

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, APRIL 26<sup>TH</sup>, 2023, 9:35 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I'M GOING TO  
6 CALL TO ORDER THE JOINT METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
7 AND BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY. I'M CHAIR ALFREDO  
8 PEDROZA, JOINED BY VICE CHAIR NICK JOSEFOWITZ. THANK YOU TO  
9 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FOR ATTENDING. YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON  
10 BY DIALING STAR NINE. BE MINDFUL WE HAVE A GOAL TO TRY TO  
11 DEPART SAN FRANCISCO AROUND 11:30 THAT PROVIDES AMP TIME TO  
12 TRAVEL. THERE ARE COMMISSIONERS RUNNING LATE TODAY. WE ALL  
13 ENCOUNTER TRAFFIC YOU WON'T FACE ANY TRAFFIC GOING TO NAPA  
14 THEY A JOKE. WE HAVE A START AT 1:30 IT IS A WORK IN  
15 TRANSITION FOR ALL OF US. I APPRECIATE EVERYONE MAKING TIME TO  
16 PARTICIPATE IN THE COMMISSION MEETING AND TO ATTEND THE  
17 WORKSHOP THAT'S GOING TO BE VERY MEANINGFUL FOR OUR REGION. AT  
18 THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM ONE. AND AT THIS  
19 POINT, YOU MIGHT SEE SOME NEW FACES UP HERE THAT ARE VERY  
20 FAMILIAR FACES. IT'S BEEN A LONG TIME COMING THAT THE U.S.  
21 DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT KNOWN AS HUD HAS  
22 APPOINTED THE FORMER MAYOR OF OAKLAND, LIBBY SCHAAF AS THEIR  
23 NON-MEMBERS TO THE COMMISSION. LIBBY, WELCOME BACK. HAPPY TO  
24 YOU HAVE BACK. WHAT I'LL SAY BEFORE YOU HAVE WORDS, I  
25 APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT YOU DIDN'T JUST SHOW UP TO COMMISSION



APRIL 26, 2023

1 MEETINGS YOU THOUGHTFULLY PREPARE AND PARTICIPATE, AND MADE  
2 SURE NOT JUST OAKLAND WAS REPRESENTED BUT THAT YOU WERE A  
3 REGIONAL PARTNER. THANK YOU. YOU'RE STILL MAYOR IN MY BOOK.

4

5 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** IN NAPA WE NEED TO GET OUR BUSINESS DONE IT'S A  
6 TESTAMENT TO THE FELLOWSHIP OF THIS COMMISSION AND THE IMPACT  
7 THAT IT HAD, AND THAT I WAS ABLE TO RETURN. AND PROUD OF  
8 SECRETARY FUDGE AND HOUSING AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT AGENCY OF  
9 THE U.S. OF AMERICA, AND AS YOU ALL KNOW, I CARE A LOT ABOUT  
10 HOUSING. SO IT'S JUST PERFECTLY APPROPRIATE. I'M BACK AND JUST  
11 SO HAPPY TO BE BACK WITH EACH AND EVERY ONE OF YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. MAYOR, AS SOMEONE WHO SITS  
14 NEXT TO ME, THE RIGHT PERSON AT THE RIGHT TIME, YOU ARE THAT  
15 PERSON. ROLL CALL.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

9

10 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI IS ON HER WAY. EL-TAWANSY IS

17 ABSENT. FLEMING IS ABSENT. GIACOPINI WILL BE JOINING ONLINE

18 MOMENTARILY. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

19

20 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY SHOULD BE JOINING

23 ONLINE MOMENTARILY. ABSENT AT THE MOMENT. MOULTON PETERS IS ON

24 HER WAY. NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN IS ON HER WAY. THANK YOU.

25 COMMISSIONER RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN?



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF?

5

6 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ON HER WAY. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. LET'S MOVE TO ITEM TWO,  
15 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF, LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE PLEASE?

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. ITEM THREE, COMPENSATION  
18 ANNOUNCEMENT?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE  
21 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY  
22 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A  
23 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A  
24 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH  
25 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. PROCEEDING TO  
3 ITEM FOUR, THE JOINT MTC AND BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR. WE HAVE  
4 TWO ITEMS ON THE CONSENT. COMMISSIONERS ANY QUESTIONS ON OUR  
5 CONSENT CALENDAR. SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT ON OUR CONSENT  
6 CALENDAR? JOINT CONSENT CALENDAR?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR  
9 HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS  
10 ITEM.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION.

13

14 **DAVID CANEPA:** SO MOVED.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY CANEPA, SECOND BY RONEN. DO  
17 WE NEED DO A ROLL CALL VOTE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE DO BECAUSE WE HAVE REMOTE  
20 PARTICIPATION AND MILEY HAS NOW JOINED. WE HAVE TO DO ROLL  
21 CALL VOTE FOR EVERY ITEM.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. 11:30 STILL STANDS ON ALL.  
24 CANEPA AND RONEN.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA.

2

3 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

10

11 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

14

15 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

18

19 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER?



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

5

6 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS IS

9 ABSENT. NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN? IS ON HER WAY. SHE IS ABSENT.

10 RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN?

11

12 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

15

16 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EXCUSE ME -- NON-VOTING MEMBER SCHAFF, I

19 APOLOGIZE. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

24 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

25





APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. MOVING TO ITEM  
2 FIVE, PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS  
3 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH  
4 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV INTO THE RECORD IF THERE IS ANYONE IN  
5 THE CHAMBERS APPROACH THE PODIUM ANYONE VIRTUALLY PLEASE RAISE  
6 YOUR HAND.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
9 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
10 ON THIS ITEM.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. PROCEED TO ITEM  
13 SIX. WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE  
14 AUTHORITY AND NOW ADJOURNED AND WE'LL CONTINUE THE BALANCE OF  
15 THE MTC AGENDA. ITEM SEVEN CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. I LOOK  
16 FORWARD TO HOSTING MANY OF YOU IN NAPA THAT HAVE BEEN FOR A  
17 WORKSHOP ON THE COMMISSION PRIORITIES AND STRATEGIC DIRECTION.  
18 COMMISSIONERS, THIS IS SOMETHING WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON  
19 RECOGNIZING WE HAVE A LOT OF NEW COMMISSIONERS JOIN US, BUT  
20 ALSO CHANGE IN OUR EXECUTIVE TEAM LEADERSHIP TODAY. TODAY WILL  
21 BE ABOUT COMING TOGETHER AS COMMISSION LEADERSHIP  
22 ACKNOWLEDGING OUR PRIORITIES AND DOUBLING DOWN ON THE OUTCOMES  
23 THAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE FOR THE REGION. I LOOK FORWARD TO  
24 EVERYONE'S THOUGHTFUL PARTICIPATION. SOME ADDITIONAL THINGS.  
25 YOU KNOW, IN TERMS OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY.



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THE COMMITTEE STARTING IN JULY WILL MOVE TO MEETINGS TO TAKE  
2 PLACE THE SECOND WEDNESDAYS AT 12:30 P.M. SINCE BAHFA  
3 COMMITTEE MEETS ON THURSDAY WHILE AN OFF COMMITTEE DAY,  
4 TELECONFERENCE WILL BE PERMITTED FOR THIS MEETING. WE DO NEED  
5 TO COME TO SAN FRANCISCO OFTEN BUT TRYING TO CONSOLIDATE TO  
6 WEDNESDAYS AND FRIDAY TO MAKE IT MORE CONVENIENT ACKNOWLEDGING  
7 THERE IS A LOT OF BENEFIT TO MEETING IN-PERSON BUT BEING  
8 SENSITIVE TO PEOPLE'S COMMITMENTS. GIVEN THAT BAHFAO WILL BE  
9 ON WEDNESDAYS WE'RE GOING ALLOW FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION FOR  
10 THAT BUT I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONERS COMING TO IN-PERSON AS  
11 MUCH AS WE CAN. WE WILL TABLE A DISCUSSION ON THE MEGA REGION  
12 MILEY HAS EXPRESSED INTEREST IN PARTICIPATING IN THE MEGA  
13 REGION FOR ALL THE RIGHT REASONS BUT I WANT TO HAVE A  
14 CONVERSATION WITH COMMISSIONERS, THAT WAS AN OVERSIGHT WHEN I  
15 WAS MAKING COMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS. I'LL ENSURE EVERYONE'S IN  
16 THE BOARD DISCUSSION. NO ACTION ITEMS ON MY COMMITTEE REPORT.  
17 COMMISSIONERS ANY QUESTIONS? KIMBERLY ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON MY  
18 REPORT?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
21 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
22 ON THIS ITEM.

23



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE  
2 GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM EIGHT. THIS IS A POLICY ADVISORY  
3 COUNCIL REPORT. RANDI KINMAN. IS RANDI WITH US TODAY?

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN:** I AM. I HAVE, UNDER HERE, IT LOOKS LIKE AN  
6 APPRECIATION FOR RICH HEDGES, AND I WAS WONDERING IF THAT WAS  
7 BEING CARRIED FORWARD BY THE COMMISSIONERS? OR?

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES. WE WILL DO THAT.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. WELL, I WILL MAKE MY REPORT SHORT THEN.  
12 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL DID MEET THIS WEEK, AND THE ONE  
13 THING THAT I WANT TO BRING FORWARD IS THE ACTION ITEM UNDER  
14 BROWN ACT LEGISLATION, ARE THE MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL VOTED  
15 UNANIMOUSLY FOR ASSEMBLY BILL 817 REGARDING TELECONFERENCING.  
16 IT BEST ALIGNED WITH OUR DESIRES TO HOLD MEETINGS WITH  
17 ADDITIONAL PUBLIC NOTICE REQUIREMENT FOR THOSE ATTENDING  
18 REMOTELY. THE CURRENT BROWN ACT RESTRICTIONS ARE ONEROUS AND  
19 UNSAFE FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT ELECTED TO OFFICE. AS ONE MEMBER  
20 OF OUR BODY STATED, WE HAVE THE MOST DIVERSE GROUP OF PEOPLE  
21 YOU'RE GOING TO FIND ON ANY BECOME WE SHOULD BE ENCOURAGING  
22 NOT DISCOURAGING THAT. WITH THAT, I WANT TO FOLLOW UP WITH THE  
23 FACT THAT OUR ATTORNEY AND STAFF HAVE GONE OUT OF THEIR WAY TO  
24 MAKE IT POSSIBLE FOR OUR MEMBERS TO ATTEND REMOTELY, BUT WITH  
25 THAT SAID, FOR SOME OF THEM, IT'S ALMOST -- IT'S ALMOST TOO



APRIL 26, 2023

1 MUCH OF A BURDEN. THERE HAVE BEEN AT LEAST THREE MEMBERS THAT  
2 HAVE NOT ATTENDED ANY MEETINGS SINCE WE HAVE REINSTATED THE  
3 BROWN ACT RULES. SEVERAL MEMBERS HAVE RESIGNED FROM THEIR  
4 COMMITTEE SEATS SEVERAL OTHERS HAVE ATTENDED MEETINGS BUT NOT  
5 UNDER BROWN ACT QUORUM AND CANNOT VOTE WHICH MAKES IT  
6 DIFFICULT FOR US TO GET BUSINESS DONE. BASED ON SURVEY  
7 STAFFING CREATED ALL OF OUR MEETINGS COMBINING ALL OF OUR  
8 MEETINGS INTO A SINGLE DAY, I EXPECT IT WILL FURTHER DECREASE  
9 PARTICIPATION AND MEMBERSHIP. WE SENT OUT A SURVEY, OUT OF THE  
10 26 MEMBERS THAT WERE SURVEYS, 17 RESPONDED AND JUST ABOUT HALF  
11 OF THOSE SAID SWITCHING TO MONDAY WOULD BE OKAY, MAYBE  
12 SWITCHING TO FRIDAY, OKAY. BUT WE HAVE SEVERAL MEMBERS WHO  
13 WILL BE LEAVING US BECAUSE THEY HAVE BUILT THEIR JOBS AROUND  
14 ATTENDING ON WEDNESDAYS. AND THAT UNDERSTANDS MY PART OF THE  
15 REPORT.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, RANDI. COMMISSIONERS, ANY  
18 QUESTIONS FROM RANDI BEFORE I READ SOME WORDS FOR RICH. DON'T  
19 SEE ANY. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
22 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
23 ON THIS ITEM.

24



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. RANDI,  
2 YOU CAN FOR YOUR REPORT. IN TERMS OF RICH HEDGES WE EXPRESS  
3 OUR HEARTFELT GRATITUDE TO RICH HEDGES FOR HIS REMARKABLE 20  
4 YEARS OF SERVICE ON THE ADVISORY BODIES FOR THE METROPOLITAN  
5 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IN SAN FRANCISCO. STARTING IN 2003,  
6 WHEN RICH WAS APPOINTED TO THE ELDER AND DISABLED COMMITTEE  
7 WHICH MORPHED INTO THE OVERALL POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL RICH  
8 HAS BEEN A CONTRIBUTOR TO OUR COMMUNITY AND HIS CONTRIBUTIONS  
9 WILL BE DEEPLY MISSED. THROUGH THE HIS TIME ON THE ADVISORY  
10 BODIES RICH HAS WORKED FOR THE PEOPLE AND COMMITTED TO EQUITY  
11 AND FAIRNESS HAS BEEN AN INSPIRATION. DEDICATION IS  
12 COMMENDABLE, AND WE'RE GRATEFUL TO HAVE HIS UNWAVERING SERVICE  
13 TO THE PEOPLE OF SAN MATEO. RICH, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR  
14 CONTRIBUTION 20 YEARS IS EASY TO SAY BUT I THINK OF ALL THE  
15 MEETINGS IN PUBLIC COMMENT THAT WAS ATTRIBUTED TO RICH. RICH  
16 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR SERVICE. AT THIS POINT I'LL TURN  
17 IT OVER TO YOU VIRTUALLY IF YOU WANT TO SAY A FEW WORDS.

18

19 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I WOULD LIKE TO. I UNDERSTAND YOUR TIME  
20 CONSTRAINT CAN YOU HEAR ME.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES. GO AHEAD.

23

24 **RICHARD HEDGES:** YOU SAID MORPHED INTO THE ADVISORY COUNCIL, I  
25 WANT TO TELL YOU THAT WHEN I FIRST GOT ON, WE STARTED TALKING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 ABOUT TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT AND I REALIZE THAT I GREW  
2 UP IN ONE. I REALLY LOOKED AT THIS AS GOING BACK TO THE  
3 FUTURE. I HAD SUCH A GREAT CHILDHOOD, I COULD JUMP ON A  
4 STREETCAR AND GO 47 MILES TO THE MOST WONDERFUL PARKS IN THE  
5 COUNTRY. WE HAD A FULL SERVICE COMMUNITY. MY PARENT HIS AN ICE  
6 BOX. THEY WERE REFUGEES FROM THE DEPRESSION. WE DID NOT HAVE A  
7 REFRIGERATOR, SO THAT NECESSITATED LOCAL TRIPS TO THE GROCERY  
8 STORIES EVERY DAY 33 SMALLTIME STORIES WITHIN A COUPLE OF  
9 BLOCKS OF MY HOUSE WE HAD A PHARMACY, THREE LIQUOR STORES,  
10 THREE BARS, WE HAD A BARBERSHOP, A GAS STATION, LAUNDRY, AND A  
11 CLEANERS, JUST ABOUT EVERYTHING YOU WOULD NEED. IF YOU GO  
12 THROUGH OLD NEIGHBORHOODS AND CITIES AND YOU SEE THESE OLDER  
13 RUN DOWN RETAIL ESTABLISHMENTS ON ALL FOUR CORNERS, THAT WAS A  
14 STREETCAR STOP. WE STILL HAVE SOME OF THOSE IN MY COMMUNITY  
15 WHERE I GREW UP IN KANSAS CITY. THIS WAS A GREAT THING FOR ME,  
16 AND I AM SO THANKFUL FOR THERESE MCMILLAN, JAMES CORLESS WHO  
17 GAVE ME THE TRAINING I NEED TO AT LEAST UNDERSTAND AND KNOW  
18 WHAT I WAS TALKING ABOUT. THERE WERE SO MANY PEOPLE, MARTHA  
19 SILVER HAS BEEN INVALUABLE TO ME, KEEPING ME ORGANIZED AND  
20 TRUST ME IF YOU ASK MY WIFE, I NEED SOMEBODY TO KEEP ME  
21 ORGANIZED. AND ALSO URSULA WAS A MAJOR HELP TO ME, AS WELL, IN  
22 KEEPING ME ORGANIZED. THERE ARE SO MANY PEOPLE I COULD THANK.  
23 I WANT TO CUT IT OFF BECAUSE I KNOW YOU HAVE TIME CONSTRAINTS.  
24 BUT, I WILL JUST SAY THAT, THAT TRANSIT IS A LEVELLING  
25 EXPERIENCE. IF YOU TALK TO EVERYBODY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT WHO IS



APRIL 26, 2023

1 WILLING TO TALK TO YOU, YOU FIND OUT THE PULSE OF OUR  
2 COMMUNITIES. I PREDICTED MAY OF 2063 THAT SOMEONE I WAS  
3 FEARFUL OF, DONALD TRUMP WOULD BE ELECTED IN NOVEMBER AND THAT  
4 WAS FROM DISCUSSION WITH PEOPLE WHO ARE FED UP WITH THEIR  
5 STATE AND LIFE ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. SO IF YOU REALLY WANT TO  
6 KNOW WHERE THE COUNTRY IS GOING, RIDE PUBLIC TRANSIT. THANK  
7 YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, RICH. I THINK WE'RE GOING  
10 TO TAKE THAT LINE, IF YOU REALLY WANT TO KNOW WHERE COMMUNITY  
11 IS RIDE PUBLIC TRANSIT. RICH, JUST WANT TO SAY AS SOMEONE WHO  
12 HASN'T BEEN ON THE COMMISSION THAT LONG, I APPRECIATE AND  
13 RESPECT PEOPLE WHO HAVE GIVEN SO MUCH TIME TO MAKE THE REGION  
14 BETTER, REALLY HOMICIDE WHAT THIS IS ALL ABOUT, PEOPLE ON BOTH  
15 SIDES OF THE EQUATION, RICH, YOU EPITOMIZE THAT. COMMISSIONER  
16 PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. RICH, I WANT TO THANK YOU. YOUR  
19 CONSISTENT PARTICIPATION, YOUR INPUT HAS BEEN SO EXTREMELY  
20 IMPORTANT, AND I KNOW YOU ARE TO BETTER THINGS WHICH IS AN  
21 APPOINTMENT TO THE SAN MATEO CITY COUNCIL. IF WE COULD CORRECT  
22 THE REPORT HERE. [LAUGHTER] IT SAYS PALO ALTO. HE'S DOING A  
23 GREAT JOB, AND I AM SO PROUD OF YOU AND YOUR CONTINUED  
24 PARTICIPATION IN EVERYTHING THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO, THANK



APRIL 26, 2023

1 YOU SO MUCH. AND I CONTINUE TO LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH  
2 YOU. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I  
5 BELIEVE WE HAVE SOME FOLKS VIRTUALLY THAT WISH TO SAY SOME  
6 WORDS.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, FOLLOWED BY  
9 RANDI KINMAN, THEN ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC.

10

11 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** IS IT MY TURN?

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES. GO AHEAD COMMISSIONER.

14

15 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. RICH, I CAN'T BELIEVE YOU'RE  
16 TAKING OFF. IT'S CONGRATULATIONS ON YOUR NEW SITUATION. YOU  
17 KNOW, IT'S BEEN SO LONG, I CAN'T BELIEVE IT. YOU KNOW, BACK  
18 WHEN WE WERE, LIKE YOU SAID, FIRST TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT  
19 ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT WITH MARSHALL, YOU JUST WANT TO THANK YOU  
20 FROM THE BOTTOM OF MY HEART FOR THE YEARS AND DECADES AND  
21 HOURS THAT YOU HAVE PUT INTO HELPING MTC WORK BETTER AND WORK  
22 MORE INCLUSIVELY. IT'S BEEN WONDERFUL. THANK YOU SO MUCH,  
23 RICH.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. RANDI?





APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE SAID GOOD BY TO RICH SEVERAL  
3 TIMES NOW AND IT DOESN'T GET ANY EASIER. RICH, I'M GOING TO  
4 MISS MY CONFIDANT, I'M GOING TO MISS MY SPARRING PARTNER, I'M  
5 GOING TO MISS MY -- THE PERSON THAT I CAN TURN TO. MOST OF ALL  
6 I'M GOING TO MISS JUST THE WONDERFUL CONVERSATIONS AND THE  
7 VAST AMOUNT OF INFORMATION THAT YOU BROUGHT TO THE POLICY  
8 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND YOUR DEDICATION TO MAKING THE WORLD A  
9 BETTER PLACE. SAN MATEO IS SO LUCKY TO HAVE YOU. I AM HOPING  
10 TO -- AS THE LONGEST PERSON WHO HAS SERVED AS AN ADVISER NOW,  
11 I HAVE BIG SHOES TO FILL. AND I WILL MISS YOU EVERY MEETING.  
12 BUT GOOD LUCK. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NOW TWO MEMBERS OF  
15 THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. THE FIRST IS ADINA LEVIN.  
16 TWO MINUTES, MR. CHAIR? OKAY. GO AHEAD MISS LEVIN, UNMUTE  
17 YOURSELF.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** THIS IS ADINA AND I AM ACTUALLY NOW IN THE  
20 HALLWAY, I DIDN'T GET THERE IN-PERSON TO REALLY CONVEY SO MANY  
21 THANKS TO RICH HEDGES FOR HAS MANY YEARS OF SERVICE AT THE  
22 REGIONAL LEVEL. I'M GLAD THAT HE IS ABLE TO BE SERVING LOCALLY  
23 IN SAN MATEO, BUT HE WILL REALLY BE MISSED AT THE POLICY  
24 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND ON REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING  
25 ISSUES. THANKS.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS VEDA FLOREZ. MISS  
3 FLOREZ, ARE YOU THERE? OKAY. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED,  
4 MR. CHAIR.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. RICH, THANK YOU  
7 VERY MUCH FOR YOUR SERVICE. SO WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED WITH THE  
8 BALANCE OF OUR AGENDA. ITEM NINE, OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S  
9 REPORT. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FREMIER

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR PEDROZA, MEMBERS OF THE  
12 COMMISSION. I'LL TRY TO BE QUICK. FIRST LET ME APOLOGIZE TO  
13 RICH, I SIGNED THE MEMO WITH THE WRONG CITY COLONEL ON THERE.  
14 WE'LL GET THE RECORDS CORRECTED FOR SURE. AND I DO ALSO  
15 APPRECIATE ALL THIS WORK. I WANT TO POINT OUT WE HAVE SIX NEW  
16 APPOINTMENTS ON THE LIST BUT IN THE NEXT MONTH OR TWO WE MIGHT  
17 SHOW PEOPLE AS MANY AS NEW EMPLOYEES ARE RETIRING WE'RE  
18 TREADING WATER IN TERMS OF BRINGING PEOPLE INTO THE BUILDING  
19 BUT WE'RE BRINGING GOOD ONES IN AND SAYING GOOD BY TO GOOD  
20 ONES AS WELL. KEY UPDATES WANT TO POINT OUT THAT APRIL 7TH WE  
21 STARTED ONLINE ENROLLMENT FOR THE EXPRESS LANES START PROGRAM  
22 THAT'S A BIG ITEM FOR US TO GET MOVING ON. DEREK AND NATALIE  
23 CAME BACK WITH SOME MONEY FROM NEW YORK CITY, THEY DID A NICE  
24 JOB REFINANCING AND BROUGHT MUCH NEEDED REVENUE. GOOD WORK TO  
25 THEM. AT THE BOTTOM OF THE ITEMS THERE WE DID ALSO DO WELL,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 AGAIN, IN THE TIRCP, THE TRANSIT AND INTERCITY RAIL AND  
2 CAPITAL PROGRAM. WE BROUGHT HOME ABOUT 60% OF THE MONEY THAT  
3 WAS AVAILABLE OUTSIDE SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. GOOD WORK THERE. IT  
4 PROVIDES SOME PROJECT DEVELOPMENT MONEY TO THE DOWNTOWN  
5 EXTENSION, THE PORTAL, AS WELL AS VALLEY LINK, AND THEN SOME  
6 CONSTRUCTION MONEY TO VTA FOR THEIR REGIONAL CONNECTOR TO BART  
7 IN EAST RIDGE. FINALLY JUST LOOKING AHEAD, I WANTED TO MENTION  
8 WE HAVE FINALLY BEEN ABLE TO COORDINATE WITH THE CAP  
9 CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THEY WILL HAVE THEIR  
10 MEETING HERE IN MAY. IT WILL BE A BIG MEETING BECAUSE THE  
11 STATE ROUTE 37 TOLLING APPLICATION IS UNDER REVIEW WITH THEM.  
12 AND THEN FINALLY WE WILL BE GOING BACK UP TO SACRAMENTO WITH  
13 AN MTC ABAG DELEGATION ON MAY 22ND TO GO OVER OUR JOINT '23  
14 STATE ADVOCACY PRIORITIES. AND I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY  
15 QUESTIONS.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR.  
18 COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS? I WANT TO ECHO COMMENTS ON THE  
19 BONDS. INCREDIBLE WORK FOR THAT AND WHAT IT MEANS TO THE  
20 AGENCY. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE TRIP AGAIN IN THE DECEMBER TIME  
21 FRAME. I HAVE ALSO ENCOURAGED OUR VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ JOIN  
22 US THAT TRIP IT PROVIDES PERSPECTIVE TO WHAT FINANCING ALLOWS  
23 US TO DO AND THIS LEAVES PEOPLE IN THE AGENCY A GOOD POSITION.  
24 PUBLIC COMMENT?

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. PROCEEDING TO  
6 ITEM TEN, COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. COMMISSIONERS, ANY GENERAL  
7 COMMENTS? I KNOW YOU'RE ALL SAVING YOURSELF FOR THE WORKSHOP.  
8 THANK YOU. PROCEEDING TO ITEM 11, OUR CONSENT CALENDAR,  
9 INCLUDES 11 A THROUGH 11H. COMMISSIONERS ANY COMMENTS OR  
10 QUESTIONS ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR FOR MTC? I DON'T SEE ANY. TO  
11 QUESTION THOSE IN THE CONTROLS WE'RE SEEING COMMISSIONER  
12 GIACOPINI'S SCREEN BUMMING AROUND I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S  
13 PUBLIC FACING. WANT TO BE MINDFUL. I SEE NO QUESTIONS OR  
14 COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
18 ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. LOOK FIGURE -- LOOKING FOR  
21 A MOTION FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

22

23 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** MOTION.

24

25 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION BY DUTRA-VERNACI.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'M GOING TO ASK DUTRA-VERNACI TO  
5 MODIFY YOUR MOTION TO EXCLUDE 11F.

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR  
8 WITH EXCEPTION OF 11F.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** DOES THAT STAND?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** IT STANDS.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ROLL CALL VOTE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

4

5 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-  
16 VERNACI?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

21

22 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PETERS?

4

5 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. SPERING?

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

12 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION FOR

15 11F.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MOVE 11F.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY SPERING.

20

21 **FEDERAL GLOVER:** SECOND.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND BY GLOVER. PUBLIC COMMENT?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO HAND RAISED.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ROLL CALL VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ? RECUSED, EXCUSE ME.

9 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

10

11 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

14

15 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

18

19 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

22

23 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?





APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. RONEN?

9

10 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

17 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT WITH THE RECUSAL FROM VICE CHAIR

18 JOSEFOWITZ.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PERFECT. OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED

21 TO ITEM 12, COMMITTEE REPORTS AND VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ CAN

22 RETURN TO THE DAIS. UP FIRST ITEM 12 THIS IS THE

23 ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE WITH OUR NEW CHAIR. CHAIR PAPAN, TAKE

24 IT AWAY.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE  
2 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER, AND DO I DO ROLL CALL?

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** NO THIS IS JUST A REPORT-OUT,  
5 COMMISSIONER.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** SORRY. I GOT MY NOTES HERE. REPORTING OUT FOR THE  
8 ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE. WE HAVE AGENDA ITEM 12 HERE, THE MTC  
9 RESOLUTION 4577, FISCAL REPORT, 2023 THROUGH 2024, OVERALL  
10 WORK PROGRAM. THIS WAS -- THIS PROGRAM GUIDES THE 2023/'24 OWP  
11 COLLABORATION METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION PLANNING PROCESS  
12 INVOLVING MTC, ABAG, AND FWFHWA AND FTA, ALL THESE ACRONYMS.  
13 OKAY. CALTRANS AND OTHER LOCAL TRANSPORTATION PARTNERS  
14 REQUESTING INCLUDES AUTHORIZATION FOR THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
15 TO ENTER INTO AN EXECUTIVE -- AN EXEC REQUIRED CERTIFICATION,  
16 ASSURANCES, AND OVERALL WORK PROGRAM AGREEMENT WITH THE  
17 FEDERAL AND STATE TRANSPORTATION PLANNING. OH MY GOSH. MOVE  
18 APPROVAL. [LAUGHTER] OF RESOLUTION 4577.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PAPAN. TO APPROVE  
21 RESOLUTION 4577. I'LL LOOK FOR A SECOND.

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** SECOND, CHAVEZ.

24



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND BY CHAVEZ. COMMISSIONERS

2 QUESTIONS ON ANY ITEM? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
6 ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY PAPAN SECOND CHAVEZ ROLL CALL  
9 VOTE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

20

21 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

24

25 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

3

4 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

7

8 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE FLEMING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER

9 GLOVER?

10

11 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

14

15 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

18

19 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN?



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
9 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND THANK YOU  
12 CHAIR PAPAN FOR YOUR REPORT. MOVING TO ITEM 13 PROGRAMMING AND  
13 ALLOCATIONS. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS OUR NEW CHAIR I'M GOING TO  
14 TURN IT OVER TO CHAIR CHAVEZ TO REPORT-OUT.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SEE IF I'M WITH YOU GUYS. YOU  
17 KNOW, THEY'RE GIVING US ALL OUR CHEATER NOTES. ALL RIGHT.  
18 CHEATER NOTES.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE HAVE IN PAPER THAN NORMAL BECAUSE  
21 OF THE WORKSHOP COMING UP. CHAVEZ CHAVEZ ITEM 13A PROGRAMMING  
22 AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET APRIL 12TH AND REFERRED FOUR  
23 ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL, THREE OF WHICH ARE ON  
24 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. 13A, MTC RESOLUTION 4510 REVISED TRANSIT  
25 CAPITAL PRIORITIES POLICY, THE TCP PROGRAM FOR FISCAL YEARS



APRIL 26, 2023

1 2021, 20 -- I'M SORRY -- '21/'22, 23/'24. PROGRAM UPDATES  
2 INCLUDE -- WE DID A NUMBER OF UPDATES TO THE PROGRAM AND  
3 INCLUDE UPDATED FIXED GUIDEWAY PROGRAMMING AND ZERO  
4 INFRASTRUCTURE BUS SET ASIDE. I'LL MAKE THE MOTION.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. IS THERE A SECOND?

7

8 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SECOND.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ANY QUESTIONS? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC  
11 COMMENT ON 13A?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
15 ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A FIRST BY CHAIR  
18 CHAVEZ ON THIS ITEM, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. ROLL CALL  
19 VOTE, PLEASE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PEDROZA?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** YES. CANEPA?

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

15

16 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

19

20 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
10 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. WE'RE  
13 GOING MOVE TO ITEM 14, THIS IS JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION  
14 COMMITTEE. OUR NEW CHAIRS, CHAIR CANEPA. TAKE IT AWAY.

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. THE JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE  
17 AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET ON APRIL 14TH, 2023 AND  
18 REPORT FOUR ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL, TWO OF WHICH  
19 WERE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. BUDGET ITEM 14A JOINT ASSEMBLY  
20 BILL 645 FRIEDMAN SAFETY PILOT PROGRAM AUTHORIZED SPECIFIC  
21 LARGE CITIES INCLUDING OAKLAND, SAN JOSE, SAN FRANCISCO IN THE  
22 BAY AREA TO IMPLEMENT FIVE-YEAR PILOTS TO TEST SPEED SAFETY  
23 CAMERAS. A REVISED VERSION OF LEGISLATION MTC SUPPORTED IN  
24 2021/2022, AB 550, CHU AND AB 2336, FRIEDMAN. I MOVE A SUPPORT





APRIL 26, 2023

1 POSITION ON AB 645 AND NOTE MANY OTHERS IN THE BAY AREA CITIES  
2 WOULD LIKE THIS OPTION TOO.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. EFFECT OF ROBUST  
5 DISCUSSION. WE WANT TO PARTICIPATE AND NOT HOLD THE  
6 LEGISLATION UP. THANK YOU. FIRST BY CANEPA SECOND BY CHAVEZ.  
7 ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION? SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY, PUBLIC COMMENT?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
10 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
11 ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. FIRST BY CANEPA SECOND BY  
14 CHAVEZ ROLL CALL VOTE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

4

5 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

12

13 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

24

25 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMMING IS ABSENT. MILEY?

7

8 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
15 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** THAT BRINGS US TO 14B SENATE BILL 532 WIENER  
18 LOCAL BALLOT MEASURE LABELS OPTION FOR LOCAL GOVERNMENTS LOCAL  
19 BOND TAX MEASURES ON THE BALLOT INCLUDING KEY FINANCIAL  
20 INFORMATION VOTER INFORMATION GUIDES INSTEAD OF THE 75 WORD  
21 BALLOT QUESTION WITH TRANSPARENCY RECOMMEND SUPPORT POSITION  
22 AND APPROVE TO EXERCISE MTC'S URGENCY PROCEDURE TO COMMUNICATE  
23 POSITION ON SB532 PRIOR TO THE COMMISSION MEETING DATE. CHAIR  
24 PEDROZA INDICATED CONCURRENCE AND CONFORMANCE WITH MTC  
25 RESOLUTION 1058 REVISED. MTC COMMISSION PROCEED YOUR MANUAL



APRIL 26, 2023

1 STAFF REQUESTS COMMISSION'S CONCURRENCE WITH THAT POSITION. I  
2 MOVE A SUPPORT POSITION ON SB532.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA. DO WE HAVE A  
5 SECOND?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** YES.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND BY CHAVEZ. ANY COMMISSIONER  
10 DIALOGUE, DISCUSSION? SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY PUBLIC COMMENT ON  
11 14B?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
15 ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT WE HAVE FIRST BY CANEPA  
18 SECOND BY CHAVEZ ROLL CALL VOTE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** CHAVEZ?

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

16

17 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER? MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK IS ABSENT. RABBITT IS ABSENT. RONEN?

24

25 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
7 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CANEPA FOR YOUR WORK  
10 ON THAT. MOVING TO ITEM 15, TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF PROPOSED  
11 FUNDING ADVOCACY FRAMEWORK AND I'LL HEED UP, NOTE WE'LL TALK  
12 ABOUT THIS LATER AT THE WORKSHOP TODAY, AS PART OF THE  
13 COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS WE CREATED AN AD-HOC COMMITTEE TO LOOK  
14 AT THIS AND VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ APPOINTED SOME COMMISSION  
15 MEMBERS TO WORK WITH HIM ALONG THIS AND I APPRECIATE YOUR WORK  
16 THIS IS A DIFFICULT MOMENT AND DIFFICULT CONVERSATION BUT I  
17 WANT TO TURN IT OVER TO VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ TO SEE IF HE HAS  
18 WORDS.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PEDROZA, AND  
21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND RABBITT AND ABAG PRESIDENT JESSE  
22 ARREQUIN FOR SERVING ON THE AD-HOC COMMITTEE THIS IS ONE OF  
23 THOSE COMMITTEES WHERE WE MEET A LOT AND REGULARLY AND I'M  
24 GRATEFUL EVERYBODY TOOK THE TIME TO DO THAT AND TO ANDY ALIX  
25 REBECCA THERESA AND GEORGIA WHO WERE SUPER ENGAGED ON THIS.



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THIS IS A REAL CRISIS FOR MANY OF OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES  
2 INCLUDING SOME OF THE MOST REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT ONES LIKE  
3 BART. THEY ARE FACING A, SORT OF, A GENERATIONAL CRISIS AND WE  
4 HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY HERE TO MAKE SURE THAT BART AS WE KNOW IT,  
5 FOR INSTANCE, SURVIVES FOR THE NEXT GENERATION AND WE ALSO  
6 HAVE, I THINK, A RESPONSIBILITY TO DO THAT. AND OF THE, SORT  
7 OF -- IT'S NOT EASY TO KIND OF PUT TOGETHER A PLAN AROUND  
8 THIS, AND I THINK THERE BEING SOME DIFFICULT DECISIONS TO MAKE  
9 YOU ABOUT I THINK THE CONVERSATIONS WE HAD AT THE AD-HOC AND  
10 THE PROPOSALS TO STAFF PUT TOGETHER AND WE'RE KIND OF  
11 RECOMMENDING THE COMMISSION ADOPT ARE OUR BEST THINKING AROUND  
12 THIS AND PROVIDE STAFF WITH THE KIND OF GREATEST FLEXIBILITY  
13 TO -- AND, SORT OF, CLEAR, AT THE SAME TIME PROVIDING CLEAR  
14 DIRECTION OF HOW WE CAN REALLY DO OUR BEST TO MAKE SURE THAT  
15 OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES CONTINUE TO SURVIVE AND EVENTUALLY  
16 THRIVE.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. AND  
19 BEFORE TURNING IT OVER TO REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION  
20 AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. WHAT YOU SAID IS APPROPRIATE. THERE IS NO  
21 EASY SOLUTION IF THERE WAS WE WOULD HAVE DONE IT ALREADY.  
22 TRYING TO MANAGE EXPECTATIONS IS A DIFFICULT MOMENT TO  
23 REQUIRING US TO THINK DIFFERENTLY RECOGNIZING WE CAN'T  
24 COMPROMISE AND WE NEED TO DO WHAT WE NEED TO IT'S A BALANCING  
25 ACT. REBECCA?



APRIL 26, 2023

1  
2 **REBECCA LONG:** REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC  
3 AFFAIRS. IF WE COULD HAVE THE TECH TEAM PULL UP THE SLIDES  
4 PLEASE? AS THE TITLE OF THIS PRESENTATION SAYS , WE CAN'T  
5 AFFORD TO LOSE TRANSIT AND YOUR 2023 ADVOCACY PROGRAM  
6 IDENTIFIED SECURING STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE TO PROTECT  
7 EXISTING SERVICE AND FUND RIDER FOCUSED ENHANCEMENTS AS OUR  
8 TOP PRIORITY THIS YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. TODAY I'M GOING TO WALK  
9 THROUGH THE LATEST RIDERSHIP STATISTICS AND DEFICIT FORECASTS  
10 FOR BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES AND DESCRIBE OUR PROPOSED POLICY  
11 PRINCIPLES AND FUNDING OPTIONS TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF.  
12 AND SUPPORT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE REGION'S TRANSIT  
13 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, WHICH I BELIEVE YOU EACH HAVE AT  
14 YOUR PLACE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, OVERALL, TRANSIT RIDERSHIP ACROSS  
15 THE BAY AREA REMAINS AT ONLY 54% OF PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS, THIS  
16 IS BASED ON THE MOST RECENT DATA FROM THE NATIONAL TRANSIT  
17 DATABASE, AVERAGE FROM DECEMBER TO FEBRUARY OF THIS YEAR. BUT,  
18 EVEN SO, IT IS IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT OVER 21 MILLION  
19 PASSENGER TRIPS WERE TAKEN ON TRANSIT ON AVERAGE IN THAT  
20 PERIOD. SO IT IS STILL PROVIDING VERY IMPORTANT MOBILITY IN  
21 THE REGION. ALSO NOTED HERE IS THAT THE DROP IN TRANSIT USAGE  
22 IS NOT ENTIRELY EXPLAINED BY REMOTE WORK. ACCORDING TO THE  
23 CONSENSUS OF THOSE STILL COMMUTING THE SHARE TAKING TRANSIT  
24 HAS FALLEN FROM 14% IN 2019 TO 5% IN 2021. HOPEFULLY IT'S  
25 HIGHER THAN THAT. WE DON'T HAVE THE 2022 DATA YET BUT IT DOES





APRIL 26, 2023

1 INDICATE THERE IS STILL AN OPPORTUNITY EVEN WESTERN THE  
2 REDUCED MOBILITY AS A RESULT OF REMOTE WORK TO CAPTURE MORE OF  
3 THOSE TRANSIT TRIPS. NEXT SLIDE. RIDERSHIP RECOVERY DOES VARY  
4 A LOT BY OPERATOR, AS YOU CAN SEE HERE, WITH THE OPERATORS  
5 THAT ARE PRIMARILY FOCUSED ON SERVING THE COMMUTE, THE MOST  
6 DEPRESSED IN TERMS OF RECOVERY. YOU CAN SEE BART IS AROUND  
7 40%, CALTRAIN IS NOT QUITE THERE, GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT AROUND  
8 40% WHEREAS LOCAL BUS OPERATORS WHICH TEND TO SERVE MORE LOCAL  
9 TRIPS HAVE SEEN MUCH MORE ROBUST RECOVERY. NEXT SLIDE. A QUICK  
10 REMINDER OF WHAT WE LEARNED FROM THE SHORT RANGE TRANSIT PLANS  
11 THAT OPERATORS FINALIZE IN FEBRUARY. AT THE TOP THERE, FAREBOX  
12 DEPENDENT OPERATORS REMAIN VULNERABLE TO THE SLUGGISH  
13 RIDERSHIP RECOVERY IT'S OUR COMMUTE ORIENTED SYSTEMS THAT TEND  
14 TO HAVE THE HIGHEST FARES AND HIGHEST FAREBOX RECOVERY RATIOS  
15 IT'S A DOUBLE WHAMMY FOR THEM WITH THE RIDERSHIP BEING MORE DE  
16 DEPRESSED THAN OTHERS AND MORE DEPENDENT ON FARES IT'S  
17 IMPORTANT TO NOTE COST IS A FACTOR PANDEMIC REVENUES WOULD NOT  
18 BE SUFFICIENT TO PROVIDE THE HELVE OF SERVICE THAT WE'RE  
19 PROVIDING TODAY REALLY A MISMATCH ACROSS THE REVENUES GROWING  
20 COSTS HAVE BEEN EXACERBATED BY OVERALL INFLATION FISCAL CLIFF  
21 IS NOT THE ONLY CHALLENGE FACING TRANSIT SOME AGENCIES AND  
22 OPERATOR RECRUITMENT RETENTION ARE SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES WHEN  
23 IT COMES TO RESTORING TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS THE FACT  
24 AFFECTING MANY INDUSTRIES INCLUDING EDUCATION, HEALTH CARE,  
25 IT'S A REAL CHALLENGE. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE ILLUSTRATES THE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 CURRENT DEFICIT FORECAST PROVIDED BY BAY AREA OPERATORS  
2 CONSISTENT WITH THEIR CURRENT BUDGET FORECAST. WHAT YOU CAN  
3 SEE IS THAT FOR FISCAL YEAR '23, '24 THE BUDGET BEING  
4 NEGOTIATED RIGHT NOW IN SACRAMENTO WE'RE LOOKING AT AROUND 70  
5 MILLION THEN IT JUMPS UP SIGNIFICANTLY TO CLOSE TO 400 MILLION  
6 THE FOLLOWING YEAR AND THEN OVER 700 MILLION IN THOSE OUT  
7 YEARS. THIS REPRESENTS THE ANTICIPATED RIDERSHIP RECOVERY,  
8 COST DRIVERS, AND OTHER OPERATORS AND THE REASON FOR THIS  
9 SIGNIFICANT JUMP OVER THE NEXT TWO YEARS IS THAT SPEND-DOWN OF  
10 THE COVID RELIEF FUNDING THAT WE RECEIVED. SO THE MISMATCH  
11 BETWEEN ACTUAL REVENUES AND EXPENDITURES IS AROUND 700 MILLION  
12 TODAY, BUT OPERATORS HAVE ACCESS TO THOSE COVID RELIEF FUNDS.  
13 NEXT SLIDE. SO NEXT I'M GOING TO OUTLINE OUR ADVOCACY  
14 FRAMEWORK FOR THE DISTRIBUTION OF WHAT WE'RE CALLING STATE  
15 TRANSIT RECOVERY FUNDS. NEXT SLIDE. THE CASE FOR WHY THE STATE  
16 SHOULD STEP UP NOW TO PROTECT EXISTING TRANSIT SERVICE IS  
17 REALLY CLEAR. FOR ONE, THE STATE IS A SIGNIFICANT INVESTOR IN  
18 OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM, HAVING INVESTED ABOUT \$6.5 BILLION IN  
19 EXPANDING THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT NETWORK OVER THE LAST TWO  
20 DECADES, BUT RELATIVELY LITTLE SUPPORT ITS OPERATIONS COMPARED  
21 TO STATES WITH ROBUST TRANSIT SYSTEMS. CONGRESS BY CONTRAST  
22 HAS STEPPED UP INFUSING \$4.4 BILLION TO SUSTAIN CURRENT  
23 TRANSIT SERVICE. AND LAST BUT MOST IMPORTANTLY, TRANSIT IS  
24 FOUNDATIONAL TO THE STATE'S CLIMATE AND EQUITY GOALS. WE  
25 CANNOT CALL OURSELVES A STATE THAT LEADS ON CLIMATE CHANGE AND



APRIL 26, 2023

1 LET OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS COLLAPSE WE CANNOT CALL OURSELVES THE  
2 STATE THAT CARES MOST ABOUT VULNERABLE POPULATIONS AND SLASH  
3 TRANSIT SERVICE WHICH IS USED DISPROPORTIONATELY BY LOW-INCOME  
4 RESIDENTS, PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND RENTERS. NEXT SLIDE. IF  
5 TRANSIT IS TO REMAIN A CORE PART OF THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT  
6 SYSTEM THE STATE IS GOING TO NEED TO STEP UP THESE ARE THE KEY  
7 CONCEPTS GUIDING OUR ASK. FIRST TO SEEK NEW FUNDING FOR  
8 TRANSIT OPERATIONS PRIMARILY BY SHIFTING EXISTING RESOURCES  
9 THAT MINIMIZE IMPACT ON THE STATE'S GENERAL FUND. YOU'RE ALL  
10 AWARE THAT THE STATE IS FACING A SIGNIFICANT DEFICIT. IT WAS  
11 ESTIMATED IN JANUARY TO BE ABOUT 22 BILLION, RUMORS ARE THAT  
12 IT'S GOING TO ACTUALLY BE QUITE A BIT HIGHER THAN THAT, BUT  
13 WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING HERE DOES NOT SIGNIFICANTLY IMPACT THAT  
14 PORTION OF THE BUDGET DEBATE. WE'RE REALLY LOOKING AT SHIFTING  
15 OTHER FUNDING SOURCES. SECONDLY, WE DO RECOGNIZE THAT TRANSIT  
16 HAS TO SHOW IT HAS SKIN IN THE GAME AND THIS THERE IS  
17 EXPECTATION THAT TRANSIT IS WILLING TO FLEX SOME OF THE  
18 FUNDING AVAILABLE FOR TRANSIT CAPITAL TO OPERATING. WE WANT TO  
19 SEE FUNDING AVAILABLE TO ENSURE THAT TRANSIT SERVICES IS  
20 MAINTAINED WHICH WE'RE CALLING THE SURVIVE BUCKET AS WELL AS  
21 MAKE THOSE INVESTMENTS TO HELP MAKE TRANSIT THRIVE THAT ARE  
22 HIGHLIGHTED IN OUR TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. I WANT TO GIVE  
23 THE LEGISLATURE A RANGE OF OPTIONS SO THEY CAN MAKE THE  
24 DIFFICULT DECISIONS AROUND WEIGHING THE PROS AND CONS AND NOT  
25 GIVING TOO NARROW OF A SET OF OPTIONS TO WORK FROM. ALSO WE DO



APRIL 26, 2023

1 RECOGNIZE THAT THE LEGISLATURE IS GOING TO WANT TO SEE  
2 COMMITMENTS ON THE PART OF TRANSIT AND WE HAVE SOME IDEAS FOR  
3 HOW THE LEGISLATURE CAN ENCOURAGE IMPROVEMENTS TO TRANSIT  
4 SERVICE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS I NOTED, THIS PRINCIPLE IS REALLY  
5 ABOUT PROVIDING FUNDING BOTH TO SUSTAIN EXISTING SERVICE, THE  
6 SURVIVE PIECE, AND ALLOW TRANSIT TO RETOOL, THE THRIVE  
7 COMPONENT. NEXT SLIDE. PRINCIPLE TWO IS THAT THE SURVIVE FUNDS  
8 SHOULD REALLY BE DISTRIBUTED BASED ON NEED. THE NEEDS ARE  
9 REALLY DISPROPORTIONATE FOR CERTAIN OPERATORS, FOR EXAMPLE, IN  
10 THE BAY AREA, WE ARE LOOKING ABOUT 2/3 OF THE NEED IS FOR BART  
11 AND MUNI. AND MANY OF OUR OTHER REGIONS OPERATE -- MANY OF THE  
12 OTHER REGIONAL OPERATORS DEPEND ON THE SUCCESS OF BART AND  
13 MUNI, AND THEY ARE WELL AWARE OF THAT. BUT WE NEED TO BE  
14 FOCUSING THE FUNDS WHERE THEY'RE MOST NEEDED. FOR THE THRIVE  
15 CATEGORY, SOME KIND OF DISTRIBUTION BY FORMULA OR EVEN  
16 COMPETITIVE MAKES SENSE BECAUSE EVERY OPERATOR IN THE STATE  
17 COULD USE IMPROVEMENTS TO THEIR SERVICE TO ATTRACT NEW RIDERS.  
18 AND THEN LASTLY, SINCE THE NEED IS NOT AS SIGNIFICANT TO  
19 SUSTAIN SERVICE IN THAT NEXT BUDGET YEAR, MORE FUNDS COULD BE  
20 FRONT-LOADED TO ADDRESS THOSE IMPROVEMENTS WHICH COULD REDUCE  
21 OUT-YEAR DEFICITS BY ATTRACTING MORE RIDERS IN THE NEAR-TERM.  
22 NEXT SLIDE. SO, NEXT I'M GOING TO OUTLINE WHAT OUR KEY FUNDING  
23 SOURCE RECOMMENDATIONS ARE IN MORE DETAIL. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS  
24 CHART WHICH IS QUITE BUSY, YOU DON'T NEED TO COMMIT IT ALL TO  
25 MEMORY RIGHT NOW REPRESENTS A MENU OF OPTIONS THAT I'LL



APRIL 26, 2023

1 EXPLAIN IN DETAIL IN THE NEXT TWO SLIDES. I WOULD LIKE TO  
2 HIGHLIGHT TWO MAIN CATEGORIES OF FUNDING. THE TOP FOUR MENU  
3 ITEMS ARE NEW SOURCES OF PROPOSED TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUE  
4 THAT ARE PROPOSED TO BE TEMPORARY. YOU CAN SEE IN THE MIDDLE  
5 COLUMN IT INDICATES WHETHER THE CALIFORNIA TRANSIT  
6 ASSOCIATIONS COMMITTEE THAT WAS STOOD UP TO LOOK AT THE FISCAL  
7 CLIFF ENDORSED THESE OPTIONS. AND YOU CAN SEE THAT TWO OF THE  
8 NEW ONES, THEY DID ENDORSE, THAT'S CAP-AND-TRADE AND THE  
9 DIESEL SALES TAX SHIFT AND THE OTHERS THEY DID NOT AND I'M  
10 GOING TO GET INTO MORE DETAIL IN A MINUTE ON WHAT EACH OF  
11 THESE OPTIONS ARE. THE NEXT COLUMN IS THE AMOUNT THAT WE'RE  
12 RECOMMENDING THE LEGISLATURE CONSIDER ON, AS A MAXIMUM IN EACH  
13 OF THESE CATEGORIES. AND YOU WILL NOTE THAT 7.4 BILLION IS THE  
14 SUMMATION OF THOSE. THAT IS MORE THAN WHAT THE CALIFORNIA  
15 TRANSIT ASSOCIATION ESTIMATES AS THE TOTAL STATEWIDE NEED  
16 WHICH IS AROUND 6 BILLION. BUT WE'RE -- WHAT WE'RE  
17 RECOMMENDING IS TO GIVE THE LEGISLATURE, AGAIN, MORE CAPACITY  
18 IN THE SET OF OPTIONS THAT WE'RE SUGGESTING, SO THAT THEY HAVE  
19 MORE FLEXIBILITY TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS. AND THE LAST COLUMN HERE  
20 IS JUST ILLUSTRATING WITHIN EACH CATEGORY OF FUNDING WHAT  
21 PORTION ARE WE SUGGESTING BE SHIFTED OR MADE AVAILABLE. NEXT  
22 SLIDE. OKAY. SO OUR STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS THAT THE  
23 COMMISSION ENDORSE EACH OF THOSE OPTIONS THAT WERE IN THAT  
24 MENU, 1 THROUGH 4, STARTING WITH CAP-AND-TRADE. THIS AMOUNT IS  
25 ABOUT 1/3 OF THE DISCRETIONARY FUNDING AVAILABLE. AS YOU



APRIL 26, 2023

1 LIKELY ARE WELL AWARE, CAP-AND-TRADE IS DISTRIBUTED PRIMARILY  
2 ON A CONTINUOUS APPROPRIATION BASIS WITH SPECIFIC PERCENTAGES  
3 PROVIDED, FOR EXAMPLE, TO HIGH SPEED RAIL, TO AFFORDABLE  
4 HOUSING. WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT HERE IS JUST THE PORTION  
5 THAT'S CALLED DISCRETIONARY, WHERE THE LEGISLATURE  
6 APPROPRIATES IT EACH YEAR AND IT'S ABOUT 1.5 BILLION. SO WE'RE  
7 SUGGESTING THAT A MAXIMUM OF 500 MILLION BE MADE AVAILABLE IN  
8 THAT CATEGORY. THIS WOULD FACILITATE, STILL, THE COMMITMENT  
9 THAT IS THE GOVERNOR HAS RECOMMENDED FOR ZERO EMISSION  
10 VEHICLES, AND STILL ACCOMMODATE THAT. CLEARLY CAP-AND-TRADE  
11 ALSO HAS PRECEDENT FOR FUNDING TRANSIT AND HAS A STRONG NEXUS  
12 TO CLIMATE CHANGE. THE NEXT BIG ITEM IS THE SHOPP.  
13 SPECIFICALLY A PORTION OF THE NEW FEDERAL HIGHWAY FUNDING  
14 INCREASE THAT THE STATE RECEIVED WHICH IS ROUGHLY 1 BILLION A  
15 YEAR STAYING AT THE STATE. STAFF IS PROPOSING MAXIMUM OF 500  
16 MILLION TO BE USED TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL CLIFF EACH YEAR  
17 STARTING WITH THE 300 MILLION THE GOVERNOR HAS ALREADY SHIFTED  
18 SOME FUNDS TO BACKFILL THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM  
19 COMMITMENTS FROM LAST YEAR'S BUDGET. WE DO NOT MAKE THIS  
20 RECOMMENDATION LIGHTLY. MTC HAS BEEN A CHAMPION OF THE  
21 IMPORTANCE OF FIX IT FIRST WITH 2/3 OF PLANNED BAY AREA'S  
22 TRANSPORTATION SPENDING GOING TOWARDS MAINTAINING AND  
23 OPERATING OUR CURRENT TRANSPORTATION NETWORK AND THE REASON WE  
24 FEEL THIS RECOMMENDATION IS SOUND IS THANKS TO THE HUGE  
25 INCREASE IN FEDERAL HIGHWAY FORMULA FUNDING THAT THE STATE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 RECEIVED FROM THE INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT AND JOBS ACT AND  
2 THAT FUNDING INCREASE WAS SO SIGNIFICANT THAT THIS SHIFT IN  
3 FUND COULD BE DONE WITHOUT IMPACTING ANY EXISTING SHOPP  
4 PROJECTS WHICH IS AN \$18 BILLION PROGRAM OVER FOUR YEARS AND  
5 ACCOMMODATING A 19% INCREASE IN SHOPP PROGRAMMING. GIVEN THAT  
6 WE THINK IT'S WORTHY OF CONSIDERATION AND ADVANCEMENT TO THE  
7 LEGISLATURE. THE NEXT ONE IS THE DIESEL SALES TAX. THIS IS THE  
8 SOLE FUNDING SOURCE TODAY, THE DIESEL SALES TAX FOR STATE  
9 TRANSIT ASSISTANCE RECEIVING 80% OF THAT PROGRAM, BUT A SMALL  
10 PORTION DOES NOT GO TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND THAT WAS  
11 ACTUALLY SUSPENDED, 2.5% OF THE RATE WAS SUSPENDED IN LAST  
12 YEAR'S BUDGET TO PROVIDE SOME ECONOMIC RELIEF. OUR  
13 RECOMMENDATION IS THAT WHEN THAT COMES BACK ONLINE, THIS  
14 OCTOBER, THOSE FUNDS BE ALSO DEDICATED TO TRANSIT, BUT THIS  
15 WOULD REQUIRE A GENERAL FUND BACKFILL. SO, THAT IS ONE OF THE  
16 LIMITATIONS OF THIS PROPOSAL. AND, LASTLY, THE TRANSPORTATION  
17 IMPROVEMENT FEE, OR TIF, THIS WOULD REPRESENT A MODEST  
18 INCREASE IN THIS REGISTRATION FEE WHOSE RATE VARIES DEPENDING  
19 ON THE VALUE OF THE VEHICLE. PROPOSAL HERE WOULD EXEMPT 40% OF  
20 THE STATE A VEHICLES BY PROPOSING NO SURCHARGE ON VEHICLES  
21 VALUED BELOW \$5,000 AND ONLINE A \$10 SURCHARGE ON VEHICLES UP  
22 TO 35,000. SO, THAT IS THAT. AND THEN I'M GOING TO WALK  
23 THROUGH THE NEXT SET OF RECOMMENDATIONS ON FUNDING SHIFTS.  
24 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, AS YOU MAY RECALL FROM THE SLIDE WITH  
25 THE TABLE, CTA ALSO ENDORSED A NUMBER OF FUNDING SHIFTS FROM



APRIL 26, 2023

1 EXISTING REVENUE. THOSE INCLUDE CONTINUING TO PROVIDE  
2 FLEXIBILITY IN WHAT'S CALLED THE LC-TOP, LOW CARBON TRANSIT  
3 OPERATIONS PROGRAM AND THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE STATE OF  
4 GOOD REPAIR. THOSE ARE ALREADY BEING USED FOR TRANSIT  
5 OPERATIONS IN THE BAY AREA. SO THAT'S GREAT TO CONTINUE THAT.  
6 IT DOES NOT HELP THE REGION. SO, WE'RE JUST STAYING NEUTRAL ON  
7 THAT TO REALLY PUT THE FOCUS ON THE NEW REVENUE. THE OTHER TWO  
8 ITEMS ARE SHIFTING, THE TIRCP PROGRAM, THE TRANSIT AND INNER  
9 CITY RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM, THEIR TWO PORTIONS OF THIS PROGRAM,  
10 ONE WAS THE GENERAL FUND AUGMENTATION THAT WE HAVE YET TO  
11 RECEIVE BUT ARE HOPING TO RECEIVE IN THIS YEAR'S BUDGET THEN  
12 THERE'S THE REGULAR TIRCP THAT WE JUST HEARD EARLIER TODAY WE  
13 RECEIVED A NUMBER OF PROJECTS IN THE BAY AREA HAVE RECEIVED  
14 AWARD ON WHAT YOU CAN SEE HERE IS CONCERN THAT WE HAVE ADOPTED  
15 COMMITMENT FOR HOW TO SPEND THESE FUNDS IN OUR MAJOR PROJECT  
16 ADVANCEMENT SO RELYING ON THESE FUNDS WOULD PUT MAJOR PROJECT  
17 ADVANCEMENTS IN JEOPARDY. LASTLY, LEGISLATURE WILL MAKE SOME  
18 DEMANDS IN TERMS OF ACCOUNTABILITY WHAT THEY WANT TO SEE FROM  
19 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN EXCHANGE FOR THESE FUNDS THAT'S NOT  
20 UNREASONABLE BUT ALSO DOES REPRESENT AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
21 ACCELERATE TRANSFORMATION ACTIONS ALREADY UNDERWAY HIGHLIGHTED  
22 HERE, SAFETY, CONVENIENCE AND SPEED WITH ANY REQUIREMENTS  
23 ATTACHED TO FUNDS WE PROPOSE ADVOCATING THEY INCLUDE RIDER  
24 FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS. NEXT SLIDE. LAST BUT NOT LEAST,  
25 LEGISLATURE WANTS TO KNOW WHAT IS THE LONG-TERM PLAN FOR





APRIL 26, 2023

1 TRANSIT TRANSITION TO A FINANCIALLY SUSTAINABLE BUSINESS  
2 MODEL. WE ARE ANTICIPATING DEFICITS IN THE RANGE OF 700  
3 MILLION BUT MAKING A FIVE YEAR ASK HERE, WHAT IS THE PLAN.  
4 WHAT'S ILLUSTRATED HERE IS SHORTHAND TO SHOW THAT WE DO IN  
5 FACT HAVE A PLAN AND SOME OF IT IS ALREADY UNDERWAY THANKS TO  
6 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IMPLEMENTING SOME OF THOSE  
7 PROJECTS AND PILOTS INCLUDING RELATED TO INTEGRATE THE FARES.  
8 ALREADY HAPPENING NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS BEING STOOD UP LATER  
9 THIS YEAR AND ALSO STARTING NOW BUT TO BE COMPLETED IN 2025 IS  
10 THE TRANSIT 2050 PLUS WHICH IS A TRANSIT NETWORK PLAN TO  
11 REALLY CHART OUT WHAT THE REGION'S TRANSIT NETWORK SHOULD BE,  
12 HOW MUCH IS ANTICIPATED TO COST, AND THEN OF COURSE, NEXT  
13 YEAR, ASSUMING THAT WE CONTINUE ON THE PATH THAT THE  
14 COMMISSION HAS DIRECTED US ALREADY, WE PLAN TO PURSUE ENABLING  
15 LEGISLATION FOR A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TO PUT ON  
16 THE BALLOT IN 2026 AND BY 2028 MANY OF THE TRANSFORMATION  
17 ACTION PLAN PRIORITIES WILL BE WELL UNDERWAY IN TERMS OF  
18 IMPLEMENTATION, REALLY PUTTING US ON A MUCH MORE STABLE  
19 FOOTING. SO, YOU KNOW, THERE IS GOING TO BE MANY MORE ACTIONS  
20 THAT ARE ILLUSTRATED ON THIS SLIDE THAT NEED TO HAPPEN, BUT  
21 THERE IS A CLEAR TRAJECTORY TO GET TO STABILITY. NEXT SLIDE.  
22 SO, AS YOU CAN SEE HERE, THERE ARE JUST SIX WEEKS BETWEEN NOW  
23 AND THE STATE BUDGET'S ADOPTION. THERE IS A LOT OF ACTIVITY  
24 HAPPENING IN SACRAMENTO THIS MORNING THE SENATE IS EXPECTED TO  
25 RELEASE THEIR SENATE BUDGET PLAN FROM THE SENATE PRO TEMPORE,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TONY ATKINS WHICH WE BELIEVE WILL REFERENCE TRANSIT IN THAT  
2 PLAN. SENATOR WIENER HAS ENDORSED ALL OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS  
3 BEFORE YOU TODAY, AND IS HOLDING A PRESS CONFERENCE AT NOON  
4 RELATED TO CHAMPION, YOU KNOW, THE NEED TO ADDRESS THIS IN THE  
5 BUDGET. SO IT'S GOING TO BE A BUSY TIME. AND JUST APPRECIATE  
6 THE TIME YOU HAVE GIVEN ME TODAY TO MAKE THE CASE FOR WHAT OUR  
7 MESSAGE WE THINK NEEDS TO BE IN SACRAMENTO. SO WE'RE HOPING  
8 THAT YOU CAN ENDORSE THE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND I'M HAPPY  
9 TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU REBECCA. I THINK YOU WILL  
12 HAVE MULTIPLE QUESTIONS. SO, COMMISSIONERS, ANYONE WANT TO  
13 KICK IT OFF? COMMISSIONER SPERING.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I DON'T KNOW OF ANY DECISION THIS COMMISSION  
16 IS GOING TO MAKE PROBABLY IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS THAT'S  
17 GOING TO BE MORE IMPORTANT THAN THIS THAT'S REALLY GOING TO  
18 SET TRANSPORTATION FUNDING PROBABLY THE NEXT GENERATION. YOU  
19 KNOW, THE CONCERN I HAVE IS, WE HAVEN'T REALLY SEEN WHAT THE  
20 OPERATORS HAVE DONE, YOU KNOW, WHAT CUTS HAVE THEY MADE, YOU  
21 KNOW, WHAT IS THEIR LONG RANGE PLANNING. AND ANOTHER CONCERN I  
22 HAVE IS WHEN WE MAKE THIS SHIFT IN FUNDING, I THINK EVERYBODY  
23 IN THIS ROOM KNOWS THAT IF THINGS DON'T CHANGE, THAT SHIFT IS  
24 GOING TO BE PERMANENT AND IT'S GOING TO AFFECT, YOU KNOW, THE  
25 CONDITION OF ALL THE OTHER MODES OF TRANSPORTATION IN THE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 STATE. AND, SO, THIS HAS TO BE WELL THOUGHT OUT. I DON'T KNOW  
2 THAT WE HAVE PUT ENOUGH EMPHASIS ON THE ACCOUNTABILITY. ARE  
3 THE NUMBERS WE'RE GETTING, THIS FISCAL CLIFF, YOU KNOW, HOW  
4 ACCURATE ARE THOSE NUMBERS? HOW ARE WE VERIFYING THOSE  
5 NUMBERS? THAT'S NUMBER ONE. AND THE OTHER IS, YOU KNOW, AS YOU  
6 SHOW THAT ONE CHART WITH THE RIDERSHIP RECOVERY VARIES, YOU  
7 KNOW WHEN YOU LOOK AT THE SMALL OPERATORS, THEY SEEM TO BE  
8 RECOVERING, AND SERVING THEIR LOCAL COMMUNITIES. AND YOU ALL  
9 HAVE HEARD ME SAY THIS BEFORE, I THINK THE SMALL OPERATORS  
10 NEED TO BE TREATED SEPARATELY, BECAUSE IF THEY'RE HEALTHY, I  
11 THINK THEY WILL FEED INTO THE LARGER OPERATORS BUT IF THE  
12 SMALL OPERATORS AREN'T HEALTHY, I MEAN, THAT'S ANOTHER LINK WE  
13 FAIL, YOU KNOW, RECOVERING FOR A TRANSIT RIDER. SO THAT'S A  
14 CONCERN I HAVE. THEN, YOU KNOW, IF MTC, IF WE DON'T CONDITION  
15 ANYTHING WE APPROVE, ESPECIALLY WITH THIS TRANSFORMATIONAL  
16 ACTION PLAN, WE ARE -- WE ARE BEING VERY SHORTSIGHTED. THIS IS  
17 AN OPPORTUNITY THAT MOST OF US WON'T SEE AGAIN IN OUR  
18 POLITICAL LIFE. AND I THINK WE HAVE GOT TO CONDITION THE  
19 MONEY, DEMAND THE CHANGES THAT WE HAVE SEEN, DEMAND THE  
20 CHANGES THAT THE RIDERS HAVE CLEARLY IDENTIFIED, AND THIS  
21 NETWORK MANAGER, I DON'T THINK, IF IT EVER HAS BEEN MORE  
22 IMPORTANT, THIS IS IT. THIS TRULY IS THE OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO  
23 PUT THAT IN PLACE TO MAKE SURE THE THINGS THAT WE'RE ASKING  
24 FOR OR REQUIRING THE OPERATORS TO DO, GET DONE. YOU KNOW, I'M  
25 KIND OF CONCERNED ABOUT US JUST APPROVING THIS TODAY. I THINK



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THERE SHOULD BE A HELL OF A LOT MORE DISCUSSION, ESPECIALLY ON  
2 1, 2, 3, 4, AND THE OTHER ONES. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM  
3 MY COLLEAGUES ON HOW THEY FEEL ABOUT THAT. BUT THIS IS A BIG  
4 DECISION THAT YOU'RE ASKING US TO MAKE TODAY. I MEAN, THIS  
5 REALLY AFFECTS A LOT OF PROJECTS. YOU KNOW? AND, YOU KNOW,  
6 THIS LAST WINTER, I DON'T KNOW ABOUT MOST COUNTIES, BUT THE  
7 ROADS ARE JUST IN TERRIBLE REPAIR. AND, YOU KNOW, IF YOU START  
8 SHIFTING MONEY FROM THAT, I MEAN, THAT AFFECTS EVERYTHING.  
9 AND, SO, IT JUST -- TO ME, IT JUST SEEMS LIKE YOU ARE ASKING  
10 US FOR A LOT RIGHT NOW WITHOUT REALLY SAYING THIS IS WHAT WE  
11 EXPECT IN RETURN. AND I THINK THAT WE HAVE TO HAVE THAT  
12 DISCUSSION. SO, MR. CHAIRMAN, THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. I JUST  
13 THINK THIS IS REALLY A VERY IMPORTANT DECISION THAT WE'RE  
14 MAKING TODAY

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER SPERING. AND,  
17 LOOK, I CONCUR WITH THE COMMENTS THAT YOU HAVE MADE. I DO WANT  
18 TO SEE THIS MOVE FORWARD WITH A CONDITION. AND TO ME, A LOT OF  
19 THE DATA THAT WE HAVE SEEN, WHEN WE FIRST SAW THE DATA IT WAS  
20 BASED OFF SOME ASSUMPTIONS. NOW WE HAVE MORE ROADWAY, MORE  
21 DATA TO REALLY TRUE-UP THOSE ASSUMPTIONS AND TO REALLY  
22 UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY ARE ASSUMING AND PROJECTING. THAT COUPLED  
23 WITH SOME OF THE BOLD DISCUSSIONS WE NEED IT MAKE WE NEED TO  
24 UNDERSTAND THAT DATA AND WHO IS REVIEWING THAT DATA TO  
25 UNDERSTAND THE FISCAL GAPS IN RIDERSHIP. FOR US TO MAKE THESE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 DECISIONS WE NEED CONFIDENCE IN THAT. REBECCA PART OF WHAT I'M  
2 GOING TO BE ASKING FOR IS YOU COME BACK WITH THAT TYPE OF  
3 INFORMATION BUT ALSO WHAT OPERATORS ARE DOING TO BE  
4 RESPONSIBLE AND ALSO TO BE A PARTNER IN ADDRESSING THE FISCAL  
5 CLIFF WE'RE FACING. I THINK THAT IS CRITICAL. SO, TO ME,  
6 THAT'S PART OF WHAT I WANT TO SEE. AND YOU KNOW, AS  
7 COMMISSIONER SPERING MENTIONED, THIS JUST UNDERSCORES THE NEED  
8 FOR NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND WHAT WE'RE DOING. AND THAT'S  
9 HAPPENING ON THAT TRACK. SO I DON'T WANT TO WALK BACK WHAT  
10 WE'RE DOING AND WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT THAT TOMORROW  
11 OF SOME THINGS THAT ARE IN MOTION ALREADY WHERE OUTCOMES DON'T  
12 MATERIALIZE BUT THERE IS A LOT IN MOTION. MOST IMPORTANTLY IS  
13 THE DATA AND HOLDING EVERYONE ACCOUNTABLE NOT JUST THE  
14 OPERATORS. THE OPERATORS WANT TO BE ACCOUNTABLE BUT I WANT TO  
15 MAKE SURE WHAT WE DO HERE IS NOT PROLONGING A BIGGER ISSUE,  
16 THAT WE ARE TRYING TO GET RIDERSHIP BACK, AND WHAT WE DO HAS  
17 TO BE GEARED TOWARDS THAT, AND TO ME, WE NEED TO BE VERY  
18 INTENTIONAL OF THAT. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

19

20 **CINDY CHAVEZ, CHAIR:** YES. THANK YOU. YOU KNOW, FIRST OF ALL, I  
21 JUST WANT TO SAY HOW MUCH I APPRECIATE THAT THE STAFF DIDN'T  
22 HAVE A GREAT -- A BUNCH OF GREAT CHOICES. RIGHT? AND THAT ALL  
23 OF OUR AGENCIES ACROSS THE BOARD ARE REALLY SUFFERING, AND I  
24 THINK WHAT THEY DID IS BRING US, YOU KNOW, THE BEST THINKING  
25 THAT THEY COULD. AND I'M GOING TO TURN AWAY FROM YOU ALL FOR A



APRIL 26, 2023

1 MOMENT AND LOOK AT US UP HERE AND JUST MAKE A COUPLE OF  
2 OBSERVATIONS. I THINK ONE IS THAT, I JUST WANT TO REEMPHASIZE  
3 THE LAST THING YOU SAID ALFREDO, AND THAT IS I BELIEVE THAT  
4 EVERY SINGLE ONE OF OUR AGENCIES IS TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW  
5 TO SURVIVE. SO, I THINK THAT'S ONE. I THINK TWO, THAT FOR MANY  
6 OF OUR AGENCIES, THE LIFE CYCLE OF THE IMPACTS OF THE ECONOMY,  
7 THE IMPACTS OF RIDERSHIP HAVE ALL HIT THEM DIFFERENTLY, AND  
8 THEY HAVE ALL RESPONDED, I THINK, TO A DEGREE, AND TRYING TO  
9 ANTICIPATE WHAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN NEXT. SO, RATHER THAN HAVE  
10 THE STAFF NECESSARILY BRING BACK, YOU KNOW, WHAT THEY, YOU  
11 KNOW, REPRESENTING THE OPERATORS, I THINK IF IT'S APPROPRIATE,  
12 I THINK IT'S TOTALLY APPROPRIATE TO HAVE OPERATORS COME AND  
13 TALK ABOUT HOW THEY'RE RESPONDING. BECAUSE ONE THING I WORRY  
14 ABOUT IS GETTING INTO AN US/THEM. WE'RE ONE TEAM, AND WE HAVE  
15 GOT TO COMPORT OURSELVES THAT WAY. I WANT TO GIVE ONE EXAMPLE  
16 THAT I THINK IS CRITICAL FOR US TO THINK ABOUT. I'M GOING TO  
17 USE VTA AS AN EXAMPLE. SO, WE, THE VALLEY TRANSPORTATION  
18 AUTHORITY, I SIT ON THE VTA BOARD AND THE CALTRAIN BOARD. THEY  
19 COULDN'T BE MORE DIFFERENT IN TERMS OF HOW THEY'RE RESPONDING  
20 -- NOT HOW THEY'RE RESPONDING -- BUT HOW THEY'RE BEING  
21 IMPACTED. VTA, FOR YEARS AND YEARS AND YEARS, BECAUSE OF OUR  
22 LOW FAREBOX RECOVERY, AND THE 1200 ACRES, 1200 SQUARE MILES WE  
23 COVER, HAVE BEEN CUTTING SERVICES FOR YEARS SO MUCH SO THAT  
24 WE'RE DOWN TO A SPINE TRYING TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ABLE TO  
25 CONNECT BECAUSE WE'RE AN INTEGRATED SERVICE AND REALLY TRYING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 TO GET SMALL SO WE COULD GROW. FOR CALTRAIN, CALTRAIN WAS  
2 ZOOMING DOWN GETTING BIGGER AND BIGGER AND BIGGER BECAUSE THE  
3 FAREBOX RECOVERY, I THINK WAS, AT ITS HIGH .74%, VTA IS AT 14.  
4 SO, VTA, PRIOR TO COVID WAS ALREADY SCOPING DOWN. CALTRAIN'S  
5 SCOPING UP, AND NOW THEY DON'T HAVE FAREBOX TO CONTINUE TO  
6 GROW. EACH OF THOSE AGENCIES IS PROPOSING SOME STRATEGIES THAT  
7 I THINK WE NEED TO ASK OURSELVES, WHAT ARE THE SHARED  
8 STRATEGIES, WHAT ARE THE DIFFERENT STRATEGIES, BASED ON WHAT  
9 YOU SAID JIM ON SIZE, IMPLICATIONS OF THE CURRENT ECONOMIC  
10 FRAMEWORK. TO MAKE IT AN US NOT THEM FRAMEWORK WE SHOULD  
11 INVITE THEM HAVE THE SAME QUESTIONS FOR ALL OF THEM GIVE THEM  
12 FIVE SLIDES 15 MINUTES. I REALLY DON'T CARE BUT I THINK I  
13 DON'T WANT TO PUT OUR STAFF IN AN AWKWARD POSITION IN  
14 TESTIMONY OF DEFENDING AND NOT DEFENDING HOW PEOPLE ARE DOING  
15 THEIR WORLD. AND THE LAST THING I WANT TO ADD WHICH IS A NON  
16 SEQUITUR BUT RELATED TO OUR CHAMPIONS IN SACRAMENTO. OUR  
17 CHAMPIONS OF IN DIFFERENT PLACES BASED ON WHAT THE IMMEDIATE  
18 NEEDS OF THE COMMUNITIES ARE. AND ONE THING I HOPE COMES OUT  
19 OF OUR DISCUSSION IS THAT WE ALL CAN HAVE SOME SHARED  
20 STRATEGIES THAT WE CAN SHARE WITH OUR ENTIRE DELEGATION. I DID  
21 -- THE CHAIR OF OUR COMMITTEE, CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ ASKED US TO  
22 MAKE SOME PHONE CALLS, AND IT WILL NOT SURPRISE YOU, DEPENDING  
23 ON WHERE YOU SIT IS HOW YOU SEE THE WORLD, AND I -- WHICH  
24 MAKES SENSE, RIGHT? -- BUT TO THAT END, I THINK TO  
25 COMMISSIONER SPERING'S POINT, THAT THE COMMISSION NOT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 NECESSARILY THE STATE, BUT THE COMMISSION NEEDS TO BUILD IN  
2 ENOUGH FLEXIBILITY IN OUR REQUESTS THAT IT ALLOWS THE  
3 COMMISSION TO RESPOND REGIONALLY IN THE BEST FAITH THAT WE CAN  
4 DO THAT. SO, ANYWAY, THOSE ARE KIND OF SOME BROAD THOUGHTS.

5 THANK YOU COLLEAGUES

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. GREAT  
8 COMMENTS. I AGREE WITH YOU IT'S NOT ABOUT US VERSUS THEM WE'RE  
9 ALL IN THIS TOGETHER. THAT'S SO IMPORTANT. THANK YOU FOR THAT.  
10 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, THEN COMMISSIONER PAPAN THEN  
11 COMMISSIONER RONEN.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING, I  
14 THINK -- YOU KNOW, I CERTAINLY HEAR YOUR CONCERNS ABOUT THIS.  
15 AND THESE WERE ALL CHALLENGES THAT WE GRAPPLED WITH IN THE AD-  
16 HOC, AND WE HAD DISCUSSIONS ABOUT WHETHER WE -- ABOUT WHETHER  
17 WE NEEDED TO DO MORE WORK ON THIS BEFORE BRINGING IT TO THE  
18 COMMISSION. AND, UNFORTUNATELY, WE'RE NOT ON OUR OWN TIMELINE  
19 HERE. THE STATE BUDGET IS GETTING NEGOTIATED AS WE SPEAK, I  
20 THINK, MAYBE EVEN -- LITERALLY AS WE SPEAK, I THINK THE SENATE  
21 IS RELEASING THEIR BUDGET BLUEPRINT, THERE IS OBVIOUSLY THE  
22 MAY REVISE COMING FROM THE GOVERNOR, AND WE, UNFORTUNATELY,  
23 DON'T HAVE THE LUXURY OF KIND OF PAUSING TO MAKE THIS AS GOOD  
24 AS IT SHOULD BE, AND AS COMPREHENSIVE AS IT SHOULD BE. BECAUSE  
25 WE NEED TO, I THINK, GIVE STAFF, SORT OF, THIS INITIAL





APRIL 26, 2023

1 DIRECTION, WHICH DOESN'T HAVE TO BE THE FINAL DIRECTION, BUT  
2 THE INITIAL DIRECTION TO KIND OF BE ABLE TO ENGAGE  
3 SUCCESSFULLY ON BEHALF OF THE REGION IN SACRAMENTO. AND SO, I  
4 THINK THAT'S ANOTHER ONE OF THE DIFFICULT DECISIONS WHICH  
5 DIDN'T HAVE GOOD -- WHICH WE DIDN'T HAVE LOTS OF GREAT  
6 OPTIONS, THAT WE, ULTIMATELY, SORT OF, ENDED UP RECOMMENDING,  
7 WE KIND OF GIVE -- WE -- WE -- THE AD-HOC ENDED UP  
8 RECOMMENDING TO THE COMMISSION THAT WE KIND OF MOVE FORWARD  
9 WITH THIS AS OF NOW. TO ADDRESS ONE OR TWO OTHER OF YOUR  
10 POINTS, I THINK WE REALLY DID FEEL -- AND MAYBE WE NEED TO  
11 REEMPHASIZE THIS, THAT THESE FUNDING -- THIS REALLY IS, SORT  
12 OF, A TRANSITIONAL MOMENT, AND THAT WE ARE TRULY ASKING FOR  
13 TEMPORARY FUNDING. OUR HOPE IS THAT IN 2026, WE WILL BE ABLE  
14 TO GO OUT WITH THE BIG REGIONAL MEASURE THAT WILL PUT OUR  
15 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES ON MUCH MORE SECURE FINANCIAL FOOTING  
16 AND WILL KIND OF JUST NOT REQUIRE US TO RELY ON THE STATE TO  
17 THE SAME DEGREE THAT WE ARE IN THIS PERIOD, AND WE'RE ALSO  
18 HOPING THAT SOME OF THE CHANGES THAT WE ARE KIND OF INITIATING  
19 THROUGH THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE AND THE TRANSFORMATIVE  
20 ACTION PLAN WILL REALLY HELP BRING BACK RIDERS TO SOME OF OUR  
21 MOST IMPORTANT TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND SO WE'RE HOPING -- OF  
22 COURSE, THERE'S "WE'RE HOPING" BUT NOT THE HOPE, THAT BY  
23 COMING, SORT OF, OUT OF, SORT OF, AFTER NOVEMBER 2026, WE WILL  
24 HAVE SOME RIDERSHIP RECOVERY, A NEW FUNDING SOURCE REGIONALLY  
25 AND WON'T BE IN A POSITION TO HAVE TO GO TO THESE FUNDING



APRIL 26, 2023

1 SOURCES AGAIN, FROM THE STATE. AND I THINK ON THE HIGHWAY  
2 FUNDING, IT'S -- THERE IS ANOTHER ELEMENT WHICH ALSO MAKES IT,  
3 I THINK, NATURALLY MORE TEMPORARY, BECAUSE WE'RE NOT GOING UP  
4 -- WHAT THE RECOMMENDATION WAS, WAS NOT TO TOUCH ANY OF THE  
5 BASE FUNDING THAT MIGHT BE ALLOCATED TO SHOPP BY THE STATE.  
6 AND IT HASN'T YET BEEN ALLOCATED TO SHOPP BY THE STATE. IT'S  
7 FUNDING COMING FROM THE IRA WHICH ITSELF IS TEMPORARY. SO THAT  
8 IS GOING TO -- THAT IS NOT GOING TO BE PERMANENT. SPECIFICALLY  
9 IN PRESIDENT BIDEN'S BUDGET, FY 2024 BUDGET MESSAGE, IT'S  
10 SPEAKING TO THESE FUNDS SPECIFICALLY, OF WHICH WE ARE, SORT  
11 OF, THE AD-HOC RECOMMENDED THAT WE ADVOCATE TO THE STATE TO  
12 FLEX A PORTION OF THEM TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS ON A TEMPORARY  
13 BASIS, AND I QUOTE "THE BUDGET ALSO ENCOURAGES STATES TO  
14 SUPPORT THEIR TRANSIT SYSTEMS BY TRANSFERRING AVAILABLE  
15 FEDERAL AID, HIGHWAY FUNDING FOR TRANSIT OPERATING NEEDS." SO,  
16 EVEN IN PRESIDENT BIDEN'S BUDGET FOR THIS TEMPORARY IRA BOOST  
17 TO FEDERAL AID HIGHWAY FUNDING, HE ALREADY ENVISIONED THERE  
18 COULD BE, SORT OF, TEMPORARY TRANSFERS TO TRANSIT OPERATING  
19 NEEDS FOR STATES LIKE OURS THAT REALLY NEED IT. AND IT'S  
20 CERTAINLY SOMETHING THAT WE -- YOU KNOW, IT WAS A DIFFICULT --  
21 IT WAS DIFFICULT, AND THERE IS A GOOD CHANCE THAT, YOU KNOW,  
22 FOR WHATEVER REASON, THAT WE DON'T -- THE STATE DECIDES NOT TO  
23 FLEX THIS FEDERAL AID HIGHWAY FUNDING TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS  
24 BUT IT'S IMPORTANT TO KIND OF KEEP IT ON THE TABLE AT THIS  
25 STAGE SO THAT WE HAVE KIND OF AS MANY OPTIONS AS POSSIBLE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 GOING UP IN SACRAMENTO AND THESE FAST MOVING BUDGET  
2 NEGOTIATIONS ARE. AND I THINK TO REITERATE WHAT EVERYONE ELSE  
3 SAID WE WISH THERE WERE AS MANY OPTIONS GOING UP TO SACRAMENTO  
4 BUT UNFORTUNATELY WE HAVE TO PICK FROM A BUNCH OF BAD OPTIONS.  
5 ALL THE POINTS YOU MADE, COMMISSIONER SPERING, WERE REALLY  
6 VALID.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** RONEN WAS BEFORE ME.

11

12 **HILLARY RONEN:** IT'S OKAY.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE'RE ALL GOING TO GET TO TALK.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** STAFF, THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR HARD WORK AND EFFORT  
17 HERE, BUT I REALLY NEED TO EMPHASIZE WHAT COMMISSIONER SPERING  
18 SAID HERE. WE HAVE HAD EVERY OPPORTUNITY. AND I HAVE SEEN THE  
19 LEGISLATIVE PACKET THAT WENT BEFORE THIS, AND AT THE VERY END,  
20 THERE WAS JUST A COMMENT ON DOING BETTER. AND I HEAR A  
21 STATEMENT FROM THE PROVIDERS, FROM BART, WE'RE GOING TO MAKE  
22 THIS AND THAT AND MAKE IT CLEANER. IT'S A LOT OF TALK. AND WE  
23 WANT TO -- THE PLAN HERE IS GREAT. BUT YOU'RE GOING TO THE  
24 STATE BUDGET AND THEY'RE HEARING FROM EVERY ONE OF THEIR, THE  
25 PEOPLE THEY REPRESENT. IT'S NOT WORKING RIGHT. AND WE WANT



APRIL 26, 2023

1 THEM TO GET THE FUNDING. DON'T GET ME WRONG. I WANT THIS  
2 FUNDING TO GO, BUT IF WE DON'T SEND THE MESSAGE ALONG WITH  
3 THAT, WE CONSISTENTLY, YOU KNOW, APPROVE THINGS. WE TALK -- WE  
4 HAVE GREAT CONVERSATIONS HERE. WE SAY WONDERFUL THINGS HERE  
5 AND IT DOESN'T -- IT'S NOT WRITTEN IN WHAT GOES FORWARD. AND  
6 THIS IS A TRANSITION, BUT IF COMMUNICATIVE IN THAT TRANSITION,  
7 WHEN WE GET TO THE BALLOT MEASURE SO MANY YEARS FROM NOW WE'RE  
8 GOING TO BE BEHIND BECAUSE WE DIDN'T BELIEVE THIS WAS GOING TO  
9 BE BETTER. I WANT TO MOVE FORWARD I WANT THIS TO HAPPEN BUT WE  
10 ALSO NEED TO ACCEPTED THAT MESSAGE, CLEARLY THAT, WHAT IS IN  
11 THE TRANSFORMATION PLAN, THAT THIS IS WHAT THE OPERATORS ARE  
12 SEEKING. AND MANY OF THEM ARE SEEKING IT. THEY ARE. THEY'RE  
13 TRYING TO GET THAT TO HAPPEN. BUT IT HAS TO BE CLEARLY IN  
14 WHATEVER FUNDING IS PROPOSED HERE. I CAN TELL YOU THE  
15 LEGISLATURE IS NOT HAPPY WITH LET'S JUST GET THIS MONEY OUT  
16 THERE, LET'S JUST KEEP IT GOING, BUT THERE IS NO ASSURANCES TO  
17 WHAT IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE MOVING FORWARD HERE. AND, AGAIN, I  
18 ABSOLUTELY FIRMLY BELIEVE THEY NEED FUNDING. BUT WITH THAT, WE  
19 HAVE TO BE CLEAR ON THE PRIORITIES, THE BLUE RIBBON, THE  
20 TRANSFORMATION PLAN HERE. BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T BEFORE. WE  
21 LITERALLY HAVE NOT. WE SPENT ALL THIS TIME ON THAT PLAN. WHEN  
22 I FIRST GOT ON THIS COMMISSION, WE ALREADY HAD A RESOLUTION  
23 THAT SAID MUCH OF THAT, AND NOBODY ENFORCED IT. NOBODY  
24 BELIEVED IT. WE BELIEVE IN THIS. THAT MESSAGE HAS TO GO WITH,  
25 THIS IS THE FUNDING THAT WE RECOMMEND. IF IT DOESN'T, BAD ON



APRIL 26, 2023

1 US. IT WON'T HAPPEN. IT WILL NOT HAPPEN. BECAUSE THE CLIFF IS  
2 SO CLEARLY THERE. EVERYBODY, THAT MESSAGE HAS TO GO FORWARD  
3 WITH WHATEVER WE DO HERE. AND I AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE SHOPP  
4 FUNDING. THE TRANSPORTATION -- THE HIGHWAY FUNDING. THAT'S A  
5 REALLY RIGHT NOW THAT, AS I THINK REBECCA SAID, FIX IT NOW --  
6 I'M A LITTLE UNFAMILIAR WITH THE TERMINOLOGY. BUT YOU ALSO  
7 SUGGESTED IT WOULDN'T HAVE THAT IMPACT. SO I'M A LITTLE  
8 CONFUSED ON THAT FRONT. AND WE REALLY NEED THE ROADS FIXED,  
9 REPAIRS ARE JUST GOING TO GET WORSE AND WORSE AND WORSE. AND,  
10 SO, IT'S AN INTERESTING QUANDARY. WE -- I THINK EVERYBODY HERE  
11 AGREES, WE NEED THE FUNDING. BUT, I MUST EMPHASIZE  
12 COMMISSIONER SPERING'S COMMENTS HERE, THAT MESSAGE NEEDS TO BE  
13 SENT NOW. AND IT -- YOU CAN'T SLOW IT DOWN. SO, PLEASE, IT'S  
14 THE BIGGEST MESSAGE WE CAN SENDS. IF WE'RE NOT SENDING IT NOW,  
15 AS WE LEAD UP TO THE BALLOT MEASURE, IT'S WHAT DID YOU DO FOR  
16 ME? AND YOU DIDN'T DO IT. I HOPE WE MOVE ALONG AND GETTING  
17 FUNDING AS WELL. I DON'T HAVE THE MAGIC PILL HERE.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THERE IS NO MAGIC PILL. WE'LL GET  
20 FURTHER DISCUSSION. COMMISSIONER RONEN?

21

22 **HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO STATE THE OBVIOUS HERE,  
23 BUT I FEEL NECESSARY TO DO SO, BECAUSE OF THIS DISCUSSION.  
24 FIRST BEFORE I DO THAT, I WANT TO THANK STAFF. YOU DID A  
25 PHENOMENAL JOB. I SUPPORT THIS WHOLEHEARTEDLY. IT'S NOT AS IF



APRIL 26, 2023

1 WE'RE REACHING THIS CLIFF OUT OF NOWHERE, OR BECAUSE OF A  
2 PROBLEM WITH OUR FUNDAMENTAL SYSTEM. WE'RE REACHING THIS CLIFF  
3 BECAUSE OF A WORLDWIDE PANDEMIC AND THE FACT THAT WORK HAS  
4 FUNDAMENTALLY TRANSFORMED IN THE REGION. AND WE CANNOT LET'S  
5 THIS FUNDAMENTAL INFRASTRUCTURE IN OUR REGION, THAT IS  
6 ESSENTIAL TO MEETING OUR CLIMATE GOALS, ESSENTIAL TO SERVING  
7 THE NEEDS OF THE POOREST AMONGST US BY LETTING IT FAIL. I JUST  
8 WANT TO REMIND US FOR A MOMENT HOW DEEPLY IMPORTANT OUR  
9 TRANSIT SYSTEM IS. AGAIN, I KNOW I'M STATING THE OBVIOUS HERE.  
10 BUT I THINK WE NEED TO GO BACK TO THOSE BASICS, BECAUSE THE  
11 SITUATION IS THAT DIRE. AND IF WE DON'T SUPPORT OUR SYSTEM, I  
12 FEAR WE WILL LOSE ENTIRE -- ENTIRE AGENCIES. THAT'S HOW BAD  
13 THINGS ARE. I DO BELIEVE WE HAVE A LONG-TERM PLAN. I ALSO  
14 BELIEVE WE DON'T KNOW HOW RIDERSHIP WILL CHANGE OVER THE NEXT  
15 FOUR YEARS IF WE ARE ABLE TO MAINTAIN THE LEVEL OF SERVICE  
16 THAT WE HAVE NOW. IF WE CONTINUE TO REDUCE THAT SERVICE, IT'S  
17 THAT DO LOOP THAT EVERYONE LOVES TO TALK ABOUT IN SAN  
18 FRANCISCO. BUT I REALLY BELIEVE THAT DO LOOP IS A REALITY FOR  
19 OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES. SO, I JUST -- I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER  
20 SPERING. THERE IS MAYBE NOTHING MORE IMPORTANT THAN THE  
21 DISCUSSION IN THIS ACTION WE'RE ABOUT TO TAKE. AND THE  
22 URGENCY, AS COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ MENTIONED, IS RIGHT NOW.  
23 IT'S THIS BUDGET YEAR. AND I REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO SUPPORTING  
24 THIS ITEM TODAY. THANKS.  
25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER.

2

3 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. THANK YOU. DOOM LOOP, IS THAT WHAT  
4 YOU JUST CALLED IT? [LAUGHTER]

5

6 **HILLARY RONEN:** ALL YOU HAVE TO READ IS ANY ARTICLE ABOUT SAN  
7 FRANCISCO AND THEY MENTION A DOOM LOOP.

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THE REASON I MENTION IT IS BECAUSE THIS  
10 MORNING THERE WAS NEWS ABOUT TRANSIT BART, THE FISCAL CLIFF,  
11 AND WHAT YOU HAVE, BUT THEY WERE CALLING ALL OF THE TRANSIT  
12 OPERATORS TO A DEATH SPIRAL. BUT YOU CALLED AT THE DOOM LOOP.  
13 FOR MY COMMENTS I APPRECIATE THE NUMBER OF STAFF THAT WORKED  
14 WITH THE NUMBER OF COMMISSIONERS UP HERE ON THE AD-HOC  
15 COMMITTEE. I KNOW YOU PUT A LOT OF THOUGHT INTO IT, AND YOU  
16 ALL AGREE AS I'M HEARING HERE AS WELL WE DON'T HAVE A LOT OF  
17 GREAT OPTIONS BUT WE HAVE TO DO SOMETHING. I AM CERTAINLY IN  
18 FAVOR OF MOVING THIS ITEM FORWARD, BUT, IN ADDITION TO THAT,  
19 FROM ALL THE WONDERFUL COMMENTS I HAVE HEARD UP HERE, I'M  
20 HAPPY TO HEAR THAT WE DO HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY TO PIVOT AS WE  
21 MOVE ALONG. BECAUSE WE DO NEED TO GO. WE'RE ON A TIMELINE OF  
22 THE STATE'S BUDGET, AND AS WE TWEAKS THINGS ALONG THE WAY AS  
23 CIRCUMSTANCES ARE UNFOLDING THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. I'M GLAD TO  
24 HEAR THIS IS TEMPORARY, BECAUSE IT'S GOING TO BE A HARD ASK  
25 FOR VOTERS IN 2026 TO SAY, YES, WE JUST TOOK MONEY FROM A



APRIL 26, 2023

1 WHOLE BUNCH OF DIFFERENT POTS BUT YET WE'RE ASKING YOU FOR  
2 EVEN MORE ON A PERMANENT BASIS. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR  
3 ENTERTAINING MY COMMENTS.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

6

7 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THANK YOU, REBECCA, FOR  
8 YOUR PRESENTATION. I THINK THIS ALL COMES DOWN TO CHOICES. AND  
9 WE HAVE DIFFICULT CHOICES TO MAKE. AND, YOU KNOW, THIS MAY BE  
10 A LITTLE BIT DRAMATIC, BUT WHEN THE NATION DEALT WITH THE  
11 BANKING CRISIS THERE WERE A LOT OF PEOPLE THAT DIDN'T WANT THE  
12 BANKS TO BE BAILED OUT, BUT WE REALIZED WE NEEDED THE CAPITAL,  
13 RIGHT? THE CAPITAL. AND WHEN I LOOK AT A FAILING SYSTEM, I  
14 LOOK AT TRANSIT IN CRISIS, EXTRAORDINARY CRISIS. I LOOKED AT A  
15 SENATOR WHO REALLY WANTS TO BE A CHAMPION, AND A SENATOR WHO  
16 NEEDS OUR SUPPORT. WE NEED THE ABILITY TO USE AS MANY TOOLS  
17 THAT ARE POSSIBLE. YOU REFERENCED, VERY ELOQUENTLY, THE  
18 BUDGET, FORECASTING \$40 BILLION. THERE ARE CHOICES. I THINK IF  
19 WE DON'T MOVE FORWARD TODAY, UNIFIED, I THINK IT SENDS THE  
20 WRONG MESSAGE. I REALLY DO. I THINK WE HAVE TO BE UNITED ON  
21 THIS. ACCOUNTABILITY IS IMPORTANT. AND, SO, I DO THINK -- I  
22 THINK CHAIR PEDROZA SPOKE ABOUT THIS, I REALLY DO THINK WE'RE  
23 IN IT TOGETHER. WE'RE IN IT TOGETHER. BUT, I LOOKED AT THE  
24 SLIDES THAT COMMISSIONER SPERING LOOKED AT, AND I JUST WOULD  
25 LIKE TO KNOW, IN MORE GREATER DEPTH FROM THE OPERATORS, WHAT





APRIL 26, 2023

1 THEIR PLAN IS. AND I THINK THAT'S GOOD ON A COUPLE OF BASIS.  
2 ONE, WE HAVE A RESPONSIBILITY IN TERMS OF THE FINANCES, BUT,  
3 TWO, I WOULD LIKE TO UNDERSTAND, FROM AN OPERATOR BY OPERATOR  
4 BASIS, YOU KNOW, WHAT THE DIFFERENCES ARE. SO, I WANT TO  
5 SUPPORT WHAT'S BEFORE US TODAY. THANK YOU, MR. PRESIDENT.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CANEPA COMMISSIONER  
8 MOULTON PETERS?

9

10 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I'M GOING TO AGREE WITH MY  
11 COLLEAGUE'S DIFFICULT CHOICES. GOT TO MOVE FORWARD. BUT I ALSO  
12 WANT TO CONDITION THIS MONEY. I HAVE SERVED ON BOARDS OF  
13 AGENCIES WHO HAVE EXPERIENCED ECONOMIC DOWN TURNS YOU KNOW  
14 THAT'S THE TIME YOU DO THE BELT TIGHTENING, YOU CHANGE UP,  
15 BECAUSE WE HAVE TO WE CAN'T LOSE THIS OPPORTUNITY.  
16 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ YOU HAVE A GREAT IDEA ABOUT ASKING THE  
17 TRANSIT PRIORITIES TO COME IN AND PRESENT WHAT THEY'RE GOING  
18 TO DO SAME WITH YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA, LET'S BRING THEM IN  
19 PUT THEIR FEET TO THE FIRE NOW IT'S THE TIME TO DO IT.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GREAT COMMENTS, COMMISSIONER. I DON'T  
22 SEE ANY -- GO AHEAD COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

23

24 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR  
25 THE HARD WORK ON THIS. CERTAINLY IT'S A DIFFICULT TIME. I



APRIL 26, 2023

1 APPRECIATE THE PROPOSAL. I KNOW THAT WE HAVE HEARD SOME  
2 CONCERNS, ESPECIALLY ABOUT THE HIGHWAY FUNDS, BUT IT SOUNDS  
3 LIKE WHAT YOU'RE LAYING OUT ACTUALLY HAS A LITTLE BIT OF  
4 FLEXIBILITY AND ROOM. SO, THERE IS SOME CHOICES THAT CAN BE  
5 MADE. SO, I APPRECIATE THAT. AND I THINK YOU ALSO MENTIONED  
6 THE 19% OF IRA FUNDS WASN'T ACTUALLY ALLOCATED. SO I DON'T  
7 KNOW IF YOU WOULD CALL IT EXTRA, BUT THAT MIGHT BE THE  
8 FLEXIBILITY THAT -- THAT MAY BE NEEDED TO RESPOND TO SOME OF  
9 THE CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED. I DO AGREE, AND ACTUALLY,  
10 I WANT TO SAY, I REALLY THOUGHT THE SLIDE, THE SURVIVE AND  
11 THRIVE, HOWEVER YOU CAME UP WITH THAT WAS VERY CLEVER. AND IT  
12 REALLY DOES LAY OUT CLEARLY WHERE WE ARE, AND WHERE WE NEED TO  
13 GO. AND THAT'S WHAT I WANTED TO JUST ECHO. I APPRECIATE  
14 COMMISSIONER SPERING AND COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ'S COMMENTS ABOUT  
15 ACCOUNTABILITY. AND I, PERSONALLY, WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM THE  
16 OPERATORS. BECAUSE, LIKE, AS A COMMISSIONER, WE HAVE THIS  
17 RESPONSIBILITY TO WORK TOGETHER AND COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS,  
18 AND IT WOULD JUST BE BETTER TO HELP ME UNDERSTAND HOW EACH  
19 AGENCY IS WORKING AND TRYING TO COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS. BUT, I  
20 GUESS WHAT I -- MY CONCERN HAS BEEN IS, EVEN BEFORE COVID, I -  
21 - I -- I FELT THAT TRANSIT HAS BEEN -- WE'RE KIND OF -- HOW  
22 SHOULD I SAY IT? IF WE JUST CONTINUE THE STATUS QUO, I THINK  
23 WE'RE DOING THE DEATH SPIRAL. SO, WE NEED TO GET TO THRIVE.  
24 AND THAT'S MY CONCERN, IS THE FUNDING TO GET TO THRIVE. AND I  
25 THINK IF WE REALLY ARE GOING TO GO OUT FOR A MEASURE IN '26,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 PROBABLY, WE REALLY NEED TO SHOW IMPROVEMENTS AND CHANGE, OR  
2 WE'RE JUST NEVER GOING -- NOT GOING TO GET THE SUPPORT WE  
3 NEED. AND, SO, THAT'S MY REAL CONCERN IS, I UNDERSTAND --  
4 RIGHT NOW, I GET IT. WE HAVE TO JUST DO WHAT WE HAVE TO DO TO  
5 SURVIVE, BUT WE NEED TO ALSO JUST START TRANSFORMING OURSELVES  
6 GET TO THAT THRIVE AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. OR, I THINK OUR  
7 FATE IS GOING TO BE PRETTY CLEAR. THIS'S JUST SOMETHING I  
8 WANTED TO SAY.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.  
11 KIMBERLY HOW MANY PUBLIC SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIVE ON ZOOM, THREE IN THE BUILDING. OH,  
14 JUST WENT TO TEN.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** KNOWING THAT THIS IS DISCUSSION AND  
17 THERE IS GOING TO BE AMPLE TIME FOR FURTHER DISCUSSION, WE'RE  
18 GOING TO GO DOWN TO A MINUTE, PLEASE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL CALL ON THE FIRST  
21 SPEAKER, IT'S MANNY LEON. GO AHEAD AND COME TO THE PODIUM. YOU  
22 WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR, AND MR. VICE CHAIR, MEMBERS OF  
25 THE COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS MANNY LEON CALIFORNIA JOBS I



APRIL 26, 2023

1 APPRECIATE THE CRISIS THE BAY AREA IS EXPERIENCING WE HAVE  
2 WORKED TOGETHER ON A VARIETY ISSUES INCLUDING CREATION OF SB1  
3 FUNDING BACK IN 2018. IT'S UNFORTUNATE WHAT'S OCCURRED IN THE  
4 TRANSIT SECT OR HERE IN THE BAY AREA. THAT BEING SAID, I'M  
5 HERE TO STATE OPPOSITION ON ANY PROPOSAL THAT WILL OFFSET OR  
6 DIVERT FEDERAL DOLLARS INTENDED OR DESIGNATED FOR HIGHWAY  
7 INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS OR ROAD REHABILITATION MAINTENANCE  
8 WORK AT THE STATE AND HOLE LEVEL. AGAIN WE UNDERSTAND THE  
9 CHALLENGES THE REGION HAS EXPERIENCED AND WE UNDERSTAND THE  
10 CHALLENGES WITH GETTING TRANSIT RELIEF THROUGH LEGISLATURE  
11 WILL BE TOUGH. BUT AS WE EXPERIENCE ECONOMIC SLOWDOWN WE WANT  
12 TO ENSURE THE PRESERVATION OF HIGHWAY FUNDS AND ROADWAY  
13 MAINTENANCE FUNDS REMAIN INTACT. WE AIM TO WORK IN PARTNERSHIP  
14 WITH YOU ALL ON A PROPOSAL THAT WE WOULD BE ABLE TO SUPPORT.  
15 AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN. FOLLOWED  
18 BY JAYNE KRAEMER.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU FOR TAKING  
21 ON THIS EXTREMELY SERIOUS ISSUE. A COUPLE OF POINTS SUPPORTING  
22 THE MEMBERS WHO WERE SAYING, DON'T WAIT ADVOCATE. THE SENATE  
23 TODAY, THE SENATE'S BUDGET PLAN DOES NOT INCLUDE OPERATIONS  
24 FUNDING FOR TRANSIT. IT CALLED FOR FLEXIBILITY WITH TIRCP AND  
25 NOTHING ELSE. SO, AGREEING HERE TO ASK FOR MORE IS ESSENTIAL



APRIL 26, 2023

1 AND WE CAN'T WAIT FOR THAT. PEOPLE WHO ARE IN LEADERSHIP  
2 POSITIONS NEED TO BE TALKING TO OUR LEGISLATORS. SECOND, THE  
3 THRIVE IS ESSENTIAL. THE POLLING TO BE DISCUSSED THIS  
4 AFTERNOON SHOWS THAT THRIVE IS ESSENTIAL. THERE IS  
5 OPPORTUNITIES TO STRENGTHEN THOSE PLANS, BUT THOSE ARE WITHIN  
6 THE POWER OF THIS BODY AND THE AGENCIES. SO, THAT SHOULD BE  
7 MOVED FORWARD. BUT WE CAN'T WAIT NOW. THE HIGHWAY FUNDING IS  
8 AN ESSENTIAL PIECE OF THE MIX. WE'LL HAVE GRIDLOCK IF WE DON'T  
9 USE ALL THE AVAILABLE FUNDING SOURCES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. JAYNE KRAEMER? FOLLOW BY EUGENE  
12 BRADLEY ON ZOOM.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** AS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, I HAVE BEEN GOING TO  
15 TRANSPORTATION MEETINGS FOR 20 YEARS, AND WE GET WORKSHOP  
16 QUESTIONNAIRES, OR WE GET SURVEYS. WHAT IS DATA? HE DIDN'T  
17 GIVE DATA. THEY GIVE PREDETERMINED OPINIONS OF THE SAME PEOPLE  
18 AND THE SAME AGENCIES THAT SHOW UP EVERY TIME YOU HAVE ONE.  
19 WHAT YOU NEED TO DO IS GET SOLID INFORMATION AT THE GROUND  
20 LEVEL AND YOU NEED TO GET IT FROM WHERE THERE IS CONFLICT.  
21 BECAUSE THAT'S WHERE THE OPPORTUNITIES AND THE ALTERNATIVES  
22 ARE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS EUGENE BRADLEY.  
25 FOLLOWED BY SEBASTIAN PETTY.



APRIL 26, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES EUGENE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** EUGENE BRADLEY SILICON VALLEY TRANSIT USERS IN SAN  
7 JOSE AND MONTEREY COUNTY. ASK THE OPERATORS WHAT THEY HAVE  
8 DONE TO CUT WASTE INEFFICIENCIES IN THEIR OPERATIONS AND  
9 CAPITAL PROJECTS. AND FELT THAT WOULD BE ONE OF THE GREAT  
10 SELLING POINTS FOR THE PUBLIC GOING TO THEM FOR A TAX MEASURE.  
11 ALSO, I SPOKE WITH CONGRESS MEMBER ROCANA A FEW WEEKS AGO, HOW  
12 COME WE HAVE NOT TAPPED COMPANIES IN SILICON VALLEY, THE BIG  
13 FIVE COMPANIES THEY HAVE \$12 TRILLION MARKET CAP. HOW COME WE  
14 HAVEN'T TAPPED AT LEAST THESE COMPANIES TO HELP OUT WITH THIS  
15 FUNDING CRISIS, ALSO THE GREAT SELLING POINT TO BETTER TO THE  
16 PUBLIC NO MORE TRANSIT; MUCH MORE GRIDLOCK. I WOULD LIKE  
17 RESPONSES TO MY QUESTIONS AND CONCERNS IN WRITING BY E-MAIL.  
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT UP IS SEBASTIAN PETTY.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** TRANSPORTATION POLICY MANAGER FOR SPUR, THE SITUATION  
23 FOR TRANSIT IS DIRE AND WE BELIEVE WE NEED TO PUSH FORWARD  
24 KEEPING OPTIONS ON THE TABLE. WE HOPE FOR THE BEST BUT MUST BE  
25 REALISTIC THE STATE IS FACING A DIFFICULT BUDGET YEAR WITH



APRIL 26, 2023

1 COMPETING PRIORITIES WE URGE COMMISSION STAFF TO BEGIN EVEN  
2 MORE DIFFICULT WORK ON CONTINGENCY PLANE THIS MEANS  
3 CONTEMPLATING BROADER BUNDLES OF REVENUE OPTIONS AND SURVIVAL  
4 STRATEGIES ALL INVOLVING DIFFICULT CHOICES AND TRADEOFFS  
5 BEYOND THOSE CONTEMPLATED TODAY WE MUST BEGIN TAKING STEPS TO  
6 EXTEND TRANSIT'S RUNWAY FOR SURVIVAL AND NEARBY SERVICES IS  
7 MEET THE REGION'S MOBILITY NEEDS.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU MR. PETTY. NEXT IS MONIQUE  
10 WEBSTER FOLLOWED BY AARON QUICKLY.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS MONIQUE MUNI,  
13 SFMTA. HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE RELY ON TRANSIT EVERY  
14 DAY, THE PROPOSAL FRAMEWORK IS THOUGHTFUL IN FUNDING OPTIONS  
15 AND PRINCIPLES FOR THE STATE TO CONSIDER. WE SUPPORT THE STAFF  
16 RECOMMENDATION. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS AARON QUIGLEY  
19 FOLLOWED BY BOB ALLEN.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ON BEHALF OF THE SANTA CLARA  
22 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF FOR THEIR  
23 WORK TO HELP ADDRESS THE TRANSIT AGENCY FISCAL CLIFFS BY  
24 FOCUSING ON NEW MONEYS. VTA SUPPORTS THAT CALL FOR ROBUST POT  
25 OF FUNDING TO SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO ENSURE THAT THE



APRIL 26, 2023

1 BAY AREA DOES NOT FALL BACK ON THE USE OF FORMULA TIRCP FUNDS  
2 ORIGINALLY INTENDED FOR CAPITAL NEEDS. SOME OF OUR REGION'S  
3 TRANSIT AGENCIES FACE BUDGET CHALLENGES IN THE ACKNOWLEDGE  
4 YEARS BUT ALSO HAVE CAPITAL PROJECT PRIORITIES LIKE BART  
5 EXTENSION SILICON VALLEY, AND CORE PROJECTS, ENSURING THEE  
6 FINISH PROJECTS WHILE MEETING FISCAL CHALLENGES OF PARTNERS IN  
7 THE REGION THANK YOU FOR THE CONSIDERATION AND FOR THE  
8 INVITATION TO TALK ABOUT OUR RECOVERY STRATEGIES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS BOB ALAN  
11 FOLLOWED BY LAURA HILL.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. THIS IS BOB ALAN, MEMBER OF URBAN  
14 HABITAT AND MEMBER OF BPT COALITION. SPEAKING FROM URBAN  
15 HABITAT THIS MORNING. I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER SPERING AND  
16 PAPAN COMMENTS ABOUT THE NEED TO DO SOME OF THE TRANSFORMATION  
17 ACTION PLAN REFORMS. I THINK THEY'RE NECESSARY FOR SURE BUT  
18 THEY'RE NOT SUFFICIENT. AND I WANT TO SAY AS SOMEONE WHO HAS  
19 BEEN BEFORE THIS COMMITTEE LONGER THAN I WOULD CARE TO ADMIT  
20 FOR 15 YEARS TALKING ABOUT STRUCTURAL BALANCE BETWEEN HIGHWAYS  
21 AND TRANSIT AND TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL. I'M GLAD WE'RE  
22 CONFRONTING THOSE STRUCTURAL ISSUES. THE OPERATIONAL FUNDS  
23 SUGGEST NOT GOING TO SOLVE ALL OF OUR PROBLEM. WE HAVE TO  
24 START WITH THAT. I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE THE SHORT-TERM  
25 FUNDING BE MOVED QUICKLY TO ADDRESS THE CRIES. AND I HOPE THAT





APRIL 26, 2023

1 WE CAN THINK ABOUT DOING WHAT THE LARGER FUNDING AND BALANCES  
2 BETWEEN HIGHWAYS AND TRANSIT AS WE GO FORWARD BUT I APPRECIATE  
3 THE LEADERSHIP AND STEPS EVERYONE IS TAKE. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS LAURA HILL  
6 FOLLOWED BY AMY THOMPSON.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS LAURA HILL, I'M A POLICY DIRECTOR WITH  
9 THE BAY AREA COUNCIL AND WE SUPPORT THIS PROPOSED FISCAL CLIFF  
10 FUNDING ADVOCACY FRAMEWORK. SAVING AND IMPROVING TRANSIT  
11 REMAINS A TOP PRIORITY FOR THE BAY AREA COUNCIL AND I'M HERE  
12 TODAY SPEAKING ON BEHALF OF OUR VICE PRESIDENT OF PUBLIC  
13 POLICY EMILY LOPER BECAUSE SHE IS AT THE STATE CAPITAL AS WE  
14 SPEAK WORKING TO ENSURE THAT TRANSIT SURVIVES THIS CRISIS. WE  
15 KNOW TRANSIT IS ESSENTIAL TO MEET OUR STATE'S EQUITY AND  
16 CLIMATE GOALS BUT THE LIFE BLOOD OF OUR ECONOMY RESIDENTS NEED  
17 TRANSIT TO ACCESS THEIR JOBS AND MAINTAINING THE VIABILITY OF  
18 THESE SERVICES IS ESSENTIAL TO OUR FUTURE OF ECONOMIC VITALITY  
19 AND OVERALL QUALITY OF LIFE. DESPITE RISE OF REMOTE WORK OUR  
20 REGIONAL ECONOMY STILL DEPENDS ON PUBLIC TRANSIT AND WITHOUT  
21 IT WE RISK OUR ECONOMIC ENGINE WITHOUT IT. WE NEED TO MOVE  
22 FORWARD THANKFUL FUNDING FRAMEWORK TO SAVE TRANSIT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AMY THOMPSON.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** HI I'M AMY THOMPSON TRANSPORTATION POLICY MANAGER AT  
2 TRANSFORM. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THEIR EXCELLENT WORK IN  
3 IDENTIFYING A BROAD ARRAY OF FUNDING SOURCES FOR FREQUENT  
4 RELIABLE TRANSIT SO AGENCIES CAN SURVIVE AS STEP ONE ACHIEVING  
5 THROUGH THE IMPERATIVE FOR US TO GET TO OUR REGIONAL CLIMATE  
6 EQUITY GOALS AND TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN WHICH IS ALREADY  
7 UNDERWAY. I WANT TO SPEAK IN PARTICULAR ABOUT REDIRECTING  
8 SHOPP DOLLARS TOWARDS TRANSIT. OUR STATE INVESTED  
9 DISPROPORTIONATE AMOUNT OF DOLLARS IN PROJECTS WOULD FURTHER  
10 PERPETUATE RACIAL INEQUITIES IN THE CRISIS, LONG IT THE  
11 PROPOSAL WOULD NOT REQUIRE TAKING MONEY AWAY FROM EXISTING  
12 PROJECTS MAKING IT AN EXCELLENT RECOMMENDATION. SUPPORTING TO  
13 SUSTAIN TRANSIT AND PUT ON A PATH TO MILLIONS OF NEW RIDERS  
14 AND OUR CLIMATE EQUITY STRATEGIES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** KIANA VALENTINE FOLLOWED BY HOWARD WONG.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** KIANA VALLEN TRANSPORTATION CALIFORNIA REPRESENTING  
19 TRANSPORTATION CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY AND WORKFORCE THAT BUILDS  
20 AND REPAIRS MAINTENANCE OUR STATEWIDE MULTI-MODAL  
21 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. I WILL ALIGN MY COMMENTS WITH MANNY  
22 LEON FROM CALIFORNIA ALLIANCE FOR JOBS AND ALSO ADD THAT  
23 DESPITE SB1 AND THE PROJECTIONS OF IIJ FUNDING INTO THE STATE  
24 HIGHWAY SYSTEM, WE STILL FACE AN ANNUAL \$5 BILLION SHORTFALL  
25 TO MAINTAIN THE EXISTING SYSTEM, MAKE SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS,



APRIL 26, 2023

1 ADDRESS BRIDGE DEFICITS, ET CETERA. WE DO LOOK FORWARD TO  
2 WORKING WITH MIRRORS AND OTHER REGIONS IN THE STATE.  
3 CALIFORNIA TRANSIT ASSOCIATION AND OTHER OPERATORS TO FIND  
4 WAYS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT WITHOUT IMPACTING STATE HIGHWAY  
5 INVESTMENTS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. HOWARD WONG FOLLOWED BY ATU  
8 1277.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HOWARD WONG A MEMBER OF THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY  
11 COUNCIL SPEAKING AS AN INDIVIDUAL. ENSURING CONFIDENCE IN  
12 ACHIEVING AND GAINING AS MUCH FUNDING AS POSSIBLE, I THINK WE  
13 NEED TO HAVE VERY MUCH SUSTAINABLE GOALS FOR FUNDING AND THAT  
14 INCLUDES ANALYSIS OF WIDER ISSUES THAT WILL IMPROVE NOT ONLY  
15 TRANSIT BUT ECONOMIC GROWTH, DOWNTOWN REVITALIZATION, AND  
16 OTHER ASPECTS OF OUR HOUSING AND OTHER SOCIAL NEEDS AND PART  
17 OF THAT ANALYSIS IS A DATA-DRIVEN EVALUATION OF FUTURE TRAVEL  
18 PATTERNS, COMMUTER TRENDS, WORK AT HOME AND MORE LEISURE TIME  
19 IN NEIGHBORHOODS, MORE INCREASING OF POTENTIAL TRAVEL  
20 INDUSTRY, AND FINDING A WAY HOW WE CAN ADDRESS THAT IN A NEW  
21 TRANSIT MASTER PLAN. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ATTU 17 FOLLOWED BY SHANE  
24 WEINSTEIN.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. AND I TOO, WOULD LIKE TO  
2 THANK YOUR STAFF FOR PRESENTING THIS PROPOSAL AND PUTTING IT  
3 ON THE TABLE. IT'S BEEN SAID HERE MANY TIMES, TRANSIT IS  
4 FUNDAMENTAL. IT IS VITAL. ATU1277 THE MEN AND WOMEN I  
5 REPRESENT HERE IN LOS ANGELES, APPROXIMATELY 4700 MEMBERS. I'M  
6 ALSO THE CALIFORNIA CONFERENCE BOARD CHAIRMAN, WHICH WE  
7 REPRESENT 13 LOCALS ACROSS THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, 13,000  
8 PLUS MEMBERS. WE WOULD LIKE TO STAND IN SUPPORT OF KEEPING ANY  
9 AND ALL POTENTIAL REVENUE SOURCES ON THE TABLE TO SAVE TRANSIT.  
10 BECAUSE IT IS THE LIFELINE THAT SUPPLIES OUR ECONOMY FOR  
11 TODAY. SO, I THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THIS TO THE TABLE, AND WE  
12 WOULD LIKE TO SHOW OUR SUPPORT FOR IT. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. AND THE LAST SPEAKER IS SHANE  
15 WEINSTEIN.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. I AGAIN  
18 WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR PUTTING FORTH AND LOOKING FOR ANY NEW  
19 MONEYS FOR THESE VERY IMPORTANT OPERATORS TO STAY AFLOAT. I  
20 DON'T THINK THAT WE CAN REALLY UNDERSTAND THE DEVASTATION THAT  
21 IT WOULD CAUSE IF WE CONTINUE TO LOSE RIDERSHIP. GOLDEN GATE  
22 TRANSIT, AS A COMMUTE-BASED SERVICE OPERATOR HAS BEEN  
23 DECIMATED IN THE WAY OF RIDERSHIP. NOT ONLY THAT, IT'S A SMALL  
24 OPERATOR, BUT THE VALUE IT BRINGS TO THE NORTH BAY AND INTO  
25 RICHMOND IS HUGE. AND TO LOSE THAT -- THAT JUST ISN'T



APRIL 26, 2023

1 PLausible. AND I WANT EVERYBODY TO THINK ABOUT GOING INTO THE  
2 FUTURE. WE HAVE ELECTRIFICATION OF BUSES. WE'RE GOING TO NEED  
3 SOME OF THESE CONTRACTORS TO HAVE A GOOD RELATIONSHIP AND WORK  
4 WITH. BECAUSE TRANSIT IS NOT GOING TO LOOK THE SAME IN 20  
5 YEARS AND WE'RE GOING TO NEED THAT GOOD RELATIONSHIP AND THOSE  
6 CONTRACTORS TO WORK IN UNISON WITH EACH OTHER.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED. THE LETTER  
9 FROM SENATOR WIENER HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I APPRECIATE CUTTING IT BACK TO A  
12 MINUTE. WE'RE ALWAYS GOING TO BE AVAILABLE THROUGH DIFFERENT  
13 MEDIUMS. COMMISSIONER SPERING.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** LISTENING TO MY COLLEAGUES I'M A LOT MORE  
16 COMFORTABLE MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS ITEM TODAY, I THINK THE  
17 VERY ISSUES THAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT IS THE ACCOUNTABILITY.  
18 WHAT IS OUR EXPECTATION. THESE AREAS, I THINK AREN'T STRONG IN  
19 THIS PRESENTATION. AND YOU KNOW, THAT WE EXPECT OUR  
20 TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN TO BE IMPLEMENTED. THE -- AND I  
21 AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. WE HAVE GOT TO STRENGTHEN THE  
22 PARTNERSHIP WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS THAT WE MAKE THESE  
23 DECISIONS TOGETHER AND THAT JUST DOESN'T COME EASILY. I THINK  
24 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE DON'T LOSE SIGHT OF PRE-PANDEMIC,  
25 TRANSIT WAS IN A DECLINE WE DON'T WANT TO GO BACK PRE-PANDEMIC



APRIL 26, 2023

1 WE WANT TO GO TO THE NEW DYNAMIC OF HOW WE DEVELOP RIDERSHIP.  
2 MANY THINGS IN OUR TRANSFORMATIONAL ACTION PLAN WE HAVE A  
3 RESPONSIBILITY TO SEE THOSE ARE IMPLEMENTED AND AS I SAID  
4 EARLIER, THIS IS A ONCE IN A LIFETIME OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE  
5 THESE CHANGES AND WE HAVE TO DEMAND THEM. AND SO, MR. CHAIRMAN  
6 F OUR CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE WILL MAKE THE MOTION, I'LL  
7 CERTAINLY SECOND IT.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HAPPY TO MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE  
10 THE STAFF AND AD-HOC RECOMMENDATION.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION BY JOSEFOWITZ. DO WE HAVE A  
13 SECOND?

14

15 **HILLARY RONEN:** SECOND.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I WANT TO GIVE OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
18 OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE COMMENTS BEFORE WE VOTE.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU. IN GENERAL WE AGREE WITH EVERYTHING  
21 YOU SAID, I WANT TO REMIND YOU THOUGH THAT CURRENTLY TODAY  
22 THERE IS NO MONEY THAT'S BEEN ALLOCATED SO PUTTING CONDITIONS  
23 ON SOMETHING THAT DOESN'T EXIST IS A HARD TASK BUT PREPARING  
24 IS KEY. WE HAVE THE SLIDE DECK AND NEXT STEPS AND WE SHOULD  
25 INCLUDE THE FACT THAT WE WILL BE IN SACRAMENTO MAY 22ND AND



APRIL 26, 2023

1 SHOULD DELIVER A STRONGER MESSAGE ABOUT WHAT WE'RE THINKING  
2 ABOUT AND HOW MONEY SHOULD BE ALLOCATED. AND AT THE TIME  
3 CERTAINLY BUILD ON SOME OF THOSE ITEMS BUT I THINK THE  
4 INFORMATION INTO THE PREAMBLE OF THE IDEAS THAT WE'RE BRINGING  
5 FORWARD ALSO EMPHASIZE THE FACT THAT KEY TO OUR SUCCESS IS  
6 REALLY IN STANDING UP THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT WORK.  
7 THERE IS GOOD INFORMATION THERE. YOU GAVE US GOOD ADVICE. I  
8 THINK FOLLOWING THE DIRECTION OF THE ACTION IS WHAT WE WANT TO  
9 DO AND KEEP WORKING ON MAKING THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
10 REALLY SUCCESSFUL IN TERMS OF DELIVERING ON THE TRANSFORMATION  
11 ACTION PLAN.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU EXECUTIVE  
14 DIRECTOR FREMIER. WE HAVE A FIRST BY -- COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** FOR CLARIFICATION, I HEARD COMMISSIONER SPERING  
17 SAID AND THEN THERE WAS THE MOTION. IS THERE SOMETHING  
18 ATTACHED --

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION -- I ASSUMED THE  
21 CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE WAS MOVING THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** NOT WITH WHAT YOU -- JUST THE MESSAGING? NOT WITH  
24 ANY MESSAGING, MOVING FORWARD? THAT'S ALL I HAD.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I'M COMFORTABLE TO INCORPORATE.

2

3 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I DON'T KNOW THAT'S NECESSARY. I THINK STAFF

4 CLEARLY UNDERSTANDS WHAT OUR POSITION IS AND WHAT OUR

5 EXPECTATION IS. I DON'T KNOW THAT IT NEEDS TO BE PART OF IT AS

6 THESE FUNDING SOURCES ARE DEVELOPED, WE'RE GOING TO LAY THOSE

7 --

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN, AS OTHER ITEMS

10 COME UP WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO ADDRESS THINGS THAT CAME UP

11 TOGETHER WORKING WITH OPERATORS AND HEARING ABOUT SOME OF THE

12 VERIFICATION OF DATA. IT'S THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION

13 INCORPORATING EVERYTHING WE TALKED ABOUT.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I CAN ADD ONE OTHER THING? PART OF

16 WHAT WE HAVE, PART OF WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE TACKLING IN THE

17 AD-HOC NEXT IS THIS VERY QUESTION. BECAUSE THE LEGISLATURE --

18 THERE ARE MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATURE AS PEOPLE HAVE SAID AS

19 COMMISSIONERS HAVE MENTIONED WHO ARE LOOKING FOR

20 ACCOUNTABILITY AND LOOKING TO US TO PROVIDE GUIDANCE ON THAT.

21 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WE WILL ALSO BE TAKING A CRACK AT, AT

22 THE AD HOC COMMITTEE OVER THE NEXT MONTH AND BRINGING THAT

23 BACK QUICKLY TO THE COMMISSION.

24





APRIL 26, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** JUST AS FINAL NOTE HERE, BECAUSE WE'RE BEING A  
2 LITTLE INCONSISTENT. WE TALK ABOUT THIS AND IT'S JUST -- IF WE  
3 COULD JUST -- THE MESSAGE WE WOULD LIKE TO SEND WITH, OF  
4 COURSE, ALL THIS FUNDING, BUT THE THRIVE LANGUAGE REALLY NEEDS  
5 TO JUST INCLUDE THAT OUR EXPECTATIONS ARE, THIS WILL BE THE  
6 FUTURE, THE TRANSPORTATION PLAN, JUST SOMETHING LIKE THAT.  
7 BECAUSE THAT -- NOT FOR AN NEXT COMMITTEE OR SOMETHING. BUT,  
8 GO AHEAD.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE HAVE THE MOTION ON THE FLOOR. AGAIN  
11 WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT THIS AT THE WORKSHOP LATER  
12 TODAY THERE IS GOING TO BE OPPORTUNITY TO INCORPORATE THEMES  
13 WE HAVE HEARD TODAY IT'S PART OF THE DISCUSSION. WE'RE  
14 CONSIDER THE MOTION BY VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. FIRST BY  
15 JOSEFOWITZ SECOND BY RONEN. SEEING NO FURTHER DISCUSSION. ROLL  
16 CALL VOTE PLEASE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

25



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS AN  
4 AYE. CANEPA?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

9

10 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

13

14 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

17

18 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES AND I CAN'T TURN MY CAMERA BACK ON FOR SOME  
23 REASON.

24



APRIL 26, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NOACK? IS ABSENT. RABBITT IS  
2 ABSENT. RONEN? SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY  
7 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS FOR YOUR  
10 THOUGHTFUL DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM. VERY IMPORTANT AS NOTED.  
11 ITEM 16 PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK IF WE HAVE RECEIVED  
12 PUBLIC COMMENT?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.  
15 HOWEVER I HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS  
16 RAISED. ALETA DUPREE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE  
17 ONE MINUTE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA, ALETA DUPREE FOR THE  
20 RECORD SHE AND HER. I'M A BIG FAN OF MTC. I HAVE BEEN FOR A  
21 LONG TIME, STILL AM. I WAS FORTUNATE TO ATTEND A TRANSIT COE  
22 RIDE-ALONG THIS PATTED FRIDAY, WE RODE ON BART AND TRIED OUT  
23 COUNTY CONNECTION AND YOUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ANDY PREMIER  
24 SHARED THAT TIME WITH US AND SPOKE AND I APPRECIATE THE  
25 SUPPORT OF MTC. NOT JUST IN MEETINGS AND DOING ALL THIS HEAVY



APRIL 26, 2023

1 POLICY WORK, BUT IN ANDY'S COMING OUT AND SHARING MTC WITH THE  
2 PUBLIC ON THE BUSES AND THE TRAINS. AND IT IS THAT TYPE OF  
3 WORK THAT MAKES ME A REALLY BIG FAN OF MTC. AND HOPEFULLY I'LL  
4 BE IN-PERSON WITH YOU SOON. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS  
7 RAISED.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING  
10 MOVE TO ITEM 17, WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN THE COMMISSION. THE  
11 NEXT MEETING THAT WILL BE HELD OF THE COMMISSION WILL BE HERE  
12 MAY 24TH, 2023. ANY CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTED. THANK YOU TO  
13 COMMISSIONERS AND TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. [ADJOURNED]

14

15

16



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*