

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 26TH, 2025, 9:35 AM**

3
4
5 **GINA PAPAN:** WELCOME. GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. WHAT A DAY. HOW
6 MANY RED LINES ON THAT NAVIGATION SYSTEM. GOOD MORNING MY NAME
7 IS GINA PAPAN, MTC COMMISSIONER FOR THE SAN MATEO COUNTY. AND
8 IT LOOKS LIKE I'M STARTING US OFF THIS MORNING. I WOULD LIKE
9 TO BRING THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION TO ORDER,
10 AND THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST VIA THE MTC WEB SITE.
11 COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO PARTICIPATE
12 VIA ZOOM MAY SPEAK USING THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIALING
13 STAR NINE. YOU WILL BE CALLED UPON AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME.
14 TELECONFERENCE COMMISSIONERS WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST
15 FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER AND WE'RE GOING TO START OUT
16 WITH ROLL CALL. I THINK WE HAVE A QUORUM.

17
18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PRETTY SURE WE DO BUT WE'LL DO IT
19 ANYWAY. WELCOME AND GOOD MORNING. WE'LL START WITH COMMISSION
20 ARE ABE-KOGA? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN?

21
22 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

23
24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSON?
25



1 **CANDACE ANDERSON:** HERE .

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EZZY-ASHCRAFT?

4

5 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** HERE .

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

8

9 **PAT BURT:** HERE .

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.

12 FLEMING?

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE .

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GIACOPINI?

17

18 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE .

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

21

22 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** PRESENT .

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

25



1 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** PRESENT.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE'LL GET BACK TO YOU. MAHAN?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MANFREE? MASHBURN?

8

9 **MITCH MASHBURN:** HERE. MELGAR?

10

11 **MYRNA MELGAR:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY? IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

18

19 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN? RAMOS?

22

23 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SCHAFF?



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** PHYSICALLY WE HAVE ONE REQUEST FOR REMOTE
7 PARTICIPATION UNDER AB2449 COMMISSION ARE KAPLAN YOU'RE ON. DO
8 YOU HAVE YOUR SCRIPT.

9

10 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** GOOD MORNING COLLEAGUES THANK YOU VERY MUCH
11 FOR THE OPPORTUNITY THIS IS COMMISSION ARE KAPLAN REQUESTING
12 PERMISSION TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY VIA AB 2449 THE CAUSE BEING
13 CHILD CARE AND THERE ARE NO PERSONS OVER THE AGE OF 18 IN THE
14 SPACE WITH ME. MY DAUGHTER IS TWO AND A HALF. THANK YOU SO
15 MUCH. I APPRECIATE THE CONSIDERATION.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** OH, WE DON'T GET TO SEE HER? HOW CUTE. WELCOME
18 COMMISSIONER KAPLAN GOOD TO HAVE YOU HERE. YOUR REQUEST IS
19 NOTED AND NOTED YOU ARE PRESENT AT THIS MEETING. FOR EVERYONE
20 WHO CAN JOIN US, CAN YOU PLEASE RISE FOR THE PLEDGE OF
21 ALLEGIANCE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO
22 THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC
23 FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH
24 LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

25



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. NICE TO SEE ALL THESE NEW FACES. ITEM
2 THREE WOULD THE CLERK PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION
3 ANNOUNCEMENT?

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING
6 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE
7 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
8 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
9 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
10 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

11

12 **SUE NOACK:** ITEM FOUR PAST CHAIR REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE
13 CHAIR WITH VACANCY WE DON'T HAVE THOSE RIGHT NOW. ITEM FIVE
14 AD-HOC NOMINATING COMMITTEE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. THE AD-HOC
15 COMMITTEE MET AND JANUARY 26TH MEETING NOMINATED COMMISSIONER
16 NOACK TO SERVE AS CHAIR AND COMMISSIONER STEPHANIE MOULTON-
17 PETERS TO SERVE AS VICE CHAIR THE COMMISSION UNANIMOUSLY
18 ACCEPTED THE NOMINATION AND NOMINATIONS WERE CLOSED
19 COMMISSIONER NOACK AND MOULTON-PETERS DO YOU ACCEPT THESE
20 NOMINATIONS? NO PRESSURE.

21

22 **SUE NOACK:** I ACCEPT THE NOMINATION.

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I ACCEPT THE NOMINATION AS WELL.

25



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 **GINA PAPAN:** TWO FOR TWO, WE'RE ON A ROLL. OKAY, MAY I HAVE A
2 MOTION AND A SECOND TO ELECT SUE NOACK AS CHAIR, AND STEPHANIE
3 MOULTON-PETERS AS VICE CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION RESPECTIVELY?

4

5 **SUE NOACK:** MOVE APPROVAL.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

8

9 **SUE NOACK:** THIS IS A TWO-YEAR TERM. OKAY. NOW I'M READY.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** SO MOVED.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. OKAY. DID YOU GET ALL OF THOSE?

16 VICTORIA WOULD YOU LIKE TO REPEAT?

17

18 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES. I'LL MAKE THAT MOTION.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. I THINK THERE WAS A SECOND --

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'LL SECOND.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** CANEPA. THANK YOU. OKAY. WE'RE GOING TO DO THIS

25 THE FAST WAY. ALL IN FAVOR -- OH --



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** ACTUALLY WE DO NEED TO CHECK FOR
3 PUBLIC COMMENT AND BECAUSE WE HAVE REMOTE PARTICIPATION TODAY
4 IT NEEDS TO BE A ROLL CALL VOTE.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. SO, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS
7 ITEM, EITHER IN THE ROOM, OR REMOTELY?

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** OR I GUESS VIA E-MAIL.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO
14 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH A HAND RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND
15 NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** OKAY. I THINK WE'LL MOVE ON NOW TO ROLL CALL,
18 PLEASE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU GOT IT. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS
21 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN? THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN?

22

23 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?



1

2 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

5

6 **PAT BURT:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

9

10 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES. CANEPA. JOHN-BAPTISTE? KAPLAN?

15

16 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

19

20 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MANFREE?

23

24 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MASHBURN. COMMISSIONER
2 MELGAR?

3

4 **MYRNA MELGAR:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY? IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS?

19

20 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL
23 MEMBERS PRESENT.

24



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **GINA PAPAN:** FANTASTIC. AND NOW, CONGRATULATIONS. AND HERE YOU
2 GO.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I'M JUST GLAD TO SEE SO MANY NAMES BEGINNING
5 WITH AN M. I WAS SO USED TO JUST THREE, KNOWING WHEN I WAS IN
6 LINE TO VOTE. NOW I HAVE TO WAIT THROUGH A LONG LIST OF MS.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** YOU THREW ME OFF ON THAT ONE.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** BEFORE WE GET TO THE RESOLUTIONS OF
11 APPRECIATION, I WOULD LIKE TO TAKE A MOMENT TO WELCOME ALL NEW
12 COMMISSIONERS THAT HAVE JOINED US SINCE OUR LAST MEETING AND
13 WELCOME THEM TO MAKE REMARKS. START AT THAT END, COMMISSIONER
14 WASHBURN -- MASHBURN. I'M NOT GOING TO GET THE NAMES RIGHT
15 FIRST GO-ROUND.

16

17 **MITCH MASHBURN:** THAT'S ALL RIGHT. AND YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE
18 BEAR WITH ME BECAUSE THERE'S GOING TO BE A LOT MA'AM-ING AND
19 SIR-ING BECAUSE THAT'S THE WAY I WAS BROUGHT UP. SO, I'M FROM
20 RURAL SOLANO COUNTY, VERY RURAL. MY FAMILY HOMESTEAD IS THERE
21 SINCE ABOUT 1890. I'M JUST A SIMPLE COUNTRY BOY. I'M FILLING
22 IN FOR JIM SPERING. HE LEFT, AS YOU KNOW, AFTER SO MANY YEARS.
23 SO, I GOT REALLY BIG SHOES TO FILL. BUT I'M GOING TO WORK AT
24 IT. HE HAD 37 YEARS TO BECOME A SIZE 15. I'M GOING TO TRY MY
25 BEST. IT'S AN HONOR TO BE HERE AND TO BE PART OF THIS GROUP



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 AND I PROMISE TO ALWAYS HAVE THIS PACKET READ AND BE UP-TO-
2 DATE AND UP TO SPEAK AND GIVE EVERYTHING I CAN. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. WE'LL GO TO COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

5

6 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU. I'M MYRNA MELGAR. I REPRESENT SEVEN
7 SAN FRANCISCO SHARED A BORDER WITH DISTRICT FIVE IN SAN MATEO
8 COUNTY I AM A TRANSPORTATION GEEK. I CHAIR THE TRANSPORTATION
9 COMMITTEE FOR SAN FRANCISCO. AND ALSO THE TRANSPORTATION
10 AUTHORITY. SO I'M REALLY EXCITED TO BE HERE AND HANG OUT WITH
11 ALL OF YOU. AND DO SOME REALLY GREAT THINGS FOR THE REGION,
12 COLLABORATE, AND COME UP WITH GOOD THINGS. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. CANDACE? ANDERSEN. I'M SORRY.

15

16 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** EXCUSE MY FRENCH I'M CANDACE ANDERSEN I AM
17 THE SUPERVISOR FROM CONTRA COSTA COUNTY I HAVE BEEN ON OUR
18 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FOR 13 YEARS INVOLVED IN TRANSPORTATION
19 ISSUES AND WITH ABAG FOR THE FIRST 12 YEARS ON MY TERM OF THE
20 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND WHEN I WAS CHAIR AND FEDERAL D.
21 GLOVER REQUIRED I DECIDED I WOULD MOVE OVER TO MTC AND
22 APPOINTED MYSELF TO SERVE ON THIS BOARD AND THAT'S THE BEAUTY
23 OF THE CHAIR YOU GET TO DECIDE WHERE YOU END UP AND SO
24 DELIGHTED TO FOCUS ON THESE TRANSPORTATION ISSUES THAT ARE
25 CONFRONTING THE ENTIRE BAY AREA.



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES. YOU KNOW WHAT, I'M JUST GOING TO HAVE
3 EVERYBODY INTRODUCE THEMSELVES SO THAT IN CASE PEOPLE DIDN'T
4 GET TO GREET EACH OTHER YOU CAN DO THAT.

5

6 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU CHAIR I'M MARILYN A I AM
7 MAYOR OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA I THINK I PROBABLY HAVE THE
8 LOVELIEST COMMUTE OF ANY OF US I TOOK THE FERRY FROM ALAMEDA
9 BUT BEING THE MAYOR THAT'S OF A CITY THAT'S ALSO AN ISLAND SEA
10 LEVEL RISE IS A THREAT TO OUR CITY AND WE FOCUS ON THE
11 INTERSECTION OF HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, CLIMATE CHANGE AND
12 I'M VERY EXCITED TO BE A MEMBER OF THIS BODY AND TO WORK ON
13 ALL OF THOSE THINGS. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING EVERYBODY WELCOME HAPPY TO BE BACK. WE
18 GRAPPLE WITH ALL OF THE CHALLENGES WE DISCUSS HERE FROM
19 HOUSING COST AND HOMELESSNESS AND ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY,
20 TRANSPORTATION MOBILITY ISSUES CLIMATE ISSUES AND ON AND ON
21 AND I HAVE LEARNED A LOT BEING PART OF THIS COMMISSION AND
22 REALLY ENJOYED HEARING THE DIVERSITY OF PERSPECTIVES SOME OF
23 WHICH ARE GEOGRAPHICALLY BASED OTHERS IDEOLOGICAL SIZE OF THE
24 CITY WHAT NOT IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE TO SERVE ON THE COMMISSION
25 AND LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO DO SO.



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

3

4 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HELLO MY NAME IS VICTORIA FLEMING I AM
5 COMMISSIONER FROM CITY OF SANTA ROSA I REPRESENT THE URBAN
6 PART OF THE COUNTY, ALSO AN INFECTED FIRE AREA, INTEREST IN
7 TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT AND GOOD URBAN PLANNING, WE ALL
8 NEED LOTS OF THAT, I LOOK FORWARD TO GROWING WITH THE REST OF
9 YOU ALL.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** JUST IN TIME. YOU'RE UP MARGARET. WE'RE JUST
12 INTRODUCING OURSELVES. BECAUSE THERE ARE SO MANY NEW
13 COMMISSIONERS. AND IT'S YOUR TURN, ACTUALLY. UNLESS YOU WANT
14 ME TO COME BACK TO YOU IF YOU'RE NOT QUITE READY.

15

16 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** JUST NAME?

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YEAH.

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. SORRY I'M LATE. IT
21 TOOK ME 20 MINUTES TO GET OUT OF MY OWN CITY. [LAUGHTER] I'M
22 MARGARET ABE-KOGA, NEWLY ELECTED SANTA CLARA CAN'T SUPERVISOR
23 DISTRICT FIVE WHICH COVERS NINE OUT OF THE 15 CITIES IN SANTA
24 CLARA COUNTY NORTH COUNTIES AND THEN ALONG THE WEST SIDE. DO
25 WE SAY ANYTHING ELSE? I GUESS I HAVE BEEN ON MTC, I THINK THIS



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 IS MY FIFTH, OR SIXTH -- FIFTH YEAR NOW AND I ALSO SERVE ON
2 THE VALLEY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AS WELL AS THE CALTRAIN
3 JOINT POWERS BOARD. SO, TRANSPORTATION HAS BECOME ONE OF MY
4 TOP FAVORITE BUSINESS IS. [LAUGHTER] AND PREVIOUS TO THAT I
5 WAS ON THE MOUNTAIN VIEW CITY COUNCIL FOR 16 YEARS. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANKS. VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

8

9 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GOOD MORNING AND WELCOME EVERYONE TO
10 OUR NEW COMMISSIONERS. STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS I SERVE FROM
11 SOUTHERN MARIN WHERE WE'RE SERVED BY AIR, WATER, AND MOTOR
12 TRANSIT, AND SO I'M DELIGHTED TO SERVE WITH SUE NOACK, AS YOUR
13 VICE CHAIR. I HAVE BEEN DOING TRANSPORTATION ISSUES FOR MANY
14 YEARS CHAIRED OUR TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, TRANSIT BOARD,
15 SERVED ON THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT AND I AM A FORMER
16 SMART DIRECTOR AS WELL. SO FELLOW TRANSIT GEEK AND HAPPY TO BE
17 HERE WITH ALL OF YOU. MY PARTICULAR INTEREST IS FORGING
18 REGIONAL COLLABORATIONS AND ALSO FINDING THE NEXUS BETWEEN
19 TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING POLICY. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I WILL JUST BRIEFLY, I'M THE
22 MAYOR OF PLEASANT HILL, SUE NOACK, CURRENT CHAIR, THANK YOU,
23 ALL, VERY MUCH FOR YOUR SUPPORT. I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT.
24 MAYOR OF PLEASANT HILL WE CALL OURSELVES THE CENTER OF
25 EVERYTHING BECAUSE WE'RE IN THE STORY OF CONTRA COSTA COUNTY



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 BUT TRANSPORTATION HAS BEEN A BITS OF MY LIFE FOR A WHILE. I
2 SERVED ON COUNTY CONNECTION FOR TEN YEARS, AND I SERVE ON --
3 CCTA AS WELL. PART OF THAT IN THE CORPORATE WORLD I FINANCE
4 TRANSPORTATION, SHIPS, AIRPLANES, TRAINS, AND THE LIKE FOR
5 ABOUT 26 YEARS. I JUST LIVE AND BREATHE TRANSPORTATION, IT
6 SEEMS LIKE. ANYWAY. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** HELLO AGAIN. MY NAME IS GINA PAPAN, AND I AM
9 HONORED TO REPRESENT THE 20 CITIES IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND
10 ALSO THE LARGEST INTERMODAL CENTER WEST OF THE MISSISSIPPI.
11 YOU WILL FIND OUT ABOUT THAT COMING UP SOON. SO, THAT MEANS WE
12 HAVE CALTRAIN, BART, CONNECTION TO SFO, AND FUTURE HIGH SPEED
13 RAIL SHOULD THAT EVER HAPPEN, ALONG WITH MANY, MANY BUSES, AND
14 WE ARE NOT JUST BETWEEN SAN JOSE AND SAN FRANCISCO. [LAUGHTER]
15 I ALSO HAIL FROM MILLBRAE WHERE I SERVED FOUR TERMS ON THE
16 CITY COUNCIL THERE THREE TIMES AS MAYOR AND MILLBRAE IS THE
17 FASTER GROWING CITY HOUSING WISE IN THE ENTIRE SAN MATEO
18 COUNTY AND I THINK THE FIFTH LARGEST IN THE REGION SO PUTTING
19 ALL THE PIECES TOGETHER IS SOMETHING WE'RE GETTING USED TO
20 HERE AND JUST BY DEFAULT COMING FROM LARGEST INTERMODAL CENTER
21 WEST OF THE MISSISSIPPI I DO LIKE TRANSPORTATION AND WE HAVE
22 MUCH WORK TO DO AND PUTTING ALL THE PIECES TOGETHER HERE I
23 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ALL AS FAR AS THE CONNECTIONS
24 THE IMPLEMENTATION OF HOUSING AND PUTTING THEM TOGETHER -- AND
25 IT'S NOT SIMPLE. SO, IT'S GOING TO BE AN EXCITING YEAR. THANK



1 YOU VERY MUCH. IT'S -- I LOOK FORWARD TO MEETING YOU ALL IN-
2 PERSON. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MY NAME IS DAVID CANEPA I AM
7 PRESIDENT OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS OF SAN MATEO COUNTY I
8 HAVE ENJOYED THIS COMMISSION IMMENSELY. I THINK WE HAVE GREAT
9 COMMISSIONERS, GREAT STAFF. BUT IT'S REALLY, YOU KNOW, FOR
10 MANY OF US WHO HAVE BEEN DOING THIS, MY 8TH YEAR ON THE BOARD
11 OF SUPERVISORS, I DID 16 YEARS, EIGHT YEARS ON THE DALY CITY,
12 CITY COUPLE, BUT ONE OF THE THINGS YOU REALIZE IS JUST HOW
13 GREAT OF A STAFF WE HAVE AND HOW COMPETENT THEY ARE. I'M JUST
14 DRIVEN BY PROJECT DELIVERY, HOW ARE WE ABLE TO GET THINGS
15 DONE. AND I THINK WHAT WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DO ON THIS
16 COMMISSION, WE'LL BE DOING MOVING FORWARD, IS REALLY JUST
17 DELIVERING ON PROJECTS. OBVIOUSLY, THE COMPLEXITIES OF THE
18 ISSUES THAT WE HAVE TO DEAL WITH, WHETHER IT'S, YOU KNOW, THE
19 BALLOT MOVING FORWARD AND GOING BEFORE THE STATE OF
20 CALIFORNIA, THEN PUTTING A BALLOT FORWARD, THIS ISN'T EASY
21 WORK BUT IT'S REWARDING WORK. BUT I THINK ALL OF US UP HERE
22 WHO HAVE STAFF, WE REALIZE THAT OUR STAFF ARE THE ONES WHO
23 REALLY TRULY, DAY IN AND DAY OUT, DAY OUT, DO THE WORK. AND,
24 SO, IT'S HARD FOR ME TO TALK ABOUT MYSELF, BECAUSE I REALIZE
25 IT'S REALLY ABOUT THE TEAM. AND I THINK VICTORIA HAD TALKED



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 ABOUT THAT. IT'S ABOUT THE TEAM. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, JUST VERY
2 APPRECIATIVE TO BE HERE, AND IT'S AN HONOR TO SERVE. SO, THANK
3 YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER AHN?

6

7 **EDDIE AHN:** HI. EDDIE AHN, HAIL FROM THIS SAN FRANCISCO BAY
8 CONSERVATION DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION WHICH OF COURSE IS A
9 REGULATORY AGENCY IN CHARGE OF SHORELINE PERMITTING AND
10 REGULATORY ACCESS. FOR MYSELF I HAVE BEEN ON MTC NOW FOR FIVE
11 YEARS, AND, ALSO, WAS JUST REMEMBERING MY PREDECESSOR FONDLY
12 ANNE HALSTED SERVING ON THIS PARTICULAR SEAT FOR A LONG TIME
13 MY BACKGROUND IS NON-PROFIT FULL-TIME AND I HAVE AN
14 ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE LEGAL BACKGROUND SO THAT INFORMS A LOT
15 OF THE WORK I DO.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

18

19 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** I'M LIBBY SCHAFF, I'M THE RECOVERING MAYOR OF
20 OAKLAND CALIFORNIA. THIS MARKS ONE DECADE THAT I HAVE SERVED
21 ON MTC, WHILE I DON'T COME CLOSE TO DOREEN IN LONGEVITY, AND
22 OF COURSE, I THINK THE SPIRIT OF JIM SPERING WILL ALSO BE
23 INFUSED INTO THIS DAIS. IT'S BEEN SUCH INTERESTING AND
24 REWARDING WORK THAT YOU COULDN'T GET RID OF ME. SO, I
25 CURRENTLY SERVE AS HUD'S APPOINTEE, AND APPARENTLY THAT CANNOT



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 BE CHANGED, EVEN THOUGH THE ADMINISTRATION HAS CHANGED. SO FOR
2 TWO MORE YEARS, I WILL SERVE AS HUD'S APPOINTEE AS A NON-
3 VOTING MEMBER. WHEN I FIRST JOINED THIS BOARD, I WAS TEASED A
4 BIT FOR ALWAYS BRINGING UP THE ISSUE OF HOUSING AND OUR NEED
5 TO ADDRESS HOUSING AND OUR NEED TO INTEGRATE IT WITH OUR
6 TRANSPORTATION WORK AND NOW THAT DOESN'T EVEN SEEM LIKE A
7 THING. WE HAVE COME A LONG WAY AND THIS IS JUST AN INCREDIBLE
8 BODY SO WELCOME TO ALL OF YOU NEW PEOPLE. AND I HOPE YOU TAKE
9 THE PRIDE THAT I THINK HAS BEEN INFUSED IN MANY OF US THAT OUR
10 CITIES, OUR COUNTIES, ARE NOT GOING TO SUCCEED IN ISOLATION,
11 THAT WE ARE AN INTERCONNECTED, INTERDEPENDENT REGION AND THAT
12 WHEN WE THINK THAT WAY, WE DO BETTER FOR EVERYONE. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE?

15

16 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M ALICIA JOHN-
17 BAPTISTE. I SERVE AS CHIEF OF INFRASTRUCTURE CLIMATE AND
18 MOBILITY FOR THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO. APPOINTEE
19 TO THIS BODY EXCITED TO WITH YOU ALL. I COME TO LOVE TRANSIT
20 BECAUSE I STARTED MY CAREER WORKING IN TRANSIT FIRST JOB
21 WORKING FOR MUNI ACTUALLY RESPONDING TO COMPLAINT LETTERS
22 WHICH YOU MIGHT ASK HOW DO YOU DEVELOP A LOVE OF TRANSIT BY
23 RESPONDING TO COMPLAINT LETTERS BUT IN READING PEOPLE'S
24 COMPLAINTS, I GOT VERY CURIOUS ABOUT WHY THINGS WORKED THE WAY
25 THEY DID AND WHAT I DISCOVERED WAS THAT AT MUNI WE HAD



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE WHO WORKED INCREDIBLY HARD EVERY DAY TO
2 BRING CREATIVE SOLUTIONS TO REALLY, REALLY CHALLENGING
3 CONDITIONS. IT INSTILLED IN ME DEEP RESPECT FOR THE AGENCY AS
4 WELL AS SERVICE IT PROVIDES AND SOMEBODY WHO WAS STRUGGLING
5 OUT OF SCHOOL I COULD TAKE MUNI AROUND SAN FRANCISCO AND LIVE
6 A FULL LIFE BECAUSE OF THE ACCESS I LOVE TRANSIT FOR 20 YEARS
7 NOW I'M HONORED TO BRING THAT REGARD FOR THE SYSTEM TO SERVE
8 TO THIS BODY LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU ALL.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER.

11

12 **PAT BURT:** BURT I'M PAT BURT I'M FROM PALO ALTO REPRESENTING
13 SANTA CLARA COUNTY CITIES ASSOCIATION OF 16 CITIES I GREW UP
14 IN SANTA CLARA VALLEY IS GILROY SUNNYVALE AND CUPERTINO I HAVE
15 A LIFE-LONG APPRECIATION OF OUR REGION I SERVED ON THE PALO
16 ALTO CITY COUNCIL FOR 14 YEARS AND THREE TERMS AS MAYOR AND
17 I'M PLEASED TO SERVE IN RECENT YEARS AND CONTINUE TO SERVE ON
18 VTA BOARDS AND CALTRAIN BOARDS. WHAT REALLY BROUGHT ME TO THIS
19 ORGANIZATION AND THOSE HAS BEEN MY PASSION FOR SUSTAINABILITY
20 AND HOW TRANSIT PLAYS SUCH A VITAL ROLE IN THE ECONOMIC AND
21 SOCIAL EQUITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL ASPECTS OF HOW WE HAVE A
22 SUSTAINABLE REGION. AND, SO, I'M REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO
23 JOINING ALL OF YOU ON THIS BOARD.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RAMOS?



1
2 **BELIA RAMOS:** GOOD MORNING. THAT TITLE FEELS REALLY AWKWARD. I
3 REALLY LIKE BEING CALLED MADAM PRESIDENT IN THESE HALLS. I
4 COME TO YOU AS THE PRESIDENT OF THE ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA
5 GOVERNMENTS, THE OTHER HALF HERE TO THE BAY METRO CENTER,
6 WHICH -- AND WHEN I REFLECT UPON IT'S A LITTLE STRANGE. I'M
7 SEEING EVERYONE IN A VERY DIFFERENT CAPACITY TODAY. BUT IT IS
8 A LONG TIME COMING. ABAG'S PRESIDENT HAS NOT SAT ON THE
9 COMMISSION FOR FIVE YEARS. AND WITH THE INTERSECTION BETWEEN
10 HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION AND WHAT WE HOPE TO BRING OUR
11 ASPIRATIONAL PLANS TO LIFE, IT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT THAT I
12 SIT HERE EVERY DAY TO REMIND ALL OF US EXACTLY WHAT FORMER
13 MAYOR LIBBY SCHAAF SAID THAT HOUSING IS MOST DEFINITELY
14 INTEGRAL INTO EVERY DECISION THAT WE MAKE THAT WE MAKE SURE WE
15 KEEP ALL OF OUR DECISIONS PEOPLE-CENTERED. HAD THE OPPORTUNITY
16 TO COMMUTE WITH OUR NEXT COLLEAGUE THAT YOU WILL MEET AND THAT
17 IS BECAUSE FOR THE FIRST TIME EVER NAPA COUNTY WHERE I COME
18 FROM BORN AND RAISED HAS TWO COMMISSIONERS ON THIS DAIS. THAT
19 HAS NEVER HAPPENED BEFORE. WE HAVE DECIDED THAT WE REALLY LIKE
20 THIS HISTORY MAKING STUFF AND WE'RE JUST GOING TO KEEP IT
21 GOING WE HAVE ALL FEMALE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS ONLY SECOND IN
22 THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. WHAT I WANT TO IMPRESS UPON EVERYONE
23 IS THE IMPORTANCE OF US SITTING HERE AND FOR ME TO HAVE THE
24 DUAL ROLE OF ABAG AND A COMMISSIONER, IS THAT WE HAVE COME A
25 LONG WAY. MY FIRST DAY AT ABAG WAS THE VOTE ON WHETHER WE



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 WOULD PLAY NICE AND LIVE IF A BUILDING TOGETHER. AND THAT WAS
2 YEARS AGO, DOWN IN OAKLAND, AND HERE WE ARE. SO, I WOULD JUST
3 SAY I VERY MUCH LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH THE CHAIR AND
4 MAKING SURE THAT WE CONTINUE TO MOVE OUR COLLECTIVE GOVERNANCE
5 FORWARD. WE HAVE MADE GREAT STRIDES IN THE LAST SIX YEARS. WE
6 HAVE FEW BRUISES TO SHOW FOR IT BUT I LOOK FORWARD TO MAKING
7 SURE WE BRING ABAG AND THE COMMISSION AS CLOSELY TOGETHER AND
8 ALIGNED AS POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. THANK YOU. LAST BUT NOT LEAST. WE
11 MIGHT HAVE TO BREAK UP THE TWO NAPA PEOPLE AT SOME POINT.

12 [LAUGHTER]

13

14 **AMBER MANFREE:** MY NAME IS AMBER MANFREE DISTRICT SUPERVISOR
15 FOR NAPA COUNTY BACKGROUND IN GEOGRAPHY IN NATURAL RESOURCES
16 FOR 25 YEARS I DO CARTING ON FEE MAPPING LANDSCAPE ANALYSIS
17 AND MOST RECENTLY YEARS WORKING IN THE FIELD OF SUSTAINABLE
18 TRANSPORTATION. I THINK TRANSPORTATION IS ONE OF THOSE REALLY
19 SNEAKY LITTLE ISSUES WHERE YOU DON'T REALIZE HOW IMPORTANT IT
20 IS YOU DO UNTIL YOU FIND A PROBLEM YOU CAN'T SOLVE WITHOUT
21 WORKING ON TRANSPORTATION IF YOU'RE WORKING ON THE CLIMATE
22 CRISIS FIGURE.

23

24 **HOWARD WONG:** TO MAKE PEOPLE'S LIVES BETTER AND LIVABLE YOU
25 HAVE GOT TO FIX TRANSPORTATION SAFETY HUMAN HEALTH, FIX



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 TRANSPORTATION. EVERYTHING IS INTEGRAL IN OUR LIVES I'M
2 LOOKING FORWARD TO THE BODY REPRESENTING THE COUNTY BRINGING
3 COLLABORATIVE SPIRIT TO THE WORK I DO.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE TWO ONLINE. COMMISSIONER
6 GIACOPINI.

7

8 **DOREEN GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. I'M DOREEN G GIACOPINI. I HAVE
9 BEEN A COMMISSIONER SINCE SEPTEMBER OF 1995. I WAS BY FAR THE
10 YOUNGEST COMMISSIONER AT THAT POINT. AND I'M GUESSING I'M NOT
11 ANYMORE. [LAUGHTER] I REPRESENT USDOT, AND I HAVE REPRESENTED
12 USDOT SINCE, THROUGH THE CLINTON ADMINISTRATION. AND THE BUSH
13 ADMINISTRATION, AND THE OBAMA ADMINISTRATION, AND THE BIDEN
14 ADMINISTRATION, AND THERE WAS A PREVIOUS TRUMP ADMINISTRATION.
15 AND I HOPE TO BE AROUND LONGER, AND I HOPE -- I FEEL SO BAD
16 THAT I DON'T KNOW SO MANY OF MY COLLEAGUES BECAUSE I HAVEN'T
17 BEEN ABLE TO BE THERE IN-PERSON. AND I'M HOPING TO GET THERE
18 IN-PERSON IN THE NEAR FUTURE. I -- MY BACKGROUND IS I WAS A
19 TRANSPORTATION PERSON -- WELL, AFTER LAW SCHOOL, I WAS A
20 TRANSPORTATION PERSON FOR CONGRESSMAN NORMAN MINETA, AND AFTER
21 THAT I WAS AN EDUCATION ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE THEN A
22 SPECIAL EDUCATION MEDIATOR FOR MANY DECADES, AND I THINK THAT
23 IS IT. AND ALSO I'M CURRENTLY ON THE BOARDS DISABILITY RIGHTS
24 EDUCATION DEFENSE FUND, COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT
25 LIVING, AND BAY AREA OUTREACH AND RECREATION PROGRAM, WHICH IS



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 BOARD OF SPORTS AND REC, ADAPTIVE SPORTS AND RECREATION. AND I
2 HAVE ALWAYS FELT LIKE MY -- I FEEL LIKE I WAS ORIGINALLY
3 APPOINTED TO WORK WITH THE COMMISSION TO IMPLEMENT THE BRAND-
4 NEW AT THAT POINT-ALMOST, AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT AND
5 IT STILL NEEDS A LOT OF IMPLEMENTATION. THANK YOU. I LOOK
6 FORWARD TO MEETING A LOT OF YOU SOON.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. AND NOW NOT LAST BUT -- SORRY,
9 REBECCA. COMMISSIONER KAPLAN. YOU'RE UP.

10

11 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. GOOD MORNING. NO PROBLEM.
12 AND I'M SORRY I'M NOT THERE WITH YOU IN-PERSON TODAY BUT LOOK
13 FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO CONNECT. I'M REBECCA KAPLAN, I'M
14 HONORED TO BE CURRENTLY THE OAKLAND REPRESENTATIVE TO MTC. I
15 PREVIOUSLY SERVED ON THE BOARD OF AC TRANSIT AND HELPED LAUNCH
16 THE ALL-NIGHTER BUS NETWORK, WHICH WAS AN EXERCISE IN BEING
17 REGIONAL. AND, ALSO, WORK TOGETHER WITH THE BAY AREA AIR
18 DISTRICT WHICH I HAD ALSO SERVED ON AND THE ALAMEDA COUNTY
19 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WHICH I SERVED ON FOR 20 YEARS, TO
20 BRING ZERO-EMISSIONS TRUCKS TO THE BAY AREA. WE HAVE LAUNCHED
21 THE LARGEST ZERO-EMISSIONS TRUCK PROJECT IN NORTH AMERICA IN
22 PARTNERSHIP WITH A BUNCH OF AGENCIES. AND ON THE ALAMEDA
23 COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, WE WORKED TO BRING TOGETHER
24 ALL THE ALAMEDA COUNTY AGENCIES TO WRITE AND PASS WHAT I
25 BELIEVE WAS THE FIRST IN THE STATE, A FULL \$0.01



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 TRANSPORTATION SALES TAX TO FUND THINGS THROUGHOUT THE REGION.
2 I'M A BIG BELIEVER IN BEING REGIONABLE. I RECOGNIZE THAT THE
3 BAY AREA IS ONE ECONOMY, ONE COMMUTE SHED, ONE HOUSING MARKET,
4 AND ONE TRANSPORTATION CONGESTION RELIEF SITUATION THAT IF WE
5 ONLY TRY TO SOLVE IT IN ONE CITY WE WON'T SOLVE IT FOR ALL OF
6 US. SO, WE NEED TO DO IT TOGETHER, AND IT'S GREAT PLEASURE TO
7 BE HERE WITH ALL OF YOU. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I KNOW THAT TOOK A LITTLE BIT OF
10 TIME BUT I APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S INPUT I LEARNED STUFF ABOUT
11 PEOPLE THAT I HAVE KNOWN FOR A BIT.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC THAT
14 WANTS TO SPEAK ON THAT ITEM IF THAT'S ALL RIGHT WITH YOU?

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ALETA DUPREE, YOU MAY APPROACH THE
19 PODIUM. YOU WANT TO DO THE RESOLUTION? PARDON ME THANK YOU FOR
20 THE CORRECTION MISS DUPREE. BACK TO YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. AS A REMINDED FOR EVERYBODY STAFF
23 HAS DISTRIBUTED TO THE COMMITTEE SELECTION FORMAT OUTLINING
24 THE COMMITTEES RESPONSIBILITIES AND ENSURE YOUR SELECTIONS ARE
25 CONSIDERED PLEASE MARK YOUR CHOICES AND RETURN THE FORM TO



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 KIMBERLY NO LATER THAN FEBRUARY 28TH ASSIGNMENTS WILL BE
2 FINALIZED BY COMMISSION ACTION ON THE MARCH 26th COMMISSION
3 MEETING IN THE MEANTIME CURRENT COMMITTEE CHAIRS AND VICE
4 CHAIRS WILL REMAIN IN THEIR ASSIGNMENTS FOR THE MARCH
5 COMMITTEE MEETINGS. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 6A. RIGHT NO PUBLIC
6 COMMENT, RIGHT? I DON'T WANT TO MESS THAT UP, WHICH IS MTC
7 RESOLUTION, NUMBER 4693, RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION FOR STATE
8 SENATOR NANCY SKINNER. NOW FORMER STATE SENATOR AS WELL AS
9 STATE ASSEMBLYMEMBER FORMER EAST BAY REGIONAL PARKS DIRECTOR
10 FORMER BERKELEY CITY COUNCIL MEMBER NANCY SKINNER AS IS
11 CUSTOMARY WHEN A COMMISSIONERS APPRECIATION IS SO DEEP AND
12 CITATIONS ARE NUMEROUS I WILL REFRAIN FROM READING THE WHOLE
13 RESOLUTION. WHEREAS FROM HER PERCH ATOP THE BUDGET AND REVIEW
14 COMMITTEE SKINNER PLAYED PISTOL ROLE IN DRAFTING 2023 PASSAGE
15 OF SENATE BILL 125 TO PROVIDE STATE SUPPORT FOR CALIFORNIA
16 TRANSIT AGENCIES OPERATIONS IN THE AFTERMATH OF COVID-19
17 PANDEMIC AND DWINDLING AVAILABILITY OF FEDERAL EMERGENCY FUNDS
18 AND WHEREAS THROUGHOUT LEGISLATIVE CAREER CHAMPIONED THE THREE
19 P'S OF HOUSING, PRODUCTION OF NEW HOMES OF ALL TYPES,
20 PRESERVATION OF EXISTING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, AND THE
21 PROTECTION OF VULNERABLE RENTERS FROM DISPLACEMENT. AND
22 WHEREAS DUE TO HER ABILITY AND DETERMINATION TO FOCUS ON
23 ACHIEVABLE GOALS, SENATOR SKINNER IS WIDE HE RECOGNIZED AS AN
24 EXPERT NEGOTIATOR A TOWN FOR WHICH THE FOURTH BOAR OF THE
25 CALDECOTT TUNNEL PROVIDES CONCRETE EVIDENCE -- BAD PUN THERE -



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 - EARLY IN ASSEMBLE HE CAREER NEGOTIATED VARIOUS MITIGATIONS
2 INCLUDING TRAFFIC SIGNALS ALONG TOLL ROADS AS WELL AS BICYCLE
3 AND PEDESTRIAN SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS IN BERKELEY AND OAKLAND TO
4 SETTLE LAWSUITS BROUGHT BY AGAINST CALTRANS BY INTEREST GROUPS
5 NOTWITHSTANDING EFFORTS AS A MEMBER OF THE ASSEMBLY TO
6 DISCOURAGE THIS BODY FROM LOCATING TO SAN FRANCISCO STAFF AND
7 COMMISSIONERS OF MTC THANK COMMISSIONER SKINNER FOR YEARS OF
8 SERVICE TO THE PEOPLE OF BERKELEY EAST BAY, BAY AREA AND STATE
9 OF CALIFORNIA HONOR SUPPORT FOR HOUSING OF ALL TYPES INCLUDING
10 ADUS AND TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT ADMIRES SERIOUSNESS WITH
11 PURPOSE SHE PURSUED PUBLIC POLICY GOALS AND CELEBRATE THE BOLD
12 COLORS AND SPLENDOR WHICH GRACED THE STATE CAP TAN AND EXTEND
13 BEST WISHES TO HER GOOD TIMES HEALTHY AND SAFE TRAVELS ON FOOD
14 BIKE OR ANY MODE SHE CHOOSE THRILLED YOU CAN BE WITH US HERE
15 TODAY ARE THERE ANY VALEDICTORY WORDS YOU MIGHT WISH TO GIVE
16 TO THE COMMISSION?

17

18 **NANCY SKINNER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD SAY THAT I'M A
19 LITTLE -- GOTTEN A LITTLE LESS USED TO THE ACCOLADES,
20 OBVIOUSLY AT THE POINT IN MY TERM IN THE SENATE ENDING THERE
21 WERE A NUMBER OF EVENTS AND SUCH FOR HONOR AND I WILL OWN THIS
22 APPRECIATION BUT IT'S OFTEN SOMETIMES HARD TO -- WE'LL JUST
23 SAY I DO APPRECIATE IT. AND I LOVED THE SARTORIAL REFERENCE.
24 [LAUGHTER] YES. TRANSIT, PUBLIC TRANSIT, WALKING,
25 ACCESSIBILITY, AND NOT BEING CAR DEPENDENT HAS BEEN SOMETHING



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 THAT -- SO, I GREW UP IN SOCAL, IN A SUBURB OF LA THAT WAS
2 VERY HILLY. MY MOTHER DID NOT DRIVE, BELIEVE IT OR NOT, AND MY
3 FATHER'S BUSINESS WAS IN THE TOWN. SO, AND THERE WAS NO
4 TRANSIT, WHATSOEVER. SO, GROWING UP, I FELT CLAUSTROPHOBIC. I
5 FELT MY WORLD WAS SO SMALL, I ENDED UP GOING TO UC BERKELEY
6 RIGHT AROUND THE TIME BART OPENED AND ALL OF A SUDDEN MY WORLD
7 WAS OPEN, AC TRANSIT, BART I COULD GO ANYWHERE I DID NOT NEED
8 A CAR. BERKELEY IS A WALKABLE TOWN, DEPENDING ON WHERE YOU
9 LIVE BUT I HAVE ALWAYS CHOSE TONE LIVE WHERE I HAVE ACCESS TO
10 TRANSIT VERY NEARBY, AND ACTUALLY MY HOUSE IS EQUIDISTANT FROM
11 THE NORTH BERKELEY BART STATION CENTRAL DOWNTOWN AND I AM ABLE
12 TO WALK TO ANYTHING I NEED AND I MADE THAT CHOICE NOW FOR 50
13 YEARS TO BE SOMEWHERE WHERE I HAD THAT KIND OF ACCESSIBILITY
14 AND DID NOT HAVE TO BE CAR DEPENDENT. I VERY MUCH VALUE MTC
15 AND OF COURSE I VERY EARLY ON UNDERSTOOD -- THE LAND USE
16 HOUSING AND TRANSIT CONNECTION AND ALSO THE CRISIS OF CLIMATE
17 AND HOW OUR CAR DEPENDENCY WHICH WAS MUCH BASED ON OUR LAND
18 USE DECISIONS BECAUSE AS YOU KNOW YOU CANNOT REALLY SUPPORT
19 GOOD TRANSIT IF YOU DON'T HAVE SOME -- IF YOU HAVE, YOU KNOW,
20 YOUR HOUSING IS SO FAR A FIELD FROM SERVICES, JOBS, SCHOOLS,
21 AND THE REST. AND OF COURSE, IF YOU HAVE A HOUSING SHORTAGE,
22 WHICH WE DO. SO, THOSE HAVE BEEN THE FOCUSES ADDRESSING THE
23 CLIMATE CRISIS, ADDRESSING THE HOUSING CRISIS, AND, OF COURSE,
24 SUPPORTING TRANSIT, HAVE BEEN SOME OF THE CORE FOCUSES OF MY
25 ENTIRE 14 YEARS IN THE STATE LEGISLATURE. NOW, I AM VERY



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 HONORED TO BE APPOINTED BY THE GOVERNOR, GOVERNOR NEWSOM TO
2 THE NEW STATE ENERGY COMMISSION, AND INTERESTINGLY, TO ALL OF
3 THIS, WE HAVE A HOUSING ROLE IN THAT WE SET THE CODES FOR
4 EFFICIENCY. WE HAVE A TRANSPORTATION RULE IN THAT WE'RE
5 RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL THE INFRASTRUCTURE TO MOVE US TO
6 TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION. AND MULTIPLE OTHER THINGS.
7 AND, SO, I'M REALLY HAPPY TO BE ABLE TO CONTINUE THE WORK,
8 SOME LEVEL OF THE WORK THAT I WAS ENGAGED IN, IN THE PAST. AND
9 I -- YOU ALL HAVE SOME VERY SERIOUS CHALLENGES. WE KNOW THAT
10 OUR TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN THE BAY AREA ARE STRUGGLING. AND WE
11 HAVE NOT HAD A RETURN TO WORK IN SO MUCH OF OUR TRANSIT, NOT
12 ALL OF IT, BUT MUCH OF IT WAS DEPENDENT ON THAT COMMUTER TO A
13 WORK OFFICE IN SPECIFIED LOCATIONS, WHICH THE PROJECTIONS I
14 SEE DON'T SEE, EVEN WITH THE ORDERS FROM VARIOUS ENTITIES, TO
15 PUT PEOPLE BACK INTO THE OFFICE -- I DON'T THINK WE'RE GOING
16 TO SEE A RETURN TO A FIVE DAYS IN THE OFFICE TYPE
17 CIRCUMSTANCE. SO WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BE NIMBLE AND THINK
18 ABOUT HOW DO WE GET OUR TRANSIT SUPPORTED, YOU KNOW, WITHOUT
19 THAT. AND OF COURSE THE -- I HAD THE PRIVILEGE OF SERVING AS
20 BUDGET CHAIR WHEN CALIFORNIA HAD A LOT OF SURPLUS. SO WHILE WE
21 HAD -- I MEAN, IT WAS UN-- I WAS NOT -- I COULD NOT UNDERSTAND
22 WHY WE HAD PEOPLE IN THE LEGISLATURE WHO DID NOT WANT TO
23 SUPPORT, BUDGETARILY, TRANSIT. BUT FORTUNATELY THERE WERE
24 ENOUGH OF US, AND WITH THE GOVERNOR'S SUPPORT, ALSO, WE WERE
25 ABLE TO PROVIDE SOME ASSISTANCE TO OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THE



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 BAY AREA, WHICH I'M VERY, VERY PROUD OF BEING ABLE TO DO. AND
2 I LOOK TO SENATOR WIENER WHO IS NOW THE BUDGET CHAIR AND MY --
3 THE PERSON THAT'S FILLED MY SEAT, SENATOR ARREGUIN, TO TRY TO
4 KEEP THAT STAY STRONG AND EVEN WITH, RIGHT NOW, THE STATE IS
5 FACING SOME REVENUE CHALLENGES, SO IT WILL BE DIFFICULT, BUT
6 HOPEFULLY YOU ALL WILL BE CREATIVE AND YOU WILL WORK WITH THEM
7 AND THEY WILL BE CREATIVE AND WE CAN GET PAST THIS AND WE CAN
8 CONTINUE TO HAVE THRIVING AND HEALTHY TRANSIT. THANK YOU SO
9 MUCH FOR HONORING ME. I GREATLY APPRECIATE IT, AND I LOOK
10 FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU IN DIFFERENT WAYS.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. [APPLAUSE] I'LL BE DOWN THERE IN
13 A SECOND TO HAND YOU THAT. NANCY, THANK YOU FOR YOUR DEDICATED
14 -- WAIT. WAIT. DON'T TAKE A PICTURE. I'LL COME DOWN.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SHE'S GOING TO COME DOWN AND TAKE A
17 PICTURE. [LAUGHTER]

18

19 **SPEAKER:** A LITTLE BIT CENTER.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I ASKED NANCY NOT TO GO ANYWHERE BECAUSE I'M
22 GOING TO INVITE OTHERS TO SPEAK IT'S FANTASTIC THERE ARE
23 COMMISSIONERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COMMENT? COMMISSION
24 ARE SCHAFF?

25



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** I HAVE HAD THE AMAZING PRIVILEGE OF HAVING
2 SENATOR SKINNER AS MY SENATOR. AND IT JUST CANNOT BE UNDER
3 SCORED WHAT YOUR BOLD -- I MEAN, FRANK HE, WE JUST SAY BAD AS
4 LEADERSHIP HAS ACCOMPLISHED NOT JUST FOR YOUR CONSTITUENTS,
5 BUT FOR YOUR DISTRICT INDEED FOR THIS REGION AND STATE OF
6 CALIFORNIA YOUR LEADERSHIP EVEN PRIOR TO BEING ELECTED IN
7 OFFICE ON CLIMATE AND REALLY BEING A COMPREHENSIVE AND
8 INTEGRATED THINKER ABOUT HOW ALL DIFFERENT SYSTEMS WORK
9 TOGETHER IS TRULY INSPIRATIONAL AS A VISIONARY LEADER, AND
10 YOUR ABILITY TO GET SHIT DONE -- SORRY. I KNOW. I GOT TO STOP
11 THIS. [LAUGHTER] YOU BRING IT OUT. I'LL ALSO SAY, AS A WOMAN
12 ELECTED OFFICIAL, YOU ARE A ROLE MODEL FOR COUNTLESS
13 GENERATIONS THAT ASPIRE TO HAVE YOUR EFFECTIVENESS IN OFFICE.
14 THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY OTHERS? COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?

17

18 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** GOOD MORNING NANCY SKINNER WHO WAS OUR
19 SENATOR FOR ALL THOSE YEARS WHEN WE WERE IN SENATE, YOUR
20 LEADERSHIP, ECHO EVERYTHING LIBBY SCHAFF SAID I APPRECIATED
21 YOU ALWAYS LISTENED, AND CAME UP WITH SUCH CREATIVE SOLUTIONS
22 AND ALWAYS BEING THE NORTH STAR BEING THAT WE CANNOT LOOK AWAY
23 FROM THE CLIMATE CHALLENGE AND HOUSING AND LAND USE PLANNING
24 AND AS LIBBY SAID, YOU ARE A WONDERFUL ROLE MODEL FOR YOUNG
25 WOMEN AND GIRLS AT A TIME WHEN IT IS CHALLENGING TO BE IN



1 ELECTIVE OFFICE BUT I REALLY DID FOLLOW YOU FROM THE TIME YOU
2 WERE ON THE EAST BAY REGIONAL PARKS DISTRICT WORD AND YOU HAVE
3 JUST SERVED YOUR PEOPLE, YOUR COMMUNITIES, AND THE STATE OF
4 CALIFORNIA SO WELL FOR ALL THESE YEARS. SO, THANK YOU SO MUCH,
5 AND I LOOK FORWARD TO OUR PATHS CONTINUING TO CROSS.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSON?

8

9 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** NANCY, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. YOU DIDN'T EVER
10 GET TO REPRESENT MY END OF CONTRA COSTA COUNTY BUT YOU DID AN
11 EXCELLENT JOB REPRESENTING OUR WEST END OF THE COUNTY AND I
12 KNOW THE ADVOCACY FOR US ON MANY IMPORTANT ISSUES IN CONTRA
13 COSTA COUNTY HAS BEEN INVALUABLE AND I TRULY APPRECIATE YOUR
14 LEADERSHIP. THANK YOU.

15

16 **NANCY SKINNER. THANK YOU.**

17

18 **>>GINA PAPAN:** VICE CHAIR?

19

20 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SENATOR THANK YOU FOR YOUR
21 LEADERSHIP ON ALL OF THESE ISSUES FROM THE NORTH BAY ACROSS
22 THE BAY WE APPRECIATE IT. I SHARE YOUR SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
23 HERITAGE WHERE TRAFFIC WAS A WAY OF LIFE, AND LIKE YOU I
24 ADMIRE BART AND THAT WAS ONE OF THE REASONS I CHOSE TO GO TO



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 COLLEGE IN THE BAY AREA FROM THE OPPOSITE SCHOOL AT THE BIG
2 GAME.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I AM WEARING BLUE.

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I NOTICED THAT AND I'M NOT WEARING
7 RED. [LAUGHTER] I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR BLAZING A TRAIL ON ALL
8 OF THESE ISSUES AND WE WILL FOLLOW IN YOUR FOOTSTEPS ON THIS
9 BOARD. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY OTHERS? GREAT. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC
12 COMMENT? NANCY WANTS TO COMMENT.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YOU CERTAINLY CAN'T FAULT ME FOR REPRESENTING MY
15 CONSTITUENTS IN THE WHOLE EAST BAY IN FIGHTING FOR THE
16 RETENTION OF MTC IN THE EAST BAY.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** [LAUGHTER]

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
21 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM AND I SEE NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE THERE
22 HAND RAISED AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU, AGAIN, VERY MUCH. OH I
25 ACTUALLY NEED A MOTION. THANK YOU. I NEED A MOTION TO --



1

2 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** MOVED.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECOND.

5

6 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** ASHCRAFT MOVED.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO

9 ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION 4693. CAN WE HAVE A ROLL CALL VOTE,

10 PLEASE?

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. PARDON ME. GET MYSELF TOGETHER. ALL

13 RIGHT. COMMISSION ARE ABE-KOGA?

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

18

19 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSON?

22

23 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?



1

2 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

5

6 **PAT BURT:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSION ARE CANEPA WAS A

9 YES. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

14

15 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

18

19 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

22

23 **MATT MAHAN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MANFREE?



1

2 **AMBER MANFREE: YES.**

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MASHBURN?**

5

6 **MITCH MASHBURN: AYE.**

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MELGAR?**

9

10 **MYRNA MELGAR: AYE.**

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?**

13

14 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.**

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?**

17

18 **GINA PAPAN: YES.**

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS?**

21

22 **BELIA RAMOS: YES.**

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS**

25 **PRESENT.**



1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM 6B AND
3 THIS IS A RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION FOR COMMISSIONER NICK
4 JOSEFOWITZ ON THE OCCASION OF HIS DEPARTURE FROM MTC SHALL WE
5 GO FORWARD WITH THAT ANYWAY AND PRESENT AT A LATER TIME?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** YES.

8

9 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** LAST MONTH'S MEETING WAS HAS LIST ON THE
10 COMMISSION I WANT TO SHARE THE RESOLUTION UNDER CONSIDERATION.
11 WHEREAS NICK JOSEFOWITZ STEPPED DOWN FROM THE METROPOLITAN
12 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AFTER EIGHT YEARS OF DEDICATE
13 SERVICE AS THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO'S MAYOR'S
14 REPRESENTATIVE AND WHEREAS DURING HIS TIME ON THE COMMISSION
15 NICK SERVED ON THE GOVERNING BOARD FOR THE BAY AREA REGIONAL
16 COLLECTIVE BOARD OF DIRECTORS FOR SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA WATER
17 EMERGENCY TRANSPORTATION AUTHOR AND EVIDENTLY LAUNCHING
18 PROFOUND SKEPTICISM IN THE MERITS OF INCREASING INVESTMENT AND
19 SERVICE AMID COMPETING TRANSIT NEEDS WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO
20 READ WHEN HE'S HERE. WHEREAS MANAGING A COMPANY FOCUSED ON
21 DEVELOPING SOLAR ENERGY PLANTS AND FOUNDING NON-PROFIT TO
22 ADVOCATE ON BEHALF OF POLITICAL CANDIDATES WHO SUPPORT CLEAN
23 ENERGY BEFORE SEEKING AND WINNING ELECTION IN 2014 TO THE BART
24 BOARD OF DIRECTORS. AND WHEREAS NICK REINFORCES CLEAN ENERGY
25 AND SUSTAINABILITY BONA FIDES BY PEDALING HIS BICYCLE TO



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 COMMISSION MEETINGS AND CHAMPIONS VISION ON ZERO. NICK PLAYS A
2 LEAD ROLE IN CRAFTING THE LANDMARK TRANSIT ORIENTED
3 COMMUNITIES POLICY ADOPTED BY MTC IN 2022 TO BOOST THE BAY
4 AREA'S HOUSING SUPPLY AND INCREASE RESIDENTIAL DENSITIES IN
5 TRANSIT-RICH AREAS AND FOSTER COMMUNITIES WHERE PEOPLE OF ALL
6 INCOME LEVELS RACIAL AND ETHNIC BACKGROUNDS AGES AND ABILITIES
7 ABILITY LEVELS CAN LIVE, WORK AND THRIVE. WHEREAS IN ADDITION
8 TO HIS POWERFUL ADVOCACY FOR CLARITY IN APPLICATION OF THE
9 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY, NICK INTRODUCED HOUSING
10 COMPLIANCE PROVISIONS FOR THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM. AND
11 WHEREAS IN HIS UNFLAGGING PROMOTION OF BUS TRANSIT WALKING
12 BIKES AND SHARED MOBILITY NICK NEVER MISSED OPPORTUNITY TO
13 QUESTION AND OFFER CLIMATE FRIENDLY CRITICS OF COMMISSION
14 PROPOSALS AND PROGRAM FUNDS OTHERWISE SUPPORT OF FREEWAY
15 EXPANSION MUCH ANY KIND OF THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED STAFF AND
16 COMMISSIONERS OF MTC THANK NICK FOR YEARS OF SERVICE,
17 TENACIOUS PURSUIT OF PEOPLE PLANET FRIENDLY POLICIES
18 CONGRATULATE HIM ON HIS NEW JOB AND WISH HIM AND HIS FAMILY
19 MANY HAPPEN VENDORS IN THE FUTURE. I'M NOT GOING TO INVITE HIM
20 TO SHARE COMMENTS HOPEFULLY WE'VE WE CAN DO THAT LATER WHEN HE
21 IS ABLE TO JOIN US AND ALSO WILL HOLD OFF ON COMMISSIONER
22 COMMENTS UNTIL HE'S PRESENT AS WELL. IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENTS?
23



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO
2 ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE ALETA DUPREE WOULD LIKE TO GIVE COMMENT
3 GO AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM. TWO MINUTES, MADAM CHAIR?

4
5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

6
7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU GOT IT.

8
9 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD
10 SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. I'LL OFFER COMMENTS ON ALL OF THE
11 CHAIR'S REPORT. FIRST OF ALL, I'M FORTUNATE TO HAVE MET NICK
12 AT A BART BOARD MEETING ABOUT EIGHT YEARS AGO. I ALWAYS
13 ENJOYED NICK'S THOUGHTFUL, WELCOMING MINDSET, AND JUST ALL
14 THINGS THAT HE DID AT BART AND HERE. AND DEFINITELY GOING TO
15 MISS NICK. I DIDN'T EXPECT NICK TO MOVE ON, BUT I WISH NICK
16 WELL, AND LOOK FORWARD TO HEAR WHAT HE'S GOING TO DO NEXT.
17 IT'S GOOD TO HEAR ALL OF YOUR INTRODUCTIONS. AS MANY OF YOU I
18 DON'T KNOW. SOME OF YOU HAVE NEVER MET ME, MAYBE YOU HAVE
19 HEARD ME SPEAK. AND I'M JUST AN ORDINARY USER OF PUBLIC
20 TRANSPORTATION. DON'T HAVE LONG-STANDING TIME HERE IN THE BAY
21 AREA. BUT I WAS INTRODUCED TO PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IN EARLY
22 1970 IN THE 34TH STREET 8TH AVENUE STATION OF THE NEW YORK
23 CITY SUBWAY, WHICH I AM SURE SOME OF YOU HAVE GOTTEN TO SEE,
24 AND IT WAS THERE THAT I BEGAN MY 55 YEAR JOURNEY OF ENJOYING
25 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. HOPEFULLY I'LL GO TO NEW YORK REAL SOON



1 AND USE THE SUBWAY. BECAUSE MY BIRTHDAY IS COMING UP AND I
2 WANT TO CELEBRATE THAT IN NEW YORK WITH FAMILY. AND, SO, TO
3 HEAR ALL OF YOU SHARE YOUR THOUGHTS, AND ABOUT WHAT BRINGS YOU
4 HERE, AND I'M LEARNING NEW THINGS, IT'S ONLY JUST A FEW DAYS
5 AGO THAT I FLEW INTO THE SAN JOSE INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT. I
6 KNEW SAN JOSE HAD AN AIRPORT. IT'S A BIG CITY. BUT IT WAS
7 NEVER REALLY ON MY RADAR. IT -- IT'S A BUSY AIRPORT, AND I USE
8 THAT FREE NUMBER 60 BUS TO TAKE ME TO BART. SO I'M LEARNING
9 NEW THINGS. THIS COMES FROM YOU, IN PART. SO, THANK YOU FOR
10 SHARING. APPRECIATE IT.

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
15 RAISED HANDS.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. I NEED A MOTION AND A SECOND TO ADOPT
18 MTC RESOLUTION 4697.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

23

24 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ALL RIGHT MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE
25 PLEASE?



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ANDERSON?

11

12 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PARDON ME. COMMISSIONER BURT?

15

16 **PAT BURT:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING? COMMISSIONER JAN

23 BAPTIST?

24

25 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES.



1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MANFREE?

3

4 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR?

7

8 **MYRNA MELGAR:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS?

19

20 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

23 PRESENT.

24



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM SEVEN IS THE
2 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT IN THE ABSENCE OF COUNCIL CHAIR
3 AND VICE CHAIR STAFF HAS PROVIDED A WRITTEN REPORT IN YOUR
4 PACKETS ON BEHALF OF THE COUNCIL. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER
5 THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PARDON ME? YES, IS PRESENT. GOOD
8 MORNING.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH.

11

12 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS KY-NAM MILLER I
13 OF STAFF LIAISON FOR THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL PRESENTING IN
14 STAY OF LIEU OF THE ELECTED COUPLE LEADER, FULFILLING VACANCY
15 LEFT BY FORMER CHAIR PAMELA CAMPOS WHO SITS ON THE SAN JOSE
16 CITY COUNCIL LAST MONTH AFTER -- NEWLY ELECTED CHAIR IN SINGLE
17 CLOSE BUT DECISIVE VOTE AND THE NEW LEADER IS GOING TO BE
18 CARINA LIEU OF OAKLAND; SHE'LL CHAIR FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE
19 TERM ENDING DECEMBER 2025. AND ELECTED VICE CHAIR GABRIELLA
20 ORANTES, SONOMA COUNTY. NOTABLY, BOTH ARE NEW MOTHERS WITH
21 YOUNG CHILDREN UNDER THE AGE OF FIVE AND HAVE THEIR EYES
22 TOWARDS THE FUTURE OF THE BAY AREA WHERE KIDS WILL EXPERIENCE
23 THE BAY AREA IN THE 2050S THAT WE ARE WORKING FOR TODAY IN
24 MARCH THERE IS A COMBINATION OF NEW COMMISSIONERS LEADERSHIP
25 UNIFIED HISTORIC WOMEN'S LEADERSHIP ACROSS MTC. YESTERDAY, MTC



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 STAFF UPDATED THE COUNCIL ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
2 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, NOTING ACCOMPLISHMENTS SHIFT IN PUBLIC
3 OPINION AND PLANS FOR UNIFIED REALTIME TRANSIT SYSTEMS WITH
4 FOCUS ON PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND FEEDBACK. YESTERDAY ALSO IN
5 ADDITION TO REVIEWING THE COUNCIL WORKPLAN, MY COLLEAGUE
6 LEGISLATIVE DIRECTOR REBECCA LONG PRESENTED ON THE DRAFT
7 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE NOTING FEASIBILITY OF HALF CENT
8 SALES TAX TO PREVENT TRANSIT CUTS AND OTHER MEASURES TO ENSURE
9 FAIRNESS AND ACCOUNTABILITY, COUNCIL FEEDBACK HIGHLIGHTED NEED
10 FOR RELIABLE POLLING DATA ESPECIALLY IN THE NORTH BAY AND FAIR
11 REPRESENTATION OF DISABLED COMMUNITY STAFF RECENTLY PROVIDED
12 UPDATE ON YOUTH PROGRAMS HIGHLIGHTING FITZGERALD COLLEGE
13 MENTORSHIP PROGRAM HIGHLIGHTING 12 PARTICIPANTS THE DEPARTMENT
14 ACCEPTING APPLICANTS FOR NEXT SUMMER WITH EXPANDING FROM 12 TO
15 19 PARTICIPANTS NORMAN MINETA BAY AREA SUMMER ACADEMY ALSO SAW
16 SIGNIFICANT GROWTH THIS PAST YEAR ON ACCESSIBILITY AND PUBLIC
17 POLICY IMPACT WITH 233 STUDENTS COMMITTEE THE PROGRAM. WE HAD
18 PARTICIPATION FROM ALL NINE COUNTIES AND SPECIFICALLY STUDENTS
19 FROM DISABILITIES AND FROM LOW-INCOME TITLE ONE SCHOOLS THERE
20 ARE FLYERS YOU MAY HAVE SEEN PROMOTING THE HIGH SCHOOL PROGRAM
21 THEY'RE AVAILABLE IN THE HALL AND WILL BE E-MAILED AS
22 APPLICATIONS OPEN IN MARCH. ADDITIONALLY EACH SUMMER WE HAVE
23 HAD COMMISSIONERS SPEAK WITH HIGH SCHOOLERS INCLUDING SOME OF
24 YOU AT THE DAIS LAST SUMMER. WE HAD COMMISSIONER AHN AND
25 COMMISSIONER RAMOS, BUT IN HER CAPACITY AS MADAM PRESIDENT OF



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 ABAG, SPEAK WITH THE STUDENTS. AND IF ANY OF YOU ARE AT ALL
2 INTERESTED IN RELATING TO THE STUDENTS YOUR CAREER PATH AND
3 SUBJECTING YOURSELVES TO QUESTIONS FROM PRECOCIOUS HIGH
4 SCHOOLERS PLEASE CONTACT ME DIRECTLY MY E-MAIL WILL BE SHARED
5 WITH YOU IN A FOLLOW UP E-MAIL FROM EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
6 PREMIER. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS OR
9 QUESTIONS? NO? OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU. ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?
10 OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
13 WRITING. NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND NO HANDS ARE
14 RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** GREAT. MOVING ON TO AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, THE
17 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. MR. PREMIER?

18

19 **ANDREW PREMIER:** THANK YOU. AND CONGRATULATIONS TO THE NEW
20 LEADERSHIP, AND WELCOME TO EVERYBODY. I SUPPOSE I SHOULD
21 PROBABLY INTRODUCE MYSELF ANDREW PREMIER. I'M THE EXECUTIVE
22 DIRECTOR. THIS IS MY SECOND ANNIVERSARY ACTUALLY AS THE
23 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. BUT I HAVE BEEN ON THE EXECUTIVE TEAM FOR
24 CLOSE TO 20 YEARS. LIKE COMMISSIONER FROM SOLANO, MY FAMILY
25 HAS BEEN HERE SINCE THE GOLD RUSH. I MOVED UP NORTH NO 1988



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 AND HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THE BRIDGE BEHIND COMMISSIONER
2 GIACOPINI EVER SINCE. SO ONE DAY I WILL GET IT DONE AND I CAN
3 MOVE ON TO OTHER THINGS. THE BUT, WELCOME, AND I LOOK FORWARD
4 TO WORKING WITH YOU ALL. I'LL BE VERY QUICK WITH MY UPDATE.
5 THE ONE I WANTED TO MENTION FIRST WAS THE FACT THAT WE HAVE
6 ESTABLISHED AN EXECUTIVE TEAM TO REALLY MONITOR ALL OF THE
7 EXECUTIVE ORDERS AND WORK COMING OUT OF WASHINGTON DC TO MAKE
8 SURE WE'RE IN GOOD SHAPE AND CAN PROVIDE STRATEGIES FOR
9 RESPONSE. CLEARLY THE WORK HAPPENING IN DC IS AFFECTING THE
10 WORK WE DO AS WE GET A LOT OF FEDERAL MONEY BUT WE'RE WORKING
11 AS WE ALWAYS DO AT CONVENING OUR PARTNERS BOTH AT FEDERAL
12 LEVEL AND LOCALLY TO ENSURE WE'RE SHARING INFORMATION AND
13 BEING AS READY FOR WHATEVER CHALLENGES COME FORWARD AND WE
14 WILL KEEP YOU IN THE LOOP AS WE NAVIGATE WHATEVER COMES OUR
15 WAY IN THAT SPACE. I ALSO WANTED TO MENTION THAT ON FEBRUARY
16 7TH, WITH THE HELP OF THE WETA TEAM, WE TOOK ASSEMBLYMEMBER
17 BUFFY WICKS OUT ON A BOAT TOUR OF THE BAY BRIDGE. WE HAD
18 COMMISSIONERS EL-TAWANSY AND STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS WITH US.
19 WE TOOK A FEW REPORTERS THERE IS AN ARTICLE ATTACHED TO MY
20 REPORT THAT CAME OUT IN THE CHRONICLE IT WAS A GOOD
21 OPPORTUNITY TO SHOW HER THE CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE IT'S EASY
22 TO THINK ABOUT THE NEW BRIDGE BEHIND COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI AS
23 BEING TEN YEARS OLD BUT THE OLD BAY BRIDGE WEST BAY BRIDGE IS
24 ALMOST NINE. AND IT DOES REQUIRE QUITE A BIT OF CARE AND
25 ATTENTION AND WE INTEND TO KEEP THEM IN GOOD SHAPE LONG INTO



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 THE FUTURE. I WANT TO MENTION FEBRUARY 20TH ALONG WITH
2 COMMISSIONERS FLEMING, NOACK, AND MOULTON-PETERS, AND ALSO
3 FORMER COMMISSIONER DAVID RABBITT, WE WERE UP IN SANTA ROSA AT
4 THE DOWNTOWN TRANSIT MALL. IT'S OUR SECOND LOCATION WHERE WE
5 HAVE LAUNCHED THE REGIONAL MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROJECT
6 WORK. IT WAS WELL-RECEIVED BY OF THE COMMUNITY. AND WE REALLY
7 DO LOOK FORWARD TO MAKING SURE THAT THOSE STATIONS REALLY
8 START TO SHOW UP AND ALLOW US TO WORK ON MORE SEAMLESS
9 TRANSPORTATION OPPORTUNITIES IN CONCERT WITH THE MEASURE THAT
10 WE'LL BE TALKING ABOUT TODAY. FINAL I WANTED TO MENTION ON
11 FEBRUARY 14TH THE CALIFORNIA STATE SENATE HONORED FORMER
12 COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING ON HIS 30 YEARS OF PUBLIC SERVICE.
13 THERE IS A QUOTE FROM SENATOR CORTESE SAYING THAT JIM WAS A
14 PEACE MAKER SOME MIGHT CALL HIM A DEAL MAKER I THINK WE ALL
15 DEEPLY APPRECIATE THE WORK TO MAKE MORE ACCESSIBLE AS WELL
16 SPACE HE HAD FOR COMMUNITY VOICES IN THE REGION WE CERTAINLY
17 ARE GOING TO MISS HIM THERE IS A NICE DISTRIBUTE AND A LINK TO
18 THAT AS WELL I'M SURE YOU'RE GOING TO SEE MR. SPERING POP-UP
19 HERE AND THERE WHETHER YOU LIKE IT OR NOT. THAT'S MY REPORT.
20 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS? NO? OKAY.
23 THANK YOU. ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED --



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** KIMBERLY IS GIVING ME THIS EYE EVERY TIME TO
3 MAKE SURE I DON'T MISS THIS. THANK YOU. THE I APPRECIATE THAT.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOUR WELCOME. [LAUGHTER] HAPPY TO GIVE
6 YOU THE EYE. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO MEMBER OF
7 THE PUBLIC HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM -- EXCUSE ME -- WE HAVE
8 ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC SORRY I OVERLOOKED YOU MISS DUPREE.
9 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR AND MEMBERS ALETA DUPREE FOR
12 THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS REALLY GOOD REPORT I
13 ALWAYS ENJOY ANDY'S MEANINGFUL AND HMM REPORTS. IT'S GOODS
14 WE'RE STAYING ENGAGED IN THESE CHALLENGING TIMES. I WANT TO
15 MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE GET EVERY PENNY OF FEDERAL MONEY THAT WE
16 ARE LEGALLY ENTITLED TO GET AND MAKE SURE WE KEEP IT AND DO
17 THE THINGS WE NEED TO DO. THE AND I HOPE TO GET TO SEE THE NEW
18 WAYFINDING INSTALLATION THAT WAS JUST MENTIONED. I HAVE BEEN
19 TO A NUMBER OF THE PRESENTATIONS. I WANT TO SEE THOSE NEW
20 SIGNS. AND THEY HAVE THE COLORS OF TEAM FOLDS. I'M REALLY
21 EXCITED ABOUT THAT. AND THE BRIDGES CAN NEVER BE UNDER
22 ESTIMATED. I WENT OVER THE BAY BRIDGE TODAY ON THE BUS. I DO
23 IT ALL THE TIME. AND I DID SEE IN THE PACKET AN ARTICLE THAT
24 WAS WRITTEN FOR THE CHRONICLE ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF OUR
25 BRIDGES. 88 YEARS OLD. THAT IS THE WEST SIDE OF THE BAY



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 BRIDGE, CALL IT 90. THAT WE HAVE TO KEEP UP WITH THAT. I HAVE
2 -- WHAT THIS WOULD PLACE BE LIKE WITHOUT THE BAY BRIDGE? IT
3 WOULD BE REALLY HARD. WHEN WE HAD THE CONSTRUCTION CONNECTING
4 THE NEW SPAN, THE BAY BRIDGE WAS OUT FOR SEVERAL DAYS. IT WAS
5 HARD. I DON'T KNOW THAT I WAS HERE AT THE TIME. SO, THANK YOU
6 FOR THE GOOD REPORT. LET'S STAY ENGAGED. BECAUSE NO MATTER
7 WHAT IS HAPPENING OUT THERE, WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE KEEP
8 EVERYTHING GOING HERE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
13 RAISED HANDS, MADAM CHAIR.

14

15 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY THANK YOU. I DID WANT TO ADD ONE
16 COMMENT. I WAS UP IN SANTA ROSA WITH STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS,
17 AND THE SIGNS WERE REALLY VERY IMPRESSIVE I THOUGHT. THE WALK
18 WAS A LITTLE FAR FROM THE RAIL STATION, I WAS IN A BOOT SO
19 DON'T RECOMMEND THAT BUT OTHERWISE THE SIGNS ARE IMPRESSIVE
20 AND REALLY PULLED EVERYTHING TOGETHER. AND SO IF PEOPLE GET A
21 CHANCE TO GET UP TO SANTA ROSA OR PASS BY I WOULD STOP AND
22 TAKE A LOOK. IT WAS IMPRESSIVE. DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD?

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** JUST SAY THANKS TO STAFF FOR A WELL
25 PLANNED EVENT GORDON DID A GREAT JOB AND SAME WITH OUR EARLIER



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 TOUR WITH OUR ASSEMBLYWOMAN VERY INFORMATIVE I LEARNED A LOT
2 THANK YOU FOR PUTTING THAT TOGETHER.

3

4 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MOVING TO AGENDA NINE, WHICH IS COMMISSIONER
5 COMMENTS. ARE THERE COMMISSIONERS THAT HAVE ANY COMMENTS THEY
6 WOULD LIKE TO MAKE? NO? ITEM TEN IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

7 INCLUDES ITEMS TEN A THROUGH 10I. ANYBODY HAVE A COMMENT OR
8 WANT TO PULL ANYTHING? OTHERWISE I'LL LOOK FOR A MOTION. THANK
9 YOU. THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. DID YOU GET --

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I GOT THE MOTIONER AS ANDERSEN. AND THE
12 SECOND?

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** SECOND IS MELGAR.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY COMMISSIONERS, ANY COMMENTS ON THIS? ANY
19 PUBLIC COMMENTS?

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
22 THIS ITEM NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND NO HANDS RAISED
23 IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

24



1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IS THERE SOMEBODY -- OKAY. JUST WANTED TO
2 MAKE SURE THERE WASN'T SOMEBODY COMING UP.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I APPRECIATE THAT.

5

6 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSON?

17

18 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT? SOME.

21

22 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

25



1 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

8

9 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

12

13 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

16

17 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MANFREE?

20

21 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN? MILEY? IS ABSENT. NOACK?

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS?

7

8 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
11 PRESENT.

12

13 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU ON TO COMMITTEE REPORTS.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOUR MICROPHONE IS TURNED OFF.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** I LEFT IT ON THE ENTIRE TIME.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** IF FIVE MICROPHONES ARE ON AT ONE TIME
20 IT WILL TURN THEM ALL OFF.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. I NEVER LEFT IT ON THAT LONG
23 BEFORE. AGENDA ITEM 11 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS. IN THE
24 ABSENCE OF COMMITTEE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR I'LL GIVE THE REPORT
25 AS FOLLOWS. THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 FEBRUARY 12TH, 2025 AND REFERRED EIGHT ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION
2 FOR APPROVAL FIVE OF WHICH WERE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR AND
3 THE OTHER THREE ARE AS FOLLOWS. AGENDA ITEM 11A MTC RESOLUTION
4 4688 WOULD APPROVE FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026 FUND ESTIMATE AND
5 PROPOSED APPORTIONMENT AND DISTRIBUTION OF APPROXIMATELY 1
6 BILLION IN TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT LOCAL TRANSPORTATION
7 FUND STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE, STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAM,
8 ASSEMBLY BILL 1107 TRANSIT RELATED BRIDGE TOLL AND LOW CARBON
9 TRANSIT OPERATIONS PROGRAM FUNDS FOR FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026.
10 DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO ADOPT EMISSION RESOLUTION
11 NUMBER 4688?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONERS THAT WOULD
18 LIKE TO MAKE COMMENT ON THIS? NO? OKAY. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
19 WRITTEN COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
22 WRITING. NO HANDS RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS
23 APPROACHED THE PODIUM FOR THIS ITEM.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WONDERFUL. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.



1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

7

8 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

11

12 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** YES ASHCRAFT?

13

14 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

17

18 **PAT BURT:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

25



1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

4

5 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

8

9 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY? MOULTON-PETERS?

12

13 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS? LE.

16

17 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
20 PRESENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** MOVING TO 11B MTC RESOLUTION 4689 ADOPTS

23 FISCAL YEAR 20242025 PRODUCTIVITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

24 INCORPORATING SENATE BILL 125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES

25 FOR EMERGENCY TRANSIT FUNDING AND UPDATE ON OPERATOR PROGRESS



1 TOWARDS SENATE BILL 125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES. DO I
2 HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION 4689?

3

4 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** MOTION TO APPROVE. ABE-KOGA.

5

6 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** ASHCRAFT SECONDS.

7

8 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. IS THERE ANY
9 COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM BY COMMISSIONERS? NO? ALL RIGHT. IS
10 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
13 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM, NO HAND ARE RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE
14 AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM FOR THIS ITEM.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ONE MOMENT. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

23

24 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSON?

2

3 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ASHCRAFT?

6

7 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

10

11 **PAT BURT:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

22

23 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

5

6 **MATT MAHAN:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? MILEY IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

9

10 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

13

14 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS?

17

18 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
21 PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** AGENDA ITEM 11C MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4633
24 REVISED AND 4639 REVISED ADOPTED 2025 REGIONAL ACTIVE
25 TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM CYCLE SEVEN PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL
2 PROGRAM CYCLE ONE PROGRAM OF PROJECTS. WHOA. DO I HAVE A
3 MOTION AND SECOND TO ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 4633 REVISED
4 AND 4639 REVISED?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** SO MOVED.

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

9

10 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. YES, YOU GOT
11 THOSE NAMES?

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION BY CANEPA, SECOND BY ABE-KOGA?
14 THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES. I'LL START REPEATING THOSE LATER ON
17 WHEN I GET THE HANG OF EVERYBODY'S NAMES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENT ON THIS
22 ITEM? NO. PUBLIC COMMENTS?

23



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR
2 THIS ITEM NO ONE APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND NO HAND RAISED IN
3 THE ZOOM SPACE.

4

5 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

12

13 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSEN?

16

17 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN.

20 ASHCRAFT?

21

22 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

25



1 **PAT BURT:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

4

5 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

8

9 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

12

13 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

16

17 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

20

21 **MATT MAHAN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MANFREE?

24

25 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.



1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR?

3

4 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

11

12 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS?

19

20 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

23 PRESENT.

24



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WE'LL GO TO ITEM AGENDA
2 ITEM 12. AND COMMISSION ARE CANEPA WILL YOU GIVE THE REPORT
3 PLEASE?

4
5 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE JOINT MTC ABAG
6 LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET FEBRUARY 14TH, 2025 AND REFERRED
7 FIVE ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION ONE WAS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR
8 AND FOUR AS FOLLOWS AGENDA ITEM 12A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
9 REVENUE MEASURE POLLING RESULTS THE COMMITTEE RECEIVED A
10 PRESENTATION OF THE TRANSPORTATION POLL RELATED TO THE A
11 FUTURE REGION NAM TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE CONDUCTED IN
12 JANUARY BY EMC RESEARCH. THEIR PRESENTATION IS INCLUDED IN
13 YOUR PACKET AND STAFF WILL PROVIDE A HIGH-LEVEL OVERVIEW IN
14 THE NEXT ITEM. NO ACTION IS REQUIRED OF THIS COMMISSION FOR
15 THIS ITEM. AGENDA ITEM 12B, TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE
16 PRINCIPLES. THIS ITEM PROVIDES --

17
18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I'M SORRY. SORRY TO INTERRUPT YOU.

19
20 **DAVID CANEPA:** YEAH?

21
22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I FAILED TO PUT PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT
23 ITEM SPEAKING POINT. WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ALTHOUGH I HAVE
24 NOT RECEIVED ANY IN WRITING NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM
25 AND THERE ARE NO HAND RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE.



1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** THAT'S WHY YOU'RE OUR FAVORITE CLERK. THIS ITEM
3 PROVIDES LEGISLATIVE UPDATE REQUEST APPROVAL OF PRINCIPLES TO
4 GUIDE MTC ADVOCACY FOR NEIGHBORING LEGISLATION FOR A
5 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. STAFF WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

6

7 **ANDREW FREMIER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND WE LOVE OUR
8 CLERKS ALL THE SAME ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I WANT
9 TO GIVE CONTEXT TO THIS ITEM, ESPECIALLY FOR OUR NEWEST
10 COMMISSIONERS. AS YOU KNOW, SEVERAL OF THE REGION'S MAJOR BAY
11 AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES BART, CALTRAIN, MUNI, AND AC TRANSIT
12 COLLECTIVELY FACE AN ANNUAL OPERATING DEFICIT BETWEEN 500 TO
13 \$800 MILLION. AND THAT BEGINS IN FISCAL YEAR '27, WHICH IS
14 JUST 17 MONTHS AWAY. SINCE THE ONSET OF THE PANDEMIC IN MARCH
15 2020 MTC HAS SUCCESSFULLY LED ADVOCACY EFFORTS TO SECURE NEW
16 FEDERAL AND STATE FUNDING TO SUSTAIN TRANSIT SERVICE THAT
17 THOSE FUNDS ARE RUNNING OUT. TRANSIT IS VITAL TO MTC'S VISION
18 TO SUSTAIN AN EQUITABLE PROSPEROUS REGION IT'S KEY TO OUR
19 ECONOMY, QUALITY OF LIFE, HOUSING AFFORDABILITY, AND AS WELL
20 FOR CLIMATE PROTECTION AND AIR QUALITY, MUCH OF THE STUFF YOU
21 ALL TALKED ABOUT IN YOUR INTRODUCTIONS. TRANSIT IS A MUST HAVE
22 FOR MOST ECONOMICALLY VULNERABLE FAMILIES IN OUR REGION AS
23 WELL AS FOR SENIORS AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES LAST YEAR WE
24 PURSUED ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
25 MEASURE AT THAT TIME IT STALLED THE AT THE TIME THE MTC STOOD



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 UP THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE REALLY
2 TO FORGE CONSENSUS A MEASURE THAT WOULD AVOID MAJOR SERVICE
3 CUTS ADVANCE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION TO ATTRACT NEW RIDERS AND
4 WIN SUPPORT IN SACRAMENTO AND AT THE BALLOT. THE PRINCIPLES
5 BEFORE YOU TODAY REALLY DO REFLECT A VERY NARROW AREA OF
6 CONSENSUS THAT EMERGED DURING THE SELECT COMMITTEE WORK AND
7 THE NUMEROUS 101'S FACILITATED BY THE SELECT COMMITTEE CHAIR
8 FORMER COMMISSIONER JIM SPERING AS WELL AS MANY STAKEHOLDER
9 MEETINGS CONVENED BY STAFF. OUR JANUARY POLL RESULTS ARE
10 SUMMARIZED AND THEY'RE INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET FOR THE PRIOR
11 ITEM. THEY AFFIRM THAT A MAJORITY OF BAY AREA VOTERS IN THE
12 FOUR COUNTIES, ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, AND SAN
13 MATEO WOULD SUPPORT A TEN OR 11 YEAR HALF CENT SALES TAX, AND
14 THERE WAS QUITE A BIT MORE INTEREST IN SAN FRANCISCO FOR MAYBE
15 TAXES THEMSELVES A LITTLE BIT MORE IN ORDER TO AVOID MAJOR
16 SERVICE CUTS. BUT THE TASK BEFORE THE COMMISSION REALLY NOW IS
17 TO UNIFY AROUND CORE PRINCIPLES AND DELIVER A BALLOT THAT
18 MEASURE THAT SUSTAINS VITAL TRANSIT SERVICE DELIVERS BETTER
19 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND INSPIRES MORE VOTERS AND TAXPAYER
20 CONFIDENCE AND TRANSIT SUCCEEDS AT THE BALLOT. SB63 WHICH IS
21 NOW A SPOT BILL WILL BE AMENDED IN MARCH SO IT CAN BE HEARD IN
22 THE SENATE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE, THE COMMISSION'S
23 ENDORSEMENT OF PRINCIPLES TODAY WILL ENABLE US TO EXPRESS OUR
24 PRIORITIES BEFORE THE FIRST AMENDMENTS ARE IN PRINT AND WITH
25 THAT I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO REBECCA LONG.



1
2 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU ANDY. REBECCA LONG DIRECTOR OF
3 LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC AFFAIRS. AS NOTED JANUARY POLL FOND
4 THAT MAJORITY OF LIKELY VOTERS IN ALAMEDA CONTRA COSTA SAN
5 FRANCISCO SAN MATEO COUNTY SUPPORTED TWO OF THE THREE
6 FRAMEWORKS TESTED AFTER HEARING ARGUMENTS FOR AND AGAINST 55%
7 OF VOTERS ACROSS COUNTIES SUPPORTED TEN-YEAR HALF CENT SALES
8 TAX AND MAJOR CUTS OPTION 11 YEAR -- THIRD FRAMEWORK WAS
9 TESTED IN ALL NINE COUNTIES AND THROUGH 44% AFTER MESSAGING 30
10 YEAR MEASURE TO RAISE FUNDS FOR HIGHWAY REPAIRS POTHOLE REPAIR
11 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN, AND COMBINATION HALF CENT SALES TAX
12 AND NINE FOOT PER SQUARE FOOT PARCEL TAX. BASED ON THE
13 RECOMMENDATIONS POLLING RESULTS AND LEGISLATION COMMITTEE'S
14 FEEDBACK STAFF HAVE RECOMMENDED ADOPTION OF SIX PRINCIPLES TO
15 GUIDE THE COMMISSION'S ADVOCACY. I'LL WALK THROUGH THOSE NOW.
16 NUMBER ONE, MEASURE MUST BE PASSABLE. WELL SOUNDS OBSTACLE BUT
17 WORK DONE TO DATE BOILS DOWN TO FOUR ELEMENTS. FIRST CAP SALES
18 TAX RATE TO HALF CENT THE UNLESS CLEAR POLITICAL SUPPORT FOR
19 HIGHER RATE WITHIN A GIVEN COUNTY POLLING INDICATES IT'S
20 VIABLE. SECOND, KEEP IT FOCUSED AND SIMPLE. THE MORE
21 COMPLICATED THE HARDER IT IS TO EXPLAIN WHICH HURTS SUPPORT.
22 THIRD, ESTABLISH A PATH FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE TO BE PLACED ON
23 THE BALLOT VIA CITIZEN INITIATIVE SO IT CAN BE PASSED BY
24 MAJORITY OF VOTERS. FOURTH, MTC'S ADVOCACY SHOULD BE ORIENTED
25 TOWARDS ENSURING SUPPORT FROM KEY CONSTITUENCIES. AND NUMBER



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 TWO, PRINCIPLE NUMBER TWO. THAT HAD A LOT OF SUBBULLETS.
2 [LAUGHTER]. MEASURE MUST PREVENT MAJOR TRANSIT SERVICE CUTS
3 FOR REGIONAL OPERATORS GIVEN THE ENORMOUS TRANSIT OPERATING
4 FUNDING GAPS FACING MULTI-COUNTY REGIONAL OPERATORS AND THE
5 CHALLENGE OF COBBLING TOGETHER SUPPLEMENTAL LOCAL FUNDING FOR
6 THOSE, THE FOCUS OF THE MEASURE NEEDS TO BE ON AVERTING MAJOR
7 SERVICE CUTS TO REGIONAL TRANSIT SERVICE. THAT SAID THE
8 MEASURE SHOULD PROVIDE FUNDING TO ALL LOCAL OPERATORS FACING
9 DEFICITS WITHIN THE MEASURE'S GEOGRAPHY. NUMBER THREE, MEASURE
10 MUST TAKE LOCAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING NEEDS INTO
11 CONSIDERATION. ONE OF THE MAJOR CONCERNS WE HAVE HEARD IS
12 ABOUT HOW A REGIONAL SALES TAX MEASURE COULD HURT EFFORTS TO
13 RENEW EXISTING COUNTY'S SALES TAX WHICH ARE SET TO EXPIRE
14 WITHIN THE NEXT TEN YEARS. THESE CONCERNS NEED TO CONSIDERED
15 WHEN DETERMINING DURATION OF A REGIONAL MEASURE. NUMBER FOUR,
16 MEASURE MUST ADVANCE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION BY DELIVERING
17 RIDER FOCUSED IMPROVEMENTS. BAY AREA VOTERS HAVE MADE CLEAR
18 THROUGH POLLING AND FOCUS GROUPS THAT THEY VALUE TRANSIT AND
19 WANT A FASTER CONVENIENT SAFER AND CLEANER SYSTEM. MUST FUND
20 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND OPERATIONS SHOULD COMPLY WITH
21 POLICIES TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE THAT ARE ADOPTED
22 THROUGH THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK IN ORDER TO BE
23 ELIGIBLE FOR FUNDS FROM THE MEASURE. NUMBER FIVE, MEASURE MUST
24 ENSURE FAIRNESS A REGIONAL MEASURE MUST BE CONSIDERED FAIR BY
25 ALL PARTICIPATING COUNTY AND TAXPAYERS NEED ASSURANCE THEY



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 WILL BENEFIT EQUITABLY FROM THE MEASURE. AND LAST BUT
2 CERTAINLY NOT LEAST THE MEASURE MUST INCLUDE MEANINGFUL
3 ACCOUNTABILITY PROVISIONS. THE LEGISLATION MUST APPROVE
4 OVERSIGHT OF TRANSIT AGENCY FINANCES AND INCENTIVIZE OPERATORS
5 TO MANAGE THEIR FINALIZED IN THE MOST EFFICIENT MANNER. SO,
6 THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION OF PRINCIPLES AND HAPPY TO
7 ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

8

9 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT.

10

11 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** BEFORE WE GO ON, I WANT TO MAKE A COUPLE OF
12 COMMENTS, ESPECIALLY FOR NEW COMMISSIONERS HERE. THE SELECT
13 COMMITTEE WAS NOT ONLY A COMMITTEE OF COMMISSIONERS BUT THERE
14 ARE OTHER STAKEHOLDERS LABOR BUSINESS TRANSIT ADVOCATES THAT
15 WERE PART OF THIS SELECT COMMITTEE AND AS POINTED OUT WE
16 DIDN'T COME TO CONSENSUS ON A LOT OF ITEMS BUT THERE WAS
17 CONSENSUS AROUND THIS TEN-YEAR OR 11 YEAR TERM. AND REALLY THE
18 FOCUS ON SAVING TRANSIT, I THINK, WAS SUPER IMPORTANT. SO, WE
19 HAD SIX MONTH OF MEETINGS DISCUSSING THIS A LOT. AND THEY WERE
20 FAIRLY LENGTHY MEETINGS. SO I SAID THIS AS THE LAST LEG
21 MEETING BECAUSE THERE WERE A LOT OF PEOPLE BRINGING UP NEW
22 ISSUES AND NEW IDEAS AND WE REALLY HAVE TO STAY FOCUSED AT
23 THIS POINT. TIME IS OF THE ESSENCE IF WE WANT TO GET SOMETHING
24 DONE IN TRANSIT IN 2026 THERE IS A LOT OF EDUCATION AND
25 WORKING TO DONE AND BEFORE WE CAN POTENTIALLY GET A MEASURE



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 PASSED I THINK WE NEED TO FOCUS ON THAT AND MAKE SURE THESE
2 PRINCIPLES GET ADOPTED AND ARE USED TO BRIDGE THE ENABLING
3 LEGISLATION IN SACRAMENTO. ONCE PRINCIPLES ARE ADOPTED I'M
4 GOING TO ASK TO MEET WITH SENATOR ARREGUIN AND SENATOR WIENER
5 TO DISCUSS MTC'S INTEREST AND INTEREST IN BEING A BILL
6 SPONSOR, AS WELL. AND I THINK THAT'S SUPER IMPORTANT AS THE
7 BILL GETS AMENDED, BEING AT THE TABLE IS AN IMPORTANT PLACE
8 FOR US TO AND WE GET THAT AS BEING A BILL SPONSOR. SO I WANT
9 TO MAKE THOSE COMMENTS BEFORE WE MOVED ON.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, YES, FOR THE NEW MEMBERS, A LOT OF WORK
12 HAS GONE INTO THIS AND THE PRINCIPLES ARE REALLY LEADING IN
13 THE RIGHT DIRECTION HERE, BUT, AGAIN, POLLING IS VERY HIGH-
14 LEVEL. AND WHEN WE WANT TO TALK ABOUT SUCCESS OF ANY MEASURE,
15 IT'S NOT QUITE CLEAR TO SOME OF THE VOTERS AS TO WHAT THEY
16 WILL BE RECEIVE SUPPORTING THAT'S WHY REBECCA POINTED OUT
17 CERTAIN THINGS AS TO ACCOUNTABILITY. ALSO, EQUITY, AND FUNDING
18 DISTRIBUTION HERE. SO, WE DO HAVE A LONG WAY TO GO HERE. BUT
19 SIMPLY, JUST SAYING HEY, YOU LIKED TRANSPORTATION IS NOT
20 REALLY GOING TO GET US TO A MEASURE OF SUCCESS HERE. AND EVERY
21 JURISDICTION IS VERY, VERY UNIQUE IN HOW THINGS PROGRESS HERE.
22 WE DO ALL AGREE. WE WANT SUCCESS HERE. AND I DO HOPE -- I KNOW
23 THERE IS SOME, SORT OF, AN ORIENTATION COMING AFTER THIS, BUT
24 WE HAD A BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY PLAN OVER FIVE YEARS
25 AGO. I HOPE YOU ALL GET A COPY OF IT. [LAUGHTER] IT HAS A LOT



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 OF ELEMENTS IN THERE THAT I THINK WE ALL AGREE ON HERE THAT WE
2 WOULD LIKE TO SEE, NOT JUST TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES GETTING
3 MONEY. BUT A WHOLE NEW VISION FOR TRANSPORTATION THAT IS MORE
4 INTEGRATED, MORE SUCCESSFUL BECAUSE IF WE WANT TO GET PEOPLE
5 BACK ON TRANSIT IT DOES HAVE TO BE TRANSFORMATIVE. AND THAT IS
6 WHERE THE RUBBER MEETS THE ROAD, I GUESS, IN MANY AREAS HERE.
7 AND THE FUNDING IT'S LIMITED. SO EACH JURISDICTION HAS
8 SPECIFIC NEEDS, AND THEY'RE VOTERS, AGAIN, THEY WILL ANSWER A
9 POLL BUT THEY NEED TO UNDERSTAND WHAT HAPPENS HERE. I'LL GIVE
10 YOU ONE EXAMPLE, REGIONAL MEASURE, WHAT WAS IT? THREE THE LAST
11 TIME OR FOUR, WHATEVER WE'RE ON. VOTERS ASKED SAN MATEO COUNTY
12 RESIDENTS HOW DO YOU FEEL ABOUT BART TO SAN JOSE. THEY WEREN'T
13 TOLD IT WAS IN THE EAST BAY. SO WE HAVE TO BE VERY CAREFUL ON
14 THE QUESTIONS ASKED AND WHAT WE COMMUNICATE WITH THE VOTERS.
15 BECAUSE WE NEED TO BUILD THEIR TRUST MOVING FORWARD HERE. AND
16 THESE PRINCIPLES ARE A GOOD WAY TO DO THAT BUT WE STILL HAVE A
17 LOT OF WORK AHEAD BRINGING THE VOTERS TO THE TABLE IN EACH
18 JURISDICTION. SO IT'S GOING TO BE GOOD BUT WE HAVE TO WORK
19 TOGETHER HERE. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** OH, YOU'RE --

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'M CHAIRING? OKAY. DO WE SEE ANY -- OKAY.
24 PLEASE GO AHEAD.

25



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU FOR THIS
2 REPORT. AND, JUST FOR THE RECORD, I AGREE WITH ALL THE
3 PRINCIPLES THAT WERE STATED. WHEN I'M LOOKING OVER THE POLLING
4 RESULTS AND EMC IS CERTAINLY A REPUTABLE AND WELL-KNOWN
5 RESEARCH ORGANIZATION, THE MARGIN OF ERROR IS HIGHER THAN I'M
6 USED TO SEEING IN POLLING DATA. IT'S 6.2% IN ALAMEDA COUNTY,
7 6.9% IN CONTRA COSTA, AND SAN FRANCISCO AND SAN MATEO
8 COUNTIES. IS -- WHAT DO WE ATTRIBUTE THAT? AM I CORRECT?
9 BECAUSE I'M USED TO SEEING AND POLLING RESULTS LOWER MARGINS
10 OF ERRORS. BUT YOU CAN EXPLAIN THE HIGHER RATE?

11

12 **REBECCA LONG:** YES HAPPY TO DO SO AND WE HAVE EMC HERE SO THEY
13 CAN FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN. WHAT WE WERE REALLY FOCUSED ON THIS
14 WAS TESTING THE BASIC VIABILITY AND ALSO ANY DIFFERENCES
15 BETWEEN THE THREE FRAMEWORKS. AND SO WE WERE REALLY FOCUSED ON
16 THE TOTALITY MUCH THE RESULTS, NOT COUNTY BY COUNTY. BECAUSE
17 THE WAY THE MEASURE WOULD BE STRUCTURED IS IT WOULD PASS BASED
18 ON A MAJORITY THAT WERE CITIZEN INITIATIVE OF THE TOTAL VOTES
19 CAST. SO EVERYONE IS ALWAYS INTERESTED IN SEEING WHAT THE
20 COUNTY LEVEL IS BUT THE MARGIN OF ERROR FOR THE TOTALITY OF
21 EACH SCENARIO WAS, I THINK BETWEEN 2.7 TO 3.1.

22

23 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** AND AS EMC IS COMING TO THE MICROPHONE,
24 I WOULD SAY IT'S ALWAYS BETTER TO BE CONSERVATIVE IN YOUR
25 POLLING ASSESSMENT. WE DON'T WANT TO BE OVER CONFIDENT. I



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 WOULD LOVE TO HEAR FROM YOU AND I HAVE OTHER QUESTIONS AND
2 POINTS. THANKS.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** YEAH, I THINK TO ECHO -- AND MY NAME IS SARA LABATT
5 FROM EMC RESEARCH. NICE TO SEE YOU ALL HERE, AND I'M GLAD TO
6 SEE MY MAYOR HERE. WHAT REBECCA SAID THE MARGIN OF ERROR WE
7 TRIED TO CREATE A POLL THAT EXPLORED A LOT OF THINGS, A LOT OF
8 DIFFERENT REGIONAL QUESTIONS AND SUBREGIONAL QUESTIONS. THE
9 WAY THE SAMPLING WAS CONSTRUCTED WAS DESIGNED TO ENSURE WE HAD
10 ADEQUATE SAMPLE SIZE FOR EACH OF THE THREE MEASURES IN THE
11 REGION THEY'RE BEING CONSIDERED. THEN WITHIN THAT WE ALLOCATED
12 INTERVIEWS MOSTLY PROPORTIONATELY TO THE PROPORTION OF VOTERS
13 IN EACH COUNTY FOR THAT PARTICULAR MEASURE. YOU'RE RIGHT TO
14 IDENTIFY DOWN TO THE INDIVIDUAL COUNTY FOR INDIVIDUAL MEASURE
15 THE MARGIN OF ERROR DO GROW TO A HIGHER LEVEL. BECAUSE WHAT WE
16 WEREN'T ASKED -- WEREN'T TRYING TO DESIGN IS A SURVEY THAT
17 COULD UNDERSTAND IF A MEASURE WAS TO PASS IN AN INDIVIDUAL
18 COUNTY OR IF A MEASURE WAS POTENTIALLY VIABLE IN ANY
19 INDIVIDUAL COUNTIES BUT RATHER REGIONALLY. SO IN TERMS OF THE
20 MARGIN OF ERROR FOR THE SAMPLES, OVERALL, THEY RANGED BETWEEN
21 1.3 -- THANK YOU. 2.7 TO 3.4 PERCENTAGE POINTS FOR EACH OF THE
22 THREE MEASURES AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL FOR EACH MEASURE TESTED.

23

24 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** AND THEN TALK TO US A BIT ABOUT THE
25 SHELF LIFE OF THE POLLING RESULTS. BECAUSE AGAIN THIS IS YOUR



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 SPECIALTY NOT MINE, I CO-CHAIR AND RECALL THE ECONOMY WAS A
2 STRONG SHELF LIFE POLL RESULTS IS LONGER WHEN IT'S NOT MAYBE
3 YOU'RE THE EXPERT. HOW LONG CAN WE RELY ON THE RESULTS?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I'M NOT SURE WHAT YOU CHARACTERIZE RELATIVE LENGTH
6 HAS TO DO WITH STRENGTH OF ECONOMY WHEN WE DO I POLL THAT
7 MEASURES THE OPINION THE UNIVERSE WE'RE POLLING FROM AT THAT
8 MOMENT IN TIME WE DID THE POLL SO IN THIS CASE THE POLL WAS
9 DONE IN JANUARY OR I'M SORRY -- IN -- YEAH, IN JANUARY. AND
10 YOU KNOW, THAT WAS -- IT WAS JANUARY 14TH THROUGH 30th. SO,
11 SORT OF, IMMEDIATELY IN THAT LATER PART OF JANUARY. SO WHAT'S
12 WE CAN SAY FROM THE POLL IS THAT'S WHAT PEOPLE THOUGHT IN THAT
13 MOMENT. IN TERMS OF HOW LONG IT'S USEFUL, I THINK THERE IS --
14 YOUR COMMENT ABOUT THE ECONOMY AND SHELF LIFE IS, SORT OF,
15 RELATED TO HOW VOTERS MIGHT CHANGE THEIR OPINIONS ABOUT, SORT
16 OF, EVERYTHING GOING ON AS THINGS IN THE ENVIRONMENT ARE
17 HAPPENING. SO, I THINK WHEN THERE IS A LOT HAPPENING, WHETHER
18 IT'S REGIONAL OR LOCAL OR NATIONAL, THEY'RE GOING TO BE
19 PROBABLY A LITTLE MORE VOLATILE, ATTITUDES ABOUT, SORT OF,
20 EVERYTHING. NOT SPECIFIC TO THIS MEASURE OR THIS TOPIC. SO,
21 YOU KNOW, I THINK THAT THERE IS A LOT TO BE GAINED FROM THESE
22 SURVEY RESULTS. THIS IS NOT A POLL THAT WAS DESIGNED TO SAY IF
23 A MEASURE THAT COULD BE TWO YEAR FROM NOW OR MORE IS VIABLE,
24 ABSOLUTELY, BUT RATHER TO UNDERSTAND WHERE WE ARE TODAY WHAT
25 IS THE APPETITE FOR VARIOUS IDEAS THAT YOU ARE INTERESTED IN



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 MEASURING THEN TAKE FROM THERE THIS IS WHERE VOTERS ARE NOW
2 RECOGNIZING WE CAN'T FORESEE WHAT WILL HAPPEN IN THE FUTURE.

3

4 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** THANK YOU. AND IT IS OF COURSE A
5 SNAPSHOT IN TIME AND IT SEEMS VERY WELL DESIGNED AND THESE
6 RESULTS ARE OF COURSE BEFORE THERE IS ANY VOTER EDUCATION SO
7 THAT VOTER EDUCATION AND OUTREACH WILL BE PERSONALITY. AND I
8 WILL JUST THROW IN A PLUG AND I DIDN'T SAY EARLIER WHEN I
9 INTRODUCED MYSELF BUT I'M HERE REPRESENTING MYSELF FROM THE 14
10 CITIES OF ALAMEDA COUNTY AND WE'RE STRONG TRANSIT RIDERS, OUR
11 CITY OF ALAMEDA RIDES BART AND AC TRANSIT EVEN NO WE DON'T
12 HAVE A BART STATION YET. ONE OF THE THINGS I THINK WILL BE
13 IMPORTANT FOR OUR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND I KNOW THEY'RE WORKING
14 ON THIS BUT IS TO MAKE THEIR SYSTEMS AS ATTRACTIVE, SAFE,
15 CLEAN, ACCESSIBLE AS POSSIBLE. I'M A STAUNCH AND DEDICATED
16 TRANSIT USER. SUNDAY AFTERNOON QUICKLY AND ANECDOTALLY MY
17 HUSBAND AND I WALKED UP TO THE BUS STOP TO AC TRANSIT AND BART
18 INTO THE CITY TO SEE A FILM AND MEET SOME FRIENDS FOR DINNER
19 AND YOU KNOW WE -- AND THAT WAS IN THE AFTERNOON BUT WE WENT
20 INTO A BART CAR AND THERE WAS A LARGE POOL OF URINE ON THE
21 FLOOR AND I SAID WE'LL GO TO THE NEXT CAR. I'M IN THIS MEETING
22 AND ALSO AS VICE CHAIR OF ATC AND I JUST GOT A TEXT MESSAGE,
23 THAT SAID COULD YOU GIVE ME MORE INFORMATION ABOUT THE
24 INCIDENT YOU HAD WE HAD OUR RETREAT ON MONDAY. BUT THESE ARE
25 THE KINDS OF THINGS TRANSIT NEEDS TO SUCCEED WE NEED THIS



1 MEASURE ALL HAND ON DECK I KNOW I'M PREACHING TO THE CHOIR
2 HERE BUT FOR LISTENING TO MY COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS.

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER BURT?

5

6 **PAT BURT:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO DIVE IN A LITTLE BIT MORE ON
7 THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES AND THE TERM WAS USED OF LOCAL
8 DEFICITS. AND I TAKE THAT TO MEAN WE'RE TALKING ABOUT CURRENT
9 DEFICITS THAT ARE BEING MET THROUGH COVID RELIEF FUNDS AND
10 PROSPECTIVE DEFICITS THAT WOULD BE UNMET, AND AS A RESULT
11 SERVICE CUTS THAT WOULD OCCUR IF WE DIDN'T HAVE THIS MEASURE.
12 SO, IT'S REALLY THE THREAT TO SERVICE THAT IS THE ISSUE WE'RE
13 TRYING TO ADDRESS. AND I WANTED TO POINT OUT, JUST THE
14 DIFFERENT CIRCUMSTANCES. IN SANTA CHAIR COUNTY, WITH VTA, WE
15 HAVE HISTORICALLY DONE TWO THINGS. WE HAVE BEEN MORE RELIANT
16 ON LOCAL TAX MEASURES AND LESS ON FAREBOX RECOVERY TO SUPPORT
17 OUR BUS SYSTEM. SECOND, MORE THAN 20 YEARS AGO, VTA WENT
18 THROUGH THE VERY DIFFICULT AND TRAUMATIC CUTS TO BUS SERVICE
19 IN ORDER TO HAVE A MORE SUSTAINABLE SYSTEM. AND THAT'S A
20 SYSTEM THAT, BECAUSE IT'S LESS RELIANT ON FAREBOX RECOVERY,
21 HAS NOT EXPERIENCED THE SEVERE IMPACTS THAT A LOT OF THE OTHER
22 AGENCIES HAVE HAD. WE'RE VERY SYMPATHETIC TO THE ISSUES OF THE
23 OTHER AGENCIES, INCLUDING CALTRAIN, WHERE SEVERAL OF US SERVE,
24 THAT HAS BEEN VERY RELIANT ON FAREBOX RECOVERY. BUT IN SANTA
25 CHAIR COUNTY WHAT WE HAVE HAD IS A SERVICE DEFICIT ALREADY.



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 AND SO I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE FRAMING THIS IN A WAY
2 THAT ADDRESSES THE DIFFERENT REGIONS WITH THE SAME OBJECTIVE,
3 WHICH IS TO RETAIN OR RESTORE ADEQUATE SERVICE. AND THAT WOULD
4 CAPTURE THE NEEDS OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY, WHICH IS OVER A
5 QUARTER OF THE REGION'S POPULATION AND AN EVEN HIGHER
6 PERCENTAGE OF THE SALES TAX REVENUE. SO, I VERY MUCH
7 APPRECIATE THE CRISIS THAT WE FACE REGIONALLY, AND JUST WANT
8 TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE ADJUSTING THOSE PRINCIPLES IN A WAY
9 THAT RECOGNIZES THAT. AND THEN, SECOND, I DID WANT TO TALK
10 ABOUT THIS KIND OF ISSUE OF SHELF LIFE OF THE POLL. AND I
11 SPENT 40 YEARS IN THE MANUFACTURING TECH ECONOMY IN OUR REGION
12 WHICH WENT THROUGH MANY PAINFUL BOOMS AND BUSTS. ROUGHLY EVERY
13 FIVE YEARS WOULD BE A DOWNTURN AND EVERY TEN WOULD BE A SEVERE
14 ONE. EVERY ONE HAS A DIFFERENT SET OF CAUSES AND A DIFFERENT
15 RECOVERY. BUT, EVENTUALLY OUR REGION DOES RECOVER DESPITE A
16 LOT OF PROGNOSTICATORS THAT EVERY DOWNTURN SAYS IT'S THE
17 BEGINNING OF THE END OF SILICON VALLEY. BUT WHAT WE'RE FACING
18 RIGHT NOW AT THE TIME OF THIS POLL IS NOT ONLY A VOTER
19 SKEPTICISM ON NEW FUNDING MEASURES BUT WE HAVE LESS CONGESTION
20 AND AS A RESULT LESS TRANSIT USE. USUALLY THESE RECOVERIES GET
21 IN FULL SWING ABOUT THREE YEARS INTO RECOVERY. SO, MY BEST
22 GUESS IS WE'LL BE RECOVERING, BUT NOT IN A FULL RECOVERY AT
23 THE TIME WE MAY GO TO THE BALLOT IN A YEAR AND A HALF. MY HOPE
24 IS THAT THE VOTER SENTIMENT WILL BE STRONGER, BECAUSE OUR
25 ROADWAYS WILL BE MORE CONGESTED. AND THERE WILL BE A GREATER



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 APPRECIATION OF THE CRITICALITY OF OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS. BUT I
2 JUST WANTED TO PUT THAT OUT ON THE TABLE AS A CAUTIOUS
3 OPTIMISM THAT WE'LL SEE SOME IMPROVEMENT IN THE POLLING IN THE
4 NEXT YEAR AND A HALF. THANK YOU.

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO, FIRST OF ALL,
9 THANK MY COLLEAGUES AND ACKNOWLEDGE OUR FORMER SELECT
10 COMMITTEE CHAIR SPERING FOR THE COLLABORATIVE AND THOUGHTFUL
11 WORK ON THIS REGIONAL MEASURE. AND I WANTED TO JUST ALSO
12 PIGGYBACK ON COMMISSIONER BURT'S COMMENTS. WE, REALLY, FROM
13 SANTA CLARA COUNTY VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THAT JIM AND THE
14 COMMITTEE TRULY HEARD THE CONCERNS OF SANTA CHAIR COUNTY AND
15 THE ENTIRE REGION. AND I BELIEVE WHAT WAS POLLED IN JANUARY
16 REALLY WAS BASED ON THE INFORMATION THAT CAME OUT OF
17 COMMITTEE. AND I WANT TO ALSO REITERATE, WE IN SANTA CLARA
18 COUNTY ARE COMMITTED TO TRANSIT SERVICE AND RIDERSHIP IN OUR
19 COUNTY AND THE BROADER REGION. AND WE CAME TO LANDING ON A NEW
20 COUNTY MEASURE, SANTA CLARA COUNTY MEASURE, IN PART, BASED ON
21 WHAT COMMISSIONER BURT SAID. WE HAVE, I GUESS, A SLIGHT
22 NUANCED DIFFERENCE IN THAT WE'RE TRYING TO RESTORE SERVICE
23 THAT WE LOST 20 YEARS AGO. AND ALSO THE OTHER FACTOR, WHICH
24 WAS PART OF THE PRINCIPLES OF ACKNOWLEDGING THAT WE ACTUALLY
25 HAVE A NUMBER OF EXISTING REVENUE MEASURES THAT WILL EXPIRE IN



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 THE NEXT TEN YEARS. SO, I JUST WANTED TO, FOR -- ESPECIALLY
2 FOR THE NEW MEMBERS, SHARE THAT AND TO SHARE THAT WE ARE
3 COMMITTED TO PARTICIPATING IN, THROUGH OUR OWN COUNTY MEASURE.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THANKS CHAIR AND I THINK MY COLLEAGUES FROM SANTA
7 CLARA COUNTY SUMMARIZED WHAT I WAS GOING TO CONVEY. FIRST A
8 QUESTION TO ZOOM OUT AND LOOK AT THE POLLING RESULTS FOR THE
9 WHOLE REGION AS WELL AS SCENARIO 1A WHICH IS THOSE FOUR
10 COUNTIES, IF YOU WILL. GIVEN THAT WE'RE NOT AT A 2/3 THRESHOLD
11 DOES THAT IMPLY THAT THIS WOULD NEED TO BE A VOTER INITIATED
12 MEASURE? AND CAN WE TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE IMPLICATIONS
13 OF THAT?

14

15 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. YES IT DOES AND THAT IS
16 WHY IT'S ONE OF THE CORE PRINCIPLES IS THE ENABLING
17 LEGISLATION WOULD NEED TO AUTHORIZE THAT. I THINK THE PROCESS
18 THAT IS ENVISIONED IS THE ENABLING LEGISLATION WOULD MAKE
19 CLEAR THAT THAT CAN OCCUR WITHIN A SPECIFIED GEOGRAPHY AND
20 THEN IT WOULD BE LEFT UP TO THE CITIZENS AND INDEPENDENT
21 GROUPS AND NOT ANY PUBLIC AGENCY TO ORGANIZE THAT, GATHER
22 SIGNATURES, AND RUN THE CAMPAIGN.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** RIGHT. AND GIVEN -- RIGHT THAT WAS MY SENSE. AND
25 GIVEN A PUBLIC AGENCY WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO PUT THAT ON THE



1 BALLOT AND ORGANIZE IT, I ASSUME WE WOULD THOUGH BE ABLE TO
2 PUBLISH A SET OF PRINCIPLES PUBLICALLY THAT WE WOULD HOPE THAT
3 FOLKS MIGHT CONSIDER AS THEY --

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER, IF I MAY. I THINK THAT IS
6 EXACTLY RIGHT. I THINK THE GOAL IS THAT WE NEED TO WORK HARD
7 AT THIS COMMISSION TO TRY TO HARD TO GET EXACTLY AT WHAT THE
8 VOTERS WOULD VOTE THE MOST FOR. AND I DON'T THINK YOU WANT TO
9 NECESSARILY GIVE UP, EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT OPTIMISTIC TODAY ON
10 BEING A 2/3 VOTE THAT'S HOW YOU SET UP THE BEST AMOUNT OF
11 GUARDRAILS AS POSSIBLE.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THAT MAKES SENSE. KATHLEEN DID YOU WANT TO CHIME IN?

14

15 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** I THINK THE GIST OF YOUR QUESTION IS
16 CORRECT IN MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE NOT ENGAGING IN ANY CAMPAIGN
17 ACTIVITY BUT THE PRINCIPLES ADOPTED TODAY MAY BE ELABORATED
18 THROUGH THE LEGISLATIVE PROCESS COULD PROVIDE GUIDANCE FOR
19 WHAT A MEASURE MIGHT LOOK LIKE.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** I THINK THE PRINCIPLES ARE HIGH-LEVEL AND WE NEED TO
22 DRAW OUT THROUGH ADDITIONAL POLLING RESEARCH CONVERSATION WHAT
23 WE REALLY MEAN BY THEM. I SAW A COUNCIL LETTER WHICH I
24 APPRECIATED AND I DO THINK AND I SUPPOSE IT'S UNDER PRINCIPLE
25 SIX THE MEASURE MUST COULD MEANINGFUL ACCOUNTABILITY



1 PROVISIONS. ACCOUNTABILITY MEANS A LOT OF DIFFERENT THINGS TO
2 DIFFERENT PEOPLE. BUT I THINK THIS OPEN CONVERSATION ABOUT HOW
3 WE CREATE VALUE AND WHAT ARE THE THINGS WE CAN DO TO FIND
4 EFFICIENCIES, INCREASE RIDERSHIP, IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER
5 EXPERIENCE, BUT ALSO LEAN INTO NEW TO TELL TECHNOLOGIES, I
6 FRANKLY DON'T THINK WE'RE THE MOST INNOVATIVE REGION IN THE
7 WORLD ARGUABLY AND I THINK WE SHOULD KEEP THAT MONIKER AND I
8 THINK WE SHOULD NOT BE AFRAID TO TALK ABOUT EMERGING
9 TECHNOLOGIES THAT MIGHT IMPROVE THE ACCESSIBILITY,
10 DESIRABILITY, EFFICIENCY OF OUR MOBILITY SOLUTIONS. I WANT TO
11 ENCOURAGE US TO THINK MORE ABOUT HOW WE GET MORE VALUE FOR THE
12 TAX PAYERS CUSTOMER SERVICE AND DEMONSTRATE THAT GOVERNMENT --
13 CAN'T JUST BE ANOTHER TAX AND IT'S ALSO HAS TO BE WE'RE
14 GETTING SMARTER EFFICIENT AND USING NEW TECHNOLOGIES AND
15 GETTING MORE VALUE PER HOUR OF LABOR FRANKLY, MORE
16 PRODUCTIVITY. AND I THINK MY COLLEAGUES FROM SANTA CLARA
17 COUNTY APPOINTED THIS I WANT TO REAFFIRM AT COUNTY LEVEL WE
18 WERE VTA OUR TRANSIT AUTHORITY GOING INTO THE FIELD SOON AND
19 WILL DO SOME RESEARCH WE ARE COMMITTED AND WANT TO UNDERSTAND
20 WHAT VOTERS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY WANT TO SUPPORT WHEN IT
21 COMES TO ADDITIONAL FUNDING WE WILL WITHIN THE NEXT DECADE YOU
22 ALL HAVE HEARD ME THOSE WHO ARE RETURNING COMMISSIONERS HAVE
23 HEARD ME AS WELL AS SUPERVISOR ABE-KOGA AND FORMER
24 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ REPEATED MANY TIMES LAST YEAR WE'LL NEED
25 TO RENEW MEASURES BUS WE'RE OPEN TO THE IDEA OF GOING OUT



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 EARLIER AND GENERATING ADDITIONAL REVENUES WHICH WILL MAKE IT
2 EASIER FOR US TO CONTRIBUTE TO REGIONAL NEEDS, THAT'S AN
3 ASPIRATION WE HAVE OF COURSE WE HAVE TO SEE IF THE VOTERS IN
4 SANTA CLARA COUNTY ARE WILLING TO SUPPORT THAT AND LOOKING AT
5 CALTRAIN SPECIFICALLY WE HAVE WORK TO DO WITHIN OUR OTHER
6 PARTNER COUNTIES FIGURING OUT WHAT OUR FAIR SHARE
7 RESPONSIBILITY IS AND I THINK TO WITH DIFFERENT FUNDING
8 SOURCES HERE AND ALIGN WITH UTILIZATION WITH SOMETHING LIKE --
9 I WANT TO BE A BODY PARTNER THROUGH THE REGION AS WE GET
10 THROUGH THIS STRETCH OF TRANSIT.

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** SUPERVISOR MELGAR?

13

14 **MYRNA MELGAR:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW THAT
15 THE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY OF SAN FRANCISCO GOT THIS
16 PRESENTATION FROM RUTH BERNSTEIN AT EMC AND ALIX BOCKELMAN,
17 VERY KINDLY ALSO CAME TO ANSWER QUESTIONS, AND MY COLLEAGUES
18 HAD A LOT, AS ANDY FREMIER TALKED ABOUT WE ARE INTERESTED IN
19 TAXING OURSELVES A LITTLE BIT MORE BECAUSE OUR MTA IS IN A
20 HIGHER DEFICIT THAN SOME OTHERS. AND WE'RE WILLING TO DO THAT
21 POSSIBLY. AND I WANTED TO TALK ABOUT SOME OF THE COMMENTS THAT
22 GINA PAPAN MADE. BECAUSE I THINK THEY'RE RIGHT ON TARGET. I
23 THINK THAT THE RELATIONSHIP THAT LATINO WORKING CLASS VOTERS
24 IN REDWOOD CITY HAVE TO PUBLIC TRANSIT IS PERHAPS DIFFERENT
25 THAN HOMEOWNERS OF PACIFIC HEIGHTS AND WE NEED ALL OF THEM TO



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 VOTE ON THIS THING AND I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO THE
2 COLLABORATION AND AS YOU SAID THE DEVIL IS IN THE DETAILS AND
3 WE HAVE TO GET IT RIGHT. POLITICALLY WE HAVE TO WORK TOGETHER.
4 WE'RE REPRESENTATIVE TO THE ENTIRE REGION AND ITS RICHNESS.
5 I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO GETTING IT RIGHT TO COLLABORATING TO
6 MAKING SURE THIS WE GET SOMETHING ON THE BOOKS THAT MEETS
7 THESE PRINCIPLES WHICH I THINK ARE GREAT. YOU SUMMED IT UP
8 REALLY WELL. BUT HIGH-LEVEL. AND WE HAVE TO GET IT RIGHT AND
9 COLLABORATE SO WE CAN GET IT THROUGH THE FINISH LINE. THANK
10 YOU.

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. COMMISSION ARE KAPLAN?

13

14 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH EVERYONE. AND THANK YOU FOR
15 SHARING THIS PRESENTATION. I WANT TO MAKE SURE TO HIGHLIGHT
16 THAT THIS PRESENTATION CONTAINS IMPORTANT GOOD NEWS THAT IT IS
17 ACTUALLY POSSIBLE TO PASS A MEASURE, PARTICULARLY IF THE 50%
18 THRESHOLD IS USED THROUGH THE PETITIONING, THAT THERE ARE
19 STRATEGIES THAT GET TO REGIONALLY, YOU KNOW, SIGNIFICANTLY
20 ABOVE 50% TO HAVE A VERY GOOD CHANCE OF PASSING. AND, SO, THAT
21 IS HIGHLY APPRECIATED. SOME THINGS THAT I THINK WILL BE
22 IMPORTANT TO IDENTIFY AND THINK ABOUT AND ANSWER GOING
23 FORWARD, ONE IS WHAT WOULD BE THE GOVERNANCE AND OVERSIGHT
24 BODY OVER THIS MEASURE, PARTICULARLY IF THE MEASURE IS NOT A
25 FULL NINE COUNTY, BUT A SUBSET OF THE COUNTIES. AND IF IT IS



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 DONE BY VOTER PETITION, WHAT THEN WOULD BE THE OVERSIGHT BODY
2 FOR THE MONEY RAISED? WOULD IT BE MTC? WOULD IT BE A SUBSET OF
3 MTC? I THINK THAT IT WILL BE A QUESTION. I THINK WE HAVE
4 IMPORTANT PUBLIC INTEREST IN SEEING MORE FUNCTIONAL
5 INTEGRATION, MORE EASE OF USE ACROSS DIFFERENT TRANSIT
6 AGENCIES TO CONTINUE TO ADVANCE THE WORK THAT THIS AGENCY
7 STARTED MANY YEARS AGO ON FARE INTEGRATION AND FARE MEDIA, AS
8 WELL AS WORK ON SCHEDULING AND MANNING AND WAYFINDING SO THAT
9 TO THE CUSTOMER, THE SITUATION IS MORE SEAMLESS ACROSS THE
10 DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES. I DID NOTE IN THE POLL THAT THE
11 ARGUMENT IN FAVOR, THAT DID THE MOST, THAT GOT THE MOST YES
12 THIS WOULD BE CONVINCING, WAS PROTECTING TRANSIT FOR THOSE
13 MOST IN NEED, INCLUDING LOW-INCOME, SENIORS, STUDENTS, PEOPLE
14 WITH DISABILITIES, THAT THAT HAD THE HIGHEST RATIO OF PEOPLE
15 SAYING THAT WOULD MAKE THEM VOTE FOR THE MEASURE. SO THAT'S
16 IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT AS WE GO FORWARD ON CRAFTING IT. AS
17 SOME OF MY COLLEAGUES HAVE ALREADY POINTED OUT, IT WILL BE
18 ESSENTIAL TO HAVE A SIGNATURE GATHERING PATHWAY TOWARD
19 ADVANCING THIS. THE COUNTY I'M FROM, ALAMEDA COUNTY, HAD A
20 VERY HIGH YES VOTE, AND, ALSO, THANKFULLY, DOES NOT HAVE OUR
21 OWN SALES TAX MEASURE UP FOR RENEWAL YET AT THIS TIME. BECAUSE
22 MEASURE BB GOES UNTIL 2045. SO THAT'S A POSITIVE FROM THE
23 ALAMEDA COUNTY PERSPECTIVE, IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO LEAN IN
24 ON SUPPORTING A REGIONAL MEASURE. HOWEVER, I DO THINK IT'S
25 IMPORTANT THAT WE WORK WITH ALL OF OUR COUNTIES AND COUNTIES



1 HAVE THEIR RENEWALS AT DIFFERENT TIMES SOME OF THEM SOONER
2 THAN LATER IT WILL BE IMPORTANT THAT THE MEASURE DEALS WITH
3 THE ISSUE OF THE SALES TAX CAP IN A WAY THAT DOES NOT HURT ANY
4 LOCAL ITEMS EITHER BY COUNTIES OR TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND, ALSO,
5 LOOK TO WAYS THAT WE CAN FURTHER SUPPORT THE EXTENSIONS THAT
6 ARE NEEDED AT LOCAL COUNTY LEVEL. LASTLY I WANT TO SUGGEST
7 THINKING SOME MORE ABOUT THINKING THE 78TH VERSUS HALF CENT.
8 AS WE WORK FORWARD TOWARD POLLING AND WE WANT MORE INPUT WE
9 WANT TO KEEP 7/8 OPTION GOING FORWARD AND NOT LOCK OURSELVES
10 INTO HALF CENT AND WHILE THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN 7/8S AND HALF
11 CENT WAS WITHIN THE MARGIN OF ERROR, 7/8TH'S DID SLIGHTLY
12 BETTER THAN HALF CENT THE WITHIN SAN FRANCISCO AND THEN THE
13 COUNTIES OUTSIDE OF SAN FRANCISCO WERE SLIGHTLY LESS HAPPY
14 WITH THESE ONE THAT GAVE HALF CENT IN OTHER COUNTIES AND 7/8S
15 IN SAN FRANCISCO. I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT BECAUSE WHEN WE
16 WERE WORKING ON ALAMEDA COUNTY MEASURE BB THERE WAS A DEBATE
17 ABOUT DOING HALF, 7/8TH'S \$0.01. WE ENDED UP LANDING ON \$0.01
18 AND FOUND THAT \$0.01 DID NOT POLL WORSE THAN 7/8 AND DID NOT
19 POLL WORSE THAN A HALF CENT, AND THE WAY PEOPLE READ
20 FRACTIONS, AND INTERPRET FRACTIONS, AND RESPOND TO FRACTIONS
21 CAN BE IN A MANNER THAT ONE WOULDN'T NECESSARILY PREDICT. AND
22 THERE WAS SOME GREAT ANALYSIS DONE SOME YEARS AGO ABOUT A
23 COMPETITION BETWEEN A BURGER CHAIN PUSHING A QUARTER POUNDER
24 BURGER VERSUS A 1/3 POUND BURGER, AND PEOPLE OVERWHELMINGLY
25 PREFERRED THE ONE QUARTER POUND BURGER OVER 1/3, AND PERCEIVED



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 ONE QUARTER POUND BURGER BIGGER THAN THE 1/3 BURGER THAT'S NOT
2 ACTUALLY THE CASE. AS WE GO FORWARD SAN FRANCISCO'S REQUEST
3 FOR MONEY AND NUANCES OF HOW PEOPLE READ FRACTIONS, THE
4 IMPORTANCE WE CONTINUE TO LOOK AT THOSE AND THE PATHWAY HERE
5 MAKING SURE WE'RE SUSTAINING OUR VITAL TRANSIT SERVICES FOR
6 OUR REGION. THANK YOU SO MUCH.

7

8 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

9

10 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YEAH, THANK YOU CHAIR CANEPA. I WANT
11 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE'RE IN THE EARLY STAGES STILL OF DOING
12 POLLING. AND THEN I WANT TO APPRECIATE OUR COLLEAGUES FROM
13 SANTA CHAIR COUNTY FOR VERY CLEARLY ARTICULATING YOUR
14 POSITION, AND WHAT YOUR NEEDS ARE AND ON YOU YOU'RE WORKING
15 WITH THIS BODY TO BE A GOOD PARTNER. I REALLY DO APPRECIATE
16 THAT. AND I CALL ON ALL THE COUNTIES, INCLUDING MY OWN NORTH
17 BAY TO BE ABLE TO COME FORWARD AND BE AS CLEAR WITH WHAT WE
18 NEED AND WHERE WE ARE IN THE PROCESS. AND THEN I WANTED TO ASK
19 A QUESTION ABOUT NEXT STEPS AND FUTURE POLLING. OBVIOUSLY, AS
20 YOU SAID, WE ASK A LOT OF QUESTIONS AT A HIGH-LEVEL ABOUT A
21 LOT OF THINGS SO I'M WONDERING, IT'S FARTHER ALONG IN THE
22 PROCESS, I ASSUME THERE WILL BE MORE POLLING AT A MORE
23 DETAILED LEVEL BUT I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR OUR STAFF TALK A
24 LITTLE BIT ABOUT THAT.

25



1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS. YEAH WE
2 HAVEN'T MADE ANY DECISION ABOUT WHEN WE WOULD DO A SUBSEQUENT
3 POLL. CERTAINLY, WE DO ENVISION ANOTHER ONE WOULD BE DONE. SO
4 I THINK IT'S GOING TO BE BASED ON FURTHER CONVERSATION. I
5 THINK THE GENERAL SENSE THAT STAFF IS OPERATING FROM AND BASED
6 ON OUR ADVOCACY PROGRAM IS WE WANT TO GET THE ENABLING
7 LEGISLATION, RIGHT? REGARDLESS. BUT AS WE'RE FLESHING OUT THAT
8 LEGISLATION, RIGHT, GOING THROUGH THAT, THOSE NEGOTIATIONS, ET
9 CETERA, IT MIGHT BE APPROPRIATE TO POLL BEFORE THE LEGISLATION
10 IS WRAPPED UP WHICH WOULD BE IN THE AUGUST TIME FRAME.

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GREAT. I WOULD CERTAINLY SUPPORT
13 THAT.

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. COMMISSIONER?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO JUST APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT'S
18 BEEN DONE TO HONE IN ON THESE PRINCIPLES. I THINK THEY'RE
19 IMPORTANT, EFFECTIVE GUIDING PRINCIPLES AND I KNOW THAT EACH
20 OF THE COUNTIES HAS REALLY SHOWN UP TO WHAT HAS BEEN A VERY
21 HONG PROCESS NOW TO TALK ABOUT THIS VERY, VERY IMPORTANT NEED.

22

23 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AND I THINK EACH OF THE COUNTIES HAS
24 REALLY DEMONSTRATED THROUGH THEIR ONGOING PARTICIPATION, HOW
25 COMMITTED WE ARE ALL ARE TO SOLVING THIS PROBLEM AND MAKING



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 SURE TRANSIT CAN CONTINUE TO FUNCTION FOR THE REGION. WE ALL
2 KNOW WHAT HAPPENS WITHOUT IT. AND IMPORTANT TO SOLVE THIS
3 PROBLEM. I ALSO APPRECIATED THE PERSPECTIVE THAT COMMISSIONER
4 MAHAN BROUGHT AROUND WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE NOT JUST,
5 SORT OF, FUNDING BUSINESS AS USUAL WE'RE IN A TIME THAT WE
6 HAVE TO CHANGE THE WAY WE APPROACH THE WORK WE DO RELATIVE TO
7 PROVIDING TRANSIT. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
8 THE MEASURES THAT WE ARE CONTEMPLATING ARE UNLIKELY TO FULFILL
9 THE ENTIRE NEED THAT OUR SYSTEMS FACE. SO WHETHER IT IS
10 THROUGH, SORT OF, EXTERNAL PRESSURE OR JUST INTERNAL, SORT OF,
11 THE REALITIES OF HAVING TO DO MORE WITH LESS WE'RE GOING TO
12 CONTINUE TO HAVE TO FIND EFFICIENCY. AND TO COMMISSIONER
13 BURT'S POINT, A LOT OF OUR SYSTEMS HAVE BEEN GRAPPLING WITH
14 THIS FOR QUITE SOMETIME. NOT TO PLAY FAVORITES, BUT MUNI HAS
15 BEEN WORKING THROUGH ITS MUNI FORWARD PROGRAM FOR TEN YEARS
16 NOW TO GET BETTER PERFORMANCE OUT OF EXISTING RESOURCE SO AS
17 WE THINKING ABOUT WHAT DOES ACCOUNTABILITY LOOK LIKE WHAT DOES
18 EFFICIENCY MEAN IT WOULD BE WORTHWHILE TO ACKNOWLEDGE AND PUT
19 A SPOTLIGHT ON SOME OF THE EFFORTS THAT HAVE COME BEFORE SO
20 WE'RE WE UNDERSTAND WHAT WE'RE BUILDING OFF AS WE MOVE
21 FORWARD. I WANT TO PUT IN A SLIGHT WORD OF URGENCY TO THIS
22 CONVERSATION. THERE IS A LOT THAT STILL NEEDS TO BE RESOLVED
23 BUT WE ALSO HAVE VERY LITTLE TIME TO RESOLVE IT BECAUSE MANY
24 OF US ARE GOING TO BE WORKING THROUGH LOCAL INITIATIVES TO
25 SUPPLEMENT ANYTHING THAT HAPPENS REGIONALLY. WE NEED TO KNOW



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 WHAT THE REGIONAL SOLUTION IS GOING TO BE IN ORDER TO
2 CONSTRUCT OUR LOCAL EFFORTS, AND WE DON'T HAVE A TON OF TIME
3 TO DO THAT AND SO THE SOONER WE CAN ENTER INTO THESE JOINT
4 CONVERSATIONS FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, THE BETTER. THANK YOU.

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ARE THERE ANY OTHER? YES?

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** I'M SORRY. JUST A QUICK FOLLOW UP WE'RE TRYING TO
9 UNDERSTAND EVERYTHING HERE I THINK THE COMMENTS ARE GREAT FROM
10 EVERYONE. CAN WE GET DETAILS ON ACTUALLY WHO WAS POLLED FROM
11 OUR JURISDICTIONS? I HAVE HEARD RUMORS THESE ARE FREQUENT
12 VOTERS, THESE ARE -- THE DETAILS WOULD BE HELPFUL TO US ALL.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** SURE HAPPY TO ANSWER THAT. IT WAS A REPRESENTATIVE
15 SAMPLE POLL OF LIKELY VOTERS IN HIGHER TURN OUT ELECTION AT
16 2026 TYPE TURN OUT ELECTION. SO, IT'S A RANDOM AND
17 REPRESENTATIVE SAMPLE. IT DOES HAVE HIGHER PROPENSITY VOTERS.
18 IT ALSO HAS APPROPRIATE SHARE OF LOWER PROPENSITY VOTERS THAT
19 MAY ONLY VOTE EVERY COUPLE OF YEARS INSTEAD OF EVERY ELECTION.
20 WE WORK HARD TO ENSURE OUR SAMPLES ARE REPRESENTATIVE IN THE
21 WAY WE'RE DOING THE SURVEY RESULT IN REPRESENTATIVE SAMPLE OF
22 VOTERS SO WE CAN BE CONFIDENT IN THOSE RESULTS.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** IT WOULD HELP WITH OUR JURISDICTIONS WHAT AGE
25 GROUP I HAVE A FRIEND WHO GOT THE POLL SHE NEVER VOTES



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 REGRETTABLY. WE'RE TRYING TO UNDERSTAND OUR JURISDICTIONS THAT
2 WILL BE HELPFUL HERE AND ALL OF THE COUNTIES ARE PARTICIPATING
3 HERE PARTICULARLY THE ONES THAT WERE MENTIONED IN THE POLL. I
4 WANT TO BE CAREFUL ON HOW WE USE THESE RESULTS BY JUST SAYING
5 HEY YOUR COUNTY APPROVES OF THIS NOT NECESSARILY WHEN'S GOING
6 TO GET TO THE FINISH LINE. AND I WANT TO ENCOURAGE STAFF,
7 THERE ARE MORE REPRESENTATIVES THAN JUST SENATOR WIENER
8 ARREGUIN HERE. WE HAVE ALL REPRESENTATIVES, AND IF WE ARE NOT
9 INCLUDING THEM IN THIS PROCESS, I DO BELIEVE SENATOR CORTESE
10 HAS -- WAS VERY VERBAL ON THE LAST GO ROUND, AND I KNOW MY
11 ASSEMBLYMEMBER WHO ALSO SERVES ON TRANSPORTATION, WE NEED TO
12 MAKE THIS A BIGGER POOL OF SUPPORTERS BEFORE WE GO TO
13 SACRAMENTO AND JUST START TELLING EVERYBODY, HEY, WE HAVE GOT
14 THIS. AGAIN, I THINK THESE PRINCIPLES ARE GOOD AND IT'S A
15 START HERE. BUT LET'S NOT JUST RELY ON ONE REPRESENTATIVE, AS
16 WAS DONE LAST TIME, AND WE NEED TO BRING EVERYBODY INTO THE
17 FOLD. OR AS MANY AS WE POSSIBLY CAN, TO MAKE THIS SUCCESSFUL.
18 SO, PLEASE, LET'S TRY TO REALLY BRING MORE TO THE TABLE.
19 BECAUSE THAT WILL ENABLE US TO HAVE MORE SUCCESS. AND THAT
20 ALSO CARRIES ON TO, IF THIS IS A CAMP I KNOW, WE HAVE GOT TO
21 LISTEN TO, AGAIN, AGAIN WE CAN'T CAMPAIGN WHICH IS CLEARLY
22 STATED HERE [LAUGHTER] BUT WHO WOULD BE SUPPORTING A CAMPAIGN?
23 WE HAVE CLEARLY HEARD FROM SOME BUSINESS ORGANIZATIONS THAT IF
24 YOU ARE GOING TO GO AHEAD WITH A PARCEL TAX, THAT'S GOING TO
25 BE -- THEY'RE NOT GOING TO HELP. SO, LET'S BE VERY CAREFUL ON



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 HOW WE PROCEED ON HERE. BECAUSE AGAIN WE DO HAVE COMMON GOALS.
2 THE TIME IS LIMITED AS HAS BEEN POINT THE OUT HERE BUT WE NEED
3 TO BRING MORE PEOPLE INTO THE FOLD, MOVING FORWARD, TO BE
4 STRONGER IN WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. THANK YOU.

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ANY OTHER ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? YOU KNOW,
7 SEEING NONE. FIRST OF ALL, LET ME JUST THANK STAFF FOR THE
8 WONDERFUL WORK THEY HAVE DONE. I DO THINK THERE ARE SOME
9 COMMENTS THAT I THINK ARE CRITICALLY IMPORTANT. I THINK THIS
10 ISSUE OF MOVING FORWARD IN A FAST WAY, A SENSE OF URGENCY I
11 THINK IS GOING TO BE CRITICAL. I THINK THE PRINCIPLES OUTLINED
12 PROVIDE US WITH CLEAR GUIDANCE AND A PATH. AND I'M NOT LOST
13 UPON THE FACT THAT IN TERMS OF US NARROWING IN TERMS OF THE
14 SCOPE AND THE SPECIFICS, THAT WILL COME TO BE. YOU KNOW, I
15 WANT TO SPEAK TO A LITTLE BIT, TO ABOUT THE FOUR COUNTY
16 MEASURE. AND IT'S GREAT TO SEE OUR REPRESENTATIVES FROM SANTA
17 CLARA COUNTY REALLY, SORT OF, ADDRESS THE ISSUE. AND I
18 UNDERSTAND, SORT OF, THEIR CHALLENGES AROUND TAXING. YOU KNOW,
19 I THINK WHAT'S CRITICALLY IMPORTANT, I THINK THE MAYOR HAS
20 ADDRESSED THIS, BUT I THINK IT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED AND IN
21 FURTHER CONVERSATIONS, IF WE MOVE FORWARD WITH THE FOUR-COUNTY
22 MEASURE, YOU KNOW, SAN FRANCISCO, SAN MATEO COUNTY,
23 SPECIFICALLY, WHEN WE HAVE TALKS AROUND CALTRAIN, REALLY WE
24 NEED TO REALLY DEFINE, YOU KNOW, SORT OF, WHAT IS SANTA
25 CLARA'S ROLE. AND, SORT OF, THAT CONTRIBUTION. AND THE REASON



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 I SAY THAT, AND I'M SURE, YOU KNOW, THOSE COMMISSIONERS ARE
2 OPENING TO IT, AND I THINK YOU'RE OPENING TO IT, WHAT I DON'T
3 WANT TO DO IS THROUGH THIS MEASURE IS TO PAY THE FREIGHT,
4 RESPECTFULLY, OF ANOTHER COUNTY THAT IS NOT IN THE MEASURE FOR
5 CALTRAIN. AND, SO, THE REASON I SAY THAT IS CLEARLY, THOSE
6 THAT ARE BEING TAXED WITHIN THIS MEASURE, THOSE DOLLARS SHOULD
7 BE FOCUSED WITHIN THOSE FOUR COUNTIES. RIGHT? AND, SO, CAN YOU
8 SPEAK TO THAT A LITTLE BIT, EXECUTIVE PREMIER AND WHAT THAT
9 MAY LOOK LIKE?

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH. THANK YOU FOR THAT COMMISSION ARE
12 CANEPA. AND LET ME START OUT BY REMINDING FOLKS THAT WE
13 EXECUTED CONTRACT TO WORK ON INDEPENDENT THIRD PARTY REVIEW OF
14 FOUNDATIONS OF HOW TRANSPORTATION FUNDING COMES INTO THE
15 REGION. WE SHOULD GET THAT INFORMATION TO THE COMMISSION IN
16 THE MARCH APRIL TIME FRAME I THINK THAT WILL HELP US GUIDE
17 REALLY THE CORE FOUNDATION OF YOUR QUESTION BUT THE GAME PLAN
18 IS TO TRY TO MAKE SURE THAT THE INVESTMENT THAT'S HAPPENING IN
19 THE COUNTY IS SUPPORTING THE TRANSPORTATION NEEDS IN THAT
20 COUNTY. AND THAT'S OUR COMMITMENT.

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** YEAH, AND THE REASON I SAY THAT IS BECAUSE, YOU
23 KNOW, US, AS COUNTIES, WE'RE ALL UNIQUE. BUT IF THERE ARE --
24 IF SOME COUNTIES ARE LOOKING AT THEIR LOCAL TAX MEASURES, THEN
25 THAT'S GREAT, BUT THEN THE CONTRIBUTIONS THAT THEY HAVE TO,



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 SORT OF, A REGIONAL -- THAT REGIONAL NETWORK, I THINK IT
2 REALLY HAS TO BE ADDRESSED. AND, SO, WITH THAT, I DON'T KNOW?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SIR?

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD JUST LIKE TO WADE INTO THAT CONCERN. MY
9 UNDERSTANDING IS THAT SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND VTA REMAINS FULLY
10 COMMITTED TO FULL SHARE CONTRIBUTION TO CALTRAIN AMONG THE
11 THREE COUNTIES THAT SUPPORT CALTRAIN AND WHETHER THAT'S DONE
12 THROUGH REGIONAL MEASURE OR CONTRIBUTION FROM COUNTY MEASURE
13 OR SOME COMBINATION THAT'S NOT IN DOUBT.

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU FOR THAT.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S RIGHT TO REITERATE I APPRECIATE THE PRINCIPLE
18 WE'RE DOING THIS RESEARCH AND FOLLOW UP CONVERSATION BECAUSE
19 WE FIRMLY BELIEVE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY THAT THE REVENUES WE
20 RAISE OUGHT TO FUND SERVICES THAT ARE NEEDED BY OUR RESIDENTS
21 AND SO GETTING TO A FAIR SHARE CONTRIBUTION TO CALTRAIN BASED
22 ON UTILIZATION AND SERVICE WOULD BE GREAT. AS FOLKS KNOW WE'RE
23 A LITTLE OUT OF WHACK SINCE PASSAGE OF RR WE LOOK FORWARD TO
24 REVISITING THE DATA AND LOOKING AT THAT TOGETHER.

25



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** ALL RIGHT THIS IS WHAT YOU CALL REGIONALISM.

2 CAN WE TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT?

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES BEFORE WE GO INTO PUBLIC COMMENT FOR
5 THIS ITEM I FAILED TO READ INTO THE RECORD PUBLIC COMMENT
6 RECEIVED FOR 12A SO I'M GOING TO DO THAT NOW. LETTERS WERE
7 RECEIVED -- PARDON ME -- CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED FROM BILL
8 HUGH, MIKE CUSTER, MIKE WILMOR, MARJORIE ALVORD, CARTER LADEN,
9 NEIL WILLIAMS REGINA ALL POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND
10 DISTRIBUTED TO YOU LAST NIGHT. MOVING TO 12B WRITTEN
11 CORRESPOND WAS RECEIVED FROM EAST BAY TRANSIT RIDERS UNION AND
12 THE BAY AREA COUNCIL. THOSE HAVE BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE
13 AGENDA AND DISTRIBUTED TO YOU LAST NIGHT. WE DO HAVE A NUMBER
14 OF RAISED HAND IN THE ZOOM SPACE BUT BEFORE WE WILL GO TO IN-
15 HOUSE PUBLIC COMMENT FROM SEBASTIAN PETTY AND ALIX WALKER. YOU
16 WILL EACH HAVE TWO MINUTES?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** ONE MINUTE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:**

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GIVE ME A MOMENT TO ADJUST MY CLOCK AND
23 I WILL PUT IT UP ON THE SCREEN FOR YOU. YOU CAN BEGIN NOW.

24



FEBRUARY 26, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK, VICE CHAIR MOULTON PETERS
2 AND COMMISSIONERS. SPUR IS DEEPLY CONCERNED ABOUT THE FISCAL
3 STATE OF OUR REGION'S TRANSIT SYSTEM AND WE HAVE BEEN
4 FOLLOWING EFFORTS BY YOURSELVES AS WELL AS SENATORS WIENER AND
5 ARREGUIN TO AUTHORIZE A FUTURE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE
6 MEASURE CHALLENGE IS SIGNIFICANT WE SHOULD BE CLEAR EYED THIS
7 IS SUSTAINING AND IMPROVING TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA WILL TAKE
8 ACTIONS AT LOCAL LEVEL STATE LEVEL AND REGIONAL LEVEL. WE KNOW
9 THE PROCESS TO DEVELOP A REGIONAL FUNDING APPROACH HAS BEEN
10 DIFFICULT AND FRAUGHT WITH COMPLEXITY AND WE APPRECIATE THE
11 WORK OF CURRENT AND FORMER COMMISSIONERS AND MTC STAFF TO KEEP
12 PUNISHING FORWARD HERE TODAY TO AFFIRM WE'RE MAKING REAL AND
13 IMPORTANT PROGRESS THAT'S EVIDENT IN THE POLLING YOU HAVE
14 REVIEWED AND IN THE PRIOR ITEM AND THE PRINCIPLES YOU'RE
15 CURRENTLY CONSIDERING. THERE IS MORE TO DO AND MORE DETAILS TO
16 RESOLVE BUT WE BELIEVE YOU ARE ZEROING IN ON AN APPROACH
17 THAT'S REALISTIC AND TRACTABLE THIS IS A SOLVABLE PROBLEM WE
18 ENCOURAGE YOU TO KEEP GOING REMAIN FOCUSED AND COLLABORATIVE
19 AND FLEXIBLE.

20

21 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS ALIX WALKER.

24



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, CHAIR, VICE CHAIR. CONGRATULATIONS ON
2 YOUR APPOINTMENTS.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PARDON ME, WOULD YOU TAP THE MIC?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THERE WE GO. GOOD MORNING CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR,
7 CONGRATULATIONS ON THE APPOINTMENTS AND COMMISSIONERS. ALIX
8 WALKER MANAGER OF LEGISLATIVE AFFAIRS AT BART AND ALSO
9 CONGRATULATIONS TO THE NEW COMMISSIONERS. WANT TO REFLECT
10 SEBASTIAN JUST SAID WE ARE AT BART TEAM PLAYER IN THIS
11 ABSOLUTELY SUPPORTIVE OF KEEPING THINGS MOVING FORWARD WE ARE
12 WORKING TO ADDRESS ISSUES I'M SORRY ABOUT YOUR EXPERIENCE
13 COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT BUT WE'RE WORKING ACTUALLY ON OUR
14 CLEANING OF CARS IN STATIONS NEW LIGHTING IN STATIONS, OUR NEW
15 FARE GATES AND ALSO WORKING FOR MORE EFFICIENCIES FOR EXAMPLE,
16 STRATEGIC HIRING FREEZE AT BART AND MORE EFFICIENCIES ACROSS
17 THE AGENCY WE'RE WORKING TO CONTINUE BUILDING TRUST AND WANT
18 TO CONTINUE PROVIDING INFORMATION AS NEEDED. AS TEAM PLAYER AS
19 YOU ARE TALKING IN SACRAMENTO, WE'RE AMPLIFYING THIS MESSAGE.
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU ALIX.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY WE'LL MOVE TO THE ZOOM SPACE. FIRST
25 UP IS CARTER LAST I KNOW. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** HOW MANY SPEAKERS DO WE HAVE ON ZOOM?

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AT THE MOMENT, THERE ARE NINE. CARTER
5 LAST I KNOW?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** HI YES MY NAME IS CARTER LAST I KNOW I AM COFOUNDER
8 OF TRANSBAY COALITION MEMBER OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC
9 TRANSPORTATION COALITION A LOT OF GOOD STUFF IN THE RIGHT
10 DIRECTION ONE KEY PART IN TERMS OF A MEASURE THAT'S PASSABLE
11 IS SOMETHING THAT USES PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES. THE AS
12 WE'RE SEEING SALES TAXES ARE VERY UNPOPULAR -- THEY'RE
13 REGRESSIVE, AS WE TALKED ABOUT COST OF EGGS, COST OF LIVING
14 COMING UP SO WHEN WE HAVE TAXES ON THINGS LIKE PARTIALS AND
15 OTHER PROGRESSIVE FUNDS WE'LL BE ABLE TO GET A LOT MORE
16 SUPPORT AND FOR PEOPLE LIKE MYSELF AND ALL VOLUNTEERS OF
17 TRANSBAY WHO ARE GOING TO BE THE ONES DOING CITIZEN
18 INITIATIVES YOU KNOW GATHERING ALL THAT STUFF IT'S IMPORTANT
19 WE HAVE A POPULAR THING THAT BOTH PREVENTS ALL CUTS NOT JUST
20 MAJOR CUTS BUT ALL CUTS AS WELL AS INCREASES SERVICE SO WE
21 NEED PROGRESSIVE FUNDING SOURCE AS WE SAW WITH AC TRANSIT
22 SALES TAX IS UNRELIABLE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS PUBLIC ADVOCATES TRANSIT
25 DEPARTMENT.



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **SPEAKER:** HI. THIS IS LAUREL FROM PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND VOICES
3 FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I WANT TO RESPOND TO SOMETHING THAT
4 WAS IN THE BAY AREA'S COUNCIL LETTER ABOUT THE NVTA I WORKED
5 THERE AT THE TIME THIS PROJECT WAS DONE AND I WILL NOTE THAT
6 IF IT WAS DONE AT SCALE IT WOULD NOT HAVE SAVED MONEY THE
7 LESSON FROM THAT PILOT WAS NOT THAT THE AGENCY CAN SAVE MONEY
8 BY MOVING FROM TRAINED PROFESSIONALS TO GIG WORKERS WHICH I
9 WILL NOTE DIDN'T INCLUDE FACTORS AND OTHER SOCIAL COST OF
10 DOING IT THAT THE LESSON IS WHEN YOU PROVIDE PEOPLE WITH
11 DISABILITIES DOOR-TO-DOOR OPTION FIXED ROUTE YOU DON'T HAVE TO
12 BOOK 24 HOURS IN ADVANCE DEMAND THIS MEANS TRANSIT OPERATES
13 AND MOBILITY FREEDOM -- TRANSIT AND IMPROVEMENTS FOR PEOPLE
14 WITH DISABILITIES IS FUNDED IN THIS MEASURE SO WE CAN CHANGE
15 OF THE WAYS PARATRANSIT WORKS SO WE CAN IMPROVE LIVES AND
16 ACCESS TO THE REST OF SOCIETY WHICH AS NOTED IS FREEDOM. THANK
17 YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS PETER AND LILLY.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. THIS IS PETER STRAUSS, ON
22 THE BOARD OF SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS, ALSO VOICES FOR
23 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME ALL NEW MEMBERS
24 TODAY AND I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A COUPLE OF POINTS. FIRST OF
25 ALL IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE STAY LASER FOCUSED ON TRANSIT



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 OPERATIONS. SECONDLY, THIS IS AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION AND FOR
2 THAT IT'S IMPORTANT TO MAXIMIZE THE OPPORTUNITIES FOR
3 PROGRESSIVE FUNDING, BOTH FOR EQUITY AND TO ALSO MAXIMIZE
4 REVENUES. THIRD, CONSISTENT WITH THE SURVEY, IT'S IMPORTANT TO
5 PROVIDE SUFFICIENT FUNDING FOR RESTORATION AND EXPANSION OF
6 SERVICE AND NOT JUST PREVENTION OF FURTHER CUTS. AND LAST IT'S
7 IMPORTANT TO GENERATE SUFFICIENT REVENUE NOT JUST SUSTAIN
8 REGIONAL RAIL OPERATORS BUT TO SUPPORT OUR WORKHORSE BUS
9 OPERATORS LIKE AC TRANSIT AND SF MUNI. MUNI AS YOU KNOW IS BY
10 FAR THE LARGEST OPERATOR BY RIDERSHIP IN THE BAY AREA AND WE
11 HAVE TO RECOGNIZE THAT A MODEST REVENUE MEASURE WILL DECIMATE
12 SERVICE IF IT LEAVES A GAP THAT'S TOO LARGE FOR SAN FRANCISCO
13 TO FILL BY ITSELF. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS PUBLIC ADVOCATES
16 AND OTHER REPRESENTATIVES.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. MY NAME IS EMILY WHEELER, I AM, AS YOU KNOW,
19 WITH PUBLIC ADVOCATES AND AS STATED WE ARE A MEMBER OF THE
20 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. WHEN I WAS IN HIGH
21 SCHOOL MY BUS ROUTE TO MY JOB WAS CUT AND SINCE THEN I HAVE
22 ONLY SEEN MORE BUS ROUTES ON AC TRANSIT CUT SERVICE AND GET
23 WORSE TO THE POINT I WILL JUMP THROUGH MANY HOOPS TO AVOID
24 TRANSFERRING BUSES IF YOU WANT VOTERS TO BE EXCITE ABOUT A
25 MEASURE YOU NEED TO IMPROVE TRANSIT AND THAT CAME ACROSS IN



1 THE POLLS. IT IS UPON MTC THE LEGISLATURE AND THE CAMPAIGN,
2 THE PEOPLE RUNNING THE CAMPAIGN, TO CONVINCED VOTERS THAT THERE
3 WILL BE IMPROVEMENTS AND THAT THIS IS SOMETHING TO VOTE FOR.
4 YOU SHOULDN'T BE SCARED OF THE VOTERS AND LET ANYONE'S DESIRE
5 NOT SPEND -- THE PROGRESSIVE TAX WILL REDUCE BURDEN ON WORKING
6 PEOPLE AND HELP GET SUPPORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN.

9

10 **ADINA LEVIN:** HELLO. ADINA LEVIN, SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND PART OF
11 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. WANTED TO SUPPORT THE
12 PREVIOUS COMMENT ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF TRANSIT
13 TRANSFORMATION. THIS IS SOMETHING THAT SHOWS UP IN POLL AFTER
14 POLL, VOTERS EXPECT THE SYSTEM TO GET BETTER. ALSO, IN THE
15 TOPIC OF FAIRNESS, IT'S IMPORTANT ALSO SHOWING UP IN THE
16 POLLING WITH PEOPLE WANTING THIS TRANSIT TO SUPPORT PEOPLE
17 WITH LOW-INCOMES AND SENIORS AND YOUTH AND PEOPLE WITH
18 DISABILITIES TO HAVE A FORMULA THAT NOT ONLY BENEFITS AGENCIES
19 WITH HISTORICALLY HIGH FARES, BUT AGENCIES, INCLUDING MUNI AND
20 AC TRANSIT, THAT SERVE LOTS OF LOW-INCOME AND SENIORS, PEOPLE
21 WITH DISABILITIES, ET CETERA, AND IN TERMS OF THE
22 CONSTITUENCIES TO SUPPORT, PLEASE CONSIDER THE ORGANIZATIONS
23 INCLUDING THE NON-PROFITS AND VOLUNTEERS THAT WILL TURN OUT
24 AND DO THE PHONE BANKING AND FLIERING AND NEED TO HAVE



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 SOMETHING THAT IS MOTIVATING BY IMPROVING MAINTAINING AND
2 IMPROVING THE TRANSIT SYSTEM. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SUZANNE KAYE.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS SUZANNE, I LIVE IN SAN FRANCISCO AND I
7 AM PART OF INDIVISIBILITY SAN FRANCISCO WE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT
8 THE PROPOSED CUTS TO MUNI THAT'S BEING DISCUSSED RIGHT NOW AND
9 WE'RE GLAD THAT YOU'RE -- I'M REALLY GLAD THAT YOU'RE BOARD IS
10 LOOKING AT PREVENTING, THESE CUTS AND KEEPING TRANSIT AROUND
11 FOR YEARS BECAUSE SAN FRANCISCO HAS BEEN BUILDING A TRANSIT
12 FIRST CITY AND HAVE MADE IT DIFFICULT TO GET AROUND ANY OTHER
13 WAY AND I AND MANY PEOPLE I KNOW USE MAIN WAY OF GETTING
14 AROUND TRANSIT GLAD YOU'RE LOOKING AT MULTIPLE WAYS TO SAVE
15 THIS I'M WONDERING IF YOU'RE LOOKING AT TAXI RIDE-SHARE
16 COMPANIES THAT WAS A PROPOSITION THAT GOT PASSED LAST YEAR AND
17 HAD MAJORITY OF VOTER SUPPORT AND IT WOULD HAVE BEEN ENACTED -
18 - PROP M. IT SEEMS TO ME THAT'S VALID AND USEFUL FORM OF
19 REVENUE FOR TO SOLVE THIS. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS VINAY PIMPLE.

22 VINAY PIMPLE? OKAY. WE'LL GO AHEAD AND MOVE ON TO ADAM HALL --
23 OR, NOPE. ADAM HALL?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** YES.



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** SO, I AM AT SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY, AND WE'RE
5 CURRENTLY TRYING TO GET THE BAY PASS PROGRAM FOR ALL OF OUR
6 STUDENTS, SO IF THEY CAN RIDE BART OR CALTRAIN. AND ONE OF THE
7 STRUGGLES WE'RE FACING IS SOMETHING EARLIER COMMENTERS HAVE
8 TALKED ABOUT IS WHERE THERE IS A PERCEPTION THAT BART IS
9 FACING SERIOUS CUTS AND THAT RIDERSHIP STILL HASN'T RECOVERED
10 FROM THE PANDEMIC, SO PEOPLE ARE ASKING WHY SHOULD WE MORE
11 THAN DOUBLE OUR PUBLIC TRANSIT COSTS JUST TO PAY FOR LESS
12 SERVICE THAN WE HAD IN 2019. AND, SO, IN UNLESS WE CAN FIND
13 SOME WAY TO PROMISE PEOPLE TO INCREASE SERVICE IN EXCHANGE FOR
14 INCREASING THEIR STUDENT ENROLLMENT FEES, THIS IS GOING TO BE
15 JUST AS MUCH OF A CHALLENGE AS A REGIONAL SALES TAX MEASURE IS
16 GOING TO BE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. VINAY PIMPLE. YOUR HAND IS
19 RAISED ON OUR SCREEN. WE'LL GO AHEAD AND MOVE TO THE NEXT
20 SPEAKER. SARAH GREENWALD.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M SARAH GREENWALD WITH 350 BAY AREA, WHICH IS
23 PART OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION. AND FIRST
24 CONGRATULATIONS THAT WE'RE MOVING FORWARD WITH A FUNDING
25 MEASURE TO SUSTAIN THE GREAT CLIMATE BENEFIT THAT IS PUBLIC



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 TRANSIT. VOTERS, I THINK FROM THE POLLING, THEY DO WANT TO SEE
2 IMPROVEMENTS TO OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM AS PEOPLE HAVE BEEN SAYING,
3 AND ONE THAT'S JUST GOING TO PREVENT CUTS AND NOT MAKE IT
4 WORSE WILL NOT SELL PEOPLE WHO ARE GOING IT FEEL LIKE THEY'RE
5 JUST THROWING MONEY AT THE SAME THING. FOR THE TRANSPORTATION
6 REVENUE MEASURE PRINCIPLES OVERALL I'M VERY IMPRESSED, A
7 CLIMATE POSITIVE PRINCIPLE ACKNOWLEDGING THE IMPORTANCE OF
8 MAINTAINING ACCESSIBLE SAFE AND RELIABLE FREQUENT PUBLIC
9 TRANSIT FOR MITIGATING THE CLIMATE CRISIS WOULD BE EFFECTIVE
10 PEOPLE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THIS NOW AND WE CAN'T FORGET OR
11 IGNORE THE FACT THAT A BUS TAKES A LOT OF CARS OFF THE ROAD
12 AND IT PRODUCES 20 TO 50% LESS THAN THE EQUIVALENT NUMBER OF
13 GASOLINE POWERED CARS, AND THAT THIS IS A VERY SIGNIFICANT
14 PART OF OUR CARBON EMISSIONS.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THAT IS YOUR TIME. NEXT UP IS
17 TOMASSO.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HI. I'M A RESIDENT IN OAKLAND I DO NOT OWN A CAR AND
20 I AM A FRIEND OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. MY IN-LAWS
21 LIVE IN SEBASTOPOL AND I HAVE NO WAY TO VISIT THEM NOW BECAUSE
22 IT WOULD TAKE FOUR HOURS, AND I WOULD GET STUCK THERE FOR
23 SERVICE SO A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE WOULD NOT IMPROVE MY
24 ABILITY TO ACCESS, LIKE SONOMA, WOULD BE REALLY HARD TO SELL
25 TO PEOPLE LIKE MY IN-LAWS WE NEED TO EXPAND PUBLIC TRANSIT AND



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 MAKE IT POSSIBLE FOR PEOPLE TO GET AROUND OUR REGION WITHOUT
2 CARS. IT NEEDS TO BE PROGRESSIVE TAX WE SAW FACEBOOK AND META
3 WAS ABLE TO SPEND \$50 BILLION ON BUILDING A USELESS PRODUCT
4 THERE IS ENOUGH WEALTH IN OUR REGION UNFORTUNATELY IT'S ALL ON
5 THE TOP SO WE NEED A PROGRESSIVE TAXATION THAT BRINGS IN
6 REVENUE WE NEED TO TURN OUR REGION INTO A WELL CONNECTED
7 MODERN HUB INSTEAD OF THE CURRENT STATUTES QUO. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ANNE PLEASE GO AHEAD AND
10 UNMUTE YOURSELF. OKAY YOUR HAND IS RAISED ON OUR END.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** SORRY CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** HIGH NAME IS ANNE HARVEY I'M WITH 350 EAST BAY MEMBER
17 OF VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION AND I WANT TO
18 SUPPORT PROGRESSIVE FUNDING -- LIKE, PROGRESSIVE TAXES, NOT
19 SALES TAXES, AND ENOUGH FUNDING TO REALLY IMPROVE SERVICES AND
20 PARTICULARLY TO SUPPORT AC TRANSIT AND MUNI THAT CARRY ABOUT
21 75% OF TRANSIT TRIPS OF THE FOUR LARGEST AGENCIES. I LIVE IN
22 OAKLAND AND USE AC TRANSIT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ROBERT'S IPHONE.

25



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** HI BOB ALLEN URBAN HABITAT VOICES FOR PUBLIC
2 TRANSPORTATION COALITION GETTING OFF PUBLIC TRANSIT RIGHT NOW
3 SORRY ABOUT THE LOUD NOISE I'M GOING TO ECHO LAUREL'S COMMENTS
4 ON THE NEEDS ABOUT THE SYSTEM THE 2020 POLL WE DID WITH ENC
5 SHOWED PROGRESSIVE REVENUE SOURCES, HIGH INCOME TAX EARNERS
6 WOULD GARNER MOST PUBLIC SUPPORT PLEASE CONSIDER THAT AS A
7 REVENUE SOURCE GO BIG AND ADDRESS THE REAL NEEDS OF THE SYSTEM
8 WHICH WE COMPLAINT ADDRESS PIE MIMICKING THE LANGUAGE OF
9 AUSTERITY THAT WE HEAR IN WASHINGTON DC. EVERYONE AGREES WE
10 SHOULD BE MORE EFFICIENT BUT GUTTING PUBLIC SECTOR WORKERS AND
11 OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM WITH THE LANGUAGE OF EFFICIENCY WHEN WE
12 HAVE NOT BEEN ADEQUATELY FUNDING PUBLIC TRANSIT AND HIGHWAYS
13 AND ROADS AT THE FEDERAL, STATE, COUNTY, LOCAL CITY LEVEL
14 WHEREVER, THAT'S FUNDAMENTAL ISSUE WE NEED TO CORRECT WITH
15 THIS MEASURE WE HOPE TO TAKE ON THAT TASK. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BEFORE I GO TO THE NEXT CALLER IF THERE
18 ARE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK PLEASE
19 RAISE YOUR HAND NOW SO WE ENSURE WE CALL UPON YOU BEFORE WE
20 MOVE ON. NEXT UP WE HAVE SARAH BLAINE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HI. MY NAME IS SARAH BLAINE, I AM A MEMBER OF
23 GENESIS, ALSO A MEMBER OF ADVOCATES -- VOICES FOR PUBLIC
24 TRANSPORTATION. AND I LIVE IN OAKLAND, AND I OWN MY OWN HOME
25 AND MY NEIGHBORHOOD IS SERVED BY TRANSIT AND THAT MAKES MY



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 HOME VALUABLE. MY FRIENDS, I HAVE A LARGE GROUP OF PEOPLE IN
2 MY NEIGHBORHOOD WHO ARE AGEING IN PLACE IN THAT NEIGHBORHOOD.
3 WE'LL BE RELYING MORE AND MORE ON TRANSIT AND ON PARA TRANSIT.
4 AND I URGE THE COMMISSION TO GO BIG. WE WILL WORK HARD TO SELL
5 A MEASURE THAT IMPROVES PUBLIC TRANSIT, THAT MEETS CLIMATE
6 CHANGE GOALS, AND IMPROVES PARATRANSIT ACROSS DIFFERENT
7 AGENCIES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ANTHONY FROM EAST BAY TRANSIT
10 RIDERS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ANTHONY CAMP ANNA WITH EAST BAY TRANSIT
13 RIDERS UNION REFERRING TO A LETTER THIS'S INCLUDED AND
14 BRINGING FUNDING THROUGH SB125 AND SB1031, THE PUBLIC WANTS TO
15 SEE IMPROVEMENTS WE SEE THAT REFLECTED IN POLLING RESULTS
16 THERE HAS BEEN SQUABBLING ABOUT WHO HAS DEFICIT WHICH COUNTIES
17 OPT IN OR OUT AND WHETHER THIS IS GOING TO INTERFERE WITH
18 LOCAL TAX RENEWALS AND FUNDAMENTALLY THE HALF CENT MEASURE IS
19 TOO SMALL, INCLUDING REDUCING DRIVING BY 30% FROM 2019 LEVELS
20 AND TRIPLING CALIFORNIA'S TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IN 2024 WE
21 SHOULDN'T PREMATURELY CAP THIS HALF CENT SALES TAX PLEASE
22 STRIKE BULLET POINT NUMBER ONE FROM THE FIRST PRINCIPLE SO
23 THAT FULL PROCESS CAN BE HAD TO LOOK AT BETTER OPTIONS. THANK
24 YOU.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU NEXT UP IS JORDAN GRIMES.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS JORDAN GRIMES STATE
4 REGIONAL RESILIENCE MANAGER AT GREEN BELT ALLIANCE POLLING
5 SHOWS YEAR OVER YEAR IMPROVEMENT ON VOTER ATTITUDES TOWARDS
6 PUBLIC TRANSIT. PEOPLE DON'T JUST RELY ON ONE AGENCY IN ONE
7 JURISDICTION TO MEET THEIR NEEDS ANYWHERE. AND TRANSIT FUNDING
8 SHOULD BE CONSIDERED ACCORDINGLY. I PERSONALLY USE CALTRAIN
9 AND BART TODAY, AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE BOTH OF THOSE AGENCIES
10 ARE FUNDED. WE HAVE HEARD A LOT ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF
11 LISTENING VERY CAREFULLY TO THE VOTERS AND I THINK EVERYONE IS
12 IN AGREEMENT ON THAT POINT. THE VOTERS VERY CLEARLY BELIEVE IN
13 PUBLIC TRANSIT. THEY WANT IT TO SUCCEED AND THEY WANT A
14 MEASURE THAT PROVIDES TRANSFORMATIVE CHANGE NOT JUST PER PET
15 YATES STATUTES QUO MESHING FAIRNESS FOR HOW WE MOVE ACROSS THE
16 REGION AND WE NEED TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE ENOUGH MONEY TO
17 DELIVER CHANGE. THANK YOU SO MUCH. THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS
18 AIDEN.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS AIDEN JONES I AM A MEMBER OF SAN
21 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. I WAS ALSO A LARGE VOLUNTEER FOR THE
22 PROP L CAMPAIGN IN SAN FRANCISCO. AND IF I'M GOING TO GO BACK
23 OUT THERE AGAIN, I NEED YOU TO ALLOW ME TO DO MY JOB WELL IN
24 TALKING TO THE CITIZENS OF SAN FRANCISCO, ENSURE THAT ANY
25 REGIONAL WIDE MEASURE WILL DO MORE THAN JUST PREVENT CUTS, IT



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 WILL MAINTAIN AND IMPROVE SERVICE. AND ENSURE THAT THE FUNDING
2 IS EQUITABLE, INCLUDING AS MANY OTHERS HAVE SAID, PROGRESSIVE
3 TAXES AND ENSURE THAT THE FUNDING WILL BE DISTRIBUTED
4 EQUITABLY ACROSS THE TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT NEED IT, INCLUDING,
5 YES, MY AGENCY OF MUNI HERE IN SAN FRANCISCO. THANK YOU FOR
6 YOUR TIME

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS SONJA HERERRA.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** HI. THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR TAKING THE TIME TO CONSIDER
11 THIS AND DOING ALL THE POLLING. I WANT TO ALSO SPEAK IN
12 SUPPORT OF THE REGIONAL TAX MEASURES. I THINK THIS POLLING
13 SHOWS A POSITIVE TRAJECTORY. I ALSO AM IN FAVOR OF IF THE TAX
14 MEASURE PASSES, SPREADING THESE REVENUES EQUITABLY AMONG THE
15 TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT SEE THE HIGHEST LEVELS OF RIDERSHIP LIKE
16 AC TRANSIT AND SF MUNI. I THINK THE POLLING SHOWS THAT A
17 REGIONAL TAX MEASURE, LIKE FOR THE FOUR COUNTIES AND NINE
18 COUNTIES RESPECTIVELY, WOULD BE BENEFICIAL TOWARD GETTING MORE
19 REVENUES FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA. BUT THANK
20 YOU SO MUCH.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS CONNOR.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS TANNER WITH TRANSBAY VOICES FOR PUBLIC
25 TRANSPORTATION COALITION. ECHOING WHAT EVERYONE HAS BEEN



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 SAYING, VOTER VALUES, PROVEN TRANSIT SYSTEM NOT JUST CUTS WE
2 WANT TO SEE TRANSFORMATIVE CHANGES CLEANER CARS CLEANER BUSES
3 CLEANER TRAINS. MORE SERVICES AND SUCH. AND WITH HOW WE ARE
4 RESPONDING TO CONCERNS ABOUT COST OF LIVING I WANT TO ASK TO
5 INCLUDE OPTIONS FOR PROGRESSIVE TAXES, ENSURE THAT THE MEASURE
6 HAS THE MOST CHANCES OF SUCCESS WHEN IT GOES TO POLLS. THANK
7 YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
10 RAISED HANDS AT THIS TIME.

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WITH THAT BEING
13 SAID, I MOVE APPROVAL OF THE PROPOSED PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE
14 MTC'S ADVOCACY ON ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A TRANSPORTATION
15 REVENUE MEASURE. THE.

16

17 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** IS THERE A SECOND?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

20

21 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND.
22 CANEPA AND JOHN-BAPTISTE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

25



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS?
2 OKAY. ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS? OH, WE ALREADY HAD THOSE. WHEW,
3 ALMOST DID THAT ALL OVER AGAIN. THAT WOULDN'T HAVE BEEN GOOD.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I WE WANT LET YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** ROLL CALL VOTE THEN.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

10

11 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

14

15 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ANDERSON?

18

19 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT.

22 CANEPA?

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

2

3 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

6

7 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

10

11 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

14

15 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN?

18

19 **MITCH MASHBURN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MELGAR? HAS STEPPED AWAY. MILEY IS

22 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

2

3 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RAMOS?

10

11 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
14 PRESENT.

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ON TO ITEM 12C,
17 SENATE BILL 239 ARREGUIN, RALPH M. BROWN ACT TELECONFERENCE
18 REFORM THIS ITEM REQUESTS APPROVAL COSPONSOR EXPANSION OF
19 REMOTE MEETING DECISION MAKERS LOCAL LEGISLATIVE ADVISORY
20 BOARDS THAT DO NOT TAKE FINAL ACTION I MOVE APPROVAL TO
21 COSPONSOR SENATE BILL 239.

22

23 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** SECOND KAPLAN.

24

25 **CHAIR, SUE NOACK:** WE HAVE MOTION AND SECOND. PUBLIC COMMENT?



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
3 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM. I HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH A
4 BLUE SPEAKER CARD, IN ADDITION TO ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD AND -
5 - MISS DUPREE, ONE MINUTE.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR DAVID CAMPOS. ALETA DUPREE FOR
8 THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLDS. IT'S ABOUT TIME THE
9 MEETING PROCEDURE BE UPDATED. TOWN MEETINGS GO BACK TO
10 PRECOLONIAL TIMES. 17th CENTURY IN NEW ENGLAND. AND I THINK WE
11 SHOULD BE ADVOCATING FOR SOMETHING MORE EXPANSIVE THAN WHAT WE
12 HAVE HERE. IN THAT THIS EXPANSIVE PROTOCOL FOR PUBLIC MEETINGS
13 SHOULD BE EXTENDED TO BODIES THAT HAVE FINAL DECISION MAKING
14 AUTHORITY. IT SHOULDN'T BE BIFURCATED. THERE ARE PEOPLE WHO
15 HAVE DISABILITIES WHO CAN AND I WOULD HOPE WILL JOIN THESE TOP
16 LEVEL BOARDS, AND WE HAVE TO HAVE A UNIFORM SOLUTION FOR THIS.
17 I ADVOCATE FOR SOMETHING BIGGER THAN WHAT WE HAVE NOW. THANK
18 YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN.

21

22 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN. I SERVE ON THE MTC POLICY ADVISORY
23 COUNCIL AND CHAIR THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER ADVISORY
24 GROUP. I AM SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, BUT REPORTING ON ACTIONS OF
25 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL OVER TIME WHICH IS TO STRONGLY



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 SUPPORT LEGISLATION SUCH AS WHAT'S BEING SPONSORED -- BEING
2 AUTHORED BY SENATOR ARREGUIN, ENABLING MEMBERS OF ADVISORY
3 BODIES TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY IS SOMETHING THAT REALLY HELPS
4 INCREASE PARTICIPATION. WE HAVE A VERY LARGE REGION AND PEOPLE
5 WITH A DIVERSE SET OF LIFE CIRCUMSTANCES WHO REALLY WANT TO
6 SERVE THE COMMUNITY BY SERVING IN AN ADVISORY CAPACITY, AND
7 THIS IS SOMETHING THAT REALLY HELPS YOU GET A DIVERSITY OF
8 INPUT FROM AROUND THE REGION. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR --
9 AND I HOPE THAT YOU VOTE YES ON THIS ITEM.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. CAROLE TAYLOR?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** HI. CAROLE TAYLOR. I AM CHAIR OF THE SONOMA COUNTY
14 IHSS PUBLIC AUTHORITY ADVISORY COMMITTEE AND WE HAVE NEVER HAD
15 THE NUMBER OF CLIENTS THAT WE ARE SUPPOSED TO HAVE. WE'RE
16 SUPPOSED TO HAVE FIVE CLIENTS ON OUR COMMITTEE. WE CAN
17 SOMETIMES GET THREE, USUALLY TWO. AND THAT'S BECAUSE THE
18 CLIENTS ARE DISABLED PEOPLE WHO COMPLAINT LEAVE THEIR HOMES.
19 SO FOR THE FUNCTIONS OF OUR COMMITTEE AND I'M SURE MANY
20 OTHERS, THIS KIND OF ZOOM PARTICIPATION IS JUST A REAL NEED
21 FOR US TO BE MEETING THE STANDARDS THAT WE'RE SUPPOSED TO
22 MEET. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED?

25



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU SO MUCH I AM ALSO A MECHANIC OF
2 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND MANY SUBCOMMITTEES AND FOR
3 YEARS I WAS ON THE EAST BAY COMMUNITY ENERGY, NOW AVA
4 COMMUNITY ENERGY BOARD. WE STRUGGLED THROUGHOUT -- WELL, WE
5 HAVE ALWAYS STRUGGLED TO BE ABLE TO GET ENOUGH PEOPLE TO
6 PARTICIPATE. IT MAKES MEETINGS RUN REALLY LATE. IT IS A
7 DECIDED BARER TO PARTICIPATION FOR A LOT OF THE FOLKS THAT
8 WANT TO GET ON OUR BODIES I WOULD ENCOURAGE NOT JUST A YES
9 VOTE BUT FOLLOW UP ACTION OF FINANCIAL SUPPORT WHATEVER NEEDS
10 TO HAPPEN IN ORDER TO GET THIS PASSED. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN?

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN, I AM PREVIOUS CHAIR OF
15 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL I HAVE SERVED MULTIPLE TERMS ON
16 THAT BODY I AM A PREVIOUS CHAIR OF A NUMBER OF COMMUNITY
17 ORGANIZATIONS. IT IS A GREAT DISSERVICE TO OUR COMMUNITY THAT
18 EMBODIES, THAT DON'T HAVE FINAL SAY IT'S ALSO DISCRIMINATORY
19 PRACTICE TO NOT ALLOW THEM TO ATTEND REMOTELY I CERTAINLY HOPE
20 THAT THIS HAS YOUR SUPPORT AND THAT WE CAN WORK TO MAKE SURE
21 THAT EVERYBODY'S VOICE IS HEARD AND THAT EVERYBODY CAN
22 PARTICIPATE IN THE PUBLIC PROCESS AS WE GO FORWARD. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
25 RAISED HANDS, MR. CHAIR.



1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. WITH THAT, DID I MOVE THE ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I DON'T RECALL.

5

6 **DAVID CANEPA:** OKAY. SO I'LL MOVE APPROVAL COSPONSOR SENATE
7 BILL 239.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION BY COMMISSIONER CANEPA, SECONDED
12 BY VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

13

14 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I'LL GO AHEAD AND CALL THE ROLL
17 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

24



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN. NOW I
2 HAVE TO GET MYSELF TOGETHER. [LAUGHTER] SO SORRY. [LAUGHTER]
3 COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?

4

5 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER BURT?

8

9 **PAT BURT:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSION ARE CANEPA?

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING IN.

16

17 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

20

21 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

24

25 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** YES.



1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MANFREE?

3

4 **AMBER MANFREE:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR?

7

8 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK HAS STEPPED AWAY. THANK YOU.

15 COMMISSIONER PAPAN? HAS ALSO STEPPED AWAY. COMMISSIONER RAMOS?

16

17 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

20 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. YOUR MIC?

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** WITH THAT WE'LL GO TO THE REGIONAL NEEDS HOUSING

23 ALLOCATION CREDIT FOR PRESERVATION AGENDA ITEM 12D THIS ITEM

24 REQUESTS APPROVAL TO COSPONSOR A BILL AB 670 BY ASSEMBLYMEMBER

25 SHARON SILVA TO ALLOW CITIES AND CANDIDATES TO EARN CREDIT FOR



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION RHNA TARGETS PRESERVING
2 NATURALLY OCCURRING AFFORDABLE HOUSING WITH LONG-TERM DEED
3 RESTRICTIONS. AB 670 WAS INTRODUCED SAME DAY THE LEGISLATION
4 COMMITTEE TOOK ACTION SO THE BILL NUMBER WASN'T NOTED AT THAT
5 TIME WHICH IS WHY IT WASN'T LISTED IN THE MEMO I MOVE APPROVAL
6 TO COSPONSOR AB 670 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION CREDIT
7 FOR PRESERVATION BILL.

8

9 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** ASHCRAFT SECONDS.

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION BY CANEPA, SECOND
14 ASHCRAFT WE'LL GO FIRST TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I HAVE NO RAISED
15 HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM, AND
16 I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM. WITH THAT
17 I'LL GO AHEAD AND DO A ROLL CALL VOTE. COMMISSION ARE ABE-
18 KOGA?

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** THAT'S AN AYE. [LAUGHTER]

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR AYE COMMISSIONER AHN.

2 COMMISSIONER ANDERSON?

3

4 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?

7

8 **MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** BURT?

11

12 **PAT BURT:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA? FLEMING?

15

16 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOHN-BAPTISTE?

19

20 **ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** KAPLAN?

23

24 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** AYE.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE?

2

3 **AMBER MANFREE:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MASHBURN? MELGAR?

6

7 **MYRNA MELGAR:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-
10 PETERS?

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK HAS STEPPED AWAY. PAPAN HAS
15 STEPPED AWAITING. COMMISSIONER RAMOS?

16

17 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
20 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

21

22 **DAVID CANEPA:** THIS CONCLUDES THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO VICE
25 CHAIR.



1

2 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THAT'S RIGHT. STANDING IN FOR OUR
3 CHAIR. WE'LL MOVE NOW TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ALL RIGHT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT ITEM 13 I
6 HAVE ONE BLUE SPEAKER CARD FROM ALEC MILLER. MR. MILLER, IF
7 YOU ARE STILL HERE, GO AHEAD AND APPROACH THE PODIUM. YOU WILL
8 HAVE ONE MINUTE.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON MY NAME IS ALIX MILLER I LIVE IN THE
11 GREAT CITY OF SEA SIDE MONTEREY COUNTY UNFORTUNATELY WE'RE NOT
12 PART OF YOUR COUNTY BUT WOULD LOVE TO BE WE HAVE GREAT PUBLIC
13 TRANSPORTATION IN MONTH RAY COUNTY. I AM A LUCKY MAN I GOT A
14 HOUSE IN SOUTH LAKE TAHOE I DRIVE FROM MONTEREY TO SOUTH LAKE
15 TAHOE BEST TWO PLACES IN CALIFORNIA AND I TAKE MY CAR, AND I
16 KNOW THIS IS ABOUT TRANSPORTATION, BUT I TAKE MY CAR AND I
17 HAVE A FASTRAK ACCOUNT, BUT I GET BOMBARDED, BOMBARDED WITH
18 MAIL FROM THIS AGENCY. FASTRAK, I CAN'T EVEN KEEP TRACK. THE
19 HOUSING PURCHASE IS NO PROBLEM. THE FASTRAK IS THE PROBLEM.
20 AND IT DOESN'T STOP THERE. THE LETTERS CONTINUOUSLY GET
21 SUPPORT TO ME. I PAY THE BILL, I GET MORE LETTERS IN THE MAIL.
22 I DON'T GET IT. I JUST DON'T GET IT. I HAD A FASTRAK ACCOUNT.
23 I HAVE PAID THESE, AND WHEN YOU PAY THESE, THERE IS NO PLACE
24 TO DISPUTE. AND MOST PLACES DO HAVE A DISPUTE. AND THAT'S PART
25 OF BEING IN GOVERNMENT, THERE SHOULD BE SOME KIND OF DISPUTE



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 ON THIS. SO, TODAY, I HAVE BROUGHT MY CASH. AND I'M READY TO
2 PAY. THE FIRST ONE IS A TOLL --

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MR. MILLER THAT, IS YOUR TIME.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS PUBLIC COMMENT I'M ALLOWED TO DO THIS.

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** WELL, WE'RE GOING TO GIVE YOU A FEW
9 MORE MOMENTS AND THEN WE CAN REFER YOU.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THIS'S OKAY. I'LL PAY MY TOLL. BUT IT'S TOO MUCH.
12 IT'S TOO MUCH COMMUNICATION. AND QUITE FRANKLY, MY BIGGEST
13 PROBLEM IS NOW THAT PUBLIC COMMENT IS AT THE END OF THE
14 MEETING.

15

16 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU, SIR.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** AT THE PUBLIC COMMENT AT THE BEGINNING OF THE MEETING
19 THE CHAMBER WAS FULL THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR WAS HERE AND NOW
20 MORE MEMBERS HAVE LEFT. THE MEETING -- PUBLIC COMMENT SHOULD
21 GO FIRST.

22

23 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** WE'LL HAVE STAFF CONNECT WITH YOU
24 AFTER THIS MEETING.

25



FEBRURARY 26, 2025

1 **SPEAKER:** SHOULD GO FIRST.

2

3 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** OUR CFO IS HERE AND IS HAPPY TO
4 DISCUSS YOUR SITUATION.

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENT. IS THERE
7 ANYONE ELSE ONLINE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
10 HANDS MADAM CHAIR.

11

12 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT. THIS
13 MEETING IS ADJOURNED AND WE'LL START THE BATA MEETING IN JUST
14 A MOMENT. [ADJOURNED]

15



NTT

Broadcasting Government