

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



JANUARY 26, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

**FRIDAY, JANUARY 26<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 10:00 AM**

**CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU FOR WAITING EVERYBODY. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER FOR THE JANUARY 26TH POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. IF WE COULD HAVE ITEM NUMBER ONE, ROLL CALL, PLEASE? AND CONFIRM OUR QUORUM. OH MY SHEET. I HAVE DONE THIS BEFORE. MY SHEET THAT I LOST. HERE WE GO. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER OF THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE CONSISTING OF SIMULTANEOUS TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS AS INDICATED ON THE AGENDA. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9 AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ACTION ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATION. AGENDA ITEM ONE IS ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM QUORUM. WILL THE CLERK CALL ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM, PLEASE?

**CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AWE?

**SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

**CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?



1

2 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** HERE .

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

5

6 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** PRESENT .

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

9

10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** PRESENT .

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU . ESUF?

13

14 **ILAF ESUF:** HERE .

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

17

18 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE .

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLASER?

21

22 **GERRY GLASER:** HERE .

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

25



1 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** PRESENT.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

4

5 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAVERY? LEVIN?

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU?

16

17 **CARINA LIEU:** PRESENT.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LODIN?

20

21 **ZELLY LODIN:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** HERE.



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?

3

4 **JOHNNY PARKER:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RHODES?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOWARD WONG?

11

12 **HOWARD WONG:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ROLAND WONG?

15

16 **RONALD WONG:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OH MY GOSH. [LAUGHTER] EVERYONE IS HERE.

19 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT, AS CHAIR KINMAN JUST ASKED. AS

20 AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING

21 ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY WILL BE

22 ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM

23 OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A

24 RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS

25 ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I'M GOING TO TAKE MY LAST BIT OF  
3 PRIVILEGE AS CHAIR AND TAKE MY PORTION OF AGENDA ITEM NUMBER  
4 FOUR TO MAKE MY CLOSING REMARKS AS CHAIR OF THIS BODY. FIRST  
5 OF ALL, MY ANNOUNCEMENTS. WE WERE NEGLECTFUL IF REQUIRING YOU  
6 AND REMINDING YOU TO SIGN IN FOR THE SECOND MEETING THAT WE  
7 HAVE ON THE DAY. SO, PLEASE DO SO. IF YOU DON'T SIGN IN,  
8 MARTHA WON'T PAY YOU, AS YOU HAVE PROBABLY HAD DISCUSSION W  
9 SO, SINCE WE WERE ALL ON BOARDED DURING COVID, YOU'RE NOT USED  
10 TO SIGNING INTO MEETINGS. BUT FROM NOW ON, SIGN INTO ANY  
11 MEETING IN WHICH YOU DO NOT APPEAR ON THE DAIS, OR YOU WILL  
12 NOT BE COMPENSATED. THE SECOND ANNOUNCEMENT IS, AFTER CHATTING  
13 WITH ANUP, I AM PLACING MYSELF ON THE NEXGEN PERMANENT SEATING  
14 FOR THAT PARTICULAR BODY. IT WILL PROVIDE THE CONTINUITY AND  
15 HE AND I DISCUSSED THAT AND WE'RE FINE WITH THAT. SO, IF YOU  
16 WOULD UPDATE THE MEMBERSHIPS ON THAT. AND MY FINAL THING I  
17 WOULD LIKE TO SAY IS, I LOVE THIS BODY THAT WE HAVE RIGHT NOW.  
18 IT'S ONE OF THE BEST, THE MOST DYNAMIC, LOOK AT US, WE'RE ALL  
19 HERE TODAY. SOMETHING THAT I RARELY, RARELY, RARELY, RARELY  
20 SEE. WE HAVE STAFF HERE THAT I ADORE, AND NONE OF THIS GETS  
21 DONE WITHOUT THE TEAMWORK OF STAFF, AND US, AND BABY -- AND  
22 BABIES. [LAUGHTER] WE HAVE GONE THROUGH SO MANY BABIES DURING  
23 OUR TOUR HERE. AND I WANT TO THANK OUR VISITORS, LIKE ALETA  
24 DUPREE. IT'S SO GOOD TO SEE YOU ON MY LAST DAY AS CHAIR. IT'S  
25 BEEN A WHILE. SO, THANK YOU, EVERYBODY. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 THIS TRANSITION. WITH THAT, I WILL TURN IT OVER TO THE CLERKS  
2 FOR AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE. [APPLAUSE]

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BEFORE WE DO THAT, WOULD ANYBODY LIKE TO  
5 MAKE ANY COMMENTS?

6

7 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU'RE NOT OFF THE HOOK THAT EASY.

10 [LAUGHTER]

11

12 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I WAS JUST, LIKE ROLL THROUGH IT.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ILAF.

15

16 **ILAF ESUF:** IT'S GOING TO BE BIG SHOES TO FILL FOR WHOEVER IS  
17 NEXT BUT SEEMS LIKE THE FOUNDATION YOU HAVE CREATED IS REALLY  
18 GOING AND PUTTING US IN A GOOD POSITION. I'M SURE EVERYBODY  
19 ELSE AGREES.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHRISTINE?

24

25 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU FOR SHOWING MEET ROPES.



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I DO AGREE. ANYBODY ELSE? WENDI?

5

6 **WENDI KALLINS:** JUST SO IMPRESSED WITH YOUR LEADERSHIP YOU HAVE  
7 GONE ABOVE AND BEYOND THE CALL OF DUTY, REALLY PROMOTING  
8 IMPORTANT ISSUES, FROM EQUITY, REALLY DIGGING DOWN INTO OUR  
9 TRANSIT NEEDS AND THE NEEDS OF SOME OF OUR SENIORS AND THINGS  
10 LIKE THAT. SO, I JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR  
11 SERVICE. YOU WILL BE MISSED. SOMEBODY IS GOING TO HAVE SOME  
12 VERY BIG SHOES TO FILL.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ADINA?

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEAH. THANKS SO MUCH TO RANDI KINMAN FOR, LIKE,  
17 ALL THE YEARS OF LEADERSHIP AND NAVIGATING THIS BODY THROUGH  
18 SOME PRETTY ROCKY WATERS, WITH THE PANDEMIC, AND FOR  
19 EVERYTHING THAT WE SEE IN THE ORDERLY, AND COMPASSIONATE  
20 MANAGES OF MEETINGS AND ALL THE WORK THAT'S BEHIND THE SCENES  
21 IN TERMS OF STEERING STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS FOR KEEPING  
22 THINGS ON TRACK ALL THE TIME.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ANNE OLIVIA?

25





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** RANDI?

2

3 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES, DEAR?

4

5 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU ENOUGH FOR WHAT YOU HAVE DONE  
6 FOR US AS INDIVIDUALS, AND NOT JUST FOR THIS BODY. YOU  
7 WELCOMED ME IN WHEN I WAS SO NERVOUS BECAUSE I DIDN'T KNOW  
8 ANYTHING ABOUT TRANSPORTATION. AND YOU WERE, LIKE, OH BELIEVE  
9 ME, IT'S YOUR BRAIN, IT'S YOUR MIND, IT'S YOUR PERSPECTIVE,  
10 IT'S YOU THAT WE WANT, NOT JUST YOUR TITLE OR YOUR JOB OR ANY  
11 OF THOSE THINGS. AND YOU HAVE BEEN A MENTOR. YOU TAUGHT ME HOW  
12 TO FIGHT, MUCH TO THE CHAGRIN OF SOME OTHER BODIES. AND YOU  
13 HAVE MADE ME A BETTER MORE ENGAGED MORE CIVICALLY MINDED  
14 HUMAN. SINCE THAT'S CORE OF MY IDENTITY AS A HUMAN, I AM  
15 BEYOND GRATEFUL TO YOU AS A PERSON. YOU HAVE BEEN THERE TO  
16 SUPPORT US INDIVIDUALLY WITH OUR PERSONAL STRUGGLES, YOU HAVE  
17 OPENED PARTS OF YOUR LIFE AND SHARED THOSE WITH US TOO. YOU  
18 ARE FIERCE AND RESPECTED AND ABSOLUTELY LOVED AND ONE OF THE  
19 BEST HUMAN BEINGS I HAVE COME ACROSS IN A REALLY LONG TIME.  
20 THANKS FOR FIGHTING FOR ALL OF US AND ALL THE DIFFERENT HATS  
21 THAT YOU WEAR, AND I'M GLAD THAT YOU'RE NOT GOING ANYWHERE,  
22 YOU'RE JUST NOT BEING CHAIR ANYMORE. WE STILL NEED YOUR FIGHT  
23 AND WE STILL NEED YOUR SUPPORT BOTH IN THIS CIVIC ARENA AND AS  
24 INDIVIDUALS. SO, THANK YOU. YOU TOUCH PEOPLE'S LIVES THAT YOU



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 DON'T EVEN KNOW. BUT WE SEE IT, AND WE SEE YOU. AND WE'RE  
2 GRATEFUL.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND THAT SEEMS LIKE ALL THE SPEAKERS.  
5 YAY.

6

7 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO WRAP IT UP BY  
8 SAYING, I COULDN'T HAVE GOTTEN THROUGH SOME OF THE TRIALS I  
9 HAVE BEEN THROUGH IN LIFE, ESPECIALLY LATELY, WITHOUT MY MTC  
10 FAMILY. GOING THROUGH IT'S ONE THING TO SAY OH YOU HAVE HAD A  
11 DEATH IN THE FAMILY, BUT WHEN YOU GO THROUGH MULTIPLE  
12 ILLNESSES, IT SEEMS LIKE THEY'RE BACK TO BACK AND I HAVE  
13 ALWAYS HAD MY MTC FAMILY STANDING THERE WITH ME AND SUPPORTING  
14 ME AND SHARING IN MY JOYS WHEN THINGS HAPPEN. I REALLY  
15 APPRECIATE EVERY SINGLE ONE OF YOU FOR BEING THERE FOR ME, AND  
16 FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO ARE NEW TO THIS, THIS IS A FAMILY. I  
17 APPRECIATE IT. LET'S GET ROLLING AND GET OUT OF HERE EARLY.  
18 THAT'S THE GOAL, OUT ON TIME. BACK TO ITEM NUMBER THREE.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ITEM NUMBER THREE WHICH IS THE ELECTION  
21 TO SUCCEED CHAIR KINMAN. FORMERLY A MEMBER OF THIS BODY AND  
22 NOW STAFF HAVING BEEN ON BOTH SIDES OF THINGS, I OFFER  
23 GRATITUDE TO YOU, CHAIR KINMAN, FOR YOUR SERVICE AND FOR YOUR  
24 STEADY STEWARDSHIP. FOR THOSE OF YOU WHO HAVEN'T DONE AN  
25 ELECTION BEFORE, AS A REFRESHER, IT'S FAIRLY STRAIGHT FORWARD.



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WE OPENED THE NOMINATION PROCESS THE LAST TIME WE MET AND YOU  
2 CAN STILL BE NOMINATED UP TO THIS POINT. AND WE'LL ALLOW THE  
3 NOMINEES TO HAVE A BRIEF ONE MINUTE STATEMENT AND WILL PROCEED  
4 TO HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE. THE WINNER OF THE ELECTION WILL BE  
5 THE PERSON WHO GETS 50% PLUS ONE. SINCE WE HAVE ALL 26 PEOPLE  
6 IN ATTENDANCE, EITHER REMOTELY OR HERE, THE MAGIC NUMBER IS  
7 14. AND THAT'S HOW WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED. SO, THAT SAID,  
8 CURRENTLY THE NOMINEES FOR CHAIR, WHICH WE'LL RUN FIRST, THEN  
9 DO VICE CHAIR AFTERWARDS, ARE PAMELA CAMPOS AND HOWARD WONG.  
10 IS THERE ANY FURTHER NOMINEES FOR THE CHAIR POSITION?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

13

14 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I BELIEVE CARINA MAY HAVE BEEN MUTED.  
15 WERE YOU MAKING A NOMINATION OR THAT WAS BACKGROUND NOISE?  
16 BACKGROUND NOISE. WITH THAT WE'LL GO IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER AND  
17 CAMPOS YOU'RE FREE TO MAKE A ONE MINUTE STATEMENT. THEN MR.  
18 WONG.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU ALL. THESE ARE INCREDIBLY  
21 BIG SHOES TO FILL, BUT I FEEL LIKE I'M UP TO THE CHALLENGE. I  
22 AM FROM THE SOUTH BAY AND GREW UP RIDING PUBLIC TRANSIT, AS A  
23 CHILD, AS A STUDENT ATTENDING SAN JOSE STATE AND ADVOCATED  
24 FIERCE -- FOR IT FIERCELY IN MY COMMUNITY. I HAVE A BACKGROUND  
25 IN EDUCATION, AND AS YOU MAY HAVE HEARD IN A LOT OF THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 ADVOCACY THAT I HAVE HERE ON THE COUNCIL, MAKING SURE THAT WE  
2 ARE BUILDING CITIES AND COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE THAT INCLUDES  
3 AND CENTERS OUR CHILDREN, OUR FAMILIES, OUR AGING ADULTS,  
4 BECAUSE I ESPECIALLY SEE PUBLIC TRANSIT AS BEING A SOLUTION TO  
5 THE CLIMATE CHANGE THAT IS VERY REAL. WE NEED TO MAKE SURE  
6 THAT PUBLIC TRANSIT IS THE NUMBER ONE CHOICE FOR PEOPLE WHEN  
7 THEY ARE GETTING TO WHERE THEY NEED TO GO, WHETHER IT'S WORK,  
8 SCHOOL, RECREATION, I KNOW THAT WE CAN DO IT, AND I HOPE TO BE  
9 WITH YOU ALL IN THIS JOURNEY AS THE NEXT CHAIR. THANK YOU.

10

11 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** GO AHEAD. YOU MAY SPEAK.

12

13 **HOWARD WONG:** SHALL I SPEAK? GOOD MORNING EVERYBODY. SEVERAL  
14 WEEKS AGO, I WAS LOOKING AT THE MTC ORGANIZATION CHART AND YOU  
15 KNOW HOW THESE CHARTS HAVE ALL THESE FLOW OF RESPONSIBILITIES.  
16 AND THERE WAS ONE BOX ON THE LEFT THAT STOOD OUT BY ITSELF,  
17 AND THAT WAS THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND IT SAID IT  
18 WAS "VOICE OF THE PEOPLE" WHICH MEANS THAT OUR GROUP  
19 REPRESENTS 7 MILLION PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA, AND LOOKING AT  
20 THE QUALIFICATIONS AND THE EXPERIENCE OF THE PEOPLE, AND STAFF  
21 HAS MENTIONED THAT THIS BODY WAS VERY -- THERE WAS SOMEBODY  
22 SELECTED FOR THEIR ACTIVISM, FOR EXPERTISE, FOR COMMUNITY  
23 INVOLVEMENT. AND LOOKING AT THE ROLES THAT ALL OF US PLAY, I  
24 FOUND THAT I HAD VERY MUCH OF AN OVERLAP WITH MANY OF THE  
25 RESPONSIBILITIES AND AREAS OF INTEREST OF THE GROUP. SO I FELT



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 THAT I COULD BRING OUT A LOT OF THE INTERESTS THAT YOU HAVE.  
2 AS A REPRESENTATIVE OF THE BODY, I REPRESENT SENIORS IN SAN  
3 FRANCISCO, FOR 15 YEARS, I HAVE BEEN A FOUNDING BOARD MEMBER  
4 OF NEXT VILLAGE WHICH HELPS SENIORS STAY IN THEIR HOMES. IT  
5 INCLUDES TRANSIT, HOUSING, AND PHYSICAL IMPROVEMENTS TO HOMES.  
6 AS A TRANSIT ADVOCATE, GROWING UP IN SAN FRANCISCO, I WAS A  
7 DEVOTED MUNI RIDER, AND BAY AREA TRANSIT RIDER FOR MY ENTIRE  
8 LIFE. I USED TO COMMUTE FROM -- WHEN I LIVED IN BERKELEY, FROM  
9 BERKELEY TO OAKLAND TO DOWNTOWN, FROM BERKELEY TO SAN  
10 FRANCISCO. WHEN I WAS IN SAN FRANCISCO, I USED TO COMMUTE TO  
11 BERKELEY. SO I HAVE BEEN A TRANSIT ADVOCATE. I HAVE INTEREST  
12 IN THAT, SO I HAVE SERVED ON THE TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS  
13 AUTHORITY CAC, MUNI CAC. I AM A FOUNDING BOARD MEMBER OF SAVE  
14 MUNI. AS AN ARCHITECT, I HAVE WORKED ON ACCESSIBILITY AND  
15 EQUITY ISSUES FOR MANY, MANY YEARS. I HAVE DEVELOPED ADA  
16 MASTER PLANS FOR THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL AIRPORT, FOR  
17 CANDLESTICK PARK STADIUM. I HAVE WORKED ON ACCESSIBILITY, AND  
18 EQUITABLE ACCESSIBILITY TO MANY PUBLIC BUILDINGS, AUDITORIUMS,  
19 ARENAS. AS A NEIGHBORHOOD ACTIVIST, I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN  
20 TRANSIT AND NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING ISSUES FOR MANY DECADES. I  
21 AM A CURRENTLY CHAIR OF THE TELEGRAPH HILL DWELLERS  
22 TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE. THIRD STINT IN THAT ROLE WHERE  
23 NEIGHBORHOOD TRANSIT WAS IMPROVED UNDER OUR WATCH BY SAVING  
24 OUR LOCAL BUS LINE BY CHANGING THE ROUTE TO IMPROVE ITS  
25 RIDERSHIP. AS A UNION PRESIDENT FOR INTERNATIONAL FEDERATION



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 OF PROFESSIONAL TECHNICAL ENGINEERS LOCAL 21, I HAD A CHANCE  
2 TO TRAVEL TO MANY OF THE BAY AREA CITIES TO LOOK AT VARIOUS  
3 WORKSITES FROM RICHMOND, TO OAKLAND, TO SAN FRANCISCO, TO  
4 FREMONT, TO SAN JOSE, TO SANTA CLARA. MORE THAN ANYTHING ELSE,  
5 I THINK I HAVE JUST HAD A VERY STRONG FEELING OF DEVOTION TO  
6 COMMUNITY, AND I FEEL THAT MY EXPERIENCE AND MY WORK,  
7 PROFESSIONAL WORK EXPERIENCE, REALLY OVERLAPS OVER MANY OF THE  
8 GOALS OF MTC AND THIS BODY. THANK YOU.

9

10 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU MR. WONG AND MISS CAMPOS.  
11 MARTHA ANY COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM OR ANY MEMBER COMMENTS IN THE  
12 GALLERY WISHING TO MAKE A COMMENT ON THIS?

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS  
15 ITEM NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE WITH  
16 THEIR HAND RAISED.

17

18 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S PROCEED WITH A ROLL CALL  
19 VOTE ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY.

22

23 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** AND JUST A REMINDER, YOU SAY THE NAME, OR  
24 YOU CAN ABSTAIN WHEN YOUR NAME IS CALLED. WHEN YOUR NAME IS



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 CALLED YOU SAY THE NAME OF THE PERSON YOU WANT TO VOTE FOR OR  
2 ABSTAIN.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** AU?

5

6 **CARLINE AU:** CAMPOS?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

9

10 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** CAMPOS. BENITEZ?

11

12 **DIANA BENITEZ:** CAMPOS.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BORDEN?

15

16 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** CAMPOS.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

19

20 **V. CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** CAMPOS?

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCH-GROSS?

23

24 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** CAMPOS.

25



1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

2

3 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** CAMPOS?

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF?

6

7 **ILAF ESUF:** CAMPOS.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

10

11 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** WONG.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLASER?

14

15 **GERRY GLASER:** WONG.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

18

19 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** CAMPOS.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

22

23 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** I DON'T KNOW. [LAUGHTER]

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ABSTAIN. OKAY. KALLINS?





1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** CAMPOS?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

5

6 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** CAMPOS.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAVERY?

9

10 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** CAMPOS.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

13

14 **ADINA LEVIN:** CAMPOS.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU? CARINA? TAKING THAT AS AN ABSENT.

17 LODIN?

18

19 **ZELLY LODIN:** CAMPOS.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

22

23 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** CAMPOS.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?



1

2 **JOHNNY PARKER:** CAMPOS.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE?

5

6 **PHILIPP PIERCE:** CAMPOS.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE?

9

10 **VINAY PIMPLE:** WONG.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RHODES?

13

14 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** CAMPOS.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

17

18 **TERRY SCOTT:** WONG.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOWARD WONG?

21

22 **HOWARD WONG:** WONG.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ROLAND WONG?

25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **RONALD WONG:** CAMPOS.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. CAMPOS IS THE WINNER WITH 19  
4 VOTES. WONG HAD FIVE. ONE ABSTENTION, AND ONE ABSENT.

5

6 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** ALL RIGHT. CONGRATULATIONS, NEW CHAIR  
7 CAMPOS. WE ARE GOING TO PIVOT NOW TO THE VICE CHAIR ELECTION.  
8 AND MR. WONG AND MR. BALDINI ARE THE TWO CANDIDATES IN THAT.  
9 AGAIN WE'LL GO IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER IN BRIEF STATEMENT ON  
10 YOUR POSITION.

11

12 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOOD MORNING. NORTH BAY  
13 NAPA BORN AND RAISED WALNUT CREEK, I'M AT THE 10AMENT FARMERS,  
14 PARENTS EARLY INTEREST IN LOGISTICS WORKED AND MOVED THROUGH  
15 THE PRIVATE SECTOR PUBLIC SECTOR GOODS THROUGHOUT THE WORLD  
16 FORTUNATE ENOUGH TO TRAVEL THROUGHOUT THE WORLD EXPERIENCE  
17 MANY DIFFERENT FORMS OF TRANSPORTATION FROM HORSE BACK TO  
18 SUPERSONIC TRANSPORT. THAT BEING SAID, I'M HUMBLLED TO BE HERE,  
19 AND I'LL WORK, AS OUR ARCHIMEDES SAID GIVE ME A PLACE TO MOVE  
20 IN THE WORLD. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

21

22 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** MR. WONG WOULD YOU LIKE TO MAKE A  
23 STATEMENT?

24



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **HOWARD WONG:** YES. OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS I HAVE BEEN  
2 ATTENDING REGULARLY MTC COMMISSION MEETINGS AT THE BAY AREA  
3 HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, FARE INTEGRATION MEETINGS REGIONAL  
4 NETWORK MANAGEMENT MEETINGS, AND I HAVE FOUND I HAVE A TRUE  
5 INTEREST IN MANY OF THE AREAS OF THE DISCUSSION. I MADE  
6 COMMENTS THAT I THINK ARE VALUABLE AS A NATIVE SAN FRANCISCO,  
7 I MENTIONED IMMIGRANT FAMILY TRANSIT WAS OUR PRIMARY MODE OF  
8 TRANSIT AND STILL IS FOR MANY PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA PUBLIC  
9 TRANSIT IS NOT ONLY A LIFELINE BUT REALLY IS THE ONLY MEANS OF  
10 COMMUTING OR USING OF GETTING AROUND THE REGION. MY TRANSIT  
11 ADVOCACY STARTED PRETTY YOUNG, I THINK, IN AGE. I HAVE  
12 TRAVELED MANY PARTS OF THE BAY AREA, ON MANY TRANSIT MODES  
13 MOSTLY AS JUST A HOBBY. AS I MENTIONED, I USED TO COMMUTE BOTH  
14 WAYS FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO EAST BAY, FROM EAST BAY TO LOCAL. I  
15 THINK MY NEIGHBORHOOD ROOTS AND ACTIVISM IS PROBABLY SOMETHING  
16 THAT'S ALWAYS CONSTANT AND I ALWAYS MAINTAIN THE RELATIONSHIP  
17 WITH WHAT'S HAPPENING LOCALLY IN MY PARTICULAR NEIGHBORHOOD.  
18 AND I THINK FOR ALL OF US, IN REPRESENTING THE 7 MILLION  
19 PEOPLE IN THE BAY AREA, THAT'S REALLY WHY I THINK WE'RE VERY  
20 POWERFUL. THAT WE DO HAVE A PULSE OF OUR NEIGHBORHOOD AND OUR  
21 COMMUNITIES. THANK YOU.

22

23 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU MR. WONG. AND I DON'T BELIEVE  
24 WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS THAT CAME IN ON THE PART OF THE  
25 VICE CHAIR POSITION?



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
3 RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM  
4 WISHING TO SPEAK AND NO ONE ON ZOOM WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

5

6 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** MR. RHODES DO YOU HAVE A COMMENT?

7

8 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** I HAVE A QUESTION I WOULD LIKE TO ASK BOTH  
9 CANDIDATES, IF THAT'S POSSIBLE. I SEE THE ROLE AS VICE CHAIR  
10 AS SUPPORTING THE CHAIRPERSON, THE CHAIR, AND CLEARLY  
11 KNOWLEDGE OF THIS ORGANIZATION, THE STAFF, AND ITS MISSION AND  
12 RESPONSIBILITIES IS VERY IMPORTANT. COULD EACH OF YOU SPEAK TO  
13 HOW YOU WILL SUPPORT THE CHAIR IN BEING SUCCESSFUL IN HER  
14 ROLE?

15

16 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** AND WHY DON'T WE FOLLOW THE CONVENTION OF  
17 ALPHABET, STILL. MR. BALDINI?

18

19 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** I HAVE DONE MY BEST AND WILL CONTINUE TO  
20 ENGAGE THE BOARD CHAIR IN PLANNING AND ATTENDANCE AND SUPPORT,  
21 AND REACHING OUT TO MY FELLOW COUNCIL MEMBERS, AND MAKE SURE  
22 THEIR VOICES ARE HEARD, AND WHO THEY REPRESENT SO I WILL BE IN  
23 SUPPORT OF THE COUNCIL AS WELL AS BEING ABLE TO STEP IN AT ANY  
24 TIME. I HAVE EXPERIENCE IN BOARD POSITIONS, NOT ONLY AT THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 COMMUNITY COLLEGE LEVEL, BUT ALSO IN -- ALSO IN OTHER  
2 TRANSPORTATION BOARDS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GO AHEAD.

5

6 **HOWARD WONG:** RANDI, WHEN YOU WATCH HER AT COMMISSION HEARINGS  
7 IS VERY HIGHLY REGARDED. AND PART OF HER SUCCESS HAS BEEN TO  
8 BRING OUT THE BEST IDEAS FROM THIS GROUP SO THAT IT CAN BE  
9 CONVEYED IN A MEANINGFUL WAY TO AFFECT FOR THE BETTER, MANY OF  
10 MTC'S GOALS REGARDING TRANSIT, TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING,  
11 REGIONAL PLANNING, URBAN DESIGN, AND MOST OF ALL TO HELP THE  
12 PEOPLE OF OUR AREA. WE'RE FACING SOME DAUNTING CHALLENGES  
13 AHEAD, WITH A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE THAT HAS SOME  
14 HURDLES. WE CAN CERTAINLY, AS A GROUP, USING IDEAS AND SUPPORT  
15 IMPLEMENT MANY OF THE PLANNED POLICIES, PLANNED BAY AREA PLAN  
16 TWIT 2050, AND FIND MEANS BY WHICH WE CAN GAIN THE SUPPORT OF  
17 A BROADER SECTION OF OUR COMMUNITY IN SUPPORT OF PUBLIC  
18 TRANSIT MEASURES AND DO OUR STAFF AND WORKERS AND OPERATORS  
19 THANK YOU.

20

21 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU MR. WONG. ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS  
22 FROM PEERS? WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED WITH ROLL CALL VOTE FOR THE  
23 VICE CHAIR LEADERSHIP POSITION.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AU?



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** WONG.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

5

6 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** BALDINI.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCH-GROSS?

9

10 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** WONG.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

13

14 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** BALDINI.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF?

17

18 **ILAF ESUF:** BALDINI.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

21

22 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** WONG.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLASER?

25



1 **GERRY GLASER:** BALDINI .

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

4

5 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** WONG .

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

8

9 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** BALDINI .

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

12

13 **WENDI KALLINS:** WONG .

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** BALDINI .

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAVERY?

20

21 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** BALDINI .

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

24

25 **ADINA LEVIN:** BALDINI .





JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WHOEVER HAS THEIR COMPUTER SOUND ON, CAN  
3 THEY PLEASE MUTE IT? IT'S GIVING FEEDBACK. LIEU? IS ABSENT.  
4 LODIN?

5

6 **ZELLY LODIN:** WONG.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** BALDINI.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?

13

14 **JOHNNY PARKER:** BALDINI.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE?

17

18 **PHILIPP PIERCE:** WONG.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE?

21

22 **VINAY PIMPLE:** BALDINI.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RHODES?

25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** BALDINI.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

4

5 **TERRY SCOTT:** BALDINI.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WONG. HOWARD WONG?

8

9 **HOWARD WONG:** WONG.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ROLAND WONG?

12

13 **RONALD WONG:** WONG.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI WINS WITH 14 VOTES. WONG HAD 11.

16 AND THERE WAS ONE ABSENT. VERY CLOSE.

17

18 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** ALL RIGHT. I THINK THAT WAS THE CLOSEST  
19 ELECTION I HAVE EVER WITNESSED. CONGRATULATIONS TO EVERYBODY  
20 WHO STEPPED UP TO RUN FOR LEADERSHIP. WE DO HAVE AN EXECUTIVE  
21 DIRECTOR ANDY FREMIER WHO HAS POPPED IN TO OFFER SOME WORDS OF  
22 GRATITUDE FOR CHAIR KINMAN.

23

24 **ANDREW FREMIER:** HELLO EVERYBODY. ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE  
25 DIRECTOR AT MTC. I APOLOGIZE FOR BEING A LITTLE BIT LATE. I



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WAS TALKING TO MAYOR MAHAN AND SPENT A MINUTE TALKING ABOUT  
2 CHAIR KINMAN AND THE SERVICE SHE'S GIVEN. I HAVE WORKED WITH A  
3 FEW CHAIRS OVER MY YEARS AT MTC BUT I REMEMBER RANDI THE MOST  
4 BECAUSE SHE'S BEEN HERE SUCH A LONG TIME. I PERSONALLY  
5 APPRECIATE THE LEVEL OF EFFORT SHE'S PUT INTO THE ITEMS. I  
6 THINK WE HAVE ALWAYS GOTTEN A FAIR RESPONSE SHE HAS A LONG  
7 MEMORY AND WE TRY TO RESPOND TO THE LONG-STANDING CHALLENGES  
8 THAT WE HAVE. I APPRECIATE HER WILLINGNESS TO JUMP INTO EVERY  
9 ITEM AND HELP YOU ALL UNDERSTAND THE PARTS AND PIECE OF WHAT  
10 WE DO, AND GIVE GOOD FEEDBACK. IT COMES FROM A HEARTFELT  
11 APPRECIATION OF THE WORK AND DEDICATED SERVICE YOU HAVE GIVEN  
12 TO THE COMMISSION. I REALIZE YOU'RE NOT STEPPING DOWN FROM THE  
13 COUNCIL AND YOU WILL BE AROUND TO HELP. REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO  
14 THE NEXT GENERATION OF LEADERSHIP HERE. I KNOW THE COMMISSION  
15 ALSO FEELS VERY MUCH IN THE SAME WAY AND THEY HAVE APPRECIATED  
16 THE INPUT AND THE REPORTS THAT WE GET ON A REGULAR BASIS. YOU  
17 KNOW, AS YOU DO TRANSITION FROM YOUR ROLE OF CHAIR, WE DO WANT  
18 TO MAKE SURE THAT YOUR CONTINUED PRESENCE DOES GET REFLECTED  
19 INTO THE DISCUSSION. WE DO WISH YOU THE WARMEST OPPORTUNITY TO  
20 MAYBE HAVE A LITTLE BIT LESS OF A DIRECT ROLE, AND MAYBE BE  
21 ABLE TO MAYBE DIG INTO ITEMS EVEN A LITTLE BIT MORE DIRECTLY.  
22 SO I WANT TO PERSONALLY THANK YOU BOTH FROM THE STAFF, BUT  
23 ALSO FROM THE COMMISSION, AND OF COURSE FROM THE PUBLIC AS  
24 WELL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH RANDI. AND I THINK WE HAVE A FEW  
25 PARTING GIFTS?



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** WE DO. AND MAYBE IF YOU DON'T MIND TAKING  
3 A MINUTE, I'LL PRESENT THE CERTIFICATE FROM EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR  
4 FREMIER ALONG WITH SOME SWAG TO BURDEN YOU DOWN FOR YOUR TRIP  
5 BACK.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND SIMULTANEOUSLY, WHILE THAT'S  
8 HAPPENING, CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR, PLEASE TAKE YOUR NEW  
9 POSITIONS.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE].

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, ALL, FOR THAT VOTE. I AM  
16 INCREDIBLY HUMBLLED TO BE IN THIS ROLE AS A FIRST TIME  
17 CHAIRPERSON. I HOPE I CAN LIVE UP TO YOUR EXPECTATIONS AND  
18 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU TO MAKE SURE THAT THE  
19 GOAL WE WANT TO ACCOMPLISH HERE WITH OUR TIME ON MTC CAN  
20 BECOME A REALITY AND I'M EXCITED ABOUT WHAT THAT'S GOING TO  
21 LOOK LIKE. IN THE SPIRIT OF KEEPING OUR MEETING MOVING  
22 FORWARD, I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A CLERICAL CHANGE TO THE AGENDA.  
23 IT LISTS RANDI KINMAN AS A PRESENTER THIS IS INCORRECT AND THE  
24 MEETING MINUTES WILL CORRECT THE ERROR. NEXT UP IS AGENDA ITEM



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 5A, APPROVAL OF THE DECEMBER 15, 2024 MEETING MINUTES. DO I  
2 HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE?

3

4 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** ELDRED MOTION TO APPROVE MINUTES.

5

6 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** I HEARD ELDRED MOTION. SECOND BY CHARLIE  
7 LAVERY. ARE THERE ANY MTC COUNCIL MEMBERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO  
8 HAVE COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? SEEING NONE. CLERK, WERE ANY ITEMS  
9 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM? AND  
10 IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM,  
11 PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-  
12 PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE BEHIND THE  
13 PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED  
16 ON THIS ITEM. THERE WAS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO  
17 SPEAK AND NO ONE? ZOOM WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL  
20 VOTE.

21

22 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AU?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BALDINI?

2

3 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BENITEZ?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** BORED ON?

10

11 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCH-GROSS?

14

15 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ELDRED?

18

19 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF?

22

23 **ILAF ESUF:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?



1

2 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GLASER?

5

6 **GERRY GLASER:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

9

10 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

13

14 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS?

17

18 **WENDI KALLINS:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KINMAN?

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LAVERY?

25



1 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LEVIN?

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** LIEU? IS ABSENT. LODIN?

8

9 **ZELLY LODIN:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** ABSTAIN.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?

16

17 **JOHNNY PARKER:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIERCE?

20

21 **PHILIPP PIERCE:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE?

24

25 **VINAY PIMPLE:** ABSENT -- [LAUGHTER] ABSTAIN.





JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RHODES?

3

4 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

7

8 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOWARD WONG?

11

12 **HOWARD WONG:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ROLAND WONG?

15

16 **RONALD WONG:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IT PASSES WITH TWO -- ONE ABSENT, TWO

19 ABSTENTIONS AND 23 AYES.

20

21 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NOW ON TO AGENDA ITEM SIX.

22 PUBLIC COMMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS. I WILL ASK THE CLERK TO

23 LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED TO THIS

24 ITEM AT [INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV) BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE

25 RECORD. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO ASK IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL  
2 COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM ON TODAY AGENDA, PLEASE USE  
3 THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS  
4 OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE BEHIND THE PODIUM, AND I WILL  
5 CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** TWO MINUTES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. ALETA, GO AHEAD.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, NEW CHAIR CAMPOS. PAMELA  
14 CAMPOS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM  
15 FOLD. SPEAKING GENERALLY. I'M VERY APPRECIATIVE TOWARD RANDI,  
16 WELCOME TO BE HERE IN THIS ROOM MANY TIMES FEELS GOOD TO BE  
17 HERE I DID A LOT OF ZOOM. I REALLY LIKE BEING HERE WITH Y'ALL  
18 THIS IS ONE OF THE MOST DIVERSE SPORTS THAT I KNOW THAT'S AN  
19 ASSET. I FEEL WELCOME IN THIS BOARDROOM AND I FEEL LIKE I  
20 BELONG IN THIS BOARDROOM. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT. I HAVE BEEN  
21 -- I PROBABLY -- I HAVEN'T BEEN TO YOUR MEETINGS IN A WHILE. I  
22 GO TO LOTS OF OTHER THINGS AND SPENT QUITE A BIT OF TIME IN  
23 NEW YORK. AND MY INCUMBENCY WITH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION ONLY  
24 GOES BACK MAYBE ABOUT TO 2,004 HERE IN THE BAY AREA. BUT I WAS  
25 INTRODUCED TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN NEW YORK CITY IN 1970.



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 THIS SHIRT SAYS NEW YORK CITY TRANSIT. THEY RUN A HUGE BUS  
2 SYSTEM, AND A LEGENDARY HISTORIC RAIL TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM  
3 CALLED THE SUBWAY WHICH HOLDS TO IDEALS OF BEING LEGENDARY AND  
4 STATELY. STEEPED IN TRADITION AND HISTORY. I HAVE BEEN DOING  
5 THAT SINCE THAT TIME AND RIDING ON MANY OTHER SYSTEMS. HOW DO  
6 WE BUILD THE BEST BART, MUNI, AND BEST MTC AND ALL THESE OTHER  
7 THINGS THAT WE CAN. I ASK THAT YOU ENGAGE DEEPLY, BECAUSE  
8 WE'RE ALL ON ONE-LEVEL HERE. WE'RE PEERS HERE. THIS IS A PEER  
9 GROUP, I SEE. AND IT'S EASY FOR ME TO SPEAK WITH PEERS AND  
10 SHARE. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO YOUR CONTINUED WORK, AND, RANDI,  
11 I HOPE THAT YOU WILL BE WITH US FOR A LONG TIME. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** DO WE HAVE ANOTHER SPEAKER?

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES, WARREN CUSHMAN IS MAKING THEIR WAY  
18 TO THE PODIUM.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. OKAY. HELLO EVERYONE MY NAME IS WARREN CUSHMAN  
21 COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING IN HAYWARD. FIRST  
22 OF ALL, I WANT TO CONGRATULATE RANDI FOR ALL OF HER YEARS OF  
23 SERVICE HERE AT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND AT MTC. SHE  
24 CERTAINLY HAS BEEN A FABULOUS REPRESENTATIVE, AND I RESPECT  
25 HER FOR A LONG TIME. SHE HAS CARED ABOUT EVERYONE IN THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 COMMUNITY, BUT A SPECIAL SHOUT OUT TO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES  
2 AND SENIORS WHICH IS SOMETHING SHE'S PASSIONATE ABOUT. I ALSO  
3 WANT TO WELCOME AND SAY THAT I'M GOING TO WORK WITH THE CHAIR  
4 AND THE VICE CHAIR, MISS CAMPOS AND MR. BALDINI. I JUST WANT  
5 TO SAY THAT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT ALL MEMBERS OF THE  
6 COUNCIL REALLY ENGAGE WITH THE BAHFA HOUSING BOND, WHICH OUGHT  
7 TO BE ON THE NOVEMBER 2024 BALLOT. PLEASE SPEND SOME TIME  
8 LEARNING ABOUT THE HOUSING BOND AS IT COMES UP. PLEASE INFORM  
9 YOURSELF ABOUT THE COUNTY STRUCTURES THAT ARE RELATED TO THE  
10 BOND. EACH COUNTY IS GOING TO HAVE ITS OWN EXPENDITURE PLAN.  
11 SO ENGAGE WITH YOUR COUNTIES, IF YOU WOULD. AND ALSO THINK  
12 ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF THE HOUSING BOND AS IT RELATES TO  
13 SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. IT'S, FRANKLY, VITAL TO  
14 OUR COMMUNITY. AND ALSO THE MEASURE COMING UP IN 2026,  
15 HOPEFULLY, THERE IS A LOT TO DO THERE. THERE IS A LOT OF  
16 ENGAGEMENT. A LOT TO BE FORBID OUT, UNCERTAINTY AROUND IT. I  
17 AM ENGAGED IN THAT REALM AND I ENCOURAGE YOU ALL TO DO SO AS  
18 WELL. THANK YOU

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC OR IN THE  
21 BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

22

23 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANYONE ONLINE?

24



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO ONE ONLINE AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND  
2 WAS RECEIVED.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** I'LL MOVE US ALONG TO AGENDA ITEM 7A  
5 TRANSIT 2050+ EXISTING CONDITIONS AND PRELIMINARY NEEDS GAPS  
6 ASSESSMENT. WE HAVE KARA VUICICH?

7

8 **KARA VUICICH:** YES. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** -- OF MTC, AND ANDY METZ TRANSIT WHOLE  
11 PRESENT THIS ITEM.

12

13 **KARA VUICICH:** I'M KARA VUICICH PRINCIPLE PLANNER WITH MTC WHO  
14 AND I'LL LET ANDY INTRODUCE HIMSELF.

15

16 **ANDY METZ:** ANDY METZ PRINCIPLE PLANNER AT AC TRANSIT COPROJECT  
17 MANAGER.

18

19 **DAVE VAUTIN:** DAVE VAUTIN DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS.

20

21 **KARA VUICICH:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBERS CHAIR CAMPOS AND VICE  
22 CHAIR BALDINI. AGAIN THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM WE'LL BE  
23 HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS AND TAKE FEEDBACK AT THE END OF THE  
24 PRESENTATION. THE EXISTING CONDITIONS NEEDS GAPS ANALYSIS THAT  
25 WE'RE PRESENTING TO YOU TODAY WAS REVIEWED BY OUR PROJECT



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 MANAGEMENT TEAM WHICH IS MADE UP OF STAFF FROM SEVEN LARGE  
2 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE REGION AND THREE REPRESENTATIVES  
3 SMALLER TRANSIT OPERATORS. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT MANY OF  
4 THE -- THERE WAS A LOT OF ANALYSIS AND WORK THAT WENT INTO THE  
5 SLIDES THAT YOU WILL SEE TODAY AND JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE  
6 THAT MUCH OF THAT WAS COMPLETED BY OUR CONSULTANT TEAM WHICH  
7 WAS LED BY FAREN PIERCE. IF YOU COULD BRING UP THE SLIDE DECK,  
8 PLEASE? GREAT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, I WANT TO START WITH A  
9 BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE PURPOSE OF TRANSIT 2050+ AND ITS  
10 RELATIONSHIP TO BOTH THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN,  
11 AS WELL AS TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AS MANY OF YOU MAY KNOW  
12 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WAS ADOPTED IN OCTOBER 2021 AS OUR  
13 REGIONAL PLAN ESTABLISHES OUR REGIONAL VISION STRATEGIES  
14 INVEST PRIORITIES FOR OUR TRANSPORTATION NETWORK INCLUDING  
15 TRANSIT THROUGH 2050. THE STRATEGIES INVESTMENTS IN PLANNED  
16 BAY AREA 2050 FOCUS ON PARTICULARLY ENHANCING TRANSIT SERVICE,  
17 IMPROVING TRANSIT NETWORK CONNECTIVITY AND REFORMING REGIONAL  
18 TRANSIT FARE POLICY. THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN,  
19 WHICH I THINK MANY OF YOU WERE INVOLVED IN THAT EFFORT WAS  
20 DEVELOPED BY THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE AND  
21 RESPONDED TO THE SIGNIFICANT CHANGES IN TRAVEL PATTERNS AND  
22 TRANSIT RIDERSHIP CAUSED BY THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC AND FOCUSED  
23 ON ADVANCING IMPLEMENTATION OF SOME OF THE KEY PLANNED BAY  
24 AREA 2050 TRANSIT STRATEGIES IN THE VERY NEAR-TERM. THE  
25 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IDENTIFIED 27 STRATEGIC



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 ACTIONS TO IMPROVE TRANSIT CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. AND IN  
2 PARTICULAR ACTION 18 WHICH IS TO FUND, DEVELOP, AND ADOPT A  
3 BAY AREA CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN BECAME THE BASIS FOR TWIT  
4 2050+. SO WITH TRANSIT 2050+ THIS IS A COMPREHENSIVE UPDATE OF  
5 THE SIX TRANSIT RELATED STRATEGIES THAT WERE INCLUDED IN  
6 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. THOSE VERY QUICKLY WERE MAINTAIN  
7 SUPPORTING OPTIMIZING OUR EXISTING SYSTEM, ENABLING SEAMLESS  
8 MOBILE EXPERIENCE REFORMING ON REGIONAL TRANSIT FARE POLICY  
9 ENHANCING LOCAL TRANSIT FREQUENCY CAPACITY RELIABILITY  
10 EXPANDING MODERNIZING REGIONAL RAIL NETWORK AND BUILDING  
11 INTEGRATED REGIONAL EXPRESS LANES AND EXPRESS BUS NETWORK.  
12 SOME OF YOU WERE ON THIS BODY OR RELATED BODY IN THE SUMMER  
13 WHEN WE PRESENTED OUR DRAFT GOALS DESIRED OUTCOMES FOR TRANSIT  
14 2050+. AND THESE WERE DEVELOPED TO REALLY FOCUS ON ADDRESSING  
15 MANY OF THE NEEDS IDENTIFIED THROUGH PREVIOUS WORK. AND REALLY  
16 COMPLEMENT THE VISION AND GUIDING PRINCIPLES ESTABLISHED FOR  
17 PLANNED BAY AREA. THESE GOALS FOCUS ON DEVELOPING AN  
18 INTEGRATED WELL CONNECTED TRANSIT NETWORK RECOVERING AND  
19 GROWING TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IMPROVING TRANSIT RELIABILITY AND  
20 SPEED AND REDUCING BARRIERS TO TRANSIT USE. NEXT SLIDE,  
21 PLEASE. SO, THIS SLIDE DEPICTS THE OVERALL TRANSIT 2050+  
22 APPROACH AND SCHEDULE, AND AS I MENTIONED, IN 2023, OUR WORK  
23 REALLY FOCUSED ON AN INITIAL ROUND OF PUBLIC OUTREACH AND THE  
24 SUMMER AND I'LL TALK ABOUT THAT IN THE NEXT SLIDE. AND THEN  
25 DEVELOPMENT OF THE TRANSIT 2050+ PROBLEM STATEMENT, GOALS AND



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 DESIRED OUTCOMES AND A WORKING DEFINITION OF OUR TRANSIT  
2 NETWORK THAT WE USE TO DEVELOP OUR NEEDS -- OUR EXISTING  
3 CONDITIONS, NEEDS, AND GAPS ANALYSIS. SO, TODAY, AGAIN, WE'RE  
4 PROVIDING AN OVERVIEW OF THE EXISTING CONDITIONS NEEDS AND  
5 GAPS AS AN INFORMATION ITEM. WE HAVE STARTED THE PROCESS OF  
6 IDENTIFYING SERVICE AND CAPITAL PROJECTS OR OPPORTUNITIES TO  
7 FILL THOSE GAPS. WE'RE GOING TO BE FINISHING UP THIS TASK IN  
8 THE NEXT SEVERAL WEEKS. WE HAVE ALSO BEGUN OUR WORK ON THE  
9 PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT WHICH ASSESSES THE BENEFITS AND  
10 COSTS OF MAJOR TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS BEING CONSIDERED FOR  
11 INCLUSION IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. AND THE GREAT MAJORITY OF  
12 THOSE PROJECTS ARE TRANSIT PROJECTS, ARE EITHER TRANSIT  
13 SERVICE OR CAPITAL INVESTMENTS WHICH IS WHY THIS WORK -- THE  
14 PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT IS BEING UNDERTAKEN AS PART OF  
15 TRANSIT 2050+. WE EXPECT TO COME BACK AND SHARE THE  
16 PRELIMINARY RESULTS OF THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT WITH  
17 THE COUNCIL AND COMMITTEE AND THE PUBLIC LATER THIS SPRING.  
18 SO, AFTER THAT, OUR NEXT MAJOR TASK IS TO DEVELOP A DRAFT  
19 TRANSIT NETWORK FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, A PART OF OUR WORK  
20 ON TRANSIT 2050+. WE'LL BE USING THE UPDATED PROJECTS FROM  
21 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, WHICH INCLUDED A ROBUST ASSESSMENT OF  
22 MID-AND LONG-TERM TRANSIT NEEDS. THE RESULTS. PROJECT  
23 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND THE VERY NEAR-TERM NEEDS, GAPS, AND  
24 OPPORTUNITIES ANALYSIS THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY TO  
25 DEVELOP THE SET OF TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND ASSOCIATED





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 INVESTMENT PRIORITIES THAT WILL MAKE UP THAT DRAFT TRANSIT  
2 NETWORK. WE'LL THEN CONDUCT A NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT  
3 WHICH WILL RELY ON USING THE MTC TRAVEL MODEL TO FORECAST, FOR  
4 THE FUTURE, THE OVERALL PERFORMANCE OF THAT NETWORK AGAINST  
5 THE GOALS AND OUTCOMES THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED FOR TRANSIT  
6 2050+. AND WE ANTICIPATE BRINGING ALL OF THIS, THE DRAFT  
7 NETWORK AND THE RESULTS BACK TO YOU THIS SPRING. SO THAT'S  
8 SOMETHING DEFINITELY TO LOOK FORWARD TO. AND IT WILL ALSO BE  
9 THE MAIN FOCUS OF THE SECOND ROUND OF PUBLIC OUTREACH THAT  
10 WILL KICKOFF IN SPRING OF THIS YEAR IN CONJUNCTION WITH  
11 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. WE'LL THEN BE SEEKING FEEDBACK ON THAT  
12 DRAFT NETWORK USING THAT FEEDBACK TO DEVELOP A FINAL NETWORK,  
13 AND THEN BRINGING THAT FOR ACTION IN THE SUMMER OF 2024 IN  
14 CONJUNCTION WITH ACTION ON THE FINAL PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+  
15 BLUEPRINT. SO, AFTER THAT, AND THEN AFTER THE SUMMER, THE WORK  
16 DOESN'T STOP THEN. WE'LL BE CONTINUING ON WITH DEVELOPING A  
17 SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT FOR TRANSIT 2050+ WHICH WILL DOCUMENT THE  
18 PROCESS OF DEVELOPING THAT NETWORK, BECAUSE THAT WILL FEED  
19 INTO PLANNED BAY AREA, AS WELL AS DOCUMENT SOME POTENTIAL  
20 EXPLORATION OF ADDITIONAL NETWORK ALTERNATIVES. NEXT SLIDE  
21 PLEASE.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** I HAVE A VERY QUICK QUESTION, JUST ABOUT THE  
24 PROCESS. AND LEAVE THE CONTENT UNTIL AT THE END. TWO QUESTIONS  
25 ABOUT THE PROCESS ARE, ONE, WHEN YOU SAY SPRING, DO YOU HAVE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 ANY IDEA, LIKE, APPROXIMATELY WHICH MONTH IN THE SPRING IT  
2 WILL BE?

3

4 **KARA VUICICH:** THAT WE WILL BE ACKNOWLEDGE BACK WITH RESULTS,  
5 APPROXIMATELY IN MAY.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** EARLIER ON THERE WAS A MENTION OF SCENARIOS OF  
8 NETWORK OPTIONS, BUT I DID NOT HEAR THE WORD SCENARIO IS THAT  
9 SOMETHING NO LONGER BEING DONE OR IS SCENARIO PART OF ANY OF  
10 THESE STEPS?

11

12 **KARA VUICICH:** SCENARIOS WILL BE AFTER DEVELOPMENT OF THE  
13 NETWORK SO WE DON'T HAVE THE TIME OR THE -- WE DON'T HAVE,  
14 BASICALLY, THE TIME, TO DEVELOP SCENARIOS, DRAFT NETWORK TIME  
15 TO MEET THE DEADLINE FOR THE PLANNED BAY AREA BLUEPRINT SO THE  
16 PROPOSAL IS TO PUT FORWARD THE DRAFT TRANSIT STRATEGIES  
17 NETWORK ESSENTIALLY TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS THAT  
18 WILL COMPRISE THE DRAFT NETWORK FOR PLANNED BAY AREA AND THEN  
19 TO CONTINUE EXPLORING VARIOUS SCENARIOS AND ALTERNATIVES AFTER  
20 THAT THEN CAN POTENTIALLY FEED INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2060  
21 WHICH WILL KICKOFF IN 2026.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. MANY QUESTIONS ABOUT CONTENT AT THE  
24 END.

25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT  
2 TIMELINE, TOO. COULD WE BACK UP TO THAT SLIDE?

3

4 **KARA VUICICH:** SURE IF YOU COULD GO BACK ONE SLIDE PLEASE.

5

6 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** SO, JUST LOOKING AT THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE  
7 ASSESSMENT, PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND THE DRAFT  
8 NETWORK, ARE THEY GOING TO LAND HERE AT THE SAME TIME OR WE'RE  
9 GOING TO HAVE ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT THE ASSESSMENT  
10 BEFORE WE'RE SHOWN A DRAFT NETWORK?

11

12 **KARA VUICICH:** SO, THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT IS A  
13 BENEFIT-COST ANALYSIS OF INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT PROJECTS WE'RE  
14 GOING TO BE USING THAT INFORMATION TO DEVELOP THE DRAFT  
15 NETWORK. AND, SO, WE WILL BE COMING BACK WITH RESULTS OF  
16 PRELIMINARY RESULTS OF BOTH. SO, YOU CAN SEE THE SCORES FOR  
17 THOSE INDIVIDUAL TRANSIT PROJECTS. AND THEN WHAT WE'LL DO IS  
18 COME BACK WITH THE DRAFT NETWORK THAT SHOWS HOW, YOU KNOW,  
19 THOSE PROJECTS EITHER FIT INTO THAT OR DID NOT.

20

21 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** SO THE ASSESSMENT WILL LAND A MEETING BEFORE  
22 THE DRAFT NETWORK?

23



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **KARA VUICICH:** YEAH WE'RE STILL FOLLOWING OUT THE EXACT TIMING.  
2 BUT DEPENDING ON THE TIMING WE'LL PROVIDE CONTEXT IN TERMS OF  
3 HOW ALL THE PIECES WILL FIT TOGETHER.

4

5 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** IT WOULD MAKE SENSE TO ME TO HAVE SOME TIME TO  
6 LOOK AT THAT ASSESSMENT RATHER THAN SEE THE ASSESSMENT AND,  
7 OH, HERE IS THE ASSESSMENT AND HERE IS WHAT WE'RE GOING TO DO,  
8 JUST IN TERMS OF PROCESS AND HAVING SOME TIME TO REVIEW THAT.

9

10 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH. APPRECIATE THE COMMENT. I WANT TO ADD TO  
11 WHAT KARA SAID. CERTAINLY WE WANT TO GET YOU USEFUL  
12 INFORMATION AND HAVE OPPORTUNITIES TO CHIME IN. I WILL JUST  
13 UNDERSCORE, THERE ARE STATUTORY DEADLINES THAT REQUIRE US  
14 MOVING AT AN ACCELERATED PACE FOR THIS EFFORT. AND THAT MEANS  
15 WE HAVE TO, YOU KNOW, WALK AND CHEW GUM AT THE SAME TIME  
16 PURSUING MULTIPLE STREAMS OF WORK SO WE'RE TRYING TO FEED  
17 THESE DIFFERENT STREAMS TOGETHER AND GET A VISION FEEDBACK.  
18 JUST TO EXPLAIN WHY THERE IS THAT RATHER QUICK CASE FOR THIS  
19 EFFORT, THE RECOMMENDATIONS COMING OUT OF TRANSIT 2050+ NEED  
20 TO FEED INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+.  
21 WHICH WILL BE HAPPENING AS YOU CAN SEE ON THE GRAPHIC HERE IN  
22 THE SUMMER TIME. SO THAT PLAN CAN GO THROUGH THE ENVIRONMENTAL  
23 CEQA PROCESS. DELAYS IN THIS EFFORT COULD THEN DELAY PLANNED  
24 BAY AREA'S ADOPTION WHICH WOULD PUT TRANSPORTATION PROJECT  
25 DELIVERY AT RISK ACROSS THE BAY AREA, BECAUSE THERE WOULD BE A



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 POTENTIAL LAPSE IN AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY. SO MOVING THAT AT A  
2 QUICK PACE ALONG IN VARIOUS STRANDS OF WORK IN A TIMELY MANNER  
3

4 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** I APPRECIATE THAT CONTEXT AND MOVING ALONG  
5 QUICKLY.

6

7 **KARA VUICICH:** THANK YOU FOR THAT FEEDBACK.

8

9 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** PLEASE GO BACK TO THE LAST SLIDE. I HAVE A  
10 COUPLE OF QUESTIONS ASSOCIATED WITH ADDITIONAL NETWORK  
11 ALTERNATIVES. IS THERE STILL AN OPPORTUNITY TO INTRODUCE  
12 ADDITIONAL NETWORK ALTERNATIVES FOR CONSIDERATION? AND WHAT IS  
13 THE TIMING? AND I GUESS, ALSO INCLUDED IN THAT IS, WHAT IS THE  
14 ROLE IN THE LOCAL MPO, IF YOU WILL, IN INTRODUCING THOSE  
15 ALTERNATIVES? CAN SOMEONE WHO IS NOT IN THE LOCAL MPO ADVANCE  
16 AN IDEA FOR CONSIDERATION? OR IDEAS FOR CONSIDERATION?

17

18 **KARA VUICICH:** SO, I THINK AS DAVE MENTIONED, UNFORTUNATELY  
19 WE'RE UNDER A TIGHT DEADLINE IN TERMS OF MEETING STATUTORY  
20 REQUIREMENTS SO WE DON'T HAVE MUCH FLEXIBILITY IN TERMS OF  
21 HAVING A SET OF A NETWORK THAT INCLUDES A SET OF TRANSIT  
22 STRATEGIES AND TRANSIT INVESTMENTS TO FEED INTO THE PLANNED  
23 BAY AREA BLUEPRINT IN THE SUMMER. SO, WHAT WE ARE FOCUSING ON  
24 THEN IS USING THE AVAILABLE INFORMATION THAT WE HAVE. SO WE  
25 HAVE A LOT OF VERY ROBUST ANALYSIS, AND A VERY ROBUST PROJECT



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 LIST FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING OVER THE  
2 PAST YEAR TO UPDATE ALL OF THAT INFORMATION FROM ALL THE  
3 VARIOUS LOCAL PROJECT SPONSORS. WE HAVE ALSO BEEN ALLOWED FOR  
4 THE OPPORTUNITY FOR THE NOMINATION OF NEW PROJECTS FROM PLANS  
5 THAT WERE ADOPTED BETWEEN, BASICALLY, AFTER PLANNED BAY AREA  
6 WAS ADOPTED. SO, WE HAVE SEVERAL OF THOSE PROJECTS, AS WELL.  
7 WE HAVE ALSO BEEN CONTINUING TO WORK WITH PROJECT SPONSORS TO  
8 REFINE SOME OF THEIR PROJECTS BASED ON THE NEEDS GAPS  
9 INFORMATION THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT TODAY, AS  
10 WELL. SO IN TERMS OF KIND OF DOING A BROADER CALL FOR OTHER  
11 IDEAS, UNFORTUNATELY I DON'T THINK -- WE'RE NOT GOING TO BE  
12 ABLE DO THAT BETWEEN NOW AND THE SPRING. BUT IT'S CERTAINLY  
13 SOMETHING WE'RE HOPING TO EXPLORE FURTHER WHEN WE HAVE IN TIME  
14 AND HAVE OURSELVES SET UP WELL FOR MOVING INTO PLANNED BAY  
15 AREA 2050 WHICH IS GOING TO BE A MUCH BIGGER OVERALL PLAN  
16 UPDATE AND ENABLE US TO REALLY HAVE A BROADER EXPLORATION OF  
17 THOSE THINGS.

18

19 **DAVE VAUTIN:** I'LL QUICKLY DIRECT YOUR ATTENTION, THE SMALL  
20 PURPLE BOXES ON THE SCREEN HERE WHICH HIGHLIGHT WE'RE GOING TO  
21 HAVE A NUMBER OF MORE OPPORTUNITIES TO NOT ONLY ENGAGE WITH  
22 THIS BODY BUT ALSO ENGAGE WITH THE PUBLIC. SO THE GOAL HERE IS  
23 TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE ONGOING FEEDBACK WITH A KEY JUNCTURE THIS  
24 SPRING TO GET FEEDBACK ON A DRAFT NETWORK FOR PLANNED BAY AREA  
25 2050+ AND AS WE MOVE INTO THE ADDITIONAL NETWORK ALTERNATIVE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 STAGE WHICH STARTS IN THE SUMMER, THERE IS PLENTY OF TIME IN  
2 THE SCHEDULE FOR THAT, THERE WILL BE FURTHER PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT  
3 WINDOWS AS WELL. SO IT'S GOING TO BE AN ONGOING PROCESS.

4

5 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** I UNDERSTAND THE NEED TO CONFORM WITH  
6 SCHEDULE, AND CERTAINLY THE NEED TO HAVE CERTIFIED CEQA  
7 DOCUMENT, AND, YOU KNOW, NEPA REQUIREMENT US THAT MAY BE  
8 TRYING TO FACE BUT I GUESS THE QUESTION IS HOW CAN WE  
9 INTRODUCE NEW IDEAS AND WHERE WILL THEY FIT IN SUBSEQUENT TO  
10 THE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ PROCESS. NOW, IS THERE -- WHEN DO  
11 WE GO INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2060, FOR EXAMPLE, I GUESS IS A  
12 FAIR QUESTION?

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** POINT OF PRIVILEGE IF I MAY, I WOULD  
15 LOVE TO HEAR THE REST OF STAFF'S PRESENTATION, AND I'M  
16 UNDERSTANDING THAT WE HAVE A LOT OF EAGERNESS TO JUMP INTO THE  
17 QUESTIONS BUT IF WE COULD PLEASE HOLD UNTIL STAFF HAS HAD A  
18 CHANCE TO PRESENT THE FULL AGENDA ITEM SO WE COULD HAVE A  
19 ROBUST COORDINATION TOGETHER, I WOULD REALLY APPRECIATE THAT.  
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **KARA VUICICH:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. AND, YEAH, DEFINITELY  
23 LOOKING FORWARD TO HEARING LOTS OF FEEDBACK AND DISCUSSION.  
24 SO, NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, JUST WANTED TO PRESENT YOU ALL  
25 WITH A VERY BRIEF OVERVIEW OF SOME OF THE KEY FINDINGS FROM



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 OUR PUBLIC OUTREACH THAT WAS CONDUCTED IN SUMMER OF 2023. OUR  
2 OUTREACH EFFORTS INCLUDED IN-PERSON POP-UP EVENTS IN ALL NINE  
3 COUNTIES AS WELL AS A SURVEY. AND THE FOCUS OF THIS INITIAL  
4 ROUND OF PUBLIC OUTREACH WAS TO INFORM THE PUBLIC ABOUT BOTH  
5 TRANSIT 2050+ AS WELL AS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. AND GAIN A  
6 BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF HOW PEOPLE'S LIVES AND PRIORITIES MAY  
7 HAVE CHANGED AS A RESULT OF THE PANDEMIC. FOR TRANSIT, WE  
8 FOCUSED ON PARTICIPANTS LEVEL OF TRANSIT USE AND WHAT FACTORS  
9 WERE IMPORTANT TO THEM WHEN CHOOSING TO USE TRANSIT, AS WELL  
10 AS THE TYPES OF TRIPS THEY EITHER MADE OR POTENTIAL WOULD LIKE  
11 TO MAKE ON TRANSIT. WHAT WE LEARNED IS THAT FREQUENCY AND  
12 CONVENIENCE -- AND WE DEFINE CONVENIENCE IN THIS PUBLIC  
13 OUTREACH WHETHER OR NOT TRANSIT TAKES YOU WHERE YOU NEED TO  
14 GO, FREQUENCY CONVENIENCE AND TRAVEL TIME EMERGED AS TOP  
15 PRIORITIES ACROSS THE BOARD. WHILE SAFETY WAS A TOP PRIORITY  
16 FOR THOSE REPORTED NEVER USING TRANSIT. AND WE KNOW FROM SOME  
17 OF OUR OTHER SURVEY WORK THAT'S A PRETTY SIGNIFICANT PORTION  
18 OF THE POPULATION. FREQUENT TRANSIT USERS REPORTED USING  
19 TRANSIT TO TRAVEL TO WORK WHILE LESS FREQUENT OR NON-USERS  
20 FOCUSED ON TRIPS FOR LEISURE, RECREATION AND TRAVEL TO THE  
21 AIRPORT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS I MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY, THE  
22 EXISTING CONDITIONS NEEDS AND GAPS ANALYSIS IS JUST ONE PIECE  
23 OF THE INFORMATION AND ANALYSIS THAT WE'RE USING TO DEVELOP  
24 THE DRAFT TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENT THAT IS GOING TO  
25 MAKE UP THE DRAFT TRANSIT NETWORK FOR TRANSIT 2050+ AND THEN





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 AGAIN WILL FEED INTO PLANNED BAY AREA. SO, WHAT'S DEPICTED ON  
2 THIS SLIDE ESSENTIALLY ARE THE DIFFERENT COMPONENTS AND HOW  
3 THEY FIT TOGETHER TO HELP US DEVELOP THAT DRAFT TRANSIT  
4 NETWORK. SO, AGAIN, THE DRAFT EXISTING CONDITIONS NEEDS AND  
5 GAPS ANALYSIS PRESENTED TODAY IS FOCUSED ON IDENTIFYING POST-  
6 PANDEMIC TRAVEL PATTERNS AND NEEDS IN 2023 AND COMPARING THEM  
7 TO CURRENT TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS TO IDENTIFY WHERE ADDITIONAL  
8 FIXED ROUTE SERVICE MAY BE NEEDED AND VIABLE. I JUST WANT TO  
9 POINT OUT THAT THIS IS -- IT'S A REGION-WIDE ASSESSMENT AND  
10 WE'RE ALSO CONTINUING TO WORK WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS AND OTHER  
11 LOCAL AGENCIES TO UPDATE THEIR LOCALLY NOMINATED PROJECTS AS  
12 PART OF TRANSIT 2050+, AS WELL. SO, AGAIN, THIS WORK  
13 COMPLEMENTS THE ROBUST ANALYSIS OF MID-AND LONG-TERM NEEDS  
14 THAT WERE CONDUCTED AS PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. AS WELL  
15 AS THE BENEFIT-COST ANALYSIS FOR THOSE MAJOR TRANSIT AND  
16 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS THAT'S BEING UNDERTAKEN AS PART OF THE  
17 PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT. AND LASTLY, WE'LL BE ASSESSING  
18 THE OVERALL PERFORMANCE OF THE DRAFT TWIT 2050+ NETWORK GOALS  
19 AND DESIRED OUTCOMES AS PART OF THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE  
20 ASSESSMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS NEXT SET OF SLIDES FOCUSES  
21 ON UNDERSTANDING CURRENT EXISTING CONDITIONS THIS INFORMATION  
22 WAS USED TO IDENTIFY POTENTIAL TRANSIT SERVICE GAPS THAT EXIST  
23 NOW IN 2023. THIS ANALYSIS COMPLEMENTS THE FUTURE ANALYSIS  
24 THAT WAS CONDUCTED AS PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND THAT  
25 WILL WE'LL ALSO BE CONSIDERING AS PART OF THE NETWORK



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT.  
2 THIS SLIDE DEPICTS TRANSIT ORIENTATION WHICH REPRESENTS THE  
3 EARN EXTERNAL FACTORS THAT AFFECT TRANSIT RIDERSHIP OUTSIDE  
4 THE SERVICE THAT IS PROVIDED AND IT HELPS US UNDERSTAND WHERE  
5 POTENTIAL TRANSIT RIDERSHIP MAY BE HIGHER OR LOWER. AND WHERE  
6 FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT IS GOING TO BE MORE EFFECTIVE AND WHAT  
7 TYPES OF TRANSIT SERVICES IN TERMS OF CAPACITY AND FREQUENCY  
8 MAY BE BEST SUITED TO DIFFERENT AREAS. THE INDEX IMAGE  
9 REPRESENTS A COMBINATION OF APPOINTMENT OF DENSITY  
10 INTERSECTION DENSITY AND SHARE OF VEHICLE HOUSEHOLDS, FACTORS  
11 THAT AFFECT RIDERSHIP FACTORS MASHED REFLECT ANALYSIS REGION-  
12 WIDE AND WELL SUPPORTED BY RESEARCH. THIS TRANSIT ORIENTATION  
13 INDEX REPRESENTS CONDITIONS IN 2020 AND 2021 AND WAS USED TO  
14 IDENTIFY CURRENT POTENTIAL FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT SERVICE NEEDS.  
15 WE'LL BE LOOKING AT FUTURE LAND USE CONDITIONS AGAIN AS PART  
16 OF THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT AND TO SOME EXTENT PART  
17 OF THE INDIVIDUAL PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT. IN SHORT IN  
18 TERMS OF KEY FINDINGS WE SEE HIGHEST LEVEL OF TRANSIT  
19 ORIENTATION IN DOWNTOWN AREAS AND IN MANY COMMUNITIES RINGING  
20 THE BAY AS WELL AS IN DOWNTOWN AREAS FARTHER EAST OF THE INNER  
21 BAY. ALL RIGHT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE NEXT COMPONENT OF  
22 OUR EXISTING CONDITIONS ANALYSIS FOCUS ON TRANSIT SERVICE  
23 LEVELS. TO UNDERSTAND BOTH CURRENT TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS AND  
24 ALSO FOR -- WE ALSO LOOKED AT OVERALL TRAVEL DEMAND, WHICH  
25 I'LL BE TALKING ABOUT NEXT, TO UNDERSTAND THESE PATTERNS



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 ACROSS THE ENTIRE NINE CAN'T BAY AREA REGION WE FIRST STARTED  
2 BY DIVIDING THE REGION INTO GEOGRAPHICS OF AREAS AND ANALYZE  
3 THE TRANSIT SERVICES CONNECTING THOSE GEOGRAPHIC AREAS AS WELL  
4 AS THE TRAVEL AND TRANSIT SERVICES BETWEEN THEM. THE  
5 CONCEPTUAL MAP THAT IS ON THIS SLIDE, THAT'S ON THE RIGHT SIDE  
6 OF THIS SLIDE REPRESENTS THESE DIFFERENT GEOGRAPHIC SUBAREAS.  
7 THESE ARE THE GRAY CIRCLES AND THESE REPRESENT MUCH LARGER  
8 GEOGRAPHIES AND THE LINES CONNECTING THESE CIRCLES REPRESENT  
9 ALL AVAILABLE TRANSIT SERVICE BETWEEN THOSE DIFFERENT  
10 GEOGRAPHIC SUBAREAS. SO THIS IS ACTUALLY A LOT OF INFORMATION  
11 THAT'S CONDENSED INTO A RELATIVELY SIMPLISTIC GRAPHIC. WE  
12 ANALYZED TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS FOR THE MORNING PEAK, MIDDAY,  
13 AFTERNOON PEAK AND EVENINGS DURING WEEKDAYS FOR THIS UNLESS  
14 ANALYSIS WE HAVE TIME AND RESOURCES TO FOCUS ON WEEKDAYS BUT  
15 WE KNOW WEEKEND RIDERSHIP HAS BEEN GROWING FOR A NUMBER OF  
16 TRANSIT OPERATORS THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND WE MAY BE ABLE TO  
17 FURTHER ASSESS LATE NIGHT SERVICE TRAVEL NEEDS AS PART OF  
18 FUTURE SERVICE PLANNING EFFORTS. THE IMAGE ON THE SLIDE SHOWS  
19 RELATIVE INDEX OF TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS FROM SPRING 2023  
20 SHOWING NUMBER OF ROUTES AND FREQUENCY OF ROOTS IN TERMS OF  
21 CAPTURING LEVEL OF SERVICE GENERAL WHAT WE SEE IS SERVICE  
22 LEVELS TO A LARGE EXTENT ALIGN WHERE WE SEE TRANSIT  
23 ORIENTATION WITH HIGHER SERVICE LEVELS IN THE INNER EAST BAY  
24 AND AROUND MAJOR DOWNTOWN AREAS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT THE PARTICULAR  
2 LAST TWO SETS OF MAPS. BECAUSE YOU HAVE A NORTHERN ZONE AND A  
3 SOUTHERN ZONE AND IT LOOKS LIKE MOST OF THE SEVEN ZONE ON PAGE  
4 SIX IS PART OF THE NORTHERN ZONE, EXCEPT FOR THE BIG PRINT-OUT  
5 TO THE RIGHT.

6

7 **KARA VUICICH:** IF YOU BEING BRING UP THE PREVIOUS SLIDE THAT'S  
8 WHAT YOU'RE ASKING ABOUT. SORRY FOR NOT EXPLAINING THAT MORE  
9 CLEARLY. IF WE COULD GO BACK ONE SLIDE PLEASE. I THINK WHAT  
10 THE TWO NORTHERN ZONES, IT'S JUST PROVIDING A CLOSE-UP OF THE  
11 MAP THAT'S ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE SLIDE. BECAUSE IT'S  
12 OBVIOUSLY VERY HARD TO SEE THE DETAIL WHEN, FOR THE ENTIRE  
13 REGION ON A MAP THAT SIZE. SO WE TRIED TO PROVIDE A CLOSE-UP  
14 OF KIND OF THE DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO DOWNTOWN OAKLAND AREAS.  
15 AND THE DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE AREAS.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** BUT MY QUESTION IS, IS, ARE YOU ACTUALLY  
18 WORKING ON THESE AS A DIVIDED -- YOU'RE NOT?

19

20 **KARA VUICICH:** NO. IT'S JUST TO ILLUSTRATE IT.

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** AND SO ON THE NEXT SET OF MAPS, WHEN YOU  
23 ARE DINNING INTO THE ALAMEDA DOWNTOWN, SAN FRANCISCO DOWNTOWN,  
24 OAKLAND, THAT'S JUST BECAUSE YOU HAVE PICKED OUT AN AREA?

25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **KARA VUICICH:** RIGHT. SO THOSE ARE ACTUALLY REPRESENTING MUCH  
2 LARGER AREAS. SO THE WAY -- BECAUSE WE WERE TRYING TO ANALYZE  
3 BOTH SERVICE AND TRAVEL PATTERNS ACROSS ALL NINE COUNTIES SO  
4 IT'S A PRETTY MACRO LEVEL ANALYSIS. WE TOOK THE ENTIRE BAY  
5 AREA AND DIVIDED IT INTO SMALLER GEOGRAPHIES AND WE BASED  
6 THOSE SMALLER GEOGRAPHIES ON KIND OF WHERE MAJOR NODES FOR  
7 TRANSIT WERE THROUGHOUT THE SYSTEM WORKING WITH OUR TRANSIT  
8 OPERATORS TO DETERMINE THAT. AND THAT'S WHAT YOU SEE  
9 REPRESENTED ON THOSE SUBSEQUENT DIAGRAMS.

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** SO MY QUESTION IS, IS THERE A  
12 COMPLEMENTARY SET OF MAPS FOR THE REST OF THE REGION FOR THIS?  
13 FOR THE ONES -- THE NEXT PAGE, ON PAGE SEVEN?

14

15 **KARA VUICICH:** I'M NOT -- IF WE COULD GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE? I'M  
16 NOT SURE I COMPLETELY UNDERSTAND YOUR QUESTION.

17

18 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** SO THAT'S NICE, THAT IT SHOWS ME THE  
19 PROCESS -- SHOWS ME THE ISSUE THERE, BUT IT DOESN'T SHOW ME  
20 THE ISSUE ANYWHERE OUTSIDE OF THAT PARTICULAR AREA. IS THERE  
21 COMPLEMENTARY SETS OF SLIDES THAT SHOW ME THE OTHER AREAS  
22 BESIDES WHAT'S ON THAT?

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** V LIKE A MORE DETAILED OF THAT PARTICULAR  
25 --



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** HERE IS ANOTHER MAP THAT GOES HERE, AND  
3 IT'S THE NEXT BLOCK PUP, OR THE NEXT BLOCK TO THE EAST OR TO  
4 THE SOUTH.

5

6 **KARA VUICICH:** THIS DIAGRAM REPRESENTS THE ENTIRE NINE COUNTY  
7 REGION.

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. BUT -- YEAH, BUT THIS DOESN'T GO  
10 ALL THE WAY DOWN, AND THIS DOESN'T GO ALL THE WAY --

11

12 **KARA VUICICH:** RIGHT. SO WE DON'T HAVE THE VERY -- RIGHT. SO, I  
13 THINK WHAT YOU'RE ASKING IS IT DOESN'T INCLUDE FOR EXAMPLE, IT  
14 DOESN'T SHOW GILROY AT THE SOUTH? RIGHT? AND WHY IS IT CUT  
15 OFF?

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES.

18

19 **DAVE VAUTIN:** ACTUALLY IF YOU LOOK CLOSELY THERE AT THE TEXT,  
20 YOU CAN SEE THERE IS AN ARROW INDICATING GILROY AND THE SOUTH  
21 COUNTY CORRIDOR. WE'RE NOT SHOWING OUR NEIGHBORING REGIONS  
22 THIS WAS ANALYSIS CONFINED TO THE REGION BUT THE MAP IS A  
23 SYMBOLIC DIAGRAM IT REFLECTS ALL OF THE BAY AREA.

24

25 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.



JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **KARA VUICICH:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. SORRY FOR MY INABILITY TO  
3 UNDERSTAND. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY. SO, SIMILAR TO THE  
4 PREVIOUS SLIDE THE IMAGE ON THIS SLIDE IS A CONCEPTUAL MAP OR  
5 DIAGRAM THAT REPRESENTS, AGAIN, THESE DIFFERENT GEOGRAPHIC  
6 SUBAREAS THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND THE LINES CONNECTING THEM  
7 REPRESENT ALL OF THE TRAVEL FOR ALL MODES, WHETHER IT'S BY CAR  
8 OR BUS OR BIKING OR WALKING, AND ALL TYPES OF TRIP PURPOSES  
9 BETWEEN THOSE DIFFERENT GEOGRAPHIC SUBAREAS. AND SO, AGAIN,  
10 THE SCALE, THE WAY WE HAVE REPRESENTED THESE DIFFERENTLY  
11 LEVELS OF TRAVEL BETWEEN THESE DIFFERENT GEOGRAPHIES IS AN  
12 INDEX. AND SO IT ILLUSTRATES THE RELATIVE TRAVEL DEMAND  
13 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO THE DARKER LINES ARE WHERE THERE IS  
14 -- WHERE WE SAW, SORT OF, THE HIGHEST LEVELS OF TRANSIT DEMAND  
15 IN THE REGION THEN THE LIGHTER YELLOW LINES WERE AREAS WHERE  
16 WE SAW LOWER TRAVEL DEMANDS BETWEEN THOSE PARTICULAR  
17 GEOGRAPHIES.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** CAN I ASK A QUESTION?

20

21 **KARA VUICICH:** SURE.

22

23 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** TO THE CHAIR.

24



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** POINT OF ORDER WE HAVE A FEW MORE SLIDES  
2 THEN WE CAN GET TO QUESTIONS IF THAT'S OKAY WITH YOU ALL.  
3 THANK YOU.

4  
5 **KARA VUICICH:** AGAIN THIS ANALYSIS FOCUSED ON TRAVEL WITHIN THE  
6 BAY AREA REGION ONLINE. UNFORTUNATELY WE DIDN'T HAVE THE  
7 CAPACITY TO STUDY TRAVEL WITH ORIGINS OR DESTINATIONS OUTSIDE  
8 THE REGION AS PART OF THIS ANALYSIS BUT WE DO HAVE MULTIPLE  
9 PROJECTS, MULTIPLE TRANSIT PROJECTS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN  
10 IDENTIFIED TO ADDRESS MANY OF THESE NEEDS THAT WE'LL BE  
11 INCLUDING IN OUR NEXT PHASE OF WORK. OVERALL THE INDEX AND  
12 DIAGRAM SHOW WHERE TRAVEL IS GREATEST FOR ALL MODES AND TYPES  
13 OF TRIPS AGAIN AVERAGE ACROSS WEEKDAYS BUT THERE ARE LINKS  
14 WHERE WE SEE GREATER VARIATION BETWEEN DIFFERENT TIME PERIODS  
15 AND WE HAVE NOTED THOSE. THE TRAVEL DEMAND INDEX SHOWS TRAVEL  
16 DEMAND FOR THE GENERAL POPULATION THEN WE ALSO ANALYZED TRAVEL  
17 DEMAND FOR SPECIFIC EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATIONS. SO THOSE WERE  
18 DEFINED AS TRIPS THAT ORIGINATED FROM OUR EQUITY PRIORITY  
19 COMMUNITIES, OR TRIPS FROM CENSUS TRACTS THAT HAVE HIGHER  
20 CONCENTRATIONS OF LOW-INCOME, BLACK, OR HISPANIC AND LATINO  
21 HOUSEHOLDS WE IDENTIFIED LINKS WHERE THOSE EQUITY PRIORITY  
22 POPULATION TRAVEL DEMAND -- WHERE THE TRAVEL DEMAND FOR THE  
23 EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATIONS ARE HIGHER THAN OVERALL TRAVEL  
24 DEMAND AND BASICALLY IDENTIFIED THE DIAGRAM LINES OF BLUE  
25 HIGHER LEVEL OF TRANSIT TRAVEL DEMAND FOR EQUITY PRIORITY





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 POPULATIONS VERSUS THE GENERAL POPULATION. WE DIDN'T FIND ANY  
2 CLEAR PATTERNS IN TERMS OF PEAK VERSUS OFF-PEAK VARIATION. SO  
3 DIDN'T SEE MAJOR DIFFERENCES BETWEEN TRAVEL DEMAND FOR THOSE  
4 EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATIONS FOR MORNING OR EVENING VERSUS  
5 MIDDAY. AND YEAH. SORRY. THAT'S -- AND, SO THAT WAS THE -- THE  
6 FOCUS OF THE EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATION TRAVEL DEMAND  
7 ANALYSIS. GREAT. SO, THAT CONCLUDES THE EXISTING CONDITIONS  
8 SLIDES. THEN IN THE NEXT SET OF SLIDES, ANDY METZ IS GOING TO  
9 WALK YOU THROUGH HOW WE USE THE EXISTING CONDITIONS ANALYSIS  
10 TO IDENTIFY WHERE WE MAY HAVE CURRENT NEEDS FOR ADDITIONAL  
11 TRANSIT SERVICE BASED ON THE TRANSIT ORIENTATION AND OUR  
12 TRAVEL DEMAND INDEX AND THEN COMPARING THAT TO EXISTING  
13 TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, KARA. IF YOU COULD ADVANCE TO THE NEXT  
16 SLIDE. AS KARA MENTIONED, IT'S A STRAIGHT FORWARD PROCESS FOR  
17 HOW WE GET TO THE TRANSIT SERVICE NEEDS AS KARA MENTIONED,  
18 THAT IS PUT THROUGH THE TRANSIT ORIENTATION, EQUITY POPULATION  
19 DEMAND AND TRAVEL INDIANA, WE COMPARE THAT WITH EXISTING  
20 SERVICE LEVELS THIS, IS SPECIFICALLY FROM SPRING OF 2023 AND  
21 THAT'S WHERE WE IDENTIFY THE AREAS WHERE WE NEED TO CONSIDER  
22 MORE SERVICE. THIS SLIDE DOES SAY GAP. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE  
23 THAT GAP DOES NOT MEAN WE'RE SPECIFICALLY LOOKING AT AN AREA  
24 THAT DOESN'T HAVE ANY TRANSIT SERVICE AND WE NEED TO FILL IT  
25 WITH TRANSIT SERVICE. THERE ARE A COUPLE OF CASES LIKE THAT,



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 BUT IT'S AN AREA WHERE WE SEE EXISTING SERVICE LEVELS NOT  
2 MEETING THE NEED OF WHAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED FROM THE TRANSIT  
3 SERVICE NEEDS. NEXT SLIDE. THIS OUTLINES RIGHT HERE THE  
4 SERVICE LEVEL NEEDS THAT WE FIND THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. SO,  
5 THE SERVICE NEEDS INDEX THAT YOU SEE ON THE LEFT-HAND SIDE  
6 GOING FROM ONE, VERY HIGH, TO FIVE, VERY LOW, THOSE INDICATE  
7 THE AREAS WITHIN THE BAY AREA WHERE WE SEE THE HIGHEST AND  
8 LOWEST NEEDS INDEX. AND PROBABLY NOT SURPRISINGLY, NEEDS ARE  
9 VERY HIGH WITHIN THE SAN FRANCISCO AREA, ALSO ALONG THE NEAR  
10 EAST BAY AND IN THE SOUTH BAY, AS WELL. THROUGHOUT THE NORTH  
11 BAY, AND THE FAR EAST BAY WE SEE USUALLY LOW TO VERY LOW  
12 SERVICE NEEDS INDEX. BUT THE NEEDS ARE STILL THERE. SO, THESE  
13 ARE AREAS THAT WE'RE, OF COURSE, STILL CONSIDERING, THEN WE  
14 HAVE THE INDEX VARIATION ACROSS TIME PERIODS THAT'S WHAT KARA  
15 REFERRED TO. THERE ARE BIG DIFFERENCES BETWEEN PEAK PERIODS  
16 AND NON PEAK PERIODS THROUGHOUT THE DAY. ON THE NEXT SLIDE.  
17 THIS INDICATES, ONCE WE DID THAT FULL ANALYSIS OF SEEING WHERE  
18 OUR EXISTING SERVICES ARE, VERSUS OUR NEEDS, WHERE WE SEE  
19 THOSE POTENTIAL SERVICE GAPS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, WE HAVE  
20 IDENTIFIED THIS AND BROKEN THIS DOWN, ESSENTIALLY INTO THREE  
21 KEY AREAS, WHERE WE SAW POTENTIAL GAPS, IDENTIFIED FOR PEAK  
22 AND NON PEAK PERIODS. WHERE WE SAW THEM ONLY FOR PEAK PERIODS  
23 AND THEN WHERE WE SAW THEM FOR ONLY NON PEAK PERIODS. YOU CAN  
24 SEE THEY'RE DISPERSED THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. WE HAVE MANY  
25 ACROSS THE BAY, NORTHEAST BAY, SOUTH BAY, EAST BAY, AND IN SAN



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 FRANCISCO AND ALONG THE PENINSULA, AS WELL. IN MANY AREAS.  
2 AND, AGAIN, AS I REPEATED EARLIER THIS DOESN'T INDICATE THESE  
3 ARE AREAS THAT DO NOT HAVE TRANSIT BUT AREAS WHERE WE THINK  
4 EXISTING CONDITIONS ARE NOT MET BY THE CURRENT SERVICE THAT'S  
5 OUT THERE. SO, IN A COUPLE OF CASES, FROM NOVATO TO VALLEJO,  
6 AND FROM SAN MATEO TO SAN LEANDRO ACROSS THE BAY, THERE IS NO  
7 CURRENT TRANSIT SERVICE. SO, WE HAVE IDENTIFIED THOSE AS  
8 POTENTIAL NEEDS AS WELL. BUT, AGAIN, THEY ARE DISPERSED, I  
9 BELIEVE THERE ARE 30 TOTAL LINKS BETWEEN THESE DIFFERENTLY  
10 TRAVEL SHED AREAS THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED AS MEETING EXTRA  
11 SERVICE. NEXT SLIDE SPECIFICALLY LOOKING AT SPEEDS WITHOUT  
12 ARTERIALS WITHIN THE SYSTEM. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THIS IS  
13 LOOKING AT ARTERIAL TRANSIT NEEDS. THAT'S WHY WE'RE AT RIGHT  
14 NOW IN THE ANALYSIS WE'RE STILL GOING FORWARD LOOKING AT  
15 FREEWAY AND BRIDGE SPEEDS AS WELL, AND THAT IS ONGOING. BUT,  
16 AGAIN, NOT UNEXPECTEDLY ARTERIAL SPEEDS ARE FAIRLY SLOW, UNDER  
17 12 MILES AN HOUR WITHIN THE SAN FRANCISCO AREA. YOU ALSO HAVE  
18 AREAS ACROSS THE PENINSULA AND SOUTH BAY AND THE EAST BAY AS  
19 WELL. THAT IS ONGOING ANALYSIS. BUT, REALLY, THIS COMBINED  
20 WITH THE SERVICE GAPS. THESE ARE WHERE WE IDENTIFY WHERE  
21 PROJECTS ARE NEEDED. SO, ON THE NEXT SLIDE, WE CAN GO TO THE  
22 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I'LL TALK ABOUT WHAT WE'RE DOING IN THE  
23 NEAR-TERM TO ASSESS BOTH THESE SERVICE GAPS AND SLOWER TRAVEL  
24 SPEEDS. WE HAVE BEEN LOOKING THROUGH PROJECTS THROUGH PLANNED  
25 BAY AREA 2050 TO SEE WHICH OF THOSE IDENTIFIED SERVICE, THOSE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 NEEDS, AS KARA MENTIONED THAT WAS ADOPTED IN OCTOBER OF 2021.  
2 SO WE'RE ALSO LOOKING AT PROJECTS THAT HAVE COME UP SINCE  
3 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 ADOPTION THEN THE FINAL AREA OF PROJECTS  
4 THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT ARE THOSE THAT, YOU KNOW, WEREN'T --  
5 GAPS THAT WERE NOT IDENTIFIED, OR ADDRESSED, IN PLANNED BAY  
6 AREA 2050 OR IN ANY SUBSEQUENT PLAN AND THOSE ARE THE AREAS  
7 WHERE WE NEED TO IDENTIFY A NEW PROJECT OURSELVES TO HELP  
8 COVER THESE GAPS. SO THAT'S BEEN WORKED. THAT'S BEEN DONE WITH  
9 OUR PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM. KARA ALREADY MENTIONED THAT IS,  
10 YOU KNOW, OUR PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM IS OPERATOR-LED BY THE  
11 SEVEN LARGE OPERATORS AND BY FOUR OF OUR SMALLER OPERATORS, AS  
12 WELL, SO WE HAVE BEEN GOING THROUGH AND HAVE MEETINGS WITH  
13 THOSE GROUPS TO IDENTIFY THOSE PROJECTS THAT COULD HELP SERVE  
14 THOSE NEEDS, THOSE GAPS THAT WE HAVE IDENTIFIED. SO, WE'RE  
15 GOING THROUGH THAT PROCESS NOW, AND THROUGHOUT SPRING WE'LL BE  
16 SHARING THOSE PROJECT PERFORMANCE RESULTS FOR THE LOCALLY  
17 NOMINATED AND REGION NAMELY IDENTIFIED PROGRAMS. AND THEN  
18 SEEKING INPUT ON THE DRAFT RECOMMENDED TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK,  
19 WHICH WILL INCLUDE THOSE STRATEGIES AND CAPITAL AND SERVICE  
20 INVESTMENTS, AS WELL. SO, BUSY NEXT FEW MONTHS, DEFINITELY,  
21 FOR THE TEAM, AND HAPPY TO BEEN ABLE TO PRESENT THIS TO YOU  
22 TODAY. SO, I WILL TURN IT BACK TO NEW CHAIR CAMPOS.

23

24 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU, ALL, FOR BEING  
25 REALLY EXCITED ABOUT THIS ITEM. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE START



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WITH FOLKS WHO HAVEN'T HAD A CHANCE TO ASK QUESTIONS YET. SO,  
2 IF YOU PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND, WE'LL MAKE SURE YOU GET A  
3 CHANCE TO SPEAK, AND WE'LL START OFF WITH COUNCIL MEMBER  
4 HANKERSON.

5

6 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU, MISS CAMPOS. MY QUESTION IS  
7 DEALING WITH THE RIDERSHIP. AND, LIKE, I'M FROM SOLANO COUNTY,  
8 POST-PANDEMIC. I USED TO GET IN MY CAR, STOP AT THE TRANSIT  
9 CENTER, GET ON A COMMUTER BUS, GO TO THE BART. BUT NOW, I  
10 CAN'T DO THAT, BECAUSE YOU HAVE CUT OFF MOST ALL THE BUSES.  
11 SO, I USED TO GO TO EL CERRITO DEL NORTE, BUT NOW IN THE  
12 MORNING YOU MIGHT GET A BUS, YOU MIGHT NOT GET A BUS. AND I  
13 THINK THAT, THROUGH MARKETING, THAT WE'RE MISSING A POINT AND  
14 THAT WE CAN BRING THE RIDERSHIP BACK. SOLANO COUNTY HAS  
15 INCREASED BY 30%. AND THE WE CAN BRING THE RIDERSHIP BACK BY  
16 PROVIDING SERVICE TO THE CUSTOMERS. THE SERVICE IS NOT THERE  
17 RIGHT NOW. AND THEN WHEN YOU LOOK AT FROM SOLANO TO HERE, THIS  
18 IS A GROWING AREA, THEY'RE BUILDING HOUSES. MORE AND MORE  
19 PEOPLE ARE COMMUTING. BUT THEY DON'T HAVE THE SERVICES IN  
20 ORDER FOR TO GET US INTO OUR RIDERSHIP. AND THAT PART, I  
21 DIDN'T EVEN SEE ANYTHING MENTIONED ABOUT IT. THIS IS WHERE  
22 WE'RE MISSING IT. WHEN YOU HOOK AT THE YELLOW LINE WHERE YOU  
23 DREW IT FROM FAIRFIELD TO A CERTAIN PLACE AND YOU SAID THERE  
24 IS A RIDERSHIP GAP. THERE IS A RIDERSHIP GAP. THERE IS NO  
25 RIDER. THERE IS NO SERVICE. I KNOW IN VALLEJO, DURING THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 PANDEMIC, I THINK MAYBE THREE MONTHS AGO, THEY JUST STARTED  
2 CHARGING TO YOU GET ON THE BUS. YOU RODE THE BUS FOR FREE. AND  
3 I THINK THAT WE'RE MISSING THE POINT HERE THAT WE NEED TO  
4 INCREASE THE SERVICE IN ORDER TO BRING THE RIDERSHIP BACK.  
5 THANK YOU SO MUCH.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I SAW WENDI AND THEN ZACK.

8

9 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. YES. FIRST OFF, I JUST WANT TO  
10 REMIND MY FELLOW COUNCIL MEMBERS THAT EVEN THOUGH WE HAVE A  
11 NEW CHAIR, SHE'S NOT A SUBSTITUTE TEACHER, AND WE NEED TO  
12 TREAT HER WITH RESPECT. ANY TIME WE WANT TO QUESTION THE  
13 PROTOCOL IS WE RAISE OUR HANDS AND SHE RECOGNIZES US. WE DON'T  
14 SPEAK OUT OF TURN. SO LET'S TREAT HER WITH THE SAME RESPECT  
15 THAT WE DID TO RANDI. I'M GLAD THAT I'M FOLLOWING UP FROM  
16 SOLANO. BECAUSE I'M ALSO CONCERNED ABOUT THE NORTH BAY AND HOW  
17 WE'RE LOOKING AT THE NORTH BAY. I THINK THE NORTH BAY IS A  
18 VERY DIFFERENT AREA THAN THE REST OF THE COUNTY. OUR LACK OF  
19 TRANSIT REALLY CREATES A CHICKEN AND EGG SITUATION. SO, ONE OF  
20 THE THINGS I WANTED TO FIND OUT, JUST A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS  
21 IS, WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT TRAVEL DEMAND ARE YOU BEING LOOKING AT  
22 THE ACTUAL TRANSIT USE OR ARE YOU JUST LOOKING AT THE  
23 POPULATION, WHO LIVES THERE AND WHETHER THEY'RE TAKING TRANSIT  
24 OR NOT?

25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **KARA VUICICH:** RIGHT. THE TRAVEL DEMAND INDEX WAS TRAVEL THAT  
2 WAS HAPPENING IT WAS NOT JUST BASICALLY LOOKING AT GENERAL  
3 POINT A TO POINT B UNDERSTANDING WHERE PEOPLE ARE GOING  
4 REGARDLESS OF TRANSPORTATION MODE.

5

6 **WENDI KALLINS:** WHICH IS SURPRISING THAT MAYBE YOU DIDN'T --  
7 MAYBE I MISSED IT, I SHOULD LOOK AGAIN. BUT THE SLOW DOWN  
8 BETWEEN NOVATO AND VALLEJO IS UNBELIEVABLE. GOD, HOW MANY --  
9 SOMETIMES IT CAN BE A HALF HOUR DELAY. AND AS HAS BEEN  
10 MENTIONED, THERE IS NO TRANSIT RIGHT NOW BETWEEN THOSE TWO  
11 AREAS. THE OTHER ISSUE, I THINK, WITH LOOKING AT URBAN VERSUS  
12 SUBURBAN, YOU -- IT REALLY IS DIFFICULT, IF YOU ARE COMPARING  
13 THE TWO, THEN WE'RE GOING TO LOSE EVERY TIME. THE SUBURBS ARE  
14 GOING TO LOSE EVERY TIME BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE DENSITY AND  
15 WE WENT HAVE THE SAME TRANSIT. AND YET, OUR NEED IS, YOU KNOW,  
16 NOT ANY LESS BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE DENSITY. IS IT POSSIBLE  
17 TO EVALUATE THESE TWO AREAS USING DIFFERENT INDEXES SO THAT WE  
18 HAVE A -- YOU KNOW, LIKE, GOT A BETTER CHANCE? THE OTHER THING  
19 I SAW THAT'S NOT IN THERE, AND IT'S KIND OF UNDERSTANDABLE, IS  
20 THE EAST WEST CORRIDORS. IT'S NOT REGIONAL TRAVEL. SO THAT'S  
21 PROBABLY WHY THEY'RE NOT IN THERE. BUT THEY ARE THE FIRST AND  
22 LAST MILE FROM THE REGIONAL TRAVEL. AND IN MARIN COUNTY WE  
23 HAVE A HUGE AMOUNT OF OUR POPULATION THAT'S ON THE EAST WEST  
24 CORRIDOR ESPECIALLY TOWARDS THE WEST AND LOOKING AT THAT, AS  
25 WELL, I THINK IS IMPORTANT IN EVALUATING THE WHOLE SYSTEM. SO,



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOMETHING -- AND I DON'T KNOW ANY OTHER  
2 AREAS, BUT IT MIGHT BE THE SAME IN SONOMA AND SOME OF THE  
3 OTHER AREAS WHERE SOME OF THOSE CONNECTING LOCAL BUSES ARE AN  
4 INTEGRAL PART OF THE SYSTEM, AND TRAFFIC CONGESTION IS VERY,  
5 VERY HIGH, FOR INSTANCE, THROUGH THE ROSS VALLEY. THE OTHER  
6 THING TO NOTE, OF INTEREST, IS THAT WHEN WE'RE LOOKING AT  
7 SMART AND MARIN TRANSIT, HAVE THE HIGHEST RIDER RETURN OF ANY  
8 OF THE BAY AREA, AND THAT MIGHT TELL YOU SOMETHING ABOUT THE  
9 NEED FOR TRANSIT IN THOSE AREAS. SO THAT'S SOMETHING I WOULD  
10 LIKE YOU TO LOOK AT. ONE OF THE OTHER THINGS I'M WONDERING  
11 ABOUT IS YOU DON'T KNOW HAVE A GAP BETWEEN NOVATO AND  
12 LARKSPUR. OH NO. IT WAS SAN RAFAEL AND LOOKS BURG, THERE WAS  
13 NO GAP. AND BETWEEN SAN RAFAEL AND LARKSPUR IS PROBABLY THE  
14 MOST CONGESTION WE HAVE ALONG THE 101 CORRIDOR IN MARIN  
15 COUNTY. SO, I QUESTION WHAT SOME OF THESE NUMBERS ARE TELLING  
16 US. AND MAYBE WE NEED TO TAKE A SECOND LOOK.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I WILL ONLY ADD TO YOUR LAST POINT THAT THE SAN  
19 RAFAEL TO LARKSPUR, WE ARE STILL LOOKING AT FREEWAY SPEEDS. SO  
20 WE HAVE IDENTIFIED ARTERIAL SPEEDS, BUT ALONG THE 101 ANALYSIS  
21 WE'RE STILL CURRENTLY DOING AND IT'S POSSIBLE IT COULD  
22 IDENTIFY A GAP.

23





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **WENDI KALLINS:** IT'S HUGE IF YOU ARE LOOKING FOR BACKUP, THAT'S  
2 WHERE IT IS. ONCE YOU GET PAST CORTE MADERA, IT STARTS TO OPEN  
3 UP AGAIN.

4  
5 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER KALLINS, WE  
6 HAVE GLASER. DEUTSCH-GROSS. GROSS GUESS TO THANK YOU. SHARING  
7 GRATITUDE FOR THE WORK ON THIS IT'S INCREDIBLY EXCITING  
8 THINKING ABOUT THE HOLISTIC TRANSIT SERVICE EXPERIENCE IN THE  
9 BAY AREA AND HOPEFULLY GIVES THE COUNCIL AND VOTERS THE  
10 URGENCY TO FUND PUBLIC TRANSIT AND SELL THEM ON A VISION OF  
11 SUCCESS AND MORE INTO THE FUTURE. I WANT TO ECHO WENDI'S  
12 POINTS AROUND, THIS IS A TRADEOFF BETWEEN FREQUENCY AND  
13 COVERAGE AND WHILE WE WANT TO REWARD DECREASING CROWDING, WE  
14 WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYONE SEES THEMSELVES IN THE MEASURE AND  
15 MAKING SURE THAT JUST BECAUSE WE THINK THERE IS NOT RIDERSHIP  
16 RIGHT NOW DOESN'T MEAN THERE WON'T BE IN THE FUTURE. SO I WANT  
17 TO THANK YOU ALL FOR THE SPECIFIC EQUITY ANALYSIS YOU HAD IN  
18 THERE WHERE IT'S LIKE THESE ARE THE CORRIDORS THAT ARE  
19 PRIORITY POPULATIONS THAT HAVE BEEN NEGLECTED AND LEFT BEHIND  
20 BY PAST TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS. GRATEFUL FOR THE  
21 FORWARDING ANALYSIS. MY QUESTION IS WHAT ABOUT THE FISCAL  
22 CLIFF. AND, LIKE, ARE WE MAKING SOME OF THESE ASSUMPTIONS IN  
23 THE SERVICE GAPS AND NEEDS BASED ON INFLATED NUMBERS THAT  
24 DON'T SHOW THE CRASH THAT'S COMING TO TRANSIT AGENCIES? AND  
25 YOU KNOW, I LOOK AT POTENTIAL SERVICE GAPS IN SAN FRANCISCO,



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 FOR INSTANCE, AND THOSE ARE REPRESENTATIVE I ASSUME OF CURRENT  
2 SERVICE AND NOT WHAT WILL HAPPEN IF MUNI HAS TO CUT 20% OF ITS  
3 RIDERSHIP. I THINK WE SHOULD DO BOTH BUT I WOULD LOVE TO SEE  
4 UNDERSTANDING WHAT OUR BASELINE IS BY 2027 AND NOT JUST WHAT  
5 WE HOPE TO PRESERVE THE STATUS QUO AND BUILD ON FROM THERE.  
6 BECAUSE I THINK THAT WILL SHOW A DIFFERENT PICTURE OF WHAT OUR  
7 TRUE NEEDS ARE AND WHERE OUR REAL GAPS ARE. SO, THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM  
10 GERRY NEXT. AND, YEAH, IF ANYONE IS ONLINE PLEASE RAISE YOUR  
11 HAND SO WE CAN CALL ON YOU NEXT.

12

13 **GERRY GLASER:** A COUPLE OF THINGS. FIRST, THANK YOU. I ACTUALLY  
14 CAN TELL THE DIFFERENCE IN THE PRESENTATION FROM WHEN WE SAW  
15 YOU LAST TIME PARTICULARLY IN THE SECTION ABOUT EFFICIENCY  
16 WHICH IS ONE OF THE THINGS I'M MOST CONCERNED B I THINK AS  
17 SYSTEMS BECOME MORE EFFICIENT, FUNDING BECOMES EASIER, AND THE  
18 FARE THAT WE PAY, PAYS A LARGER PORTION OF THE TRIP AND WE CAN  
19 DO MORE THINGS AS WE BECOME MORE EFFICIENT OF THE I'M IN  
20 SONOMA COUNTY AND WITH THREE DIFFERENT TRANSIT DISTRICTS AND  
21 YOU CAN GUESS IF YOU HAVE THREE DIFFERENT TRANSIT DISTRICTS  
22 COVERING THE SAME PLACE MAYBE EFFICIENCY WASN'T THE PRIMARY  
23 REASON FOR THE SYSTEM TO BE THE WAY THAT IT IS. PART OF  
24 EFFICIENCY, ALSO, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE, AS WE WORK THROUGH THIS  
25 OVER THE NEXT FEW YEARS IS, WHAT ARE THE TARGETS. HOW ARE WE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 GOING OR GETTING TO THE END REAL NUMBERS? ARE WE GOING TOWARDS  
2 THE TARGETS? I DON'T LIKE THE TARGETS WE HAVE ON THE NEXT  
3 GENERATION HIGHWAY AND THE NUMBERS THAT WE GOT, BUT WE HAVE  
4 NUMBERS. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THAT IN EVERY CATEGORY WE HAVE  
5 HERE SO OUR GOALS GET ENUMERATED THAT BECOMES PART OF THE  
6 POLICY. ONE OF THE THINGS I MISSED THAT I'M SURPRISED IN YOUR  
7 OUTREACH YOU DIDN'T PICK IT UP, I WOULD EXPECT FOR FREQUENT  
8 USERS, NOT PEOPLE LIKE ME BUT SOMEBODY THAT'S COMMUTING EVERY  
9 DAY, THE COST OF TRAVEL IS PROBABLY A HIGH-LEVEL POINT. WHAT  
10 WAS THE MOST EFFICIENT WAY FOR ME TO COME TO THE CITY EVERY  
11 DAY OR MAKE IT TO MY OFFICE EVERY DAY. AND, SO, I EXPECT THAT  
12 FOR FREQUENT USERS WE WANT BOTH PROGRAMS AND MECHANISMS THAT  
13 ARE DIFFERENT, THAT DO FOCUS SOMEWHAT ON COST. YOU MENTIONED  
14 COST BENEFIT, AND ONE OF THE QUESTIONS I WOULD LIKE YOU TO  
15 ANSWER, FEDERAL GOVERNMENT TODAY, NOW WITH COST OF CARBON AND  
16 \$190 PER METRIC TON, I WANT TO KNOW WHEN WE DO COST BENEFIT DO  
17 WE INCLUDE SOCIAL COST OF CARBON, MAYBE A 20 YEAR LOOK AT  
18 THAT. AND LASTLY, JUST SOMETHING AS FAR AS THE TONE, THE  
19 POINTS THAT WE HAVE, AND A LOT OF THE THINGS WE HAVE TALKED  
20 ABOUT AS FAR AS IMPROVING OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AND HAVING LANES  
21 IN THE HIGHWAY THAT ALLOW BUSES TO GO FORWARD, I THINK,  
22 GENERALLY, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE WANT TO BE SAYING IN OUR  
23 MESSAGING IS PRIORITIZE TRANSIT. WHICH HAS NOT BEEN THE FOCUS  
24 IN THE PAST. AND I DON'T SEE IT AS SOMETHING WE PUT IN THE  
25 PRESENTATION. IT SAYS WE PRIORITIZE TRANSIT. NOT JUST IN THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 FUNDING. WE PRIORITIZE TRANSIT AS TO THE MECHANISM. WHAT'S  
2 GOING TO BE FASTER, WHAT'S GOING TO GET THE RESOURCE. YOU  
3 KNOW, WHY DO I GET TO DRIVE DOWN A LANE IN MY ELECTRIC CAR, TO  
4 THE HIGHWAY, WHEN THE BUS HAS TO GO BEHIND ME, AND TO WENDI'S  
5 POINT, WHEN I COME ACROSS SANTA ROSA, AND YOU MAKE IT FROM  
6 ROHNERT PARK UP THROUGH SANTA ROSA ON THE TRANSIT BUS, IT'S IN  
7 THE CARB POOL LANE WITH THOUSANDS OF OTHER PEOPLE, IN THE  
8 CARPOOL LANE DOING ABOUT, ROUGHLY SEVEN MILES AN HOUR. THE BUS  
9 OUGHT TO BE ABLE TO WHIZ BY SO THE GUYS IN THE CARS LOOK OVER  
10 AND SAY, OH, I WANT TO BE OVER THERE. [LAUGHTER] ON THE BUS.  
11 BUT THE MAIN POINTS, AND I KNOW WE'LL BE WORKING TOGETHER MORE  
12 AS WE WORK ON REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AS WELL, AND THOSE  
13 POINTS COME UP. THANKS.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I RECOGNIZE THERE ARE FOLKS  
16 ONLINE BUT WOULD LIKE TO KNOW IF WE HAVE ANYONE ONLINE? MARCY  
17 DO WE HAVE ANYONE ONLINE?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ROLAND I SEE YOUR HAND RAISED, BUT  
20 YOU'RE IN HERE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE].

23

24 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** VINAY AND THEN ROLAND.

25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YEAH. SO, I JUST WANT TO START OFF WITH A COUPLE  
2 OF THINGS THAT HAPPENED TO ME, THAT ARE MY EXPERIENCE, WHERE  
3 I'M COMING FROM. SO, THERE IS A STOP A BLOCK AND A HALF FROM  
4 WHERE I LIVE, I NEED TO GO TO THE BART, GET SOMEWHERE IN SAN  
5 FRANCISCO, AT A PARTICULAR TIME ONCE A WEEK. AND YOU KNOW,  
6 THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO BE HALF HOUR BUSES. I WENT TO CATCH THE  
7 7:35 WAS AT THE BUS STOP AT 7:30. 735 DIDN'T SHOW UP. 8:35  
8 DIDN'T SHOW UP. IT SHOWED UP AT 9:20. I GOT THERE AT 10:30.  
9 WHEN WE TALK ABOUT RELIABLE FREQUENCY, IT'S NICE TO BE ABLE TO  
10 SAY RELIABILITY FREQUENCY, BUT IT'S REALLY ABOUT BUSES BEING  
11 LATE OR NOT SHOWING UP. AGAIN, WHEN I COME HERE, THE IDEA FOR  
12 ME TO COME HERE IS TO GET THE L BUS. WHICH COMES TO THE  
13 TRANSBAY CENTER. YOU KNOW, I TRY TO CAST BUS THE FIRST WEEK,  
14 IT WAS GREAT FIRST TIME IT WAS GREAT. NEXT TIME, THE BUS  
15 DIDN'T SHOW UP. IT COMES ONCE AN HOUR, AND, SO, WE DID 45  
16 MINUTES, THEN, YOU KNOW, BOTTOM LINE IS, IF I NEED TO GET  
17 SOMEWHERE ON TIME, THE ONLY WAY I CAN DO IT IS TAKE A LEFT TO  
18 THE BART, AND BART OVER. AND THERE IS JUST NO WAY THAT BUSES,  
19 AT THIS POINT, YOU CAN'T -- IF SOMEBODY NEEDS TO GO TO WORK,  
20 THEY CAN'T TAKE THE BUS, BECAUSE THEY WOULD LOSE THEIR JOB IN  
21 THE FIRST FEW WEEKS. SO, I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE, YOU KNOW,  
22 THOSE KIND OF DELAYS REALLY BE CLEARLY ARTICULATED IN TERMS OF  
23 WHAT IS THE PICTURE AND DELAY, INSTEAD OF JUST TALKING ABOUT  
24 RELIABILITY AND FREQUENCY. BECAUSE YOU CAN HAVE FREQUENCY  
25 EVERY HALF HOUR, I DON'T CARE, BUT I DO CARE IF THEY DON'T



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 SHOW UP AT ALL, AND HAVING TO WAIT FOR TWO HOURS. YOU KNOW,  
2 AND THEN, ARE THERE SOLUTIONS FOR THIS. AND I JUST WANT TO  
3 SAY, WEDNESDAY THERE WAS A THING ABOUT HIGHWAY EXPANSION.  
4 THERE IS A LOT OF OPPOSITION TO HIGHWAY EXPANSION, AND SOME  
5 PEOPLE WERE SAYING THAT WHILE WE NEED TO MAKE THE LIVES OF THE  
6 PEOPLE IN THE CARS MISERABLE SO THEY WILL START TAKING THE  
7 BUS. SO WE SHOULDN'T ABSOLUTELY ALLOW OUR RIGHTS TO BE AN EASY  
8 THING. THE THING I WANT TO THINK OF IS, DRIVING A CAR IS NOT A  
9 PARTICULARLY FUN THING, PARTICULARLY IF THERE IS CONGESTION.  
10 IDEALLY, IF YOU ARE OFFERED A CHAUFFEUR-DRIVEN SERVICE, I  
11 THINK MOST PEOPLE ARE GOING SAY, YEAH, I WANT TO SIGN UP FOR  
12 THAT. SO, BUSES SHOULD BE SOMETHING THAT PEOPLE JUMP ON. IT  
13 SHOULD NOT BE SOMETHING THAT PEOPLE HAVE ALL THIS HESITATION B  
14 SO, THE ISSUE IS REALLY IS WHAT KIND OF SERVICE ARE WE GIVING  
15 PEOPLE? ARE WE GIVING THEM THE KIND OF SERVICE THAT THEY WILL  
16 LOSE THEIR JOB OR ARE WE GIVING THEM SERVICE THAT SAYS HEY,  
17 YOU DON'T HAVE TO DRIVE TO TAKE YOU WHERE YOU NEED TO GO AT A  
18 PARTICULAR TIME. SO I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE THIS ISSUE  
19 ADDRESSED SQUARELY, NOT SQUARELY, BUT AS AN ISSUE OF DELAYS,  
20 NOT JUST EXPANSION MUCH SERVICE, BUT ACTUALLY DELAYS, DO BUSES  
21 SHOW UP ON TIME. BECAUSE BUSS IS A MEANS OF GETTING FROM HERE  
22 TO THERE AT A PARTICULAR TIME, FOR A SPECIFIC PURPOSE. SO, I  
23 WOULD LIKE MORE ATTENTION ON THAT. I THINK THERE ARE A COUPLE  
24 OF EASY FIXES. I'M NOT GOING TO DISCUSS THAT RIGHT NOW. BUT I



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WOULD LIKE YOU FOLKS TO THINK ABOUT THAT ALSO NOT JUST  
2 INCREASING SERVICE, BUT MAKING IT REALLY GOOD. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO LISTEN TO  
5 FOLKS WHO HAVEN'T HAD A CHANCE TO SPEAK. WE HAVE ROLAND,  
6 CARLENE, FOLLOWED BY HOWARD, GABE, AND JEFF, AND ADINA. IF YOU  
7 HAVEN'T BEEN HEARD, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND.

8

9 **RONALD WONG:** THANK YOU FOR THE 2050+ PRESENTATION. THIS IS A  
10 BIG PROJECT. MY COMMENTS MAY BE NARROWED. AND NOT SO MUCH A  
11 BIG PICTURE AS DISCUSSED IN THIS PRESENTATION, AS I LEARNED  
12 MORE ABOUT THE 2050+ PLAN. I TEND TO LOOK AT THINGS IN SMALL  
13 INCREMENTS, WHICH MAY HELP ME UNDERSTAND THE 2050 PLAN. I'LL  
14 BEGIN, I BASICALLY HAVE TWO COMMENTS REGARDING, LIKE, THE 501,  
15 ON SLIDE TEN IS ABOUT CONGESTION. YOU KNOW, BECAUSE I  
16 ORIGINALLY, FROM SAN FRANCISCO BUT I MOVED TO EAST BAY. SO,  
17 AND I'M ALSO A PARATRANSIT USER. JUST, YOU KNOW, COMMUTING  
18 DURING PEAK HOURS, YOU KNOW, FROM DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO TO  
19 THE EAST BAY, THE CONGESTION IS SO BAD THAT WE CAN BARELY  
20 MOVE, YOU KNOW, AT A TIME. SO, SOMEHOW THERE NEEDS TO BE A  
21 SOLUTION TO EASE THE CONGESTION AND ENCOURAGE MORE PEOPLE TO  
22 RIDE TRANSIT. I KNOW THIS IS AN ONGOING DISCUSSION. SO, ON  
23 SLIDE 11, THIS IS A SEGUE TO THE PREVIOUS COMMENT. LET'S SEE.  
24 IT'S MORE SPECIFIC TO AC TRANSIT. BECAUSE THAT'S, BASICALLY,  
25 WHAT I RIDE TO, ON MY TRANSIT NEEDS TOO. TO NAME A FEW BUS



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 LINES, LIKE THE 28 AND THE 60, IT, BASICALLY, HAS, LIKE, A  
2 ONE-HOUR FREQUENCY. WHICH, IN A SENSE IT DOESN'T QUITE MAKE  
3 SENSE, NEVER MAKES ANY SENSE TO ME. I COULD SEE WHY PEOPLE MAY  
4 NOT TAKE TRANSIT OR BUSES BECAUSE THEY HAVE TO WAIT ONE HOUR  
5 FOR THE NEXT BUS. THERE NEEDS TO BE A WAY TO FILL IN THIS GAP  
6 TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP. ANYWAY, I THANK YOU. AND I RETURN TO  
7 THE CHAIR CAMPOS. YEAH.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WE WILL HEAR FROM CARLENE AND  
10 THEN GABE.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO REITERATE EARLIER COMMENTS ABOUT THE NEED  
13 FOR CLARIFICATION WHETHER THESE NAPS REFLECT SERVICE CUTS THAT  
14 OCCURRED DURING THE PANDEMIC I FORGET WHAT THE TIME FRAME FROM  
15 THE DATA THAT ILLUSTRATED ON THESE MAPS. SERVICE CUTS THAT  
16 OCCURS DURING THE PANDEMIC I'M NOT SURE IF THAT'S REFLECTED.  
17 AND SECOND POINT WAS JUST LOOKING BEYOND THE NINE COUNTY BAY  
18 AREA IT'S HARD TO IGNORE SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY AND TRAFFIC  
19 CONGESTION COMING FROM PLACES LIKE TRACE E MODESTO, STOCKTON,  
20 THERE IS A GROWING NUMBER OF RESIDENTS COMMUTING TO THE INNER  
21 BAY AREA FOR HIGHER WAGES, COMMUTERS COMING THROUGH EAST BAY  
22 OTHER AND PARTS THAT ARE NOT REFLECTED IN THESE MAPS AND IT'S  
23 IMPACTING -- IT'S A CHICKEN AND EGG SITUATION, LIKE, THERE IS  
24 NO TRANSIT THAT IS RELIABLE AND FREQUENT OUT THERE. AND SO WE  
25 ARE SEEING MAJOR CONGESTION ALONG THOSE POCKETS.





JANUARY 26, 2024

1

2 **CARLINE AU:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I MISSPOKE. HOWARD AND THEN  
5 GABE, PLEASE?

6

7 **HOWARD WONG:** I WANTED TO ECHO THAT COVERAGE GAPS IS AN  
8 IMPORTANT FOCUS. IN SAN FRANCISCO IT'S INTERESTING THAT IS.  
9 FMTA SET CRITERIA THAT EVERY RESIDENCE HAS TO BE WITHIN THREE  
10 BLOCKS, WORTHY GOAL EVEN WITH THAT TYPE OF GOAL PANDEMIC  
11 AUTOMOBILE TRAVEL MODE INCREASED TO 60% SAN FRANCISCO, OAKLAND  
12 SAN FRANCISCO WHICH ARE RICH IN TRANSIT, ONE TIME THERE WAS  
13 SOMETHING IN THE RANGE OF 20 TO 25 TRANSIT MODAL SHARE, IN THE  
14 BAY AREA TRANSIT MODE SHARES ARE 5% WHICH MEANS THERE ARE HUGE  
15 GAPS WHERE PEOPLE ARE NOT WITHIN THREE BLOCKS OF A TRANSIT  
16 STATION, BUT MILES, OR TEN MILES, OF A TRANSIT STOP. THE  
17 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT HAS SET GOOD MODELS ON HOW TO LOOK AT  
18 PROMOTING TRANSIT. THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION HAS BEEN  
19 EMPHASIZING RURAL AND SUBURBAN AREAS FOR ITS FUNDING. THEY  
20 HAVE PROVIDED BOOT CAMPS TO HELP SMALLER CITIES GET SOME OF  
21 THE INFRASTRUCTURE FUNDING FOR TRANSIT IN SMALL CITIES, SMALL  
22 COMMUNITIES. THE DOT HAS STARTED TO, IN A WAY, USE TRANSIT  
23 FUNDING AND TRANSIT PLANNING AS A POLITICAL SELLING POINT.  
24 OBVIOUSLY IN THE UNITED STATES, JUST LIKE IN THE BAY AREA,  
25 TRANSIT IS FOCUSED ON VERY SMALL POCKETED IN THE UNITED



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 STATES. IT'S LIKE, WHAT, 8 TO 10 URBAN AREAS, THEY HAVE THE  
2 BULK OF TRANSIT, AND USE THE BULK OF TRANSIT FUNDING.  
3 SIMILARLY IN THE BAY AREA, THE BIG CITIES, PARTICULARLY SAN  
4 FRANCISCO AND OAKLAND, AND OAKLAND IS FACING SOME PRETTY BIG  
5 CHALLENGES AT AC TRANSIT PROPOSING MAJOR CUTS BUT THE REST OF  
6 THE BAY AREA, WHICH MEANS THE REST OF THE VOTERS OF THE BAY  
7 AREA WILL HAVE -- WILL SAY, WHAT'S IN IT FOR ME. IN TERMS OF  
8 THE UPCOMING BOND MEASURES. I THINK THAT THE MESSAGING HAS TO  
9 BE ABOUT, YOU KNOW, HOW DO WE GET TRANSIT WITHIN A CERTAIN X  
10 DISTANCE FROM YOU, THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA.

11

12 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WE'LL HEAR FROM GABE, JEFF,  
13 ADINA AND THEN DIANA. GABRIEL BORDEN: THANK YOU. JUST A COUPLE  
14 OF CLARIFYING QUESTIONS. LOOKING AT THE PDF OF THIS ITEM AND  
15 ON THE SECOND PAGE IT NOTES THAT A PARTICULAR PROJECT'S  
16 ABILITY TO FILL A POTENTIAL TRANSIT SERVICE GAP IS ONLY ONE OF  
17 MULTIPLE FACTORS IN DETERMINING WHETHER OR NOT THAT PROJECT  
18 WILL BE RECOMMENDED. CAN YOU GIVE A BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF WHAT  
19 THOSE MULTIPLE FACTORS ARE?

20

21 **KARA VUICICH:** IN CONTEXTUALIZING THE ANALYSIS WAS A COMPLEMENT  
22 TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 INVOLVING THREE POTENTIAL HORIZON  
23 FUTURES FOR 2050 TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE FUTURE MIGHT LOOK LIKE  
24 AND GAPS AND NEEDS FOR TRANSIT SERVICE WERE GOING TO BE.

25



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THERE IS A GRAPHIC TO ILLUSTRATE KARA'S POINT IN  
2 THE PRESENTATION WITH FOUR PUZZLE PIECES AND THIS IS ONE OF  
3 THOSE PUZZLE PIECES.

4  
5 **KARA VUICICH:** GREAT. SO, WE HAVE ESSENTIALLY A VERY ROBUST  
6 LIST OF TRANSIT PROJECTS, AND THAT INCLUDES BOTH, MIKE, MAJOR,  
7 REALLY LARGE AND CAPITAL SERVICE INVESTMENTS AS WELL AS VERY  
8 SMALL LOCALIZED SERVICE INCREASES FOR VERY LOCAL SERVICE. SO  
9 WE'RE STARTING WITH THAT VERY, VERY LONG ALL RIGHT. AND THIS  
10 GAP ANALYSIS IS REALLY JUST FOCUSED ON IDENTIFYING, HAS  
11 ANYTHING CHANGED, BASICALLY, POST-PANDEMIC, THAT MAY NOT HAVE  
12 BEEN IDENTIFIED IN THAT VERY LONG LIST OF PROJECTS. IT TURNS  
13 OUT THAT WHEN WE COMPARE GAPS TO THAT LONG LIST THERE IS  
14 PRETTY MUCH A PROJECT IDENTIFIED FOR ALMOST ALL OF THE GAPS  
15 THAT WE IDENTIFIED. SO THERE IS -- SO THAT WE WANT TO JUST  
16 QUALIFY THAT. AND IN TERMS OF TRYING TO DETERMINE WHAT IS  
17 GOING TO BE THE COMBINATION OF STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS, AGAIN,  
18 WE'RE STARTING WITH WHAT WE HAD IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,  
19 UNFORTUNATELY WE HAVE A LOWER ANTICIPATED REV FUNDING ENVELOPE  
20 TO WORK WITH FOR THIS PLAN CYCLE, THAN WE DID FOR THE PREVIOUS  
21 PLAN. SO, WITH THE PROCESS OF DETERMINING WHICH PROJECTS, FOR  
22 THE VERY LARGE PROJECTS, YOU KNOW, HOW DO THEY PERFORM IN  
23 TERMS OF BENEFIT-COST ANALYSIS AND THEN ALSO UNDERSTANDING THE  
24 KIND OF VARYING NEEDS ACROSS THE REGION. A NUMBER OF FOLKS  
25 COMMENTED ON THE NEED EVEN FOR SERVICE AREAS THAT DON'T HAVE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 NECESSARILY HIGH TRANSIT ORIENTATION BUT NEED TO HAVE A  
2 CERTAIN LEVEL OF CONNECTIVITY THROUGHOUT THE REGION. ONE OF  
3 THE THINGS WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING IS WORKING WITH OUR TRANSIT  
4 OPERATOR STAFF PARTNERS TO APPLY THOSE NETWORK MANAGEMENT  
5 BUSINESS CASE ADVISORY GROUP WORK TRANSIT PLANNING PRINCIPLES  
6 TO DEVELOP A COMPREHENSIVE SET OF STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS  
7 TO DRAFT THAT DRAFT NETWORK, FOR TRANSIT 2050+.

8

9 **GABRIEL BORDEN:** GOT IT. THANK YOU. AND RELATED ON THE  
10 PRESENTATION, I THINK IT'S THE LAST SLIDE OR SECOND TO LAST  
11 SLIDE WHEN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT NEXT STEPS. FOR THIS WINTER IT  
12 REFERENCES THAT YOU ARE FINALIZING NEEDS AND GAPS ANALYSIS AND  
13 INCLUDING IDENTIFICATION OF REGIONALLY IDENTIFIED PROJECTS.  
14 SO, WHEN YOU SAY NOW, IS THAT REALLY NEW, OR IS IT PROJECTS  
15 THAT JUST DIDN'T MAKE IT INTO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050? YEAH.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** IT'S A COMBINATION, IN THE GAPS WE DIDN'T IDENTIFY  
18 PROJECTS, PRETTY SMALL MINORITY THAT DIDN'T HAVE PROJECTS FROM  
19 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 OR ANY PLANS SUBSEQUENT TO THAT WE  
20 WORKED WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS TO IDENTIFY WHAT A POTENTIAL  
21 PROJECT WOULD BE TO FILL THIS PARTICULAR GAP IN SOME CASE IT  
22 IS WASN'T PART OF THIS PRESENTATION BECAUSE WE HAVE BEEN DOING  
23 IT OVER THE LAST FEW WEEKS COULD BE A BRAND-NEW PROJECT EVEN  
24 IF IT'S A MINOR PROJECT OR EXTENSION OF A PROJECT ALREADY



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 SUBMITTED FOR TRANSIT FOR 2050, AND THEY NEED TO MAKE SOME  
2 MINOR MODIFICATIONS TO THAT.

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** WE'RE DEVELOPING IT WITH OUR OPERATOR PARTNERS  
5 AND IN SPRING WHEN WE COME BACK WITH THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE  
6 ASSESSMENT WE'LL BE ABLE TO SHARE A LIST OF OPPORTUNITIES.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** WE HAVE JEFF, ADINA DIANA AND CHRISTINE  
11 ONLINE AFTER WARDS.

12

13 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** I FOUND THE PRESENTATION TO BE ENLIGHTENING  
14 BUT NOT SURPRISING. POPULATION DENSITY AND ORGANIZATION SEEM  
15 TO DRIVE TRANSIT DEMAND AND ULTIMATELY YOU COULD UNDERSTAND  
16 HOW THAT WOULD DRIVE PRIORITY REGIONAL INVESTMENT. IT'S PRETTY  
17 OBSTACLE. THE PROBLEM THOUGH IS PROPORTIONS OF THE REGION  
18 NORTH OF BERKELEY AND SAN FRANCISCO, IT'S HARD TO JUSTIFY  
19 SIGNIFICANT REGIONAL INVESTMENTS WHEN YOU LOOK PURELY AT THOSE  
20 NUMBERS. AND FOR FOLKS LIKE WENDY AND MYSELF, THAT'S -- OTHER  
21 AND NORTH BAY, AND SOLANO COUNTY FOLKS, FOR EXAMPLE, THAT'S  
22 REALLY A CONCERN. I GUESS WHAT'S REALLY DIFFICULT TO IGNORE IS  
23 THIS LAND USE TRANSIT CONNECTION. AND WHAT I'M WONDERING IS,  
24 AS WE LOOK AT PLANNED BAY AREA, AS IT GOES FORWARD, THERE IS  
25 CLEARLY A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT PDAS IDENTIFIED, AND THERE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 PRESUMABLY IS THE ASSUMPTION THAT THERE WILL BE SIGNIFICANT  
2 DEVELOPMENT IN THOSE PDAS. THE QUESTION IS WHAT, SORT OF,  
3 IMPACT WILL DECREASING DEVELOPMENT IN THOSE PDAS HAVE ON  
4 TRANSIT DEMAND? WILL IT JUSTIFY FURTHER INVESTMENT? DO WE  
5 REALLY KNOW WHAT IT IS? OR IT SEEMS THAT THIS ANALYSIS IS  
6 FUNDAMENTALLY BASED UPON EXISTING DEMANDS. YOU KNOW, FROM THE  
7 ORGANIZATIONS THAT PROVIDE THE SERVICES. AND THAT'S REALLY  
8 GREAT, BUT PERHAPS NOT ALL TOGETHER FULLY HELPFUL WHEN WE'RE  
9 LOOKING AT FORWARD PLANNING. SO, I GUESS THE FIRST QUESTION  
10 IS, IS THERE A WAY, OR HAS THERE BEEN ANY EFFORT TO MODEL THE  
11 IMPACTS OF DEVELOPMENT OF THE PDAS ON THE FUTURE TRANSIT  
12 NETWORK AND I GUESS THE OTHER QUESTION IS ABOUT INVESTMENTS IN  
13 THE TRANSIT NETWORK ON TRANSIT USAGE? FOR EXAMPLE, THERE ARE  
14 CLEARLY MISSING LINKAGES IN THE SYSTEM, IF THOSE LINKAGES WERE  
15 COMPLETED, WOULD THAT IMPACT DEMAND? A GOOD EXAMPLE WOULD BE  
16 THE FACT THAT SMART DOESN'T REALLY CONNECT WITH THE FERRIES.  
17 IF WE ADD A CROSS-PLATFORM CONNECTION, WHAT WOULD THE IMPACT  
18 OF THAT BE ON TRANSIT USAGE. AND IS THERE A WAY OF MODELING  
19 THAT SO THAT WE CAN DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT THOSE SORTS OF  
20 INVESTMENTS ARE JUSTIFIED. ANOTHER EXAMPLE THAT WAS VERY CLEAR  
21 IN THE PRESENTATION THAT YOU MADE IS THAT, FROM AN EQUITY  
22 STANDPOINT, WE REALLY DON'T HAVE ADEQUATE SERVICE BETWEEN  
23 CENTRAL SAN RAFAEL AND, SAY, EL CERRITO. YOU KNOW, ONE BUS PER  
24 HOUR, WHATEVER IT MAY BE. AND CLEARLY FROM AN EQUITY  
25 STANDPOINT, WE'RE NOT GETTING ADEQUATE SERVICE TO PROVIDE THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 SERVICE THAT OUR ESSENTIAL WORKERS NEED TO BE ABLE TO ACCESS  
2 THEIR JOBS IN MARIN, AS AN EXAMPLE. AND I GUESS, FINALLY, I  
3 WOULD LIKE TO KNOW, I HAVE SOME IDEAS ABOUT SOME REGIONAL  
4 TRANSPORTATION LINKAGES THAT COULD SIGNIFICANTLY IMPROVE THE  
5 SITUATION, CERTAINLY IN THE NORTH BAY, BUT A QUESTION IS, WHEN  
6 WOULD IT BE APPROPRIATE TO INTRODUCE THOSE IDEAS FOR  
7 CONSIDERATION. YOU MENTION PLANNED BAY AREA 2060, YOU KNOW,  
8 WHEN WILL WE START THAT? OBVIOUSLY WE GOT TO GET THROUGH  
9 2050+, AND WE DON'T WANT TO HOLD UP CRITICAL PROJECTS THAT ARE  
10 UNDERWAY FROM CEQA CLEARANCE. BUT WHEN DO WE DO THE NEXT  
11 ROUND?

12

13 **DAVE VAUTIN:** HAPPY TO TAKE THOSE QUESTIONS QUICKLY. FIRST, I  
14 JUST WANT TO UNDERSCORE THAT WE SHOWED SOME MAPS TODAY ABOUT  
15 EXISTING CONDITIONS. YOU KNOW, THE COLOR CODING REFLECTED  
16 AREAS IN A BLUE COLOR, I BELIEVE, THAT WERE THE PLACES MOST  
17 PRIMED FOR HEAVY RAIL, HIGH CAPITAL COST TRANSIT. IT ALSO  
18 SHOWED IN A LOT OF OUR SUBURBAN AREAS OF THE REGION THAT THOSE  
19 AREAS DO JUSTIFY INVESTMENT, BUT PERHAPS MORE IN TERMS OF BUS  
20 SERVICE AND RAPID BUS SERVICE AND OTHER SORTS OF LOWER COST  
21 INVESTMENTS FOCUSED ON SERVICE. I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THE LAND  
22 USE FINDINGS ON CONSTITUTE DO NOT TRY TO SAY THAT THERE IS NOT  
23 A NEED FOR TRANSIT IN SUBURBAN RURAL AREAS JUST THAT THE  
24 TRANSIT SERVICE MIGHT LOOK DIFFERENT IN AN URBAN SUBWAY THAN A  
25 HIGH CAPACITY RAIL LINE. THAT'S ONE POINT AND THE QUESTION ON



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 PDAS AND BUILD-OUT, IN THE PAST LONG RANGE PLANS LOOKING AT  
2 2050 FAR OUT INTO THE FUTURE WITH THE PUZZLE PIECE GRAPHIC  
3 WE'RE SAYING WE DID THIS ANALYSIS WE LOOKED AT TODAY TO  
4 UNDERSTAND WHAT GAPS ARE TODAY, POST-COVID FOR THE NEXT 5 TO  
5 10 YEARS AND PAIR THAT WITH THE FUTURE FOCUSED ANALYSIS WHICH  
6 IS WHAT THE NETWORK AND PROJECT PERFORMANCE DO. IN THAT  
7 ANALYSIS LOOKING AT DIFFERENT LAND USE PATTERNS. PLANNED BAY  
8 AREA 2050 HAD A MILLION NEW HOMES NEAR TRANSIT IN MANY OF  
9 THOSE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS IN THE STUDY OF INDIVIDUAL  
10 PROJECTS UNDERSTANDING IF WORKING IN A SITUATION WHERE THERE  
11 IS GROWTH IN THOSE PDAS INCORPORATE INTO OUR MODELING IN THE  
12 QUESTION ABOUT FUTURE PLANS CYCLES WE'RE ALMOST ALWAYS DOING A  
13 LONG RANGE PLAN HERE AT MTC. THE NEXT LONG RANGE PLAN 2060  
14 WILL BE IN THE NEXT UPDATE AND OFFER OPPORTUNITIES FOR MORE  
15 INPUT.

16

17 **JEFFREY RHOADS:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM  
20 DIANA AND OUR FOLKS FROM ONLINE, CHRISTINE, ANNE OLIVIA AND  
21 BRING IT -- SORRY. ADINA DIANA CHRISTINE, OLIVIA AND THEN  
22 RANDI.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO STAFF FOR WORKING ON THIS,  
25 AND WHILE THIS GO AROUND IS NOT GOING TO DO EVERYTHING THAT IS





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 DONE INTERNATIONAL -- IN THE TIME FRAME ALLOTTED, EVERYTHING  
2 TO GET TO INTERNATIONAL BEST PRACTICE SERVICE BASED PLANNING,  
3 THIS IS REALLY HISTORIC. AND THE FIRST TIME EVER THAT THE BAY  
4 AREA IS BEING LOOKING, STARTING WITH A LOOK AT WHAT THE NEEDS  
5 ARE, WHAT THE GAPS ARE. AND WITH A FOCUS ON THE SERVICE NOT  
6 ONLY STITCHING TOGETHER A SET OF CAPITAL PROJECTS. SO, THANK  
7 YOU VERY MUCH TO THE STAFF AT MTC AND THE AGENCIES FOR GOING  
8 IN THIS DIRECTION. A FEW QUESTIONS AND OBSERVATIONS. I THINK A  
9 COUPLE OF PEOPLE, INCLUDING HOWARD, MENTIONED ACCESS AS AN  
10 IMPORTANT METRIC, LIKE WHAT SHARE OF PEOPLE ARE WITHIN TEN OR  
11 15 MINUTE WALK OF REASONABLY FREQUENT TRANSIT. THAT WAS A LENS  
12 THAT A NUMBER OF AGENCIES ARE USING. AC TRANSIT USED IT AND IT  
13 WAS USED EARLIER IN EXERCISE IS THAT GOING TO BE PART OF THE  
14 EVALUATION?

15

16 **DAVE VAUTIN:** WE'RE STILL IN THE PROCESS OF DEVELOPING THE  
17 METRICS THAT WILL ALIGN WITH EACH OF THE GOALS. THAT'S A  
18 CONSIDER FOR THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT BUT WE'RE  
19 LOOKING AT METRICS OF THAT TYPE, AND IN FACT ACCESS TO  
20 TRANSIT, SO FOLKS CAN GET TO PLACES WITH INSURANCE HAVING  
21 THOSE METERS OF PAST PLANNED BAY AREA AREAS.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** I THINK A NUMBER OF PEOPLE OBSERVED LOOKING AT  
24 THE MAP BASED ON FAMILIARITY WITH THE LOW KALE SAYING IT SAYS  
25 THERE IS NO GAP BUT I OBSERVE THERE IS A GAP BASED ON THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 LOCAL CONDITIONS IT SEEMS LOOKING AT THE LEVEL OF ABSTRACTION  
2 HERE THAT THE LEVEL OF GROUND IS IMPORTANT AND WILL HOPE THAT  
3 THE PROJECT TEAM IS TAKING THAT GROUND TRUTH INTO ACCOUNT  
4 REFINING THE MODEL. IT DOESN'T IDENTIFY -- IT HAS ALMOST NO  
5 GAPS IN SAN FRANCISCO AND LIKE LOOKING AT THE DETAIL THERE ARE  
6 SOME AND ALMOST NO GAPS IN OAKLAND AND LIKE GETTING FROM EAST  
7 OAKLAND TO OTHER PLACES LIKE THERE ARE SOME GAPS. SO HOPEFULLY  
8 THE GROUND TRUTHING WILL FILL IN SOME OF THOSE GAPS. IN TERMS  
9 OF GAPS ALSO IT DID NOT IDENTIFY A LOT OF GAPS IN SANTA CLARA  
10 COUNTY WHEREAS VTA AND DONE VISIONARY NETWORK ANALYSIS AND  
11 OBSERVED THAT SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAS LOWER SERVICE LEVEL PER  
12 CAPITA THAN OTHER PLACES IN THE REGION AND PLACES IN THE  
13 COUNTRY, ALSO IN THE OVERLAY OF WHAT YOU'RE GETTING FROM  
14 DIFFERENT AGENCIES FROM VTA FROM AC TRANSIT ON THEIR VISIONARY  
15 NETWORK THAT ADD COLOR WHEREAS THE PLACES THAT SAYS THERE IS  
16 NO GAP BUT VTA HAS IDENTIFIED THEM THAT THOSE WILL BE FILLED  
17 IN. WELL WAS A, ON SLIDE TELL, IT TALKED ABOUT SPEED AND I  
18 WOULD ENCOURAGE YOU TO LOOK AT AND ALSO THE QUESTION ABOUT  
19 WHETHER WE LOOKED AT SPEED AND RELIABILITY BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT  
20 THE SAME THING. THE -- FOR EXAMPLE, ONE OF THE PLACES THAT DID  
21 OBSERVE A GAP IS ON THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR, AND IN LEVEL OF  
22 SERVICE, BUT NOT IN SPEED, ONE THINGS ARE GOOD, THINGS ARE  
23 FINE, BUT WHEN THINGS ARE BAD, YOU KNOW, THE BUS CAN BE  
24 DELAYED BY HALF AN HOUR AND YOU CAN'T MAKE THE CONNECTION OVER  
25 TO BART. AND, SO, IF YOU CAN LOOK AT, LIKE, WHAT THE ERROR



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 BARS ARE ON THE SPEED, THAT'S ALSO AN AREA THAT CAN  
2 POTENTIALLY IDENTIFY A PROJECT THAT WILL HELP TO IMPROVE  
3 RELIABILITY, NOT ONLY THE BEST CASE SCENARIO SPEED. A COUPLE  
4 OF PEOPLE HAVE MENTIONED THE FIRST AND LAST MILE, AND, LIKE,  
5 THOSE LOCAL CONNECTIONS. AND MY UNDERSTANDING FROM EARLIER IS  
6 THAT ON THE ONE HAND, THE PARTICULAR DECISIONS ABOUT THOSE  
7 ROUTES ARE IN THE HANDS OF THE LOCAL AGENCY SO THAT IS NOT  
8 CLEARLY AS PART OF THIS PLAN, AND YET IN TERMS OF PROVIDING  
9 ACCESS TO FIRST AND LAST MILE CONNECTIONS ARE CRITICAL. SO I'M  
10 WONDERING IS THERE A LENS THAT WILL BE LOOKING AT THOSE FIRST  
11 AND LAST MILE CONNECTIONS EVEN THOUGH MAYBE IN TERMS OF THE  
12 PLAN IT WOULD BE REPRESENTED AS EXPENDITURES IN SOME OTHER  
13 WAY? I'LL ASK THAT AS A QUESTION. AND YOU CAN SPEAK TO THE  
14 RELIABILITY IS THAT BEING CONSIDERED TOO?

15

16 **DAVE VAUTIN:** HAPPY TO TAKE THE FIRST QUESTION THEN TURN IT TO  
17 MY COLLEAGUES FOR THE RELIABLE QUESTION. ON ALL ROUTES ALL  
18 OPERATORS ARE PART OF OUR TRANSIT 2050+ EFFORT. NEEDS AND GAPS  
19 ANALYSIS FOCUSES ON THESE SETS OF NODES AND CORRIDORS TO LOOK  
20 TOP DOWN ACROSS THE REGION. BUT LOCAL OPERATORS ALSO MET THOSE  
21 FIRST LAST MILE COMMUNITY SHUTTLE, OTHER ROUTE IMPROVEMENT FOR  
22 CONSIDERATION IN THIS PLAN. SO THOSE ARE BEING EVALUATED AND  
23 CONSIDERED. SOME WILL BE INCLUDED, SOME WILL NOT, BECAUSE IT'S  
24 A FISCALLY CONSTRAINED PLAN AND SAME WITH THESE CONNECTIONS  
25 SERVICES RUNNING ON THE REGIONAL CORRIDORS. JUST WANT TO



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 CLARIFY, IT IS NOT JUST A PLAN FOR REGIONAL TRANSIT, IT'S A  
2 PLAN FOR ALL TRANSIT.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I'LL ALSO ADD YOU MENTIONED THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR  
5 AND SAME GOES FOR THE 101 WITHIN MARIN AND SONOMA, BUT THAT'S  
6 AN ONGOING SPEED ANALYSIS THAT WE'RE WORKING ON NOW.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. AND ARE YOU LOOKING AT RELIABILITY IN  
9 ADDITION TO SPEED NOT JUST THAT SPEED GOES WELL BUT WHEN THE  
10 SPEED WHEN THINGS GO POORLY?

11

12 **KARA VUICICH:** UNFORTUNATELY WE'RE NOT ABLE TO DO ANALYSIS I  
13 DON'T DISAGREE WITH ANYTHING YOU SAID, WE'RE WORKING ON  
14 RELYING ON DETAILED SPEED AND RELIABILITY ANALYSIS THAT  
15 OPERATORS HAVE DONE AND IDENTIFYING PROJECTS FOR THAT SO WE'RE  
16 TRYING TO KEEP THAT AND UNFORTUNATELY DIDN'T HAVE THE CAPACITY  
17 TO DO THE LEVEL OF DETAILED ANALYSIS.

18

19 **ADINA LEVIN:** THOSE WERE MY QUESTIONS THAT I HAD.

20

21 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** DIANA.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** FEW POINTS OF CLARIFICATION JOINED THE COUNCIL AT THE  
24 END OF LAST YEAR AND STILL GETTING FAMILIAR WITH WHAT MY OTHER  
25 COUNCIL MEMBERS HAVE REVIEWED. YOUR MEMO MENTIONED THE ITEMS



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 EQUITY NEEDS MAP, PRIORITIZED EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES MAP  
2 BUT ALSO USED DATA LOOKING AT POPULATIONS OF LOW-INCOME BLACK  
3 AND LATINO POPULATIONS I HAVE NEVER SEEN THAT MAP BEFORE. CAN  
4 THAT BE SHARED WITH ME THE SECOND DATA POINT?

5

6 **KARA VUICICH:** WE DID PRODUCE SOME OF THOSE MAPS IN DEVELOPING  
7 THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY POPULATION. SO WE SHOULD -- I  
8 THINK, WE SHOULD HAVE UPDATES OF THOSE THAT ARE GOING TO BE  
9 GENERATED THIS SPRING.

10

11 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH, I WOULD SAY JUST ON THAT TOPIC THAT THIS  
12 YEAR WE'LL BE -- I THINK IT'S SPRING TIME WE'LL BE COMING BACK  
13 TO THE COUNCIL WITH UPDATES ON THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES  
14 TOPIC THAT WILL REFLECT THE LATEST DATA AND THAT WILL PROVIDE  
15 OPPORTUNITY TO DIVE INTO SOME OF THOSE TOPICS.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** TO CLARIFY IT SOUNDS LIKE YOU USED TWO DIFFERENT MAPS  
18 THAT YOU COMBINED.

19

20 **KARA VUICICH:** IT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED THAN THAT. WE  
21 USED A SOFTWARE PRODUCT CALLED REPLICA, WHICH INCORPORATES  
22 LOTS OF DIFFERENT INFORMATION SOURCES IT INCLUDES LOCATION  
23 BASED SERVICES, DATA FROM CELL PHONES MOBILE DEVICES, MOBILE  
24 DEVICES WITHIN CARS, AS WELL AS CENSUS DATA, AMERICAN  
25 COMMUNITY SURVEY DATA AND CREATES A REALTIME MODEL FOR TRAVEL



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 DEMAND. SO SOME -- MY UNDERSTANDING, IN TERMS OF THE -- THOSE  
2 EQUITY PRIORITY CHARACTERISTICS THAT WE LOOKED AT CAME FROM  
3 CENSUS AMERICAN COMMUNITY SURVEY DATA THAT WERE INCORPORATED  
4 THEN INTO THE REPLICA SOFTWARE PRODUCT TO LOOK AT DEMAND  
5 ACROSS THOSE PARTICULAR POPULATIONS VERSUS THE GENERAL  
6 POPULATIONS.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** GOT IT. GOT IT. AND THE SECOND THING, I KNOW GABRIEL  
9 ALREADY ASKED, BUT THE MEMO TALKS ABOUT A CURRENT SET OF  
10 LOCALLY NOMINATED TRANSIT SERVICE AND CAPITAL PROJECTS. YOU  
11 CAN'T SHARE A CURRENT LIST AT THIS TIME?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** WE DO HAVE THE LIST FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. SO WE  
14 WOULD BE HAPPY TO SHARE THAT, IT'S AVAILABLE ONLINE.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** GOT IT. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO OUR FOLKS  
19 ONLINE. CHRISTINE AND THEN ANNE OLIVIA.

20

21 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU CHAIR CAMPOS. SO AS HAS BEEN  
22 MENTION SAID, CONCERNS HAVE BEEN LOOKED AT WITH THE CORRIDORS  
23 BETWEEN STOCKTON AND MODESTO AND 101, I WANT TO ARGUE THE  
24 OTHER WAY AROUND, SOUTH BAY, I HAVE LIVED IN SAN JOSE ALL OF  
25 MY LIFE, I HAD TO GO UP-AND-DOWN MANY TIMES NOT ONLY FOR



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 BUSINESS, BUT FOR VISITING FAMILY OUTSIDE OF THE AREA, AND AS  
2 WE ADD MORE HOUSING WHICH WE'RE DOING AT A RAPID PACE BECAUSE  
3 WE'RE TRYING TO MEET DEMAND, THINGS ARE BEING PUSHED MORE AND  
4 MORE OUT DOWN SOUTH ON THE 101 CORRIDOR, AND EVEN ON THE  
5 HIGHWAY 17. NOW, I ADMIT THAT THE 17 FLYER IS A SPECIALIZE  
6 DISTRICT IN AND OF ITSELF, HOWEVER, I WOULD THINK THAT IT  
7 WOULD BE EXTREMELY IMPORTANT TO LOOK AT THESE TWO CORRIDORS  
8 AND THE CONGESTION THAT HAPPENS EVERY DAY. 101 HAS BEEN  
9 EXPANDED AT LEAST TWO TIMES IN MY LIFETIME, ADDING A 2 AND  
10 THIRD LANE TO EACH SIDE. SO, MY MAJOR CONCERN IS HAVING ENOUGH  
11 OF A ROBUST BUS SYSTEM OR OTHER FACTOR IN ORDER TO HELP PEOPLE  
12 GET FROM SOUTH COUNTY, AS WE CALL IT HERE, UP NORTH, AND  
13 LOOKING AT THE FIRST AND LAST MILE, PLUS ACCESSIBILITY. AND  
14 ACCESSIBILITY COMES IN THAT FIRST AND LAST CORRIDOR, OR FIRST  
15 AND LAST MILE, BUT THIS IS ALSO ANOTHER FACTOR, ONE OF THE  
16 BIGGEST THINGS WE'RE LOOKING AT AS YOU'RE BUILDING THESE NEW  
17 HOUSING STRUCTURES IS MAKING SURE THAT THE VARIOUS BUS AND  
18 PARATRANSIT STOPS, THAT WE COULD GO TO THE END OF THE ACTUAL  
19 HOUSING AREAS, NEED THE DEMAND. AND NEED A SIMPLIFIED GETTING  
20 FROM POINT A TO POINT B WITH CLEAR CORRIDORS OF TRAVEL, THAT  
21 KIND OF THING. SO IT IS MY HOPE THAT YOU ALL ARE LOOKING AT  
22 SOUTH COUNTY AND HOW 101 AND 17 AFFECTS -- A WHOLE -- I KNOW  
23 WE'RE STILL TRYING TO WORK ON THE EXTENDED RAIL SYSTEM,  
24 THAT'S, YOU KNOW, IN THE WORKS FROM SAN FRANCISCO TO LA, WHICH



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WOULD BE GREAT. THE HIGH SPEED RAIL, BUT WE'RE NOT THERE YET.  
2 SO, WE NEED TO REALLY KEEP OUR EYE ON THAT AS WELL. THANK YOU  
3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WE'LL HEAR FROM ANNE OLIVIA,  
5 THEN WILLIAM, RANDI, AND MICHAEL. IF ANYONE ELSE HAS COMMENTS  
6 TO SHARE, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND, BECAUSE WE ARE IN THE  
7 HOMESTRETCH.

8  
9 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. SO, THANK YOU FOR THIS  
10 PRESENTATION. IT WAS REALLY AWESOME. LIKE, SO MUCH GOOD  
11 INFORMATION HAS BEEN LAID OUT HERE. A LOT OF MY QUESTIONS OR  
12 COMMENTS HAVE BEEN MADE. SO I'LL SKIP OVER THERE. A COUPLE OF  
13 POINTS ABOUT CONNECTING THE FERRIES IN A MORE -- IN A WAY  
14 THAT'S EASIER FOR FOLKS TO PLAN THEIR TRIP. IT DOESN'T SHOW UP  
15 FOR ME. IT'S ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WOULD MAKE IT EASIER, AND,  
16 ALSO, REALLY UPLIFTING ADINA'S COMMENT ABOUT SPEED AND  
17 RELIABILITY. THE ONLY OTHER TWO AREAS I WANT TO TOUCH ON, ONE  
18 IS INVESTMENT IN RURAL AREAS. SO, AS A PERSON WHO COMES FROM A  
19 FAMILY THAT IS IN RURAL AREAS, THERE IS NOTHING THAT UPSETS MY  
20 BROTHER MORE THAN PAYING FOR INVESTMENTS AND SERVICES THAT HE  
21 DOESN'T SEE AT ALL. ESPECIALLY -- SO, FOR US, LIKE REALLY  
22 LOOKING IN AREAS WHERE SOME SIGNIFICANT PERCENTAGE OF THE  
23 POPULATION WOULD TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT IF IT WERE AVAILABLE IN A  
24 MEANINGFUL WAY, BUT IT ISN'T. SO EVEN IN HIGH INCOME AREAS  
25 WHERE THE AVERAGE FAMILY MAY OWN A MILLION CARS OR WHATEVER,





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 THERE ARE STILL? INCOME FOLKS, LIKE PEOPLE WHO WOULD TAKE  
2 PUBLIC TRANSIT BECAUSE OF MORE LIMITED INCOMES, OR PEOPLE OF  
3 DIFFERENT AGES GROUPS OR ALL KINDS OF REASONS PEOPLE WOULD  
4 TAKE TRANSIT IF IT WAS AVAILABLE, BUT IT ISN'T. THEN I HEARD  
5 TODAY ABOUT PEOPLE TALKING ABOUT FIRST AND LAST MILE BUT AGAIN  
6 I ENCOURAGE US TO ALWAYS LOOK AT FIRST AND LAST 25 MILES.  
7 PARKING IS GROSSLY INADEQUATE AT THE END OF THE BART LINES AND  
8 IT IS OFTEN FULL WELL BEFORE 6:00 A.M. SO IF YOU GO IN AND TRY  
9 TO TAKE THE BART AND YOU CAN'T, THEN IT LEAVES PEOPLE WITH NO  
10 OPTION BUT TO DRIVE. SO IN OUR GREAT HEAR TO GET PEOPLE OFF OF  
11 THE RHODES, WE'RE PRETTY MUCH BUILDING SYSTEMS ONLY FOR PEOPLE  
12 WHO LIVE NEAR PUBLIC TRANSIT AND IT'S COMPLETELY DISREGARDING  
13 EVERYONE WHO ISN'T -- FALLS INTO THAT NORM CATEGORY. LOOKING  
14 AT GAPS AND ACCESSIBILITY, AGAIN, LOOKING AT CONNECTION TIMES,  
15 ESPECIALLY FOR PEOPLE WHO AREN'T GOING FROM HOMES NEAR BART TO  
16 JOBS NEAR BART, BUT MORE BLUE-COLLAR WORKERS WHOSE JOBS AREN'T  
17 IN THE MIDDLE OF A BIG CITY, AND WHOSE HOMES AREN'T NEAR THOSE  
18 TRANSIT LINES BECAUSE THEY HAVE BEEN PUSHED OUT. AND I'M  
19 WONDERING IF YOU'RE LOOKING AT ADDITIONAL WAYS TO CROSS THE  
20 BAY, ESPECIALLY FOR, LIKE, DEEPER EAST BAY, TO SOUTH SAN  
21 FRANCISCO. A LOT OF FOLKS ARE MAKING THAT COMMUTE AND HAVE TO  
22 DRIVE ACROSS SOME BRIDGE SO THEY'RE DRIVING A PRETTY LONG WAYS  
23 BECAUSE THERE IS NO GOOD WAY TO GET THERE WITH PUBLIC  
24 TRANSPORTATION, SO YOU'RE HAVING SOMETHING BASICALLY GO  
25 STRAIGHT ACROSS THE WATER BUT THEY'RE HAVING TO DRIVE TO ONE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 OF THE BRIDGES ADDING ALL OF THIS CONGESTION THAT'S  
2 UNNECESSARY AND I'M WONDERING IF YOU ARE LOOKING AT GOOD NIGHT  
3 TIME TRANSIT, BECAUSE ANYBODY WHO HAS, WHETHER IT'S THEIR OWN  
4 JOB OR A SECOND JOB, WHERE THEY HAVE A NIGHT JOB, A 10 MINUTE  
5 DRIVE CAN SOMETIMES BE AN OVER AN HOUR COMMUTE, ESPECIALLY AT  
6 NIGHT ON PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. IT JUST STRAIGHT UP STOPS  
7 RUNNING FOR A SIGNIFICANT PERIOD OF TIME. SO ANYONE IN THE  
8 SERVICE INDUSTRY, ANYONE WHO WORKS CLEANING A PUBLIC BUILDING,  
9 OR AT A RETAIL STORE THAT CLOSSES AT 11 OR MIDNIGHT, LIKE  
10 THERE, IS JUST NOT OPTIONS. SO I'M WONDERING WHAT YOU ARE  
11 LOOKING AT ON THAT. APOLOGIES FOR THE BACKGROUND NOISE.

12

13 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. DID STAFF WANT TO ANSWER ANY  
14 OF THOSE QUESTIONS?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. I DON'T KNOW IF I AM GOING TO TOUCH UPON ALL  
17 OF YOUR POINTS THERE, BUT CERTAINLY AREAS AROUND CROSSING THE  
18 BRIDGE WERE PART OF OUR ANALYSIS. THEY -- MANY, ESPECIALLY THE  
19 SOUTH BAY BRIDGES, THE DUMBARTON AND THE SAN MATEO ARE BOTH  
20 IDENTIFIED AS GAPS. THOSE ARE AREAS WHERE WE, YOU KNOW, ARE  
21 IDENTIFYING PROJECT EXTENSIONS OR PROJECTS AS A PART OF THIS.  
22 I DON'T KNOW IF THERE IS ANYTHING YOU WANT TO ADD THERE?

23

24 **KARA VUICICH:** TOUCHING ON THE LATE NIGHT SERVICE ALSO WOULD  
25 PERTAIN TO WEEKEND SERVICE AS WELL. PREVIOUSLY UNFORTUNATELY



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WE DIDN'T HAVE THE CAPACITY AND RESOURCES TO DIVE DEEPLY INTO  
2 THAT ANALYSIS OF, SORT OF, SERVICE NEEDS AND SERVICE  
3 AVAILABILITY DURING THAT TIME. IT'S POTENTIALLY SOMETHING THAT  
4 WE COULD LOOK MORE CLOSELY INTO IN THE FUTURE. I WOULD SAY FOR  
5 NOW, THOUGH, AGAIN, A LOT OF THAT WORK IN TERMS OF, SORT OF,  
6 VERY LOCALIZED NEEDS HAS BEEN IDENTIFIED BY OPERATORS AND MORE  
7 LOCAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES AND WE ARE INCORPORATING THAT  
8 WORK AND PROJECTS OR SERVICE NEEDS THAT HAVE RESULTED FROM  
9 THAT WORK, INTO THE NEXT, IN TERMS OF WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT.

10

11 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** IF IT'S OKAY TO FOLLOW-UP THERE? I HEAR  
12 STAFF TALK A LOT ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WANTING TO KNOW HOW COME  
13 PEOPLE WON'T GET OUT OF THEIR CARS, AND HOW COME THEY WON'T  
14 TAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WHEN IT'S AVAILABLE, AND, YOU KNOW,  
15 WE'RE LOOKING AT THIS THING, WE'RE GOING TO CHARGE PEOPLE TO  
16 DRIVE ON FREEWAYS, AND WE'RE NOT -- WE'RE NOT BEING PROVIDED  
17 AN OPTION THAT ALLOWS US TO TAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. SO, A  
18 LOT OF FOLKS HAVE A NIGHT JOB, WHICH IS OFTEN A SECOND JOB  
19 BECAUSE OUR DAY JOBS DON'T PAY US ENOUGH TO ONLY HAVE ONE JOB.  
20 SO, IT -- IT -- IT FEELS LIKE WE'RE BEING ASKED TO PAY OVER  
21 AND OVER AGAIN FOR NOT HAVING ONE OF THOSE FANCY JOBS. SO, I  
22 STRONGLY ENCOURAGE GOOD NIGHT TIME TRANSIT OPTIONS. LIKE,  
23 REALLY LOOKING AT WHAT THAT WOULD MEAN. BECAUSE THAT IS ONE OF  
24 THE WAYS, LIKE, PROVIDING US ALTERNATIVES TO DRIVING, IS THE  
25 ONLY WAY THAT YOU'RE GONNA GET US OFF THE ROAD AND DRIVING.



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 AND THIS IS A REALLY BIG GAP. AND SEEING THIS MUCH EFFORT AND  
2 RESOURCES AND EVERYTHING GOING INTO IT, WITHOUT LOOKING AT THE  
3 NEEDS OF FOLKS WHO HAVE TO DRIVE BECAUSE WE CAN'T RELY ON THE  
4 SERVICE THAT'S BEING PROVIDED TO US, IT'S A LITTLE  
5 DISHEARTENING. BUT I DO LOVE THIS PROCESS, AND THANK YOU FOR  
6 THE WORK ON IT.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WILLIAM AND THEN RANDI.

9

10 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** THANK YOU CHAIR CAMPOS. AND THANK YOU FOR THE  
11 PRESENTATION. REALLY GREAT INFORMATION. ALL OF THE QUESTIONS  
12 HAVE ALREADY BEEN ASKED, AND I THANK THE COUNCIL BECAUSE I  
13 LEARN FROM THESE QUESTIONS THAT YOU ASKED. I DID WANT TO FOCUS  
14 ON THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT. ON SLIDE NINE IT SAYS  
15 THAT THE NEEDS ASSESSMENT WILL FOCUS ON THE NEAR-TERM UNMET  
16 TRANSIT NEEDS. AND I WAS TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THOSE NEAR-  
17 TERM UNMET TRANSIT NEEDS WERE. AND ALSO I READ THIS MORNING,  
18 THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT METHODOLOGY, AND I NOTICED  
19 THAT THERE IS A DRAFT FOR THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT  
20 METHODOLOGY, BUT I COULD NOT FIND IT. IS THAT AVAILABLE? AND  
21 CAN BE MADE AVAILABLE?

22

23 **KARA VUICICH:** WE'RE -- IT'S STILL IN PROCESS AND WE'RE WORKING  
24 ON REFINING IT. BUT I THINK, YES, IT WILL BE PUBLICLY  
25 AVAILABLE. SO, WE'LL MAKE A NOTE TO SEND THAT OUT TO FOLKS



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WHEN IT IS. BUT THANKS FOR ASKING ABOUT THAT. AND THEN TO  
2 ADDRESS YOUR OTHER QUESTION IN TERMS OF -- OH, THE FOCUS OF  
3 THIS ANALYSIS AND THE KIND OF NEAR-TERM UNMET TRANSIT NEEDS.  
4 SO, AGAIN, I WANT TO, SORT OF, CONTEXTUALIZE THIS AND THAT  
5 IT'S, SORT OF, A VERY -- THAT'S WHAT WE WERE FOCUSED ON IN  
6 TERMS OF AT A VERY KIND OF HIGH-LEVEL REGIONAL, REGION-WIDE  
7 ANALYSIS TO LOOK AT KIND OF ARE THERE MAIN GAPS IN TERMS OF  
8 NOT SO MUCH WITHIN SMALLER GEOGRAPHIES BUT REGION-WIDE ARE  
9 THERE GAPS IN TRANSIT SERVICE THAT WE NEED TO ADDRESS EIGHT  
10 REGIONAL SCALE WHICH IS NOT TO SAY THERE ARE NOT MUCH MORE  
11 LOCALIZED GAPS OUT THERE, AND SO APOLOGIES FOR NOT BEING CLEAR  
12 ABOUT THAT FROM THE START -- BUT THIS'S WHAT WE'RE REFERRING  
13 TO. IT'S MORE OF THIS HIGHER LEVEL ANALYSIS THAT IS DESIGNED  
14 TO SUPPLEMENT AND COMPLEMENT THOSE MORE DETAILED ANALYSIS THAT  
15 ARE UNDERTAKEN AT THE LOCAL LEVEL.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** WILLIAM GOODWIN: OKAY. IN THAT VAIN, I NOTED THERE  
18 WAS A COORDINATED PUBLIC TRANSIT AND HUMAN SERVICES  
19 TRANSPORTATION PLAN, AND THAT WAS GOING TO BE UPDATED THIS  
20 YEAR. AND I'M WONDERING, BECAUSE THAT, SPECIFICALLY FOCUSED ON  
21 THE CONSIDERATION, THE MOBILE MOBILITY NEEDS AND GAPS OF  
22 SENIORS, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, AND LOW-INCOME FOLKS, AS  
23 WELL AS VETERANS, WILL THAT, SORT OF, BE LOOPED INTO THIS?

24



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **KARA VUICICH:** YES AND THANK YOU FOR ASKING ABOUT THAT, BECAUSE  
2 IT'S ACTUALLY REALLY PERSONALITY. THAT UPDATE IS CURRENTLY  
3 UNDERWAY, AND I THINK DRENNEN SHELTON MAY HAVE COME BEFORE YOU  
4 PREVIOUSLY AND TALKED ABOUT IT. SO WE HAVE BEEN COORDINATING  
5 WITH HER IN TERMS OF TRACKING WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THAT PLAN  
6 AND WE'LL CONTINUE TO WORK WITH HER. AND SO ONE OF THE THINGS,  
7 YOU KNOW, BECAUSE THIS IS A REGION-WIDE PLAN FOR  
8 TRANSPORTATION AND TRANSIT, IT WILL INCLUDE FUNDING AND, SORT  
9 OF -- AND/OR STRATEGIES, PROGRAMMATIC SUPPORT FOR PARATRANSIT  
10 AND THE TYPES OF THINGS THAT ARE IN THE COORDINATED SERVICES  
11 PLAN. SO, WE ARE CONTINUING TO COORDINATE WITH DRENNAN IN  
12 TERMS OF GETTING A GOOD UNDERSTANDING OF, LIKE, OKAY, WHAT  
13 DOES THAT FUNDING NEED LOOK LIKE BETWEEN, YOU KNOW, 2025 WHEN  
14 THIS PLAN WILL BE ADOPTED, AND 2050, AND THE TYPES OF THINGS  
15 THAT NEED TO BE FUNDED FROM THAT AND BEING ABLE TO INCORPORATE  
16 THAT AS WELL.

17

18 **WILLIAM GOODWIN. I'M NOT SURE IF THIS IS RELEVANT BUT I'M**  
19 **CURIOUS ABOUT RIDE-SHARING AND THE EFFECT ON CONGESTION, AND**  
20 **TAKING PEOPLE AWAY FROM PUBLIC TRANSIT. THE MARKET SHARES ARE**  
21 **GOING UP AND THERE IS A NEED AND THEY'RE FILLING A GAP. WILL**  
22 **WE LOOK AT THAT?**

23

24 **>>DAVE VAUTIN:** THAT WAS ACTUALLY SOMETHING THAT WE STARTED  
25 INTEGRATING INTO A MODELING AND ANALYSIS IN THE LAST PLAN, SO



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WE MADE UPDATES TO OUR TRAVEL DEMAND TO INTEGRATE BOTH  
2 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK COMPANIES THAT ARE NORMALLY UBER AND  
3 LYFT AS WELL AS THE POTENTIAL BOTH POSITIVE AND ADVERSE  
4 IMPACTS OF AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES AND THOSE BEING USED FOR RIDE-  
5 SHARE OPERATIONS SO THAT CONTINUES TO BE PART OF OUR MODELING.  
6 AND WE NEED TO INCORPORATE THE BEST FIELD DATA IN TERMS OF  
7 WHAT THE IMPOSSIBILITY OPTIONS ARE ON THE GROUND.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** RANDI THEN MICHAEL.

12

13 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO LIFT UP SOME OF  
14 THE COMMENTS AND THANK YOU ADINA FOR BRINGING UP VTA STUDY  
15 THAT THEY HAVE COMPLETED AND LAUNCHED. I WANT TO LIFT UP SOME  
16 OF THE ISSUES AROUND DESERTS MUCH TRANSPORTATION. AND THE  
17 REASON FOR THAT IS THEY'RE IN REMOTE AREAS, THEY'RE IN OUTER  
18 REACHES WHERE THERE IS EITHER SMALLER TOWNS OR SMALLER LITTLE  
19 'BURBS OR SMALLER LITTLE VILLAGES, OR THERE IS A -- THERE IS A  
20 COMMERCIAL ESTABLISHMENT AROUND PROCESSING ANYTHING FROM  
21 GRIPES GARLIC THAT GOES ON THAT REQUIRES PEOPLE TO BE THERE AT  
22 DIDN'T HOURS. AND I DON'T THINK WE'RE CAPTURING THAT, I DON'T  
23 THINK WE'RE CAPTURING ANY OF THAT. SO TO ME THAT LOOKS LIKE WE  
24 ARE MISSING A SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF PEOPLE IN THE SERVICE  
25 INDUSTRY. WE'RE NOT CAPTURING THE SERVICE INDUSTRY THAT IS



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WORKING LATE, THAT IS NOT GETTING OFF UNTIL 3, 4:00 IN THE  
2 MORNING, AND THEN THE MAIDS START AT SIX OR 7:00 IN THE  
3 MORNING. SO WE'RE NOT PROVIDING OPTION IN THOSE AREAS AND I  
4 FINISHING WE DO THAT WE FIND OVERLAP IN OUR FAIRLY ACTIVE  
5 RURAL AREAS. WE'RE NOT GOING TO FIND IT IN FARMLAND BUT WE'RE  
6 GOING TO FIND IT ACROSS THE BOARD IN SOUTHERN SANTA CLARA  
7 COUNTY, SOUTHEASTERN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, EASTERN CONTRA COSTA  
8 COUNTY, WESTERN MARIN, WESTERN SAN MATEO COUNTY. THERE IS A  
9 NUMBER OF AREAS WHERE THAT -- THOSE HOLES EXIST FOR A REASON.  
10 AND, SO, I THINK THAT WE NEED TO -- WE NEED TO NOT JUST LOOK  
11 AT IT AS SERVICE WORKERS. AND I REMEMBER DURING THE LAST BIG  
12 RECESSION WHEN WE WERE COUNTING ON -- WE WERE GIVING BUS  
13 SERVICE PROVIDERS KIND OF POINTS FOR KEEPING THEIR SERVICE AT  
14 A CERTAIN RATE, AT A 15 OR 20 MINUTE RATE, AND I DISTINCTLY  
15 SAID WHAT THEY'RE GOING TO DO IS THEY'RE GOING TO LOWER THEIR  
16 NIGHT TIME RATE. SO THOSE PEOPLE WORKING AT MALLS WERE NOT  
17 GOING TO HAVE A WAY TO GET HOME. AND IT WAS LIKE, OH, NO, NO,  
18 THEY'RE NOT GOING DO THAT AND I GO OKAY AS LONG AS WE'RE  
19 TRACKING NUMBERS CAN WE TRACK THAT CAN WE COME BACK A YEAR  
20 FROM NOW AND LOOK AT THOSE NUMBERS? AND SURE ENOUGH, THAT'S  
21 WHAT HAPPENED. SO, I WANT US TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE TRACKING  
22 ALL OF THOSE PROBLEMS BECAUSE IT DOESN'T JUST HAPPEN OUT IN  
23 THE HINTERLANDS, IT HAPPENS HERE. ALL THE MAIN LOADING THAT  
24 GOES ON AT A MAJOR MALL, HAPPENS AT NIGHT. IT HAPPENS DURING  
25 THOSE HOURS WHEN YOU DON'T HAVE PEOPLE THERE. BUT THOSE PEOPLE





JANUARY 26, 2024

1 NEED TO GET IN AND OUT. YOU KNOW? AND PEOPLE WHO WORK THOSE  
2 HOURS ACTUALLY NEED BUS SERVICE TO DO THEIR SHOPPING AND TO DO  
3 THEIR LAUNDRY AND TO DO ALL THIS OTHER STUFF ON WEEKENDS,  
4 WHICH THEY DON'T HAVE. MEANWHILE ANY TIME WE DON'T HAVE A  
5 DIRECT LINE, A BUS SERVICE LINE, WE'RE CUTTING OUT OUR ADA,  
6 LINE, AND THAT REALLY SCARES ME AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE US  
7 TRACK SOME OF THIS BETTER. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:**

10

11 **V. CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT AND YOUR  
12 PATIENCE. IT SEEMS LIKE THE UNDER LYING PHRASE WOULD BE MIND  
13 THE GAP, AS YOU WOULD SEE IN THE TUBE. AND THERE IS A LOT OF  
14 GAPS OUT THERE. SPEAKING OF THE HOSPITALITY INDUSTRY, THE  
15 MANUFACTURING THAT GOES ON IN THE NORTH COUNTIES. LACKING EAST  
16 WEST AND NORTH SOUTH. AND ACCORDING TO DESTINATION NAPA  
17 VALLEY, 2018, WE'RE HAVEN'T GOTTEN BACK TO THOSE LEVELS, BUT  
18 THAT WAS 3.8 MILLION VISITORS A YEAR AND 2.4 ARE DAY-TRIPPERS  
19 AND THERE IS NO DEPENDABLE TRANSIT. PARDON ME, OUR CHAIRMAN,  
20 DO I SAY EMERITUS? OR -- SHE HAS MENTIONED IN THE PAST AND  
21 IT'S STILL A PROBLEM, 30% OF NAPA COUNTY VALLEY TRANSIT AGENCY  
22 BUS SERVICE WAS IMPACTED BY LACK OF TRANSIT OPERATORS, LACK OF  
23 BUS DRIVERS AND WITHOUT AN ONGOING EFFORT BY ALL CONCERNED TO  
24 BRING THAT UP, AND PAY A GOOD WAGE FOR THAT, IT WOULD GO A  
25 LONG WAYS. AND SEEMINGLY, WITH NAPA COUNTY HAS -- IN THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 WORKS, AND TERRY COULD SUPPORT ME ON THIS -- IS QUITE A FEW  
2 HOUSING PROJECTS IN LINE, NAPA PIPE, 900 UNITS AMERICAN CANYON  
3 PROBABLY A COUPLE THOUSAND THERE. WE'RE SPEAKING ABOUT  
4 GENERATIONAL PROJECTS, SPEAK BY THE TIME TURNOVER ON THIS  
5 BOARD 5, 6, 7, 8 TIMES AND ALL THOSE QUESTIONS WILL BE ASKED,  
6 I'M SURE, IN THE FUTURE. SO WITH THAT I BELIEVE THERE'S A  
7 STRONG IMPETUS OR COMPELLING REASON TO HAVE SOME INPUT ON  
8 PROJECTS THAT, HEY THINGS HAVE CHANGED IN THE LAST 2, 3, 4  
9 YEARS AND MAYBE WE OUGHT TO REVISIT THIS AS MR. RHODES HAS  
10 BROUGHT UP BEFORE, HOW DO WE BET SOMETHING STARTED. OH, OUR  
11 NEXT PROJECT 2026 SHORT-TERM THAT'S NOTHING BUT TO START  
12 PLANNING FOR IT RIGHT NOW I THINK IS IMPORTANT. THANKS VERY  
13 MUCH.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I ALSO WANT TO EXPRESS MY  
16 APPRECIATION FOR THE REPORT, ESPECIALLY THOSE MAPS. I  
17 UNDERSTAND IT IS A HUGE LIFT TO TRY AND CONDENSE DATA AND  
18 INFORMATION, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE THE VISUALS TO HELP US  
19 DIGEST THE DATA. BUT I DID HEAR A LOT OF QUESTIONS ABOUT THE  
20 MAPS. AND, SO, IN THE FUTURE, IF WE COULD HAVE SOME CONTEXT  
21 AND CLARIFICATION BEFOREHAND, JUST TO KNOW WHAT IT IS THAT WE  
22 ARE LOOKING AT, WHAT IT IS THAT WE NEED TO SEE, I PARTICULARLY  
23 HAD TROUBLE UNDERSTANDING BETWEEN MAP 10 AND 11 ON MY OWN TIME  
24 AT HOME, WHAT THE DIFFERENCES WERE. AND I DID HEAR A LOT OF  
25 QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT. SO, I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL IN



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 GUYING OUR COORDINATION. AND TO SOME OF THE POINTS MADE ABOUT  
2 THE MORE RURAL AREAS THAT AREN'T AS VISIBLY REPRESENTED ON THE  
3 MAP, I WILL SPEAK TO MY COMMUNITY IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, AND  
4 GILROY WHERE I HAVE FAMILY, I KNOW FOR A FACT THAT THERE'S A  
5 NEED TO IMPROVE THE PUBLIC TRANSIT SYSTEM, BOTH FOR NEEDS AND  
6 FOR RECREATION. I HAVE A COUSIN I KNOW WHO HAS TO GO TO SAN  
7 JOSE FOR HAS PHYSICAL THERAPY BECAUSE THAT IS WHERE HIS  
8 INSURANCE PROVIDER IS, AND HE HAS TO GO IN A CAR BECAUSE THERE  
9 IS NO PUBLIC TRANSIT THAT WILL TAKE HIM TO HIS APPOINTMENT ON  
10 TIME. THIS FAMILY ALSO DRIVES TO SHARKS GAMES AND I AM SURE  
11 THEY'RE NOT THE ONLY FAMILY IN GILROY, MORGAN HILL, OR SAN  
12 MARTIN WHO LIKES TO GO TO HOCKEY GAMES OR A NIGHT OUT IN  
13 DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE. I HOPE WE CAN ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE ARE  
14 FAMILIES, WORKERS PEOPLE WHO NEED ACCESS TO PUBLIC TRANSIT,  
15 AND TO SAY THAT THERE IS NO GAP NEEDED IN THOSE AREAS IS  
16 INCORRECT. SO I'M GOING TO BORROW THIS PHRASE THAT I HEARD, WE  
17 SHOULD BE DATA INFORMED WITH VALUES DRIVEN AND IF WE WANT TO  
18 MAKE SURE THAT EVERYONE IS PUTTING PUBLIC TRANSIT AS THEIR  
19 NUMBER ONE CHOICE FOR GETTING AROUND THEN WE NEED TO REALLY  
20 EMPHASIZE EQUITY THAT A LOT OF FOLKS ARE LIFTING UP THAT IS  
21 NEEDED TO MAKE SURE WE'RE IMPROVING OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM. FOR  
22 FUTURE INFORMATION ITEMS IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO KNOW WHAT  
23 QUESTIONS YOU HAVE FOR US. IS THERE SPECIFIC DATA THAT YOU  
24 WOULD LIKE TO HEAR FROM US? COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT SUPPORT? THE  
25 MORE GUIDANCE AND DIRECTION THAT WE CAN HAVE FROM STAFF IN



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 TERMS OF THE INFORMATION ITEMS AND WHAT WOULD BE MOST HELPFUL  
2 TO HEAR FROM OUR COUNCIL, I THINK WOULD HELP RUN THE  
3 CONVERSATION A LITTLE BIT MORE SMOOTHLY. AND, FINALLY, I  
4 THINK, I CAN'T REITERATE ENOUGH HOW IMPORTANT IT IS FOR OUR  
5 COUNCIL MEMBERS THAT WE INCREASE SERVICE AND IMPROVE LINKAGE,  
6 ESPECIALLY AS WE'RE WORKING ON UPDATING TRANSIT 2050+ AND  
7 LOOKING TOWARDS THE FUTURE IT'S PARAMOUNT THAT WE KEEP THIS AT  
8 THE HEART OF THE WORK BECAUSE IF THAT'S WHAT OUR COUNCIL  
9 CONTINUES TO BRING UP TIME AND TIME AGAIN IT'S BECAUSE IT'S  
10 WHAT WE'RE ENERGY OUR COMMUNITIES BECAUSE IT'S WHAT WE'RE  
11 EXPERIENCING AS PUBLIC TRANSIT RIDERS OURSELVES AND WE HAVE AN  
12 OPPORTUNITY TO DO PART AND I BELIEVE IT'S OUR RESPONSIBILITY  
13 TO DO SO. SO THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR THE COORDINATION AND  
14 COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS FROM ALL. I WILL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE  
15 WERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH  
16 THIS ITEM AND IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON  
17 THIS ITEM PLEASE USE THE RAISED THE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR  
18 NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR  
19 THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TWO MINUTES. I'LL  
22 GIVE YOU A WARNING AT 15 SECONDS.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** WARREN CUSHMAN. COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT  
25 LIVING. I WANT TO START OUT BY SAYING I'M PLEASED BY THE



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 BREADTH OF KNOWLEDGE OF THIS COUNCIL. TO ME PLEASING ALL THE  
2 DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVES THAT YOU HAVE. I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT  
3 THERE ARE A LOT OF MOVING TARGETS HAPPENING RIGHT NOW. ONE  
4 THING THAT'S GOING ON IN OUR MIDST IS THAT THE AC TRANSIT IS  
5 TALKING ABOUT A 20% CUT IN SERVICE, EITHER 15 OR 20% CUT IN  
6 SERVICE. SO THESE TARGETS MOVE. AND I THINK THAT MATTERS AS WE  
7 MOVE FORWARD. I'M GLAD TO HEAR WE'RE LOOKING AT SOME SHORT-  
8 TERM DATA AND SOME SHORT-TERM PLANNING. BUT LET'S KEEP IN  
9 MISUNDERSTOOD THIS THOSE TARGETS MOVE AS WE SPEAK. ALSO I DO  
10 WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR CONNECTING WITH DRENNAN AND THE  
11 PARATRANSIT EFFORT. YOU KNOW, ONE DOES AFFECT THE OTHER. SO  
12 I'M GLAD TO HEAR THAT. AND FINALLY, I JUST THINK THAT, YOU  
13 KNOW, THE FISCAL CLIFF IS A REALITY, AND I THINK WE REALLY DO  
14 NEED TO THINK ABOUT, AS WE PLAN IN THE NEAR-TERM, YOU KNOW, WE  
15 CERTAINLY DO WANT MORE SERVICE AND WE WANT INCREASED SERVICE,  
16 AND THERE IS A BATTLE GOING ON BETWEEN FREQUENCY AND COVERAGE.  
17 AND THAT BATTLE, UNFORTUNATELY, IS INFORMED BY THE FISCAL  
18 CLIFF AND SHORT-TERM. SO I THINK WE SHOULD BE AWARE OF THAT,  
19 STAFF AND ALL OF US HERE SHOULD BE THINKING ABOUT HOW TO STEP  
20 FORWARD AND DEAL WITH THAT REALITY. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. OUR NEXT PUBLIC COMMENT?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CAMPOS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR  
25 THE RECORD, SHE AND HER, WITH TEAM FOLD. VERY GOOD



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 PRESENTATION. I DO SEE GAPS. AND I RARELY EVER GO TO THE NORTH  
2 BAY OR THE SOUTH BAY, BECAUSE IT JUST TAKES SO LONG. AND I  
3 THINK A LOT OF THAT GOES BACK DECADES. WE NEVER FORESAW, SAY,  
4 BUILDING A TRAIN TUNNEL FROM MARIN COUNTY, HERE TO SAN  
5 FRANCISCO, JUST AS IN NEW YORK, THEY NEVER DID BUILD A SUBWAY  
6 TUNNEL BETWEEN BROOK LONE AND STATEN ISLAND, MUCH AS I HOPED  
7 IT WOULD HAPPEN SOME DAY. AND EVEN TO GET ACROSS THE BAY, THE  
8 F BUS ONLY RUNS OVER THE BAY BRIDGE EVERY 30 MINUTES. AND BART  
9 DOESN'T RUN THROUGH THE TUNNEL AS MUCH AS IT USED TO. I LIVE  
10 WITHOUT A CAR, BY CHOICE. I DO HAVE A DRIVER'S LICENSE.  
11 SOMETIMES I USE RIDE SHARES, ESPECIALLY ELECTRIC RIDE SHARES.  
12 AND I'M LOOKING AT TRYING OUT THIS AUTONOMOUS VEHICLE SERVICE.  
13 I HAVE AN ACCOUNT WITH THEM, AND GET INTO A CAR THAT DOES NOT  
14 HAVE A DRIVER, AND SEE WHAT THAT IS LIKE. BECAUSE I LIKE  
15 HAVING OPTIONS. I KNOW WHAT IT'S LIKE TO BE A SUPER COMMUTER  
16 AND HAVE JOBS WITH ODD HOURS. BUT WE HAVE TO THINK ABOUT OUR  
17 AIRPORTS. THERE ARE PEOPLE WHO WORK IN AIRPORTS, AS I DID  
18 YEARS AGO, THAT YOU DON'T HAVE TRANSIT CONNECTIONS TO THE AIR  
19 CARGO SECTIONS. IT'S RELATIVELY EASY TO GET TO THE TERMINAL,  
20 BUT FOR PEOPLE WHO LOAD AIRPLANES AT NIGHT, THERE IS NO  
21 TRANSIT OVER THERE. SO WE HAVE TO REMEMBER PEOPLE WHO WORK FOR  
22 AIRPORTS AND TRANSIT SYSTEMS THAT THEY NEED TRANSIT TOO. THANK  
23 YOU.  
24



JANUARY 26, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. SEEING NO MORE MEMBERS OF THE  
2 PUBLIC PROVIDING PUBLIC COMMENT -- I'M SORRY. MARTHA IS THERE  
3 --?

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I JUST SENT YOU A TEXT MESSAGE ABOUT IT.  
6 BUT THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.  
7 THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK, AND  
8 EVERYONE IN THE BOARDROOM THAT WANTED TO SPEAK DID.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. IT LOOKS LIKE WE ARE GOING TO  
11 CLOSE THE MEETING NOW, BECAUSE WE DROPPED SOME OF OUR REMOTE  
12 MEMBERS. SO, I WILL CALL THIS MEETING TO CLOSE. AND THE NEXT  
13 MEETING OF MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD FRIDAY  
14 FEBRUARY 23RD, 2024, AT 10:00 A.M. AT THE BAY AREA METRO  
15 CENTER, 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO CALIFORNIA. ANY  
16 CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.  
17 THANK YOU, ALL, FOR YOUR TIME. [ADJOURNED]

18



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*