

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL

FRIDAY, OCTOBER 27TH, 2023, 10:00 AM

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A VOICE VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ITEMS AS THERE ARE NO TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS. NO TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS. AGENDA ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL, CAN WE CONFIRM THE QUORUM, PLEASE?

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR KINMAN?

RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR: HERE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR CAMPOS?

V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS: AYE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MEMBER AU? BALDINI IS EXCUSED. MEMBER DEUTSCH-GROSS?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

4

5 **ANN OLIVIA ELDRED:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF IS EXCUSED. FITZGERALD IS EXCUSED.

8 GLASER IS RUNNING BEHIND SCHEDULE. GOODWIN?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HANKERSON IS EXCUSED. KALLINS?

13

14 **WENDI KALLINS:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAVERY?

17

18 **CHARLES LAVERY:** PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEE? IS NOT HERE YET. LODIN?

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES IS EXCUSED. PARKER?

4

5 **JOHNNY PARKER:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER PIERCE?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER PIMPLE?

12

13 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ONE MORE TIME VINAY? DID I TURN IT OFF

16 VINAY? THANK YOU. RHODES IS EXCUSED. SCOTT?

17

18 **TERRY SCOTT:** PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOWARD WONG?

21

22 **HOWARD WONG:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ROLAND WONG?

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **ROLAND WONG:** HERE .

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE HAVE A QUORUM. REMINDER TO TURN OFF
4 YOUR MIC .

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SINCE OUR LAST MEETING, WE HAVE LOST ONE
7 ADDITIONAL COUNCIL MEMBER, AND WE HAVE GAINED FIVE. WE'RE
8 AHEAD OF THE GAME. VEDA FLOREZ RESIGNED ON OCTOBER 4TH, 2023.
9 AND THE MTC COMMISSION APPROVED APPOINTMENT OF CARLINE AU,
10 DIANE BENITEZ, GABRIELLE GORDEN, JEFFREY RHODES AND ROLAND
11 WONG TO THE COUNCIL AT ITS SEPTEMBER 27TH MEETING. I'LL GIVE
12 EACH A CHANCE TO INTRODUCE THEMSELVES .

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS CARLINE AU, I REPRESENT THE ECONOMY I
15 CURRENTLY LIVE AND WORK IN THE CITY OF OAKLAND, I'M HONORED TO
16 REPRESENT THE EAST BAY BUT ALSO THE BROADER ECONOMIC
17 STAKEHOLDERS. NICE TO MEET EVERYONE .

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DIANA?

20

21 **DIANA BENITEZ:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M DIANA BENITEZ, AT-
22 LARGE. I REPRESENT THE ENVIRONMENT I LIVE IN BERKELEY AND WORK
23 IN SAN RAFAEL. THANK YOU .

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GABRIEL?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GABRIEL BORDEN ALSO AN ENVIRONMENTAL REPRESENTATIVE
3 AT-LARGE FROM SAN JOSE COMING OUT OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY. I
4 WORK IN BERKELEY, ALSO REMOTE AND HAPPY TO BE HERE. THANK YOU.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND ROLAND?

7

8 **ROLAND WONG:** I'M ROLAND WONG, A RESIDENT OF HAYWARD SERVING ON
9 THE DISABLED SENIOR AND DISABLED OF ALAMEDA COUNTY. IT IS MY
10 PLEASURE TO HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO SERVE ON THE POLICY
11 ADVISORY COUNCIL. THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IT'S NICE HAVING NEW MEMBERS.
14 AND I HAD A CHANCE, AND SO DID MY VICE CHAIR PAM, WE MET WITH
15 ALL OF THEM. MR. RHODES IS OUT OF TOWN ON VACATION THIS MONTH.
16 SO WE WILL CATCH UP TO HIM WHEN HE COMES BACK. AND AS I
17 MENTIONED AT LAST COUNCIL MEETING, THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
18 ACTION PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE HAS CONCLUDED IN THE REGIONAL NETWORK
19 MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE CUSTOMERS ADVISORY GROUP. CAN WE FIND AN
20 ACRONYM FOR THAT. ALTHOUGH WE DON'T LIKE ACRONYMS. WAS STOOD
21 UP AT A SPECIAL MEETING OF THE COMMISSION HELD WEDNESDAY
22 OCTOBER 25TH OF THE THEY ARE HAVING THEIR FIRST MEETING AT
23 NOON TODAY, AND WELCOME ALL COUNCIL MEMBERS TO ATTEND AS
24 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IF YOUR SCHEDULE ALLOWS. APPOINTING



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 CHARLES LAVERY TO THE CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP. ARE THERE ANY
2 PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
6 ON THIS ITEM.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND JUST AS A MATTER, OF COURSE, I WILL
9 BE MAKING SOME APPOINTMENTS AT THE END OF THE AGENDA, AND
10 WITHDRAWING MY POSITION ON THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
11 -- WELL, I CAN DO THAT AT THE MOMENT, RIGHT NOW. SO, I WILL BE
12 WITHDRAWING MY POSITION ON THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
13 AS I WAS HOLDING IT TO WAIT FOR MR. ROLAND WONG TO MAKE HIS
14 APPEARANCE HERE AND BE OFFICIALLY A MEMBER WITH THE BODY. SO,
15 ROLAND, YOU ARE NOW AN OFFICIAL MEMBER WITH THE EQUITY AND
16 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. CONGRATULATIONS.

17

18 **ROLAND WONG:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AND WITH THAT, WE WILL
21 MOVE INTO ITEM NUMBER THREE, APPROVAL OF THE SEPTEMBER 22ND,
22 2023 MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE?

23

24 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** MOTION TO APPROVE, ELDRED.

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M SORRY -- I --

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** MOTION TO APPROVE, ELDRED.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** AND SECOND.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M SORRY. AND SCOTT. THANK YOU. WERE
10 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENCE RECEIVED UNDER THIS ITEM?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
13 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS. PUBLIC WITH THEIR
14 HAND RAISED AND NO MEMBER IN ZOOM. NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS BY MEMBERS OF THE
17 COUNCIL? WITH THAT, ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** AYES.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OPPOSED? WE HAVE A UNANIMOUS VOTE?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ABSTENTIONS? ARE THERE ANY ABSTENTIONS?

24



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I'M SO NOT USED TO DOING -- ROLL CALL
2 VOTE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOLD ON. BECAUSE I COULDN'T HEAR. WE'RE
5 THERE ANY ABSTENTIONS?

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THERE WERE ABSTENTIONS?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** ABSTAIN.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** I WILL ABSTAIN ALSO.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAST NAME?

14

15 **VINAY PIMPLE:** PIMPLE.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ITEM FOUR PUBLIC COMMENT ON
18 OTHER BUSINESS I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED
19 UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED TO THIS ITEM AT
20 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD.
21 I WOULD ASK FOR ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
22 TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM ON
23 TODAY AGENDA PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR
24 NINE. IN-PERSON SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND I WILL



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
2 AGENDA ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
5 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
6 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM
9 NUMBER FIVE, AN INFORMATION ITEM. FIVE A, PLANNED BAY AREA
10 2050 PLUS, ROUND ONE ENGAGEMENT FINDING DRAFT CORE PLANNING
11 ASSUMPTIONS AND DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGY REFINEMENTS. CHIRAG,
12 DO YOU HAVE YUCHI AND LESLIE WITH YOU? YOU HAVE DAVE VAUTIN
13 WITH YOU.

14

15 **CHIRAG RABARI:** GOOD MORNING CHIRAG RABARI, PROJECT MANAGER FOR
16 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS AND YES I'M JOINED BY DAVE VAUTIN
17 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR MAJOR PLANS, YUCHI, DEPUTY PROJECT MANAGER.
18 I WANT TO SAY THE CONTENT WE'RE SHARING REPRESENTS WORK AND
19 COLLABORATIVE EFFORTS OF A MORE THAN 20 PERSON TEAM I WANT TO
20 ACKNOWLEDGE A LOT OF HARD WORK BY A LOT OF PEOPLE HELPING TO
21 PUT THIS MATERIAL TOGETHER. NEXT SLIDE. SO, A BRIEF REFRESHER,
22 THE COUNCIL'S WORK PLAN PRIORITIES FOR 2023 CALL FOR SIX
23 SPECIFIC FOCUS AREAS AND A PRESENTATION WE'RE SHARING TODAY
24 FALLS SQUARELY INTO ITEM NUMBER THREE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IN
25 TERMS OF PREVIOUSLY RELEVANT MATERIAL THAT WAS SHARED ON THIS



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 TOPIC, IN JULY WE PRESENTED THE SCOPE AND SCHEDULE FOR PLANNED
2 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. IN JUNE WE SHARED THE DRAFT GOALS AND
3 UPDATE PROCESS FOR TRANSIT 2050 PLUS, AND IN MAY, WE PRESENTED
4 THE DRAFT PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN WHICH DOCUMENTED WHAT OUR
5 ENGAGEMENT APPROACH FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS WAS GOING
6 TO LOOK LIKE. AND LAST YEAR AROUND THIS TIME, WE SHARED AN
7 IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS UPDATE FOR THE PREVIOUSLY ADOPTED
8 PLAN. WE ALSO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT PREVIOUS COUNCIL INPUT
9 HAS BEEN VERY HELPFUL IN IDENTIFYING THOSE ENGAGEMENT
10 OPPORTUNITIES WITH THE NEED TO PRIORITIZE ONLINE ENGAGEMENT
11 AND QUICK INPUT OPPORTUNITIES, EXPANDING THE SCOPE OF OUR IN-
12 PERSON EVENTS TO GO TO WHERE PEOPLE ARE, INCLUDING COMMUNITY
13 COLLEGES, WHICH IS SOMETHING THE COUNCIL PREVIOUSLY PROVIDED
14 INPUT ON. WE STRIVE TO MAKE SURVEYS AVAILABLE IN MULTIPLE
15 LANGUAGES. AND IN ADDITION TO GOING TO WHERE PEOPLE ARE, BUT
16 REALLY TARGETING OUR EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES, AS WELL AS
17 EXPANDING OUR CBO PARTNERSHIPS. AND FINALLY WANT TO
18 ACKNOWLEDGE, YOU KNOW, SOMETHING THAT WE -- THE COUNCIL HAS
19 PROVIDED A LOT OF INPUT ON IN THE PAST HAS TO DO WITH
20 PRIORITIZING THE NEEDS AND PERSPECTIVES OF PEOPLES WITH
21 DISABILITIES. AND THIS IS SOMETHING THAT STAFF HAS
22 ACKNOWLEDGED AS AN AREA WHERE WE NEED TO IMPROVE. AND, YOU
23 KNOW, THIS IS AN AREA THAT HAS BECOME A FOCUS NOT JUST IN THE
24 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS CONTEXT, BUT IS ALSO THE FOCUS OF
25 OUR NEW ACCESSIBILITY, CULTURE, AND RACIAL EQUITY OFFICE. IN



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 OFFICE OUR BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY STAFF HELD A
2 LISTENING SESSION FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES THIS FRIDAY
3 STAFF HELD A LISTENING SESSION ON THE POTENTIAL TRANSPORTATION
4 REVENUE MEASURE AND ON THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS SIDE
5 WE'RE PLANNING A LISTENING SESSION ON NOVEMBER 9TH BRINGING IN
6 STAFF FROM OTHER RELATED EFFORTS. WE'RE LOOKING FOR TODAY FOR
7 FEEDBACK ON OUR ROUND ONE ENGAGEMENT, ACTIVITIES, PROPOSED
8 STRATEGY REFINEMENTS WE'LL BE DISCUSSING AS WELL AS QUESTIONS
9 AND SUGGESTIONS. WE ARE HERE IN THE FALL OF 2023 ABOUT SIX
10 MONTHS INTO THE TWO AND A HALF YEAR PLANNING PROCESS THIS
11 MONTH WE'LL BE COMPLETING 504 ROUND OF PUBLIC PARTNER
12 STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT WITH ADDITIONAL ENGAGEMENT COMING IN
13 SPRING OF 2024 FALL OF 2024 AND SPRING AND SUMMER OF 2025.
14 WE'LL BE HARD AT WORK ON THE FINAL DRAFT BLUEPRINT THAT CAN BE
15 THOUGHT OF AS A FIRST DRAFT OF THE PLAN THE FOCUS OF THE
16 BLUEPRINT IS ON STRATEGIES, PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS AND
17 GEOGRAPHIES, NUTS AND BOLTS OF THE PLAN, AS WELL AS ASSOCIATED
18 TECHNICAL ANALYSIS ON PERFORMANCE AND EQUITY OUTCOMES. REALLY
19 HOW DOES THE PLAN MEASURE UP IN TERMS OF METRICS AND
20 INDICATORS THAT MATTER TO US AS A REGION. THE FINAL PHASE OF
21 THE PLAN WILL RUN FROM FALL 2024 TO FALL 2025. SO, IN ADDITION
22 TO SUMMARIZING THE ACTUAL PLAN ITSELF, THIS PHASE OF THE PLAN
23 INCLUDES AN ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT, WHICH ANALYZES THE
24 POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OF THE PLAN, AS WELL AS
25 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WHICH CONSIDERS HOW WE CAN MAKE LONG-TERM



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 STRATEGIES A REALITY THROUGH NEAR-TERM ACTIONS AND
2 COMMITMENTS. THERE WILL BE VARIOUS MILESTONES AND DECISION
3 POINTS FROM MTC ABAG BOARDS ALONG THE WAY INCLUDING APPROVAL
4 OF THE PLAN IN FALL 2025. NEXT SLIDE. AS A REMINDER, ONE OF
5 THE UNIQUE THINGS ABOUT THIS PLANNING CYCLE IS WE'RE ADVANCING
6 TWO LONG-RANGE PLANNING EFFORTS IN PARALLEL, PLANNED BAY AREA
7 2050 PLUS LIMITED FOCUSED AND MINOR UPDATE TO PLANNED BAY AREA
8 2050 WHICH AT PRESENT IS FOCUSING ON THE 29 NON-TRANSIT
9 RELATED STRATEGIES FROM THE PREVIOUS PLAN, AND TRANSIT 2050
10 PLUS WHICH IS A SERVICE ORIENTED FISCAL CONSTRAINT TRANSIT
11 NETWORK PLAN FOR THE REGION FOCUSED ON REIMAGINING SIX TRANSIT
12 RELATED STRATEGIES FROM THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I BELIEVE
13 YOU WILL BE SEEING AN UPDATE ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS
14 IT'S IMPORTANT TO HIGHLIGHT WHILE THE PROCESS IS MOVING IN
15 PARALLEL WITH AND EVENTUALLY WILL BE INCORPORATED INTO THE
16 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS FINAL BLUEPRINT IN 2024 IN TERMS OF
17 THE POWERPOINT TODAY WE'RE LOOKING AT PROGRESS DATE FOR
18 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 INCLUDING ENGAGEMENT FINDINGS CORE
19 PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS AND STRATEGY REFINEMENTS AS INFORMED BY
20 ROUND ONE ENGAGEMENT OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IMPLEMENTATIONS.
21 FIRST FOCUS IS UNDERSTANDING HOW THE ARES ARRIVES HAVE BEEN
22 AFFECTED BY THE PANDEMIC AND HOW PART RAISING CONCERNS SHIFTED
23 TO INFORM DRAFT BLUEPRINT STRATEGY REFINEMENTS KEY ACTIVITIES
24 INCLUDING 15 POP-UP WORKSHOPS HELD IN ALL NINE COUNTIES BAY
25 AREA COUNTIES ONLINE SURVEY CHINESE, ENGLISH, SPANISH,



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 VIETNAMESE, PARTNER STAKEHOLDER VIRTUAL WORKSHOPS TECHNICAL
2 WEBINAR PARTNERSHIPS WITH 14CBO ORGANIZATIONS ACROSS THE
3 REGION AS WELL AS OFFICE HOURS ONE-ON-ONES AND LISTENING
4 SESSIONS. IMPORTANT THE OVERALL TONE OF PARTICIPANT ATTITUDES
5 WITH GREAT CONCERN ABOUT CURRENT SITUATION AND FUTURE AS WELL
6 AS SENSE OF HOPELESSNESS AND HELPLESSNESS THAT SHOWED UP
7 ACROSS THE FOUR ELEMENTS TOP PRIORITY WAS HOUSING
8 AFFORDABILITY FOLLOWED BY HOMELESSNESS, ACCESS AS WELL AS
9 HOUSING SECURITY FOR THE ECONOMY OVERWHELMING MAJORITY OF
10 COMMENTS FOCUSED ON NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF INFLATION HIGH COST OF
11 LIVING IN THE BAY AREA FOLLOWED BY LOW OR STAGNANT WAGES IN
12 THE JOB MARKET AS WELL AS INCOME INEQUALITY. CENTRAL THEME
13 COMPONENT COMMENTS RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION WITH A GENERAL
14 CALL TO IMPROVE TRANSIT SAFETY CLEANLINESS FREQUENCY CITED AS
15 TOP THREE MOST IMPORTANT ISSUES ADDRESS THIS FOLLOWED BY
16 CHANGES IN TRAVEL BAY AREA, REMOTE WORK LONGER COMMUTES FOR
17 PEOPLE, IMPROVEMENTS TO BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN INFRASTRUCTURE
18 AS A REMINDER TRANSIT ISSUES ARE GOING TO BE LOOKED AT THROUGH
19 THE TRANSIT 2050 PLUS PROCESS AS WELL AS HOW FEEDBACK WILL
20 INFORM TRANSIT 2050 PLUS WILL BE SHARED TO THE FUTURE UPDATE
21 FINALLY WITH RESPECT TO THE ENVIRONMENT, THINGS SEEM TO HAVE
22 GOTTEN DIRTIER OVER THE PAST FEW YEARS FOLLOWED BY CONCERNS
23 ABOUT CHANGING CLIMATE, NEED FOR ADAPTATION MEASURES AND
24 ENVIRONMENTAL DEGRADATION. TO DEFINE TERMS, I WANT TO TAKE A
25 MINUTE BY WE MEAN BY SOME OF THESE PHRASES, THE FOCUS OF THE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 PRESENTATION. PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS ARE THE CORE TECHNICAL
2 ASSUMPTIONS THAT INFORM THE PLAN. EXTERNAL SOURCES REFLECT
3 ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT FUTURE YEAR CONDITIONS THAT ARE INDEPENDENT
4 FROM PLANNED BAY AREA AND BEYOND OUR REGION'S CONTROL. BUT
5 THESE CONDITIONS DO INFLUENCE THE IMPACT OF STRATEGIES ADOPTED
6 IN THE PLAN. THE REGIONAL GROWTH FORECAST ESTIMATES HOW MUCH
7 THE BAY AREA MIGHT GROW IN BETWEEN NOW AND 2050, INCLUDING FOR
8 POPULATION, JOBS, HOUSEHOLDS AND HOUSING UNITS, NEEDS AND
9 REVENUE ANALYSIS ARE FINANCIAL FORECAST THAT SUPPORT THE
10 STRATEGIES ADOPTED IN THE TRANSPORTATION HOUSING AND
11 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS. ON THE OTHER SIDE STRATEGIES ARE EITHER
12 PUBLIC POLICIES OR INVESTMENTS THAT CAN BE IMPLEMENTED IN THE
13 BAY AREA OVER THE NEXT 25 YEARS AT THE LOCAL, REGIONAL, OR
14 STATE LEVELS. THESE STRATEGIES ARE REALLY THE HEART OF THE
15 PLAN. GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES ARE AREAS WITHIN THE REGION'S NINE
16 COUNTIES WHERE FUTURE HOUSING AND OUR JOBS GROWTH WOULD BE
17 FOCUSED UNDER THE PLAN STRATEGIES. PLANNED BAY AREA INCLUDES
18 TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES, HOUSING GEOGRAPHY AND STRATEGIES,
19 ECONOMIC GEOGRAPHIES AND STRATEGIES, AS WELL AS ENVIRONMENTAL
20 STRATEGIES. THE JOINT MTC PLANNING WITH THE ABAG
21 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WILL FORMALLY ADOPT PLANNED BAY AREA
22 2050 PLUS STRATEGIES AND GEOGRAPHIES FOR FURTHER STUDY AS PART
23 OF A DRAFT BLUEPRINT ACTION ITEM IN JANUARY 2024. AND WE'LL BE
24 COMING BACK TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IN DECEMBER TO
25 SHARE THE BASIC CONTENT OF THIS UPDATE. NEXT SLIDE. SO,



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 INTOXICATE FOR FUTURE UNCERTAINTIES IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,
2 WE EXPLORED OVER 40 EXTERNAL SOURCES UNDER THREE DISTINCT
3 FUTURES DURING THE HORIZON INITIATIVE TO STRESS TEST
4 STRATEGIES FOR DIFFERENT POTENTIAL FUTURES. AS LIMITED AND
5 FOCUSED UPDATE, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS WILL BUILD ON THAT
6 WORK AND MAKE TARGETED UPDATES TO REFLECT KEY CHANGES IN
7 PLANNING CONTEXT ESPECIALLY WHERE THERE IS SUFFICIENT EVIDENCE
8 FOR A SHIFT IN LONG-TERM TRENDS IN THIS POST-PANDEMIC NEW
9 NORMAL. TODAY WE'RE GOING TO FOCUS ON THREE OF THOSE FORCES.
10 FIRST IS WORK-FROM-HOME. IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE
11 FORMULATED THY ASSUMPTIONS DURING THE MIDST OF THE PANDEMIC AT
12 THE TIME STAFF ANTICIPATED THE PANDEMIC WOULD NOT NOT
13 SIGNIFICANTLY ALTER THE LONG-TERM BASELINE TREND WORK-FROM-
14 HOME SO WITHOUT POLICY INTERVENTION HOMEWORK ANTICIPATED TO
15 INCREASE GRADUALLY FROM 12% IN 202050 TO 15% BY 2050 THEN ON
16 TOP REDUCTION PROGRAMS STRATEGY N7 WOULD PUSH PLANNED BAY AREA
17 2050 PLUS WITH MORE RECENT DATA POINTING TO HIGHER WORK-FROM-
18 HOME LEVELS STAFF PROPOSED TO UPDATE THE BASELINE ASSUMPTIONS
19 TO ASSUME GRADUAL SLIGHT DECLINE FROM THE CURRENT LEVEL 25%
20 BEFORE STABLING AT 18% AROUND YEAR 2030. THIS ASSUMPTION IS
21 BASED UPON BEST AVAILABLE DATA AND WILL CONTINUE TO EVALUATE
22 DATA RESOURCES TO MAKE NECESSARY UPDATES SECOND EXTERNAL FORCE
23 INVOLVES AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES DURING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE
24 EXPLORED A WIDE RANGE OF MARKET PENETRATION DURING HORIZON
25 FROM 10% TO 95% EVENTUALLY ADOPTING A CONSERVATIVE ASSUMPTION



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 WHICH WAS 5% EV PENETRATION BY 2035 AND 20% BY 2050. SINCE
2 THEN DESPITE TECHNOLOGICAL REGULATORY ADVANCEMENTS OF THE
3 FUTURE INDUSTRY REMAINS HIGHLY UNCERTAIN WITHOUT CONCRETE
4 EVIDENCE POINTING TO A DIFFERENT TRAJECTORY FOR THE INDUSTRY,
5 WE WILL MAINTAIN PREVIOUS ASSUMPTIONS. LAST EXTERNAL FORCE
6 WE'LL DISCUSS SEA LEVEL RISE. PLAN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
7 INTRODUCED SEA LEVEL RISE AS PART OF THE ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT
8 WHILE ASSUMING TWO FOOT BASELINE SEA LEVEL RISE BY 2050
9 STRATEGY AIMED TO PROJECT COMMUNITIES AGAINST UP TO THREE FEET
10 OF FLOODING. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS WE'LL UPDATE THE
11 ASSUMPTION TO ASSUME PROTECTION AT 4.9 FEET. BASED UPON THE
12 SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION FUNDING INVESTMENT. A HIGHER
13 PROJECTION COMES AT INCREASED FUNDING NEED. A FINAL NOTE ON
14 EXTERNAL FORCES MTC AND ABAG DO NOT HAVE INDEPENDENT AUTHORITY
15 TO SET ASSUMPTIONS OF THESE FORCES. THESE HAVE TO BE APPROVED
16 AND REVIEWED BY THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD. NEXT
17 SLIDE. SO, JUST AS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IS A LIMITED AND
18 FOCUSED UPDATE THIS WAS ALSO TRUE ABOUT THE REGIONAL GROWTH
19 FORECAST PROJECTIONS OF POPULATION JOBS AND HOUSING. SO THAT
20 MEANS CARRIED OVER THE CORE METHODOLOGY AND MODELING APPROACH
21 FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. PRIMARILY GOAL IN UPDATING THIS
22 FORECAST WAS TO INCORPORATE MORE RECENT DATA IN LIGHT OF
23 COVID-19 PANDEMIC AND POPULATION LOSS THAT FOLLOWED. IN TERMS
24 OF POPULATION WE'RE SEEING MODERATELY SLOWER POPULATION GROWTH
25 ECHOING BOTH THE COVID-19 SLOW DOWN BALLS LONGER TERM



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 REDUCTION IN THE NATIONAL POPULATION OUTLOOK FROM PROMINENT
2 FORECASTERS SUCH AS CENSUS AND CONGRESSIONAL BUDGET OFFICE.
3 POPULATION 2050 IS ABOUT 750,000 LESS COMPARED TO THE PREVIOUS
4 PLAN AT 9.6 MILLION FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS VERSUS 10.3
5 MILLION IN PLAN 2050. JOBS EMPLOYMENT 5.4 MILLION IN PLANNED
6 BAY AREA IS SIMILAR TO THE PREVIOUS PLAN MOSTLY DUE TO THE
7 STRONG NATIONAL ECONOMY AND A CONTINUED COMPETITIVE BAY AREA
8 ECONOMY AS WELL AS UNDERLYING ECONOMIC SHIFTS AND STRUCTURE OF
9 JOBS WITH GIG ECONOMY AND SELF-EMPLOYED WORKERS AND SECOND
10 JOBS TAKING ON A GREATER SHARE. IN TERMS OF HOUSEHOLDS AGING
11 POPULATION IS RESULTING IN SMALLER AVERAGE HOUSEHOLD SIZE. THE
12 BAY AREA POPULATION IS GOING TO CONTINUE TO DIVERSIFY, DRIVEN
13 BY BOTH MIGRATION AND FERTILITY DYNAMICS. WE'RE CONTINUING TO
14 SEE PRESSURE ON THE MIDDLE CLASS WITH MODESTLY GROWING SHARES
15 OF BOTH LOWER AND HIGHER INCOME GROUPS FINALLY THE REGION IS
16 GOING TO CONTINUE TO BE A CENTER FOR INNOVATION TECHNOLOGY IN
17 HIGH VALUE SERVICES AND INDUSTRY. NEXT SLIDE. SO, NEEDS AND
18 REVENUES ARE ONE OF THE EARLIEST DELIVERABLES TO ESTABLISH
19 PARAMETERS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. IN THE
20 TRANSPORTATION COST CONTEXT NEEDS ARE THE ESTIMATED COST TO
21 OPERATE, MAINTAIN, AND OPTIMIZE THE EXISTING SYSTEM. AND THIS
22 IS IMPORTANT, BECAUSE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THE EXISTING SYSTEM,
23 NOT AN EXPANDED SYSTEM. REVENUES ARE THE ESTIMATED REVENUES
24 FROM FOLLOWER, STATE, REGIONAL AND LOCAL NEW SOURCES THAT ARE
25 REASONABLY EXPECTED TO BE AVAILABLE OVER THE PLANNING PERIOD.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT IS DIFFERENT FROM THE OTHER
2 ELEMENTS OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS BECAUSE STATUTE
3 REQUIRES THAT TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS BE FISCALLY
4 CONSTRAINED. FOR LONG-RANGE PLANNING PURPOSES FISCAL
5 CONSTRAINT MEANS INVESTMENTS TO MAINTAIN THE TRANSPORTATION
6 NETWORK MUST NOT EXCEED PROJECTED REVENUES PROJECTS MUST BE
7 INCLUDED IN THE PLAN'S FISCALLY CONSTRAINT PROJECT LIST IN
8 ORDER TO ADVANCE CONSTRUCTION PHASES. NEXT SLIDE. OVERALL, THE
9 PICTURE FOR TRANSPORTATION IS VERY CHALLENGING, PARTICULARLY
10 WITH THE FISCAL CONSTRAINT REQUIREMENT. WE HAVE SIMILAR NEEDS
11 TO THE PREVIOUS PLAN HIGHER PROJECT COST AND LESS REVENUE.
12 MOVING FORWARD IN THE COMING MONTHS IN 2024 THERE ARE GOING TO
13 BE DIFFICULT TRADEOFF DISCUSSIONS. AT 380 BILLION COST TO
14 MAINTAIN, OPERATE MAINTAIN AND OPTIMIZE THE TRANSPORTATION
15 NETWORK ARE ROUGHLY EQUIVALENT TO THE PREVIOUS PLAN DESPITE A
16 SHORTER PLAN PERIOD. CAPITAL COSTS FOR MAJOR PROJECTS ARE
17 RISING FASTER THAN INFLATION ON THE ORDER OF 20 TO 40% GREATER
18 THAN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. DRAFT REVENUE FORECAST INCLUDING
19 ANTICIPATED NEW AND OPTIONAL REVENUES IS NEARLY \$100 BILLION
20 LESS THAN THE PREVIOUS PLAN. AND WITHOUT THOSE ANTICIPATED NEW
21 OR OPTIONAL REVENUES FUNDING FOR EXPANSION OR ENHANCEMENT
22 PROJECTS WOULD BE LIMITED AFTER ADDRESSING OPERATING AND
23 MAINTENANCE NEEDS. IT MIGHT LOOK LIKE REVENUES ARE MORE THAN
24 THE NEEDS, BUT, AGAIN, THOSE NEEDS DO NOT ENCOMPASS NEW
25 EXPANSION OR ENHANCEMENT PROJECTS. SO EVEN UNDER A BEST CASE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 SCENARIO WHERE ALL POTENTIAL ANTICIPATED OPTIONAL REVENUES ARE
2 INCLUDED WE'RE LOOKING AT LESS THAN HALF THE MONEY FOR
3 EXPANSION COMPARED TO THE PREVIOUS PLAN. BOTTOM LINE THERE IS
4 NOT ENOUGH REVENUE FOR ALL PROJECTS THAT WERE INCLUDED IN THE
5 PREVIOUS PLAN LET ALONE ANY POTENTIAL NEW PROJECTS THAT THERE
6 MAY BE INTEREST IN PURSUING THIS COULD RESULT IN THE DELAY OR
7 REMOVAL OF PROJECTS IN ORDER TO MEET FISCAL CONSTRAINT
8 REQUIREMENTS. NEXT SLIDE. HOUSING NEEDS AND REVENUES TAKE A
9 SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT APPROACH THAN TRANSPORTATION FOR THE
10 PURPOSES OF THE PLAN HOUSING NEEDS ARE DEFINED AS THE
11 ESTIMATED PUBLIC SUBSIDY NEEDED TO ENSURE BAY AREA RESIDENTS
12 HAVE ACCESS TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING REGARDLESS OF INCOME LEVEL
13 INCLUDING CURRENTLY UNHOUSED RESIDENTS. HOUSING REVENUES ARE
14 DEFINED AS ESTIMATED REVENUES, AGAIN, FROM LOCAL, REGIONAL,
15 STATE, AND FEDERAL SOURCES OVER THE PLANNING PERIOD. UNLIKE
16 TRANSPORTATION NEEDS FOR REVENUES FOR HOUSING ARE NOT FISCALLY
17 CONSTRAINED SO IMPLEMENTING HOUSING STRATEGIES MAY REQUIRE
18 SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN FUTURE REVENUE. DRAFT INITIAL ESTIMATE
19 OF THE HOUSING SUBSIDY FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IS \$552
20 MILLION, \$97 BILLION INCREASE FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SOME
21 OF THE REASONS ARE RISING DEVELOPMENT COST INCREASED
22 CONSTRUCTION COSTS ARE INTEREST RATES HAVE DRIVEN UP PER UNIT
23 COST TO BUILD HOUSING, LOW INCOME HOUSEHOLDS ARE FORECAST TO
24 ACCOUNT FOR LARGER SHARE OF OVERALL POPULATION GROWTH ALTHOUGH
25 PROJECTED REVENUES HAVE INCREASED BY 37 BILLION IN THE LAST



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 PLAN MOSTLY DRIVEN BY UPTICK IN HOUSING SUBSIDIES AT THE STATE
2 LOCAL LEVEL THIS INCREASE FALLS FAR RIGHT AND I WANT TO
3 EMPHASIZE THAT REFINEMENTS TO THE PLAN STRATEGIES WILL AIM AT
4 MEETING THE REMAINING NEED BY REDUCING PRODUCTION COSTS AS
5 WELL AS THROUGH A MIX OF DIFFERENT SOURCES INCLUDING LEVERAGED
6 REGIONAL AND LOCAL SOURCES. NEXT SLIDE. ENVIRONMENT NEEDS AND
7 REVENUE ARE DEVELOPED IN A SIMILAR MANNER TO THE OTHER
8 ELEMENTS WE HAVE ESTIMATED NEEDS FOR EACH STRATEGY AND HAVE
9 GONE THROUGH VARIOUS SOURCES IN THE PLAN ONE UNIQUE QUALITY OF
10 THE ENVIRONMENT IS THAT NEEDS FOR STRATEGIES IN 1 THROUGH 7
11 ARE NOT FISCALLY CONSTRAINED SIMILAR TO HOUSING, WHILE
12 STRATEGIES IN 8 AND 9 ARE PART OF THE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED
13 TRANSPORTATION REVENUES. WHEN WE SUM THE ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT
14 NEEDS WE ARRIVE AT \$215 BILLION WHICH IS DOUBLE WHAT WAS
15 FORECASTED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THE ADAPTING TO SEA LEVEL
16 RISE STRATEGY MAKES UP HALF OF THE INCREASE REFLECTING HIGHER
17 PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS AS WELL AS RECOGNIZING OUR PER UNIT COST
18 PREVIOUSLY PLANNED BAY AREA SIGNIFICANT OF SIGNIFICANT LEAVE
19 MEASURES LIKE MARSH RESTORATION AND HORIZONTAL LEVEES. THE
20 NEGATIVE VALUES YOU SEE ON THE SCREEN DUE TO ELEMENTS
21 STRATEGIES SHIFTING BETWEEN ONE ANOTHER, RESHUFFLING
22 STRATEGIES EN2 AND EN3 AS WELL AS EN5 AND EN6 RESULTS IN
23 DECREASE IN ONE AND INCREASE IN THE OTHER. ANTICIPATE
24 INVESTMENT IN STRATEGIES IN EN8 AND EN9 WHICH ARE CRUCIAL TO
25 MEETING GREENHOUSE REDUCTION TARGETS GOALS. THIS IS THE FIRST



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 TIME PLANNED BAY AREA HAS FORECAST ENVIRONMENT REVENUES AND
2 THAT FORECAST UNCOVERED \$3 BILLION IN SUPPORT OF THE FULL
3 SUITE OF REVENUES THROUGH 2050 WHICH IS ONLY 14% OF PROJECTED
4 ENVIRONMENT NEEDS. DESPITE LARGE FEDERAL STATE INVESTMENT ON
5 CLIMATE ACTION RESILIENCE IN RECENT YEARS NEARLY ALL PROGRAMS
6 WERE ONE TIME. SO THERE IS A WAVE OF FUNDING IN THE NEAR-TERM
7 BUT THOSE FUNDING SLOWS SIGNIFICANTLY FOR STATE AND FEDERAL
8 SOURCES. WE'RE GOING TO SHIFT TO PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS TO THE
9 PROPOSED REFINEMENTS, THE ACTUAL STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN. NEXT
10 SLIDE. THERE IS MORE INFORMATION IN YOUR PACKET GOING THROUGH
11 PROPOSED REFINEMENTS ON A STRATEGY ENJOY STRATEGY BASIS THE
12 GOAL HERE IS TO REVIEW HIGHLIGHTS AND HOW ENGAGEMENT INFORMED
13 THOSE REFINEMENTS. AS WE MENTIONED, THERE WAS A STRONG FOCUS
14 ON IMPROVING TRANSIT SAFETY, CLEANLINESS AND FREQUENCY. AND
15 THE TRANSIT 2050 PLUS EFFORT IS REALLY LOOKING AT HOW TO
16 SUPPORT CONNECTIVITY, RIDERSHIP RECOVERY, AND SYSTEM
17 RELIABILITY. WE'LL BE SHARING MORE ON TRANSIT 2050 PLUS IN THE
18 COMING MONTHS AND THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS WILL BE INTEGRATED
19 INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IN MID-2024. AS MANY OF YOU
20 ARE AWARE, THROUGH THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY, THE NEED
21 FOR EQUITABLE PRICING STRATEGIES HAS BEEN A MAJOR FOCUS, AND
22 WE ARE PROPOSING REFINEMENTS TO THE PER MILE FREEWAY TOLLING
23 STRATEGY TO INCLUDE THOSE EXPANDED EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS.
24 WE'RE ALSO PROPOSING TO WEAVE TOGETHER THE PLAN'S EXISTING
25 PRICING STRATEGIES SUCH AS PARKING PRICING, AS WELL AS CORDON



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 PRICING, INTO A MORE COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH. WE'RE ALSO
2 CONSIDERING EXPANDING THE STRATEGY TO INCLUDE A NEW REGIONAL
3 MILEAGE BASED USER FEE. AS MENTIONED, WE HEARD A LOT ABOUT THE
4 NEED FOR ENCOURAGING ACTIVE AND SAFE TRANSPORTATION AND
5 PROPOSED REFINEMENTS TO OUR COMPLETE STREETS, AS WELL AS
6 REGIONAL VISION ZERO STRATEGIES, LOOK TO ENHANCE SAFETY ON THE
7 HIGH INJURY AND REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION NETWORKS WITH
8 EMPHASIS ON ALL AGES AND ABILITIES DESIGN PRINCIPLES.
9 STAKEHOLDERS ALSO HIGHLIGHTED THE NEED TO PROTECT KEY
10 COMMUNITY SPACES, PARTICULARLY SCHOOLS AND SENIOR CENTERS.
11 NEXT SLIDE. IN OTHER AREAS OF THE PLAN, BESIDES
12 TRANSPORTATION, WE HEARD ABOUT THE NEED TO SUPPORT INNOVATION,
13 TO REDUCE THE COST OF BUILDING HOUSING, AS WELL AS REMOVING
14 POLICY BARRIERS TO BUILDING HOUSING, AND PART OF OUR APPROACH
15 THERE WILL INVOLVE INTEGRATING AREAS OF THE SUBJECT TO THE
16 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY AS PART OF A MINOR REFRESH
17 TO THE PLAN'S GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. AND WE ALSO WANT TO REFINE
18 OUR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION STRATEGIES TO INTEGRATE
19 INNOVATIVE CONSTRUCTION AND FINANCE MODELS AS WELL AS OUR
20 PRIORITY SITES PROGRAM. WITH RESPECT TO THE NEED TO REDUCE
21 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS, WE WANT TO PROPOSE A TARGETED
22 EXPANSION FOR OUR BUILDING DECARBONIZATION STRATEGY, AS WELL
23 AS OUR ELECTRIC VEHICLE AND TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT
24 PROGRAMS. WE WANT TO -- THE ITEMS THAT WE ARE CONSIDERING IS
25 INTEGRATING E-BIKES INTO A MORE COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH, NOT



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 JUST FOCUSING ON CARS WITH RESPECT TO THE CLEAN VEHICLES
2 STRATEGY. WITH RESPECT TO ADAPTING TO CLIMATE CHANGE IMPACTS,
3 AS MENTIONED, WE ARE PROPOSING A SIGNIFICANT EXPANSION OF THE
4 SEA LEVEL RISE ADAPTATION STRATEGY, AND ARE ALSO LOOKING AT
5 EFFORTS TO EXPAND URBAN GREENING WITH MORE TREE CANOPY TO
6 ADDRESS HEAT ISLANDS AND OTHER NEGATIVE IMPACTS OF CLIMATE
7 CHANGE. NEXT SLIDE. SO, IN TERMS OF SOME OF THE NEXT STEPS, WE
8 WILL BE COMING BACK WITH AN UPDATE ON TRANSIT 2050 PLUS IN
9 DECEMBER. WE WILL ALSO COME BACK WITH THE ITEM INTENDED TO GO
10 FOR APPROVAL AT THE JANUARY PLANNING AND ADMINISTRATIVE
11 COMMITTEE, REFINEMENTS TO DRAFT GROUP STRATEGIES AS INFORMED
12 BY FEEDBACK FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TODAY AS WELL AS
13 COMMITTEES NEXT WEEK. PRESENT GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES FROM THE PLAN
14 AS PERSONALLY WHERE WE SEE IMPORTANT CHARGES IN MEETING THE
15 PLAN'S CLIMATE TARGETS. FOLLOWING APPROVAL WE'LL STUDY
16 OUTCOMES OF THESE STRATEGIES WHICH WILL INFORM A SECOND ROUND
17 OF ENGAGEMENT AS WELL AS THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE FINAL
18 BLUEPRINT, WHICH WILL BE APPROVED IN SUMMER OF 2024. AND WITH
19 THAT, HAPPY TO TAKE ANY COMMENTS OR ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. IF MEMBERS WOULD RAISE THEIR
22 HANDS IF THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE QUESTIONS, AND WE'LL START
23 TAKING NAMES. I'M SEEING ALL THE HANDS. WE START WITH ANNE
24 OLIVIA. GO AHEAD.

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I'M A BAD ONE TO START WITH. I ALWAYS HAVE
2 SO MANY. I THANK YOU SO MUCH. THAT WAS AN INFORMATIVE
3 PRESENTATION. I HAVE E-MAILED A QUESTION TO MARTHA TO SEND TO
4 YOU. LOOKING -- I'LL JUST PICK ONE AND IF THE REST AREN'T
5 ANSWERED, I'LL COME BACK AT THE END. LOOKING AT THE STRATEGY,
6 SPECIFICALLY, I THINK IT WAS T5 AROUND ALL LANES PUTTING
7 TOLLING ON EVERY LANE OF THE FREEWAY, SOME OF THE INDIVIDUAL
8 STRATEGIES THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT SPECIFICALLY THAT ARE NOT
9 BEING EVALUATED FOR REALLY KEY EQUITY ASPECTS. I AM PART OF
10 THE NEXGEN ADVISORY GROUP. AND WE HAVE BEEN TOLD REPEATEDLY
11 THAT IT'S NOT THEIR JOB TO EVALUATE THOSE EQUITY MEASURES
12 BECAUSE THAT'S THE PLAN, THAT'S THE JOB OF THE PLAN. SO I'M
13 JUST WONDERING WHAT STAFF'S APPROACH IS TO LOOK AT EACH OF
14 THESE INDIVIDUAL STRATEGIES FOR SOME OF THOSE BIG EQUITY
15 IMPACTS IF THEY'RE NOT BEING EVALUATED IN THE INDIVIDUAL
16 STUDIES OF THE STRATEGIES. AND ESPECIALLY BEFORE THEY LOOK AT
17 GETTING ADOPTED. I LOOKED AT THE ATTACHMENT THAT LOOKS AT THE
18 PROPOSED REFINEMENT, AND IT LOOKS LIKE IT'S RELYING PRETTY
19 HEAVILY ON THAT INDIVIDUAL ANALYSIS OF THAT STRATEGY, BUT THAT
20 STRATEGY ANALYSIS HAS STATED IT'S NOT ITS JOB TO LOOK AT
21 EQUITY. AND IT LOOKS LIKE THE PROPOSED REFINEMENTS ARE LOOKING
22 AT MORE OF EXPANDING IT TO MAKE IT MORE EQUITABLE WHICH
23 DOESN'T ADDRESS ANYTHING AROUND PRIVATIZE PUBLIC GOOD LIKE FEE
24 PER MILE CONCEPT IS JUST AS REGRESSIVE AS THE SALES TAX LIKE
25 PEOPLE WHO ARE DISPLACED KIDS IN THE SAME SCHOOL TRYING TO



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 KEEP PART OF THEIR CHURCH OR MAINTAIN THEIR JOB TO HAVE TO NOW
2 DRIVE MUCH FARTHER THAN PEOPLE CAN AFFORD TO LIVE IN THESE
3 BARELY HIGH COST AREAS, STAFF STRATEGY AROUND FISCALLY
4 CONSTRAINED REQUIREMENTS, I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR HOW STAFF PLAN
5 TO MAKE SURE THAT FUNCTIONALLY WE'RE NOT STEALING THE QUALITY
6 OF LIFE OF FISCALLY CONSTRAINED HOUSEHOLDS AND SELLING IT TO
7 THE HOUSEHOLDS WHO CAN AFFORD TO BUY IT. I WANT TO HEAR IF
8 THAT'S NOT THE JOB OF THE STUDY HOW IS THE PLAN GOING TO DO
9 THAT BEFORE WE HAVE SOME REALLY NEGATIVE UNINTENDED
10 CONSEQUENCES. AND I'M CURIOUS IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE IN HERE
11 BUT I FOUND THE AUTONOMOUS VEHICLE GROUP, SOME OF THEM JUST
12 DRIVE IN A CIRCLE, A FRIEND OF MINE WORKS FOR ONE OF THE RIDE-
13 SHARE AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES. THEY SAID THEY NEVER STOP DRIVING
14 BECAUSE THEY DON'T WANT TO PAY FOR PARKING. SO THEY KEEP
15 DRIVING THEM AROUND 24 HOURS A DAY WAITING FOR RIDES. I'M
16 CURIOUS, HOW AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES ARE FACTORING IN? I SAW THE
17 PERCENTAGE, BUT ARE YOU FACTORING INTO THEM DRIVING 24 HOURS A
18 DAY AND THAT KIND OF THING? BUT AGAIN, NOT IN HERE. THAT FIRST
19 QUESTION IS REALLY THE ONE I WANT TO HEAR ON.

20

21 **CHIRAG RABARI:** STRATEGY T5 REGARDING HOW EQUITY IMPACTS ARE
22 GOING TO BE ANALYZED. ASSUMING WE GET APPROVAL OF THIS SUITE
23 OF STRATEGIES, INCLUDING THE POTENTIAL EXPANDED SCOPE FOR
24 STRATEGIES T5, WE WILL BE ENGAGING IN OUR EQUITY AND
25 PERFORMANCE ANALYSIS, SO WHAT THAT REALLY WILL LOOK AT OVER



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 THE COURSE OF SPRING 2024 IS THAT EVALUATED AS A SUITE OF
2 INVESTMENTS -- OR, I'M SORRY, SUITE OF STRATEGIES, SO NOT
3 ISOLATING ANY ONE STRATEGY, BUT THE STRATEGIES AS A WHOLE, HOW
4 DO THEY RESULT IN -- HOW DO THEY PERFORM ALONG EQUITY MEASURES
5 AND PERFORMANCE INDICATORS THAT ARE IMPORTANT INCLUDING
6 OVERALL AFFORDABILITY OF TRANSPORTATION COSTS. SO, YOU KNOW,
7 THE IMPACTS OF STRATEGY T5 IN TERMS OF POTENTIAL COST WOULD
8 ALSO BE LOOKED AT IN CONCERT WITH OTHER STRATEGIES THAT ARE,
9 YOU KNOW, POTENTIALLY REDUCING TRANSPORTATION COSTS. SO THE
10 RESULTS OF THAT EQUITY ANALYSIS WOULD SHOW, WELL, HOW ARE WE
11 DOING ALONG THESE -- ALONG THESE MEASURES. SO WE WILL HAVE
12 MORE INFORMATION ON THAT IN THE SPRING OF 2024, WHICH, YOU
13 KNOW, WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO SHARE INFORMATION ON.

14

15 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** WHAT I'M HEARING FROM THAT IS THEY WILL
16 NOT BE EVALUATED. JUST SO YOU KNOW. IF YOU ARE NOT WILLING TO
17 LOOK AT IMPACTS OF A SINGLE STRATEGY, A REALLY BIG \$25 BILLION
18 STRATEGY, OR YOU'RE LIKE, HEY, THESE ARE REALLY TERRIBLE, BUT
19 MAYBE WE CAN JUST LOOK AT FOLKS WHO CAN AFFORD TO DO PUBLIC
20 TRANSPORTATION, AND WE CAN BALANCE THE OUTCOMES OF THAT AND
21 SAY, LIKE, WELL, THIS GROUP IS GOING TO BENEFIT, BUT THIS
22 GROUP IS STILL GOING TO SUFFER. JUST SO YOU KNOW, TO THOSE OF
23 US WHO AREN'T ON THE PLANNING TEAM -- AND I AM ON OTHER
24 PLANNING TEAMS -- IT SOUND LIKE WE DON'T CARE. AND AS THE
25 STRATEGY SPECIFICALLY DOES NOT LOOK AT INTERNAL DISPLACEMENT,



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 I JUST -- I WANT YOU TO HEAR THAT. AS PLAINLY AS I CAN SAY IT,
2 IT SOUNDS LIKE THEY DON'T CARE. SO, I HOPE THAT'S HEARD.

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, DAVE VAUTIN, ASSISTANT
5 DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS. I JUST WANT TO ADD A LITTLE BIT TO
6 WHAT CHIRAG SAID. WE DO AN EQUITY PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT OF
7 THE PLAN AND THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WILL BE HAPPENING IN THE
8 SPRING ON THE ISSUE OF INTERNAL DISPLACEMENT WE'LL LOOK AT
9 INTERSECTION OF T5 WITH THE OTHER 34 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN.
10 AS PART OF THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY, WE ARE VERY MUCH
11 LOOKING AT EQUITY ISSUES. BUT WE HAVE ACKNOWLEDGED THAT LAND
12 USE IMPACTS LIKE INTERNAL DISPLACEMENT LIKE YOU'RE MENTIONING
13 IS OUTSIDE THE SCOPE OF THAT STUDY, THAT IS WHAT WE GET TO
14 CAPTURE NOW IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS, BECAUSE WHEN WE
15 LOOK AT STRATEGY T5, 1 STRATEGY, WITH THE OTHER 34, AND WE DO
16 SIMULATION MODELING, LAND USE AND TRANSPORTATION IMPACTS,
17 WE'LL BE ABLE TO SEE HOW THAT STRATEGY, AS PART OF A PACKAGE,
18 AFFECTS THE INTERNAL DYNAMICS OF THE REGION WHEN IT COMES TO
19 LAND USE. SO, YOU KNOW, WHILE NO ANALYSIS IS PERFECT, AND
20 THERE ARE ALWAYS LIMITATIONS WHEN IT COMES TO STUDYING THESE
21 THINGS WE'LL BE ABLE TO CAPTURE A KEY LENS FOR ROADWAY PRICING
22 AND BROADLY WITH THE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES AS PART OF THIS
23 EFFORT.

24



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IF I MAY, BECAUSE I'M A LITTLE CONFUSED
2 HERE. YOU'RE SAYING THAT YOU KNOW THAT A STRATEGY MAY CAUSE
3 SIGNIFICANT DOWNSIDE FOR A SIGNIFICANT NUMBER OF PEOPLE, BUT
4 YOU'RE HOPING THAT THE OTHER STRATEGIES COMPENSATE FOR IT?

5

6 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I THINK IT'S MORE THAT THEY'RE UNWILLING
7 TO LIST THE NEGATIVES OF THAT STRATEGY OUTSIDE THE CONTEXT OF
8 THE REST OF THEM.

9

10 **DAVE VAUTIN:** TWO THINGS, FIRST OF ALL, IN PLANNED BAY AREA,
11 THERE ARE 35 DISTINCT STRATEGIES. WE DON'T STUDY EACH OF THEM
12 SILOED INDIVIDUALLY. WE'RE STUDYING AND DOING A DEEP DIVE OF
13 STRATEGY T5 ALL PLUSES AND MINUSES THROUGH THE NEXT GENERATION
14 FREEWAY EFFORT. AND THE PURPOSE OF THE LONG RANGE PLAN SHOULD
15 SAY OKAY, MTC AND ABAG ARE PURSUING A VARIETY OF INITIATIVES,
16 IMPROVING OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM, INVESTING IN HOUSING, ALL OF
17 THESE DIFFERENT EFFORTS. AND SO THE ANALYSIS WE DO THROUGH THE
18 LONG RANGE LOOKS AT THE INTERSECTION OF THESE EFFORTS.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY IF WE MAKE THIS SIMPLISTIC, IF I SAY
21 ONE OF OUR STRATEGIES IS TO INSTALL MORE COMPREHENSIVE
22 SIDEWALK INFRASTRUCTURE AROUND SCHOOLS AS PART OF OUR SAFE
23 ROUTES TO SCHOOLS MEASURES FOR REDUCING FATALITIES AND
24 INJURIES, THAT IS A STRATEGY, AND WE CAN MEASURE THAT STRATEGY
25 AS PART OF OUR SUITE OF STRATEGIES.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **DAVE VAUTIN:** WE GO THROUGH A MODELING PROCESS WHERE WE LOAD IN
3 ALL THE DIFFERENT STRATEGIES INTO OUR MODEL AND THEN WE LOOK
4 AT THE REGIONAL OUTCOMES ASSOCIATED WITH THE PACKAGE OF
5 STRATEGIES.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** BUT THAT'S A STRATEGY WHERE YOU CAN
8 MEASURE THAT ACTUALLY COMPONENT. CORRECT?

9

10 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH.

11

12 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** SOME OF THEM WE CAN MEASURE THE ACTUAL
13 OUTCOME OF A SPECIFIC STRATEGY, SOME OF THEM WE'RE NOT ABLE TO
14 DO THAT.

15

16 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO WHAT I WOULD SAY IS WE STUDY, YOU KNOW, WE
17 STUDY INDIVIDUAL STRATEGIES THROUGH TOPICAL PLANS, LIKE THE
18 NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY, WE STUDY INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS
19 THROUGH THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE, WE EXPLORE SOME OF THESE
20 THROUGH DEEP DIVES, BUT IT'S NOT POSSIBLE FOR US TO DO 35
21 INDIVIDUAL STRATEGIES ANALYSIS IN THE CONTEXT OF THE LONG
22 RANGE PLAN WHICH IS WHY WE DO TOPICAL PLANS, RIGHT? SO, AS
23 PART OF THE BLUEPRINT PROCESS WE STOCK UP THE STRATEGIES
24 BECAUSE THERE ARE INTERACTIONS BETWEEN THEM SOME HAVE
25 COBENEFITS WITH ONE ANOTHER OTHERS HAVE CONFLICTS WITH EACH



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 OTHER WE LOOK AT THE PACKAGE OF INVESTMENTS AND UNDERSTAND HOW
2 THAT LEADS TO SUITE OF REGIONAL OUTCOMES THIS IS CONSISTENT
3 WITH HOW WE HAVE DONE IN PAST ITERATIONS OF PLANNED BAY AREA
4 AS WELL.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I THINK IT WOULD BE IN THIS CASE
7 BENEFICIAL TO PEOPLE THAT ARE WORKING ON THE NEXGEN FREEWAY
8 THING IS TO SEE THE STRATEGIES THAT HAVE THE POTENTIAL FOR
9 OFFSET. BECAUSE WE'RE NOT SEEING IT. SO THAT -- THIS CONTINUES
10 TO COME UP TIME AFTER TIME. SO, IN ORDER FOR US TO BE MORE
11 COMFORTABLE, PERHAPS SEEING THIS SUITE IN ACTION, OR POTENTIAL
12 ACTION, WOULD BE OF BENEFIT. THANK YOU.

13

14 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** AND JUST SO YOU KNOW, WE'RE TOLD
15 REPEATEDLY IN THAT GROUP THAT THOSE EQUITY THINGS ARE NOT
16 BEING STUDIED. SO I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS GROUP
17 KNEW THAT THEY ARE NOT BEING STUDIED. SOME EQUITY FACTORS ARE
18 BEING STUDIED. BUT A WHOLE LOT OF THEM ARE NOT, AND THAT
19 SPECIFICALLY IT -- AND MY CONCERN IN THAT GROUP WAS, WHEN WE
20 GO TO TALK ABOUT THE PLAN, THEY'RE GOING TO SAY EQUITY WAS
21 STUDIED IN THAT -- IN THAT STUDY, AND WE'RE -- I MEAN, ALL OF
22 THE THINGS THEY SAY, NO. THIS ISN'T OUR JOB MERE SO I WANT TO
23 MAKE SURE THAT COMES BACK TO YOU WE DON'T NEED TO SPEND MORE
24 TIME ON IT I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT GOT BACK TO YOU AND IN
25 THIS GROUP THAT IS NOT BEING STUDIED.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY ANNE OLIVIA. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON
3 TO THE NEXT ONE. HOWARD?

4

5 **HOWARD WONG:** FIRST, EVERY TIME I HEAR A PRESENTATION, YOU
6 KNOW, THINGS GET CLEARER AND CLEARER. IT'S REALLY GREAT TO
7 HAVE THESE KIND OF OVERALL WRAP-UPS EVERY ONCE IN A WHILE
8 BECAUSE IT REALLY HELPS. I THINK ENGAGEMENT WITH TRYING TO
9 REACH AVERAGE PEOPLE IS REALLY COMMENDABLE. YOU KNOW, MANY
10 STUDIES OFTEN PEOPLE SEE GOVERNMENT ENTITIES APPROACHING THE
11 PUBLIC WITH PRECONCEIVED NOTIONS. THE AND I THINK THE ATTEMPT
12 TO REACH PEOPLE WHERE THEY ARE IS REALLY QUITE GOOD. SO, KEEP
13 THAT UP. REGARDING TRANSPORTATION I THINK ONE SHOULD LOOK AT
14 TECHNOLOGY AS FAR REACHING FAR BEYOND AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES, I
15 THINK YOU KNOW, JUST ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE ALREADY EXISTING,
16 DIGITAL MEANS OF MANAGEMENT OF STREETS, TRAFFIC ROADS, TRAFFIC
17 LIGHTS, CARS. THERE IS A LOT OF TECHNOLOGY MOVING VERY, VERY
18 FAST. 25 YEARS IS A LONG TIME FRAME IN TERMS WHATEVER WE'RE
19 SEEING IN REALLY TRANSFORMATIONAL CHANGES, WE'RE SEEING IN
20 COMMUTING, WORK, TRANSIT. THE, YOU KNOW, ROBO TAXIS ARE MOVING
21 QUICKLY, BUT WE'RE ALSO SEEING MICRO TRANSIT AUTOMATED LOOP
22 BUSES LIKE ON TREASURE ISLAND. I THINK ONE HAS TO EXPAND THE
23 CONCEPT OF WHAT TECHNOLOGY IS. IN TERMS OF HOUSING, I THINK I
24 HAVE ALWAYS BEEN A FAN OF MANY OTHER HOUSING MODELS AROUND THE
25 WORLD, I THINK OUR TENDENCY IS TO LOOK AT HOUSING AS KIND OF A



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 TRADITIONAL SENSE OF WHAT A HOUSE IS, BUT IN ORDER TO OBTAIN
2 HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF UNITS OR MILLIONS OF UNITS WE NEED IN
3 20 YEARS OR 25 YEARS WHAT ONE HAS TO START EXAMINING THE
4 HOUSING CONCEPTS OTHER COUNTRIES HAVE, SOCIAL HOUSING, CORE
5 HOUSING, MICRO HOUSING, SO THROUGHOUT THE STUDY ONE SHOT
6 STUDIES OF HOW OTHER CITIES AND NATIONS CAN, YOU KNOW, ACHIEVE
7 MILLIONS OF HOUSING UNITS OF GROWTH, AND THAT INCLUDES OF
8 COURSE NEW TOWNS NEW CITIES WHICH WE SEE ON DRAWING BOARDS IN
9 OTHER PARTS OF THE WORLD. IN TERMS OF ENVIRONMENT WE MIGHT
10 ALSO WANT TO LOOK AT NOT JUST THE INDIVIDUAL ISSUES OF SEA
11 LEVEL RISE, YOU KNOW, CLIMATE CHANGE, BUT THE TREND TOWARDS
12 URBANIZATION THAT THE WORLD AND OUR COUNTRY IS MOVING MUCH
13 MORE TOWARDS CONCENTRATED URBAN CORES, PERHAPS THAT'S BEEN
14 SOMEWHAT LESSENERED BY COVID AND WORK-FROM-HOME SOCIAL CHANGES.
15 BUT I THINK THE TREND THAT MOST DEMOGRAPHERS SEE IS
16 CENTRALIZED URBAN AREAS, WHICH ACTUALLY COULD BE A GOOD THING
17 FOR THE ENVIRONMENT, BECAUSE IT WOULD REDUCE THE FOOTPRINT ON
18 THE REST OF THE PLANET, ON THE REST OF THE AREAS OUTSIDE OF
19 CITIES. SO BY LOOKING AT URBANIZATION, YOU COULD ENVISION VERY
20 GREEN CITIES NOT ONLY IN TERMS OF ENVIRONMENTAL
21 SUSTAINABILITY, BUT, ALSO, TRULY GREEN, PLANTED CITIES, TREES,
22 BUILDINGS LUSH WITH VEGETATION. URBAN AGRICULTURE, URBAN
23 FARMING. SO, THAT KIND OF OVERALL LOOK AT THE SHIFT TOWARDS
24 CENTRALIZATION IS IMPORTANT. AND I THINK ALSO IN ALL THE
25 ISSUES IN THE STUDY, YOU KNOW, AGAIN, JUST LOOKING AT



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 SPECIFICS, MAYBE ONE SHOULD STEP BACK AND LOOK AT ALL THE
2 OVERARCHING ISSUES THAT APPLY TO EVERYTHING. AS AN ARCHITECT,
3 I ALWAYS LOOK AT A LOT OF THINGS IN ONE WAY, AND THAT IS THE
4 DESIGN, TO DESIGN QUALITY. WHATEVER YOU DO, WHETHER IT'S IN
5 HOUSING, TRANSIT, THE ENVIRONMENT, PARKS, OPEN SPACE, ROADS,
6 BUILDINGS. STREETS. YOU KNOW? ONE SHOULD LOOK AT, OVERALL,
7 CRITERIA FOR THE DESIGN OF WHATEVER YOU SPEND MONEY ON SO YOU
8 GET THE MOST OUT OF YOUR -- WHATEVER MONEY YOU SPEND, SO THAT
9 WHATEVER YOU DO ISN'T, YOU KNOW, VANILLA, THAT IT'S REALLY
10 GETTING SOMETHING SPECIAL FOR THE DOLLAR. SO THOSE ARE SOME OF
11 MY COMMENTS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU HOWARD. NEXT I HAVE ADINA.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, I HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS. THE
16 BIGGEST ONE IS ON SLIDE 11.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BROADCASTING TEAM, CAN YOU BRING THE
19 POWERPOINT BACK UP, PLEASE? SO, WITH THE TRANSPORTATION NEEDS,
20 THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IS \$28
21 BILLION LOWER. AND I AM WONDERING WHAT IS UNDERLINING THAT,
22 GIVEN THAT, YOU KNOW, IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO ACHIEVE OUR
23 CLIMATE GOALS AND EQUITY GOALS AND HOUSING GOALS AND SO ON, IT
24 WOULD BE VALUABLE TO HAVE MORE FREQUENT SERVICE, FREQUENCY OF
25 TRANSIT SERVICE IS INTERNATIONALLY EXTREMELY HIGHLY CORRELATED



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 TO RIDERSHIP. SO, HAVING -- LIKE, AND TRANSIT AGENCY BUDGETS
2 HAVE BEEN REALLY IMPACTED BY THE PANDEMIC WITH LOWER FARE
3 REVENUE, AND SO, WITH A PUSH FOR MORE PUBLIC FUNDING FOR
4 TRANSIT OPERATIONS. SO WHY IS THAT NUMBER SMALLER?

5

6 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION. TO CLARIFY THE
7 MAIN DRIVER BEHIND THE DECREASE IS WE'RE LOOKING AT THE
8 CURRENT BASELINE OF WHAT IS THE CURRENT -- WHAT WOULD IT COST
9 TO MAINTAIN THE CURRENT LEVEL OF SERVICE PASS PART OF OUR,
10 SORT OF, BASELINE SERVICE LEVEL. AND MOVING FORWARD. AND THAT
11 IS OBVIOUSLY LESS THAN WHAT IT WAS IN THE PREVIOUS PLAN,
12 BECAUSE THERE IS LESS TRANSIT SERVICE BEING OPERATED RIGHT NOW
13 THAN THERE WAS IN 2019. THE APPROACH THAT WE'RE GOING TO TAKE
14 IS THAT A STRATEGY BASED APPROACH IN TERMS OF IDENTIFYING THE
15 AMOUNT OF SERVICE THAT WE WANT TO INCREASE IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE
16 OUR REGIONAL GOALS. SO, THE -- WE WILL, AS PART OF THE TRANSIT
17 2050 PLUS PROCESS, AND THEN INCORPORATE IT INTO THE FINAL
18 TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST, IDENTIFY, YOU KNOW, WHATEVER
19 SERVICE INCREASES ARE APPROPRIATE, GIVEN THE FISCAL
20 CONSTRAINT, AS WELL AS GIVEN, YOU KNOW, OPERATORS DESIRE TO
21 INCREASE SERVICE, AND INCORPORATE THAT AS PART OF THE
22 STRATEGIES AND THE OVERALL PROJECT LIST. HOPEFULLY THAT MAKES
23 SENSE.

24



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO, WHAT I'M HEARING IS YOU'RE GOING TO USE
2 TRANSIT 2050 PLUS TO READJUST THAT NUMBER WHICH IS CURRENTLY
3 183, BUT I'M -- ARE YOU SAYING THAT IF WE'RE LOOKING AT THINGS
4 THE WAY THEY ARE NOW WITH, YOU KNOW, LESS FARE REVENUE FOR
5 PUBLIC TRANSIT, THAT NUMBER WOULD GO DOWN, AND NOW WE'RE
6 LOOKING AT TRANSIT 2050 PLUS FOR WAYS OF POTENTIALLY PROVIDING
7 MORE SERVICE? OR ARE YOU SAYING YOU'RE BAKING INTO THE
8 ASSUMPTION THAT WE WILL HAVE LESS SERVICE IN THE FUTURE THAN
9 WE ASSUMED A NUMBER OF YEARS AGO?

10

11 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SO, THE TRANSIT OPERATION NEED IS -- AGAIN,
12 IT'S JUST OUR ASSUMPTION ABOUT MAINTAINING CURRENT LEVELS OF
13 SERVICE IN THE FUTURE, AND THEN THROUGH TRANSIT 2050 PLUS,
14 THROUGH THESE STRATEGIES WE CAN IDENTIFY ADDITIONAL POTENTIAL
15 INVESTMENTS TO EXPAND THAT SERVICE AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN TIME.

16

17 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY I'M NOT SURE I UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE
18 SAYING, BUT I HAVE A COMMENT, WHICH IS IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE OUR
19 GOALS WE WOULD WANT TO HAVE MORE SERVICE IN THE FUTURE THAN
20 LESS SERVICE.

21

22 **DAVE VAUTIN:** WHAT CHIRAG IS SAYING IS BASICALLY THE BASELINE
23 COST TO OPERATE THE SYSTEM TRANSIT SYSTEM, WE HAVE TODAY IS
24 183 BILLED, OF THAT CHART YOU SEE TOTAL REVENUE IS 493 TOTAL
25 NEEDS OF 381 THAT MEANS THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN THOSE NUMBERS



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 IS THERE'S \$112 BILLION REMAINING TO INCREASE FREQUENCIES TO
2 BUILD NEW RAIL PROJECTS INVEST IN LOCAL STREETS TO DO ALL THE
3 STUFF, THE FUNDAMENTAL POLICY QUESTION IN TRANSIT 2050 PLUS IS
4 HOW TO SPEND A SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF THAT 112 BILLION SOME OF
5 WHICH CAN AUGMENT AND GROW OUR TRANSIT OPERATIONS SO WE NEED
6 THIS TYPE OF ANALYSIS TO UNDERSTAND WHERE WE ARE STARTING WITH
7 AND THEN HOW MUCH IS REMAINING WHICH WE CURRENTLY CALCULATED
8 AT ABOUT ONE HUNDREDS \$12 BILLION AND REMAINING CONCEPT FROM
9 SHIFT FROM TRAILS SIMILAR TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH
10 ROUGHLY DOUBLED THE AMOUNT OF TRANSIT SERVICE OUT THERE.

11

12 **ADINA LEVIN:** SOME SMALLER QUESTIONS AND COMMENTS DO YOU HAPPEN
13 TO KNOW OFF OF TOP OF YOUR HEAD, WHAT IS THE ASSUMPTION
14 LEADING TO THE SIGNIFICANT INCREASE IN ASSUMED SEA LEVEL RISE?
15 IF SOMEBODY HASN'T ANSWERED, YOU CAN SAY IT'S PAGE 37 ON THE
16 DOCUMENT.

17

18 **CHIRAG RABARI:** HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP, BUT THE MAIN DRIVER IN NEW
19 STATE GUIDANCE COMPARED TO THE PREVIOUS PLAN THERE WAS A NEW
20 STATE GUIDANCE THAT WAS RELEASED IN 2019 THAT ASSUMED A HIGHER
21 LEVEL OF PROTECTION NEED THAT WAS ONE OF THE MAIN DRIVERS. THE
22 OTHER FACTOR IS WE'RE NOT LOOKING AT JUST ANTICIPATED SEA
23 LEVEL RISE, BUT, ALSO, YOU KNOW, KING TIDE EVENTS AS WELL AS
24 STORM SURGES FROM MORE REGULARLY OCCURRING STORMS. SO THAT IS
25 REALLY WHAT'S DRIVING THE NEED FOR A HIGHER LEVEL OF



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 PROTECTION. THAT IT'S NOT JUST A, YOU KNOW, HIGHER LEVEL FROM
2 ANTICIPATED SEA LEVEL RISE BUT ALSO TRYING TO PROTECT AGAINST
3 A GREATER VARIETY OF NATURAL PHENOMENON THAT WE'RE LIKELY TO
4 SEE WITH INCREASED FREQUENCY.

5

6 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS. OKAY. THREE OUT OF FOUR. THE -- ON THE
7 TELEWORK, YOU KNOW, GIVEN COVID THE MOST OPTIMISTIC
8 ASSUMPTIONS OF TELEWORK WHO WERE BORNE OUT BECAUSE OF A
9 PANDEMIC, IN THE -- LET ME TRY TO FIND THE PAGE. LIKE, AT THIS
10 POINT, WITH THE AMOUNT OF TELEWORK, THERE ARE A COUPLE OF
11 DIFFERENT STRATEGIES THAT ARE SOMEWHAT AT CROSS PURPOSES, WE
12 HAVE A LOT OF DOWNTOWNS THAT HAVE BEEN VERY NEGATIVELY
13 IMPACTED WITH LOCAL BUSINESSES THAT HAVE BEEN STRUGGLING, AND
14 A LOT OF REGIONAL EFFORTS TO REVIVE A DOWNTOWNS, AND BRING
15 PEOPLE BACK. SO, WANTING TO PUSH EVEN MORE STRONGLY TOWARDS
16 MORE WORK-FROM-HOME IS PROBABLY GOING IN THE OPPOSITE
17 DIRECTION IN SOME OF OUR ECONOMIC OBJECTIVES. THE AND THEN
18 LASTLY, QUICKLY, AS A QUESTION, LIKE, POINT ME TO THE DOCUMENT
19 IF IT'S -- DON'T HAVE THE YES/NO ANSWER. WITH THE BAHFA, THERE
20 IS A REJIGGERING AROUND FUNDING FOR SEISMIC RETROFITS IT SEEMS
21 LIKE A GOOD IDEA BECAUSE IT'S A RISK TO PEOPLE'S LIVES. DOES
22 ANYBODY KNOW IF A BAHFA MEASURE IS INTENDED TO HAVE FUNDING
23 THAT CAN BE USED FOR SEISMIC RETROFITS OF HOMES? YES OR NO
24 QUESTION. IF YOU DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER FEEL FREE TO SEND ME A
25 LINK TO A DOCUMENT



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **CHIRAG RABARI:** DON'T KNOW THE ANSWER TO THE QUESTION BUT WOULD
3 BE HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** WENDI?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** CAN I ASK, WENDI, GERRY AND CHARLES IS THERE ANYONE
12 ELSE ON THIS SLIDE WHO WANTS TO TALK THAT I DIDN'T GET DOWN?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THEN WENDI.

15

16 **WENDI KALLINS:** THIS IS KIND OF JUST A FOLLOW UP CLARIFICATION
17 QUESTION FROM WHAT ADINA WAS A TALKING ABOUT. WHEN YOU'RE
18 HOOKING AT THE TRANSPORTATION PIECE, HOW ARE YOU FIGURING IN
19 THE WHOLE TRANSIT BLUEPRINT NETWORK MANAGEMENT, YOU KNOW,
20 PROCESS THAT'S GOING ON THAT POTENTIALLY COULD LEAD TO A
21 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE AND INVESTMENTS? HOW IS THAT BEING
22 FIGURED INTO YOUR PLANNED BAY AREA, IF AT ALL?

23

24 **DAVE VAUTIN:** GREAT QUESTION. SO, A COUPLE OF POINTS THERE.
25 FIRST IS THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT EFFORT AT MTC HAS A



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 NUMBER OF INITIATIVES GOING. YOU KNOW? FARE INTEGRATION,
2 TRYING WORKING TO IMPROVE TRANSFERS. YOU KNOW, THE LIST GOES
3 ON. SOME OF THOSE ARE ALREADY PLANNED BAY AREA STRATEGIES
4 WE'RE ACTUALLY REFRESHING THOSE STRATEGIES AS PART OF THIS
5 UPDATE AND THROUGH TRANSIT 2050 PLUS WE MAKE SURE EVERYTHING
6 IS ALL IN SYNC BUT ALSO ON THE REVENUE SIDE, YOU MENTIONED THE
7 2026 MEASURE WE HAVE INTEGRATED THAT INTO THE MEASURES THAT
8 ARE NO LONGER ON THE SCREEN, TOTALS OF REVENUE BAKES INTO THE
9 ASSUMPTION THAT THE VOTERS ARE WILLING TO MOVE FORWARD WITH A
10 2026 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION --

11

12 **WENDI KALLINS:** BIG ASSUMPTION.

13

14 **DAVE VAUTIN:** AND THAT'S JUST ONE OF SEVERAL REVENUE SOURCES
15 THAT ARE INCORPORATED. CHIRAG WAS POINTING OUT COVERED ON THE
16 SLIDE WITHOUT REVENUES MEASURES, ROAD PRICING WITHOUT PARKING
17 PRICES, THE LIKE, WE WOULD ONLY BE ABLE TO OPERATE AND
18 MAINTAIN OUR EXISTING SYSTEM WITH VERY LITTLE CAPACITY FOR
19 EXPANSION.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS:** THAT'S WHERE 183 COMES IN, RIGHT?

22

23 **DAVE VAUTIN:** 183?

24



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** THE OPERATIONS NUMBER THAT'S BASED ON THE
2 NUMBER WE HAVE IN HAND.

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THAT NUMBER IS KEY BUT AT THE BOTTOM OF THE
5 SLIGHT, WITHOUT ANTICIPATED NEW AND OPTIONAL REVENUES ONLY
6 \$406 BILLION. SO THAT REALLY IS NOT MUCH MORE THAN THE 381 TO
7 OPERATE THE SYSTEM VERSUS 493 INCORPORATES THINGS LIKE THE
8 2020.

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** GOT IT. JUST A GENERALIZED COMMENT. LOOKING AT
11 THE PROCESS OF PLANNING, AS SOMEONE WHO WORKS FOR
12 SUSTAINABILITY, AND WE DEFINE SUSTAINABILITY AS THE
13 INTEGRATION OF EQUITY, ENVIRONMENT, AND ECONOMY. AND IT SEEMS
14 TO ME WHAT YOU'RE TRYING TO DO HERE IS -- AND THE REASON WHY
15 YOU CAN'T STUDY INDIVIDUAL STRATEGIES, YOU'RE LOOKING AT
16 INTEGRATION OF ALL THE DIFFERENCE STRATEGIES AND AT THE END OF
17 THE ROAD, HAVE WE EFFECTED ALL THREE OF THOSE E'S? SO THERE
18 ARE STRATEGIES THAT ARE BETTER FOR THE ECONOMY BUT NOT GOOD
19 FOR EQUITY. WHEREAS OTHER STRATEGIES MIGHT BE GOOD FOR THE
20 ENVIRONMENT, BUT NOT SO GOOD FOR THE ECONOMY, BUT HOPEFULLY
21 ALL THE STRATEGIES PUT TOGETHER, IN BALANCE, DOES BRING US TO
22 A PLACE OF BALANCE OF THOSE THEE E'S. AM I READING THAT RIGHT?
23 NOD. NOD. NOD. THANK YOU.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:**



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** I'LL KEEP IT QUICK. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
3 PRESENTATION. IT WAS REALLY WELL THOUGHT OUT AND A LOT TO
4 CONSIDER. AND EVERYBODY ON THE COUNCIL HAS GIVEN GREAT
5 FEEDBACK AND SUGGESTIONS. WORN THING WANT TO GIVE FEEDBACK ON
6 THE STRATEGY REFINEMENTS I LIKE THAT YOU ADDED E BIKES INTO
7 CONSIDERATION TO REDUCE EMISSIONS. I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO,
8 AND COWORKERS AND COLLEAGUES WILL SKIP BART AND ADD AN E-BIKE.
9 THAT'S AN OPTION THEY WILL GO TO. FEEDBACK ON THE 16,000
10 COMMENTS, TWO QUESTIONS ON THAT THEN I'M DONE. 16,000 DOES
11 SOUND LIKE A LOT. DO YOU HAVE A BENCHMARK OR CONTEXT OF
12 PREVIOUS EFFORTS LIKE WHO YOU ARE TRYING TO REACH, CERTAIN
13 THRESHOLD NUMBER OF COMMENCE. FIRST QUESTION. SECOND QUESTION
14 IS ANYTHING IN THE COMMENTS WAS ANYTHING SIGNIFICANT CALLED
15 OUT THAT YOU HAVEN'T CONSIDERED FROM THE PUBLIC?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, LESLIE ENRIQUEZ ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOR
18 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT WE DON'T HAVE A BENCHMARK FOR SPECIFIC
19 NUMBER OF COMMENTS BUT OUR PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PLAN CALLS FOR
20 IMPLEMENTING STRATEGIES TO ELEVATE VOICES WHO HAVE BEEN
21 HISTORICALLY LEFT OUT OF THE REGIONAL DECISION-MAKING PROCESS
22 MUCH SO WE DO PRIORITIZE THOSE INTERACTION SUPERVISOR THOSE
23 ACTIVITIES THAT HELP TO REACH OUR COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN, OUR
24 LIMITED ENGLISH PROFICIENCY COMMUNITY, SO THAT'S HOW OUR
25 ENGAGEMENT PROGRAM IS DRIVEN. IT'S NOT SPECIFICALLY NUMBERS OR



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 A SPECIFIC TARGET. BUT COMPARED TO THE LAST PLAN, I DON'T
2 REMEMBER OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD, BUT IT WAS A SIMILAR AMOUNT
3 OF COMMENTS THAT WE RECEIVED DURING THE FIRST ROUND.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** IT WAS ON THE SCALE OF SIX FIGURE COMMENTS BUT THAT
6 WAS FOR THE WHOLE FOUR YEAR PLAN FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BUT
7 FOR THIS MEDIUM TERM PLAN I THINK IT'S SIMILAR TO SCALE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S HELPFUL.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** JOHNNY.

12

13 **JOHNNY PARKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT PRESENTATION. I HAVE A
14 QUESTION IN REGARDS TO SLIDE 13, THE ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT
15 STRATEGIES. THEY SEEM TO BE LISTED BY NUMBER, LIKE, THEY'RE
16 NUMBERED. SO, ARE THEY LISTED BY PRIORITY?

17

18 **CHIRAG RABARI:** NO THEY'RE NOT LISTED BY PRIORITY. THEY'RE
19 REALLY JUST GROUPED BY THEMES. [LAUGHTER] IT'S DIFFICULT TO
20 INCLUDE ALL POSSIBLE INFORMATION, BUT REALLY, THOSE FIRST
21 THREE SLIDES ARE FOCUSED ON -- I'M SORRY -- THE FIRST THREE
22 STRATEGIES ARE GROUPED IN TERMS OF CLIMATE HAZARDS. THE
23 STRATEGIES EN FOUR THROUGH EN SIX ARE FOCUSED ON PARKS AND
24 OPEN SPACE, THEN STRATEGIES EN7 THROUGH 9 ARE FOCUSED ON
25 REDUCING CLIMATE EMISSIONS. IT'S REALLY MORE ABOUT THE THEMES



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 THEY'RE GROUPED UNDER AS OPPOSED TO ANY, SORT OF, IMPLICIT
2 PRIORITIZATION.

3

4 **JOHNNY PARKER:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. I WAS CURIOUS, BECAUSE AT
5 THE TOP IS SEA LEVEL RISE AND THAT HAS COME UP QUITE A FEW
6 TIMES TODAY. THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. CHARLES THEN GERRY.

9

10 **CHARLES LAVERY:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. AGAIN I HAVE A
11 QUESTION ON SLIDE 11 JUST GIVEN THE FEEDBACK WE HAVE HEARD,
12 THE SLIDE NEEDS MORE INFORMATION, WHAT I HEARD WHEN WE WERE
13 BEING LOOKING AT NUMBERS AT THE BOTTOM OF THE ABLE TO 493
14 VERSUS YOU KNOW, THE REVENUE VERSUS NEEDS YOU MADE A COMMENT
15 THAT SURPLUS ONLY WAS HALF OF WHAT WAS ACTUALLY NEEDED FOR
16 ANTICIPATED OR REQUIRED CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS. COULD YOU
17 EXPLAIN ADDRESS THESE QUESTIONS WITH A LITTLE MORE
18 INFORMATION? ALSO HOW -- YOU SAID THE ANTICIPATED FUNDING
19 MEASURE IS INCLUDED IN THE 493, SO IF THERE IS STILL A
20 SHORTFALL, WHAT'S THE STRATEGY? WHAT'S THE PLAN FOR THOSE
21 CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS?

22

23 **CHIRAG RABARI:** YEAH. APPRECIATE THE FEEDBACK ON THE SLIDE. I
24 KNOW IT'S A LOT OF INFORMATION TO TRY TO GET IN ONE PLACE. SO
25 WE CAN DEFINITELY CONSIDER HOW TO IMPROVE THE COMMUNICATION OF



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 SOME OF THE KEY TAKEAWAYS. SO, I THINK, YOU KNOW, JUST TO
2 REITERATE IN TERMS OF THOSE NEEDS, MTC HAS A FIX IT FIRST
3 POLICY. RIGHT? SO, THE COST TO MAINTAIN OUR CURRENT SYSTEM,
4 YOU LOOK AT THOSE REVENUES AND YOU BASICALLY HAVE TO TAKE
5 THOSE NEEDS RIGHT OFF THE TOP, AND THEN EVERYTHING THAT'S LEFT
6 IS WHAT'S AVAILABLE FOR CAPITAL EXPANSION, ENHANCEMENT
7 IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS. SO, HAVING, EVEN WITH ALL OF THESE
8 ADDITIONAL, YOU KNOW, ANTICIPATED NEW OPTIONAL REVENUES, IT'S
9 SIGNIFICANTLY LESS THAN THE PREVIOUS PLAN. SO, ALL OF THE BIG
10 CAPITAL EXPANSION PROJECTS THAT THE REGION IS TRYING TO MOVE
11 FORWARD, THERE IS JUST, SIMPLY NOT AS MUCH REVENUE. SO, I
12 THINK, AS WE MOVE FORWARD OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS, WE
13 COULD -- YOU KNOW, WE COULD GET POLICY DIRECTION THAT WE NEED
14 TO EXPLORE EVEN MORE NEW REVENUE SOURCES IN ORDER TO, YOU
15 KNOW, INCLUDE ALL DESIRED CAPITAL EXPANSION PROJECTS. WE'LL
16 HAVE TO GO THROUGH A PRIORITIZATION PROCESS TO IDENTIFY WHAT
17 CAN BE ACCOMMODATED WITHIN THE PLAN VERSUS WHAT MAY NOT BE
18 ABLE TO BE ACCOMMODATED.

19

20 **CHARLES LAVERY:** DO YOU HAVE AN EXPENDITURE PLAN, OR A KIND OF
21 GUIDELINE THAT'S PART OF THE PLAN?

22

23 **CHIRAG RABARI:** SO, THERE WILL BE A TRANSPORTATION -- A
24 PROPOSED TRANSPORTATION PROJECT LIST WITH ASSOCIATED COST THAT
25 WILL BE SHARED IN THE SPRING AND INTO THE SUMMER OF 2024.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **CHARLES LAVERY:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** YES.

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** I WANT TO ADD A LITTLE BIT TO THAT RESPONSE. ONE
9 OF THE VERY IMPORTANT STAGES IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE LONG
10 RANGE PLAN IS THE REVENUE FORECAST, RIGHT? AND AS HAS BEEN
11 DESCRIBED BY THE STAFF, UNDER FEDERAL LAW, WE HAVE TO MAKE THE
12 CASE THAT THIS IS FISCALLY CONSTRAINED, IT'S REASONABLE. SO
13 EVEN THOUGH WE'RE TALKING ABOUT ANTICIPATED FUNDING THAT'S NOT
14 BY DEFINITION THERE, BUT WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO MAKE THE CASE
15 THAT IT'S REASONABLE. WHAT STAFF HAVE DONE IN THIS FORECAST
16 CURRENTLY IS ASSUMED THAT THE FUTURE REVENUE UNDER DISCUSSION
17 WOULD GENERATE ABOUT A BILLION DOLLARS A YEAR IF I'M CORRECT.
18 WHEREAS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WE HAD ALMOST TWICE THAT WE HAVE
19 MORE AMBITIOUS REVENUE MEASURE SO IT'S POSSIBLE WE GET
20 DIRECTION FROM THE COMMISSION TO ENABLE LEGISLATION NEXT YEAR
21 FOR SOMETHING EVEN ARE LARGER THAN A BILLION DOLLARS WE COULD
22 FEED THAT INTO THE FORECAST AND MAKE THE CASE TO THE FEDERAL
23 HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION, THIS IS WHAT WE'RE GOING AFTER POLLING
24 SUGGESTS THIS IS NOT THERE YET SO WE'RE TAKING THE MORE
25 CONSERVATIVE APPROACH.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GERRY THEN GABRIELLE.

3

4 **GERRY GLASER:** THREE QUESTIONS, FIRST COMMENT IS THIS THE
5 APPENDIX WAS REALLY USEFUL THANKS FOR THE APPENDIX THAT WAS
6 INSIGHTFUL AND GAVE ME A GOOD IDEA OF THE KIND OF THINGS THAT
7 YOU'RE ASKING. THE SECOND WAS TALKING ABOUT PARKING AT TRANSIT
8 STATIONS APOLOGIES FOR BEING LATE THE REASON FOR BEING LATE
9 WAS HEADWAY AS A RESULT OF TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO PAY FOR
10 PARKING AT BART. WHICH IS DIFFERENT THAN PARKING AT OTHER
11 PLACES LIKE SONOMA COUNTY FOR SMART, THE NEW DIRECTOR SAID
12 THIS IS KIND OF -- WHY WOULD WE CHARGE YOU FOR PARKING. WE
13 WANT YOU TO USE THE TRAIN. SO THAT'S ONE THING WE MIGHT LOOK
14 AT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA PLUS. USING THE TERM LIVING WAGE AND
15 MINIMUM WAGE I WOULD LOVE FOR DOCUMENTS TO SAY LIVING WAGE.
16 DEFINITION OF LIVING WAGE IS DIFFERENT THAN IN OTHER PLACES,
17 ONE TIME A COMMISSIONER TOLD ME OH WE'RE GOING TO SOLVE THE
18 HOUSING PROJECT BY BUILDING A LOT MORE HOUSING. THE COST OF
19 BUILDING HOUSING IS INCREDIBLE. I DON'T KNOW HOW WE GET
20 AFFORDABLE HOUSING AS A RESULT OF BUILDING MORE HOW LONG. WE
21 HAVE TO FIGURE OUT A WAY TO SUPPLEMENT INCOMES. ANNE OLIVIA
22 AND I ARE ON DIFFERENT SIDES OF THESE BUT I DO AGREE THAT
23 EVERYBODY HAS TO HAVE A WAY TO MAKE THEIR WAY THROUGH THEIR
24 LIFE. SEA LEVEL RISE, I EXPECTED COST SOME PLACE CLOSER TO \$30
25 BILLION HIGHER I THINK IN REALITY ONLY FINISHED ADDRESSING --



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 [INDISCERNIBLE] NOT AT 85 BILLED. ONE COMMENT. ON TRANSIT
2 OPERATIONS. I LIKED ADINA'S POINT. WE NEED SHORTER HEADWAYS WE
3 NEED MORE TRANSIT. I'M HOPING THAT WITH REGIONAL NETWORK
4 MANAGEMENT ONE OF THE THINGS WE FOCUS ON IS HOW DO WE GET THE
5 TRANSIT THAT WE WANT WITH IT COSTING LESS. NOT FOR THE
6 CONSUMER, COSTING LESS FOR US TO ACTUALLY OPERATE IT BY MAKING
7 IT MORE EFFICIENT. WITH 27 TRANSIT DISTRICTS IT CERTAINLY
8 CAN'T BE THAT EFFICIENT. I'M HOPING WE LOOK AT THAT AND THE
9 MONEY SPENT TODAY WOULD GO FARTHER BECAUSE WE'RE DOING IT
10 SMARTER THAN WE WERE BEFORE. BECAUSE EVERYBODY IS GOING TO --
11 AS WAS POINTED OUT, ANNE ARCHITECT TO LOOK AT, IF YOU LOOK AT
12 ONE PROBLEM AT A TIME YOU DO NOT GET A SOLUTION YOU LOOK AT
13 ALL PROBLEMS AT ONE TIME YOU PUT THEM TOGETHER. SO, TO THE
14 QUESTIONS. [LAUGHTER] THERE ARE THREE QUESTIONS. ONE IS YOU
15 USE THE TERM FREQUENTLY IN HERE, INTEGRATE, AND I KNEW THAT
16 HAD NOT TO DO WITH COMMUNITIES, BUT IT HAD TO DO WITH
17 FUNCTION. BUT I WANE SURE EXACTLY WHAT THAT MEANT. AND IF YOU
18 BEING HIGHLIGHT WHAT KINDS OF THINGS FIT INTO INTEGRATION IN
19 THE SYSTEM. AND THEN THE OTHER QUESTION I WANT TO ASK -- AND I
20 REALLY WOULD LIKE TO GET AN ANSWER FROM YOU THOUGH -- WE TOOK
21 QUITE A BIT TO DO THE SURVEYS TO CONTACT PEOPLE. THERE IS A
22 LOT IN THE APPENDIX BUT IF YOU HOOK AT WHAT YOU EXPERIENCE,
23 WHAT ARE THE THREE MAJOR FINDINGS AS THE RESULT OF GETTING THE
24 INFORMATION FROM PEOPLE AND ASKING FOR INFORMATION? AND THEN
25 THE VERY LAST QUESTION IS, WHAT ARE THE THREE SURPRISES THAT



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 YOU GOT? WERE THERE SURPRISES? SO, THOSE ARE YOUR THREE
2 QUESTIONS. WHAT DOES THE INTEGRATE MEAN. WHAT ARE THE MAJOR
3 TAKE-AWAY'S. AND WHAT ARE THE THREE MAJOR SURPRISES?

4

5 **CHIRAG RABARI:** IF I MAY, COULD YOU SPECIFICALLY CLARIFY ON THE
6 INTEGRATE? I'M JUST NOT SURE WHICH SLIDE DISPLACE.

7

8 **GERRY GLASER:** A NUMBER OF SLIDES. I CAN TRY TO FIND IT.

9

10 **CHIRAG RABARI:** DOES IT MEAN WHAT DO WE MEAN BY INTEGRATING
11 FEEDBACK?

12

13 **GERRY GLASER:** NO. NO. NO. IT'S -- AND UNFORTUNATELY I GOT
14 SLIDES ALL OVER THE PLACE HERE NOW. WHY DON'T YOU ANSWER THE
15 OTHER ONES AND I'LL FIND INTEGRATE FOR YOU. [LAUGHTER]

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD SAY, SURPRISINGLY, I HAVE BEEN WITH MTC -- I
18 MEAN, I TOOK A BREAK FOR A LITTLE BIT, BUT I HAVE BEEN WITH
19 MTC FOR A LONG TIME. THIS IS THE FIRST TIME IN PUBLIC
20 ENGAGEMENT THAT THE SENTIMENT OF HOPELESSNESS, HELPLESSNESS
21 AND JUST HOW GLOOMY THE SITUATION WAS FOR FOLKS, AND WE'RE
22 SEEING THAT ACROSS OTHER PROJECTS SO THAT WAS MOST SURPRISING.
23 IN THE PAST THERE HAS ALWAYS BEEN SOME, SORT OF, OPTIMISM,
24 THERE WAS DEFINITELY NOT THAT DURING THIS ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT.
25 AND TOP THREE TAKE-AWAY'S, DEFINITELY THE COST OF LIVING,



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 INFLATION, AND THE COST OF LIVING, HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, AND
2 TRANSIT WERE THE TOP THREE THINGS WE HEARD.

3

4 **GERRY GLASER:** YEAH. THE HOUSING ONE IS ONE THAT BOTHERS ME THE
5 MOST BECAUSE EVEN THE TRANSIT IS EXPENSIVE, BUT THE HOUSING IS
6 ATROCIOUS. I DON'T KNOW MANY PEOPLE THAT I HAVE EXPERIENCE
7 WITH WHO CAN FIGURE OUT HOW TO PAY FOR THEIR HOUSING. IT'S A
8 SMALL PORTION OF THE POPULATION HERE. SOMEBODY CORRECTED ME IN
9 ONE TALK I WAS GIVING WHERE I SAID 50% OF THE BAY AREA RENTS.
10 AND THIS GUY WALKED UP TO ME AND SAID NO, WRONG ANSWER. 60% OF
11 THE BAY AREA RENTS. WELL WHY IS THAT? THEY CANT AFFORD TO OWN.
12 THEY COULD INTEGRATE --

13

14 **CHIRAG RABARI:** I THINK I FOUND YOUR REFERENCE. THERE WAS
15 ONE REFERENCE TO THE TRANSIT 2050 PLUS AND THAT EFFORTS THAT
16 YOU RECOMMENDATION RECOMMENDED WILL BE INTEGRATED INTO PLANNED
17 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS.

18

19 **GERRY GLASER:** I THOUGHT THERE WAS SOME PLACE ELSE IN HERE
20 BECAUSE IT TALKED ABOUT INTEGRATING SOME FEATURES.

21

22 **CHIRAG RABARI:** WE ALSO HAVE REFERENCE INTEGRATING AREAS
23 SUBJECT TO THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY POLICY AS PART OF
24 OUR GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES.

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **GERRY GLASER:** I THINK THAT WAS PROBABLY PART OF THE REFERENCE.

2

3 **CHIRAG RABARI:** ESSENTIALLY WE HAVE OUR GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES
4 WHERE WE TRY TO PRIORITIZE HOUSING AND JOBS GROWTH AND THOSE
5 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES ARE COMPRISED OF A NUMBER OF AREAS,
6 INCLUDING PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS, HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS,
7 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS, AS WELL AS PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREAS. SO,
8 THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY THAT WAS RECENTLY
9 ADOPTED, THAT DEFINITION HAS EXPANDED AREAS THAT MAY QUALIFY
10 FOR THAT TRANSIT-RICH DEFINITION, OVER THE KIND OF -- THE
11 PLANNING HORIZON OF THE PLAN. SO, WE WILL INTEGRATE AREAS THAT
12 ARE, YOU KNOW, NOW, NEWLY DEFINED AS TRANSIT-RICH BASED UPON
13 THE, AGAIN, THIS IMPLEMENTATION EFFORT OF REVAMPING OUR
14 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY.

15

16 **GERRY GLASER:** VERY GOOD. PART OF WHAT I WAS LOOKING FOR, I
17 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S THE CASE -- I'M GLAD YOU FOUND THE
18 REFERENCE, BRT, ESPECIALLY IF IT HAS DEDICATED LANES AND
19 STATIONS AND WHATEVER, OUGHT TO BE PART OF TRANSIT-RICH.

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GABRIELLE THEN PAM.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I THINK IT WAS SLIDE 12 THAT REFERENCED HUGE INCREASE
24 IN HOUSING PRODUCTION AND A LOT OF THAT BEING DUE TO INTEREST
25 RATE ENVIRONMENT I GUESS QUICK QUESTION ON THAT IS IF THE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 CURRENT INTEREST RATE ENVIRONMENT IS A REASONABLE ASSUMPTION
2 TO USE FOR THE LONG-TERM IF I'M UNDERSTANDING THAT CORRECTLY?
3 THAT YOU'RE USING CHANGES DUE TO THE FACT THAT YOU'RE
4 ASSESSING BASED ON THE CURRENT INTEREST RATE ENVIRONMENT
5 PROJECTED OUT INTO THE FUTURE AND IS IT REASONABLE TO ASSUME
6 IF INTEREST RATES MIGHT FALL DOWN AT SOME POINT IN THE FUTURE.

7

8 **CHIRAG RABARI:** GOOD QUESTION. HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP WITH YOU ON.
9 MY BELIEF IS THE CURRENT INTEREST RATE ENVIRONMENT HAS HELPED
10 TO -- HELP US IDENTIFY THE BASELINE COST, BUT UNFORTUNATELY, I
11 DO NOT RECALL WHAT, SORT OF, ASSUMPTION WE'RE MAKING ABOUT
12 KIND OF WHETHER THESE RATES ARE GOING TO PERSIST IN THE FUTURE
13 AND WHETHER THAT'S DRIVING SOME OF THESE HIGHER COSTS. WE
14 WOULD BE HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP WITH YOU ON THAT SPECIFIC
15 TECHNICAL CLARIFICATION.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ON ATTACHMENT B, ALL OF THE PUBLIC
18 ENGAGEMENT WORK, FANTASTIC. I NOTICED THERE WAS A CALL-OUT, OR
19 A REFERENCE TO REACHING OUT TO THE 31 TRIBES, BAY AREA TRIBES,
20 AND IT SEEMS LIKE THAT WAS DONE I HAVE A KIND OF A LETTER
21 ENGAGEMENT, IF THAT WE RECEIVED FEEDBACK FROM ONE OF THOSE
22 TRIBES. SO, I GUESS PART OF THE QUESTION WAS, ONE OUT OF 31
23 DOESN'T SEEM GREAT. IS THERE OTHER METHODS OF COMMUNICATION
24 THAT WE CAN DO, TO GET BETTER FEEDBACK IN THE FUTURE?

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** WE ARE WORKING TO ENGAGE OUR TRIBES WITH THE
2 FEDERALLY RECOGNIZED TRIBES AND THE NON-FEDERALLY RECOGNIZED
3 TRIBES. THAT LETTER IS A REQUIREMENT OF A.B. 52. BUT WE ARE
4 WORKING TO IDENTIFY A COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION THAT SERVES
5 TRIBES. SO, WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON IDENTIFYING CONTACTS AND
6 BUILDING RELATIONSHIPS. BUT AS OF THIS DATE, WE HAVEN'T BEEN
7 SUCCESSFUL. BUT, WE ARE CONTINUING TO TRY. AND I'LL JUST
8 REMIND YOU ALL THAT WE HAVE ANOTHER THREE ROUNDS OF ENGAGEMENT
9 COMING UP, SO WE'RE STILL CONTINUING TO BUILD THOSE
10 RELATIONSHIPS AND IDENTIFY THEM.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. HOPEFULLY WE CAN, IN THE FUTURE. YEAH. THAT
13 WOULD BE GREAT. AND ON ATTACHMENT G, IT LOOKED LIKE IN EACH OF
14 THE STRATEGIES THERE WAS REFERENCE TO WHAT WAS CHANGING FOR
15 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS, CHANGES IN ASSUMPTIONS. STRATEGY
16 H8, OR REALLY NONE OF THE STRATEGIES I NOTICED WHEN IT CAME TO
17 HOUSING DIDN'T SEEM TO REFERENCE ANY OF THE INTERIM HOUSING
18 OPTIONS. THINGS LIKE TINY HOMES OR MODULAR STYLE BUILDINGS
19 THAT ARE BUILT IN CITIES IN THE BAY AREA AND I WONDER IF THOSE
20 TYPES OF INTERIM HOUSING OPTIONS SHOULD BE INCLUDED IN THE
21 TYPES OF BUILDINGS THAT WE WANT TO BUILD OVER THE NEXT NUMBER
22 OF YEARS. BECAUSE IT SEEMS LIKE WE ALREADY ARE. SO WE PROBABLY
23 -- I DON'T KNOW. IT SEEMS LIKE SOMETHING TO CONSIDER. AND THEN
24 MY LAST COMMENT WAS ON STRATEGY H1, THERE IS A RECOMMENDATION
25 FOR A MAXIMUM RENT INCREASE, I THINK REGIONALLY OF, LIKE, 4.1



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 ACCIDENT OR 4% PER YEAR. AND PART OF THAT, IT SEEMED LIKE HAD
2 TO DO WITH INFLATION CONCERNS. AND WHICH IS GREAT THAT WE'RE
3 CONSIDERING THAT. BUT I WONDER IF THE STRATEGY INCLUDES HOW TO
4 SUPPORT THE, NOT JUST RENTERS, BUT LANDLORDS ON THE OTHER SIDE
5 OF THAT. SO, DURING THE PANDEMIC, AND THE EVICTION MORATORIUMS
6 THAT WE HAD, THERE WAS PROTECTIONS FOR RENTERS, BUT THIS WAS
7 ASSOCIATED DEMANDS FOR PROTECTIONS FOR LANDLORDS TOO. JUST
8 BECAUSE YOU DON'T HAVE INCOME COMING IN, ALL OF A SUDDEN, IT'S
9 NOT LIKE MONEY IS MADE OUT OF THIN AIR THERE HAS TO BE SOME
10 SUPPORT. SO I'M WONDERING IF WE'RE THINKING ABOUT A CAP AT
11 4.4% ARE WE CONSIDERING HOW TO SUPPORT LANDLORDS, ESPECIALLY
12 SMALL LANDLORDS THAT HAVE SECTION-8 TENANTS, LANDLORDS THAT
13 HAVE AFFORDABLE HOUSING? THAT, SORT OF, THING. SO I WANT TO --
14 THAT'S A COMMENT. AND A QUESTION RIGHT OFF THE BAT, IF YOUR
15 UNDERSTANDING IS WHETHER THERE IS EITHER THAT STRATEGY OR
16 ANOTHER STRATEGY THAT INCLUDES THE SUPPORT ON THE OTHER END OF
17 THE EQUATION WITH LANDLORDS?

18

19 **CHIRAG RABARI:** THAT IS NOT A PART OF THE SCOPE OF THE
20 STRATEGY, AS IT EXISTS. BUT, OBVIOUSLY HAPPY TO TAKE THAT
21 AROUND CONSIDERATION AS A COMMENT. AND FOR YOUR EARLIER, I
22 THINK, COMMENT ABOUT THE, YOU KNOW, INTERIM SOLUTIONS. SO, WE
23 ARE CONSIDERING, AS MENTIONED, SORT OF, OTHER MODELS,
24 CONSTRUCTION MODELS, FINANCE MODELS THAT COULD HELP BRING
25 THOSE PER UNIT COST DOWN. BECAUSE THOSE PER UNIT COSTS ARE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 EXTREMELY HIGH. SO HAPPY TO SHARE THAT WITH OUR HOUSING
2 FINANCE TEAM AS SOMETHING TO CONSIDER AS THEY CONSIDER HOW WE
3 MIGHT BE ABLE TO BRING THESE COSTS DOWN AND DELIVER MORE
4 HOUSING.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. PAM?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT REALLY GREAT
11 PRESENTATION, AND I WAS VERY EXCITED TO BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE
12 IN ONE OF THE BOOTHS DURING THE SUMMER OUTREACH. I WANT TO
13 REITERATE THAT THE BOTH I ATTENDED WAS 1 OF 2 IN A LARGE
14 COUNTY WITH MANY PEOPLE THAT HAD A FIVE THERE COST TO ACCESS.
15 WHILE IT WAS AN INCREDIBLE WELL STAFFED BOOTH AND ENGAGING, IT
16 WAS NOT ACCESSIBLE TO EVERYONE. AND MY COMMENTS ARE, I'M
17 CURIOUS, WERE THERE PEOPLE WHO GOT REALLY EXCITED ABOUT THE
18 WORK THAT YOU WERE DOING, DID YOU TRACK OR KEEP CONTACTS OF
19 FOLKS WHO COULD POTENTIALLY BECOME COMMUNITY LEADERS OR MTC
20 AMBASSADORS IN THEIR COMMUNITY TO MAKE SURE WE'RE DOING MORE
21 COMMUNITY OUTREACH? I KNOW THAT MTC CAN'T BE EVERYWHERE, BUT
22 CAN WE PARTNER WITH CBOS TO GET MORE IN COMMUNITY PROGRAMMING,
23 HAVING PEOPLE SHOW UP AT PDA AND NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION
24 MEETINGS TO ENCOURAGE FOLKS TO TAKE THE SURVEY, OR BEING WHERE
25 PEOPLE ACTUALLY NEED TO GO, GROCERY STORES AND GAS STATIONS?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** SO, WE DO KEEP -- WE DO REQUEST FOLKS TO SIGN UP FOR
3 OUR MAILING LIST TO STAY INVOLVED IN THE PROCESS. AND WE DID
4 PARTNER WITH -- WE STARTED OUT WITH 16 CBOS FOR ROUND ONE OF
5 ENGAGEMENT, ONLY 14 WERE ABLE TO FULLY PARTICIPATE IN ENGAGING
6 FOLKS. WE HAD CBOS THAT SERVED IN EVERYTHING FROM LIMITED
7 ENGLISH PROFICIENCY COMMUNITIES, LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES,
8 COMMUNITIES OF COLOR, WE ARE CONTINUING TO PARTNER WITH OUR
9 CBOS WE DO PAY -- UNFORTUNATELY, WE DON'T HAVE A BUDGET FOR
10 THAT, BUT WE PRIORITIZE COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS VERSUS
11 INDIVIDUALS.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THAT'S AWESOME ESPECIALLY GIVEN THAT
14 CBOS KNOW THEIR COMMUNITY BEST THEY KNOW HOW DO THEIR LOCAL
15 OUTREACH JUST HAVING A SMALL TABLE WITH AMAZING COLORING BOOKS
16 THAT INVITE CHILDREN TO COME, THAT INVITE PARENTS TO STAY AND
17 CHAT FOR A LITTLE WHILE, GETS MORE PARTICIPATION. 16,000
18 SURVEY RESPONSES FOR NINE OF OUR COUNTIES SEEMS LIKE A DROP IN
19 THE BUCKET. SO I'M THINKING OF WAYS WHERE WE CAN GET MORE
20 PEOPLE PARTICIPATION, AND ESPECIALLY, AT GROCERY STORES AND AT
21 GAS STATIONS WHERE PEOPLE ARE ALWAYS GOING TO GO. AND
22 CONSIDERING GAS STATIONS COULD BRING UP THAT QUESTION OF WHY
23 AREN'T YOU TAKING PUBLIC TRANSIT? WHY ARE YOU CONTINUING TO
24 STOP AND GET GAS AND USE YOUR CAR. DO YOU WANT TO SUPPORT
25 GETTING OFF CARS OFF THE ROAD AND ON TO PUBLIC TRANSIT SOME



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 COMMENTS ABOUT WHAT I FOUND MOST CONCERNING WITH THE PLANNED
2 BAY AREA 2050 PLUS UPDATES IS EMPHASIZING ON OUR SHRINKING
3 MIDDLE CLASS I DIDN'T SEE ENOUGH SPECIFIC STRATEGIES OR
4 ATTENTION TO THIS. OUR HOUSING GENTRIFICATION IS CAUSED BY
5 RACISM, WE HAVE IT BAD HERE BECAUSE OF OUR INCOME INEQUALITY
6 AND I'M CURIOUS TO KNOW WHAT WE'RE DOING TO CHANGE THIS. I
7 MEAN, IF WE HAVE PEOPLE WHO ARE EXCITED ABOUT WHAT IT MEANS TO
8 BUILD PUBLIC TRANSIT, WHAT IT MEANS TO CONNECT, LOW RESOURCE
9 AREAS, TO HIGH-RESOURCE AREAS OF OPPORTUNITY AND SEE
10 THEMSELVES IN THIS ISSUE, CAN WE GET MORE PEOPLE ACTIVATED AND
11 ENSURING THAT WE HAVE A SUCCESSFUL REGIONAL MEASURE THAT
12 PASSES. ESPECIALLY WHEN IT COMES TO BUILDING THE MIDDLE CLASS
13 WE DIDN'T CONTINUE TO BUILD WEALTHY AND LOW-INCOME COMMUNITIES
14 AND EVAPORATE A MIDDLE CLASS. WE NEED WORKING PEOPLE TO
15 CEMETERY OUR REGION. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PUBLIC
16 TRANSIT, THAT THEY HAVE ACCESS TO, IS A WAY THAT ALLOWS THEM
17 TO TRAVEL FROM THESE GROWING LOWER SOCIO-ECONOMIC
18 NEIGHBORHOODS TO GO TO AREAS OF EMPLOYMENT, AREAS OF
19 EDUCATION, AND AREAS OF ECONOMIC MOBILITY OPPORTUNITY. SO, I
20 DON'T WANT OUR EQUITY GOALS TO JUST BE A STATEMENT. I WANT
21 THEM TO BE A PLAN OF ACTION.

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND I'LL WRAP IT UP WITH JUST
24 A COMMENT. THANK YOU. IT'S BEEN A VERY GREAT IN-DEPTH
25 CONVERSATION. THERE IS A LITTLE TENSION FOR ME ON THE PROPOSED



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 STRATEGY REFINEMENTS ON PAGE 16 AND THE PLANNING ASSUMPTIONS
2 DRAFT ENVIRONMENT NEEDS ON PAGE 13 REGARDING -- REGARDING EN
3 SIX MODERNIZING EXPANDING PARKS AND TRAILS AND REMOVING LOCAL
4 POLICY BARRIERS TO BUILDING HOUSING AND SUPPORTING INNOVATION.
5 IT'S SPECIFICALLY WITHIN THE TOCS, THE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT
6 AREAS AND BAHFA PILOT PROGRAMS. IN ORDER TO GAIN THE UNITS PER
7 ACRE THAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR IN OUR TOCS AND OUR PDAS, WE LOSE
8 PARKLAND. WE LOSE -- AND THE CITIES CONCEDE THE PARKLAND
9 REQUIREMENTS. WE LOSE TRAILS, WE LOSE ACCESS TO OUTDOOR AREAS.
10 AND, SO, THAT CONFLICTS WITH DEVELOPING NEW ONES. I WOULD LIKE
11 TO SEE THE NET LOSS OF THESE PROGRAMS. BECAUSE IF WE WERE TO
12 BE STICKING, FOR INSTANCE, WITH JUST THE CITY OF SAN JOSE'S
13 GUIDELINES ON PARK LANDS -- SINCE IT'S THE LARGEST CITY IN THE
14 BAY AREA -- WHAT ARE WE LOSING WHEN WE CONVERT THOSE -- WHEN
15 WE LOSE THOSE -- THAT SQUARE FOOTAGE THAT THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO
16 BE SUPPLYING PER UNIT? IT DOESN'T SHOW UP ANYWHERE. AND I'M
17 NOT SURE THAT THE CITY -- MAYBE THE CITY OF SAN JOSE HAS DONE
18 THAT ANALYSIS, BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE GOOD ACROSS THE BOARD
19 TO ADMIT WE ARE LOSING THAT, BECAUSE WE CAN'T FIX SOMETHING IF
20 WE DON'T QUANTIFY WHAT THE PROBLEM IS. WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO
21 CLOSE OUT THIS AGENDA ITEM BY ASKING THE CLERK IF THERE IS ANY
22 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD
23 LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR
24 DIAL STAR NINE. IF THERE IS ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO
25 WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK IN-PERSON HERE, FORM A LINE NEAR THE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. I SEE ONE
2 PERSON. NO? I SEE THAT PERSON DASHING FROM THE ROOM. I HAVE
3 NEVER HAD THAT HAPPEN. [LAUGHTER]

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
6 THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. HOW MUCH TIME
7 WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE THEM?

8

9 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. CHRIS. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
12 YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

13

14 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** GREAT COMMENTS ALL THE WAY AROUND. I
15 WILL PUT A VOICE OUT THERE TO SPEAKING ON, THERE IS A -- THERE
16 IS A FAMOUS MOUSE WHOSE FATHER PROPOSED A PILOT COMMUNITY
17 CALLED EPCOT. LOOKING AT WHAT WE WERE DOING, OR WHAT WE'RE
18 GOING TO DO IN THE FUTURE, THERE HAS TO BE A BALANCE BETWEEN
19 THE GREENBELTS AND NON-GREENBELT AREAS. AND I WOULD HAVE TO
20 AGREE WITH CHAIR KINMAN, IN THAT WE REALLY HAVE TO LOOK AT THE
21 WHOLE PICTURE AND NOT JUST ONE OR TWO PARTS. THE
22 INTERCONNECTIVITY OF COMMUNITY -- OR TRANSPORTATION IS VITAL.
23 MANY YEARS AGO, FOUR OR FIVE, VTA DID A PRESENTATION ON WHAT
24 COULD BE IN THE FUTURE, AND THE CONCEPT FOR IT WAS GREAT. THEY
25 REALLY ALLOCATE TO GET GOODS AND SERVICES FROM ONE PLACE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 ANOTHER EFFICIENTLY, GIVEN THERE WERE LESS ROADS. SO THERE HAS
2 TO BE A BALANCE. THE EPCOT CONCEPT TO ME MAKES A LOT OF SENSE.
3 BUT THERE HAS TO BE A BALANCE BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW ABOUT
4 EVERYBODY ELSE AROUND THE TABLE, I DON'T WANT TO LIVE IN A
5 CONCRETE JUNGLE, I WANT TO LIVE IN A BALANCED SOCIETY WHERE
6 ALL CAN GET AROUND.

7

8 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHRISTINE. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC
9 SPEAKERS.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
12 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
13 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON
14 THIS ITEM.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL CLOSE OUT THIS
17 ITEM AND WE'LL GO TO 5B, THE 2024 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM FOR
18 MTC AND ABAG, EXPRESSING THE AGENCY'S STATE AND FEDERAL
19 LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. GEORGIA
20 GANN DOHRMANN WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. GEORGIA, APOLOGIES FOR
21 US RUNNING LATE. THANK YOU FOR BEING PATIENT.

22

23 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN, MTC STAFF,
24 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR FOR LEGISLATION AND RESEARCH ON THE TEAM.
25 JUST GIVEN THE TIME, WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO TODAY IS, SORT



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 OF, GIVE YOU AN OVERVIEW OF WHAT THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM -- OH,
2 THANK YOU KY-NAM -- WHAT THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM IS, WHAT WE'RE
3 ASKING FROM YOU TODAY, AND THEN WALK THROUGH -- THIS IS A TEN
4 PAGE DOCUMENT THAT YOU HAVE ON WHAT OUR PROPOSED ADVOCACY
5 PRIORITIES ARE, BUT WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO IS REALLY PULL OUT
6 WHAT I THINK THE, SORT OF, HIGHEST PRIORITIES ARE GOING TO BE
7 IN SACRAMENTO TAKE A PAUSE, GET YOUR FEEDBACK, AND THEN TURN
8 TO WHAT WE THINK MIGHT TAKE UP A LOT OF ENERGY IN WASHINGTON,
9 D.C. THIS YEAR. SO, I THINK THROUGH THE CHAIR, YOU CAN TELL ME
10 TO AHEAD. OKAY GREAT. I'LL GO THROUGH THE DRILL WE HAVE QUITE
11 A FEW COLONEL MEMBERS HERE TODAY. EVERY YEAR MTC AND ABAG
12 ADOPT A JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM, THE PROGRAM IS A SET OF GOALS
13 AND OUTCOMES WE WOULD LIKE TO ACHIEVE IN SACRAMENTO AND IN
14 WASHINGTON, D.C. AND THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM THEN GUIDES HOW THE
15 LEGISLATIVE TEAM, SORT OF, APPROACHES OUR ANALYZING OF BILLS
16 AND OTHER LEGISLATIVE PROPOSALS THAT COME OUT AT THE STATE
17 LEVEL AND AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL. AND IT ALSO THEN REALLY GUIDES
18 WHAT BILLS WE DECIDE TO COME AND TAKE TO THE LEGISLATION
19 COMMITTEE THROUGH THE COMMISSION AND ABAG TO TAKE POSITIONS ON
20 BILLS. SO, IT DOESN'T REALLY STATE EVERY SINGLE THING WE THINK
21 WE'RE GOING TO ENGAGE ON, IT'S REALLY MORE FOCUSED ON GENERAL
22 CATEGORIES. THE TIMING IS THAT WE SPEND THE FALL GETTING
23 FEEDBACK FROM THE IMPORTANT STAKEHOLDERS INCLUDING POLICY
24 ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND THEN IN NOVEMBER WE TAKE THE DRAFT
25 ADVOCACY PROGRAM A REVISED VERSION OF WHAT YOU SEE HERE, TO



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE, THE MTC ABAG JOINT LEGISLATION
2 COMMITTEE WE TAKE FURTHER FEEDBACK THERE WE BRING PROPOSED
3 FINAL ADVOCACY PROGRAM TO THE COMMITTEE IN DECEMBER THEN ASK
4 FOR IT TO BE MOVED TO ADOPTION BY THE COMMISSION IN DECEMBER
5 JANUARY AND FEBRUARY. THAT IS THE TIMELINE, YOU COULD FOLLOW
6 UP WITH ME AFTER IF THERE IS NOT ENOUGH TIME FOR FEEDBACK AND
7 COMMENTS. I'LL BE ABLE TO TAKE THAT THEM INTO ACCOUNT WITH
8 WHAT WE BRING TO THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. WITH THAT, I WANT
9 TO START AT THE STATE LEVEL. I THINK, YOU KNOW, THE WAY THAT
10 WE HAVE STRUCTURED THIS PROGRAM IS REALLY AROUND -- IT'S
11 REALLY, SORT OF, ITEMS IN LEVEL OF IMPORTANCE AROUND WHAT WE
12 THINK IS GOING TO TAKE WHERE MTC COULD BE, SORT OF, LEADING A
13 LOT OF THE EFFORTS IN SACRAMENTO AND WHERE WE THINK THERE IS
14 GOING TO TAKE THE MOST STAFF CAPACITY. SO, WHAT WE ANTICIPATE
15 ARE OR ARE PROPOSING TO BRING IS, SORT OF, THE BIGGEST AMOUNT
16 OF ENERGY THAT STAFF SPENDS THIS YEAR BE ON SEEKING
17 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION FOR A FUTURE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
18 REVENUE MEASURE. SO, WE WOULD SEEK AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION IN
19 2024 TO BRING A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE TO THE
20 BALLOT IN 2026. THIS IS BASICALLY TEEING US UP. WHAT THE
21 LEGISLATION TEAM DID BACK IN 2019 WAS AROUND SECURING
22 AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION TO BRING A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE TO
23 THE BALLOT AND THEN AFTER WE SECURE THAT AUTHORIZATION, IT,
24 SORT OF, MOVES OVER TO THE OTHER TEAMS WHO DO THE
25 IMPLEMENTATION AND THEY WORK ON MAKING SURE WE CAN MOVE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 FORWARD THAT REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE AND WHAT WE'RE DOING NOW
2 IS SEPARATING AND GOING TO THE LEGISLATURE AND SAYING WE WANT
3 TO TEE UP WHAT WE NEED TO DO IN TRANSPORTATION. JUST TO TIE IT
4 BACK TO THE PREVIOUS ITEM, THIS PROPOSAL TO SEEK AUTHORIZING
5 LEGISLATION IS REALLY THE WAY THAT WE ARE, SORT OF, MOVING
6 FORWARD WITH TRYING TO GET THAT ANTICIPATED NEW REVENUE IN THE
7 PLAN. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. SO, THAT WILL BE A LIFT THIS
8 YEAR. THE OTHER ITEM THAT I THINK IS GOING TO TAKE, YOU KNOW,
9 WE'RE PROPOSING THAT WE, SORT OF, ALLOT A LOT OF SPACE AND
10 ENERGY TO IS MAINTAINING THE TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING THAT WE
11 WERE ABLE TO SECURE THROUGH LAST YEAR'S BUDGET. SO, WHAT THE
12 GOVERNOR AND THE LEGISLATOR WERE ABLE TO DO IN 2023 IS THEY
13 WERE ABLE TO PROVIDE AND SENSE OF CERTAINTY TO MTC AND TRANSIT
14 OPERATORS IN THE BAY AREA THAT WE WOULD HAVE SOME STATE
15 RESOURCES THAT ARE GOING TO COME IN THIS YEAR AND THEN IN
16 FUTURE YEARS TO KEEP OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS OPERATING AND TO
17 AVOID GOING OVER THAT FISCAL CLIFF. BUT THE LEGISLATURE DIDN'T
18 GIVE US ALL THE MONEY AT ONCE. THEY'RE GOING TO -- WE NEED TO
19 GO BACK TO THEM EVERY YEAR AND MAKE SURE THE MONEY THAT THEY
20 SAID WAS GOING TO BE THERE ACTUALLY COMES TO FRUITION.
21 HOPEFULLY EVERYBODY IS ON BOARD AND IT DOESN'T END UP NEEDING
22 TO TAKE A LOT OF OUR TIME TO ADVOCATE FOR. BUT THERE IS ALWAYS
23 THE CHANCE THAT WITH TIGHT BUDGET IT IS DOESN'T AND WE NEED TO
24 ALLOT TIME FOR THAT. JUMPING TO NUMBER TWO ON PAGE TWO OF YOUR
25 HANDOUT, WHERE WE EXPECT TO SPEND A LOT OF EFFORT IS TO



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 SUPPORT TRANSIT SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS THAT ENHANCE COORDINATION
2 AND IMPROVE THE RIDER EXPERIENCE. SO THE WAY I VIEW THIS IS,
3 LIKE, THE NUMBER ONE ON OUR ADVOCACY PROGRAM IS AROUND
4 RESOURCES AND MONEY AND NUMBER TWO IS MAKING SURE THOSE
5 RESOURCES AND MONEY ARE SPENT IN A WAY THAT REALLY DELIVERS ON
6 IMPROVEMENTS AND BENEFITS TO TRANSIT RIDERS. AND REALLY, ALL
7 USERS OF THE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK IN THE BAY AREA. I'M GOING
8 TO JUMP DOWN TO NUMBER THREE. SO THIS, IS WHERE WE GET INTO
9 HOUSING. AND YOU WILL SEE 3A IS AROUND THE BAY AREA HOUSING
10 FINANCE AUTHORITY. AND WHAT THIS ITEM IS LOOKING TO IS DOING
11 WHAT WE CAN IN SACRAMENTO TO TEE US UP IN THE BAY AREA TO BE
12 SUCCESSFUL WITH A REGIONAL HOUSING REVENUE MEASURE IN 2024.
13 AND REALLY THE CONTEXT HERE IS THAT THERE IS AN EFFORT AT THE
14 STATE LEVEL TO LOWER THE VOTE THRESHOLD FOR OUR REGIONAL
15 HOUSING MEASURE. AN ASSEMBLY CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT DID PASS
16 LAST YEAR THAT WOULD PLACE AN AMENDMENT ON THE NOVEMBER 2024
17 BALLOT AN OPTION TO CONSIDER LOWERING THE VOTE THRESHOLD TO
18 55% INSTEAD OF 2/3 THAT WOULD APPLY TO OUR REGIONAL HOUSING
19 MEASURE. THAT BILL MOVED THROUGH QUICKLY AT THE END OF LAST
20 YEAR AND THERE IS, SORT OF, AN EFFORT AROUND RIGHT NOW LOOKING
21 AT IT, ANALYZING IT AND SEEING WHAT CHANGES, IF ANY, NEED TO
22 BE MADE TO THAT CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT TO MAKE IT BASICALLY
23 -- GET IT IN THE BEST SHAPE TO BE PASSABLE BY VOTER VOTERS.
24 ONE OF THE THINGS FOLKS ARE LOOKING AT UP IN SACRAMENTO IS DO
25 WE NEED TO TIGHT END UP, LIMIT THE TYPES OF INFRASTRUCTURE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 THAT CAN BE SUBJECT TO A 55% VOTE INSTEAD OF 2/3 WE EXPECT
2 WE'LL BE ENGAGED IN THAT CONVERSATION UP IN SACRAMENTO AGAIN
3 WITH THE AIM OF HELPING TO MAKE SURE THAT ACA1 ITSELF IS
4 ACTUALLY POSSIBLE. IN THE ITEMS ON HOUSING PRESERVATION YOU
5 HAVE SEEN THIS OFTEN IT'S PRETTY CONSISTENT WITH WHAT WE HAD
6 IN OUR PREVIOUS ADVOCACY PROGRAM WHICH IS WE WANT TO UP IN
7 SACRAMENTO SUPPORTING RESOURCES NEEDED FOR US TO BUILD MORE
8 AFFORDABLE HOUSING ON THE GROUND, TO SUPPORT THE BAY AREA
9 HOUSING FINANCING AUTHORITY'S PILOTS THAT ARE GETTING ON THE
10 GROUND TO TRY TO REALLY PUT IN GOOD PROGRAMS THAT CAN HELP
11 DELIVER NEW AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS AND PRESERVATION
12 PROJECTS. AND THEN, ALSO RELATE THE TO THINGS, LIKE,
13 STREAMLINING AND CREATING NEW TOOLS FOR HOLE GOVERNMENTS TO BE
14 ABLE TO ACTUALLY REALIZE THEIR HOUSING GOALS. NUMBER FOUR ON
15 HERE IS ABOUT CALLING IT SUSTAINABLE AND EQUITABLE
16 TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE. AND THIS IS REALLY ABOUT THE MEAT
17 OF WHAT YOU ALL JUST DISCUSSED IN YOUR LAST ITEM. SO, WHAT
18 THIS COVERS IS CHANGES THAT MIGHT BE MADE UP IN SACRAMENTO TO
19 EITHER PROVIDE MTC AND OTHER REGIONS WITH MORE TOOLS TO
20 IMPLEMENT OUR SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES STRATEGIES. SO, ONE OF
21 THE THINGS THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT WITH 4A IS THE POTENTIAL FOR
22 THE STATE TO PROVIDE SOME ADDITIONAL ACTUAL FLEXIBLE RESOURCES
23 TO MTC AND OTHER REGIONS THAT CAN SAY, YOU GUYS HAVE
24 IDENTIFIED SIX STRATEGIES THAT ARE REALLY GOING TO BE GAME
25 CHANGES TO MEETING YOUR HOUSING GOALS OR EQUITY GOALS OR YOUR



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 CLIMATE GOALS APPROXIMATE ALL OF THEM AND HERE ARE SOME
2 RESOURCES TO USE THAT TO IMPLEMENT. THERE HAS STARTED TO BE
3 INTEREST IN SACRAMENTO IN FOLKS AGAIN PROVIDING MORE MONEY AND
4 MORE POLICY RESOURCES TO HELP SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY STRATEGIES
5 NOT JUST TO BE A PLAN THAT SITS ON A SHELF BUT SOMETHING THAT
6 MAKES REAL CHANGE ON THE GROUND SO CERTAINLY WE'LL BE INVOLVED
7 IN THOSE CONVERSATIONS. NEXT PIECE IS 4B, POTENTIAL CHANGES UP
8 IN SACRAMENTO TO THE SENATE BILL 375 LAW THAT CREATED THE
9 SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES STRATEGY MANDATE AND THE REGIONAL
10 HOUSING NEEDS ASSESSMENT PROCESS. MANY OF YOU ARE PROBABLY
11 THINKING, WELL, WE ARE JUST FINISHING OUR HOUSING ELEMENTS AND
12 OUR HOUSING PLANNING PROCESSES IN THE BAY AREA, SO WHY ARE WE
13 GOING TO BE THINKING ABOUT REFORM ALREADY IN SACRAMENTO. AND
14 THE REASON IS THAT SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA IS ON, SORT OF, AN
15 EARLIER SCHEDULE THAN THE BAY AREA, AND SO FOR ANY LAWS TO
16 MAKE A DIFFERENCE ON WHAT SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA DOES WITH THEIR
17 NEXT TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE PLANNING CYCLES, BILLS REALLY
18 NEED TO BE PASSED IN 2024 THAT THEN IMPACT THEIR NEXT ROUND OF
19 PLANNING. SO, I THINK, YOU KNOW, I DON'T NEED TO READ THROUGH
20 THE PRINCIPLES HERE, BECAUSE YOU HAVE GOT THEM. BUT WHAT MTC
21 AND ABAG, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING TO DO IS REALLY
22 APPROACH THOSE REFORM DISCUSSIONS WITH THE AIM OF HAVING ANY
23 NEW PLANNING RULES, ALLOW US TO STILL SUPPORT THE GUIDING
24 PRINCIPLES OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND ANY FUTURE PLANS. SO,
25 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. WE REALLY WANT TO ALSO MAKE SURE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 THAT WE HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY AND THE GUIDANCE FROM THE STATE
2 TO BALANCE WHAT CAN SOMETIMES BE, YOU KNOW, COMPETING GOALS,
3 AND/OR COMPLIMENTARY GOALS AROUND THINGS LIKE PLANNING FOR
4 HOUSING, PRESERVING OPEN SPACE, YOU KNOW, SUPPORTING
5 AFFIRMATIVELY FURTHERING FAIR HOUSING AND ACHIEVING CLIMATE
6 GOALS. AND THEN THE LAST PIECE IS WE REALLY NEED TO MAKE SURE
7 THEY'RE TECHNICALLY IMPLEMENTABLE. WHICH, YOU KNOW, IS VERY
8 IMPORTANT. AND I AM GOING TO JUMP DOWN TO SIX. AROUND CLIMATE
9 RESILIENCE AND ENVIRONMENT. THERE ARE A LOT OF WORDS HERE BUT
10 THE TWO I WANT TO CALL OUT FOR YOU THERE ARE, YOU THINK THAT -
11 - YOU SAW AND HEARD IN THE PRESENTATION LAST -- EARLIER, ABOUT
12 WHAT THE MASSIVE NEED IS FOR SEA LEVEL RISE AND OTHER CLIMATE
13 ADAPTATION INVESTMENTS IN THE BAY AREA, AND ONE OF THE
14 QUESTIONS WAS, HOW ARE WE GOING TO GET FUNDING FOR THAT. AND
15 THERE MAY BE AN OPPORTUNITY THIS YEAR TO SEEK SOME RESOURCES
16 TO AT LEAST GET US STARTED IN THE BAY AREA ON MOVING FORWARD
17 WITH SOME OF THOSE IMPORTANT CLIMATE ADAPTATION PROJECTS AND
18 PLANS THROUGH A NEW CLIMATE BOND. SO, THE LEGISLATURE IS
19 CONSIDERING PUTTING A CLIMATE BOND ON THE NOVEMBER 2024
20 BALLOT. AND THERE'S -- THERE COULD BE AN OPENING TO -- AND
21 THERE ARE SOME -- THERE ARE ALREADY DISCUSSIONS ABOUT DOING
22 THINGS RELATED TO SUPPORTING REGIONAL SCALE EFFORTS TO
23 INTEGRATE -- TO ADDRESS CLIMATE ADAPTATION NEEDS, NOT JUST
24 CLIMATE MITIGATION, CLIMATE CHANGE MITIGATION. AND THEN THE
25 OTHER PIECE IS THAT ONE OF OUR COUNCIL MEMBERS HAD ASKED ABOUT



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 HOME HARDENING AND SEISMIC RETROFITS. AND ONE PIECE OF GOOD
2 NEWS, AFTER SEEING WHAT THE MASSIVE NEED IS, IS THAT THERE IS
3 A PROPOSAL AND A POTENTIAL TO LOCK IN SOME STATE RESOURCES FOR
4 US, LIKE THE RETROFIT PROGRAM FOR RESIDENTIAL SEISMIC
5 RETROFITS. IT'S NOT A HUGE AMOUNT OF MONEY. IT'S ONLY \$250
6 MILLION, BUT THE PROGRAM IS SOMETHING THAT OUR TEAM IS PAYING
7 ATTENTION TO VERY CAREFULLY. BECAUSE IT COULD BE, SORT OF, A
8 MODEL FOR ALL TYPES OF HOME HARDENING. SO, AND RIGHT NOW THERE
9 JUST HASN'T BEEN STATE RESOURCES THAT HAVE GONE INTO EITHER
10 THINGS LIKE WILDFIRE PREPARATION AND SEISMIC RETROFITS, AND
11 SOME OTHER THINGS THAT RESIDENTS ARE GOING TO NEED TO DO
12 ACROSS THE BOARD TO MAKE SURE THAT THEY CAN BE, YOU KNOW, BE
13 PREPARED IN THE CASE OF NATURAL DISASTERS. AND SO GETTING ANY
14 STATE MONEY INTO SOME OF THOSE PROGRAMS COULD REALLY HELP
15 FOLKS AT THE STATE LEVEL FIGURE OUT WHAT THEY -- WHAT THEY
16 MIGHT BE ABLE TO DO. SO WE'RE PAYING ATTENTION TO THAT. THE
17 LAST PIECE I REALLY WANTED TO CALL OUT FOR YOU ALL IS AROUND
18 BROWN ACT REFORMS. SO, THAT'S NUMBER NINE ON PAGE 6 OF 10. AND
19 ON THE BROWN ACT REFORM PIECE, THERE IS A BILL THAT MTC AND
20 ABAG HAVE SUPPORTED. WE HAVE COORDINATED WITH YOUR CHAIR ON
21 THIS BILL. IT'S A.B. 817. IT IS A TWO-YEAR BILL, AND IT IS
22 SOMETHING THAT WOULD ALLOW FOR MORE FLEXIBILITY TO MEET
23 REMOTELY WITHOUT NEEDING TO DISCLOSE LOCATIONS AND SOME OF THE
24 OTHER PRIVACY CONCERNS THAT CAN COME UP IF AN BODY IS AN
25 ADVISORY BODY. AND, SO, INCLUDING THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 OR OTHER ADVISORY COMMITTEES THAT DON'T MAKE FINAL DECISIONS
2 ON ITEMS. AND THINGS LIKE SPENDING. AND THE IDEA THERE IS THAT
3 IT IS A MORE BALANCED APPROACH THAT STILL ALLOWS FOR, YOU
4 KNOW, THE BROWN ACT'S MAIN AIM, WHICH IS TO ENSURE THAT THERE
5 IS A WAY FOR THE PUBLIC TO BE IN FRONT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE
6 MAKING DECISIONS ABOUT HOW TO SPEND THEIR MONEY, WHILE ALSO
7 ALLOWING FOR US TO HAVE SOME OF THE, YOU KNOW, REALLY, SOME OF
8 THE BROADER PARTICIPATION AND ENGAGEMENT TO HELP INFORM
9 DECISION-MAKING FROM YOU ALL. SO, THAT BILL REALLY GOT HELD
10 LAST YEAR BECAUSE THE COMMITTEE CHAIR OF THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT
11 COMMITTEE WAS VERY STRONGLY OPPOSED TO, SORT OF, ANYTHING THAT
12 WOULD CRACK A NUT OPEN ON THE BROWN ACT, AND THAT COMMITTEE
13 CHAIR IS NO LONGER THE CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE. SO, THERE IS
14 MAYBE AN OPENING FOR IT TO MOVE. I WILL SAY SHE IS NOW THE
15 INCOME TWO IN THE ASSEMBLY, SO MOVING PAST THE COMMITTEE MIGHT
16 BE CHALLENGING. BUT, YOU KNOW, THERE IS A REALLY ROBUST
17 COALITION THAT IS WORKING VERY, VERY HARD ON THIS. AND I THINK
18 IT'S REALLY GOING TO BE AN OPPORTUNITY IN AN AREA WHERE WE CAN
19 USE A LOT OF THE, SORT OF, LESSONS LEARNED AND, SORT OF,
20 EXAMPLES OF HOW WE HAVE LOST MEMBERS FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY
21 COUNCIL TO HELP MAKE THE CASE UP IN SACRAMENTO. THAT'S WHAT I
22 HAVE IN A STREAMLINED REVIEW. AND I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE A PAUSE
23 AND ASK QUESTIONS ABOUT THE STATE BEFORE WE GO TO THE FEDERAL
24
25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** DOES ANYBODY -- OKAY. WIND E GO AHEAD.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** YEAH. REGARDING 4B, A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. I
3 KNOW ONE OF THE THINGS THAT CAME OUT OF THE LAST ROUND OF RHNA
4 NUMBERS IS THAT THERE WAS A LOT OF PUSH BACK BECAUSE OF THE
5 HIGH NUMBERS THAT WERE REQUIRED, AND ESPECIALLY HOW MANY --
6 HOW MANY OF THAT, ALMOST 40%, WHICH WAS MARKET RATE HOUSING. I
7 KNOW THE COUNTY OF MARIN TRIED TO SEE IF THEY COULD JUST GO
8 WITH THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND MODERATE HOUSING, AND WERE
9 TOLD A RESOUNDING NO. IS THERE REFORM BEING DISCUSSED ON THE
10 SACRAMENTO LEVEL?

11

12 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** IT'S QUITE EARLY. SO, I HAVE NOT HEARD
13 SPECIFIC PROPOSALS THAT HAVE BEEN, SORT OF, UNVEILED YET ABOUT
14 WHAT FOLKS ARE CONSIDERING IN SACRAMENTO. BUT I DO EXPECT THAT
15 THERE WILL BE ROBUST CONVERSATION ABOUT HOW DOES THE STATE
16 COME UP WITH THE TOTAL NUMBER OF WHAT EACH REGION'S, SORT OF,
17 HOUSING NEED IS GOING TO BE. AND THEN, YEAH, SIMILARLY,
18 GETTING INTO THAT SPACE AROUND, YOU KNOW, HOW SHOULD REGIONS
19 DECIDE HOW TO DIVVY UP THAT NEED.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS:** AND ALONG WITH THAT, SOMETHING THAT'S HAPPENING
22 ACROSS THE STATE, I THINK I'M GETTING THIS RIGHT, IT'S CALLED
23 THE DEVELOPERS REMEDY, I THINK I GOT THAT RIGHT, THAT'S
24 CROPPING UP QUITE A BIT, STRIPPING COMPLETE LOCAL CONTROL OVER
25 HOUSING. AND IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION OF REFORMING THAT?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** SO JUST TO CLARIFY, IT'S CALLED THE
3 BUILDERS REMEDY.

4

5 **WENDI KALLINS:** BUILDERS REMEDY. THANK YOU.

6

7 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** AND THERE HAD BEEN DISCUSSIONS LAST
8 YEAR ABOUT, SORT OF, POTENTIALLY GETTING INTO THAT, AND THERE
9 WAS A STRONG STATEMENT, I WOULD SAY, FROM FOLKS IN THE
10 ADMINISTRATION THAT THEY WERE NOT INTERESTED IN GETTING INTO
11 THAT SPACE. AND SO, I HAVE NOT HEARD, TYPICALLY CSAC, THE
12 CALIFORNIA STATE ASSOCIATION OF COUNTIES AND THE CALIFORNIA
13 LEAGUE OF CITIES WOULD BE, SORT OF, REALLY LEADING THOSE
14 EFFORTS AND I HAVE NOT -- AT LEAST TO DATE, HEARD THAT THERE
15 IS GOING TO BE ANY PUSH IN THAT AREA.

16

17 **WENDI KALLINS:** WELL, ON THE OTHER SIDE OF THE EQUATION, THE
18 ANTIHOUSING PEOPLE ARE BUSY USING THESE THINGS TO DRUM UP
19 SUPPORT FOR A STATEWIDE MEASURE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT TO
20 STRIP THE STATE OF ANY CONTROL OVER HOUSING. DO YOU KNOW
21 WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THAT? AND IF THERE IS ANY DISCUSSION
22 ABOUT HOW TO COUNTER THAT ONE?

23

24 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** I'M GOING TURN TO MY BOSS.

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU GEORGIA. TO MY KNOWLEDGE, THAT
2 INITIATIVE EFFORT HAS NOT YET QUALIFIED. AND I HAVEN'T CHECKED
3 SECRETARY OF STATE'S WEB SITE RECENTLY TO SEE IF IT'S COMING
4 CLOSE TO THE NUMBER OF SIGNATURES. BUT A FEW MONTHS AGO, I HAD
5 HEARD THAT THE EFFORT WAS REALLY WANING, AND THEY WEREN'T
6 GAINING A LOT OF RESOURCES TO SUPPORT THAT SIGNATURE GATHERING
7 EFFORT. BUT WE CAN GET BACK TO YOU TO CONFIRM.

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS:** OKAY. ALL RIGHT. THANKS.

10

11 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. TERRY? AND THEN ADINA.

12

13 **TERRY SCOTT:** MY QUESTION RELATES TO THE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
14 ISSUE. AND IT SEEMS TO ME THAT -- I GUESS MY QUESTION WOULD
15 BE, IS THE STATE INTERESTED IN, OR CAPABLE OF MAKING, IN SOME
16 MANNER OR ANOTHER, URGING OR INCENTIVIZING LOCAL COMMUNITIES
17 TO BUILD MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AS OPPOSED TO MARKET RATE
18 HOUSING? IS TEAMS TO ME IN MY COUNTY THAT MARKET RATE HOUSING
19 IS NOT A PROBLEM. ABOVE MARKET RATE HOUSING IS NOT A PROBLEM.
20 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS ONE. AND THE NUMBERS ARE -- WE HAVE SO
21 MANY PEOPLE IN THE HOSPITALITY INDUSTRY THAT COMMUTE INTO OUR
22 COUNTY BECAUSE THERE IS NO AFFORDABLE HOUSING AVAILABLE. AND
23 IT'S VERY, VERY PROBLEMATIC. AND I JUST WONDER, IS THE STATE
24 AND -- I -- ON THE RHNA NUMBERS -- AND I CHAIRED THAT
25 COMMITTEE FOR OUR COUNTY -- IT WAS -- WE BASICALLY WERE TOLD



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 THAT THE STATE WOULD DETERMINE THAT. BOTTOM LINE. WE COULD
2 MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS. IT DIDN'T REALLY MATTER. SO, ANYHOW, I
3 WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME INCENTIVES FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND,
4 ALSO, THAT WOULD PROVIDE MORE FLEXIBILITY, OR AT LEAST SOME
5 FLEXIBILITY ON THE LOCAL LEVEL.

6

7 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR? THE STATE HAS REALLY
8 TRIED TO -- NOT TRIED TO -- BUT THE STATE EFFORTS AROUND
9 SUPPORTING AND IN TRYING TO INCENTIVIZE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
10 DEVELOPMENT AND PRESERVATION HAVE, REALLY, SINCE ABOUT 2017,
11 FOCUSED ON, SORT OF, THREE CORE AREAS. THE FIRST HAS BEEN
12 AROUND THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION. RIGHT? SO
13 THEY REALLY BUMPED UP SAYING HERE IS THE ASSESSMENT OF WHAT
14 THE NEED IS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING EACH REGION, AND THEN USE
15 THAT GROUNDWORK TO SAY LOCAL GOVERNMENTS NEED TO PLAN FOR AND
16 AT LEAST ADOPT A ZONING THAT COULD MAKE IT REASONABLE THAT
17 THOSE UNITS CAN COME TO FRUITION, SO THAT'S ONE. THE SECOND
18 PIECE HAS BEEN AROUND CEQA STREAMLINING AND ALLOWING FOR
19 MINISTERIAL APPROVALS SO THERE HAVE BEEN THIS WHOLE SLEW OF
20 STATE BILLS THAT HAVE BEEN ABOUT MAKING IT EASIER TO BUILD
21 HOUSING AND IN PARTICULAR EASIER TO BUILD AFFORDABLE HOUSING
22 THE STREAMLINING, SORT OF, WAYS THAT EASE GETTING THROUGH THE
23 PERMITTING PROCESS 100% AFFORDABLE UNIT SIGNIFICANTLY
24 DIFFERENT FROM THE MARKET RATE. SIMILARLY THE STATE HAS DONE A
25 LOT AROUND TRYING TO INCENTIVIZE TO MAKE IT EASIER ON GET



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 HOUSING ON THE GROWN, I HATE THE TERM NATURALLY AFFORDABLE,
2 BECAUSE IT'S NOT REALLY A GREAT TERM BUT ACCESSORY DWELLING
3 UNITS OR CASITAS, THINGS LIKE THAT FOR THE STATES REALLY
4 TRYING TO WORK IN THAT SPACE THEN THIRD HAS BEEN AROUND
5 FUNDING THERE'S BEEN SIGNIFICANT HIGH AMOUNTS OF STATE
6 INVESTMENT IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROGRAMS SO THINGS LIKE
7 MULTI-FAMILY HOUSING PROGRAM TO DIRECTLY FUND AFFORDABLE
8 HOUSING BUT ALSO THINGS LIKE INFRASTRUCTURE GRANT PROGRAM THAT
9 CAN HELP INVEST IN THE ASSOCIATED INFRASTRUCTURE THAT'S
10 NECESSARY TO BRING FORWARD. WE SAW UNPRECEDENTED THE AMOUNTS
11 OF STATE INVESTMENTS BECAUSE BUDGETS WERE SO AND WE'RE GOING
12 TO BE SEEING THE BELT TIGHTENING WE SAW IT THIS YEAR WE'LL SEE
13 IT NEXT YEAR AND SO THE AREA OF OPPORTUNITY WE SEE ON THAT
14 SIDE THAT'S INDICATED IN YOUR ADVOCACY PROGRAM ARE, SORT OF,
15 TWOFOLD ONE IS WE THINK THERE IS EFFORT TO PUT STATE BONDS
16 STATEWIDE HOUSING BOND ON THE BALLOT IN NOVEMBER 2024 SO
17 ALTHOUGH WE DON'T EXPECT THE STATE TO BE PUTTING GENERAL FUND
18 MONEY A HUGE AMOUNT OF GENERAL FUND MONEY TOWARDS AFFORDABLE
19 HOUSING THAT COULD BE ONE, BOND MONEY THEN TWO IS EFFORTS
20 THEY'RE TAKING TO MAKE IT EASIER FOR LOCALS TO RAISE OUR OWN
21 LOCAL REVENUES SO THAT'S REALLY, SORT OF, WHAT'S BEEN
22 HAPPENING IN THE PAST AND I EXPECT TO SEE THE FOCUS MORE ON
23 THE REVENUE SIDE I'M SURE WE'LL CONTINUE TO SEE STREAMLINING
24 BILLS WE ARE ALSO STARTING TO HEAR MORE FROM LEGISLATURE
25 HAVING AN INTEREST IN DOING THINGS LIKE PROVIDING MORE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 RESOURCES TO MTC AND BAHFA TO DO CREATIVE THINGS WE HAVE BEEN
2 DOING ON THE GROUND TO REMOVE SOME OF THE BARRIERS TO BUILD
3 HOUSING AND I'M HOPEFUL THAT WE'LL START GAINING SOME STEAM
4 WITH THE STATE.

5

6 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ADINA?

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** A COUPLE OF THINGS. THANKS TO MTC FOR SUPPORTING
9 THE BROWN ACT REFORM AND IF THERE IS ANYTHING THAT PEOPLE ON
10 THIS BODY INCLUDING PEOPLE THAT HAVE BEEN IMPACTED, AND
11 INCLUDE AND DIFFICULTY IN PARTICIPATING REMOTELY IN A BIG
12 REGION WITH PEOPLE AND A VARIETY OF DIFFERENT NEEDS IT WOULD
13 BE APPROPRIATE YOU KNOW, PLEASE REACH OUT TO US BECAUSE THIS
14 IS SOMETHING WE HAVE SPOKEN UP IN FAVOR OF CONTINUOUSLY AND
15 HAVE BEEN IMPACTED AS A BODY BY THE CURRENT STATE OF AFFAIRS.
16 THEN IN TERMS OF UNDER LEGISLATION SUPPORTING THE
17 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLANNED BAY AREA COORDINATION
18 INITIATIVES I'M NOT REMEMBERING THE EXACT WORDS THAT WERE USED
19 IN THE STAFF REPORT, BUT THAT'S SOMETHING THAT THIS BODY HAS
20 CONTINUOUSLY SUPPORTED BUT I'M GOING TO MAKE A COMMENT AS KIND
21 OF INDIVIDUAL, YOU KNOW, COMING FROM THE ADVOCACY SIDE THAT
22 FOLKS HERE MIGHT BE INTERESTED IN WHICH IS A RECOMMENDATION
23 THAT WE USE THE AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION FOR A REGIONAL
24 MEASURE, AND THE REGIONAL MEASURE FUNDING IN ORDER TO BE ABLE
25 TO ENSURE THE IS BEING OF THOSE COORDINATION INITIATIVES. I



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 MEAN, WE'RE SEEING, AS THESE INITIATIVES ARE MOVING FORWARD,
2 AND YOU KNOW, WE'RE SEEING GREAT PROGRESS, LIKE THE BAY PASS
3 AND 40% INCREASE IN TRANSIT USAGE AND THE SECOND PHASE OF THE
4 BAY PASS, TERMS AND CONDITIONS AGENCIES ARE SAYING WE'RE ONLY
5 COMMITTING TO ONE YEAR. WE'RE VERY -- WE'RE SUPPORTIVE OF IT,
6 BUT WE'RE NERVOUS ABOUT IT. AND IF IT'S NOT EXACTLY WHAT WE
7 INDEPENDENT A YEAR WE WANT TO FEEL FREE TO PULL OUT. IN TERMS
8 OF BEING ABLE TO REACH GOALS, THAT KIND OF INSTABILITY IS NOT
9 WHAT WE WANT. SO IF THERE IS NEW WAYS TO USE MONEY AND STRINGS
10 AND POLICIES AROUND THE NEW MONEY AS THINGS GO FORWARD TO
11 ENSURING CAPITAL THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE COMPLIMENTARY
12 TO THE GOALS THAT WE HAVE BEEN SUPPORTING, CONTINUOUSLY.
13 THANKS.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ROLAND?

16

17 **ROLAND WONG:** YEAH. THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO PIGGYBACK ON THE
18 BROWN ACT. YES, I SERVE ON THE -- ON OTHER COMMITTEES THAT
19 FOLLOWS THE BROWN ACT, AND THIS YEAR THEY BASICALLY ARE
20 RETURNING IN-PERSON. BUT MANY OF THE DISABILITY MEMBERS ARE
21 VERY UNEASY, AS FAR AS, BECAUSE OF THEIR DISABILITY, THEY ARE
22 IMMUNE COMPROMISED. SO, THEY BASICALLY ARE -- NOT FORCED --
23 BUT ELECTED TO RESIGN BECAUSE THEY JUST FELT THAT THEIR HEALTH
24 ISSUES OF, YOU KNOW, OF NOT BEING ABLE TO SERVE, BECAUSE THEY
25 HAVE TO BE IN-PERSON. BUT HAVING MORE THE FLEXIBILITY OF DOING



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 REMOTELY, I THINK THEY WILL HAVE A BETTER -- I THINK THEY WILL
2 BE MORE COMFORTABLE AS FAR AS SERVING ON THE COMMITTEES. SO, I
3 DO NOT -- SO, I'M NOT REALLY SURE, MAYBE YOU CAN CLARIFY
4 AGAIN? IS IT BEING HELD UP AGAIN? IS IT TWO YEARS YOU WERE
5 REFERRING TO?

6

7 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO MOVE THROUGH
8 SOME BROWN ACTION REFORM THIS YEARS. IT'S A TWO-YEAR BILL, IT
9 WAS INTRODUCED LAST YEAR IT'S ON A FASTER TIMELINE, IT WILL
10 HAVE TO BE IN A FASTER TIMELINE IN 2024 INSTEAD OF A, SORT OF,
11 BILL THAT WAS NOT INTRODUCE SPRUCED LAST YEAR. THERE IS A RAY
12 OF SUNSHINE IN THAT WE MIGHT HAVE AN EASIER CHANCE. TWO RAYS
13 OF SUNSHINE, ONE IS THAT WE HAVE OF TIME SINCE LAST YEAR TO
14 BUILD UP A STRONGER COALITION AND ADVOCACY MESSAGE AROUND THE
15 IMPORTANCE OF THESE REFORMS FOR ADVISORY BOARDS, AND THEN,
16 TWO, THAT THE CHAIR OF THE COMMITTEE THAT HAS BEEN VERY
17 STRONGLY OPPOSED TO IT, THAT WAS A FIRST COMMITTEE TO GO
18 THROUGH, IS NO LONGER THE CHAIR. BUT IT'S STILL GOING TO BE AN
19 UPHILL BATTLE, BECAUSE THERE IS STRONG CONCERNS FROM LEADERS
20 IN SACRAMENTO. SO WE JUST REALLY HAVE TO MAKE THE CASE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** VINAY.

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **VINAY PIMPLE:** SO A CONCERN IS AFFORDABLE HOUSING, HOW DO
2 PEOPLE AFFORD RENTS ONCE THEY RETIRE? WHAT IS OUR PLAN FOR
3 THAT TO SHIFT THEM OUT OF THE STAGE? ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I
4 WOULD LIKE TO SEE, LOOKING AT THE STATE DEFINITION OF
5 AFFORDABLE HOUSING, THEY ALSO HAVE THEIR OWN AFFORDABLE
6 HOUSING, BUT IF YOU LOOK AT THE DEFINITION IT REALLY COMES TO
7 HOUSING THAT WOULD BE AFFORDABLE WITH ALMOST LIKE 22 OR 23% OF
8 THE PERSON'S INCOME. WHICH MEANS THEY'RE DEFINING IT IN TERMS
9 OF IMPOSSIBLE TO MEET STANDARDS. AND, SO, MAYBE WE COULD PUSH
10 FOR SOMETHING THAT IS MORE WITHIN REASONABLE RANGE. BECAUSE
11 ACTUALLY IF YOU CONSIDER THE PROPORTIONS OF THE HOUSING COSTS
12 WHERE IT SAYS OTHER COSTS, THE 30% TO HOUSING THAT'S THE
13 NATION-WIDE STANDARD SHOULD REALLY BE CLOSER TO 50% IN THE BAY
14 AREA. SO IF WE INCREASE THIS. I THINK WE WILL SEE A LOT OF
15 AFFORDABLE HOUSING THAT IS BUILT BY MARKET RATED DEVELOPERS
16 BECAUSE THEY HAVE ZONING BY RIGHT. AND YOU TONS AND TONS, YOU
17 KNOW, 800 TO 1,000 SQUARE FOOT CONDOS BEING SOLD FOR HALF A
18 MILLION DOLLARS. AND A LOT OF PEOPLE, THEY CAN'T AFFORD TO
19 BUY, THEY EITHER HAVE TO LEAVE OR WE HAVE TO SUBSIDIZE THEM
20 THIS WAY OR THE OTHER WAY, WE HAVE OWNED HOUSING, AND WE DON'T
21 HAVE TO SUBSIDIZE THEM THEY STAY HERE OR THEY RETIRE. SO I
22 WONDER IF THERE IS ANY THOUGHT ABOUT THAT.

23

24 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THANK YOU FOR BRINGING THIS UP, I THINK
25 THE WAY WE HAVE STRUCTURED THE ITEM THREE GIVES US SPACE TO



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 ENGAGE IN THIS AREA. TO AT LEAST EXPLORE IT MORE. WHAT WE HAVE
2 STRUCTURED FOR NUMBER THREE IS TO, SORT OF, GENERALLY, GIVE US
3 THE SPACE TO ENGAGE ON ALL POLICY AND FUNDING RELATED TO
4 HOUSING, PRODUCTION, PRESERVATION AND TENANT PROTECTIONS AND
5 SO I THINK YOU CALLED OUT TWO ITEMS, ONE IS AROUND WHAT IS THE
6 STATE DOING, AND WHAT ARE THEIR OPPORTUNITY TO ENSURE THAT
7 RENTERS WHO ARE RENTING CAN STAY IN THEIR HOMES WHEN THEY
8 RETIRE AND ARE ON FIXED INCOMES, RIGHT? THAT'S A REALLY BIG
9 THINGS RELATED TO TENANT PROTECTIONS. BUT THE OTHER ITEM I
10 HAVE NOT EXPLORED YET IS LOOKING INTO THINGS LIKE CAL HOME AND
11 OTHER RESOURCES TO, SORT OF, INCENTIVIZE AND SUPPORT LOW-
12 INCOME HOMEOWNERS TO, SORT OF, SEE WHAT THE THRESHOLDS ARE AND
13 IF THERE IS AN INTEREST IN OPENING TO DO SOMETHING AROUND
14 MAKING SURE THE THRESHOLDS CAN REALLY GO UP TO MORE OF WHAT I
15 THINK WE -- BECAUSE OF RHNA WE CALL MIDDLE INCOME OR MODERATE
16 INCOME, BUT ISN'T NECESSARY HE MIDDLE INCOME OR MODERATE
17 INCOME IN THE BAY AREA.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GABRIEL?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS, IT SEEMS LIKE WHAT
22 WE ARE SUPPORTING SO FAR IS FOR OUR STATE ADVOCACY. DID DOES
23 YOUR GROUP ALSO SUPPORT LOCAL MEASURES? IF THERE IS SOMETHING
24 HAPPENING IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY IS THERE ADVOCACY THAT HAPPENS
25 IN LOCAL LEVEL TOO?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** REBECCA LONG, WHILE GEORGIA IS GIVING HER
3 CONTACT INFORMATION TO ONE OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
4 MEMBERS. WHAT WE DO SOMETIMES IS BRING BALLOT MEASURES FORWARD
5 TO THE COMMISSIONERS TO TAKE POSITIONS ON, FOR EXAMPLE, SALES
6 TAX MEASURES OR HOUSING BONDS AT THE COUNTY LEVEL AND EVEN --
7 I DON'T KNOW THAT WE HAVE EVER SUPPORTED INDIVIDUAL CITY BUT
8 MAYBE SOME OF THE LARGE CITIES. THAT'S SOMETHING WE DO, WE DO
9 NOT ENGAGE IN ORDINANCES OR THINGS OF THAT NATURE, TO DATE.
10 BUT IF IT'S A SIGNIFICANT BALLOT MEASURE, WE SOMETIMES DO.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. GREAT. IT JUST KIND OF GETS INTO MY THOUGHT
13 ABOUT -- IT'S GREAT HEARING ABOUT, LIKE, ENVIRONMENTAL BON
14 MEASURE THOUGHTS AND THAT POTENTIALLY COMING TO FRUITION BUT I
15 WONDER ABOUT IN 2024 BOND FATIGUE WHEN THEY HAVE 17 BOND
16 MEASURES INCLUDING ONES AT THE LOCAL LEVEL. I'M HOPING THAT'S
17 PART CALCULATIONS WE BRING FORWARD WHEN WHAT WE ADVOCATE FOR
18 COMING IN 2024 AND 2026. SOMETHING TO KEEP IN MIND. I GUESS --
19 I THINK IN ITEM -- IN THE HOUSING SECOND, ITEM B IT MENTIONS
20 HOMELESSNESS AND ADVOCACY THERE. DOES THAT INCLUDE, LIKE, IF
21 THE STATE CAME UP WITH, LIKE, A 2024 BOND MEASURE ON MENTAL
22 HEALTH OR FUNDING FOR MENTAL ILLNESS AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE
23 PROGRAMS WITH THAT, BECAUSE IT'S TANGENTIALLY RELATED TO
24 HOMELESSNESS IS THAT SOMETHING YOU GUYS WOULD CONSIDER
25 SUPPORTING?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** SIMILAR TO WHAT REBECCA JUST SHARED,
3 FOR THE ADVOCACY PROGRAM IT GIVES US THE STRUCTURE WHICH I
4 BELIEVE HAS THE STRUCTURE THEN WE WOULD BRING THAT TO THEM FOR
5 AN INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THAT SEEMS LIKE A TECHNICAL QUESTION BUT IT SEEMS
8 LIKE IN RHNA WHEN THE ORIGINAL RHNA NUMBERS WERE CREATED IT
9 WAS MY UNDERSTANDING THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WAS PART OF
10 THE CAUSE OF ACTION FOR THE POPULATION GROWTH OVER THE NEXT 25
11 YEARS AND THEN HOW MUCH HOUSING WE NEED TO BUILD THEN THE RHNA
12 NUMBERS WERE SOMEWHAT BASED ON THAT, I WONDER WHAT WE TALKED
13 ABOUT ON THE PREVIOUS ITEM WITH PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS IF
14 THERE WILL BE AN ITERATIVE PROCESS TO THEN BE LIKE OKAY EITHER
15 THE GROWTH PATTERNS CHANGED SO THEREFORE OUR RHNA NUMBERS MAY
16 EITHER NEED TO INCREASE OR DECREASE. I WONDER IF THAT'S BEING
17 CONSIDERED AT THE STATE LEVEL. AND THEN MY ONLY OTHER COMMENT
18 WOULD BE ON THE BIG BAHFA RELATED MEASURE POTENTIAL COMING IN
19 2024 IF, SINCE -- MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT STATE FUNDING
20 SOURCES DON'T REALLY INCENTIVIZE MIDDLE -- QUOTE UNQUOTE
21 MIDDLE INCOME HOUSING 80% AVERAGE MEDIAN INCOME HOUSING IS
22 MORE FOR INCENTIVIZING DEEPLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING I'M WONDERING
23 IF THE BAHFA MEASURE IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO INCLUDE
24 INCENTIVIZING FOR MIDDLE HOUSING AND ALSO FOR HOMEOWNERSHIP
25 PROJECTS OR PROJECTS THAT ARE A BLEND OF BOTH?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **REBECCA LONG:** I'LL TAKE THAT LAST QUESTION FIRST. SO, WITHIN
3 THE BAHFA MEASURE, 80% OF THE FUND ARE DISTRIBUTED TO COUNTIES
4 ON A RETURN TO SOURCE BASIS AND FOR THOSE FUNDS THERE IS THE
5 ABILITY TO GO TO HIGHER INCOME. WE'RE ENCOURAGING THAT THERE
6 BE MORE OF A FOCUS ON LOW-INCOME, BUT IT DOES ALLOW FOR UP TO
7 120% AMI. AND THEN IT ALSO DOES ALLOW FOR SOME HOMEOWNERSHIP
8 INVESTMENT WHEREAS WITH THE REGIONAL SHARE, IT'S ALL LOWER
9 INCOME AND HOMEOWNERSHIP.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GEORGIA, YOU WANT TO GO ON TO
14 THE -- OH, ANNE OLIVIA. SO, BEFORE WE DO THAT, WE'RE RUNNING
15 30 MINUTES LATE. AND WE HAVE A FEDERAL THING TO DO. SO I WANT
16 TO CHECK IN WITH GEORGIA ON HOW SHE WANTS TO COVER THAT.

17

18 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** I CAN GO VERY QUICKLY ON THE FEDERAL.

19

20 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY. I THINK -- WE HAVE ANOTHER MEETING
21 THAT'S SUPPOSED TO BE STARTING IN THIS ROOM. SO, ANNE OLIVIA,
22 THEN HOWARD.

23

24 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I'LL BE SUPER FAST. THANK YOU, THIS IS
25 AWESOME. ANYTHING WE CAN DO TO SUPPORT THE BROWN ACT REFORM.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 LET US KNOW. ON 3C IN THE HOUSING, I'M -- AGAIN, I DON'T NEED
2 TO RECEIVE THAT NECESSARY HE IN HERE, BUT I WOULD LOVE TO FIND
3 OUT WHAT IS BEING LOOKED AT TO HELP MUNICIPALITIES MEET THE
4 RHNA GOALS AND IF WE ARE CONSIDERING PENALTIES FOR NOT MEETING
5 THEM BECAUSE AS FAR AS I CAN SEE THERE AREN'T ANY. AND TOOLS
6 BEING LOOKED AT TO BRING DOWN THE COST OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING
7 PRODUCTION. YOU MADE A COMMENT ABOUT THAT, AND I'M WONDERING
8 IF THERE IS ANY COOPERATION WITH LOCAL MUNICIPALITIES ON THAT,
9 IF WE CAN RECEIVE INFORMATION ON THAT THOSE OF US WHO DO WORK
10 IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT WOULD LOVE TO ADOPT ANY
11 STRATEGY WE POSSIBLY CAN, AND SO THERE MIGHT BE WAYS TO ECHO
12 THAT OUT. AND THEN THERE ARE YOU LOOKING AT FUNDING FOR
13 SERVICES ASSOCIATED WITH RUNNING AFFORDABLE HOUSING. I KNOW
14 THAT'S ONE OF THE BIGGEST ISSUES WITH EVERYONE TIGHTENING
15 THEIR BELTS RIGHT NOW WE'RE ALREADY STOPPING AT LEVELS THAT
16 ARE NOT MEETING EITHER STAFF'S OR CLIENTS NEEDS AND IN BETWEEN
17 HOUSING FOR SERVICE WORKERS AND JANITORS AND SOCIAL SERVICE
18 WORKERS THAT KIND OF STUFF THOSE FOLKS ARE BEING PUSHED
19 FARTHER AND FARTHER OUT AND SOON HAVE TO PAY TO GO TO WORK.
20 AND LOOKING AT SINCE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS PRIORITIZING THOSE
21 WHO HAVE THE GREATEST NEED, WHICH IS LOGICAL, WHAT WE'RE
22 ENDING UP WITH IS INDIVIDUALS HAVING TO EXPERIENCE
23 HOMELESSNESS FOR EXTENDED PERIODS OF TIME, WHICH IS MAKING IT
24 HARDER AND MORE EXPENSIVE TO TRANSITION FOLKS OFF THE INTO
25 HOUSING. SO, I'M WONDERING IF THERE IS MORE EFFORTS THAT ARE



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 LOOKING AT GETTING FOLKS WHO HAVE VERY RECENTLY LOST THEIR
2 HOMES, BACK INTO HOUSING, AS A SEPARATE TO TRY AND REDUCE THAT
3 TIME FOR ALL THE REASONS THAT I'M SURE YOU'RE FAMILIAR W THANK
4 YOU.

5

6 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** I CAN FOLLOW UP WITH YOU ON MOST OF
7 THOSE, THAT WOULD JUST BE CONNECTING FOLKS. BUT IN GENERAL WE
8 -- THERE ARE -- I THINK IT'S GREAT NEWS THAT THERE IS MORE AND
9 MORE, SORT OF, ACKNOWLEDGMENT IN SACRAMENTO AROUND HOW COMPLEX
10 AND ALSO HOW FACETED IT IS TO ENSURE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
11 DEVELOPMENT AND AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS FOR ELI
12 FOLKS ARE ACTUALLY IN INTEGRATED SERVICES AND HAVE SUPPORTIVE
13 SERVICES IN THERE. SO THERE ARE SOME CREATIVE IDEAS THERE THAT
14 ARE FLOWING AROUND SACRAMENTO WHICH IS NEWS I CAN FOLLOW UP
15 WITH YOU ON THEN. AND THE OTHER PIECE IS OUR KEY TO ADVOCACY
16 IN SACRAMENTO ON THINGS HIKE MAKING SURE THAT WE CAN HAVE THE
17 FLEXIBILITY TO TRY TO HELP PEOPLE BEFORE THEY BECOME HOMELESS,
18 LIKE, THOSE ARE THINGS THAT WE'RE JUST TRYING TO, AT THE
19 SACRAMENTO LEVEL GET AS MUCH FLEXIBILITY AS POSSIBLE, AND THEN
20 WHEN WE RECEIVE EITHER STATE MONEY OR THE BAHFA BOND CAN THEN
21 BE, SORT OF, BE FLEXIBLE SO WE COULD UTILIZE RESOURCES FROM
22 THOSE REVENUE SOURCES TO BE ABLE TO REALLY TAKE ADVANTAGE OF
23 THE BEST PRACTICES THAT WE ALL LEARN DURING COVID.

24

25 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. HOWARD?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **HOWARD WONG:** ALSO IT'S IMPORTANT TO KEEP IN MIND AN
3 OVERARCHING FINANCING THEME WHICH IS DEDICATED FUNDING FROM
4 JUST TRADITIONAL BUDGETS, THAT THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ONE OF
5 THE LARGEST ECONOMIES IN THE WORLD, BAY AREA, VERY WEALTHY,
6 AND OF COURSE, THE UNITED STATES, ONE OF THE MOST AFFLUENT
7 COUNTRIES IN THE WORLD, HISTORICALLY, EVEN THE UNITED STATES
8 HAS HAD TIMES WHEN IT HAD MUCH MORE INVESTMENT IN HOUSING. IT
9 HAS FUNDED SPECIAL PROGRAMS, LIKE THE SPACE PROGRAM OR
10 INTERSTATE HIGHWAY PROGRAM. OTHER COUNTRIES HAVE MUCH MORE
11 INVESTMENTS IN HOUSING IN TRANSPORTATION. THERE IS NO REASON
12 WHY THE UNITED STATES, THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, AND THE BAY
13 AREA CAN'T FUND IMPORTANT PUBLIC NEEDS WITHOUT NECESSARILY
14 NEEDING TO GO TO BOND MEASURES OR TO EXTRA TAXATION. SO THAT
15 SHOULD ALWAYS BE AN UNDERLYING ADVOCACY THING. THANK YOU.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. GEORGIA, FEDERAL.

18

19 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** COUNCIL MEMBER WONG. THAT WAS A GREAT
20 INTRO INTO WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE ASKING FOR AT THE FEDERAL
21 LEVEL, WHICH IS THE FEDS TO, SORT OF, KEEP FUNDING,
22 TRANSPORTATION, AT ROBUST LEVELS FOR THEM TO UP THEIR FUNDING
23 FOR HOUSING, BOTH THROUGH DIRECT GENERAL FUND, COMMITMENTS TO
24 HOUSING, AND ALSO THROUGH REALLY FUNDING AND MAKING POLICY
25 CHANGES TO THE LOW-INCOME HOUSING TAX PROGRAM SO WE CAN DO A



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 BETTER JOB FINANCING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN CALIFORNIA. AND, SO
2 THAT'S REALLY MOST OF NUMBER ONE FOR YOU. AND THEN NUMBER TWO,
3 ON THE FEDERAL SIDE IS JUST, NOW IS THE TIME THAT POLICY
4 DISCUSSIONS ARE GOING TO BEGIN IN WASHINGTON, D.C. AROUND THE
5 SERVICE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORIZATION. SO, SORT OF, IN 2026,
6 THE CURRENT FEDERAL LAW THAT GUIDES TRANSPORTATION SPENDING
7 AND POLICIES WILL RUN -- WILL EXPIRE, AND SO FOLKS IN DC START
8 TALKING A COUPLE YEARS EARLIER ABOUT WHAT PRIORITIES ARE GOING
9 TO BE, NEED TO BE. AND ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE REALLY LOOKING
10 OUT FOR, WHICH IS ACTUALLY SOMETHING THAT WAS IN YOUR
11 PRESENTATION EARLIER TODAY IS JUST ACKNOWLEDGMENT THAT IN 2021
12 AND 2022, THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT MADE JUST ENORMOUS
13 INVESTMENTS IN INFRASTRUCTURE, IN TRANSPORTATION, RESILIENCE,
14 ET CETERA, ET CETERA, AND A LOT OF THAT WAS ONE-TIME MONEY.
15 AND, SO, WE HAVE, SORT OF, GOTTEN USED TO FEDERAL MONEY BEING
16 AT A HIGHER LEVEL THAN -- BUT IT'S SET TO, SORT OF, DROP DOWN
17 IN 2026. AND, SO, WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO LOOK AT WITH A
18 REAUTHORIZATION IS URGE THE FEDS TO REALLY LOOK THROUGH AND
19 PRIORITIZE WHAT ARE THE MOST IMPORTANT FUND SOURCES FOR BAY
20 AREA, AND THIS IS A TRANSPORTATION FOCUS THING. SO, FOR BAY
21 AREA TRANSIT, AND YOU KNOW, SAFE STREETS, ET CETERA, ET
22 CETERA, AND WORK WITH PARTNERS AROUND THE COUNTRY TO FOCUS ON
23 PROTECTING THOSE FIRST AND FOREMOST.
24



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AND DID YOU WANT TO CONTINUE WITH
2 ANYTHING ELSE IN FEDERAL?

3

4 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** OH SORRY. I FORGOT. THERE ARE OTHER
5 FEDERAL THINGS. CLIMATE RESILIENCE AND ENVIRONMENT. SO WHAT
6 YOU HAVE ON ITEM TWO IS WHAT WE ARE PROPOSING, SORT OF, OUR
7 EARLY SURFACE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORIZATION PRIORITIES ARE
8 GUIDING PRINCIPLES AND ITEM THREE IS CONTINUING TO HOPE THAT
9 THE FEDS CAN BE REALLY STRONG PARTNERS ON CLIMATE RESILIENCE
10 AND THE ENVIRONMENT. I DON'T THINK WE'RE EXPECTING -- I HEAR
11 THE LAUGHTER. I DON'T THINK WE'RE EXPECTING ANYTHING
12 REVOLUTIONARY NEXT YEAR AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL, GIVEN, SORT OF,
13 WHAT'S GOING ON THERE. BUT WE THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THAT
14 WE KEEP RINGING THE BELL AND BEATING THE DRUM ON THAT ONE.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS FOR GEORGIA ON
17 THE FEDERAL LEVEL? I'M NOT SEEING ANY HANDS RAISED. MARTHA
18 WERE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON THIS
21 ITEM NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK. CHRIS DID YOU
22 STILL WANT TO SPEAK? I SEE YOU LOWERED YOUR HAND. THERE IT
23 GOES. CHRIS, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE
24 TO GIVE?

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU. IT WAS A COMMENT, IF I MAY?

2

3 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** WE CAN HEAR YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE CAN HEAR YOU, CHRIS.

6

7 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** I HAD A COMMENT/QUESTION ON THE STATE
8 SIDE, IF I MAY?

9

10 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

11

12 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. SO, REALLY QUICKLY, AS
13 WE ALL KNOW, BAGLEY KEENE MAKING STATE BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS
14 ACCESSIBLE FOR FOLKS REMOTELY FOR PARTICIPANTS AND COMMUNITY
15 MEMBERS. I'M WONDERING, IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS A THIRD LEG
16 THAT WE'RE MISSING HERE. SO, WE NOW ARE LOOKING AT A.B. 817.
17 AND THAT'S GREAT TO MAKE THE ADVISORY BODIES AVAILABLE
18 REMOTELY, TO BOTH PARTICIPANTS, TO MEMBERS, AND COMMUNITY
19 MEMBERS. BUT I FEEL LIKE THERE IS A MISSING LINK HERE IN
20 COUNTY AND AREA WIDE COMMISSIONS AND BOARDS. AM I WRONG IN
21 THAT? OR DO WE NEED TO LOOK IN A DIFFERENT DIRECTION FOR THAT?

22

23 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN HERE, MTC STAFF.
24 YOU'RE CERTAINLY NOT WRONG ON THAT, WHERE THE A.B. 817 -- SO,
25 THE STATE ALWAYS LIKES TO TREAT THEM SELF DIFFERENTLY. A.B.



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 817 WHAT THAT WOULD DO IS, SORT OF, A COMPROMISED APPROACH
2 THAT HAS JUST BEEN VETTED UP IN SACRAMENTO AND THAT THIS IS
3 GOING TO BE THE ONLY WAY TO GET A LITTLE BIT MORE FLEXIBILITY
4 FOR LOCALS AND COUNTIES IS TO START WITH ADVISORY BOARDS. AND
5 COMMITTEES THAT DO NOT MAKE FINAL DECISIONS. SO, THERE WOULD
6 BE AN OPPORTUNITY FOR, LET'S SAY, LIKE, A CITY COUNCIL
7 COMMITTEE THAT ISN'T MAKE FINAL DECISIONS ON BUDGETING, TO
8 TAKE ADVANTAGE OF MORE FLEXIBILITY FOR REMOTE MEETINGS, BUT
9 NOT THE OFFICIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING. SO, THAT'S REALLY,
10 AGAIN, THE COMPROMISE OF WHERE FOLKS THINK IF THERE COULD BE A
11 PATH FORWARD.

12

13 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** OKAY CHRISTINE?

14

15 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THAT'S FINE. THAT'S GOING TO BE TOUGH
16 FOR THOSE OF US WHO WANT TO MOVE UP IN THE FOOD CHAIN.

17

18 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. YOU'RE CORRECT ON THAT. WITH
19 THAT I DON'T SEE ANY FURTHER COMMENTS. WE'LL MOVE TO FIFE C
20 STAFF LIAISON REPORT. KY-NAM?

21

22 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU. I HAVE NOTHING TO ADD BEYOND
23 THE WRITTEN REPORT.

24



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** CITY REPORTS THERE. IS NOT ONE HERE BUT I
2 WILL MAKE AN ANNOUNCEMENT AT THIS POINT IN TIME RODNEY NICKENS
3 WAS AN APPOINTEE OF THE BAHA COMMITTEE AND SINCE HE IS NO
4 LONGER A MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL I'M APPOINTING
5 CHARLES LAVERY IN HIS PLACE. AND KY-NAM AND I WILL WORK ON A
6 LETTER. IT'S NOT AN ACTUAL SUBCOMMITTEE BUT IT'S AN OFFICIAL
7 POSTING. DON'T WORRY ABOUT IT, MARTHA. WE'LL TAKE CARE OF THAT
8 BUT I NEED TO MAKE AN OFFICIAL ANNOUNCEMENT. WITH THAT,
9 SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. CHRISTINE FITZGERALD, DO YOU HAVE A
10 SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR PARKER IS GOING TO GIVE THE
13 REPORT.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** VICE CHAIR PARKER WILL BE GIVING THE
16 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT.

17

18 **JOHNNY PARKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. IN SEPTEMBER WE HAD TWO
19 INFORMATIVE PRESENTATIONS DURING THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
20 MEETING. GORDON HANSON AND AARON PREVIN ARE THE COMANAGERS OF
21 THE REGIONAL MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT. THEY PROVIDED
22 UPDATES ON THE PROJECT INCLUDING BRINGING ON AN ACCESSIBLE THE
23 CONSULTANT TO JOIN AND ADVISE THE CORE PROJECT TEAM. SOME
24 HIGHLIGHTS FROM THE PRESENTATION ARE THEIR FOCUS ON MAKING
25 TRANSIT JOURNEYS EASIER TO KEEP EXISTING TRANSIT RIDERS AND



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 INCREASE THE AMOUNT OF PEOPLE USING TRANSIT. THEY ARE ALSO
2 WORKING ON A SET OF INITIAL DRAFT STANDARDS FOR WAYFINDING
3 SIGNAGE, INCLUDING DESIGN, SIZE, AND TEXT CONTENT. SIGN
4 PROTOTYPES WILL BE INSTALLED AT THE SANTA ROSA TRANSIT MALL
5 AND THE EL CERRITO, DEL NORTE BART STATION. THEY WILL BE
6 GATHERING FEEDBACK IN EARLY 2024. THE SECOND PRESENTATION WAS
7 FROM THE ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF THE MTC ABAG AGENCY
8 ACCESSIBILITY CULTURAL RACIAL EQUITY OFFICE JUDIS SANTOS, SHE
9 IS PROVIDED AN OVERVIEW OF THE MIRRORS'S COMMUNITY ACTION
10 RESOURCE EMPOWERMENT PROGRAM KNOWN AS CARE FOR SHORT, THE
11 PRESENTATION FOCUSED ON HIGH-LEVEL OVERVIEW OF THE DRAFT
12 GUIDELINES WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT THE DETAILED DRAFT
13 GUIDELINES CAN BE LOCATED ON THE MTC CARE WEB SITE. HIGHLIGHTS
14 INCLUDED IN THE PRESENTATION REMINDING US THAT CARE IS A
15 SUCCESSOR TO THE MTC'S LIFELINE TRANSPORTATION CORE PROGRAM
16 THE PROGRAM IS BEING SHAPED TO BE RESPONSIVE TO PRINCIPLES IN
17 STATE COMMITMENT TO CALIFORNIA FOR ALL EXECUTIVE ORDER 1622.
18 AND JUST TO SUMMARIZE ONCE AGAIN DETAILED INFORMATION CAN BE
19 LOCATED ON MTC'S CARE WEB SITE. ANY QUESTIONS?

20

21 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT THAT WAS
22 RECEIVED? AND IF THERE IS ANYBODY WHO IS ON OUR ZOOM MEETING,
23 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. MEMBERS OF THE
24 PUBLIC IN THE ROOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, FORM A LINE NEAR
25 THE PODIUM. CLERK?



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
3 ON THIS ITEM OR THE PREVIOUS ITEM. NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM
4 WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE ON ZOOM THAT HAS A RAISED HAND ON
5 THIS ITEM.

6

7 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THAT CONCLUDES OUR SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS.
8 KY-NAM?

9

10 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** WELL, WE DON'T HAVE THE OTHER
11 SUBCOMMITTEE HAVING IN THE LAST TIME, BUT WE WILL SEQUENTIAL
12 HAVE THE SUCCESSOR COMMITTEE. I CAN SPELL THAT OUT.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** CORRECT. THE SUBSEQUENT MEET --
15 SUBSEQUENT -- THEY WILL BE MEETING AFTER THIS MEETING.

16

17 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH.

18

19 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** I WAS GOING TO GET TO THAT PART.
20 SUBSEQUENT -- SUBCOMMITTEE -- SEC -- YEAH. ANYWAY. WE'RE UP TO
21 FIVE FIVE E COUNCIL MEMBER REPORTS. MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL MAY
22 REPORT ON LOCALLY RELEVANT ISSUES OR EVENTS. THIS IS YOUR
23 CHANCE TO LET US KNOW WHAT'S GOING ON IN INTEREST OF YOUR -- I
24 SEE GERRY.

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **GERRY GLASER:** FAST ONE, JOHNNY MADE HE THINK OF THIS FROM YOUR
2 EQUITY REPORT. I'M ALSO ON THE CITIZEN'S ADVISORY COMMITTEE
3 FOR SONOMA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION. AND IN JANUARY, THERE IS A
4 REPORT FROM 2019, WHICH HAS TO DO WITH INTEGRATION OF THE
5 THREE DIFFERENT BUS TRANSIT DISTRICTS IN SONOMA COUNTY, AND
6 HOW THEY MIGHT INTEGRATE, AND THERE WAS A REPORT COMING OUT IN
7 THE MEETING IN JANUARY, IF ANYBODY IS INTERESTED ON WHAT'S THE
8 PROGRESS SO FAR, WHAT ARE WE DOING NEXT AND ONE OF THE POINTS,
9 THE SIGNAGE, BY THE WAY, AT THE TRANSIT CENTER IS PART OF THAT
10 COORDINATION BETWEEN THE THREE DIFFERENT BUS DISTRICTS THAT
11 ACTUALLY DRIVE-THRU THE ONE PLACE. SO THAT'S GETTING TO
12 EVERYBODY TO FIND IT. THAT WOULD BE INTERESTING TO FOLLOW AND
13 DOVE TAIL WITH THE WORK WE'RE DOING ON THE REGIONAL NETWORK
14 MANAGEMENT AS WELL.

15

16 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYBODY ELSE? I SEE NO OTHER
17 HANDS RAISED. TO THE CLERK, WERE THERE ANY COMMENTS RECEIVED
18 UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM? AND IF ANYONE
19 FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, USE THE
20 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IF PERSONS -- IF THE
21 PUBLIC IN THE ROOM WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, FORM A LINE NEAR THE
22 PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK.

23



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
2 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
3 RAISED IN ROOM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** ITEM THROUGH NEW BUSINESS ANY MEMBERS OF
6 THE COUNCIL CAN BRING UP OTHER BUSINESS OR DISCUSSION IN
7 ADDITION TO FUTURE AGENDA ITEM. I SEE NO RAISED HANDS. CLERK
8 WAS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?
9 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SAME AS LAST TIME EITHER DIAL STAR NINE,
10 RAISE YOUR HAND OR LINE UP AT THE PODIUM. I SEE NOTHING.
11 CLERK?

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
15 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

16

17 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. AND AS WE ALL THE KNOW THERE
18 IS ANOTHER MEETING COMING UP AFTER THIS. SO WHAT I'M GOING TO
19 ASK YOU TO DO, IS THE MEMBERS OF THIS BODY WHO ARE NOT MEMBERS
20 OF THE NEXT MEETING, PLEASE VACATE YOUR SEAT, TAKE YOUR STUFF.
21 IF YOU ARE HANGING OUT, MOVE YOUR STUFF OFF THE DAIS. TAKE
22 YOUR STUFF AND GO OFF THE DAIS. AND MEMBERS WHO ARE IN THE
23 NEXT MEETING, GO GRAB YOUR LUNCH AND I -- WHEN WILL THEY BE
24 ADJOURNING HERE?

25



OCTOBER 27, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** TEN MINUTES. IT'S 12:40 AT 12:50 WE'LL START.

2

3 **RANDI KINMAN, CHAIR:** AT 12:50 YOU WILL BE COMING BACK HERE.

4 EVERYBODY'S WELCOME TO STAY. THOSE MEMBERS GRAB THEIR LUNCH

5 FIRST. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE

6 HELD FRIDAY NOVEMBER 17TH, 2023, 10:00 A.M. BOTH THE NOVEMBER

7 AND DECEMBER MEETINGS WILL BE HELD ON THE THIRD, NOT FOURTH,

8 FRIDAY AT 10:00 A.M. AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE

9 STREET, SAN FRANCISCO. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE

10 DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THIS MEETING OF THE POLICY

11 ADVISORY COUNCIL IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

12



NTT

Broadcasting Government