

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JULY 23, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL

TUESDAY, JULY 23RD, 2024, 10:00 AM

CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS: GOOD MORNING, EVERYBODY. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. THE MEETING IS ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COUNCILMEMBERS PARTICIPATING FROM ZOOM SHOULD USED THE RAZED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON WITH THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE CALL. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. AGENDA ITEM 1. WILL BE CLERK PLEASE CALL ROLL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM.

CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS: PRESENT.

V.CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI: PRESENT.

CARLINE AU: PRESENT.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MEMBER BENITEZ IS EXCUSED. MEMBER BORDEN. DEB DEUTSCH-GROSS.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: PRESENT.

ILAF ESUF: PRESENT.



JULY 23, 2024

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FROM YOUR REMOTE LOCATION. MEMBER
2 FITZGERALD. LOOPING BACK. MEMBER GLASER.

3

4 **GERRY GLASER:** I'M HERE.

5

6 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** PRESENT.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HANKERSON. MEMBER KALLINS.

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER KINMAN IS ABSENT.

13

14 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** PRESENT.

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER LIEU IS ABSENT. MEMBER ORANTES IS
19 ABSENT. MEMBER PARKER IS ABSENT. MEMBER PIERCE IS ABSENT.

20

21 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER RHOADS IS ABSENT.

24

25 **TERRY SCOTT:** HERE.



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **ROLAND WONG:** HERE .

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU MADE OUR QUORUM.

5

6 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** HERE .

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YOU MADE OUR QUORUM. YAY. WE HAVE A

9 QUORUM.

10

11 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. TWO REQUESTS FOR REMOTE
12 PARTICIPATION UNDER AB 2449 FROM MTC COUNCILMEMBERS ROLAND
13 WONG AND CHRISTINE FITZGERALD. MEMBER ROLAND WONG.

14

15 **ROLAND WONG:** I AM REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER AB
16 2449 JUST CAUSE BECAUSE OF A NEED RELATED TO PHYSICAL
17 DISABILITY AS DEFINED IN SECTION S 12926 AND 12926.1, NOT
18 OTHERWISE ACCOMMODATED BY SUBDIVISION G. THERE ARE NO
19 INDIVIDUALS UNDER 18 YEARS OF AGE OR OLDER PRESENT IN THE
20 ROOM. I WILL UPDATE THE CHAIR IF THE SITUATION ABOUT WHO IS
21 THE ROOM CHANGES. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. AND MEMBER FITZGERALD.

24



JULY 23, 2024

1 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR. I AM REQUESTING
2 TO JOIN UNDER AB 2449 UNDER SECTION 12926 AND 1296.1. NOT
3 OTHERWISE COVERED UNDER SECTION G DUE TO JUST CAUSE,
4 CAREGIVING ISSUES AND THAT IS DISABILITY-RELATED. NO ONE IN
5 THE ROOM UNDER UNDER THE AGE OF 18. I AM THE ONLY ONE HERE. IF
6 THAT DOES CHANGE, I WILL INFORM THE CHAIR.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. YOUR REQUESTS ARE NOTED. WE
9 ARE ADDING MTC COUNCILMEMBERS ROLAND WONG AND CHRISTINE
10 FITZGERALD AS PRESENT. NEXT AGENDA ITEM IS OUR COMPENSATION
11 ANNOUNCEMENT. WILL THE CLERK READ THE ANNOUNCEMENT.

12

13 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAWMAKERS. THE
14 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. MEMBER OF THE BOARD WILL GET \$1
15 MOUNTAIN PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER
16 MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF
17 CONVENING A MEETING OF WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO
18 COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NEXT AGAIN ITEM IS WELCOMING
21 AND CHAIRS REPORT. I KNOW THAT WE HAVE A -- A POTENTIAL ACTION
22 ITEM ON OUR AGENDA TODAY. YESTERDAY, THE TRANSIT REVENUE
23 MEASURE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MET. NEXT MONDAY, THE SELECT
24 COMMITTEE WILL MEET AND TOMORROW IS THE COMMISSION MEETING.
25 THESE ARE ALL REALLY GREAT OPPORTUNITIES FOR US AS A COUNCIL



JULY 23, 2024

1 TO THINK TOGETHER ABOUT WHAT POINTS WE WOULD LIKE TO BRING UP
2 SO THAT TOMORROW AT THE COMMISSION MEETING I CAN SHARE, YOU
3 KNOW, WHAT KEY POINTS WERE DISCUSSED IN TODAY'S MEETING. THERE
4 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
7 RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN ZOOM OR THE
8 BOARD ROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 28, 2024
11 MEETING MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE
12 THE JUNE 28 MEETING MINUTE?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

15

16 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** A MOTION BY CHARLIE AND A SECOND BY
17 TERRY. ANY MTC MEMBERS WHO WOULD LIKE TO HAVE COMMENT ON THIS
18 ITEM? SEEING NONE. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON
21 THIS ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARD ROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO
22 SPEAK.

23

24 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, WILL THE CLERK CALL A ROLL
25 CALL.



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MOTION BY LAVERY. SECOND BY SCOTT.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES.

5

6 **V.CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** YES.

7

8 **CARLINE AU:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER BENITEZ SECRETARIES ACCUSED.

11 MEMBER BORDEN IS ARDENT. MEMBER DEUTSCH-GROSS IS BE A DENT.

12

13 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

14

15 **ILAF ESUF:** YES.

16

17 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** AYE. GLAZERS GLAZERS YEP.

18

19 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** I MUST ABSTAIN.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ABSTAIN. MEMBER HANKERSON?

22

23 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. MEMBER KALLINS.



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER KINMAN IS BE A DENT.

5

6 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** AYE.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER LIEU IS ABSENT. MEMBER ORANTES IS
11 ABSENT. MEMBER PARKER IS ABSENT. MEMBER PIERCE IS ABSENT.

12

13 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER RHOADS IS EXCUSED.

16

17 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

18

19 **HOWARD WONG:** YES.

20

21 **ROLAND WONG:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PASSES WITH 15 AYES AND WITH ONE BE A
24 SENSE.

25



JULY 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM IS PUBLIC COMMENT.
2 DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO ONE IN THE BOARD ROOM OR ZOOM WISHING
5 TO SPEAK AND WE DID RECEIVE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE FROM --
6 LET'S SEE. FROM DAVID MANDEL FOR THE CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF
7 THE BLIND THAT HAS BEEN DISTRIBUTED TO ALL COUNCILMEMBERS AND
8 POSTED ONLINE.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. NOW WE HAVE AGENDA ITEM 6-A.
11 WE HAVE KARA VUICICH -- HOW DO YOU SAY YOUR LAST NAME?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** VUICICH.

14

15 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** AND ANDY METZ WHO WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM
16 FOR INFORMATION.

17

18 **KARA VUICICH:** THANK YOU, I AM PRINCIPAL MANAGER FOR MTC AND
19 PROJECT MANAGER FOR TRANSIT 2050+. ANDY METZ, LET HIM
20 INTRODUCE.

21

22 **ANDY METZ:** I AM ANDY METZ PRINCIPAL MANAGER FOR AC AND PROJECT
23 MANAGER FOR TRANSIT 2050+.

24



JULY 23, 2024

1 **KARA VUICICH:** TODAY WE WILL HAVE A MAJOR MILESTONE THE DRAFT
2 PERFORMANCE AND THE DRAFT TRANSIT NETWORK. WITH THAT, LET'S GO
3 AHEAD AND GET STARTED. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO WE WERE LAST
4 BEFORE YOU EARLIER THIS CALENDAR YEAR. AND JUST TO KIND OF
5 GIVE YOU ALL A REFRESHER. TRANSIT 2050+ IS A COMPREHENSIVE
6 UPDATE OF THE TRANSBARRIER STRATEGIES. YOU HAVE RECEIVED, AND
7 THE REST THIS IS A CYCLE LIMITED AND FOCUSED UPDATE EXCEPT FOR
8 THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS. TRANSIT 2050+ RESPONSE
9 TO ACTION ITEM NUMBER 18 FROM THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION
10 ACTION PLAN WHICH CALLS TO FUND, DEVELOP AND ADOPT A BAY AREA
11 CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN. SO THE APPROACH WE HAVE TAKEN FOR
12 TRANSIT 2050+ REPRESENTS A MAJOR CHANGE FROM THE WAY WE
13 APPROACHED DEVELOPMENT OF THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES AND PROJECTS
14 IN OUR REGIONAL PLAN. AND AS PART OF THAT, ONE OF THE THINGS
15 THAT WE HAVE DONE IS WORK CLOSELY WITH A TRANSIT OPERATOR-LED
16 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM AND ALSO A CO-PROJECT MANAGER
17 REPRESENTING TRANSIT OPERATORS. THAT PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM
18 IS MADE UP OF SEVEN STAFF FROM THE SEVEN LARGE TRANSIT
19 OPERATORS AND FOUR SMALL TRANSIT OPERATORS. WORKING TOGETHER
20 WITH THEM, WE DEVELOPED AN INITIAL SET OF GOALS FOR TRANSIT
21 2050+. AN INTEGRATED TRANSIT NETWORK TO GROW RIDERSHIP,
22 IMPROVE RIDABILITY AND SPEED AND REDUCING BARRIER FOR USING
23 TRANSIT. I THINK SOME OF YOU MAY RECALL EARLIER THIS YEAR WE
24 PRESENTED TO YOU THE INITIAL FINDINGS FROM THE NEEDS, GAPS AND
25 OPPORTUNITIES ANALYSIS THAT FOCUSED ON REGIONAL POST-PANDEMIC



JULY 23, 2024

1 TRAVEL PATTERNS IN ORDER TO IDENTIFY WHERE ADDITIONAL
2 INVESTMENTS IN TRANSIT FREQUENCY SPAN AND TRANSIT PRIORITY
3 TREATMENTS NEEDED IN THE NEAR TERM. WE THEN WORKED WITH OUR
4 PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM AND CONSULTANT TEAM TO LOOK AT OUR
5 CURRENT LIST OF PROJECTS AND INVESTMENTS. AND FOUND THAT MANY
6 OF THESE IF NOT MOST OF THE GAPS WERE FILLED BY SERVICE AND
7 CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN IDENTIFIED. BUT WE
8 ALSO WORKED WITH THE PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM TO DEVELOP
9 SEVERAL NEW PROJECT CONCEPTS FOR THE SAN MATEO AND DUMBARTON
10 BRIDGE CORRIDORS. FROM THE DROPPED PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT THAT
11 WE WILL BE TALKING ABOUT TODAY IN ADDITION TO OTHER FACTORS
12 WERE USED TO DEVELOP THE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK WHICH IS
13 THE FOCUS OF TODAY'S PRESENTATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO THE
14 PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT IS A KEY COMPONENT OF PLAN
15 BARRIER. THE PLAN BARRIER TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT THAT IS
16 REQUIRED TO BE FISCALLY CONSTRAINED. WE THEN -- WE USE THE
17 PROJECT PERFORMANCE INVESTMENT RESULTS TO UNDERSTAND THE
18 RELATIVE BENEFITS OF LARGER SCALE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS
19 WHICH WE DEFINE THOSE AS TOTAL LIFE CYCLE COST OF \$250 MILLION
20 OR MORE, UNDER A WIDE RANGE OF POTENTIAL FUTURE CONDITIONS. WE
21 USE THE SAME METHODOLOGY FOR THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE
22 ASSESSMENT THAT WAS USED FOR PLAN 2050 AND LOOKS AT A RANGE OF
23 PROJECT UNDER VERY DIFFERENT 2050 FUTURES. THE WHAT-IF
24 SCENARIO WAS THE RISING TIDES FALLING FORTUNE FUTURE THAT
25 REPRESENT CONDITIONS LIKE THE POST-PANDEMIC FUTURE TRAJECTORY



JULY 23, 2024

1 WITH SLOWER ECONOMIC GROWTH, LOWER JOB GROWTH, LOWER HOUSING
2 GROWTH -- OR HOUSING AND POPULATION GROWTH. AND THE TWO OTHER
3 FUTURES, CLEAN AND GREEN AND BACK TO THE FUTURE REPRESENT
4 FUTURES WITH VERY DIFFERENT TYPES OF DEMANDS FOR OUR
5 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM DUE TO THE RESPECTIVE SETS OF EXTERNAL
6 FORCES. THOSE TWO FUTURES -- THOSE TWO FUTURES ASSUME MUCH
7 MORE ROBUST ECONOMIC GROWTH AND JOBS AND HOUSING GROWTH BUT
8 THE DISTRIBUTION OF WHERE THOSE JOBS AND NEW HOUSEHOLDS ARE
9 LOCATED IS VERY DIFFERENT. THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT
10 CONSISTS OF THREE MAIN COMPONENTS. FIRST ARE THE BENEFIT COST
11 ANALYSIS THAT COMPARES THE CAPITAL, OPERATING AND LIFE CYCLE
12 COST OF A PROJECT TO A SET OF MONETIZED BENEFITS FOR ALL THREE
13 2050 FUTURES. AND EQUITY ASSESSMENT THAT SEEKS TO UNDERSTAND
14 WHICH INCOME GROUPS MIGHT BENEFIT MOST FROM A PROJECT ACROSS
15 ALL THREE DIFFERENT FEATURES, AS WELL AS A PROJECT WILL
16 DIRECTLY SERVE AN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY AS CURRENTLY
17 DEFINED IN 2024. LASTLY A QUALITATIVE ASSESSMENT IF A PROJECT
18 ALLIANCE WITH THE PLAN BARRIER GUIDING PRINCIPLES OF CREATING
19 AN AFFORDABLE, CONNECTED, DIVERSE AND HEALTHY AND VIBRANT BAY
20 AREA. THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT DOES HAVE SOME
21 LIMITATIONS. AGAIN, THIS IS WHY WE USE IT AS ONE COMPONENT OF
22 DETERMINING THE -- DEVELOPING THE DRAFT TRANSIT NETWORK. IT
23 EXPRESSES INDIVIDUAL PROJECTS OPPOSED TO PROJECTS AS A GROUP
24 OR THE NETWORK AS A WHOLE. AND IN SOME CASES FOR VERY LARGE
25 MAJOR CAPITAL PROJECTS SUCH AS, LIKE, NEW RAIL LINES, IT



JULY 23, 2024

1 DOESN'T NECESSARILY CAPTURE ALL OF THE LAND USE ECONOMIC AND
2 COMMUNITY BENEFIT OF A PROJECT. IN ORDER TO ADDRESS THE --
3 BEING ABLE TO ASSESS THE BENEFITS OF THE -- OF THE PROPOSED
4 TRANSIT NETWORK AS A WHOLE HOWEVER, WE WILL BE CONDUCTING A
5 NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT WITH THE PLAN BARRIER PLUS
6 ASSESSMENT TO UNDERSTAND HOW THE INTEGRATED NETWORK AND
7 STRATEGY AND IMPROVED PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES WITH BASELINE.
8 IMPROVEMENTS OF ACCESS TO JOBS. OVERALL IMPROVEMENT OF
9 ACCESSIBILITY ACROSS THE REGION. ACCESSIBILITY IMPROVEMENTS
10 FOR EQUITY COMMUNITY RESIDENTS. CHANGES IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP
11 AND LOAD SHARE. MILES TRAVELED AND GREENHOUSE EMISSION AND
12 TRANSIT VERSUS AUTO TRAVEL TIMES FOR KEY ORIGIN AND
13 DESTINATION PAIRS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO SOME OF THAT KIND OF
14 HIGHLIGHTS FROM THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT. EXTERNAL
15 CONDITIONS THINGS LIKE ECONOMIC GROWTH, LEVELS OF REMOTE WORK
16 WERE. WHERE JOBS AND HOMES ARE LOCATED IN THE FUTURE AND
17 AUTONOMOUS VEHICLE USAGE HAVE A EFFECT ON CREATING OUTCOMES.
18 DEPENDING ON WHAT HAPPENS IN THE FUTURE A BIG EFFECT IN TERMS
19 OF WHAT PROJECTS CAN PROVIDE MORE BENEFITS FOR FEWER BENEFITS
20 COMPARATIVELY. GENERALLY, WE FIND THAT LOWER COST TRANSIT
21 PROJECTS THAT ARE DESIGNED TO SERVE MANY TRIP PURPOSES ARE
22 MOST RESILIENT ACROSS VERY THREE DIFFERENT FUTURES MORE
23 EQUITABLE IN TERMS OF WHICH INCOME GROUPS THEY BENEFIT. ONE OF
24 THE OTHER ISSUE IS THAT WHILE THE RAIL MEGA PROJECTS THAT ALSO
25 PROVIDE SIGNIFICANT ACCESSIBILITY BENEFITS, THEY ALSO HAVE



JULY 23, 2024

1 VERY HIGH COST AND ARE VERY MUCH AFFECTED BY THE IMPACTS OF
2 INFLATION. SERVICE ENHANCEMENTS SUCH AS FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS
3 ON EXISTING TRANSIT LINES AND THE EXPANSION OF TRANSIT SERVICE
4 TO TRANSIT MARKETS PERFORM BETTER ACROSS THE RANGE OF
5 POTENTIAL FUTURES COMPARED TO PROJECTS THAT SERVE MARKETS THAT
6 ALREADY HAVE A NUMBER OF OTHER SERVICES. PRICING PROJECTS DO
7 HAVE AN EFFECT ON TRAVEL BEHAVIOR AND HELP WITH CONGESTION.
8 BUT PERFORM BETTER WHEN INCLUDE TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS THAT
9 PROVIDE ADDITIONAL MOBILITY OPTIONS FOR LOWER INCOME
10 HOUSEHOLDS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO NOW I WANT TO MOVE TO
11 TALKING ABOUT OUR REVENUE PROJECTIONS. AS I MENTIONED THE
12 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF OUR REGIONAL PLAN IS FISCALLY
13 CONSTRAINED TO ANTICIPATED FUTURE REVENUES. AND OUR DRAFT
14 REVENUE ESTIMATE STARTS WITH ALL THE EXISTING AND ANTICIPATED
15 REVENUES -- REVENUES FROM ALL LOCAL, REGIONAL, STATE AND
16 FEDERAL FUNDING SOURCES. AND THESE ARE REPRESENTED BY THE
17 LARGE PORTION OF THE PIE CHART ON THE SLIDE AND TOTAL
18 APPROXIMATELY \$409 BILLION. THIS PLAN SETTLE INCLUDES
19 SIGNIFICANT NEW REVENUE SOURCES, WHICH ARE HIGHLIGHTED ON THE
20 SLIDE. AND THESE ARE ALL ANTICIPATED TO COME TO FRUITION
21 DURING THE PLAN HORIZON BY 2050, AND REPRESENTED ON THE
22 SMALLER PORTION OF THE PIE CHART IN TOTAL APPROXIMATELY \$86
23 BILLION. THESE INCLUDE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, ALL
24 LANE TOLLING ON FREEWAY, PRICING, PARKING AND GROWTH, REGIONAL
25 MILEAGE USER FEE AND ANY NEW, FEDERAL, STATE STIMULUS FUNDING



JULY 23, 2024

1 BILLS. ANDY WILL PRESENT FURTHER DETAIL ON THE NEXT SLIDE, NEW
2 REVENUES WITH A TRAFFIC SET OF STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS THAT
3 MAINTAIN EXISTING SERVICE LEVELS AND ALSO MAKE MAJOR
4 IMPROVEMENTS TO TRANSIT NETWORK INTEGRATION, SAFETY AND
5 SECURITY, SPEED, FREQUENCY AND RELIABILITY OF TRANSIT SERVICE
6 AND EXPANSION OF THE SYSTEM TO SERVE NEW OR GROWING TRAVEL
7 MARKETS. WITH THAT, I WILL TURN IT OVER TO ANDY.

8

9 **ANDY METZ:** THANK YOU, KARA. TURN TO THE NEXT SLIDE. WE WILL
10 TALK ABOUT WHERE THE ANTICIPATED TRANSPORTATION REVENUES ARE
11 GOING. AND YOU WILL SEE IN THE PIE CHART ON THE RIGHT HAND
12 SIDE, WE HAVE 74 BILLION ANTICIPATED. AND THAT WILL BE USED
13 FOR FIVE DIFFERENT TRANSIT STRATEGIES THAT I WILL GO OVER IN A
14 SECOND. AND MOST OF THE REMAINING IS GOING TO OUR TRANSIT
15 STRATEGY T-1, OUR OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE TRANSIT STRATEGY,
16 COMPLYING WITH MTC'S LONG-STANDING FIX IT FIRST POLICY. TOTAL
17 AMOUNT OF \$496 BILLION IS \$95 BILLION LESS THAN WHAT WE HAD TO
18 WORK WITH IN THE PREVIOUS PLAN BAY AREA CYCLE. AND THAT IS
19 IMPORTANT TO POINT OUT, BECAUSE WHILE OUR OPERATIONS AND
20 MAINTENANCE HAVE NOT CHANGED SIGNIFICANTLY, IT DOES IMPACT THE
21 AMOUNT OF FUNDS THAT WE HAVE FOR NEW TRANSIT PROJECTS. SO
22 THAT'S WHERE THAT \$74 BILLION COMES INTO PLACE. NOW WE HAVE
23 SIX TRANSIT STRATEGIES FOR THIS ROUNDS OF PLAN BAY AREA 2050
24 PLUS. WE HAD 50 IN THE PREVIOUS OF PLAN 2050, AND THESE ARE
25 DIFFERENT AND I WANT TO SPEND A COUPLE OF MINUTES TO GO OVER



JULY 23, 2024

1 THE DISTINCTIONS. I MENTIONED T-1 ALREADY. T-2 IS SPECIFICALLY
2 OF THE RIDER EXPERIENCE THROUGH NETWORKER INTEGRATION. MOSTLY
3 ABOUT SOME OF THE -- INTEGRATION. MOSTLY BECAUSE OF THE PLANS
4 WE HAVE, MAPPING AND WAGE FINDING, FARE COORDINATION AND THE
5 PARATRANSIT COORDINATION EFFORT AS WELL. T-3 IS SPECIFICALLY
6 OF IMPROVING THE RIDER EXPERIENCE WITH TRANSFER TIMING AT KEY
7 REGIONAL HUBS .THAT FUNDING INCLUDE THE RESOURCES IT WILL TAKE
8 TO DO THAT LEVEL OF RESEARCH AND PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS, AS
9 WELL AS OPERATIONAL AND CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS FOR THOSE HUBS.T-
10 4, WHICH IS ABOUT ENHANCING SECURITY, SAFETY AND SECURITY ON
11 TRANSIT. THIS IS A NEW ADDITION TO ARE THIS ROUND OF PLAN
12 BASED AREA BASED ON FEEDBACK FROM COMMITTEE MEETINGS INCLUDING
13 OURSELVES AS WELL AS PUBLIC OUT REACH THAT WE DID LAST SUMMER
14 AND OUR OPERATOR LED PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM THAT HELPED TO
15 PUT TOGETHER THE GOALS FOR TRANSIT 2050+. WE KNEW THAT T-4
16 WOULD BE AN ESSENTIAL STRATEGY FOR US TO INCLUDE IN PLANNED
17 AREA 2050 PLUS. T-10 AND T-11, ENHANCING TRANSIT FREQUENCY AND
18 EXPANDING TRANSIT SERVICES. THIS IS WHERE YOU WILL SEE MOST OF
19 THE PROJECTS YOU SEE IN ATTACHMENT D FALL UNDER ONE OF THESE
20 TWO CATEGORIES. ENHANCING TRANSIT FREQUENCY. THOSE ARE
21 PROJECTS THAT ARE MORE LIKE BUS FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENT,
22 EXPANDING TRANSIT SERVICES. IT COULD BE AN EXPANSION OF BRT OR
23 RAIL. AND I THINK THOSE TWO DISTINCTIONS WHICH, AGAIN, ARE
24 OPERATOR-LED PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM HELPED US DECIDE THAT IS
25 HOW WE WANTED TO DIVINE THOSE TWO TRANSIT STRATEGIES DOVETAIL



JULY 23, 2024

1 NICELY INTO OUR ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES WHICH -- IF WE CAN
2 SWITCH TO THE NEXT SLIDE -- WE WILL GO OVER THERE. IN OUR NEAR
3 TERM, WE ARE LOOKING AT PRIMARILY QUICK AND IMPACTFUL
4 UPGRADES. THE NEAR TERM IS DEFINED AS PROJECTS THAT OPEN IN
5 THE YEAR 2035 OR BEFORE, AND LONG TERM, THOSE ARE THE
6 EXPANSION FOR THE FUTURE GENERATION TYPE PROJECTS AND THOSE
7 ARE DEFINED BY AN OPENING YEAR BETWEEN 2036 AND 2050. KARA
8 MENTION IT EARLIER THE NUMBER OF FACTORS THAT GO INTO DECIDING
9 WHICH PROJECTS PART OF THE DRAFT NETWORK PLAN AND WHICH ARE
10 NOT. THESE ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES ARE ONE OF MANY FACTORS. KARA
11 WENT OVER THE PROJECT ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE RESULTS WHICH
12 INCLUDED EQUITY. INCLUDED BENEFIT COST RATIO. AGENCY.
13 BASICALLY, AGENCY -- THE NEEDS AND -- THE LEVEL OF FEDERAL
14 FUNDING COMMITTED. THOSE ARE OTHER FACTORS AS WELL AS OUR
15 NEEDS, GAPS AND OPPORTUNITIES ANALYSIS WHICH HAD BASICALLY THE
16 RESULT OF WHICH WAS DETERMINING DIFFERENT SPEED GAPS AND
17 FREQUENCY GAPS TO INCLUDE AS WELL. SO ALL OF THOSE FACTORS GO
18 INTO THE PROJECTS THAT MAKE UP PLAN BAY AREA 2050 PLUS, OUR
19 DRAFT TRANSIT NETWORK FOR THAT. ON THE FOLLOWING SLIDE, IF WE
20 CAN SWITCH TO THE NEXT SLIDE. WE ARE GOING TO GO OVER A FEW
21 SLIDES THAT ARE MAP-FOCUSED. SO I DO WANT TO SPEND A MINUTE TO
22 ORIENT YOU ON WHAT YOU WILL BE LOOKING AT WITH THESE SERIES OF
23 MAPS. THE MAP ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE IS A STYLIZED AND
24 SIMPLIFIED VERSION OF THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA. THE WHITE DOTS
25 THAT YOU SEE WITH TOWN NAMES OR NEIGHBORHOOD NAMES NEXT TO



JULY 23, 2024

1 THEM REPRESENT A LARGER TRAVEL SHED. AND ALL OF THE LINES IN
2 BETWEEN THEM ARE NOT NECESSARILY SPECIFIC CORRIDORS. IN SOME
3 CASES THEY ARE. BUT MORE OFTEN REPRESENT ALL OF THE POTENTIAL
4 TRANSIT LINKS THAT COULD EXIST BETWEEN THOSE TRAVEL SHEDS. SO
5 IN THIS SLIDE, WE ARE SHOWING ALL OF THE NEW PROJECTS THAT ARE
6 IDENTIFIED IN THE DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK. AND WE HAVE
7 DISTINGUISHED THEM BETWEEN LOCAL BUS PROJECTS, WHICH IS THE
8 HIGHLIGHTED YELLOW. THIS BRT, LRT AND RAPID IN ORANGE. EXPRESS
9 BUS AND FERRY IS BLUE. FERRY SPECIFICALLY THE DOTTED BLUE
10 LINES. AND BLACK IS THE HEAVY RAIL. IN THE FOLLOWING TWO
11 SLIDES, IF WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE WE ARE SHOWING THE
12 DISTINCTION BETWEEN WHAT WE SEE IN OUR EXISTING NETWORK AND
13 WHAT IS IN OUR EXISTING NETWORK PLUS THE RECOMMENDATIONS IN
14 OUR DRAFT TRANSIT 2050+ NETWORK. THIS IS A COMBINATION OF ALL
15 MODES AND WE ARE SHOWING JUST THE MIDDAY OF SERVICE. AND IT --
16 IT ALSO SHOWS ALL PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE LIFE OF THE PLAN.
17 NOW THE WAY THAT -- THE KEY KIND OF GOES OVER THE IMPROVEMENTS
18 IS DARK GREEN IS YOUR FREQUENT ON THE DOMINANT SEGMENT THAT IS
19 FIVE MINUTES OR BETTER. ALL THE WAY DOWN TO RED, WHICH IS
20 FREQUENCY THAT IS EVERY HALF AN HOUR. THE MAP ON THE LEFT YOU
21 CAN SEE WHAT THE EXISTING CONDITIONS ARE. THE MAP ON THE
22 RIGHT, YOU CAN SEE HOW THOSE CHANGED. WE HAVE ALSO HIGHLIGHTED
23 SPECIFICALLY THE LINKS THAT HAVE IMPROVED DURING THE MIDDAY
24 WITH THE DRAFT NETWORK. YOU CAN SEE THROUGHOUT SAN FRANCISCO,
25 IN PARTICULAR, YOU HAVE SEGMENTS OR, EXCUSE ME, LINKS THAT GO



JULY 23, 2024

1 FROM SIX TO TEN MINUTES UP TO FIVE MINUTES OR BETTER. THE SAME
2 IS THE CASE THROUGHOUT THE PENINSULA AND SAN JOSE. EAST BAY
3 AND NORTH BAY HAVE IMPROVED AS WELL. IF WE SWITCH TO THE NEXT
4 SLIDE THAT LOOKS AT THE. AND YOU CAN SEE HOW THE RECOMMENDED
5 CHANGES AFFECT THE NETWORK TO AN EVEN GREATER DEGREE. YOU CAN
6 SEE THE NUMBER OF THE LINES YOU SEE ON THE MAP ARE HIGHLIGHTED
7 INDICATING THERE ARE IMPROVEMENTS MADE FOR THOSE AREAS. AND,
8 AGAIN, YOU HAVE SEVERAL AREAS WITHIN THE MORE DENSE AREAS OF
9 THE BAY AREA. GO FROM FIVE MINUTES OR BETTER ON THE DOMINANT
10 SEGMENT AND AREAS OF THE NORTH BAY, FURTHER EAST BAY, AND
11 ALONG THE PENINSULA HAS IMPROVED THEIR SERVICE FREQUENCY
12 LEVELS. IF WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, THIS WILL BE THE LAST
13 MAP SLIDE. AND IT HIGHLIGHTS SPECIFICALLY THE TRANSIT PRIORITY
14 FEATURES. SO, AGAIN, WE ARE SHOWING THE EXISTING NETWORK ON
15 THE LEFT AND THE PROPOSED NETWORK ON THE RIGHT. AND
16 HIGHLIGHTING RAPID BUS FOR ORANGE. AND MAGENTA IS YOUR BRT OR
17 LRT. AND, AGAIN, YOU CAN SEE A LOT OF IMPROVEMENTS ALONG THE
18 EAST BAY, ALONG THE PENINSULA AS WELL, GOING DOWN TO SAN JOSE
19 AND IN SAN FRANCISCO AS WELL, GOING FROM THE EXISTING NETWORK
20 TO THE DRAFT NETWORK. I ALSO WANT TO POINT OUT WITH THIS MAP
21 THAT THIS MAP DOES NOT SIMPLY DISPLAY ALL OF THE CHANGES THAT
22 ARE TAKING PLACE IN TERMS OF TRANSIT PRIORITY FEATURES WHICH,
23 AGAIN, A HUGE FOCUS OF TRANSIT 2050+, YOU START SHOWING
24 SEGMENT-LONG FEATURES. BUT ALSO SOME SPOT TREATMENTS THAT
25 EXIST WITH BAY AREA FORWARD, ESPECIALLY ALONG SOME OF THE



JULY 23, 2024

1 BRIDGES AND NAPA THAT ARE PART OF THIS PLAN AS WELL. SO,
2 AGAIN, THOUGH NOT DISPLAYED ON THIS PARTICULAR MAP, THERE ARE
3 A NUMBER OF TRANSIT PRIORITY FEATURES THAT ARE A PART OF
4 TRANSIT 2050 PLUS. ALL RIGHT. ON THE NEXT SLIDE -- IF YOU CAN
5 GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS MEMORY A SUMMARY WHAT YOU HAVE
6 SEEN WITH THE PREVIOUS SLIDES. WHEN WE TALK OF IMPROVED
7 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, AGAIN, THIS TAKES PLACE, OF COURSE, A LOT
8 OF THINGS IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE, BUT I WANT TO CALL OUT,
9 AGAIN, OUR TRANSIT STRATEGIES THAT ARE NOT PROJECT SPECIFIC,
10 BUT WITH T 2 IMPROVING A REGIONAL PLANS, GOING DOWN TO T-4,
11 SAFETY AND SECURITY AT STATION STOPS AND ON VEHICLES. AND THEN
12 WITH THE MAPS AND WITH T-10 AND T-11 WHICH IS PRIMARILY WHERE
13 OUR PROJECTS LIVE, WE ARE IMPROVING TRANSIT FREQUENCY,
14 IMPROVING TRANSIT CONNECTIVITY, AND, OF COURSE, TRANSIT SPEEDS
15 AND RELIABILITY AS WELL. SO WITH THAT, I WILL TURN IT BACK TO
16 KARA TO TALK ABOUT ON OUR NEXT SLIDE OUR SCHEDULE AND UPCOMING
17 NEXT STEPS.

18

19 **KARA VUICICH:** GREAT. THANKS, ANDY. SO -- OBVIOUSLY WE ARE HERE
20 TODAY TO PRESENT TO YOU OUR MAJOR MILESTONE IN TERMS OF OUR
21 PROJECT ASSESSMENT DRAFT RESULTS AND THE DRAFT NETWORK. AND AS
22 I BEFORE, PLAN BAY AREA 2050 PLUS LIMITED FOCUS UPDATE.
23 WHEREAS, THE TRANSIT COMPONENTS ARE UNDERGOING SIGNIFICANT
24 REVISIONS UNDER TRANSIT 2050+. THOSE TWO STREAMS OF WORK HAVE
25 BEEN ON PARALLEL TRACK, BUT THEY WILL NOW START TO CONVERGE AS



JULY 23, 2024

1 WE MOVE TOWARDS DECEMBER OF THIS YEAR. SO STARTING WITH OUR
2 SECOND ROUND OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT, AND I BELIEVE YOU HAVE A
3 PRESENTATION FROM THE PLAN BAY AREA 2050 PLUS ON UPCOMING
4 ROUND OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT. WE WILL BE INCLUDING KIND OF THE
5 HIGHLIGHTS OF WHAT WE PRESENTED TO YOU TODAY AS PART OF THAT
6 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT WHICH INCLUDES POP-UP -- IN-PERSON POP-UP
7 EVENTS, ONLINE WEBINARS AND SURVEYS THAT WILL BE IN OCTOBER
8 AND NOVEMBER. AND THE REGIONAL MANAGEMENT COUNCIL WILL BE
9 GOING TO THE MTC -- THE JOINT MTC ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE
10 COMMITTEE IN NOVEMBER. AND WORKING WITH OUR MANAGEMENT TEAM TO
11 INCORPORATE THAT FEEDBACK FOR THE FINAL DRAFT SET OF TRANSIT
12 STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS. THAT WILL INCLUDE THE SPECIFIC
13 LIST OF PROJECTS, AS WELL AS WHAT WE CALL "PROGRAMMATIC
14 CATEGORIES" THAT WILL ESSENTIALLY BE GROUPS OF SMALLER
15 INVESTMENTS. THAT COULD INCLUDE THINGS LIKE GRADE SEPARATIONS,
16 FOR EXAMPLE, NOT NECESSARILY SMALLER DOLLAR VALUE INVESTMENT,
17 BUT WE GROUP THOSE INTO CATEGORIES OR GROUP. OR SORT OF MORE
18 SMALLER SPOT TRANSIT PRIORITY TREATMENTS, FORECAST. WE WILL
19 THEN BE COMING BACK WITH -- IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE PLANNED
20 BAY AREA TEAM WITH ESSENTIALLY THE FINAL -- TO BRING BACK TO
21 YOU THE FINAL SET OF TRANSIT 2050+ STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS
22 WHICH WILL THEN BE FOLDED INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR PLAN
23 BAY AREA. WE WILL PLAN TO COME BACK TO YOU ALL IN NOVEMBER.
24 AND WE WILL BE TAKING THE FINAL PLAN BAY AREA 2050 PLUS
25 BLUEPRINT THAT WILL INCLUDE ALL OF THE TRANSIT COMPONENTS FOR



JULY 23, 2024

1 ACTION IN DECEMBER. AND THAT WILL GO TO THE MTC PLANNING
2 COMMITTEE ABAG AED ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE AS WELL AS THE
3 COMMISSION AND THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD. AND THAT KIND OF HITS
4 THE HIGHLIGHTS OF OUR PRESENTATION TODAY. IF WE CAN MOVE TO
5 THE NEXT SLIDE. WE DO HAVE SOME SPECIFIC QUESTIONS TO GUIDE
6 YOUR COMMENTS AND FEEDBACK, ALTHOUGH WE ARE OPEN TO ANY OTHER
7 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS AND FEEDBACK THAT YOU MIGHT HAVE.
8 SPECIFICALLY LOOKING FOR FEEDBACK ON THE DRAFT TRANSIT
9 STRATEGIES. ANYTHING MISS SOMETHING IN ANY RELATIVE PRIORITIES
10 ACROSS THOSE STRATEGIES? LOOKING FOR FEEDBACK ON THE
11 ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES FOR THE DRAFT TRANSIT NETWORK AND ARE
12 THERE SPECIFIC QUESTIONS AND MODIFICATIONS WITH RESPECT TO THE
13 DRAFT PROJECTS LIST BOTH WERE THOSE FOR INCLUSION ON THE PLAN
14 AND UNRESTRAINED LIST. TO CLARIFY THE PROJECTS ON THE
15 UNCONSTRAINED LIST DO NOT FIT WITHIN THE FINANCIAL CONSTRAINTS
16 OF THE PLAN. THOSE PROJECTS WILL BE ELIGIBLE FOR ONGOING
17 PROJECT DEVELOPMENT OPPORTUNITIES AND WILL NOT NECESSARILY BE
18 OPENING OR UNDERGOING CONSTRUCTION BEFORE 2050. AND TO, WITH
19 THAT, I WILL TURN IT OVER TO CHAIR CAMPOS.

20

21 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I WILL START OUR DISCUSSION.
22 WE CAN GO AROUND THE ROOM. MAYBE STARTING ON MY RIGHT HAND
23 SIDE. CARLINE, DO YOU HAVE ANY.

24



JULY 23, 2024

1 **CARLINE AU:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I APPRECIATE THE SUMMARY, AND
2 SLIDE 12 IS VERY NICELY SUMMARIZED. MY COMMENTS ARE REALLY
3 FOCUSED ON IMPROVING THE CUSTOMER, YOU KNOW, RIDER'S
4 EXPERIENCE. I APPRECIATE TAKING A MORE COMPREHENSIVE VIEW,
5 THAT INCLUDES GETTING PEOPLE TO TRAIN STATIONS OR TO BUS
6 STOPS. I THINK THAT -- YOU KNOW, FOR ME, LIKE TOP OF MIND AS A
7 FEMALE RIDER GETTING TO A BUS STOP, GETTING TO A TRAIN
8 STATION, YOU KNOW, LIGHTING, ACCESS, SAFETY ARE SUPER
9 IMPORTANT. AND I AM ALSO THINKING OF PHYSICAL UPGRADES. AND I
10 WONDER WHERE THAT WOULD FALL IN -- IN THE -- I DON'T KNOW, THE
11 CONSTRAINED OR UNCONSTRAINED PROJECT LIST. SIDEWALKS,
12 LIGHTING, CLEANLINESS. I WASN'T SURE WHERE THAT WOULD, YOU
13 KNOW, FALL UNDER. AND THEN MY QUESTION WAS -- MY OTHER
14 QUESTION IS AROUND THE FUNDING PLAN. I SEE FINAL
15 IMPLEMENTATION, YOU KNOW, COMING ABOUT IN LATE 2025. AND I WAS
16 WONDERING ABOUT THE OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE OF THESE TYPES
17 OF IMPROVEMENTS, HOW THEY WILL BE MAINTAINED AND SUSTAINED
18 OVER TIME. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** WOULD STAFF LIKE TO RESPOND.

21

22 **KARA VUICICH:** I CAN GO AHEAD AND RESPOND. THE TRANSIT 2050+
23 WITH SAFETY AND SECURITY MORE FOCUSED ON SPECIFIC STOPS AND
24 STATIONS. WE HAVE OTHER COMPONENTS OF THE TRANSPORTATION
25 ELEMENT OF THE PLAN, THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION STRATEGIES THAT



JULY 23, 2024

1 WILL FOCUS ON -- THAT DO HAVE A BIG FOCUS ON ACCESS TO TRANSIT
2 VIA BIKING AND WALKING, AS WELL AS A CONTINUED FOCUS -- AND I
3 AM NOT RECALLING THE SPECIFIC STRATEGY -- BUT ON OTHER
4 INTEGRATED MOBILITY MODES. SHARED MOBILITY AND OTHER OPTION
5 TOO. NOT SPECIFICALLY IN THE TRANSIT STRATEGIES, IT IS COVERED
6 IN THE TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT STRATEGIES COMING IN THE FALL.
7 AND THEN TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION OF THE FUNDING -- OH, FOR
8 OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE, THE PART OF THE REASON THAT WE --
9 FIRST OF ALL, TO OPERATE AND MAINTAIN SORT OF THE CURRENT
10 LEVEL OF TRANSIT SERVICE THAT WE HAVE, THAT STRATEGY T-1,
11 ESSENTIALLY WHAT WE TAKE OFF THE TOP TO MAINTAIN WHAT IS
12 CURRENTLY IN EXISTENCE. PART OF THE REASON WE INCLUDE LIFE
13 CYCLE COSTS FOR NEW PROJECTS IS TO INCORPORATE WHAT IT IS
14 GOING TO COST TO MAINTAIN THOSE PROJECTS ONCE THEY ARE BUILT
15 AND OPERATIONAL. SO THAT'S WHY THAT IS SOMETHING THAT WE
16 INCORPORATE IN TERMS OF LOOKING AT NOT JUST THE INITIAL
17 CAPITAL NEEDS OF THE PROJECT BUT WHAT IT IS GOING TO TAKE THEN
18 TO MAINTAIN THAT PROJECT. THAT IS INCORPORATED INTO THOSE FULL
19 PROJECT COSTS AND COMPARED TO WHAT WE THINK OUR REVENUE
20 STREAMS ARE GOING TO BE IN THE FUTURE.

21

22 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, WILLIAM AND THEN WINDY.

23

24 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** YES, THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THE
25 PRESENTATION. A LOT OF GREAT INFORMATION. I WAS WONDERING



JULY 23, 2024

1 ABOUT INCENTIVES LIKE INCENTIVES FOR DRIVING LESS AND
2 INCENTIVES FOR USING PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, BECAUSE IF YOU OWN
3 A VEHICLE, LET'S SAY, BUT YOU CHOOSE TO USE PUBLIC
4 TRANSPORTATION, WHAT INCENTIVE AM I GAINING? AM I GAINING A
5 DISCOUNT ON MY REGISTRATION FEE? SO JUST INCENTIVES THAT WILL
6 DRIVE PEOPLE TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, EITHER TO DRIVE LESS OR
7 JUST TO USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I DIDN'T SEE THAT IN THESE
8 FOUR STRATEGIES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** YOU ARE RIGHT. SO THEY ARE NOT THERE. SO THOSE ARE
11 ACTUALLY -- SOME OF THAT IS INCLUDED IN OUR ENVIRONMENT
12 STRATEGIES IN THE PLAN. AND, AGAIN, YOU WILL SEE THOSE I THINK
13 IN THE FALL AS ALL OF THIS KIND OF COMES TOGETHER MORE
14 HOLISTICALLY. WE DO HAVE WHAT WE REFER TO COMMONLY AS
15 "TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT MEASURES." NOT THE MOST
16 EXCITING TERM, BUT BASICALLY WE HAVE A WHOLE SUITE OF
17 STRATEGIES AND INVESTMENTS INCLUDED IN THE PLAN TO ADDRESS
18 SPECIFICALLY WHAT YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT. TO TRY TO INCENTIVIZE
19 PEOPLE TO CHANGE THEIR MODE OF TRANSPORTATION TO SOMETHING
20 THAT IS MORE CARBON-NEUTRAL AND REDUCING VEHICLE MILES
21 TRAVELED.

22

23 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AND ALSO, I WAS LOOKING AT
24 ATTACHMENT B AND D. HOW AM I SUPPOSED TO USE THOSE TWO
25 ATTACHMENTS? ARE THEY OVERLAYING EACH OTHER OR -- I WAS --



JULY 23, 2024

1 BECAUSE THESE ARE ALL THE PROJECTS THAT -- THAT WE HAVE
2 LISTED, CORRECT? ATTACHMENT P, I THINK.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** DAVE ROTEN, DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS. QUICK
5 EXPLANATION IS ATTACHMENT B SUMMARIZES PROJECT PERFORMANCE
6 ASSESSMENT. ALL THE PROJECTS EVALUATED. INSIGHT FROM THEIR
7 DIFFERENT SCORES, ETC. ATTACHMENT D IS THE NEXT STEP TO THAT
8 PROCESS. BASICALLY TRANSLATED THAT ANALYSIS, THE PRIOR NEEDS
9 GAP ASSESSMENT. OTHER ATTRIBUTES OF PROJECTS AND SHOW HOW THEY
10 LINK -- LINE UP WITH THE -- THE RECOMMENDATIONS. THE
11 RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE DRAFT NETWORK OF WHICH PROJECTS WILL BE
12 NEAR TERM, LONG TERM AND UNCONSTRAINED. SO YOU CAN LOOK AT
13 ATTACHMENT B AS KIND OF A DATA SET THAT SUMMARIZES YOU WILL,
14 ONE OF THE ANALYSES. ATTACHMENT D PIVOTS TO DRAFT
15 RECOMMENDATIONS.

16

17 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** OKAY. AND THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT
18 METHODOLOGY IS USED IN ALL OF THIS, CORRECT?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** YES, SO THE PROJECT ASSESSMENT. THERE ARE A NUMBER OF
21 DIFFERENT SCORES THAT WERE IDENTIFIED. WHEN WE WORKED WITH THE
22 OPERATOR-LED PROJECT MANAGEMENT TEAM TO DETERMINE THAT IS ONE
23 ANALYSIS. WE HAVE A VARIETY OF METRICS, WHICH OF THOSE DO YOU
24 WANT TO USE IN THE PRIORITIZATION AND DECISION MAKING AND
25 PRIOR ANALYSES TOO INCLUDING THE NEEDS GAP OPPORTUNITY



JULY 23, 2024

1 ASSESSMENT FOCUSED ON NEAR-TERM TRANSIT SYSTEM NEEDS. THAT WAS
2 PRESENTED TO THIS COUNCIL BILL BACK IN JANUARY AND FEBRUARY
3 AND ATTACHMENT B PUTS THE PUZZLE PIECES TOGETHER. CONDUCTED IN
4 THE WINTER. NEW ANALYSIS CONDUCTED IN THE SPRING AND
5 SUMMERTIME AND SHOWS HOW THAT LEADS TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS.

6

7 **WILLIAM GOODWIN:** THANK YOU. I WILL CONTINUE TO STUDY.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. WENDI?

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** THANK YOU. I AM VERY, VERY EXCITED TO SEE THIS.
12 AS YOU MAY KNOW, I AM CONSTANTLY ASKING WHEN WILL WE BE
13 TALKING TO NETWORK CONNECTIVITY. YAY, WE ARE TALKING OF
14 NETWORK CONNECTIVITY. I REALLY THINK OF ALL THE THINGS WE ARE
15 DOING, FARE INTEGRATION, WAY FINDING, IT IS THE NETWORK
16 INTEGRATION THAT WILL MAKE OR BREAK WHETHER WE HAVE A REALLY
17 WORLD-CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM OR NOT. AND, OF COURSE, THIS IS THE
18 MOST DIFFICULT TO ACCOMPLISH. THESE ARE HIGH-END CONCEPTS, HOW
19 TO ACTUALLY MAKE THEM WORK. I THINK THE DEVIL WILL BE IN THE
20 DETAILS. I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. I HAVE A SNEAKY
21 SUSPICION IF I LOOKED AT THOSE TWO ATTACHMENTS, THEY MIGHT
22 HAVE BEEN ANSWERED BUT I WILL ASK YOU ANYWAY. JUST TO CLARIFY,
23 BETWEEN STRATEGY T-10 AND 11, JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND. THE
24 10 REALLY IS THE -- THE BONES OF -- OF TAKING OUR EXISTING
25 SYSTEM AND MAKING IT MORE FREQUENT, MORE ROBUST. AND 11 WOULD



JULY 23, 2024

1 BE ADDING RAPID BUS TRANSIT AND ADDING MORE RAIL SERVICE. IS
2 THAT CORRECT?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THAT IS A FAIR SUMMARY OF KIND OF THE
5 DISTINCTION BETWEEN THOSE TWO TRANSIT STRATEGIES, YES.

6

7 **WENDI KALLINS:** SO IN LOOKING AT THAT, I THINK THAT STRATEGY T-
8 10 IS -- SHOULD BE HIGH ON THE LIST. IF WE ARE LOOKING FOR NEW
9 FUNDING. ALONG WITH T-3, WHICH IS, OF COURSE, THE TRANSFER
10 TIMING AT KEY HUBS. AND THAT DOESN'T TAKE AWAY FROM THE
11 IMPORTANCE OF THE OTHERS. AND I DO THINK 111 SHOULD BE AT THE
12 BOTTOM OF THE LIST THATCH WE SHOULD BE NICE TO EXPAND OUR RAIL
13 SERVICE. I THINK WE HAVE IMPROVE OUR EXISTING SERVICE BEFORE
14 WE ADD MORE. THE OTHER QUESTION IS THAT NICE NEW LANE BETWEEN
15 NFL TO AND VALLEJO. IS THAT ANTICIPATING RAIL SERVICE?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THAT IS THE -- I BELIEVE THE SR 37 BUS SERVICE.

18

19 **WENDI KALLINS:** OH, IT IS -- BUT IS IT A NEW BUS SERVICE?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YES.

22

23 **WENDI KALLINS:** OKAY. DOES IT EXIST YET, NO?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** NO. AMTRAK THROUGHWAY, COUPLE OF TRIPS A DAY.



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** REALLY NOT FOR PEOPLE WHO LIVE IN VALLEJO AND
3 WORK IN --

4

5 **SPEAKER:** WHAT ANDY IS EXPRESSING. THERE IS CURRENTLY SOME VERY
6 LIMITED AMTRAK BUS SERVICE, BUT THE IDEA WITH THE EXPRESS BUS,
7 IT IS DESIGNED TO SERVE COMMUTERS WHO ARE TRAVERSE WILLING THE
8 NORTH BAY. THAT IS THE INTENTION AND PART OF THE BROADER COPE
9 OF THE CORRIDOR IMPROVEMENTS.

10

11 **WENDI KALLINS:** YOU ARE AWARE THAT SMART IS EXPLORING EXTENSION
12 TO VALLEJO.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES. WE DID EVALUATE AND SCORE THAT PROJECT AS PART
15 OF THE PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT. IT IS AN EXPENSIVE
16 PROJECT ESPECIALLY GIVEN THE RESILIENCE NEED OF THE RAIL
17 CORRIDOR. GIVEN THE LIMITED FISCAL RESOURCES WE HAVE, WE LENDS
18 A INTO THE LOWER COST BUS IMPROVEMENTS IN THE CORRIDOR AT THIS
19 TIME, BUT IT REMAINS PART OF THE UNCONSTRAINED PROJECT LIST.

20

21 **WENDI KALLINS:** AND I AM CONTRADICTING MYSELF HERE. I JUST WANT
22 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE CAN ALL BE HYPOCRITICAL. I NOTICE THAT
23 THERE WAS NO EXPANSION OR INCREASED FREQUENCY ON THE BUS LINE
24 TO THE RICHMOND BART. AND I AM CURIOUS WHY THAT IS CONSIDERED.
25 THE HUGE DISCUSSION OF THE RICHMOND BRIDGE BACK-UP. AND, YOU



JULY 23, 2024

1 KNOW, THOSE BUSES ARE NOT ONLY NOT FREQUENT, BUT GOING BACK TO
2 THE -- THE REFINED TIMING OF TRANSFER. IT DOES NOT ACTUALLY
3 HELP TO YOU GET TO THE OAKLAND. BECAUSE IT ARRIVES FIVE
4 MINUTES AFTER THE BART LEAVES. AND THEN IF WHEN YOU COME BACK,
5 YOU HAVE A HALF HOUR WAIT TO GET THE BUS BACK WHICH MUST BE
6 WHY IT IS NOT USED VERY MUCH.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANKS FOR THAT COMMENT. YOU KNOW, WE CAN DEFINITELY
9 TAKE A LOOK AT THE MAPS TO MAKE SURE THEY ARE CORRECTLY
10 REFLECTING THE INVESTMENT. I BELIEVE WITH THE RICHMOND SAN A
11 FELL AND WE CAN LOOK AT THE MAPPING TO SEE IF IT IS
12 APPROPRIATELY REFLECTED HERE.

13

14 **WENDI KALLINS:** I KNOW THERE WAS TALK OF TAKING THE BIKE LANE -
15 - SORRY ALL MY BIKING FRIENDS, AND USING FOR TRANSIT -- AS A
16 TRANSIT LANE. IF THAT WERE THE CASE, THEN TRANSIT FREQUENCY
17 WILL BE IN ORDER. AND THEN LASTLY, I KNOW THAT YOU -- I KNOW,
18 YOU REALLY -- YOU ARE A REGIONAL BODY. YOU CAN'T TALK OF LOCAL
19 SERVICE -- WELL, YOU CAN TALK ABOUT IT. BUT IT IS NOT WHAT YOU
20 ARE STUDYING. BUT I THINK THE -- GIVEN THE FIRST AND LAST
21 MILE, IT REALLY IS IMPORTANT THAT THE TRANSFERS TO LOCAL BUS
22 SERVICE -- TO AND FROM LOCAL BUS SERVICE HAS TO SOMEHOW BE
23 INCLUDED IN THIS WHEN YOU ARE LOOKING AT CONNECTIVITY, BECAUSE
24 THAT IS REALLY ONE OF THE -- THE KEY BROKEN PARTS OF THE
25 SYSTEM IS THAT ONCE YOU HAVE TO TRANSFER ON TO A LOCAL BUS,



JULY 23, 2024

1 SOMETIMES THAT IS WHEN YOU HAVE YOUR LONG WAITS. ANY FEEDBACK
2 ON THAT?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD JUST SAY THAT IS A MAJOR COMPONENT OF TRANSIT
5 STRATEGY 3. WHICH, I FEEL, HAS PRETTY ROBUST FUNDING
6 ASSOCIATED WITH IT AND INCLUDES ALL THE THINGS YOU MENTIONED
7 TO. AND BEING ABLE TO APPROVE THE CAPITAL AND OPERATIONAL
8 EXPENSES TO IMPROVE TRANSFER TIMING.

9

10 **WENDI KALLINS:** I SAW YESTERDAY THAT MY LOCAL TRANSIT SERVICE
11 WAS PRESENT ON THE BOARD. ARE THEY REPRESENTING ALL THE LOCAL
12 TRANSIT -- OR OTHER LOCAL TRANSIT PROVIDERS ON THAT COMMITTEE
13 YESTERDAY. PAUSE I CAN'T READ ALL THE PLACARDS. IT IS HARD TO
14 READ.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I CAN TAKE IT. CHIEF DEPUTY DIRECTOR. YOU ARE TALKING
17 OF THE WORKING GROUP ON THE --

18

19 **WENDI KALLINS:** TALKING OF THE OPERATE SPECIAL SORRY, GETTING
20 CONFUSED. WE HAD SO MANY MEETINGS YESTERDAY.

21

22 **WENDI KALLINS:** I KNOW DID YOU. I WAS ON ZOOM TRYING TO GET IN
23 ZOOM. I HAD A HARD TIME GETTING INTO ONE OF THE MEETING.

24



JULY 23, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THE COUNCIL INCLUDES THE LARGE TRANSIT
2 OPERATORS AND ALSO SEVERAL SMALL OPERATORS. I BELIEVE IT IS
3 COUNTY CONNECTION, MARIN TRANSIT AND WETA IS ON THE COUNCIL
4 AND OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WHO IS IN THE ROOM HERE. SO THAT IS
5 THE COUNCIL MAKE-UP.

6

7 **WENDI KALLINS:** OUR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY WAS ALSO
8 REPRESENTED THERE. TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OF MARIN?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THAT WAS A DIFFERENT MEETING NOT THE R AND N COUNCIL.
11 THAT WAS THE EXECUTIVE GROUP TALKING OF THE REVENUE MESH.

12

13 **WENDI KALLINS:** THAT COULD BE. THAT WAS ONE I COULDN'T GET INTO
14 UNTIL PARTWAY INTO THE MEET.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** QUICK POINT OF CLARIFICATION. KATHLEEN SULLIVAN WHO
17 REPRESENTS MARIN WAS THAT THE A MEETING.

18

19 **WENDI KALLINS:** HE WAS AT THAT MEETING. JUST WONDER GOING THE
20 LOCAL TRANSIT PROVIDERS WERE COORDINATING AMONGST THEMSELVES
21 SO THEY ARE REPRESENTING ALL THE LOCAL PROVIDERS. OKAY.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** IN FACT THAT IS A BIG PART OF ANDY'S ROLE. AND IN
24 FACT WE ARE DOING THE SAME PRESENTATION OF A GROUP OF SMALL
25 OPERATOR GMS THIS AFTERNOON.



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **WENDI KALLINS:** OKAY, THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** CHARLEY AND THEN ANNE OLIVIA.

5

6 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** GOOD MORNING. I DID HEAR YOUR FULL
7 PRESENTATION YESTERDAY. AND I HAD TO STEP OUT AND TAKE A CALL.
8 SO IT IS A VERY DENSE PRESENTATION. AND WE SPENT SOME TIME
9 AFTER YESTERDAY'S MEETING GETTING CLARIFICATION. AND I THINK
10 TO THAT POINT, IT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL SO KIND OF KEY SOME OF
11 THE GRAPHICS SO THAT -- CERTAINLY I WANT TO SPEAK FOR MYSELF
12 THAT I HAVE A BETTER UNDERSTANDING THAT WHAT SOME OF THE
13 TERMINOLOGY MEANS. I THINK -- SO, YOU KNOW, I -- I JOINED
14 ABOUT A YEAR AGO AND -- AND CLEARLY SOME OF THIS WAS
15 INFORMATION BEFORE THAT. AND I THINK JUST A SHORT -- IF THERE
16 IS A SHORT EXPLANATION, SOME OF THE -- SOME OF THE GRAPHICS,
17 SOME COUNTY TERMINOLOGY, I THINK IT WOULD BE MUCH MORE
18 BENEFICIAL TO THE COUNCIL. I THINK THE -- THE TIMELINE IS
19 REALLY USEFUL FOR ME, BECAUSE THIS IS SO DENSE. SO MUCH
20 INFORMATION HERE. SO MANY PROJECTS TO CONSIDER. AND, AGAIN,
21 ATTACHMENT B, THAT IN ITSELF -- YOU CAN SPEND A LOT OF HOURS
22 GOING THROUGH THAT LINE BY LINE. SO I APPRECIATE THAT. AND
23 THEN ON -- ON THE SMART TO CLOVERDALE, IS IT INCLUDED IN THIS
24 PLAN OR NO?

25



JULY 23, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** ON THE UNCONSTRAINED PROJECT LIST. TO HEALDSBURG WITH
2 WHAT IS GOING TO BE OPERATIONAL. AND SMART TO CLOVERDALE AND
3 THAT PROJECT COULD CONTINUE -- AT LEAST IN THE DRAFT LIST, IT
4 COULD CONTINUE PROJECT DEVELOPMENT ACTIVITIES BUT NOT
5 ANTICIPATED TO BE OPERATIONAL BEFORE 2050 IN THIS VERSION.

6

7 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** THE PLAN IN GENERAL, WHAT IS THE INTERACTION
8 WITH THE STATE? WHAT ROLE DOES THE STATE HAVE WITH THE PLAN?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THE STATE PLAYS A NUMBER OF ROLES WHEN IT COMES TO
11 OUR TRANSPORTATION SIDE OF THE PLAN. I MEAN, FOR ONE, THE
12 STATE IS A KEY THUNDER OF -- OF MANY OF THESE DIFFERENT
13 IMPROVEMENTS IDENTIFIED IN THE PLAN. ESPECIALLY WHEN IT COMES
14 TO SORT OF CAPITAL SITE IMPROVEMENTS SINCE IT IS MORE LIMITED
15 HISTORICALLY. THE STATES WILL PLAYS AN APPROVAL ROLE ON THE
16 ULTIMATE PLAN. CALTRANS REVIEWS THE PLAN AND REVIEW IT IS
17 PERHAPS MOST IMPORTANTLY THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD
18 THAT IS KEENLY FOCUSED ON WHETHER THE OVERALL PLAN BAY AREA.
19 THE MORE COMPREHENSIVE, MULTITOPIC REGIONAL PLAN ACHIEVES THE
20 CLIMATE TARGET ESTABLISHED. SO THIS NETWORK, WHILE MAYBE NOT
21 ALL BY ITSELF WILL HELP WITH THE GHG GAP IDENTIFY IT, IT IS
22 KIND OF A KEY PIECE OF THE PUZZLE HERE.

23

24 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** WHO IS OURS -- WHO IS OUR INTERFACE WITH
25 STATE. WHERE DOES MTC INTERFACE WITH THE STATE?



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** WELL, I THINK -- WOW, WHAT I WILL SAY TO YOUR
3 QUESTION IS THE STATE IS NOT A SINGULAR ENTITY BUT A PLURAL
4 ENTITY, RIGHT. WE INTERFACE WITH EACH STATE AGENCY ON THEIR
5 DISTINCT PROJECT. CALTRANS WE ENGAGE ON SPECIFIC
6 TRANSPORTATION FUNDING AND PLANNING PROCESS. WITH CARB,
7 ONGOING WITH CLIMATE METHODOLOGY AND OTHER TOPICS AND THE SAME
8 DISCUSSIONS WITH OTHER STATE ENTITIES LIKE THE HOUSING
9 COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AS WELL.

10

11 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** WHAT OF THE STATE LEGISLATURE?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THAT COMES MORE OF THE IMPLEMENTATION AND ADVOCACY
14 WORK OF THE PLAN'S ADOPTION. ONGOING WORK WITH THE REVENUE
15 MEASURE THAT I AM SURE YOU WILL HEAR MORE IN THE NEXT ITEM.
16 BUT THE NEXT STEP FOR THIS PARTICULAR PLANNING PROCESS IS TO -
17 - IN 2025 IS TO IDENTIFY SPECIFIC NEAR TERM IMPLEMENTATION
18 ITEMS WHICH COULD INCLUDE ADVOCACY PRIORITIES TO IMPLEMENT THE
19 VISION PUT FORWARD IN THIS PLAN, THAT IS KIND OF THE -- IT IS
20 KIND OF A MULTISTEP PROCESS THAT WILL INFORM OUR ADVOCACY
21 PRIORITIES IN 2025-'26 AND BEYOND.

22

23 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** CLARIFYING THAT. YOU CLARIFIED MY QUESTION.
24 WHO IS THE ADVOCATE FOR THE PLAN. WHO DO WE USE? IS IT A
25 LOBBYIST?



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** AGAIN, I THINK -- I MEAN, I -- WHEN COMES UP TO SPEAK
3 OF THE NEXT ITEM, HER TEAM WORKS, REBECCA, WE HAVE AN INTERNAL
4 TEAM OF FOLKS INVOLVED IN THE SPACE AS I UNDERSTAND SOME
5 CONSULTANT ASSISTANCE ON THE STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL.

6

7 **CHARLEY LAVERY:** APPRECIATE ALL THE ANSWERS.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** ANNE OLIVIA AND THEN DWAYNE.

10

11 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THIS IS SO MUCH WORK
12 AND IT IS PRESENTED VERY WELL. SO TAKING THIS QUANTITY AND
13 DENSITY OF INFORMATION AND DISTILLING IT INTO SOMETHING THAT
14 IS EVEN REMOTELY APPROACHABLE BY THE MAJORITY OF US IS REALLY
15 A FEAT. AND I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE AMOUNT OF WORK THAT WENT
16 INTO THAT. I HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS AND SOME CLARIFICATIONS. I
17 AM GOING TO ACTUALLY START AT THE BACK OF THE PRESENTATION AND
18 MOVE FORWARD BECAUSE THAT IS THE PAGE THAT IS OPEN TO ME RIGHT
19 NOW. SO LOOKING AT THAT IMPROVED CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE PIECE. I
20 HAVE -- I HAVE BROUGHT THIS UP IN SO MANY MEETINGS OVER THE
21 LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. AND I STILL HAVEN'T HEARD AN ANSWER
22 ACCEPT THIS ISN'T PART OF WAY FINDING. I AM LIKE, GREAT. WHAT
23 IS IT A PART OF? PART OF THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IS FIGURING
24 OUT WHAT FORM OF TRANSPORTATION YOU ARE GOING TO TAKE TODAY
25 AND MANAGING THAT DECISION BETWEEN THE CAR AND THE PUBLIC



JULY 23, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION. LIKE, THAT IS THE FIRST STEP WE ALL TAKE,
2 RIGHT. AND SO WHAT I DO IS I CHECK TIMES. AND I CHECK ROUTES.
3 AND THEN I THINK, HOW RELIABLE LIABLE IS THAT REALLY? AND ONE
4 OF THE THINGS THAT DOESN'T COME UP IS THE FERRY. UNLESS YOU
5 ARE LOOKING AT WALKING. SO WHEN I GO TO USE MY BICYCLE, IT
6 DOES NOT GIVE ME THE OPTION FOR A FERRY. WHEN I GO TO DO
7 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, IT DOES NOT GIVE ME THE OPTION FOR THE
8 FERRY. IT ONLY SHOWS IT FOR WALKING. AND BECAUSE I NEVER THINK
9 ABOUT WALKING FROM OAKLAND TO SAN FRANCISCO, IT DOES NOT COME
10 UP AS AN OPTION. AND I SAID THIS IN SO MANY MEETINGS. AND I
11 NEVER ONCE HEARD A RESPONSE, BUT THAT IS A BIG PART OF THE
12 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. AND FERRIES ARE A REALLY IMPORTANT PART.
13 I WENT BACK OVER THE LAST TWO WEEKS AND REVIEWED MY NOTES FROM
14 ALL THESE DIFFERENT PRESENTATIONS I HAVE BEEN HERE FOR. I
15 MISSED -- I AM SURE I MISSED A COUPLE OF THEM. IT HAS BEEN
16 YEARS, RIGHT. BUT I HAVE BEEN HERE FOR A LOT OF THEM AND I
17 KEEP PRETTY GOOD NOTES. AND FERRIES, FROM THE VERY BEGINNING,
18 ARE THE MODE OF TRANSPORTATION THAT HAS PERFORMED THE BEST
19 OVER ALL POSSIBLE CLIMATE FUTURES. SEA RISE. ALL THE KINDS OF
20 THINGS. FERRIES PERFORM THE BEST. AND THEY ARE KIND OF A SIDE
21 NOTE IN A LOT OF THE PRESENTATIONS, AND IT DOESN'T MAKE SENSE
22 TO ME. AND SO AT A VERY MINIMUM, ARE THERE PLANS TO INCLUDE
23 GOOGLE MAPS WHICH HAS LYFT AS ONE OF THE OPTIONS BUT DOES NOT
24 HAVE THE FERRY. LIKE, COULD WE WORK ON THAT? THAT WOULD BE
25 COOL. AND MAYBE THERE IS A PLAN FOR THAT. AND I WOULD LOVE TO



JULY 23, 2024

1 HEAR IT. BECAUSE IT HAS NEVER BEEN OFFERED AS A RESPONSE. AND
2 SO WHEN I AM LOOKING AT SLIDES 10 AND 11, AND THEN I LOOK AT
3 ATTACHMENT D, I DO SEE WETA ON THERE. SWEET. BECAUSE THAT IS
4 OUR PUBLIC ONE. IS THAT CORRECT? THAT IS SUITE. THANK YOU FOR
5 PRIORITIZING OUR PUBLIC FERRIES OVER THE PRIVATIZED ONES. I
6 THINK IT IS IMPORTANT THAT WE PUT INVESTMENT IN OUR PUBLIC
7 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AND NORTH OUR PRIVATIZED ONE THAT WE
8 HAVE GOOD UNION REPRESENTED WORK AND LYNN BOATMAN'S UNION IS
9 DOING GOOD. THEY ARE DOING GREAT WORK OUT THERE. THEY ARE
10 BEING SUCCESSFUL OF HIRING FROM ONE OF OUR LOCAL COMMUNITIES,
11 THEY ARE ONE OF THE MORE SUCCESSFUL IN THAT AND PRIORITIZING
12 THAT. I AM A VERY STRONG SUPPORTER. BUT I COULDN'T UNDERSTAND
13 ON SLIDE 10 LIKE WHAT IMPROVEMENTS ARE THERE BEING MADE. THIS
14 IS ALL MODES DURING P.M. PEAK TIME, BUT IS THERE EVENING?
15 LIKE, I CAN'T TAKE THE FERRY HERE BECAUSE IT STOPS RUNNING FOR
16 LUNCH. AND SO I WOULD HAVE TO WAIT THREE HOURS TO GO BACK AND
17 MY JOB IS NOT THAT COOL, YOU KNOW. SO, LIKE, I WOULD LOVE TO
18 DO THIS. AND OTHERS WOULD DO. BECAUSE IT IS THE MOST PLEASANT
19 FORM OF TRANSPORTATION REALLY. I ALSO DON'T SEE -- AND IT
20 COULD BE ME JUST READING IT WRONG -- ANY PLANS FOR ADDITIONAL
21 FERRY STATIONS. NOTHING CONNECTING THE SOUTH BAY TO -- TO SAN
22 FRANCISCO. THERE IS -- LIKE, YOU HAVE TO DRIVE TO OAKLAND. SO
23 IF YOU WERE IN THE SOUTH BAY, YOU HAVE TO GO AND MAKE THAT
24 BOTTLENECK WORSE. YOU CAN'T JUST GO ACROSS. AND IT IS LIKE --
25 YOU CAN'T GET THERE FROM SAN LEANDRO. THERE IS NO WAY TO DO



JULY 23, 2024

1 IT. SO I AM WONDER GOING THE FORM OF TRANSPORTATION THAT
2 PERFORMS BEST IN ALL FUTURE SCENARIOS IS GOING TO BE EXPANDED.
3 AND I WOULD JUST LOVE TO HEAR ABOUT INCREASED STATIONS.
4 INCREASED FREQUENCY. INCREASED ROUTE OPTIONS. AND HOURS. LIKE
5 -- BECAUSE ALL OF THESE ANALYSES SEEM TO BE IN THE DAYTIME OR
6 P.M. PEAK BUT DOES NOT LOOK AT ANYBODY WHO WORKS IN THE
7 EVENING. AND, LIKE, I WORK WITH A BUNCH OF THE FOLKS FROM THE
8 AIRPORT UNIONS AND THEY ARE LIKE, YEAH, WE CAN'T -- WE JUST
9 DON'T GET TO TAKE TRANSPORTATION TO WORK LIKE WE CAN'T EVEN
10 KNOW WE WOULD LOVE TO. THEY DON'T WANT TO LEAVE DURING THAT
11 TIME, BUT THEY CAN'T GET TO WORK. SO, LIKE, REALLY LOOKING AT
12 HOW OUR THREE AIRPORTS ARE CONNECTED WOULD BE SUPER COOL
13 MAKING THAT CONNECTED MORE. IT WOULD REALLY HELP WITH A LOT OF
14 TRAFFIC ACTUALLY. AND, YOU KNOW, LIKE THE TWO THINGS ARE
15 MIDDAY AND P.M. PEAK AND NOTHING IN THE EVENING. AND THAT IS
16 THE MAJORITY OF MY QUESTIONS. I DO HAVE ONE MORE, BUT IT IS ON
17 SUCH A VERY DIFFERENT TOPIC THAT -- DO YOU WANT ME TO -- DO
18 YOU WANT TO RESPOND TO ANY OF THOSE THINGS?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I MEAN, I AM HAPPY TO START WITH THE LAST THING
21 FIRST. AND I REALIZE YOU HAD A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS THERE. AND
22 MANY THAT I -- THAT I EMPATHIZE, SYMPATHIZE WITH. I LOVE
23 TAKING THE FERRY TOO. I WILL SAY IN THE -- IN THE PRESENTATION
24 ITSELF, WE DID SHOW MIDDAY AND P.M. PEAK. THAT IS NOT TO SAY
25 THAT ONLY MIDDAY AND P.M. PEAK ARE COVERED BY ANY OF THE



JULY 23, 2024

1 PROBLEMS THAT ARE PART OF THE PLAN. A NUMBER OF FREQUENCY
2 BOOSTS THAT COVER ALL TIMES OF DAY AND MULTIPLE TIMES OF DAY.
3 WE SHOWS THAT FOR, I THINK CLARITY, SIMPLICITY SAKE. A PART OF
4 THE PLAN INCLUDE ALL TIMES OF DAY IN THOSE FREQUENCY
5 IMPROVEMENTS IN PARTICULAR, NOT TO MENTION THE NEWER PROJECTS
6 THAT ARE OUTSIDE OF FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENT.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** IT WILL BE VERY HELPFUL FOR US TO -- AT LEAST GET
9 SOMETHING IN AN E-MAIL THAT SAYS, THIS IS WHAT IT IS GOING TO
10 LOOK LIKE FOR -- FOR JANITORS. THIS IS WHAT IT IS GOING TO
11 LOOK LIKE FOR SERVICE WORKERS, FOR PEOPLE WHO WORK LATE AT
12 NIGHT. LIKE, IT WOULD BE -- BECAUSE THAT IS ONE OF THE
13 SKETCHIEST TIMES TO TRAVEL. SO IT WOULD BE REALLY COOL TO SEE
14 THE PLAN, BECAUSE IT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I WILL JUST BRIEFLY ADD TO GIVE A SPECIFIC ANSWER TO
17 YOUR QUESTION OF THE FERRY FREQUENCIES. THE FERRY IMPROVEMENTS
18 LEAN MAKING INTO THE EXISTING LINES MORE FREQUENT FOR THE WETA
19 SERVICES AND OUR GOLDEN STATE FERRY. THE WETA SERVICES, THEY
20 HAVE PRIORITIZED ON THE NEAR TERM. EVENING FREQUENCY FRONT.
21 NOT JUST RUNNING AT THE PEAK, BUT ALSO IN THE MIDDAY AND THE
22 EVENING. AND THEY ARE ENVISIONING THAT MOST OF THE LINES WOULD
23 GO TO AN HOURLY SERVICE ALL THE WAY UNTIL 10 OR 11:00 AT
24 NIGHT. THAT IS THE PRISON THAT WETA BROUGHT FORWARD AND
25 INCORPORATED A NEAR TERM INVESTMENT IN THE NETWORK. THE ONE



JULY 23, 2024

1 NEW FERRY TERMINAL WHICH IS PARTIALLY NEW IS WETA SERVICE TO
2 TREASURE ISLAND AND THAT IS OPERATED WITH A SMALL SCALE,
3 PRIVATELY OPERATED SERVICE AND THAT WOULD TRANSITION OVER TO
4 WETA SERVICE IN THE FUTURE. AND THAT IS A NEAR TERM INVESTMENT
5 PRIORITY.

6

7 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THAT IS SUPER COOL. PLEASE CONSIDER IN THE
8 FUTURE ADDING SOMETHING FARTHER SOUTH. YOU COULD SEE GOOD
9 RETURNS FOR THAT. I AM NOT THE ONLY PERSON HERE. SO I WOULD --
10 IF THERE IS ANY OTHER INFORMATION, I WOULD LOVE TO GET IT. THE
11 LAST THING I WANTED TO TOUCH ON WAS SLIDE 5. LOOKING AT
12 LEVERAGING NEW REVENUES. AND I HAVE SIMILAR FEEDBACK ON THE
13 MIDDLE THREE. THE PARKING PRICING IN GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. SO
14 GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES. IF YOU TAKE A LOOK AT THEM AND OVERLAY IT
15 WITH THAT -- WITH THE EQUITY MAP. WHAT YOU ARE LOOKING AT IS
16 ADDING PRICING TO PARKING AND LOST IN LOW INCOME NEIGHBORHOODS
17 AND NEIGHBORHOODS ACTIVELY BEING GENTRIFIED. AND SO, THERE IS
18 RAMIFICATIONS. THERE ARE EQUITY RAMIFICATIONS OF THAT. AND IT
19 IS -- IT IS ANOTHER THING THAT ENCOURAGES INTERNAL
20 DISPLACEMENT. AND THEN YOU COUPLE THAT WITH BOTH A REGIONAL
21 MILEAGE-BASED FEE AND PLUS ONE WILL NOT HAVE ANY CONTROL OVER
22 WHICH WILL BE THE STATE'S FEE. AND THEN ALL LANE TOLLING ON
23 FREEWAYS. AND YOU ARE TELLING PEOPLE MOVE. WE DON'T WANT YOU
24 HERE ANYMORE. YOU ARE TELLING ME TO MOVE. AND IT'S -- IT'S A
25 TRIFECTA OF IF YOU DON'T MAKE ENOUGH MONEY LEAVE. SO I SEE SO



JULY 23, 2024

1 MUCH EFFORT GOING FORWARD EQUITY ADJUSTMENTS, BUT ONLY FOR
2 FOLKS REGISTERED LOW INCOME AND NOT THIS MUCH OF THE
3 POPULATION. AND I THINK YOU ARE PROBABLY DOING ANYTHING ABOUT
4 IT. BUT I WILL JUST KEEP SAYING IT. YOU ARE ASKING PEOPLE TO
5 LEAVE. AND IT'S -- IT'S HARD TO SEE. SO I HOPE THAT THERE ARE
6 SOME REALLY BRILLIANT NEW WAYS TO INCORPORATE ADDITIONAL
7 EQUITY MEASURES INTO OTHER THINGS, BUT THAT -- THAT IS WHAT
8 THAT DOES. AND THAT'S ALL. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, DWAYNE AND THEN HOWARD.

11

12 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I DO HAVE A
13 COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. FIRST ONE ON PAGE FIVE, NEW REVENUES AND
14 THE POLICY CHANGES. ALL LANE TOLLING AND THE REGIONAL MILEAGE-
15 BASED FEE. IS THIS ALREADY DECIDED. IS THIS SOMETHING THAT IS
16 GOING TO BE PART OF THE PLAN NO MATTER WHAT?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** SO THE PLAN IS STILL UNDER DEVELOPMENT AND I WILL SAY
19 BOTH OF THOSE STRATEGIES IN THE CURRENTLY ADOPTED REGIONAL
20 PLAN THERE IN PLAN BAY AREA 50. FOR THE DRAFT BLUEPRINT FOR
21 PLAN BAY AREA 2050 PLUS, THEY HAVE BEEN RETAINED. THE FINAL
22 BLUEPRINT PROCESS IS JUST ABOUT TO KICK OFF, AND ANOTHER FIVE
23 MONTHS OF DEVELOPMENT ON THAT FRONT. WE WILL BE TALKING TO THE
24 PUBLIC AND STAKEHOLDERS THIS SUMMER AND WE ARE GETTING
25 FEEDBACK ON ALL THAT. I THINK WHAT I WOULD NOTE IS SOME OF



JULY 23, 2024

1 THOSE PRICING STRATEGIES HAVE PROVEN, YOU KNOW, IMPORTANT FOR
2 THE MTHD WHICH IS A STATUTORY REQUIREMENT OF THE PLAN AND
3 CONTRIBUTE TO THE \$86 BILLION SPICE OF THE PIE. IF THEY ARE
4 DIALED BACK AND REMOVED, WE WILL TAKE THIS TRANSIT NETWORK AND
5 MAKE ADJUSTMENTS TO REFLECT THE REVENUES NOT BEING PART OF THE
6 PICTURE.

7

8 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** NOW WILL -- WILL ALTERNATE ROUTES LIKE THE
9 MAINTENANCE OF ALTERNATIVE ROUTES, OFFSET ANY OF THE GAINS YOU
10 ARE MAKING WITH THE NEW RESOURCES?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** SORRY, CLARIFY WHAT YOU MEAN BY ALTERNATIVE?

13

14 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** WHEN I THINK OF ALL-LANE TOLLING IN SOLANO
15 COUNTY, YOU ARE COMING UP 80 WEST. AND NOW YOU DON'T WANT TO
16 TAKE 80 WEST, BECAUSE YOU ARE GOING TO BE CHARGED A MILEAGE
17 FEE. NOW YOU ARE GOING TO TAKE HIGHWAY 12. ARE YOU GOING TO
18 TAKE THE LEAD TOWN ROAD AND PUT MORE CARS ON THOSE AVENUES AND
19 IT IS GOING TO MAKE IT WHERE THE ROADS DETERIORATE QUICKER.
20 LIKE IS THAT PART OF A STRATEGY? IS THAT INCLUDED IN WHAT WE
21 ARE THINKING AND ONLY THINKING ABOUT THE \$86 BILLION. I KNOW
22 IT IS A LOT OF MONEY BUT ALSO STUFF THAT OFF-SETS THAT. I AM
23 WONDERING PART OF THE STRATEGY AND WHAT WE ARE THINKING ABOUT?

24



JULY 23, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** WE ARE THINKING OF THE DIVERSION ISSUE AND VARIETY OF
2 IMPACTS THAT ARE ASSOCIATED WITH DIVERSION AND WHEN FACILITIES
3 ARE PRICED. THE MAINTENANCE PROPOSAL BROADER THAN TRANSIT HERE
4 IS REALLY DESIGNED TO MAINTAIN EXISTING CONDITIONS OF THE
5 CRITICAL INVESTMENTS TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PAVEMENT IS NOT
6 DEGRADING AND MAKE SURE THE BRIDGES ARE IN GOOD CONDITION.
7 THAT SORT OF THING.

8

9 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU. ON PAGE 6, I AM LOOKING AT ALL
10 THE STRATEGIES. AND MY QUESTION IS THIS, RIGHT. AND I WILL
11 JUST GO TO STRATEGY 4, ENHANCED SECURITY AND CLEANLINESS ON
12 TRANSIT. \$4 BILLION. WILL WE GET DETAILED INFORMATION ON EACH
13 STRATEGY? LIKE HOW ARE YOU GOING TO DO THIS. I WANT TO KNOW --
14 LIKE, HOW ARE YOU GOING TO IMPROVE IT. WHAT ARE YOU GOING TO
15 DEDICATE THE MONEY TO. ARE YOU GOING TO MAKE PEOPLE ON THE
16 BART CLEAN. WHAT IS THE SECURITY GOING TO BE LIKE? BECAUSE TO
17 ME, THE SECURITY IS NOT ONLY LIKE ME GETTING ON BART AND
18 GETTING TO WHERE I WANT TO SAFELY. BUT PARKING MY CAR AT THE
19 BART. NOBODY STEALING MY CATALYTIC CONVERTER AND GETTING HOME
20 SAFELY. WILL WE GET MORE INFORMATION DETAILED ON THAT?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I WILL ADD FOR THIS PARTICULAR STRATEGY, WE HAVE
23 WORKED CLOSELY ALSO WITH OUR AGENCY PARTNER WHO HAVE PERHAPS
24 IN THE PAST PUT TOGETHER SAFETY AND SECURITY CLEANLINESS PLANS
25 FOR THEIR LOCAL AGENCY. SO WE HAVE TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT ELEMENTS



JULY 23, 2024

1 OF THOSE. AND -- AND, AGAIN, LIKE SPEAKING TO YOUR QUESTION
2 INCLUDES STAFFING ELEMENTS INCLUDE LARGE CAPITAL COSTS. WE
3 REALLY HAVE LOOKED AT A NUMBER OF CATEGORIES THAT ARE THROUGH
4 THIS PARTICULAR TRANSIT STRATEGY. SO, YES, DEFINITELY IN
5 PARTICULAR WITH STAFFING AREAS. AND FEW DIFFERENT CAPITAL
6 COSTS. PARTICULARLY WHAT WE RECEIVED FROM AGENCIES LIKE BART
7 AND CAL TRAIN WHO HAVE CONCERN FOR THIS TYPE OF TRANSIT
8 STRATEGY.

9

10 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** OKAY. WE WILL GET DETAILED INFORMATION ON
11 WHAT THE MONEY IS ACTUALLY GOING USED FOR? OR IS THAT
12 SOMETHING ABOUT THIS GROUP?

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SO WE ARE HAPPY -- IN OUR STRATEGIES ATTACHMENT.
15 LITTLE DISCUSSION AND WILL BE HAPPY TO PROVIDE MORE DETAIL FOR
16 THE COUNCIL MOVING FORWARD. I WANT TO UNDERSCORE, THOUGH, THIS
17 IS A PLAN, RIGHT. SO WE ARE NOT ALLOCATING THE \$4 BILLION
18 TODAY OR -- OR IN THE FUTURE. WHAT IT IS TRYING TO LAY OUT IS
19 HERE ARE THE TYPES OF INVESTMENTS WE COULD BE MAKING IN THIS
20 SPACE. AND HOW -- HOW COULD WE BE AUGMENTING KIND OF THE
21 AGENCY RESOURCES TO IMPROVE CONDITIONS, RIGHT. JUST WANT TO
22 UNDERSCORE THE PLANNING CONTEXT OF IT, BUT MAY SPARK SOME
23 IDEAS HOW THE REGION CAN TACKLE THOSE CHALLENGES.

24



JULY 23, 2024

1 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** YOU BROUGHT JUST BROUGHT UP ANOTHER QUESTION
2 FOR ME. IF I LOOK AT A PLAN AND SAYS \$4 BILLION, LIKE, HOW DID
3 YOU COP UP WITH \$4 BILLION? YOU HAD TO HAVE SOME KIND OF
4 DETAILED INFORMATION. I KNOW YOU GOT IT FROM OTHER AGENCIES
5 WITH WHAT THEY PLAN TO DO. I THINK THAT EVEN NEEDS TO BE
6 SCRUTINIZED. LIKE YOU SAID, WE DON'T HAVE THE MONEY. IF WE ARE
7 WASTING MONEY, WE ARE NOT REALLY GETTING TO THE POINT WE WANT
8 TO GET TO. LIKE WE WANT TO MAKE THE TRANSPORTATION ARENA A
9 LITTLE BIT BETTER. THAT WAS JUST A COMMENT. AND MY LAST
10 COMMENT OR QUESTION. I AM LOOKING AT PAGE 9, AND I LOOK AT THE
11 GROUP FROM FAIRFIELD TO THE RICHMOND BART. NOW THAT USED TO BE
12 ONE BUS. NOW DO THESE WHITE DOTS MEAN THAT IN FAIRFIELD, I GET
13 ON THE BUS, AND I HAVE TO TRANSFER IN VALLEJO? BECAUSE THAT
14 WAS A ONE-STOP GROUP. NOW IT LOOKS LIKE IT WILL TAKE LONGER
15 BECAUSE IT IS LIKE FROM FAIRFIELD TO VALLEJO TO RICHMOND. IT
16 IS LIKE GOING THROUGH ANOTHER TRANSIT CENTER BECAUSE THE
17 VALLEJO HAS A DIFFERENT TRANSIT CENTER. AND THEN -- THAT
18 ACTUALLY IS QUITE A WAYS FROM THE FREEWAY. NOW THE BUS HAS TO
19 GET OFF THE FREEWAY. GO TO THE VALLEJO TRANSIT CENTER AND GO
20 TO RICHMOND. IS THAT WHAT I AM SEEING? BECAUSE THAT IS A
21 SIGNIFICANT CHANGE.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** YES. TO CLARIFY WHAT YOU SEE ON THOSE MAPS. DO NOT
24 REFLECT THE TYPES OF TRANSFERS THAT YOU WOULD HAVE TO MAKE AT
25 SPECIFIC LOCATIONS. THE ONLY REASON WE CALLED THEM OUT AND IN



JULY 23, 2024

1 THE PRESENTATION WE I CALLED THEM "TRAVEL SHEDS "IN RETROSPECT
2 A HORRIBLE TERM TO USE AND NOBODY KNOW WHAT IS IT IS MEAN. A
3 MULTIGEOPGRAPHIC AREA AND WE ARE DOING OUR BEST JOB OF
4 DEPICTING THE TYPE OF IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE TO BE MADE. YOU
5 DON'T READ IT LIKE APART MAP WHERE YOU TRANSFER PAZ THOSE
6 LOCATIONS. THAT IS NOT WHAT WE REPRESENT.

7

8 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. HOW WARD?

11

12 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU FOR THE INFORMATIVE PRESENTATION. I
13 LIKE THE -- YOUR -- YOUR PREMISE -- EARLIER PREMISE OF MORE
14 IMMEDIATE BENEFITS AND HELPING PEOPLE IN MORE OF THE NEAR
15 FUTURE. THE -- THE LONGER-RANGE PLANS DOESN'T OBVIOUSLY SHOW
16 THAT. BUT IT SEEMS THAT ONE SHOULD HAVE A -- MOVE OF A NEAR
17 TERM, QUICKER BENEFITS TYPE OF PLAN OR MAP THAT SHOW HOW WE
18 CAN INCREASE, FOR INSTANCE, REGIONAL MODAL SHARE WHICH IS VERY
19 LOW, ABOUT 5%, I THINK, TRANSIT MODAL SHARE IN BAY AREA AS A
20 WHOLE. HOW THAT COULD BE IMPROVED IN THE VERY NEAR FUTURE IN A
21 YEAR OR FIVE YEARS. THE LONG-TERM PLANS THAT YOU KNOW MAY TAKE
22 BIG INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS MAY NOT BE FUNDED FOR QUITE A
23 WHILE. AND THEY OFTEN TAKE TEN OR 20 YEARS TO GAIN APPROVALS.
24 AND EIRs AND IMPLEMENTATION FUNDINGS. AND ALSO IT SEEMS THAT
25 ONE SHOULD -- BY 2050, AS WE ARE ALREADY SEEING YEAR AFTER



JULY 23, 2024

1 YEAR, TRANSIT AND TRANSPORT TECHNOLOGY IS RAPIDLY EVOLVING.
2 THESE PLANS COULD HAVE BEEN SR. FROM THE 1950s OR 60s. BUT
3 TODAY, THE ACCELERATION OF TRANSIT AND INCLUDES FERRIES. THERE
4 IS NEW HYDROGEN FERRY BEING TESTED IN SAN FRANCISCO. YOU CAN
5 GET A FREE RIDE ON WEEKENDS. AND ZEUS RECENTLY SHOWED OR
6 DEMONSTRATED A ROBO-TAXI. WE HAVE ON DEMAND COMMUNITY --
7 COMMUNITY BUSES IN THE BAY VIEW OF SAN FRANCISCO BEING TESTED.
8 AND THESE PLANS SEEMED A LITTLE -- SEEMED LITTLE BIT OLD
9 FASHIONED IN A SENSE THAT WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT TRULY A PLAN
10 FOR VERY RAPID TRANSIT BENEFITS THROUGHOUT THE REGION RATHER
11 THAN LOOKING AT VERY EXPENSIVE PROJECTS THAT ACTUALLY HAVE
12 VERY LITTLE BENEFIT. THE GOOD EXAMPLE IN SAN FRANCISCO IS THE
13 CENTRAL SUBWAY, WHICH ON A WHOLE, PROBABLY DECREASED SERVICE
14 LEVELS THROUGHOUT SAN FRANCISCO. BY PUTTING \$2 BILLION INTO A
15 VERY TRANSIT-RICH NEIGHBORHOOD OF THE NORTHEAST PART OF THE
16 CITY. AND ACTUALLY HAS VERY, VERY LOW DOLLAR PER NEW PASSENGER
17 BENEFITS. WHEREAS, WHEN WE WERE TO SAY LET'S SPEND A BILLION
18 DOLLARS ON THE ENTIRE SAN FRANCISCO BUS SYSTEM. IT WOULD BE
19 GREATER GAINS IN RIDERSHIP. OR RESTORING NORTH-SOUTH OLD LINES
20 LIKE THE 15 KEARNEY THAT WENT FROM THE NORTH TO SOUTH. AND HAD
21 PRETTY GOOD RIDERSHIP AND IF YOU FACTOR IN THE NEXT TECHNOLOGY
22 OF SURFACE BUSES OR SURFACE VEHICLES. AND HAVE THAT
23 IMPLEMENTED WITHIN FIVE YEARS, YOU WOULD GAIN MUCH MORE NEW
24 RIDERSHIP THAN THE SHORT TERM AND APPLIES TO MANY PARTS OF THE
25 EAST BAY TO SOUTH BAY THAT ONE NEEDS TO LOOK AS TRANSIT



JULY 23, 2024

1 EXPERTS. YOU ARE MUCH MORE IN TUNE WITH WHAT -- YOU KNOW, THE
2 TRANSFORMATIONS OF THE TECHNOLOGY OF TRANSPORT. THE
3 INTEGRATION OF ALL MODAL SHARES NOT JUST PUBLIC TRANSIT. LOOK
4 -- FOLDING IN RIDE SHARE. MICRO TRANSIT. ALTERNATIVE MOBILITY
5 MODES THAT ARE BEING DEVELOPED. A ONE PASS FOR EVERY TRANSPORT
6 MEANS. AND HOW QUICKLY CAN YOU CREATE A SYSTEM, OR NETWORK
7 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. AND, YOU KNOW, FERRY SERVICE, YOU KNOW,
8 IS ONE OF THEM. SOME CITIES HAVE 300,000 FERRY RIDER AS DAY.
9 AND OTHER CITIES -- RISERS A DAY. AND OTHER CITIES HAVE
10 TOTALLY INTEGRATED SURFACE TRANSIT. STREETCARS, BUSES. WITH
11 VERY HIGH TRANSIT SHARE. SO WHEN I LOOK AT A PLAN LIKE THIS,
12 IT SEEMS LIKE IT IS STEPPING BACK IN TIME. WE ARE NOT BEING
13 FUTURISTIC AND FORWARD THINKING. AND I WOULD URGE YOU TO
14 CREATE THIS PLAN THAT HAS A IMMEDIATE BENEFITS PLAN. HOW DO WE
15 -- AND THE MEASURE IS NOT HOW MUCH YOU SPEND, IT IS HOW MUCH
16 NEW RIDERSHIP ONE CREATES. AND UNFORTUNATELY, THE RECORD HAS
17 BEEN VERY POOR IN OUR REGION, THAT IF YOU ADD UP ALL THE
18 BILLIONS OF DOLLARS THAT WE HAVE INVESTED IN PUBLIC TRANSIT
19 AND ROLES, THE NET RESULT HAS BEEN A LOSS OF RIDERSHIP EVEN
20 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. IT DID NOT GLOW. WHEN WE SEE OTHER CITIES
21 AND COUNTRIES IN THE WORLD DEVELOP REGIONAL SYSTEMS THAT
22 EXPAND RIDERSHIP FOR TRANSIT AND REDUCE CONGESTION. SO THANK
23 YOU.
24



JULY 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, HOWARD. ADINA AND THEN TERRY.
2 LEVIN THANKS. SO I HAVE A --
3
4 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU. I HAVE SOME OVERALL COMMENTS AND THEN
5 MORE FINE GRAINED QUESTIONS. SO THE HIGH LEVEL COMMENT WHICH
6 IS GOING TO CARRY OVER INTO THE COMMENT ON THE NEXT ITEM IS
7 ABOUT THE POTENTIAL CORRELATION BETWEEN THEM. SO THIS APPROACH
8 OF HAVING A SERVICE-BASED STRATEGY. IT'S REALLY JUST VERY
9 EXCITING AND GREAT TO SEE THOSE FIRST MAPPING ON THE, YOU
10 KNOW, SLIDE 9, ETC., LOOKING AT HOW SERVICE IS GOING TO
11 INCREASE IN -- OR CHANGE AND IMPROVE IN DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE
12 -- OF THE REGION. AND THAT DOES HAVE THE POTENTIAL TO REALLY
13 START TO MORE CLEARLY EXPLAIN AND COMMUNICATE TO THE PUBLIC
14 AND VARIOUS DIFFERENT STAKEHOLDERS. AND BE COMPELLING AND
15 PERSUASIVE WHY THEY WOULD WANT TO AUTHORIZE THE FUNDING TO DO
16 IT. I THINK THAT THERE IS A SIGNIFICANT OPPORTUNITY TO CONNECT
17 THE RIGHT HAND AND THE LEFT HAND OF THE HOUSE AND THE PEOPLE
18 WHO ARE SITTING ON DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE -- STAFF TABLE HERE.
19 TO -- TO WORK TOGETHER TO REALLY -- REALLY DRAW THOSE
20 CONNECTIONS AND -- AND CORRELATIONS. ONE -- ONE THAT -- I WANT
21 TO -- I WANT SMALL QUESTION ABOUT THE -- IT WAS MENTIONED IN
22 THE STAFF PRESENTATION ABOUT THE NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESS
23 THAT WAS GOING TO INCLUDE -- AND SO THIS INCLUDES THE SERVICE
24 IMPROVEMENTS IN THE PLAN, BUT THEN THERE WAS ANOTHER SET OF
25 LENSES ABOUT THE OUTCOMES. THE CHANGE IN TRANSIT RIDERSHIP,



JULY 23, 2024

1 CLIMATE, OUTCOMES, ACCESS TO JOBS AND OTHER DESTINATIONS, LOAD
2 SHARE, ETC. WHEN IN THE TIMELINE ARE THOSE EXPECTED TO BE
3 COMING FORWARD?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** SO WE EXPECT TO HAVE THOSE IN VERY EARLY 2025.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO -- AND -- SO I THINK THAT IS -- WILL BE
8 A -- A POWERFUL PART OF THE PICTURE IN TERMS OF COMMUNICATING
9 THE BENEFITS OF THIS PLAN. AND I HOPE THAT THE -- THAT THE
10 TIMELINE REGARDING THE FUNDING IS MANAGED SO THAT IT IS
11 POSSIBLE TO USE THAT INFORMATION AS PART OF A COMMUNICATION
12 WHY PEOPLE SHOULD FUND IT. AND WE DON'T WIND UP PRECLUDING
13 OPTIONS THAT ACTUALLY WILL DELIVER THE BENEFITS. SO WE WILL BE
14 CHUGGING ALONG. DOING A REPORT. SHOWING IN THE BENEFITS ARE.
15 AND WE DECIDED WE ARE NOT GOING TO FUND IT. THAT WILL BE BAD
16 AND MANAGING THE TIMELINE TO USE THAT OUTCOME INFORMATION IN
17 ORDER TO BE ABLE TO, YOU KNOW, MOTIVATE TO BE ABLE TO DELIVER
18 THOSE RESULTS WOULD BE GOOD. LET'S SEE. ONE QUESTION THAT I
19 HAVE ABOUT THE TRANSIT PRIORITY. SO I THINK IT WAS SAID THAT
20 THERE IS A NUMBER OF THE FORWARD PROJECTS THAT ARE HAPPENING,
21 YOU KNOW, BEING PLANNED, BUT THAT ARE NOT ON THE MAP. I WOULD
22 ENCOURAGE AND HOPE THAT THERE WOULD BE A VERSION OF THE MAP
23 THAT WILL SHOW THOSE THINGS, BECAUSE IT IS -- YOU KNOW,
24 FACTUALLY TRUE. AND, YOU KNOW, ALSO, HELPFUL IN -- IN GETTING
25 FEEDBACK AND COMMUNICATING TO PEOPLE ABOUT, LIKE, WHAT IS THIS



JULY 23, 2024

1 NETWORK OF MORE FAST AND RELIABLE SERVICE THAT PEOPLE WILL
2 GET. AND, YOU KNOW, I AM NOT A GRAPHICS PERSON, BUT HOPEFULLY
3 THERE IS SOME WAY TO GRAPHICALLY COMMUNICATE LIKE HERE IS A
4 THING THAT IS LIKE A MAJOR IMPROVEMENT, A FULL BRT AND HERE IS
5 SOMETHING THAT IS AN INCREMENTAL IMPROVEMENT. IT IS STILL
6 GOOD. IT IS MAKING YOUR EXPERIENCE FASTER AND MORE RELIABLE.
7 LET'S SEE. ANOTHER THING THAT I PICKED UP FROM SOME OF THE
8 COMMENTS AT YESTERDAY'S MANY MEETINGS THAT ALL RAN TOGETHER IS
9 THAT THERE WERE SOME PEOPLE, FOR EXAMPLE, FROM THE NORTH BAY
10 GRAND CONTRA-COSTA COUNTY WHO NOTED THERE WERE SOME PROJECTS
11 THAT -- SOME PLANS FOR, LIKE, FASTER AND MORE FREQUENT SERVICE
12 THAT WERE BEING WORKED ON INTERNALLY BUT NOT YET REPRESENTED
13 ON THESE MAPS. I AM HOPEFUL AND BASICALLY ASKING IF THAT IS
14 SOMETHING IN THIS ROUND OF OUTREACH, YOU WILL BE ABLE TO PICK
15 UP MORE PLANS THAT ARE BEING DONE LOCALLY THAT ARE RELEVANT
16 THAT CAN BE INCLUDED IN THE NEXT VERSION THAT MAY BE MISSING
17 IN THIS VERSION.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** DO YOU WANT ME TO GO AHEAD AND RESPOND.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES, PLEASE.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** UNFORTUNATELY, WE DON'T HAVE THE ABILITY TO INCLUDE
24 SERVICE EXPANSIONS IN NEW PROJECTS AT THIS POINT IN TIME IN
25 THE PLAN BAY AREA PROCESS. WITH THAT BEING SAID, WE WILL START



JULY 23, 2024

1 ON THE NEXT PLAN UPDATE IN 2026. SO THAT OPPORTUNITY. BUT ONE
2 OF THE THINGS THAT IS -- THAT -- THAT CAN HAPPEN IS IN TERMS
3 OF SHIFTING SERVICE AROUND, SORT OF WITHIN THE SAME ENVELOPE,
4 THAT IS COMPLETELY SOMETHING THAT THAT INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS
5 CAN DO. IN TERMS OF REALLOCATING -- EXISTING SERVICES FOR
6 DIFFERENT AREAS AND EXPANDING SERVICE AND GROWING THE NUMBER
7 OF SERVICE HOURS OR ADDING NEW ROUTES OVER WHAT IS CURRENTLY
8 EXISTING. WE DON'T HAVE THE ABILITY INCORPORATE THAT AT THIS
9 POINT IN TIME.

10

11 **ADINA LEVIN:** I HEAR THAT FROM A LAND MANAGEMENT PERSPECTIVE,
12 BUT I AM THINKING OF THE LENS OF THE DISCUSSION AND DEBATE
13 WHAT WILL IT TAKE TO GET REGIONAL SUPPORT FOR NINE-COUNTY
14 MEASURE. IF WE ARE UNDERPLAYING THINGS THAT ARE ALREADY IN THE
15 WORK. WE ARE NOT IMAGINING ANYTHING THAT IS WHOLE CLOTH, BUT
16 SOMETHING BEING PLANNED IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY AND BEING
17 PLANNED IN THE NORTH BAY, AND NOT IN HERE, THEN WE RISK HAVING
18 PARTS OF THE REGION SAY, WELL, WE ARE NOT GETTING WHAT WE
19 WANT, SO WE DON'T WANT TO PARTICIPATE OPPOSED TO, LIKE, FIGURE
20 OUT HOW CAN WE ACTUALLY SHOW THOSE REAL THINGS IN A WAY THAT
21 WILL, YOU KNOW, GET THAT BUY IN TO DELIVER THE FUNDING TO
22 ACTUALLY DO IT. AND I WILL HAVE, I THINK, A FEW MORE COMMENTS
23 ABOUT CORRELATING THIS, YOU KNOW, VERY GOOD DIRECTION WITH THE
24 -- WITH THE NEXT ITEM WHEN WE DISCUSS THE NEXT ITEM. AND I
25 ALSO HAVE -- OH, YEAH, ONE MORE HIGH-LEVEL COMMENT AND



JULY 23, 2024

1 QUESTION. WILL THERE BE VERSIONS OF -- I KNOW THERE ARE TABLES
2 THAT SHOW WHICH THING IS IN THE FIRST 15 YEARS AND THEN THE
3 NEXT SEGMENT POINT IN TIME. THERE WILL BE MAPS THAT SHOW THAT
4 THAT SHOW -- HERE IS WHAT THE NETWORK WILL LOOK LIKE IN THE
5 FIRST TRANCHE OF TIME AND THE NEXT TRANCHE OF TIME?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES, EVENTUALLY. THERE WILL BE A LOT MORE DETAILED
8 INFORMATION ON THE SPECIFIC PROJECTS AND PROGRAMMATIC
9 CATEGORIES AND DETAILED MAPPINGS. I DON'T THINK THAT WE WILL
10 NECESSARILY HAVE THOSE BY THE END OF THIS NEXT CALENDAR YEAR
11 BUT THE FINAL VERSION OF THE PLAN IN 2025.

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** OKAY. SO ONCE AGAIN IN THE THEME OF CONNECTING
14 THE PEOPLE ON, LIKE, THIS SIDE OF THE STAFF TABLE AND THE
15 OTHER SIDE OF THE STAFF TABLE, LIKE, HAVING THAT AS PART OF
16 THE COMMUNICATION ABOUT, YOU KNOW, WHAT TO AUTHORIZE FOR THE
17 REGIONAL AS WELL AS STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING. WHAT MIGHT
18 HAPPEN IN A MODERATE TERM IN WHICH WE MIGHT FUND. A CHALLENGE
19 FROM A PROJECT MANAGEMENT PERSPECTIVE, BUT IT WOULD BE VALUE
20 TO ACTUALLY MAKE TO BE MORE LIKELY TO BE REAL ALL RIGHT.
21 THAT'S IT FOR NOW. VERY EXCITING TO SEE IT GOING IN THIS
22 DIRECTION AND EVEN MORE EXCITING TO SEE IN ADDITION TO THIS
23 BEING VERY USEFUL AND GETTING COMMUNITY FEEDBACK THE OUTCOME
24 OF TRICKS WE WILL GET THE BEGINNING OF THE YEAR.

25



JULY 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, ADINA. TERRY?

2

3 **TERRY SCOTT:** I THINK MY COMMENTS WILL BE RELATIVELY BRIEF
4 HERE. THIS IS -- FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF OUR COUNTY, FULL, IN
5 THE NORTH BAY INTERCONNECTIVITY WITH MANY OF THE OTHER SYSTEMS
6 IS VERY DIFFICULT IF NONEXISTENT. AND IN PART BECAUSE -- I
7 AGREE WITH PREVIOUS COMMENTS ABOUT THE EFFICIENCY AND THE
8 BENEFITS OF THE FERRY SYSTEM. IT IS A GREAT METHOD OF TRAVEL.
9 AND I USE IT TO COME TO EACH OF THESE MEETINGS, BUT TO DO SO,
10 I HAVE TO DRIVE 18 MILES TO THE CITY OF VALLEJO WHICH IS NOT
11 PART OF OUR COUNTY. AND THAT -- THAT TRIP HAS TO BE ON HIGHWAY
12 29, WHICH IS A -- THE ONLY MAJOR THOROUGHFARE THROUGH OUR
13 ENTIRE COUNTY. THE -- THE ISSUES, I THINK -- WE ARE -- AND I --
14 - I MAY HAVE STATED THIS PREVIOUSLY, IN NAPA, AND THAT PORTION
15 OF THE NORTHWEST BAY, WE ARE TWO TO THE NORTH BAY AND THE BAY
16 AREA IN GENERAL, ARE WHAT SWITZERLAND IS TO THE EUROPEAN
17 UNION. WE ARE VERY, VERY SMALL. AND TO PUT THAT INTO
18 PERSPECTIVE, THE ENTIRE NUMBER OF FULL-TIME RESIDENTS IN OUR
19 COUNTRY IS EQUAL TO THE NUMBER OF RESIDENTS IN THE CITY OF
20 CONCORD IN CONTRA-COSTA. AND SO, WE DON'T HAVE THE MULTITUDES
21 AND THE DIFFERENT KINDS OF TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AVAILABLE TO
22 US THERE. IT IS PRETTY MUCH, YOU KNOW, BY -- BY CAR, BUS AND
23 TRAIN. THAT IS ABOUT IT. AND THE TRAIN ISN'T -- ISN'T AS
24 INTERCONNECTED AS IT COULD BE AND SHOULD BE. WE CAN GET MORE.
25 AND PART OF IT IS THE TRAIN SYSTEM BASICALLY RUNS ALONG --



JULY 23, 2024

1 ADJACENT TO HIGHWAY 29 IN THE NORTH BAY. BUT WE ARE VERY
2 DIFFERENT FROM THE REST OF THE BAY AREA. AND MANY OF WHAT --
3 OF WHAT YOUR -- THE DRAFT NETWORK STRATEGIES ARE -- ARE
4 CRITICAL TO SOME OF THE OTHER COUNTIES MORE SO THAN TO US. WE
5 HAVE -- IN THE LAST TEN YEARS, THE PRIMARY MAJOR CHANGE THAT
6 WE HAVE EXPERIENCED IS THAT WE HAVE ABOUT 30,000 CAR AS DAY
7 THAT ARE -- THAT ARE DRIVING INTO THE COUNTY OF NAPA, AND THIS
8 SEEMS TO BE A SMALL PROBLEM WHEN YOU COMPARE IT TO OTHER MAJOR
9 CITIES IN THE OTHER. IN THE OTHER. AND NAPA. THAT IS BASICALLY
10 25% OF THE RESIDENTS OF OUR COUNTY. TOTAL COUNTY. AND IT IS
11 SPREAD OUT OBVIOUSLY. HALF OF THE RESIDENTS IN THE COUNTY ARE
12 LOCATED IN THE CITY OF NAPA. THAT'S ABOUT IT. THEY ARE ONLY A
13 TOWN AND FOUR CITIES IN THE COUNTY OF NAPA. BUT WHAT WE ARE
14 LOOKING FOR, I THINK, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME KIND OF
15 EXPANSION AND UTILIZATION OF THE -- OF THE NETWORK THAT
16 INVOLVES THE TRAIN SYSTEMS. AND -- AND THAT IS THE ONLY THING
17 THAT I CAN THINK OF. WE DON'T HAVE THE PEOPLE TO -- TO
18 NECESSITATE GREATER RESOURCES IN TERMS OF -- OF HIGHWAYS AND
19 SO FORTH. IT IS JUST -- IT IS NOT WORTH IT. BUT WHAT THE
20 32,000 CAR AS DAY THAT ARE COMING IN, MOST OF THEM ARE COMING
21 BECAUSE THEY WORK THERE, BUT THEY CAN'T AFFORD TO LIVE THERE.
22 SO IT IS A HOUSING ISSUE. THE INTERCONNECTION WITH HOUSING IS
23 INCREDIBLE, AND I THINK IT IS PROBABLY TRUE THROUGHOUT THE BAY
24 AREA, AND IT IS -- IT IS SPECIFICALLY SIGNIFICANT IN -- IN
25 THIS PARTICULAR CATEGORY. MANY PEOPLE AND I AM ONE OF THEM --



JULY 23, 2024

1 MOVE THERE TO GET AWAY FROM THE CONGESTION OF THE INNER CITIES
2 AND SO FORTH AND OF THEIR COUNTIES. BUT WE ARE -- WE ARE
3 CONNECTED WHETHER WE WANT TAMPA OR NOT. AND, OF COURSE, MANY -
4 - MANY OF OUR -- OF OUR RESIDENTS DO. WE NEED A BETTER
5 COORDINATION BETWEEN -- BETWEEN THE DEVELOPMENT OF AFFORDABLE
6 HOUSING. WE HAVE GOT PLENTY OF HIGH-END HOUSING. AND NORTH OF
7 THE CITY OF NAPA, 25% OF THE HOMES ARE SECOND, THIRD OR FOURTH
8 HOMES. OKAY. IT IS A WHOLE DIFFERENT KIND OF PROBLEM THAN MANY
9 OF THE OTHER COUNTIES THAT ARE EXPERIENCING. AND I AM NOT SURE
10 HOW TO RECOMMEND WHAT STRATEGY WOULD BEST HANDLE OUR
11 PARTICULAR CONCERNS. AND WE ARE JUST A SMALL PIECE OF THE BAY
12 AREA. SO I DON'T WANT -- I DON'T WANT TO WASTE A LOT OF TIME
13 TALKING OF OUR PROBLEMS. WE ARE GOING TO CONTINUE TO UTILIZE
14 AUTOMOBILES AND BUSES AS THE PRIMARY SOURCE OF TRANSPORTATION.
15 AND MANY OF THE OTHER TRANSIT SYSTEMS JUST ARE NOT AVAILABLE
16 IN NAPA COUNTY. SO IN REVIEWING THIS, I SEE IT IS VERY
17 COMPLICATED PROCESS. AND I APPLAUD YOU AND YOUR APPROACH. IT
18 IS DETAILED. IT HAS TO BE. IT IS A VERY COMPLICATED PROBLEM. I
19 WISH WE COULD -- WE COULD PROVIDE SOME BENEFIT IN ADDITION OR
20 PERSPECTIVE THAT WILL BE BENEFICIAL, BUT FRANKLY, I DON'T
21 THINK WE CAN. THANK YOU.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** LET ME JUST ADD ONE THING THERE. I THINK TRANSIT
24 STRATEGY T-3 AROUND TRANSFER TIMING I THINK IS IMPORTANT FOR -
25 - FOR NAPA AND FOR OTHER LESS DENSE, MORE AREAS. AND I WOULD



JULY 23, 2024

1 ALSO ADD THAT IF YOU FEEL SO INCLINED, NEXT MONTH WHEN NAPA
2 AND VTA HAS THEIR SERVICE CHANGE. TAKE ROUTE 29 TO EL SERIES
3 AT THAT DEL MAR. THEY WORKED VERY HARD ON TRANSFER TIMING AND
4 I THINK IT WILL BE A BETTER EXPERIENCE.

5

6 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. JERRY AND JEN JOHNNY.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTIONS. IT GETS TO THE STRUCTURE
9 OF THINGS THAT I SAY. AND I HOPE I ADDRESS SOME OF THEM. THE
10 MAPS APPLIED ARE BRILLIANT AND YOU SHOULD USE THEM IN EVERY
11 PRESENTATION THAT YOU USE THE HIGHLIGHT OF THE CHANGES AND,
12 ETC. MADE IT EASY TO READ THROUGH. APPENDIX D. I WENT WITH
13 THE. D TOOK TIME TO GO THROUGH AND I SPENT TIME LOOKING AT THE
14 PROJECTS. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT THE MAPS MAY HELP WITH ALSO -
15 - AND I HAVEN'T FOUND THIS REPORT. YOU MENTIONED IT, ANDY, IN
16 YOUR PRESENTATION, ESPECIALLY IN SONOMA COUNTY. WHERE ARE THE
17 CONNECTION PROBLEMS? IT WOULD BE GREAT TO IDENTIFY THESE ARE
18 THE CONNECTION PROBLEMS THAT YOU IDENTIFIED. YOU MISSED THIS
19 ONE. YOU MISSED THAT ONE. IN SONOMA COUNTY, IF I WANT TO TAKE
20 THE BUS AND THE TRAIN. THE BUS AND THE TRAIN HIT EACH OTHER IN
21 THE SAME LOCATION IN PETALUMA. THAT'S IT. THAT IS THE ONLY
22 PLACE. EVERY PLACE ELSE WOULD YOU HAVE TO WALK A MILE OR
23 LONGER TO GET FROM ONE TO THE OTHER. AND IN MARIN COUNTY IT IS
24 A LITTLE BIT BETTER. THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA WE WILL FIND THAT
25 IS A CASE HIGHLIGHTING THEM SO WE HAVE -- WE MAY NOT EVEN HAVE



JULY 23, 2024

1 PROJECTS FOR THEM. AND I HAD A DISCUSSION WITH THE EXECUTIVE
2 DIRECTOR IN SONOMA COUNTY ON THIS, AND HE SAID, WE ARE TRYING
3 TO IDENTIFY HOW DO WE CONNECT THOSE THINGS. THEY ARE
4 PHYSICALLY NOT IN THE SAME PLACE. WENDI AND I WERE WALKING
5 FROM THE FERRY OVER HERE AND SAID WHY IN THE HECK DID WE HAVE
6 A TRANSIT CENTER AND BART IS NOT THERE. JUST A LOT OF ECONOMIC
7 REASONS WHY BART IS NOT THERE. HOW TO TAKE CARE OF THOSE
8 THINGS. HIGHLIGHTING THAT WILL BE GREAT. AND GET MORE INPUT
9 FROM PEOPLE ON THAT. I WILL KEEP PUTTING MY GLASSES ON TO
10 REMEMBER THE PLACE THAT I POINTS I WANTED TO MAKE. SECOND
11 POINT. I REALLY -- I REALLY LIKE THE FACT YOU HAVE COST
12 BENEFIT -- COST BENEFIT THAT YOU STATED AS ONE OF THE CORE
13 PRINCIPLES. I ASKED RECENTLY -- AND DAVE SENT ME AN ANSWER AND
14 I AM LOADING IT INTO A DATABASE NOW GOING TO THE NATIONAL
15 DATABASE. FOR EACH ONE OF THE VARIOUS AGENCIES, I WANTED TO
16 FIND OUT, HOW MUCH DOES IT COST PER PASSENGER MILE TO PROVIDE
17 THE SERVICE? HOW MUCH DOES IT COST PER VEHICLE MILE TO PROVIDE
18 THE SERVICE. I BELIEVE THAT IF WE START FOCUSING ON THAT IN
19 THE PROJECTS THAT WE SELECT, THAT ULTIMATELY IMPROVE THE
20 SITUATION FOR THE LARGER NUMBER OF PEOPLE. EQUITY ENDS UP
21 BEING AN ISSUE WITH THAT. NOT NECESSARILY EQUITY IS SOLVED
22 WITH COST BENEFIT, BUT FOR INCREASING THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE WHO
23 RIDE AND WHY AND WHEN THEY RIDE. COST BENEFIT IS THE LARGEST
24 NUMBER WHEN WE USE. I WOULD LOVE TO HAVE PRESENTATIONS THAT
25 SHOW US THOSE NUMBERS. I EXPRESSED THE SAME INTEREST IN SONOMA



JULY 23, 2024

1 COUNTY. ALONG WITH THAT I WANT TO ECHO A LOT OF WHAT HOWARD
2 SAID. I DON'T THINK THE PLAN IS THINKING OF NEW TECHNOLOGY. WE
3 HAVE TECHNOLOGIES AVAILABLE TO US TODAY AND NOT OBVIOUS
4 TECHNOLOGIES. WE LOOK AT THE VEHICLES AND WE THINK OF THEM AS
5 THE TECHNOLOGIES. WE BUILT OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM ON
6 SCHEDULES. THE MORE FREQUENT THE SCHEDULE -- BART IS TERRIFIC.
7 I BART, AND I DON'T CARE WHEN BART IS COMING, I KNOW BART WILL
8 COME. SAME IN MADRID, WHEN YOU WALK TO THE STATION, A DRAIN
9 WILL SHOW UP. THAT IS GREAT. I WANTED TO TAKE AND MAKE THE
10 POINT OF COMMUTING ALL THE WAY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT FROM MY HOME
11 TO THE MEETING TODAY. I USED THE APPLICATION THAT ANNE OLIVIA
12 DID TOO AND POPPED IT UP. I CAN GET THE FERRY BUT TELLS ME I
13 HAVE TO LEAVE AT 7:00 IN ORDER TO GET HERE FOR THE 10:00
14 MEETING. ON MONDAY, LEAVE 7:00 P.M. ON MONDAY HAS TO DO WITH
15 COORDINATION. THIS MEETING IF SOMEBODY SAY LET'S HAVE A
16 MEETING AT 10:15 INSTEAD OF 10:00, I CAN SAVE AN HOUR AND A
17 HALF OF MY TRANSIT BECAUSE THE FERRY GETS HERE FIVE MINUTES
18 BEFORE THE MEETING MORE THAN A FIVE-MINUTE WALK AND I DON'T
19 WANT TO BE LATE FOR THE MEET. THAT IS THE PROBLEM THROUGHOUT
20 THE BAY AREA AND ONE OF THE REASONS WE HAVE THE NEXT PART
21 CONSOLIDATION, COORDINATION IS THE PROBLEM. WE DO NOT HAVE A
22 WORLD-CLASS TRANSIT SYSTEM IN THE BAY AREA. I SAW A COUPLE
23 COME -- FOR OUR LAST MEETING I TOOK TRANSIT DOWN TO THE
24 FRIENDS IN PALO ALTO AND I CAME BACK TO GO HOME IN SONOMA
25 COUNTY AND I SAW A COUPLE LEAVING FROM THE AIRPORT WITH THEIR



JULY 23, 2024

1 SUITCASES ON BART. EMBARCADERO STATION AND WENT TO THE FERRY.
2 GOT OUT THE FERRY THAT ANDY IS PROVIDING FOR A SHUTTLE TO THE
3 TRAIN. WHEN TO THE TRAIN AND SANTA ROSA. WHERE IS THE
4 ADVERTISEMENT THAT THE TRANSIT SYSTEM CAN TAKE YOU FROM SAN
5 FRANCISCO AIRPORT TO SANTA ROSA PUBLIC TRANSIT INSTEAD OF A
6 PRIVATE CONCERN. WE DON'T HAVE THAT ANYPLACE AND PLAN BAY AREA
7 2050 SHOULD BE INCLUDING THE MARKETING PORTION OF THIS AND HOW
8 WE HAVE A TRANSIT SYSTEM. WE CAN'T HAVE WORLD-CLASS UNTIL WE
9 MAKE IT WORLD-CLASS AND HOW WE TALK ABOUT IT INSTEAD OF THE
10 SEPARATE AGENCIES. IN-COST BENEFIT WHEN REBECCA TALKED OF 1031
11 AND WE GOT TO THE CLOVERDALE REQUIREMENT THAT SONOMA COUNTY
12 WANTED. \$300 MILLION TO MOVE FROM HEALDSBURG TO CLOVERDALE
13 WITH A DECLINING POPULATION. AND TAKES PART TO HOWARD'S POINT
14 AS WELL. THE BOARD UP THERE KEEPS VOTING SAYING WE HAVE TO
15 HAVE THE RAIL. WE HAVE TO HAVE THE RAIL. NOBODY IS PUTTING
16 SOMETHING IN FRONT OF THEM THAT SAYS, WE CAN GET THE SERVICE,
17 A BETTER SERVICE, IF WE USE THIS NEW TECHNOLOGY. WE USE NEW
18 DATA, NEW TRANSPORTATION TECHNOLOGY. OUR SYSTEM NEEDS TO
19 INCORPORATE MORE AND MORE ON DEMAND. WE HAD TO DO IT MORE THAN
20 THE WAY WE DID BEFORE. DIDN'T HAVE THE DATA SYSTEM. WE CAN DO
21 ON DEMAND AND PRIVATE ENTITY TODAY. WE SHOULD DO IT AS A
22 PUBLIC ENTITY. WE SHOULD HAVE ON DEMAND WHEN I SAY I WANT TO
23 GET TO THE TRAIN IN SANTA ROSA AND I LIVE FIVE MILES AWAY, I
24 CAN ACTUALLY GET HERE ON TIME. MY SCRIBBLES ALWAYS LOOK LIKE
25 THIS AND VERY HARD FOR ME TO READ MY NOTES. THE MILEAGE AND



JULY 23, 2024

1 THE PARKING FEES I UNDERSTAND -- I WAS CHAIR OF THE
2 SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION, OUT MESSAGE SOMETHING WRONG. THE
3 MESSAGE IS WE ARE GOING TO RAISE MONEY BY CHARGING FOR THE
4 HIGHWAYS AND CHARGE FOR THE PARKING. THE MESSAGING SHOULD BE,
5 WE ARE TRYING TO GET PEOPLE OFF THE HIGHWAYS AND ON TO
6 SOMETHING ELSE. WAY WE ARE DOING THAT TAKING THE MONEY FROM
7 HERE AND PUTTING IT OVER THERE. I HAVE TO ADMIT, I HAVEN'T
8 PAID FOR THE ROADWAYS FOR 24 YEARS, 26 YEARS. I HAVEN'T BEEN
9 BUYING GAS. I HAVE BEEN DRIVING ELECTRIC CARS FOR ALL THAT
10 TIME. SO I HAVEN'T BEEN PAYING MY FAIR DUE. MY FAIR DUE WILL
11 BE PER MILE. I DROVE ENOUGH MILES. THAT IS THE MESSAGE. WE ARE
12 COLLECTING HERE. USED TO DO IT THIS WAY. WILL DO IT THAT WAY
13 NOW. WE WILL GIVE YOU A NEW SERVICE AS A RESULT OF THAT. TELL
14 PEOPLE TO EXCHANGE ONE FOR THE OTHER. IT IS FASTER FOR ME TO
15 TAKE TRAIN AND TAKE THE FERRY TO GET HERE THAN IT WILL BE TO
16 DRIVE FROM HOME. THAT IS THE MESSAGE WE WANT. PUBLIC TRANSIT
17 WILL BE BETTER. IF IT IS NOT BETTER FOR YOU ALREADY, TELL ME
18 THE IN I THINK SO THAT MAKE IT BETTER FOR YOU ALREADY. I KNOW
19 PUBLIC TRANSIT IS SAFE ENOUGH. I KNOW FAMILY AND FRIENDS WHO
20 SAY I WON'T RIDE IT BECAUSE IT IS NOT SAFE. I FIND IT CLEAN
21 AFTER TRAVELED ON PUBLIC TRANSIT IN OTHER PARTS OF THE WORLD.
22 IT IS PRETTY DARN GOOD. IT IS PRETTY INEFFICIENT. AND THAT IS
23 THE PROBLEM WE HAVE WITH OUR SYSTEM TODAY AND WHY IT IS NOT
24 WORLD-CLASS AND LASTLY. A SALESMAN WON'T TOLD ME I WILL BE THE
25 LAST ONE TO SELL AND I WILL MAKE THE LAST POINT WHICH IS MY



JULY 23, 2024

1 LARGER POINT. PLAN BAY AREA 2050 IS BASICALLY TAKING THE
2 ORGANIC GROWTH WE HAVE AND INERTIA AND THE ORGANIC GROWTH AND
3 ADDRESSING THE ORGANIC GROWTH THAT WE HAVE. IT WILL BE GREAT
4 TO HAVE A PLAN THAT SAYS, I WANT TO BE CONSCIOUS ABOUT THIS
5 AND THIS IS WHERE I WANT THIS TO GO. GOT THAT THOUGHT OF
6 RESULTING OF LOOKING AT WHAT PLAN BAY AREA CHOSE FOR THE NORTH
7 BY A LOW GROWTH. LOW NEED WE SATURATED THE SOUTH BAY. I LIVED
8 IN SUNNYVALE FOR 20 YEARS. WE HAVE GROWTH AREAS. I HAVE
9 FRIENDS THAT COMMUTE FROM CENTRAL VALLEY TO COME HERE.
10 PROBABLY NOT THE BEST PLACE TO BE. WE SHOULD BE LOOKING AT A
11 PLAN -- AND PLAN BAY AREA 2050 SHOULD BE THINKING ABOUT, WHAT
12 IS IT THAT WE WANTED TO HAPPEN -- NOT JUST ADDRESS WHAT IS
13 HAPPENING TO US. AND THAT IS THE WAY FOR US TO MOVE INTO THE
14 RIGHT DIRECTION IS TO HAVE A PLAN THAT TAKES US WHERE WE WANT
15 TO GO MAYBE SOME ELEMENTS WE HAVEN'T TALKED ABOUT. AND MAYBE
16 HARDEST PART. THANKS.

17

18 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. JOHNNY.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I SUPPORT THE
21 ORGANIZING PRINCIPLES, BUT I WANT TO ADDRESS SOME THINGS
22 BROUGHT UP BY MY COLLEAGUES, FIRST REGARD TO MARKETING. I AM
23 LOOKING AT -- I THINK IT IS ON PAGE 12 HERE. THESE ARE SOME
24 AMAZING BENEFITS. THESE BENEFITS ACTUALLY COVER A LOT OF
25 COMPLAINTS THAT PEOPLE HAVE HAD ABOUT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION.



JULY 23, 2024

1 BUT I DIDN'T SEE IT IN THE PLAN BUT I AM SURE YOU HAVE IT. A
2 ROBUST WAY OF PROMOTING IT. ONCE YOU PROMOTE WAY THAT IT IS
3 SAFER NOW. THERE IS MORE SECURITY. THAT THERE IS A LITTLE BIT
4 MORE CONSISTENCY IN THE CONNECTIVITY WITH THE OTHER DENTS,
5 THAT WILL INCREASE YOUR RIDERSHIP. I HOPE YOU DO THAT IN THE
6 FUTURE. I SEE SOME -- ON THE OTHER SLIDE, THERE ARE ENGAGEMENT
7 DATES AND I AM SURE THAT IS WHERE YOU HUNKER DOWN ON THE
8 PROMOTION, BUT WHATEVER MARKETING YOU CAN DO. THAT WILL BE
9 ABSOLUTELY GREAT. THEN ANOTHER COLLEAGUE BROUGHT UP THE
10 CHALLENGES OF EQUITY. I WAS JUST CURIOUS THROUGHOUT ALL THIS
11 PLANNING, DO YOU HAVE A PROJECT THAT FORESEES OR PROJECTS HOW
12 MANY PEOPLE FROM THE BAY AREA WILL TRY TO RELOCATE TO A MORE
13 AFFORDABLE COUNTY LIKE SOLANO OR SONOMA WHERE THE PUBLIC
14 TRANSPORTATION IS REALLY NOT THAT GREAT RIGHT NOW. YOU KNOW,
15 PEOPLE ARE GOING TO MOVE TO WHEREVER THEY CAN AFFORD TO AND
16 THEN WORRY ABOUT TRANSPORTATION LATER IF YOU GET A LOT OF BOOM
17 MOVING THROUGH THESE VARIOUS AREAS. A DRIVER OPPOSED TO
18 ANOTHER PUBLIC TRANSIT RIDER BECAUSE WE TONE HAVE THE SYSTEM
19 SET UP THROUGH ALL OF THIS. I HOPE THAT THROUGH ALL OF THIS,
20 YOU HAVE SOME KIND OF PROJECT OR TEAM THAT LOOKS AT THAT IN
21 CASE IT HAPPENS AND COULD BE NOW. COULD BE 2036 AND 2050.
22 THOSE ARE ALL THE COMMENTS I HAVE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. VINAY.

25



JULY 23, 2024

1 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YEAH, SO THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION AND
2 EVERYBODY'S COMMENTS. I HAVE SOME COMMENTS AND COMMENT OF MY
3 OWN. ONE THING THAT WE POINT OUT PEOPLE TALK OF NETWORK
4 INTEGRATIONS AND SOMETIMES FEELING THE WAY PEOPLE TALK ABOUT
5 IT, THERE IS A BIT OF A MISUNDERSTANDING AND PEOPLE TALK ABOUT
6 -- I COME BY BART AND THE NEXT BUS IS LIKE AN HOUR -- I HAVE
7 TO WAIT AN HOUR FOR THE BUS. THAT IS NOT ACTUALLY A SCHEDULING
8 PROBLEM. WHEN YOU THINK OF IT, LET'S SAY A BUS COMES EVERY
9 HOUR AND THE BART OVER 15 MINUTES. YOU WILL HAVE FIVE MINUTES,
10 20 MINUTES, 30 MINUTES OR 50-MINUTE WAIT DEPENDING ON WHICH
11 BART YOU TAKE. PROBLEM IS NOT THE SCHEDULING THERE. TWO
12 PROBLEMS. YOU TOOK THE WRONG BART, AND THE BUS ONLY GOES ONCE
13 AN HOUR. IT IS NOT A SCHEDULING ISSUE. THE SCHEDULING ISSUE IS
14 WHERE, YEAH, YOU KNOW, EACH OF THEM JUST COME ONCE AN HOUR AND
15 ONE AT 12 AND THE OTHER AT 12:30. A SCHEDULING ISSUE. THE
16 OTHER ONE IS YOU TOOK THE WRONG BART, AND THE BUS IS ONLY
17 ONCE-A-HOUR ISSUE. SECOND THING I WANT TO SAY IS ANNE OLIVIA
18 MENTIONED THIS OF WAY FINDING AND STUFF LIKE THAT. I BROUGHT
19 THIS UP A FEW TIMES THAT WE REALLY NEED TO WORK WITH THESE
20 COMPANIES LIKE GOOGLE AND SO FORTH. BECAUSE WHILE -- WHY ARE
21 CERTAIN THINGS NOT THERE? I MEAN, I MENTIONED THAT ABOUT
22 ACCESSIBILITY ALSO. THE KEY THING ABOUT ACCESSIBILITY IS TO
23 WORK WITH THESE ORGANIZATIONS WHERE EVERYBODY GOES TO FIND OUT
24 HOW TO GET FROM HERE TO THERE. AND I SORT OF -- I MEAN, I ALSO
25 MENTIONED THIS MANY TIMES AND I JUST DON'T SEEM TO HAVE ANY



JULY 23, 2024

1 KIND OF -- I NEVER GOT A SENSE THAT THAT WAS HAPPENING. AND
2 THE KEY THING THERE ALSO IS THAT, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE TALK ABOUT
3 NETWORK INTEGRATION AND SCHEDULING AND HOW WE NEED ONE
4 ORGANIZATION. GUESS WHAT, THERE IS ONE ORGANIZATION THAT
5 ACTUALLY HAS ALL THAT INFORMATION. IT IS GOOGLE. IT IS 511. SO
6 IF WE -- WELL, TWO ORGANIZATIONS. AND MORE. BUT THE POINT IS,
7 LIKE THEY ARE GOING TO HAVE THE DATABASES THAT YOU HAVE DECENT
8 DATA ANALYSTS WITHIN A FEW WEEKS AND FEW MONTHS. YOU ARE GOING
9 TO FIGURE OUT WHAT THE SCHEDULING ARE AND WE WILL BE ABLE TO
10 FIX THEM BECAUSE THEY HAVE ALL THAT INFORMATION. IT IS GOING
11 TO BE SUPER DIFFICULT FOR THE OPERATORS TO COORDINATE WITH
12 EACH OTHER AND REINVENTING THE WHEEL. WHY? PEOPLE HAVE DATA
13 AND REALLY SAMPLE MATTER OF FIGURING OUT THE SCHEDULING
14 ISSUES. THE THIRD THING I WANT TO TALK -- TALK ABOUT ALSO.
15 THIS IS -- TERRY SCOTT TALKED ABOUT THIS THAT A LOT OF THE
16 ISSUE WE ARE TALKING ABOUT DON'T CONCERN NAPA. AND FRANKLY, I
17 GET VERY SCARED WHEN I HEAR PEOPLE SAY, AND I HEAR IT ALL THE
18 TIME. IF YOU WANT TO BUILD A WORLD-CLASS TRANSPORTATION
19 SYSTEM, I DON'T WANT TO BUILD A WORLD-CLASS TRANSPORTATION
20 SYSTEM. AND HERE IS WHY. NEW YORK CITY, FOR EXAMPLE, HAS MORE
21 POPULATION THAN THE BAY AREA. DENSITY IS MORE THAN 20 TIMES
22 OUR DENSITY. LONDON, AGAIN, MORE POPULATION THAN THE BAY AREA.
23 DENSITY IS MORE THAN TEN TIMES OUR DENSITY. WE SHOULD NOT BE
24 LOOKING TO BUILD A WORLD- CLASS SYSTEM. WE SHOULD BE BUILDING
25 A SYSTEM THAT IS BEST FOR US. AND US IS LARGELY LOW DENSITY



JULY 23, 2024

1 SUBURBAN AREA WITH A FEW URBAN POCKETS. SAN FRANCISCO, PARTS
2 OF OAKLAND, PARTS OF SAN JOSE. HOWARD MENTIONED BOGOTA, FOR
3 EXAMPLE. BOGOTA IS A CITY POPULATION OF THE BAY AREA AND
4 POPULATION TWO-THIRDS THE SIZE OF SAN JOSE. LET'S BUILD WHAT
5 IS BEST FOR US OTHER THAN THINKING THEY ARE WORLD-CLASS. AND
6 FOURTH THING AND JUST THE LAST THING. AGAIN, LIKE WHAT HOWARD
7 AND GERRY JUST MENTIONED. I, TOO, THINK THIS IS NOT VERY
8 FORWARD LOOKING. WE CAN -- THIS IS BASED ON INERTIA. OBSOLETE
9 TECHNOLOGIES. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I THINK COULD BE A
10 VERY PROMISING THING IS ON-DEMAND STUFF. ON-DEMAND STUFF AS
11 WELL AS SHARED AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES. PLANS WE HAVE FOR THAT.
12 AND I WOULD PERSONALLY LIKE TO KNOW, LIKE, HOW IS IT THAT WE
13 ARE GOING TO BRING THE SHARED AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES QUICKER.
14 LIKE DO WE HAVE A LAW, FOR EXAMPLE, THAT SAYS THAT ONCE THE
15 ACCIDENTS FROM THESE AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES DROP BELOW THE
16 ACCIDENT RATE OF HUMAN DRIVERS. IT IS GOING TO BE
17 AUTOMATICALLY ALLOWED. BECAUSE IF YOU DON'T DO THAT, THAT
18 MEANS YOU ARE CAUSING MORE ACCIDENTS BY NOT ALLOWING THEM. SO
19 THOSE KIND OF THINGS I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE, LIKE, WHAT
20 KIND OF FUNDS DO WE HAVE FOR THAT. NOTHING PARTICULARLY IN THE
21 LOW DENSITY AREAS. THAT KIND OF SHARED AUTONOMOUS VEHICLES
22 WILL BE REALLY HELPFUL. YOU DON'T NEED A HUGE BUS WITH 50-
23 PERSON CAPACITY. ALL YOU NEED IS A MINIVAN TO TAKE FIVE PEOPLE
24 AROUND. THANK YOU.

25



JULY 23, 2024

1 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY FOLKS ONLINE
2 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED?

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES, MEMBER FITZGERALD HAS THEIR HAND
5 RAISED IN ZOOM.

6

7 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** LET'S HEAR FROM CHRIS.

8

9 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR. GREAT
10 PRESENTATION. FANTASTIC PRESENTATION. AS IS ALL MY COMMENTS --
11 ALL THE COMMENTS AROUND THE TABLE. FANTASTIC, GUYS. I WOULD
12 LIKE TO ADD A BIT MORE TO THE COMPLEXITY OF THIS. ALL MY
13 COLLEAGUES HAVE PUT OUT THEIR LOGICAL ARGUMENTS. I CAN SEE IF
14 I CAN THROW A DART IN THE MIDDLE OF THE BULL'S-EYE. SO FIRST
15 THINGS FIRST. WHAT WE ARE LOOKING AT IS AN EXTREMELY COMPLEX
16 PROCESS SURELY AS WE HAVE SEEN AND HEARD AROUND THE TABLE
17 MULTIPLE ISSUES THAT GO INTO THIS BAKING OF THE BREAD IF YOU
18 WILL. CERTAINLY COMPLEXITIES. ONE BIG QUESTION THAT I HAVE AND
19 I KNOW THAT WORKING WITH THE TRANSIT AGENCIES, REPRESENTATIVES
20 OF THE TRANSIT AGENCIES THROUGHOUT THE REGION, FANTASTIC. A
21 BIG CONCERN THAT I HAVE IS THAT NUMBER ONE, ARE YOU USING --
22 ALONGSIDE THOSE FOLKS COMING TOGETHER AND AGREE ON DIFFERENT
23 THING. ARE YOU USING SOME KIND OF SOFTWARE, YOU KNOW, AS SORT
24 OF A SIM CITY SOFTWARE WHERE YOU CAN MODEL ALL OF THESE THINGS
25 TO SEE HOW THEY INTERPLAY? AND THE BIGGER ISSUE THAT I HAVE



JULY 23, 2024

1 AND THAT A LOT OF MY COLLEAGUES FROM THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY
2 HAVE IS THE ISSUE OF THE -- OF BEING SO CLOSELY TIED TO FIXED
3 ROUTE TRANSPORTATION AS IT REQUIRED BY THE ADA. THAT THE --
4 THAT THE CITIES THAT ARE MORE REMOTE LIKE NAPA. LIKE SOLANO.
5 AND ALL THESE AREAS. THEY HAVE A DEFINITE NEED. AND THEY HAVE
6 A DEFINITE REQUIREMENT TO HELP FOLKS WITH DISABILITIES. BUT AT
7 THE SAME TIME, BECAUSE -- BECAUSE THEY MAY NOT HAVE AS --
8 WELL, THEY TRULY DON'T HAVE AS ROBUST A SYSTEM AS WE HAVE
9 HEARD BEFORE RIGHT NOW BUT THE HOPE IS IN THE FUTURE THAT THEY
10 WOULD BUT I WOULD LIKE TO STRONGLY RECOMMEND IF YOU HAVE NOT
11 DONE SO, PLEASE, PLEASE, INCLUDES THE PARATRANSIT ORGANIZATION
12 ACCORDING TO THAT PARTICULAR TRANSIT AREA. FOR EXAMPLE,
13 LOOKING AT VTA AND BRINGING IN ACCESS TO SPEAK WITH YOU. SAN
14 MATEO. ALL THESE DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES. HAVE THEIR
15 PARATRANSIT REPRESENTATIVES. KEY COMPONENT. THE MORE COMPLEX
16 THIS IS, THE MORE WE HAVE TO GO OUTSIDE THE BOX AND CERTAINLY,
17 AGAIN, YOU KNOW, THOSE OF US IN THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY
18 REALLY TRIED TO GET FOLKS TO GO AWAY FROM HAVING PARATRANSIT
19 SO CLOSELY RELATED TO THESE TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT THEY CAN NOT
20 RIGHT NOW PROVIDE THE ONE SEAT RIDE. SOMETHING WE ARE TRYING
21 TO EMPHASIZE AND I KNOW OUT -- BUT, AGAIN, MAKING SURE THAT AS
22 MANY PEOPLE ARE AROUND THE TABLE AS COULD BE POSSIBLE TO
23 ENSURE BOTH DOOR-TO-DOOR SERVICE AND CROSS COUNTY SERVICE THAT
24 CAN BE MANAGED AND DONE BECAUSE FOR A LOT OF FOLKS BEING ON
25 EXTENDED RIDES, MORE THAN 30, 40 MINUTES AT A TIME IS



JULY 23, 2024

1 OUTRAGEOUS WITHIN THE COUNTY BUT EVEN MORE OUTRAGEOUS WHEN YOU
2 CONSIDER HAVING TO TRANSFER FROM ONE COMPANY TO ANOTHER AS IT
3 IS NOW INSTEAD OF A ONE-SEAT RIDE. SO I WOULD -- AGAIN, I
4 WOULD HIGHLY RECOMMEND THAT IF IT HAS NOT BEEN DONE, I WOULD
5 HIGHLY RECOMMEND THAT THE -- THE DIFFERENT PARATRANSIT
6 COMPANIES AND PRIVATE TRANSPORTATION COMPANIES THAT MIGHT CROP
7 UP, THE UBERS, THE LYFTS, THESE ARE IMPORTANT TOO. AND, AGAIN,
8 IT SHOULD BE RECOGNIZED THAT THEY ALSO PROVIDE THE ONE SEAT
9 RIDE TYPE OF SERVICE THAT -- THAT THOSE OF US IN THE
10 DISABILITY COMMUNITY REALLY RELY ON IN ORDER TO GET TO OUR
11 DESTINATION IN A MORE STREAMLINE FASHION. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, CHRIS. DO WE HAVE ANYONE ELSE
14 ONLINE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED? OKAY. THANK YOU. VICE-CHAIR
15 BALDINI.

16

17 **V.CHAIR, MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I VERY MUCH
18 ENJOYED THE CONVERSATION AND THE PRESENTATION THAT IT BROUGHT
19 ABOUT. QUESTION ABOUT THE CALIFORNIA STATE RAIL PLAN. DOES
20 THIS FEED INTO IT? OR VICE IS A ON A GREATER PICTURE. AND
21 SECOND QUESTION. ON THE -- ON THE -- WE MENTIONED ON PAGE 2,
22 THE CONNECTED NETWORK. THOUGH AS I READ IT, THAT -- THAT IS
23 PUSHED BACK TO THE 2036, 2050, WHEN IT SEEMS THAT -- THAT
24 WOULD RANK HIGHER IN LOOKING AT THE ENTIRE SYSTEM AND WHAT WE
25 ARE TRYING TO OFFER HERE. I, ALONG WITH MY COLLEAGUE, COME



JULY 23, 2024

1 DOWN FROM NAPA. AND THERE IS ALWAYS THAT QUESTION -- YOU KNOW,
2 CHECKING -- IT IS 19.8 MILES. AND TRANSIT TIMES ANYWHERE FROM
3 26 TO 50 MINUTES AND THREE TIMES MY CAR HAS BEEN BROKEN INTO
4 PARKING THERE. SO WE WERE TALKING ABOUT INCENTIVES EARLIER. I
5 JUST -- I THINK THAT CAN HAPPEN ORGANICALLY IF WE SATISFY OR
6 MAKE A STRONG EFFORT TO FULFILL AS IT WAS MENTIONED. THE
7 LIABILITY PART OF IT. THAT -- BY -- BY NAPA VALLEY TRANSIT
8 AUTHORITY CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE CHAIRPERSON. OUR DRIVER
9 CALLOUT RATE IS JUST WAY OFF THE CHARTS MEANING THAT BUS MAY
10 OR MAY NOT SHOW UP. I WORK AN HOURLY JOB. I'M HERE ON VACATION
11 TO BE AT THIS MEETING. IF I AM FIVE MINUTES LATE, THEY WILL
12 LET ME WORK, BUT GOES AGAINST MY KPI. BEING HERE I VIEW AS
13 BEING VERY IMPORTANT. SO I DROVE. AND WITH THAT, THERE WAS AN
14 AUTO ACCIDENT AND THE TIME TO GET HERE WILL VARY FROM AN HOUR
15 AND 15 MINUTES TO TWO AND A HALF HOURS. THOSE THINGS WE LOOK
16 AT OPTIONS. BECAUSE I HAVE TO RUN SOME ERRANDS AFTERWARDS,
17 THOSE OPTIONS ARE EXTREMELY LIMITED. BUT WHAT -- BUT OFFERING
18 THAT CONNECTIVITY AND THE RELIABILITY ASPECT AND SAFETY
19 ASPECT. THE ONE SEAT WHEN WE CAN. AN POINTED OUT THE
20 CLEANLINESS WHICH HAS COME A LONG WAY. AND BEING COMPETITIVE
21 AS FAR AS THE TIME. THOSE ARE THE INCENTIVES THAT ARE GOING TO
22 GET ME OUT OF THAT CAR SEAT AND ON TO TRANSIT. TO BE AT WORK
23 ON TIME AND BE TO MEETINGS ON TIME AND GET TO ONE PLACE TO THE
24 OTHER. A DAUGHTER IN STANFORD WITH A LIVER TRANSPLANT BEEN
25 THERE A MONTH. IT TAKES ME TWO AND A HALF HOURS TO GET THERE.



JULY 23, 2024

1 NO OTHER OPTION BUT I HAVE GOT TO DRIVE. NO OTHER OPTIONS TO
2 GO BACK AND FORTH AND IF I PUT SIREN ON TOP OF MY CAR, I MAY
3 BE ABLE TO MAKE IT. AND LIKE MY COLLEAGUE'S COMMENTS. WHAT IS
4 BEST FOR US. AND LOOKING AT THE NORTH BAY, WE HAVE BEEN --
5 MUCH LIKE EUROPE, WE HAVE BEEN TRAMPLED OVER FOR YEARS AND
6 YEARS AND YEARS. A TWO-LANE HIGHWAY CONNECTING SONOMA COUNTY,
7 A VERY LARGE POPULATION AND GOING WITH SOLANO COUNTY AND THE
8 REST OF THE WORLD, THEY COME TO US AND A TWO-LANE ROAD AND TWO
9 MILLION PEOPLE COMING UP. AND THE RAILROAD WAS MENTIONED. IT
10 IS SITTING THERE. IT IS A TOURIST OPERATION. AND YOU LOOK AT
11 THESE PROJECTS. AND MY -- AND MY COLLEAGUE EXAMPLE OF THE
12 CHINATOWN SUBWAY. WE ARE SPENDING BILLIONS OF DOLLARS. WE CAN
13 CONNECT THAT 37 FREEWAY NOT OVER THE NEXT 25 YEARS, BUT WE CAN
14 DO IT PRETTY QUICK WITH A BILLION OR TWO HERE AND THERE. SO
15 WHERE WE DIRECT THAT MONEY MUST HAVE THAT GREENHOUSE GAS
16 REDUCTION. IT IS FAIRLY DIFFICULT FOR ME TO UNDERSTAND THE
17 CLEAN AND GREEN PART OF IT. I WANT TO SEE NUMBERS. AND I WANT
18 TO SEE WHAT THAT COST BENEFIT IS TO THE ENTIRE REGION. WE WILL
19 NEVER -- AND THAT GOES INTO THE NEXT AGENDA ITEMS. WE WILL
20 NEVER GET WHAT WE WANT BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE POPULATION.
21 WE ARE NOT GENERATING THE CASH. SO FOR GOING FORWARD. AND
22 EVERYBODY IS LOOPING AROUND US WITH MULTIPLE OPERATIONS TO GET
23 WHERE THEY ARE GOING. NAPA -- TRIPPING STONE IN THE MIDDLE.
24 BUT TO GO THROUGH -- IT IS LIKE DRIVING -- TO GET TO HIGHWAY
25 INTERSTATE 80, 12 SIGNALS AND THIS MORNING IT TOOK ME ALMOST



JULY 23, 2024

1 AN HOUR TO -- TO GO THAT. WHICH IS -- IT'S UNCONSCIONABLE. AND
2 THEN WE ARE TURNING AROUND SPENDING BILLIONS OF DOLLARS TO
3 DRILL SIX MILES FOR BART. IT IS WHERE WE ARE PUTTING THE
4 MONEY. WHERE IT IS BEST USED. AND -- AND THERE IS THAT DR.
5 SEUSS SAYING THAT -- YOU KNOW, TO -- TO THE WORLD YOU ARE JUST
6 ONE. AND THAT IS HOW I LOOK AT THESE 53 PROBLEMS. AND -- BUT
7 TO ONE, YOU ARE THE WORLD. AND TO EVERY AGENCY, THAT ONE
8 PROJECT ON THIS LIST IS THE MOST IMPORTANT. WITHOUT LOOKING AT
9 WHAT YOU FOLKS ARE TRYING TO UNDERSTAND, WHAT WE ARE TRYING TO
10 UNDERSTAND AND GET IT GOING HERE IS -- IS A SYSTEM THAT --
11 THAT DOES CONNECT. DOES HAVE THE FREQUENCY AND THE
12 RELIABILITY. THANK YOU FOR THIS FIRST GREAT STEP. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I ALSO WANT TO ECHO WHAT A
15 LOT OF THE OUR COUNCILMEMBERS SHARED REGARDING THIS
16 PRESENTATION. IT IS A VERY IMPORTANT SUBJECT THAT COMES TO US.
17 AND TIME AND TIME AGAIN, I FEEL IT IS GETTING EASIER TO
18 UNDERSTAND THE MORE TIMES WE HEAR IT. THANK YOU FOR THE WORK
19 YOU PUT IN WITH THE MAPS WITH DESCRIPTION, THE COST BENEFIT
20 ANALYSIS ON SHORT-TERM AND LONG-TERM PROJECTS. IT WAS
21 PARTICULARLY USEFUL TO MANY OF THE COUNCILMEMBERS AND MYSELF.
22 I DID WANT TO REFERENCE PAGE 8, THE DRAFT NETWORK BIG PICTURE.
23 AND -- FOR MY UNDERSTANDING, AT THE BEGINNING OF THE
24 INFORMATION, WE HEARD THAT THIS PLAN DOESN'T INCLUDE LAND USE.
25 IS THAT RIGHT?



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS A MODAL PLAN FOR TRANSIT THAT WILL BECOME
3 PART OF THE COMPREHENSIVE PLAN. PLAN BAY AREA 2050 PLUS. THE
4 BROADER PAY AREA 2050 PLUS ABSOLUTELY INCLUDES LAND USE. IT
5 HAS A HOUSING ELEMENT. ECONOMY ELEMENT. AND GROWTH PATTERN AN
6 ALIGNING WITH TRANSIT INVESTMENTS.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT. IT DOES
9 MENTION SOMEWHERE IN HERE THAT WE ARE TO THINK OF THIS IN
10 CONJUNCTION WITH SOME OF THOSE ELEMENTS. AND SO I THINK THE
11 ONE THING I WANTED TO CALL OUT THAT I DIDN'T -- THAT I DIDN'T
12 SEE AND I WANTED TO MAKE SURE IT IS INCLUDED ARE SPORTS,
13 ENTERTAINMENT AND RECREATION, BEING INCORPORATED INTO OUR
14 TRANSIT ECONOMIC PLUS AND EVENTS. AND I OTHER COMMENTS
15 MENTIONED OF FERRY SERVICE ON TO SOUTH BAY. THE TRANSPORTATION
16 OF PEOPLE GOODS AND SERVICES AND, OF COURSE, HOUSING JUST
17 WANTED TO UPLIFT AND TRANSIT DOESN'T WORK IN A SILO AND THERE
18 ARE THOSE CORE COMPONENTS THAT I FEEL WE ALREADY ARE DOING A
19 GREAT JOB OF LINKING TRANSIT TO HOUSING AND JOBS, BUT ALSO WE
20 NEED TO THINK HOW TO MAKE THE TRANSIT FOR WHEN THEY ARE
21 RECOGNIZE 1998ING AND UBER AND LYFT IS NOT ENHANCING OUR
22 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AND KEY OPPORTUNITIES TO BE
23 INCORPORATING THEIR STRATEGIES. IT IS MENTIONED OUR
24 COMMUNICATIONS PIECE AND THAT IS REALLY IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE
25 THAT IT IS EMPHASIZING TO OUR COMMUNITY THAT PUBLIC



JULY 23, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION CAN GET YOU TO AIRPORTS TO SPORTS EVENTS
2 THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY. AND THAT IS THE VISION WE WANT TO GET
3 TO. AND THAT'S WHY PEOPLE SHOULD BE OPEN TO INVESTMENT AND IT
4 IS THE TIME OF CHANGES THAT WILL BE WITH OUR DOLLARS. AND TO
5 REFLECT BACK OTHER KEY POINTS I HEARD FROM THE COUNCIL. IT
6 LOOKS LIKE WE ARE LOOKING FORWARD TO MORE DETAILS AT OUR LAST
7 UPDATE REGARDING INCENTIVES FOR PEOPLE TO DRIVE LESS. WHAT THE
8 SAFETY AND SECURITY AND CLEANLINESS IMPLEMENTATION MAY LOOK
9 LIKE HAVING MORE DETAILED MAPS, I THINK IT WILL BE VERY
10 HELPFUL TO HAVE COUNTY BASED MAPS WITH THE NEIGHBORING
11 COUNTIES SHOWING BEFORE AND AFTER, LIKE, WE ALREADY SAW. BUT
12 INCLUDING THE VMT CHANGES, VISIBLE OVERLAY OF THE TIME THAT
13 YOUR COMMUTE WILL TAKE IF YOU WERE IN A CAR VERSUS PUBLIC
14 TRANSIT. AND IF POSSIBLE, ONLINE INTERACTIVE TOOLS TO SUPPORT
15 WITH US THIS COMMUNICATION PIECE AND HELPING PEOPLE SEE AND
16 WHAT WE KNOW AND COMMUNICATING THAT TO OUR BAY AREA REGION. MY
17 FINAL COMMENT FOR CONFIRMATION FOR ALL THE INFORMATION THAT
18 COUNCIL SHARED TODAY AND THE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT PERIOD THAT
19 WILL HAPPEN A THAT WILL BE HAPPENING THIS FALL. HOW WILL WE
20 SEE IT INCORPORATED INTO THE NEXT ITERATION OF TRANSIT 2050+
21 OR PAB 2050 PLUS?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** SO WE WILL BE COMING BACK TO THE COUNCIL IN THE FALL
24 WITH A SUMMARY OF ALL THE DIFFERENT TYPES OF ENGAGEMENT, SOME
25 OF THE KEY FINDS AND ANTICIPATED FOR THE OCTOBER, NOVEMBER



JULY 23, 2024

1 TIME FRAME AND BRINGING FORWARD THE FINAL NETWORK AND
2 BLUEPRINT FOR PLAN PAY AREA 2050 PLUS FOR REVISIONS AND THE
3 STAKEHOLDER PROCESS. A COUPLE OF PRESENTATIONS IN THE FALL AND
4 TOWARD THE END OF THE YEAR THAT WILL SPOTLIGHT THOSE CHANGES
5 PRIOR TO THE COMMISSION AND THE ABAG FOR PLANS FOR ADOPTION --
6 OR I SHOULD SAY FOR APPROVAL TO ADVANCE THEM IN 2025.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** OKAY, THANK YOU SO MUCH.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** CAN I ASK A QUICK CLARIFYING QUESTION REGARDING THAT
11 LAST ANSWER?

12

13 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** SURE, CLARIFYING QUESTION.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** WHAT YOU ARE SAYING YOU WILL BRING BACK CHANGES MADE
16 VIA THE FEEDBACK, BUT I HAD -- KARA AND ANDY SAID IT MAY BE
17 TOO LATE TO MAKE THOSE CHANGES. CAN YOU CLARIFY ON THE
18 FEEDBACK THAT MTC IS ABOUT TO DO?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I AM NOT -- I AM NOT ENTIRELY CLEAR. WHAT I WOULD SAY
21 IS THERE ARE -- WE ARE IN THE MIDDLE OF THIS PLANS PROCESS.
22 YOU KNOW, WE CAN'T HAVE NEW MEGA PROJECTS BE SUBJECTED AT THE
23 11th HOUR, AND OPPORTUNITIES TO CONTINUE TO REFINE ASPECTS OF
24 OUR STRATEGIES, ASPECTS OF WHAT IS PRIORITIZED THE FIRST HALF
25 OR THE LATTER HALF OF THE PLAN OR TRADE-OFFS. THIS IS THE



JULY 23, 2024

1 DRAFT NETWORK. WE ARE GETTING FEEDBACK ON THE DRAFT NETWORKS
2 AND WE WILL MAKE REVISIONS AS PART OF THE FINAL NETWORK BASED
3 ON THE FEEDBACK RECEIVED. SO THAT -- I THINK THAT IS KIND OF
4 WHERE WE ARE AT IN THE PROCESS, YOU KNOW. YOU KNOW, THAT IS
5 WHY WE ARE DOING THE ENGAGEMENT AT THIS CRITICAL JUNCTURE.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PUBLIC COMMENT. NO WRITTEN
12 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND ONE MEMBER OF THE
13 PUBLIC WITH HAND RAISED. ALETA DUPREE. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU TO THE SHARE. ALETA DUPREE. CAN'T SAY I
16 EVER HAVE BEEN TO NAPA COUNTY. I WOULD GO IF IT IS EASIER TO
17 GET THERE WITH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. IT TAKES A LONG TIME. I
18 CAN RENT A CAR, BUT I -- I OFTEN DON'T WANT THE RESPONSIBILITY
19 OF RENTING A CAR. THAT IS ONE REASON WHY I PUBLIC
20 TRANSPORTATION AND MORE AND MORE PEOPLE USE PUBLIC
21 TRANSPORTATION, BECAUSE THEY DON'T WANT THE RESPONSIBILITY OF
22 A CAR. IT IS EXPENSIVE AND YOU CAN GET IN AN ACCIDENT AND
23 POLICE AND PAPERWORK AND INSURANCE COMPANIES AND ALL THAT.
24 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION ERASES THAT FEAR FOR ME. BUT HOW -- HOW
25 DO WE MOVE PUBLIC TRAPPING FORWARD? AND I THINK SOME OF IT HAS



JULY 23, 2024

1 TO BE AUTONOMOUS. I USE AUTONOMOUS CARS. I COULD LOSE SOME
2 FRIENDS OUT OF IT, BUT I DO IT ANYWAY. IT IS HARD GETTING
3 PEOPLE TO DO IT. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER** : THANK YOU, ALETA. NO OTHER MEMBERS OF
6 THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED TO SPEAK IN ZOOM.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS** : I WANT TO MOVE US ALONG TO THE NEXT
9 ITEM.

10

11 **SPEAKER** : CAN I ADD ONE THING?

12

13 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS** : WE HAVE TO KEEP GOING WITH THE SAKE OF
14 THE TIME WE HAVE. NEXT ITEM IS AGENDA 6-A -- 6-B. REVENUE
15 MEASURE. REBECCA LONG WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

16

17 **SPEAKER** : THANK YOU, CHAIR CAMPOS, NOT SURE WHAT TIME WE HAVE
18 BUT I WILL PROCEED. THIS IS AN ITEM TO PROVIDE VIEW MORE
19 FEEDBACK ON THE WORK OF THE REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE
20 AND -- WHICH IS MEETING NEXT MONDAY. I DID WANT TO JUST
21 HIGHLIGHT FOR EVERYONE THAT THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE
22 EXECUTIVE GROUP MET YESTERDAY. AND SO THOSE MATERIALS ARE
23 POSTED ON OUR WEB SITE. WE HAVE ALSO JUST LAUNCHED A SURVEY.
24 WE ARE CALLING IT A COMMUNITY SURVEY TOOL, BECAUSE NOT A
25 RANDOMIZED POLL, BUT IT IS A SURVEY TOOL THAT IS ON THE MTC



JULY 23, 2024

1 HOME PAGE. SO PLEASE GO THERE TO PROVIDE YOUR PERSPECTIVE ON
2 KEY PRIORITIES. SO AT THE MEETING YESTERDAY, I THINK WE GOT
3 QUITE A BIT OF FEEDBACK AROUND SOME OF THE KEY QUESTIONS AND
4 THE KEY FRAMING THAT WE WILL FEED INTO NEXT WEEK'S MEETING.
5 ONE OF THE SLIDE THAT UP SEE BOTH YESTERDAY AND AT THE SELECT
6 COMMITTEE MEETING IS REALLY ABOUT, WHAT ARE WE SOLVING FOR.
7 WHAT IS THE PROBLEM WE ARE TRYING TO SOLVE. WE TALKED A LOT
8 ABOUT IT AT THE FIRST SELECT COMMITTEE FRAMING IT -- IT IS THE
9 FISCAL CLIFF. WHAT WE ARE TRYING TO DO IS TO BE MORE SPECIFIC
10 ABOUT THAT. AND, YOU KNOW, HIGHLIGHTING THAT THERE IS
11 DIFFERENT WAYS OF DEFINING THAT TRANSIT UPGRADING NEED, RANGES
12 FROM, YOU KNOW, WHAT IS THE AMOUNT OF FAIR GENERATION THAT HAS
13 BEEN LOST DUE TO THE DECLINE IN RELATIONSHIP. THE STANDARDIZED
14 SHORTFALLS THAT MTC USED TO ASSIGN THE STATE TRANSIT
15 ASSISTANCE FUNDING OR WHAT THE OPERATORS PROVIDE. THAT HAS A
16 RAINING OF, YOU KNOW, \$300 MILLION DIFFERENCE. SO TRYING TO
17 GET MORE CONSENSUS AROUND THAT IS REALLY, YOU KNOW, A CRITICAL
18 PIECE. SO WE TALKED ABOUT THAT. THERE IS QUITE A BIT OF IT
19 DISCUSSION ABOUT THE TIME FRAME OF THE MEASURE. AND I WOULD
20 SAY DIFFERENCES OF OPINION THERE ABOUT WHETHER THIS SHOULD BE
21 A LONG-TERM 20 TO 30-YEAR MEASURE OR REALLY SHOULD BE FOCUSED
22 ON THE NEAR TERM. KIND OF EMERGENCY. AND, YOU KNOW, LOOKING
23 FOR A FUTURE EFFORT TO REALLY ADDRESS LONG-TERM STRUCTURAL
24 CHALLENGES. SO WE DID PROVIDE SOME QUESTIONS AS A HANDOUT. IT
25 LOOKS LIKE THE TEAM IS ABOUT TO SHARE THESE. THESE ARE SOME



JULY 23, 2024

1 QUESTIONS THAT WE THOUGHT YOU MIGHT WANT TO WEIGH IN ON, BUT I
2 WOULD REALLY JUST SAY. IF THERE IS ANY SPECIFIC ITEMS RELATED
3 TO TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE THAT YOU WANT TO WEIGH IN ON
4 THAT WE CAN SHARE WITH THE SELECT COMMITTEE, YOU KNOW, WE ARE
5 HAPPY TO DO SO. BUT I THINK JUST WALKING THROUGH THESE VERY
6 QUICKLY. FIRST ONE IS, WHAT ARE THE MOST CRITICAL TRANSIT
7 OPERATING NEEDS THAT SHOULD BE ADDRESSED. THAT IS KIND OF WHAT
8 I WAS JUST DESCRIBING. AND ALSO THINKING ABOUT, WHICH -- WHICH
9 OPERATORS ARE WE TALKING ABOUT. AS ALTHOUGH 27 OPERATORS. THEY
10 DON'T ALL HAVE SIGNIFICANT FUNDING GAPS. SOME MORE THAN
11 OTHERS. SOME CARRY MORE RIDERS THAN OTHERS. HOW SHOULD WE BE
12 THINKING OF THAT. ON TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS, WHAT ARE THE
13 MOST URGENT AND ESSENTIAL IMPROVEMENTS TO BE MAKING. YOU KNOW,
14 WE HAVE TALKED A LOT HERE ABOUT -- WELL, JUST NOW IN THIS
15 PRESENTATION OF SERVICE ENHANCEMENTS VERSUS BIG INFRASTRUCTURE
16 PROJECTS AS WELL AS THE TRANSIT INTERACTIVE PLANS AND WEIGH IN
17 ON THAT AND OTHER MODES, LIKE IMPROVEMENTS TO LOCAL STREETS
18 AND ROADS, BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN SAFETY ENHANCEMENT, AND THEN
19 ANOTHER KEY TOPIC. AND I KNOW VERY INTERESTED IN, SPEAKING OF
20 EQUITY AND THINGS WE ARE TRYING TO INCORPORATE INTO THE
21 DEVELOPMENT OF A FUTURE MEASURE THAT ENSURES THAT THE BENEFITS
22 ARE EQUITABLY CONTRIBUTED AND PARTICULARLY HELPING MOBILITY
23 FOR UNDERSERVED AND LOW INCOME POPULATIONS. SO WE PUT THESE
24 OUT HERE TO HELP FRAME THE CONVERSATION, BUT REALLY WHATEVER
25 KEY DIRECTION YOU WANT TO PROVIDE, WE ARE HERE TO RECEIVE IT.



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU, REBECCA. I WANT TO LET YOU
3 KNOW THAT WE -- WITH THIS DISCUSSION, WE ARE SEEKING TO ANSWER
4 THE REQUEST HE IS THAT ARE POSED BY STAFF. SO THAT WE CAN
5 BETTER UNDERSTAND WHAT OUR COUNCIL'S BIGGEST HOPES AND
6 CONCERNS ARE FOR THE TRANSPORTATION MEASURE ARE. IF WE CAN
7 ALLOW FOLKS TO CHIME IN AND HAVE A CHANCE TO SHARE THEIR
8 THOUGHTS BEFORE MAKING A DECISION TO TAKE A VOTE, THAT WILL BE
9 IDEA. AND IF WE -- IF WE DON'T TAKE A VOTE TODAY, STILL AN
10 OPPORTUNITY IN OUR NEXT MEETING IN SEPTEMBER TO DO SO. THIS IS
11 NOT THE ONE AND ONLY TIME FOR US TO TAKE ACTION, BUT IT IS A
12 START FOR US TO START TO -- TO DISCUSS WHAT OUR -- WHAT OUR --
13 OUR CONCERNS AND ASPIRATIONS FOR TRANSPORTATION MEASURE MEET
14 LOOK LIKE. SO I WILL CALL ON FOLKS IN THE ORDER THAT HANDS ARE
15 RAISED. AND WE WILL START WITH GER.

16

17 **GERRY GLASER:** AFTER OUR LAST MEETING WE MENTIONED WE WANT TO
18 BRING SOMETHING FORWARD. CHAIR HAD WROTE DOWN WHAT WE HAVE
19 CONSENSUS. I WROTE DOWN THINGS THAT I THOUGHT WE HAD CONSENSUS
20 ON. THEY ARE NOT NECESSARILY ANSWERING YOUR QUESTIONS. THE
21 FIRST ONE WAS, THE MEASURE SHOULD INCLUDE ALL NINE COUNTIES
22 AND 27 AGENCIES. THE FOCUS SHOULD BE ON THE RIDERS '
23 EXPERIENCES. NOT NECESSARILY THE AGENCY AGENCIES EXPERIENCE.
24 THE THIRD POINT WAS -- AND MAYBE EVERYBODY WILL NOT AGREE ON
25 THIS AND DISCUSS IT. THIS SHOULD BE A STUDY -- THERE SHOULD BE



JULY 23, 2024

1 A STUDY BOTH CONSOLIDATION AND COORDINATION. AND I THINK THERE
2 WAS A LOT OF CONFUSION ABOUT -- OH, WE ARE GOING TO DO
3 CONSOLIDATION OR DO COORDINATION. THE POINT IS, IT SHOULD BE A
4 STUDY AND SHOULD BE STATED AS A STUDY OF THOSE TWO THINGS. AND
5 AFTER THAT, THERE WAS A DETERMINATION. AND THE FOURTH POINT
6 WAS, THE PROBLEM WITH 1031 IS IT HAD BOTH THE FUNDING AND THE
7 STUDY TOGETHER IN A SINGLE BILL. IF SHOULD BE TWO SEPARATE
8 BILLINGS. THE STUDY BILL IS FIRST. THE FUNDING BILL WILL
9 FOLLOW THAT AND WILL THEN SAY, WE NEED THE FUNDING FOR THOSE
10 THINGS OPPOSED TO WE ARE DROWNING AND WE NEED MONEY RIGHT
11 AWAY. AND SORRY, THIS WAS NOT THE CONSENSUS AND THIS WAS JUST
12 MY OWN OPINION. OUR FISCAL CLIFF IS TWO, THREE-YEAR PROBLEM
13 THAT WE ARE LOOKING AT AND NOT A LONG-TERM PROBLEM IF WE START
14 SOLVING OUR TRANSPORTATION APPROXIMATE, WE WILL MAKE OUR
15 TRANSPORTATION -- OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM REALLY ATTRACTIVE. THAT
16 WILL BE PART OF THE SOLUTION. AND THAT IS WHY I THINK -- THERE
17 ARE FOUR POINTS. THE POINTS I PICKED UP OUT OF THEM. I PUT
18 THEM FORWARD SO WE CAN ARGUE THEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HI, UNFORTUNATELY WE ACTUALLY HAVE TO END THE MEETING
23 NOW BECAUSE WE LOST OUR REMOTE LOCATION. SO THAT WAS A GOOD
24 START TO THE CONVERSATION. LIKE I SAID, WE WILL SEE IT AGAIN.
25 BUT WITH THAT, WE ARE --



JULY 23, 2024

1

2 **SPEAKER:** WE ARE GOING TO BRING IT BACK IN AUGUST FOR ACTION.
3 SO IT WILL BE PRESENTED AT THE WORKSHOP. IF YOU WANT -- SO IT
4 WILL BE ON THE AGENDA AND CAN ALSO BE DEFERRED. UNFORTUNATELY,
5 WE CAN'T TAKE ANY COMMENTS OR FEEDBACK. CHAIR WILL ADJOURN THE
6 MEETING.

7

8 **CHAIR, PAMELA CAMPOS:** THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE MTC
9 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TUESDAY AT 10 A.M. ADDITIONALLY A
10 SPECIAL MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WORK AUGUST 22, 2024 AT 10
11 A.M. BOTH MEETINGS 375 BEALE STREET, SAN FRANCISCO,
12 CALIFORNIA. ALL CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED TO
13 THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU. THANK YOU ALL.

14



NTT

Broadcasting Government