

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**BAY AREA PARTNERSHIP BOARD
MONDAY, DECEMBER 2ND, 2024, 10:00 AM**

CHAIR, KATE MILLER: GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M GOING TO BEGIN TODAY'S MEETING MEETING. SO, WE ARE CALLING THIS MEETING TOGETHER OR CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE BAY AREA PARTNERSHIP BOARD. THE MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. AGENDA ITEM ONE TODAY IS CALLING THE MEETING TO ORDER. SO, WALLY WILL YOU DO ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. I'M GOING TO CALL YOU BY LAST NAME. CHAIR MILLER?

CHAIR, KATE MILLER: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR GONOT? IS ABSENT. MEMBER ALBEE? IS ABSENT. MEMBER BARNES FOR TRAN? MEMBER BOUCHARD?

SPEAKER: I'M HERE ON BEHALF OF MICHELLE BOUCHARD.



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. MEMBER CAMERON?

2

3 **JAMES CAMERON:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CHAN?

6

7 **APRIL CHAN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CHANG.

10

11 **TILLY CHANG:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHARPENTIER? IS ABSENT. CHURCHILL?

14

15 **BILL CHURCHILL:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CLIFF? CHAU? ABSENT. MEMBER
18 CUMINS?

19

20 **EDDY CUMINS:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** DAGANG?

23

24 **DEBORAH DAGANG:** HERE.

25



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER EDE? IS ABSENT. EL-TAWANSY? OR
2 AMBUEHL?

3

4 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FABRY? IS ABSENT. FEINSTEIN? IS ABSENT.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER FINE OR?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FREMIER?

13

14 **ANDREW FREMIER:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER GOLDZBAND? IS ABSENT. GONOT? IS

17 ABSENT. MEMBER HAILE? OR [INDISCERNIBLE]? MEMBER HALLS IS

18 ABSENT. MEMBER HOEVERTSZ?

19

20 **JOHANNES HOEVERTSZ:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER HURSH? IS ABSENT. MEMBER KRANDA?

23 IS ABSENT. MEMBER CLEVINGER FOR LYGEL?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** HERE.



1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MULLIGAN?

3

4 **DENNIS MULLIGAN:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MURPHY?

7

8 **SEAMUS MURPHY:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER OMISHAKIN? IS ABSENT. POWERS? IS

11 ABSENT. MEMBER RAMOS?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HERE FOR RAMOS.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RICHMAN?

16

17 **ANNE RICHMAN:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RISTOW?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** HERE FOR RISTOW.

22

23 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ROWAN?

24

25 **JOSH ROWEN:** HERE.



1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** STUTH? IS ABSENT. MEMBER TAVARES IS
3 ABSENT. TAYLOR? IS ABSENT. MEMBER TELLIS?

4

5 **RAY TELLIS:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THOMPSON? IS ABSENT. MEMBER TUMLIN? WE
8 HAVE --

9

10 **SPEAKER:** MONIQUE WEBSTER FOR JEFF TUMLIN.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. MEMBER VAN DE WATER?

13

14 **ADAM VAN DE WATER:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WAN? IS ABSENT. WEGENER?

17

18 **CHRISTY WEGENER:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WHELAN IS ABSENT. WILSON? IS ABSENT.
21 LOWE FOR WOLDESENBET. WE HAVE QUORUM. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** THANK YOU, WALLY. THE NEXT ITEM IS TO
24 WELCOME NEW MEMBERS TO THE PARTNERSHIP BOARD. LUCKY YOU GUYS.
25 JOSH ROWEN IS REPLACING FRED KELLY FROM THE CITY OF OAKLAND



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 DOT. HEY, WELCOME JOSH. SETH BENEDICT IS REPLACING MICHAEL
2 MUSAF FROM LIVERMORE MUNICIPAL AIRPORT?

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** HE'S NOT HERE.

5

6 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** I SHOULD PAY CLOSER ATTENTION TO THE ROLL.
7 IS IT MATTHEW OR MATT [INDISCERNIBLE] -- IT'S NOT A TYPO,
8 RIGHT? IT WAS MATTHEW. OKAY -- REPLACED AZALEA MITCH FROM CITY
9 OF SAN MATEO. ALSO NOT HERE. WELCOME TO THE NEW MEMBERS. DO
10 YOU NEED ME TO TALK ABOUT THE VACANCIES? IS ENVIRONMENTAL
11 PROTECTION AGENCY REGION NINE THERE IS A VACANCY AS WELL AS
12 THE FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION. SO, IF ANYBODY WANTS TO
13 CHANGE AGENCIES AND TAKE THOSE POSITIONS, IT COULD BE A VERY
14 EXCITING CAREER CHANGE FOR ALL OF YOU. AGENDA ITEM 2A
15 RELOCATION OF THE REGION NINE REGIONAL OFFICE TO LOS ANGELES
16 AND CREATION OF THE NEW BAY AREA OFFICE THIS IS AN INFORMATION
17 ITEM AND RAY TELLIS WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

18

19 **RAY TELLIS:** THANK YOU, KATE. GLAD TO BE WITH ALL OF YOU THIS
20 MORNING. WANT TO THANK MTC FOR ACCOMMODATING ME AT THE LAST
21 MINUTE ON THE SCHEDULE, AND THERESA, IN PARTICULAR, CERTAINLY
22 APPRECIATE THE RECEPTIVENESS. THIS IS THE FIRST OPPORTUNITY I
23 HAVE TO PRESENT TO ALL OF YOU ALL 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE
24 BAY AREA AS WELL AS TO THE STAKEHOLDERS AS TO THE RELOCATION
25 OF OUR REGIONAL OFFICE FROM DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO TO LOS



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ANGELES. AND I DID SEND A NOTE WHEN THIS WAS ABOUT TO HAPPEN
2 IN TERMS OF GIVING YOU ADVANCED NOTICE THAT THIS WAS
3 HAPPENING. BUT THERE WERE CERTAIN THINGS I JUST COULDN'T PUT
4 IN WRITING AND I'M GLAD TO BE HERE THIS MORNING TO BE ABLE TO
5 SHARE ALL OF THAT COMPREHENSIVELY. SO, I DID HAVE ONE SLIDE,
6 IF THAT COULD BE LOADED UP? ALL RIGHT. SO, THIS IS THE
7 REGIONAL OFFICE NEW STRUCTURE ORG CHART. ESSENTIALLY WHAT WE
8 UNDERTOOK WAS EVALUATION OF -- OUR PRIORITY HAS ALWAYS BEEN
9 CUSTOMER SERVICE AND WHERE COULD WE SERVE ALL OF OUR CLIENTS
10 WITH OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES, REALLY, WE CALL THEM RECIPIENTS OR
11 GRANTEES TRANSIT AGENCIES PROJECT SPONSORS FOR THE MOST PART
12 AND JUST TO REMIND YOU REGION NINE'S JURISDICTION IS FOUR
13 STATES, THAT'S ARIZONA, CALIFORNIA, HAWAII, NEVADA AND U.S.
14 PACIFIC TERRITORIES, GUAM, SAIPAN, NORTHERN MARIANA ISLANDS
15 AND THEN AMERICAN SAMOA. I DO LIKE TO BRAG I'M THE ONLY
16 REGIONAL ADMINISTRATOR THAT HAS JURISDICTION IN A DIFFERENT
17 DATELINE NOT TIME ZONE ALSO ONLY REGIONAL ADMINISTRATOR WHERE
18 YOU NEED A PASSPORT TO VISIT ONE OF OUR JURISDICTIONS THAT IS
19 AMERICAN SAMOA I'M NOT HERE TO TALK ABOUT THE BREADTH OF OUR
20 JURISDICTION BUT TO POINT OUT WE HAVE PEOPLE IN HONOLULU WE
21 HAVE TWO PEOPLE IN HONOLULU, TWO PEOPLE IN PHOENIX TO SUPPORT
22 THE HAWAII PROGRAM AS WELL AS TERRITORIES WE HAVE PEOPLE IN
23 PHOENIX TO SUPPORT PHOENIX PROGRAM AS WELL AS ARIZONA MOST
24 RECENTLY PUT A PERSON IN NEVADA TO SUPPORT THE PROGRAM IN
25 CARSON CITY IT'S A BROAD JURISDICTION AS WE LOOK AT CUSTOMER



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 SERVICE AND HOW WE MIGHT IMPROVE IT'S NOT OFTEN THAT FEDERAL
2 REGION NINE OFFICE IS RELOCATE OUT FROM SAN FRANCISCO BUT IT
3 HAS HAPPENED THERE IS PRECEDENT WHEN YOU ARE SERVING YOUR
4 CLIENTELE TO A GREATER EXTENT AS WELL AS SOMETIMES A COST
5 CONSIDERATION SO WE LOOK AT THE PROGRAM AND DON'T GET ME
6 WRONG, THE PROGRAM AND I'LL TALK ABOUT IT IN THE BAY AREA IS
7 SIGNIFICANT YOU HAVE MAJOR CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT HAVE PUT US
8 ON THE MAP, AND CERTAINLY WITH THE VTA PROJECTS, DTX, AND
9 OTHERS, AS I LOOK ACROSS THE ROOM WE CERTAINLY HANDLING
10 BIGGEST PROJECTS IN OUR PORTFOLIO AS WELL AS SECOND LARGEST
11 RIGHT NOW BUT AS WE LOOK AT THE PROGRAM ACROSS YOU ALL OF OUR
12 JURISDICTIONS MULTIPLE STATES LOS ANGELES JUMPED OUT AT US IN
13 TERMS OF SIZE OF THE PROGRAM AND WAY WHERE THEY WERE HEADED
14 WITH LUCRATIVE SALES TAX INITIATIVE AS WELL AS SOUTHERN
15 CALIFORNIA WHEN WE ADDED THE NUMBERS THEY CAME OUT AHEAD BY
16 QUITE A LARGE NUMBER MARGIN WHAT PUT THAT OVER THE TIME WAS
17 REALLY THE OLYMPICS, THE MAYOR IS CALLING FIRST CALL FOR CAR
18 FREE OLYMPICS THAT'S NOW PORTRAYED AS INTENDED TO BE TRANSIT
19 FIRST OLYMPICS WE NEED TO HAVE ROBUST TRANSIT SYSTEM
20 SUPPORTING THE GAMES THEY'RE GOING TO BE SUCCESSFUL THE
21 OLYMPICS AS PARA-OLYMPICS AND TO THAT EXTENT STAND UP TO
22 PROVIDE SUPPORT WE ARE THE AGENCY I HAVE INTERACTED WITH EVERY
23 ONE OF YOU AROUND THE TABLE IN TERMS OF SUPPORTING YOUR
24 PROGRAM AND WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO DO THAT SO THAT MADE SENSE
25 THEREFORE TO HAVE THE REGIONAL OFFICE MOVE TO LOS ANGELES. THE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 PART I COULDN'T PUT IN MY WRITTEN BRIEFING TO ALL OF YOU IS
2 THE SAFETY AND CONCERN WITH SAFETY AND SECURITY OF OUR OFFICE
3 HERE, CLOSE BY, IN THE TEND -- TENDER LOIN, AND IN THE FEDERAL
4 BUILDING AND THAT LEVEL WE WERE CONCERNED FOR OUR STAFF AND
5 WELL-BEING BECAUSE OF THE NUMBER OF CRIME AND ALL THINGS AND
6 IF YOU HAVE VISITED US IN RECENT TIMES YOU HAVE EXPERIENCE
7 THAT FOR YOURSELF, ONE OR TWO OF YOU HAVE COME UP TO ME AND
8 SAID, WELL, LET ME SAY THIS, NURIA FERNANDEZ VISITED THE
9 OFFICE AND SHE SAID, RAY, YOU NEED TO GET OUT OF THERE. THIS
10 IS WHEN SHE WAS THE ADMINISTRATOR AT THE FTA. SO WE LOOKED AT
11 THAT AND ARE RIGHT NOW ISSUED STAY-AT-HOME ORDERS FOR STAFF IN
12 SAN FRANCISCO BECAUSE OF THE SAFETY CONCERNS THE SECURITY
13 CONCERNS AND CERTAINLY THEIR WELL-BEING SO NOW TO THE POINT
14 WHERE WE'RE GOING TO BE STRATEGICALLY HAD TO TELL GSA THAT WE
15 WERE CHANGING OUR MISSION BECAUSE WE COULDN'T SITE A SAFETY
16 CONCERNS THAT'S A FEDERAL BUILDING, SO WE COULDN'T MOVE BASED
17 ON SAFETY CONCERNS WE HAD TO DRIVE IT BY A BUSINESS REASON OR
18 A MISSION DRIVEN REASON. STRATEGICALLY WE'RE MOVING OPERATIONS
19 TO LOS ANGELES. WHAT WE TOLD OUR STAFF, WHEN WE COULD AFFORD
20 REMOTE WORK, THERE WAS A TIME AT DOT WHERE WE COULD AFFORD
21 REMOTE WORK AND WE ENCOURAGED OUR STAFF IN SAN FRANCISCO TO
22 REMOTE WORK BECAUSE OF THE SAFETY CONCERN SO WE BEAT THE IN
23 ADDITIONAL AVERAGE WHICH IS ABOUT 33% FOR REMOTE WORK, WE WERE
24 UP IN THE 85 TO 90% TO GET PEOPLE TO STAY AT HOME, BE SAFE.
25 AND IF THERE IS A SILVER LINING FROM THE PANDEMIC IT WAS THAT



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 OUR FOLKS WERE PRODUCTIVE AND MOTIVATED AND WE HAVE NEVER SEEN
2 MORE AIL AS HIGH AS IT WAS AND I'M SURE YOU ALL CAN ATTEST TO
3 THAT IN TERMS OF PRODUCTIVITY. MYSELF INCLUDED WHEN I LIVED
4 HERE I WAS PLEASED TO BE REMOTE WORKING AND WORKING FROM HOME.
5 SO, WE HAD TO THEN TRY TO GET OUT OF THE BUILDING LEASE AND
6 THE ONLY WAY TO DO THAT WAS TO ASK FOR A SMALLER FOOTPRINT IN
7 A BETTER LOCATION HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO. SO, WHAT I'M HERE,
8 THIS MORNING, PARTICULARLY WITH THIS GROUP IS TO ASSURE YOU
9 THAT WE ARE STANDING UP A BRAND-NEW OFFICE IN SAN FRANCISCO.
10 WE HAVE ALREADY DELINEATED THE GEOGRAPHY OF WHERE WE WOULD
11 LIKE TO BE IN THE EMBARCADERO AREA, OR EVEN THE FINANCIAL
12 DISTRICT SOME PLACE LIKE THIS THAT IS SAFE AND SECURE, AND GSA
13 DOES THAT FOR US AND THEY'RE LOOKING FOR A SPACE FOR US TO
14 STAND UP THIS NEW BAY AREA OFFICE BECAUSE OF THE SIZE OF THE
15 PROGRAM HERE IN THE BAY AREA IS SIGNIFICANT. IT'S ABOUT \$30
16 BILLION. THAT'S HUGE. RIGHT? SO, WE HOPE THAT HAPPENS. IF THAT
17 DOESN'T HAPPEN THERE MIGHT BE OPPORTUNITY TO MOVE TO THE
18 FEDERAL BUILDING IN OAKLAND, OR SOME OTHER LOCATION IN
19 OAKLAND. BUT WE CAN'T GO TO A PRIVATE BUILDING WE HAVE TO
20 FIRST GO TO A FEDERALLY OWN BUILDING IF THAT'S NOT POSSIBLE,
21 GO TO OAKLAND, IF THAT'S NOT POSSIBLE GO TO A BUILDING LIKE WE
22 HAVE IN LOS ANGELES. THE REASON I SHOW YOU THE ORG CHART POINT
23 OUT TO YOU EVENTUALLY WE'LL HAVE MORE IN THE BAY AREA NEW
24 OFFICE STANDING UP, PROGRAM MANAGEMENT, OFFICE OF FINANCIAL
25 MANAGEMENT AND PROGRAM OVERSIGHT, REVIEWS THAT ALL OF



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ENCOUNTER, THE REGIONAL COUNCIL WILL REMAIN IN SAN FRANCISCO
2 THE ASSISTANT REGIONAL COUNCIL WILL REMAIN IN SAN FRANCISCO
3 AND CIVIL RIGHTS OFFICE WILL REMAIN IN SAN FRANCISCO WE HAVE
4 AN ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE IN SAN FRANCISCO. AMY CHEN, MANY OF
5 YOU MET DEPUTY REGIONAL ADMINISTRATOR, SHE WILL STAY HERE TO
6 SET UP THE MEETING THEN MURAK OMAI, SHOWN IN THE YELLOW BOX
7 THERE WILL BE THE NEW GRAY AREA OFFICE DIRECTOR. WE HAVE MOVED
8 PLANNING OFFICE TO LOS ANGELES WE HAVE ALWAYS HAD A BIG
9 PRESENCE IN LOS ANGELES WE HAVE ADDED THAT AND THEN YOU CAN
10 SEE OUR PRESENCE IN HONOLULU AND PHOENIX AND CERTAINLY HAWAII,
11 ARIZONA AND NEVADA, I LEAVE HERE TODAY TO SAY WE ARE PROVIDING
12 MORE SERVICE WE WILL PROVIDE MORE SERVICE IT WILL BE SEAMLESS,
13 OUR OFFICE WILL BE A SIZABLE OFFICE HERE IN THE BAY AREA TO
14 SUPPORT THE PROGRAMS, LARGE PROGRAM, THE LARGEST OF OUR
15 PORTFOLIOS HERE IN THE BAY AREA WE CANNOT DO ANYTHING ELSE BUT
16 TO SUPPORT YOU AND WE'RE TRYING DO THAT IN THE MOST SEAMLESS
17 WAY POSSIBLE. THERE WERE RUMORS THAT WE GOT UP AND LEFT BUT WE
18 DID NOT AND OUR LEADERSHIP WAS INSISTENT AND DEPUTY
19 ADMINISTRATOR INSISTED THAT I BRIEF YOU PERSONALLY TO GIVE YOU
20 THAT ISSUE. SO KATE I'M DONE, IF THERE ANY QUESTIONS. THANK
21 YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY THAT WAS VERY IMPORTANT TO US HERE
22
23 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY QUESTIONS OF MR. TELLIS? THANK YOU
24 VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE THAT. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT? RIGHT?
25 ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO COMMENT?



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FOR A SPEAKERS THAT COULDN'T MAKE IT
3 TODAY SEAN CHARPENTIER. UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** SEAN CHARPENTIER I WANT TO NOTE FOR THE RECORD I'M
6 PARTICIPATING VIA THE ZOOM FUNCTION, AND I'M AVAILABLE FOR ANY
7 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
10 SPEAKERS.

11

12 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY GREAT. SO, OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM IS
13 THE CONSENT CALENDAR, CONSISTS OF ITEMS -- ITEM 3A APPROVAL OF
14 THE BAY AREA PARTNERSHIP BOARD MINUTES OF THE OCTOBER 23RD,
15 2023 MEETING. DOES ANYBODY REMEMBER -- OH SORRY. DO I HAVE A
16 MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] TO APPROVE.

19

20 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** I'M SORRY. WHO WAS THAT? THANK YOU, MEMBER
21 CUMINS. AND THE SECOND? MEMBER? WHO WAS THE SECOND? YEAH.
22 MEMBER CHANG. THANK YOU. ANY BOARD MEMBER THAT WOULD LIKE TO
23 HAVE -- MAKE COMMENTS ON THIS MOTION? NO. AND THEN, WILL ALL
24 THOSE IN FAVOR ACKNOWLEDGE BY STATING AYE? ARE THERE ANY
25 OPPOSED? AYE. [AYES]



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OPPOSED? GREAT. NEXT ITEM IS TRANSIT 2050
3 FINAL NETWORK --

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FOR THE RECORD, WE WANT TO STATE THE
6 MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY. THE MOTION -- I WILL DO THAT IN THE
9 FUTURE. THANK YOU. SO, AGENDA ITEM FOUR, TRANSIT 2050+, FINAL
10 NETWORK -- STAFF WILL PRESENT FINAL NETWORK RECOMMENDATIONS
11 FROM THE TRANSIT 2050 MODEL -- PLUS MODEL, PLAN DEVELOPED WITH
12 THE OPERATOR-LED PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM, WHICH WILL BE
13 INTEGRATED INTO THE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED PLANNED BAY AREA
14 2050+. THIS INFORMATION IS GOING TO BE PRESENTED BY KARA --
15 I'M GOING -- VUICICH. THANK YOU. MTC ABAG AND ANDY METZ, AC
16 TRANSIT WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM TODAY.

17

18 **KARA VUICICH:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND GOOD MORNING BOARD
19 MEMBERS. I KNOW MANY OF YOU HAVE BEEN WORKING ALONG WITH US AS
20 WE DEVELOP TRANSIT EXIST POLICE, SOME OF YOU ARE NEW TO THIS
21 PROCESS SO I'LL TAKE A BIT OF TIME TO EXPLAIN WHAT TRANSIT
22 2050+ IS AND HOW IT'S INTEGRATING WITH THE REST OF THE PLANNED
23 BAY AREA 2050+. NEXT SLIDE. TRANSIT EXIST PLUS IS A
24 COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE OF THIS TRANSIT STRATEGIES FROM PLANNED
25 BAY AREA 2050 AND WE'RE CURRENTLY IN THE PROCESS OF GENERALLY



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 FOCUSED UPDATE PLANNED BAY AREA THAT'S REPRESENTED BY PLANNED
2 BAY AREA 2050+ WHICH IS THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM THAT YOU WILL
3 HAVE IN PRESENTATION AND THE REASON WE HAVE UNDERTAKEN
4 PARALLEL PLANNING EFFORT FOR TRANSIT FOR SEVERAL REASONS
5 OBVIOUSLY THE PANDEMIC HAD MAJOR EFFECT ON ALL OF OUR TRANSIT
6 SYSTEMS THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND AS A RESULT THE TRANSIT
7 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT WAS DEVELOPED BY THE BLUE
8 RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE WE INITIATED TRANSIT 2050+
9 TO FOLLOW UP ON ONE OF THE ACTIONS FROM THE ACTION PLAN WHICH
10 CALLED FOR FUNDING DEVELOPING AND ADOPTING A BAY AREA
11 CONNECTED NETWORK ALSO WHY WE DEVELOPED A TRANSIT OPERATOR LED
12 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM AND WHY WE HAVE BEEN WORKING CLOSELY
13 WITH COPROJECT MANAGER ANDY METZ WHO IS HOUSED AT AC TRANSIT
14 AND DEVELOPMENT OF TRANSIT 2050+. WE STARTED WORKING WITH OUR
15 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM BACK IN 2023 IT NOW CONSISTS OF STAFF
16 FROM 12 DIFFERENT OPERATORS INCLUDING SEVEN LARGE OPERATORS
17 AND FIVE SMALLER OPERATORS SO WE EXPRESS OUR APPRECIATION FOR
18 EVERYONE'S TIME AND EFFORT IN WORKING TOGETHER AND DEVELOPING
19 THIS PLAN. WE STARTED BY DEVELOPING A SET OF GOALS FOR TRANSIT
20 2050+ WHICH WERE TO DEVELOP AN INTEGRATED CONNECTED TRANSIT
21 NETWORK RECOVER AND GROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND IMPROVE TRANSIT
22 RELIABILITY AND SPEED AND REDUCE BARRIERS IN TRANSIT AND THAT
23 GUIDED A LOT OF OUR SUBSEQUENT WORK THROUGHOUT THE LAST TWO
24 YEARS. STARTED DEVELOPING NEEDS GAP OPPORTUNITIES ANALYSIS
25 WHICH FOCUSED ON ASSESSING REGIONAL POST-PANDEMIC TRAVEL



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 PATTERNS AND TRANSIT SERVICE POST-PANDEMIC TO TRY TO IDENTIFY
2 WHAT NEAR-TERM TRANSIT NEEDS HAVE CHANGED AND PARTICULARLY
3 SINCE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED AND HOW THAT INFORMS
4 DECISIONS THAT WE WOULD HAVE TO MAKE OR END UP MAKING GOING
5 FORWARD IN TERMS OF DEVELOPING THE TRANSIT 2050+ STRATEGIES
6 AND MAKE CHOICES ABOUT PROJECTS TO INCLUDE AS PART OF THE
7 FINAL RECOMMENDED NETWORK. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE DO AS
8 PLANNED BAY AREA PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT WHERE WE LOOK
9 AT BENEFITS OF COST OF MAJOR TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS
10 MAJORITY OF THOSE INVESTMENTS ARE TRANSIT PROJECTS AND LOOK AT
11 BENEFITS AND COSTS OVER THREE VERY DIFFERENT POTENTIAL FUTURES
12 TO REALLY UNDERSTAND HOW DIFFERENT TYPES OF PROJECTS PERFORM
13 UNDER DIFFERENT CONDITIONS TO TRY AND UNDERSTAND AND HELP THAT
14 INFORM OUR CHOICES AND DECISION-MAKING. WE USED ALL OF THAT
15 INFORMATION WORKING CLOSELY WITH PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAMS.
16 NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS SLIDE PROVIDES OVERVIEW OF OUR FULL
17 SCHEDULE AND SO WHAT YOU SEE HIGHLIGHTED IS WHERE WE ARE
18 TODAY. THE PRESENTATION OF THE RECOMMENDED FINAL TRANSIT
19 NETWORK. AND THIS REPRESENTS ALL OF THE STRATEGIES, THE
20 TRANSIT STRATEGIES, PROJECTS, AND REALLY, TODAY, IS THE FIRST
21 IN A SERIES OF MEETINGS THAT WE'RE DOING IN DECEMBER, AS AN
22 INFORMATION ITEM, START WITH PARTNERSHIP BOARD WE'LL ALSO BE
23 GOING TO THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
24 COMMITTEE THIS MONTH AS WELL AS THE REGIONAL NETWORK
25 MANAGEMENT COUNCIL AND THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THEN WE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ANTICIPATE TAKING, WITH THE PLANNING COMMITTEE, THE ABAG
2 EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE COMMISSION TAKING ACTION ON THE FINAL
3 PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT EARLY NEXT YEAR. AND YOU WILL HEAR
4 MORE ABOUT THAT PROCESS AND WHAT THAT ENTAILS IN THE NEXT
5 AGENDA ITEM. AND THEN FOLLOWING THAT WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE
6 DOING FOR TRANSIT 2050+ IS WHAT WE'RE CALLING OUR NETWORK
7 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT SO IT WILL BE PART OF THE FULL
8 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT THAT WE DO FOR PLANNED BAY AREA BUT
9 SPECIFICALLY WE'LL BE DOING MORE SPECIFIC ANALYSIS FOR THE
10 TRANSIT NETWORK ITSELF AND WE HAVE A SLIGHT LATER IN THE DECK
11 THAT TALKS MORE IN DETAIL ABOUT THAT ALSO PUTTING TOGETHER A
12 REPORT THAT DOCUMENTS DEVELOP OF THE TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK AND
13 ANTICIPATE ALSO USING THAT TO REPORT A DEEPER DIVE ON
14 IMPLEMENTING THE NEAR-TERM IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TRANSIT 2050+
15 NETWORK. NEXT SLIDE. TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF PLANNED BAY
16 AREA OF WHICH TRANSIT EXIST PLUS IS PART OF A STATUTORILY
17 REQUIRED TO BE FINANCIALLY CONSTRAINED REASONABLY ANTICIPATED
18 REVENUES OVER 2025 YEAR PLANNING HORIZON AND THIS INCLUDES ALL
19 EXISTING FEDERAL STATE REGIONAL LOCAL REVENUE SOURCES
20 INCLUDING TRANSIT FARES AS WELL AS POTENTIAL NEW REVENUE
21 SOURCES WHICH WOULD INCLUDE A NEW REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
22 MEASURE. I THINK EVERYONE IN THIS ROOM KNOWS WE'RE SEEING
23 DRAMATIC EFFECTS OF THE PANDEMIC IN TERMS OF SIGNIFICANTLY
24 LOWER PROJECTED REVENUES FORECASTED FOR TRANSIT INCLUDING
25 TRANSIT EXIST PLUS WE HAVE ESSENTIALLY \$40 BILLION LESS OF



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ANTICIPATED REVENUES, WE HAVE A 25 YEAR PLANNING HORIZON
2 INSTEAD OF 30 YEARS AND ARE FEELING EFFECTS OF THE PANDEMIC IN
3 TERMS OF OUR ANTICIPATED REVENUE. THIS MEANS WE HAVE HAD TO
4 MAKE DIFFICULT CHOICES IN TERMS OF PRIORITIZATION AND CRAFTED
5 STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS IN THE FINAL RECOMMENDED TRANSIT
6 NETWORK FOCUSED ON KEY NETWORK ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES WHICH
7 FOCUS ON SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS THAT COULD BE DELIVERED COST
8 EFFECTIVELY BUT WOULD POTENTIALLY HAVE A BIGGER IMPACT IN
9 TERMS OF IMPROVING RIDERSHIP IMPROVING SERVICE AND EQUITY
10 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND DELIVERING BETTER SERVICES TO TRANSIT
11 CUSTOMERS. THINGS THAT CAME UP IN NEEDS AND GAPS ASSESSMENT
12 USING INFORMATION THAT WE OBTAINED FROM THE PROJECT
13 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT LOOKING AT INVESTMENTS CONTRIBUTED AND
14 IMPROVED OVERALL NETWORK CONNECTIVITY AND ALSO CONSIDERED
15 LOCAL PRIORITIES AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. IN TERMS OF
16 WHERE WE ARE TODAY, WE, AS SOME OF YOU WILL RECALL, WE
17 RELEASED THE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK OVER THE SUMMER. WE
18 MET WITH PROJECT SPONSORS AND STAKEHOLDERS. AND THEN CONDUCTED
19 A SECOND ROUND OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE
20 PLANNED BAY AREA TEAM AND REALLY KIND OF ASKED THE PUBLIC MORE
21 GENERAL QUESTIONS ABOUT THE FOCUS OF THE NETWORK DIFFERENT
22 TYPES OF INVESTMENTS AND ASKED MORE QUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT
23 PEOPLE'S PRIORITIES WERE IN TERMS OF SAFETY AND SECURITY
24 INVESTMENTS WHICH IS SOMETHING THAT WE HEARD A LOT FROM THE
25 PUBLIC ABOUT DURING FIRST ROUND OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND IN



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THE DIFFERENT SURVEYS THAT HAVE GONE OUT IN REPRESENTATIVE
2 YEARS AS WELL. GOT SOME VERY GOOD INFORMATION FROM THAT. WE
3 ALSO CONTINUE TO MEET WITH PROJECT SPONSORS AND STAKEHOLDERS,
4 AS I MENTIONED, PRESENTED TO THE PLANNING COMMITTEE, THE
5 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL AND POLICY ADVISORY
6 COUNCIL, OVER THE SUMMER. AND WE HELD TWO IN-PERSON WORKSHOPS
7 IN CONJUNCTION WITH PLANNED BAY AREA AND GOT A LOT OF GREAT
8 FEEDBACK AND COMMENT FROM THAT TOO. SO USING ALL THAT
9 INFORMATION AND FEEDBACK AS WELL AS LETTERS THAT WERE
10 SUBMITTED BY PROJECT SPONSORS, WE HAD SEVERAL SUBSEQUENT
11 MEETINGS WITH THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM TO REVIEW ALL OF
12 THAT INFORMATION AND MAKE A RECOMMENDATION FOR THE FINAL
13 TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK. SO, GENERALLY SPEAKING, THERE WERE NOT
14 HUGE, HUGE CHANGES, FROM WHAT WE PRESENTED IN THE SUMMER FOR
15 THE TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK, BUT THERE WERE SOME CHANGES WHICH
16 ARE HIGHLIGHTED HERE ON THE SLIDE THAT INCLUDES SOME REVISIONS
17 TO PROJECT SCOPE, WHICH INCLUDE SAID SOME ADDITIONAL TRANSIT
18 PRIORITY INVESTMENTS IN THE SOUTH BAY AS PART OF THE VTA
19 VISIONARY NETWORK SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS, SOME PHASING OF THE AC
20 TRANSIT RAPID IMPROVEMENTS AND THE ALTAMONT CORRIDOR EXPRESS
21 FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS AND ADDED SEVERAL PROJECTS INCLUDING
22 CAPITAL CORRIDOR SOUTH BAY CONNECT PROJECT, U.S. 101 PROJECT
23 AND BERKELEY FERRY TERMINAL SERVICE AND LASTLY THE WORK THAT
24 HAPPENED IN THE FALL WAS DELINEATION AND DEFINITION OF
25 PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES OF PROJECTS AND THOSE ARE GROUPS OF



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 PROGRAMS THAT ARE SIMILAR THAT INCLUDE THINGS LIKE
2 IMPROVEMENTS IN EXISTS TRANSIT STATIONS AND STOPS SMALLER
3 LOWER LEVEL FREQUENCY TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS AND THINGS LIKE
4 ONGOING PROJECT DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSIT STUDIES. NEXT SLIDE
5 PLEASE. AND SO HERE'S AN OVERVIEW OF WHERE WE ARE IN TERMS OF
6 THE TRANSIT 2050+ STRATEGIES AND THEIR FUNDING AMOUNTS. SO,
7 REALLY, OFF THE TOP, AND THIS IS THE LARGEST AMOUNT OF FUNDING
8 FOR OUR TOTAL TRANSPORTATION NETWORK IS 380 BILLION FOR
9 ONGOING OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE, THAT INCLUDES TRANSIT AS
10 WELL AS ALL OTHER MODES OF OPERATING AND MAINTAINING WHAT WE
11 HAVE ON GROUND IN TERMS OF TRANSIT SERVICES FIRST STRATEGY T2
12 INCLUDES THINGS LIKE REGIONAL FARE INTEGRATION REGIONAL
13 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PARATRANSIT ENHANCEMENTS COORDINATED
14 SERVICES PLAN IMPLEMENTATION \$6 BILLION OVER 25 YEAR PLANNING
15 HORIZON STRATEGY C3 INCLUDES INFRASTRUCTURE ENHANCEMENTS 15
16 KEY REGIONAL HUBS TO IMPROVE TRANSFERS BETWEEN TRANSIT MODES
17 CONNECTIVITY AND OTHER MODES ALSO INCLUDES OPERATING
18 ASSISTANCE AND TECHNICAL RESOURCES TO ENABLE INCREASED SERVICE
19 FOR FREQUENCIES FOR KEY TRANSFER ROUTES. T471S WHEN WE HEARD
20 FROM THE PUBLIC IN TERMS OF CONTINUED FOCUS ON SAFETY AND
21 SECURITY INCLUDES ONGOING SUPPORT FOR ADDITIONAL THINGS LIKE
22 CAMERA, STAFFING AND ALL KIND OF THINGS FOR AMBASSADORS CRISIS
23 INTERVENTION, STAFF AS WELL AS SECURITY AND POLICE AND THEN
24 PUBLIC AWARENESS AND SAFETY CAMPAIGNS AND PROJECTS
25 PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES ARE IN STRATEGIES T11 AND 12 BY FAR



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THE MAJORITY OF PROJECTS ARE STRATEGY T11 WHICH INCLUDES
2 PROJECTS FOR BUS FERRY AND RAIL AS WELL AS PROGRAMMATIC
3 IMPROVEMENTS TO EXISTING TRANSIT STATION CENTERS AND STOPS
4 INCLUDING MOBILITY HUBS AS WELL AS INVESTMENT TO ENHANCE
5 TRANSIT RELIABILITY AND FREQUENCY AND CAPACITY OTHER
6 INVESTMENTS FOR ENHANCING AND MODERNIZING EXISTING TRANSIT
7 FACILITIES T12 REPRESENTS MAJOR INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS AND
8 ONGOING SUPPORT FOR TRANSIT STUDIES AND DEVELOPMENT, PHASE TWO
9 VALLEY LINK PORTAL SMART EXTENSION HEALDSBURG WITH THAT I'M
10 GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO COPROJECT MANAGER ANDY METZ TO FINISH
11 THE PRESENTATION.

12

13 **ANDY METZ:** THANK YOU, KARA. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. WE'RE GOING TO
14 GO OVER A SERIES MUCH MAPS OVER THE NEXT FOUR SLIDES, AND I
15 WANT TO TAKE A LITTLE BIT TIME TO ORIENT YOU TO THE MAPS AND
16 TO WHAT YOU'RE SEEING. ON THE LEFT HAND SIDE, YOU WILL SEE OUR
17 EXISTING TRANSIT NETWORK HIGHLY STYLIZED. YOU MAY HAVE SEEN
18 THIS IN THE PAST; COVERS WHOLE NINE-COUNTY BAY AREA. ON THE
19 MAP SHOWS EXISTING PLUS RECOMMENDED FINAL NETWORK SO THE FIRST
20 MAP WE'RE SHOWING HERE IS MIDDAY SERVICE IMPROVEMENTS. EACH OF
21 THE CIRCLES YOU SEE WITH THE TOWN NAME OR NEIGHBORHOOD NAME
22 NEXT TO IT REPRESENTS LARGER GEOGRAPHIC SHED. AND THEN ALL OF
23 THE LINES IN BETWEEN THOSE NODES REPRESENT BASICALLY POTENTIAL
24 MODES BY TRAVEL BETWEEN THOSE GEOGRAPHIC SHEDS. IN THE LEGEND
25 THAT YOU CAN SEE AT THE BOTTOM, WE'RE SHOWING FREQUENCY BY



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 DOMINANT SEGMENT, MEANING MOST FREQUENT OF THE SERVICE BETWEEN
2 THOSE GEOGRAPHIC SHEDS. SO, IN THE MIDDAY, YOU CAN SEE AREAS
3 THAT WE HAVE HIGHLIGHTED FOR IMPROVEMENT THROUGHOUT THE BAY
4 AREA, PARTICULARLY IN AREAS THAT ARE GETTING FIVE-MINUTE OR
5 BETTER SERVICE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND IN THE EAST BAY, IN THE
6 SOUTH BAY AND IMPROVEMENTS AS WE GO FURTHER OUT. NEXT SLIDE.
7 THIS SHOWS PM PEAK SERVICE. YOU CAN SEE IN THE AREAS
8 HIGHLIGHTED DOWN ON THE MAP ON THE RIGHT-HAND SIDE. EVERY
9 SEGMENT THAT'S IMPROVED IS HIGHLIGHTED AS WELL AS YOU CAN SEE
10 THE COLOR CHANGE IMPROVEMENT ON THE FREQUENTLY OF THE DOMINANT
11 SEGMENT. HIGHLIGHTING MIDDAY SERVICE POST-COVID IS ESPECIALLY
12 CRITICAL, URBAN CORES INCLUDING SAN FRANCISCO EAST BAY AND
13 SOUTH BAY IMPROVEMENTS IN FREQUENCY GETTING AROUND THE INNER
14 BAY THEN OF COURSE IMPROVEMENTS GOING OUT FURTHER OUT TO
15 SUBURBS WHERE WE SEE A LOT OF SEGMENTS GO FROM FREQUENCY OF
16 WORSE THAN 30 MINUTES TO 15 TO 30 MINUTE BRACKETS OR BETTER.
17 ON THE NEXT SLIDE, IMPROVEMENTS IN TRANSIT PRIORITY, SHOWING
18 THE BUS AND LIGHT RAIL WITH RAPID BUS AS THE OVERAGE AND BRT
19 AND LRT IN PINK THE MAP HIGHLIGHTS THE SEGMENT ALONG THE
20 IMPROVEMENTS YOU WILL SEE A LOT IN SAN FRANCISCO GOING ON THE
21 PENINSULA INTO SOUTH BAY AND IN EAST BAY AND FURTHER OUT
22 PARTS, WHAT THIS MAP DOES NOT HIGH LIGHT ARE CERTAIN SPOT
23 TREATMENTS THAT YOU SEE AS PART OF THE BAY AREA FORWARD SO KEY
24 PART OF TRANSIT 2050+ TRANSIT PRIORITY. THEN ON THE FINAL MAP
25 SLIDE YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE SHOWS THAT TRANSIT PRIORITY



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 FOR HEAVY RAIL AND FERRY AS WELL, AND YOU CAN SEE IMPROVEMENTS
2 THROUGHOUT THE EAST BAY GOING, AND, AGAIN, THOSE HIGHLIGHTED
3 SEGMENTS GOING TO THE NORTH BAY AND THE SOUTH BAY, AS WELL,
4 AND GOING FURTHER OUT INTO THE EAST BAY. AS WELL AS
5 IMPROVEMENTS ACROSS THE BAY, WITH THE FERRIES. ALL RIGHT. ON
6 THE NEXT SLIDE, IF YOU CAN GO TO THAT? JUST A QUICK SUMMARY OF
7 THE CUSTOMER BENEFITS. KARA, THROUGH THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES
8 ALREADY WENT THROUGH SOME OF THE IMPROVED CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE
9 POINTS. OF COURSE, WE SEE AN IMPROVEMENT WITH TRANSIT
10 FREQUENCY AND TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY, THAT YOU CAN SEE
11 THROUGHOUT THE BAY. AND THEN IMPROVED TRANSIT SPEED AND
12 RELIABILITY FROM THE LAST TWO MAP SLIDES THAT WE SHOWED. IF WE
13 CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE? ONE OF THE AREAS I WANT TO HIGH
14 LIGHT IS INVESTMENT IN PROJECT DEVELOPMENT. THIS IS PART OF
15 OUR PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES THAT KARA HIGHLIGHTED AS PART OF
16 TRANSIT STRATEGIES 11 AND 12. KEY AREAS THAT WE WANT TO MAKE
17 SURE THAT WE ARE REPRESENTING THE VISION AS PART OF THIS. WE
18 HAVE HIGHLIGHTED REDWOOD CITY CONTRA COSTA SMART EXTENSION
19 CLOVER DAILY SUISUN CITY AS WELL AS NEW RAIL LINES IN SAN
20 FRANCISCO AND OAKLAND AND IMPROVEMENTS TO THE SOUTH BAY RAIL
21 NETWORK. THAT FEEDS INTO THE NEXT SLIDE THAT I WANT TO GO
22 OVER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WHICH IS SPECIFICALLY AROUND HOW WE
23 HAVE WORKED WITH STAKEHOLDERS AND WORKED WITH OPERATOR LED
24 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM THAT HELPED GET US TO THIS RECOMMENDED
25 FINAL NETWORK. THERE ARE CERTAINLY PROJECTS THAT ARE NOT



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 INCLUDED WITHIN THAT FINAL NETWORK AND THAT INCLUDES SMART
2 EXTENSION FROM HEALDSBURG TO CLOVERDALE, WETA, REDWOOD CITY
3 FERRY, AND THE SAN JOSE AIRPORT CONNECTOR, AMONG OTHERS. THERE
4 WAS A NUMBER OF FACTORS THAT WERE HIGHLIGHTED THAT INCLUDE
5 PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT UNDERSTANDING PROJECT BENEFITS
6 COST RATIO WHETHER PROJECTS SERVE AS EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY
7 WHETHER IT FILLS FREQUENCY OR SPEED GAPS AS PART OF OUR SPEED
8 NEEDS GAPS AND OPPORTUNITIES AGENCY NEEDS GEOGRAPHIC SPREAD
9 WHETHER PART OF OUR ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES, FREQUENCY
10 IMPROVEMENTS IN SHORT-TERM AND CAPITAL PROJECTS LONG-TERM ONE
11 OF THE MOST IMPORTANT FACTORS HAS BEEN INPUT FROM OUR OPERATOR
12 LED PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM WHICH AGAIN REPRESENTS OUR SEVEN
13 LARGE AGENCIES AND FIVE SMALLER AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE BAY
14 AREA AS WELL. SO, ALL OF THOSE FACTORS HAVE COME INTO PLAY TO
15 HAVE THE PROJECTS THAT ARE A PART OF THE RECOMMENDED FINAL
16 NETWORK THAT WE HAVE SHOWN HERE TODAY. AND I ALSO WANT TO HIGH
17 LIGHT FOR ANY PROJECT THAT WE WANT TO CONSIDER ADDING TO THE
18 NETWORK, WE WOULD HAVE TO TAKE OUT OTHER PROJECTS THAT ARE
19 CURRENTLY IN THE NETWORK THAT HAVE BEEN RECOMMENDED BY THAT
20 PMG AND BY OTHER STAKEHOLDERS AS WELL. SO, SIGNIFICANT TRADE-
21 OFFS THERE. ALL RIGHT. AND THE FINAL SLIDE THAT I WOULD LIKE
22 TO GO OVER, IF WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE? AGAIN, I WANT TO
23 HIGH LIGHT NEXT STEPS. KARA WENT OVER A FEW OF THESE IN THE
24 SCHEDULING SLIDE. ONE OF THE KEY NEXT STEPS FOR US IS THE
25 NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT WHICH WILL SHOW HOW OVERALL



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ACCESSIBILITY IS IMPROVED THROUGHOUT THE REGION AS WELL AS
2 ACCESSIBILITY FOR RESIDENTS OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND
3 OTHER FACTORS THEN LOOKING AT OUR SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT WHICH
4 WILL AGAIN FOCUS ON THE PROCESS THAT WE WENT THROUGH IN THIS
5 PROJECT INCLUDING THAT WITH OUR OPERATOR LED PROJECT
6 MANAGEMENT TEAM WHICH I HAVE BEEN -- I THINK, HONORED TO LEAD
7 THROUGH THE THIS PROCESS. SO, WITH THAT I'LL STOP AND I'LL
8 TURN IT BACK TO CHAIR MILLER ON THE NEXT SLIDE.

9

10 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** WELL, THANK YOU SO MUCH. I KNOW THERE WAS
11 A LOT OF WORK AND TIME INVESTED IN THIS AND I THINK IT WAS A
12 REALLY GREAT COLLABORATIVE PROCESS, AT LEAST FROM THE NBTA
13 PERSPECTIVE. ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS CENTER MEMBER CUMMINS?

14

15 **EDDY CUMINS:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE IT. I'M REALLY
16 DISAPPOINTED NOT TO SEE CLOVERDALE ON THE LIST AND I WOULD
17 JUST ASK THAT IT BE RECONSIDERED. IN 2008 VOTERS IN SONOMA-
18 MARIN COUNTY PASSED A SALES TAX TO BUILD A PASSENGER RAIL LINE
19 FROM LARKSPUR TO CLOVERDALE. AND AS OUR SALES TAX COMES UP
20 WHAT PEOPLE EXPECT OF US TO CONTINUE TO MAKE PROGRESS THAT'S
21 ALL WE'RE ASKING FOR TO BE INCLUDED IN THE PLAN ALLOW US AN
22 OPPORTUNITY TO COMPETE FOR FEDERAL FUNDS AND I JUST ASK FOR
23 RECONSIDERATION. THANK YOU.

24



1 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? MEMBER
2 GONOT?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** YEAH. I DO HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT
5 THAT. BECAUSE I KNOW THE AIRPORT CONNECTOR TO SAN JOSE IS IN
6 THERE, AS WELL. IS THERE, IN THE VISION, IS THERE ABILITY TO
7 CONTINUE PLANNING, BUT CAN YOU GO AFTER FEDERAL FUNDS? YOU
8 CAN'T GO AFTER FEDERAL FUNDS FOR CONSTRUCTION, THEY WOULD HAVE
9 TO BE IN THE RTP?

10

11 **KARA VUICICH:** MY UNDERSTANDING IS YOU NEED TO BE IN THE
12 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN IF YOU ARE -- SO IF YOU NEED TO
13 USE FEDERAL FUNDS AND THEN WOULD REQUIRE CERTIFICATION YOU
14 WOULD NEED TO BE IN RTT TO COMPLETE YOUR CERTIFICATION IF IT'S
15 CEQA YOU CAN CONTINUE WITH PROJECT PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT
16 THROUGH ENVIRONMENTAL COMPLETION BUT NOT COMPLETION OF NEPA
17 UNTIL YOU ARE IN THE RTP.

18

19 **CAROLYN GONOT:** OKAY. THAT CAN BE LIMITING. BECAUSE SOME STATE
20 GRANTS ASK FOR THAT AS WELL I'M CONCERNED ABOUT THIS BECAUSE
21 WE'RE LOOKING OUT TO 2050 AND SO IT'S QUITE A WAY AWAY SO LES
22 FURTHER AWAY THAN I THINK SO I DO GET NERVOUS ABOUT
23 CONSTRAINING THE ABILITY FOR A PROJECT TO BE ABLE TO MOVE
24 FORWARD AND GO AFTER GRANT FUNDS THAT YOU KNOW THAT'S A
25 PRIORITY FOR THOSE COMMUNITIES IT'S ALMOST LIKE A CHICKEN AND



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 EGG IF YOU CAN'T GO FOR GRANT FUNDS THEN MOVE PROJECTS FORWARD
2 SO IT'S MORE COMFORTABLE IF WE CAN'T IF THEY'RE NOT IN THE RTP
3 AND I UNDERSTAND THOSE SOURCES BUT THE QUESTION IS WHAT DID WE
4 ASSUME FOR SOURCE IS THERE NO ASSUMPTION THAT THEY THERE WILL
5 BE ADDITIONAL GRANT MONIES FOR THOSE TYPES OF PROJECTS IN THE
6 FUTURE? I DON'T KNOW HOW OTHER REGIONS DEAL WITH THAT HOW
7 FISCALLY CONSTRAINED THEY ARE OR DO THEY ASSUME THAT THERE'S
8 SOME LEVEL OF FUNDING FOR RAIL WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THE -- GOING
9 TO OFFER IN THE FUTURE AND SO WHAT IS DIFFERENT THAN FTA HAS
10 MORE PATTERN -- NOT PATTERNED WELL THAT'S TRUE FOR FERRIES TOO
11 I DON'T KNOW. I MEAN JUST CURIOUS ABOUT THE WHOLE -- THIS
12 ISN'T GOING TO BE AN EASY ONE TO ADD INTO AN RTP IF IT'S
13 SOMETHING SMALLER AMENDED INTO THE RTP.

14

15 **KARA VUICICH:** THIS IS ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WE FACE ON THE
16 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM AND I THINK WE'RE TRYING TO SEEK
17 BALANCE IN TERMS OF PROJECTS AND LONGER TIMELINE WE'RE GOING
18 TO BE UNDERTAKING AND DOING MAJOR UPDATE OF PLANNED BAY AREA
19 STARTING IN 2026 SO THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY TO ADD IN
20 PROJECTS FOR THE NEXT PLAN BUT IT DOES PUSH OUT THAT TIMELINE
21 FOR SURE.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** WHICH WOULD BE -- WHEN WOULD WE HAVE
24 ADOPTED THEN PLANNED BAY AREA? 2028?

25



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 **KARA VUICICH:** 2029.

2

3 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** THAT'S FIVE YEARS AWAY FOR THEM TO BE ABLE
4 TO APPLY FOR GRANTS.

5

6 **KARA VUICICH:** YEAH. THAT WOULD REQUIRE BEING AN RTP YES. IF
7 IT'S A GRANT THAT WOULD REQUIRE THEM TO BE --

8

9 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** MOST OF THE GRANTS TO MOVE INTO
10 CERTAIN THINGS WANTS YOU TO HAVE ENVIRONMENTAL DONE SO THEY'RE
11 GOING TO ASK YOU FOR THAT. FOR US WHO ARE GOING AFTER GRANTS
12 ALL THE TIME THAT'S CRITICAL FOR US. SO BUT BEING -- OKAY. SO
13 BEING IN PLANNING NO LONGER -- HAVING MONEY INTO THE PLANNING
14 PHASE NO LONGER ALLOWS YOU TO GET NEPA. IT USED TO BE OKAY
15 MANY YEARS AGO, 30, WHEN I DID THE FIRST PART.

16

17 **KARA VUICICH:** YEAH.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** BUT OTHER THAN THAT WE HAVEN'T BEEN
20 ABLE TO DO THAT. I KNOW I'M PUSHING ON THIS AND IT KEEPS
21 GETTING PUSHED ON BUT IT'S A LONG TIME FRAME BECAUSE IT TAKES
22 A LONG TIME FOR OUR REGION TO DO IT AND I KNOW THAT IT CAN BE
23 ASSUMED IN FISCAL LEVELS.

24



1 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ARE THERE OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?
2 MEMBER CAMERON?

3

4 **JAMES CAMERON:** THANK YOU. SO JUST TO CHIME IN BRIEFLY ON THE
5 SMART TOPIC. OUR COUNTY IS A BIG ADVOCATE FOR SMART. SCTA
6 BOARD IS SUPPORTIVE OF GOING TO CLOVERDALE HAS BEEN SINCE THE
7 SALES TAX PASSED EVEN PRIOR TO THAT WHEN THE ORIGINAL SALES
8 TRANSPORTATION SALES TAX IN SONOMA COUNTY PASSED IN 2004
9 PERFORMANCE AND RIDERSHIP IS THROUGH THE ROOF IT'S BEEN SHOWN
10 THE NUMBER OF RIDERS TAKING BUS TO USE SMART TRAIN AS OPENED
11 TO TRANSIT SO ANY SUPPORT FOR THAT SCTA BOARD BACKS. THANK
12 YOU.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I HAVE A QUESTION --

15

16 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** I HAVE A QUICK QUESTION -- SORRY. MEMBER
17 MULLIGAN?

18

19 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I'LL CHIME IN TOO FOR MY FRIENDS AT SMART WHO
20 TAKES PASSENGERS TO MY FERRY I KNOW THERE WAS STRUGGLE TO GET
21 SMART TO HEALDSBURG IN THE PLAN THERE WAS A LOT OF
22 APPREHENSION THAT'S MY UNDERSTANDING THEN TRADE-OFFS ARE MADE
23 THEN OVERNIGHT SMART GOT MONEY TO GO TO HEALDSBURG TRADE-OFFS
24 THAT WERE MADE THAT MONEY MUST STILL BE SITTING THERE AND
25 TRAINS ARE ELIGIBLE FOR CERTAIN POTS LIKE FERRIES, AND YOU



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 MADE A DOGMATIC STATEMENT AS YOU SHOULD IT'S BEEN IN LAW FOR
2 30 YEARS CAROLYN, HAS TO BE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED, IF YOU ADD
3 PROJECT YOU HAD IT TAKE A PROJECT OUT BUT THAT'S CONTINGENT
4 UPON YOUR FINANCIAL ASSUMPTIONS BEING AIR TIGHT 100% ACCURATE
5 FOR PROGRAMS, CERTAIN FERRYBOAT PROGRAMS, AND THERE'S SOME
6 POTS OUT THERE ACCOUNT FOR THOSE, SMART PROBABLY SETTING A
7 RECORD FOR FASTEST PROJECT TO EVER GET FUNDING FOR HEALDSBURG
8 SEGMENT IS ENCOURAGING AND SOMETHING WE SHOULD NOT DISCOUNT.

9

10 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OTHER COMMENTS? MEMBER EL-TAWANSY?

11

12 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** THANK YOU THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I
13 WANT TO ASK A QUESTION HAVE YOU LOOKED AT STATE PLANS IN
14 CONSIDERATION OF WHAT REMAINS IN THE RTP AND WHAT DOES NOT? TO
15 EDDY'S COMMENT BECAUSE IF SOMETHING IS IN THE STATE PLANS
16 LIKELIHOOD OF COMPETING FOR FUNDING FOR THAT IS MUCH HIGHER SO
17 WE DEFINITELY WANT TO KEEP THAT IN CONSIDERATION AS YOU'RE
18 EVALUATING WHAT STAYS IN OR GOES OUT?

19

20 **KARA VUICICH:** IT WAS A CONSIDERATION I THINK NOT A PRIMARY
21 CONSIDERATION I THINK THE CRITERIA THAT WE TACKED ABOUT IN THE
22 PRESENTATION WHERE R WERE THE PRIMARY THINGS THAT WERE
23 CONSIDERED BY THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM AND APPRECIATE THE
24 COMMENT.

25



1 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS?

2

3 **SEAMUS MURPHY:** YES.

4

5 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MEMBER MURPHY?

6

7 **SEAMUS MURPHY:** THANKS TO THE PMT FOR INCLUDING ENHANCEMENTS TO
8 OUR EXISTING SERVICE IN THE PLAN AND FINDING A WAY TO PUT THE
9 REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL INTO THE PLAN THAT'S APPRECIATED
10 WE THINK THE SAME RATIONALE SHOULD BE USED THAT'S ALREADY BEEN
11 IN THE LONG LINES OF THE QUESTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN ASKED AND
12 COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE ADD REDWOOD CITY FERRY TERMINAL
13 AND FUNDING PLAN FOR THAT TERMINAL INCLUDES LOCAL MONEY THAT
14 CAN'T BE USED FOR ANYTHING ELSE REGIONAL MONEY THAT'S
15 DEDICATED TO CAPITAL PROJECTS WE CONTROL ALONG WITH MTC WHERE
16 THOSE FUNDS GO PLAN IS TO USE SOME OF THAT FOR THE REDWOOD
17 CITY PROJECT AND THEN APPLY FOR FEDERAL FUNDS AS DENIS SAID WE
18 HAVE DONE A GOOD JOB BRINGING LEVERAGING LOCAL DOLLARS AND
19 REGIONAL DOLLARS TO DELIVER THOSE FERRY ONLY FUNDS TO THE
20 REGION IF WE DON'T HAVE THIS PROJECT WE WON'T BE ABLE TO USE
21 THOSE FUNDS LEVERAGE THOSE DOLLARS AND BRING THEM TO THE
22 REGION THEY'RE AUTHORIZED WE SHOULD ANTICIPATE AND ASSUME THEY
23 WILL GET AND IF THEY'RE APPROPRIATED YOU DON'T NEED TO TAKE
24 ANY OTHER PROJECTS OUT THERE'S ENOUGH CAPACITY TO BE ABLE TO
25 FUND THE REDWOOD CITY TERMINAL WITHOUT TAKING ANY OTHER FERRY



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 PROJECTS OUT OF THE PLAN THAT'S OUR REQUEST THAT HAPPENED AND
2 THE PLAN BE CHANGED TO ACCOMMODATE THE PROJECT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS?

5

6 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** I HAVE A CLARIFYING COMMENT ON WHAT
7 DINA WAS TALKING ABOUT. DIRIDON IS THAT A PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
8 OKAY TO GET NEPA CLEARANCE.

9

10 **KARA VUICICH:** MY UNDERSTANDING, IN PROJECT DEVELOPMENT IS THAT
11 IT WOULD NEED TO BE IN THE RTP TO COMPLETE NEPA CERTIFICATION
12 OR FINALIZATION.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** THAT COULD BE PROBLEMATIC. IS WHAT
15 DINA SAID ABOUT THE STATE PLAN TRUE? I WAS MEETING WITH CHAD
16 EDISON THE OTHER DAY AND WE WERE TALKING ABOUT SOME PROJECTS
17 IN OUR COUNTY AND HE SAID IT'S CRITICAL TO BE IN THE STATE
18 RAIL PLAN I KNOW WE DIDN'T CONSIDER IT AS CRITERIA BUT IT
19 HELPS WITH GETTING FUNDING AND I AGREE WITH DINA I WANT TO PUT
20 AN EXCLAMATION POINT ON WHAT SHE WAS TALKING ABOUT.

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** MATT MALONEY DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR METRO
23 PLANNING AND POLICY. THERE IS SOME NUANCE, CAROLYN, ON THINGS
24 LIKE STATIONS LIKE DIRIDON RELATIVE TO SERVICES THAT EXPAND
25 THE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. SOME OF THIS COMES DOWN TO AIR



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 QUALITY CONFORMITY. SO, WE NEED TO ABIDE BY FEDERAL AIR
2 QUALITY CONFORMITY WHEN WE DO, LIKE, TRANSIT EXTENSIONS. IF
3 THEY ARE BRAND-NEW STATIONS, NOT NECESSARILY. SO THERE IS SOME
4 NUANCE THERE AND I YOU THINK WE SHOULD MAYBE TAKE THAT
5 CONVERSATION OFFLINE A LITTLE BIT ABOUT NEPA AND CEQA AND
6 EXACTLY WHAT IS REQUIRED IN TERMS OF BEING NAMED IN THE PLAN.
7 IT'S A BIT OF A GRAY AREA.

8

9 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** BECAUSE EVERYTHING ELSE WE DO IS VERY
10 BLACK AND WHITE. [LAUGHTER] ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** CASEY FROHMSTIN HERE FOR MICHELLE BOUCHARD. I WANT TO
13 THANK THE TEAM, SPECIFICALLY ANDY AND KARA, I KNOW YOU FOLKS
14 WORK CLOSELY ON THE ITEMS THAT ARE IN THE PLAN SO THANK YOU
15 FOR ALL YOUR WORK ON THAT AND TO THE POINT THERE IS SOME GRAY
16 AREA AROUND DIRIDON WE NEED TO TAKE THAT OFFLINE WE WOULD LIKE
17 TO BE PART OF THIS CONVERSATION MAKE SURE THAT LINES UP WITH
18 WHAT WE'RE HOPING AS PART OF THE PROCESS TO MOVE FORWARD
19 CERTAINLY NOT THE END OF IT BUT WE WOULD LIKE TO BE PART OF
20 THAT AS WELL.

21

22 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** GO AHEAD.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR JOHN RIZZO CITY OF SAN JOSE JUST
25 WANT TO BACK UP WHAT'S BEING SAID HERE SOUTH BAY PROJECTS AND



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 AIRPORT CONNECTOR AND BOTH PROJECTS WERE HEAVILY INVESTED IN
2 AND WANT TO BE AT THE TABLE FOR WHATEVER'S GOING ON IN THE
3 CONVERSATION AND IN TERMS OF OFFLINE CONVERSATIONS ALSO THANK
4 THE TEAM I KNOW WE HAVE DONE A LOT OF WORK TOGETHER SO JUST
5 MAKE SURE THAT'S OUT THERE I WANT TO GET SOME CLARITY NOT ONLY
6 ON DIRIDON BUT AT THE SAME AIRPORT CONNECTOR BECAUSE WE ON THE
7 OTHER HAND THAT IF WE GOT IN THE PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORY WE HAD
8 SOME LEEWAY TO GET INTO THOSE FURTHER FUNDS WHERE THERE WERE
9 PRIMARY PROJECT SPONSOR FOR AIRPORT CONNECTOR. REALLY
10 INTERESTED IN WHERE THAT'S GOING TO GO.

11

12 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MATT?

13

14 **MATT MALONEY:** A FEW COMMENTS THAT HAD TO DO WITH THE FISCAL
15 CONSTRAINT OF THE PLAN I MEAN I THINK THAT THE FISCAL
16 CONSTRAINT FOR RTPS ARE SUPER IMPORTANT, WHAT MAKES IT A PLAN
17 AND NOT JUST, SORT OF, A VISION LIST AND OUR FEDERAL PARTNERS
18 AND I'M GLAD THE ADMINISTRATOR FROM FTA IS HERE AND SO WHEN WE
19 DO CERTIFICATION WITH FEDS EVERY SO OFTEN THAT'S A BIG TOPIC
20 OF CONVERSATION, ASSUMPTIONS THAT WE MAKE YOU KNOW WE TRY TO
21 IN OUR PLAN ACCOUNT FOR THE REVENUES THAT WE'RE GETTING TODAY
22 AND WE FORECAST THAT FORWARD BUT WE ARE ALSO TRYING TO BE
23 AMBITIOUS ABOUT WHAT REVENUES THAT WE DON'T HAVE IN THE HAND
24 TODAY SO WE LOOK AT ASSUMPTIONS LIKE REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE
25 WHICH IS ANOTHER TOPIC OF CONVERSATION WE HAVE STRATEGY IN



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THEREABOUT PRICING AND HIGHWAY NETWORK WHICH WOULD ADD
2 ADDITIONAL REVENUES SO WE HAVE A BALANCE IN TERMS OF REALISM
3 WITH AMBITION AND BOTH A SCIENCE AND ART BUT WE FEEL LIKE WE
4 HAVE A PRETTY GOOD BALANCE IN TERMS OF THE REVENUES THAT WE
5 ASSUME IN THE PLAN ALTHOUGH AS KARA AND ANDY MENTIONED IT'S
6 TRICKY. WE CAN'T PUT EVERY PROJECT IN THE PLAN, AND SO WE DO
7 HAVE A FEW MONTHS FOR THOSE TRADE OFFER DISCUSSIONS THIS IS A
8 VENUE FOR THAT AND THAT WILL CONTINUE WITH OUR COMMISSION IN
9 OUR COMMITTEE OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS.

10

11 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** GREAT. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? I
12 HAVE A QUESTION. I'M BRINGING UP SOME LANGUAGE FROM OLDER
13 PLANS, I REMEMBER IT'S REALLY HARD TO OPEN UP THE PLAN TO DO
14 AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY MID-STREAM. BUT THERE WAS A TIME WE HAD
15 A THING CALLED ANTICIPATED UNIDENTIFIED REVENUES. [LAUGHTER]
16 WE CAN'T DO THAT ANYMORE? IT SEEMS LIKE WOULD BE ONE WAY BEING
17 ABLE TO ACTUALLY PUT SOME OF THESE OTHER PROJECTS.

18

19 **MATT MALONEY:** WE STILL HAVE ANTICIPATED AND UNSPECIFIED
20 REVENUES ASSUMED IN OUR PLAN BECAUSE FROM TIME TO TIME THOSE
21 HAVE APPEARED IN OUR REGION. SO, YOU KNOW LOOKING, BACK AT
22 WHAT HAS HAPPENED IN THE PAST, WE CREATE A FORECAST FOR THE
23 FUTURE SO THAT DEFINITELY IS STILL PART OF OUR FORECAST.

24



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** WELL GIVEN THE NORTH BAY'S STRONG
2 PROPENSITY FOR PASSING SALES TAX MAYBE THIS IS SOMETHING THAT
3 YOU GUYS CAN TAKE A STRONGER LOOK AT AND HAVE A CONVERSATION
4 WITH MY PARTNER, EDDY, SO THAT HE'S NOT SO DISTRACTED ON THAT
5 AND HE CAN ACTUALLY START TALKING ABOUT MOVING IT TO NAPA TOO.
6 YEAH. ALL RIGHT. GOOD CONVERSATION. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF
7 THE PUBLIC THAT HAVE COMMENTS, WALLY?

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING
10 THERE ARE NO SPEAKER CARDS IN THE ROOM AND THERE IS NO ONE
11 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

12

13 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY. GREAT. THERE IS NO VOTING ON THIS
14 ITEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR THEIR PRESENTATION. AND
15 WE'LL MOVE ON TO 4B, RIGHT? 4B IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
16 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT UPDATE. STAFF WILL PRESENT AN OVERVIEW
17 OF PROPOSED TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS
18 PRIOR TO INTEGRATION TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. FINAL
19 BLUEPRINT IN JANUARY 2025. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM AND
20 CHIRAG IS GOING TO GO AHEAD WITH ADAM AND PRESENT THIS ITEM.
21 SO, GO AHEAD, THANKS.

22

23 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND GOOD MORNING,
24 EVERYONE. I'M CHIRAG RABARI, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ PROJECT
25 MANAGER, AND I'M JOINED BY MY COLLEAGUE, ADAM NOELTING, WHO IS



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT LEAD FOR THE PLAN. SO, KARA AND
2 ANDY TALKED QUITE A BIT ABOUT THE TRANSIT ASPECT OF THE PLAN,
3 AND THIS ITEM IS GOING TO LOOK AT SOME ASPECTS OF THE
4 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT, OVERALL, INCLUDING MORE DISCUSSION
5 ABOUT THE FINANCIAL -- THE FINANCIAL PICTURE AND FISCAL
6 CONSTRAINT, AS WELL AS OUR APPROACH FOR SOME OF THE NON-
7 TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS. AND IF WE COULD GO TO THE
8 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS ITERATION OF THE LONG RANGE PLAN
9 KICKED OFF IN MID-2023, AND TO DATE WE HAVE CONDUCTED TWO
10 EXTENSIVE ROUNDS OF PUBLIC AND PARTNER STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT.
11 OBVIOUSLY ONE OF THE UNIQUE THINGS ABOUT THIS PLANNING CYCLE
12 IS WE'RE MOVING THE PLAN AS WELL AS THE PARALLEL TRENDS OF THE
13 2050+ PROCESS IN PARALLEL WE'RE COMING CLOSE TO THE CONCLUSION
14 OF THE PLANS BLUEPRINT PHASE WHERE WE'RE IDENTIFYING WHAT ARE
15 THE STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES AND INVESTMENTS THAT WE'RE
16 PROPOSING TO MOVE FORWARD IN THE PLAN. WE'RE COMING UP ON KEY
17 MILESTONES IN EARLY 2025 WHERE WE'LL BE ASKING OUR POLICY
18 MAKERS TO APPROVE THIS BLUEPRINT FOR FURTHER ANALYSIS AND
19 STUDY AND THEN SCHEDULE ACTUALLY MOVE THE PLAN INTO CEQA AND
20 THE ENVIRONMENTAL PHASE. THE FINAL PHASE OF THE PLAN WILL
21 STRETCH THROUGH THE MAJORITY OF 2025 AND WE'RE ANTICIPATING
22 APPROVAL IN LATE 2025. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS THE FEDERAL REGIONAL
23 TRANSPORTATION PLAN AND STATE SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES
24 STRATEGY, THE PLAN IS SUBJECT TO A HOST OF PLANNING
25 REQUIREMENTS AS THE RTP HAS TO BE UPDATED EVERY FOUR YEARS



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 INCLUDE ROBUST PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROCESS AS WELL AS CONTAIN
2 FISCALLY CONSTRAINED TRANSPORTATION NETWORK AND AS THE STATE
3 SCS HAS COORDINATE LONG RANGE TRANSPORTATION PLANNING HOUSING
4 LAND USE PLANNING ACCOMMODATE PROJECTED GROWTH FOR ALL INCOME
5 LEVELS AS WELL AS REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS PER CAPITA GREENHOUSE
6 EMISSIONS FROM LIGHT-DUTY VEHICLES BY YEAR 2035 PARTNERS SUCH
7 AS FHWA CALTRANS CARB AND CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD ALL
8 HAVE A ROLE IN APPROVING AND REVIEWING THE PLAN THIS IS A
9 MINOR PLAN UPDATE COMPARED TO OTHER CYCLES BECAUSE THERE IS NO
10 PARALLEL REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION PROCESS OR RHNA AND
11 WE ALSO HAVE THE SAME GHG AS THE LAST PLAN AS WELL AS SAME
12 PLAN HORIZON YEAR OF 2050. NEXT SLIDE. IMPORTANT TO NOTE IN
13 TERMS OF OUTCOMES AND LOOKING AT VARIOUS DIFFERENT METRICS IN
14 TERMS OF CREATING AN AFFORDABLE CONNECTED DIVERSE HEALTHY AND
15 VIBE RAPID BAY AREA IT'S THE PLANS HOUSING ENVIRONMENT AND
16 ECONOMY ELEMENTS THAT DRIVES THE MAJORITY OF OUTCOMES IN TERMS
17 OF SEEING THINGS MOVING IN A POSITIVE DIRECTIONS IN THE
18 FUTURE. HOWEVER WE KNOW THAT TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT IS
19 CONSIDERABLE INTEREST BECAUSE OF ITS ROLE IN IDENTIFYING LONG
20 RANGE TRANSPORTATION PRIORITIES AND ROLE THAT IT HAS IN
21 FEDERAL AND STATE PLANNING PROCESSES AND MOVING PROJECTS
22 FORWARD SO THAT IS REALLY GOING TO BE THE FOCUS OF THIS
23 PRESENTATION. ONE OTHER NUANCE I WOULD ADD WHEN WE RELEASED
24 OUR ANALYSIS OF THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT EARLIER THIS SPRING
25 ALTHOUGH THAT INCLUDED A HANDFUL OF TRANSPORTATION POLICY



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 BASED STRATEGIES IT DID NOT INCLUDE ANY TRANSPORTATION
2 INVESTMENTS THAT'S OUR FOCUS HERE TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. NEXT
3 SLIDE. THANK YOU. KARA AND ANDY TALKED ABOUT DYNAMICS THAT ARE
4 NEEDED TO REIMAGINE OR RECONSIDERING THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES IN
5 LIGHT OF EVOLVING CIRCUMSTANCES. BUT FOR THE TRANSPORTATION
6 ELEMENT, OVERALL, I WOULD SAY THERE ARE THREE CONSIDERATIONS
7 THAT WE HAVE BEEN CONTENDING WITH. WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT THE
8 FACT THAT THERE IS LESS MONEY TO INVEST IN TRANSPORTATION
9 ENHANCEMENT AND EXPANSION COMPARED TO THE PREVIOUS PLAN AND WE
10 HAVE BEEN RELATIVELY CONSISTENT ON THIS MESSAGING SINCE MAN
11 KICK OFTEN SIMPLY NOT ENOUGH MONEY PROJECTS ARE GOING TO BE
12 DELAYED SCOPE TO ADDRESS FISCAL CONSTRAINT REQUIREMENTS WE
13 ALSO HAVE GHG REQUIREMENT FOR THE PLAN AND IT'S ACCORDING TO
14 OUR PRELIMINARY ANALYSIS WE'RE CURRENTLY FALLING SHORT OF THE
15 GHG TARGET BY THREE POINTS THAT'S OUR ANALYSIS AND METHODOLOGY
16 FOR CALCULATING GHG REDUCTION IS SUBJECT TO APPROVAL FROM THE
17 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD. THEY COULD REJECT OUR
18 ASSUMPTIONS OR REQUIRE MORE CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTIONS. AND WE
19 DO NEED TO HAVE A COMPLIANT PLAN THAT ACHIEVES GHG TARGET IN
20 ORDER TO BE ELIGIBLE FOR CERTAIN STATES TRANSPORTATION FUNDING
21 SOURCES, INCLUDING SOLUTIONS FOR CONGESTED CORRIDOR PROGRAM
22 AND TRADE CORRIDOR ENHANCEMENT PROGRAM ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
23 DOLLARS THEN FINALLY SPECIFIC TO THE NON-TRANSIT COMPONENT OF
24 THE PLAN IMPORTANT TO NOTE EVOLVING STATE POLICY ENVIRONMENT
25 WITH RESPECT TO VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED VMT AND SENATE BILL



1 SB43 PASSED IN 2013 THERE IS GUIDELINES THAT HAVE BEEN
2 DEVELOPED OVER THE YEARS WE'RE GETTING MORE CLARITY ABOUT HOW
3 THAT'S GOING TO BE IMPLEMENTED AND UNDERSTAND THAT TO BE
4 ROBUST COSTLY MITIGATIONS REQUIRED FOR PROJECTS THAT EXPAND
5 CAPACITY AND INCREASE VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED WE ALSO HAVE SEEN
6 LESS SUCCESS FOR SOME FREEWAY EXPANSION PROJECTS OVER THE
7 INTERVENING YEARS IN TERMS OF SUCCESSFULLY GETTING FUNDING
8 FROM STATES PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE. IN TERMS OF REVISED REVENUE
9 FORECAST FOR THE PLAN OUR UPDATE DID INCLUDE SOME DETAILED
10 ATTACHMENTS THAT HAD REVENUE TABLES AS WELL AS DETAILED WRITE
11 UP ON NEEDS AND REVENUE SOURCES AND REVENUE FORECAST FEDERAL
12 STATE AND REGIONAL SOURCES ARE RELATIVELY CONSISTENT WE KNOW
13 THIS PLAN AND THE PREVIOUS PLAN ONLY MODEST REDUCTIONS. THE
14 LARGEST CHANGES HAVE BEEN IN WHAT WE CALL THE LOCAL CATEGORY
15 WHICH INCLUDES TRANSIT FARE REVENUES YOU CAN SEE \$30 BILLION
16 REDUCTION IN THAT CATEGORY PRIMARILY DUE TO LESS ANTICIPATED
17 RIDERSHIP AND LESS REVENUES FROM TRANSIT FARES AS WELL AS OUR
18 NEW AND ANTICIPATED SOURCE WHICH IS DECLINED BY \$40 BILLION.
19 HOWEVER LOOK AT THE RED WE'RE STILL ASSUMING NINE COUNTIES
20 REGIONAL REVENUE MEASURE AT HALF CENT SALES TAX OR EQUIVALENT
21 WE HAVE ANTICIPATED REVENUES NEARLY \$23 BILLION AND THAT IS
22 ANTICIPATED UNSPECIFIED SOURCES WE HAVE A ROADWAY PRICING
23 STRATEGY, PARKING PRICING STRATEGY AS WELL AS NEW USER FEES TO
24 GENERATE \$90 BILLION SO PRETTY SIGNIFICANT ROBUST SERIOUS OF
25 NEW ANTICIPATED REVENUE SOURCES TO SUPPORT TRANSPORTATION



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 EXPANSION AND ENHANCEMENT ALTHOUGH SMALLER THAN THE PREVIOUS
2 PLAN. WHERE WE STAND RIGHT NOW WE'LL INCORPORATE FINAL
3 TECHNICAL CORRECTIONS INTO THE FORECAST IN JANUARY. NEXT
4 SLIDE. AGAIN, WALKING THROUGH SOME OF THE MATH OF HOW WE
5 CALCULATE THESE THINGS AND HOW THEY COMPARE TO THE PREVIOUS
6 PLAN. YOU CAN SEE THE NEARLY \$70- TO \$80 BILLION DECLINE
7 BETWEEN PLANS IN TERMS OF OVERALL REVENUE FORECAST TO THE \$512
8 BILLION. THE NEEDS TO OPERATE AND MAINTAIN SYSTEM ARE NEARLY
9 UNCHANGED FROM THE PREVIOUS PLAN \$380 BILLION. AND WITH MTC'S
10 LONG-STANDING FIX IT FIRST POLICY, ESSENTIALLY WE TAKE THAT
11 OWN THE O&M NEEDS SUBTRACT IT FROM THE REVENUE FORECAST AND
12 EVERYTHING THAT'S LEFT OVER IS WHAT'S AVAILABLE TO INVEST IN
13 ALL OTHER TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS. I WANT TO
14 NOTE \$380 BILLION INVESTMENT IN STRATEGY T1 IS NOT ACTUALLY
15 GOING TO GET US TO A STATE OF GOOD REPAIR THAT'S REALLY JUST
16 TO MAKE SURE THAT CONDITIONS DO NOT GET WORSE THAN CURRENT
17 CONDITIONS REALLY ALSO ABOUT MAINTAINING TRANSIT SERVICE
18 LEVELS AT 2023 LEVELS, CONSIDERING PREVIOUS SLIDE \$90 BILLION
19 IN NEW AND ANTICIPATED REVENUES AND \$132 BILLION FOR EXPANSION
20 ENHANCEMENT, OUR EXPANSION ENHANCEMENT PORTFOLIO IS VERY MUCH
21 DEPENDENT UPON ROBUST AND APPROXIMATE FAIRLY AGGRESSIVE SERIES
22 OF ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT NEW AND ANTICIPATED SOURCES IN TERMS OF
23 INVESTMENTS OVER HALF OF THE MONEY IS GOING TO OPERATE AND
24 MAINTAIN OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM 14th TO OPERATE AND MAINTAIN OUR
25 ROADWAY SYSTEM, \$380 BILLION FOR THAT \$132 BILLION REMAINDER



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 GOES TO TRANSIT EXPANSION AS CAROLE WAS DISCUSSES WE ALSO HAVE
2 NON-TRANSIT EXPANSION AND ENHANCEMENT INVESTMENTS THINGS LIKE
3 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION OUR LOCAL ROADWAYS AND FREEWAYS OTHER
4 AREAS THEN INVESTMENT IN HIGH IMPACT CLIMATE STRATEGIES
5 WEIGHTED INTO THE NEAR-TERM TO HELP US MEET THE 20 BE 35 GHG
6 TARGET. NEXT SLIDE. WALKING THROUGH THE STRATEGIES THE COLORS
7 EXPLAINING THE STRATEGIES LIGHT GREEN SHADE THAT INCLUDES
8 THINGS LIKE PRICING OUR REGIONAL VISION ZERO POLICY AS WELL AS
9 REDUCED SPEEDS ON FREEWAYS AS WELL AS INVESTMENT IN
10 ELECTRIFICATION AND EXPANDING IT. DM INITIATIVES THOSE ARE
11 RELATIVELY LOW-COST STRATEGIES THAT ARE EFFECTIVE AT HELPING
12 US MEETS THE PLAN'S GHG TARGET. THE STRATEGIES SHADED IN THE
13 DARKER BROWN COLOR THOSE ARE THE STRATEGIES THAT ACTUALLY
14 INCLUDE NAMED PROJECTS ON THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST. THE
15 OTHER STRATEGIES, AND THE LIGHTER BROWN, THOSE ARE
16 PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES, SO THEY DON'T INCLUDE SPECIFICALLY
17 NAMED PROJECTS. IN TERMS OF THE OVERALL INVESTMENTS, YOU CAN
18 SEE THAT THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENT IN THE ACTIVE
19 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK FOR THE REGION, ABOUT 20% OF THE TOTAL
20 50 BILLION GOING TO NON-TRANSIT EXPANSION ENHANCEMENT. WE HAVE
21 A LOT OF INVESTMENTS IN REGIONAL PROGRAMS AND LOCAL
22 PRIORITIES, WHICH INCLUDE STREETS AND ROADWAYS, AND THEN TALK
23 MORE ABOUT STRATEGIES T5, T6, AND T7 ON THE NEXT SLIDE. I'LL
24 NOTE THAT THE AMOUNT OF INVESTMENTS THAT'S GOING INTO
25 EXPANDING FREEWAYS IS RELATIVELY MODEST AT \$3 BILLION AND THAT



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ALSO INCLUDES MITIGATION IMPACTS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, YOU KNOW,
2 THERE IS CONSIDERABLE INTEREST IN TOPICS OF ROAD PRICING WHICH
3 IS PART OF OUR STRATEGY T5. THESE STRATEGIES ARE VERY
4 IMPORTANT TO HELP US MEET THE GHG TARGET FOR THE PLAN. THEY
5 ALSO GENERATE, YOU KNOW, MUCH NEEDED REVENUE. AND THE
6 INTENTION HAS ALWAYS BEEN TO ALIGN THE PLAN'S PRICING STRATEGY
7 WITH THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY, BAY
8 AREA FREEWAY STUDY WHICH SOME OF YOU MAY BE FAMILIAR WITH AND
9 IT'S BEEN MOVING FORWARD OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. NEXGEN
10 WAS BEING LOOKING AT TWO DIFFERENT PATHWAYS FOR ROADWAY
11 PRICING. HIGHWAY PEAK PERIOD ALL-LANE TOLLING AS WELL AS
12 REGIONAL WIDE MILEAGE BASED FEE BOTH CAN HELP US MEET GHG
13 REDUCTION GOALS ALTHOUGH THEY HAVE DIFFERENT BENEFITS AND
14 DISBENEFITS IN TOLLING CAN REDUCE VMT FEWER IMPACTS IN TERMS
15 OF AFFORDABILITY THERE IS ALSO DIVERSION MILEAGE BASED FEE
16 GENERATE QUITE A BIT OF REVENUE AND FINANCIAL IMPACTS
17 HOUSEHOLD IN THE REGION BUT COULD ALSO ALIGN WITH POTENTIAL
18 STATE PROGRAMS IN THAT AREA. HOWEVER NEXGEN WAS NOT ABLE TO
19 RECOMMEND A SINGLE PATH FORWARD DUE TO THE NEED FOR ADDITIONAL
20 RESEARCH IN THIS AREA. IN THE PLAN CONTEXT WE'RE PROPOSING TO
21 MAINTAIN ALL-LANE TOLLING BUT AS A PLACE HOLDER STRATEGY WITH
22 THE PRIMARY CONSIDERATION BEING THAT WE'LL HAVE FEWER IMPACTS
23 ON AFFORDABILITY AND CAN HELP DRIVE GREATER VMT REDUCTION. BUT
24 WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE NEXT PLAN CYCLE IS GOING TO HAVE
25 TO RECONSIDER AND CONFIRM THAT THIS IS THE CORRECT APPROACH



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 DEPENDING ON HOW THINGS EVOLVE IN POLICY, FUNDING AND MOBILITY
2 ENVIRONMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SO IN TERMS OF OUR FREEWAY STRATEGY,
3 WE MENTIONED CHALLENGES IN THE FISCAL SPACE AS WELL AS CHANGES
4 OF STATE, CLIMATE, AND FUNDING POLICIES. OUR PREVIOUS PLAN HAD
5 A STRATEGY T6 TO IMPROVE INTERCHANGES AND ADDRESS HIGHWAY
6 BOTTLENECK THAT HAVE ALL FREEWAY INVESTMENTS JUST IN ONE BIG
7 CATEGORY. WHEN WE'RE PROPOSING FOR THIS PLAN IS TO REALLY
8 DISTINGUISH BETWEEN THOSE FREEWAY AND ROADWAY INVESTMENTS THAT
9 ARE NON-CAPACITY INCREASING VERSUS THOSE THAT DO INCREASE
10 CAPACITY. OUR NEW AND REVISED STRATEGY T6 IS REALLY LOOKING AT
11 TECHNOLOGY, LOOKING AT SAFETY, IT'S LOOKING AT INTERCHANGE
12 ENHANCEMENTS, AS WELL AS, YOU KNOW, MULTIMODAL ACCESS. BY
13 CONTRAST, STRATEGY T7 IS WHERE THE CAPACITY INCREASING
14 PROJECTS ARE GOING TO GO. SO, THIS FREEWAY WIDENING, THAT'S
15 WHERE GENERAL PURPOSE FREEWAY EXPANSIONS, HIGH-OCCUPANCY TOLL
16 LANES, EXPRESS LANES, AS WELL AS HOV LANES. WE'RE PROPOSING
17 THAT ANY FREEWAY CAPACITY INCREASING PROJECTS DO ALSO INCLUDE
18 MITIGATION FOR ANY ADDITIONAL VMT THAT MIGHT GENERATED BY
19 THOSE PROJECTS AND WE'RE ALSO PROPOSING THAT A PROJECT
20 DEVELOPMENT KIND OF SUBCATEGORY SO THAT PROJECTS THAT ARE NOT
21 INCLUDED AS NAMED PROJECTS CAN CONTINUE TO MOVE FORWARD. AND
22 THAT WOULD BE, SORT OF, A PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORY TO HELP
23 ADDRESS PROJECT LEVEL PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW. NEXT
24 SLIDE. SO, TO KIND OF ILLUSTRATE HOW THIS IS GOING TO WORK
25 WITHIN THE EXPRESS LANES CONTEXT, WE HAVE BEEN WORKING CLOSELY



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 WITH OUR PARTNERS OVER THE PAST YEAR TO BALANCE OUR PRIORITIES
2 GIVEN THE PLANNING CONSTRAINTS BUT STILL MOVE SOME STRATEGIC
3 PROJECTS FORWARD AND ALLOW FOR CONTINUED PLANNING WHERE
4 APPROPRIATE. SO, IN TERMS OF THE CONSTRAINED LIST, THE NAMED
5 PROJECTS WE ARE PROPOSING TO INCLUDE NAMED SEGMENTS ON U.S.
6 101 IN SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA, I680, ALAMEDA CONTRA COSTA
7 AS WELL AS SR85 IN SANTA CLARA IN TERMS OF THOSE
8 CONSIDERATIONS, YOU KNOW, REALLY TRYING TO PRIORITIZE
9 CONTINUOUS CORRIDORS. THOSE PROJECTS THAT ARE MOST LIKELY TO
10 MOVE FORWARD CONSTRUCTION WITHIN THE NEXT FOUR YEARS AND WORK
11 WITHIN OUR FISK ENVELOPE. PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORY WILL ALLOW FOR
12 CONTINUED PROJECT DEVELOPMENT. THE ADVANTAGE OF THAT CATEGORY
13 IS THAT IT WILL NOT WORSEN OUR GHG PERFORMANCE OR ABILITY TO
14 MEET THAT TARGET. BUT PROJECTS CAN KEEP MOVING FORWARD WITH
15 SOME OF THEIR ENVIRONMENTAL WORK BUT WOULD NEED -- WOULD
16 NECESSITATE A PLAN AMENDMENT IF THERE WERE CHANGES TO
17 CIRCUMSTANCES AND THEY WERE TO MOVE FORWARD. YOU KNOW, WE ALSO
18 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THESE PROJECTS ARE ALIGNED WITH THE
19 EVOLVING STATE, YOU KNOW, CLIMATE, AND THE FUNDING ENVIRONMENT
20 TO ENSURE THAT THEY HAVE THE BEST OPPORTUNITIES TO MOVE
21 FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE. SO, A NEW ELEMENT OF PLANNED BAY AREA
22 2050+, WHICH HAS NOT BEEN INCLUDED IN PREVIOUS PLANS IS WHAT
23 WE'RE CALLING OUR DRAFT RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST. THIS IS
24 SOMETHING THAT WE HAVE BEEN WORKING CLOSELY WHO BCDC STAFF ON,
25 AND IT'S A FISCALLY UNCONSTRAINED LIST OF SEA LEVEL RISE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ADAPTATION PROJECTS THAT ARE NESTED WITHIN OUR STRATEGY EN ONE
2 TO ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL RISE. THIS IS INTENDED TO HELP SERVE AS
3 AN INFORMATIONAL RESOURCE, AS AN ADVOCACY RESOURCE, LOOKING AT
4 PROJECTS THAT ARE GOING TO BE PROTECT AGAINST BOTH NEAR-TERM
5 FLOODING AND SEA LEVEL RISE CONCERNS, AS WELL AS LONGER TERM
6 FLOODING CONCERNS. SO, THE MAJORITY OF THESE FUNDING
7 REQUIREMENTS ARE ANTICIPATED TO OCCUR AFTER THE YEAR 2035. WE
8 WERE ABLE TO GATHER QUITE A BIT OF INFORMATION FROM LOCAL
9 PARTNERS. SO, THIS LIST DOES INCLUDE 127 LOCALLY DEVELOPED
10 PROJECTS WHERE THERE ARE ACTIVE PLANNING EFFORTS MOVING
11 FORWARD. BUT WE ALSO HAVE CLOSE TO 300 PLACEHOLDER PROJECTS
12 THAT WILL PROTECT AGAINST UP TO FIVE FEET OF WATER RISE. NEXT
13 SLIDE. SO, IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE CHALLENGES THAT WE ARE
14 ANTICIPATING AS WE MOVE INTO THE NEXT PHASES OF THE PLAN. I
15 THINK, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE OBVIOUSLY HEARD QUITE A BIT TODAY IN
16 TERMS OF ONGOING CONCERNS ABOUT PROJECTS THAT ARE NOT ABLE TO
17 BE ACCOMMODATED ON THE LIST BUT WE DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE
18 THAT, YOU KNOW, IF THERE ARE PROJECTS THAT WERE TO EXPERIENCE
19 A CHANGE IN CIRCUMSTANCES IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW, FUNDING, OR
20 THE NEED TO MOVE FORWARD, YOU KNOW, FUTURE PLAN AMENDMENTS
21 COULD BE MADE TO HELP ADDRESS THOSE PROJECTS. JUST IN TERMS OF
22 THE BROADER POLICY AND FUNDING ENVIRONMENT ON THE STATE LEVEL
23 THERE ARE SOME DISCUSSIONS THAT ARE STARTING TO PERCOLATE
24 REGARDING SB 375 REFORM THAT COULD IMPACT THIS PLAN OR THE
25 NEXT ONE. OBVIOUSLY THE RESULTS AND THE CHANGE OF



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 ADMINISTRATION AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL, YOU KNOW, THERE COULD BE
2 ISSUES WITH FUNDING OR POLICY, AGAIN, THAT COULD IMPACT THE
3 STRATEGIES AND POLICIES INCLUDED IN THE PLAN. AND THEN, ALSO
4 WANT TO NOTE THAT, YOU KNOW, YOU KNOW, AT A STAFF LEVEL, THE
5 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD HAS BEEN APPLYING VERY
6 SIGNIFICANT SCRUTINY AND PRESSURE TO THE TECHNICAL PLANNING
7 AND FINANCIAL ASSUMPTIONS IN THE PLAN, AS WELL AS OUR
8 IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS IN TERMS OF PREVIOUS PLANS. SO, YOU
9 KNOW, ACHIEVING THAT GHG TARGET IS NOT GUARANTEED. GETTING
10 APPROVAL OF THE SCS IS NOT GUARANTEED, AND THIS PROCESS COULD
11 STRETCH, YOU KNOW, UP TO A YEAR OR LONGER, PAST THE
12 ANTICIPATED PLAN APPROVAL DATE. JUST BASED UPON PAST
13 EXPERIENCE WITH THE AIR RESOURCES BOARD. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IN
14 TERMS OF THE NEXT STEPS, YOU KNOW, WE ARE HOPING THIS MONTH TO
15 MAKE ADDITIONAL PROGRESS, FINALIZING THE PROJECT LIST, AND
16 MAKING ANY NEEDED REVISIONS TO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT, INCLUDING
17 SOME OF THOSE TECHNICAL CORRECTIONS TO THE REVENUE FORECAST,
18 WHICH I MENTIONED. IN JANUARY, THE INTENTION IS TO SEEK
19 APPROVAL FROM THE POLICY BOARDS FOR THE FINAL BLUEPRINT
20 STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES, WHICH WILL INCLUDE THE PROJECT
21 LIST AND, REALLY THAT'S JUST TO DO FURTHER STUDY AND ANALYSIS
22 OF HOW DOES THIS FINAL BLUEPRINT HELP US MEET OUR KEY REGIONAL
23 GOALS, HOW WELL DOES IT PERFORM IN SOME OF THOSE KEY OUTCOMES
24 AND METRICS AREAS. AND THEN THE IMPORTANT KEY MILESTONES WILL
25 BE ADVANCING THE FINAL BLUEPRINT ONCE WE HAVE THE RESULT OF



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THAT ANALYSIS INTO THE CEQA PHASE IN THE SPRING AND THEN
2 RELEASING A DRAFT ITERATION OF THE PLAN ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
3 REPORT AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN IN SUMMER OF 2025 FOR PUBLIC
4 FEEDBACK AND ENGAGEMENT. WITH THAT, HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
5 QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY HAVE. AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

6

7 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** GREAT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHIRAG. ARE
8 THERE ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? DARYL?

9

10 **DARYL HALLS:** THANK YOU, KATE. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO THANK
11 CHIRAG, AND ADAM FOR ALL THEIR OUTREACH. WE MET WITH ADAM
12 THREE OR FOUR TIMES AND HE WAS VERY HELPFUL. I WANT TO
13 ACKNOWLEDGE THEIR EFFORTS. WE'RE BIG FANS OF THE BASE LANES
14 SOLANO COUNTY I80, WORKING WITH MTC AND CALTRANS AND
15 PROGRAMMATIC FLEXIBILITY IS REALLY CRITICAL. THANK YOU FOR
16 INCLUDING THAT IN THIS DOCUMENT.

17

18 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MEMBER GONOT?

19

20 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** I HAD A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS ON THE
21 FUNDING. BECAUSE I HAVE A QUESTION. CAN -- WAS THE DECREASE --
22 I GUESS, IT, SORT OF, SHOWS, THE BIG DECREASE ON THE REVENUE
23 FORECAST WAS BASED ON FARES, MOSTLY? OR -- AND THEN NEW AND
24 ANTICIPATE -- I GUESS I WAS CURIOUS HOW THE FORECAST WENT
25 DOWN?



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1

2 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH, SO, WE -- AS PART OF THE LOCAL COMPONENT
3 OF THE FORECAST, WE ARE PROJECTING HOW MUCH REVENUE WE'RE
4 ANTICIPATING FROM TRANSIT FARE, YOU KNOW, TRANSIT FARES. AND
5 JUST, YOU KNOW, REBASELINING THAT TO OUR CURRENT LEVELS OF
6 RIDERSHIP THAT DID HAVE A PRETTY SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON HOW
7 MUCH FUTURE REVENUE WE WOULD ANTICIPATE FROM TRANSIT. ON THE
8 NEW AND ANTICIPATED SIDE, YOU KNOW, THE PREVIOUS PLAN INCLUDED
9 A \$0.01 REGIONAL -- \$0.01 SALES TAX FOR THE REGIONAL REVENUE
10 MEASURE. THIS PLAN IS ASSUMING A HALF CENT SALES TAX. I MEAN,
11 YOU KNOW, I WANT TO NOTE IT'S STILL ASSUMING A HALF CENT TAX
12 FOR ALL NINE COUNTIES. SO DEPENDING UPON HOW THOSE
13 CONVERSATIONS PROCEED OVER THE NEXT MONTH WE MAY NEED TO
14 REVISIT HOW WE'RE CHARACTERIZING THAT SOURCE. ALTHOUGH, I
15 THINK OUR INTENTION IS TO KEEP THE OVERALL ASSUMPTIONS
16 RELATIVELY CONSISTENT, UNLESS THERE IS, YOU KNOW, AN APPETITE
17 AT THE POLICY MAKER LEVEL TO REVISIT THOSE ASSUMPTIONS.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** AND THEN THE OTHER QUESTION I HAD --
20 AND I APPRECIATE ALL THE WORK ON THIS -- ON THAT SAME SLIDE
21 SEVEN WHERE THE TRANSIT O&M IS 50%, AND WE HAVE ALWAYS SAID
22 THAT THIS IS GOING TO BE FIX IT FIRST, SORT OF, POLICY, WHICH
23 I AGREE. I DON'T HAVE ANY -- BUT I DON'T -- I WAS CURIOUS, ARE
24 WE REALLY TRACKING TO THAT WHEN WE SPEND OUR FUNDING? AND I'M
25 CURIOUS ABOUT THAT. LIKE, WHAT ARE WE SPENDING? ARE WE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 TRACKING AT? I KNOW WE SAY 50% AND COVER OUR, ALL OF OUR
2 OPERATING AND MAINTENANCE NEEDS, BUT I DON'T THINK WE'RE
3 COVERING ALL OF OUR MAINTENANCE, OPERATING AND MAINTENANCE
4 NEEDS, NOT COUNTING THE FISCAL ISSUES WE'RE HAVING NOW. BUT IS
5 IT REALLY TRACKING THAT WAY? I WANT TO BE MORE REALISTIC ABOUT
6 WHAT WE ARE PUTTING IN THE PLAN A LITTLE BIT, IF WE'RE REALLY
7 TRACKING AT 40, 45%, AND THAT'S THE WAY IT LOOKS? IS THAT THE
8 WAY WE'RE GOING TO GO? YOU KNOW? I DON'T KNOW. I GUESS, WE
9 HAVE BEEN HAVING THIS POLICY FOR TEN YEARS NOW ARE WE TRACKING
10 TO WHAT WE SAYING WE'RE COVERING?

11

12 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERESA ROMMEL POLICY PROGRAMS AT MTC. WE DO
13 TRACK OUR STATE OF REPAIR ON ANNUAL BASIS TARGET SETTING WE
14 HAVE RTCI REGIONAL TRANSIT CAPITAL INVENTORY AND WE USE THOSE
15 TOOLS TO ESTIMATE WHAT THE COST IT WILL BE TO MAKE SURE THAT
16 WE MAINTAIN OUR TRANSIT ACCESS AND ROADWAY ASSETS AND AT A
17 CERTAIN LEVEL OF REPAIR, AND I THINK CHIRAG NOTED THAT WE ARE
18 COSTING THAT OUT TO BASICALLY BE MAINTAINING CURRENT
19 CONDITIONS OF STATE OF GOOD REPAIR THAT'S BASICALLY HOW WE
20 COME UP WITH THAT NUMBER AND WE ESSENTIAL TO TRACK THAT YEAR
21 AS WELL TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE AT LEAST MAKING THOSE.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** I APPRECIATE THAT. I WAS CURIOUS
24 MAYBE SOMETIME I COULD TAKE A LOOK AT HOW WE'RE TRACKING.
25 THANKS THINGS ON THE TRANSIT SIDE. AND APPRECIATE THE WORK



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THERE ARE A LOT OF CONSTRAINTS ON THAT ON THE EXPRESS, IF
2 THERE WAS A WAY TO MOVE MORE OF OUR EXPRESS LANES THAT ARE IN
3 PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORY LIKE FOR EXAMPLE, WE HAVE NEPA ON TWO OF
4 OUR AREAS SO WE ALREADY HAVE THEM IN THE PROGRAMMATIC BECAUSE
5 I THINK ON THAT MAYBE BECAUSE MAYBE FHWA RUNS DIFFERENTLY THAN
6 FTA AND I DON'T KNOW ABOUT THAT SO I WAS CURIOUS JUST AS WE
7 CONTINUE TO MOVE THIS FORWARD AS LONG AS WE HAVE NEPA.

8

9 **ADAM NOELTING:** ADAM NOELTING MTC PLANNING I THINK IN THE CASE
10 SIMILAR ISSUE WITH CONSTRUCTION FUNDING BECAUSE A PROJECT
11 WOULD BE WIDENING A FREEWAY EXAMPLE EXPRESS LANE WOULD REQUIRE
12 REGIONAL CONFORMITY ANALYSIS TO BE PART OF THE FISCALLY
13 CONSTRAINED PLAN IN ORDER FOR THAT PROJECT TO MOVE FORWARD.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** SO WE HAVE NEPA CURRENTLY ON 85 AND
16 101 CORRIDOR WE HAVE 85 AND 101 FULL CORRIDORS BUT WOULDN'T IT
17 BE IN THE RTP FOR CONSTRUCTION AND CURRENT PROPOSAL?

18

19 **ADAM NOELTING:** THAT'S CORRECT BECAUSE IT'S LIMITED SUBSET OF
20 OLD CORRIDORS EVEN ARE THOUGH THERE ARE SOME THAT DO HAVE AS
21 YOU POINT OUT NEPA OR CEQA APPROVAL.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** ALL RIGHT. I HAVE TO TAKE THAT
24 QUESTION OFFLINE THE OTHER QUESTION I HAVE IS ON THE
25 RESILIENCY IS PROJECT I APPRECIATE THERE'S IMPORTANT NOTICING,



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 LIKE EVERY SINGLE ONE OF OUR YARDS IS A FLOODPLAIN THERE IS A
2 LOT OF FLOODING GRANTED AND EXPECTED IN THE SOUTH BAY SO EVERY
3 SINGLE ONE OF OUR PROJECTS IS A FLOODPLAIN I MEAN OUR ASSETS
4 ARE THREE YARD ACTUALLY ALL OF OUR YARDS ARE THREE BUS YARDS
5 AND RAIL IDEA ARE ALL IN FLOODPLAINS I DIDN'T SEE THEM
6 IDENTIFIED WOULD THEY BE LISTED AS A RESILIENCY PROJECT?

7

8 **CHIRAG RABARI:** WE WOULD USE THE PURPOSE OF THE RESILIENCE
9 PROJECT LIST IS TO IDENTIFY THE ADAPTATIONS AND INVESTMENTS
10 THAT ARE GOING TO PROTECT THE BAY FROM FUTURE SEA LEVEL RISE
11 IT'S NOT NECESSARILY SPECIFYING WHAT THE ASSETS ARE THAT'S
12 GOING TO BE PROTECTED BECAUSE UNLESS THERE IS ALREADY PART OF
13 A TRANSPORTATION PLANNING PROJECT OR PROCESS WE IDENTIFIED
14 PLACEHOLDERS WHERE THESE ARE THE TYPES OF INVESTMENTS THAT
15 WOULD NEED IN ORDER TO PROTECT THIS AREA I DON'T RECALL OFF
16 THE TOP OF MY HEAD WHICH INVESTMENTS ARE PROPOSED FOR SOUTH
17 BAY BUT WE ARE PROTECTING THE ENTIRE BAY FROM ANTICIPATED SEA
18 LEVEL RISE.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** OKAY.

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** I WILL ADD THAT DRAFT RESILIENCE PROJECT LIST
23 DISTINCT FROM THE TRANSPORTATION PART OF THE PLAN DOES NOT
24 ASSUME ANYTHING ABOUT TRANSPORTATION REVENUES BEING USED I



1 MEAN WE MAY AT SOME POINT NEED A LOT OF MONEY DO THESE
2 ADAPTATIONS THE PLAN NOT ASSUME AT THIS POINT.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** DOES IT ASSUME LEVEES DOES ALONG
5 CREEKS, AND WATER DISTRICTS?

6

7 **MATT MALONEY:** THERE ARE PLACES WHERE WE WORK CLOSELY WITH BCDC
8 ON THESE ASSUMPTIONS THESE ASSUMPTIONS ARE PLACES WHERE WE
9 ASSUME HARD INFRASTRUCTURE AND LEVEES AND PLACES WHERE THERE
10 IS MORE OF A GREEN INFRASTRUCTURE TYPE OF TREATMENT IT DEPENDS
11 ON THE AREA.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** IT'S A BIG COUNTY AND VERY LITTLE FOR
14 SANTA CLARA AND I ASSUMED IT WAS JUST IN THE SALT PONDS BUT WE
15 HAVE HAD FLOODING IN OUR AREAS THEY HAVE INCREASED LEVEES WITH
16 THE WATER DISTRICT JUST CURIOUS ABOUT THOSE TYPES OF THINGS.

17

18 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS? MEMBER CHANG?

19

20 **TILLY CHANG:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION AND WORK. I HAD A
21 QUESTION ABOUT THE EXPAND FREEWAYS AND MITIGATION IMPACTS ON
22 PAGE 8 OF 21 IN THE PACKET THERE'S A COUPLE OF REGIONAL
23 PROGRAMS THAT ARE GENERICALLY TALKING ABOUT EXPRESS LANE
24 NETWORK PROJECT DEVELOPMENT AND VMT MITIGATION, I'M WONDERING
25 ABOUT THE EXPANSION RELATED PROJECTS WONDERING ABOUT



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY RELATED POLICY, SORT OF, FEATURES OF
2 THE EXPANSION EXPRESS LANE PROGRAM WHETHER THOSE WOULD BE
3 ELIGIBLE FOR DEVELOPMENT IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS MOSTLY
4 SPEAKING TO PROJECT DEVELOPMENT AROUND EXPANSION ASPECT OF THE
5 MITIGATION OF THE EXPANSION.

6

7 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THE IDEA BEHIND THOSE PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
8 CATEGORY. -- THE CATEGORY AS WELL AS THE VMT MITIGATION IS
9 SPECIFIC TO THE EXPRESS LANES THAT COULD -- THAT COULD MOVE
10 FORWARD. THE PROJECT DEVELOPMENT CATEGORY COULD, YOU KNOW,
11 ESSENTIALLY BE A HOLDING AREA FOR THOSE PROJECTS THAT ARE NOT
12 NAMED PROJECTS ON THE LIST TO CONTINUE MOVING FORWARD WITH
13 THEIR PLANNING PROCESSES. THE VMT MITIGATION, AGAIN, WOULD BE
14 FOCUSED ON MITIGATING IMPACTS AND -- OF THE VMT INCREASES, AND
15 THAT COULD POTENTIALLY BE A PART OF A FUTURE SCOPE FOR ONE OF
16 THE NAMED PROJECTS OR A FUTURE NAMED PROJECTS. BUT WE HAVE
17 REALLY TRIED TO KEEP THE FOCUS, YOU KNOW, WITHIN THAT CATEGORY
18 ON THE IMPACTS OF EXPRESS LANES, WITH RESPECT TO VMT. I THINK
19 IN TERMS OF AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY, THE PLAN INCLUDES QUITE
20 A ROBUST SUITE OF INVESTMENT SUPERVISOR POLICIES ACROSS
21 NUMEROUS DIFFERENT STRATEGIES THAT HELP US MEET SOME OF THOSE
22 IMPORTANT GOALS.

23

24 **TILLY CHANG:** I THINK THEY'RE BOTH REALLY IMPORTANT EMERGING
25 ISSUES AND I APPRECIATE THAT YOU HAVE HAD ONGOING



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 CONVERSATIONS WITH MANY OF US AROUND THE TABLE AND OTHER
2 STAKEHOLDERS. JUST WANT YOU TO MAKE A PLUG FOR ADDRESSING THE
3 EQUITY AND AFFORDABILITY LONG SIDE THE EXPANSION AND
4 MITIGATION PIECE PLEASE.

5

6 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MEMBER EL-TAWANSY?

7

8 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I ALSO WANT
9 TO SAY THANK YOU FOR CARRYING ON THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY
10 STRATEGY, AS A NUMBER OF STRATEGIES RATHER THAN FOCUSING ON
11 ONE. I THINK IT'S THE PROPER THING TO DO AT THIS TIME. DO I
12 HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT WHAT IT MEANS TO HAVE JUST THE OLD
13 FREEWAY LANE TOLLING AS A PLACEHOLDER IN TERMS OF THE FUTURE,
14 WHAT TO EXPECT, THAT'S ONE QUESTION. ALSO, THE PLAN, AT ALL
15 MAKE REFERENCE TO THE INCREMENTAL APPROACH TO GETTING THERE,
16 PERHAPS CONVERSIONS, WHEN FEASIBLE AND NECESSARY. AND THEN I
17 ALSO HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT THE RESILIENCY LIST, HAS THERE BEEN
18 A LOT OF COORDINATION WITH THE BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATIVE
19 RAT ON THAT, AND ON THAT INTERSECTION AND ARE WE PLANNING TO
20 CAST A WIDE NET IN TERMS OF NEEDS AROUND THE REGION TO KIND OF
21 HAVE MORE COMPREHENSIVE ARE UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT THE NEEDS
22 ARE?

23

24 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YES WITH RESPECT TO THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY
25 STUDY, I THINK THE WAY WE'RE TRYING TO CHARACTERIZE IT AT THIS



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 POINT IN TIME, THE ALL LANE TOLL SUGGEST A PLACEHOLDER
2 STRATEGY SO WE'RE SAYING, YOU KNOW, IMPLEMENT THIS OR AN
3 EQUIVALENT STRATEGY TO HELP US MOVE FORWARD. AS YOU WOULD BE
4 FAMILIAR WITH, WHEN WE GO TO THE AIR RESOURCES BOARD, WE DO
5 NEED TO PROVIDE SOME CLARITY IN TERMS OF THE TECHNICAL
6 MODELING DETAILS ABOUT WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE, AND HOW IT COULD BE
7 IMPLEMENTED. BUT, AGAIN, WE WANT TO SAY, OR AN EQUIVALENT
8 STRATEGY. AND I THINK AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH THE
9 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WHERE WE TRY TO IDENTIFY SOME OF THE
10 SPECIFIC ACTIONS THAT CAN HELP MOVE THE STRATEGY FORWARD, I
11 THINK THAT WILL -- THAT COULD INCLUDE, SOME LANGUAGE TO THE
12 EFFECT OF WHAT ARE THE ACTUAL NEXT STEPS IN TERMS OF MOVING
13 THIS FORWARD. AND I KNOW THAT THE NEXGEN TEAM IS ALSO GOING TO
14 BE PRODUCING A FINAL REPORT WHERE THEY WILL INCLUDE SOME
15 RECOMMENDATIONS ABOUT NEXT STEPS. AND, YOU KNOW, THAT COULD
16 INCLUDE SOME ADDITIONAL LANGUAGE ABOUT POTENTIAL INCREMENTAL
17 APPROACHES. YOU KNOW, WITH RESPECT TO THE RESILIENCE PROJECT
18 LIST, YEAH, I BELIEVE THAT BARC HAS BEEN A -- YOU KNOW, A
19 CLOSE PARTNER IN THAT EFFORT. AND YOU KNOW, IN TERMS OF
20 CASTING A WIDER NET, YOU KNOW, THIS WAS OUR FIRST ATTEMPT, AND
21 WE DID HAVE MULTIPLE ROUNDS OF OUTREACH TO JURISDICTIONS AND
22 PARTNERS ACROSS THE ENTIRE REGION IN TERMS OF HELPING TO
23 DEVELOP THIS INITIAL DRAFT LIST. BUT AS WE MOVE FORWARD INTO
24 FUTURE PLANNING CYCLES, I THINK WE'LL CONTINUE TO REFINE AND



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 EXPAND THAT APPROACH TO MAKE SURE WE'RE HEARING FROM MANY
2 DIFFERENT PARTNERS.

3

4 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS? ANY MEMBERS OF THE
5 PUBLIC WISHING TO COMMENT?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** SORRY LAST -- LATE HERE.

8

9 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU TALK ABOUT HOW THE DECLINE IN GAS TAX BEING
12 INCORPORATED INTO THOUGHT HERE BECAUSE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
13 HIGHWAY THAT SEEMS TO BE ONE OF OUR VMTS HOLDING THAT SEEMS TO
14 BE THE OPEN TOPIC AS HOW WE'RE GOING TO DO THAT AND HOW THAT'S
15 BEING PLAYED OUT IN THIS?

16

17 **CHIRAG RABARI:** OUR ASSUMPTION IN THE PLAN CONTEXT IS THAT THE
18 STATE IS GOING TO MOVE TO A REVENUE NEUTRAL TYPE OF REVENUE
19 NEUTRAL MILEAGE BASED FEE TO REPLACE THE LOST PURCHASING POWER
20 OF THE GAS TAX. AND I THINK WE'RE ASSUMING THAT COULD BE IN
21 PLACE BY 2030? YEAH.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** AND THAT DOESN'T CHALLENGE THE TOLLING OF HIGHWAYS
24 THAT WOULD SEEM TO BE CONSIDERED BY MANY, A, KIND OF, DOUBLE-
25 DIPPING THERE?



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1

2 **CHIRAG RABARI:** NO. I MEAN, THEY ARE DISTINCT STRATEGIES. SO,
3 THE TOLLING OF THE HIGHWAYS WOULD BE APPLIED TO SPECIFIC
4 CORRIDORS AT SPECIFIC TIMES OF DAY. YOU KNOW, SPECIFIC VEHICLE
5 CLASSIFICATIONS. WHEREAS THE GAS TAX REPLACEMENT WOULD BE
6 OBVIOUSLY JUST FOR ALL MILES TRAVELED.

7

8 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MEMBER CAMERON?

9

10 **JAMES CAMERON:** I'M HAVING A LITTLE BIT OF TROUBLE ASSESSING
11 THE PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES VERSUS THE NAMED PROJECTS. AND I
12 DON'T THINK IT'S WORTHWHILE, LIKE, TALKING IN DETAIL OF SONOMA
13 BUT WE'LL JUST FOLLOW UP WITH YOU DIRECT PRIOR TO THE 16th
14 DEADLINE FOR COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? GREAT. ANY OTHER
17 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO COMMENT?

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE HAND RAISED ONLINE. WOULD
20 YOU LIKE TO GIVE TWO MINUTES?

21

22 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** YES.

23



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** OKAY. PAT PIRAS. YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF
2 TO SPEAK. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK AND I WILL PUT ON THE
3 TIMER.

4

5 **PAT PIRAS:** OKAY. THIS WON'T TAKE THAT LONG AND THIS IS
6 ACTUALLY A QUESTION. THE O&M DATA THAT STAFF PERSON ROMMELL
7 REFERENCED, HOW CAN MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC OBTAIN THOSE REPORTS
8 AND/OR DATA? THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** THERESA?

11

12 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WE DO TAKE AN ITEM TO OUR COMMITTEE MEETINGS
13 AND OUR COMMISSION. I'LL HAVE TO CHECK ON THE ACTUAL TIME
14 FRAMES FOR THAT. BUT WE DO HAVE TARGET SETTING AND PERFORMANCE
15 -- PERFORMANCE AGAINST THOSE TARGETS ON A REGULAR CADENCE AT
16 OUR COMMITTEE AND COMMISSION MEETINGS.

17

18 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NO OTHER
19 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK? GREAT. SO, WE'LL MOVE
20 ON NOW TO ITEM 4C. THAT WAS AN INFORMATION ITEM ONLY. AND THIS
21 WILL BE PRESENTED BY THOMAS ARNDT. DID I GET THAT RIGHT?

22

23 **THOMAS ARNDT:** YOU DID GET THAT RIGHT.

24

25 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** GREAT. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1

2 **THOMAS ARNDT:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M THOMAS ARNDT WITH
3 FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM STAFF HERE AT MTC. I MANAGE OUR ONE BAY
4 AREA GRANT PROGRAM HERE TO TALK ABOUT THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE
5 NEXT CYCLE OBAG 4. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. SO, WE'RE KICKING
6 OFF DEVELOPMENT OF THE OBAG FOUR PROGRAM AND I'LL BE SHARING
7 INITIAL CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE HAVE BEEN THINKING ABOUT AND
8 I'LL BE FOCUSING ON IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TRANSIT ORIENTED
9 COMMUNITIES POLICY, OR TOC POLICY. AND I'LL ALSO BE SHARING A
10 HIGH-LEVEL TIMELINE OF OBAG FOUR DEVELOPMENT AND THIS WILL BE
11 THE FIRST OF MANY OPPORTUNITIES TO PROVIDE INPUT ON THE OBAG
12 FOUR PROGRAM OVER THE COMING YEAR. SO NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. JUST
13 AS A REMINDER ON THE OBAG PROGRAM, IT'S OUR FRAMEWORK FOR
14 PROGRAMMING FEDERAL HIGHWAY FORMULA FUNDS THESE INCLUDE
15 SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM AND THE CONGESTION
16 MITIGATION AND AIR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM. THE MAIN
17 PURPOSE OF THE OBAG FOUR FRAMEWORK IS TO IMPLEMENT OUR PLAN
18 AND WE DO THIS THROUGH INVESTMENTS AND INCENTIVES THAT SUPPORT
19 REGIONAL PRIORITIES AND LOCAL NEEDS. WE'RE CURRENTLY IN THE
20 MIDDLE OF THE THIRD CYCLE OF THE OBAG PROGRAM, OR OBAG THREE
21 WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO THE NEXT CYCLE AND HAVE IDENTIFIED
22 KEY CONSIDERATIONS WHICH ARE LISTED ON THE SLIDE. SOME RELATE
23 TO NEW POLICIES OR CONSTRAINTS THAT WE'RE ANTICIPATING. THESE
24 INCLUDE THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY WHICH I'LL BE
25 DISCUSSING A LOT MORE IN A MOMENT. BUT, ALSO, THE TRANSIT



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 FISCAL CLIFF, AND THE CONTRIBUTION OF FEDERAL HOW MANY FORMULA
2 FUNDS FOR TRANSIT OPERATIONS. AND THIS IS PART OF A REGIONAL
3 FUNDING FRAMEWORK TO ADDRESS THAT NEAR-TERM FISCAL CLIFF. THIS
4 WILL REDUCE THE CAPACITY AVAILABLE FOR THE OBAG PROGRAM BY
5 APPROXIMATELY \$100 MILLION. AND WE HAVE AN ITEM IN DECEMBER
6 GOING TO OUR COMMISSION ON THAT. IN ADDITION, WE WILL -- THE
7 OBAG PROGRAM WILL REFLECT ON THE ONGOING PLAN UPDATE WHICH WE
8 HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT A LOT. IN ADDITION TO ADOPTING
9 ADAPTING NEW POLICIES WE'LL BE LOOKING TO EXISTING AREAS FOR
10 POTENTIAL IMPROVEMENTS THESE INCLUDE OUR SPONSOR AND PROJECT
11 REQUIREMENTS SO WE'RE PLANNING TO TAKE A CLOSE LOOK AT WHAT
12 WE'RE REQUIRING OUR PROJECT DELIVERY PARTNERS TO ACCESS THESE
13 EXISTING ON, BAG REQUIREMENTS AND BETTER UNDERSTAND THIS
14 OVERALL EFFECTIVENESS AND POTENTIALLY DEVELOP RECOMMENDATIONS
15 FOR IMPROVEMENTS. WE'LL ALSO BE LOOKING AT PROJECT SELECTION
16 CRITERIA AND PROCESSES WITH OUR PARTNERS WITH FOCUS ON MAKING
17 DATA-DRIVEN DECISIONS AND FINALLY WE'LL BE USING THE MTC
18 EQUITY PLATFORM TO GUIDE DEVELOPMENT OF THE OBAG PROGRAM AND
19 IDENTIFY EFFECTIVE STRATEGIES TO MEET THE NEEDS OF
20 HISTORICALLY UNDERSERVED GROUPS. AGAIN THIS ITEM IS FOCUSING
21 ON THE TOC POLICY BUT THESE ARE ALL CONSIDERATIONS THAT WE'RE
22 KEEPING IN MIND MOVING FORWARD WITH OBAG FOUR. AS A REMINDER,
23 THE TOC POLICY REQUIRES THAT JURISDICTIONS WITH CERTAIN FIXED
24 ROUTE TRANSIT STOPS TAKE SPECIFIED STEPS TOWARDS PROMOTING
25 INCLUSIVE ACCESSIBLE MIXED USE NEIGHBORHOODS AROUND THOSE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 TRANSIT STATIONS. AND THE POLICY COMMITTED TO APPLYING TOC
2 COMPLIANCE IN THE OBAG FOUR CYCLE SO THAT'S WHAT WE'RE GOING
3 TO BE TALKING ABOUT NOW. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE IS
4 TRYING ON ILLUSTRATE SOME INITIAL CONSIDERATIONS FOR TOC
5 POLICY IMPLEMENTATION IN OBAG FOUR. BASED ON INITIAL OUTREACH
6 TO JURISDICTIONS ABOUT TOC POLICY REQUIREMENTS, WE EXPECT A
7 WIDE RANGE OF COMPLIANCE ACROSS JURISDICTIONS, WITH TOC
8 STATION AREAS. THE BELL CURVE ON THE SLIDE IS ATTEMPTING TO
9 VERY ROUGHLY ILLUSTRATE A SIMPLIFIED VIEW OF ANTICIPATED
10 COMPLIANCE IN THE OBAG FOUR PERIOD. MOST JURISDICTIONS ARE
11 EXPECTING TO MAKE SUBSTANTIAL PROGRESS ON THE TOC COMPLIANCE
12 BY 2026 REPRESENTED BY THE LARGE YELLOW SECTION IN THE MIDDLE
13 OF THE BELL CURVE. A FEW JURISDICTIONS MAY BE FULLY OR NEARLY
14 COMPLIANT REPRESENTED BY THE SMALL GREEN SECTION ON THE RIGHT
15 AND THEN BY CONTRAST FEW JURISDICTIONS HAVE MADE LITTLE OR NO
16 PROGRESS ON THE TOC POLICY COMPLIANCE AS REPRESENTED BY THE
17 RED SECTION TO THE LEFT. OUR CURRENT PLAN IS TO CATEGORIZE
18 JURISDICTIONS FOR THE PURPOSE OF OBAG FOUR INTO THREE
19 COMPLIANCE TIERS PRIOR AND HIGHER TIER JURISDICTIONS ARE WOULD
20 HAVE ACCESS TO MORE FUNDING SPECIFICALLY NON-COMPLIANT
21 JURISDICTIONS ARE WOULD HAVE ACCESS ONLY FOR PLANNING FUNDS TO
22 WORK TOWARDS TOC COMPLIANCE. JURISDICTIONS IN THE MIDDLE TIER
23 WOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR MOST 0 BAG FUNDS AND JURISDICTIONS IN
24 THE TOP TIER WOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR ALL FUNDING INCLUDING SET
25 ASIDE THAT'S TYPICALLY FOR JURISDICTIONS IN THAT TIER. AND



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THEN FINALLY JURISDICTIONS WITHOUT TOCS WOULD ALSO BE ELIGIBLE
2 FOR MOST OBAG FUNDS. THERE ARE STILL A LOT OF DETAILS TO BE
3 DECIDED AND THIS IS HIGH-LEVEL CONCEPTUAL, FOR EXAMPLE,
4 CRITERIA AND REQUIREMENTS FOR EACH TIER ARE STILL BEING
5 DETERMINED. BUT AT THIS POINT OUR GOAL IS TO INTRODUCE THE
6 FRAMEWORK AND START CONVERSATIONS AROUND FURTHER DEFINING AND
7 WORKING TOWARDS COMPLIANCE IN OBAG FOUR AND REALLY GIVE
8 JURISDICTIONS ENOUGH TIME TO PREPARE AND TAKE THOSE STEPS TO
9 COMPLY AND FOR US TO WORK WITH THEM AND GET THIS INPUT. SO,
10 NEXT SLIDE. VERY HIGH-LEVEL TIMELINE, WE'LL CONTINUE TO
11 COORDINATE WITH PARTNER AGENCIES ON OBAG FOUR DEVELOPMENT OVER
12 THE NEXT YEAR. WE EXPECT TO BRING A FINAL OBAG FOUR POLICY TO
13 OUR COMMISSION FOR ADOPTION IN EARLY 2026. THE FINAL
14 SUBMISSION DEADLINE FOR TOC COMPLIANCE DOCUMENTATION WOULD
15 LIKELY BE SHORTLY THEREAFTER. WE EXPECT THE COUNTY CALL FOR
16 PROJECTS IN 2026, WITH PROJECT SELECTION IN EARLY 2027. SO,
17 AGAIN, THIS MEETING KICKS OFF, SORT OF, OUR INITIAL ROUND OF
18 OUTREACH ON OBAG FOUR WE'LL BE BRINGING THE SAME INFORMATION
19 TO SOME OF OUR WORKING GROUPS AND CTAS IN THE COMING WEEKS AND
20 WILL BE DOING OUTREACH THROUGH THE 2025. WITH THAT I'M
21 AVAILABLE FOR ANY QUESTIONS.

22

23 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY QUESTIONS? ANY COMMENTS? MEMBER GONOT?

24



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** I KNOW. SORRY. THE 100 MILLION, IT
2 SAID THAT THERE WAS 100 MILLION TO COVER ON THE TRANSIT --
3 WHERE IS THAT IN THE RESOLUTION 4619?

4

5 **THOMAS ARNDT:** I BELIEVE THERE IS 93 MILLION IN THE RESOLUTION
6 AND YOU'RE LOOKING AT THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN 93 AND 100
7 THERE'S 7 MILLION THAT WE ARE CURRENTLY PROGRAMMED INTO FTA
8 FUNDS FOR VANPOOL AND WE'LL BE SWAPPING THAT WITH STPC TOTAL
9 FUTURE CAPACITY OF STP CMAQ THAT WE'RE COMMITTING TO CLOSER TO
10 100 MILLION RATHER THAN 93 THAT YOU SHOULD SEE I BELIEVE
11 ATTACHMENT D TO THE RESOLUTION YOU'RE LOOKING AT 4619 THE
12 SB125 FUNDING FRAMEWORK.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** WELL IS NO ATTACHMENT D.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** IF YOU GOOGLE IT RESOLUTION WAS REVISED IN NOVEMBER
17 IF YOU LOOK AT THE MATERIALS ASSOCIATED WITH THE NOVEMBER PAC
18 MATERIALS YOU SEE ALL THE NEW ATTACHMENT TO THAT NOVEMBER
19 2024.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** YES 2023 THE NUMBER THEY ALREADY TOOK
22 ACTION TO PUT 100 MILLION OF OBAG MONEYS IN.

23

24 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YES 93 SPECIFICALLY FROM OBAG THEN THERE WAS
25 ADDITIONAL SWAP THAT WAS MADE.



1

2 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY OTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** OF CITY OF SAN JOSE THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR WORKING
5 TO FIND THE BETTER SOLUTION THAN THE ORIGINAL COMPLIANCE OR
6 NOT WE REALLY LIKE THE THREE TIERS AND WORKING WITH US TO KIND
7 OF FIGURE OUT HOW IT'S GOING TO WORK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT.
8 COUPLE OF QUESTIONS, IT'S AN IMMENSE AMOUNT OF GRAY AREA INTO
9 WHAT COMPLIANCE LOOKS LIKE, AND FRAMEWORK TRYING TO KIND OF
10 MITIGATE THAT AND SAN JOSE IS WORKING REALLY HARD TO TRY TO
11 FIND COMPLIANCE BUT WE STILL HAVE A LOT OF TREPIDATION
12 INTERNALLY WHAT IT REALLY MEANS AND WE'RE WONDERING IF THERE
13 IS GOING TO BE SOMETIME BETWEEN NOW AND 2026 WHEN THE BOARD IS
14 GOING TO GIVE US MORE CLEAR DIRECTION AS TO WHAT THEY THINK
15 COMPLIANCE IS BECAUSE I THINK WE'RE ALL KIND OF MULLING AND WE
16 JUST APPLIED FOR THREE OF THE DIFFERENT GRANT OPPORTUNITIES
17 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT, AND TO CERTAIN ELEMENTS IN THE
18 TOC POLICY, SCHOOLS ARE FRANKLY IMPOSSIBLE FOR GENERAL
19 JURISDICTIONS TO DO AND WE WANT TO GET A SENSE OF WHAT KIND OF
20 HARD LIMITS ARE AND THE BOARD IS GOING TO GIVE US AT THE END
21 OF THE DAY. LOOKING FOR CLEAR SENSE OF WHAT WE'RE WORKING FOR.

22

23 **MATT MALONEY:** MATT MALONEY DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF METRO
24 PLANNING AND POLICY. YOU KNOW YOU'RE CORRECT THE COMMISSION
25 HAS NOT YET ACTS WITH IRON CLAD DEFINITION OF WHAT COMPLIANCE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 IS. WE WENT TO THEM A WHILE BACK TO HAVE DISCUSSION WITH THEM
2 ABOUT WHAT THIS MIGHT LOOK LIKE. OUT OF THAT CONVERSATION WE
3 DID HEAR FROM THEM THAT IT WAS IMPORTANT FOR US TO RETAIN SOME
4 DEGREE OF FLEXIBILITY. WE HAVE NOT QUANTIFIED WITH THEM
5 EXACTLY WHAT THAT MEANS. WE WILL RETURN TO THEM IN 2025
6 CERTAINLY AS PART OF THIS CONVERSATION WITH OBAG BUT PERHAPS
7 SEPARATELY TO HAVE THAT CONVERSATION ABOUT COMPLIANCE I THINK
8 IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT WE HAVE ENGAGED BROADLY AND DEEPLY
9 WITH ALL LOCAL JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE AFFECTED BY THIS POLICY
10 IN MANY CASES MULTIPLE TIMES AND YOU KNOW IT'S IMPORTANT FOR
11 US AS STAFF TO HAVE A GOOD UNDERSTANDING OF WHERE
12 JURISDICTIONS ACTUALLY ARE AND WHAT'S ACHIEVABLE WE ADOPT THE
13 POLICY TO BE ACHIEVABLE IF POSSIBLE WE KNOW BUT IT ALSO IS AN
14 AGGRESSIVE POLICY AND IT WOULD AFFECT SOME CHANGE IN THE
15 REGION BUT AT THE SAME TIME WE DON'T WANT NUMEROUS
16 JURISDICTIONS TO FAIL AT IT AND I THINK WHAT WE'RE SORTING OUT
17 ON THE STAFF SIDE IS GETTING MORE DATA AND INFORMATION FROM
18 THE JURISDICTIONS REALLY HOW THEY'RE DOING SO I THINK WE'LL
19 RETURN TO THE COMMITTEES IN 2025 TO THIS OUT.

20

21 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM?
22 MEMBER RICHMAN.

23

24 **ANNE RICHMAN:** THANK YOU. I HAD THE SAME KIND OF QUESTIONS
25 ABOUT COMPLIANCE AND ALSO KIND OF WHEN THAT INFORMATION WILL



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 BE AVAILABLE RELATIVE TO WHEN THESE REQUIREMENTS WILL BE
2 DETERMINED OR PUT IN PLACE. AND ADDITIONALLY THE SET ASIDE
3 INCENTIVE IS A NEW CONCEPT. CAN YOU TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT
4 WHERE THAT WOULD COME FROM AND HOW THAT COULD WORK IF YOU KNOW
5 YET?

6

7 **THOMAS ARNDT:** WE DON'T KNOW YET AND I THINK ALL OPTIONS WILL
8 BE ON THE TABLE FOR WHERE THIS SET ASIDE MIGHT COME FROM SO
9 THAT'S NOT DECIDED AS PART OF THIS AND HOPE WILL BE INFORMED
10 BY OUR OUTREACH IN THE NEXT YEAR.

11

12 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MEMBER CAROLYN?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO EXPRESS APPRECIATION MTC AND STAFF WE HAVE
15 WITH JURISDICTIONS AS WELL PLANNING MULTIPLE MEETINGS WITH
16 PLANNING DIRECTORS AND PUBLIC WORKS TRANSPORTATION STAFF I
17 THINK IT'S HELPFUL JUST AS JURISDICTIONS ARE STILL TRYING TO
18 WRAP THEIR ARMS AROUND WHAT THIS MEANS DEFINITELY APPRECIATE
19 THAT AND I THINK AS MUCH AS YOU CAN KEEP CTA'S ENGAGED ON WHAT
20 YOU HEAR BACK FROM THE JURISDICTIONS WILL BE HELPFUL BECAUSE I
21 THINK THERE IS STILL GOING TO BE CONFUSION AT THE LOCAL
22 JURISDICTION LEVEL AND WHEN THEY START TO DIG INTO TOC AND SEE
23 IF THEY'RE ELIGIBLE OR NOT I THINK PEOPLE HAVEN'T CONNECTED
24 THE DOTS AND THAT'S GOING TO IMPACT FUNDING IN THE FUTURE.



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 IT'S STILL NOT A CONCEPT THAT'S FULLY RESONATED AT THE LOCAL
2 JURISDICTION LEVEL.

3

4 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ALL RIGHT. ARE THERE PUBLIC COMMENTS?

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING
7 THERE ARE NO HANDS RAISED COMMENT AND THERE ARE NO SPEAKER
8 CARDS IN THE ROOM.

9

10 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY. IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE DOWN TO 4D.
11 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. AND I THINK REBECCA LONG IS
12 GOING TO BE PRESENTING ON THIS ITEM.

13

14 **REBECCA LONG:** YES. IT LOOKS LIKE IT. GOOD MORNING. ALMOST
15 AFTERNOON, EVERYBODY. GOOD TO SEE YOU. IF WE COULD PULL UP THE
16 SLIDE? GREAT. SO, THIS PRESENTATION PROVIDES AN UPDATE ON THE
17 WORK OF THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE.
18 AND WE'RE INTERESTED IN ANY FEEDBACK AND QUESTIONS TODAY. AND
19 WE WILL COVER NEXT STEPS AT THE END OF THE PRESENTATION. JUST
20 TO LET FOLKS KNOW, WE'RE GOING TO BE INCLUDING FORMAL FEEDBACK
21 THAT WAS SENT TO THE SELECT COMMITTEE IN A REPORT THAT WE'RE
22 FINALIZING THAT WILL BE AVAILABLE TO THE LEGISLATURE. WE'RE
23 HOPING TO PRESENT A DRAFT OF THAT REPORT AT THE SPECIAL
24 COMMISSION MEETING ON THE REVENUE MEASURE NEXT MONDAY, A WEEK
25 FROM TODAY. AND IT'S MONDAY AFTERNOON, BY THE WAY, UNUSUAL,



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 2:00 P.M. MEETING. GIVEN THAT MANY OF YOU HAVE BEEN VERY
2 INVOLVED IN TRACKING THIS OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS, I'M GOING
3 TO JUMP RIGHT INTO THE MAIN POINTS. NEXT SLIDE. SO, LET'S
4 START WITH FEEDBACK THAT WAS PROVIDED BY THE SELECT COMMITTEE.
5 IN OUR FINAL MEETING WE ASKED THE COMMITTEE TO SCORE KEY
6 COMPONENTS OF A POTENTIAL MEASURE ON A 1 TO 5 SCALE OF
7 GRADIENTS OF AGREEMENT. AND THERE ARE LOTS OF, YOU KNOW, VERY
8 DIFFERENT OPINIONS, BUT ON BALANCE WE WERE ABLE TO KIND OF
9 SUMMARIZE THEM AS FOLLOWS. ON GEOGRAPHY, THERE WAS A STRONG
10 PREFERENCE FOR THE MEASURE TO BE PLACED ON THE BALLOT IN AT
11 LEAST FOUR COUNTIES, ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, AND
12 SAN MATEO. SO LETTING THE OTHER FIVE COUNTIES OPT IN. AND I'LL
13 NOTE IN TERMS OF OPT IN, YOU KNOW, THAT IS SOMETHING THAT WE
14 ENVISION WOULD HAPPEN AS PART OF THE LEGISLATION, SO THERE
15 WOULD BE CERTAINTY ABOUT WHERE THE MEASURE WOULD BE ON THE
16 BALLOT BUT THE IDEA IS THAT OPT IN CONVERSATION WOULD PROCEED
17 OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL MONTHS, VERSUS REQUIRING THE MEASURE TO
18 INCLUDE ALL NINE COUNTIES, WHICH IS THE APPROACH IN 1031. ON
19 DURATION, THE SELECT COMMITTEE SLIGHTLY PREFERRED TEN YEARS,
20 BUT THERE WAS A STRONG OVER 30 YEARS. BUT THERE WAS A STRONG
21 PREFERENCE FOR TEN YEAR MEASURE AMONG COMMISSIONERS
22 REPRESENTING THE FOUR CORE COUNTIES. YOU KNOW, NATURALLY, WE
23 MTC STAFF IS CONSIDERING SPONSORING THE LEGISLATION IT'S
24 IMPORTANT TO BE LOOKING AT WHERE COMMISSIONERS ARE ON THESE
25 TOPICS SANTA CLARA COMMISSIONERS ON THE OTHER HAND PREFERRED A



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 30 YEAR MEASURE. COMMITTEE MEMBERS OVERALL HAD A SLIGHT
2 PREFERENCE FOR TARGETING ADJUSTED FARES OVER OPERATOR REPORTED
3 SHORTFALLS. I'LL TAKE A MINUTE TO EXPLAIN WHAT THAT MEANS.
4 EVERYBODY KNOWS THAT THE BIG PURPOSE OF THE MEASURE IS TO
5 ADDRESS TRANSIT AGENCY OPERATING DEFICITS THEN THE QUESTION IS
6 WHAT IS THE AMOUNT AND WE SPENT A LOT OF TIME AT THE SELECT
7 COMMITTEE THE PROBLEM REALLY CAME UP WITH ONE WAY WHICH IS A
8 LESSER AMOUNT WHICH REALLY LOOKING AT WHAT IS THE DIFFERENCE
9 IN FARE REVENUE, IN THE BAY AREA IT'S GONE DOWN SUBSTANTIALLY
10 HOW HAS IT CHANGED FROM 2019 TO 2024 THAT ADDING ADJUSTMENT
11 FOR INFLATION OF 2% ADJUSTED FARES, AND OPERATOR, REPORTED
12 FAIRLY SELF-EXPLANATORY WHAT DO THE OPERATORS ESTIMATE TO BE
13 THEIR TOTAL DEFICITS WHICH INCORPORATES ALL MANY OF REVENUE
14 CHANGES SINCE THE PANDEMIC AS WELL AS INCREASE IN COST AND
15 WHAT WE SAW THERE WAS OVERALL COMMISSIONERS AND BUSINESS
16 COMMUNITY CONSTRUCTION LABOR STRONGLY PREFERRED USING ADJUSTED
17 FARES WHEREAS TRANSIT ADVOCATES AND TRANSIT LABOR
18 REPRESENTATIVES FAVORED OPERATOR REPORTED SHORTFALLS. WITH
19 RESPECT TO FUNDING SOURCE THERE WAS A SLIGHT PREFERENCE
20 OVERALL AMONG THE COMMITTEE FOR SALES TAX OVER PARCEL TAX AND
21 PAYROLL TAX WE DID LOOK AT OTHER OPTIONS BUT THOSE WERE THE
22 THREE THAT WERE CONTINUED TO BE EXAMINED OVER THE COURSE OF
23 THE SELECT COMMITTEE BUT THERE WAS INTEREST IN MULTIPLE
24 SOURCES BEING LOOKED IT'S PART OF THE SINGLE MEASURE AS WELL
25 AS POTENTIALLY A VARIABLE RATE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AT THE FINAL



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 MEETING, THE COMMITTEE RECEIVED A PRESENTATION THAT SUMMARIZED
2 THE FACT THAT THERE HAD BEEN FOUR OPTIONS CONSIDERED. THOSE
3 FOUR OPTIONS WERE TWO VARIANTS ON A SALES TAX, ONE OF A
4 CONTINUE YEAR, WHICH YOU'RE SEEING HERE IS 1A, ALONG WITH A 30
5 YEAR AND THEN TWO VERSIONS OF A HYBRID WHICH WOULD BE HALF
6 CENT SALES TAX ALONG WITH EITHER A PAYROLL TAX ON BUSINESSES
7 OR A PARCEL TAX. GIVEN TIMING AND THE NEED TO PREPARE FOR THE
8 LEGISLATIVE SESSION, EVEN THOUGH THE SELECT COMMITTEE SAID ALL
9 FOUR OF THESE OPTIONS SHOULD BE ADVANCED TO THE COMMISSION FOR
10 FURTHER CONSIDERATION, CHAIR SPERING, COMMISSIONER SPERING,
11 WHO CHAIRED THE SELECT COMMITTEE DIRECTED STAFF TO NARROW IT
12 DOWN FURTHER. SO WHAT WE BROUGHT BACK FOR INFORMATION TO OUR
13 JOINT LEGISLATION COMMITTEE, TWO OPTIONS WHICH YOU SEE HERE,
14 SCENARIO 1A, AND HYBRID. BEFORE I EXPLAIN EACH OPTION, I DO
15 WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT THESE PROPOSALS DO NOT YET RESOLVE KEY
16 CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED BY SEVERAL SAN MATEO COUNTY
17 ELECTED OFFICIALS, AND WE TAKE THESE CONCERNS VERY SERIOUSLY
18 AND DO WANT TO CONSIDER -- EXCUSE ME -- CONTINUE THOSE
19 PRODUCTIVE CONVERSATION SUPERVISOR NEGOTIATIONS THAT ARE
20 NEEDED TO REACH AGREEMENT AMONG ALL FOUR PARTICIPATING
21 COUNTIES WHO WOULD BE PART OF SCENARIO 1A. NEXT SLIDE. SO, AS
22 SHOWN ON THE MAP, SCENARIO 1A IS PROPOSED ONLY FOR THE
23 COUNTIES OF ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN MATEO, AND SAN
24 FRANCISCO, AS FAR AS, YOU KNOW, DEFINITELY BEING INCLUDED,
25 WITH AN OPT IN FOR SANTA CLARA SHOWN HERE IN GREEN. SCENARIO



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 1A REALLY FOCUSES ON TRANSIT. IT'S A TRANSIT ONLY MEASURE, AND
2 THE FOCUS IS TO AVERT MAJOR CUTS AND INVEST IN TRANSIT
3 TRANSFORMATION. SANTA CLARA WOULD BE GIVEN THE OPTION TO
4 PARTICIPATE, WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT IF THEY CHOOSE NOT
5 TO, THEY WILL STILL BE FUNDING THEIR SHARE OF BART THROUGH
6 THEIR VTA BART OPERATING AGREEMENT, AND THAT THEY WOULD ALSO
7 PROVIDE NEW FUNDING TO COVER THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION NEEDS,
8 WHICH REALLY ARE, YOU KNOW, REGIONAL NEEDS, AS WELL AS THEIR
9 SHARE OF CALTRAIN'S OPERATING DEFICITS. AND I WOULD LIKE TO
10 NOTE THAT VTA, CAROLYN, AND OUR THREE SANTA CLARA COUNTY
11 COMMISSIONED INDICATED THEIR SUPPORT FOR PROVIDING FUNDING FOR
12 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, AND CALTRAIN OPERATING ASSISTANCE
13 THROUGH A LETTER THAT WAS SUPPORT TO THE SELECT COMMITTEE, TO
14 CHAIR SPERING, AND IT WAS PRESENTED TO THE LEGISLATION
15 COMMITTEE, AS WELL. AND THEY ALSO INDICATED THEIR PREFERENCE
16 FOR RAISING FUND THROUGH THEIR OWN MEASURE, THROUGH BASIC
17 LIKELY AN EARLY REAUTHORIZATION OF A SALES TAX THAT WOULD BE A
18 30 YEAR MEASURE BUT THAT WOULD HELP FUND THESE REGIONAL NEEDS.
19 OVERALL SCENARIO 1A WOULD PROVIDE ADDITIONAL 505 MILLION TO
20 MAKE UP FOR THE LOST FARE REVENUE FOR BART, CALTRAIN, AC
21 TRANSIT, AND MUNI ON TRANSIT OPERATING SIDE. THEN \$55 MILLION
22 FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND THEN I WOULD NOTE THAT WITH
23 RESPECT TO TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ONE OF THE THINGS WE HEARD
24 DURING THE SELECT COMMITTEE PROCESS AND OUTREACH WAS HOW MUCH
25 OF THAT IS GOING TO COME BACK TO EACH COUNTY AND WE ARE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 PROPOSING THAT 50% OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION BE
2 ESSENTIALLY RETURNED TO SOURCE IN TERMS OF BENEFIT SO THERE
3 WOULD BE GUARANTEE THAT 5% WOULD BE FUNDING TRANSFORMATION
4 THAT IS GOING TO PROVIDE BENEFIT IN EACH COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE.
5 THIS SNAPSHOT OF FINANCIALS ON THE LEFT SIDE ANNUAL FIGURES
6 AND ON THE RIGHT TEN YEAR FIGURES. YOU CAN SEE SIGNIFICANT
7 FUNDING FOR ALL THE OPERATORS OVER THOSE -- THAT 10-YEAR
8 PERIOD. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS IS THE HYBRID SCENARIO. AND YOU
9 CAN SEE THAT THE OPT-IN COUNTIES ARE SHOWN AS, IN BLUE HERE,
10 OR, EXCUSE ME, THE OPT-INS ARE IN GREEN. AND WHILE SANTA CLARA
11 IS SHOWN AS AN OPT-IN ALONG WITH THE NORTH BAY, WE'RE
12 RECOMMENDING THAT THIS CONCEPT, THIS FRAMEWORK, REALLY ONLY
13 MAKES SENSE IF SANTA CLARA CHOOSES TO OPT-IN PRIMARILY BACK TO
14 THE POINT YOU KNOW IF THE COMMISSION IS GOING TO BE SPONSORING
15 THE LEGISLATION IT NEEDS TO BE SOMETHING THAT, YOU KNOW, IS
16 SUPPORTED BY COMMISSIONERS. AND AS I MENTIONED EARLIER, SANTA
17 CLARA COMMISSIONERS SAID THEY'RE SUPPORTIVE OF A 30-YEAR
18 MEASURE. SO THAT'S WHAT THIS IS. THIS WOULD BE A 30-YEAR
19 MEASURE A HALF CENT SALES TAX COMBINED WITH A PARCEL TASKS
20 \$0.09 PER BUILDING SQUARE FOOT IF IT WERE IMPLEMENTED IN ALL
21 NINE COUNTIES IT WOULD GENERATE 1.5 BILLION, 1.3 BILLION IN
22 ALL FIVE, AND THIS VERSION IS NOT JUST FOR TRANSIT. AND SO IT
23 KIND OF TAKES THE SCENARIO 1A APPROACH FOR THE KIND OF CORE --
24 THE CORE COUNTIES AND WOULD LARGELY BE FUNDING TRANSIT IN THE
25 FIRST EIGHT YEARS. THAT WAS TAPERED DOWN UNTIL YEAR 15 AND



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 THEN THERE WOULD BE A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF FUNDING AVAILABLE
2 FOR COUNTY FLEX. SO, THIS KIND OF RESPOND MORE TO SOME OF THE
3 CONCERNS THAT, YOU KNOW, YOU REALLY NEED TO BE INCLUDING
4 ROADWAY IMPROVEMENT EXERCISE OTHER IMPROVEMENTS IN TRANSIT TO
5 BUILD MORE SUPPORT. WITH RESPECT TO COUNTY FLEX FUNDS WOULD BE
6 REALLY AVAILABLE TO ANY PROJECT AS LONG AS IT'S ALIGNED WITH
7 PLANNED BAY AREA OR SUCCESSOR PLANS AND PROJECTS WOULD BE
8 SELECTED BY THE COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES. NEXT SLIDE.
9 HERE'S THE VERSION OF THE SNAPSHOT ON THE FINANCIALS YOU CAN
10 SEE AT THE BOTTOM LEFT SHOWING 30-YEAR AMOUNT FOR COUNTY FLEX
11 IT'S ALMOST \$30 BILLION OVERALL REGION-WIDE IF ALL NINE
12 COUNTIES WERE TO ANTICIPATE AND THEN ON THE RIGHT YOU'RE
13 SEEING AMOUNTS AVAILABLE TO TRANSIT. AFTER 15 YEARS PARCEL TAX
14 WOULD CONTINUE TO FUND TRANSIT AT MINIMUM OF \$300 MILLION,
15 KIND OF PRO RATA THAT'S THE CURRENT ESTIMATE BASICALLY 60% OF
16 PARCEL TAX WOULD GO TO TRANSIT OPERATORS BUT HOW THAT WOULD BE
17 DISTRIBUTED WOULD BE DETERMINED LATER BASED ON NEEDS THEN WITH
18 THE COUNTY FLEX THAT WOULD BE AVAILABLE TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS
19 BUT WOULD BE AT DISCRETION OF EACH COUNTY. NEXT SLIDE. A BIT
20 OF DETAIL ON TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. BOTH MEASURES INCLUDE A
21 SALES TAX AND THE PROPOSAL IS THAT 10% OF THAT WOULD GO
22 TOWARDS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION. I KNOW MANY OF YOU ARE
23 FAMILIAR WITH WHAT THAT IS. BUT JUST TO PROVIDE A LITTLE BIT
24 MORE DETAIL, YOU KNOW, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT FARE INTEGRATION,
25 THE REGIONAL MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT, ACTUALLY



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 DEPLOYMENT OF THAT. TRANSIT PRIORITY, WHICH CAN SPEED UP
2 TRANSIT, HOPEFULLY BRING MORE PEOPLE BACK ON TO TRANSIT. THE
3 WHOLE IDEA HERE IS WE KNOW THERE ARE A LOT OF THINGS THAT ARE
4 GOING TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP WE WANT RIDERSHIP INCREASE IN THE
5 REGION FOR MANY REASONS AND IT ALSO HELPS WITH THE FINANCIAL
6 SITUATION FOR TRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE. AND, SO, THIS SLIDE JUST
7 RECAPS SOME OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT THE SELECT COMMITTEE
8 DID MAKE. EVEN THOUGH THEY DIDN'T RECOMMEND A SPECIFIC FUNDING
9 FRAMEWORK. THEY DID ADOPT A POLICY RECOMMENDATION THAT
10 HIGHLIGHTED THE IMPORTANCE OF HAVING STRONGER OVERSIGHT OF
11 TRANSIT AGENCY FINANCIALS. WE KNOW THAT VOTERS ARE VERY KEYED
12 INTO ACCOUNTABILITY, RIGHT NOW, IT'S ALSO SOMETHING WE HEAR A
13 LOT ABOUT IN THE LEGISLATURE. SO THERE WAS STRONG AGREEMENT
14 THAT ANY KIND OF MEASURE HAS TO HAVE SOME STRONGER FINANCIAL
15 TRANSPARENCY WITH RESPECT TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND THEN ALSO
16 THAT THERE WOULD BE CONDITIONS ON RELEASE OF THE FUNDS FOR
17 OPERATORS TO BE SHOWING PROGRESS ON THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
18 POLICIES ARE BEING ADOPTED THROUGH THE REGIONAL NETWORK
19 MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK. TRANSIT CONSOLIDATION, AS MANY OF YOU
20 WELL KNOW, WAS INCORPORATED AS A STUDY REQUIREMENT IN SB1031,
21 AND THAT TRIGGERED A LOT OF OPPOSITION TO THE BILL. THE
22 COMMITTEE UNANIMOUSLY AGREED WITH THAT THIS SHOULD NOT BE PART
23 OF THE MEASURE. YOU KNOW, THAT IT'S AN IMPORTANT TOPIC, BUT IF
24 IT'S GOING TO BE PURSUED IT SHOULD NOT BE IN THE ENABLING
25 LEGISLATION FOR A MEASURE. AND THEN THERE WAS SUPPORT FOR THIS



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 IDEA OF 10% OF THE MONEY GOING TOWARDS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION.
2 AND THEN LASTLY, SUPPORT FOR INCLUDING PROVISIONS THAT WOULD
3 ENABLE A CITIZEN INITIATIVE SO THAT THE MEASURE COULD BE
4 APPROVED BY A SIMPLE MAJORITY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, HERE IS THE
5 TIMELINE. AFTER TODAY, AS I MENTIONED, WE'RE GOING TO BE GOING
6 TO THE COMMISSION NEXT MONDAY WITH A SPECIAL COMMISSION
7 MEETING. WE'LL BE BASICALLY ASKING THEM TO ENDORSE THESE TWO
8 OPTIONS FOR POLLING AND FURTHER CONSIDERATION. YOU KNOW, WE
9 DEFINITELY RECOGNIZE THERE ARE A LOT MORE ONGOING
10 CONVERSATIONS TO BE HAD. AFTER WE GET THOSE POLLING RESULTS
11 WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO THE COMMISSION TO PRESENT THOSE,
12 PROBABLY IN FEBRUARY, GIVEN JUST THE TIMING OF THE POLLING.
13 AND THEN WE'LL BE, YOU KNOW, GOING FORWARD FROM THERE. I
14 THINK, FOLKS, YOU KNOW THE LEGISLATIVE TIMELINE, BUT BILLS
15 NEED TO BE IN SUBSTANTIVE FORM BY MARCH TO GO THROUGH THE
16 FIRST POLICY HEARING. AND THEN IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ABLE TO
17 HAVE A BALLOT MEASURE IN 2026, WE NEED TO GET THIS THROUGH THE
18 LEGISLATURE THIS YEAR AND ON TO THE GOVERNOR'S DESK BY
19 SEPTEMBER. SO, WITH THAT, I WILL CLOSE AND OPEN UP TO ANY
20 COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS.

21

22 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** THANK YOU REBECCA. MEMBER CHAN?

23

24 **TILLY CHANG:** THANK YOU. AND THANKS REBECCA FOR THE
25 PRESENTATION. I JUST MAYBE WANTED TO REITERATE, AND I KNOW YOU



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 DID SAY THAT IN YOUR PRESENTATION. FOR SAN MATEO COUNTY, WE DO
2 HAVE CONCERNS, I THINK, IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE
3 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT CURRENTLY INCLUDED IN THE RECOMMENDATION.
4 AND I THINK IT'S REALLY PROBABLY FOR BOTH, OR FOR THE NUMBERS
5 SCENARIOS THAT'S INCLUDED. BECAUSE IT ASSUMES A CERTAIN LEVEL
6 OF PARTICIPATION, I THINK, BY SAN MATEO COUNTY, IN TERMS OF
7 THE CONTRIBUTION TO BART, IN PARTICULAR. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE
8 ALWAYS SAID THAT WE AGREE THAT SAN MATEO NEEDS TO PARTICIPATE
9 BUT WE NEED TO FIND THE RIGHT BALANCE IN TERMS OF WHAT IS THE
10 APPROPRIATE SHARE. AND I KNOW THAT'S A COORDINATION THAT'S
11 BEING HAD CURRENTLY. SO JUST WANTED TO PUT THAT ON THE TABLE.
12 AND I'M A LITTLE -- IS MAYBE THIS TIES BACK TO SOME OF THE
13 EARLIER PRESENTATION ESPECIALLY WITH THE PLANNED BAY AREA
14 DISCUSSION ON THE FUNDING. I BELIEVE THIS CURRENTLY, THE
15 PLANNED BAY AREA FUNDING ASSUMPTIONS ASSUME THAT THERE WILL
16 BE, I BELIEVE, IT'S A NINE-COUNTY MEASURE. AND GIVEN THAT IT
17 COULD BE JUST NARROWED DOWN TO POSSIBLY A 10-YEAR MEASURE,
18 ONLY MAYBE FOR FOUR COUNTIES. LIKE, WHAT COULD BE POTENTIALLY
19 THE RECONCILIATION? BECAUSE IF IT'S ONLY JUST THE FOUR COUNTY,
20 DOES THAT MEAN THE OTHER FIVE GET EXCLUDED? YOU KNOW? ON SOME
21 OF THOSE PROJECTS, LIKE, HOW DAO ACTUALLY RECONCILE THAT MATH?
22
23 **MATT MALONEY:** MATT MALONEY, I THINK WE TRY TO RECONCILE IT AS
24 BEST WE CAN, BUT I THINK WITH THE KNOWLEDGE THAT THE PLANNED
25 BAY AREA IS A 30 YEAR LONG RANGE PLAN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ONE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 REVENUE MEASURE RIGHT NOW DOESN'T PRECLUDE US FROM GOING OUT
2 AGAIN TO THE VOTERS IN A NUMBER OF YEARS SO, I THINK WE TRY TO
3 BALANCE THOSE THINGS DON'T NECESSARILY THINK WE MUST RECONCILE
4 THEM 1-TO-1. WE DO HAVE A BIT OF FLEXIBILITY IN THERE IN OUR
5 AMBITIONS.

6

7 **APRIL CHAN:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ALL RIGHT. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS? MEMBER
10 CHURCHILL?

11

12 **BILL CHURCHILL:** REBECCA, THANK YOU. THAT WAS REALLY A
13 PHENOMENALLY SUCCINCT REPORT GIVEN ALL THE ITERATIONS WE HAVE
14 GONE THROUGH. SO, APPRECIATE THAT. YOU KNOW, LOOKING FORWARD,
15 FOR ME, IT BECOMES OPAQUE TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT'S GOING TO
16 HAPPEN FOLLOWING NEXT WEEK'S MEETING. CLEARLY POLLING WOULD
17 HAVE TO OCCUR. I GUESS I WOULD ENCOURAGE MTC STAFF AND
18 OPERATOR STAFF TO WORK TOGETHER POTENTIALLY DEVELOPING THAT
19 POLLING. I THINK THAT COULD BE HELPFUL IN GAINING A BETTER
20 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT WE CAN DO OR WHAT WE NEED OR WHAT THE
21 VOTERS REALLY THINK. AND THEN I GUESS MY OTHER QUESTION FOR
22 YOU IS, REBECCA, GIVEN THAT SOME OF THE DIFFERENT ELECTED'S
23 HAVE TAKEN SUCH A VASTLY DIFFERENT APPROACH TO THE MEASURE
24 THEY WOULD WANT TO PROPOSE, HAS THERE BEEN ANY POTENTIAL
25 VETTING OF THIS CONCEPT? KIND OF BECAUSE IT WOULD ALMOST HAVE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 TO BE DONE IN PARALLEL IN ORDER TO GET A BILL IN THE PIPELINE
2 IN TIME. SO, IN OTHER WORDS, MTC SAYS YAY, YOU START ON THE
3 POLLING PROCESS THEN SUDDENLY IN FEBRUARY WE HAVE GOT A 30 DAY
4 OR LESS TO PULL A BILL TOGETHER IS THERE A POTENTIAL AUTHOR IN
5 MIND? IS THERE AN AUTHOR THAT'S BEEN LOOKING AT THIS? WHERE
6 ARE WE WITH THAT?

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** THANKS FOR THAT. I MEAN, I THINK MANY OF YOU
9 HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS QUITE A BIT IT'S
10 FAIRLY FLUID, YOU CAN HAVE AN AUTHOR INTRODUCE A BILL, IT'S A
11 SPOT BILL THEN YOU'RE WORKING CLOSELY WITH THEM YOU CAN MAKE
12 AMENDMENTS LATER INTO THE PROCESS. I DON'T KNOW WE DON'T KNOW
13 YET WHO THE AUTHOR IS GOING TO BE CERTAINLY SENATOR WIENER IS
14 ACTIVELY INVOLVED IN THIS AND WILL LIKELY WANT TO INTRODUCE A
15 BILL. WHETHER THAT'S COAUTHORED, OR THOSE CONVERSATIONS ARE
16 ONGOING WOULD JUST SAY WE'RE CONFIDENT A BILL WILL BE
17 INTRODUCED AND THAT SHOULD THE COMMISSION CHOOSE TO SPONSOR IT,
18 THERE WILL BE A VEHICLE TO DO THAT.

19

20 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS ON THIS?
21 MEMBER CHANG?

22

23 **TILLY CHANG:** THANK YOU REBECCA FOR ALL YOUR WORK I'M WONDERING
24 IF ANY OF THE POLLING THAT MTC OR OTHERS MAY BE GOING FORWARD
25 I WANT TO MENTION THE VARIABLE RATE THAT CAME UP THROUGH THE



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 SFMTA OPERATOR PROPOSAL THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO OPERATORS FOR
2 COLLABORATING ON THAT SO WE WOULD BE INTERESTED IN PARTNERING
3 WITH OTHERS TO TEST FOR SAN FRANCISCO. JUST WANT TO BE, AGAIN,
4 ON THE RECORD. THANK YOU.

5

6 **REBECCA LONG:** I CAN FOLLOW UP ON THAT. BILL MENTIONED IT, AND
7 YOU JUST SAID TOO, TILLY. WE DEFINITELY ARE TALKING TO THE
8 OPERATORS ABOUT COLLABORATING, WHETHER POLLING RESOURCES AND
9 COMBINING ONE POLL WE AGREE THERE IS A LOT OF INTEREST IN THAT
10 AND WANT TO JUST MAKE SURE THAT THE CORE OPERATORS ARE SEEING
11 THE QUESTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN PUT INTO IT. WE AGREE.

12

13 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MONIQUE?

14

15 **MONIQUE WEBSTER:** YEAH. JUST FOLLOWING UP ON WHAT TILLY JUST
16 SAID. I WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE UNDERSTANDS THAT SCENARIO
17 1A ONLY PROVIDES FOR LESS THAN 1/3 OF MUNI'S TRANSIT OPERATING
18 DEFICIT AND LEAVES US IN A PLACE WHERE WE WILL NEED OTHER
19 SOLUTIONS TO COME TO THE TABLE, AS WELL, IF THAT'S THE WAY
20 THIS WILL GO FORWARD AS IT MOVES THROUGH THE LEGISLATURE WHICH
21 IS WHY WE PUT FORWARD THE VARIABLE RATE PROPOSAL BECAUSE IT
22 WOULD ALLOW FOR SOME JURISDICTIONS, FOR INSTANCE, FOR SAN
23 FRANCISCO TO HAVE A HIGHER RATE THAN OTHERS IN ORDER TO DO A
24 BETTER JOB OF CLOSING OUR FUNDING DEFICIT. I JUST WANT TO MAKE
25 SURE THAT EVERYONE IS HEARING THAT AS WELL. THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? OR -- OKAY.
3 SO, ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO COMMENT?
4 WALLY?

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.
7 THERE IS NO ONE ON THE LINE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND THERE
8 IS NO SPEAKER CARDS IN THE ROOM.

9

10 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** OKAY. GREAT. SO THAT BRINGS US TO NUMBER
11 FIVE. I KNOW HOW MUCH WE HATE TO LEAVE THESE MEETINGS. BUT,
12 THIS IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR BOARD MEMBERS TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL
13 INPUT OR DIRECTION TO STAFF ON PRIORITIES AND FUTURE MEETING
14 TOPICS. ANY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FUTURE MEETING TOPICS? I
15 THINK, OBVIOUSLY, WE WOULD KEEP THE REVENUE MEASURE ON, AND
16 OBAG. [LAUGHTER] OTHER COMMENTS? ALL RIGHT. ANY PUBLIC
17 COMMENTS ON OTHER TOPICS?

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.
20 THERE IS NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND WELL IS NO SPEAKER
21 CARDS IN THE ROOM. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** MEMBER GONOT?

24



DECEMBER 2, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** OKAY HOPEFULLY THIS WILL BE THE LAST
2 TIME I TALKED TODAY. I WANT TO THANK KATE FOR BEING THE VICE
3 CHAIR OF THE PARTNERSHIP BOARD -- [LAUGHTER] I'M THE VICE
4 CHAIR. AS THIS IS KATE'S LAST MEETING OF THE PARTNERSHIP,
5 BOARD CHAIR. WHEN ARE YOU LEAVING?

6

7 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** WE DON'T HAVE THESE MEETINGS VERY
8 FREQUENTLY. BUT IF THERE IS ONE BEFORE APRIL-ISH, I MAY STILL
9 COME BACK. OR NOT. I THINK IT'S PROBABLY MAYBE TIMELY FOR US
10 TO TALK ABOUT TRANSITIONING. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK THIS IS A
11 LIFETIME POSITION. IT FEELS LIKE ONE. BUT IT'S -- I DON'T
12 THINK IT HAS BEEN ONE. YEAH. [LAUGHTER]

13

14 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** YEAH BUT I DO WANT TO SAY THAT IN
15 CASE WE DIDN'T HAVE A CHANCE TO DO IT I WASN'T SURE.

16

17 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, CAROLYN GONOT:** REALLY, HER STEWARDSHIP IN THE
20 POSITION AND EVERYTHING SHE'S DONE. TAU. [APPLAUSE]

21

22 **CHAIR, KATE MILLER:** VERY MUCH APPRECIATED AND MAYBE THAT WILL
23 BE THE FIRST ITEM ON THE NEXT PARTNERSHIP BOARD MEETING WHERE
24 YOU POINT A NEW CHAIR. ALTHOUGH THAT EPA POSITION REALLY LOOKS
25 INTERESTING. [LAUGHTER] THE MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]





NTT

Broadcasting Government