



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



DECEMBER 11, 2024

PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 11TH, 2024, 9:45 AM

V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY: ALL RIGHT. GOOD MORNING. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMISSIONER SUPERVISOR MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL NINE, STAR NINE, AND YOU WILL -- AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL?

CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR MILEY?

V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSION ARE ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY?

DINA EL-TAWANSY: HERE.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

2

3 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE .

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN? PRESENT BUT NOT AT THE DAIS.

14 COMMISSIONER NON-VOTING SCHAFF?

15

16 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU AGENDA ITEM TWO INCLUDES ITEMS

21 2A THROUGH 2H. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO

22 PULL AN ITEM FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR? OKAY. DO I HAVE A

23 MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT?

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** FLEMING SECOND.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD
5 LIKE TO HAVE COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? OKAY. WERE THERE ANY ITEMS
6 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM? ANY
7 COMMENTS?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED, NO ONE IN THE
10 ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. WILL THE CLERK -- WE GOT A MOTION,
13 DIDN'T WE?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE HAD A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN
16 AND SECOND COMMISSIONER FLEMING. WITH THAT, VICE CHAIR MILEY?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY CALL THE ROLL.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

25



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

16

17 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
20 PRESENT.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SO, AGENDA ITEM 3A. THE
23 REGIONAL COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT, PROJECT PARTNERS IN MEMORANDUM
24 OF UNDERSTANDING WITH PROJECT SPONSOR AND FUNDING PARTNERS,
25 BAY AREA MEGA PROJECT, DIRIDON STATION, AND THE TRANSBAY JOINT



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 POWERS AUTHORITY REQUEST TO AUTHORIZE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
2 WITH DIRIDON STATION COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WITH PROJECT
3 PARTNERS IN THE TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY IN MEMORANDUM
4 UNDERSTANDING WITH THE PROJECT SPONSOR FUNDING AND ESTABLISH
5 ROLLED AND RESPONSIBILITIES FOR THE NEXT PHASE OF THESE
6 PROJECTS. I WOULD LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO OUR EXECUTIVE
7 DIRECTOR IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO MAKE ANY INTRODUCTORY MARKS
8 BEFORE TURN IT OVER TO JAMES AND THERESA TO PRESENT THIS ITEM
9 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.

10

11 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU VICE CHAIR MILEY I THINK IT'S AN
12 EXCITING OPPORTUNITY TO TALK ABOUT THESE PROJECTS AND IT'S
13 IMPORTANT TO PUT CONTEXT TO THE DISCUSSION IN 2022 A WORKSHOP
14 ON MEGA PROJECT DELIVERY THE COMMISSION DIRECTED STAFF TO
15 ESTABLISH THE MAJOR PROJECT POLICY TO ASSIST IN DELIVERING
16 MEGA PROJECTS INCLUDED IN PLANNED BAY AREA STAFF WAS DIRECTED
17 TO GET MORE INVOLVED IN THE REGION'S MEGA PROJECTS ESPECIALLY
18 DURING PROJECT DEVELOPMENT STAGES EARLY AND OFTEN TO REALLY
19 DEAL WITH RISK MANAGEMENT AND TO BE AN ACTIVE INVESTOR. THE
20 DIRIDON STATION IN SAN JOSE AND THE PORTAL PROJECT WHICH WOULD
21 EXTEND CALTRAIN TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO ARE TWO EXAMPLES
22 WHERE MTC IS PURSUING THAT CHANGE AS PART OF AN INTEGRATED
23 MULTI-PARTNER PROJECT TEAM THIS. HAS GIVEN US A BETTER
24 UNDERSTANDING OF THE PROJECT DESIGN, CONTRACTING APPROACHES
25 AND RISKS, AND ALLOWS US TO BRING BETTER INFORMATION MORE



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 QUICKLY TO THE COMMISSION. IN BOTH CASES, THE AGENCIES
2 INVOLVED WISH TO CONTINUE THE PARTNERSHIP INTO THE NEXT
3 DELIVERY PHASES, ENVIRONMENTAL CLEARANCE FOR DIRIDON AND
4 CONSTRUCTION FOR THE PORTAL. THE AGREEMENTS BEFORE YOU TODAY
5 ARE ALSO INTENDED TO DO JUST THAT, AND I CONSIDER THIS TO BE A
6 VERY GOOD DEVELOPMENT THAT IS HELPING THE REGION APPROACH MEGA
7 PROJECTS MUCH MORE EFFECTIVELY. REGIONAL PARTICIPATION AND
8 LEADERSHIP BY MTC IS MORE IMPORTANT NOW THAN EVER AS WE SEE
9 INCREASED COMPETITION FOR SCARCE CAPITAL GRANT OPPORTUNITIES
10 AT THE FEDERAL, STATE, REGIONAL, AND LOCAL LEVELS, LOOKING TO
11 THE FUTURE, DELIVER OTHER CAPITAL PROJECTS ON TIME AND WITHIN
12 BUDGET IS ONLY THE FIRST STEP. EXPANSION PROJECTS WILL ONE DAY
13 COMPETE FOR LIMITED OPERATING AND MAINTENANCE FUNDING THAT IS
14 ALREADY NOT ABLE TO SUPPORT THE EXISTING BAY AREA TRANSIT
15 SYSTEM AS WE KNOW IT. WE ARE WELL AWARE FROM YOUR LEADERSHIP
16 AROUND THE TRANSIT OPERATORS FACED REAL CHALLENGES IN THIS
17 ARENA. AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH PROJECTS IN THE EARLY STAGES,
18 SUCH AS DIRIDON, VALLEY LINK, AND STATE ROUTE 37, IT'S
19 IMPORTANT TO CONTEMPLATE THE PROS AND CONS OF ESTABLISHING NEW
20 ENTITIES TO DELIVER, OPERATE, AND MAINTAIN THE NEW
21 INVESTMENTS. THIS IS CONSISTENT WITH THE FINDINGS FROM THE BAY
22 AREA REGIONAL RAIL PARTNERSHIP STUDY THAT WAS COMPLETED IN
23 2023. IT NOTED THAT THE DELIVERY GOVERNANCE MODEL FOR MEGA
24 PROJECTS SHOULD BE INFORMED BY THE UNDERSTANDING OF THE
25 PROJECTS IN A REGIONAL PORTFOLIO, RATHER THAN IN PROJECT IN



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 ISOLATION. ESTABLISHING A CONSTRUCTION DELIVERY AUTHORITY THAT
2 IS INDEPENDENT OF A SPECIFIC PROJECT AND INDEPENDENT OF
3 ADVOCATES FOR ITS -- INDEPENDENTLY ADVOCATING FOR FUNDING FOR
4 THAT SPECIAL PROJECT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED AS WE MOVE FORWARD
5 IN THE PORTFOLIO. WE DO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE PORTAL IS A
6 DIFFERENT STAGE THAN DIRIDON. THE PORTAL IS BEING DELIVERED BY
7 AN EXISTING AGENCY AND IS QUITE ADVANCED BUT THE WORK ON OTHER
8 PROJECTS WE SHOULD BE CAUTIOUS ABOUT CREATING ADDITIONAL
9 SINGLE PURPOSE ENTITIES FOR THESE MEGA PROJECTS. THERESE AND
10 JAMES WILL PROVIDE SOME DETAILS ON THE AGREEMENTS BEFORE YOU.
11 BUT WE DO RECOMMEND THAT YOU AUTHORIZE THE AGREEMENT AND THAT
12 WE CONTINUE TO BRING FORWARD CONCEPTS AND FRAMEWORKS TO REFINE
13 THE REGIONAL LEADERSHIP ROLE IN THESE PROJECTS AND IN OTHERS.
14 THANK YOU. THERESE?

15

16 **THERESE TRIVEDI:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, THERESE TRIVEDI
17 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR AND JAMES TO THINK WE'LL BE REQUESTING THE
18 COMMISSION TO APPROVE THE COMMITTEE AND EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO
19 ENTER INTO PROJECTS, DIRIDON STATION COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT
20 WITH PROJECT PARTNERS AT THE CORRIDOR WE HAVE TRANSBAY JOINT
21 POWERS AUTHORITY PORTALS MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING MOU I'LL
22 START WITH DETAILS ABOUT DIRIDON AND JAMES WILL TALK ABOUT THE
23 PORTAL. BEFORE DIVING INTO DIRIDON I WANT TO REFERENCE THE
24 2022 COMMISSION WORKSHOP SETTING CONTEXT AND BACKDROP FOR BOTH
25 PROJECTS. AS ANDY MENTIONED IN HIS INTRODUCTION, THE



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 COMMISSION HELD THIS WORKSHOP A COUPLE OF YEARS AGO THAT
2 REALLY FOCUSED ON DISCUSSION ABOUT CHARGES AND OPPORTUNITIES
3 OF DELIVERING MAJOR PROJECTS IN THE REGION AND MTC'S ROLE IN
4 THE DELIVERY OF THOSE PROJECTS BOTH LOOKING BACK AND LOOKING
5 AT OPPORTUNITIES AHEAD. AND IN THAT DISCUSSION, OBVIOUSLY,
6 THERE WAS THE REQUEST TO DEVELOP FUNDING STRATEGIES TO
7 PRIORITIZE AND SEQUENCE REQUESTS THAT COME THROUGH FOR THESE
8 PROJECTS AND OTHER ENTITY IN THE REGION WHICH DID LEAD TO THE
9 ADOPTION OF MTC'S MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY LATER THAT
10 YEAR. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO NOW MOVING INTO DIRIDON, MTC STAFF
11 HAS BEEN ENGAGED IN DIRIDON PLANNING EFFORTS FOR MANY YEARS
12 DATING BACK TO THE EARLIER 2000s WITH SOME STATIONARY PLANNING
13 SUPPORT AS WELL AS OTHER PARTICIPATION IN OTHER PLANNING
14 EFFORTS OVER THE YEARS FAST FORWARDING TO 2020, THAT IS WHEN
15 MTC ENTERED INTO THE INITIAL COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WITH OUR
16 PARTNER AGENCIES. I SHOULD NAME THEM, THEY'RE LISTED HERE, THE
17 CITY OF SAN JOSE, CALTRAIN, VTA, AND CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED
18 RAIL. AT THAT TIME, THERE WAS SOME CONCEPTUAL WORK THAT WAS
19 BEING COMPLETED FOR THE DIRIDON STATION AREA. AND AT THAT
20 TIME, THE PARTNERS IDENTIFIED THE NEED TO, IN ORDER TO ADVANCE
21 THE PROJECT, IT REALLY WOULD NEED MORE EFFORT ON THE DESIGN
22 THAN THE THEN CONCEPTUAL DESIGNS WERE ILLUMINATING. THE IDEA
23 HERE WAS THAT THE TIME FRAME PARTNER AGENCIES DEVELOPED A
24 SCOPE OF WORK TO ADVANCE BUSINESS CASE LOOK AT EXPANDING
25 FURTHER CONCEPTUAL DESIGN AND REALLY DEFINE PROJECT MOVE INTO



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 ENVIRONMENTAL AND MOVE AHEAD. IN 2021 MTC CONTRIBUTED \$2
2 MILLION TO COMPLETE THIS BUSINESS CASE AND IN ADDITION TO
3 DEVELOPING SOME DESIGN ALTERNATIVES THAT WOULD ADVANCE, THE
4 IDEA WAS ALSO TO EXPLORE BOTH SHORT-TERM AND LONG-TERM
5 GOVERNANCE OPTIONS TO GUIDE THE PROJECT FORWARD. FINALLY TO
6 NOTE DIRIDON IS AN RM3 PROJECT THERE IS \$100 MILLION IN THE
7 MEASURE FOR DIRIDON AND TO DATE THE PROJECT HAS RECEIVED JUST
8 OVER \$30 MILLION MAINLY FOR RIGHT OF WAY PURCHASE BUT ALSO FOR
9 PREENVIRONMENTAL WORK. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO NOW TALKING A
10 LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE AGREEMENT BEFORE YOU TODAY. AS NOTED MTC
11 IS IN THE CURRENT AGREEMENT WITH THE PARTNER AGENCIES AND IT'S
12 WORTH NOTING THAT THE NEW CO-OP AGREEMENT ENGAGES PARTNERS IN
13 A MANNER SIMILARLY TO WHAT'S INCLUDED IN THE EXISTING
14 AGREEMENT. I WILL SAY WITH THE PARTNER AGENCIES THERE ARE MANY
15 LEVELS OF STAFF THAT ARE INVOLVED IN THE PROJECT THERE, IS A
16 TECHNICAL LEVEL, A POLICY LEVEL, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND
17 THE GENERAL MANAGER'S PARTICIPATE AS WELL AS THE JOIN POLICY
18 BOARD WHICH IS MADE UP MAINLY OF ELECTED OFFICIALS,
19 COMMISSIONER MAHAN REPRESENTS MTC ON THE AS THE NAME IMPLIES
20 AN ADVISORY BODY WORTH NOTING IT'S A NEW AGREEMENT IN ORDER TO
21 MOVE THE PROJECT FORWARD WE NEED MORE DECISION-MAKING CO-OP
22 AGREEMENT EVOLVING ADVISORY P JAB DECISION MAKING STEERING
23 COMMITTEE AND MTC WOULD CONTINUE TO HAVE A SEAT ON THAT
24 COMMITTEE THE AGREEMENT DOES HAVE PROVISIONS FOR STAFFING OF
25 THE PARTNER AGENCIES AND HOW THEY WOULD PARTICIPATE DOES



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 IDENTIFY AREAS OF LEAD RESPONSIBILITY FOR EACH PARTNER AGENCY
2 AND AS MAY BE OBSTACLE MTC WILL LEAD THE REGIONAL LEGISLATIVE
3 ADVOCACY FUNDING AND NETWORK COORDINATION. ALSO NOTE ANOTHER
4 HIGHLIGHT FROM THE CO-OP AGREEMENT IS THAT CURRENTLY AS I
5 MENTIONED THERE IS A LOT OF STAFF THAT PARTICIPATE FROM THE
6 PARTNER AGENCIES. THERE ISN'T A DEDICATED STAFF PERSON THAT'S
7 FOCUSED ON DIRIDON, YOU KNOW, AS THEIR FULL-TIME DAY JOB. SO,
8 THE CO-OP AGREEMENT DOES ALLOW FOR HIRING OF A PROJECT
9 DIRECTOR THROUGH CALTRAIN, WHICH WOULD SERVE AS THE LEAD
10 AGENCY. AND THAT PROJECT DIRECTOR WOULD REPORT TO THE STEERING
11 COMMITTEE AND WOULD BE ALLOWED TO DEVELOP ACTIONS AND
12 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE STEERING COMMITTEE. THE CO-OP
13 AGREEMENT DOES SERVE AS THE NEAR-TERM GOVERNANCE FOR THE
14 PROJECT AND THE NEAR-TERM AGREEMENT IS UP TO FOUR YEARS WHICH
15 IS ANTICIPATED TO CARRY THE PROJECT THROUGH THE ENVIRONMENTAL
16 PHASE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO NOW TO TOUCH ON NEXT STEPS. AS A
17 RESULT THE BUSINESS CASE WORK THAT I MENTIONED EARLIER IS
18 WRAPPING UP. THERE ARE TWO DESIGN ALTERNATIVES THAT ARE STILL
19 AROUND CONSIDERATION AND IN EARLY 2025, WE ANTICIPATE THERE
20 WOULD BE A SELECTION OF PREFERRED VERSION THAT WOULD ADVANCE.
21 THE CO-OP AGREEMENT BEFORE YOU IS ALSO A MAJOR MILESTONE AS
22 ONE OF THE BUSINESS CASE DELIVERABLES. AND THEN FINALLY AS
23 ANDY HAD ALLUDED TO IN HIS OPENING REMARKS THERE IS STILL
24 DISCUSSION THAT IS ONGOING ABOUT THE LONG-TERM GOVERNANCE FOR
25 THE PROJECT. THE CONSULTANT TEAM THAT IS SUPPORTING THE



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 PROJECT WITH THE BUSINESS CASE HAS LOOKED AT SEVERAL PEER
2 ORGANIZATIONS AND GOVERNANCE STRUCTURES OVER THE LAST YEAR AND
3 THE CURRENT CONSIDERATION IS LEANING TOWARDS ESTABLISHING A
4 CONSTRUCTION DELIVERY AUTHORITY. AND AS ANDY NOTED MTC STAFF
5 DOES HAVE SOME INTEREST HERE. IN ADDITION TO DELIVERING THE
6 DIRIDON PROJECT THERE COULD BE SOME POSSIBILITIES FOR
7 DELIVERING OTHER MEGA PROJECTS IN THE REGION, AS YOU KNOW,
8 ALSO REFERENCING THE 2022 WORKSHOP, I THINK ONE OF THE
9 CHALLENGES FOR THE REGION IS THAT THERE ISN'T CONSISTENT
10 STAFFING EXPERTISE AND CAPACITY TO DELIVER THESE MEGA PROJECTS
11 SO THIS COULD BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO AND THAT HOPEFULLY
12 WOULD HELP TO ELIMINATE DELIVERY RISK AS WE GO FORWARD. ON THE
13 OTHER -- MAYBE ANOTHER SIDE OF THAT COIN IS THAT ANOTHER THING
14 THAT ANDY MENTION SIDE THAT BY CREATING ANOTHER ENTITY IN THE
15 REGION, IT WOULD ADD TO THE MANY OTHER THAT ARE ALREADY
16 EXISTING AND MAY SERVE TO COMPLICATE AN ALREADY COMPETITIVE
17 LANDSCAPE SO THESE ARE AREAS THAT WE WANT TO CONTINUE THE
18 CONVERSATION PART OF THAT DISCUSSION. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
19 JAMES WHOLE TALK ABOUT THE PORTAL.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU THERESA. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. NEXT
22 SLIDE. A QUICK OVERVIEW AND BACKGROUND OF THE PROJECT, THE
23 IMAGE IN FRONT OF YOU SHOWS THE TWO MILE TUNNEL THAT WILL
24 CONNECT THE FOURTH AND KING STATION TO THE SALESFORCE TRANSIT
25 CENTER THIS IS WHAT WE CALL THE PORTAL, PORTAL MOU, THAT WE'LL



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 BE PRESENTING TO YOU TODAY FOLLOWS PREVIOUS MOU THAT WAS
2 ESTABLISHED IN JUNE OF 2020 AND IT HAS EXPIRED IN MAY OF THIS
3 YEAR HAD SET UP A WORKING RELATIONSHIP WITH SIX PARTNER
4 AGENCIES INCLUDES TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY, TJPA,
5 CALTRAIN, CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED RAIL AUTHORITY, COUNTY
6 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AND CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
7 AND OF COURSE MTC. AND SINCE THAT TIME, MTC HAS HAD GREAT
8 INSIGHT AND PARTICIPATION INTO THE PORTAL PROJECT. THE TEAM
9 HAS ESTABLISHED THE PROGRAM DELIVERY STRATEGY WE HAVE
10 DEVELOPED THE PROCUREMENT DOCUMENTS AND ADVANCED THE PROJECT
11 THROUGH THE FTA NEW STARTS PROGRAM. THE PROGRAM TOTAL IS \$8.2
12 BILLION, AND THIS PROJECT DOES RECEIVE RM3 CONTRIBUTION OF
13 \$325 MILLION. AND JUST AS A NOTE, THAT LAST BULLET IS NOT JUST
14 FOR PRECONSTRUCTION IT'S FOR THE WHOLE PROJECT. I BELIEVE THAT
15 PRECONSTRUCTION IS LESS THAN 325. SO APOLOGIES FOR THE ERROR.
16 NEXT SLIDE. THE NEW MOU ESTABLISHES A NEW FRAMEWORK WHICH WAS
17 DEFINED IN THE PORTAL OF GOVERNANCE BLUEPRINT THAT WAS
18 APPROVED BY THE TJPA BOARD IN AUGUST OF 2023. THE GRAPHIC ON
19 THE RIGHT SHOWS YOU THAT GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE AND THE BUBBLES
20 SHOWN IN RED HIGHLIGHT THE AREAS OF MTC PARTICIPATION. AND
21 JUST TO DIRECT YOUR ATTENTION TO THE PORTAL BOARD COMMITTEE,
22 THIS COMMITTEE WILL HAVE MTC PARTICIPATION, AS WELL. WE HAVE A
23 NON-VOTING MEMBER, OUT OF THE FOUR MEMBERS TOTAL. SO, THE KEY
24 FUNCTIONAL GROUPS FOR MTC PARTICIPATION WILL BE THE BOARD
25 COMMITTEE, JUST MENTIONED, THE EXECUTIVE WORKING GROUP, THE



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 INTEGRATED MANAGEMENT TEAM, AND THE CHANGE CONTROL BOARD. SO,
2 WE REALLY DO HAVE GOES VISIBILITY INTO THE GOVERNANCE OF THE
3 PORTAL PROJECT. THE IDEAL OF THIS NEXT MOU IS TO PROVIDE
4 MANAGEMENT FOR THIS PROJECT THROUGH THE DELIVERY PHASE. WE
5 EXPECT THE TERM OF THIS AGREEMENT TO LAST APPROXIMATELY NINE
6 YEARS, AND SUNSETTING AT THE TESTING AND COMMISSIONING PHASE.
7 AND JUST TO NOTE THAT THIS MOU DOES HAVE AN ATTACHMENT WHICH
8 IS A WORKPLAN AND THAT WORKPLAN WILL DEFINE THE WORKING
9 RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN EACH PARTNER AGENCY. NEXT SLIDE. AND
10 JUST TO GO THROUGH THE NEXT STEPS FOR THE PROJECT, THE NEXT --
11 ONE OF THE NEXT DOCUMENTS WE NEED TO DEVELOP IS THE CHANGE
12 CONTROL BOARD CHARTER. AND THIS CHARTER DOCUMENT WILL DEFINE
13 THE RULES FOR ENGAGEMENT WITH THE CHANGE CONTROL BOARD. TJPA
14 WILL LEAD THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE CHARTER, ALONG WITH
15 CONSULTATION WITH MTC AND SFCTA. WE MUST STAND UP THE VARIOUS
16 COMMITTEES AND BOARDS AND BODIES THAT WE JUST SAW IN THE
17 PREVIOUS GRAPHIC AND WE MUST INITIATE PRECONSTRUCTION
18 CONTRACTS. THIS IS ALL TO REALLY TARGET AN FTA FULL FUNDING
19 GRANT AGREEMENT DATE OF JULY 2027. AND ALONG THE WAY, WE WILL
20 CONTINUE TO APPLY FOR GRANTS AND EVALUATE THE COST SAVING
21 MEASURES SUCH AS VALUE ENGINEERING ACTIVITIES TO TRY TO REDUCE
22 THE COST OF THE PROJECT. NEXT SLIDE. AND JUST TO WRAP UP, WE
23 ARE REQUESTING COMMITTEE APPROVAL TO ALLOW THE EXECUTIVE
24 DIRECTOR TO DESIGN THE COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WITH THE -- FOR
25 THE DIRIDON PROJECT WITH THE CITY OF SAN JOSE, CALTRAIN, VTA,



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 AND THE CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED RAIL AUTHORITY. AND, ALSO, TO
2 ENTER INTO THIS MOU WITH TJPA, CALTRAIN, CALIFORNIA HIGH SPEED
3 RAIL AUTHORITY, SFCTA, THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO,
4 AND, AGAIN, FOR THE PORTAL PROJECT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONERS.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS
7 OR QUESTIONS? PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION HERE THIS IS KIND
10 OF EXCITING. COULD WE BE MORE EXCITE FIGURE WE COULD GET A
11 FOLLOW UP AFTER THIS GOES THROUGH HERE BECAUSE WE ARE ALL
12 TRYING TO LEARN WITH THE MEGA PROJECTS WE HOPE THESE ARE
13 GREATLY SUCCESSFUL BUT IT WOULD HELP US TO SEE HOW FAR THINGS
14 ARE GOING, WHAT'S WORKING. THE CHANGE CONTROL BOARD. THAT
15 SOUNDED VERY INTERESTING. [LAUGHTER] I HAVE NEVER SEEN ONE OF
16 THOSE BEFORE. A COUPLE OF THINGS HERE. GIVEN -- THE QUESTION
17 IS, GIVEN SAN FRANCISCO'S DEFICIT, IS THIS GOING TO BE
18 IMPACTED IN ANY WAY THIS PROJECT? ARE THEY SEEKING FUNDING FOR
19 THAT? IS THIS PART OF --

20

21 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERESA ROMMEL MTC. I DON'T BELIEVE THE
22 FUNDING PLAN FOR THE PORTAL INCLUDES FUNDING FROM SAN
23 FRANCISCO ITSELF. THERE ARE DEFINITELY A LOT OF DIFFERENT
24 PARTS TO THE FUNDING PLAN BUT SAN FRANCISCO IS NOT
25 CONTRIBUTING CITY DOLLARS TO THE PROJECT.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** WHAT WAS IT 8.2 BILLION?

3

4 **THERESA ROMMELL:** SOME SALES TAX ASSOCIATED WITH THAT BUT IT'S
5 -- BUT IT'S A BIG PROJECT. A LOT OF IT WOULD HOPEFULLY COME
6 FROM THIS FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT THAT THEY HOPE TO
7 SECURE IN THE COMING YEARS.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** SO, I HAVE A LITTLE RED FLAG THERE. BUT WE'LL GO
10 AHEAD HERE BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW THAT HIGH SPEED RAIL HAS A
11 BURN OF MONEY -- I DON'T KNOW THAT ANY OF THOSE OPERATORS
12 [LAUGHTER] HAVE FUNDING. SO THAT'S WHY I WOULD LIKE TO
13 FORMALLY REQUEST, AS THIS MOVES FORWARD HERE, LIKE SIX MONTHS,
14 WE GET AN UPDATE. BECAUSE WE'RE ALL TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT
15 FUNDING AND IF THAT IS PART OF THE PROCESS FOR SAN FRANCISCO,
16 I WOULD LIKE TO BE TRANSPARENT ON THAT. SO, PLEASE IF WE CAN
17 GET THAT?

18

19 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I WILL NOTE, I BELIEVE IT'S IN JANUARY THAT
20 WE WILL BE BRIEF -- JANUARY OR FEBRUARY WE'LL BE COMING BACK
21 TO THE COMMISSION AND THE COMMITTEE WITH AN UPDATE ON THE
22 PORTAL PROJECT SPECIFICALLY AS IT RELATES TO THEIR STAGE GATE
23 ANALYSIS AS THE PROJECT IS CURRENTLY UNDERWAY WITH.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **ANDREW FREMIER:** COMMISSIONER WE'LL BE COMING BACK REGULARLY
3 THAT'S THE POINT OF THIS EXERCISE, AND THE MOU INVESTMENT
4 KEEPING AN EYE ON THE INVESTMENT ALSO PAYING ATTENTION TO WHAT
5 MIGHT CHANGE IN TERMS OF FUNDING LANDSCAPE.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH BECAUSE WE WANT MEGA PROJECTS
8 TO HAPPEN EFFICIENTLY. SO THAT'S GREAT. DIRIDON PROJECT, WHO
9 WILL BE RUNNING THE STATION? I KNOW WE'RE IN THE DESIGN PHASE.
10 I CAN'T TELL FROM ALL THESE PARTNERS.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** DO YOU MEAN FOR THE ENVIRONMENTAL? DO YOU MEAN THE
13 STATION OPERATIONS ITSELF?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** YOU'RE DESIGNING A STATION, AND YOU HAVE ALL THESE
16 DIFFERENT PARTNERS WHOSE GOING TO BE THE MANAGER WHEN IT
17 HAPPENS?

18

19 **THERESE TRIVEDI:** I THINK NEXT PHASE AFTER CONSTRUCTION I THINK
20 THAT'S STILL YET TO BE DISCUSSED. I DON'T KNOW IF ANDY, I SEE
21 --

22

23 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THE ONLY THING, IT'S CALTRAIN PROPERTY, SO
24 RIGHT NOW IT'S THEIR STATION TO OPERATE IT INTERFACES WITH A



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 LOT OF OTHER OPERATORS, SO THEY WILL HAVE TO FIGURE OUT SOME,
2 SORT OF, AGREEMENT PROBABLY LIKE TRANSBAY HAS.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** I'LL TALK TO CALTRAIN BUT EXPERIENCE FROM HAVING
5 AN INTERMODAL CENTER HERE -- [LAUGHTER] -- IS THAT THE
6 OPERATORS DON'T PLAN WELL AT ALL FOR BUSINESS OR RETAIL. THEY
7 DON'T PLAN WELL FOR OFFICES OR STORAGE. SO, I JUST WANT TO
8 COMMUNICATE THOSE THINGS IN BECAUSE WE HAVE KIOSKS IN OUR
9 STATION WHICH HAVE NEVER BEEN USED FOR ANY TYPE OF BUSINESS
10 THEY'RE USED AS A BREAK ROOM, FOR STORAGE, THIS IS YOUR
11 PLANNING SO THIS IS WHY I BRING THIS UP I WOULD HATE TO SEE
12 THAT HAPPEN TALK TO CALTRAIN, AS MANY PEOPLE AS WE CAN I WOULD
13 LIKE TO SEE THIS PLANNED WELL SO IT IS A SUCCESS AND YOU NEED
14 TO BE AWARE OF THOSE ASPECTS.

15

16 **THERESE TRIVEDI:** I MIGHT ADD, THERE HAS BEEN PART OF
17 DISCUSSION OVER THE PAST YEAR WITH BUSINESS CASE AGAIN I THINK
18 IN THE NEAR-TERM DELIVERABLES WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, IT'S ON
19 EVERYBODY'S RADAR.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE ALL OF THIS AND
22 LOOK FORWARD TO SEE WHAT HAPPENS.

23

24 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR THE
25 PRESENTATION. I HAVE SEEN THE DIRIDON PRESENTATION A COUPLE OF



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 TIMES ALREADY UPON. IT'S LIKE THE THIRD TIME, I THINK. THE
2 AGREEMENT IS IMPORTANT. I HAVE BEEN TRYING TO GET UP TO SPEED
3 ON ALL OF THIS. THE PROCESS. THERE ARE A LOT OF THINGS TO WORK
4 OUT. BUT I HAVE BEEN VERY HAPPY TO SEE THAT WE HAVE BEEN ABLE
5 TO COME TO AGREEMENT PRETTY WELL SO FAR. I NOTICED IN YOUR --
6 IN THE SLIDES, THERE'S MENTION, MTC'S INTEREST, THE SECOND
7 POINT OF CONCERN OF A CREATION OF A NEW AUTHORITY WOULD ADD TO
8 MANY ENTITIES IN THE REGION. IF NOT, IF WE DIDN'T DO IT THIS
9 WAY, WHO ELSE WOULD WE BE DOING THIS WITH SO MANY DIFFERENT
10 AGENCIES INVOLVED?

11

12 **ANDREW FREMIER:** I DO THINK THAT'S AN ULTIMATE CHALLENGE. I
13 INVOLVED IN THE CHALLENGE I THINK OUR SUGGESTION IS THAT ONE
14 OF THESE WE HAVE IDENTIFIED WITH STATE OF CALIFORNIA WHEN THEY
15 BUILT THE BRIDGE SYSTEM AND TUNNELS THEY DO FIRST TIME OUT THE
16 GATE ON PROJECTS FOR THE FIRST TIME 5060 YEARS AT TIMES IN THE
17 CASE WHERE ENTITY HAD TO LEARN HOW TO BUILD THE BRIDGE,
18 THEY'RE GOING TO DO A TUNNEL, OUR SUGGESTION IS MAYBE LOOK AT
19 WHETHER WE GET THE BENEFIT OF THE DELIVER THAT CAN DO MULTIPLE
20 MEGA PROJECTS, LEARNING THE INTENT AND NEEDS SEPARATE
21 MECHANISMS TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO DELIVER THE QUESTION HOW YOU
22 CAN DELIVER MEGA PROJECTS MORE EFFICIENTLY IN THE REGION THEN
23 BUILD ON CAPITAL INVESTMENT WHAT YOU LEARN ABOUT THE DELIVERY
24 PROCESS ALONG THE WAY.

25



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SOUNDS GREAT. PROJECTS IN PARALLEL WE WANT
2 TO MOVE THEM ALONG AS QUICKLY, HOW DO YOU HAVE SO MANY AT THE
3 SAME TIME AND HAVE ONE ENTITY DOING SO MUCH.

4

5 **ANDREW FREMIER:** IT'S A LONG TIME BEFORE WE'LL HAVE ONE ENTITY
6 DOING A LOT OF THINGS AND THEY'RE COMPETING FOR THE SAME MONEY
7 THAT'S THE CHALLENGE.

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THAT'S THE CONVERSATION DO WE LINE THEM UP
10 IN A CERTAIN TIMELINE, THE RELATION IS LONGER WE WAIT, MORE
11 THE COST, COST INCREASING DEALING WITH OUR GRADE SEPARATION
12 PROJECTS, COSTS BECOMING ALMOST INFEASIBLE AT THIS POINT. I
13 THINK THIS AUTHORITY IS THE BEST WAY TO BE INCLUSIVE OF ALL
14 THE DIFFERENT AGENCIES INTERESTED AND I THINK FIVE IS A LOT
15 FRANKLY AND I WISH WE COULD PAIR THAT DOWN BUT IN LIGHT OF
16 INTEREST, I THINK THIS IS THE BEST WAY TO GO. THANK YOU.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** FOLLOWING UP ON WHAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA SAID
19 HERE. SO, WE ARE BEARING THE BURDEN HERE OF CALTRAIN GOING
20 FULL SPEED AHEAD WITH DESIGN, WITHOUT BRINGING IN
21 CONSTRUCTION. SO, MY ADVICE IS THAT THEY HAVE TO BE
22 COORDINATED AND UNITED EARLY ON. BECAUSE THAT DIDN'T HAPPEN.
23 BROADWAY GRADE SEPARATION AND BURLINGAME. AND WE GOT SLAPPED
24 WITH A WHOLE BUNCH OF ADDITIONAL FUNDING. SO, PLEASE AS THIS
25 MOVES AHEAD, BE AWARE, DESIGN NEEDS TO BE PARTNERS WITH



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 CONSTRUCTION AS YOU MOVE FORWARD IN ORDER TO BE MORE EFFICIENT
2 AND SAVE FUNDING. BECAUSE COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA AND I ARE
3 REALLY HAVING PROBLEMS WITH GRADE SEPARATIONS ALONG THOSE
4 LINES. SO, JUST A BIT OF ADVICE. BECAUSE WE WANT TO MAKE SURE
5 THIS WORKS AND IN AN EFFICIENT MANNER. THANK YOU.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS? OKAY. SEEING
8 NONE. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE THE EXECUTIVE
9 DIRECTOR ENTER INTO THE DIRIDON STATION COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT
10 WITH PROJECT PARTNERS AND THE TRANSBAY JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY
11 MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING, WITH PROJECT SPONSOR AND FUNDING
12 PARTNERS TO ESTABLISH ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES FOR THE NEXT
13 PHASE OF THESE PROJECTS FOR THE COMMITTEE APPROVAL?

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND ABE-KOGA.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** MOVED AND SECONDED. IS THERE ANY
20 COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM FURTHER?
21 CLERK, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE
24 ZOOM SPACE. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE?

25



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** TWO MINUTES IS FINE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. DAVID TRAN, IF YOU COULD PLEASE
4 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR TWO MINUTES BEGINS NOW.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS DAVID TRAN SPEAKING ON
7 BEHALF OF THE CITY OF SAN JOSE AND MAYOR MAT MAHAN. WE ASK
8 THAT YOU APPROVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND INTO DIRIDON
9 STATION COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WE APPRECIATE STAFF'S
10 RECOMMENDATION AND EVEN MORE THE FACT THAT MTC STAFF HAS BEEN
11 KEY PARTNERS IN REDEVELOPMENT OF SAN JOSE DIRIDON STATION THIS
12 COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT STRENGTHENS OUR ABILITY TO WORK TOGETHER
13 AND BRING THIS PROJECT TO THE REGION EVEN STATEWIDE
14 SIGNIFICANCE TO REALITY THANK YOU FOR AND WE RESPECTFULLY ASK
15 FOR YOUR SUPPORT.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY OTHER PUBLIC COMMENTS?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE ZOOM
20 SPACE NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED AND NO ONE IN THE
21 BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

13

14 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

21

22 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS

25 PRESENT.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. ITEM 3B.
3 REGIONAL MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4644 REVISED FISCAL YEAR 2024,
4 2025 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE OPERATING PROGRAM APPROVAL OF
5 REVISION OF FISCAL YEAR 2024, 2025 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE
6 OPERATING PROGRAM TO SUPPORT EXPRESS BUS OPERATIONS,
7 ACCORDANCE WITH MTC RESOLUTION 4619 REVISED APPROVED BY THE
8 COMMISSION IN NOVEMBER. THIS ITEM INCLUDES FUNDING COMMITMENTS
9 TO SATISFY THE 300 MILLION THERE REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION TO
10 ADDRESS PUBLIC TRANSIT OPERATOR SHORTFALLS. RALEIGH WILL MAKE
11 THIS PRESENTATION.

12

13 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THROUGH THE CHAIR IF I COULD MAKE A QUICK
14 REMARK IN REGARD TO THIS ITEM AND THE NEXT YOU WILL BE HEARING
15 TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL CONTEXT. THE NEXT FEW ITEMS BEFORE YOU
16 ON TODAY'S AGENDA DEAL WITH PROGRAMMING OF FUNDS FROM A
17 VARIETY OF SOURCES INCLUDING BRIDGE TOLLS, FEDERAL TRANSIT AND
18 FEDERAL HIGHWAY FORMULA FUNDS FOR MULTIPLE PROJECTS AND
19 PURPOSES. BUT THE COMMON THREAD TO ALL OF THEM IS THAT THEY
20 EACH INCLUDE PROGRAMMING THAT WILL SATISFY MUCH OF THE 300
21 MILLION IN REGIONAL FUNDING COMMITMENT TO ADDRESS FISCAL YEAR
22 2025 AND 2026 PUBLIC TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALLS. THIS
23 COMMITMENT WAS MADE THROUGH MTC RESOLUTION 4619 REVISED THAT
24 WAS APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION LAST MONTH. TODAY'S ACTIONS
25 IMPLEMENT THAT COMMITMENT. AND THESE ACTIONS ARE BEING TAKEN



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 AS SEPARATE ITEMS AND ARE NOT COMBINED BECAUSE ACTIONS BEING
2 PROPOSED DO MORE THAN JUST ADDRESS TRANSIT OPERATING
3 SHORTFALLS. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THIS PROGRAMMING AND REGIONAL
4 COMMITMENT AS A CONTINUATION. ACTIONS THE COMMISSION HAS TAKEN
5 SINCE 2020 TO AVERT MAJOR CUTS TO BAY AREA PUBLIC
6 TRANSPORTATION. THESE ACTIONS ARE CONSISTENT WITH SB125 PLAN
7 THAT WAS SUBMITTED TO THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, WHICH REFLECT
8 BOTH STATE AND REGIONAL CONTRIBUTIONS TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS.
9 SO, THAT ADDITIONAL CONTEXT, I WILL HAND IT OVER TO RALEIGH
10 FOR THE PRESENTATION.

11

12 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** THANK YOU THERESE. RALEIGH MCCOY MTC STAFF,
13 HERE TODAY TO REQUEST APPROVAL OF FISCAL YEAR 2024, 2025
14 CURRENT FISCAL YEAR REGIONAL MEASURE THREE OPERATING PROGRAM
15 FUNDING FOR EXPRESS BUS NEXT SLIDE. AS RECAP RM STATUTE
16 SPECIFIES THAT MAXIMUM OF 16% OF RM3 REVENUES GO TOWARD
17 OPERATING OF PROGRAM TO SUPPORT EXISTING AND EXPANDED
18 OPERATIONS THE PIE CHART ON THE RIGHT SUMMARIZES MAKE UP OF
19 THE RM3 PROGRAM OF THE 16% OF TOTAL REVENUE GOING TO THE
20 OPERATING PROGRAM THE COMMISSION HAS APPROVED PROGRAMMING OF
21 FUNDING FOR THE TRANSBAY TERMINAL OPERATIONS ELEMENT ON TJPA
22 AND EXPANDED FERRY SERVICE ELEMENT TO WETA IN MAY OF THIS
23 YEAR. IN THIS PRESENTATION WE'LL COVER PROPOSED METHODOLOGIES
24 FOR DETERMINING THE FUNDING LEVELS ASSOCIATED WITH THE YELLOW
25 SLICE OF THE PIE REPRESENTING EXPRESS BUS SERVICE. NEXT SLIDE.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 AS THERESA MENTIONED, TODAY'S PROPOSED PROGRAMMING BUILDS ON
2 THE ACTION THE COMMISSION TOOK LAST MONTH IN ADOPTING THE \$300
3 MILLION REGIONAL FUNDING FRAMEWORK THROUGH MTC RESOLUTION 4619
4 REVISED. WE'RE FOCUSING ON THE BRIDGE TOLL LINE ITEM
5 REPRESENTING 49 MILLION OF THE \$300 MILLION REGIONAL FUNDING
6 COMMITMENT AND YOU WILL HEAR FROM COLLEAGUES LATER REQUESTING
7 APPROVAL OF PROGRAMMING FROM THE FTA FORMULA FUNDS LINE ITEM
8 AND THE SURFACE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING LINE ITEMS. NEXT SLIDE
9 PLEASE. TURNING NOW TO THE PROPOSED PROGRAMMING. FIRST LET'S
10 TALK ABOUT THE OVERALL REVENUE ENVELOPE. STAFF ESTIMATE THAT
11 JUST OVER 15 MILLION WILL BE AVAILABLE THIS YEAR FOR THE RM3
12 OPERATING EXPRESS BUS ELEMENT REFLECTS BOOST IN REVENUES FROM
13 THE THREE THERE INCREASE COMING ONLINE JANUARY 1ST, 2025 FROM
14 THE RM3 PROGRAM. BUILDING ON THE METHODOLOGY THAT WAS USED TO
15 SET PROGRAMMING LEVELS FOR THE OPERATING PROGRAM LAST YEAR
16 THIS YEAR'S PROGRAMMING LEVELS ARE CLOSELY TIED TO
17 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS THAT MTC AND OPERATOR PARTNERS
18 DEVELOPED OVER THE COURSE OF 2023 AND WERE REALLY THE
19 FOUNDATION OF SENATE BILL 125 FUNDING FRAMEWORK AND PLAN THAT
20 WAS SUBMITTED TO THE STATE. RM3 OPERATING PROGRAM FUNDS WILL
21 BE ASSIGNED ACROSS THIS FISCAL YEAR AND THE NEXT TO ADDRESS
22 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS TO THE GREATEST EXTENT POSSIBLE BASED
23 ON FUNDING ELIGIBILITY AS SHOWN IN THE TABLE ON THE RIGHT AND
24 IN ADDITION ASIDE FROM PROGRAMMING FOR THE FISCAL CLIFF THIS
25 PROGRAM ALSO INCLUDES \$500,000 FOR TRI DELTA TRANSIT TO



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 ADDRESS UNANTICIPATED BUDGET DEFICITS IN THIS FISCAL YEAR AND
2 \$100,000 FOR COUNTY CONNECTION TO SUPPORT LOCAL CONNECTIONS TO
3 BART. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TO TIE TODAY'S PROGRAMMING INTO THE
4 BIG PICTURE OF HOW RM3 ELIGIBLE OPERATOR SHORTFALLS ARE BEING
5 ADDRESSED THIS TABLE IDENTIFIES STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS THREE
6 YEARS OF WRIGHT M THREE OPERATING PROGRAM FUNDING ACROSS 2024,
7 '25, AND '26 AND OTHER OPERATING FUNDING THAT WOULD FULLY
8 ADDRESS STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS WHERE THOSE OPERATORS
9 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS ARE GREATER THAN RM3 ELIGIBLE
10 EXPENSES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THIS SLIDE OUTLINES TWO
11 CONSIDERATIONS THAT ARE DISCUSSED IN FURTHER DETAIL IN THE
12 ISSUES SECTION OF THE MEMO. FIRST, THIS YEAR'S FUNDING LEVELS
13 ARE CLOSELY TIED TO THE STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS AS REFERENCED
14 SEVERAL TIMES THROUGH THE THIS PRESENTATION IN DEVELOPING THE
15 PROPOSAL STAFF HAVE COMMUNICATED WITH OPERATOR PARTNERS THAT
16 FUNDING LEVELS MAY CHANGE IN UPCOMING YEARS AS THE REGION
17 RESPOND TO A SHIFT YOU FINANCIAL LANDSCAPE FOR TRANSIT.
18 ADDITIONALLY, WHILE RM3 WAS UNDER LEGAL CHALLENGE IN ITS FIRST
19 FEW YEARS OF IMPLEMENTATION ROUGHLY 24 MILLION IN RM3 FUNDING
20 FOR THE EXPRESS BUS PROGRAM WAS EARNED BUT HAS NOT YET BEEN
21 PROGRAMMED AND STAFF WILL RETURN TO PAC IN THE UPCOMING FISCAL
22 YEAR TO REQUEST PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATION OF THESE FUNDS
23 CONSISTENT WITH THE FUNDING FRAMEWORK THAT WAS SHOWN IN THE
24 PRIOR SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TO CONCLUDE, THE STAFF
25 RECOMMENDATION TODAY IS REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTIONS 4644



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THIS CONCLUDES MY
2 PRESENTATION AND I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER? YES.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I THINK WE HAVE --
7 THREE OF US HERE HAVE AT LEAST MENTIONED IF THIS FUNDING IS
8 COMING FROM THE REGIONAL PORTION OR THE LOCAL PORTION, AND
9 WE'RE ALL VERY SENSITIVE TO OUR LOCAL FUNDING. SO, DO WE HAVE
10 AN ANSWER?

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN THIS ITEM IS REALLY FOCUSED
13 ON BRIDGE TOLLS FOR TRANSIT, THE VOTER APPROVED BRIDGE TOLLS
14 FOR TRANSIT I THINK WHAT YOU'RE REFERRING TO WITH REGIONAL
15 VERSUS LOCAL WILL COME UP IN TWO ITEMS FROM NOW WHEN WE'RE
16 TALKING ABOUT THE STP AND CMAQ.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** THAT'S IT. THANK YOU.

19

20 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. ANYBODY ELSE? CLERK, DO WE HAVE
21 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PROBLEM OF THE PUBLIC IN THE ZOOM
24 SPACE, NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND
25 RECEIVED.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. NOW, IS THIS AN INFORMATIONAL
3 REPORT OR IS THIS AN ACTION ITEM?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO
8 APPROVE REFERRAL MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4644 REVISED APPROVAL
9 OF FISCAL YEAR '24/'25 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE OPERATING
10 PROGRAM TO SUPPORT EXPRESS BUS OPERATIONS TO THE COMMISSION
11 FOR APPROVAL?

12

13 **HILLARY RONEN:** RONEN SO MOVES.

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** VERY GOOD. THANK YOU. ANY OTHER
18 COMMISSION COMMENTS? CAN WE HAVE THE ROLL.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. ALL RIGHT. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

25



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING? COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

4

5 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

12

13 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
16 PRESENT.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. ITEM 4A. WAIT A MINUTE. 4A,
19 RIGHT? OKAY. IT'S OKAY. ITEM 4A. FEDERAL MTC RESOLUTION
20 NUMBERS 4674 AND 4510 REVISED, TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES
21 PROGRAM. FISCAL YEE 2024, 2025, AND 2026 PROGRAMMING OF 1.5
22 BILLION FTA FORMULA REVENUES FOR FISCAL YEARS 2024, 2025, AND
23 2026 FOR TRANSIT OPERATOR STATE OF GOOD REPAIR CONSISTENT WITH
24 THE TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROCESS AND CRITERIA. IN
25 ACCORDANCE WITH MTC RESOLUTIONS 4619 REVISED, APPROVED BY THE



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 COMMISSION IN NOVEMBER, THIS ITEM INCLUDES FUNDING COMMITMENTS
2 TO SATISFY THE 300 MILL DOLLAR REGIONAL CONTRIBUTIONS TO
3 ADDRESS TRANSIT SHORTFALLS. MARGARET WILL PRESENT THIS
4 PRESENTATION.

5

6 **MARGARET DOYLE:** MARGARET DOYLE. MTC STAFF HERE TO PRESENT THE
7 TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROGRAM OR TCP FOR FISCAL YEAR
8 2025, 2026. NEXT SLIDE. OVERVIEW TCP PROGRAMS NEARLY \$700
9 MILLION ANNUALLY IN FTA FEDERAL FORMULA FUNDS IN TO THE REGION
10 IN A PROCESS GUIDED BY FEDERAL REQUIREMENTS AS WELL AS MTC'S
11 TCP POLICY FUNDING SOURCES INCLUDE 5307 URBANIZED AREA FORMULA
12 FUNDS 5337 STATE OF GOOD REPAIR FUNDS 5339 GRANTS FOR BUSES
13 AND BUS FACILITIES TODAY'S ITEM PROPOSES PROGRAMMING OF 2
14 BILLION CARRIES THROUGH THE END OF BIPARTISAN INFRASTRUCTURE
15 LAW, BILL WHICH GOES THROUGH FISCAL YEAR 2026 PROGRAM WAS
16 DEVELOPED IN CLOSE COORDINATION WITH TRANSIT PARTNERS. NEXT
17 SLIDE. FISCAL YEARS 2025 ARE 2026 PROGRAM INCLUDES FUNDING OF
18 \$1.5 BILLION ACROSS TWO YEARS VAST MAJORITY OF FUNDS ARE GOING
19 TOWARD BUS REPLACEMENTS WHICH ARE MAINLY 0-EMISSION BUSES AS
20 WELL AS FIXED GUIDEWAY STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROJECTS AND MAJOR
21 INVESTMENT IN CALTRAIN REPLACEMENT RAIL CARS, SFMTA LIGHT RAIL
22 VEHICLES, AND BART REPLACEMENT RAIL CARS. TODAY'S PROGRAMMING
23 INCLUDES A PORTION OF THE REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION OUT OF TCP
24 PROGRAM, WHICH IS \$132 MILLION PROGRAM FOR PREVENTIVE
25 MAINTENANCE FOR ASSISTANCE WITH THE FISCAL CLIFF. NEXT SLIDE



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 PLEASE. TODAY'S ITEM PROPOSES \$429 MILLION ACROSS THE TWO
2 FISCAL YEARS FOR REPLACEMENT OF 408 BUSES ACROSS THE REGION.
3 THE 408 BUSES 278 WILL BE 0-EMISSIONS VEHICLES EITHER BATTERY
4 ELECTRIC OR FUELCELL BUSES THOSE ZERO-EMISSIONS VEHICLES
5 ACCOUNT FOR 68% OF REPLACEMENTS BUT 78 OF FUNDS THAT ARE
6 PROGRAMMED TOWARDS BUS REPLACEMENTS LAST MONTH THIS COMMITTEE
7 APPROVED UPDATE TO THE TCP POLICY WHICH INCREASE UNDERSTAND
8 THE BUS VAN PRICE LIST BY 20% AND THOSE INCREASED PRICES WERE
9 UTILIZED BUILD THIS PROGRAM. AS OPERATORS WORK TO MEET THE
10 ZERO-EMISSIONS REQUIREMENTS SET FORTH BY THE CARB INNOVATIVE
11 CLEAN TRANSIT RULE THE HIGH PRICES OF BUSES REMAINS A
12 CHALLENGE. TODAY'S PROGRAM ALSO INCLUDES \$22 MILLION FOR
13 ASSOCIATED CHARGING AND FUELING INFRASTRUCTURE AND FACILITIES,
14 WHICH IS FAR BELOW THE NEEDED INVESTMENT, BUT DOES JUMP-START
15 SOME PROJECTS ACROSS THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
16 ADDITIONALLY, TODAY'S ITEM INCLUDES MAJOR INVESTMENTS FOR
17 CALTRAIN, SFMTA AND B.A.R.T. VEHICLES. THERE IS \$125 MILLION
18 FOR CALTRAIN, EMUS, \$117 MILLION FOR SFMTA LIGHT RAIL VEHICLES
19 AND \$96 MILLION FOR BART REPLACEMENT RAIL CARS. FOR BART \$46
20 MILLION EVER THOSE FUNDS ARE FOR PAY GO, AND \$50 MILLION IS
21 PROGRAMMED IN FISCAL YEAR 2026 TO START PAYING DEBT SERVICE ON
22 THE REPLACEMENT RAIL CAR LOAN PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. THE
23 PROPOSED PROGRAM INCLUDES SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENTS IN STATE OF
24 BODY REPAIR PROGRAMMING ACROSS THE REGION INCLUDES \$359
25 MILLION IN FIXED GUIDEWAY STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAMMING



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 WHICH INCLUDES PROJECTS LIKE TRAIN CONTROL, TRACK MAINTENANCES
2 AND FERRY INFRASTRUCTURE AS WELL AS SIMILAR PROGRAMMING TO OUR
3 FIXED GUIDEWAY OPERATORS. THERE IS ADDITIONALLY \$67 MILLION
4 DOLLARS IN PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE FUNDS ACROSS THE REGION
5 AND AS PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED \$22 MILLION IN 0-EMISSION BUS
6 INFRASTRUCTURE WHICH INCLUDES CHARGING AND FUELING
7 INFRASTRUCTURE AND FACILITY IMPROVEMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS
8 PART OF THE REGIONAL APPROACH TO SUSTAINED TRANSIT AND ADDRESS
9 SHORTFALLS IN TRANSIT OPERATING BUDGET WE ARE INCLUDING \$132
10 MILLION, AS PART OF THE 300 THERE MILLION -- EXCUSE ME, 300
11 MILLION -- \$300 MILLION CONTRIBUTION. THIS IS INCLUDING \$132
12 MILLION IN IT. CP FUNDS THAT ARE PROGRAMMED TO PREVENTATIVE
13 MAINTENANCE FOR BART CALTRAIN AND SFMTA MORE DETAIL ON ALL OF
14 TODAY'S PROPOSED PROGRAMMING CAN BE FOUND IN TODAY'S MATERIAL.
15 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN CONCLUSION STAFF RECOMMENDS REFERRAL OF
16 MTC RESOLUTION OF 4674 AND 4510 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR
17 APPROVAL. AND WE WILL RETURN TO THIS COMMITTEE IN THE COMING
18 MONTHS FOR ANY ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING AS WELL AS TO RECONCILE
19 PROJECTED APPORTIONMENTS WITH ACTUALS ONCE RELEASED. AND
20 CONCURRENT WITH TODAY'S PROGRAMMING IS A PROPOSED
21 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM OR TIP AMENDMENT THAT
22 INCLUDES SOME OF THE FISCAL YEARS '25 AND '26 PROGRAMMING AND
23 STAFF WILL INCLUDE PROJECTS AND FUNDING IN UPCOMING TIP
24 ADMINISTRATIVE MODIFICATIONS AND AMENDMENTS AS APPLICABLE.
25 THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS? THE
3 BUSES, WHERE ARE THEY MANUFACTURED?

4

5 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** I BELIEVE THERE IS A REQUIREMENT THAT THEY'RE
6 MANUFACTURED IN THE U.S. YEAH.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** PARDON ME? I DIDN'T HEAR THE --

9

10 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERE IS A REQUIREMENT THEY'RE MANUFACTURED
11 IN THE U.S. BUT DO YOU MEAN SPECIFICALLY WHERE THEY'RE
12 MANUFACTURED?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** NO. THAT'S GOOD. THANKS. LET'S SEE HERE.
15 SO, IS THIS AN ACTION ITEM?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES IT IS.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. DO WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND
20 TO APPROVE REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4674 AND 4610
21 REVISED TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROGRAM FOR FISCAL YEARS
22 2024, 2025, AND '25/'26 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL?

23

24 **HILLARY RONEN:** RONEN SO MOVED.

25



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

2

3 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO
6 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM
7 WISHING TO SPEAK.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. IF WE CAN CALL THE ROLL?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

20

21 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

24

25 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

7

8 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
11 PRESENT.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. AGENDA ITEM 4B FEDERAL MTC
14 RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4202, REVISED 4505 REVISED AND 4678.
15 ADOPTION OF PROJECT SELECTION AND PROGRAM POLICIES FOR CERTAIN
16 SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM, CONGESTED
17 MITIGATION AND AIR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM, FUNDS FOR
18 TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN VARIOUS REVISION TO THE ONE BAY AREA
19 GRANT, OBAG 2 AND 3 PROGRAMS. IN ACCORDANCE WITH MTC
20 RESOLUTION 4619, REVISED, APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION IN
21 NOVEMBER. THIS ITEM INCLUDES FUNDING COMMITMENTS TO SATISFY
22 \$300 MILLION REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION TO ADDRESS PUBLIC TRANSIT
23 OPERATOR SHORTFALLS. THOMAS WILL MAKE THIS PRESENTATION.

24



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 **THOMAS ARNDT:** THANK YOU VICE CHAIR. THOMAS ARNDT. AS YOU
2 MENTIONED THIS IS A COMPONENT OF THE \$300 MILLION REGIONAL
3 CONTRIBUTION TO THE 125 FRAMEWORK FOR THE TRANSIT FISCAL
4 CLIFF, AND STP CMAQ TRANSIT OPERATIONS PROGRAM WILL CONTRIBUTE
5 \$101 MILLION IN FUTURE STP CMAQ APPORTIONMENT FOR TRANSIT
6 OPERATIONS I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THESE FUNDS ARE TYPICALLY USED
7 FOR MTC -- OBAG THREE CYCLE HOWEVER WOULD REDUCE TOTAL
8 CAPACITY FOR NEXT OBAG PSYCH OLE EARLY STAGES DEVELOPING
9 BECAUSE TRANSIT PROJECTS WILL DELIVER IN NEXT TWO YEARS ACTION
10 COULD DELAY EXISTING ON, BAG THREE PROJECTS STAFF ARE WILL BE
11 WORKING WITH SPONSORS TO MITIGATE THESE IMPACTS IN ADDITION TO
12 THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS PROGRAM THIS ITEM INCLUDES VARIOUS
13 UNRELATED REVISIONS TO THE OBAG 2 AND 3 PROGRAMS AS DETAILED
14 IN THE STAFF REPORT STAFF RECOMMENDATION TODAY IS TO REFER THE
15 FOLLOWING RESOLUTIONS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL 4202,
16 OBAG TWO PROGRAM 505 REVISED OBAG THREE PROGRAM AND 4678 IS
17 THE NEW STP CMAQ TRANSIT OPERATIONS PROGRAM.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. ANY COMMISSIONERS HAVE ANY
20 COMMENTS?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** THANKS FOR THE HEADS UP THERE. SO, TO REPEAT
23 BRIEFLY HERE. LOCAL JURISDICTIONS, WE ARE DEEPLY CONCERNED. I
24 THINK MY COLLEAGUES WILL JOIN ME ON WHAT PERCENTAGE COMES OUT
25 OF THE LOCAL POT FOR THIS. BECAUSE WE UTILIZE THOSE FUNDS



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 REALLY, REALLY WELL, AND ANY LOSS OF THEM IN THE FUTURE, IT --
2 I DON'T KNOW THAT WE COULD ACCEPT THAT. SO, CAN SOMEBODY
3 ELABORATE, PLEASE?

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. SO, THIS ITEM,
6 AGAIN, DOES NOT MAKE ANY COMMITMENTS ON OBAG FOUR. AND I THINK
7 THAT'S WHERE YOU'RE RAISING THE CONCERNS ABOUT WHEN WE GET TO
8 THE OBAG FOUR, HOW MUCH OF THE TRANSIT PROGRAMMING COMES FROM
9 THE COUNTY PROGRAM VERSUS THE REGIONAL PROGRAM. SO, WE HAVE
10 DEFINITELY HEARD THE CONCERNS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS. HEARD
11 CONCERNS FROM THE CTAS SO WE'LL BE COMING BACK EARLY IN 2025
12 WITH INFORMATION AND WE CERTAINLY WILL BE VERY AWARE AND WE'LL
13 TAKE THAT INTO CONSIDERATION WHEN WE COME BACK TO YOU WITH THE
14 OBAG FOUR CONSIDERATIONS.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU ALIX AND STAFF IN 2025 WE'LL SHOW UP IN
17 FULL FORCE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS? OKAY. DO I HAVE
20 A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTION
21 NUMBERS 4202 REVISED, 4505 REVISED, AND 4678, ADOPTION OF
22 PROJECT SELECTION AND PROGRAM BEING POLICIES FOR CERTAIN
23 SURFACE TRANSPORTATION BLOCK GRANT PROGRAM AND CONGESTION
24 MITIGATION IN AIR QUALITY IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM FUND FOR TRANSIT



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1 OPERATIONS IN VARIOUS REVISIONS TO OBAG 2 AND 3 PROGRAMS TO
2 THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL? IS THERE A MOTION AND A SECOND?

3

4 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** FLEMING SECONDS.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. SO WHO DID WE GET? GLOVER FIRST?

9 OKAY. GLOVER FOLLOWED BY FLEMING. OKAY. GREAT. OKAY. ANY OTHER

10 COMMISSIONERS HAVE ANY FURTHER COMMENTS? ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YOU HAVE RECEIVED WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE

13 FROM SEAN SHARP TEAR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND CITY AND COUNTY

14 ASSOCIATION OF GOVERNMENTS. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE

15 WISHING TO PROVIDE COMMENT AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. CAN WE TAKE THE ROLL?

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CERTAINLY. FIRST BY GLOVER SECOND BY

20 FLEMING. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

25



1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

16

17 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
20 PRESENT.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. SO, ARE I BELIEVE WE'RE UP TO
23 ITEM SEVEN, NOW, RIGHT?

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FIVE.



DECEMBER 11, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** FIVE?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. PARDON. WE'RE ON AGENDA ITEM FIVE
5 PUBLIC COMMENT.

6

7 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OR OTHER BUSINESS.

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. I THOUGHT WE WERE UP TO
12 PUBLIC COMMENT. OKAY. I WAS -- DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
13 ON THIS ITEM?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE IN THE
16 BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT VERY GOOD. SO, THE NEXT
19 MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS
20 SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER, 375 BEALE
21 STREET, SAN FRANCISCO, ON WEDNESDAY JANUARY THE 8TH, 2025. ANY
22 CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC.
23 WE'RE ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

24



Broadcasting Government