METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
2	WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 10 TH , 2024, 9:45 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE
6	PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING TO ORDER. THIS
7	MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON MTC'S WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE
8	PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE
9	RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND THE CLERK WILL CALL
10	UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES
11	WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE
12	NUMBER. MAY I ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM WE
13	HAVE A QUORUM?
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CERTAINLY. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
16	
17	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?
20	
21	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
24	
25	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA IS PRESENT. NON-VOTING
3	COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. FLEMMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER
4	HIS STATED HE IS PRESENT. PAPAN?
5	
6	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN? RONEN IS PRESENT. NON-VOTING
9	COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?
10	
11	LIBBY SCHAFF: HERE.
12	
13	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THAO IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM.
14	
15	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. OUR NEXT ITEM IS OUR
16	CONSENT AGENDA. AND THIS INCLUDES ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2G. DO I
17	HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?
18	
19	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.
20	
21	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. A MOTION FROM GLOVER. A SECOND
22	FROM? AND A SECOND FROM MARGARET ABE-KOGA. ARE THERE ANY
23	PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?



CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE. THERE 1 2 IS NO ONE PRESENT IN THE BOARDROOM. AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND 3 WAS RECEIVED. 4 5 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GREAT THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO CLOSE THE PUBLIC COMMENT AND I'M GOING TO COME TO THE BOARD FOR -- I SEE 6 NO PUBLIC COMMENTS, BUT ONLY ACTION. AND WE DON'T HAVE TO DO 7 8 ROLL CALL ALL THOSE IN FAVOR -- OH WE DO. ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE. 9 10 SPEAKER: AYES. 11 12 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: OPPOSED? ABSTENTION. THAT MOTION CARRIES 13 UNANIMOUSLY. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO OUR REGULAR AGENDA. WE 14 HAVE TWO BIG ITEMS. ONE SHOULD BE LESS BIG. AND I'M GOING TO 15 16 MOVE TO 3B MTC RESOLUTION REGIONAL MEASURE THREE PROGRAM AMENDMENTS THIS ITEM INCLUDES SUMMARY OF PUBLIC COMMENTS 17 RECEIVED AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO MODIFY FIVE EXISTING PROJECTS. 18 THEN WE'RE GOING TO COME BACK TO CLIPPER START. BECAUSE I 19 ALWAYS REALLY EXCITE STAFF ON THAT TOPIC. IS IT OKAY IF WE GO 20 21 DO 3B? ALL RIGHT. I'M GOING TO ASK YOU KENNETH TO TAKE IT 22 AWAY. 23 KENNETH KAO: THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS AND CHAIR GOOD MORNING 24

KENNETH KAO MTC STAFF. ITEM THREE IS REGIONAL MEASURE THREE



1	PROGRAM APPROVED BY VOTERS IN 2018 AND IDENTIFY 35 CAPITAL
2	PROJECTS TO BE FUNDED BY INCREASED BRIDGE TOLLS STATUTE ALLOWS
3	THE COMMISSION TO MODIFY ARE. M THREE PROGRAM AFTER CONDUCTING
4	A PUBLIC HEARING. PUBLIC HEARING AT THE DECEMBER 13TH PAC
5	MEETING AND RECEIVED TWO PUBLIC COMMENTS SUMMARIZING THE STAFF
6	REPORT PERIOD CLOSED DECEMBER 30TH AND MTC DID NOT RECEIVE ANY
7	FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS. MODIFYING
8	FIVE CAPITAL PROJECTS SPECIFICALLY REDIRECTING \$16.7 MILLION
9	FROM THE SOLANO INTERCHANGE PROJECT OR SOLANO 80 EXPRESS LANES
10	TOLLS SYSTEM PROJECT WHICH IS PART OF THE BAY AREA EXPRESS
11	LANES PROGRAM PROJECT TWO MODIFY SCOPE OF SONOMA TO MODIFY 101
12	SONOMA NARROWS PROJECT TO MODIFY LIMITS AND JOINT PROJECT
13	SPONSOR TO SR37 IMPROVEMENT PROJECT 23 WHICH RECOGNIZES THAT
14	MTC IS LEADING IMPLEMENTATION ON PORTIONS OF THAT PROJECT. MTC
15	HAS CONSULTED WITH THE PROJECT SPONSORS AND TOGETHER AGREE TO
16	RECOMMEND THE PROPOSED ACTIONS FOR COMMISSION CONSIDERATION.
17	THEREFORE STAFF RECOMMENDS THAT THE COMMISSION REFER MTC
18	RESOLUTION 4621 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. HAPPY TO
19	ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.
20	
21	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. BEFORE I GO TO QUESTIONS FROM

- 21
- MY COLLEAGUES I'M GOING TO SEE IF THERE ARE PUBLIC COMMENTS? 22
- ANY SPEAKERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO MAKE COMMENT. 23



CLERK OF THE BOARD: I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE. NO 1 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN 2 3 CORRESPOND WAS RECEIVED. 4 5 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE THE PUBLIC HEARING COMPONENT. I WILL MOVE TO MY COLLEAGUES TO SEE 6 7 IF ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? SEEING NONE. I'M GOING 8 TO ASK FOR A MOTION. 9 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL. 10 11 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: SECOND? MARGARET SECONDS. ANY OTHER 12 ROBUST DEBATED? ALL THOSE IN FAVOR SAY AYE? 13 14 SPEAKER: AYE. 15 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: JUST ONE MOMENT MADAM CHAIR. 17 18 KATHLEEN KANE: I'M SORRY CHAIR. I THINK WE LOST OUR QUORUM IF 19 I'M COUNTING CORRECTLY. SO BEFORE WE TAKE THIS MOTION WE COULD 20 21 DEPUTIZE CHAIR PEDROZA FOR PURPOSES OF THE MOTION. 22 23 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: SO DONE. 24

25

KATHLEEN KANE: GREAT.



1 2 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: I KNOW I FEEL LIKE BOOM BOOM. ALL IN 3 FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE. 4 5 SPEAKER: AYES. 6 7 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: OPPOSED? ABSTENTION THAT PASSES 8 UNANIMOUSLY WITH ONE DEPUTIZED CHAIR. WE'RE GOING TO GO BACK TO ITEM 3A AND THAT IS THE CLIPPER START PILOT PROGRAM UPDATE. 9 AND I'M GOING TO WELCOME JUDIS, ARE YOU GOING TO BE OUR LEAD 10 SPOKESPERSON HERE? 11 12 JUDIS SANTOS: YES. 13 14 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: ALL RIGHT. I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO 15 16 YOU. 17 JUDIS SANTOS: THANK YOU, CHAIR CHAVEZ AND COMMISSIONERS. COULD 18 STAFF PLEASE PULL UP THE PRESENTATION. GOOD MORNING. JUDIS 19 SANTOS, ASSISTANCE DIRECTOR IMPACT MTC'S OFFICE I'M HERE WITH 20 21 LYSA HALE OPERATIONS AND PROJECT DELIVERY LEAD FOR CLIPPER 22 START. TODAY'S UPDATE IS COMBINATION OF WORK BEING DONE BY MTC 23 WITH SUPPORT FROM PARTICIPATING TRANSIT OPERATORS AND COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS. NEXT SLIDE. TODAY'S UPDATE WILL 24 FOCUS ON EVOLVING AND GROWING THE PROGRAM PHASE THREE ON THIS 25



- 1 SLIDE FAR RIGHT GREEN BOX. WE HAVE COMPLETED PHASE TWO AND
- 2 LAST SUMMER STAFF SHARED KEY LEARNINGS PROPOSED EXTENSION OF
- 3 CLIPPER START TO JUNE 30TH, 2025 AND INTRODUCED LOW-HANGING
- 4 FRUIT STRATEGIES TO BE IMPLEMENTED IMMEDIATELY AND STRATEGIES
- 5 TO FURTHER EXPLORE TO INCREASE CLIPPER START PARTICIPATION.
- 6 SINCE THEN IN PHASE THREE WE ARE FOCUSED ON INCREASING RIDER,
- 7 NEW RIDER PARTICIPATION BY PROVIDING A CONSISTENT 50% TRANSIT
- 8 DISCOUNT, GETTING 100% TRANSIT OPERATOR PARTICIPATION WITH
- 9 TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT USE CLIPPER, CONTINUING TARGETED
- 10 MARKETING OUTREACH AND PROCESS IMPROVEMENTS, AND, LASTLY,
- 11 REMOVING ADDITIONAL BARRIERS WHERE THERE IS LOGISTICAL,
- 12 ADMINISTRATIVE, STRUCTURAL COMMUNICATIONS TO PARTICIPATION
- 13 THAT ARE CURRENTLY UNDERWAY IN A NUTSHELL THE PROGRAM IS
- 14 CONTINUOUSLY EVOLVING IN ORDER TO OPERATIONS EQUITY PLATFORM
- 15 NEXT SLIDE. ACTIVATING FOLLOWING PILLARS MTC EQUITY PLATFORM
- 16 TO DEFINE AND MEASURE ESTABLISHING GOALS AND METRICS E SOLVING
- 17 AND GROWING THE PROGRAM LISTENING AND LEARNING COCREATING
- 18 REFINING THE PREMEDITATE AND APPLYING FEEDBACK WE HAVE
- 19 COMMITTEE AND STAKEHOLDERS CONTINUING TO FOCUS AND DELIVER
- 20 IMPLEMENTING PROGRAM BY UTILIZING RESULTS FROM THE EVALUATION
- 21 TO IMPROVE POLICY PROGRAMS CURRENTLY IMPLEMENTED THROUGH PHASE
- 22 THREE ASSESSMENT. NEXT SLIDE. AS A REMINDER CLIPPER START
- 23 GOALS ARE ON THE LEFT APPROVED IN MAY 2018 VIA RESOLUTION 4320
- 24 ON THE RIGHT ARE THE ELEMENTS OF THE FRAMEWORK WITH MOST
- 25 RECENT REVISIONS IN JUNE 2025. MTC AND TRANSIT AGENCY BOTH



- 1 SUBSIDIZE THE DISCOUNT WILL USE CLIPPER CARD TO RIDE AND
- 2 RECEIVE DISCOUNTS ALL SINGLE RIDE FARES PILOT PHASE OPEN TO
- 3 THOSE WHOSE INCOME IS 200% BELOW POVERTY LEVEL HOUSEHOLD SIZE,
- 4 BEFORE TAXES. NEXT SLIDE. WE'LL TALK ABOUT THAT FURTHER. THIS
- 5 INFOGRAPHIC HIGHLIGHTS CUSTOMER STATISTICS TO DATE FOR CLIPPER
- 6 START THROUGH NOVEMBER 2023. YEAR THREE SHOWS A TOTAL OF
- 7 29,000 APPLICATIONS SUBMITTED AND ENROLLED 25,000 REFLECTING
- 8 PLUS 97% GROWTH COMPARED TO THE FIRST TWO YEARS OF THE
- 9 PANDEMIC. NEARLY 18,000 ACTIVELY USING THE PROGRAM. WE HAVE
- 10 SEEN BIGGEST GROWTH IN NUMBER OF TRIPS TAKEN AND TRANSFERS.
- 11 PARTICIPANTS HAVE TAKEN A TOTAL OF 2.8 MILLION TRIPS USING
- 12 CLIPPER START. LIKEWISE PARTICIPANTS TRANSFER FROM ONE VEHICLE
- 13 TO ANOTHER 582,000 TIMES. THESE STATISTICS REINFORCE THE TREND
- 14 THAT CLIPPER START PARTICIPATION AND RIDERSHIP IS STEADILY
- 15 GROWING EARNING INDIVIDUALS RIDES TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO.
- 16 SANTA CLARA VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY IS A PARTICIPATING
- 17 TRANSIT AGENCY OFFERING 50% DISCOUNT NOW ALL CLIPPER TRANSIT
- 18 AGENCIES IN THE REGION OFFER CLIPPER START DISCOUNTS.
- 19 DEVELOPMENT IN 2024 IS A CONSISTENT REGION-WIDE 50% DISCOUNT A
- 20 SIGNIFICANT INCREASE FOR MANY AGENCIES WE PLAN TO CONTINUE OUR
- 21 EXISTING MARKETING OUTREACH EFFORT WHERE IS WE TARGET LOW-
- 22 INCOME COMMUNITIES AND PRODUCE MATERIALS AND ADVERTISING IN
- 23 MULTIPLE LANGUAGES NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN THE LAST OUARTER OF
- 24 THE FISCAL YEAR ASSESSMENT OF MARKETING OUTREACH WAS CONDUCTED
- 25 USING FOCUS GROUPS, SURVEY, AND INTERVIEWS WITH SOCIAL SERVICE



- 1 AND COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS STAFF. RESULTS REINFORCED
- 2 MARKETS TACTICS THAT INCLUDE REGION WIDE DISCOUNT AND PROMOTE
- 3 CODE TAKING PEOPLE TO THE TARGET WEB SITE. AT THIS TIME
- 4 OPERATORS SUPPORTING ADVERTISING, AND RECOMMENDATION FROM
- 5 ASSESSMENT WAS TO CONTRACT WITH COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS
- 6 TO PROMOTE THE PROGRAM. STAFF WORKED WITH ROOTS COMMUNITIES
- 7 HEALTH CENTER LAST YEAR ON A PILOT BASIS AND THIS YEAR STAFF
- 8 IS CONTRACTING WITH TEN ADDITIONAL COMMUNITY-BASED
- 9 ORGANIZATIONS STAFF IS OPEN TO NEW IDEAS AND RESOURCES SUCH AS
- 10 VIDEOS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NOW SWITCHING GEARS TO THE NEAR-
- 11 TERM. IN KEEPING THE CUSTOMER AT CENTER OF THE WORK, WE ARE
- 12 NOT ONLY IMPLEMENTING LOW-HANGING FRUIT STRATEGIES TO INCREASE
- 13 AWARENESS LIKE IMMEDIATE CHANGES IN MARKETING AND OUTREACH BUT
- 14 ALSO EXPLORING CUSTOMER FOCUSED STRATEGIES TO BREAK DOWN
- 15 DIFFICULT BARRIERS WHICH ARE COMPLEX, MULTI-DIMENSIONAL,
- 16 OPERATIONAL AND POLICY RELATED BARRIERS SPECIFIC TO CLIPPER
- 17 START AND RECOGNIZING THAT THESE BARRIERS ARE ALSO BEING
- 18 EXPERIENCED BY OTHER MTC MEANS BASED POLICY AND PROGRAMS SUCH
- 19 AS EXPRESS LANES START. THESE POTENTIAL STRATEGIES BEING
- 20 EXPLORED TO CUTTING CHALLENGES TO FURTHER REDUCE ADJUSTMENT
- 21 WITH ENROLLMENT MODELS SUCH AS AUTO ENROLLMENT, VERIFICATION
- 22 AND/OR MARKETING ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD WE HAVE HEARD FROM THIS
- 23 COMMITTEE AND STAKEHOLDERS ABOUT BROADENING ACCESS TO CLIPPER
- 24 START ASSESSING BROADER TARGETED POLICY FOR PEOPLE TO BENEFIT
- 25 FROM CLIPPER START, FARE POLICY MORE CONSISTENT AND AFFORDABLE



- 1 FARE POLICY AND LASTLY ENGAGE EXISTING USERS AND FUTURE USERS
- 2 IN DESIGN IMPLEMENTATION AND EVALUATION. THESE CHALLENGES ARE
- 3 BEING ADDRESSED HOLISTICALLY THROUGH INTERRELATED COORDINATED
- 4 INITIATIVES SUCH AS MTC REGIONAL SURVEY STUDY TO FURTHER
- 5 UNDERSTAND TRANSIT RIDER DEMOGRAPHICS AND USER BEHAVIOR,
- 6 COLLECTIVE TRAVEL DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION FROM BAY AREA
- 7 HOUSEHOLDS EVERY OTHER YEAR BENEFITS PORTAL ONE-STOP-SHOP
- 8 CUSTOMER APPLICATION EXPERIENCE FOR MTC'S TRANSPORTATION
- 9 RELATED ACTIVITIES LASTLY TECHNICAL ANALYSIS BEING LAUNCHED
- 10 THIS MONTH TO COMPLETE SUMMER 2024 ASSESSMENT OF VARIOUS
- 11 ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLDS AND ENROLLMENT MODELS. THE GOAL OF
- 12 TYPICAL ANALYSIS IS TO BUILD UNDERSTANDING AT A NATIONAL LEVEL
- 13 RESEARCH AND LOCAL LEVEL AND VARIOUS OPTIONS AND IMPACTS
- 14 SPECIFIC TO CLIPPER START AND HOW AND WHERE POLICIES FOR OTHER
- 15 MEANS BASED PROJECTS ALIGN RELATED TO AUTO ENROLLMENT SELF-
- 16 VERIFICATION AND ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD MODELS. WHY WE DO THIS
- 17 IS BECAUSE THERE'S A BROAD RANGE OF OPTIONS FOR POTENTIAL
- 18 STRATEGIES BEING EXPLORED AND FOR EACH ON THE LEFT IN BLUE,
- 19 HOW EACH OF THESE STRATEGIES IMPACT EASE FOR CUSTOMER USE AND
- 20 PARTICIPATION RATE. WILL THE STRATEGY MAKE IT EASIER FOR THE
- 21 ELIGIBLE TO HAVE ACCESS TO THE BENEFIT RESULTING IN THE
- 22 CUSTOMERS USING THE BENEFIT TO TAKE TRANSIT. WHAT ARE SUBSIDY
- 23 NEEDS? WHAT ARE REGULATORY AND LEGAL CHALLENGES AND ITS
- 24 IMPLEMENTATION AND DECISION-MAKING WITHIN MTC'S AUTHORITY.
- 25 LEGAL ANALYSIS WILL BE CONDUCTED IN PARALLEL OF THIS EFFORT



- 1 AND LASTLY WHAT ARE TIMELINE AND COST IMPLICATIONS TO
- 2 OPERATIONALIZING AND IMPLEMENT. IN YOUR PACKET PROVIDES
- 3 ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND PRELIMINARY ASSUMPTIONS OF CONCEPTS
- 4 BEING EXPLORED. IN ADDITION, THERE ARE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS FOR
- 5 EACH STRATEGY. AUTO ENROLLMENT MEANS ENROLLMENT IN PARTNER
- 6 PROGRAMS ARE ENROLLED INTO CLIPPER START BY DEFAULT. WE HEARD
- 7 FROM FOCUS GROUPS THAT THIS WOULD MAKE IT POTENTIALLY EASIER
- 8 BUT HOW DO WE INCORPORATE CHOICE AND WHAT ROLE COULD AUTO
- 9 ENROLLMENT BE DONE PERHAPS IN COMBINATION AT THE COUNTY LEVEL,
- 10 STATE LEVEL, TRANSIT PEER AGENCY AND/OR AUTOMATE THE ACROSS
- 11 ENROLLMENT AMONG MTC PROGRAMS FOR SELF-VERIFICATION THIS MEANS
- 12 VERIFYING ELIGIBILITY DONE IN DIFFERENT WAYS WITH OBJECTIVE TO
- 13 SIMPLIFIED ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION PROCESS OPTIONS INCLUDE
- 14 EXPANDED AUTOMATED PARTNERING WITH STATE GOVERNMENT INITIATIVE
- 15 LIKE COUNTY INTEGRATED TRAVEL PROJECT SUPPORTED BY CALIFORNIA
- 16 STATE TRANSPORTATION AGENCY AND CALTRANS COMMUNITY BASE
- 17 ORGANIZATION VERIFICATION OR APPLICANT'S ELIGIBILITY WILL BE
- 18 IDENTIFIED COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION FOR EXAMPLE, SAN MATEO
- 19 101 EXPRESS PROGRAM WITH COUNTY CORE SERVICE AGENCY NETWORK OF
- 20 LOCAL NON-PROFITS. AND LASTLY OPEN VERIFICATION WHERE
- 21 APPLICANTS DECLARE ON THE APPLICATION THAT THEIR INCOME FALLS
- 22 WITHIN THE ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD. FOR ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD
- 23 WHAT SHOULD ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD BE TO PARTICIPATE IN
- 24 BENEFITS WHAT IS THE INCOME ALLOWABLE ADJUSTMENT AND WHAT
- 25 SHOULD BE THE ELIGIBILITY THRESHOLD DEFINITION BE, USING



- 1 FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL AT OR BELOW 200% SHOULD IT BE DEFINED AT
- 2 ANOTHER LEVEL OTHER THAN FEDERAL SUCH AS AREA NEED YAM INCOME
- 3 AT THE COUNTY LEVEL AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. STAFF PLANS ON
- 4 COMING BACK AND REPORTING DRAFT FINDINGS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
- 5 NEXT STEPS FOR CLIPPER START IS TO CONTINUE MONITORING THE
- 6 PROGRAM WITH CUSTOMER STATISTICS WITH THE ADDITION OF
- 7 [INDISCERNIBLE] STARTING JANUARY 1ST CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENTS
- 8 IN MARKETING OUTREACH EFFORTS AND FOR CROSS AGENCY STAFF
- 9 CONDUCTING INTERRELATED ACTIVITIES LIKE SURVEY AND TECHNICAL
- 10 ANALYSIS TO INFORM POTENTIAL CLIPPER START PROGRAM
- 11 ENHANCEMENTS AND WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO ADDRESS ANY QUESTIONS
- 12 OR COMMENTS YOU MAY HAVE.
- 14 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: I'M GOING TO FIRST SEE IF THERE ARE ANY
- 15 COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC.
- 17 CLERK OF THE BOARD: WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE
- 18 WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD
- 19 YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE?
- 21 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: TWO MINUTES, PLEASE.
- 23 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY.
- 25 CLERK OF THE BOARD: OKAY. CALLER RANDI KINMAN.

13

16

20

22



1	
2	RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY
3	COUNCIL. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW HOW OUR CAMPUSES, ESPECIALLY OUR
4	COMMUNITY COLLEGES CAN GET INVOLVED IN THIS. WE HAVE, IN THE
5	PAST, PROVIDED FREE TRANSIT PASSES TO OUR STUDENTS. MY
6	PARTICULAR DISTRICT, WEST VALLEY MISSION, PROVIDES ALL THREE -
7	- WE'RE ON A PILOT PROGRAM, SO OUR STUDENTS RECEIVE FREE
8	TUITION, FREE PARKING, FREE CHILD CARE, FREE BOOKS, YOU NAME
9	IT, FREE EVERYTHING. AND DUE TO THAT, WE COLLECT AND WE
10	REGISTER THEM FOR CAL-FRESH. THEY RECEIVE A NUMBER OF BENEFITS
11	ALREADY, SO WE HAVE ALL OF THAT DATA. THE ONE THING THAT WE'RE
12	MISS SUGGEST OUR ABILITY TO MAKE SURE THEY HAVE TRANSIT
13	PASSES. SO I DO THINK THIS IS A HUGE CHUNK OF PEOPLE THAT WE
14	ARE MISSING. THEY QUALIFY. WE HAVE STAFF THAT ARE ALREADY
15	COLLECTING THIS INFORMATION. IT'S PART OF THE DATABASE WE WORK
16	WITH TO PROVIDE SERVICES FOR OUR STUDENTS AND IT WOULD GREATLY
17	IMPROVE THEIR LIVES AS SOME OF THEM ARE, EVEN WITH WHAT WE CAN
18	PROVIDE FOR THEM, THEY'RE STILL WORKING TWO JOBS. THEY'RE
19	TRAVELLING FROM COUNTY TO COUNTY, ESPECIALLY THE PEOPLE AT
20	MISSION WHO LIVE CLOSE TO THE EDGE OF OTHER COUNTIES. AND I
21	WOULD APPRECIATE BEING CONSIDERED AS PART OF THE SOLUTION FOR
22	MOVING THIS PROGRAM INTO THIS PARTICULAR COHORT OF PEOPLE.

24

23

THANK YOU.



1	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU, CALLER. AND THERE IS NO FURTHER
2	PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE
3	
4	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GREAT. AND NO WRITTEN COMMENT.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND AND NO ONE IN THE
7	ROOM.
8	
9	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: I WILL CLOSE THE PUBLIC COMMENT AND GO IT
10	MY COLLEAGUE. MISS PAPAN?
11	
12	GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. YOU'RE NOT GOING TO SHUT OFF MY MIC,
13	ARE YOU? WHY DO WE ONLY GO TO 64. 19 TO 64 AGE GROUP? SENIORS
14	ARE BECOMING MOST AT RISK.
15	
16	SPEAKER: THERE CURRENTLY IS A DISCOUNT FOR SENIORS AND THERE'S
17	A CATEGORY THAT RANGES AT MINIMUM 60% ACROSS THE AGENCIES.
18	
19	GINA PAPAN: 60% I LIKE THAT NUMBER.
20	
21	SPEAKER: 60% ACROSS THE REGION AND 65 FOR SENIOR CATEGORY.
22	
23	GINA PAPAN: YOU CAN PUT IN A FOOTNOTE, 65 OR OLDER SENIOR
24	DISCOUNTS ARE AVAILABLE.



JUDIS SANTOS: I'M GOING TO DEFER TO OUR OPERATIONS LEAD. 1 2 LYSA HALE: THIS PROGRAM REQUIRES TO YOU GET RECERTIFIED EVERY 3 TWO YEARS BECAUSE PEOPLE'S INCOME LEVELS CHANGE OVER TIME. 4 5 HOPEFULLY PEOPLE ARE INCREASING THEIR INCOME LEVELS AND NO MAY LONGER NEED THE PROGRAM. AND THE REASON WE SET IT UP THIS WAY 6 IS BECAUSE YOU CAN GET A SENIOR CLIPPER CARD THAT NEVER 7 8 REQUIRES REENROLLMENT. SADLY, NONE OF US ARE GETTING YOUNGER. SO, ONCE YOU OUALIFY FOR A SENIOR CLIPPER CARD, YOU CAN USE 9 10 THAT FOR THE REST OF YOUR LIFE AND YOU DON'T NEED TO REAPPLY. 11 GINA PAPAN: OKAY YEAH. AND AS FAR AS INCOMES GROWING, UNLESS 12 YOU HAVE PAID YOUR INSURANCE LATELY, FOR MOST PEOPLE, PEOPLE 13 ARE LOSING MONEY. SO, YEAH, I'M CONCERNED ABOUT ALL THAT. MY 14 15 DISTRICT HAS THREE COMMUNITY COLLEGES. SO I'M INTERESTED IN 16 THAT. AND THEN, ALSO, I'LL DEFER TO MY FRIENDS ON THE CALTRAIN 17 BOARD. THE GO PASS AND HOW THAT IS INCORPORATED, WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND, ALSO, MAJOR BUSINESSES. MAJOR EMPLOYERS. I THINK 18 WE REALLY NEED TO -- PEOPLE ARE COMMUTING. HUGE DIFFERENCES 19 FOR EMPLOYMENT -- DISTANCES -- EXCUSE ME -- SO, THE MORE 20 21 EMPLOYERS WE CAN GET ON BOARD WOULD BE VERY, VERY HELPFUL. AND FINALLY, HERE, I'M VERY INTERESTED, I THINK IT WAS MENTIONED 22 EARLIER, TRANSFERS, IF WE ARE COLLECTING DATA ON TRANSFERS 23 BETWEEN OPERATORS. BECAUSE A LOT OF PEOPLE HAVE TO GO FROM --24

WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT FREE TRANSFERS WHICH WOULD BE GREAT. SO



- 1 ANY DATA WE COLLECT ON THAT, I THINK IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT.
- 2 BECAUSE PEOPLE GETTING TO AND FROM WORK ARE GENERALLY TAKING
- 3 MULTIPLE OPERATORS. AND THEN TO TUTORIALS. I'M JUST GOING TO
- 4 SAY. BECAUSE I GOT MY OLD FASHIONED CLIPPER CARD, AND I STILL
- 5 CAN'T GET IT ON MY PHONE OR WHATEVER.

6

7 CINDY CHAVEZ: ANDY WILL HELP YOU.

8

- 9 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: VIDEO TUTORIALS WOULD BE EXCEPTIONALLY
- 10 HELPFUL. I THINK I MENTIONED IT BEFORE. LIKE, SOME TECHIES
- 11 CAME TO TOWN, TRIED TO GO ON OUR WEB SITE, BUT YOU HAVE TO GO
- 12 THROUGH, LIKE, APPLE PAY, OR SOMETHING? I'M JUST SAYING, THE
- 13 TECHIES COULDN'T FIGURE IT OUT. SO A LITTLE FURTHER
- 14 EXPLANATION ON HOW YOU ACTUALLY GET ONE WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL.
- 15 AND I'M NOT ONE OF THOSE EXPERTS.

16

- 17 CINDY CHAVEZ: COULD YOU RESPOND -- I HAVE A LIST -- BUT IF YOU
- 18 COULD START WITH THE CONNECTION TO THE COMMUNITY COLLEGES AND
- 19 THEN THE YOUTUBE TUTORIALS AND I FORGOT THE OTHER ONE. OH
- 20 BETTER UNDERSTANDING, I THINK THE CONNECTION BETWEEN ALL THE
- 21 DIFFERENT PROGRAMS INCLUDING GO PASS RELATIVE TO THIS.

22

- 23 JUDIS SANTOS: I WILL DEFER THE PROJECT DELIVERY QUESTIONS TO
- 24 LYSA.



1	LYSA HALE: COMMUNITY COLLEGES, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF COMMUNITY
2	COLLEGES AS NOTED THAT DO PROVIDE TRANSIT PASSES TO THEIR
3	STUDENTS. SO WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH THE COLLEGES WHO DON'T
4	PROVIDE PASSES TO THEIR STUDENTS. SO ASSUMING THOSE ARE THE
5	STUDENTS WHO NEED THE MOST HELP, BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT ALREADY
6	GETTING ASSISTANCE, WITH PURCHASING TRANSIT PASSES. SO, THIS
7	IS A SINGLE RIDE PROGRAM. SO YOU CAN GET DISCOUNTS ON SINGLE
8	RIDES, AND WE'RE CURRENTLY REACHING OUT TO WE HAVE ALREADY
9	GOT FIVE COMMUNITY COLLEGES ON BOARD. I DO NOT REMEMBER THE
10	NAMES OF THEM BUT CERTAINLY CAN GET BACK TO YOU ON NAMES ON
11	WHO THEY ARE. BUT WE'RE REACHING OUT TO ALL OF THE OTHERS AS
12	WE SPEAK.
13	
14	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: ONE THING I WOULD LIKE TO OFFER, IS
15	IRRESPECTIVE WHETHER A COMMUNITY COLLEGE IS INVESTING I THINK
16	WE WANT TO HAVE ONE PROGRAM THAT EVERYBODY CAN PARTICIPATE IN,
17	WITH SPENDING MORE ON FOOD FOR THE KIDS OR WHATEVER, I THINK
18	WE SHOULD HAVE A ONE-STOP-SHOP AND NOT PENALIZE PEOPLE WHO ARE
19	HELPING THEIR STUDENTS.
20	
21	LYSA HALE: CAN I ADDRESS THE YOUTUBE VIDEOS?
22	
23	CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GINA WILL STAR IN IT FOR YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



LYSA HALE: IT'S A CLIPPER START THING AND MORE A CLIPPER 1 2 THING. WE HAVE SOME VIDEOS ON OUR WEB SITE. IF YOU GO, IT 3 TELLS YOU EXACTLY HOW TO PUT A CARD ON YOUR PHONE. SO, HOPEFULLY IF THOSE ARE NOT CLEAR, THEN WE NEED TO GO BACK AND 4 5 REVISIT THEM AND MAKE SURE WE HAVE DONE THEIR MORE CLEARLY. 6 GINA PAPAN: IF I MAY, THROUGH THE CHAIR? IT'S NOT ONLY PUTTING 7 8 CARD ON THE PHONE IT'S THE TRANSFER. 9 LYSA HALE: WE'RE CONTINUING TO DEVELOP A NUMBER OF VIDEOS 10 BETWEEN NOW AND THE TIME THAT OUR NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER 11 LAUNCHES WE'RE LOOKING AT DEVELOPING 15 OR 16 MORE VIDEOS THAT 12 PROVIDE INSTRUCTION ON NOT ONLY THIS, BUT ON ALL THE OTHER NEW 13 FEATURES IN THE NEW SYSTEM. 14 15 16 GINA PAPAN: I'LL TALK TO MY AGENT ABOUT THAT. 17 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: SO WE'LL WANT TO SEE. NEXT MEETING WE'RE 18 GOING TO TEST YOU. THE OTHER ISSUE WAS COMMUNICATING WITH 19 SENIORS. LIKE, HOW THAT -- BECAUSE I DO THINK -- YOU KNOW 20 21 WHAT, WHEN WE HAVE MULTIPLE PROGRAMS, I AM INTERESTED IN HOW

23

22

- 24 LYSA HALE: WE HAVEN'T BEEN COMMUNICATING SPECIFICALLY TO
- 25 SENIORS, BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT ELIGIBLE FOR THE PROGRAM. WE HAVE

WE'RE JUST MAKING IT EASY FOR FOLKS TO ACCESS THE SERVICE.



BEEN FOCUSING OUR EFFORTS ON THE 19 TO 64 RANGE OF PEOPLE WHO 1 2 ARE ELIGIBLE FOR THE PROGRAM. 3 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: AN OBSERVATION ON THIS FRONT, WHEN WE 4 5 START TO ADOPT MORE HEALTH INSURANCE PLANS WHEN PRESIDENT OBAMA WAS SUCCESSFUL IN CREATING OBAMACARE, ONE OF THE THINGS 6 WE LEARNED AT A LOCAL LEVEL THAT WAS WE TREATED EVERYBODY WHO 7 8 CAME TO US, AS A CLIENT FOR SOMETHING. AND ONE THING WE MIGHT WANT TO THINK ABOUT AS WE'RE MULTIPLYING PROGRAMS IS HOW WE 9 HAVE A ONE-STOP-SHOP THAT THEN APPLIES THE PROGRAM TO THE 10 PERSON. SO, I APPRECIATE THE POINT YOU'RE RAISING, BUT I WOULD 11 WANT TO BETTER UNDERSTAND HOW THE CUSTOMER SERVICE MODEL -- BY 12 THE WAY, NOT JUST FOR MTC, BUT YOU KNOW, THAT AWFUL OUR 13 TRANSIT AGENCIES NEED TO HAVE A DIFFERENT APPROACH. I'M 14 15 FASCINATED WITH HOW MUCH -- HOW MANY DIFFERENT OFFERINGS WE 16 HAVE THAT AREN'T CLEAR. 17 LYSA HALE: WE'RE ACTUALLY LOOKING AT THAT. JUDIS MENTIONED IN 18 THE PRESENTATION, A UNIFIED APPLICATION PORTAL. THE IDEA RIGHT 19 NOW IS PEOPLE DO HAVE TO GO TO DIFFERENT WEB SITES TO APPLY 20 21 FOR THESE DIFFERENT PROGRAMS. SO WE'RE LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN CONSOLIDATE THAT. SO WE'RE WORKING ON IT. 22 23

CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GOOD. JOSEFOWITZ?

24



NICK JOSEFOWITZ: TERRIFIC YOU'RE GOING TO BE EXPLORING 1 ALTERNATIVES FOR CLIPPER START. ARE YOU GOING TO BE EXPLORING 2 THEM FOR OTHER MEANS BASED PROGRAMS? 3 4 5 JUDIS SANTOS: WE'RE LOOKING AT HOW IT IMPACTS CLIPPER START BUT ALSO EXPRESS LANES START AS WELL AS SR37. 6 7 8 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: WHY ARE I MEAN IF WE'RE THINKING ABOUT AUTO ENROLLMENT AND SELF-VERIFICATION FOR CLIPPER START AND EXPRESS 9 10 LANES START WHY ARE WE NOT LOOKING AT FOR MEANS BASED PROGRAMS FOR BRIDGE TOLLS. 11 12 ALIX BOCKELMAN: THROUGH THE CHAIR, ALIX BOCKELMAN, DEPUTY 13 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. WE DO HAVE AN INTERNAL TEAM LESSONS 14 15 LEARNED BOTH AT THE FEDERAL OR NATIONALLY AT THE STATE LEVEL 16 WE WILL GET THAT AND BE ABLE TO APPLY THOSE LESSONS LEARNED TO ALL PROGRAMS INCLUDING PAYMENT PLANS AGAIN WHAT'S POSSIBLE AND 17 WHAT'S BEING DONE IN OTHER PLACES WE HAVE A TEAM ACROSS THE 18 AGENCY THAT WORK ON DIFFERENT PROGRAMS AT THE TABLE FOR THAT 19 WORK. 20 21 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: JUST SO I UNDERSTAND, THE TECHNICAL ANALYSIS 22 23 IS GOING TO LOOK AT SPECIFIC REVENUE IMPACTS TO A PARTICULAR PROGRAM? OR JUST HIGH-LEVEL? 24



- 1 ALIX BOCKELMAN: YEAH WE'LL HAVE TO PAIR IT WITH THAT PART
- 2 REVENUE IMPACT. FOR CLIPPER START IT MAY LOOK AT SOME OF
- 3 THESE. BUT I THINK SOME OF THE REAL, YOU KNOW, WHAT THIS MEANS
- 4 FOR THE CUSTOMER, WHAT'S ALREADY AVAILABLE, YOU KNOW, LEGAL
- 5 ISSUES, ESPECIALLY AROUND PRIVACY AND PERSONAL IDENTIFIABLE
- 6 INFORMATION, YOU KNOW, THAT CAN BE A REAL BARRIER FOR US JUST
- 7 BEING ABLE TO ENROLL PEOPLE. SO, I THINK SOME OF THOSE THINGS,
- 8 SOME OF THE ISSUES AROUND, YOU KNOW, THE FEDERAL POVERTY
- 9 LEVEL, ET CETERA, LIKE THOSE THINGS, I THINK, CAN BE LESSONS
- 10 LEARNED ACROSS PROGRAMS. BUT SPECIFIC IMPACTS WE'LL HAVE TO
- 11 RECOGNIZE, THIS IS NOT ALL PART OF ONE TECHNICAL ANALYSIS SO
- 12 THAT WILL BE PAIRED WITH IT.
- 14 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: NICK MAY I JUMP IN JUST TO ASK THIS
- 15 OUESTION? I ACTUALLY THINK, YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE A PARAGRAPH
- 16 ABOUT WHAT'S BEING ASSESSED IN A STRATEGIC COORDINATED WAY,
- 17 AND IT'S A VERY HIGH-LEVEL EXACTLY AS YOU SAID, WE'RE ALL
- 18 TALKING TO EACH OTHER AND LOOKING AT NEW WAYS TO DO THIS,
- 19 INCLUDING WHETHER OR NOT -- I'M PRESUMING THAT ALSO INCLUDES
- 20 WHAT'S THE APPROPRIATE LEVEL OF POVERTY, WHAT I JUST WANTED TO
- 21 SAY IS I REALLY WANT TO IMPLORE, THROUGH THE CHAIR OF OUR
- 22 BOARD AND THE STAFF THAT THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE
- 23 SOMETHING THAT IS AD-HOC, AS I MENTIONED IN THE EARLIER
- 24 MEETING. BECAUSE I DO THINK THAT YOU WANT MEMBERS OF THE
- 25 BOARD, PERHAPS, FROM DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS, EVEN, TO HAVE



- 1 THIS CONVERSATION. BECAUSE I THINK THIS ACTUALLY SPEAKS TO A
- 2 BIGGER ISSUE WHICH IS -- AND LET ME JUST SAY, IN THIS
- 3 INSTANCE, ONE OF THE QUESTIONS I WOULD BE ASKING IS NOT JUST
- 4 HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE USING THE PROGRAM, BUT CAN WE LEARN THAT
- 5 THIS IS ACTUALLY INCREASING PEOPLE'S DESIRE TO USE OUR SERVICE
- 6 INSTEAD OF UBER AND LYFT. BECAUSE I THINK THIS IS -- AND AGAIN
- 7 I'M GOING TO USE THE HEALTH CARE INDUSTRY, AND WHAT I HAVE
- 8 LEARNED IN THE COUNTY AND THAT IS ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S
- 9 VERY APPEALING ABOUT THE COUNTY HEALTH SYSTEM -- AND I'M SURE
- 10 THIS IS TRUE IN SAN FRANCISCO AS WELL, BUT SAN CLAIR'S DIVERSE
- 11 LANGUAGES, IF YOU ARE A MEDICAL PATIENT YOU CAN GO TO THE
- 12 PRIVATE SECTOR AND WE'RE COMPETING FOR THOSE FOLKS. SO, I
- 13 THINK THESE ARE EXCITING NUMBERS. I'M VERY INTERESTED AND I'M
- 14 SURE THIS IS WHAT YOU WERE REFERRING TO IN THE DIARIES, WHO IS
- 15 USING THIS, AND WHAT THEY THINK IS ANOTHER CHEAP TRIP ON A
- 16 SINGLE USE, AND THE BIGGER QUESTION IS, WHAT IS THE BUY-IN FOR
- 17 A LOWER USE. AND THIS GOES BACK TO THE PAYMENT PLAN ISSUE WE
- 18 WERE JUST TALKING ABOUT WHICH IS, AND CAN YOU PAY EVERY TIME
- 19 YOUR CHECK COMES, IT AUTOMATICALLY, A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF MONEY
- 20 GOES TO YOUR CLIPPER CARD, OR YOUR PRODUCT CARD. BECAUSE
- 21 THAT'S -- YOU HAVE CHANGED YOUR MODE OF TRANSPORTATION. SO I
- 22 WOULD JUST THINK THAT THIS IS ONE OF THOSE AREAS THAT GET A
- 23 LOT OF UNDERSTANDING FROM THE BOARD, AND A LOT OF BUY-IN. AND
- 24 I DON'T THINK YOU NEED A TON OF US. BUT THE ONES, YOU KNOW,
- 25 SOME SUBSET OF BOARD THAT HAVE, YOU KNOW, HAVE THOUGHTS ON



THIS, I THINK, WOULD BE VERY BENEFICIAL. BECAUSE OTHER WORDS 1 2 WE'RE GOING TO BE RUNNING AROUND THEM. 3 LYSA HALE: IF I CAN ADDRESS THAT, WE ACTUALLY HAVE IN CLIPPER 4 5 A FEATURE CALLED AUTOLOAD WHERE IF YOUR BALANCE FALLS BELOW A 6 CERTAIN AMOUNT IT CAN AUTOMATICALLY BE RELOADED IN THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM RIGHT NOW IT HAS GOT THE LIMITATION 7 8 OF \$10. IN THE FUTURE OF CLIPPER SYSTEM, YOU WILL BE ABLE TO SET IT UP SO YOU CAN TIE IT TO A PARTICULAR DAY, SET IT UP SO 9 YOU CAN HAVE IT DONE, YOU KNOW, THE FIRST AND THIRD MONDAYS OF 10 THE MONTH. SO, IT'S GOING TO GIVE A LOT MORE FLEXIBILITY. 11 12 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: WELL, LET ME JUST SAY THE OTHER THING 13 WOULD BE THINKING ABOUT, AND THIS GOES BACK TO THE ANNUAL, IF 14 YOU AGREE TO AN ANNUAL DRAWDOWN, THAT IT WOULDN'T MATTER WHEN 15 16 YOUR MONEY CAME, BECAUSE YOU WOULD HAVE A CERTAIN NUMBER OF RIDES YOU COULD USE ALL YEAR LONG. I MEAN WHAT WE USED TO CALL 17 LAY AWAY PRODUCTS, I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BE 18 AGGRESSIVE RELATED TO SERVICES ESPECIALLY PUBLIC SERVICES 19 THOSE ARE KINDS OF THINGS THAT WOULD BE WORTH DIVING INTO AT 20 21 ANNE AD-HOC LEVEL. AND NICK THANK YOU FOR LETTING ME JUMP IN. 22 I APOLOGIZE. 23 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: NO. I THINK THAT WAS GREAT. I ALSO HAVE 24

SIMILAR COMMENTS. NOW THAT I HAVE COME DOWN A BIT FROM WHAT I



- 1 SAID EARLIER IN THE PREVIOUS MEETING. I STILL DON'T HAVE GREAT 2 SENSE OF WHAT SUCCESS LOOKS LIKE FOR THIS PROGRAM. WOULD
- 3 ANYBODY LIKE -- IS THAT SOMEBODY PEOPLE HAVE BUT JUST HAVEN'T
- 4 PUT ON A SLIDE, LIKE WHAT DOES SUCCESS LOOK LIKE RATHER THAN
- 5 DOING BETTER THAN WE WERE DOING LAST WEEK?

- 7 MELANIE CHOY: MELANIE CHOY WITH REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT.
- 8 IN TERMS OF SUCCESS IN THE PROGRAM WE HAVE HAD EVALUATION AS
- 9 YOU HAVE SEEN IN THE SLIDE DECK, EVALUATION OF YEARS 1 AND 2
- 10 IN THE DATA, THEN YEAR THREE OF DATA IN THE SLIDE DECK IN
- 11 TERMS OF WHERE WE'RE AT IN TERMS OF DEFINING SUCCESS CURRENTLY
- 12 I DON'T THINK WE HAVE AS INDICATED IN THE PREVIOUS
- 13 CONVERSATION A SPECIFIC METRIC TARGET OUANTITATIVE GOAL THAT
- 14 YOU HAVE STATED CONSIDERATIONS THAT WERE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT IS
- 15 THAT WHEN WE ENTERED CLIPPER START PROGRAM BACK IN 2018 PLANS
- 16 AND PROJECTIONS WERE QUITE HIGH AT THAT TIME, AND THEN 2020
- 17 HIT WITH THE PANDEMIC AND WE ROLLED OUT CLIPPER START PROGRAM
- 18 IN THE SAME YEAR THAT THE PANDEMIC HIT THEN THE NUMBERS AND
- 19 USAGE WAS JUST UNPREDICTABLE AND VARIED. NOW THAT IT'S THREE
- 20 YEARS UNDER OUR BELT IN THIS PROGRAM ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE
- 21 DOING IN PARALLEL WITH THIS ANALYSIS IS TO RELOOK AT THAT
- 22 DEFINITION OF SUCCESS, OUR DEFINITION OF SUCCESS INCLUDES
- 23 METRICS SUCH AS INCREASING THE ACCESS AND MOBILITY FOR USERS
- 24 THEN WE HAD A NUMBER OF THINGS WE WERE AIMING FOR WITH THIS
- 25 PROGRAM BUT IN TERMS OF QUANTITATIVE SUCCESSES LOOKING AT 1 TO



3 YEAR DATA IN TERMS OF USAGE WE WILL TAKE THAT AND IN 1 PARALLEL WITH THIS WORK COME UP WITH A DEFINITION. AND MAYBE 2 3 I'LL GO ALSO CROSSWALK TO UNDER THE RNM COMMITTEE AND RNM WORK ITSELF THERE IS ALSO DISCUSSION ABOUT PERFORMANCE METRICS AND 4 5 KPIS AND SO THERE IS LIKELY TO BE A DISCUSSION THAT LOOKS AT IT SO THAT WE'RE COMPREHENSIVELY LANDING ON THE SAME METRIC 6 7 THROUGH THE THESE PROGRAMS. 8 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: SO I CAN JUST ASK MAYBE A MORE -- SORRY, 9 10 ALIX. 11 ALIX BOCKELMAN: I WAS GOING TO ADD ONE THING TO WHAT MELANIE 12 SAID AND THAT WAS WHEN WE CAME TO YOU AND ASKED YOU TO EXTEND 13 THE PILOT IT WAS NOT BECAUSE WE FELT WE WERE ACHIEVING SUCCESS 14 15 THAT WE NEEDED FOR THIS PROGRAM AND THAT'S WHY WE DID NOT WANT 16 TO GO TO A REGULAR PROGRAM YET. I GUESS THE ITEM OF CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT, DURING COVID WE WEREN'T COLLECTING FARES FOR A 17 WHILE ON MOST OF OUR SYSTEMS. SO WITH MARKETING IT'S KIND OF 18 LIKE WE'RE SOMETIMES AT 20%. JUST THIS JANUARY HAVE WE BEEN 19 ABLE TO SAY YOU CAN SIGN UP GET THIS DISCOUNT AT 50% ON EVERY 20 21 SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA. I THINK THAT'S VERY POWERFUL. SO, I WANT TO SAY THAT I DON'T THINK WE DON'T THINK WE HAVE ACHIEVED 22 SUCCESS. WE HAVE SPENT A LOT IN THIS PROGRAM AND NOT MANY 23 PEOPLE ARE GETTING THE BENEFIT. WHEN WE FIRST STARTED TALKING 24

ABOUT THIS WHEN WE FIRST MOVED INTO THIS BUILDING, ANYWAYS IT



- 1 WAS A LONG TIME AGO. I THINK YOU ALL WANTED US TO ACHIEVE, TO 2 REACH 50% OF THE ELIGIBLE PEOPLE. EVEN YOU SAID THAT WAS NOT
- 3 GOOD ENOUGH AND WE WERE LOOKING AT COMPARISONS, I MAY NOT HAVE
- 4 ALL THE PERCENTAGES. IT WAS A LONG TIME AGO. BUT WE ARE
- 5 NOWHERE NEAR THAT. WE'RE LOOKING AT ALL THE THINGS TO GET THIS
- 6 INTO THE HANDS OF PEOPLE BECAUSE THE PEOPLE THAT HAVE IT IT'S
- 7 MEANINGFUL AND IS MAKING A DIFFERENCE BUT WE DON'T NOT HAVE
- 8 THIS IN THE HANDS OF ENOUGH PEOPLE. THAT'S WHAT THIS IS KIND
- 9 OF ALL ABOUT.

- 11 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I APPRECIATE THAT ALIX IT'S REFRESHING. AND I
- 12 HOPE THAT'S THE, SORT OF, SPIRIT AND HONEST SELF-ASSESSMENT
- 13 THAT WE CAN CARRY THROUGH IN A QUANTITATIVE WAY ON AN ONGOING
- 14 BASIS AS WE GET THESE PRESENTATIONS. WE KNOW THESE THINGS ARE
- 15 DIFFICULT AND IT'S ONLY BY BEING HONEST WITH OURSELVES AND
- 16 WITH THE COMMISSION, ALIX THANK YOU FOR THE HONESTY. IT'S
- 17 REFRESHING. TWO OF THE METRICS WE HAD PREVIOUSLY SPOKEN ABOUT
- 18 WHICH ARE MAYBE WORTH REUPPING, AND I THINK IMPORTANT TO
- 19 UNDERSTAND WHEN WE GET REPORTS OUT ON THESE THINGS ARE WHAT
- 20 YOU SAID, THE PERCENTAGE OF ELIGIBLE PARTICIPANTS THAT ARE
- 21 ACTUALLY ENROLLED, EITHER IN CLIPPER START OR IN SOME OTHER
- 22 DISCOUNT PROGRAM, I KNOW SAN FRANCISCO FOR INSTANCE HAS --
- 23 MANY OTHER AGENCIES HAVE THEIR OWN DISCOUNT PROGRAMS AND THOSE
- 24 DISCOUNT PROGRAMS MIGHT WORK WELL FOR PEOPLE AND THEY DON'T
- 25 NEED TO ENROLL IN CLIPPER START. THAT NUMBER KIND OF



- 1 CONSTANTLY REFRESHED UPDATES WOULD BE HELPFUL. AND WHAT
- 2 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ MENTIONED, I THINK IT WAS COMMISSIONER
- 3 CHAVEZ, ABOUT WHETHER PEOPLE ARE NOW TAKING MORE TRIPS AS A
- 4 RESULT OF GETTING ON CLIPPER START AND IF IT'S ACTUALLY
- 5 DRIVING TRANSIT USAGE PRESUMABLY AND ENHANCING PEOPLE'S
- 6 MOBILE. AND I THINK THOSE TWO STATISTICS, IF WE HAVE A GOAL OF
- 7 LIKE WHAT THOSE ARE, WOULD BE THE ONES THAT ARE -- THAT I
- 8 THINK WOULD BE UNAVAILABLE FOR ME TO ACCESS THE SUCCESS OF THE
- 9 PROGRAM AND HOPEFULLY CAN BE SOMETHING THIS WE ALL KIND OF --
- 10 WELL, MAYBE -- IT MIGHT -- I SUGGEST TO MY COLLEAGUES THOSE
- 11 ARE STATISTICS THAT WE COULD WRAP, SORT OF, AGREE THAT THOSE
- 12 ARE THE TOP PRIORITY FOR THIS PROGRAM.
- 14 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE].
- 16 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I AM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
- 18 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: MARGARET.
- 20 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER
- 21 JOSEFOWITZ'S COMMENTS. I WAS THINKING ABOUT THIS PROGRAM AND
- 22 OTHERS, I THINK THE GOAL IS ALWAYS TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP. SO,
- 23 BUT I'M ASSUME THAT'S OUR GOAL. AND THAT IT WOULD BE GOOD TO
- 24 SEE THE CHANGE IN THE NUMBERS. BECAUSE I KNOW THAT, AS WE
- 25 SUBSIDIZE, RIGHT, WE NEED TO INCREASE THE RIDERSHIP TO MAKE UP

13

15

17



- 1 THAT -- THE LOSS IN REVENUE TO BE ABLE TO STAY AT LEAST EVEN
- 2 AND HOPEFULLY GET INTO A MORE PROFITABLE SITUATION. BUT I'M
- 3 GOING TO GO BACK TO MY PREVIOUS QUESTION. ARE WE LOOKING AT
- 4 INCLUDING THE BRIDGE TOLL AS PART OF THE PROGRAM AND HOW DOES
- 5 THIS INTERFACE WITH FASTRAK DOWN THE ROAD?

6

- 7 ANDREW FREMIER: THAT'S A COMPLICATED QUESTION BUT WE DID GET
- 8 THE ASSIGNMENT TODAY TO TALK ABOUT IT BIT MORE. THE BRIDGES
- 9 ARE NOT ELIGIBLE FOR A SUBSIDY PROGRAM UNLESS WE CAN FIND A
- 10 FRESH CLEAN SET OF MONEY THAT CAN REIMBURSE BATA. THAT'S THE
- 11 DIFFERENCE. THERE IS ALSO A DISTINCT DIFFERENCE IN FASTRAK
- 12 START PROGRAM RIGHT NOW BY HOUSEHOLD CLIPPER INDIVIDUAL
- 13 PROGRAM WHICH IS ACTUALLY ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S DIFFICULT
- 14 TO TIE TO TWO PROGRAMS TOGETHER IS PEOPLE GENERALLY ARE
- 15 FASTRAK AND FAMILY MULTIPLE CARS MULTIPLE RIDERS COULD BE YOUR
- 16 PARENTS YOU WANT INDIVIDUAL AND HOW THEY USE TRANSIT
- 17 FUNDAMENTALLY THERE ARE DIFFERENCES. I THINK THAT'S WHAT THE
- 18 SLIDE WAS TALKING ABOUT WAS BENEFITS AND DEVELOPING GOALS BUT
- 19 PROBABLY FOR DIFFERENT PURPOSES. BECAUSE WE'RE NOT ACTUALLY
- 20 TRYING TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP ALTHOUGH DERRICK WOULD LIKE MORE
- 21 PEOPLE DRIVING ACROSS THE BRIDGES, THAT'S NOT CONSISTENT WITH
- 22 PLANNED BAY AREA. GETTING MORE PEOPLE ON TRANSIT IS. THAT'S
- 23 THE DISTINCT DIFFERENCE THAT'S WHEN WE HAVE TO NOT FORGET
- 24 WHILE WE MANAGE THIS SPACE.



- 1 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU FOR EXPLAINING THAT. I WAS
- 2 THINKING IN INTEGRATION SIMPLIFICATION FOR ALL THE DIFFERENT
- 3 PROGRAMS IF WE'RE STILL TARGETING THE SAME POPULATION OF THE
- 4 LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS OR INDIVIDUAL HOUSEHOLDS IF THERE IS
- 5 SOME WAY TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR FOLKS. THANKS.

6

7 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GINA?

- 9 GINA PAPAN: THANKS. TO FOLLOW UP REAL QUICKLY. SO, YES, I
- 10 THOUGHT THE IDEA HERE WAS TO GET MORE PEOPLE ON TRANSIT HERE.
- 11 MY CONCERN IS RISING COST. SO BART JUST ANNOUNCED INCREASED
- 12 PRICING. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, YOU MAY BE GETTING 50% OFF NOW,
- 13 BUT THAT'S REALLY NOT -- AND THEIR EXCUSE WAS, YEAH, BECAUSE
- 14 THESE 50% ARE COMING. SO, I DON'T KNOW -- BUT I THINK WE
- 15 SHOULD BE WATCHING THINGS LIKE THAT. BECAUSE IT'S QUITE A
- 16 BURDEN ON PEOPLE. AND WE ARE AT A LEVEL WHERE PEOPLE ARE
- 17 BARELY MAKING IT ANYWAY. SO, I WOULD ASK THAT SOMEHOW WE WATCH
- 18 THE DIFFERENT OPERATORS. I KNOW CALTRAIN IS DELAYING
- 19 INCREASES. JUST WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN FUTURISTICALLY, BECAUSE
- 20 AGAIN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT MAYBE A TRANSIT BOND. AND THAT'S NOT
- 21 GOING TO MAKE PEOPLE HAPPY. SO, I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT WOULD
- 22 PLAY HERE. BUT LET'S BE AWARE OF THAT. AND AS YOU SAID, FOR
- 23 COMMUNITY COLLEGES, OURS DON'T HAVE REGULAR TRANSIT
- 24 CONNECTIONS. SO THEY ACTUALLY GIVE STIPENDS TO STUDENTS TO
- 25 TAKE AN UBER OR A LYFT TO CONNECT WITH. SO, IT'S KIND OF



- 1 INTERESTING. AND I GUESS WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT ALL THAT TOO.
- 2 BECAUSE WE WANT TO REACH AS MANY PEOPLE AS POSSIBLE. AND IT'S
- 3 A TIMING ISSUE TOO. WE CAN'T HAVE -- YOU HAVE GOT QUITE A
- 4 POPULATION, ONE CLASS ENDS AND WHO NEEDS TO GET WHERE, THAT
- 5 KIND OF THING. BUT THESE ARE JUST ISSUES AND CONCERNS THAT
- 6 MAYBE WE CAN WORK WITH LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ON TO HELP THEM GET
- 7 THERE. THANK YOU.

8

- 9 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GREAT. ANYBODY ELSE? OKAY WE SPOKE TO THE
- 10 PUBLIC. WE GOT YOU TIRED OUT. THANK YOU JUDIS SO MUCH FOR THIS
- 11 REPORT. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING STAFF COME BACK WITH A
- 12 KNOW APPROACH AND WANT TO SAY WELL DONE. ALL RIGHT. LET'S
- 13 FINISH THIS WHILE IT'S STILL 2024. WE'RE ON ITEM -- AT THE END
- 14 OF OUR AGENDA, I BELIEVE. TO PUBLIC COMMENT OTHER AND
- 15 BUSINESS. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY ITEM THAT'S NOT ON
- 16 OUR AGENDA BUT WITHIN THE PURVIEW OF THIS COMMITTEE

17

- 18 CLERK OF THE BOARD: NO ONE ONLINE, NO ONE IN THE ROOM AND NO
- 19 WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.

20

21 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: GREAT.

22

23 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I CAN SAY SOMETHING QUICKLY?

24

25 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: SURE.



1 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: THE SAN FRANCISCO FERRY SERVICE HAS BEEN OUT 2 3 FOR TWO DAYS BECAUSE OF MECHANICAL ISSUES. THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF DISCUSSION ON THIS COMMISSION ABOUT HOLDING TRANSIT 4 5 AGENCIES ACCOUNTABLE. WETA IS THE LARGEST RECIPIENT OF RM3 FUNDING. IT'S SCHEDULED TO RECEIVE OVER \$1.2 BILLION. AT THE 6 SAME TIME, THEIR FARES ARE EXCISE AS EXPENSIVE BART, THEY GET 7 8 TWICE AS MUCH SUBSIDY PER TRIP. ENVIRONMENTAL FOOTPRINT IS TWICE AS LARGE. I'LL SAY THAT AGAIN, YOU TAKE A WETA FERRY 9 YOU'RE GOING TO PAY TWICE AS MUCH FOR THE SAME LOAD ON ANOTHER 10 TRIP. I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE SERIOUS ABOUT HOLDING TRANSIT 11 AGENCIES ACCOUNTABLE WE HAVE TO BE IN THE CROSS HAIRS FOR 12 AGENCY THAT IS GETTING A TON OF MONEY FROM MTC AND MAYBE IS 13 NOT IN THIS CASE IS STRUGGLING WITH, SORT OF, SERVING THE 14 15 PUBLIC AT THE LEVEL THAT WE WOULD EXPECT. 16 CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. JUST ON THE NOTE, WE MADE THIS 17 RECOMMENDATION, AND I'LL WORK WITH STAFF TO AGENDAIZE, A 18 DEEPER DIVE WITH DIFFERENT AGENCY PARTNERS SO THAT WE COULD 19 HAVE CONVERSATIONS WITH THEM OUTSIDE OF THEIR BEING THERE 20 BEING AN EMERGENCY BUT MAYBE WE START WITH WETA. THAT'S NOT A 21 BAD IDEA. SEEING NO OTHER COMMENTS FROM MY COLLEAGUES. WE'RE 22 ADJOURNED. SEE YOU ALL ON FORBID 14th. THANK YOU. -- FEBRUARY 23 14TH. [ADJOURNED] 24

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.





Broadcasting Government