

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



JULY 22, 2022

1                                   **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**  
2                                   **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY & ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE**  
3                                   **FRIDAY, JULY 22, 2022 1:00 PM**  
4  
5   **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. BROADCASTING TEAM CAN YOU PLAY  
6 THE MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES  
7 ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED  
8 AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL  
9 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS  
10 MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL  
11 CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER  
12 SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE  
13 THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS  
14 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS  
15 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO  
16 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION  
17 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE  
18 OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE  
19 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON  
20 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED  
21 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT,  
22 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC  
23 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT [INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV](mailto:INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV) BY 5 P.M.,  
24 YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED  
25 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF



JULY 22, 2022

1 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE  
2 TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL  
3 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE  
4 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD  
5 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE  
6 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP  
7 TO DATE.

8

9 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. MARTHA CAN YOU DO ROLL CALL TO  
10 CONFIRM QUORUM?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. CHAIR ISUF?

13

14 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR MARKHAM?

17

18 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER FITZGERALD?

21

22 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER HANKERSON?

25



JULY 22, 2022

1 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** PRESENT.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER ORANTES?

4

5 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER PIMPLE?

8

9 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER SCOTT?

12

13 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER WELTE?

16

17 **FRANK WELTE:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MEMBER WILSON? MEMBER WILSON? MEMBER  
20 WONG?

21

22 **HOWARD WONG:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ALTERNATES CAMPOS?

25



JULY 22, 2022

1 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ALTERNATE ELDRED? WE HAVE A QUORUM  
4 WITHOUT THE ALTERNATES NEEDED.

5

6 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GREAT. THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE.  
7 GREAT TO SEE EVERYBODY TODAY. WHY DON'T WE START WITH  
8 APPROVING THE MINUTES FROM JUNE 23RD. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A  
9 SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES?

10

11 **TERRY SCOTT:** SO MOVED.

12

13 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** DO I HAVE A SECOND?

14

15 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** SECOND.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

18

19 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GREAT. MOTION WAS MADE BY TERRY SCOTT, AND I  
20 HEARD THE SECOND FROM A COUPLE OF FOLKS. I THINK DWAYNE WAS  
21 ONE OF THEM. IS THERE A DISCUSSION ON THE ITEM? I ASSUME WE  
22 DIDN'T GET ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON IT

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NO CORRESPONDENCE ON THIS ITEM.

25



JULY 22, 2022

1 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S DO THE VOTE.

2

3 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CHAIR ISUF?

4

5 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** VICE CHAIR MARKHAM?

8

9 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** FITZGERALD?

12

13 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE -- YES.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

16

17 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ORANTES?

20

21 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE?

24

25 **VINAY PIMPLE:** AYE.



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WELTE?

3

4 **FRANK WELTE:** NO.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT?

7

8 **TERRY SCOTT:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILSON IS ABSENT. WONG?

11

12 **HOWARD WONG:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IT PASSES WITH ONE NO AND EIGHT AYES.

15

16 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE CAN MOVE ON TO AGENDA

17 ITEM NUMBER FOUR. WE HAVE DRENNEN WHO IS GOING TO TALK ABOUT

18 THE BLUE RIBBON ACTION PLAN ACCESS AND MOBILITY WORK UPDATE.

19 DRENNAN, I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU.

20

21 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** THANKS FOR HAVING ME BACK. I'M HERE FOR THE

22 REGULAR UPDATE TO LET YOU KNOW WHAT'S GOING ON WITH THE ACCESS

23 AND MOBILITY WORK PLAN. A REMINDER WHAT THIS WORK PLAN IS,

24 LAST SUMMER THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE DEVELOPED THE

25 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND WITHIN THAT ACTION PLAN THERE



JULY 22, 2022

1 ARE FIVE ACCESSIBILITY ITEMS THESE ARE HEAVILY FOCUSED ON  
2 PARATRANSIT WE HAVE BUNDLED THEM TOGETHER INTO THE ACCESS  
3 MOBILITY WORK PLAN A QUICK REMINDER OZ As TO WHAT THOSE ARE,  
4 ACTION ONE IS TO DESIGNATE THE MOBILITY MANAGER IN EACH COUNTY  
5 AND THE MOBILITY MANAGER WILL COORDINATE RIGHTS AND FUNCTION  
6 AS LIAISON BETWEEN THE RIDERS ACTION TWO ADDITIONAL  
7 SUBREGIONAL ONE SEAT PARATRANSIT RIDE PILOT AND DEVELOPING  
8 POLICIES FOR JURISDICTIONAL PARATRANSIT. ACTION THREE IS THE  
9 INTEGRATION OF THE ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICE ON THE NEXT  
10 GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM. ACTION 24 WILL IDENTIFY KEY  
11 PARATRANSIT CHALLENGES AND RECOMMEND REFORMS. AND LASTLY,  
12 ACTION 25 IS TO ADOPT STANDARDIZED ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR  
13 PARATRANSIT. I DON'T HAVE MUCH OF AN UPDATE FOR YOU THIS  
14 MONTH, BUT I'M HAPPY TO SEE I'M ALMOST DONE GETTING OUR  
15 CONSULTANT ON BOARD. YOU REMEMBER FROM LAST MONTH THAT MTC IS  
16 ENGAGING NELSON NYGAARD WITH THE SAME PROJECT TEAM THAT IS  
17 CURRENTLY WORKING WITH ME ON THE UPDATED COORDINATED PLAN.  
18 THAT TEAM WILL GET STARTED ON OUR WORK AND INTEGRATE IT INTO  
19 THE UPDATED WORK PLAN AND OUR CONSULTING BOARD WILL KICKOFF  
20 OUR WORK NEXT MONTH AND WE'LL DEVELOP A TIMELINE THAT WILL GO  
21 ALONG WITH THE WORK PLAN SO YOU WILL SEE THAT TIMELINE LIKELY  
22 NEXT MONTH. BUT IN THE MEANTIME, I INVITED OUR LEAD CONSULTANT  
23 FROM NIELSEN NYGAARD TO OUR MEETING. NAOMI IS HERE. FUN  
24 FANTASTIC SHE USED TO SIT WHERE YOU ARE SHE WAS A MEMBER OF  
25 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THE EQUITY AND ACCESS





JULY 22, 2022

1 SUBCOMMITTEE FOR MORE THAN A FEW YEARS. SO I'LL TURN IT OVER  
2 NAOMI TO INTRODUCE HERSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I WAS A MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY  
5 COUNCIL WHEN IT WAS FIRST INSTALLED AND I STAYED ON FOR MANY  
6 YEARS. I BELIEVE UNTIL 2017 OR 18, AND I WAS A MEMBER OF THE  
7 EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE ALL THAT TIME AND WAS HERE FOR A  
8 GREAT DEAL OF IT SO IT'S VERY NICE TO SEE SO MANY PEOPLE  
9 INVOLVED AND SO MANY NEW FACES AND PEOPLE WHO ARE REALLY  
10 COMMITTED TO THIS WORK. SO I THINK THAT'S REALLY ENCOURAGING.  
11 I'M A PRINCIPLE PLANNER WITH NELSON NYGAARD BASED IN THE  
12 OAKLAND OFFICE. THOUGH LIKE MANY PEOPLE, I AM WORKING FROM  
13 HOME QUITE A BIT NOW-A-DAYS. I AM PROJECT MANAGER FOR THIS  
14 PROJECT, WHICH WE ARE VERY EXCITED ABOUT, AND WE HAVE PEOPLE  
15 WHO ARE WORKING ON THE CURRENT COORDINATED PLAN WHO WILL BE  
16 WORKING WITH ME ON THIS, AND IT'S, AS DRENNEN SAYS, THE  
17 SCHEDULING AND THE PLANNING OF THESE DIFFERENT TASKS IS GOING  
18 TO BE OUR FIRST CHALLENGE TO LAY THEM OUT SO THAT WE CAN  
19 APPROACH THEM THOROUGHLY AND COMPLETELY, BUT NOT TRY TO  
20 PROBABLY DO ALL FOUR AT ONCE THAT IS GOING TO GET A LITTLE BIT  
21 COMPLICATED. SO, BUT WE'RE GOING TO LAY ALL THAT OUT AND I'M  
22 REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT AND TO UPDATING THIS COMMITTEE  
23 ON OUR WORK ON THAT AND I'M EXCITED TO HAVE THIS SPACE FROM  
24 MTC TO ADDRESS THESE ISSUES THAT HAVE BEEN COMING UP FOR A



JULY 22, 2022

1 NUMBER OF YEARS. SO, YEAH, WITH THAT, YEAH, I'M HAPPY TO MEET  
2 YOU ALL, AND LET ME KNOW IF YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS.

3

4 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** THANKS NAOMI.

5

6 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. I SEE HOWARD'S HAND RAISED.

7

8 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY EXISTING SIMILAR STUDIES  
9 OR PAST STUDIES THAT ONE CAN LOOK AT FIRST? AS A START?

10

11 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** THAT STAFF IS LOOKING AT? OR THAT YOU COULD  
12 LOOK AT?

13

14 **HOWARD WONG:** WELL, TO START THE PROJECT? OR WE COULD ACTUALLY  
15 LOOK AT? BUT, IS THERE ANY PAST BEST PRACTICES OR PAST SIMILAR  
16 PROJECTS ANYWHERE AROUND THE COUNTRY OR IN THE WORLD?

17

18 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** THERE ARE A NUMBER OF BEST PRACTICES THAT WE  
19 WILL BE LOOKING AT, BUT NOT FOR ONE STUDY THAT WILL TACKLE ALL  
20 OF THESE ITEMS. I THINK FOR US, THAT'S OUR JOB. WE, SORT OF,  
21 LOOK ACROSS THE COUNTRY AND ACROSS THE WORLD FOR THOSE BEST  
22 PRACTICES, AND FOR YOU ALL, I WOULD STRONGLY ENCOURAGE YOU TO  
23 READ THE CURRENT COORDINATED PLAN. I THINK I HAVE SENT IT TO  
24 YOU MULTIPLE TIMES. I WILL ALWAYS RECOMMEND THAT TO GET YOU UP



JULY 22, 2022

1 TO SPEED AND REMIND YOU OF THE CURRENT CONDITIONS OF THE  
2 REGION.

3

4 **HOWARD WONG:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. DOES ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY  
7 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS THEY WOULD LIKE TO STATE? I SEE NO ONE  
8 FROM THE COUNCIL. LET'S MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT. I THINK THERE  
9 ARE TWO ATTENDEES WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THAT'S CORRECT. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU  
12 LIKE TO GIVE THEM?

13

14 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** TWO MINUTES EACH.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WAS  
17 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. FIRST UP IS GOING TO BE ADINA. GO AHEAD  
18 AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. TO EQUITY AND  
21 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS AND STAFF. ADINA LEVIN, AND I AM  
22 ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND NOT ON THIS COMMITTEE AND  
23 HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT THE COORDINATED PLAN, THE ITEM ABOUT  
24 SUPPORTING THE DISABILITY ELIGIBILITY, AS PART OF THE  
25 COORDINATED -- SORRY -- AS PART OF CLIPPER. AND THE THING THAT



JULY 22, 2022

1 I AM A LITTLE BIT CONFUSED ABOUT -- AND THROUGH THE CHAIR, IT  
2 WOULD BE WELCOME TO GET AN ANSWER IS -- SINCE THIS IS ABOUT  
3 CLIPPER, IS THIS SOMETHING THAT'S ALSO PART OF NELSON  
4 NYGAARD'S SCOPE OF WORK AND IF SO, WHY? OR IS THIS SOMETHING  
5 THAT WILL JUST GO DIRECTLY TO THE CLIPPER TEAM TO WORK ON  
6 HAVING THESE FARES AND ELIGIBILITY WORK WITH THE CLIPPER  
7 SYSTEM? THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** DRENNEN DO YOU WANT TO ADDRESS THE QUESTION?

10

11 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** SURE. THIS PROJECT ISN'T LOOKING AT  
12 ELIGIBILITY FOR CLIPPER. THE -- WHAT IT'S LOOKING AT IS  
13 ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR DIFFERENT PROGRAMS, AND THE RTC  
14 PROGRAM, WHICH IS A CLIPPER DISCOUNT FIXED ROUTE, WILL BE PART  
15 OF THAT. THE ACTION OF INTEGRATION OF THE ADA PARATRANSIT  
16 SERVICES ON CLIPPER SEW BEING RUN THROUGH CLIPPER STAFF  
17 CURRENTLY, AND NELSON NYGAARD ISN'T WORKING ON THAT PORTION OF  
18 THIS WORK PLAN.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** OKAY. NEXT UP IS WARREN CUSHMAN. GO  
21 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THERE WE GO. IT WASN'T WORKING. SO HELLO EVERYONE MY  
24 NAME IS WARREN CUSHMAN, AND I WANT TO SAY A COUPLE OF THINGS.  
25 FIRST I'M GLAD TO HEAR THAT NAOMI IS PART OF THE TEAM. I



JULY 22, 2022

1 CONSIDER NAOMI TO BE AN EXPERT IN THE FIELD AND I'M GLAD THAT  
2 SHE'S GOING TO BE THE PROJECT MANAGER OF THIS MATTER. I WANT  
3 TO SAY TWO THINGS, FIRST OF ALL, THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY IS  
4 PASSIONATE ABOUT THIS TOPIC IT MATTERS TO US A LOT I  
5 PERSONALLY RIDE PARATRANSIT PROBABLY THREE TIMES A WEEK SO THE  
6 WHOLE QUESTION OF HOW PARATRANSIT IS GOING TO RUN BOTH LOCALLY  
7 AND REGIONALLY REALLY MATTERS. I DO WANT TO SAY THAT,  
8 OFTENTIMES I FIND THAT SOME OPERATORS VIEW PARATRANSIT IN A  
9 VERY DIFFERENT LIGHT THAN THE COMMUNITY ACTIVIST POINT OF  
10 VIEW. AND I'LL LEAVE THAT THERE. I'LL JUST SAY THAT OFTENTIMES  
11 OPERATORS DON'T SEE THINGS THE SAME WAY AS RIDERS OF THE  
12 SYSTEM AND IT'S SOMETHING I WANT TO ELEVATE TO THIS COMMITTEE  
13 AS A POINT TO PAY ATTENTION TO, THAT OPERATORS DON'T ALWAYS  
14 HAVE THE SAME VIEW AS THE RIDER. AND, SOMETIMES, LOOK  
15 SPECIFICALLY AT COST SAVINGS RATHER THAN WHAT'S BEST FOR THE  
16 RIDER. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU WARREN. NEXT UP IS RICH  
19 HEDGES, FOLLOWED BY DAVEED.

20

21 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANKS DRENNEN I KNOW YOU'RE COMMITTED TO THIS  
22 WORK I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS RELATED TO FOCUSING ON ONE  
23 RIDE POLICY IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT ESPECIALLY FOR THE DISABLED  
24 VETERANS THAT HAVE TO GET OUT OF THE VETERANS HOSPITALS OR OUT  
25 OF THE COUNTY WHICH THEY LIVE AND ALSO INTEGRATING CLIPPER ONE



JULY 22, 2022

1    THING WHEN PEOPLE ARE DISABLED AND ARE NOT QUALIFIED FOR  
2    PARATRANSIT I THINK ONCE THEY'RE QUALIFIED THEY SHOULDN'T HAVE  
3    TO REQUALIFY. THAT'S ALL I HAVE. THANK YOU.

4

5    **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. NEXT IS DAVEED MANDELL. YOU  
6    HAVE ONE MINUTE. ONCE YOU GET TO 15 SECONDS I'LL LET YOU KNOW.

7

8    **SPEAKER:** I'M DAVEED MANDELL MEMBER OF THE TRANSPORTATION  
9    COMMITTEE OF THE AMERICAN COUNCIL OF THE BLIND. FIRST I WANT  
10   TO SAY I HAVE A GREAT DEAL OF RESPECT FOR THE INTEGRITY AND  
11   KNOWLEDGE OF NAOMI. I WORKED WITH HER AND APPRECIATE ALL THAT  
12   SHE DOES. WHAT I'M GOING TO SAY SHOULD NOT BE CONSTRUED AS A  
13   PERSONAL ATTACK ON NAOMI. I AM DEEPLY DISAPPOINTED THAT MTC  
14   HAS CHOSEN TO HIRE NELSON NYGAARD AS A CONSULTANT ON PARA  
15   TRANSIT. I HAVE SPOKEN IN DEPTH WITH ONE OF ITS PRINCIPLES  
16   RICHARD WIENER, AND I HAVE TO SAY THAT NELSON NYGAARD IS NOT  
17   COMMITTED TO RESTRUCTURING ADA PARATRANSIT AS IT SHOULD BE.  
18   BECAUSE AS MANY PEOPLE ARE BEGINNING TO REALIZE ADA  
19   PARATRANSIT HAS NO CIVIL RIGHTS BASIS WHATSOEVER IT HAS MANY  
20   GLARING QUALITIES THAT NO ONE ELSE EXCEPT RIDERS OF  
21   PARATRANSIT MUST FACE SUCH AS ADVANCED RESERVATIONS HAVING TO  
22   PAY TWICE AS MUCH AS THE AVERAGE NON-DISCOUNTED FARE. WHAT  
23   WE'RE DEMANDING IS REGIONAL ON DEMAND SAME DAY PARATRANSIT AND  
24   WE ARE DEMANDING THAT PARATRANSIT BE LINKED NOT TO FIXED ROUTE  
25   PARATRANSIT BUT THE INABILITY TO DRIVE AND WE HAVE TO WORK ON



JULY 22, 2022

1 BRINGING THIS UP A LEVEL AND NELSON NYGAARD IS NOT COMMITTED  
2 TO THIS. THERE ARE CONSULTANT WHO IS ARE MUCH MORE COMMITTED  
3 TO RESTRUCTURING PARATRANSIT WHO ARE MUCH MORE CREATIVE AND  
4 WHO ARE VERY MUCH INVOLVED IN THIS STRUGGLE. AND, AGAIN, I  
5 WANT TO EXPRESS MY DISAPPOINTMENT THAT NELSON NYGAARD HAS BEEN  
6 HIRED. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS OUR LAST SPEAKER.

9

10 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I JUST WANT TO GIVE  
11 DRENNEN A CHANCE TO SAY ANY FINAL STATEMENTS BEFORE I MOVE TO  
12 THE NEXT ITEM.

13

14 **DRENNAN SHELTON:** I WILL BE BACK NEXT MONTH WITH AN UPDATE AND  
15 I SINCERELY APPRECIATE THE CONTINUED ENGAGEMENT FROM THE  
16 COMMUNITY AND ALSO FROM THE SUBCOMMITTEE. SO, THANKS.

17

18 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU SO MUCH DRENNEN. WE'RE SO GLAD  
19 THAT YOU ARE A REGULAR PART OF OUR CALLS AND WITH THAT WE CAN  
20 MOVE -- I SEE HOWARD HAS HIS HAND RAISED. YOU'RE MUTED HOWARD.

21

22 **HOWARD WONG:** I JUST WANTED TO MAKE A QUICK COMMENT ON THE  
23 COMMENT THE GENTLEMAN JUST MADE ABOUT THE ON DEMAND  
24 PARATRANSIT. ACTUALLY, I WAS JUST READING THAT -- I CAN'T  
25 REMEMBER WHICH JURISDICTION, WHAT CITY, BUT THEY'RE TESTING



JULY 22, 2022

1 THE ON-DEMAND SAME-DAY OR 15-MINUTE RIDE. SO I JUST WANTED TO  
2 BRING THAT UP. IT'S SOMETHING'S HAPPENING SOMEWHERE. BUT I  
3 DON'T KNOW WHICH CITY. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANKS HOWARD. ALL RIGHT. WE CAN MOVE TO THE  
6 NEXT ITEM, WHICH IS EXPRESS CARPOOL, CHECK SMART PHONE APP  
7 PILOT. AND CHELSEA GAMULO WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM. I'LL TURN IT  
8 OVER TO YOU CHELSEA.

9

10 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU. GOOD AFTERNOON EQUITY AND ACCESS  
11 SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS MY NAME IS CHELSEA GAMULO MTC EXPRESS  
12 LANES STAFF JOINED TODAY BY MY COLLEAGUE SARAH BURNSWORTH  
13 PROJECT MANAGER FOR THIS PILOT TO HELP FILL ANY QUESTIONS YOU  
14 MIGHT HAVE AT THE CONCLUSION OF MY PRESENTATION. WITH THAT  
15 I'LL ASK THE BROADCASTING TEAM TO PLEASE TEE UP -- PERFECT,  
16 THANK YOU. I'M HERE TODAY WITH AN UPDATE ABOUT A REQUEST FROM  
17 THE COMMISSION TO EXPLORE NEW TECHNOLOGIES TO IMPROVE  
18 COMPLIANCE WITH OCCUPANCY REQUIREMENTS IN EXPRESS LANES AND  
19 HOW WE ARE APPROACHING PILOTING A SMART PHONE APP THROUGH AN  
20 EQUITY LENS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE WANT TO IMPROVE COMPLIANCE  
21 WITH EXPRESS LANE OCCUPANCY RULES SO THAT THE EXPRESS LANES  
22 WORK BETTER FOR CARPOOLS, TRANSIT, AND PEOPLE WHO CHOOSE TO  
23 PAY THE TOLL. PICTURED HERE IS A FASTRAK FLEX TOLL TAG TO TELL  
24 THE TOLL SYSTEM HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE IN THE CAR. SORRY. I NEED  
25 TO START OVER. PICTURE HERE IS A FASTRAK FLEX TOLL TAG AND





JULY 22, 2022

1 BEACON IN AN EXPRESS LANE DRIVERS CURRENTLY FOLLOW THE HONOR  
2 SYSTEM IN TERMS OF SETTING THE TAG TO TELL THE TOLL SYSTEM HOW  
3 MANY PEOPLE ARE IN THEIR CAR AND THE TOLL SYSTEM SHOWS THE  
4 NUMBER OF PEOPLE ON THE NUMERIC BEACON TO SUPPORT CHP  
5 ENFORCEMENT. MTC IS NOW EXPLORING THROUGH TECHNOLOGY WAYS TO  
6 ACTUALLY VERIFY THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN THE CAR INSTEAD AND  
7 REDUCE THE NEED FOR CHP. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. CARPOOL VIOLATORS  
8 UNDERMINE THE ABILITY OF THE EXPRESS LANES TO MOVE FOR PEOPLE  
9 WITHIN OUR EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE AND AFFECT THE EXPRESS LANE  
10 EXPERIENCE FOR ALL TRAVELERS. FINDING A SOLUTION TO REDUCE  
11 CARPOOL VIOLATIONS IS CRITICAL TO MAINTAINING THE INTEGRITY OF  
12 EXPRESS LANES. A 2015 STUDY REVEALED AVERAGE HOV VIOLATION  
13 RATES OF 22% ON BAY AREA HOV LANES WITH SOME VIOLATION RATES  
14 APPROACHING NEARLY 40%. THERE ARE MANY BENEFITS TO REDUCING  
15 CARPOOL VIOLATIONS INCLUDING INCREASING PERSON THROUGHPUT,  
16 REDUCING CONGESTION, REDUCING TOLLS, PROVIDING MORE RELIABLE  
17 TRAVEL TIMES FOR CARPOOLS AND TRANSIT, INCREASING OVERALL  
18 EFFICIENCY OF THE SYSTEM, AND INCREASING PUBLIC CONFIDENCE  
19 THAT THE LANES ARE WORKING AND BEING UTILIZED AS INTENDED.  
20 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE CURRENTLY EXPLORING TWO SEPARATE  
21 TECHNOLOGIES, WHICH ARE BEING PILOTED IN PHASES TO VERIFY  
22 CARPOOLS, ELIMINATE THE NEED FOR OCCUPANCY ENFORCEMENT, AND  
23 INCREASE THE AMOUNT OF PEOPLE TRAVELING ON BAY AREA HOV LANES.  
24 THE FIRST PILOT WHICH I WILL BE TALKING ABOUT IN MORE LENGTH  
25 TODAY IS A SMART PHONE APP-BASED SOLUTION PICTURED TO YOUR



JULY 22, 2022

1 LEFT. WE HAVE PARTNERS WITH RIDE FLAG TO TEST THE SMART PHONE  
2 APP-BASED SYSTEM AS A POTENTIAL COST EFFECTIVE WAY TO IMPROVE  
3 LANE PERFORMANCE ON I 680 CONTRA COSTA EXPRESS LANES. LATER IN  
4 MY PRESENTATION, I'LL WALK YOU THROUGH WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE  
5 FROM A USER PERSPECTIVE AND EXPLAIN HOW RIDE FLAGS APP  
6 ACTUALLY WORKS WITH PICTURES AND THE SECOND PILOT PICTURED TO  
7 YOUR RIDE IS A ROADSIDE CAMERA APPROACH. PHASE ONE OF THE  
8 ROADSIDE CAMERA PILOT WAS COMPLETED ON NORTHBOUND I-880 IN  
9 HAYWARD PHASE TWO IS BEING CONSIDERED FOR THE BAY PRIVILEGE  
10 AND WOULD INVOLVE INTEGRATION WITH THE FASTRAK CUSTOMER  
11 SERVICE CENTERS BACK OFFICE SYSTEMS. TODAY, MY PRESENTATION IS  
12 ONLY ABOUT THE SMART PHONE APP PILOT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'RE  
13 PILOTING THIS APP APPROACH FOR A NUMBER OF REASONS, TO  
14 EVALUATE HOW EFFECTIVE AND ACCURATE THIS APPROACH IS, TO  
15 MEASURE AND EVALUATE USABILITY, IS THE APP EASY TO ACCESS AND  
16 USE, TO EXPLORE AND ADDRESS PRIVACY CONCERNS OR ISSUES, TO  
17 UNDERSTAND COST IF DEPLOYED MORE BROADLY AND EXPLORE WAYS TO  
18 MAKE IT BETTER. PHASE ONE OF THE PILOT WILL INVOLVE RECRUITING  
19 APPROXIMATELY 500 TO 600 VOLUNTEERS WHO CARPOOL IN THE I 680  
20 EXPRESS LANES BETWEEN MARTINEZ AND SAN RAMON. PARTICIPANTS  
21 WILL USE RIDE FLAG SMART PHONE APP TO COUNT THE NUMBER OF  
22 PEOPLE IN THEIR CARPOOL. MTC WILL TEST TWO VERSIONS OF THE  
23 RIDE FLAG APP, ONE THAT DOES NOT STORE DATA ON THE PHONE AND  
24 ONE THAT DOES. THE VERSION THAT DOES NOT STORE DATA WILL ONLY  
25 CONFIRM THAT THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN THE CARPOOL MEETS



JULY 22, 2022

1 OCCUPANCY RULES AT THE START AND END OF THE TRIP. THE VERSION  
2 THAT STORES DATA WILL ALSO CONFIRM THAT THE PEOPLE THAT  
3 STARTED THE TRIP ARE LIKELY THE SAME AS THOSE THAT COMPLETED  
4 THE PILOT WILL RUN FOR APPROXIMATELY THREE MONTHS DURING WHICH  
5 TIME ALL PARTICIPANTS WILL BE INCENTIVIZED TO PROVIDE PERIODIC  
6 FEEDBACK THROUGH ONLINE SURVEYS. AT THE END OF THE PILOT  
7 VOLUNTEERS MAY BE ASKED ASK COMPENSATED TO PARTICIPATE IN  
8 FOCUS GROUP MEETINGS. I WOULD LIKE TO HIGHLIGHT RIDE FLAGS  
9 EXPERIENCE WITH THIS TECHNOLOGY. RIDE FLAG RECENTLY CONCLUDED  
10 A SIMILAR SMART PHONE APP PILOT WITH UTAH DEPARTMENT OF  
11 TRANSPORTATION ON THEIR I15 EXPRESS LANES RIDE FLAG IS  
12 CONDUCTING SEVERAL RESEARCH PILOTS WITH FLORIDA DEPARTMENT OF  
13 TRANSPORTATION AND UNIVERSITY OF SOUTH FLORIDA'S CENTER FOR  
14 URBAN TRANSPORTATION STUDIES. SEVERAL OTHER MAJOR TOLLING  
15 AGENCIES ARE FOLLOWING THIS PILOT WITH MTC TO ASSESS WHETHER  
16 THE RIDE FLAGS TOOL COULD EVENTUALLY REPLACE THE TRANSPONDER  
17 SWITCH. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SINCE DEVELOPING THE ORIGINAL PILOT  
18 CONCEPT, MTC HAS MADE A CONSCIOUS DECISION TO CONSIDER EQUITY  
19 AS PART OF THE PILOT SCOPE. WE HAVE HIRED CENTERS FOR  
20 NEIGHBORHOOD TECHNOLOGY AND EQUITY TO GIVE US ADVICE ABOUT HO  
21 TO YOU INFUSE EQUITY IN THE PILOT. MTC HAS ASKED CMT AND  
22 EQUITICITY TO LOOK AT OUR PILOT PLAN. SOME PROJECT MATERIALS  
23 REVIEWED TO DATE INCLUDE THE APP PILOT FRAMEWORK OUTREACH  
24 MATERIALS CMT AND EQUITICITY HAVE PROVIDED INVALUABLE FEEDBACK  
25 ON PROJECT DELIVERABLES AND DIRECTION. THEIR FEEDBACK WILL BE



JULY 22, 2022

1 INSTRUMENTAL FOR PHASE ONE AND FUTURE PHASES OF THIS WORK.  
2 RECOMMENDATIONS ABOUT THE APP PILOT FRAMEWORK INCLUDE FRAMING  
3 THE PROJECT AROUND ACCESS RATHER THAN ENFORCEMENT ENCOURAGING  
4 PARTICIPATION BY LOW-INCOME BLACK INDIGENOUS AND PEOPLE OF  
5 COLOR CREATE RECRUIT TARGETS PROVIDE TRANSPARENCY ON HOW  
6 PERSONAL DATA IS USED AND SECURITY AND CONSIDER OBSTACLES FOR  
7 UNDOCUMENTED INDIVIDUALS. OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS NOT SHOWN ON  
8 THIS SLIDE INCLUDE EXPAND STRATEGIES TO REACH A DIVERSE GROUP  
9 OF PARTICIPANTS. RECONSIDER FASTRAK FLEX REQUIREMENT FOR  
10 PARTICIPANTS TO LOWER THE RISK OF SURPRISE TOLLS OR OTHER  
11 COSTS, ENGAGE WITH COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS FOR RECRUITMENT,  
12 AND INCREASE THE PARTICIPATION INCENTIVE. RECOMMENDATIONS  
13 ABOUT OUTREACH MATERIALS INCLUDE USE CONVERSATIONAL LANGUAGE  
14 AND PROVIDE OUTREACH MATERIALS IN RELEVANT LANGUAGES, FOCUS ON  
15 BENEFITS TO TESTERS AND FUTURE USERS, BE CLEAR ABOUT THE  
16 PURPOSE OF THE PILOT SINCE THE DETAILS OF CARPOOLING AND HOW  
17 EXPRESS LANES WORK MAY NOT BE WIDELY UNDERSTOOD. HIGHLIGHT THE  
18 INTENT TO MAKE THIS PROJECT AND CARPOOLING EQUITABLE. WE'RE  
19 LOOKING AT THEIR RECOMMENDATIONS, CONTAINING CONVERSATIONS  
20 ABOUT EQUITY AND FIGURING OUT HOW TO INCORPORATE  
21 RECOMMENDATIONS IN PHASE ONE OR FUTURE PHASES OF THE APP  
22 PILOT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I WANT TO SPEND SOME TIME EXPLAINING  
23 HOW RIDE FLAGS APP WORKS SO YOU UNDERSTAND THE TECHNOLOGY. THE  
24 APP IS DESIGNED TO ACCURATELY COUNT REAL FACES USING UNIQUE  
25 FACIAL VECTORS WHAT DRIVE FLAG REFERS TO AS FACIAL SIGNATURE



JULY 22, 2022

1 THIS IS ACHIEVED BY MEASURING THE DISTANCE BETWEEN FACIAL  
2 FEATURES SUCH AS THE DISTANCE BETWEEN THE CORNER OF A PERSON'S  
3 MOUTH TO THE TIP OF THEIR NOSE. THESE FACIAL VECTORS ARE  
4 TRANSLATED INTO NUMERIC VALUE THAT CANNOT BE REPLICATED OR  
5 REVERSE ENGINEERED TO REVEAL OR IDENTIFY A PERSON'S FACE.  
6 PHOTOGRAPHIC IMAGES ARE NEVER STORED BUT DEPENDING ON HOW WE  
7 CONFIGURE THE APP A PERSON'S FACIAL SIGNATURE MAY BE TEMP  
8 REALLY STORED ON THE PHONE. THE APP IS DESIGNED TO VALIDATE  
9 ALL SKIN TONES ALL AGES, INCLUDING INFANTS, ANY TIME OF DAY,  
10 AND EVEN WHEN WEARING SUN GLASSES AND MASKS. ONLY ONE SMART  
11 PHONE IS REQUIRED AND THE PROCESS TO VERIFY OCCUPANCY CAN BE  
12 ACCOMPLISHED IN ABOUT FIVE SECONDS OR LESS. WE PLAN TO PILOT  
13 TWO DIFFERENT VERSIONS OF THE APP, ONE THAT TEMPORARILY STORES  
14 FACIAL SIGNATURES ON THE PHONE, AND ONE THAT DOES NOT. THIS  
15 GRAPHIC SHOWS HOW THE APP WORKS. FIRST, WHEN A USER PRESSES  
16 THE VERIFY CARPOOL BUTTON BEFORE DRIVING, THE APP COUNTS THE  
17 NUMBER OF REAL FACES IN THE CAR. THEN, THE APP WILL SHOW THE  
18 NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN THE CAR IN THE UPPER RIGHT HAND CORNER OF  
19 THE APP AND TELL THE USER THAT THEY ARE ELIGIBLE TO CARPOOL IN  
20 THE I 680 EXPRESS LANE. AT THE END OF THE TRIP, THE APP WILL  
21 INDICATE TO THE USER THAT REVERIFICATION IS REQUIRED.  
22 REVERIFICATION WILL BE DONE 1 OF 2 DIFFERENT WAYS. ONE VERSION  
23 OF THE APP WILL CONFIRM THAT THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE IN THE  
24 CARPOOL MEETS OCCUPANCY REQUIREMENTS AT THE START AND END OF  
25 THE TRIP. THE OTHER VERSION OF THE APP WILL USE FACIAL



JULY 22, 2022

1 SIGNATURES TO CONFIRM THAT THE PEOPLE WHO STARTED THE TRIP ARE  
2 LIKELY THE SAME PEOPLE AS THOSE WHO COMPLETED IT. A FACIAL  
3 SIGNATURE MATCH BETWEEN INITIAL VERIFICATION AND  
4 REVERIFICATION IS INDICATED BY A GREEN CHECK MARK. ONCE  
5 REVERIFICATION IS CONFIRMED, THE USER IS NOTIFIED THAT THEY  
6 HAVE RECEIVED THEIR CARPOOL CREDIT OR BENEFIT. NEXT SLIDE  
7 PLEASE. LISTED ON CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR CONSIDERING  
8 THROUGH AN EQUITY LENS ENSURING THE APP TECHNOLOGY IS  
9 ACCESSIBLE TO ANYONE WHO WANTS TO USE IT IS A HIGH PRIORITY  
10 AND INTENTIONAL EFFORT TO ADDRESS EQUITY WE HAVE HIRED AN  
11 EQUITY CONSULTANT TO APPLY AN EQUITY LENS REVIEW KEY PROJECT  
12 DELIVERABLES TO PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS OCCUPANCY DETECTION  
13 FOR INDIVIDUALS OF ALL SKIN TONES ALL AGES ANY TIME OF DAY AND  
14 OPPORTUNITY TO RECRUIT PARTICIPANTS FROM MARGINALIZED  
15 COMMUNITIES PROVIDING ACCESS TO A RESOURCE THAT WASN'T EASILY  
16 ACCESSIBLE BEFORE. WE ACKNOWLEDGE CERTAIN POPULATIONS MAY HAVE  
17 DIFFERENT AND INCREASED CONCERNS AROUND PRIVACY, PERSONALLY  
18 IDENTIFIABLE INFORMATION, SO WE WOULD LIKE TO BETTER  
19 UNDERSTAND THOSE SENSITIVITIES RELATIVE TO HOW THE APP WORKS.  
20 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. BEFORE YOU IS A HIGH-LEVEL TIMELINE FOR  
21 PHASE ONE PILOT WORK BY QUARTER. PLEASE NOTE THIS TIMELINE  
22 DOES NOT REFLECT CHANGES THAT HAVE OCCURRED OVER THE PAST WEEK  
23 OR THE PAST FEW WEEKS SHIFTING CERTAIN ACTIVITIES OUT BY ONE  
24 MONTH. I WILL SPEAK TO THESE CHANGES AS I GO THROUGH EACH  
25 ACTIVITY. THE PILOT FRAMEWORK HAS BEEN REFINED AND FINALIZED



JULY 22, 2022

1 THAT WORK IS ALREADY DONE. OUTREACH RECRUITMENT PLAN MATERIALS  
2 HAVE BEEN REVIEWED BY OUR EQUITY CONSULTANTS AND ARE EXPECTED  
3 TO BE FINALIZED BY MID-LATE AUGUST. THE LATEST SCHEDULE SHOWS  
4 THE PREPILOT RUNNING FROM MID-JULY TO MID-AUGUST HOWEVER WITH  
5 THE RECENT IMPROVEMENTS TO THE APP, THE PREPILOT IS MOST  
6 LIKELY TO BE EXECUTED MID-AUGUST TO MID-SEPTEMBER. THE MAIN  
7 OBJECTIVE OF THE PREPILOT ARE TO TEST AND FINE TUNE THE APP  
8 AND OBTAIN VALUABLE FEEDBACK ON THE DIFFERENT ASPECTS OF THE  
9 PILOT PRIOR TO FULL DEPLOYMENT. THE PREPILOT WILL INCLUDE A  
10 SOFT LAUNCH WITH A SMALL GROUP OF 30 TO 40 MTC AND PARTNER  
11 AGENCY STAFF VOLUNTEERS WHO WILL RUN THROUGH A 30 DAY TRIAL OF  
12 THE APP AND PROVIDE VALUABLE FEEDBACK ON ALL ASPECTS. PILOT,  
13 INCLUDING RECRUITMENT PROCESS AND MATERIALS, DRAFT ONLINE  
14 SURVEYS, ET CETERA. THE REMAINING ACTIVITIES HAVE ALSO SHIFTED  
15 OUT BY ONE MONTH BUT ARE STILL WITHIN THE QUARTER SHOWN. THE  
16 PILOT PERIOD WILL LAUNCH IN OCTOBER AND RUN THROUGH JANUARY OF  
17 2023. POST PILOT EVALUATION IS EXPECT EARLY 2023, AND THE  
18 FINAL EVALUATION REPORT IS EXPECTED AROUND APRIL OF NEXT YEAR,  
19 2023. I WOULD LIKE TO COME BACK TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS  
20 SUBCOMMITTEE AND PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED  
21 FROM PHASE ONE AND NEXT STEPS IN THE CONTEXT OF EQUITY. NEXT  
22 SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WITH THAT, THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME TODAY. I  
23 PUT TOGETHER A FEW QUESTIONS I WOULD LIKE TO ASK OF YOU, BUT I  
24 AM ALSO HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE, AS WELL.  
25 THANK YOU.



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU CHELSEA. I APPRECIATE YOU BRINGING  
3 THIS FORWARD TO US. WE WILL JUMP RIGHT INTO QUESTIONS. I SEE  
4 WALTER'S HAND IS RAISED.

5

6 **WALTER WILSON:** GOOD AFTERNOON EVERYONE. APOLOGIES FOR BEING  
7 LATE. I WAS IN ANOTHER MEETING. THIS IS RATHER TIMELY, I  
8 THINK. AND BECAUSE I'M LATE, I JUST WANT TO ASK A COUPLE OF  
9 QUESTIONS, ONE IS, WHAT IS THE ULTIMATE GOAL OF THIS PROGRAM?

10

11 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION, WALTER. SO THE  
12 ULTIMATE GOAL OF THE PROGRAM IS TO PROVIDE -- OR IS TO PROVIDE  
13 ACCESS TO THE EXPRESS LANE WITHOUT THE NEED FOR CHP  
14 ENFORCEMENT.

15

16 **WALTER WILSON:** OKAY. SO IT'S ABOUT INCREASING --

17

18 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** ACCESS.

19

20 **WALTER WILSON:** IT'S INTERESTING BECAUSE EVERY DAY I DRIVE DOWN  
21 I'M IN SILICON VALLEY, EVERY DAY I'M DRIVING DOWN AND WE HAVE  
22 BEEN TRYING FOR 40 YEARS TO PUT OTHER PEOPLE IN THEIR CARS TO  
23 RIDE WITH THEM, AND I'M THINKING TO MYSELF, YOU KNOW, WHEN I  
24 LIVED UP NORTH, WE WOULD JUST -- AND THIS IS PROBABLY 20, 25  
25 YEARS AGO MAYBE LONGER, WE WOULD JUST PICK UP PEOPLE AT





JULY 22, 2022

1 CERTAIN STOPS IN OAKLAND, AND THEY WOULD JUMP IN YOUR CAR AND  
2 GO ACROSS THE BRIDGE DOWNTOWN. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S STILL  
3 HAPPENING. BUT THAT WAS ONE WAY THE PEOPLE JUST GET FREE RIDES  
4 AND ALSO IT WOULD ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO RIDE TOGETHER. BUT ONE  
5 OF MY CONCERNS, REALLY, TO BE HONEST WITH YOU, IT'S A PRIVACY  
6 ISSUE. THAT'S A HUGE CONCERN. I WAS LOOKING AT THE FACIAL  
7 RECOGNITION, WHICH I DON'T REALLY UNDERSTAND WHY THAT'S EVEN  
8 NECESSARY AT ALL. PERIOD. I MEAN, IF YOU ARE JUST GOING TO  
9 COUNT INDIVIDUALS IN THE CAR, YOU COUNT INDIVIDUALS IN THE  
10 CAR, YOU SEE LIVE PEOPLE AND THAT SAYS MAYBE SOME PEOPLE MIGHT  
11 USE MANNEQUINS OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT AND I DON'T KNOW IF THIS  
12 TECHNOLOGY CAN DETECT THAT OR NOT THAT ANOTHER BODY WOULD BE  
13 THERE LOOKING LIKE A PERSON BUT IS NOT A PERSON. I DON'T KNOW  
14 IF THE TECHNOLOGY EXISTS WITH THAT, BECAUSE IF WE CAN'T PICK  
15 UP HEAT SIGNATURES, I DON'T THINK -- AND THE OTHER THING, THE  
16 SIGNATURE HOLDING THE IMAGINE FOR A CERTAIN AMOUNT OF SECONDS  
17 AND THE OTHER ONE DOESN'T HOLD THE IMAGE AT ALL, IT JUST  
18 COUNTS AND SAYS LET'S GO. WHAT ARE THE DIFFERENCE BETWEEN  
19 THOSE TWO AND WHY. AND THE OTHER THING IS WHO HAS ACCESS TO  
20 THIS INFORMATION? HOW DO WE KNOW WHO HOLDS THIS INFORMATION OR  
21 MORE IMPORTANTLY THAT IT CAN'T BE CONVERTED TO USE BY OTHER  
22 AGENCIES? THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU WALTER. GREAT QUESTIONS. FACIAL  
25 SIGNATURES CANNOT BE USED TO RECONSTRUCT AN ILLUSTRATION OF A



JULY 22, 2022

1 FACE WITH ANY SIGNIFICANCE RESEMBLANCE SO THE APP DOESN'T LOOK  
2 -- WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO LOOK AT AND YOU SAY THAT'S MR. WALTER  
3 WILSON. OKAY? FACIAL SIGNATURES ARE VECTOR MAPS OF FACIAL  
4 LANDMARK MEASUREMENTS THAT CAN ONLY BE USED TO ENSURE  
5 CARPOOLERS IN QUESTION WERE PRESENT DURING BOTH INITIAL  
6 VERIFICATION AND REVERIFICATION. SO, THE VECTOR MAP CONSISTS  
7 OF 512 DIFFERENT LAND MARKS WHICH ARE MEASUREMENTS BETWEEN FOR  
8 EXAMPLE, THE CENTER OF THE LEFT EYE TO THE TIP OF THE NOSE.  
9 WHILE FACIAL RECOGNITION IS ALSO -- ALSO USES FACIAL LANDMARK  
10 MEASUREMENTS IT COMPARES THOSE MEASUREMENTS AGAINST A HUMAN  
11 FACE OR DIGITAL IMAGE OF A DATABASE IMAGINE TYPICALLY USED AS  
12 A MAINTENANCE TO VERIFY PERSON'S ID OR IDENTIFICATION THIS  
13 DOES NOT THESE ARE MEASUREMENTS AS WE REFER TO AS VECTORS.  
14 FACIAL SIGNATURES ARE USED TO CHECK WHETHER THE SAME OCCUPANTS  
15 DURING THE VERIFICATION, THE INITIAL VERIFICATION ARE THE SAME  
16 OCCUPANTS AT THE END OF THE TRIP. AND THE FACIAL SIGNATURE  
17 MODEL USES LIKELY AS OPPOSED TO CAPACITY IMAGES OF FACIAL  
18 DIFFERENTIATION FACTORS, LIKE THOSE THAT ARE USED FOR FACIAL  
19 RECOGNITION. SO, THIS APP DOES DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT THERE  
20 IS A REALNESS PROBABILITY THAT YOU ARE A REAL PERSON. SO,  
21 MANNEQUINS AND PICTURES, YOU KNOW, IF YOU HAVE A PICTURE OF  
22 SOMEONE, THAT WOULDN'T WORK. IT DOES -- IT'S -- THIS  
23 TECHNOLOGY IS SO SOPHISTICATED THAT IT DOES -- THIS TECHNOLOGY  
24 IS SO SOPHISTICATED, IT IS ABLE TO KIND OF TAKE THOSE  
25 MEASUREMENTS AND DETERMINE THAT YOU ARE A REAL PERSON. BUT IT



JULY 22, 2022

1 DOES NOT STORE YOUR PHOTO AT ALL. IN TERMS OF THE MEASUREMENTS  
2 KEEPING IT FOR THE DURATION OF THE TRIP, ANY INFORMATION THAT  
3 IS TAKEN FROM THIS APP IS THE PROPERTY OF MTC. THIS IS  
4 TECHNOLOGY AND WHAT IS STORED ON THE APP AND ON YOUR PHONE IS  
5 NOT RIDE FLAGGED, IT IS ONLY MTC THAT ARE PRIVY TO THIS  
6 INFORMATION. AND, AGAIN, YOUR INFORMATION, AT THE END OF THE  
7 TRIP IS DISCARDED. AND THERE IS NO WAY TO REPOPULATE THAT  
8 INFORMATION. NO ONE CAN GO BACK ON THE PHONE. THAT INFORMATION  
9 IS GONE AT THE END OF THE TRIP.

10

11 **WALTER WILSON:** SINCE IT BELONGS TO MTC, ANY CURRENT POLICIES,  
12 RULES, OR RELATIONS THAT MTC MAY HAVE WITH, SAY, LAW-  
13 ENFORCEMENT, THAT WOULD BE APPLICABLE TO THIS TECHNOLOGY?  
14 THAT'S ACTUALLY A LAWYER QUESTION. AND I THINK THE ANSWER IS  
15 GOING TO BE YES. THE OTHER QUESTION I HAVE, AND I WOULD JUST  
16 LET THIS GO IS THAT THIS TECHNOLOGY IS AMAZING, FIRST OF ALL,  
17 I THINK THE PLAN, I THINK THE IDEA OF ENCOURAGING PEOPLE TO  
18 COMMUTE GET INTO THE LANES IS WAY OVERDUE AND IT'S INTERESTING  
19 TO SEE HOW IT'S GOING TO BE IMPLEMENTED AND I THINK THE  
20 BIGGEST QUESTION IS GOING TO BE ABOUT WHETHER OR NOT LAW-  
21 ENFORCEMENT HAS ACCESS TO THIS TECHNOLOGY AND IF IT'S  
22 CONSISTENT WITH RELATIONSHIPS THAT THEY CURRENTLY HAVE WITH  
23 MTC, AND I THINK THEY HAVE A VERY CLOSE RELATIONSHIP BECAUSE  
24 OF OUR PUBLIC SAFETY, I WOULD BE -- I WOULD QUESTION THIS  
25 TECHNOLOGY. THANK YOU.



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** YES. AND I UNDERSTAND YOUR CONCERN, MR.  
3 WILSON. I WILL SAY THAT, AGAIN, ONCE THE FACIAL SIGNATURE IS  
4 CAPTURED DURING THE INITIAL VERIFICATION AND THEN AT THE END  
5 OF THE TRIP FOR REVERIFICATION IT GOES AWAY. THERE IS NOTHING  
6 TO RETAIN. THERE IS NOTHING TO HOLD ON TO. CHP WILL NOT HAVE  
7 ACCESS THERE IS NOTHING TO ACCESS AT THIS POINT. IT'S GONE FOR  
8 GOOD. SO THERE IS NOTHING TO -- THERE IS NOTHING THERE. AGAIN,  
9 THE FACIAL SIGNATURE, THE MEASUREMENTS, THE VECTORS, WHICH ARE  
10 REALLY JUST MEASUREMENTS ARE ONLY RETAINED FOR THE PURPOSE OF  
11 YOUR TRIP. ONCE YOU'RE DONE WITH YOUR TRIP, IT'S GONE.

12

13 **WALTER WILSON:** THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. I SEE DWAYNE'S HAND RAISED.

18

19 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU. MR. WILSON ASKED THE EXACT  
20 QUESTIONS THAT I WAS GOING TO ASK AS FAR AS WITH LAW-  
21 ENFORCEMENT HAVE ACCESS TO THIS INFORMATION, SPEAKING JUST AS  
22 A GENERAL CITIZEN, I WOULD HAVE A LOT OF CONCERNS AROUND  
23 ANYBODY HAVING ANYTHING TO DO WITH MY FACIAL RECOGNITION IN  
24 THEIR SYSTEM. SO, I THINK THAT THAT'S GOING TO BE AN ISSUE.  
25 AND THEN AT THE SAME TIME, A QUESTION THAT CAME TO MY MIND



JULY 22, 2022

1 WAS, SUPPOSE YOU START A TRIP, SAY, IN SAN JOSE, RIGHT? AND I  
2 DON'T KNOW HOW FAR OUT THIS GOES, AND THEN YOU STOP IN WEST  
3 OAKLAND, YOU LET ONE PASSENGER OUT, AND THEN YOU PICK UP  
4 ANOTHER PASSENGER, IS IT GOING TO BE -- IS THAT, LIKE, STILL  
5 MEASURING THE END OF THE TRIP? OR IS THAT GOING TO SAY, NO,  
6 YOU HAVE DIFFERENT PEOPLE IN YOUR CAR NOW? SO, I'M WONDERING  
7 ABOUT, HOW THAT'S GOING TO PLAY OUT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR QUESTION. THERE WERE TWO  
10 QUESTIONS IN THERE. BUT I DO REALLY WANT TO REITERATE THEY  
11 UNDERSTAND THE CONCERNS AROUND CHP AND ENFORCEMENTS. I REALLY  
12 WANT TO REITERATE THAT CHP WILL NOT HAVE ACCESS. THERE IS NO  
13 WAY THAT THEY CAN GO BACK AND LOOK AT -- YOU KNOW, LOOK TO SEE  
14 WHO WAS USING THE APP. THE APP DOES NOT DETECT YOUR ID. YOUR  
15 IDENTIFICATION. SO IT CANNOT LOOK AT -- IF I'M USING THE APP  
16 IT CANNOT SAY THAT'S CHELSEA GAMULO. THERE'S NO WAY TO  
17 DETERMINE WHO I AM. IT'S ONLY DETERMINE THANK YOU AM A REAL  
18 PERSON. I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT'S CLEAR. BECAUSE I DO  
19 UNDERSTAND THE CONCERNS AROUND THAT.

20

21 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** BEFORE YOU GO ON, I WANT TO ASK ONE MORE  
22 THING. SUPPOSE THERE IS AN AMBER ALERT AND IT SAYS YOU HAVE  
23 FOUR PEOPLE IN YOUR CAR, IS THAT GOING TO BE ABLE TO BE  
24 TRANSFERRED TO -- THIS PERSON COULD LIKELY BE THE PERSON ON



JULY 22, 2022

1 THE AMBER ALERT. THAT'S A FOLLOW UP QUESTION TO WHAT YOU JUST  
2 SAID.

3

4 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** GREAT QUESTION. NO IT WILL NOT DETERMINE IF  
5 THAT'S THE PERSON ON THE AMBER ALERT BECAUSE THE TECHNOLOGY  
6 DOESN'T HAVE A WAY OF KNOWING WHO YOU ARE. IT ONLY KNOWS THAT  
7 YOU A REAL PERSON BY USING YOUR MEASUREMENTS. I HOPE THAT  
8 HELPED AT LEAST ANSWER THAT QUESTION. IN TERMS OF YOUR SECOND  
9 QUESTION ABOUT, YOU KNOW, IF YOU WERE TO START A TRIP IN ONE  
10 LOCATION AND DROP OFF A PERSON. SO, WHEN YOU ARE USING THE  
11 APP, YOU WOULD NEED TO SELECT IN-TRIP, AND AGAIN, WE'RE GOING  
12 TO PILOT TWO DIFFERENT VERSIONS OF THE APP. SO, ON THE 680, TO  
13 RIGHT IN THE HOV LANES, IT'S A TWO PERSON, RIGHT? SO, AS LONG  
14 AS YOU HAVE TWO PEOPLE IN ONE VERSION OF THE APP, AS LONG AS  
15 THERE ARE TWO PEOPLE FROM THE START OF THE TRIP, AND AT THE  
16 END OF THE TRIP, THEN YOUR CARPOOL IS GRANTED. OKAY? THAT'S  
17 ONE VERSION OF THE APP. THE SECOND VERSION OF THE APP THAT  
18 WE'RE PILOTING AND CONSIDERING IS SEEING OR -- I'M SORRY -- IS  
19 MAKING SURE THAT THE SAME PEOPLE THAT STARTED THE TRIP ARE THE  
20 SAME PEOPLE AT THE ENDS OF THE TRIP. SO, WE'RE TESTING TWO  
21 DIFFERENT VERSIONS OF THE APP TO SEE, YOU KNOW, TO SEE WHAT'S  
22 GOING TO REALLY PAN OUT. BUT TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION, IT SOUND  
23 LIKE IT WOULD WORK IN ONE VERSION OF THE APP BUT NOT THE  
24 OTHER.

25



JULY 22, 2022

1 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** CAN I ASK A FOLLOW UP QUESTION THAT RELATED  
2 TO THIS? I'M SORRY, DWAYNE DID YOU HAVE ANYTHING ELSE YOU  
3 WANTED TO SAY?

4

5 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** JUST SAYING THANK YOU. ACKNOWLEDGING A THANK  
6 YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** TOUCHING ON DWAYNE'S QUESTION, CAN YOU  
9 EXPLAIN WHAT THE PURPOSE IS OF HAVING THAT SECOND VERSION IS  
10 WHERE THEY'RE MONITORING IF IT'S THE SAME PEOPLE.

11

12 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** YOU KNOW, I WOULD. [LAUGHTER] I DON'T KNOW  
13 THAT I -- I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, FOR THE PURPOSES OF TESTING,  
14 WE'RE JUST TRYING TO SEE -- THAT'S WHY WE'RE ASKING FOR  
15 VOLUNTEERS, WE'RE TRYING TO SEE WHICH VERSION OF THE APP IS  
16 GOING TO WORK BETTER AND, YOU KNOW, WHAT THE RESULTS OF EACH  
17 VERSION IS. I THINK THIS IS JUST -- WE'RE JUST TESTING THE  
18 TECHNOLOGY OUT. I DON'T KNOW THAT ONE IS GOING TO WORK OUT  
19 BETTER THAN THE OTHER. THE REASONING, I THINK, BEHIND DOING  
20 TWO DIFFERENT VERSIONS OF THE APPS IS, I THINK THERE IS JUST  
21 DIFFERENT OPTIONS. THERE IS DIFFERENT WAYS OF DEPLOYING THESE  
22 TECHNOLOGIES SO WE WILL REALLY LEARN A LOT FROM THE VOLUNTEERS  
23 THAT WE RECRUIT TO GET THEIR PERSPECTIVES TO SEE WHICH VERSION  
24 OF THE APP IF WE DEPLOY, WHICH VERSION OF THE APP WE WOULD  
25 LIKELY DEPLOY.



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. NO, MY QUESTION WAS, WHAT'S  
3 PURPOSE OF THE SECOND VERSION TO BEGIN WITH? WHY EVEN CARE IF  
4 IT'S THE SAME PEOPLE?

5

6 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** SARAH, DID YOU WANT TO ADD ANYTHING TO THAT? I  
7 KIND OF HAVE AN IDEA BUT I DON'T WANT TO PUT MY FOOT IN MY  
8 MOUTH.

9

10 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** HI I'M SARAH BURNSWORTH WORKING WITH CHELSEA  
11 ON THIS PILOT. THE SECOND VERSION WHERE IT'S CONFIRMING THAT  
12 THE PEOPLE AT THE BEGINNING OF THE TRIP ARE LIKELY THE SAME  
13 PEOPLE AT THE END OF THE TRIP IS TO REDUCE THE POTENTIAL FOR  
14 PEOPLE TAKING ADVANTAGE. YOU KNOW? IN THEORY YOU COULD AT THE  
15 END OF YOUR TRIP GRAB SOME PEOPLE WHO WEREN'T IN YOUR CAR, AND  
16 COUNT THOSE PEOPLE AS PART OF YOUR CARPOOL. SO, IT'S A LITTLE  
17 BIT MORE RESTRICTIVE, BUT ALSO A LITTLE BIT MORE FAIR  
18 POTENTIALLY THAN THE VERSION THAT DOES NOT STORE SIGNATURES.

19

20 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. THAT'S HELPFUL. AND BEFORE WE  
21 MOVE ON TO OTHER QUESTIONS, I ALSO WANTED TO THROW OUT THERE  
22 THAT LAW-ENFORCEMENT HAS TO HAVE A WARRANT BEFORE MTC TURNS  
23 OVER ANY INFORMATION SO FOR QUESTIONS AROUND THAT I JUST  
24 WANTED TO PUT THAT OUT THERE. I SEE TERRY'S HAND RAISED.

25





JULY 22, 2022

1 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. MY QUESTION WAS RELATING TO THE  
2 EFFECTIVENESS OF THE RECOGNITION SYSTEM, PARTICULARLY AS IT  
3 APPLIES TO CHILDREN. AND CHILDREN, NOT NECESSARILY INFANTS AND  
4 VERY YOUNG CHILDREN WHO WOULD BE IN CAR SEATS, BUT OLDER  
5 CHILDREN WHO WOULD BE AT THE -- YOU KNOW, THEIR FACES COULD BE  
6 RECOGNIZED AT THE BEGINNING OF A TRIP, BUT THEY COULD LAY DOWN  
7 AND GO TO SLEEP IN THE BACK SEAT. HOW WOULD THEY BE VISIBLE?  
8 WILL THE DRIVER KNOW THAT THERE IS A PARTICULAR TIME WHERE  
9 THAT CHILD NEEDS TO BE RECOGNIZED AS STILL BEING THERE?  
10 BECAUSE MAYBE THEY'RE WITHOUT THE CHILDREN, MAYBE IT'S JUST  
11 ONE CHILD, AND THEY'RE BELOW THE MULTIPLE PERSON REQUIREMENT  
12 TO UTILIZE THIS?

13

14 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR QUESTION. SO FOR THE APP TO  
15 WORK IT WILL NEED TO DETECT -- IT WILL NEED TO DETECT THOSE  
16 MEASUREMENTS TO KNOW THAT THERE IS A REAL FACE. SO, YOU KNOW,  
17 FORTUNATELY, THE CHILD CAN STAY ASLEEP. THE TECHNOLOGY IS ABLE  
18 TO, IF YOUR EYES ARE CLOSED, IT CAN STILL TAKE THE MEASUREMENT  
19 THAT IS IT NEEDS TO DETERMINE THAT IT'S A REAL FACE. BUT IT  
20 WOULD NEED TO DETECT THE FACE IN THE APP.

21

22 **TERRY SCOTT:** THAT WAS THE PURPOSE. IF YOU ARE LAYING DOWN, AND  
23 YOUR HEAD IS BEHIND EITHER ONE OF THE FRONT TWO SEATS, THEN  
24 THAT -- THE HEAD WOULD NOT BE VISIBLE, OR PERHAPS THE REST OF  
25 THE BODY OR A PORTION OF IT BUT IT JUST SEEMS TO ME TO BE A



JULY 22, 2022

1 FAULTY MEASURE OF ACTUALLY DETERMINING HOW MANY PEOPLE ARE IN  
2 THE CAR AT THE CONCLUSION OF THE JOURNEY.

3

4 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU MR. SCOTT. I WILL SAY, AGAIN, FOR  
5 THE APP TO WORK IT WILL NEED TO DETECT A FACE. IF THE KID IS  
6 SLEEPING AND THERE IS A WAY TO MANEUVER SOMEHOW TO DETECT THE  
7 FACE OF THE KID INTO THE APP TO DETECT THE KID THEN IT WOULD  
8 NOT WORK, UNFORTUNATELY.

9

10 **TERRY SCOTT:** IT SEEMS IMPRACTICAL FOR SOMEONE WHO IS DRIVING  
11 THEIR FAMILY ANY DISTANCE.

12

13 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** I APOLOGIZE FOR INTERRUPTING WITH AN INFANT  
14 REAR FACING CAR SEE THE I THINK THE DRIVER WOULD OPEN THE REAR  
15 DOOR AND BRING THE PHONE AROUND THAT WAY TO CAPTURE THE FACE  
16 OF SOMEONE WHO IS MAYBE AN INFANT OR CHILD WHO IS SLEEPS SO IT  
17 DOESN'T HAVE TO BE DONE NECESSARILY FROM THE FRONT OF THE  
18 VEHICLE.

19

20 **TERRY SCOTT:** I GUESS MY LAST QUESTION WOULD PAIR WITH AN  
21 EARLIER QUESTION IS, WHO CARES IF THE FACES ARE DIFFERENT. I  
22 DON'T UNDERSTAND THAT. IF WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, A  
23 NUMBER OF CARS AND MEETING THE NEED FOR THE CARPOOL LANE, THEN  
24 I, YOU KNOW, I USED TO GO TO THE CITY TOO, AND I REMEMBER  
25 THOSE DAYS WHERE WE WOULD PULL OVER TO THE SIDE AND PICK UP



JULY 22, 2022

1 AND GO ACROSS THE BRIDGE OR WHATEVER. ANYWAY. THAT'S THE END  
2 OF MY QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU TERRY. I SEE HOWARD'S HAND RAISED.

5

6 **HOWARD WONG:** THE WORDS SKIN TONE WERE MENTIONED ISN'T IT TRUE  
7 THAT VECTOR MEASUREMENTS, IT'S IMMATERIAL WHAT THE SKIN TONE  
8 IS. ISN'T THAT ACCURATE?

9

10 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** I'M SORRY. YOU CAN REPEAT THAT QUESTION.

11

12 **HOWARD WONG:** THE WORD SKIN TONE WAS USED. ISN'T IT TRUE THAT  
13 VECTOR MEASUREMENT IS INDEPENDENT OF SKIN TONE. SKIN TONE IS  
14 IMMATERIAL TO VECTOR MEASUREMENTS. ISN'T THAT TRUE?

15

16 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** I BELIEVE SO. SARAH, CAN YOU CONFIRM.

17

18 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** THAT'S CORRECT.

19

20 **HOWARD WONG:** SO SKIN MATERIAL IS IMMATERIAL TO THIS APP. IT'S  
21 NOT A NECESSARY COMPONENT OF THE APP.

22

23 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THAT'S CORRECT.

24



JULY 22, 2022

1 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** THEY HAVE DONE SOME LIGHTING IN TERMS OF  
2 CAPTURING, AND THE LIGHTING SKIN TONE DOESN'T INTERACT WITH  
3 THE WAY TO DETECT THE ABILITY OF THE APP TO CAPTURE.

4

5 **HOWARD WONG:** THE INFORMATION SEARCH SHOWING THAT DARK SKINNED  
6 DOES HAVE A BEARING ON FACIAL RECOGNITION. THE VECTOR  
7 MEASUREMENT SEEMS TO BE DIFFERENT RIGHT JUST LIKE PHYSICAL  
8 POINTS RATHER THAN OTHER DISTINGUISHING ELEMENTS. SO, IN  
9 THEORY THIS WON'T SAY -- THIS APP WON'T SAY DARKER PEOPLE ARE  
10 IN THIS CAR. IS THAT TRUE?

11

12 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** SO, MR. WONG, TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION, FACIAL  
13 RECOGNITION IS DIFFERENT FROM WHAT WE'RE DOING WITH FACIAL  
14 SIGNATURES. SO, REGARDLESS OF COMPLEXION, OR SKIN TONE, YOU  
15 KNOW, THE TECHNOLOGY IS ABLE TO DETERMINE THROUGH MEASUREMENTS  
16 REAL FACES.

17

18 **HOWARD WONG:** BUT IT WON'T NECESSARILY IDENTIFY PEOPLE AS  
19 HAVING DARKER SKIN TONE?

20

21 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** NO IT DOES NOT. IT DOES NOT DETECT SKIN TONE  
22 AT ALL.

23

24 **HOWARD WONG:** THANK YOU.

25



JULY 22, 2022

1 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

2

3 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GENAY?

4

5 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** SO, I HAVE SEVERAL QUESTIONS. SO I'M  
6 JUST GOING TO STATE THEM ONE AT A TIME. THE FIRST THING IS,  
7 HOW CAN IT BE DETERMINED THAT YOU'RE A REAL PERSON BASED ON  
8 MEASUREMENTS? WHAT ABOUT PEOPLE WHO MAYBE HAVE A DISFIGURED  
9 FACE OR WHO HAVE BEEN IN AN ACCIDENT. LIKE, HOW ARE THEY BEING  
10 CONSIDERED WITH THE FACIAL MEASUREMENTS?

11

12 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU. THAT'S A REALLY GOOD QUESTION. I  
13 WOULD HAVE TO SAY THAT RIDE FLAG HAS CONDUCTED EXTENSIVE  
14 TESTING AND THERE ARE 512 DIFFERENT CONFIGURATIONS AND WAYS TO  
15 DETECT MEASUREMENTS TO TELL A REAL FACE. I, YOU KNOW, I CAN  
16 GET BACK TO YOU ON A SPECIFIC QUESTION -- OR THE SPECIFIC  
17 ANSWER TO YOUR QUESTION REGARDING THAT. BUT I WILL SAY THAT  
18 THE WAY IT'S CURRENTLY CONFIGURE, THERE ARE 512 POSSIBLE WAYS  
19 TO DETERMINE A REAL FACE. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT SPECIFICALLY  
20 HAS BEEN TESTED, SO, I CAN LOOK INTO THAT AND GET BACK TO YOU  
21 ON A RESPONSE.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** YEAH. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S REALLY  
24 IMPORTANT. NOT EVERYBODY'S FACE LOOKS THE SAME. SO -- AND I  
25 GET THAT THERE IS 512, BUT JUST IN CASE THERE IS SOMEONE, YOU



JULY 22, 2022

1 KNOW, THAT IS NOT CONSIDERED IN THE 512, LIKE IS THERE A WAY  
2 THAT CAN BE TESTED JUST TO MAKE SURE THAT IS ALSO INCLUDING  
3 FOLKS WHO, YOU KNOW, MAYBE, YOU KNOW, HAVE SUFFERED SOME  
4 TRAUMA OR THINGS LIKE THAT. ALSO, I'M KIND OF INTERESTED, I  
5 HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT PRIVACY, TOO, SPECIFICALLY, IT, LIKE, IN  
6 THE APP, IS THERE A WAY FOR YOUR LOCATION NOT TO BE TRACKED  
7 ONCE YOU'RE NOT USING THE APP? LIKE, IS THERE A WAY TO OPT OUT  
8 OF YOUR LOCATION BEING TRACKED OR ANYTHING?

9

10 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** YES. SO THE APP IS ONLY TRACKING, WHILE YOU'RE  
11 USING THE APP. SO WITNESS YOU CLOSE OUT THE APP, IT'S NO  
12 LONGER TRACKING. SO, IT'S -- IT'S ONLY WHILE USING THE APP.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** OKAY. AND THEN I ALSO HAVE SAFETY  
15 CONCERNS. I'M CONCERNED ABOUT PEOPLE HAVING TO USE AN APP  
16 WHILE THEY'RE DRIVING. THAT COULD POTENTIALLY CAUSE A CAR  
17 CRASH. SO, AND THEN, ALSO, LIKE, EARLIER, IT WAS MENTIONED  
18 PEOPLE CAN GET OUT OF THEIR CAR TO TAKE A PICTURE OF A  
19 SLEEPING CHILD, YOU KNOW, AT THE -- LIKE, IF THE CHILD FALLS  
20 ASLEEP DURING THE RIDE, THAT IS ALSO DANGEROUS. SO, I'M JUST  
21 WONDERING, LIKE, HOW -- LIKE, WHAT SAFETY MEASURES ARE IN  
22 PLACE, LIKE, TO PROTECT DRIVERS FROM THIS TYPE OF SCENARIO?  
23 BECAUSE THEY'RE GOING TO HAVE TO SPLIT THEIR ATTENTION. LIKE,  
24 ARE THEY GOING TO DRIVE UP TO WHERE THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO PAY A



JULY 22, 2022

1 TOLL AND THEN DO IT? OR, YEAH, I'M JUST KIND OF WONDERING  
2 ABOUT LIKE, HOW THAT WILL GO.

3

4 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE QUESTIONS. THE APP CAN  
5 ONLY -- THE APP -- ONLY USING THE APP AT THE BEGINNING OF YOUR  
6 TRIP SO YOU'RE NOT USING THE APP DURING YOUR TRIP, AT ALL.  
7 IT'S WHEN YOU GET IN YOUR CAR, RIGHT, SO WHEN YOU GET INTO  
8 YOUR CAR, BEFORE YOU START DRIVING, IS WHEN YOU VERIFY. YOU  
9 WILL NOT USE YOUR APP. YOU WILL NOT NEED TO PRESS ANY BUTTONS  
10 YOU WILL HAVE TO LEAVE THE APP OPEN ON YOUR PHONE BUT THAT  
11 DOESN'T REQUIRE YOU TO DO ANYTHING ACTIVELY WHEN YOU'RE  
12 DRIVING. YOU JUST LEAVE IT OPEN. WHEN YOU ARE PARKED AT THE  
13 END OF YOUR TRIP IS WHEN YOU HIT THE BUTTON AGAIN TO FINISH  
14 THE TRIP. AND AT THAT TIME, THE APP WILL ASK YOU TO KIND OF  
15 RE- TO REVERIFY. SO, YOU WILL NEED TO, BY REVERIFYING, YOU  
16 WILL NEED TO KIND OF GET IN THE PICTURE SO IT CAN DETECT YOU  
17 ARE THERE. BUT YOU DO NOT NEED TO USE THE APP -- ACTUALLY, THE  
18 BUTTONS ARE DISABLED. SO YOU'RE NOT ABLE TO USE THE APP AT ALL  
19 WHILE YOU'RE DRIVING.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** OKAY. I GUESS -- I MEAN IF YOU NEED  
22 TO REVERIFY AT THE END OF THE RIDE, AND YOU'RE, LIKE, DOING,  
23 LIKE, CARPOOLING, OR, YEAH -- I HAVE SOME -- I GUESS I'M JUST  
24 WONDERING. LIKE, EVEN IF YOU, SOMETIMES PEOPLE ARE CARPOOLING  
25 AND DROPPING PEOPLE OFF AS THEY GO ALONG, SO THEY MAY NOT



JULY 22, 2022

1 PARK, YOU KNOW, BY THE END OF THEIR RIDE -- LIKE, THEY'RE  
2 TAKING PEOPLE TO DIFFERENT LOCATIONS. SO, YEAH. I GUESS THAT'S  
3 WHY I STILL HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT, LIKE, HOW THAT WOULD WORK.  
4 AND THEN, ALSO, I WANTED TO KNOW, LIKE, HOW IS THIS APP BEING  
5 DESIGNED TO ACCOMMODATE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES? SO, YOU  
6 KNOW, THERE ARE SOME THINGS THAT CAN BE DONE, SO THAT THE APP  
7 IS, YOU KNOW, MORE ACCESSIBLE TO FOLKS WHO HAVE DISABILITIES.  
8 SO I KIND OF WANTED TO HEAR ABOUT THAT.

9

10 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION. RIDE FLAG HAS  
11 TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION POTENTIAL USERS WITH DISABILITIES  
12 THAT MAY IMPACT THE USER EXPERIENCE WHILE USING THE TOOL, RED  
13 GREEN COLOR-BLINDNESS WILL IMPACT THE USER'S EXPERIENCE GIVEN  
14 THE PROMINENT RED GREEN COLOR SCHEME TO CIRCUMVENT THIS  
15 CHALLENGE THE DESIGN TEAM, THE UX TEAM PLANS ON DESIGNING A  
16 SEPARATE COLOR PALETTE THAT MAY BE ENABLED BY USERS WITH THE  
17 AFOREMENTIONED COLOR DERBY IN THE PILOT STAGE. THAT'S  
18 SOMETHING BEING CONSIDERED AND WORKED ON. THE DESIGN TEAM ARE  
19 CLOSELY FOLLOWING THE WEB CONTENT ACCESSIBILITY GUIDELINES 2.0  
20 AND BEST PRACTICES AND HAVE CAREFULLY DESIGNED NOTIFICATIONS  
21 AND INCORPORATED LANGUAGE THAT IS EASY TO SEE AND UNDERSTAND  
22 RESPECTIVELY THE VERIFY CARPOOL BUTTONS HAVE BEEN ENLARGED TO  
23 ACCOMMODATE PEOPLE WHO HAVE LARGER THUMBS, REDUCING THE AMOUNT  
24 OF PHYSICAL EXERTION REQUIRED WHILE USING THE TOOL AND  
25 NOTIFICATIONS WHEN CAR PULL HAS GONE GRANTED HAVE BEEN PAIRED





JULY 22, 2022

1 WITH VISUALS AND ACCOMPANYING AUDIBLES TO GIVE USERS CONTEXT  
2 ABOUT THE NOTIFICATION WITHOUT NEEDING TO READ.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** YEAH. THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT.  
5 AND, I THINK -- I ALSO THINK THAT VOICE OVER SUPPORT IS  
6 IMPORTANT, AS WELL, OR SOMETHING THAT SHOULD BE TAKEN INTO  
7 CONSIDERATION. AND THEN IN THE PRESENTATION -- OH, ANOTHER  
8 THING I WANT TO KNOW IS, IS THE APP GOING TO BE AVAILABLE IN  
9 DIFFERENT LANGUAGES?

10

11 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** YES. THE APP WILL BE AVAILABLE IN DIFFERENTLY  
12 LANGUAGES. YES.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** AND THEN, I KNOW THERE IS AN OUTREACH  
15 PLAN IS THERE ANY WAY THAT WE CAN -- LIKE, THAT CAN BE SENT TO  
16 US SO WE CAN TAKE A LOOK AT IT?

17

18 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** SARAH, DID YOU WANT TO CHIME IN? I SAW YOU  
19 CAME OFF MUTE FOR A SECOND. DID YOU --

20

21

22

23 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** I WAS GOING TO CLARIFY THAT THE APP ITSELF  
24 WILL BE AVAILABLE IN ENGLISH. ALL OF THE TRAINING MATERIALS  
25 AND ALL OF THE OTHER MATERIALS WILL BE TRANSLATED INTO OTHER



JULY 22, 2022

1 LANGUAGES. THERE IS NOT BE A LOT OF READING THE TEXT THIS'S  
2 HAPPENING IS MINIMIZED THAT TYPE OF INTERACTION.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** JUST A COUPLE MORE QUESTIONS. ALSO,  
5 HOW ARE THE 5 TO 600 VOLUNTEERS BEING CHOSEN? YEAH. LIKE, ARE  
6 THERE ANY MEASURES -- LIKE, WHAT ARE THE MEASURES THAT ARE IN  
7 PLACE TO, LIKE, NOTIFY PEOPLE ABOUT THIS PILOT?

8

9 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** SO, IN TERMS OF RECRUITMENT, WE ARE, YOU KNOW,  
10 THE RECOMMENDATION FROM OUR EQUITY CONSULTANT IS TO RECRUIT  
11 FROM MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES FIRST. WE ARE SETTING PERCENTAGE  
12 GOALS ON RECRUITMENT FROM MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES TO MAKE  
13 SURE THAT WE HAVE A NICE ASSORTMENT OF FOLKS AND WE ARE ALSO  
14 CONSIDERING, POTENTIALLY, RECRUITING OUTSIDE OF THE 680  
15 CORRIDOR. SO WE ARE LOOKING TO EXPAND THE AREA OF RECRUITMENT  
16 TO GET A NICE DIVERSE AMOUNT OF PEOPLE FROM THE 500 TO 600.

17

18 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** THANK YOU. AND LASTLY, LIKE, HOW ARE  
19 PEOPLE WHO DON'T USE APPS BEING CONSIDERED, LIKE, IN THE  
20 SCENARIO? SO IT WAS STATED IN THE DOCUMENTS THAT WAS SHARED  
21 WITH US, THAT THIS TECHNOLOGY MAY SOME DAY COMPLEMENT OR  
22 REPLACE TOLL TAG TECHNOLOGY TO VERIFY TOLL-FREE OR DISCOUNTED  
23 TRAVEL IN EXPRESS LANES AND TO ME THIS ASSUMES THAT EVERYONE  
24 HAS ACCESS TO A PHONE AND THAT EVERYONE IS FAMILIAR WITH  
25 DOWNLOADING AND USING APPS, AND THAT'S NOT TRUE. SO, HOW, YOU



JULY 22, 2022

1 KNOW, CAN THAT BE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION WHEN, LIKE, WHEN  
2 MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS PILOT?

3

4 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** YEAH. SO ANOTHER GREAT QUESTION. THANK YOU. SO  
5 THE SMART PHONE PENETRATION RATE IN THE UNITED STATES HAS  
6 GROWN OVER THE PAST FEW YEARS RESULTING IN APPROXIMATELY 85%  
7 OF AMERICANS OWNING A SMART PHONE DEVICE OF SOME KINDS. GIVEN  
8 THAT CARPOOL REQUIRES AT LEAST TWO OCCUPANTS THERE IS A VERY  
9 HIGH PROBABILITY THAT AT LEAST ONE OF THE OCCUPANTS WILL OWN A  
10 SMART PHONE DEVICE. RIDE FLAG HAS TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION  
11 PHONE MODELS PROVIDED BY GOVERNMENT ASSISTANCE PROGRAMS SO IOS  
12 AND ANDROID DEVICES OF VARYING AGENCY HAVE BEEN VIGOROUSLY  
13 TESTED SO BEYOND WHAT I MENTIONED MTC WILL NEED TO DISCUSS  
14 POLICIES THAT ACCOMMODATE CARPOOLERS WITHOUT SMART PHONES IF  
15 AND WHEN WE DEPLOY.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM:** THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. GABRIELA?

20

21 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** GENAY, THOSE ARE EXCELLENT QUESTIONS. SOME  
22 OF THEM WERE MINE. BUT I WAS JUST GOING TO ECHO TERRY'S  
23 CONCERNS AROUND THE PRACTICALITY OF THIS. BUT, I WOULD BE  
24 CURIOUS, THEN -- WELL, MY HOPE WOULD BE THAT YOU DO INCLUDE A  
25 PERCENTAGE OF FAMILY, OR, LIKE, PARENTS OR PEOPLE WHO DRIVE



JULY 22, 2022

1 WITH CHILDREN TO FIGURE OUT HOW PRACTICAL IT IS FOR THAT KIND  
2 OF MULTI-TASKING, ESPECIALLY DURING COMMUTE TIMES WHEN YOU ARE  
3 RUSHING TO GET TO AN EVENT OR SOMETHING -- JUST TAKING THOSE  
4 NUANCES INTO ACCOUNT. AND WITH REGARDS TO POLICY -- I MEAN  
5 DATA SHARING, I APPRECIATE CHAIR ILAF SAYING THAT THE MTC --  
6 THAT LAW-ENFORCEMENT MUST HAVE A WARRANT BEFORE REQUESTING  
7 DATA. HOWEVER, I'M JUST WONDERING, ASIDE FROM THAT, IS THERE  
8 ANY SPECIFIC -- I WOULD BE CURIOUS IF STAFF COULD PROVIDE MORE  
9 SPECIFICS TO CURRENT POLICIES THAT MTC HAS, SO THAT WE COULD  
10 SEE, OR WHERE I COULD FIND THAT KIND OF SPECIFIC CLARIFICATION  
11 THAT CHAIR ILAF BROUGHT UP. BECAUSE, YEAH. I WOULD BE CURIOUS  
12 TO GET THAT IN A FOLLOW-UP. AND FOR CHELSEA, DID YOU SAY, AT  
13 ALL -- AND I MAY HAVE MISSED THIS -- DID YOU SAY AT ALL, DOES  
14 THE CAMERA -- OH NO -- DOES THE CAMERA CONNECT ANY OF YOUR  
15 LOCATION WITH LICENSE PLATE AT ALL? I KNOW THAT WHEN YOU'RE  
16 TAKING A PICTURE IN THE APP, YOU'RE NOT TAKING A PICTURE OF  
17 YOUR LICENSE PLATE, BUT IT -- I GUESS IT DOES CORRELATE WITH  
18 YOUR -- I'M SORRY. I'M THINKING OUT LOUD. I GUESS IT DOES  
19 CORRELATE WITH THE FASTRAK LITTLE -- I FORGET WHAT IT'S CALLED  
20 -- THE LITTLE MACHINE THAT'S ON THE CAR ANYWAYS. SO THAT'S  
21 CONNECTED. BUT I THINK THERE IS STILL GOING TO BE ONGOING  
22 CONCERN AROUND PEOPLE IN THE CAR, LICENSE PLATE, AND LAW-  
23 ENFORCEMENT -- AND JUST THE DATA SHARING. I THINK IT'S JUST --  
24 CONTINUED TO BE A CONCERN ON THAT. ONE MUCH GENAY'S QUESTIONS



JULY 22, 2022

1 WAS AROUND RECRUITMENT. WHO DOES THE RECRUITMENT? IS IT THE  
2 CONSULTANT? THE EQUITY CONSULT OR IS IT U.S. STAFF?

3

4 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU FOR THOSE QUESTIONS. I WANT TO BE  
5 ABLE TO ADDRESS ALL OF THEM. ONE OF YOUR QUESTIONS WAS IN  
6 REGARDS TO CHILDREN, AND I WANTED TO LET YOU KNOW THAT A PILOT  
7 CONSIDERATION IS TO EXPLORE HOW THE APP HANDLES CHILDREN AND  
8 INFANTS. SO, STAFF WILL TRY TO RECRUIT ABOUT 10% OF VOLUNTEERS  
9 WHO HAVE CHILDREN OR INFANTS. IN TERMS OF THE RECRUITMENT  
10 EFFORTS, WE HAVE CONTRACTED WITH ATKINS TO HELP WITH THE  
11 RECRUITMENT EFFORTS FOR THIS PILOT, AND, SO, WITH THE  
12 RECOMMENDATIONS FROM OUR EQUITY CONSULTANT, WE ARE KIND OF  
13 LOOKING AT THAT FEEDBACK AND TRYING TO INFUSE THAT -- THOSE  
14 RECOMMENDATIONS INTO OUR RECRUITMENT EFFORTS. BUT ATKINS, OUR  
15 CONTRACTOR ATKINS IS RESPONSIBLE FOR RECRUITMENT; NOT THE  
16 EQUITY CONSULTANT, TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTION.

17

18 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** GOING SO THE RESPONSIBILITY FALLS ON A THIRD  
19 PARTY TO DO THE RECRUITMENT THAT SHOULD TAKE INTO ACCOUNT SOME  
20 OF THE EQUITY PRINCIPLES AROUND ENSURING THAT MARGINALIZED  
21 COMMUNITIES AND FOLKS WHO LIKELY MAY NOT ACTUALLY ACCESS THE  
22 CARPOOLING, GET ACCOUNTED FOR.

23

24 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** YES. ATKINS HAS -- THEY PROVIDED THEIR  
25 RECRUITMENT STRATEGY AND THEIR PLAN MATERIALS TO OUR EQUITY



JULY 22, 2022

1 CONSULTANT FOR REVIEWER. AND THEY HAVE REVIEWED THOSE  
2 DOCUMENTS AND THEY HAVE PROVIDED RECOMMENDATIONS AND FEEDBACK.  
3 AND, SO, NOW, ATKINS IS REVISITING THOSE DOCUMENTS TO INFUSE  
4 THAT FEEDBACK INTO THE RECRUITMENT STRATEGY MATERIALS.

5

6 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY. IS THERE -- DO YOU HAVE -- ARE YOU  
7 ABLE TO SHARE THE PERCENTAGES THAT YOU'RE LOOKING FOR, AND HOW  
8 THOSE ARE BROKEN UP?

9

10 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** SARAH, DO YOU HAVE ANY THOUGHTS ON THE SHARING  
11 OF THE PERCENTAGES?

12

13 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** I THINK WE CAN. THEY'RE STILL UNDER  
14 DEVELOPMENT WE'RE HAVING ONGOING CONVERSATIONS WITH THE EQUITY  
15 CONSULTANT AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN COME BACK AND SHARE  
16 WITH YOU.

17

18 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY. IT WOULD BE GREAT. AS I LEARN ABOUT  
19 THESE PROCESSES, SEEING HOW SOME OF OUR PROJECTS TAKE INTO  
20 ACCOUNT X COMMUNITIES, SOME OF THEM DON'T, OR IT'S A  
21 CONTINUOUS -- IF THAT WE'RE CONTINUALLY SEEING THE COMMUNITIES  
22 THAT NEED TO BE SEEN DURING THESE KIND OF PROJECTS IS WHERE  
23 I'M GOING WITH THAT. AND JUST TO CONFIRM, SARAH YOU MENTIONED  
24 -- SO WHAT I HEARD FROM YOU IS -- CORRECT ME IF I AM WRONG --



JULY 22, 2022

1 BUT THE APP WILL NOT BE IN OTHER LANGUAGES, JUST THE TRAINING  
2 MATERIAL?

3

4 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** FOR THIS FIRST PHASE ONE PILOT YES THE APP  
5 WOULD BE IN ENGLISH AND ALL OF THE TRAINING MATERIALS,  
6 OUTREACH, OTHER MATERIALS DEVELOPED AROUND THE APP AND  
7 OUTREACH WOULD BE TRANSLATE.

8

9 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY. I WOULD KNOW CURIOUS TO FIND OUT THEN,  
10 LIKE, WHAT IF -- IF THERE IS A PERCENTAGE THAT THERE IS HOPE  
11 OF GETTING PEOPLE WHOSE PREDOMINANT LANGUAGE IS NOT ENGLISH,  
12 THOSE KIND OF USERS TO SEE IF THOSE TRAINING MATERIALS MAKE  
13 SENSE IN OTHER LANGUAGES ONCE APPLIED TO THIS APP.

14

15 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** FOR SURE.

16

17 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. VINAY? VINAY, DO YOU WANT TO  
18 UNMUTE YOURSELF TO ASK YOUR QUESTION?

19

20 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. YEAH, SO, I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT, YOU  
21 KNOW, AS OF -- AS SOMEONE WHO HAS WORKED AS A SOFTWARE  
22 ENGINEER IN THE PAST, I DO WANT TO COMMENT THE FOLKS, I THINK  
23 THEY ARE DOING A REALLY GOOD, AND REALLY THOUGHTFUL SOFTWARE  
24 DESIGN JOB. AND I DO WANT TO SAY THAT IN TERMS OF, YOU KNOW,  
25 THE FACIAL VERIFICATION AT THE BEGINNING AND THE END, IT'S



JULY 22, 2022

1 ACTUALLY NOT THAT FAR-FETCHED TO THINK THAT SOMEBODY COULD  
2 LOAD UP THEIR FAMILY WHEN THEY START THE CAR, AND THEN YOU GET  
3 TO THE END OF THE CAR -- I MEAN, THE END OF THE TRIP, YOU  
4 COULD HAVE A BUNCH OF FRIENDS. YOU KNOW? LIKE, YOUR OFFICE  
5 COLLEAGUES, THERE MAY BE FOUR OFFICE COLLEAGUES, EVERY DAY ALL  
6 FOUR OF THEM GET A PASS THIS WAY, BECAUSE THEY'RE ALL SIT IN  
7 EACH OTHER'S CARS, AND THEY SAVE AN EXTRA 15 MINUTES, HALF AN  
8 HOUR, WHAT HAVE YOU. SO I DO THINK THAT IT'S VALID TO DO THE  
9 FACIAL VERIFICATION AT THE BEGINNING AND THE END. THE SECOND  
10 THING I WANT TO SAY, BECAUSE I UNDERSTAND THAT PEOPLE GET  
11 WORRIED ABOUT THE WHOLE SECURITY THING AND STUFF LIKE THAT,  
12 AND AS A SOFTWARE ENGINEER, I JUST WANT TO TELL PEOPLE, YOU  
13 KNOW, GIVEN WHAT FUNCTIONALITY THIS SOFTWARE HAS, IT'S VERY,  
14 VERY EASY TO MAKE IT 100% PROOF. IT'S EASY TO DO THAT. THE  
15 KIND OF STUFF WE DO ON THE INTERNET, FOR EXAMPLE, LIKE SECURE  
16 STUFF ON THE INTERNET, THAT, YOU KNOW IMPLEMENTING THAT IS  
17 ACTUALLY WAY MORE DIFFICULT THAN IMPLEMENTING SECURITY FOR  
18 SOMETHING LIKE THAT. FOR SOMETHING LIKE THIS. SO HAVING 100%  
19 SECURITY FOR SOMETHING LIKE THIS IS ACTUALLY VERY EASY THING  
20 TO DO. SO, I JUST WOULD NOT BE CONCERNED ABOUT THAT AT ALL. I  
21 MEAN, UNLESS, LIKE, THESE FOLKS ARE REALLY DELIBERATELY TRYING  
22 TO SPY FOR THE -- FOR WHOEVER, THERE IS JUST -- THERE IS JUST  
23 NO CHANCE THAT, THAT PEOPLE NEED TO WORRY ABOUT THAT. THANK  
24 YOU.  
25





JULY 22, 2022

1 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. CHRISTINE?

2

3 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** THANKS. I WANT TO SHARE A COUPLE OF  
4 STORIES AND SUGGESTIONS. I HAD A FRIEND WHO WAS TOTALLY COLOR-  
5 BLIND COULD ONLY SEE BLACK, WHITE, AND GRAY SCALE, THAT'S IT.  
6 YOU MENTIONED THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT DIFFERENT COLOR PALATES,  
7 THIS IS A NICE THING. HOWEVER, I WOULD LIKE TO STRONGLY  
8 SUGGEST THAT YOU LOOK AT OTHER TECHNOLOGIES. SO, FOR EXAMPLE,  
9 LOOKING AT HOW AIRLINES USE THE DIFFERENT SOUND QUEUES FOR  
10 PILOTS, BECAUSE THEIR EYES CANNOT BE ON THE INSTRUMENTS AT ALL  
11 TIMES. THEY HAVE TO KEEP THEIR EYES PEELED FOR OTHER PLANES.  
12 SO LOOKING AT THE DIFFERENT SOUND CUES THAT CAN ASSIST  
13 SOMEBODY HAD FINISHING WHAT'S GOING ON, AND YOU CAN MAKE  
14 ANYTHING TALK. SO, WHETHER OR NOT YOU USE A VOICEOVER OR TALK  
15 BACK, IT DOESN'T MATTER. BUT YOU CAN DEFINITELY SET A SYSTEM  
16 THAT AUTOMATICALLY TALKS TO YOU, AND I WOULD ALSO SUGGEST THAT  
17 PERHAPS LOOKING AT ANOTHER COMPANY THAT USES THE DIFFERENT  
18 SOUNDSCAPES, IF YOU WILL, IS CALLED NAVILENS. IT'S A  
19 WAYFINDING PRODUCT FOR HELPING THOSE WHO ARE LOW VISION AND  
20 BLIND NAVIGATE THROUGHOUT CERTAIN AREAS. ONE LAST THING, ALSO  
21 LOOKING AT THE USE OF YOU WERE MENTIONING HOW YOU'RE USING A  
22 GREEN CHECKMARK VERSUS A RED X, THAT SIMPLE DIFFERENTIATION  
23 MAKES IT VERY EASY TO TRACK WHETHER OR NOT, HEY, IT'S OKAY OR  
24 OH, DARN IT'S NOT. AN X AND A CHECK LOOK VERY DIFFERENT.

25



JULY 22, 2022

1 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU, CHRIS. WALTER?

2

3 **WALTER WILSON:** YES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WANT TO SAY I HAVE  
4 BEEN ENGAGED IN TECHNOLOGY FOR OVER 50 YEARS, PERSONALLY, AND  
5 I DO NOT TRUST IT. I THINK EACH OF US HAVE OUR OWN OPINIONS  
6 ABOUT IT, INCLUDING THE GOVERNMENT, THERE WOULD PROBABLY BE NO  
7 NEED FOR NSA IF WE COULD TRUST ALL OF THESE WONDERFUL PEOPLE  
8 WHO ARE BUILDING THESE TECHNOLOGIES AND GENERALLY IT'S NOT THE  
9 PEOPLE THAT BUILD THEM, QUITE FRANKLY, AT ALL. IT'S USUALLY  
10 OTHERS THAT HAVE NEFARIOUS GOALS AND MEANS IN MIND. I JUST  
11 WANT TO SAY THAT AS A MATTER OF POLICY FROM MY OWN  
12 PERSPECTIVE. SO, YEAH, YOU CAN PUT FIRE WALLS IN PLACE, BUT  
13 PEOPLE FIND A WAY TO GET THROUGH THEM IF THAT I WANT TO. I  
14 HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT THIS TECHNOLOGY, A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS,  
15 FIRST OF ALL, THE COMPANY ATKINS, ARE THEY A LOCAL DIVERSE  
16 COMPANY? ARE THEY A LOCAL DIVERSE OWNED COMPANY?

17

18 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** ATKINS ARE A GLOBAL COMPANY, THEY ARE OUR  
19 OUTREACH AND EVALUATION CONSULTANT.

20

21 **WALTER WILSON:** I KNOW WHO THEY ARE. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A  
22 DIVERSITY BENCH THAT WAS DEVELOPED BY SOME PEOPLE IN THIS  
23 ROOM, WHO SHOULD BE DOING THIS WORK. BECAUSE THEY KNOW THE  
24 PEOPLE ON THE GROUND IN THESE COMMUNITIES. WE PULL THOSE  
25 PEOPLE FROM THOSE COMMUNITIES AND PUT THEM ON THAT FOR REASON.



JULY 22, 2022

1 THEY DIDN'T COME FROM WASHINGTON INTERNATIONALLY TO DO  
2 OUTREACH BECAUSE THEY ARE FROM THE COMMUNITY AND HAVE  
3 CONNECTIONS AND THEY KNOW WHO THESE FOLKS ARE. THAT'S NUMBER  
4 ONE. I THINK THIS NEEDS TO BE REVISITED THESE ARE LOCAL  
5 TAXPAYER DOLLARS THEY'RE NOT INTERNATIONAL DOLLARS. THIS IS  
6 REAL TALK. THIS IS ACCESSING EQUITY RIGHT HERE IN MOTION. THIS  
7 IS A CASE IN POINT WHY WE HAVE THIS COMMITTEE. BECAUSE I KNOW  
8 WHO THIS GROUP IS. WE WENT THROUGH A WHOLE LOT OF TROUBLE OF  
9 PUTTING THIS BENCH TOGETHER WITH LOCAL MINORITY, LGBTQ,  
10 DISABLED VETS [INDISCERNIBLE] TO DO WORK THAT WE SHOULD BE  
11 DOING LOCALLY, WITH LOCAL COMPANIES, LOCALLY OWNED BY THE  
12 DIVERSE PEOPLE HERE. I'M REALLY CRITICAL ABOUT THAT. THE OTHER  
13 QUESTION I HAVE IS, THIS TECHNOLOGY, THIS PLAN, THIS IS A  
14 PILOT PROGRAM, CORRECT?

15

16 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** CORRECT.

17

18 **WALTER WILSON:** HOW DID THIS PARTICULAR COMPANY GET SELECTED  
19 AND WAS THERE A BIDDING PROCESS FOR THIS COMPANY BEFORE MAKING  
20 THIS DISCUSSION I'M JUST CURIOUS. I HADN'T SEEN OR HEARD  
21 ANYTHING ABOUT AND I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW ABOUT THE RESEARCH.  
22 THIS IS GOING TO BE A LUCRATIVE CONTRACT. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT  
23 THAT.

24



JULY 22, 2022

1 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** MR. WILSON PLEASE CONFIRM ARE YOU ASKING ABOUT  
2 ATKINS, RIDE FLAG OR EQUITY CONSULTANTS?

3

4 **WALTER WILSON:** ATKINS IS YOUR OUTREACH CONSULTANT?

5

6 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** CORRECT.

7

8 **WALTER WILSON:** THAT WAS MY QUESTION WHO THEY WERE, AND THEY  
9 ARE WHO I THOUGHT THEY WERE. THE SECOND QUESTION IS ABOUT THE  
10 CONSULTANTS THAT ACTUALLY CREATED THE SOFTWARE AND THE PROCESS  
11 THAT TOOK PLACE. WAS THAT A BIDDING PROCESS? AND HOW DID IT  
12 OCCUR? WAS THERE OPPORTUNITY TO BRING OTHER PEOPLE IN THE  
13 PROCESS? OR WERE THEY SELECTED BY A GROUP? THAT'S GOING TO BE  
14 A LUCRATIVE CONTRACT IF IT GETS IMPLEMENTED. THOSE ARE THE TWO  
15 QUESTIONS.

16

17 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THANK YOU. SIR DID YOU HAVE ANYTHING YOU WANT  
18 TO ADD TO ABOUT ATKINS AND RED FLAG?

19

20 **SARAH BURDENS WORTH:** THE VENDOR RIDE FLAG THERE WAS A  
21 COMPETITIVE PROCUREMENT PROCESS CONDUCTED BACK IN 2020.

22

23 **WALTER WILSON:** THEY ARE OUT OF WASHINGTON OR SOMETHING, RIGHT?

24

25 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** I BELIEVE THEY ARE A CANADIAN COMPANY.



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **WALTER WILSON:** CANADIAN. OKAY. AND THAT'S GOING TO BE  
3 INTERESTING. THAT'S GOING TO BE A LUCRATIVE CONTRACT. AND THE  
4 SELECTION OF THE ATKINS GROUP WAS THE OTHER QUESTION AS  
5 OPPOSED TO PICKING SOMETHING FROM OUR VERY OWN EQUITY BENCH.

6

7 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** THERE WAS A PROCUREMENT FOR ATKINS IN 2020  
8 AS WELL. AND I SEE MICHAEL BRINTON HAS HIS HAND RAISED.

9

10 **WALTER WILSON:** THAT DOESN'T ANSWER MY QUESTION AS TO WHY WE  
11 DIDN'T PICK SOMEBODY LOCAL. WE COULD HAVE IT WRITTEN INTO OUR  
12 RFP THAT WAY. GO AHEAD MICHAEL.

13

14 **MICHAEL BRINTON:** WE HAVE A BENCH, ELECTRIC PAYMENTS SECTION OF  
15 CONSULTING HAS A BENCH WE CREATED BACK IN 2019 SORRY -- WE  
16 ISSUED A MINI PROCUREMENT OFF THAT BENCH IN 2019 PRIOR TO THE  
17 ESTABLISHMENT OF THE EQUITY BENCH SO ATKINS WAS SELECTED AS AN  
18 OUTREACH VENDOR FROM THAT BENCH IN THE PROCUREMENT PROCESS AND  
19 WAS REVIEWED AND APPROVED IN JANUARY OF 2020.

20

21 **WALTER WILSON:** ARE YOU SAYING ATKINS IS PART OF OUR LOCAL  
22 DIVERSITY GROUP THAT'S PART OF THAT EQUITY BENCH?

23

24 **MICHAEL BRINTON:** NO THEY'RE ON A DIFFERENT BENCH. I'M NOT SURE  
25 IF ATKINS.



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **WALTER WILSON:** OUR EQUITY BENCH ONE OF THE REQUIREMENTS IS IT  
3 BE BAY AREA BASED. SO I DON'T THINK SO.

4

5 **MICHAEL BRINTON:** I DON'T THINK SO EITHER I WAS RESEARCHING  
6 THIS AWARD OF CONTRACT TO ATKINS THAT I HAVEN'T PULLED UP,  
7 THEY DO HAVE A DBE THAT I WAS TRYING TO SEARCH FOR TO SEE IT'S  
8 CALLED VRPA. LET'S SEE HERE. I'LL HAVE TO FOLLOW UP WITH YOU  
9 ALL, BUT ATKINS DOES HAVE A DBE THAT'S ON THEIR STAFF CALLED  
10 EBRA TECHNOLOGIES. I'LL FOLLOW UP WITH YOU. BUT THE ATKINS  
11 AWARD OCCURRED BEFORE THE EQUITY BENCH WAS ESTABLISHED.

12

13 **WALTER WILSON:** THAT'S GOING TO BE IMPORTANT HUNDREDS OF  
14 MILLIONS OF DOLLARS LEAVING HERE RIGHT OUT THE DOOR. TAXPAYER  
15 MONEY.

16

17 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU MICHAEL. I APPRECIATE YOU BEING  
18 HERE AS WELL. BEFORE WE SEE IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT. I ALSO  
19 HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS. MICHAEL, DID YOU WANT TO ADD ANYTHING?

20

21 **MICHAEL BRINTON:** I CAN WAIT MY TURN. I HAD A QUESTION FOR  
22 CHELSEA THAT I THOUGHT MIGHT HELP CLARIFY SOME OF THE  
23 QUESTIONS ABOUT PEOPLE DROPPING OFF PEOPLE AND PICKING UP  
24 OTHERS WHILE THEY'RE DRIVING. I THINK MAYBE A LITTLE  
25 CLARIFICATION ON HOW A TRIP IS BUILT ON THE EXPRESS LANES.



JULY 22, 2022

1 BECAUSE THE EXPRESS LANE IS IN THE FAST LANE, AND AS FAR AS  
2 I'M AWARE THERE IS NOT A PLACE FOR PEOPLE TO STOP AND DROP  
3 PEOPLE ON AND OFF WHILE THEY'RE IN THE EXPRESS LANE. SO, I  
4 BELIEVE THEY ENTER, START A TRIP, AND WHEN THEY EXIT THE  
5 EXPRESS LANE, THAT WOULD BE THE END OF THAT TRIP. AND THEN IF  
6 THEY PULLED OFF, SWAPPED OCCUPANTS AND GOT BACK OFF THE  
7 FREEWAY AND GOT BACK INTO THE EXPRESS LANE THAT WOULD START A  
8 SECOND TRIP. IS THAT CORRECT, CHELSEA? I DON'T THINK THERE'S  
9 AN ISSUE OF STARTING WITH THREE PEOPLE IN THE CAR AND SWAPPING  
10 PEOPLE WHILE THEY'RE ON A TRIP ON THE EXPRESS LANES BECAUSE IT  
11 WOULD REQUIRE THE TRIP TO END AND THEN RESTART, BECAUSE THEY  
12 WOULD HAVE TO GET OFF THE FREEWAY TO MAKE THE PASSENGER  
13 CHANGE. IS THAT ACCURATE?

14

15 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THAT'S CORRECT. IT IS. THANKS MIKE.

16

17 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. SO MY QUESTIONS, ONE, I WAS  
18 CURIOUS, IS THE INTENT -- I KNOW WE'RE JUST DOING A PILOT  
19 PROGRAM RIGHT NOW BUT IF IMPLEMENTED IS THE INTENT FOR THIS TO  
20 BE THE ONLY OPTION? BECAUSE I'M WONDERING ABOUT PEOPLE WHO  
21 MIGHT NOT HAVE SMART PHONES OR THE DATA PLAN TO SUPPORT AN APP  
22 BEING ON FOR THAT DURATION.

23

24 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** SO, NO, THIS IS NOT THE ONLY OPTION THAT WE'RE  
25 CONSIDERING. THIS IS ALSO, EARLIER IN MY PRESENTATION, I NOTED



JULY 22, 2022

1 THAT THERE WAS A SECOND PILOT THAT'S BEING CONSIDERED, ALSO, A  
2 ROADSIDE PILOT. THEY DO NOT HAVE A LOT OF INFORMATION ABOUT.  
3 I'M MORE CAUGHT UP TO SPEED ON THE APP-BASED PILOT. BUT WHAT  
4 DO KNOW ABOUT THE ROADSIDE PILOT AND THE VEHICLE OCCUPANCIES  
5 DETECTION AND ASSESSING DIFFERENT OPTIONS FOR DEPLOYMENT OF  
6 THE TECHNOLOGY ASIDE FROM THAT I DON'T KNOW MORE ABOUT THE  
7 SECOND PILOT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** OKAY THANK YOU. THAT'S HELPFUL. AND THEN MY  
10 OTHER QUESTION WAS, ARE THERE, SAY SOMEONE DOESN'T FULFILL --  
11 SO, ARE THERE -- HOW DO I PHRASE THIS? I GUESS, ARE THERE  
12 PENALTIES ATTACHED TO THIS? SAY SOMEONE DOESN'T HAVE THE SAME  
13 PEOPLE IN THEIR CAR OR THEY HAD FOUR PEOPLE TO BEGIN WITH AND  
14 SOMEHOW NOW IT'S ONLY ONE PERSON. WHAT HAPPENS THEN?

15

16 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** THERE ARE NO PENALTIES ASSOCIATED WITH USING  
17 THIS APP. YOUR CARPOOL IS GRANTED. YOU KNOW, BASED ON YOUR  
18 TRIP. SO, IF YOU'RE DRIVING IN THE I 680 EXPRESS LANE AND YOU  
19 ARE USING THE APP AND YOU HAVE TWO PEOPLE -- YOU KNOW, IT JUST  
20 DEPENDS ON, YOU KNOW, YOUR USAGE, BUT THERE IS NO PENALTIES.  
21 IF YOU DON'T FINISH THE TRIP OR IF THE EXIT THE APP THERE IS  
22 NO PENALTIES ASSOCIATED OR TACKED ON TO USING THIS APP.

23





JULY 22, 2022

1 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** OKAY. I COULD IMAGINE THERE ARE ISSUES WITH  
2 IF THE PHONES DIE OR THE PHONE GLITCHES OR SOMETHING LIKE  
3 THAT.

4

5 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** IF YOUR PHONE CUTS OFF THINGS HAPPEN WITH  
6 TECHNOLOGY AT THE ENDS OF YOUR TRIP IF YOU ARE ABLE TO CONNECT  
7 WITH WI-FI THERE ARE HOTSPOTS AND THINGS LIKE THAT THAT YOU  
8 CAN STILL COMPLETE YOUR TRIP IF YOU ARE ABLE TO CONNECT TO  
9 SOME KIND OF WI-FI OR, YOU KNOW, I'M NOT SURE WHAT IT'S  
10 CALLED, I THINK IT'S JUST WI-FI. THE INTERNET.

11

12 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** OKAY. THAT IS HELPFUL. I DON'T SEE ANY  
13 PUBLIC COMMENT. MARTHA DO YOU?

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I DO NOT SEE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
16 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. THERE IT GOES.

17

18 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** WALTER, GO AHEAD.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RICH RAISED HIS HAND.

21

22 **WALTER WILSON:** YEAH I DID. THE OTHER --

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** RICH HEDGES, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE  
25 YOURSELF.



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **RICHARD HEDGES:** IF YOU WANT TO LET WALT ARE GO AHEAD I'M FINE  
3 WITH IT.

4

5 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IT'S PUBLIC COMMENT RIGHT NOW.

6

7 **RICHARD HEDGES:** I'M WATCHING THIS INTENTLY AND I'M WONDERING  
8 THE BENEFITS OF AN APP OVER THE TRANSPONDER I UNDERSTAND WE  
9 WANT TO ELIMINATE SOME OF THE HIGHWAY PATROL CARS BUT PEOPLE  
10 CAN STILL USE THE TRANSPONDER I'M ASSUMING AND I WOULD INTEND  
11 TO USE THE TRANSPONDER. I'M NOT SO WORRIED ABOUT PERSONAL  
12 INFORMATION. IT REALLY DEPENDS ON WHAT THE APP ASKS FOR. AND I  
13 HAVE HAD MY PERSONAL INFORMATION GIVEN AWAY BY DIFFERENT  
14 AGENCIES JUST RECENTLY I RECEIVED A LETTER FROM AN AGENCY WITH  
15 THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA THAT EXPOSED ME AND SEVERAL OTHER  
16 MILLION PEOPLE IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA TO DRIVER'S LICENSE  
17 NUMBERS, SOCIAL SECURITY NUMBERS AND MANY OTHER WAYS OF  
18 IDENTIFYING INCLUDING ADDRESSES IT'S PART OF DOING BUSINESS  
19 NOW WITH THE APPS AND THE INTERNET. BUT I REALLY AM WONDERING  
20 WHAT THIS IS GOING TO BENEFIT AND WHETHER THE COST IS ACTUALLY  
21 WORTH IT. AND I WISH SOMEBODY COULD ENLIGHTEN ME ON THAT.  
22 BECAUSE I THINK THE TRANSPONDER WORKS JUST FINE. PEOPLE ARE  
23 GOING TO TRY TO AVOID PAYING NO MATTER WHAT WE DO. SO IF  
24 SOMEBODY COULD REALLY GIVE ME THE ADVANTAGES BASED ON THE COST



JULY 22, 2022

1 TO DEVELOP THIS APP, I WOULD APPRECIATE HAVING TO LEARN ABOUT  
2 IT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE  
5 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

6

7 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. BEFORE I JUMP TO WALTER, THAT WAS  
8 A QUESTION I HAD, YOU ARE WELCOME TO ADDRESS IT NOW. IF YOU  
9 HAVE OTHER ITEMS YOU WOULD LIKE TO FOLLOW UP THAT'S FINE AS  
10 WELL.

11

12 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** GREAT QUESTION. I THINK WE'RE GOING TO LEARN A  
13 LOT. IT'S A PILE. SO WE'RE TESTING THIS TECHNOLOGY OUT TO SEE  
14 HOW IT'S GOING TO SPAN OUTS. BUT THE PURPOSE IS TO ACCESS  
15 WHETHER OR NOT THIS APP IS EASY TO USE AND WHETHER OR NOT  
16 THERE ARE, YOU KNOW, TO ADDRESS AND THINK ABOUT EXPLORE  
17 PRIVACY CONCERNS. YOU KNOW, THERE -- AGAIN, THIS IS JUST -- WE  
18 ARE TRYING TO SEE WHAT WE CAN DO TO REDUCE THE NEED OF CHP  
19 ENFORCEMENT, I THINK THAT WAS A CONCERN. AND, SO, WE ARE JUST  
20 TESTING OUT THIS TECHNOLOGY TO SEE, YOU KNOW, TO GAUGE USER  
21 EXPERIENCE THAT'S WHY WE'RE RECRUITING VOLUNTEERS TO  
22 UNDERSTAND THEIR EXPERIENCE AND GET THEIR FEEDBACK ON WHETHER  
23 OR NOT THIS IS SOMETHING THAT COULD WORK. AND, SO WE'RE TRYING  
24 TO UNDERSTAND DEPLOYMENT COST AND WE'RE DOING ALL OF THIS TO  
25 GET AHEAD AND TO UNDERSTAND THE PURPOSE AND TO REALLY KIND OF



JULY 22, 2022

1 GAUGE ALL THESE DIFFERENT THINGS. SO THAT'S WHY WE'RE PILOTING  
2 THIS PROGRAM IS TO SEE IF IT STICKS.

3

4 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** I THINK IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO FRAME FUTURE  
5 PRESENTATIONS AS HERE IS THE PROBLEM WE'RE TRYING TO ADDRESS.  
6 AND HERE'S WHY. THOSE KINDS OF QUESTIONS THAT COME UP A LOT  
7 WITH OUR EQUITY AND ACCESS COMMITTEE. BUT THANK YOU FOR  
8 PROVIDING THAT CONTEXT. WALTER?

9

10 **WALTER WILSON:** APPRECIATE THE WORK DONE ON THIS. I'LL TRY  
11 ANYTHING TO TRY TO GET PEOPLE TO CARPOOL. I'LL BE HONEST WITH  
12 YOU HERE IN SANTA CLARA AND EVERYWHERE IN THE BAY AREA LOOKING  
13 AT TENS OF THOUSANDS OF MILLIONS OF PEOPLE IN THE CARPOOL BY  
14 THEMSELVES. THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THE OTHER THING IS, IS THIS  
15 THING CONNECTED TO A NETWORK? THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** SO, YOU -- USING YOUR PHONE, YOU WOULD BE  
18 CONNECTED TO YOUR -- TO YOUR NETWORK BEING YOUR PHONE. THERE  
19 IS NOT AN OUTSIDE NETWORK IF THAT'S WHAT YOU ARE ASKING. IT'S  
20 JUST BEING CONNECTED TO THE INTERNET.

21

22 **WALTER WILSON:** HOW IS THE DATA -- HOW DO YOU CAPTURE THE DATA  
23 TO TAKE A SNAPSHOT OF IT? DOES IT DOWNLOAD LATER? OR HOW DOES  
24 THAT WORK? BECAUSE A SNAPSHOT OF THE DATA SAYING THESE PEOPLE  
25 MEETING REQUIREMENTS SO THEY'RE LEGALLY DRIVING



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **CHELSEA GAMULO:** I HOPE I'M SAYING THIS CORRECTLY, YOU DOWNLOAD  
3 THE APP WHICH IS THEN CONNECTED TO THE INTERNET, AND YOUR  
4 INFORMATION IS RETAINED UNTIL THE END OF YOUR TRIP. I'M NOT  
5 SURE I'M ANSWERING THIS CORRECTLY.

6

7 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** FOR THE PILOT THERE IS NO CONNECTION TO THE  
8 TOLL CENTER OR THE CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER OR THE BACK END OF  
9 ANY OTHER SYSTEMS FOR THE PILOT IT'S PURELY THE APP AND THE  
10 APP IS WHAT'S CONFIRMING. YOU'RE BASICALLY SELF-VALIDATING  
11 THAT YOU ARE A CARPOOL THROUGHOUT APP AND THERE IS NO NEED FOR  
12 CHP ENFORCEMENT INVOLVED.

13

14 **WALTER WILSON:** I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT CHP ENFORCEMENT WHEN IT  
15 TAKES THIS SNAPSHOT THERE IS THREE OR FOUR PEOPLE IN THE CAR  
16 THAT'S VERIFYING IT DOESN'T MATTER WHO THEY ARE, WHEN IS THE  
17 INFORMATION TRANSFERRED TO YOUR SYSTEM? NOT IMMEDIATELY, DOES  
18 IT DOWNLOAD LATER IN THE MONTH? AT THE END OF THE TRIP? WHEN  
19 DOES THAT HAPPEN? BECAUSE WHEN THAT HAPPENS THAT'S WHEN THE  
20 CONNECTION TO THE NETWORK TAKES PLACE I'M CURIOUS WHEN THAT IS  
21 IF YOU KNOW. THANK YOU.

22

23 **SARAH BURNSWORTH:** YEAH, CURRENTLY THAT INFORMATION IS NOT  
24 BEING TRANSFERRED TO OUR SYSTEM, BUT MTC, FOR PURPOSES OF THE  
25 PILOT WILL BE USING INFORMATION FOR EVALUATION, BUT THAT WILL



JULY 22, 2022

1 BE SOMETHING FOR FUTURE CONSIDERATION IF THERE WAS GOING TO BE  
2 THAT TRANSFER.

3

4 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU, CHELSEA AND SARAH. LOOKING  
5 FORWARD TO SEEING WHAT HAPPENS WITH THIS PROPOSED PILOT KEEP  
6 US UPDATED. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM SIX THE STAFF  
7 LIAISON REPORT. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO KY-NAM.

8

9 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANKS ILAF. I DON'T HAVE MUCH TO ADD. BUT JUST  
10 A REMINDER, I SENT OUT A NOTE TO FOLKS ON THE COUNCIL EARLIER  
11 TODAY THAT WE HAVE THE LAST INSTALLMENT OF THE NORMAN ETA  
12 BAY AREA SUMMER ACADEMY TAKING PLACE NEXT THURSDAY AND OUR  
13 ILLUSTRIOUS CHAIR IS GOING TO BE ONE OF THE FEATURES SPEAKERS  
14 ALONG WITH CONGRESSMAN MIKE HONDA AND I'M GUESSING ABOUT 40 TO  
15 50 KIDS MAKING A PRESENTATION. SO A REALLY FUN THING. YOU CAN  
16 REGISTER AND GET THE ZOOM LINK. AND EVEN IF YOU'RE NOT ABLE TO  
17 STOP BY FOR THE ENTIRE LENGTH OF IT, YOU KNOW, POP IN AND SEE  
18 SOME OF THE KIDS PRESENTATIONS I WOULD ENCOURAGE THAT. THAT'S  
19 IT.

20

21 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GREAT. ANY DISCUSSIONS OR PUBLIC COMMENT ON  
22 THIS?

23

24 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE  
25 RECEIVED ON THIS AND THERE IS GOES --



JULY 22, 2022

1

2 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GO AHEAD RICH.

3

4 **RICHARD HEDGES:** THANKS. I WANT TO CHIME IN. I HAVE BEEN  
5 ATTENDING, WHEN I CAN, AND THE LAST ONE WAS MEMBERS OF THE AIR  
6 BOARD TALKING ABOUT THEIR HISTORIES AND WITH SOME OF THE KIDS  
7 SPEAKING UP. I THINK IT'S A GREAT THING FOR US TO TAKE PART  
8 IN. MANY OF US HAVE OVER THE YEARS EVEN WHEN WE HAD TO TRAVEL  
9 TO BE WITH THE YOUNG PEOPLE THAT ARE GOING THROUGH THIS  
10 PROGRAM. THEY'RE OUR FUTURE. SO, ANYWAY, THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU FOR THAT.

13

14 **KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU RICH FOR SHOWING UP ALL THE TIME. WE  
15 APPRECIATE YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** I'M CURIOUS FOR FOLKS WHO MIGHT HAVE MISSED  
18 THE PAST MEETINGS IS THAT RECORDED SOMEWHERE, ACCESSIBLE  
19 SOMEWHERE? IF THAT I WANTED TO?

20

21 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH. I'LL INCLUDE A LINK OUT WITH THE SYLLABUS  
22 WHICH INCLUDES RECORDING LINKS FOR EACH OF THE SESSIONS. WHAT  
23 WAS REALLY DESIGNED FOR HIGH SCHOOLERS I THINK IT'S APPLICABLE  
24 FOR ANYONE WHO WANTS TO UNDERSTAND OUR DISTRICT. IT'S PRETTY  
25 INTERESTING STARTING OUT WITH A PLEASE BY NORM MINETA AND HIS



JULY 22, 2022

1 BIOGRAPHY STARTED OUT AS AN INTERN CAMP DURING WORLD WAR II  
2 AND HIS PATHWAY TO PUBLIC SERVICE. I'LL CHECK IT OUT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO NEW BUSINESS. DOES  
5 ANYONES ON THE SUBCOMMITTEE HAVE ANY NEW BUSINESS THEY WOULD  
6 LIKE TO BRING UP? ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THAT?

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO -- OH, DID YOU WANT TO GET  
9 GABRIELA FIRST?

10

11 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** YEAH. GO AHEAD GABRIELA.

12

13 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** THANKS. I HAD A QUESTION FOR CLARIFICATION.  
14 NEW BUSINESS, THIS IT WOULD BE FOR ITEMS FOR FUTURE AGENDAS.  
15 IS THAT?

16

17 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** IT COULD BE TOPICS FOR DISCUSSION OR FUTURE  
18 AGENDA.

19

20 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY. I WOULD BE INTERESTED IN HAVING A  
21 FOLLOW UP CONVERSATION OR GETTING MORE CLARIFICATION AROUND  
22 THE DATA SHARING ASPECT THAT WE WERE BRINGING UP, ESPECIALLY  
23 AS IT TOUCHES ON CONCERNS OF COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE BEEN --  
24 HAVE -- YEAH, HAD -- HAVE ADVERSE OR NEGATIVE EXPERIENCES WITH  
25 LAW-ENFORCEMENT IN THE PAST AND HOW WE WANT TO TAKE THAT INTO





JULY 22, 2022

1 AND ACCOUNT THOSE NUANCES. SO SOMETHING FOR THE FUTURE. I ALSO  
2 WANTED TO ASK FOR CLARIFICATION, IF WE -- IF NEW BUSINESS  
3 COULD ALSO INCLUDE POTENTIAL PRESENTATIONS BY COMMUNITY  
4 ORGANIZATIONS THAT -- THAT PERTAIN TO OUR TOPICS? OR IS IT  
5 JUST STAFF THAT CAN PROVIDE PRESENTATIONS ON PROJECTS AND  
6 POLICIES, APPLICABLE PROJECTS AND POLICIES.

7

8 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** KY-NAM AND MARTHA FEEL FREE TO JUMP IN IF  
9 I'M WRONG. BUT I'M OPEN TO A PRESENTATION IF YOU WANT TO PUT  
10 IT ON A FUTURE AGENDA IF YOU THINK IT'S APPLICABLE TO THE  
11 SUBCOMMITTEE AND THE WORK WE'RE DOING WITH MTC. KY-NAM, I WANT  
12 TO CHECK IF THAT'S ALLOWED?

13

14 **KY-NAM MILLER:** TYPICALLY IT'S BEEN KIND OF STAFF LED, AND  
15 MAYBE IF A COMMUNITY ORGANIZATION IS COOPERATING ON A PROJECT  
16 THEN MAY MIGHT PERHAPS COPRESENT. SO, THEORETICALLY AS LONG AS  
17 IT'S IN LINE WITH EQUITY AND ACCESS OR THE COUNCIL'S PURVIEW I  
18 DO NOT SEE WHY NOT. WE JUST HAVE TO THINK THROUGH WHO AND WHY.  
19 THE AGENDA CAN GET THICK BUT I THINK IT'S GOOD TO HAVE  
20 COMMUNITY VOICES.

21

22 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GABRIELA IF YOU WANT TO CHAT MORE ABOUT THAT  
23 OFFLINE I WOULD BE HAPPY TO BRAINSTORM WITH YOU. AND I WANT TO  
24 CHECK WITH YOUR DISCUSSION ON DATA SHARING IS THAT SOMETHING  
25 YOU WANTED FOR OPEN DISCUSSION OR A QUESTION YOU WANT STAFF TO



JULY 22, 2022

1 ANSWER WE ARE FOLLOWING UP WITH LEGAL TO UNDERSTAND SOME OF  
2 THOSE DATA SHARING COMPONENTS HAPPY TO INCLUDE YOUR QUESTION  
3 THERE AS WELL.

4

5 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** DO YOU MEAN FOR DISCUSSION IS NOW OR  
6 DISCUSSION IN THE FUTURE?

7

8 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** FUTURE.

9

10 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** FUTURE. IN THE FUTURE.

11

12 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** GOOD. JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE I UNDERSTOOD.  
13 I SEE WALTER'S HAND RAISED.

14

15 **WALTER WILSON:** I WOULD DEFINITELY LIKE TO AGREE WITH THE ISSUE  
16 OF DATA SHARING. THAT'S WHAT I WAS GETTING TO THE DATA SHARING  
17 SOMEBODY'S HAVE TO HAVE SOME INFORMATION SOME PLACE. THE OTHER  
18 ABOUT THE COMMUNITY BEING ABLE TO DO PRESENTATIONS, I THINK  
19 IT'S -- IT'S GET TO BE -- FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, ANYWAY, I THINK  
20 IT'S GET TO BE SOMETHING THAT'S RELATED TO SPECIFIC ISSUES  
21 THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH THAT ARE I MEAN, IN THIS EFFORT THE  
22 INFORMATION WE HAVE GOTTEN IS GREAT IN TERMS OF EDUCATING US  
23 ABOUT WHAT'S GOING ON WITH LEGISLATION AND THE TRANSPORTATION  
24 ISSUES AND SO ON. SO THERE MAY BE SOME COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS  
25 THAT ARE ADVOCATES OUT THERE BUT I THINK IT HAS TO BE VETTED



JULY 22, 2022

1 BY OUR CHAIR AND CO-CHAIR AND BY STAFF TO MAKE SURE THAT IT'S  
2 GOING TO BE CONSISTENT WITH WHATEVER THE SUBJECT MATTER AT  
3 HAND IS. OTHERWISE, IT CAN GET OUT OF HAND.

4

5 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** YEAH DEFINITELY AGREE. GENAY AND I ARE OPEN  
6 TO TALKING WITH FOLKS IF THERE ARE THINGS THAT YOU WANT TO PUT  
7 ON THE AGENDA INCLUDING IF YOU THINK THERE IS A COMMUNITY  
8 ORGANIZATION THAT SEEMS RELEVANT TO THE TOPICS WE ARE  
9 DISCUSSING. WE CAN HAVE A CONVERSATION OFFLINE IF IT'S  
10 APPROPRIATE OR NOT THE OTHER THING IS PUBLIC OPPORTUNITY FOR  
11 GROUPS TO COME IN AND PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT AS IT RELATES TO  
12 MATERIALS DEFINITELY ENCOURAGE COMMUNITY VOICES I WANT  
13 RECOMMEND FOLKS KNOW THAT'S AN OPTION. FOR THOSE COMMUNITY  
14 ORGANIZATIONS GABRIELA LET THEM KNOW THEY ARE WELCOME TO COME  
15 ATTEND THESE MEETINGS AND PARTICIPATE IN PUBLIC COMMENT IN  
16 ADDITION TO OR IN LIEU OF PROVIDING A PRESENTATION. AND AGAIN  
17 WE CAN HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS OFFLINE TO SEE WHAT'S  
18 APPROPRIATE. I THOUGHT I SAW PUBLIC COMMENT. YES GO TO WARREN.

19

20 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WARREN DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK AROUND THIS  
21 NEW BUSINESS ITEM OR DID YOU WANT TO SPEAK UNDER GENERAL  
22 PUBLIC COMMENT WHICH IS THE NEXT ITEM?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

25



JULY 22, 2022

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. OKAY. SO THAT'S  
2 THE NEXT ITEM. JUST GIVE US A LITTLE BIT AND THEN WE'LL CALL  
3 ON YOU. OKAY?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** IF THERE ARE NO NEW BUSINESS ITEMS THAT THE  
8 SUBCOMMITTEE WANTS TO BRING UP, WE CAN MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT.  
9 GO STRAIGHT TO WARREN.

10

11 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WARREN GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** THERE WE GO.

14

15 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I'LL PROVIDE A 15 SECOND WARNING TOO.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** CAN YOU HEAR ME? THIS IS WARREN CUSHMAN AND I WANT TO  
18 UPLIFT A THEME THAT I HAVE HEARD THE LAST COUPLE OF MONTHS AND  
19 ESSENTIALLY I SEE THE THEME IN A CHANGE IN HOW MTC DOES  
20 BUSINESS. I HAVE HEARD TALK OF CONTRACTS BY MEMBER WILSON. I  
21 HAVE HEARD TALK OF LOOKING AT HOW DISABILITY POLICY IS RAISED  
22 BY MEMBER WELTE. AND SO WHAT I HAVE BEEN THINKING ABOUT IS,  
23 HOW THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE CAN LOOK AT POLICY  
24 SHIFT, POLICY CHANGE, THROUGHOUT THE MTC PROCESS. AND I THINK  
25 THAT CONTRACTS, FOR EXAMPLE, AND HOW CONTRACTS ARE AWARDED,



JULY 22, 2022

1 AND THE THEMES ON HOW THAT IS DONE, THE LENSES ON HOW THAT IS  
2 DONE, IS AN EXAMPLE OF WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT. WE REALLY NEED  
3 TO BE THINKING ABOUT DOING BUSINESS IN A DIFFERENT WAY. AND SO  
4 I WANT TO URGE TO THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR OF THE EQUITY AND  
5 ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE TO THINK ABOUT HOW TO DRILL DOWN INTO THE  
6 WHOLE POLICY SHIFT OF HOW MTC DOES BUSINESS AND REALLY BRING  
7 SOME OF THESE THEMES TO THE FORE, HOW MTC DOES BUSINESS TO  
8 REALLY REFLECT THE GROUND-LEVEL NEED OF PEOPLE WITH  
9 DISABILITY. THE GROUND-LEVEL EQUITY LENS THAT WE ALL CARE  
10 ABOUT. AND SO THAT DOES HAVE TO DRILL DOWN INTO THE CHANGE OF  
11 HOW MTC PERFORMANCES HOW IT DOES BUSINESS HOW IT AWARDS  
12 CONTRACTS. TO ME, I REALLY WANT TO UPLIFT THAT AND POINT THAT  
13 OUT AS WE MOVE FORWARD, AND I HOPE TO HEAR SOME REAL CHANGES.  
14 I HOPE TO HEAR SOME REAL CHANGES IN THE FUTURE. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU WARREN. AND THERE ARE NO OTHER  
17 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, ILAF ESUF:** THANK YOU. AND WITH THAT, WE ARE COMING TO A  
20 CLOSE OF OUR MEETING. SO THE NEXT MEETING THAT WE'RE GOING TO  
21 HAVE FOR THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE IS GOING TO BE ON  
22 THE 26th OF AUGUST AT 11:00 A.M. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING  
23 YOU GUYS THERE. THIS HAS BEEN A GREAT MEETING. LOTS GREAT  
24 CONVERSATIONS. IF THERE IS ANYTHING YOU WANT TO CHAT ABOUT IN  
25 THE INTERIM REACH OUT TO ME OR GENAY OR STAFF WITH QUESTIONS



JULY 22, 2022

1 YOU MIGHT HAVE. THANK YOU. I'LL SEE YOU GUYS ON THE 26th.

2 [ADJOURNED]

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43



*Broadcasting Government*