSIT DATABASE. THE BOTTOM GROWN ARROW SHOWS
20 THE REALTIME TRANSIT DATA AND THE EXPRESS LANE DATA FEEDING
21 INTO THE REALTIME PROCESSING AND DISSEMINATION SYSTEM. THE
22 BOTTOM PURPLE CYLINDERS. ALL OF THIS DATA FEEDS INTO 511'S
23 TRADITIONAL TRAVELER INFORMATION CHANNELS SHOWN ON THE TOP
24 RIGHT WHICH INCLUDE THE 511 PHONE, THE 511.ORG WEB SITE,
25 SOCIAL MEDIA, AND ELECTRONIC TRANSIT INFORMATION DISPLAYS AT



MAY 10, 2024

1 REGIONAL TRANSIT HUBS. THE NEXT KEY AREA IS THE 511 OPEN DATA
2 PROGRAM. IT UTILIZES ALL THE DATA SHOWN BY THE GREEN ARROWS
3 AND PURPLE CYLINDERS, AND IS SHOWN ON THE MIDDLE RIGHT,
4 PROVIDES DATA FEEDS VIA THE 511 OPEN DATA PORTAL TO OUR
5 REGIONAL PARTNERS OUTLINED IN ORANGE. AND FOR THE PRIVATE
6 SECTOR, OUTLINED IN YELLOW. THE REMAINING TWO KEY ARROWS --
7 EXCUSE ME -- THE REMAINING TWO KEY AREAS START WITH THE BIG
8 ORANGE ARROW. ONE IS DISSEMINATING EMERGENCY TRANSPORTATION
9 INFORMATION, 511 IS PREPARED TO PROVIDE TRANSPORTATION
10 INFORMATION DURING REGIONAL EMERGENCIES USING ALL REGULAR
11 CHANNELS AND INCLUDING SPECIAL WEB SITE PAGES AND OUR NIXLE
12 REGIONAL ALERTING ACCOUNT THE OTHER IS ACTING REGIONAL
13 INFORMATION PORTAL FOR TRAVELER PROGRAMS AND SERVICES. 511
14 PROVIDES A DIGITAL PRESENCE FOR THE BAY AREA'S EXPRESS LANES
15 PROGRAM, THE BAY AREA COMMUTER BENEFITS PROGRAM, PROVIDING
16 CARPOOL AND VANPOOL OPTIONS, PROVIDES LINKS TO THE BAY'S
17 TRANSIT AGENCIES AND PROVIDES INFORMATION FOR ALL-NIGHTER
18 SERVICE AND MANY OTHERS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. PREY AS WE CAN
19 SEE IN THE SCREENSHOT FROM THE 511.ORG WEB SITE, THE 511 OPEN
20 DATA MISSION IS TO PROVIDE HIGH QUALITY DATA TO PUBLIC AND
21 PRIVATE SECTOR DISSEMINATORS IN ORDER TO MAXIMIZE NUMBER OF
22 TRAVELERS BENEFITTING FROM 511 DATA. THE ROBUST OPEN DATA
23 PROGRAM HAS ALLOWED 511 TO BE A SIGNIFICANT DATA PROVIDER FOR
24 BAY AREA TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES AND FOR PRIVATE SECTOR
25 TRANSPORTATION INFORMATION PROVIDERS. NEXT SLIDE. THE 511



MAY 10, 2024

1 PROGRAM CONTINUES TO HAVE SIGNIFICANT USAGE THIS. SLIDE SHOWS
2 THE 511 USAGE FROM JANUARY 2018 TO MARCH 2024. ON THE HORIZON
3 AXIS, THE LINE GRAPH SHOWS THE 511.ORG WEB SITE VISITS IN
4 ORANGE, THE NUMBER OF 511 PHONE CALLS IN BLUE, AND THE 511
5 OPEN DATA REQUESTS IN GREEN. THE GRAPH IS ORGANIZED WITH THE
6 NUMBER OF PHONE CALLS AND WEB VISITS ON THE LEFT VERTICAL
7 ACCESS, AND THE NUMBER OF OPEN DATA REQUESTS ON THE RIGHT
8 VERTICAL AXIS. AS YOU CAN SEE PHONE AND WEB USAGE DROPPED AT
9 THE START OF THE PANDEMIC AND IN RECENT YEARS WEB USAGE HAS
10 HAD SIGNIFICANT SPIKES DURING TRANSPORTATION EMERGENCIES. THE
11 GREEN LINE FOR OPEN DATA REQUESTS SHOWS A DRAMATIC INCREASE
12 FROM 5 MILLION IN JANUARY 2018 TO 130 MILLION IN MARCH 2024.
13 WE EXPECT IT WILL CONTINUE TO INCREASE WITH THE NEW UPCOMING
14 511 PROJECTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE HAVE SEVERAL NEW EFFORTS
15 THAT ARE EXCITING NEWER DIMENSIONS TO THE 511 PROGRAM. THESE,
16 AS HAD AS TRADITIONAL 511 EFFORTS ALIGN WITH THE BLUE RIBBON
17 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE GOALS AND ACTION PLAN AND THE
18 SUBSEQUENT BAY AREA TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. ONE
19 EFFORT WORTH MENTIONING, BUT NOT SHOWN ON THE SLIDE IS THAT
20 THE 511.ORG WEB SITE IS CURRENTLY UNDERGOING A REDESIGN THAT
21 WILL PROVIDE A NEW LOOK AND FEEL TO THE SITE AND IN KEEPING
22 WITH 511 KEY PRINCIPLES, WILL PROVIDE TIMELY, ACCURATE
23 TRAVELER INFORMATION, EASY ACCESS TO INFORMATION DURING A
24 TRANSPORTATION EMERGENCY, AND A PORTAL FOR ACCESSING 511'S
25 OPEN DATA. ADDITIONALLY, 511 IS WORKING TO MEET OUR



MAY 10, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY PARTNER'S NEEDS THROUGH THE DEVELOPMENT
2 OF SOFTWARE INVOLVING REGIONAL DATA, SUCH AS THE UPCOMING
3 MAPPING DATA SERVICES PLATFORM FOR REGIONAL MAPPING AND
4 WAYFINDING IN THE UPPER LEFT-HAND CORNER, AND THE REGIONAL
5 CONSOLIDATED GTFS, AND GTFS REALTIME FEEDS, INCLUDING PATHWAYS
6 DATA IN THE UPPER RIGHT-HAND CORNER. THIS PATHWAY'S DATA WILL
7 BE USED BY PRIVATE AND PUBLIC SECTOR APPS FOR NAVIGATING
8 COMPLICATED STATIONS LIKE THE EMBARCADERO STATION. IN THE
9 BOTTOM LEFT, WE HAVE THE WORK ZONE DATA EXCHANGE OR WZDX
10 PROJECT. THIS ENHANCEMENT TO THE 511 SYSTEM ALLOWS CALTRANS
11 AND LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO COLLECT, PROCESS, AND DISSEMINATE
12 ROADWAY EVENT DATA FOLLOWING THE FEDERAL WZDX STANDARDS. AND
13 ON THE BOTTOM RIGHT, THE TRANSIT TRANSFER TOOL WHICH ALLOWS
14 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO IDENTIFY TRANSFER CONNECTIVITY ISSUES
15 BETWEEN SERVICES AT REGIONAL TRANSIT HUBS AND TAKE
16 COLLABORATIVE ACTIONS TO REDUCE RIDER'S WAIT TIMES. NEXT SLIDE
17 PLEASE. THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE A
18 511 PROGRAM UPDATE. I'M AVAILABLE TO TAKE QUESTIONS

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, ALYSHA.
21 LOOKING TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR QUESTIONS? DIRECTOR SHAW?

22

23 **DIANE SHAW:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THIS PRESENTATION. THERE
24 IS A LOT OF WORK GOING ON HERE. THIS IS REALLY GOOD STUFF. I
25 HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. ONE IS, I NOTICED THE NUMBER OF



MAY 10, 2024

1 AGENCIES USING GTFS, AND THEN USING GTFS REALTIME, AND THERE
2 IS A DIFFERENCE AND I'M GUESSING THAT PART OF THAT IS SOME
3 SMALLER AGENCIES DON'T HAVE THE STAFF, NECESSARILY, TO DO THE
4 WORK THAT'S NEEDED TO DO THAT. SO I'M WONDERING IF YOU GUYS
5 ARE WORKING WITH STAFF AND GETTING THE SAME INFORMATION FROM
6 BOTH GROUPS AND AROUND THAT SAME AREA, I KNOW GTFS FLEX A NEW
7 ONE COMING THROUGH WORKING WITH MORE ON DEMAND-TYPE STUFF THAT
8 MIGHT SHUTTLING THAT MIGHT BE OPEN TO THE PUBLIC. AND I DON'T
9 KNOW IF THERE ARE ANY OPTIONS GOING FORWARD FOR HOW YOU GUYS
10 ARE LOOKING AT HOW YOU CAN INCORPORATE PUBLIC RUNNING SHUTTLES
11 THAT ARE AVAILABLE SO PEOPLE CAN GO IN ONE PLACE AND SEE ALL
12 THE DIFFERENT TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS THAT THEY HAVE TO TAKE AS
13 A PUBLIC PERSON?

14

15 **ALYSHA NACHTIGALL:** GREAT QUESTION. YES WE'RE WORKING WITH ALL
16 THE AGENCIES TO ENSURE THAT AS THEY'RE ABLE TO PROVIDE
17 REALTIME DATA WE'RE GATHERING IT FROM THEM AND THERE ARE
18 SEVERAL AGENCIES WHO WE RECENTLY ADDED AND WHO ARE ACTIVELY IN
19 THE PROCESS OF INCORPORATING THEIR REALTIME DATA. SO THAT
20 CONTINUES. AND THE DATA TEAM IS CLOSELY COLLABORATE WITH ALL
21 TRANSIT PROVIDERS. AND THE SECOND QUESTION, I WILL HAVE TO
22 CHECK AND GET BACK TO YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. MEMBER LI?

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **JANICE LI:** THANK YOU FOR THIS PRESENTATION. EXCITED TO SEE --
2 YES, JUST THE UPDATES AND WALK BACK THROUGH THE HISTORY THAT
3 I'M NOT REALLY FAMILIAR WITH. JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS
4 REGARDING THE TECHNOLOGY SPECIFICALLY, HOW ARE TRANSIT
5 AGENCIES AND MTC STAFFING UP AND/OR INCREASING CAPACITY AS
6 TECHNOLOGY CHANGES SO THAT, YOU KNOW, WE ARE ABLE TO MATCH ALL
7 OF THESE NEW, LIKE, FANCY WAYS OF BEING ABLE TO USE TECHNOLOGY
8 AND NAVIGATE?

9

10 **NICK ROETHEL:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. NICK ROETHEL, CHIEF
11 OPERATING OFFICER. WE RUN A TIGHT STAFFING MODEL WITHIN 511.
12 WE HAVE GENERALLY A GRANT LEVEL CONSTRAINT AS FAR AS HOW WE'RE
13 STAFFED. SO, IN TERMS OF HOW WE LOOK AT STAFFING, WITHIN 511,
14 IT REALLY DEPENDS ON IS THERE A NEED, OR IS THERE AN ASK THAT
15 COMES THROUGH THAT COMES WITH A FUNDING SOURCE. AND THEN
16 WHETHER OR NOT THAT FUNDING SOURCE IS SUSTAINABLE IN A WAY
17 THAT WE WOULD ACTUALLY ADD STAFF. IT'S VERY MUCH DRIVEN BY
18 WHAT THE NEED IS, AND THEN WHETHER THERE IS A FUND SOURCE
19 AVAILABLE. THAT SAID, THE OTHER PIECE OF THIS, BECAUSE WE ARE
20 A TIGHT ORGANIZATION, IT'S AN EXTREMELY TECHNICAL GROUP OF
21 PEOPLE WORKING ON 511, SO THERE IS A LOT OF RENEWABLE OF
22 CURRENT EMPLOYEES, AND THE RESKILLING AND UPSKILLING AS THE
23 TECHNOLOGY IS CHANGING. SO, ONE OF THE THINGS -- AND YOU SEE
24 THIS WITH ALYSHA AND HER STAFF, WE HAVE AGILE FOLKS WITH A



MAY 10, 2024

1 VERY SIGNIFICANT TECHNICAL APTITUDE THAT ALLOWS THEM TO BE
2 FLEXIBLE IN THE ROLES.

3

4 **JANICE LI:** THANK YOU. I WOULD SAY JUST SAY, STAFFING AGENCIES
5 TO BE ABLE TO BE NIMBLE I RECOGNIZE THAT IS HARD AND I WANT TO
6 POINT OUT AS AN EXAMPLE IN THE EARLY 2000s YOU WERE PROBABLY
7 STAFFING UP A BUNCH OF CALL CENTER FOLKS WHO WERE ANSWERING
8 PHONES AND HELPING PEOPLE NAVIGATE THROUGH THAT AND NOW YOU'RE
9 HAVING TO FIND FOLKS WHO KNOW HOW TO MAP 3D MAP STATIONS AND
10 DOING THINGS THAT 20 YEARS AGO WE DON'T EVEN KNOW. ALSO THERE
11 ARE EXCITED NEW CHANGES SUCH AS STATION MAPPING, ARE THERE
12 TECH IMPROVEMENTS THAT THIRD PARTY COMPANIES ARE PUSHING
13 TRANSIT AGENCIES TO DEVELOP? I'LL GIVE AN EXAMPLE, I REMEMBER
14 BACK IN 2016, UBER HELD THIS ODD VIP STAKEHOLDER GROUP AROUND
15 AUTONOMOUS VEHICLE TECHNOLOGY. SELENA REYNOLDS WAS THERE,
16 LIEUTENANT GOVERNOR NEWSOME WAS THERE, AND FOR WHATEVER
17 REASON, BIKE COALITION. AND THE DISCUSSION WAS FASCINATING AND
18 UBER WAS LIKE, IF SAN FRANCISCO COULD HAVE SMART SIGNALS AND
19 FIX ROADS AND BRING THIS TECHNOLOGY, WE WOULD HAVE EVS
20 EVERYWHERE, SORT OF, THIS WHAT IS THE BURDEN OF PUBLIC
21 AGENCIES TO BE ABLE TO UPGRADE THEIR INFRASTRUCTURE TO BE ABLE
22 TO MATCH CURRENT TECH. TO PUT IT SIMPLY, YOU KNOW, ARE THE
23 THIRD PARTY COMPANIES, WHETHER IT'S THE WAY MOS AND GOOGLE
24 MAPS AND TRANSIT APPS OF THE WORLD, IS THERE SOMETHING THEY'RE



MAY 10, 2024

1 DOING BETTER TO PUSH 511 DEVELOP BETTER, 511 DATA OR
2 OTHERWISE?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** NOT THAT I'M AWARE. WE ARE CURRENTLY TALKING ABOUT
5 WAYS FOR THEM TO START TO INTEGRATE SOME MORE OF OUR DATA WITH
6 THAT I HAVEN'T HEARD ABOUT ANY THIRD PARTIES PUSHING TOWARDS
7 ANYTHING PARTICULAR TO DEVELOP.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I DID MEAN WAYS AND NOT WAY MO. THOSE ARE
10 ALL THE QUESTIONS I HAD. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANYONE ELSE
13 HAVE ANYTHING? PLEASE.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** AS WAYFINDING ARE WE COORDINATED WITH
16 WAYFINDING BROADLY AT MTC WITH LINES OF GRANTS AND NEEDING
17 FUNDING TO DO ANYTHING I'M TRYING TO UNDERSTAND HOW THAT
18 INTERACTS WITH THE REST OF THE WAYFINDING WORK THAT MTC IS
19 DOING.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YES WE ARE CLOSELY WORKING WITH THE MAPPING AND
22 WAYFINDING PROGRAM AND PROVIDING MAPPING AND DATA SERVICES
23 THAT WILL SUPPORT THE MAPPING AND WAYFINDING.

24



MAY 10, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** JANICE MENTIONED THEY WERE DOING
2 SOMETHING ON THEIR STATIONS I ASSUME YOU'RE COORDINATES SO
3 YOU'RE NOT DUPLICATING EFFORTS. WE WOULD HATE FOR BOTH
4 AGENCIES TO BE WORKING ON THAT.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** YES WE ARE COORDINATING WE MET WITH BART EARLIER THIS
7 WEEK.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANKS.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** ANYONE ELSE? I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU
12 VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE THE TIMELINE. BACK IN 1983 THERE WAS
13 PROBABLY SOMEONE STICKING THE PHONE WIRES INTO THE OPERATION
14 BOARD BUT IT GOES TO SHOW YOU HOW QUICKLY THINGS CHANGE WHILE
15 THE INTENT, I BELIEVE, IS STILL VERY MUCH WHAT IT WAS THEN BUT
16 THE TECHNOLOGY IS CONSTANTLY CHANGING AND PEOPLE SHOULD NOT
17 TAKE THAT FOR GRANTED THAT THERE IS GREAT STAFF WORKING BEHIND
18 THE SCENES TO MAKE SURE THAT'S DELIVERED IN SUCH A WAY. PEOPLE
19 DO HAVE HIGH EXPECTATIONS THESE DAYS TO HAVE INSTANTANEOUS
20 INFORMATION. SO, WE RECOGNIZE THAT, AS A CHALLENGE AS WELL AND
21 DO APPRECIATE THE WORK. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES. THERE ARE
22 A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT CONTRACTS. THERE ARE THREE, I BELIEVE,
23 OR FOUR, CONTRACTS INCLUDED WITHIN THE UPDATE ITSELF, AND I
24 WILL LOOK TO MARTHA FOR PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE WE LOOK FOR A
25 MOTION.



MAY 10, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
3 THIS ITEM NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND THERE
4 IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK HOW MUCH
5 TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE.

6

7 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** COUPLE OF MINUTES.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ANNE OLIVIA. UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE
10 TWO MINUTES.

11

12 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. I ACTUALLY DON'T NEED THAT MUCH
13 TIME.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I'M MOSTLY CURIOUS ABOUT THE INTEGRATION
18 OF DIFFERENT TRANSIT MODELS INTO THIS, LIKE, RIGHT NOW, IF YOU
19 WANT TO FIND OUT IF THE FERRY IS AN OPTION, YOU HAVE TO LOOK
20 UNDER WALKING DIRECTIONS, INSTEAD OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION
21 DIRECTIONS. AND I NEVER THINK TO DO THAT. BECAUSE I'M NOT EVER
22 GOING TO WALK FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO OAKLAND.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** [LAUGHTER]

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** SO, IT'S REALLY NOT USER FRIENDLY. AND A
2 LOT OF THE TIME I WOULD CHOOSE TO TAKE THE FERRY, BUT IT JUST
3 DOESN'T EVEN SHOW UP AS AN OPTION BECAUSE THE FERRY IS AT
4 LEAST MORE PLANET. SO I END UP DRIVING AND SOMETIMES LATER I
5 THINK OH I FORGOT TO CHECK WALKING DIRECTIONS I'M WONDERING IF
6 THAT'S TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT IF A MORE USER FRIENDLY WAY.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MECHANICS OF THE
11 PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** IS THAT SOMETHING YOU COULD -- THE
14 QUESTION THAT WAS POSED, IS THERE --

15

16 **ALYSHA NACHTIGALL:** IT SOUNDED AS THOUGH IT POTENTIALLY A TRIP
17 PLANNER AND WE DON'T HAVE ONE SO I'M NOT ENTIRELY SURE.

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** LOOKING TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR A MOTION ON
20 4A 511 TRAVEL INFORMATION UPDATE.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I ASSUME WE CAN MAKE A MOTION ON ALL FOUR
23 CONTRACTS IF SO I'LL MOVE THE ITEM.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.



MAY 10, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL PLEASE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR RABBITT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOACK?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AHN?

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? IS

21 ABSENT. MEMBER SPERING? IS ABSENT. DEPUTIZED MEMBER PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
2 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** ALL RIGHT. GREAT. THANK YOU, DEPUTIZED
5 DIRECTOR PAPAN. 4B, THE TRANSIT AGENCY PROGRESS ON TRANSIT
6 PRIORITY AND MTC RESOLUTION 47 -- 4647, THE BUS ACCELERATED
7 INFRASTRUCTURE DELIVERY PROGRAM. WE HAVE BRRIT TANNER OF MTC,
8 MICHAEL ROADS OF SFMTA, AND ROBERT DELL ROSARIO OF AC TRANSIT.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** SLIDE PLEASE. MY NAME IS BRRIT TANNER I AM A
11 PRINCIPAL IN THE TRANSIT PRIORITY WORK RNM SECTION WE HAVE
12 DRAFT FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS WHICH WERE APPROVED BY THE RNM
13 COUNCIL APRIL 22ND. FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO GO THROUGH CONTEXT
14 ABOUT WHY INVESTING IN TRANSIT IS PERSON. WHEN WE INVEST IN
15 TRANSIT WE MAKE TRANSIT MORE RELIABLE AND FASTER AND IMPROVE
16 OUR TRAVEL TIMES FOR CUSTOMERS. EFFICIENT OPERATIONS RESULTS
17 IN COST SAVINGS THAT CAN BE REINVESTED INTO MORE FREQUENT
18 SERVICE AND TO OTHER SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS FOR TRANSIT
19 CUSTOMERS. CONVERSELY, NOT INVESTING IN TRANSIT OR ALLOWING
20 TRAVEL TIMES TO INCREASE DUE TO CONGESTION RESULTS IN LOWER
21 RELIABILITY AND HIGHER TRANSPORTATION COSTS. SO BEFORE I GO
22 INTO THE BusAID FUNDING RECOMMENDATIONS I HAVE ASKED PROJECT
23 PARTNERS MICHAEL ROADS FROM SFMTA, AND ROBERT FROM AC TRANSIT
24 TO SHOWCASE THEIR RECENT INVESTMENTS IN TRANSIT PRIORITY WHICH



MAY 10, 2024

1 ARE SIMILAR TO THOSE WE ARE FUNDING THROUGH BusAID HAVE
2 IMPROVED TRANSIT IF THEIR SYSTEM. FIRST MICHAEL
3
4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU GOOD AFTERNOON. I'M MICHAEL ROADS PLANNING
5 TRANSIT PRIORITY IMPROVEMENTS AT SFMTA, WE HAVE IMPROVEMENTS
6 THAT USE TRANSIT LANES SIGNALS BULBS PRIORITY ISLANDS STOPS
7 SPACING TRAFFIC ADJUSTMENTS TRANSIT PEDESTRIAN SAFETY
8 IMPROVEMENTS THAT HELP PEOPLE GET TO THE BUS SAFELY. NEXT
9 SLIDE PLEASE. RESULTS WE HAVE SEEN SINCE WE STARTED
10 IMPLEMENTING THE FIRST MUNI FORWARD PILOT PROJECTS BACK IN
11 2012 HAVE MET AND EXCEEDED OUR EXPECTATIONS WE HAVE SEEN
12 RIDERSHIP GROW WITH PAIRED SERVICE ENHANCEMENTS WITH TRANSIT
13 PRIORITY CAPITAL PROJECTS PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP GREW
14 BY 20% ON THESE FOCUS CORRIDORS AS NATION-WIDE RIDERSHIP WAS
15 STAGNANT AND MUNI'S RIDERSHIP WAS STAGNANT OR DECREASING
16 ACROSS THE SYSTEM. SINCE THE PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP HAS RECOVERED
17 IN RELIABILITY SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS THESE NUMBERS ARE UPDATED
18 AS WE CONTINUE TO SEE RIDERSHIP GROWTH BUT TREND HAS CONTINUED
19 IN CORRIDORS LIKE VAN NESS, MISSION, GEARY WE HAVE SEEN
20 RIDERSHIP RECOVER WITH 2/3 OF RIDERSHIP BACK. NEXT SLIDE. THIS
21 IS ONE OF OUR MOST SUCCESSFUL TRANSIT PRIORITY CORRIDORS SINCE
22 2016 A SERIES OF IMPROVEMENTS ACROSS THE ENTIRE 14 MISSION
23 ROUTE FROM HERE TO DOWNTOWN DALY CITY WE HAVE TRANSIT LANES
24 BULBS STOPS SIGNAL PRIORITY SPACING CHANGES IMPROVED LIABILITY
25 INCREASED RAPID SERVICE LOCAL FREQUENCY AND MADE PEDESTRIAN



MAY 10, 2024

1 SAFETY UPGRADES. AS A RESULT OF 19% RIDERSHIP INCREASE IN
2 YEARS BEFORE THE PANDEMIC ON ROUTES SERVING THIS CORRIDOR AND
3 92% RIDERSHIP RECOVERY COMPARED TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS
4 STRONGEST ROUTE RECOVERY RATES IN OUR SYSTEM ESPECIALLY SINCE
5 THE 14 SERIES SERVES DOWNTOWN WHERE OFFICE CORE IS NOT SEEING
6 SAME LEVELS OF DEMAND OVERALL 14 REDUCED 9% ON THE ENTIRE LINE
7 SINCE 2015 AND WE HAVE SEEN 33% RUCK IN PEDESTRIAN INJURY
8 COLLISIONS ON MISSION STREET SINCE 2016 WE PAIR TRANSIT
9 PRIORITY WITH PEDESTRIAN SAFETY UPGRADES. I'LL HAND IT OVER TO
10 ROBERT DEL ROSARIO FROM AC TRANSIT.

11

12 **ROBERT DEL ROSARIO:** THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE. GOOD AFTERNOON.
13 ROBERT DEL ROSARIO DIRECTOR OF SERVICE DEVELOPMENT AND
14 PLANNING FOR AC TRANSIT, SIGNAL IMPROVEMENTS WE CAN DO TO
15 INCREASE SPEED AND RELIABILITY OF BUSES IS CRITICAL SINCE AC
16 TRANSIT BUS FEES HAVE STEADILY BEEN DECLINING OVER THE PAST 15
17 YEARS. THIS RESULTED IN LONGER TRAVEL TIMES FOR RIDERS AND
18 COST TO PROVIDE SAME LEVEL OF SERVICE. THIS IS A TREND WE SEE
19 AMONG URBAN BUS TRANSIT AGENCIES NOT ONLY IN THE BAY AREA BUT
20 ALSO THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY. NEXT SLIDE. SO I'LL GO OVER
21 TRAFFIC SIGNAL COORDINATION AND TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY TWO
22 COMPONENTS OF TRANSIT PRIORITY THAT AC TRANSIT IS
23 IMPLEMENTING. TRAFFIC SIGNAL COORDINATION IS COORDINATION OF
24 SIGNALS TO OPERATE EFFICIENTLY AND ALLOW PROGRESSION TO MANAGE
25 TRAFFIC POPULAR COORDINATED STREETS WE SEE ARE SAFE L STREET



MAY 10, 2024

1 IN SAN FRANCISCO WHERE YOU SEE PROGRESSION HAPPENING AS YOU'RE
2 TRAVELING BY BUS BIKE OR CAR. TSP TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY IS
3 TRAFFIC SIGNAL TO GRANT EXTRA GREEN TIME OR RED TIME TO GET
4 BUSES THROUGH INTERSECTIONS WITH LESS DELAY. THESE ARE
5 INTERSECTIONS WITH BENEFITS LOTS OF TRAFFIC FLOW BETTER SPEED
6 REGULATION IMPROVED TRAVEL TIMES FOR TRANSIT BUT ALSO THEY
7 HAVE CHALLENGES WITH AGING SIGNAL SYSTEMS IN THE BAY AREA A
8 LOT IN THE URBAN CORE ARE URBAN SIGNALS IN THE LESS DENSE
9 AREAS INFRASTRUCTURE IS NEWER THAT CREATES COMPLICATED
10 PROJECTS, APPROVAL PROCESSES AND DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS
11 HAVING SAY IN PROJECTS WE IMPLEMENT AND WE ALSO HAVE
12 CONFLICTING VALUES SO THERE ARE POLICIES OUT THERE THAT
13 DEPRIORITIZE PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND SO WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT HOW
14 WE WORK THOSE ALL TOGETHER. LASTLY WITH THE AGING
15 INFRASTRUCTURE I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT THE DATA COLLECTION IS
16 DIFFICULT AND WHEN YOU HAVE AN OLD SIGNAL SYSTEM SOMETIMES
17 YOU'RE GOING OUT TO THE CABINET WITH A THUMB DRIVE AND TRYING
18 TO PULL DATA FROM THE CABINET SO THERE IS TRICKINESS INVOLVED
19 WITH TRYING TO GET THE DATA. NEXT SLIDE. SO A NUMBER OF OUR
20 TRUNK LINES HAVE CARRY HIGHEST RIDERSHIP WITH IT. SP AND SOME
21 OF THOSE CORRIDORS HAVE YIELDED 10% SAVINGS ON OUR TEMPLE LINE
22 WITH PASSENGER TRAVEL TIMES ALONG THE CORRIDOR IMPROVED
23 REFLECTED IN THE TREMENDOUS RIDERSHIP GROWTH. TEMPO ACCOUNTS
24 FOR 10% OF OUR SYSTEM'S RIDERSHIP AND IS ONE OF A FEW
25 CORRIDORS WHERE WE SEE PRE-PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP LEVELS. THESE



MAY 10, 2024

1 ARE CORRIDORS WE HAVE WITH IMPLEMENTED TSP AND MINIMAL IMPACT,
2 AC TRANSIT SEES EXPANDING OUR PROGRAM TO INCLUDE MISSION
3 FRUITVALE, TELEGRAPH, INSTALLING IT. SP ON BEHALF OF MAJOR
4 TRANSIT INITIATIVES INCLUDING DO YOU KNOW BART ON, EMERYVILLE
5 AS PART OF THE BAY BRIDGE FORWARD PROGRAM, LOCAL JURISDICTIONS
6 ARE INSTALLING IT. SP ON BEHALF OF COMPLETE STREETS PROJECTS
7 AND TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS, MAC ARTHUR OAKLAND AND
8 EMERYVILLE LOTS OF EXAMPLES WE HAVE SHOWING OUR SUCCESSES AND
9 MORE IN THE FUTURE. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO BRITT.

10

11 **BRITT TANNER:** THANK YOU. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN ADDITION TO ALL
12 THESE OPERATOR LED EFFORTS, MTC IS WORKING ON A REGIONAL LEVEL
13 AND WE HAVE INVESTED \$250 MILLION IN THE PAST TEN YEARS TO
14 TRANSIT PROJECTS. THE INNOVATIVE DEPLOYMENTS TO ENHANCE
15 ARTERIALS PROGRAM, IDEA. WE'LL HAVE CALL FOR PROJECTS FOCUSING
16 ON TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY. THE GOAL OF THIS YEAR'S CALL FOR
17 PROJECTS WILL BE TO SUPPORT AGENCIES WITH PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
18 SO THEY CAN MAKE THEIR PROJECTS FROM AN IDEA INTO AN ACTUAL
19 PROJECT THAT COULD BE COMPETITIVE FOR PROJECTS ON THAT LIST
20 SUCH AS BusAID OR TPI OR OTHER FUNDING PROGRAMS. WE'RE WORKING
21 WITH PARTNERS AT CALTRANS, THEY ARE LEADING THEIR OWN EFFORTS
22 SUCH AS TRANSIT PRIORITY FOCUS AND BAY AREA TRANSIT PLAN. NEXT
23 SLIDE PLEASE. TODAY'S FOCUS IS ON BusAID. BusAID IS A TRANSIT
24 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN INITIATIVE TO IMPLEMENT NEAR-TERM
25 SOLUTIONS AT PROBLEM HOTSPOTS TO REDUCE TRANSIT TRAVEL TIMES



MAY 10, 2024

1 AND IMPROVE TRANSIT RELIABILITY. IT'S A \$30 MILLION PROGRAM
2 FUNDED HALF BETWEEN LOCAL STA EXCHANGE FUNDS AND FEDERAL OBAG
3 FUNDS WE START WITH A LIST OF 87 POTENTIAL HOTSPOTS THAT WERE
4 IDENTIFIED IN INTERVIEWS WITH 21 OPERATORS AS WE'RE GOING
5 THROUGH AND DOING THE EVALUATION WE LOOKED AT THE HIGHER
6 RIDERSHIP OPERATORS THOSE WITH MORE THAN 500,000 RIDERS PER
7 MONTH SEPARATELY FROM THE LOWER RIDERSHIP OPERATORS AS SHOWN
8 ON THE MAP ON THE RIGHT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WHEN LOOKING AT
9 ALL THOSE PROJECTS WE SCORED BASED ON TRANSIT RIDERSHIP
10 POTENTIAL DELAY REDUCTION, EQUITY, DEMOGRAPHIC CONSIDERATIONS
11 AND PRESENCE OF PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS. TOP 24 PROJECTS
12 BASED ON SCORES WERE INVITED TO PARTICIPATE IN NEXT SCREENING
13 LINE REVIEW WHICH IS FEASIBILITY AND READINESS. AT THAT .13
14 PROJECTS DECIDED TO CONTINUE AND UNFORTUNATELY ALL OF THE
15 NORTH BAY AGENCIES DEFERRED SUBMITTING BECAUSE THEY FELT THEIR
16 PROJECTS WERE NOT FAR ENOUGH ALONG IN DEVELOPMENT. LOOKING AT
17 THE 13 PROJECTS SUBMITTED WE TRIED TO APPLY PRINCIPALS,
18 INCORRECTLY SPELLED, APOLOGIES. I DO KNOW THE DIFFERENCE
19 BETWEEN A PRINCIPAL AND PRINCIPLE, NOTED. WE TRY TO HAVE A
20 DIVERSITY OF OPERATORS. WE HAD A CAP OF TWO PROJECTS OR \$5
21 MILLION PER OPERATOR. WE ALSO NOTED THAT MANY OPERATORS DID
22 NOT SUBMIT AND SO WE RESERVED SOME MONEY FOR FUTURE ROUNDS OR
23 FOR DEFERRED PROJECTS. WE ALSO EMPHASIZED NEAR-TERM
24 IMPLEMENTATION BUT THERE WERE SOME PROJECTS THAT WERE IN THE
25 PLANNING AND DESIGN PHASE WHERE IT MADE SENSE FOR US TO MAKE



MAY 10, 2024

1 THE INVESTMENT IN THESE PROJECTS SO THEY COULD COMBINE TRANSIT
2 ELEMENTS INTO THEIR PROJECTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. HERE WE HAVE
3 THE LIST, WE HAVE EIGHT PROJECTS WITH SIX OPERATORS. THREE OF
4 THEM ARE TRANSIT SIGNAL PRIORITY PROJECTS WE HAVE PARK STREET
5 IN ALAMEDA FROM AC TRANSIT, MONUMENT CORRIDOR, FROM COUNTY
6 CONNECTION IN CONCORD, AND, ALSO, A CLOUD BASED NETWORK SIGNAL
7 PRIORITY NETWORK COMPLETION IN SAN JOSE. ALL FUNDS WILL ALLOW
8 THEM TO COMPLETE EXPANSION OF CLOUD BASED TSP OF ALL FREQUENT
9 NETWORK ROUTES BETWEEN VTA IN SAN JOSE. A COUPLE CORRIDOR
10 PROJECTS. THE K INGLESIDE ON OCEAN AVENUE FROM SFMTA AND PART-
11 TIME TRANSIT LANE IN ALVARADO-NILES, THEN WE HAVE THREE
12 PROJECTS SUPPLEMENTING A PROJECT THAT'S ALREADY COMPLETED OR
13 ONE IN PLANNING, AC TRANSIT TEMPO LINE HELPING DELINEATION
14 ALONG THE BRT LINE. IN SAN JOSE ON CENTER ROAD, WE'RE ADDING
15 BUS BOARDING ISLANDS TO VISION ZERO PROJECT WHERE A PROTECTED
16 BIKE LANE ADDED DELAYS FOR THE VTA BUS, AND LASTLY REDWOOD
17 CITY SUPPORTING PLANNING PHASE TO HAVE BUS ISLANDS ADDED TO
18 CALTRANS BIKE PAVING PROJECT. COMING UP NEXT SLIDE TODAY WE'RE
19 ASKING YOU TO APPROVE THESE DRAFT BusAID FUNDING
20 RECOMMENDATIONS SEEING PROJECTS COMPLETED WITHIN THE NEXT 1 TO
21 3 YEARS WE'RE RESERVING 12 MILLION FOR FUTURE ROUNDS AND
22 COOPERATES WITH PARTNERS ON TRANSIT PRIORITY EFFORTS. THANK
23 YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION WE'RE AVAILABLE TO TAKE QUESTIONS
24



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I HAVE ONE QUICK
2 QUESTION IN TERMS OF THE NORTH BAY I HAVE TO ASK THIS SENTENCE
3 I REPRESENT THAT AREA. I'M CURIOUS THE PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
4 WHICH THEY WEREN'T QUITE READY WAS THAT WITHIN THE TRANSIT
5 AGENCIES THEMSELVES OR IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE JURISDICTIONS
6 THEY'RE OPERATING. JUST CURIOUS.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** YEAH THERE WAS FOUR PROJECTS FROM FOUR DIFFERENT
9 NORTH BAY AGENCIES ALL OF WHICH WERE STILL IN THE PROJECT
10 DEVELOPMENT PHASES AND MANY OF THEM ARE GOOD CANDIDATES FOR
11 THE TSP CALL FOR PROJECTS COMING OUT THIS SUMMER WE ALREADY
12 HAVE A PROGRAM IN PLACE TO HELP SUPPORT THEM SO THEY WOULD BE
13 READY FOR THE NEXT OPPORTUNITY TO GO TOWARD IMPLEMENTATION.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THEY TRULY ARE THE LEAD AGENCY AND ARE
16 NOT RELIANT UPON A CITY, SAY SANTA ROSA OR COUNTY OF SONOMA?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I THINK IT DEPENDS ON THE AGENCY. BUT WE WILL BE
19 WORKING WITH THEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** OKAY. PERFECT. THANK YOU. VICE CHAIR
22 NOACK?

23



MAY 10, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH JUST ESCAPED MY BRAIN. WHAT'S THE TIME
2 FRAME FOR THE SECOND GO AROUND YOU SAID 12 LINES BEING SAVED
3 FOR FUTURE CALL FOR PROJECTS. WHAT'S THE TIME FRAME FOR THAT?

4
5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER NOACK, FOR THE QUESTION.
6 MELANIE CHOY, DIRECTOR OF REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT. IN
7 TERMS OF TIME FRAME OUR INTENT IS IN 6 TO 12 MONTHS TO GO
8 THROUGH A SIMILAR PROCESS AS THIS ONE TO EVALUATE AND ALLOW OR
9 CONSIDER NEW PROJECTS OR THE EXISTING QUEUE. SO WE ANTICIPATE
10 DOING THAT WITHIN THE NEXT 12 MONTHS OR EARLIER.

11
12 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GOT IT. THANKS.

13
14 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** MEMBER DUTRA-VERNACI?

15
16 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** WHATEVER -- [LAUGHTER] -- IT'S LATE OR
17 EARLY, OR WHATEVER. NOT A QUESTION, BUT A COMMENT. I SEE, OF
18 COURSE, THAT UNION TRANSIT IS IN ONE OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS. I
19 REALLY APPRECIATE THAT BECAUSE AS WE TALK ABOUT COMPLETE
20 STREETS AND BUS RAPID TRANSIT AND WHAT YOU HAVE, AND IN MY
21 PART OF THE COUNTY WE REALLY DON'T HAVE THAT, SO WITH THIS
22 PILOT, SEEING WHAT THAT WILL LOOK LIKE IN TERMS OF SAVING TIME
23 AND OF COURSE GETTING CARS OFF THE ROAD SO IT'S JUST A THANK
24 YOU. SO, THANK YOU, CHAIR.

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. IT'S GOOD TO SEE THESE PROJECTS MOVING
4 FORWARD. HAVE A COMMENT AND A QUESTION. TECHNOLOGY IS CHANGING
5 SO RAPIDLY, SO TSP IMPLEMENTATION SAYS THAT WERE PUT IN A FEW
6 YEARS AGO NO LONGER WORK WITH OTHER TSP IMPLEMENTATIONS. SO,
7 IT'S A CHALLENGE MOVING FORWARD, AS THE TECHNOLOGY CONTINUES
8 TO CHANGE SO FAST AND WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT BOTH CITIES
9 AND TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE WORKING TOGETHER ALL ALONG THE
10 CORRIDOR TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE NOT ONE SEA ISN'T PUTTING
11 SOMETHING IN THAT DOESN'T WORK WITH, YOU KNOW, TWO CITIES
12 DOWN. SO, IT'S REALLY GOING TO BE IMPORTANT. AND I HOPE MTC
13 CAN PLAY THAT ROLE TO MAKE SURE THAT SOMEBODY IS LOOKING AT
14 THAT AS THIS TECHNOLOGY CHANGES. I'M HOPING THE CLOUD BASED
15 TECHNOLOGY WILL BE SOMETHING THAT CAN STAY AROUND A LITTLE BIT
16 LONGER BECAUSE THE OPPORTUNITIES TO SEPARATE HARDWARE FROM
17 SOFTWARE IS GOOD. JUST A COMMENT. MY QUESTION HAS TO DO WITH
18 WHEN YOU TALKED ABOUT THE TIMING SOME OF THE PARAMETERS IN
19 THIS ROUND WAS AGENCY CAN ONLY DO -- HAVE TWO PROJECTS, SO
20 WHEN YOU GO TO THE NEW ROUND OF FUNDING ARE THEY ABLE TO BE
21 RECONSIDERED BECAUSE SINCE THEY ALREADY HAD TWO THEY WON'T BE
22 INCLUDED?

23

24 **MELANIE CHOY:** WE WOULD RECONSIDER AND LOOK AT THE LIST
25 HOLISTICALLY, ADDITIONAL COMPONENT OF THIS IS THAT IN ONE OF



MAY 10, 2024

1 THE SLIDES PRESENTED THERE IS A NUMBER OF FUNDING SOURCES, WE
2 WANT TO LOOK AT ALL OF OUR FUNDING SOURCES THAT FUND TRANSIT
3 PRIORITY PROJECTS AND LOOK AT IT HOLISTICALLY IN TERMS OF
4 COMPREHENSIVENESS.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S VERY GOOD. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU. IF THERE IS NO MORE QUESTIONS
9 WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** OH I'M SORRY. DEPUTY.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THE NEWBIE HERE. THANK YOU. THIS IS VERY
16 INTERESTING. THE CONSISTENCY, EFFICIENCIES, KIND OF THE SHARED
17 RESOURCES HERE, IF YOU COULD, QUICKLY, SO WE KNOW THE
18 INVESTMENT THAT WAS MADE ON VAN NESS [LAUGHTER] -- I DON'T
19 KNOW HOW MANY YEARS THAT TOOK -- BUT IT SEEMS TO HAVE PAID OFF
20 IN ONE WAY, SHAPE, OR FORM, SO JUST KIND OF SHARING THAT
21 INFORMATION HERE, ARE THESE BOARDING ISLANDS AND STUFF, ARE
22 ALL THE OPERATORS KIND OF LOOKING ON TO SEE WHAT'S WORKING THE
23 BEST? DO WE KNOW?

24



MAY 10, 2024

1 **MELANIE CHOY:** IN TERMS -- WELL, I CAN'T SPEAK FOR OPERATORS
2 THEMSELVES, BUT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE REALLY
3 EMPHASIZED AND FOCUSED IN ON WITH THE ACTION PLAN IS CONVENING
4 A TRANSIT PRIORITY WORKING GROUP OF STAFF. AND THERE HAS BEEN
5 AN EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION THROUGH THAT FORUM, THAT WE HAVE
6 BEEN HOLDING FOR THE LAST YEAR AND A HALF. AND ONE OF THE
7 POSITIVES, FOR ME, IN TERMS OF COMING THROUGH THIS IS WE ARE
8 REALLY CLOSELY PARTNERING WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF, AND
9 WE HAVE A TRANSIT AGENCY CO-PM ON THIS PROJECT, AS WELL, OR
10 THIS SET OF PROJECTS. AND, SO, WE ARE WORKING TIGHTLY WITH
11 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THIS, AND IN TERMS OF DEVELOPING THE NEEDS
12 ASSESSMENT AND HOW THE PROJECTS WERE DEVELOPED, A LOT OF THOSE
13 CONVERSATIONS ARE COMING THROUGH. ONE OF THE THINGS WE ARE
14 ALSO -- THAT'S ON THE HORIZON FOR US IS LOOKING AT A REGIONAL
15 TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICY. AND I -- IN A LOT OF THE
16 CONVERSATIONS, AND IN A LOT OF THE IDEAS THAT YOU'RE RAISING
17 IN TERMS OF EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION IS COMING THROUGH THOSE
18 BRAINSTORMING AND CONVERSATIONS ON WHAT SHOULD GO INTO A
19 REGIONAL TRANSIT PRIORITY POLICY.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** THE SOONER YOU CAN SHARE THAT INFORMATION WOULD BE
22 VERY HELPFUL. I KNOW MANY OF US ARE TRYING TO, LIKE, PARTNER
23 WITH DEVELOPERS, IF THEY'RE ON A TRANSIT CORRIDOR HERE. SO, IF
24 IT'S A SPECIFIC, LIKE, BUS ISLAND, OR STOP, OR EVEN ALIGNMENT,
25 IT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL. BECAUSE WE WOULD LOVE FOR THEM TO



MAY 10, 2024

1 PAY FOR IT, INSTEAD OF THE OPERATORS. BUT THAT WOULD BE
2 EXTREMELY HELPFUL THERE. AND IF YOU COULD JUST GIVE ME A
3 SECOND HERE, WHAT IS CLOUD BASED TRANSIT SIGNAL? [LAUGHTER]
4 JUST REALLY SHORT, BECAUSE, I'M SORRY, I'M NEW.

5

6 **BRRIT TANNER:** BRRIT TANNER AGAIN. BEFORE I WORKED AT MTC, I
7 WORKED AT SFMTA, IMPLEMENTING SBRT AND WORKING ON THE TRANSIT
8 SIGNAL PRIORITY PROGRAM I CAN ANSWER YOUR QUESTION THE SHORT
9 ANSWER IS WHEN YOU HAD AN EMITTER ON THE BUS AND SOMETHING AT
10 THE INTERSECTION THEN THE DETECTOR, CLOUD BASED DETECTION IS
11 IN THE CLOUD THEN THE CLOUD TELLING THE TRAFFIC CONTROLLER HEY
12 THERE IS A BUS COMING TO CHANGE THE LIGHT IT GETS A LOT OF THE
13 INTERMITTENT INFRASTRUCTURE AND MAKES IT MORE SEAMLESS BUT
14 ALSO REQUIRES FOR THE NETWORK TO BE WORKING SO IT'S
15 COMPLICATED AND A STEP UP AS NOTED AND WE HAVE THE TSP
16 PROGRAM.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. YEAH, WE DON'T WANT NETWORKS FAILING US.
19 THANK YOU; APPRECIATE IT.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** ANYONE ELSE? NOW WE HAVE A PUBLIC
22 COMMENT CARD FROM ADINA LEVIN. ADINA?

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** TWO POINTS FROM LISTENING TO THIS PRESENTATION,
25 AND, ALSO, FROM BEING ON THE STAKEHOLDER GROUP FOR THE TRANSIT



MAY 10, 2024

1 PRIORITY. ONE QUESTION THAT COMES TO MIND IS THERE ARE SMALL
2 SMALLER AGENCIES AND JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE TAKING LONGER TO
3 PULL PROJECTS TOGETHER. IS THERE ANY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO
4 GET MORE PLACES TO BE AT THAT LEVEL OF READINESS? AND AS AN
5 INDIVIDUAL VOLUNTEER WITH SILICON VALLEY BICYCLE COALITION,
6 THERE WAS A GROUP BEING BROUGHT ON TO DO PARKING INVENTORY IN
7 THE CITY OF SAN MATEO RELATING TO TRANSIT PRIORITY AND, LIKE,
8 WHY ARE WE CALLING ON VOLUNTEERS? IS THERE A NEED FOR, YOU
9 KNOW, MORE SUPPORT FOR THE JURISDICTIONS AND THE EIGHT
10 AGENCIES TO DO THAT KIND OF THING? THE -- THAT'S .1, ABOUT THE
11 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE. .2 IS ABOUT COMMUNICATIONS. THE SUCCESS,
12 THE INCREASED RIDER FRIENDLY, SO THE SYSTEM IN TERMS OF
13 RELIABLE AND COST EFFECTIVENESS IS FANTASTIC AND HAVING A
14 COMMUNICATION STRATEGY ON THIS NOT ONLY HERE, BUT TO THE
15 PUBLIC IS REALLY INVALUABLE AND IS ALSO INVALUABLE WITH
16 RESPECT TO THAT BROADER FUNDING CONVERSATION WHERE I HEAR IN
17 LOCAL DISCUSSIONS ABOUT IN THIS REGIONAL MEASURE WHY IS MONEY
18 BEING TAKEN OFF THE TOP BY MTC AS A MONEY GRAB AS OPENED TO,
19 WOW, HERE IS SOME MONEY BEING USED TO MAKE OUR SYSTEM BETTER
20 AND MORE COST EFFECTIVE. AND THINKING ABOUT THE OUTBOUND
21 COMMUNICATIONS VALUE TO DECISION MAKERS AND TO THE PUBLIC IS
22 SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT IN THIS GOOD PROGRAM, AS WELL. THANK
23 YOU.
24



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE IN THE
2 CHAMBER THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK? IS THERE ANYONE ONLINE?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO. THERE IS NO ONE THAT SUBMITTED
5 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM AND NO ONE ON ZOOM AND NO ONE ELSE
6 IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** COULD I ASK STAFF IF THERE IS -- IS
9 THERE ANY TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE COMPONENT? OR IS IT AN AFTER
10 THE FACT BUILT-IN, INTO AN AWARD?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** SORRY. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PERSON OF BusAID. WE
13 WORKED WITH THE PROJECT SPONSORS THROUGH THE THEIR PROJECT AND
14 TRY TO PROVIDE SUPPORT AS NEEDED. IT IS NOT FORMALLY PART OF
15 THE BusAID FUNDING, HOWEVER.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** OKAY.

18

19 **MELANIE CHOY:** WOULD ALSO -- MELANIE CHOY, I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO
20 ADD, OUR INTENT WHEN THINKING ABOUT THIS PROGRAM WAS FOCUSED
21 ON PINCH POINTS AND TRYING TO SOLVE SOME PROJECT ISSUES TO THE
22 EXTENT WE CAN AND THROUGH ANY OTHER PROGRAMS WE HAVE AVAILABLE
23 TO US IN OTHER FUNDING LEVERAGE THOSE EFFORTS WITH
24 JURISDICTIONS AND WHEN IT'S WITH PARTNERSHIPS IN JURISDICTIONS
25 LEVERAGING AND SETTING US UP FOR SUCCESS FOR PROJECT FUNDING.



MAY 10, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. I'M LOOKING TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR
3 A MOTION AND SECOND TO REFER MTC RESOLUTION 4647 BusAID
4 PROGRAM TO MTC COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR RABBITT?

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOACK.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AHN?

19

20 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? IS
2 ABSENT. SPERING? SPERING IS ABSENT. DEPUTIZED MEMBER PAPAN.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
7 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL SHOW MY
10 AGE AND SAY THAT IF 1031 DOESN'T PASS MAYBE BusAID CAN COME
11 BACK AND BE A MAJOR SUMMER EVENT. [LAUGHTER] MIGHT BE WHAT WE
12 NEED TO DO. [LAUGHTER] WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM 4C WHICH IS MTC
13 RESOLUTION 4648, THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE
14 MEASURES. AND WE HAVE ALLISON QUACH FROM MTC AND HANNAH
15 LINDELOF FROM BART.

16

17 **ALLISON QUACH:** GOOD AFTERNOON, COMMISSIONERS. AND LET'S GO TO
18 THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, TODAY WE'RE PRESENTING FOR YOU THE
19 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES. THE PROPOSED
20 APPROACH TO THEM, AS WELL AS INITIAL MEASURES FOR YOUR
21 CONSIDERATION. IN DEVELOPING THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES OUR
22 APPROACH WAS ROOTED IN THE MISSION OF REGIONAL NETWORK
23 MANAGEMENT WHICH IS TO DRIVE TRANSFORMATIVE IMPROVEMENTS
24 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE FOR REGIONAL BAY AREA TRANSIT. SO, THE
25 PERFORMANCE MEASURES THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING TO DEVELOP



MAY 10, 2024

1 SHOULD REALLY FOCUS ON MEASURING REGIONAL TRANSIT OUTCOMES FOR
2 RIDERS WITH A FOCUS ON BENEFITS TO THE RIDER. IN ADDITION,
3 PERFORMANCE MEASURES WILL ALSO BE USED TO ASSESS THE SUCCESS
4 OF THE RNM FRAMEWORK AND DELIVERING OUTCOMES AND TO IDENTIFY
5 OPPORTUNITIES FOR CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
6 OUR GOAL IS TO ESTABLISH A NEAR-TERM APPROACH FOR RNM
7 PERFORMANCE MEASURES WHICH WILL BE BASED ON READILY AVAILABLE
8 DATA AND TO WORK ON ESTABLISHING THOSE CAPABILITIES NOW AND
9 PROVIDING QUARTERLY WORKPLAN UPDATES. THIS WILL EVOLVE INTO A
10 LONGER TERM VISION WITH MORE ROBUST PERFORMANCE MEASURES. WE
11 SEE THESE PERFORMANCE MEASURES EVOLVING OVER TIME TO INCLUDE
12 THINGS LIKE MORE COMMON DATA DEFINITIONS, ESTABLISHING
13 TARGETS, AND DEVELOPING MORE AUTOMATED PROCESSES FOR DATA
14 COLLECTION, AGGREGATION, AND DISAGGREGATION, AND POTENTIALLY
15 DEVELOPING INTERACTIVE DASHBOARDS SO THAT ALL OF THIS REGIONAL
16 TRANSIT DATA CAN BE EASILY ACCESSIBLE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO,
17 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES ARE ORGANIZED
18 INTO TWO TYPES OF MEASURES. AS YOU CAN SEE HERE. ON THE LEFT
19 ARE TYPE ONE TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOMES. AND THIS FOCUSES ON TWO
20 THINGS. WHAT THE EXPERIENCE OF THE INDIVIDUAL RIDER IS ON
21 TRANSIT, AND WHAT ARE THE BENEFITS FOR RIDERS THAT WILL RESULT
22 FROM THE RNM'S ACTIVITIES. TYPE II ON THE LEFT ARE RNM AND
23 TRANSIT OPERATIONS. THESE ARE A LITTLE BIT MORE KIND OF BEHIND
24 THE SCENES MEASURES OF HOW WE'RE OPERATING, BOTH, YOU KNOW,
25 RNM AS A WHOLE, AS WELL AS TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN THE REGION.



MAY 10, 2024

1 IN THIS CATEGORY OF MEASURES WILL HELP US TELL HOW EFFECTIVELY
2 THE RNM IS DELIVERING ON THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION
3 PLAN AND ON THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL'S
4 WORKPLAN. I'M GOING TO PASS THE NEXT FEW SLIDES TO HANNAH
5 LINDELOF OF FROM BART TO TALK MORE ABOUT THE PROPOSED
6 CATEGORIES AND MEASURES.

7

8 **>>HANNAH LINDELOF:** THANKS ALLISON. THIS SLIDE TAKES THE
9 QUESTIONS ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE. SORRY. SLIDE FIVE, PLEASE.
10 THIS SLIDE TAKES QUESTIONS FROM THE PREVIOUS SLIDE THAT
11 ALLISON TALKED THROUGH AND TRANSLATES THEM INTO DESCRIPTIVE
12 CATEGORIES THE TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOMES INCLUDE RIDER EXPERIENCE
13 THAT'S JOURNEY END TO END, AND RIDER BENEFITS THAT ARE COMING
14 DIRECTLY FROM THE RNM ACTIVITIES. THE TYPE II MEASURES ARE
15 MEASURING THE WORKPLAN ACHIEVEMENT, AN ASSESSMENT OF THE RNM'S
16 CAPABILITIES AND NEEDS AND THEN OVERVIEW OF THE REGIONAL
17 TRANSIT OPERATIONS, HIGHER LEVEL INDICATORS OF THE
18 FUNCTIONALITY AND OVERALL HEALTH OF THE NETWORK. NEXT SLIDE.
19 LOOKING MORE CLOSELY AT TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOME MEASURES, I
20 WOULD LIKE TO REITERATE THAT THESE ARE THE INITIAL MEASURES
21 PROPOSED AND THEY WILL EVOLVE OF SOLVE OVER THE COURSE OF
22 THE WORK AS THE RNM CAPABILITIES EVOLVE. I'M NOT GOING TO READ
23 EACH ONE AS YOU HAVE THEM BEFORE YOU BUT WANT TO MAKE A FEW
24 POINTS. WITHIN THE RIDER EXPERIENCE CATEGORY THERE ARE FOUR
25 CUB CATEGORIES WE HAVE IDENTIFIED METRICS THAT CAN BE MARRIED



MAY 10, 2024

1 USING EXISTING DATA SOURCES AND ELEMENTS THAT CAN BE MASHED BY
2 FEEDBACK FROM A REGIONAL RIDER SURVEY SO WE CAN HEAR DIRECTLY
3 FROM RIDERS IN THOSE AREAS. ALL ARE IMPORTANT TO MEASURE IN
4 ORDER TO TELL A HOLISTIC STORY ABOUT THE RIDER EXPERIENCE ON
5 TRANSIT BUT ACKNOWLEDGING THERE ARE FACTORS OUTSIDE OF CONTROL
6 OF OPERATORS AND MTC THAT WILL AFFECT PERFORMANCE TO THE
7 EXTENT FEASIBLE STAFF WILL INCORPORATE THIS CONTEXT INTO THAT
8 REPORTING. I'LL ALSO NOTICE HERE -- OR NOTE HERE THAT THE
9 FOCUS IS NOT TO SCRUTINIZE INDIVIDUAL LOCAL SERVICE BUT ASSESS
10 TRANSIT AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL TO THAT UNDERSTAND STAFF WILL
11 REFINE DETAILS ON HOW DATA WILL BE REPORTED FOR INSTANCE
12 AGGREGATION OR DISAGGREGATION OF DATA BY MODE OR SERVICE TYPE
13 TELLING A MEANINGFUL STORY THAT CAN INFORM OUR WORK MOVING
14 FORWARD. SECOND TABLE MEASURES OUTLINES FOCUS SPECIFICALLY ON
15 BENEFITS TO RIDERS FROM RNM ACTIVITIES MEASURES WILL BE
16 TAILORED TO EACH PROGRAM ESTABLISHED AS EACH INITIATIVE
17 ADVANCES THE TABLE WILL EVOLVE AS VARIOUS INITIATIVES MOVE
18 FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. TYPE II RNM TRANSIT OPERATIONS MEASURES
19 PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO THE STATE OF RNM AND TRANSIT OPERATIONS
20 IN THE REGION AND WILL BE USED TO ASSESS HOW EFFECTIVELY THE
21 RNM IS DELIVERING ON THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND RNM
22 COUNCIL WORKPLAN. ACHIEVEMENT WILL BE REPORTED QUARTERLY AND
23 ANNUALLY ALONGSIDE OTHER PERFORMANCE MEASURES PROVIDING
24 INSIGHT INTO OPERATIONS OF RNM SUCH AS CAPABILITIES AND
25 RESOURCE NEEDS AND LASTLY SET OF MEASURES RELATED TO REGIONAL



MAY 10, 2024

1 TRANSIT OPERATIONS WHICH ARE DESIGNED TO ASSESS THE HEALTH OF
2 THE NETWORK. WE'LL ALSO CONSIDERING THE BEST METHOD OF
3 DISAGGREGATING THIS DATA RIDERSHIP WILL BE DISAGGREGATED TO
4 REFLECT DEMOGRAPHICS AND ELEMENTS LIKE TIME OF DAY TO BETTER
5 UNDERSTAND RIDERSHIP PATTERNS IN THE REGION. AS PERFORMANCE
6 MEASURES -- SORRY -- PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING EVOLVES
7 THIS MAY INCLUDE OTHER BENEFITS FOR THE REGION SUCH AS VMT
8 REDUCTIONS AND MODE SHIFT. I'M GOING TO PASS IT TO ALLISON TO
9 TALK MORE ABOUT THE EVOLUTION OF MEASURES OVER TIME.

10

11 **>>ALLISON QUACH:** THANK YOU, HANNAH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS WE
12 HAVE OUTLINED AT THE BEGINNING, THE MEASURES PRESENTED ON THE
13 PREVIOUS SLIDES ARE REALLY JUST THE INITIAL MEASURES THAT WE
14 HAVE IDENTIFIED THAT CAN BE PULLED TOGETHER WITH EXISTING
15 READILY AVAILABLE DATA. THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES SOME OF THE WAYS
16 THAT WE WILL EVOLVE THE MEASURES MOVING FORWARD TO PROVIDE A
17 MORE HOLISTIC STORY ABOUT TRANSIT PERFORMANCE AND ABOUT THE
18 RIDER EXPERIENCE. AND ATTACHMENT D, IN YOUR PACKET, LISTS SOME
19 SPECIFIC MEASURES THAT MAY BE CONSIDERED. BUT ACROSS EACH OF
20 THE RIDER EXPERIENCE CATEGORIES, FUTURE MEASURES SHOULD GO
21 BEYOND OPERATOR AND MTC ACTIVITIES TO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE
22 METRICS OF CONNECTIVITY AND OF SAFETY AND COMFORT. EVOLVED
23 FROM SOME OF THE METRICS FOCUSED AROUND AVAILABILITY TO
24 MEASURES OF QUALITY, AND THAT APPLIES TO ELEMENTS SUCH AS
25 REALTIME INFORMATION. AND THEN FINALLY, PROVIDE MORE CONTEXT



MAY 10, 2024

1 TO THE DATA, SUCH AS THINKING ABOUT TRANSIT SPEEDS IN THE
2 CONTEXT OF DRIVING SPEEDS OR ROADWAY SPEED LIMITS. AS
3 PERFORMANCE MEASURE REPORTING EVOLVES RNM AND TRANSIT
4 OPERATIONS MEASURES COULD INCORPORATE OTHER READILY AVAILABLE
5 DATA, CONSIDER COSTS, REVENUES, AND SOCIETAL BENEFITS OF
6 TRANSIT, CONSIDER OTHER ASPECTS OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS, SUCH AS
7 MUTUAL AID, OR WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT. AND THEN EXPAND TO
8 INCLUDE OTHER BENEFITS FOR THE REGION, SUCH AS VMT REDUCTIONS
9 AND MODE SHIFT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TODAY WEEK SEEKING YOUR
10 APPROVAL AND ANY ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK ON THE PROPOSED APPROACH
11 AND INITIAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES. WE ANTICIPATE THAT WE WILL
12 PREPARE THE FIRST ANNUAL REPORT ON PERFORMANCE MEASURES IN
13 SUMMER OF 2025, AHEAD OF DEVELOPING THE RNM COUNCIL'S NEXT
14 WORKPLAN WHICH WILL EXTEND FROM SUMMER OF 2025 TO 2026.
15 HOWEVER, WE RECOGNIZE THE NEED TO DELIVER ON REPORTING QUICKLY
16 AND WHERE FEASIBLE, WE PLAN TO PROVIDE PRELIMINARY REPORTING
17 ON SELECT MEASURES WHERE THAT DATA IS AVAILABLE. MOVING
18 FORWARD, MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF WILL WORK TO DEVELOP ALL OF
19 THESE PROCESSES TO COLLECT, AGGREGATE, AND ANALYZE THE DATA.
20 AND THIS INCLUDES SCOPING OUT OF THE REGIONAL TRANSIT RIDER
21 EXPERIENCE SURVEY. THAT'S PART OF THE TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOMES
22 MEASURES. WE ALSO ANTICIPATE ONGOING COORDINATION WITH STATE
23 EFFORTS AROUND TRANSIT AND WITH OTHER MTC EFFORTS TO KIND OF
24 COLLECT AND REPORT ON DATA AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. THANK YOU.
25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. THANK YOU. APPRECIATE THAT VERY
2 MUCH. LOOKING AT MY COLLEAGUES. VICE CHAIR NOACK?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. INTERESTING KPIS.
5 BUT YOU HAVE CATEGORIES AND SUBCATEGORIES, BUT WE REALLY DON'T
6 HAVE THE KPIS HERE, RIGHT? YOU'RE ASKING US TO APPROVE, SORT
7 OF, CATEGORIES OF KPIS, NOT ACTUALLY KPIS. AM I MISS -- OR DID
8 I MISS SOMETHING?

9

10 **ALLISON QUACH:** WHAT WE'RE ASKING YOU TO APPROVE IS SHOWN IN
11 ATTACHMENT A TO THE RESOLUTION, AND THAT INCLUDES BOTH THIS
12 OVERALL FRAMEWORK OF THE CATEGORIES, AND SUBCATEGORIES, AS
13 WELL AS THE SPECIFIC INITIAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES. SO, THIS
14 DOES NOT INCLUDE TARGETS, NECESSARILY, BECAUSE WE WANT TO
15 START WITH COLLECTING THE DATA FIRST AND UNDERSTANDING THE
16 TRENDS AND WITH WE WANT TO ACHIEVE. BUT AS NOTED IN THIS LONG-
17 TERM EVOLUTION, THIS WILL MOVE TOWARDS SETTING TARGETS FOR
18 MEASURES WHERE APPLICABLE.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SO WE'RE REALLY JUST LOOKING AT WHERE ARE
21 WE GOING TO MEASURE AND THEN BEING ABLE TO COMPARE, NOT REALLY
22 TARGETS WE'RE SHOOTING FOR AND ANYTHING OF THAT SORT. I ASSUME
23 THAT WILL COME LATER ON. AND THEN YOU MENTIONED ABOUT LOOKING
24 AT THIS REGIONALLY, PERFORMANCE MEASURES, AND NOT BY OPERATOR.
25 IS THERE A REASON WHY WE SHOULDN'T BE DOING THAT AS WELL?



MAY 10, 2024

1

2 **ALLISON QUACH:** SO TO CLARIFY THAT POINT, WE DO WANT TO PRESENT
3 THIS REGIONALLY, IN AS CONSISTENT A MANNER AS WE CAN TO
4 UNDERSTAND HOW THE SYSTEM, AS A WHOLE, IS PERFORMING. WE WILL
5 KIND OF USE THAT APPROACH TO BE ABLE TO DRILL DOWN, EITHER AT
6 THE SUBREGIONAL LEVEL, OR TO THE OPERATOR, IF NEEDED, TO
7 DIAGNOSIS, BUT PART OF WHAT WE'LL BE WORKING ON THROUGH
8 IMPLEMENTATION IS TO DETERMINE WHAT THE APPROPRIATE
9 AGGREGATION IS DISAGGREGATION LEVELS ARE, FOR THE DATA.
10 BECAUSE IT'S A LOT OF DATA.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH.

13

14 **ALLISON QUACH:** ESPECIALLY AS YOU BREAK IT OUT IN DIFFERENT
15 WAYS WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE LOOKING AT IT IN A THOUGHTFUL
16 WAY TO INFORM THE WORK.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE DELVE DEEP ENOUGH
19 THAT IF THERE ARE THINGS THAT NEED TO BE ADJUSTED OR
20 CONSIDERED THAT WE HAVE THE DATA AND ABILITY TO LOOK AT THAT
21 AND NOT JUST LOOK AT ONE REGIONAL NUMBER WITHOUT FURTHER --
22 OKAY. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** COMMISSIONER SHAW?

25



MAY 10, 2024

1 **DIANE SHAW:** THANK YOU FOR THIS. IT'S REALLY GOOD INFORMATION.
2 LIKE YOU SAID, THERE IS A LOT OF DATA HERE, AND, SO, PUTTING
3 THAT DATA TOGETHER INTO A MEANINGFUL WAY, HOW DO YOU PLAN TO
4 DO THAT? I MEAN, THERE ARE TOOLS IN PLACE? ARE YOU EXPECTING
5 THE AGENCIES TO GIVE IT TO YOU IN A CERTAIN FORMAT? AND HOW
6 ARE THE SMALLER AGENCIES GOING TO DEAL WITH THAT? THAT'S MY
7 FIRST QUESTION THEN I'LL ASK A SECOND ONE AFTER THAT BECAUSE
8 IT'S A TOTALLY DIFFERENT ONE.

9

10 **ALLISON QUACH:** SURE. FOR EACH OF THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES THAT
11 WE HAVE IDENTIFIED, THEY'RE GOING TO COME FROM A RANGE OF DATA
12 SOURCES. SOME OF IT IS DATA THAT MTC STAFF HAVE MORE READILY
13 AVAILABLE ACCESS TO, SUCH AS CLIPPER DATA TO LOOK AT
14 TRANSFERS, RIDERSHIP, ET CETERA, AND YOU KNOW, ALSO WORKING
15 WITH THE 511 TEAM TO LOOK AT THE GTFS DATA. FOR SOME OF THESE
16 OTHER MEASURES, WE WILL BE WORKING CLOSELY OPERATOR STAFF TO
17 DETERMINE WHAT PROCESS MAKES SENSE BOTH FOR US MTC IN ORDER TO
18 MANAGE THE DATA IN A SMOOTH WAY. BUT ALSO FOR THE OPERATOR
19 STAFF TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE THAT. SO, WE DON'T HAVE THAT --
20 THOSE FORMATS DETERMINED YET, BUT WE'LL BE WORKING WITH THEM
21 CLOSELY TO DEVELOP THAT.

22

23 **DIANE SHAW:** YEAH, AND I SAY TO THAT, I KNOW THE STAFF THAT IT
24 TAKES TO DO SOME OF THIS WORK SOMETIMES SO I'M SURE THAT'S
25 GOING TO HAVE TO GHEE INTO WHAT YOU LOOK AT TO DECIDE WHETHER



MAY 10, 2024

1 SOME AGENCIES NEED MORE HELP THAN OTHERS AND HOW WE HELP THEM
2 DO THAT IN ORDER TO HAVE THE DATA THAT WE NEED FROM EVERYBODY.
3 SECOND THING IS, I WAS TRYING TO THINK ABOUT THIS FROM THE
4 CONTEXT OF SOMETHING I HAD HEARD ABOUT LAST WEEK WHEN I WAS AT
5 SOMETHING, AND GETTING THE DATA AROUND WHERE PEOPLE GO AND WHY
6 PEOPLE GO WHERE, I THINK IS IMPORTANT. AND I THINK I AM SEEING
7 SOME OF THAT IN HERE THAT YOU'RE GOING TO KIND OF MEASURE
8 WHETHER THEY'RE GOING AND STUFF. AND I SAY THAT BECAUSE
9 PARTNERSHIPS, AS WE MOVE FORWARD, I THINK ARE GOING TO BE
10 REALLY IMPORTANT AND ONE THAT I HEARD ABOUT IS UP IN PORTLAND
11 PARTNERING WITH INSTACART TO DELIVER FOOD FOR THOSE HAVING A
12 HARD TIME GETTING OUT. AND NOT ONLY DID IT HELP THOSE PEOPLE
13 IT HELPED PARATRANSIT SERVICE THAT WAS LESS TRIPS THAT THEY
14 HAD TO TAKE TO THE FOOD STORE, AND GOING FORWARD I THINK
15 LOOKING AT A MYRIAD OF DIFFERENT SOLUTIONS THAT WE ARE TRYING
16 TO ACCOMPLISH AS A REGION. THAT'S A COMMENT AS YOU LOOK
17 FORWARD AND THINK ABOUT FUTURE THINGS THAT MIGHT BE GOOD TO
18 MEASURE. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. DIRECTOR LI?

21

22 **JANICE LI:** YES. THANK YOU. OKAY. SO, YOU TALKED ABOUT IT A
23 LITTLE BIT IN RESPONSE TO THE QUESTIONS ABOUT LIKE DATA
24 AGGREGATION. I HAVE A LOT OF QUESTIONS HERE TOO BUT IT SEEMS
25 LIKE YOU MIGHT NOT BE READY TO REALLY PRESENT THAT. BUT I DO



MAY 10, 2024

1 THINK THAT HOW YOU ACTUALLY SHOW THIS DATA IN A MEANINGFUL
2 WAY, LIKE THAT -- THE DECISIONS YOU MAKE ABOUT DISAGGREGATION
3 VERSUS AGGREGATION, I THINK YOU NEED TO BRING BACK TO THE
4 BOARD THAT'S WHEN WE'LL HAVE SOMETHING TO RESPOND TO REGARDING
5 OUTCOME PERFORMANCE MEASURES RIGHT NOW IT'S ALL THEORETICAL SO
6 I'M NOT GOING TO ASK ANY MORE QUESTIONS ON THE AGGREGATION
7 PIECE BUT LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THAT COME BACK. I DID
8 RAISE THAT QUESTION WHEN I MET WITH HANNAH EARLIER THIS WEEK.
9 IN ALL OF THE DATA THAT'S READILY AVAILABLE IT'S AN APPLES TO
10 APPLES COMPARISON AND DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES MAY COLLECT
11 LESS OR MORE DATA AS WELL, EXAMPLE, ON CALTRAIN WE DO
12 QUARTERLY REPORTS AND RECEIVED THE LATEST ONE AT OUR BOARD
13 MEETING YESTERDAY I'M SURE DIFFERENT OPERATORS HAVE DIFFERENT
14 WAYS OF MEASURING RELIABILITY ALSO ON MODE IF YOU ARE WETA
15 VERSUS SMART AND MUNI BUS HOW YOU ACTUALLY MEASURE SOMETHING
16 AS BIG AS RELIABILITY IT'S GOING TO BE REALLY DIFFERENT YOU'RE
17 GOING TO HAVE DIFFERENT BASELINES AS WELL. YOU CAN TALK MORE
18 ABOUT HOW YOU'RE NAVIGATING THOSE APPLES TO OVERAGE
19 COMPARISONS WITH PERFORMANCE MEASURES?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** DO YOU WANT TO --

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SO, I WOULD SAY THAT IS GOING TO BE ONE TOUGHER
24 THINGS WE'LL WORK THROUGH SPECIFICALLY RELIABLE AND ON TIME
25 PERFORMANCE IS WHERE WE'LL HAVE THE MOST APPLES TO ORANGES



MAY 10, 2024

1 DATA TO WORK AND COMBINE WE'RE WORKING THROUGH AND THIS
2 MEASURE IS DIFFERENT WHERE WE HAVE TO REPORT BY MODE RAIL ON
3 TIME IS DIFFERENT FROM BUS ON TIME PERFORMANCE AND SOME BUSES
4 MEASURE HEADWAY RATHER THAN SCHEDULED TIME. THIS'S SOMETHING
5 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO DRILL INTO. SO, THAT IS -- DO YOU HAVE
6 MORE TO ADD THAN THAT?

7

8 **ALLISON QUACH:** YEAH. I THINK, YOU KNOW, THE OBSTACLE ONE IS
9 AROUND, LIKE, RELIABILITY OR PERHAPS HOW YOU MEASURE THINGS
10 LIKE RIDERSHIP, BUT I THINK GOING TO SOME OF THE THINGS THAT
11 ADINA HAD LIFTED UPCOMING OUT OF THE ADVISORY GROUP, SAFETY IS
12 GOING TO BE REALLY DIFFERENT I WOULD SAY AT BART FIRST OF ALL
13 WHEN WE PRESENT THE THIS DATA WHEN I FIRST STARTED THE BOARD
14 WAS SMILEY FACES AND VERY CONFUSING DATA AND IT WAS ALSO LIKE
15 FTA REQUIRED DATA SO IT WOULD BE, LIKE, SAFETY INSTANCE PER,
16 LIKE, 1 MILLION TRIPS, WHICH, LIKE, WELL, LIKE, HOW MANY STEPS
17 OCCURRED, YOU KNOW? HOW MANY -- LIKE, IT WAS SO HARD TO REALLY
18 UNDERSTAND. OVER THE YEARS BART PD AND BART OPERATIONS HAVE
19 DONE AN INCREDIBLE JOB HELPING THE BOARD AS POLICY MAKERS AND
20 GENERAL PUBLIC AS PAYING CUSTOMERS BETTER UNDERSTAND WHAT DOES
21 SAFETY MEAN OR NOT MEAN VIA THE DATA. AT FIRST WE USED TO BE
22 LIKE POLICE PRESENCE IS THE ONE WAY WE WOULD IDENTIFY SAFETY,
23 THAT, AND, LIKE, THE FTA REQUIRED, HIKE, PART 1 MILLION CRIMES
24 PER ONE MILL TRIPS WAS HOW IT WAS MEASURED OVER TIME THAT CAN
25 MEAN A LOT OF OTHER THINGS SAFETY AND COMFORT ALSO LIKE WITH



MAY 10, 2024

1 NEW POLICING SOCIAL WORKERS AND INVESTORS LIKE ARE WE MAKING
2 REFERRALS ARE THOSE REFERRALS AND SERVICES BEING RECEIVED FOR
3 UNHOUSED OR THOSE EXPERIENCING MENTAL HEALTH CRISIS WE CAME TO
4 UNDERSTAND SAFETY AS IT RELATES TO WHAT WE'RE HEARING FROM THE
5 PUBLIC AND FOCUS GROUPS ET CETERA. SO, I WOULD SAY THAT THE
6 APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON WILL NOT EXIST BUT IT'S NOT JUST
7 FOR RIDERSHIP IT'S FOR ALL OF THE SUBCATEGORIES THAT YOU HAVE
8 IDENTIFIED. SO, I DO HAVE A FEW COMMENTS. FIRST, I WANT TO
9 THANK ADINA AND THE WORK THAT THE ADVISORY GROUP HAS DONE.
10 EVERYTHING YOU SHARED, ADINA BOTH IN THE MEMO AND VERBAL
11 UPDATE IS SUMMARY AND BULLET POINT LEVEL. IT DOES SEEM TO BE
12 HELPFUL FEEDBACK THAT I AGREE W SECOND I WANT TO MAKE SURE
13 THAT THIS DATA COLLECTION FOCUSES ON MEETING SPECIFICALLY THE
14 GOALS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE IN OUR COORDINATION EFFORTS
15 AND THROUGH THE TRANSFORMATION TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION
16 PLAN. THIS IS TO SAY, THIS SHOULD NOT BE AN ALL ENCOMPASSING
17 EXERCISE TO FIGURE OUT HOW GREAT TRANSIT IS WRIT LARGE AND HOW
18 TRANSIT OPERATIONS ARE ACROSS THE BOARD. I THINK WE CAN
19 QUICKLY GET TO A POINT WHERE WE'RE EITHER TAKING IN TOO MUCH
20 DATA AND YOU ALREADY HAVE SO MUCH DATA TO, SORT OF, PARSE
21 THROUGH, AND THAT TRYING TO GATHER THAT DATA AND PARSING IT
22 BECOMES FAR ARDUOUS THAN WHAT THE REAL WORK IS THAT MAKE
23 POLICY AND OPERATIONS CHANGES AND OUTCOMES AND COORDINATION,
24 WHICH IS DON'T GO OVERBOARD. SO BRINGING BACK TO US, SEEING
25 HOW WE'RE DOING AND MAKING IMPROVEMENTS AROUND COORDINATION



MAY 10, 2024

1 FASTER. I'M TELLING BOTH THE PUBLIC AND COLLEAGUES HERE. IN
2 RESPONSE TO WHAT YOU PRESENTED, THE TYPE ONE TRANSIT RIDER
3 OUTCOMES MADE A LOT OF SENSE TO ME AND HIT THE BASICS. I DO
4 NOT HAVE A LOT TO ADD AT THIS TIME THIS IS HIGH-LEVEL FOR US.
5 I HAVE THOUGHTS REGARDING TYPE II MEASURES. AGAIN THERE IS NOT
6 A LOT OF DETAIL HERE SO THERE IS NOT A LOT FOR ME TO RESPOND
7 TO BUT IT IS TRICKY AND REALLY FASCINATING. I THINK TRYING TO
8 MEASURE THIS IS DIFFICULT AND YOU'RE LIKELY GOING TO CREATE
9 NEW METRICS THAT MIGHT OR MIGHT NOT LAND VERSUS TRANSIT RIDER
10 OUTCOMES WHERE YOU'RE LIKE SAFETY, CLEANLINESS, PERFORMANCE,
11 RELIABILITY, ALL THOSE THINGS THAT ARE OBVIOUS, OPPOSED TO HOW
12 EFFECTIVE IS THE NEW INFRASTRUCTURE THAT'S HARD. I THINK
13 YOU'RE MEASURING COORDINATION AND HOW THE NEW RNM
14 INFRASTRUCTURE IS WORKING AND IS IT WORTH IT. SO OF COURSE
15 RIDER OUTCOMES ARE ONE WAY TO FIGURE THAT OUT. SO WE BETTER
16 HOPE ALL THIS TIME AND ENERGY WE'RE SPEND SUGGEST MAKING
17 THINGS BETTER FOR THE USER BUT WE ALSO WANT TO KNOW ARE WE
18 TEARING OUR HAIR OUT JUST TO GET MINIMAL RIDER OUTCOMES AND
19 THERE IS ALL THIS COST AND COORDINATION IN INFRASTRUCTURE,
20 STAFF TIME, CAPACITY OF THIS BOARD AND COMMISSION, MEMBERS TO
21 HOLD MEETINGS LIKE THIS. THERE IS CAPACITY OF THE PUBLIC TO
22 MEANINGFULLY ENGAGE IN THIS AND SO FORTH. ONE CREATIVE WAY TO
23 THINK ABOUT WHETHER A COORDINATION INFRASTRUCTURE IS WORKING
24 OR NOT IS TO THINK ABOUT THE NUMBER OF STEPS AND AMOUNT OF
25 TIME, INITIATIVES IT TAKES TO DEVELOP, APPROVE AND IMPLEMENT.



MAY 10, 2024

1 FOR EXAMPLE, AND, BRITT, IT IS GOOD TO SEE YOU HERE AT MTC. I
2 WAS SHOCKED TO SEE YOU IN THE PRESENTATION, I HATE TO BRIDGE
3 UP ALL THE -- BUT THE SF BICYCLE COALITIONS NUMBER OF BIKE
4 LANE HOT SPOT IMPROVEMENTS THROUGH THAT HAPPENED THROUGH EACH
5 OF THE KEY STEPS NEEDED I WAS TRACKING FUNDING APPROVALS AND
6 SALES TAX ALLOCATIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE TO FULL BOARD AND
7 SECOND APPROVALS ALL OF THAT TRACKING ENVIRONMENTAL AND
8 ENGINEERING, SF PUBLIC WORKS NOTED TO PROCEED ACTUALLY
9 BREAKING OF THE GROUND AND CONSTRUCTION COMPLETION I THINK IT
10 WAS 8, 9, 10 STEP PROCESS IN THE END WE TRACKED HOW LONG EACH
11 OF THE START OF TO FINISH PROCESSES TAKE AND MATCH THE SIZE OF
12 THE PROJECT AND IMPACT AND PROCESS TO IMPROVE IT. SMALL
13 PROJECTS THAT WERE PAINT AND POST SHOULD NOT TAKE NEARLY AS
14 LONG AS BIGGER PROJECTS THAT REQUIRE CONCRETE, SIGNAL
15 UPGRADES, YOU KNOW, PARKING REMOVAL, MASSIVE CHANGES. SO TO
16 BRING THIS BACK TO RNM COORDINATION, THE IDEA IS THAT WE'RE
17 TRACKING AND WHAT WE NEED TO KNOW IS MAKING SURE ALL THE NEW
18 INFRASTRUCTURE, ADVISORY GROUP, RNM COUNCIL, THIS COMMITTEE,
19 TO EACH OF THE POLICY DECISIONS THAT EACH OF THE TRANSIT BOARD
20 MAY NEED TO TAKE, IT BETTER NOT TAKE THAT LONG [LAUGHTER]
21 RIGHT? LIKE, WE CAN'T DO ALL THIS INFRASTRUCTURE AND SPEND ALL
22 THIS MONEY TO PAY ALL THE STAFF AND DO ALL THIS STUFF, IT'S
23 TAKING SO LONG TO GET MINIMAL TRANSIT OUTCOMES AND I THINK
24 THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE TRACKING IN THE TRACK TWO TYPE II
25 PERFORMANCE MEASURES. I HOPE NEXT TIME YOU BRING THIS BACK TO



MAY 10, 2024

1 US BE CREATIVE AND THE URGENCY IS MEASURES IN HOW QUICKLY CAN
2 WE MOVE TO MAKE CHANGES THAT ELICIT OUTCOMES. THANK YOU VERY
3 MUCH. ALL OF THIS IS REALLY FASCINATING THIS IS WHAT WE ALL
4 SET OUT TO DO TO MAKE SURE WE'RE MAKING SURE THAT THINGS ARE
5 BETTER FOR TRANSIT

6

7 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** COMMITTEE MEMBER PAPAN. I'M SORRY.
8 YOU'RE RIGHT. DIRECTOR DUTRA-VERNACI, THEN WE'LL GO TO OUR
9 DEPUTY.

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I DON'T HAVE
12 QUESTIONS. JUST COMMENTS, IN GENERAL. FIRST OF ALL, I WANTED
13 TO COMMENT WITH OUR TRANSPORTATION AGENCY PARTNERS ON THIS
14 BOARD. THAT IS VALUABLE JUST BY HEARING THE COMMENTS THAT YOU
15 HAVE MADE HERE TODAY AND IN TERMS OF WHAT OUR GOAL IS AND
16 THINKING ABOUT THE GOAL WHEN THIS PRESENTATION FIRST STARTED,
17 THE FIRST THING I FOCUSED ON WAS REALLY WHAT YOU'RE CALLING
18 TYPE ONE, THE TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOMES. BECAUSE THE WHOLE GOAL,
19 IN MY OPINION, BEHIND THIS WHOLE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT
20 IS TO GET PEOPLE OUT THEIR CARS INTO PUBLIC TRANSIT. AND SO
21 WHEN WE'RE MEASURING THAT, I LIKE THE FRAMEWORK YOU HAVE COME
22 UP WITH, AND I LIKE THAT YOU'RE CALLING IT ONE AS OPPOSED TO
23 TWO, BECAUSE WE NEED TO REMEMBER WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO IS
24 MAKE THIS A BETTER EXPERIENCE FOR THE END USER SO THAT WE CAN
25 GET OTHER USERS INTO THE SYSTEM. BUT THAT BEING SAID, YOU DO



MAY 10, 2024

1 HAVE A BIG TASK IN TERMS OF THE OPERATOR SIDE, AS WELL AS THE
2 USER SIDE. BUT I THINK IT'S, LIKE, CAUSE AND EFFECT. IF THE
3 OPERATORS ARE FIGURING OUT WHAT THEY'RE DOING AND GETTING IT
4 RIGHT, THEN THE USERS ARE GOING TO BE THE PROOF THAT IT'S
5 WORKING. BECAUSE THEY'RE JUMPING INTO THE SYSTEM. SO, THANK
6 YOU. AND I KNOW IT'S A WORK IN PROGRESS. SO WE APPRECIATE YOUR
7 EFFORT. THANK YOU, CHAIR.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR PAPAN?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I'LL HAVE TO AGREE WITH OUR COLLEAGUE
12 LI HERE. THIS IS REALLY -- WE HAVE HAD THIS PLAN FOR THREE
13 YEARS AND TO JUST SAY THIS IS EVOLVING AND JUST COLLECTING
14 DATA, I THINK WE'RE GETTING BOGGED DOWN WAY TOO MUCH. AND WE
15 NEED TO SHOW THE PUBLIC RESULTS NOW. SO WHEN WE TALK
16 CONNECTIVITY, THEN I'LL SAY IT, BRING BART AND CALTRAIN INTO A
17 ROOM AND FIGURE OUT WHY THEY CAN'T COORDINATE. [LAUGHTER]
18 LET'S JUST GET SOME RESULTS HERE AND FIGURE OUT WHAT'S WORKING
19 AND WHAT'S NOT WORKING HERE. SAFETY. OKAY, BART HAS -- A BART
20 WATCH APP. THAT'S GOING TO GIVE YOU DATA. THAT'S, YOU KNOW,
21 TAKE SOME THINGS THAT CURRENTLY EXIST AND LET'S LOOK AT THAT
22 TO MOVE IN THIS DIRECTION. THESE OUTCOMES. WE KNOW WHAT THE
23 OUTCOMES ARE SUPPOSED TO BE. WE HAVE KNOWN FOR A LONG TIME,
24 BUT TO SAY, YOU KNOW, OH THIS IS EVOLVING... WE NEED TO FOCUS
25 ON RESULTS HERE. AND THE TIMELINE HERE. OH MY GOSH. 2026? WE



MAY 10, 2024

1 DON'T HAVE THAT KIND OF TIME. THERE IS A FINANCIAL CLIFF
2 THAT'S HAPPENING HERE. RIDERS NEED RESULTS NOW. SO, I THINK
3 YOU'RE TRYING TO GO FOR PERFECT. LET -- PULL BACK. LOOK AT
4 WHAT YOU HAVE BEFORE YOU, THE OPERATORS YOU HAVE BEFORE YOU,
5 THE BusAID, THAT WAS GREAT. THOSE ARE SPECIFICS. LIKE, RIGHT
6 NOW. THAT'S WHAT WE NEED TO FOCUS ON HERE. I UNDERSTAND, NICE
7 PLAN AND EVERYTHING. BUT, I HAVEN'T READ HERE, ARE THE
8 OPERATORS COMMITTED TO THIS? DO WE HAVE TO WAIT ANOTHER YEAR
9 FOR THEM TO COMMIT? WE HAD THE OPERATORS INVOLVED IN THE
10 TRANSIT ORIENTED TRANSFORMATION PLAN. THE PROBLEM WAS THEIR
11 BOARDS DIDN'T VOTE ON IT. SO, IF THIS IS THE DIRECTION WE'RE
12 HEADING IN, WE NEED THAT COMMITMENT RIGHT NOW FROM THOSE
13 BOARDS. SO, I GET IT. THE AND I REALLY WANT SUCCESS HERE
14 [LAUGHTER] BECAUSE WE ARE LOOKING TO THE VOTERS TO PASS A
15 BOND. WE'RE LOOK -- ALL OF THIS -- THEY WANT RESULTS NOW. SO,
16 I ASK THAT DON'T BE BOGGED DOWN, LONG-TERM. WE NEED THE THINGS
17 RIGHT NOW THAT ARE GOING TO IMPACT. SO, A WHOLE 'NOTHER YEAR
18 OF DATA COLLECTION AND REPORTING WITH NO BUILT IN RESULTS OR
19 MEASURES AT THIS POINT, I THINK YOU HAVE MEASURES THAT ARE
20 THERE. THAT WE CAN GET TO, LIKE, RIGHT NOW. THAT'S WHAT WOULD
21 MAKE THIS OPERATION MUCH MORE SUCCESSFUL, THE PUBLIC WOULD DO.
22 YOU TALKED ABOUT RIDER SURVEYS. THEY SAY THE SAME THING. THEY
23 HAVE SAID FOR THE LAST TEN YEARS [LAUGHTER] WHICH IS
24 RELIABILITY, CONNECTIVITY, EQUITY, AND SAFETY AND COMFORT. WE
25 KNOW WHAT THE RIDERS WANT. NOW, LET'S GIVE IT TO THEM,



MAY 10, 2024

1 SOMEHOW. AND YOU CAN TEST HOW YOU'RE DOING BY SURVEYING. SO, I
2 -- SORRY TO BE SO HARSH HERE, BUT I HAVE DEALT WITH THIS FOR A
3 VERY LONG TIME [LAUGHTER] AND I KNOW YOU CAN GET RESULTS. YOU
4 CAN DO IT RIGHT NOW. WE JUST HAVE TO BRING THESE OPERATORS IN
5 AND SAY, HEY, WHAT CAN YOU SHOW US RIGHT NOW SO THAT WE CAN
6 BUILD ON THAT, AND WE CAN GET EVEN BIGGER AND BETTER. YOU HAVE
7 GOT YOUR ACTIVITIES HERE. YOU CAN ADD TO THOSE MORE
8 SPECIFICALLY AND WE'RE ALREADY PAYING FOR MUCH OF THIS. SO,
9 I'M SORRY TO BE SO PASSIONATE ABOUT THIS, BUT I REALLY DON'T
10 WANT TO SEE MORE ANALYSIS, PARALYSIS. RESULTS ARE WHAT
11 EVERYBODY IS LOOKING FOR, INCLUDING THE LEGISLATURE. SO, LET'S
12 GET READY. THANK YOU

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR LI. MEMBER LI.

15

16 **JANICE LI:** JUST A QUICK RESPONSE. I'M GOING TO CALL YOU DEPUTY
17 PAPAN. [LAUGHTER]. A LITTLE BIT OF DEFENSE FOR TRANSIT
18 OPERATORS. THEY'RE BRINGING THIS TO US NOW, AND THANK GOODNESS
19 THEY ARE. WE HAVE BEEN GETTING UPDATES FOR BAY PASS, CLIPPER
20 START UPDATES, COORDINATION HAPPENING, PERFORMANCE MEASURES,
21 WE'RE TAKING ACTIONS NOW FROM THE TRANSIT OPERATOR SIDE TO MTC
22 AND THEIR SUPPORT. SOMETHING I JUST FOUND OUT YESTERDAY AT
23 BART BOARD -- YEAH, WELL, IN MY BRIEFINGS I FOUND OUT BUT WE
24 RECEIVED AN UPDATE ABOUT A RAIL SERVICE PLAN AS WE WERE
25 GETTING READY TO APPROVE THE BART TWO YEAR BUDGET AND BART IS



MAY 10, 2024

1 ACTUALLY, WELL, THERE IS NOW FULL ON REGIONAL COORDINATION
2 AROUND SCHEDULES AND ONE OF THE BIGGEST ISSUES WAS THE
3 DIFFERENCE IN BID SCHEDULE SO YOU HAVE TO PUT THE BIDS OUT
4 THERE IN BATA BART WE USED TO DO THAT IN FEBRUARY AND
5 SEPTEMBER EVERY YEAR WE ARE REALIGNING AND SHIFTING TO JANUARY
6 AND AUGUST THAT WILL ALLOW US TO GET FULL ON COORDINATION NOT
7 JUST COORDINATION WITH CALTRAIN BUT ACROSS THE TRANSIT
8 OPERATORS, RECOGNIZING KEY SERVICE THAT BART PROVIDES LIKE
9 REGIONAL CONNECTOR MORE LOCAL SERVICE HAPPY TO MEASURE FIGURE
10 OUT KPIS, THAT IS ON THE GROUND AND I'M GRATEFUL THAT MTC AND
11 TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE BEEN WORKING HAND-IN-HAND AS WE LOOK
12 TOWARDS THE BIGGER PICTURE OF IS THIS IN THE LONG RUN SPEEDING
13 UP OUTCOME AND GETTING TO THE COORDINATION THAT WE NEED.
14 DEFENSE TO TRANSIT OPERATORS.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** AND THESE ARE THE KINDS OF THINGS THAT NEED TO BE
17 ACKNOWLEDGED NOW THIS SHOWS REGIONAL MANAGEMENT IS WORK. AND I
18 HAVE HEARD EVERYBODY'S GOT DIFFERENT CONTRACTS AND STUFF LIKE
19 BUDGETS AND STUFF LIKE THAT F THAT CAN BE COORDINATED
20 REGIONALLY THAT'S A HUGE STEP IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION BIOLOGY
21 WHAT YOU JUST SAID THERE IS HUGE. SO, LET'S TRY TO ACKNOWLEDGE
22 THAT. THAT THOSE ARE SUCCESSES. BUT BUILD THEM INTO WHAT
23 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT THANK YOU.

24



MAY 10, 2024

1 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** I'M GOING TO ASK -- WE'RE GOING TO LOSE
2 OUR QUORUM AND THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. I'M GOING TO LOOK TO MY
3 COLLEAGUES. FIRST OFF, I KNOW I CAN'T TAKE THE VOTE WITHOUT
4 PUBLIC COMMENT I'M GOING TO ASK MARTHA IF THERE IS ANYONE
5 ONLINE OR IN CHAMBERS.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM NO
8 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

9

10 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO REFER
11 THE MTC RESOLUTION REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE
12 MEASURES MTC COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

15

16 **EDDIE AHN:** AHN SECONDS.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** ROLL CALL VOTE AND YOU CAN CALL ON
19 DIRECTOR AHN FIRST.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER AHN?

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RABBITT.



MAY 10, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOACK.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEPUTIZED MEMBER PAPAN? IS.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND CANEPA, SPERING, AND MAHAN, MOULTON-

17 PETERS ARE ALL ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL

18 MEMBERS PRESENT.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. JUST TO

21 CHIME IN ON THAT LAST ITEM, I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION. I

22 DO THINK -- I MEAN, FOR ME, KIND OF STEP UP TO THE HIGHER

23 LEVEL AND JUST LOOK AT, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE INCLUDED SOME OF THE

24 -- HONESTLY, THE LOW-HANGING FRUIT OF WHAT WE CAN DO QUICKLY,

25 COLLABORATIVELY TOGETHER, INCLUDING COORDINATION, WAYFINDING



MAY 10, 2024

1 FARE COORDINATION, ALL OF THAT, THE PROOF IN THE PUDDING IS
2 GOING TO BE THE ATTRACTION OF ADDITIONAL RIDERS, MAKING SURE
3 THEY STAY WITHIN THE SYSTEM BUT REALLY ATTRACTING OTHER RIDERS
4 THAT GOES TO ISSUES ON SAFETY PERCEPTION VERSUS REALITY, WE
5 CAN HAVE DATA POINTS AND MINUTIA THAT DEPARTMENT DATA POINTS
6 AND DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION HAS, AT THE END OF THE DAY
7 IT'S HOW MANY MORE PEOPLE ARE GONNA COME AND TAKE THE BUS.
8 THERE ARE THOSE THAT HAVE THE OPTION TO EITHER DRIVE OR TAKE
9 PUBLIC TRANSIT WHEN THEY WEIGH OPTION COMMITMENT AND SCHEDULES
10 AND EVERYTHING ELSE, THEY GET IN THE CAR. HOW CAN WE FLIP THAT
11 THE OTHER WAY. THAT'S THE MOST TRANSFORMATIONAL THING WE CAN
12 DO MOVING FORWARD I KNOW IT'S THE MOST DIFFICULT. GAUGING THAT
13 AND GETTING TO BASE HELVE DATA FOR SOME OF THOSE THINGS THAT'S
14 THE MOST IMPORTANT ONE. I THINK THAT WAS AT THE END OF OUR
15 ACTION ITEMS. AND ITEM NUMBER FIVE IS PUBLIC COMMENT. IS THERE
16 ANYONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK TO THIS BODY ON ANY ITEM THAT
17 WAS NOT ON THE AGENDA OR IS THERE ANYONE ONLINE?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
20 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN ZOOM OR THE
21 BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT:** ALL RIGHT AND BEFORE WE ADJOURNED TO OUR
24 NEXT MEETING WHICH IS GOING TO BE JUNE 14TH IN THIS ROOM ON
25 FRIDAY. THIS DATE IS THE SIGNIFICANT DATE. VERY HISTORIC DATE



MAY 10, 2024

1 BECAUSE IT IS MARTHA SILVER'S BIRTHDAY. [LAUGHTER] [APPLAUSE]
2 I JUST GOT TO SAY THANK YOU TO MARTHA THE CON SUM MAT
3 PROFESSIONAL WHO IS ALWAYS SUPPORTING US POINTING AT ME AND
4 MAKING SURE WE FOLLOW EVERYTHING. THANK YOU SO MUCH MARTHA.
5 IT'S GREAT TO HAVE A BIRTHDAY ON FRIDAY BECAUSE YOU GET THE
6 BIRTHDAY WEEKEND CELEBRATION. SO ENJOY, AND AGAIN, THANK YOU
7 VERY MUCH AND HAPPY BIRTHDAY AND WE ARE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]
8



NTT

Broadcasting Government