

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



JANUARY 10, 2025

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**PLANNING COMMITTEE**

**FRIDAY, JANUARY 10<sup>TH</sup>, 2025, 9:40 AM**

**CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER. YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW WHEN YOU'RE ON THE WAY OUT WHEN YOUR STAFF GIVES YOU YOUR NAME TAG AND SAYS TAKE IT WITH YA. [LAUGHTER] YEAH, IT'S CEREMONIAL. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC ABAG WEB SITES COMMITTEE AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I OR MARTHA CALL UPON YOU AT THAT TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBERS PARTICIPATION TODAY. THE ABAG -- LET'S SEE, ARE YOU GOING TO DO YOUR -- COMPENSATION?

**CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** NO YOU'RE OFF THE PAGE. NEXT IS THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE AND I'M GOING TO VOLUNTEER YOU TO LEAD THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE.

**CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** IN ADDITION TO THAT, IF EVERYONE COULD END THEIR THOUGHTS AND PRAYERS, THINK ABOUT ALL



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 OF OUR FELLOW CITIZENS IN SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. WE HAVE  
2 FAMILIES JUST DESTROYED AND REALLY SAD STATE OF AFFAIRS. SO  
3 KEEP THAT IN YOUR THOUGHTS AND PRAYERS. WITH THAT I WE'LL DO  
4 THE PLEDGE. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO  
5 THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC  
6 FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH  
7 LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** ALL RIGHT. I'M ON THE RIGHT  
10 PAGE NOW. THE ROLL CALL TO THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE, PLEASE?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR SPERING?

13

14 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

17

18 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA?

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS  
4 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NOACK?

9

10 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RABBITT? IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

13

14 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. PLANNING COMMITTEE  
15 CONSENT CALENDAR. I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

16

17 **SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED --

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** HANG ON. ITEM FOUR,  
20 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. MARTHA.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING  
23 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE  
24 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP  
25 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
2 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ITEM FIVE IS  
5 THE PLANNING COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR.

6

7 **SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED.

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE A  
10 SECOND?

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SECOND, MOULTON-PETERS.

13

14 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** SECOND. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC  
15 COMMENTS, ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS?

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
18 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR  
19 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. I THINK I'LL BE TURNING  
22 IT OVER TO PRESIDENT RAMOS.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VOTE FOR THIS ITEM.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** PARDON ME.

2

3 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** WOULD YOU LIKE A VOTE ON YOUR  
4 ITEM FOR CONSENT?

5

6 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** PROBABLY SHOULD.

7

8 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YEAH, PROBABLY.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR SPERING?

11

12 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** WE CAN'T DO IT BY VOICE?

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO. REMOTE --

15

16 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SPERING?

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AHN?

23

24 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** YES.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?  
2 RABBITT IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
3 PRESENT.

4

5 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** TURN IT OVER TO RAMOS.

6

7 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** AT THIS TIME I WOULD LIKE TO CALL  
8 TO ORDER THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ROLL CALL VOTE WILL  
9 BE TAKEN FOR ACTION ITEMS DUE TO RE MOTE COMMITTEE  
10 PARTICIPATION.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. ROMERO?

13

14 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT SILVA?

15

16 **CINDY SILVA:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILLIAMS?

19

20 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

23

24 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** IF THE CLERK COULD PLEASE READ  
25 THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?



JANUARY 10, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING  
3 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG COMMITTEE  
4 IN ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM  
5 AN AMOUNT OF \$150 AND PER DIEM IS PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF  
6 CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO  
7 COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. NEXT BEFORE US, AGENDA  
10 ITEM EIGHT IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR FOR THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE  
11 COMMITTEE MEETING. WE HAVE THREE ITEMS FOR OUR CONSIDERATION,  
12 8A THROUGH 8C, DO I HAVE A MOTION?

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MOVE IT.

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** SECOND.

17

18 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** MOTION BY ECKLUND, SECOND  
19 WILLIAMS. ANY DISCUSSION AMONG THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I'LL ASK  
20 IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENTED ON THIS?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING THERE  
23 IS NONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM SPACE ON THIS ITEM.

24

25 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** ROLL CALL VOTE.





JANUARY 10, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSEN?

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

7

8 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. ROMERO?

11

12 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SILVA?

15

16 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILLIAMS?

19

20 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

23 PRESENT.

24



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** MOVING TO ITEM 9A MTC RESOLUTION  
2 4687 AND ABAG RESOLUTION NUMBER 042025, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+  
3 FINAL BLUEPRINT. WE WILL RECEIVE A REPORT FROM CHIRAG RABARI,  
4 BUT ALSO DAVE VAUTIN IS ON HAND SO I'LL HAND IT OVER TO YOU,  
5 PLEASE.

6

7 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THANK YOU PRESIDENT RAMOS. AND GOOD MORNING  
8 COMMISSIONERS AND BOARD MEMBERS. DAVE VAUTIN, PLANNING  
9 DIRECTOR. I WANT TO QUICKLY SET THE STAGE FOR THIS MORNING'S  
10 ACTION ITEM ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, THE REGIONAL PLAN FOR  
11 TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT,  
12 WHICH HAS BEEN UNDER DEVELOPMENT FOR THE PAST 18 MONTHS. THIS  
13 IS THE SECOND OF FOUR KEY APPROVAL MILESTONES FOR THE LONG  
14 RANGE PLAN AND WOULD ADVANCE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR ANALYSIS.  
15 SIMILAR TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 THE FINAL BLUEPRINT CONTINUES  
16 TO INCLUDE 35 STRATEGIES THAT HAVE BEEN STRATEGICALLY REVISED  
17 TO MEET THE MOMENT WITH SIGNIFICANT PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDER  
18 INVOLVEMENT OVER THE PAST YEAR. THROUGHOUT THE FALL, KEY  
19 PIECES OF THE PUZZLE HAVE BEEN ROLLED OUT AT THIS COMMITTEE  
20 FOR FEEDBACK, INCLUDING THE TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK IN SEPTEMBER  
21 AND DECEMBER. THE REVISED STRATEGIES IN OCTOBER AND THE  
22 TRANSPORTATION AND RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST IN DECEMBER. THIS  
23 ITEM PUTS TOGETHER ALL OF THOSE PIECES INTO A PLAN THAT IS  
24 MORE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED AND REFLECTS THE STRONGER HEADWINDS  
25 FACING THE BAY AREA THAN IN YEARS PAST. WHILE THE FINAL



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 BLUEPRINT IS OPTIMISTIC ABOUT NEW REVENUES COMING INTO  
2 FRUITION IN DECADES AHEAD THERE IS LESS MONEY OVERALL THAN IN  
3 PRIOR CYCLES WHICH MADE THE TRADE-OFFS TOUGHER. DESPITE ALL  
4 THAT IT INTEGRATES THE VISION FOR BAY AREA TRANSIT THAT PUTS  
5 RIDERS FIRST FOCUSES ON FREQUENCY AND RELIABILITY SAFETY  
6 EXPANDED CLIMATE STRATEGIES DESIGNED TO HELP US MEET EVER MORE  
7 DIFFICULT GHG TARGETS AND CONTINUES TO LEAD INTO HOUSING AND  
8 LAND USE STRATEGIES AS AVENUES TO ADVANCE EQUITY,  
9 AFFORDABILITY, AND SUSTAINABILITY GOALS. TODAY'S ACTION IF  
10 APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION AND ABAG BOARD LATER THIS MONTH  
11 WOULD ADVANCE THE FINAL BLUEPRINT AND ITS COMPOSITE  
12 GEOGRAPHIES STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS FOR FURTHER STUDY AND  
13 ANALYSIS THIS WINTER ALLOWING STAFF TO REPORT BACK TO ALL OF  
14 YOU IN THE SPRING ON OUTCOMES AND FINDINGS. THAT INCLUDES  
15 ALLOWING US TO DETERMINE IF THIS BLUEPRINT MEETS OR FALLS  
16 SHORT OF THE CRITICAL GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS TARGET, GIVEN  
17 THAT KEY TRANSPORTATION FUND SOURCES ARE DEPENDENT ON THAT  
18 ACHIEVEMENT AND WE'LL BE ABLE TO PROVIDE THAT INFORMATION TO  
19 ALL OF YOU PRIOR TO THE THIRD OF THOSE FOUR ACTION ITEMS,  
20 WHICH WOULD ADVANCE THE PLAN INTO THE CEQA PROCESS. WITH THAT,  
21 I'LL TURN IT OVER TO CHIRAG RABARI, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+  
22 PROJECT MANAGER.

23

24 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU DAVE AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS  
25 AND BOARD MEMBERS. WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. I THINK DAVE



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 COVERED THE PROCESS AND SCHEDULE TO DATE PRETTY WELL. I THINK  
2 I WOULD JUST NOTE WE'RE ABOUT A YEAR AND A HALF INTO THIS  
3 PROCESS AND THIS IS A KEY TRANSITION, AS WE MOVE OUT OF THIS  
4 BLUEPRINT ANALYTICAL PHASE AND INTO THE FINAL YEAR OF THE PLAN  
5 WHERE WE WILL BE DEVELOPING AN EIR DRAFT PLAN AND DRAFT  
6 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, AND WE DO EXPECT BRINGING THE PLAN  
7 FORWARD FOR APPROVAL TO YOU ALL AT EITHER THE END OF 2025 OR  
8 BEGINNING OF 2026. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WE DO THROW A LOT OF  
9 TERMINOLOGY AROUND, AND WE THOUGHT IT WOULD BE HELPFUL JUST TO  
10 CLARIFY SOME OF THE KEY ELEMENTS OF WHAT WE CALL THE  
11 BLUEPRINT. IT'S REALLY THREE KEY TRACKS OF WORK. THERE ARE --  
12 THERE IS OUR BASELINE DATA WHICH IS REALLY ABOUT WHERE ARE WE  
13 RIGHT NOW IN TERMS OF OUR EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, THE  
14 ZONING AND LAND USE DATA THAT WE USE TO UNDERSTAND, YOU KNOW,  
15 WHERE WE ARE WITH RESPECT TO THE HOUSING AND LAND USE IN THE  
16 REGION, AS WELL AS OUR TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS. WE THEN TRY TO  
17 UNDERSTAND WHAT COULD HAPPEN IN THE FUTURE WITH RESPECT TO  
18 DIFFERENT KEY EXTERNAL FORCES, LIKE WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS, OR  
19 SEA LEVEL RISE, HOW MUCH WE THINK THE REGION IS GOING TO GROW  
20 IN TERMS OF POPULATION, JOBS, AND HOUSING, AS WELL AS NEEDS  
21 AND REVENUE ANALYSIS IN OUR TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING AND  
22 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS. BUT IMPORTANTLY WE NEED THEN TO  
23 UNDERSTAND HOW ARE WE GOING TO GET TO WHERE WE WANT TO GO IN  
24 TERMS OF OUR REGIONAL VISION AND GOALS, AS WELL AS DEVELOPING  
25 A PLAN THAT CAN COMPLY WITH ALL OF THE VARIOUS STATUTORY



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 REQUIREMENTS AND THAT'S WHERE THE POLICY AND INVESTMENTS COME  
2 IN AND THAT'S WHAT YOU ALL ARE TAKING ACTION ON TODAY. THESE  
3 ARE OUR GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, STRATEGIES, AS WELL AS OUR  
4 TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST AND RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST. NEXT  
5 SLIDE. SO, AS A QUICK REFRESHER, THE COMMITTEES DID APPROVE,  
6 AND WE DID STUDY THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT DURING THE FIRST HALF OF  
7 2025. IMPORTANTLY, THAT DRAFT BLUEPRINT DID NOT INCLUDE  
8 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS, SO THAT IS A KEY ELEMENT OF WHAT  
9 WE'RE APPROVING HERE TODAY. HOWEVER, THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT STILL  
10 DID SHOW A LOT OF PROGRESS IN SOME IMPORTANT AREAS SUCH AS  
11 HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, ACCESS TO OPPORTUNITY, PROTECTIONS FROM  
12 NATURAL HAZARDS AS WELL AS OTHER GOALS. HOWEVER, AS WAS  
13 ALLUDED TO EARLIER, ARE THE PLAN WAS FALLING SHORT IN SEVERAL  
14 KEY AREAS. THAT WAS THEN THE FOCUS OF OUR OUTREACH OVER THE  
15 LAST SEVERAL MONTHS TO UNDERSTAND HOW WE COULD DEVELOP SOME  
16 FINAL BLUEPRINT REFINEMENTS THAT COULD PERFORM BETTER. BUT  
17 MOST IMPORTANTLY, WE WERE FALLING SHORT OF THAT STATUTORILY  
18 REQUIRED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGET. YOU KNOW,  
19 THE PRIMARY REASON BEING, FOR THAT BEING THAT THE REGION  
20 TRANSIT USAGE IN THE REGION IS MUCH LOWER THAN IT WAS PRIOR TO  
21 THE PANDEMIC, AND THAT IS REALLY THE BIGGEST HEAD WIND THAT  
22 WE'RE FACING IN TERMS OF TRYING TO GET ON THE BETTER TRACK IN  
23 TERMS OF GHG PERFORMANCE. BUT WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. I'M  
24 GOING TO WALK THROUGH ALL THE DIFFERENT KEY COMPONENTS OF THE  
25 FINAL BLUEPRINT ONE BY ONE. WE PRESENTED TO COMMITTEES LAST



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 MONTH ON OUR EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES UPDATE, AND YOU KNOW,  
2 AS A REMINDER, WE RELEASED A DRAFT EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES  
3 MAP EARLIER THIS YEAR AND WORKED CLOSELY WITH ALL OF OUR  
4 PARTNERS AND STAKEHOLDERS, AND REALLY LISTENS TO AND HEARD  
5 SOME OF THEIR CONCERNS REGARDING THE POTENTIAL LOSS OF EPC  
6 STATUTES BETWEEN THE PREVIOUS PLAN AND THE CURRENT PLAN  
7 UPDATE. AND, SO, FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ WE ARE  
8 RECOMMENDING THAT WE INCORPORATE -- THAT WE INCLUDE BOTH EPCS  
9 THAT WERE A PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AS WELL AS EPCS  
10 THAT WERE NEWLY IDENTIFIED WITH MORE RECENT CENSUS DATA. AND  
11 WE WILL ANALYZE BOTH OF THESE DATA LAYERS AS PART OF OUR  
12 STATUTORILY REQUIRED EQUITY ANALYSIS. AND WE THINK THAT THIS  
13 APPROACH WILL ADDRESS THE CONCERNS THAT WE DID HEAR FROM OUR  
14 PARTNERS REGARDING PLANNING AND FUNDING IMPLICATIONS. WILL  
15 ADDRESS OUR STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS AND WILL CONTINUE OUR  
16 EXISTING BOARD APPROVED METHODOLOGY FOR IDENTIFYING EPCS.  
17 IMPORTANTLY, AS WE DID MENTION LAST MONTH, WE'LL BE MOVING  
18 FORWARD WITH A BROAD EFFORT TO RE-ENVISION THIS EPC FRAMEWORK  
19 AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO COLLABORATING WITH ALL OF YOU AS WELL  
20 AS OUR PARTNERS OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS AS THAT MOVES  
21 FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IT'S A REMINDER, EXTERNAL FORCES,  
22 THESE ARE WHAT WE CALL "EXTERNAL FORCES" REFLECT ASSUMPTIONS  
23 ABOUT FUTURE YEAR CONDITIONS IN THE BAY AREA BUT THEY'RE  
24 SEPARATE FROM THE PLAN'S STRATEGIES. AND CONSIDERING WHERE WE  
25 ARE IN THE REGION, WE MADE SOME TARGETED UPDATES TO AREAS SUCH



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 AS WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS, ANTICIPATED SEA LEVEL RISE AS WELL  
2 AS PEOPLE'S TRANSIT TRAVEL PREFERENCES. AND JUST TO REFLECT,  
3 YOU KNOW, HOW SOME OF THOSE CHANGED WITH MORE RECENT DATA, FOR  
4 EXAMPLE, OUR WORK-FROM-HOME ON A TYPICAL DAY, YOU KNOW, IN  
5 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THE OBSERVED WORK-FROM-HOME LEVEL, IN  
6 2019, WAS RELATIVELY LOW AT 11% BUT WE ASSUMED THAT THE  
7 PANDEMIC IMPACTS WERE GOING TO BE TEMPORARY AND THAT BY THE  
8 YEAR 2050, THAT RATE WOULD HAVE GONE BACK DOWN TO 13% AND THEN  
9 WITH THE IMPACT OF PLANNED STRATEGIES WOULD HAVE GONE HIGHER  
10 TO ABOUT A 20% SHARE OF WORK-FROM-HOME. HOWEVER, GIVEN MORE  
11 RECENT DATA FROM THE CENSUS, AS WELL AS FROM OUR BAY AREA  
12 TRAVEL STUDY, WE HAVE A HIGHER ASSUMED -- OBSERVED WORK-FROM-  
13 HOME LEVEL IN 2023 AND THINK WE THAT WILL MODERATELY TAIL OFF  
14 AS WE MOVE TOWARDS 2050. AND WHAT WE'LL BE DOING OVER THE NEXT  
15 SEVERAL MONTHS IS TO FURTHER UNDERSTAND THE IMPACT OF THE PLAN  
16 STRATEGIES IN TERMS OF WHAT THE FINAL 2050 WORK-FROM-HOME  
17 LEVEL IS GOING TO BE. AS A REMINDER, WE DO NOT HAVE AUTHORITY  
18 TO INDEPENDENTLY SET THESE EXTERNAL FORCES. THEY ARE SUBJECT  
19 TO REVIEW AND APPROVAL BY THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD,  
20 WHICH, AGAIN, COULD HAVE IMPACT ON OUR GHG PERFORMANCE, IF  
21 THEY DON'T AGREE WITH SOME OF OUR ASSUMPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE. SO,  
22 IN TERMS OF OUR REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST FOR FUTURE  
23 POPULATION, JOBS, AND HOUSING, WE DID SHARE A DRAFT -- A  
24 DETAILED DRAFT VERSION OF THIS FORECAST LAST YEAR WITH  
25 COMMITTEES AND WE ARE RECOMMENDING CARRYING THIS FORECAST



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 FORWARD AS PART OF THE FINAL BLUEPRINT. SOME OF THE NOTABLE  
2 THINGS TO BE AWARE OF WITH RESPECT TO THIS FORECAST IS THAT IT  
3 DOES HAVE LOWER PROJECTED POPULATION GROWTH THAN THE PREVIOUS  
4 -- THE PREVIOUS PLAN. HOWEVER, THE JOBS PICTURE IS EXPECTED TO  
5 REMAIN RELATIVELY STRONG, GIVEN THE REGION'S, YOU KNOW,  
6 ONGOING RELEVANCE AS A CENTER FOR INNOVATION, TECHNOLOGY, AND  
7 HIGH VALUE SERVICES AND INDUSTRIES. SOME OTHER NOTABLE  
8 CHANGES, YOU KNOW, WE DO EXPECT TO SEE A CONTINUING AGING  
9 POPULATION. WE DO EXPECT TO SEE DECLINING HOUSEHOLD SIZES,  
10 CONTINUED DIVERSIFICATION, AS WELL AS, UNFORTUNATELY, A  
11 CONTINUED SHRINKAGE OF THE MIDDLE CLASS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, OUR  
12 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, AGAIN, THESE ARE PLACES THAT WE TRY TO  
13 PRIORITIZE THROUGH ALL OF THESE FUTURE HOMES, JOB SERVICES AND  
14 AMENITIES THEY INCLUDE LOCALLY NOMINATED PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT  
15 AREAS AND PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS AS WELL AS REGIONALLY  
16 IDENTIFIED TRANSIT-RICH AREAS, AND HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS THAT  
17 MEET STATE CRITERIA FOR ACCESS TO JOBS AND GOOD SCHOOLS THAT  
18 ALSO MEET CERTAIN BASELINE TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS. THESE  
19 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES DO NOT INCLUDE AREAS IN VERY HIGH FIRE  
20 HAZARD SEVERITY ZONES AND AREAS THAT ARE NOT EXPECTED TO BE  
21 PROTECTED FROM SEA LEVEL RISE, AS WELL AS, OBVIOUSLY, PARKS  
22 AND OPEN SPACE. THERE WERE MINOR UPDATES TO THESE GROWTH  
23 GEOGRAPHIES WHICH WE SHARED PREVIOUSLY WITH COMMITTEES  
24 PRIMARILY REFLECTING CHANGES TO THE REGION'S TRANSIT NETWORK  
25 AS IDENTIFIED THROUGH THE TRANSIT 2050+ PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE.





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 DAVE TALKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE REVENUE PICTURE FOR THE  
2 PLAN. JUST AS A QUICK REFRESHER, YOU KNOW, ONLY THE  
3 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN IS SUBJECT TO FISCAL  
4 CONSTRAINT REQUIREMENTS, WHEREAS OUR HOUSING, ECONOMY, AND  
5 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS ARE MORE VISIONARY IN NATURE. ONE  
6 PERSONALITY CLARIFICATION TO OFFER THERE IS THERE ARE SOME  
7 TRANSPORTATION REVENUES THAT ARE ASSIGNED TO SELECT  
8 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT STRATEGIES, PARTICULARLY IN TERMS OF  
9 REDUCING CLIMATE EMISSIONS AND THAT IS BECAUSE OUR REGULATOR,  
10 AIR RESOURCES BOARD, YOU KNOW, DOES WANT TO SEE THAT WE ARE  
11 SUPPORTING OUR CLIMATE, YOU KNOW, CLIMATE REDUCING STRATEGIES,  
12 YOU KNOW, WITH PROJECTED REVENUES THAT ARE ANTICIPATED TO BE  
13 AVAILABLE. YOU KNOW, AS YOU CAN SEE, A MAJORITY OF THE  
14 EXISTING REVENUES THAT WE DO PROJECT ARE IN THE TRANSPORTATION  
15 ELEMENT. HOWEVER, WE ARE STILL VERY MUCH RELIANT ON NEW  
16 REVENUES IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO SUPPORT OUR EXPANSION AND  
17 ENHANCEMENT INVESTMENTS. EXISTING REVENUES ARE MUCH MORE  
18 CONSTRAINED IN THE OTHER ELEMENTS OF THE PLAN. NEXT SLIDE. SO,  
19 AS WE HAVE SHARED PREVIOUSLY ON, YOU KNOW, THE PLAN  
20 STRATEGIES, I THINK, YOU KNOW, THE MAIN THING TO COMMUNICATE  
21 THERE IS THAT THESE STRATEGIES ARE INTENDED TO WORK TOGETHER  
22 AS AN INTEGRATED SUITE OF STRATEGIES TO HELP US ACHIEVE OUR  
23 REGIONAL VISION OF AN AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE HEALTHY  
24 ENVIRONMENT BAY AREA FOR ALL THE YEAR 2050 SO THESE DO INCLUDE  
25 REGION-WIDE PROTECTIONS FROM SEA LEVEL RISE TRANSIT ORIENT THE



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 COMMUNITIES PROTECTING OUR EXISTING INDUSTRIAL LANDS AS WELL  
2 AS PRESERVING URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES, SIGNIFICANTLY EXPANDING  
3 INVESTMENTS IN CLEAN VEHICLES AND THE LIKE CHARGING AS WELL AS  
4 MAJOR INVESTMENTS IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING NEAR LOCAL TRANSIT AS  
5 WELL AS UPGRADING COMMUNITY PARKS. NEXT SLIDE. WITH RESPECT TO  
6 THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT, AGAIN, AS MENTIONED, THESE \$512  
7 BILLION IN INVESTMENTS THAT INCLUDE BOTH TRANSPORTATION  
8 STRATEGIES AS WELL AS SELECT ENVIRONMENT STRATEGIES, THE VAST  
9 MAJORITY OF THE FUNDING CLOSE TO THREE QUARTERS GOES TOWARDS  
10 SUPPORTING OUR LONG STANDING FIX IT FIRST POLICY OF OPERATING  
11 AND MAINTAINING OUR EXISTING TRANSPORTATION NETWORK THAT IS  
12 NEARLY \$380 BILLION. THE NEXT LARGEST CATEGORY OF EXPENDITURES  
13 ARE TO SUPPORT TRANSIT EXPANSION AND ENHANCEMENT, AND, AGAIN,  
14 THE TRANSIT 2050+ PROCESS WORKED CLOSELY -- WORKING CLOSELY  
15 WITH OPERATORS AS WELL AS OTHER PART PARTNERS THROUGHOUT THE  
16 REGION FOCUSED ON TARGETED IMPROVEMENTS TO MAKE HIGH IMPACT  
17 CHANGES OVER THE NEAR-TERM AS WELL AS EXPANDING A NETWORK FOR  
18 FUTURE GENERATIONS. WE ALSO HAVE VERY SERIOUS INVESTMENTS, \$34  
19 BILLION, OR 7% OF THE TOTAL THAT GOES TOWARDS BICYCLE  
20 PEDESTRIAN IMPROVEMENTS NON-CAPACITY ROAD IMPROVEMENTS AS WELL  
21 AS A VERY LIMITED NUMBER OF FREEWAY EXPANSIONS, INCLUDING  
22 MITIGATIONS, THEN WE TRY TO FRONT LOAD AGAIN THOSE CLIMATE  
23 STRATEGIES WHICH INCLUDE THINGS LIKE PRICING, LOW PROVIDE  
24 SAFETY -- LOWER FREEWAY SPEED LIMITS, ELECTRIFICATION, AND  
25 TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT TO HELP US MEET THAT 2035



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 CLIMATE TARGET. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AGAIN, WE PRESENTED THE DRAFT  
2 TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST LAST MONTH, AND AS WE DID NOTE AT  
3 THAT TIME, THERE WERE SOME CONCERNS THAT WE DID RECEIVE FROM  
4 PARTNERS REGARDING PROJECTS THAT WERE NOT INCLUDED ON THAT  
5 INITIAL DRAFT LIST AND THE DIRECTION FROM THE COMMITTEE WAS TO  
6 WORK WITH SPONSORS TO IDENTIFY POTENTIAL PROJECT SWAPS THAT  
7 WOULD HAVE, AGAIN, MINIMAL NET COST AND GHG IMPACTS. SO, WE  
8 HAVE INCLUDED ON THE TABLE HERE SOME OF THE MORE NOTABLE  
9 CHANGES THAT WE WANTED YOU TO BE AWARE OF, INCLUDING  
10 ACCELERATING THE IRVING TO KNOW BART STATION TO THE FIRST HALF  
11 OF THE PLAN WHICH WAS ACCOMPLISHED BY MOVING THE SOUTH BAY  
12 CONNECT PROJECT TO THE SECOND HALF, INCLUDING SR SOUR  
13 WESTBOUND OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS IN CONTRA COSTA THROUGH THE  
14 REMOVAL OF SOME OTHER LOCAL ROADWAY PROJECTS, ACCOMMODATING  
15 THE WETA REDWOOD CITY FERRY THROUGH THE SAN MATEO BRIDGE  
16 EXPRESS BUS PROJECT ACCOMMODATING EXPRESS LANES PHASE SIX U.S.  
17 101 IN SANTA CLARA AGAIN SWAPPING OUT ROADWAY PROJECTS AS WELL  
18 AS ACCOMMODATING THE SMART TO CLOVERDALE EXTENSION BY REMOVING  
19 A SERIES OF PROJECTS IN SONOMA COUNTY. SO WE REALLY DO WANT TO  
20 THANK OUR PARTNERS FOR THEIR CLOSE COLLABORATION AND  
21 COOPERATION ON THIS EFFORT. WE DO THINK THAT THIS HAS ARRIVED  
22 AS A GOOD PLACE, AND WE DO HOPE TO MOVE THIS FORWARD. NEXT  
23 SLIDE. SO, IN TERMS OF THE RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST, AGAIN,  
24 THIS WAS IN CLOSE COLLABORATION WITH BCDC STAFF, AS WELL AS A  
25 LARGE NUMBER OF LOCAL PARTNERS AND JURISDICTIONS. I THINK A



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 COUPLE NOTABLE CHANGES WE WANT YOU TO KNOW AWARE OF IN TERMS  
2 OF THE FINAL RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST IS THAT THERE WERE TWO  
3 CHANGES TO BE AWARE OF. AFTER HEARING FROM SOME PARTNERS WE  
4 DID ADD A PROJECT THROUGH THE ONE SHORELINE EFFORT IN SAN  
5 MATEO COUNTY TO PROTECT HIGHWAY 101 FROM BRISBANE AND SOUTH  
6 SAN FRANCISCO, AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATING A SMART PROJECT IN  
7 NOVATO IN MARIN COUNTY TO PROTECT A THOUSAND FEET OF LOW LYING  
8 TRACK. OVERALL, I WOULD JUST REFERENCE WITH THE RESILIENCE  
9 PROJECT LIST, AGAIN, WE TRY TO BEND THESE NEEDS IN TERMS OF  
10 WHAT WE NEED TO PROTECT IN THE SHORT RUN BETWEEN NOW AND 2035,  
11 PROJECTS THAT FLOOD AT ONE FEET VERSUS A LONGER TERM LIST OF  
12 PROTECTIONS BETWEEN NOW AND 2050, AGAIN, TOTALING ABOUT \$96  
13 BILLION. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IN TERMS OF THIS, YOU KNOW, FINAL  
14 BLUEPRINT, WE DO JUST WANT TO REMIND MEMBERS THAT, YOU KNOW,  
15 THIS PLAN UPDATE IS A LIMITED AND FOCUSED UPDATE TO PLANNED  
16 BAY AREA 2050 WHICH WAS UNANIMOUSLY ADOPTED BACK IN OCTOBER OF  
17 2021. AND THAT -- THAT PLAN DID INCLUDE A SIGNIFICANT SCENARIO  
18 PLANNING EFFORT THAT TRIED TO EVALUATE A WHOLE SERIES OF  
19 FUTURE POTENTIAL CONDITIONS AND IDENTIFY STRATEGIES THAT COULD  
20 BE EQUITABLE AND RESILIENT IN THE FACE OF UNANTICIPATED  
21 CHALLENGES. AND THAT'S REALLY THE BASELINE FOR WHAT WE HAVE  
22 PUT FORWARD AS PART OF THIS PLAN UPDATE. SO WHAT WE HAVE  
23 REALLY BEEN FOCUSING ON IS UPDATING THE BASELINE AND PLANNING  
24 ASSUMPTIONS WITH THE BEST AVAILABLE INFORMATION, YOU KNOW,  
25 UNDERSTANDING THAT WE ARE IN A TIME OF SIGNIFICANT UNCERTAINTY



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 FOR THE REGION, AS WELL AS REVISING OUR PLAN STRATEGIES AND  
2 IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS TO BETTER ADDRESS THE NEEDS THAT WE  
3 HAVE IDENTIFIED, UNDERSTANDING THAT THE BAY AREA IS IN A  
4 CHALLENGING PLACE RIGHT NOW AND FACING A NUMBER OF HEADWINDS.  
5 BUT WE WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE NOT EXPLORED  
6 EVERY POSSIBLE SCENARIO FOR A TRAJECTORY FOR THE REGION,  
7 WHETHER IN TERMS OF FUTURE AVAILABLE FUNDING, FUTURE GROWTH  
8 TRAJECTORIES OR INVESTMENT PARADIGMS, BUT WE THINK THIS IS,  
9 YOU KNOW, FOR A LIMITED AND FOCUSED UPDATE, THE, SORT OF, BEST  
10 THAT WE CAN DO AT THIS TIME BUT WE WANT TO RECOMMEND THAT THE  
11 TYPE OF SCENARIO PLANNING THAT WE DID IN THE PREVIOUS PLAN BE  
12 SOMETHING THAT WE REALLY PUSH FORWARD AS PART OF THE MAJOR  
13 PLAN UPDATE, YOU KNOW, THAT IS GOING TO KICKOFF IN, ROUGHLY,  
14 15 MONTHS OR SO, PLANNED BAY AREA 2060. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AGAIN,  
15 THE ACTION THAT'S REQUESTED OF YOU ALL TODAY IS TO APPROVE  
16 THESE FINAL BLUEPRINT GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, THE FINAL BLUEPRINT  
17 STRATEGIES, INCLUDING THE PROJECT LIST FOR FURTHER STUDY AND  
18 ANALYSIS. THAT WILL THEN ALLOW US TO MOVE INTO THAT MODELING  
19 PHASE, REPORT BACK ON OUTCOMES, INCLUDING THAT IMPORTANT GHG  
20 RESULT, AND THEN MOVE THE PLAN INTO THE ENVIRONMENTAL PHASE,  
21 AND THEN KICKOFF BOTH LAST ROUND OF PUBLIC FEEDBACK AND  
22 ENGAGEMENT OVER THE SUMMER. AND WITH THAT, THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
23 TIME AND ATTENTION AND HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.  
24



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. YOU KNOW,  
2 FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THEIR REVISIONS. YOU KNOW,  
3 JUST MORE EXAMPLE OF LETTING THE COUNTY SET THEIR PRIORITIES,  
4 SO, I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT STAFF LET THEM DO THESE TRADE-  
5 OFFS. AND I THINK IT'S SUPERINTENDANT THAT NONE OF THESE  
6 PROJECTS ARE ADDED WITHOUT TRADE-OFFS. THAT'S SOMETHING THAT  
7 HAD TO BE EITHER REMOVED OR MODIFIED. AND, SO, THANK STAFF FOR  
8 THAT. FIRST ON THE NEW REVENUE, THE 89 BILLION THAT MAKES UP  
9 THE 512. GIVE ME EXAMPLES THESE NEW REVENUE. WHAT ARE WE  
10 TALKING ABOUT?

11

12 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THESE NEW AND ANTICIPATED REVENUES INCLUDE SOME  
13 OF OUR STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN, SO, IT DOES INCLUDE ROADWAY  
14 PRICING, IT INCLUDES PARKING PRICING IN GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES, IT  
15 ALSO INCLUDES A REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE, YOU KNOW, CONSISTENT  
16 WITH SOME OF THE DISCUSSIONS THAT HAVE BEEN HAPPENING, YOU  
17 KNOW, AT THE COMMISSION, AND IT ALSO INCLUDES, YOU KNOW, WHAT  
18 WE CALL, YOU KNOW, "ANTICIPATED UNSPECIFIED REVENUES" WHICH  
19 COULD INCLUDE A VARIETY OF FUTURE FEDERAL AND STATE STIMULUS  
20 BILLS OR AUGMENTATIONS THROUGH THE FEDERAL AND STATE  
21 GOVERNMENTS. THOSE ARE REALLY THE CORE OF WHAT COMPRISING THE  
22 \$90 BILLION CATEGORY.

23

24 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS  
25 QUESTIONS? PAT?



JANUARY 10, 2025

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** YEAH, I HAVE A COUPLE OF BIG PICTURE QUESTIONS  
3 ACTUALLY. BUT BEFORE I DO I WANTED TO, FIRST OF ALL,  
4 ACKNOWLEDGE, I THINK MOST OF US WATCHED THE JIMMY CARTER THING  
5 YESTERDAY, 100 YEARS OLD, NOT BAD. IMAGINE WHAT HE SAW THROUGH  
6 THE HIS WHOLE LIFE. I ALSO WANTED TO MENTION, TOO, SOME OF YOU  
7 ALL KNOW THAT ON MONDAY, MY MOM IS GOING TO TURN 98, AND SHE'S  
8 DOING REALLY WELL. SHE IS GOING TO LIVE TO 100, I HOPE. BUT I  
9 TALKED TO HER A LOT ABOUT WHAT IT WAS LIKE TO GROW UP IN  
10 ALAMEDA, AS A KID AND SEE SOME OF THE CHANGES, AND SHE --  
11 OBVIOUSLY ALL OF US HAVE SEEN CHANGES IN OUR LIFETIME -- BUT  
12 ONE OF THE THINGS THAT, WHEN I WAS GOING TO COLLEGE, WE TALKED  
13 ABOUT WHAT IS THE CARING CAPACITY OF A PARTICULAR GEOGRAPHIC  
14 REGION. HAVE WE EVER DETERMINED WHAT THE CARING CAPACITY IS  
15 FOR THE BAY AREA? BECAUSE IT CAN ACCOMPANY SO MUCH GROWTH CAN  
16 ONLY ACCOMMODATE SO MANY PEOPLE WHAT'S THE CARRYING CAPACITY  
17 BECAUSE THE CHART KEEPS GOING UP AND UP BUT AT SOME POINT THE  
18 BAY AREA WILL NOT BE ABLE TO ACCOMMODATE THE PEOPLE THAT WANT  
19 TO LIVE HERE WITHOUT MAKING SOME DRAMATIC ENVIRONMENTAL  
20 CHANGES THAT CHANGES OUR QUALITY OF LIFE AND CHANGES THE  
21 EARTH, WHICH MAY NOT BE IN THE BEST INTEREST FOR A GLOBAL  
22 SURVIVAL. THAT'S A PHILOSOPHICAL QUESTION AND IF YOU CAN'T  
23 ANSWER IT, THAT'S OKAY I JUST WANT TO ASK HAVE WE LOOKED AT  
24 WHAT THE CARRYING CAPACITY IS?

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THAT IS A GREAT QUESTION. WHAT I WOULD SAY IS  
2 THERE IS NOT A SINGLE VALUE FOR THE REGION'S CARRYING VALUE.  
3 YOUR DESCRIBING KEY CONSTRAINTS ENVIRONMENTAL UTILITIES ALL  
4 SORTS OF THINGS THAT EXIST IN ANY REGION. WHAT WE'RE DOING IN  
5 THE PLANS BECAUSE THE TYPE OF GROWTH THAT MATTERS A LOT IN  
6 TERMS OF THOSE DEMANDS THAT OUR DECISIONS ON WHERE TO FOCUS  
7 GROWTH AND TO PROTECT GROWTH AFFECTS THAT. A HOUSEHOLD LIVING  
8 IN AN APARTMENT OR CONDO WITH NO YARD HAS A LOT LESS WATER  
9 NEED THAN ONE THAT HAS A BACKYARD THAT NEEDS TO BE WIRED OR  
10 VEGETATION THAT REQUIRES WATER. I WOULDN'T THINK IT AS A  
11 SINGULAR NUMBER, CAPS FOR THE REGION BUT MORE THERE ARE  
12 CONSTRAINTS THAT EXIST IN THE REGION IN OUR CHOICES AND  
13 STRATEGIES OF THE PLAN THAT AFFECT AND ACCOMMODATE GROWTH  
14 ENVIRONMENTALLY THAT'S NOT A SINGLE NUMERICAL VALUE BUT, SORT  
15 OF, CONSTRAINTS THAT WE THINK ABOUT WHILE CRAFTING STRATEGIES  
16 TO ACCOMMODATE GROWTH AND WORKING WITHIN THE BOUNDS OF THE  
17 REGION IN TERMS OF UTILITIES AND RESOURCES.

18

19 **PAT ECKLUND:** I THINK SUBVALUE OF MAYBE ALL THE REGIONAL  
20 AGENCIES THAT DEAL WITH DIFFERENT FACETS OF OUR QUALITY OF  
21 LIFE, BCDC, BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT, MTC ABAG  
22 REGIONAL BOARD I MEAN ALL OF THOSE COULD START HAVING THOSE  
23 GLOBAL DISCUSSIONS. AS CARLOS AND I WERE LOOKING, 2060S  
24 PROBABLY MOST OF US WILL NOT BE HERE BY 2060 PROBABLY MOST OF  
25 US IN THIS ROOM. ANYWAY, I WAS JUST CURIOUS. THE OTHER THING I





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 HAD IS I'M REALLY GLAD THAT SEA LEVEL RISE IS REALLY  
2 EMPHASIZED IN THIS, BUT EACH JURISDICTION AND THE COUNTIES ARE  
3 GOING TO BE REQUIRED BY BCDC TO CREATE REGIONAL SHORELINE  
4 ADAPTATION PLANS, SO THE PLANS THAT WE DEVELOP MAY BE  
5 DIFFERENT THAN SOME OF THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT YOU'RE MAKING. I  
6 LOOKED ON THE MAPS, I'M REALLY WORD ABOUT BAHIA MARIN IS  
7 VULNERABLE BUT BEL MARIN KEYS WHICH IS DEFINITELY VULNERABLE  
8 AS WELL BUT BAHIA IS TOO BECAUSE PEOPLE HAVE WATER, RIGHT NOW,  
9 UNDERNEATH THEIR HOMES. SO THAT WATER IS GOING TO RISE. SO, IS  
10 MTC AND ABAG, ARE WE GOING TO BE ABLE TO CHANGE WHAT THAT SEA  
11 LEVEL RISE IS BASED ON, WHAT SHORELINE ADAPTATION PLANS THAT  
12 EACH OF THE JURISDICTIONS DEVELOP.

13

14 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU, MEMBER ECKLUND. I WOULD SAY THIS  
15 RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST ON THIS IS OUR FIRST FORAY INTO THIS  
16 AREA. IT'S THE PRODUCT OF SEVERAL YEARS OF WORK COLLABORATING  
17 WITH BCDC, AS WELL ALL THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS IN THE REGION.  
18 WE UPDATE THESE PLANS EVERY FOUR YEARS. SO, AS FURTHER  
19 PLANNING TAKES PLACE ACROSS THE REGION, THAT WILL BE  
20 INCORPORATED INTO FUTURE ITERATIONS OF THE RESILIENCE PROJECT  
21 LIST. I THINK ONE NOTABLE THING THAT IS WE IDENTIFIED A LOT OF  
22 THESE PLACEHOLDER TYPE PROJECTS, RIGHT? AND FOR JURISDICTIONS  
23 THAT DIDN'T NECESSARILY HAVE THE CAPACITY TO DO THAT TYPE OF  
24 INITIAL PLANNING, AND WE HOPE THIS PROJECT LIST CAN SERVE AS A



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 PLANNING RESOURCE, COMMUNICATIONS RESOURCE, ADVOCACY RESOURCE  
2 THAT WILL BE REFINED AND UPDATED OVER TIME.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'M GLAD IT'S GOING TO BE FLEXIBLE. THE LAST  
5 COMMENT I WANTED TO MAKE IS, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR  
6 ACCOMMODATING NOVATO LEAD. REALLY APPRECIATE THAT A LOT. AND  
7 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT -- YOU KNOW, NOVATO HAS A LOT OF AREAS  
8 THAT ARE GOING TO BE ADVERSELY IMPACTED BY SEA LEVEL RISE, AND  
9 OTHER THINGS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ACCOMMODATING THAT.

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** BOARD MEMBER SILVA, DO YOU  
12 HAVE YOUR HAND UP?

13

14 **CINDY SILVA:** YES I DO. THANK YOU. I THINK I HAVE TWO  
15 QUESTIONS. FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT  
16 GETS CLEARER AND CLEARER EVERY TIME I HEAR IT. AND IT TAKES  
17 MULTIPLE -- [ AUDIO DISTORTION ] [INDISCERNIBLE] DIG THROUGH  
18 ALL OF THIS. WE HAVE ABOUT A YEAR LEFT ON THIS WORK. TO WHAT  
19 EXTENT IS OUTREACH TO OUR ELECTED OFFICIALS BEYOND THE ABAG  
20 BOARD AND THE MTC COMMISSION -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IS THAT  
21 INCLUDED IN THIS? I DON'T SEE A -- AND MAYBE YOU CAN ELABORATE  
22 HOW YOU PLAN TO GET TO THAT LOWERED LEVEL OF ELECTED  
23 OFFICIALS.

24



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER SILVA, YEAH, AND I DO WANT TO  
2 EMPHASIZE THAT THAT LAST ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT WHEN THE DRAFT  
3 PLAN HAS BEEN DEVELOPED, YOU KNOW, WE REALLY DO SEE THAT AS AN  
4 OPPORTUNITY TO DO MORE OF THAT TYPE OF OUTREACH. SO, YOU KNOW,  
5 WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO CIRCLE BACK WITH A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL  
6 OVER THE SUMMER AND EARLY FALL WHEN WE, YOU KNOW, EXPECT TO GO  
7 BACK OUT ACROSS THE REGION AGAIN TO COMMUNICATE THE DRAFT PLAN  
8 AND FINDINGS AND GATHER ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK. BUT THAT IS  
9 TYPICALLY THE TIME, YOU KNOW, WHEN WE DO THESE ROADSHOWS FOR  
10 ADDITIONAL ELECTED OFFICIALS.

11

12 **CINDY SILVA:** THANK YOU. I WAS AT THE CONTRA COSTA COUNTY  
13 MAYOR'S CONFERENCE, AND SUE NOACK AND I WERE THERE I WOULD BE  
14 HARD PRESSED TO PRESENT THE DEFINITELY OF DETAIL AT THE HIGH-  
15 LEVEL SUMMARY THAT YOU DID TODAY, IN 30 SECONDS. WE NEED TO  
16 GET FROM 30 SECONDS TO A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL FOR PEOPLE. MY  
17 QUESTION INVOLVES WORK-FROM-HOME ASSUMPTIONS WHAT WAS IT IN  
18 THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ WHAT IS IT YOU'RE LOOKING AT NOW  
19 BECAUSE WE HAVE NO CONTROL OVER WHEN OUR LARGE MAJOR EMPLOYERS  
20 SAY NO LONGER WORK-FROM-HOME RETURN TO WORK WHICH IS HAPPENING  
21 IN OTHER MARKETS FOR EXAMPLE, AMAZON, SEATTLE HAS TOLD  
22 EVERYBODY YOU'RE BACK IN THE OFFICE FULL-TIME THAT CHANGES  
23 TRANSPORTATION PATTERNS BUT IT ALSO CHANGES ECONOMIC PATTERNS  
24 WHAT THEY'RE DOING AT LUNCHTIME AND THE IMPACTS IT HAS ON OUR



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 LOCAL COMMUNITIES WHAT'S OUR ASSUMPTION NOW AND HOW ARE WE  
2 KEEPING ABREAST OF THAT EFFECT?

3

4 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU MEMBER SILVA THIS IS A GOOD QUESTION  
5 AND THIS IS DEFINITELY ONE OF THE MORE CHALLENGING SPACES TO  
6 NAVIGATE CONSIDERING DYNAMIC THINGS, I WILL SAY IT'S PART OF  
7 THE REASON WHY WE UPDATE THESE PLANS EVERY FEW YEARS AS WE GET  
8 NEWER AND BETTER DATA. IN THE LAST PLAN WE HAD RELATIVELY LOW-  
9 LEVEL OF OBSERVED WORK-FROM-HOME IN 2019 THIS SPIKED UP PRETTY  
10 HIGH OBVIOUSLY AS THE PANDEMIC WORKED ITS WAY THROUGH, AT THAT  
11 TIME WE FELT THE WORK-FROM-HOME WAS GOING TO BE A TEMPORARY  
12 PHENOMENON AND LEVELS WOULD THEN MODERATE BACK CLOSER TO WHAT  
13 HAD BEEN PRIOR TO THE PANDEMIC HOWEVER WHAT WE HAVE SEEN IS  
14 THE BEST AVAILABLE DATA THAT'S AVAILABLE THROUGH THE CENSUS AS  
15 WELL AS OUR PRETTY EXPENSIVE BAY AREA TRAVEL SURVEY THAT MTC  
16 CONDUCTED OVER THE COURSE OF 2023 IS THAT WORK-FROM-HOME  
17 LEVELS ARE A LITTLE BIT STICKIER THAN WE ANTICIPATED THEY  
18 WOULD BE. SO, WE ANTICIPATE THAT, YOU KNOW, FROM RELATIVELY  
19 MODERATE LEVELS THAT THEY ARE AT RIGHT NOW, ABOUT 27% SHARE OF  
20 WORK-FROM-HOME ON A TYPICAL DAY, THAT WILL MODERATE SLIGHTLY  
21 BY THE YEAR 2050. AND AGAIN THAT'S BASED UPON THE BEST  
22 AVAILABLE QUANTITATIVE DATA THAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW. AS WE GET  
23 MORE DATA OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS AND WE'RE ABLE TO SEE  
24 WHETHER THESE PRONOUNCEMENTS OF DIFFERENT EMPLOYERS ARE MAKING



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 INTO TRANSLATING INTO ACTUAL CHANGES TO BEHAVIOR WE'LL UPDATE  
2 THAT ASSUMPTION IN THE NEXT PLANNING CYCLE.

3

4 **CINDY SILVA:** LET ME ASK THE QUESTION TO MAKE SURE I HAVE THIS  
5 RIGHT. WE WERE ASSUMING IN -- [INDISCERNIBLE] MARCH 2019 AND  
6 COVID WE WERE ASSUMING AT 2050 THE WORK-FROM-HOME PERCENTAGE  
7 WOULD BE AT 27%. DID I HEAR THAT RIGHT?

8

9 **CHIRAG RABARI:** NO. SO, IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THE PREVIOUS  
10 PLAN, WE ASSUMED THAT BY THE YEAR 2050, THE WORK-FROM-HOME  
11 LEVEL WITHOUT ANY INTERVENTIONS FROM THE PLAN'S STRATEGIES  
12 WOULD BE ABOUT 13%, ONLY SLIGHTLY HIGHER THAN THE OBSERVED  
13 LEVELS OF 2019. BUT WITH THE IMPACT OF PLAN STRATEGIES TO HELP  
14 US MEET OUR GHG TARGET, WE ANTICIPATED THAT LEVEL WOULD BE  
15 CLOSER TO 20% BY THE YEAR 2050. WHAT WE'RE NOW ASSUMING IS  
16 THAT WE THINK THAT WORK-FROM-HOME LEVEL IN 2050 WILL BE CLOSER  
17 TO 25%, NOT ACCOUNTING FOR THE IMPACT OF ANY PLAN STRATEGIES.  
18 THAT'S THE WORK THAT WE'RE GOING TO DO OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL  
19 MONTHS TO ANALYZE WHETHER THE PLAN STRATEGIES MAY HAVE AN  
20 ADDITIONAL EFFECT ON FUTURE ANTICIPATED WORK-FROM-HOME LEVELS.  
21 WE THINK THAT THE IMPACT OF THE PLAN STRATEGIES COULD BE  
22 FAIRLY MODEST. SO, YOU KNOW, THAT FINAL FIGURE COULD BE A  
23 LITTLE BIT HIGHER THAN THE CURRENTLY ASSUMED 25%. BUT WE'LL  
24 KNOW MORE IN THE SPRING.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CINDY SILVA:** THANK YOU. [ AUDIO DISTORTION ] [INDISCERNIBLE]  
2 FROM MY PERSPECTIVE IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HAVE THAT AS A CLEAR  
3 COMPARISON CHART SO WE CAN START TO REMEMBER WHAT OUR  
4 ASSUMPTIONS ARE. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER  
7 NOACK?

8

9 **SUE NOACK:** SO, I WANT TO, FIRST, THANK YOU FOR THE  
10 PRESENTATION. I CAN DO THIS NOW IN MY SLEEP. I THINK I HAVE  
11 SEEN IT SO MANY TIMES [LAUGHTER] NOT THE PROJECT LIST BUT THE  
12 PRESENTATIONS. I DEPARTMENT TO NOTE I APPRECIATE AS YOU'RE  
13 TALKING ABOUT CHANGING SOME THINGS ON THE 2060 PLAN, I'M  
14 LOOKING AT DIFFERENT TRAJECTORIES, SEVERAL OF US HAD EXPRESSED  
15 CONCERN NOT BEING ABLE TO GENERATE NEW REVENUES DEPENDING ON  
16 THE ADMINISTRATION DEPENDING ON TAX MEASURES AND THINGS LIKE  
17 THAT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT FOR US TO BE ABLE TO LOOK AT  
18 DIFFERENT TRAJECTORIES GOING FORWARD SO I APPRECIATE NOT BEING  
19 ABLE TO DO THAT IN THIS BUT IN THE INTERIM UPDATE I REALLY  
20 HOPE WE TAKE A HARD LOOK AT THAT IN THE 2060 PLANNING. THANK  
21 YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** ANY OTHER BOARD MEMBERS?  
24 STEPHANIE?

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I WANT TO EXPRESS MY CHANGES IN THE  
2 SWAPS IN THE PROJECT LIST I KNOW THAT WAS A CHALLENGE TO DO  
3 YOU DID IT AND I APPRECIATE IT, AND INCORPORATING OUR NORTH  
4 BAY PROGRAM THANK YOU FOR THAT AND THEN MARIN CITY AS  
5 CONTINUING EQUITY COMMUNITY. JUST TWO QUESTIONS ON THE GROWTH  
6 GEOGRAPHIES AND THE COMPREHENSIVE PLANNING CONTEMPLATED FOR  
7 THAT I'M WONDERING THERE ARE SOURCES FUNDING EITHER NOW OR  
8 CONTEMPLATED IN THE FUTURE FOR PLANNING FOR GROWTH IN THE  
9 GROWTH GEOGRAPHY AREAS?

10

11 **MATT MALONEY:** MATT MALONEY DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR METRO  
12 PLANNING AND POLICY, THE SOURCES THAT WE HAVE RELIED ON OVER  
13 THE PAST COUPLE OF DECADES, THE BIGGEST SOURCE HAS BEEN, SORT  
14 OF, FEDERAL SURFACE TRANSPORTATION MONEY THAT WE HAVE USED TO  
15 DO OUR PDA PLANNING PROGRAM AND EPISODICALLY WE HAVE COME TO  
16 THIS COMMITTEE TO PROVIDE UPDATES ON THE PROGRAM I THINK WE'RE  
17 OUT FOR ANOTHER CALL FOR PROJECTS LARGER CALL FOR PROJECTS OF  
18 THE MONEY COULD BE USED FOR PDA PLANNING SO CALL FOR PROJECTS  
19 HAS BEEN OUT INNOVATE RECENTLY OVER THE PAST FEW MONTHS IT'S,  
20 SORT OF, ONGOING. WE ALSO THINK IT'S GOING TO BE IMPORTANT IN  
21 YEARS AHEAD TO TRY TO BUILD MORE CONSISTENT FUNDING FOR  
22 REGIONAL TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS INCLUDING PLANNING WE  
23 HAVE HAD TWO ROUNDS OF REAP MONEY THE FIRST ROUND FLOWED  
24 THROUGH ABAG A LITTLE OVER 20 MILLION AND WE REALLY PUT THAT  
25 MONEY TO WORK WITH OUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS, INCLUDING A LOT OF



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 PLANNING, THAT'S MORE HOURS ELEMENT TYPE OF WORK THEN WE HAD  
2 REAP TWO, WHICH ALLOWED US TO CONTINUE SOME OF THAT TYPE OF  
3 WORK BUT I THINK WE REALLY NEED AN ONGOING SOURCE OF PLANNING  
4 ASSISTANCE MONEY I THINK FROM THE STATE TO CONTINUE THIS WORK.  
5 YOU CAN SEE ON THE MAP WE HAVE A TON OF GROWTH AREAS AND NOT  
6 ENOUGH MONEY TO DO THE PLANNING.

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GOOD. I WOULD SUPPORT THAT. ANOTHER  
9 COMMENT, CHIRAG, YOU MENTIONED THE SCENARIO PLANNING, WHICH I  
10 THINK IS EXCELLENT, AND I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER NOACK. WE'RE  
11 GOING TO BE AT THIS FOR A LONG TIME. IT'S AN ITERATIVE  
12 PROCESS. IS THE SCENARIO PLANNING WE DID THIS ROUND DIFFERENT  
13 THAN WHAT WE HAVE DONE IN THE PAST? OR IS THIS MORE OF THE  
14 SAME? JUST NOT HAVING BEEN HERE THAT LONG, I DIDN'T KNOW.

15

16 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO WE TYPICALLY DO OUR SCENARIO PLANNING WORK IN  
17 MAJOR PLAN UPDATE CYCLES. SO, WE DID IT AS PART OF THE FIRST  
18 PLANNED BAY AREA, AND WE DID IT AS PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA  
19 2050. THAT EFFORT THAT WE DID FOR SCENARIO PLANNING IN 2050  
20 EXPLORED THESE WHAT-IF SCENARIOS, DIFFERENT TRAJECTORIES  
21 DIFFERENT FUNDING LEVELS, ALL OF THAT. SO WHAT WE'RE, YOU  
22 KNOW, EXPLORING, AND HAVE LISTED ON THIS SLIDE, WHICH IS  
23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2060 WHICH WILL BE A MAJOR UPDATE STARTING  
24 WITH THE SCENARIO PLANNING AGAIN AND DELVING INTO DIFFERENT  
25 TRAJECTORIES WILL BE VALUABLE TO DO THAT, SORT OF, THINKING AT





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 THE START OF THE PLAN PROCESS MINOR UPDATES YOU KNOW WE REALLY  
2 TRY TO BE MORE TARGETED AND FOCUSED IN HONING IN ON EXISTING  
3 STRATEGIES.

4

5 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GREAT. THEN MY LAST COMMENT REALLY  
6 TO MY COLLEAGUES I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE CHALLENGES MEETING  
7 THE GREENHOUSE GAS REQUIREMENTS THEY'RE REALLY JUST A SKEW OF  
8 PLANS IN THE DIRECTION IT'S DIFFICULT TO ACHIEVE, SO I WANT TO  
9 THANK YOU FOR THE COMMUNICATIONS THAT YOU AND OTHER MPOS ARE  
10 HAVING WITH CARB AND HOPE WE CAN PURSUE AND PERHAPS THROUGH  
11 OUR LEGISLATORS THAT SIT ON THE BOARD BUT THIS IS A BIG  
12 ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM THAT MAKES LOCAL PLANNING DIFFICULT.

13

14 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** DAVID.

15

16 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU DAVID, MATT, AND EXECUTIVE  
17 DIRECTOR, I THINK WHAT WE'RE DOING AROUND TRADE-OFFS, AND  
18 CHALLENGES THAT WE FACE, I THINK IT'S 81 OR \$84 BILLION IN  
19 TERMS OF THE PLAN?

20

21 **CHIRAG RABARI:** IN TERMS OF, LIKE, HOW MUCH LESS REVENUE?

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CORRECT.

24



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH, IT'S CLOSE TO 80 BILLION LESS THAN THE  
2 LAST PLAN.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I THINK MANY IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND  
5 THROUGHOUT APPRECIATE THE INCLUSION OF THE WETA REDWOOD CITY  
6 FERRY. SO, I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE STAFF FOR THEIR EFFORT AND  
7 FLEXIBILITY. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT STRUCK ME WAS ON THE  
8 PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS IS AROUND INCOME, I'M WONDERING FROM  
9 STAFF SHRINKAGE OF THE MIDDLE CLASS OFFSET BY INCREASE BOTH  
10 HIGH AND LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS, WITHIN THE PLAN THERE IS A  
11 NUMBER OF STRATEGIES THAT TRIES TO ADDRESS THIS, WITHIN THESE  
12 ASSUMPTIONS, THIS IS GOING TO CONTINUE TO INCREASE, HOW DO YOU  
13 ADDRESS THAT WITHIN THE PLAN FOR THAT, SORT OF, PEOPLE WHO ARE  
14 IN THE MIDDLE CLASS AND ARE REALLY MAYBE NOT GOING TO BE IN  
15 THE MIDDLE CLASS? SO, THAT PROVIDES A SIGNIFICANT GAP IN A  
16 PARADIGM SHIFT. I'M JUST CURIOUS TO YOUR THOUGHTS ON THAT.

17

18 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER, FOR THAT QUESTION.  
19 AND, YES, IN TERMS OF THE PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS, THIS IS,  
20 ESSENTIALLY, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE THINK OR PROJECT IS GOING  
21 HAPPEN IN THE FUTURE WITHOUT INTERVENTION FROM THE PLAN'S  
22 STRATEGIES. SO, THE PLAN REALLY, IN PARTICULAR, IS HOUSING AND  
23 ECONOMY ELEMENTS, DOES TRY TO PROPOSE VARIOUS POLICY  
24 INTERVENTIONS THAT CAN MAKE THIS A, YOU KNOW, A MORE LIVABLE,  
25 AFFORDABLE, DYNAMIC PLACE FOR FOLKS IN THE MIDDLE CLASS. SO,



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 THAT'S, YOU KNOW, PRIMARILY THROUGH MAKING HOUSING MORE  
2 AFFORDABLE THROUGH, YOU KNOW, A BROAD SUITE OF HOUSING  
3 STRATEGIES, INCLUDING PRODUCING SUBSIDIZED AFFORDABLE HOUSING,  
4 AS WELL AS YOU KNOW MORE MARKET RATE HOUSING. AS WELL AS  
5 CERTAIN ECONOMY STRATEGIES THAT TRY TO TARGET, YOU KNOW,  
6 PATHWAYS THROUGH THE MIDDLE CLASS, YOU KNOW, WHETHER THAT'S  
7 JOB TRAINING AND INCUBATOR PROGRAMS, YOU KNOW, PATHWAYS TO  
8 APPRENTICESHIPS, AS WELL AS, YOU KNOW, REALLY CREATING A  
9 DYNAMIC ECONOMY THAT MORE FOLKS WILL HAVE ACCESS TO.

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. AND THEN FINALLY THESE CONVERSATIONS  
12 RELATIVE TO CARB, HOW ARE THEY GOING -- IN TERMS OF THE  
13 DIALOGUE, ARE THEY, SORT OF, UNDERSTANDING SOME OF THE  
14 CHALLENGES OR HAVING -- YOU KNOW, I'M JUST CURIOUS. THERE IS  
15 AMBITIOUS -- THEY'RE AMBITIOUS AND AUDACIOUS GOALS FROM CARB  
16 AND THE STATE, ARE THERE AREAS WHERE THEY HAVE, SORT OF,  
17 LISTENED TO US AND SAID HEY THESE ARE AREAS WHERE WE MIGHT BE  
18 A LITTLE BIT MORE FLEXIBLE?

19

20 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. YOU KNOW, THE DIALOGUE  
21 WITH CARB IS OBVIOUSLY AN ONGOING PROCESS THROUGH THE PLAN  
22 DEVELOPMENT IN ADDITION TO THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH A  
23 WORKING GROUP CONVENED WITH CARB OTHER AND STATES AND MPS TO  
24 LOOK AT SYSTEMATIC IMPROVEMENTS TO THE REGIONAL PLANNING  
25 PROCESS AND SENATE BILL 375. WHAT I CAN SEE IS CARB AND THE



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 STATE AGENCIES HAVE BEEN LISTENING TO SOME OF OUR CONCERNS  
2 BUT, YOU KNOW, HAVE NOT COMMITTED TO ANY, SORT OF, CHANGES  
3 THROUGH THAT PROCESS AT THIS TIME. IT'S IN EARLY PHASES AND WE  
4 CONTINUE TO BE AT THE TABLE REPRESENTING THE BAY AREA'S NEEDS  
5 AND INTEREST ALONG WITH OUR OTHER REGIONAL PARTNERS. WE'RE  
6 HOPEFUL THAT AS THE YEAR GOES ON THAT SOME POTENTIAL IDEAS TO  
7 REFORM THE PROCESS EMERGE FROM IT, FROM WITH THROUGH  
8 ADMINISTRATIVE OR LEGISLATIVE MEANS THAT COULD BE ADVANCED IN  
9 THE NEXT YEAR OR TWO BUT THERE IS A LONG ROAD AHEAD.

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** I WOULD SAY LET'S CONTINUE TO TRACK THAT, YOU  
12 KNOW, I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS ANY WAY IN WHICH A MATRIX COULD  
13 BE CREATED BUT REALLY, SORT OF, UNDERSTAND WHERE OUR FEEDBACK  
14 IS AND, SORT OF, LISTENING TO IT AND I THINK JUST  
15 UNDERSTANDING THOSE ADJUSTMENTS WOULD BE HELPFUL IN TERMS OF  
16 FUTURE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

17

18 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER  
19 LIGHTS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES THERE IS. FIRST IS JOSHUA ARCE. HOW  
22 MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

23

24 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** TWO MINUTES.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TWO MINUTES. TURN ON YOUR MIC.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, CHAIR SPERING AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS  
4 JOSHUA WITH THE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA LABORERS UNION AND  
5 AFFILIATES AND MEMBERS OF THE CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS ON  
6 BEHALF OF OUR 30,000 MEMBERS FROM THE CENTRAL VALLEY TO OREGON  
7 BORDER JUST WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK REALLY EXCITED  
8 ABOUT THIS PLAN OUR ORGANIZATION HAS BEEN PART OF GROWING  
9 ADVOCACY AROUND THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL PROJECT YOU  
10 HEARD FROM BUSINESS LEADERS COUNCIL COMMUNITY MEMBERS ELECTED  
11 OFFICIALS RESIDENTS CERTAINLY ORGANIZATIONS ABOUT THE  
12 IMPORTANCE OF THIS REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PROJECT WE'RE  
13 REALLY APPROXIMATE DELIGHTED TO SEE IT BACK ON THE LIST IT'S A  
14 TESTAMENT TO THE WORK OF EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDY FREMIER AND  
15 STAFF TO WORK DOWN THE ROAD TO GET THE PROJECT BACK IT'S  
16 REALLY IMPORTANT IT MEETING THE VOTERS WHERE THEY'RE AT, SAN  
17 MATEO RESIDENTS HAVE ALREADY APPROVED AND FUNDED THIS PROJECT.  
18 SO, I THINK IT'S PART OF WHAT WE WANT TO DO TO LISTEN TO ALL  
19 THE RESIDENTS OF THE BAY AREA, WHAT'S IMPORTANT, WHAT IT'S  
20 GOING TO TAKE FOR THEM TO GET BEHIND ALL OF THE WORK THAT WE  
21 NEED TO DO AROUND THE FUTURE OF THE BAY AREA REGIONAL  
22 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. SO IT'S JUST A REALLY GREAT WIN. I WANT  
23 TO THANK SUPERVISOR AND MTC COMMISSIONER DAVID CANEPA AND MTC  
24 COMMISSIONER GINA PAPAN AND EVERYONE WHO WORKED AROUND THIS



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 AND ADVOCATED TO WORK TIRELESSLY WITH STAFF TO GET THE PROJECT  
2 BACK IN. BIG WIN WE LOVE THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL.

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS GOING TO BE BRIAN  
7 COLBURTON, FOLLOWED BY ADINA LEVIN. BRIAN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
8 YOURSELF.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS BRIAN CULBERTSON. I'M A  
11 TRANSIT RIDER LIVING IN OAKLAND, AND I'M HERE TO COMMENT ABOUT  
12 HOW THESE PLANS AFFECT CLIMATE CHANGE. YOU'RE RESPONSIBLE HERE  
13 TODAY FOR ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT ACTIONS CALIFORNIA CAN DO  
14 FOR THE CLIMATE. 39% OF CALIFORNIA'S GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS  
15 COME FROM TRANSPORTATION. SO, THE WAY WE PLAN OUR  
16 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM HERE IN THE BAY AREA IS CRUCIAL FOR  
17 REDUCING THOSE EMISSIONS TO SAVE THE PLANET. AS WE SEE LA BURN  
18 TO THE GROUND, WE REALLY NEED TO BE REDUCING OUR GREENHOUSE  
19 GAS EMISSIONS RAPIDLY AND WE ALL KNOW THAT. ONE OF THE THINGS  
20 WANTED TO BRING UP IS THAT WE HAVE A COUPLE OF HIGHWAY  
21 WIDENING PROJECTS ON THIS LIST, ONE OF THE STRATEGIES, T7, IS  
22 TO WIDEN HIGHWAYS, WHICH WE KNOW INCREASES GREENHOUSE GAS  
23 EMISSIONS. IT DOES SAY TO MITIGATE VMT IMPACTS. BUT I WOULD  
24 LIKE TO POINT OUT THAT ONE OF THESE PROJECTS, THE INTERCHANGE  
25 IMPROVEMENTS ON SR37 AT FAIRGROUNDS DRIVE IS ADDING A



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 DIVERGING DIAMOND INTERCHANGE WHICH SOLTRANS, THE TRANSIT  
2 AGENCY HAS NOT HAD A CHANCE TO REVIEW AND IT DOES NOT MATCH  
3 WITH THE -- DOES NOT ALLOW FOR TRANSIT. SO, IF YOU'RE -- IF  
4 WE'RE GOING TO EXPAND HIGHWAYS, AND THAT WE KNOW INCREASE  
5 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS WE NEED TO AT LEAST MAKE IT  
6 COMPATIBLE WITH TRANSIT OPERATIONS IF WE COULD ADD IT TO THE  
7 STRATEGY OF T7 TO SAY THAT ANY, SORT OF, HIGHWAY CHANGES ARE  
8 COMPATIBLE WITH TRANSIT PLANS, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN,  
11 FOLLOWED BY JORDAN MOLDOW. ADINA GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.  
12 ADINA? DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM? OKAY. WE'LL LOOP  
13 BACK TO YOU. JORDAN MOLDOW, YOU'RE UP.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HI. JORDAN, I'M FROM THE CITY OF SAN JOSE AND SANTA  
16 CLARA. I'M A TRANSIT RIDER, A CAR DRIVER, A BICYCLIST, A  
17 PEDESTRIAN, BASICALLY MULTI-MODAL TRANSIT. AND I AM REALLY  
18 HOPING THAT WE CAN SEE AN IMPROVED PROJECT LIST THAT REALLY  
19 PRIORITIZES OUR CLIMATE AND OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT SOLUTIONS. I  
20 WAS DISAPPOINTED. SO, I HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING THE VTA2050  
21 PLANNING GOING ON OVER THE LAST YEAR, AND A NUMBER OF MONTHS  
22 AGO, THEY HAD -- THEY HAD PRESENTED TO THEIR BOARD THEIR  
23 PROPOSED 2050 LIST THAT HAD ABOUT 88 PROJECTS IN IT, OR SO,  
24 YOU KNOW, A WHOLE MIX OF HIGHWAY PROJECTS, TRANSIT PROJECTS,  
25 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS. THE LIST BEING CONSIDERED NOW



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 SEEMS TO HAVE BEEN NARROWED FROM THAT 88 PROJECTS DOWN TO JUST  
2 41. AND OF THOSE 41 PROJECTS, 33 OF THEM, SO, A VAST MAJORITY  
3 ARE ABOUT EXPANDING ROADWAYS, WHICH WE KNOW TIME AND TIME  
4 AGAIN, EXPANDING ROADWAYS DOESN'T SOLVE CONGESTION, AND IT  
5 CERTAINLY DOESN'T SOLVE CLIMATE CHANGE. WE NEED REAL TRANSIT  
6 SOLUTIONS TO BE PRIORITIZED IN OUR 2050 PLAN. WE NEED REAL  
7 SOLUTIONS SO THAT PEOPLE HAVE ALTERNATIVES TO DRIVING. THERE  
8 IS LOTS OF PEOPLE WHO DRIVE CARS WHO WANT TO TAKE TRANSIT MORE  
9 OFTEN, AND THEY'RE LOOKING FOR THOSE OPTIONS. SO, TO, YOU  
10 KNOW, LEADERS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND THE OTHER COUNTIES IN  
11 SIMILAR POSITIONS, I REALLY HOPE THAT YOU CAN TAKE ANOTHER  
12 LOOK AT THIS LIST THAT'S BEEN SENT ON TO MTC AND REALLY THINK  
13 ABOUT REDOING THIS LIST AND PUTTING A MUCH HIGHER EMPHASIS ON  
14 CLIMATE POSITIVE PROJECTS FOR REAL PUBLIC TRANSIT SOLUTIONS.  
15 THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ADINA, FIGURED BY EMILY LOPER.  
18 ADINA, GO AHEAD.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI. YES, ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA. AT A  
21 HIGH-LEVEL, I WANTED TO EXPRESS A LOT OF GRATITUDE ABOUT  
22 TRANSIT 2050+ IN A WAY THIS HAS BEEN DONE WITH FOLLOWING THE  
23 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN STRATEGY FROM THE TRANSPORTATION ACTION  
24 PLAN, LOOKING AT FROM A BASIS OF PROVIDING A NETWORK OF  
25 TRANSIT SERVICE WITH IMPROVEMENTS TO TRANSIT SERVICE FREQUENCY





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 IN AREAS AROUND THE REGION, LOOKING AT PEAK AND OFF-PEAK  
2 SERVICE, AND LOOKING AT IDENTIFYING SOME MISSING LINK  
3 CONNECTIONS AND FILLING THEM IN. WE, ALONG THE LINES OF SOME  
4 CORRESPONDENCE THAT WE HAVE SENT OVER TIME, WE HAVE WORKED  
5 WITH NUMEROUS COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS AND GENERATED OVER 250  
6 COMMENTS WITH PEOPLE COMMENTING, SPECIFICALLY, ABOUT THE NEEDS  
7 IN THEIR COMMUNITIES, AND A NUMBER OF THOSE NEEDS HAVE BEEN  
8 REPRESENTED IN THE MODIFICATION IN THE PLAN WITH IMPROVED NEW  
9 LOCAL SERVICE AND TRANSIT PRIORITY. ONE THING I DO WANT TO  
10 LIFT UP AND EXPRESS ONE PIECE OF GRATITUDE AND ONE PIECE OF  
11 DISMAY ABOUT, IS I'M GLAD TO SEE THE INCLUSION OF THE REDWOOD  
12 CITY FERRY, BUT, UNFORTUNATELY, THAT HAS BEEN DONE AS A  
13 TRADEOFF AGAINST THE REMOVAL OF THE BUS ACROSS THE 92 BRIDGE.  
14 THIS IS SOMETHING THAT TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS HAVE COMMENTED  
15 ON WANTING TO BRING BACK. THIS IS A MAJOR ROUTE THAT HAS NO  
16 PUBLIC BUS SERVICE ON IT, WHATSOEVER. MTC IDENTIFYING THIS  
17 LINK IN THE INITIAL PLAN WAS GOOD. AND REMOVING IT IS REALLY  
18 DISMAYING. AND I WONDER, AND I HOPE THAT IT'S POSSIBLE TO FIX  
19 THAT BEFORE THE FINAL-FINAL.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU ADINA. EMILY LOPER FOLLOWED BY  
22 LAUREN GALANTE. UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** EMILY LOPER WITH BAY AREA COUNCIL I WANT TO THANK MTC  
25 STAFF AND SAMTRANS FOR WORKING WITH SFA FERRY FOR GETTING THE



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL BACK IN THE PLAN. THIS IS A VERY  
2 IMPORTANT PROJECT FOR OUR REGION AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO  
3 WORKING TOGETHER TO HOPEFULLY DELIVER IT SOON. SO THANK YOU  
4 STAFF. ONE COMMENT ON THE DISCUSSION ABOUT THE REMOTE WORK  
5 ASSUMPTION. WE HAVE HEARD FROM OUR MAJOR EMPLOYERS FROM AROUND  
6 THE REGION THAT THEY HAVE BEGUN TO INCREASE THEIR IN-OFFICE  
7 WORK REQUIREMENTS AS OF THIS FALL. SO WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING  
8 ONE MORE ROUND OF OUR RETURN TO OFFICE SURVEY IN COLLABORATION  
9 WITH MTC TO QUANTIFY THOSE CHANGES AND THAT WILL HAPPEN NEXT  
10 MONTH AND I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SHARE THOSE RESULTS WITH THIS  
11 COMMITTEE. SO, THANKS VERY MUCH, AGAIN.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. OUR LAST SPEAKER, LAUREN  
14 GALLARTE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** YEAH, GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS, AND CHAIR  
17 SPERING. MY NAME IS LAUREN, HERE TO REPRESENT SAN FRANCISCO  
18 BAY FERRY UNFORTUNATELY NOT IN-PERSON TODAY DUE TO A COLD SO I  
19 APOLOGIZE FOR MY VICE I WANT TO THANK THE COMMITTEE, MTC STAFF  
20 AND SAMTRANS AND STAKEHOLDERS FOR THE REDWOOD CITY FERRY  
21 TERMINAL WORKING OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF WEEKS TO GET THE  
22 REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL PROJECT INTO THE PLAN WE  
23 APPRECIATE THE EFFORT AND RECOGNIZE THE REGIONAL SIGNIFICANCE  
24 OF THIS PROJECT AND LOOK FORWARD TO BRINGING BACK THE FERRY  
25 FUNDING TO THE REGION TO SUPPORT THIS PROJECT.



JANUARY 10, 2025

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND WE HAD TWO HANDOUTS FOR  
3 THIS ITEM ONE WAS WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FROM THE  
4 CITY OF FREMONT FROM MAYOR RAJ SALWAN AND UPDATED IN  
5 ATTACHMENT F.

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. CARLOS, YOU WANT  
8 TO COMMENT?

9

10 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THESE PROCESSES ARE ALL ABOUT TRADE-OFFS.

11

12 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** ABSOLUTELY.

13

14 **CARLOS ROMERO:** AND YOU KNOW, WE WISH WE COULD HAVE ACTUALLY  
15 INCLUDED THE SAN MATEO EXPRESS LANE. I DO WANT COLLEAGUES,  
16 BOTH WHO ARE LISTENING, AS WELL AS THOSE IN THIS ROOM THAT --  
17 I MEAN, BUS RAPID TRANSIT IS IMPORTANT, EXPRESS BUS LANES ARE  
18 IMPORTANT. WE ARE GOING TO CONTINUE TO FIGURE HOW WE CAN FUND  
19 THESE. SOME OF THE MOST NEEDY LOW-INCOME FOLKS AROUND THE  
20 NINE-COUNTY BAY AREA UTILIZE BUSES TO GET TO WORK. IT'S ONE OF  
21 THE REASONS SAMTRANS IS DOING BETTER THAN VTA BUSES AND SO ON  
22 AND SO FORTH. SO, I THINK THIS WAS THE RIGHT CHOICE. I THANK  
23 STAFF FOR ALLOWING THE ACCOMMODATION, AND I ALSO THANK OUR  
24 COUNTY LEADERS, IN DISCUSSIONS THAT I HAD, FOR DOING THE  
25 TRADEOFF. WE'RE NOT GOING TO TURN OUR BACK, CERTAINLY, ON THE



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 COUNTY, IN THE REGIONAL CONNECTIONS ON BUS, WE'RE GOING TO  
2 CONTINUE TO WORK IN THAT DIRECTION BUT FOR NOW I THINK THIS  
3 PLAN SHOWS THE TRADE-OFFS THAT WERE NEEDED TO GET US TO WHERE  
4 WE ARE WILLING TO WORK WITH IT AS NEEDED. THANK YOU TO STAFF  
5 AND EVERYONE ELSE FOR GETTING US THERE

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE COMMENTS.  
8 THE IMPORTANT KEY THING HERE IS SAN MATEO SET THEIR PRIORITIES  
9 SO IT DOESN'T MEAN THOSE OTHER ISSUES AREN'T IMPORTANT AND I  
10 THINK CERTAINLY EXPRESS BUS IS IMPORTANT BUT THANK YOU FOR  
11 THOSE COMMENTS. OTHER COMMITTEE MEMBERS? OKAY. THIS IS AN  
12 ACTION ITEM FOR BOTH MTC AND ABAG. AND, SO, WITH THAT SAID,  
13 I'LL ENTERTAIN -- FOR MTC, I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE.

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'LL MOVE THE ITEM.

16

17 **SUE NOACK:** SECOND.

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.  
20 FURTHER DISCUSSION? SEEING NONE. TAKE THE ROLL, PLEASE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

23

24 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

6

7 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

10

11 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. THE MOTION PASSES

14 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

15

16 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. BEFORE I PASS IT TO

17 CHAIR RAMOS, I WANT TO COMMENT. YOU KNOW, AFFORDABLE HOUSING,

18 THE DISCONNECT BETWEEN WHAT'S HAPPENING IN OUR PLAN AND

19 HAPPENING IN THE CITIES AND COUNTIES, I THINK THERE IS GOING

20 TO BE A LOT MORE DISCUSSION AS HOW THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING CAN

21 BE DELIVERED MORE EFFICIENTLY, FASTER, KIND OF A UNIFORM

22 PROGRAM THROUGHOUT THE REGION ONE CITY HAS CERTAIN FEES

23 ANOTHER HAS DIFFERENT IT'S CONFUSING IF YOU HAD A PREAPPROVED

24 PLAN THAT WERE ACCEPTED BY ALL NINE COUNTIES THAT WOULD SPEED

25 UP THE PROCESS. THERE HAS GOT TO BE MORE DISCUSSION WITH THE



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS HOW WE CAN DELIVER AFFORDABLE HOUSING. WE  
2 CAN CERTAINLY HAVE ALL THIS STUFF IN OUR PLAN BUT IT REALLY IS  
3 DIFFERENT EQUATE TO WHAT'S HAPPENING ON THE GROUND. AND SO --  
4 AND I KNOW STAFF, BOTH MTC AND ABAG, AS WE EMBARK ON HOUSING,  
5 WE'RE NOW NOT ONLY TRANSIT, WE'RE A TRANSPORTATION HOUSING  
6 AGENCY. AND SO WE NEED TO START REALLY LOOKING AT THAT IN A  
7 MORE HOLISTIC WAY AND NOT JUST HOPE EACH JURISDICTION DOES THE  
8 RIGHT THING. SO I JUST WANTED STAFF TO BE, SORT OF, THINKING  
9 IN THOSE TERMS. SO, WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER TO CHAIR  
10 RAMOS.

11

12 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH AND THANK YOU  
13 TO STAFF. WE'LL TAKE THIS ACTION ITEM. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND  
14 A SECOND TO REFER ABAG RESOLUTION NUMBER 04-2025 BAY AREA  
15 PLAN, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ FINAL BLUEPRINT TO THE ABAG  
16 EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR APPROVAL.

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MOVE THE ITEM.

19

20 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** I'LL SECOND THE ITEM. CHAIR RAMOS, I JUST  
21 WANTED TO ALSO AGREE WITH BOARD MEMBER SPERING ON HIS RECENT  
22 REMARK ON THIS WORKING COLLABORATIVELY, UNIFORMLY WITH THE  
23 LOCAL AREAS. SECOND. THANK YOU.

24



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION BY  
2 MEMBER ECKLUND AND A SECOND BY MEMBER WILLIAMS. WILL THE ABAG  
3 CLERK PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RAMOS?

6

7 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANDERSON?

10

11 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE IS ABSENT. RABBITT IS ABSENT? ROMERO?

18

19 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SILVA?

22

23 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILLIAMS?



JANUARY 10, 2025

1

2 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL  
5 MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT ITEM BEFORE  
8 US, 9B, WE'RE GOING TO TAKE OUR -- THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO  
9 STAFF, WE'RE GOING TO TAKE ON OUR NEXT ITEM OF THE MTC AND  
10 ABAG ADVISORY COUNCIL STRATEGY. WE HAVE HEARD FROM KY-NAM  
11 BEFORE ON THIS OF WHAT COMES NEXT, WHEN IT COMES TO THE MTC  
12 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THE ABAG REGIONAL PLANNING  
13 COMMITTEE MEETING. SO, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU. THANK YOU.

14

15 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RAMOS. GOOD MORNING, MEMBERS  
16 OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND ABAG ADMINISTRATION  
17 COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS KY-NAM MILLER. I'M ASSISTANT DIRECTOR  
18 AND EQUITY OFFICER AT MTC AND BAG. TODAY I'M HERE TO PROVIDE  
19 AN UPDATE ON A PROPOSAL TO INTEGRATE THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY  
20 COUNCIL AND ABAG'S REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE INTO A SINGLE  
21 ADVISORY BODY. THIS NEW BODY WILL SERVE BOTH THE MTC  
22 COMMISSION AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD HELPING TO BROADEN THE  
23 RANGE OF ADVISORY INPUT INTO THE WORK OF BOTH AGENCIES AND  
24 FURTHER IMPROVE OUR COORDINATION. TODAY WE'RE REQUESTING  
25 APPROVAL OF THIS PROPOSAL FROM BOTH THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 AND THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. BACK ON NOVEMBER 8TH,  
2 2024 STAFF PROVIDED BACKGROUND HAD TO BODY ON RECENT  
3 INTEGRATION EFFORTS BETWEEN MTC AND ABAG COMMITTEES INCLUDING  
4 THIS CONCEPT TO INTEGRATE THE MTC COUNCIL AND ABAG PLANNING  
5 COMMITTEE AFTER RECEIVING FEEDBACK AND PRESENTING THE CONCEPT  
6 TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL ON NOVEMBER 19TH RECEIVING  
7 FURTHER GUIDANCE MTC ABAG AND THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WE  
8 DEVELOPED MORE SPECIFIC PROPOSAL BASED ON COLLECTIVE FEEDBACK  
9 THANKS TO THAT FEEDBACK THIS UPDATED DRAFT REPRESENTS BALANCED  
10 APPROACH THAT REPRESENT BOTH INTERESTS OF AGENCIES. THE  
11 PRIMARY GOALS OF THE PROPOSAL ARE TO ENSURE THAT ABAG AND MTC  
12 ARE PARTNERS IN SELECTING NOMINEES TO MAINTAIN OPEN NOMINATION  
13 PROCESS WITH ADDED CONSIDERATION FOR CANDIDATES ENDORSED BY  
14 ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND MEMBERS OF MTC TO LIMIT MEMBERSHIP TO  
15 27 MEMBERS TO RESERVE SEATS FOR NON-ELECTED BAY AREA RESIDENTS  
16 TO BRING DIVERSE VIEWPOINTS TO MTC AND ABAG'S VISION. STAFF  
17 AIMS TO BRING NEW VOICES TO THE TABLE VIA EXPANSIVE OPEN  
18 NOMINATION PROCESS. THANKS TO COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT EFFORTS  
19 THROUGHOUT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND 2050+. MTC HAS DEVELOPED  
20 DEEPER COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS OVER THE YEARS. BY LEVERAGING  
21 THESE RELATIONSHIPS AS WELL AS NETWORKS OF THE COMMISSIONERS  
22 AND ABAG BOARD MEMBERS, WE AIM TO ACHIEVE A ROBUST APPLICANT  
23 POOL. THIS PROPOSED BODY WILL HAVE 27 MEMBERS, NINE EQUITY  
24 REPRESENTATIVES, NINE MEMBERS, REPRESENTING SENIORS OR PERSONS  
25 WITH DISABILITIES, AND NINE AT-LARGE MEMBERS REPRESENTING



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 VARIOUS REGIONAL INTERESTS LIKE LABOR, BUSINESS, ENVIRONMENT,  
2 TRANSIT ADVOCACY, SOCIAL EQUITY, YOUTH, CIVIC, PUBLIC HEALTH,  
3 FAIR AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING. THE BODY'S BYLAWS ENSURE  
4 GEOGRAPHIC DIVERSITY AND REPRESENTATION FROM THE NINE  
5 COUNTIES, AND NOMINATIONS OPEN TO THE PUBLIC. THE FINAL  
6 SELECTION WILL BE MADE BY THE MTC CHAIR AND ABAG PRESIDENT  
7 TOGETHER, SUBJECT TO APPROVAL BY THE COMMISSION AND THE ABAG  
8 EXECUTIVE BOARD. FOLLOWING TODAY'S ACTION OUR NEXT STEP WILL  
9 BE TO DRAFT A RESOLUTION FOR CONSIDERATION BY BOTH THE MTC  
10 COMMISSION AND ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. WE AIM TO REQUEST ACTION  
11 ON THIS PROPOSED RESOLUTION AT MEETINGS IN FEBRUARY OR MARCH.  
12 RECRUITMENT FOR THE NEW ADVISORY BODY WILL BEGIN IN THE SUMMER  
13 OF 2025, WITH SELECTIONS FINALIZED THIS FALL, AND THE NEW BODY  
14 WOULD START MEETINGS IN JANUARY OF NEXT YEAR. THIS INTEGRATION  
15 WILL STRENGTHEN POLICY COORDINATION BETWEEN MTC AND ABAG,  
16 ALLOW MEMBERS TO ADDRESS A BROADER RANGE OF ISSUES, AND FOCUS  
17 ON NON-ELECTED RESIDENT ADVISORS TO ENSURE DIVERSE COMMUNITY  
18 REPRESENTATION. THE AT-LARGE MEMBERS WILL REPRESENT VARIOUS  
19 REGIONAL INTERESTS BRINGING A WIDE ARRAY OF PERSPECTIVES TO  
20 THE TABLE, AND WE ALSO CONSIDER FORMING SUBCOMMITTEES TO  
21 ADDRESS SPECIFIC FOCUS AREAS ONCE THE NEW ADVISORY BODIES ARE  
22 ESTABLISHED. IN CONCLUSION, THIS PROPOSAL ENSURES AN INCLUSIVE  
23 PATHWAY FOR NOMINATIONS AND SELECTIONS ALIGNED WITH OUR  
24 COMMITMENT TO EQUITY. AND POSITIONS MTC AND ABAG TO ACHIEVE  
25 OUR REGIONAL PLANNING AND EQUITY GOALS AND FOSTER COMMUNITY



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 ENGAGEMENT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION, AND I  
2 AM OPEN TO QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. THIS IS AN ACTION  
5 ITEM. WE'LL TAKE DISCUSSION. START WITH PAT.

6

7 **PAT ECKLUND:** I DON'T HAVE ANY QUESTIONS AT ALL. I'M NOT GOING  
8 TO SUPPORT THE RECOMMENDATION. AND ONE OF THE REASONS IS THAT  
9 THE REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE THAT ABAG HAD, THAT GROUP HAD  
10 A FULL DISCUSSION SO THAT ELECTED OFFICIALS, CITY AND COUNTY,  
11 COULD HEAR AND ENGAGE WITH THOSE WHO WERE NOT ELECTED. AND THE  
12 UNIQUENESS ABOUT THAT REGIONAL PLANNING COMMITTEE WAS THAT  
13 THERE WAS A BROAD REPRESENTATION WITH BUSINESS AND LABOR,  
14 ENVIRONMENTAL, HOUSING, PUBLIC HEALTH, MINORITIES, OPEN SPACE,  
15 EQUITY, AND THAT ALSO THERE WAS REPRESENTATION FROM SPECIAL  
16 DISTRICTS AND SCHOOLS. SO, THERE IS ALL FACETS, ALL FACETS OF  
17 A COMMUNITY AS PART OF THE REGION, SO WE COULD HAVE THAT FULL  
18 DISCUSSION. INTO THEN, ALSO, THE REGIONAL AGENCIES, THE  
19 REGIONAL BOARD, WATER QUALITY CONTROL BOARD, THE BAY AREA AIR  
20 QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT, BCDC, MTC, ABAG, WE HAVE ALL SAT  
21 DOWN AND TALKED ABOUT ISSUES AND THAT -- AND I ATTENDED THE  
22 MTC ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING AND THE DISCUSSION WAS NEVER AS  
23 FULL AS WHAT WE HAD AT ABAG. AND SO, I'M NOT GOING TO SUPPORT  
24 IT, BECAUSE IT'S TAKING -- IT'S JUST COMPLETELY ELIMINATING,  
25 IN MY OPINION, THE DIVERSITY AND THE FULLNESS OF A DISCUSSION



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 BETWEEN ALL ELECTED OFFICIALS AND THE COMMUNITIES TOGETHER.  
2 AND, SO, WHAT -- AGAIN, I KEEP SAYING MTC'S TOP DOWN, ABAG IS  
3 BOTTOM-UP. AS AN ELECTED OFFICIAL, I VALUE THAT DISCUSSION IF  
4 A MEETING FORMAT. AND, BUT NOT HAVING THAT DISCUSSION WITH  
5 THEM, I THINK, LOSES THE VALUE. SO, I'M NOT GOING TO BE  
6 SUPPORTING THE RECOMMENDATION. I MADE THIS COMMENT BEFORE. AND  
7 NOT MUCH HAS REALLY CHANGED FROM MY OPINION. SO, THANK YOU  
8 VERY MUCH FOR YOUR PRESENTATION AND YOUR WORK.

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM  
11 COMMITTEE MEMBERS.

12

13 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** QUESTION.

14

15 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** WANDA.

16

17 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** HI. AGAIN I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR ALL OF THE  
18 HARD WORK AND DEDICATION ON THIS. I KNOW IT TOOK A LOT OF TIME  
19 AND EFFORT TO PUTTING IT. I HAD A QUESTION ON THE AGENDA ON  
20 PAGE TWO, LISTED UNDER PROPOSED NOMINATIONS AND SELECTION  
21 PROCESS. AND WHEN I WAS READING THE INFORMATION, UNDER THE  
22 NINE AT-LARGE MEMBERS REPRESENTING INSTITUTIONS, IT INDICATED  
23 THAT STAFF WOULD STRIVE TO ENSURE THAT THE OVERALL MEMBERSHIP  
24 OF THIS CATEGORY WAS GEOGRAPHICALLY DIVERSE AND REPRESENTATIVE  
25 OF THE NINE COUNTIES. AND, SO, MY QUESTION WAS, HOW DID YOU



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 MAKE THAT DETERMINATION OR HAS THERE BEEN SOME THOUGHTS ON HOW  
2 TO ACCOMPLISH THAT FEAT OR THAT DESIRE? AND I WAS A LITTLE  
3 CONCERNED WITH THE WORD WOULD STRIVE VERSUS SHALL STRIVE,  
4 WORDS CARRY WEIGHT, RIGHT? AND I JUST WANTED SOME CLARITY ON  
5 THAT.

6

7 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SURE THING. I THINK STAFF WOULD BE HAPPY FIRST  
8 OF ALL JUST SUBSTITUTE SHOULD AND WOULD I THINK WOULD BE MORE  
9 DIRECT ABOUT WHAT WE INTEND TO DO IT'S KIND OF RECRUITING FOR  
10 A TEAM OF PEOPLE DEPENDING ON THE POOL YOU GET DIFFERENT  
11 GEOGRAPHIC REPRESENTATIONS, DIFFERENT STRENGTHS EXPERIENCES SO  
12 YOU'RE TRYING TO FORM A GLOBAL WHOLE THAT CAPTURES THE  
13 INTEREST OF ALL GROUPS GEOGRAPHIES, INTEREST OF GROUPS HERE IN  
14 THE BAY AREA IT'S A PROCESS INVOLVED THAT INCLUDES INTERVIEWS  
15 REFERENCE CHECKS AND CHECKING THROUGH ABAG MEMBERS AND MTC  
16 COMMISSIONERS AND LEADERSHIP AND THE PUBLIC SO EVERYONE CAN  
17 WEIGH IN. THAT'S OUR APPROACH IN TERMS OF HOW WE DEVELOPED THE  
18 APPLICANT POOL.

19

20 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** I WAS DOING MY THIRD YEAR SO I HAVEN'T HAD THE  
21 OPPORTUNITY TO SEE HOW THIS WORKS IT WAS GOOD TO HEAR HOW THE  
22 PROCESS WOULD TAKE PLACE AND THAT THERE IS ACTUALLY LIKE THE  
23 APPLICATION PROCESS. SO WHEN IT GOES OUT FOR -- WHEN WE GET TO  
24 THE POINT WHERE WE'RE ADVERTISING FOR APPLICANTS, IS THIS  
25 INFORMATION SENT TO ALL THE DIFFERENT REGIONS? AND I GUESS MY



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 QUESTION IS, WHERE IN THE REGION IS IT SENT TO. LINE, IN OUR  
2 COUNTY WE HAVE OUR STA. SO, I DON'T KNOW ABOUT THE OTHER  
3 AREAS. HOW WOULD THAT WORK?

4

5 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SO, THE RECRUITMENT PERIOD LASTS TYPICALLY 6 TO  
6 8 WEEKS AND WE WILL ADVERTISE SOMETIMES IN PRINT MEDIA, ON  
7 SOCIAL MEDIA, WE'LL DEFINITELY LEVERAGE THE RELATIONSHIPS YOU  
8 ALL HAVE IN YOUR COMMUNITIES, WE PUSH IT OUT TO, WE HAVE NOW  
9 400 ALUMNI FROM OUR HIGH SCHOOL AND COLLEGE PROGRAMS THAT WE  
10 WANT OUR YOUTH TO BE APPLYING TO FOR THIS PROGRAM. WE HAVE  
11 GOOD READERSHIP IN OUR NEWS LETTERS IT REALLY DEPENDS ON  
12 COMMUNITY PARTNERS. IN SOLANO COUNTY SAYING HEY WE NEED YOU TO  
13 STEP UP YOU HAVE CANDIDATES WHO MIGHT NOT WANT TO BE ELECTED  
14 BUT WANT TO PARTICIPATE MIGHT BE A GOOD WAY TO GET PEOPLE  
15 INVOLVED.

16

17 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** ALL RIGHT. THAT'S ALL. THANK YOU FOR TAKING  
18 THE TIME TO ANSWER ALL MY QUESTIONS. AGAIN, THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** CARLOS?

21

22 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I'M CAUTIOUSLY IN SUPPORT OF THE PROPOSAL. I  
23 THINK, IDEALLY, AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE SOME OF THE COMMENTS  
24 THAT MY COLLEAGUE HAS MADE REGARDING THE OLD REGIONAL PLANNING  
25 COMMISSION. -- COMMITTEE, THAT WE WERE BOTH ON, AT ONE POINT,



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 AND I WAS PRESIDENT -- VICE CHAIR OF THAT COMMITTEE. WE HAD  
2 DISCUSSION AND THERE ARE REASONS WHY WE DIDN'T DO IT, BUT AN  
3 INTERESTING THOUGHT THAT I KICKED AROUND THAT NEVER MADE IT  
4 INTO THIS, THAT IF WE HAD 31 MEMBERS WE COULD POTENTIALLY HAVE  
5 PERHAPS SOME NON-VOTED ELECTED'S SITTING ON THE BODY. THERE  
6 HAVE BEEN CONVERSATIONS -- I HAVE SAT ON BOTH THE ADVISORY  
7 COMMITTEES OF MTC, AS WELL AS ON THE REGIONAL PLANNING  
8 COMMITTEE. THE CONVERSATIONS CAN BE DIFFERENT. HOWEVER THE  
9 CHARGE OF THIS NEW COMMITTEE HAS BEEN EXPANDED. AND I THINK  
10 THE DISCUSSIONS WILL PROBABLY BE MORE IN LINE WITH THOSE  
11 DISCUSSIONS THAT WE HAD AT THE RPC. I THINK THAT'S WHAT THE  
12 GOAL IS, I THINK WE SHOULD TRY THIS. IT MAKES SENSE TO DO THIS  
13 CONSOLIDATION, WE ARE MTC ABAG, WE EVENTUALLY WANT TO MOVE TO  
14 THIS FULL CONSOLIDATION. LET'S TRY THIS. YOU KNOW, I THOUGHT  
15 ADDING FOUR MEMBERS WOULD HAVE BEEN GREAT. STAFF HEARD THAT  
16 AND, LIKE, NO, ANOTHER FOUR MEMBERS, I CAN UNDERSTAND 27 IS  
17 REALLY UNRULY. LET'S SEE HOW THIS GOES. I'M IN SUPPORT OF IT  
18 AGAIN LET'S NOT TRY TO STRIVE FOR THE PERFECT AT THIS POINT  
19 BUT MOVE FORWARD WITH WHAT WE HAVE BUT I DO WANT TO  
20 ACKNOWLEDGE SOME OF MY COLLEAGUE'S CONCERNS RELATED TO WHAT WE  
21 HAVE BEFORE US. SO, THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** STEPHANIE?

24



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH, THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK MY  
2 ABAG COLLEAGUES FOR YOUR COMMENTS HAVING SERVED ON ABAG, AND  
3 THEN CITY COUNCIL MEMBER, I KNOW THESE ARE VERY DIFFERENT  
4 CULTURALLY ORGANIZATIONS, AND SO COMMISSIONER I APPRECIATE YOU  
5 WALKING THE LINE BETWEEN THE TWO I'LL BE INTERESTED IN OUR  
6 PROCESSES INCLUSIVE THE WAY THE ABAG PROCESSES WERE. I THINK  
7 TO YOUR POINT, PAT AND WAND A BECAUSE I DO THINK WE NEED TO  
8 FORGE AND INTEGRATE THESE COMMITTEES IN A WAY THAT'S  
9 REFLECTIVE OF BOTH VALUES BOTH OF THEM SO THAT'S WHAT I'M  
10 HOPEFUL IS THAT WE SEE IN THE DISCUSSIONS AND FORMAT PROCESS.  
11 SO I'M WILLING TO SUPPORT THIS IT'S A START.

12

13 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. I JUST WANT TO COMMENT,  
14 YOU KNOW, I HAVE THE SAME CONCERNS THAT BOARD MEMBER ECKLUND  
15 HAS. I AM SUPPORTING IT, BUT AS I SAID BEFORE, AND I'LL SAY IT  
16 AGAIN, YOU HAVE GOT TO GOT TO GET NEW FACES NEW PEOPLE  
17 INVOLVED IN THIS WE SEE THE SAME PEOPLE, SAME AGENDA, THEY  
18 HAVE A MISSION AND GOAL AND IT'S VERY IMPORTANT DIVERSITY IS  
19 FROM A NEW GROUP PEOPLE THAT SEE THINGS DIFFERENTLY THAN WE DO  
20 AND I THINK IT'S HEALTHY AND PERSONALITY FOR THE ORGANIZATION.  
21 I HOPE THE PRESIDENT OF ABAG AND MTC CHAIR REALLY LOOKS AT THE  
22 ASPECT OF GETTING NEW PERSPECTIVE, NEW INDIVIDUALS INVOLVED.  
23 AND FROM THE ORGANIZATION IT SEEMS LIKE WE GET THE SAME PEOPLE  
24 FROM THOSE ORGANIZATIONS. I THINK WE OUGHT TO STRIVE TO GET  
25 DIFFERENT PEOPLE FROM THOSE ORGANIZATIONS. SO I HOPE STAFF CAN





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 HELP STEER IT IN THAT DIRECTION. I THINK DIVERSITY IS  
2 ABSOLUTELY NEEDED AT THIS TIME OF THIS PROCESS. AND, SO, IS  
3 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS? I SEE MARTHA IS NOT HERE. OKAY.  
4 YEAH, COME ON FORWARD AND WE'LL LET THE AUDIENCE TAKE CHARGE.  
5 HOW MANY MINUTES DO YOU WANT? [LAUGHTER] WE'RE GOING TO GIVE  
6 YOU TWO

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR SPERING. THANKS FOR YOUR PUBLIC  
9 SERVICE. I JUST WANTED TO REPORT THAT I WAS, YOU KNOW, PART OF  
10 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM, ALSO ON  
11 THE FOCUS GROUP. AND WE HAD, YOU KNOW, A LENGTHY QUESTION  
12 SESSION. WE WERE KIND OF REASSURED BY STAFF. AND I WANT TO  
13 THANK STAFF FOR THEIR ETHICS ON THIS. I MEAN, I LIKE THE  
14 ABSENCE OF ELECTED OFFICIALS. I THINK THIS'S HELPFUL. I THINK  
15 THERE WAS A LOT OF CONCERN ABOUT THE CHANGE. YOU KNOW, IT'S A  
16 NEW -- IT'S A NEW THING, BUT THE LIGHT -- THE QUESTIONS KIND  
17 OF SHINE A LIGHT ON THE FACT THAT WE'RE STAYING WITH PRETTY  
18 MUCH THE SAME PROCESSES. AND I THINK IT'S JUST A STREAMLINING  
19 MEASURE. IT MAKES EVERY SENSE, WE HAVE A LOT OF COMMITTEE  
20 MEETINGS IN THIS ROOM, ONE LESS, AND ONE LESS REPORT TO GIVE  
21 FOR STAFF, I THINK MAKES A LOT OF SENSE. SO, I THINK THE  
22 STRATEGIES, THE NEXT STEPS, AND THE PROCESSES OUTLINED IN THE  
23 REPORT ARE NOT IN CONFLICT WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL OR  
24 THE FOCUS GROUP. THANK YOU.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANY OTHER  
2 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WANT TO SPEAK? IS THERE -- I HAVEN'T  
3 RECEIVED ANY WRITTEN COMMENTS. HAS STAFF RECEIVED ANYTHING?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE TWO PUBLIC COMMENTS. FIRST WILL BE  
10 ADINA LEVIN FOLLOWED BY RANDI KINMAN. GO AHEAD ADINA.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL,  
13 AND I'M SPEAKING FOR MYSELF HERE. I THINK THAT THE  
14 RECOMMENDATION MOVING FORWARD IS A REASONABLE MIX IN TERMS OF  
15 WANTING TO GET MORE COMMUNITY INPUT ON THE HOUSING ISSUES THAT  
16 HAVE TRADITIONALLY BEEN COVERED UNDER ABAG, AND HAVING  
17 REPRESENTATION FROM PEOPLE REPRESENTING DIFFERENT SECTORS OF  
18 THE COMMUNITY ALL AROUND THE REGION. YOU KNOW, I HEAR THE  
19 REMARK FROM COMMISSIONERS SAYING, HEY, WE COULD BE EVEN MORE  
20 REPRESENTATIVE IF WE HAD EVEN MORE PEOPLE ON THE BODY. I CAN  
21 SAY AS SOMEONE SERVING ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL THAT  
22 COVERS REALLY DIFFERENT AND WEIGHTY TOPICS, THAT OUR MEETINGS  
23 OFTEN RUN VERY, VERY, VERY LONG IN A WAY THAT IS A LITTLE BIT  
24 OF A CHALLENGE FOR PEOPLE THAT ARE COMMUNITY MEMBERS THAT DO  
25 NOT DO THIS FULL-TIME, AND THAT HAVE JOBS OTHER AND



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 OBLIGATIONS. SO, I'LL APPRECIATE STAFF FROM KEEPING THE NUMBER  
2 OF PARTICIPANTS AT THE CURRENT LEVEL IN ORDER TO, YOU KNOW,  
3 MAKE THE PROCESS OF SERVING ON THIS COMMUNITY ADVISORY BOARD  
4 MANAGEABLE FOR THE PARTICIPANTS AND STAFF. AND I THINK IT'S A  
5 REASONABLE MIX. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT WE'LL HAVE RANDY KINMAN  
8 FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY  
11 COUNCIL. AND I'M PROBABLY RIGHT NOW THE LONGEST SERVING MEMBER  
12 OF THAT. I JUST WANTED TO POINT OUT THAT MTC HAS NEVER HAD A  
13 PROBLEM WITH REACHING OUT AND MAINTAINING A BODY FOR THE  
14 ADVISORY COUNCIL THAT IS INCLUSIVE, THAT IS DYNAMIC, AND THAT  
15 HAS COUNTY REPRESENTATION ACROSS THE BOARD. EVERYBODY IS  
16 REPRESENTED TO THE BEST OF OUR ABILITY. AND SOMETIMES WE HAVE  
17 OVER REPRESENTATION IN THAT YOU HAVE PEOPLE WORKING IN ONE  
18 COUNTY AND LIVING IN ANOTHER COUNTY, AND THAT'S A GOOD THING  
19 FOR US, IT CROSS POLLINATES. WHAT I WANT TO SAY IS IT'S  
20 IMPORTANT FOR YOU TO HAVE A BODY THAT REMAINS -- THAT REMAINS  
21 NEUTRAL AND IS NOT PART OF THE ELECTED BODY SYSTEM. BECAUSE  
22 THAT MEANS THAT AT THE ADVICE THAT WE ARE GETTING AND THE  
23 INFORMATION THAT WE ARE GETTING IS FROM THE STAFF AND FROM THE  
24 MEMBERS OF OTHER GROUPS THAT ARE PRESENTING INFORMATION, AND  
25 THAT THERE IS NEVER ANY DOUBT THAT WE ARE BEING INFLUENCED BY



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 AN ELECTIVE REPRESENTATIVE. I FEEL VERY, VERY STRONGLY ABOUT  
2 THAT. THERE IS ALSO THE ABILITY FOR US TO, AS ADINA SAID, OUR  
3 MEETINGS GO LONG, BUT I FORESEE US HAVING THE ABILITY TO DO  
4 MORE SUBCOMMITTEES, JUST AS YOU ARE DOING RIGHT NOW. THIS  
5 CONVERSATION IS NOT TAKING PLACE AT THE JOINT MEETING, IT'S  
6 TAKING PLACE AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL. AND I THINK THAT'S WHERE  
7 WE WILL BE MORE EFFECTIVE AND SERVE BOTH BODIES EQUALLY. THANK  
8 YOU.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, RANDI. AND OUR LAST RAISED HAND  
11 IS VINAY PIMPLE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HI. I ALSO SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I  
14 AGREE 100% WITH EVERYTHING THAT RANDI SAID ABOUT WHY ELECTED'S  
15 SHOULD MAYBE STAY AWAY, BUT ALSO THE OTHER POINT SHE MAKES HOW  
16 THINGS CAN BE HANDLED THROUGH SUBCOMMITTEES AND SO FORTH. THE  
17 THING I WANTED TO SAY IS WE SEE OUR ROLE AS LARGELY HELPING  
18 STAFF. AND HAVING BEEN AN ELECTED OFFICIAL MYSELF IN THE PAST,  
19 I MEAN, MY EXPERIENCE WAS THAT MOST ELECTED OFFICIALS, WHEN  
20 PUSH COMES TO SHOVE, THEY'RE NOT REALLY GOING TO LISTEN TO  
21 WHAT WE SAY. AND, SO, SOME PEOPLE DO HAVE THE SENSE THAT WE  
22 ARE HERE TO, YOU KNOW, GUIDE THE ELECTED OFFICIALS. AND THAT'S  
23 REALLY NOT THE CASE. WE ARE HERE TO HELP STAFF OUT TO MAKE  
24 SURE THAT STAFF GIVE YOU THE BEST REPORTS THAT THEY CAN GIVE  
25 YOU, RATHER THAN TO ACTUALLY INFLUENCE YOU FOLKS DIRECTLY.



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 AND, SO, I'M A LITTLE SURPRISED THAT WE DON'T HAVE MORE INPUT  
2 FROM STAFF. LIKE, WHAT DO STAFF ACTUALLY THINK? AND NOT JUST  
3 STAFF LIKE KY-NAM WHO IS SUPER, BUT STAFF WHO CAN GIVE  
4 REPORTS, WHAT THE SENSE IS OF THE BETTER OPTION IN TERMS OF  
5 GETTING USEFUL INPUT. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS  
8 ITEM.

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. I APPRECIATE THE NON-  
11 ELECTED OFFICIAL COMMENTS. BEING THAT I'M NOT ELECTED, SO I  
12 DON'T FALL INTO THAT CATEGORY. [LAUGHTER]

13

14 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** EMERITUS.

15

16 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THEY DIDN'T SAY FORMER. THIS  
17 IS AN ACTION ITEM FOR MTC AND ABAG. WE'LL TAKE MTC COMMITTEE  
18 FIRST COMMENTS. THERE WAS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS, MARTHA?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE FOR  
21 THIS ITEM.

22

23 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION FROM  
24 THE MTC COMMITTEE.

25



1 **SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

4

5 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** MOTION AND A SECOND. ROLL  
6 CALL, PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR SPERING?

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

13

14 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

21

22 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT IS ABSENT. THE MOTION  
4 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. I'LL HAND IT OVER TO  
7 PRESIDENT RAMOS.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. I'LL SAY BRIEFLY TO  
10 STAFF, I KNOW THIS IS A LOT OF WORK AND REALLY TO ASK MY  
11 COLLEAGUE TO KEEP AN OPEN MIND. 27 MEMBERS IS A LOT OF  
12 MEMBERS. THIS TAKES US ONE STEP CLOSER TOWARDS OUR GOVERNANCE  
13 CONSOLIDATION THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON, SLOWLY. THIS IS  
14 ONE MORE STEP IN THAT JOURNEY OF OUR RELATIONSHIP OF TRUST IN  
15 EACH OTHER AT ABAG MTC. AND THE COMMENTS THAT MY CO-CHAIR HERE  
16 SAID TO THE PRESIDENT OF ABAG, I'M RIGHT HERE AND I HEARD  
17 THEM. SO, NOTED. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE  
18 THE PROPOSAL AND DIRECT STAFF TO THE RESOLUTIONS ESTABLISHING  
19 UNIFIED ADVISORY BODY SERVING BOTH ABAG AND MTC AS DESCRIBED  
20 IN THE SUMMARY SHEET.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL  
2 VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
5 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** NO IT DOESN'T. WE HAD A NO VOTE FROM  
8 ECKLUND.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FORGIVE ME. THE MOTION DOES NOT PASS.

11

12 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** NO. IT DOES PASS, BUT --

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOT BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. NOT  
15 UNANIMOUSLY. FORGIVE ME.

16

17 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YES.

18

19 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** JUTTING FOR CLARITY OF THE RECORD. WE  
20 HAD ONE NO VOTE FROM MEMBER ECKLUND, AND WE WANT TO REFLECT  
21 THAT IN THE RECORD.

22

23 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT ITEM. THANK  
24 YOU SO MUCH. OUR NEXT ITEM AGENDA 10A PRIORITY CONSERVATION  
25 AREA AMENDMENT PROGRESS AND CALL FOR NEW NOMINATIONS AND WE'RE





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 GOING TO RECEIVE A REPORT BY MICHAEL GERMERAAD. DID I SAY THAT  
2 CORRECTLY?

3

4 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** YES. I'LL KEEP REMARKS BRIEF THE PRIORITY  
5 CONSERVATION AREAS IDENTIFY KEY NATURAL HABITATS FARMLAND  
6 RECREATION SPACES URBAN DEGREE SPACE TO ADDRESS CLIMATE  
7 RESILIENCE LAST MAY ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVED UPDATED  
8 FRAMEWORK INCORPORATING NEW DATA TO SUPPORT MAPPING TO CHANGE  
9 THE FRAMEWORK RESULTING IN THE NEED TO UPDATE THE EXISTING  
10 PCAS OVER THE PAST SIX MONTHS WE HAVE WORKED WITH LOCAL  
11 GOVERNMENTS TO AMEND THE 60% OF 180 PLUS EXISTING PCAS  
12 ATTACHMENT B LISTS JURISDICTIONS WE'LL COLLABORATE WITH THIS  
13 WINTER AND SPRING TO ADDRESS THE REMAINING 40%. ATTACHMENT B  
14 WALNUT CREEK WAS MISTAKENLY INCLUDED CITY STAFF HAVE ADDRESSED  
15 THE SINGLE PCA SO NO FURTHER ACTION NEEDED THERE. FINALLY  
16 WE'RE EXCITED TO ANNOUNCE THAT WE WILL RELEASE CALL FOR NEW  
17 PCA NOMINATIONS IN THE COMING MONTHS THIS WILL ALLOW LOCAL  
18 GOVERNMENTS TO NOMINATE NEW PCAS ALIGNED WITH OF THE UPDATED  
19 FRAMEWORK ANNOUNCEMENTS AND DETAILED GUIDANCE AND NOMINATIONS  
20 WILL BE SHARED SOON.

21

22 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. DO WE HAVE  
23 COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS.

24



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** EXISTING PCA YOU SAY ARE  
2 INCONSISTENT? HOW DO YOU DETERMINE THE THAT? CAN THEY REAPPLY  
3 OR ARE JUST DISQUALIFIED.

4

5 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** WE'RE WORKING WITH JURISDICTIONS TO COME UP  
6 WITH AMENDMENTS TO THE EXISTING PCAS SO WE HAVE 180 OVER 110  
7 THAT HAVE ALREADY GONE THROUGH THE AMENDMENT PROCESS WE'RE  
8 WORKING WITH A LITTLE OVER A DOZEN JURISDICTIONS TO WORK  
9 THROUGH AMENDMENTS. THE GOAL IS TO BRING ALL EXISTING PCAS  
10 INTO THE FRAMEWORK IT JUST REQUIRES ADJUSTMENTS TO EITHER THE  
11 TYPE IT WAS DESIGNATED AS ADJUSTMENTS TO BOUNDARY AND  
12 POTENTIALLY SPLITTING AN EXISTING PCA, AND DIFFERENT PIECES  
13 REFLECTING TWO DIFFERENT TYPES.

14

15 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** SOLANO COUNTY THAT HAVE  
16 PROJECTS THE WAY I UNDERSTAND IT THAT WOULD BE DISQUALIFIED.  
17 EXPLAIN TO ME HOW THAT WORKS. AND WHAT DISQUALIFIES?

18

19 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** WE'RE TALKING SPECIFICALLY ABOUT PCA  
20 DESIGNATIONS WHERE PCAS ARE MAPPED. AND ANY PROJECTS, THROUGH  
21 THE PCA GRANT PROGRAM THAT ARE CURRENTLY FUNDED CONTINUE TO  
22 MOVE THROUGH THAT PROCESS AS IS. WHAT WE'RE WORKING TO DO IS  
23 TO UPDATE THOSE DESIGNATIONS, THOSE GEOGRAPHIES OF PCAS SO  
24 WE'LL BE WORKING WITH SOLANO COUNTY AND A FEW OF THE  
25 JURISDICTIONS THAT REMAIN ON OUR LIST OF PCAS THAT NEED TO GO



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 THROUGH THE AMENDMENT PROCESS. THERE ARE PATHS TO KEEP THOSE  
2 GEOGRAPHIES, IN MANY CASES, EXACTLY AS THEY ARE, JUST CHANGING  
3 TYPES. IN SOME CASES A FEW SMALL TWEAKS TO BOUNDARIES. WE'RE  
4 WORKING ONE-ON-ONE WITH JURISDICTIONS TO SUPPORT IN THOSE  
5 EFFORTS.

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THAT'S WHAT I WANT TO HEAR  
8 BECAUSE WHILE I WAS READING IT IT LOOKED LIKE THEY WERE JUST  
9 DISQUALIFIED. THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR WORKING WITH THOSE  
10 JURISDICTIONS.

11

12 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. BOARD MEMBER ECKLUND?

13

14 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, IT LOOKING AT MARIN,  
15 TOWN OF ROSS, AND CITY OF NOVATO, ARE BOTH BLANK. SO WHAT DOES  
16 THAT MEAN? ARE YOU WORKING WITH US TO BRING US UP TO WHERE WE  
17 NEED TO BE IN ORDER TO -- BECAUSE NOVATO, WE -- WE PROPOSED  
18 SEVERAL OF THEM. AND I THINK THAT THEY WERE APPROVED. BUT IT'S  
19 BEEN A WHILE SINCE I THOUGHT ABOUT THAT. SO, I WOULD  
20 APPRECIATE IT IF STAFF WOULD CONTACT ME SO THAT I CAN ALSO  
21 WORK WITH THE TOWN OF ROSS AND SO THAT I MAKE SURE THAT THE  
22 CITIES, OR THE MUNICIPALITIES ARE REPRESENTED. BECAUSE I'M NOT  
23 SURE WHERE ROSS IS, OR NOVATO, AT THIS POINT, BECAUSE I  
24 HAVEN'T HEARD ANYTHING. SO, I WOULD HATE TO HAVE SOMETHING GET  
25 OFF THE LIST. SO, THAT'S A COMMENT. BUT THEN DO WE HAVE A LIST



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 OF WHAT THE NON-CONFORMING PCAS ARE? AND CAN WE GET A COPY OF  
2 THAT? BECAUSE IT'S -- IT -- LIKE, WHEN I LOOK AT THE MAP ON  
3 ATTACHMENT C, THERE IS LITTLE RED DOTS THAT IT LOOKS LIKE  
4 THAT'S IN NOVATO, BUT I'M NOT SURE IF IT'S IN NOVATO OR NOT.  
5 AND THEN WHERE IS ROSS. SO, IT'S HARD FOR ME TO TELL, BECAUSE  
6 THE LEGEND IS NOT -- DOESN'T PROVIDE THAT DISTINCTION. SO, CAN  
7 YOU GET US A LIST?

8

9 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** YEAH. WE CAN PRODUCE A LIST OF THE PCA  
10 NAMES AND THE JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVE NOT YET AMENDED. AND  
11 THEN TO YOUR FIRST QUESTION ABOUT NOVATO AND ROSS, HAPPY TO  
12 FOLLOW UP WITH YOU. WE ARE IN CONTACT WITH PLANNING DIRECTORS  
13 IN BOTH JURISDICTIONS.

14

15 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY GREAT. IT WOULD HELP IF WE -- ALSO HAVE THAT  
16 INFORMATION. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** COMMISSIONER NOACK.

19

20 **SUE NOACK:** JUST A QUESTION ON THE NOMINATION PROCESS. I DON'T  
21 KNOW HOW -- SOMEBODY CAME UP TO ME AT THE MAYOR'S CONFERENCE  
22 LAST NIGHT, AND I WANTED TO KNOW -- IT WAS THE CITY OF  
23 MARTINEZ, AND I DON'T KNOW -- YOU CAN GIVE ME MORE DETAIL ON  
24 HOW THAT PROCESS FOR NOMINATIONS CAN BE MADE?

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** YEAH WE'RE WORKING ON FINAL DETAILS AND  
2 WE'LL GET THE INFORMATION OUT LIKELY IN THE NEXT MONTH. WE'RE  
3 ALSO DEVELOPING RESOURCES THAT WILL MAKE IT EASY FOR  
4 JURISDICTIONS TO NOMINATE NEW PCAS SO IT WILL BE EASY FOR  
5 FOLKS TO DRAW NEW PCA BOUNDARIES IN AN ONLINE DASHBOARD. THE  
6 PROCESS WILL BE FOR A LOCAL JURISDICTION TO NOMINATE AN AREA  
7 AS PCA, AND ABAG AND MTC STAFF THEN WILL VERIFY THAT IT  
8 CONFORMS TO THE UPDATED PCA PLANNING FRAMEWORK THEN IT GOES  
9 BACK TO THE LOCALS FOR APPROVAL. SO IT HAS TO GO TO THE LOCAL  
10 CITY OR TOWN COUNCIL OR BOARD OF SUPERVISORS OR PARK BOARD FOR  
11 APPROVAL BEFORE COMING BACK TO ABAG FOR DESIGNATION. SO, IT'S  
12 FOUR STEPS. WE'RE WORKING ON A DIAGRAM TO TALK THROUGH THE  
13 TIMELINES OF EACH OF THOSE PHASES. AND WE ANTICIPATE THAT FIRST  
14 PHASE OF NOMINATING A PCA, THROUGH THIS SPRING.

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** TO THE BEGINNING PART, HOW DO THOSE JURISDICTIONS  
17 FIND OUT ABOUT THE APPLICATION PROCESS TO MAKE THEIR  
18 NOMINATION?

19

20 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** YEAH, SO, WE WILL REACH OUT TO PLANNING  
21 DIRECTORS IN EVERY JURISDICTION. WE ALSO HAVE A FAIRLY  
22 EXTENSIVE EXISTING PCA MAILING LIST. WE PLAN ON HOSTING A  
23 WEBINAR PROVIDING DETAILS ON THE PROCESS. THOSE ARE THE MAIN  
24 WAYS THAT WE'LL BE REACHING OUT TO JURISDICTIONS.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **SUE NOACK:** OKAY. OKAY. THANK YOU.

2

3 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. BOARD MEMBER WILLIAMS?

4

5 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** THANK YOU, PRESIDENT. I JUST WANT TO CIRCLE  
6 BACK TO BOARD MEMBER SPERING'S REMARK IN REFERENCE TO SOLANO  
7 COUNTY. AND I WAS JUST LOOKING AT THE ATTACHMENT B SHOWING  
8 THAT JURISDICTIONS WITH EXISTING PCAS THAT STILL NEED TO BE AN  
9 AMENDMENT P ARE THEY IN THE BEGINNING STAGES OF AMENDMENT? OR  
10 ARE WE STILL WAITING TO HEAR BACK FROM THESE PARTICULAR  
11 CITIES? AND THEN, MY SECOND QUESTION THAT I HAVE TWO, THE  
12 SECOND QUESTION IS REFERENCE TO NEXT STEPS IT INDICATES THAT  
13 STAFF WILL PROACTIVELY ENGAGE WITH JURISDICTIONS AND THAT WITH  
14 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. AND SUISUN CITY FALLS UNDER THAT  
15 CATEGORY BUT I DID NOT SEE THEM LISTED. SO I CAN ASSUME  
16 THEY'RE WITHOUT A PCA? I THINK THEY'RE ON THE PREVIOUS MAP  
17 THAT WANT FOR THIS. IT WAS A DIFFERENT MAP. SO THAT MEANS  
18 THEY'RE NOT, RIGHT? OR THEY DON'T HAVE ONE?

19

20 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** I BELIEVE THAT SUISUN CITY DOES NOT  
21 CURRENTLY HAVE A PCA, SO AS PART OF THE NEW NOMINATION  
22 PROCESS, WE WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE AN EXTRA DEGREE OF  
23 ENGAGEMENT TO JURISDICTIONS THAT DON'T HAVE A PCA, BUT HAVE AN  
24 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY. AND SO, THOSE ARE INSTANCE WHERE IS  
25 WE PLAN ON SENDING A KIND OF INDIVIDUAL E-MAIL TO THE



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 JURISDICTION AS OPPOSED TO A KIND OF NEWS LETTER STYLE E-MAIL.  
2 AND THE QUESTION REGARDING WHAT IS THE STATUTES OF DIFFERENT  
3 JURISDICTIONS, IT'S A BIT OF A MIX. ALL JURISDICTIONS HAVE  
4 BEEN CONTACTED THIS PAST SUMMER AND FALL. A NUMBER OF  
5 JURISDICTIONS MADE A STRATEGIC DECISION THAT THEY DIDN'T HAVE  
6 THE TIME AND RESOURCES TO PURSUE THE AMENDMENT AS PART OF WORK  
7 THIS PAST SUMMER AND FALL. SO, WE'LL BE REENGAGING THEM IN  
8 THIS WINTER AND SPRING TO GET THOSE STARTED. AND THEN IN A LOT  
9 OF CASES, JURISDICTIONS MADE THE DECISION THAT THEY WANTED  
10 MORE TIME TO DECIDE WHAT TO DO WITH THE AMENDMENTS AND WANTED  
11 TO ALSO HAVE IT COINCIDE WITH THE OPPORTUNITY FOR NEW  
12 NOMINATIONS. BECAUSE THEY WOULD LIKE TO THINK ABOUT  
13 POTENTIALLY ADJUSTING THOSE BOUNDARIES MORE SIGNIFICANTLY. SO  
14 THEY'RE PLANNING TO DO THEIR AMENDMENT AT THE SAME TIME THEY  
15 MIGHT NOMINATE AN ADDITIONAL PCA.

16

17 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** OKAY. I JUST -- I WAS CONCERNED.

18

19 **MICHAEL GERMERAAD:** SURE.

20

21 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** ABOUT SOLANO COUNTY. I KNOW CAPACITY, A LOT OF  
22 TIMES, HAS TO DO WITH SOLANO COUNTY NOT BEING ABLE TO ALWAYS  
23 SUPPLY WHAT'S NEEDED. BUT WE'LL WORK ON IT. WE'LL GET THERE.

24 [LAUGHTER] ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

25



JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THIS WAS AN INFORMATION ITEM. MR.  
2 I THINK YOU HAVE HEARD FROM THE MEMBERS HERE OF THE COMMITTEE  
3 THAT THERE IS INTEREST IF THERE ARE JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE NOT  
4 THROUGH THE PROCESS I THINK IT WOULD BE WISE TO COPY THE  
5 RESPECTIVE REPRESENTATIVES SO WE CAN INDIVIDUALLY BE ENGAGED  
6 AND IF WE DO HAVE ONE OF THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES IN  
7 OUR AREA LIKE SOLANO COUNTY, I THINK IT WOULD BE PRUDENT TO  
8 MAKE SURE THAT THE APPOINTEE FOR THAT JURISDICTION BOTH ON THE  
9 ABAG AND MTC SIDE ARE ENGAGED IN AND NOTICED ABOUT THAT. THANK  
10 YOU. EXCELLENT. THAT BRINGS US ON YOUR FAVORITE TIME. PUBLIC  
11 COMMENT

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
14 RECEIVED ON THAT ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR  
15 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THAT ITEM.

16

17 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU. THANK YOU.  
18 AND NOW WE'RE DONE WITH THAT ITEM. THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT  
19 WE'LL MOVE TO GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. THIS IS YOUR OPPORTUNITY  
20 TO ADDRESS THIS COMMITTEE. THIS ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE ON  
21 ANY MATTERS NOT AGENDAIZED. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE  
22 BOARDROOM.

23





JANUARY 10, 2025

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN COMMENT RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM  
2 AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS  
3 ITEM.

4

5 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** EXCELLENT THAT. BRINGS US TO  
6 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE  
7 AND THE ABAG ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE WILL BE ON FRIDAY  
8 FEBRUARY 14TH AT 9:40 AT BAY AREA METRO, 375 BEALE. ANY  
9 CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED. WE ARE  
10 ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

11



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*