

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



December 9, 2020

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 9, 2020, 9:45 AM**
4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'M NICK
6 JOSEFOWITZ, THIS IS THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE.
7 I'M CALLING THE MEETING TO ORDER. LET'S PLAY THE INTRODUCTORY
8 RECORDED MESSAGE, WHICH IS ALWAYS A HIGHLIGHT OF MY DAY. DUE
9 TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR,
10 PURSUANT TO THE GOVERNOR'S EXECUTIVE ORDER N-29-20 WHICH
11 SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING
12 IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON
13 COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS BY NAME,
14 AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE
15 GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST
16 AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR
17 ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS
18 OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD
19 USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND THE CHAIR
20 WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
21 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
22 PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR
23 NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS
24 VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT
25 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY WILL BE POSTED TO



December 9, 2020

1 THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE
2 READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD
3 LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO, AND SHOULD RAISE THEIR
4 HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM ON THE APPROPRIATE
5 TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS.
6 PANELISTS SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE TO
7 ATTENDEES. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE
8 MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

9

10 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** IF ANYBODY ASKS WHAT YOU DID DURING
11 COVID, BINGE WATCHING NETFLIX AND BROWN ACT ANNOUNCEMENTS. IF
12 WE COULD CALL ROLL AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES DUTRA-VERNACI?

15

16 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER? GLOVER IS PRESENT.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN? PAPAN IS PRESENT.

25



December 9, 2020

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

2

3 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF?

6

7 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WORTH? WORTH IS PRESENT. QUORUM IS
10 PRESENT.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** TERRIFIC. MOVING TO CONSENT CALENDAR,
13 DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** DUTRA-VERNACI WILL MAKE THE
16 MOTION FOR APPROVAL OF THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

17

18 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** RONEN WILL SECOND.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** DUTRA-VERNACI MAKES THE MOTION SAVVY
21 AND SECONDS. PUBLIC COMMENT?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NONE RECEIVED.

24



December 9, 2020

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** IF THERE ARE NO COMMENTS BY
2 COMMISSIONERS, LET'S DO A VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES
5 UNANIMOUSLY FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 3AMTC
8 RESOLUTION 3738, REVISION ATTACHMENT OF BUCKER REPLACEMENT
9 FUNDING EXCHANGE RESERVE ACCOUNT AUTHORIZED \$161 MILLION
10 REVISING A CONDITION ON THE PREVIOUS AUTHORIZATION. GOOD
11 MORNING. CRAIG WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** THIS ITEM IS FUNDING OF \$161 MILLION FOR
14 EXCHANGE ACCOUNT FUND AS PART OF \$179 MILLION THAT COMMISSION
15 COMMITTED TO EXPANSION, CORE CAPACITY PROJECT ALLOWING BART TO
16 MOVE FORWARD WITH EXPANSION CARS AS REQUIRED BY THE EXCHANGE
17 ACCOUNT AGREEMENT BART'S BOARD OF DIRECTORS AUTHORIZED THIS
18 REQUEST LAST MONTH THIS PROPOSED ACTION WOULD REMOVE THE
19 CONDITION PLACED ON THE COMMISSION'S AUTHORIZATION LAST APRIL
20 TO WITHDRAW \$220 MILLION IN EXCHANGE OF ACCOUNT FUNDING MADE
21 BY BART APPROVAL PART OF THE TAX REGULATORY AGREEMENT WHICH
22 WAS REQUIRED AS PART OF FINANCING PARTS REPLACEMENT FOR RAIL
23 CARS. IT'S BEEN DELAYED MAKING IT ADVISABLE TO MAINTAIN THIS
24 CONDITION IN CONDITION OF FACING PROJECTED CASH FLOW NEEDS IN
25 EARLY 2021. HOWEVER THIS PROJECT IS SCHEDULED FOLLOWING



December 9, 2020

1 WITHDRAWAL OF EXCHANGE ACCOUNT FUNDS IT'S CRITICAL TAX
2 REGULATORY AGREEMENT BE COMPLETED. STAFF IS TO RETURN AND
3 DISCUSS RECOMMENDED FINANCING RELATED ACTIONS STARTING NEXT
4 MONTH STAFF RECOMMENDATION TODAY IS TO FORWARD MTC RESOLUTION
5 3738 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THANK YOU AND I'M
6 HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONER
9 PAPAN?

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I UNDERSTAND THE DISBURSEMENT
12 NOW BUT I HAVE QUESTIONS AS TO WHAT BART IS DOING WITH THE OLD
13 CARS. IT SEEMS THEY ARE USING SOME OF OUR STATIONS AS A
14 GRAVEYARD, AND THAT IS NOT A BENEFICIAL USE OF ANY PUBLIC
15 STATION AREA. SO, YOU KNOW, THEY CAN GET ALL THESE NEW CARS,
16 BUT IF THERE IS NO PLACE TO -- OR PLAN, TO GET RID OF THE OLD
17 ONES, THIS IS SEEMING SOMEWHAT RIDICULOUS AND POORLY PLANNED
18 OUT. SO I THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE THAT WE GET A BRIEFING ON
19 WHAT'S HAPPENING WITH THE OLD CARS, WHERE THEY'RE BEING
20 STORED, AND HOW THEY INTEND TO GET RID OF THEM. CAN WE GET
21 THAT BRIEFING OF THAT IN THE NEAR FUTURE, PLEASE?

22

23 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** YES COMMISSIONER WE CAN FOLLOW UP WITH OUR
24 COLLEAGUES AT BART AND GET A REPLACEMENT. I THINK IT'S ALSO
25 GOOD TO NOTE THAT AS THE NEW CARS COME ONLINE, AND THERE IS,



December 9, 2020

1 AS OF THE LAST REPORT, OVER, ABOUT 250 NEW CARS IN SERVICE
2 RIGHT NOW, THEY'RE RETIRING THE OLDEST MOST PROBLEMATIC CARS
3 FIRST AND HAVE A VARIETY OF DISPOSAL OPTIONS SOME OF WHICH ARE
4 FAIRLY CREATIVE, BUT WE'LL FOLLOW UP WITH THEM AND GET THAT
5 REPORT TO YOU.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** WELL, I CAN TELL OF THEIR OLD CARS ARE JUST BEING
8 STORED AT THE MILLBRAE STATION, AND IT'S NOT A GOOD USE OF
9 THAT STATION, OR THE RESOURCES. WE DON'T WANT TO LOOK AT THE
10 CAR GRAVEYARD. SO, IF YOU COULD, PRESS THEM ON THAT, I WOULD
11 GREATLY APPRECIATE IT.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** MAYBE WE COULD HAVE THEM AS AN ART
14 PROJECT IN THE LOBBY OF THE METRO BUILDING. OR STICKING OFF
15 THE SIDE OF THE BAY BRIDGE. LOTS OF INTERESTING OPPORTUNITIES.
16 BART CAR DRIVING OFF NON-EXISTING BIKE PATHS OF THE WESTBOUND.
17 ARE THERE ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS OR PUBLIC COMMENT
18 KIMBERLY?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NO PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS
21 ITEM AND THERE ARE NO HANDS RAISED.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** LET'S TAKE A VOTE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RIGHT AFTER WE GET A MOTION AND SECOND.



December 9, 2020

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** RIGHT. WE DIDN'T GET A MOTION AND
3 SECOND.

4

5 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION.

6

7 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI MAKES THE
10 MOTION AND COMMISSIONER WORTH SECONDS.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE]

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES WITH ONE
15 ABSTENTION AND SIX AYES.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** ITEM 3BMTC RESOLUTION 3108 REVISED,
18 RM2 AMENDMENTS. ANNE WILL PRESENT.

19

20 **ANNE SPEVACK:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MTC HELD A PUBLIC
21 HEARING TO GATHER FEEDBACK PROPOSED CHANGES OF THE RM2 CAPITAL
22 PROGRAM TO MODIFY SCOPE OF PROJECTS AND REASSIGN FUNDS
23 PROPOSED CHANGES WOULD ALLOW SAVINGS UNSPENT FUNDS FOR
24 ADDITIONAL BAY BRIDGE FORWARD PROJECTS AND DO YOU KNOW BART
25 ORIGIN PROGRAM TRANSIT RECOVERY STRATEGIES AND IDENTIFIED BY



December 9, 2020

1 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. THERE WERE NO WRITTEN PUBLIC
2 COMMENTS RECEIVED DURING THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD ENDING
3 NOVEMBER 25TH. A SERIES OF RESPONSES IS INCLUDED IN
4 ATTACHMENT A OF THIS ITEM. THIS ACTION WILL FORMALIZE CHANGES
5 AS PROPOSED DURING THE PUBLIC HEARING UPDATED MTC RESOLUTION
6 3801 REVISED. THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM TODAY PROPOSES TO ALLOCATE
7 BAY BRIDGE FUNDS FOR REVISED PROJECT DESCRIPTION ALLOCATIONS
8 FOR OTHER PROJECTS MODIFIED BY THIS ACTION. STAFF RECOMMENDS
9 THE COMMITTEE REFER RESOLUTION 3801 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION
10 FOR APPROVAL TO FORMALIZE CHANGES PROPOSED AT PUBLIC HEARING.
11 THANK YOU. I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. COMMISSIONERS,
14 COMMENT? DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS
17 RAISED AND HAVE RECEIVED NO PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND?

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** I'LL MOVE IT. AND I'LL MAKE -
22 - DUTRA-VERNACI WILL SECOND IT.

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** MOVED BY SCHAFF, SECOND BY DUTRA-
25 VERNACI. LET'S TAKE A VOTE.



December 9, 2020

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] THANK YOU. THE MOTION
3 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 3C, AGENDA ITEM
6 IS REVISED, RECISSION APPOINTMENT OF RM2 FUNDS FROM I-80
7 EXPRESS LANE PROJECT AND \$4.8 MILLION FUNDS FOR ENVIRONMENTAL
8 AND PRINCIPAL PHASE FOR VARIOUS BAY BRIDGE 2020 PROJECTS.
9 KENNETH KAO WILL PRESENT.

10

11 **KENNETH KAO:** AS THE CHAIR MENTIONED THIS IS RECISSION OF 4.8
12 MILLION IN RM2 FUNDS FOR I-80 EXPRESS LANES IN ALAMEDA AND
13 CONTRA COSTA COUNTY IN ALLOCATION OF THE SAME AMOUNT TO THE
14 BAY BRIDGE FORWARD PROJECT. A HISTORY ON THIS. COMMISSION
15 ALLOCATED 4.8 MILLION ORIGINALLY IN 2018 TO THE I-880 EXPRESS
16 LANES PROJECT SINCE THEN THE PROJECT HAS NOT ADVANCED DUE TO
17 THE NEED FOR ADDITIONAL PLANNING AND ANALYSIS. UNDER THE LAST
18 ITEM, WHICH ANNE SPEVACK DID THIS COMMITTEE RECOMMENDED
19 REVISING THE SCOPE OF RM PROJECT TO THOSE OPERATIONAL
20 IMPROVEMENTS SUCH AS THOSE PROSED BY BAY BRIDGE 2020. THIS
21 MONTH REQUESTS DEALLOCATING FULL \$4 MILLION IN FUNDS AND
22 REALLOCATING FUNDS TO THE ENVIRONMENTAL FOR THE BAY BRIDGE
23 SUITE OF PROJECTS WHICH WILL BE RM2 PROJECT 38.2. MAP OF
24 PROPOSED IMPROVEMENTS IS INCLUDED AS ATTACHMENT ONE STAFF DOES
25 RECOMMEND REFERRING MTC RESOLUTION 4095 REVISED TO THE



December 9, 2020

1 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AND NOTE THIS RECOMMENDATION IS
2 CONTINGENT UPON THE COMMISSION'S APPROVAL THE RESOLUTION 3801
3 REVISED AND JUST RECOMMENDED UNDER ITEM 3B. THANK YOU. I WOULD
4 BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DO I HAVE QUESTIONS FROM
7 COMMISSIONERS? I HAVE A QUESTION. I THOUGHT IT WAS SORT OF
8 INTERESTING, BUT VERY DIFFICULT TO DECIPHER THE KIND OF MEMO -
9 - THE SORT OF APPENDICES TO THE MEMO WHERE IT KIND OF
10 SUMMARIZED WHAT THE CURRENT RM2 EXPENDITURE PLAN IS. AND GIVEN
11 THE CONVERSATIONS WE'RE HAVING LATER IN THIS MEETING, I THINK
12 IT WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL FOR US ALL TO JUST, MAYBE YOU CAN
13 SEND THIS OUT BY E-MAIL AS A FIRST STEP, IF YOU WANT, BUT JUST
14 TO GET AN UNDERSTANDING OF LIKE, WHAT THE CURRENT RM2
15 EXPENDITURE PLAN IS, WHEN THOSE FUNDS ARE GETTING SPENT, AND
16 WHETHER -- AND WHEN THE SORT OF, THE GAPS WILL OPEN UP,
17 WHETHER THERE IS -- WHERE THERE IS NEW MONEY THAT WILL BE ABLE
18 TO BE SPENT FROM FUTURE BRIDGE TOLLS? BASED ON THE RM2
19 INCREASE. BECAUSE THE INFORMATION, I THINK, IS ALL THERE IN
20 THE APPENDIX, BUT I CAN'T MAKE HEADS OR TAILS OF IT IN A
21 STANDARDIZED WAY. IT'S JUST LOTS OF PARAGRAPHS.

22

23 **KENNETH KAO:** STAFF CAN PROPER -- PREPARE THAT AND SEND THAT
24 OUT TO THE COMMITTEE.

25



December 9, 2020

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL. IS
2 THERE ANY COMMENTS ON THIS KIMBERLY?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
5 HAND RAISED AND HAVE RECEIVED NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** I'LL MOVE THE ITEM
10 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

11

12 **AMY R. WORTH:** SECOND.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** MOTION BY DUTRA-VERNACI SECOND BY
15 WORTH. LET'S VOTE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] MOTION PASSES
18 UNANIMOUSLY.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THE ITEM WE HAVE ALL BEEN WAITING FOR,
21 AGENDA ITEM 3D PROPOSED PRINCIPLES FOR REDIRECTING FUNDING TO
22 TRANSIT OPERATIONS FROM COVID-19 EMERGENCY RESPONSE AND
23 UPCOMING OPPORTUNITY CONCEPTS, FOR DISCUSSION. THERESA ROMMEL
24 WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

25



December 9, 2020

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** YES. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THE ITEM I'M
2 PRESENTING TODAY PROPOSES SEVERAL PRINCIPLES FOR IF AND WHEN
3 MTC MIGHT USE ITS DISCRETION TO FLEX FUNDING NORMALLY USED FOR
4 CAPITAL OR OTHER TRANSPORTATION PURPOSES, FOR TRANSIT
5 OPERATIONS. I'LL ALSO BE HIGHLIGHTING AN UPCOMING OPPORTUNITY
6 TO PROVIDE SOME ADDITIONAL FLEXIBILITY TO TRANSIT OPERATORS TO
7 HELP EASE OPERATING SHORTFALLS WITHIN THE PROPOSED POLICY FOR
8 AN UPCOMING MAJOR FEDERAL FUNDING PROGRAM. AND AS WE'RE
9 PAINFULLY AWARE, THE ONGOING SHELTER-IN-PLACE AND DISRUPTION
10 CAUSED BY THE PANDEMIC HAS HAD A TERRIBLE IMPACT ON TRANSIT
11 OPERATING REVENUE. FARES ARE STILL DOWN IN THE 80 PERCENT
12 RANGE SYSTEM WIDE, BRIDGE TOLLS ARE DOWN AT LEAST 20 PERCENT
13 ON THE STATE BRIDGES, AND SPECIFICALLY MORE ON THE GOLDEN GATE
14 BRIDGE. SALES TAXES WHILE THEY HAVEN'T BEEN DOWN AS MUCH AS WE
15 HAVE FEARED THEY WOULD BE ARE STILL LAGGING REGION-WIDE, AND
16 SAN FRANCISCO HAS BEEN HIT PARTICULARLY HARD BY SALES TAX
17 REVENUE LOSSES. WHILE THE TRANSIT SYSTEMS GENERATED AND
18 COLLECTED APPROXIMATELY \$3.7 BILLION ANNUALLY PRE COVID WE'RE
19 FACING REVENUE LOSSES IN THE 400 TO \$600 MILLION RANGE FOR
20 FISCAL YEAR '21 AND UP TO 1.7 BILLION FOR FISCAL YEAR '22. 1.3
21 BILLION IN CARES ACT FUNDING RECEIVED LAST SUMMER WERE A HUGE
22 HELP BUT THOSE FUNDS ARE RUNNING OUT FOR SOME OF THE LARGEST
23 OPERATORS IN THE REGION. TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE BEEN
24 CONTINUING TO ADJUST AND ADAPT BEST THEY CAN. THERE HAVE BEEN
25 SERVICE ADJUSTMENTS AND COST CUTTING STRATEGIES BUT THE



December 9, 2020

1 CONTINUED CONCERN ABOUT RIDERSHIP MAKE IT DIFFICULT TO PREDICT
2 WHAT FUTURE BUDGETARY MEASURES MIGHT BE NEEDED. IF THERE IS NO
3 FURTHER RELIEF COMING FROM THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT AND NO
4 ECONOMIC REBOUND ON THE NEAR HORIZON, TRANSIT OPERATORS WILL
5 BE FORCED AND FACED WITH DIFFICULT DECISION IN FISCAL YEAR '22
6 IF NOT SOONER. WHILE MTC CANNOT PROVIDE RESOURCES SUFFICIENT
7 TO SUBSIDIZE PRE PANDEMIC SERVICE AND BUDGET LEVELS, WE ARE
8 ABLE TO PROVIDE SOME FLEXIBILITY OPERATORS. SO THEY CAN BRIDGE
9 A BUDGETARY GAP TO A NEW FEDERAL RELIEF PACKAGE OR TO PROVIDE
10 A GLIDE PATH TO CORRECTLY SIZE THEIR TRANSIT SERVICE TO NEW
11 DEMAND AND RESOURCE LEVELS. REDIRECTING FUNDS FROM ONE
12 INTENDED INVESTMENT TO ANOTHER OBVIOUSLY COMES WITH CERTAIN
13 TRADEOFFS. MANY OF THEM VERY SIGNIFICANT. AND IT ALSO LEADS TO
14 INCREASED COMPLEXITY IN THE FUNDING PROGRAMS WHERE THE
15 REDIRECTION IS MADE. WE HAVE DEVELOPED SEVERAL PRINCIPLES TO
16 GUIDE COMMISSION DECISION ON WHEN AND IF FUNDS UNDER MTC'S
17 DISCRETION SHOULD BE REDIRECTED. THESE PRINCIPLES SHOULD ALSO
18 BE CONSIDERED ALONGSIDE ADVOCACY EFFORTS TO SECURE ADDITIONAL
19 FEDERAL AID. STAFF PROPOSED THREE PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE
20 COMMISSION DECISIONS ON REDIRECTING FUNDS. THE DETAIL OF WHICH
21 CAN BE FOUND IN ATTACHMENT A TO THIS ITEM. BUT I'LL GIVE YOU A
22 QUICK SUMMARY OF THEM NOW. NUMBER ONE, THE REDIRECTION SHOULD
23 PROVIDE A GLIDE PATH, FUNDING SHOULD SMOOTH THE TRANSITION TO
24 A CORRECTLY SIZED TRANSIT SYSTEM BASED ON SERVICE DEMAND AND
25 AVAILABLE RESOURCES. TWO, CONSIDER THE OPPORTUNITY COST. THE



December 9, 2020

1 BENEFITS OF REDIRECTING CLAIMS TO TRANSIT OPERATIONS SHOULD
2 DEFINITELY OUTWEIGH THE DISBENEFITS AND THREE THERE SHOULD BE
3 OPERATOR BALANCE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS REDIRECTED FROM TRANSIT
4 CAPITAL PRIORITIES TRANSIT OPERATIONS PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE
5 PROMOTE FAIRNESS AMONG BAY AREA OPERATORS. NEXT I WOULD LIKE
6 TO HIGHLIGHT UPCOMING OPPORTUNITY FOR STAFF PRELIMINARY
7 RECOMMENDATION ON HOW MTC COULD PROVIDE INCREASED FLEXIBILITY
8 TO TRANSIT AGENCIES AS THEY STRUGGLE WITH THEIR TRANSIT
9 OPERATING SHORTFALLS. DESIGNATED RECIPIENT FOR FEDERAL TRANSIT
10 ADMINISTRATION FDA FORMULA FUNDS FOR SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA,
11 MTC DEVELOPS TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES, TCP FOR SHORT. FOR
12 STATE OF GOOD REPAIR USED FOR CONSTRAINTS FOR TRANSIT
13 OPERATIONS PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE EXPENSES PREVENTIVE
14 MAINTENANCE OPERATIVE EXPENSE COULD BE APPLIED THEREBY FREEING
15 UP OTHER OPERATING FUNDS FOR THAT PURPOSE. \$450 MILLION ANNUAL
16 AVAILABLE IN TCP FUNDING, BUT NOT SUFFICIENT TO SUSTAIN LONG-
17 TERM OPERATING SHORTFALLS OF CRITICAL EXPENSE CAPITAL
18 INVESTMENTS. STAFF PROPOSES REDIRECTING FISCAL YEAR 2021FTA
19 FEDERAL FORMULA FUNDS PROVIDING ANY SHIFTING OF FUNDING IS
20 TEMPORARY AND WOULD BE PURSUED TO PROVIDE TRANSIT OPERATORS
21 WITH A TOOL TO STABILIZE OPERATING BUDGETS THROUGH END OF
22 FISCAL YEAR 2021 AT WHICH POINT WE WILL HAVE A FEDERAL
23 EMERGENCY RELIEF PACKAGE OR IN THE ABSENCE OF THAT OPERATORS
24 WOULD NEED TO ADDRESS STRUCTURAL SERVICE AND WORK TO ADDRESS
25 THOSE CHANGES. SECONDLY, THE AMOUNT OF TRANSIT CAPITAL



December 9, 2020

1 INVESTMENT TO BE SHIFTED ON AN AGENCY BASIS WOULD BE SPECIFIC
2 TO THAT AGENCY'S UNIQUE CONDITIONS. AND IT SHOULD BE THE
3 TRANSIT AGENCY'S CHOICE TO EXERCISE THAT FLEXIBILITY. WITH
4 THAT SAID, STAFF HAVE DEVELOPED A PROPOSAL TO ALLOW FOR THE
5 SHIFTING OF IT TCP PROGRAM FUNDS TO CAPITAL OPERATIONS TO HELP
6 BRIDGE FISCAL YEAR 2022. WE PROPOSE TO AUGMENT FLEXIBILITY IN
7 TCP POLICY WHICH LEAD INCLUDES PROVISIONS TO ALLOW OPERATORS
8 TO REQUEST PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE FUNDING TO MEET OPERATING
9 SHORTFALLS FOR CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS. THESE FUNDING
10 AUGMENTATIONS INCLUDE MAKING OPERATING FUNDING AVAILABLE IN
11 ADDITION PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE UNDER FDA EMERGENCY RELIEF
12 RULES CONSIDER SPECIAL PANDEMIC FACTORS DURING STAFF REVIEW OF
13 OPERATOR REQUESTS AND OPERATOR DEMONSTRATION. WE WAIVE
14 REQUIREMENT FOR BOARD APPROVED BRIDGING STRATEGIES TO SUSTAIN
15 FINANCIAL RECOVERY FOR FUTURE YEARS AND ALSO WAIVE REQUIREMENT
16 TO ENTER INTO MOU WITH OTHER AFFECT THE OPERATORS AND
17 ELIMINATE THE LIMITATION ON USE OF THE STRATEGY TO TWO YEARS
18 WITHIN A 12 YEAR PERIOD. FOR THOSE AUGMENTED FLEXIBILITY
19 PROVISIONS WOULD REMAIN UNTIL REMOVED BY THE COMMISSION. UNDER
20 THIS PROPOSAL OPERATORS COULD OPT TO USE THEIR TCP FUNDS FOR
21 EITHER CAPITAL OR OPERATING AND PREVENTATIVE OPERATING
22 MAINTENANCE AS GIVEN APPROPRIATE UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES. IF THEY
23 OPT TO SHIFT FUNDS FROM CAPITAL STAFF WILL WORK WITH OPERATORS
24 TO REMOVE OR REFER CAPITAL PROJECTS FROM THE FISCAL YEAR 2021
25 PROGRAM. OPERATORS HAVE EXPRESSED SUPPORT FOR THIS



December 9, 2020

1 FLEXIBILITY. SOME OPERATORS THAT ARE VERY CAPITAL INTENSIVE
2 ARE USING THEIR CAPITAL FUNDS TO SUPPORT A REDIRECTED AND
3 RETAINED WORKFORCE TO DELIVER THEIR CAPITAL PROGRAMS THAT'S
4 HOW THEY'RE AVOIDING ADDITIONAL LAYOFFS THOSE OPERATORS WOULD
5 LIKELY NOT EXERCISE SHIFTING FUNDS FROM CAPITAL TO OPERATING.
6 AS THAT WOULD DISADVANTAGE THEM. MANY SMALLER OPERATORS STILL
7 HAVE CARES FUNDING TO GET THEM THROUGH THE FISCAL YEAR. OTHER
8 OPERATORS HAVE EXPRESS SAID THEY WILL ASSESS THEIR OPTIONS AND
9 WOULD PROVIDE SUFFICIENT FLEXIBILITY FOR FUNDING FISCAL 2022.
10 NOTE I WANT TO MIGHT CONCURRENT TOPIC RELATIONS TO THE TCP
11 PROGRAM CAPACITY. AND THAT IS THE NECESSITY TO ACCOMPLISH THE
12 SUCCESSFUL FINANCING OF THE BART REPLACEMENT VEHICLES.
13 REPLACEMENT OF 775 BART CARS, INCLUDES A ROUGHLY \$1 BILLION
14 COMMITMENT FROM THE TCP PROGRAM. WITH THE FINANCING WOULD DO,
15 ALLOW TCP PROGRAM TO PAY FOR THE BART CARS OVER A 15 YEAR
16 PERIOD INSTEAD OF A FIVE YEAR PERIOD. WITHOUT FINANCING, THERE
17 WOULD LIKELY NOT BE THE CAPACITY IN THE TCP PIPELINE
18 SUFFICIENT TO SHIFT FUNDING FROM CAPITAL TO OPERATING AND
19 FURTHER THE LACK OF FINANCING WOULD MAKE IT DIFFICULT TO
20 ACCOMPLISH ESSENTIAL STATE OF GOOD REPAIR INVESTMENTS. STAFF
21 INTENDS TO RETURN TO THE COMMISSION AND BAIFA IN EITHER
22 JANUARY OR FEBRUARY TO REQUEST AUTHORIZATION FOR THE FINANCING
23 OF THIS COMMITMENT BASED ON A LETTER OF NO PREJUDICE SECURED
24 THROUGH THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION. TO SUMMARIZE STAFF
25 REQUESTS THAT THE COMMITTEE APPROVE THE PRESENTED SET OF



December 9, 2020

1 PRINCIPLES FOR SHIFTING FUNDS TO SUSTAINED TRANSIT OPERATIONS
2 THE APPROVED AS OUTLINED IN ATTACHMENT A, AND TO REITERATE,
3 STAFF BELIEVES THAT THE PRELIMINARY RECOMMENDATION TO MODIFY
4 THE EXISTING TCP PROGRAM CAN BE AN EFFECTIVE BRIDGING
5 MECHANISM, AND WE REQUEST THAT THE COMMITTEE DIRECT STAFF TO
6 DEVELOP AND PRESENT A PROPOSED TCP PROGRAM PROCESS AND
7 CRITERIA FOR FISCAL YEAR 2021, FOR REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATION
8 FOR COMMISSION APPROVAL IN JANUARY, INCLUDING THE FLEXIBLE
9 OPERATING PROVISIONS THEY JUST PRESENTED. SO WITH THAT, I'LL
10 CONCLUDE, AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

11

12 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THANK YOU FOR
13 YOU AND YOUR TEAM'S WORK ON THIS, AND ENGAGING WITH TRANSIT
14 OPERATORS AND ADVOCATES AND LABOR REPRESENTATIVES, AND THE
15 SORT OF BROAD OUTREACH IN DEVELOPING THIS STRATEGY. SO I'M
16 GOING GO TO COMMISSIONERS. COMMISSIONER RONEN?

17

18 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** YES, THANK YOU CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. I JUST
19 HAD A CONCERN AND A QUESTION RELATED TO THE LANGUAGE OF
20 PRINCIPLE ONE. MY WORRY IS THAT THE LANGUAGE SEEMS TO ASSUME
21 THAT WE'RE GOING DOWN A PATH THAT WILL LEAD TO A LOWER LEVEL
22 OF SERVICE AFTER THE PANDEMIC IS OVER. AND WE, YOU KNOW, I
23 WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SURE THAT THE GLIDE PATH DOESN'T LOCK US
24 INTO A SMALLER SYSTEM COMPARED TO PRE COVID LEVELS, BUT IS A
25 BRIDGE TO GET US BACK TO NORMAL LEVELS, PRE COVID SERVICE. AND



December 9, 2020

1 I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT'S WHAT YOU MEAN, IN THIS
2 LANGUAGE OF PRINCIPLE ONE.

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** COMMISSIONER RONEN, I CAN MAKE TAKE THIS
5 QUESTION. BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY IT IS REFLECTIVE OF THE BROADER
6 CRISIS BEFORE US. RETURNING TO PRE PANDEMIC LEVELS IS GOING TO
7 DEPEND ON A NUMBER OF CIRCUMSTANCES, LARGELY OUT OF OUR DIRECT
8 CONTROL. AS YOU KNOW, CLEARLY, IN SAN FRANCISCO, AND OTHERS,
9 THE OVERALL ECONOMY IS REALLY DRIVING WHAT THE FUTURE STATUS
10 OF SUBSIDY SOURCES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT IS GOING TO BE. AND THIS
11 IS ACROSS THE COUNTRY. THIS IS NOT UNIQUE JUST TO THE BAY
12 AREA. SO OF COURSE WHAT WE'RE HOPING FOR IS THAT WE WILL SEE A
13 ROBUST ECONOMIC REBOUND, WHICH WOULD THEN HELP TO UNDERWRITE
14 THINGS LIKE SALE TAXES, THINGS LIKE BRIDGE TOLLS IN PLACE,
15 LOCAL SOURCES SUCH AS PARKING FEES AND OTHER ELEMENTS THAT
16 HAVE BEEN CRITICAL TO UNDERWRITING PUBLIC TRANSIT, GENERALLY,
17 AND OF COURSE, TO ALLOW OUR RIDERSHIP TO COME BACK SO THAT
18 FARES CAN ALSO PLAY INTO THIS. BUT WHAT WE DON'T KNOW, WHAT
19 THE FUTURE LOOKS LIKE. WHAT WE'RE DOING HERE IS TO TRY TO
20 PROVIDE AS MANY TOOLS AS WE CAN TO KEEP THE SHIP A AFLOAT, AS
21 THEY SAY, AS THESE FACTORS COME TO BARE. A CRITICAL PIECE OF
22 THIS IS WHAT'S HAPPENING IN WASHINGTON, D.C. I DON'T THINK WE
23 CAN EMPHASIZE ENOUGH THAT CONTRIBUTIONS FROM WASHINGTON IN
24 TERMS OF SUSTAINING SUBSIDY WILL BE ESSENTIAL TO ALLOWING,
25 AGAIN, THESE MANY ECONOMIC FORCES TO RETURN. BUT THAT IS WHY



December 9, 2020

1 THE LANGUAGE IS FRAMED AS IT IS, THAT WE WILL, YOU KNOW,
2 ADJUST SERVICES TO THE ECONOMIC CONDITIONS, AND THAT WILL
3 HOPEFULLY BE ABLE TO SEE A REALLY ROBUST REBOUND THAT WE ALL
4 HOPE WILL HAPPEN AFTER THIS CRISIS.

5

6 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT AND
7 UNDERSTAND THAT. AT THE SAME TIME, I THINK THAT, YOU KNOW, WE
8 HAVE TO PUT EVERYTHING ON THE TABLE AND RETHINK. WHAT WE
9 UNDERSTAND OUR ECONOMY STARTS TO LOOK LIKE, AS THE VACCINE
10 BECOMES MORE WIDESPREAD, AND LIFE GETS BACK TO WHAT IT WAS
11 PREVIOUSLY, OR AT LEAST BIT BY BIT, THAT RESTORING TRANSIT TO
12 PRE COVID LEVELS HAS TO BE A PRIORITY. AND I JUST -- I HEAR
13 YOU, AND I UNDERSTAND, OF COURSE, YOU KNOW, THAT'S THE REALITY
14 WE'RE LIVING IN, BUT THIS LANGUAGE, FOR ME, IS A LITTLE SELF
15 DEFEATIST, AND SORT OF ASSUMES AND ACCEPTS THAT WE'RE GOING TO
16 HAVE SMALLER -- A SMALLER SYSTEM, AND OF COURSE, MY WORRY IS
17 THAT IF WE SHRINK FROM TRANSIT TOO MUCH, THEN IT'S GOING TO
18 SLIP INTO THE DEATH SPIRAL THAT YOU HAVE BEEN WARNING US OF,
19 AND THAT WE'LL NEVER BE ABLE TO REBUILD THE SYSTEM. AND OF
20 COURSE, THIS'S TERRIFYING. SO I JUST WANT TO HAVE, YOU KNOW,
21 MORE OPTIMISTIC OUTLOOK, WHERE WE REALLY SEE THIS FUNDING
22 CHANGE OR, YOU KNOW, LOOSENING, OR AN ALLOWANCE OF THIS
23 FUNDING FOR OPERATION AS AN INTERIM BRIDGE TO, YOU KNOW,
24 FURTHER SOLUTIONS THAT WE HOPE AND EXPECT TO SEE COMING FROM
25 THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, ET CETERA. WHEN I READ THIS LANGUAGE



December 9, 2020

1 IT DOESN'T MAKE ME FEEL LIKE WE'RE GOING TO DO EVERYTHING IN
2 OUR POWER TO KEEP THE SYSTEM, YOU KNOW, ROBUST, AND TO BUILD
3 IT BACK TO WHAT IT ONCE WAS. IT MAKES ME FEEL LIKE WE'RE
4 ALREADY ACCEPT THAT BEING WE'RE GOING TO DOWNSIZE THE SYSTEM.
5 AND THAT'S THE CHANGE IN PURPOSE THEY WOULD LIKE TO SEE IN
6 TERMS OF A PRINCIPLE.

7

8 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** CAN I JUST ASK, THERESE, WHAT YOUR
9 PERSPECTIVE ON THAT IS?

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I THINK, TO THE DEGREE THAT WE CAN BETTER
12 ARTICULATE THAT WE WOULD, YOU KNOW, BE PULLING ALL TOOLS
13 AVAILABLE TO US TO BEAR, THAT WE COULD PERHAPS BETTER REFRAIN
14 THAT OVERALL INTENT. I THINK THE BALANCE OF THE PRINCIPLES,
15 THOUGH, NUMBER TWO, IS IMPORTANT INsofar AS, TO THE DEGREE, WE
16 CAN GET NEW DEDICATED REVENUE, THAT IS ABSOLUTELY FANTASTIC,
17 AND HEAVEN KNOWS WE ARE PUSHING ALL CYLINDERS TO ADVOCATE FOR
18 THAT CIRCUMSTANCE. IF WE FIND OURSELVES IN THE CIRCUMSTANCE,
19 THOUGH OF RECESSING OTHER FUNDING SOURCES THAT MIGHT BE
20 REDIRECTED, AS WE PRESENTED TO THIS COMMITTEE LAST MONTH, AND
21 WHAT WE HIGHLIGHT IN PRINCIPLE, PARTICULARLY NUMBER TWO, WE
22 JUST NEED TO TAKE CARE AS TO WHAT THOSE TRADEOFFS ARE, AND TO
23 MAKE A VERY INFORMED DECISION AS TO HOW A SWITCH TO OPERATIONS
24 WOULD LINE UP WITH WHAT MAY NOT BE HAPPENING. AS AN EXAMPLE,
25 WITH CAPITAL, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT IS



December 9, 2020

1 MAINTAINING THE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR OF THE SERVICE WE WOULD
2 BE PUTTING OUT ON THE STREET, PARTICULARLY FOR OUR MOST
3 VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES, AND THAT CRITICALLY, IN SAFETY
4 INVESTMENTS, ABSOLUTELY WOULD HAVE TO BE MADE. SO THOSE ARE
5 THE TYPES OF THE VALUE FRAMES WE WOULD ALWAYS NEED TO KEEP IN
6 MIND, AS A COMMISSION, AS WE OVERALL THOUGHT TO GET THROUGH
7 THIS CRISIS AND MAINTAIN TRANSIT AS MUCH AS WE CAN.

8

9 **DIR. HILLARY RONEN:** OKAY. WELL, I JUST WANT TO PUT ON THE
10 RECORD THAT I WORRY THAT THIS LANGUAGE IS A LITTLE TOO
11 PESSIMISTIC. THAT, YOU KNOW, I SEE THE GLIDE PATH AS A BRIDGE.
12 AND, YOU KNOW, WE'LL CONTINUE TO BE OPERATING UNDER THE
13 ASSUMPTION THAT WE ARE GOING TO BE DOING EVERYTHING IN OUR
14 POWER TO RESTORE SERVICE TO PRE COVID LEVELS. AND, YOU KNOW,
15 LOOK AT THE NEW STATE OF THE WORLD AS WE START TO REBUILD
16 AFTER, YOU KNOW, THE VACCINE IS WIDESPREAD ENOUGH, YOU KNOW,
17 TO GET US BACK TO -- BACK TO PRE COVID LIFE. YOU KNOW, I'LL
18 JUST LEAVE IT AT THAT.

19

20 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN, I THINK YOU WERE
21 NEXT IN LINE.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. ALONG THE LINES OF
24 WHAT COMMISSIONER RONEN SAID THERE, I THINK THIS IS THE TIME
25 THAT WE NEED TO SET OUR STANDARDS, EVEN THOUGH THIS IS



December 9, 2020

1 CONSIDERED BRIDGE FUNDING. WE ARE, HOPEFULLY, GOING TO GET
2 ADDITIONAL FUNDING, BUT NOWHERE IN THIS ARE WE ASKING FOR THE
3 BEST INVESTMENT POSSIBLE. AS THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSPORTATION
4 RECOVERY TEAM IS DOING INCREASED EFFICIENCIES, INCREASED
5 ACCOUNTABILITY WITH THIS FUNDING, BRIDGE FUNDING, I THINK WE
6 NEED TO SET THESE LEVELS. EXPECTATIONS ARE MOVING FORWARD. WE
7 ALL KNOW PEOPLE AREN'T GOING TO GET BACK ON TRANSPORTATION IF
8 IT'S NOT MAINTAINED IN GOOD REPAIR BUT THAT'S ALSO ENSURING
9 PUBLIC SAFETY, THE RIDERS, AND THE OPERATORS ARE PROTECTED. I
10 SEE NONE OF THIS IN THERE. WE HAVE, BEFORE US, CIRCUMSTANCE
11 WHERE, IN ADDITION PROVIDING THIS FUNDING, I THINK WE SHOULD
12 CARRY ON WHAT THE RECOVERY COMMISSION IS DOING HERE. THAT WE
13 HAVE EXPECTATIONS ON HOW YOU'RE GOING TO USE THIS BRIDGE
14 FUNDING, NOT ONLY WITH GOOD REPAIR, BUT YOU'RE GOING TO BE
15 HELD ACCOUNTABLE, TO THE PUBLIC SAFETY TO GREATER
16 EFFICIENCIES. IF WE DON'T SET THOSE STANDARDS AT THIS POINT IN
17 TIME, YOU'RE GIVEN BART A WHOLE BUNCH OF NEW CARS. I GET THAT,
18 AND I GET THE FACT THAT THEY NEED TO BE PUT INTO PLAY HERE.
19 BUT NOR, AM I SEEING THE BART BOARD, THEY HAVE CIRCUMSTANCES
20 THEY CAN MOVE TO RIGHT NOW, THEY CAN REMOVE THE PAN-HANDLING
21 ORDINANCE, THEY CAN START ENFORCING THEIR FARES. THERE ARE
22 THINGS OPERATORS CAN BE DOING AT THIS POINT IN TIME THAT
23 AFFECT THE PUBLIC SAFETY, AND ALSO, I THINK, SHOULD BE A PART
24 OF THIS BRIDGE FUNDING. SO IS THAT POSSIBLE AT THIS POINT IN



December 9, 2020

1 TIME? TO TELL THEM THAT WE HAVE CERTAIN STANDARDS THAT GO WITH
2 THIS?

3

4 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** I WOULD -- WOULD YOU LIKE ME TO OFFER A
5 RESPONSE? I WOULD POINT OUT A COUPLE OF THINGS. ONE, THE
6 FLEXIBILITY THAT WE ARE ALLOWING HERE IS A VERY SHORT AND
7 SPECIFIC TIME FRAME. WE'RE LOOKING AT EXERCISING THIS
8 FLEXIBILITY ONLY TO GET US THROUGH THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR, AS
9 ANTICIPATED, MADE PRESENTATIONS BEFORE, TO THIS BODY, THAT
10 ABSENT, AGAIN, SIGNIFICANT INTERVENTION FROM THE FEDS OR THE
11 STATE OR A MASSIVE REBOUND IN THE NEXT SIX MONTHS. WE'RE
12 LOOKING UPWARDS AT \$1.7 BILLION IN THE LEVEL OF REVENUE NEED
13 FOR NEXT FISCAL YEAR, THAT THIS PROPOSAL CAN'T COME CLOSE TO
14 ADDRESSING. SO REALLY, THIS IS AN EXTREMELY TEMPORARY FIX. I
15 WOULD SAY, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, THAT THE POINTS THAT YOU RAISE
16 ARE EXACTLY THE TYPE, THOUGH, OF OVERARCHING CONSIDERATIONS,
17 THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE IS LOOKING TO, IN TERMS OF THE
18 BROADER QUESTION OF HOW IS PUBLIC TRANSIT GOING TO MANIFEST
19 ITSELF INTO THE FUTURE. AS COMMISSIONER RONEN SAID, WE'RE ALL
20 HOPING THAT A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT FACTORS WILL COME INTO BEAR
21 AND THERE WILL BE AN ACCELERATION OF WHAT NOW AN OVERUSED TERM
22 OF A NEW NORMAL EVEN NO WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT EXACTLY IS
23 GOING TO BE. IN TALKING IN THAT SPACE THERE SHOULD BE A SET
24 EXPECTATION OVERALL OF WHAT THE SYSTEMS LOOK LIKE HOW WE WORK
25 TOGETHER ET CETERA. I WOULD SUGGEST THAT YOUR OBSERVATIONS ARE



December 9, 2020

1 REALLY GEARED, IS PART OF THAT BROADER QUESTION WE'RE TACKLING
2 AS PART OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, BECAUSE THE SCALE OF
3 THAT IS MUCH MORE THAN THE DISCRETE EXISTING POLICY AND IF
4 IT'S TO BE AS EFFECTIVE AS A FUNDING BRIDGE, ONE OF THE THINGS
5 THAT WILL INCREASE THE EFFICACY OF THAT, IS THIS BUILDING ON
6 EXISTING POLICY, THE COMMISSION ALREADY HAS, TO THE DEGREE
7 THAT SOME AND WE COULD MOVE QUICKLY TO MAKE THOSE
8 ACCOMMODATION IN THIS SHORT TIME FRAME. I WOULD OFFER THAT
9 OBSERVATION.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** I APPRECIATE THAT, THERESE. I THINK IT'S
12 IMPORTANT, AT THIS POINT IN TIME THAT, WE START SENDING THE
13 MESSAGE, TO THE OPERATORS, YES. WE ARE HERE TO HELP YOU. IT'S
14 CLEARLY STATED, THIS IS NOT GOING TO BE SUFFICIENT FUNDING
15 MOVING FORWARD. THIS IS A TINY BRIDGE. BUT AT THIS POINT IN
16 TIME, I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WE START REITERATING WHAT THE
17 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TEAM HAS BEEN ASKING FOR. AND WE
18 SET OUR EXPECTATIONS UP THERE. YES, YOU'RE GOING TO GET THIS
19 BRIDGE FUNDING. BUT DURING THAT PROCESS, YOU NEED TO START
20 LOOKING AT AND PROVIDING THESE ELEMENTS. AND I THINK THAT'S
21 IMPORTANT AT THIS POINT IN TIME. I'M HOPING COMMISSIONER
22 SPERING WILL SPEAK UP HERE TOO. BUT YOU KNOW, AT A CERTAIN
23 POINT WE HAVE TO START BEING CONSISTENT IN WHAT WE'RE ASKING
24 FOR. EVEN IF THIS IS BRIDGE FUNDING. AND WE KNOW WE NEED TO
25 GET IT OUT QUICKLY, WE ARE GOING TO HAVE TO PUT OUR PRINCIPLES



December 9, 2020

1 INTO THESE PROPOSALS OR THEY'RE NOT GOING TO HAPPEN AT ANY
2 TIME. I'LL ALLOW THE OTHER SPEAKERS.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I CAN
5 ASK ONE CLARIFYING QUESTION BEFORE WE MOVE TO COMMISSIONER
6 SPERING? WHEN ARE THESE FUNDS GOING TO BE MADE AVAILABLE? OR
7 THE FLEXIBILITY, I SHOULD SAY. IS THIS FLEXIBILITY THE
8 OPERATORS CAN AVAIL THEMSELVES OF, YOU KNOW, IN DECEMBER? OR
9 IS IT IN -- IS IT SOMETIME NEXT YEAR?

10

11 **THERESA ROMMELL:** IT WOULD BE HOPEFULLY BY THE END OF THIS
12 FISCAL YEAR, BY THE END OF THIS FISCAL YEAR, THE OPERATORS
13 SHOULD HAVE THE FUNDING IN HAND. WE WILL TAKE A PROGRAMMING
14 ACTION TO THE COMMISSION AND COMMITTEE IN THE SPRING AND TO
15 AWARD THE FUNDING, AND THERE WOULD BE A PROCESS THE OPERATOR
16 HAS TO GO THROUGH WITH THE FTA TO ACTUALLY PUT THE FUND INTO A
17 GRANT AND TO RECEIVE THE GRANT BACK. WE HOPE WITH THE HELP OF
18 OUR FTA PARTNERS WE COULD EXPEDITE THAT PROCESS AS MUCH AS
19 POSSIBLE AND MAKE SURE THAT THE OPERATORS WHO WANT TO AVAIL
20 THEMSELVES OF THIS FLEXIBILITY COULD GET SOMETHING IN HAND,
21 WELL PRIOR TO THE END OF THE FISCAL YEAR.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** SO LIKE SORT OF Q2 NEXT YEAR WOULD BE
24 LIKE A --

25



December 9, 2020

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** BY NO LATER THAN JUNE OF THIS YEAR.

2

3 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** SO IT WOULDN'T BE AVAILABLE FOR
4 OPERATORS, YOU KNOW, JANUARY, FEBRUARY, SORT OF -- WHO ARE
5 STRUGGLING WITH CASH NEEDS RIGHT NOW.

6

7 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I MEAN FOR THOSE OPERATORS THAT ARE
8 STRUGGLING WITH CASH NEEDS THERE MIGHT BE A WAY WE COULD HELP
9 CASH FLOW THEN TO GET TO END OF FISCAL YEE BUT THERE IS
10 LIMITED ABILITY TO DO THAT WE COULD PROBABLY THROW SOME
11 OPERATORS UP WITH THAT.

12

13 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** IT'S WORTH REITERATING, WE'RE REVIEWING THIS
14 AS A TOOL FOR THE TRANSIT OPERATORS TO USE AMONG A NUMBER OF
15 TOOLS BUT THEY'RE ALL KNOW DESIGNED TO PUT FORWARD AND THE
16 COMMISSION WOULD TAKE ACTION TO SAY THIS IS ALLOWED IN AN
17 ENVIRONMENT DEFINITELY NOT ONE SIZE FITS ALL ABOUT HOW THEY
18 CAN STAGE IT, SEQUENCE IT, ET CETERA, TO THE DEGREE IT COULD
19 HELP IN SOME TYPE OF CASH FLOW CIRCUMSTANCE TO THE EXTENT,
20 LOOKING AT EVERY WAY POSSIBLE TO LEVERAGE THE CAPACITY BEING A
21 BRIDGE IN THIS CIRCUMSTANCE.

22

23 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. VERY HELPFUL CLARIFICATION.
24 COMMISSIONER SPERING.

25



December 9, 2020

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WANTED TO
2 TAKE MAYOR SCHAFF COMMENTS FIRST. SHE'S A MEMBER OF THE
3 COMMITTEE AND I'M NOT.

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I WAS GOING BASED ON WHEN I SAW THE
6 LITTLE BLUE HANDS.

7

8 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** I ALWAYS DEFER TO COMMISSIONER SPERING. PLEASE.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU MAYOR SCHAFF. I WANT TO AGREE WITH
11 THE COMMISSIONER, THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE TALKING ABOUT THE
12 NEED TO BE IMPLEMENTED IN FLEXIBILITY, TO THE OPERATORS, BUT
13 THE PURPOSE OF THIS IS TO PROVIDE FLEXIBILITY TO THE OPERATORS
14 AND THIS IS GOING TO COME FROM THEIR REQUEST, IS THAT CORRECT?

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THAT WAS A YES. SO THE QUESTION THAT
19 COMMISSIONER RONEN IS RAISING, ABOUT THE SIZE OF OPERATION,
20 THAT REALLY IS GOING TO BE THE OPERATOR'S DECISION, NOT MTCS
21 IN HOW THEY PROCEED IN HOW THEY RECOVERY FROM THIS PANDEMIC IS
22 THAT CORRECT?

23

24 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** ULTIMATELY THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE GOING
25 TO HAVE TO MAKE, AS YOU JUST POINTED OUT, WHAT DECISIONS OF



December 9, 2020

1 THE NATURE OF THEIR SERVICE, THE AMOUNTS OF THEIR SERVICE, ET
2 CETERA.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I WANT TO MAKE SURE COMMISSIONER RONEN'S
5 POINT IS AN IMPORTANT ONE BUT THAT DETERMINATION WILL NOT BE
6 MADE BY MTC, IT WILL BE MADE BY THAT OPERATOR. THE OTHER
7 QUESTION IS, IN THE REPORT YOU TALKED ABOUT BIG ENOUGH TO
8 MATTER, AND I THINK THERE WAS SOME LANGUAGE ABOUT THE
9 STABILITY DECISION, HOW IS THAT DECISION GOING TO BE MADE? I
10 MEAN, WHO IS GOING TO DETERMINE WHETHER IT'S -- I THINK IT WAS
11 THE TERM YOU USED THAT WAS BIG ENOUGH TO MATTER. HOW IS THAT
12 DETERMINATION MADE?

13

14 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS GOES BACK TO THE PRESENTATION, YOU
15 RECALL, THAT STAFF MADE BACK IN NOVEMBER, AND ALSO TO THE BLUE
16 RIBBON COMMITTEE. WE WERE ASKED TO LOOK AT THE POSSIBLE FUND
17 SOURCES AT THE COMMISSION'S DISPOSAL THAT MIGHT BE ABLE TO
18 HELP IN OPERATING BRIDGE TRANSIT OPERATORS. AND ONE OF THINGS
19 IS THE FUNDING SOURCES POSSIBLY AVAILABLE THEY WOULD NEED TO
20 BE BIG ENOUGH COMPARED TO THE IMPACT THAT THE NEED THAT THE
21 TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE. TO USE THE ANALOGY, IF YOU HAVE A \$100
22 NEED, BUT ONLY A FIVE THERE SOLUTION, THAT, YOU KNOW, AS
23 OPPOSED TO ONE THAT'S A 50 THERE, YOU KNOW, SOLUTION, YOU JUST
24 WANT TO EVALUATE THE SCALE OF BEING ABLE TO HAVE A MEANINGFUL
25 IMPACT ON THE PROBLEM. AND OUR FORMULA PROGRAM IS AT A SCALE



December 9, 2020

1 WHERE SHOULD AN OPERATOR CHOOSE TO USE THE TOOL, THE TOOL
2 OFFICIAL TO BE ABLE TO EFFECTUATE THIS PRIVILEGE SO MAYBE THAT
3 IS A LONG EXPLANATION BUT THAT'S THE CONCEPT.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THERESE DOES THAT COME TO THE COMMISSION FOR
6 THAT DETERMINATION?

7

8 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** AS PART OF OUR PRESENTATION, YES. THERESE,
9 WHY DON'T YOU TAKE THAT.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** OUR STAFF WOULD BE MAKING A RECOMMENDATION
12 THAT YES THIS IS BIG ENOUGH TO MAKE A DIFFERENCE. AND ONE OF
13 THE LAST QUESTIONS IS, YOU KNOW, I THINK EVERYBODY ON THIS
14 COMMITTEE REALIZES THIS IS A SLIPPERY SLOPE WHEN WE START
15 MOVING MONEY FROM CAPITAL PROJECTS TO OPERATIONS. IF WE'RE
16 GOING HAVE A RECOVERY, AN ECONOMIC RECOVERY, THESE CAPITAL
17 PROJECTS ARE GOING PLAY A VERY SIGNIFICANT ROLE IN THAT
18 RECOVERY, AND THAT RECOVERY IS GOING TO HELP GENERATE REVENUES
19 FOR THESE OPERATORS. SO WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE'RE REALLY
20 MAKING THE RIGHT DECISION, THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE SOME
21 LONG-TERM ADVANTAGE TO BOTH THE OPERATORS AND TO THE REGION,
22 AS WE SHIFT THESE FUNDS. I THINK EVERYBODY IS VERY
23 UNCOMFORTABLE ONCE YOU START MOVING MONEY FROM CAPITAL TO
24 OPERATIONS. THE LAST QUESTION, THERESE, IS IF THEY DECIDE TO
25 MAKE THIS SHIFT, HOW IS THIS MONEY RECOVERED? OR WHO IS



December 9, 2020

1 RESPONSIBLE FOR REPLACING IT IN THE FUTURE. COMMISSIONER PAPAN
2 IS RAISING A GOOD POINT. A LOT OF THESE ARE SAFETY PROJECTS, A
3 LOT OF THESE ARE LONG-TERM BENEFITS TO THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS.
4 SO IS MTC GOING TO BE EXPECTED TO REPLACE THAT MONEY? BECAUSE
5 THAT'S GOING TO COME FROM EVERYBODY IN THIS REGION. THAT COULD
6 IMPACT ALL OF US IN A NEGATIVE WAY. SO HOW IS THAT RECOVERY OF
7 THAT MONEY GOING TO BE GENERATED?

8

9 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** LET ME HAVE THERESE COVER THAT. BECAUSE
10 AGAIN ONE OF THE IMPORTANT ELEMENTS REALLY IMPORTANT FACTORS
11 IN BUILDING UP OUR PRINCIPLES WOULD BE TO BUILD UP THAT VERY
12 QUESTION. THERESA DO YOU WANT TO EXPLAIN THAT.

13

14 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I'LL TAKE A CRACK. YOU'RE RIGHT, ANY
15 INCREASES OVERALL CAPITAL NEED FOR THE REGION. WE HAVE A
16 LITTLE BIT OF BENEFIT RIGHT NOW BECAUSE WE'RE AT THE FRONT END
17 OF A CYCLE, SO WE'RE LOOKING AT SHARES OF FUNDING TO BE ABLE
18 TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS A LITTLE BIT EASIER TO ENSURE OTHER
19 OPERATORS ARE NOT SIGNIFICANTLY DISADVANTAGED IN THE PROGRAM
20 BEING CYCLE. I THINK I SAID IN MY PRESENTATION THAT WE WOULD
21 BE WORKING CLOSELY WITH OUR OPERATORS TO EVALUATE WHETHER
22 PROJECTS COULD BE DEFERRED IN OTHER WORDS, YOU KNOW, THE
23 OPERATOR GETS BACK IN LINE IN AN APPROPRIATE TIME WITH THEIR
24 SCORE 16 PROJECT IT MAY NOT BE THE NEXT YEAR IT COULD BE A
25 COUPLE OF YEARS LATER DEPENDING ON HOW FUNDING FOR THE PROGRAM



December 9, 2020

1 LOOKS AND WHAT THE OTHER OPERATOR NEEDS ARE WITHIN THE REGION.
2 SO IT WILL JUST BE A VERY DELICATE BALANCE THAT WE HAVE TO
3 WORK WITH THE OPERATORS TO ACHIEVE SOME OPERATORS ALSO HAVE A
4 SHARE OF THE TCP FUNDING, SKYWAY FUNDING WHICH THEY CAN EITHER
5 ELECT IT DOESN'T IMPACT SCORE 16, MAJOR CAPITAL NEEDS IN THE
6 REGION. SO THERE ARE A COUPLE OF OPTIONS. BUT TO BE TRUTHFUL
7 IT WILL BE A DIFFICULT BALANCING ACT. IF ONE OPERATOR CHOOSES
8 TO USE THEIR FUNDS FOR OPERATING INSTEAD OF CAPITAL.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I THINK THEY'RE GOING TO LOOK AT IT IN THAT
11 DEPTH BUT I HOPE AS THIS MOVES FORWARD IN THE COMMITTEE THAT
12 SOME LANGUAGE IS ADDED, THAT COMMISSIONER PAPAN AS SAID, THERE
13 REALLY NEEDS TO BE LINKAGE TO SOME OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT
14 THE BLUE RIB COMMITTEE IS MAKE BECAUSE THEY'RE VERY IMPORTANT
15 SAFETY ELEMENT THAT IS GOING TO BE A BIG PART OF THE RECOVERY.
16 SO IF IT DOESN'T HAPPEN HERE, IT SHOULD HAPPEN AT THE
17 COMMISSION. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING.
20 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

21

22 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO START BY COMMENDING STAFF
23 MAKING A BALANCED APPROACH. I WANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT IN TOUGH
24 TIMES EVERYONE IS GOING TO HAVE TO HAVE CRITICISM AND YOU ARE
25 PROBABLY LANDING ON THE RIGHT COMPROMISE WHEN EVERYONE IS A



December 9, 2020

1 LITTLE BIT UNHAPPY. I THINK YOU COME UP WITH AN ADMIRABLE
2 BALANCED APPROACH COMMISSIONER SPERING HAS RAISED EXCELLENT
3 POINTS THAT DO DESERVE CONSIDERATION AND FOLLOW UP. I THINK
4 YOUR RECOMMENDED STRATEGIES ARE BEING RESPONSIVE TO THE CRISIS
5 BUT ALSO BEING PRUDENT. WE CANNOT ASSUME THINGS WILL GO BACK
6 TO THE WAY THEY WERE AND FRANKLY LET US TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS
7 MOMENT TO ACCELERATE CHANGES THAT WE KNOW SHOULD HAPPEN. AND
8 YOU KNOW I WANT TO ALSO LIFT UP THE POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS OF
9 SEAMLESS BAY AREA IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO BRING TRANSIT
10 AGENCIES TOGETHER AND HAVE A BETTER COORDINATED AND
11 CONSOLIDATED SYSTEM. I WANT TO COMMEND STAFF'S WORK. I THINK
12 THIS IS HARD. I JUST WANT TO TRY AND PUT ANY CRITICISM THAT
13 YOU'RE RECEIVING IN CONTEXT, BUT I DO THINK COMMISSIONER
14 SPERING RAISED SOME GOOD POINTS. SO, IN GENERAL, THANK YOU FOR
15 THIS EXCELLENT WORK. AND I'M HERE TO SUPPORT YOU. THANK YOU.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SCHAFF.
18 COMMISSIONER WORTH? I WANT TO CONCUR WITH THE COMMENTS.
19 COMMISSIONER STAFF MADE HER POINT WELL, AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN
20 LOOKING AT ELEMENTS WE COULD CONTINUE TO WORK ON ON THE TASK
21 FORCE. AND AS A MEMBER OF THE TRANSIT BOARD I WANT TO COMMEND
22 THE TRANSIT AGENCIES FOR WORKING TOGETHER DURING THIS CRISIS.
23 THIS IS UNPRECEDENTED THIS IS PHENOMENON THE WAY THE TRANSIT
24 AGENCIES, TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE WORKING TOGETHER TO ADDRESS
25 THESE ISSUES, AND I BELIEVE OUT OF THIS WILL COME SOME



December 9, 2020

1 OPPORTUNITIES THAT ARE, THAT WILL BE IDENTIFIED AND PRESENTED
2 BY THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. BUT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO
3 KEEP IN MIND THE FACT THAT THESE FUNDS, ABSENT OUR POLICY
4 CHANGE WOULD NOT BE EASILY AVAILABLE TO PROVIDE THIS BRIDGE.
5 AND WE RECOGNIZE THAT FEDERAL ADVOCACY EFFORTS ARE ESSENTIAL
6 TO THE FUTURE OF TRANSIT IN THESE NEXT FEW YEARS. SO, THIS IS
7 A PIECE, I THINK THIS IS AN EFFORT TO KEEP, TO PROVIDE, ONCE
8 AGAIN, IT'S THE RESPONSIBILITY OF EACH TRANSIT AGENCY TO MAKE
9 THE DETERMINATION IN TERMS OF THEIR PRIORITIES AND THEIR
10 REALITIES. IT'S ESTABLISHED PRINCIPLES WITH THE TASK FORCE
11 WITH REGARDS TO THE TREMENDOUS IMPORTANCE OF MINDFULNESS
12 RELATIVE TO THE SERVICE IMPACTS AND THOSE RIDERS WHO ARE
13 IMPACTED BY SERVICE CUTS, THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT, THE EQUITY
14 CONSIDERATIONS, RELATIVE TO THE SERVICE DECISIONS THAT ARE
15 BEING MADE. SO, I KNOW THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE
16 IMPLEMENTING THIS IN TERMS OF THE PRIORITIES THAT WE AS A
17 REGION HAVE SET FOR EQUITY. SO, I SUPPORT THE STAFF
18 RECOMMENDATION, AND APPRECIATE YOUR HARD WORK TO COME UP WITH
19 A SOLUTION THAT PROVIDES SOME IMMEDIATE RELIEF, ALTHOUGH IT IS
20 IN NO WAY COMPARABLE TO THE CAPACITY OF THE FEDERAL RELIEF
21 THAT WE HOPE AND CONTINUE TO WORK HARD IN WASHINGTON TO
22 ACHIEVE. SECOND OF ALL, RECOGNITION THE IMPORTANCE OF CAPITAL
23 IN THE LONG-TERM HEALTH AND WELFARE OF OUR TRANSIT OPERATIONS.
24 SO THANK YOU.

25



December 9, 2020

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. ONE OF
2 THE THINGS THEY JUST BEFORE -- I GO TO YOU COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
3 VERNACI, IF I MAY. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I'M HEARING IS THERE
4 IS REAL INTEREST FROM A NUMBER OF COMMISSIONERS, INCLUDING ME,
5 TO JUST SORT OF ADD TO THE PRINCIPLES, A -- EITHER A PRINCIPLE
6 OR A SUBPRINCIPLE ABOUT HOW WE WILL CONTINUE TO -- WE WILL
7 THINK ABOUT -- WE WILL CONSIDER HOW THIS BENEFITS THE GOALS OF
8 INTEGRATING OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORKS AS SORT OF EMERGED
9 FROM THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S AN
10 ATTEMPT TO SUMMARIZE THE SENTIMENT. AND I DON'T THINK WE
11 NECESSARILY WANT TO WORDSMITH THAT PRECISE PRINCIPLE RIGHT NOW
12 BUT MY THINKING IS THAT IF SOMEONE WOULD BE WILLING TO INCLUDE
13 THAT IN A MOTION THAT STAFF GOES OFF AND DEVELOPS THAT
14 PRINCIPLE AND BRINGS IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION THAT MIGHT BE
15 AN APPROPRIATE WAY FORWARD. DOES THAT KIND OF CAPTURE WHAT,
16 EITHER WHAT SORT OF COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** I FINISHING WE -- I THINK IF WE COULD HEAR FROM
19 EVERYBODY ELSE FIRST, I COULD COME UP WITH SOMETHING.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I WANT TO ADD THAT TO THE CONVERSATION
22 SO FOLKS COULD RESPOND IF THEY WANT TO. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
23 VERNACI?

24



December 9, 2020

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH CHAIR
2 JOSEFOWITZ. FIRST I WANT TO SAY I APPRECIATE THE THOUGHTFUL
3 CONVERSATION WE'RE HAVING AROUND THIS TOPIC. IT'S CERTAINLY
4 ADDED SOME CLARITY TO MY THINKING. AND I KNOW IT'S ALWAYS BEEN
5 ONE OF OUR GUIDING PRINCIPLES THAT WE KEEP OUR POTS OF MONEY
6 SEPARATE BETWEEN CAPITAL AND OPERATIONS. BUT THE THING THAT'S
7 REALLY COME THROUGH IN THIS CONVERSATION IS THAT THE
8 INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS WOULD BE MAKING THE ASK AND THEY WOULD DO
9 THAT, CERTAINLY, WITH THAT SAME LEVEL, I WOULD HOPE, OF
10 THOUGHTFULNESS, REALIZING CAPITAL VERSUS OPERATIONS PART OF
11 THE EQUATION, AND WE ARE IN TERRITORIES OF FLEXIBILITY, AND
12 KEEPING IN MIND AS WAS TALKED ABOUT IN THE STAFF REPORT, THE
13 BALANCE AND THE OPERATING COST, BECAUSE WHEN THE MONEY IS GONE
14 IT'S GONE. EVERYBODY WHO IS CHOOSING WILL HAVE TO MAKE THE
15 DECISION THAT IS BEST FOR THEM TO SURVIVE UNTIL WE COME OUT ON
16 THE OTHER END WHATEVER THAT'S GOING TO LOOK LIKE. THANK YOU
17 VERY MUCH.

18

19 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BEFORE I GO BACK TO YOU
20 COMMISSIONER PAPAN, I WANT TO BRING UP TWO ADDITIONAL POINTS.
21 AND I, AGAIN, AS I STARTED OFF, I THINK THIS IS REALLY GOOD
22 WORK, AND SORT OF, YOU KNOW, GIVEN THE LIMITED ABILITY -- THE
23 LIMITED RESOURCES THAT WE HAVE, AND THE LIMITED, TO HELP
24 TRANSIT OPERATORS, I THINK THIS IS GOING TO MAKE A MEANINGFUL
25 DIFFERENCE. SO IN ADDITION THE SORT OF THE PRINCIPLE AROUND



December 9, 2020

1 INTEGRATION, WHICH I DO THINK IS REALLY IMPORTANT IN THE BLUE
2 RIBBON TASK FORCE, I DID WANT TO ALSO SUGGEST AND SEE IF,
3 WHEN, TO ADD TO THE SECOND PRINCIPLE AROUND THE COST OF
4 BASICALLY SORT OF THE COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS, THE CONCEPT OF
5 EQUITY, AS WELL, AND THE BENEFITS TO LOW INCOME RIDERS, AND
6 THE COST TO LOW INCOME AND TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS IS, SHOULD
7 BE PARTICULARLY HIGHLIGHTED IN THAT THINKING. AND I THINK
8 THAT'S SOMETHING THAT A LOT OF TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE DOING
9 ALREADY. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SEE THE -- THAT INCLUDED
10 EXPLICITLY IN THAT SORT OF ADDITION TO COST-BENEFIT. AND THE
11 SECOND POINT IS THERE ARE VERY GOOD REASONS TO SWITCH MONEY
12 FROM STATE OF GOOD REPAIR TO OPERATIONS AS WE'RE EXPERIENCING
13 NOW AROUND THE BRIDGE. BUT THERE ARE ALSO LONG-TERM COSTS TO
14 NOT KEEPING YOUR ASSETS IN A STATE OF GOOD REPAIR WHICH
15 DRAMATICALLY EXCEED THE AMOUNT OF MONEY THAT WOULD HAVE TO BE
16 SPENT IN THE SHORT-TERM KEEPING THEM IN A STATE OF GOOD
17 REPAIR. SO I THINK WE NEED TO BE REALLY CONSCIOUS, GUIDING THE
18 OPERATORS NOT TELLING THEM, GUIDING THE OPERATORS TO NOT
19 MAKING DECISIONS WHICH IS GOING TO LEAVE A BIG BUDGET HOLE
20 FOUR OR FIVE YEARS DOWN THE LINE BECAUSE OF SOME SORT OF
21 DISREPAIR ISSUE BECAUSE WE NEED TO BE STEWARDING, LIKE, AS
22 HIGH A LEVEL OF TRANSIT SERVICE AS POSSIBLE, NOT JUST NOW,
23 BUT, YOU KNOW, FOR THE FUTURE AS WELL. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF --
24 SO, THOSE ARE MY TWO SMALL CONCERNS THEY WANTED TO MAYBE ADD
25 TO THIS DISCUSSION AS WELL. SO COMMISSIONER PAPAN?



December 9, 2020

1
2 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. I THINK IF WE ARE ABLE TO
3 ADD A PRINCIPLE, BUT IT IS THE EXPECTATION OF THIS FUNDING
4 THAT THE PROVIDERS SEEK TO ACHIEVE THE GOALS OF THE BLUE
5 RIBBON TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE, OR THEIR RECOMMENDATIONS
6 MOVING FORWARD, I THINK THAT SENDS A MESSAGE WITHOUT TYING
7 THEIR HANDS. BUT WE NEED TO BE VERY CLEAR. AND THAT WOULD
8 INCLUDE YOUR EQUITY ISSUE, IT WOULD INCLUDE OUR PUBLIC SAFETY
9 ISSUES, AND OUR GOALS MOVING FORWARD HERE. AND I DO THINK
10 THAT'S IMPORTANT AT THIS POINT IN TIME, THAT WE SEND THAT
11 MESSAGE. WE ARE, OF COURSE, GOING TO WORK WITH THEM. BUT IF WE
12 ARE NOT CLEAR, THEN WE ARE JUST SENDING MONEY OUT, WITHOUT
13 EXPECTATION. AND I THINK WE NEED TO BE CLEAR ON WHAT THE
14 EXPECTATIONS ARE OF ANY FUNDING THAT MOVES FORWARD. AND IT
15 ALSO SHOWS THE FEDS THAT WE'RE VERY SERIOUS. WHEN YOU GIVE US
16 NEW MONEY, WE WANT TO GET PEOPLE BACK ON PUBLIC
17 TRANSPORTATION, IN THE SAFEST MANNER, MOST EQUITABLE MANNER
18 POSSIBLE. SO IF WE CAN ADD A PRINCIPLE THAT IT IS FOR
19 EXPECTATION THAT THE EXPENDITURE OF THESE FUNDS WILL SEEK TO
20 ACHIEVE THE GOALS OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSPORTATION -- OR
21 RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE, I
22 THINK THAT WOULD BE SUFFICIENT IF THE COMMISSIONERS WOULD
23 AGREE TO THAT. I THINK THAT WOULD COVER US, AND ALSO ALLOW FOR
24 FLEXIBILITY MOVING FORWARD. IS THAT POSSIBLE? THAT WOULD BE MY
25 RECOMMENDATION AND MOVEMENT.



December 9, 2020

1

2 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THERESE WOULD YOU BE -- IS THAT
3 SOMETHING THAT --

4

5 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YEAH. WE'RE INTENDING TO BRING THIS -- THE
6 PRINCIPLES TO THE COMMISSION. SO BETWEEN NOW AND THEN, WE CAN
7 MODIFY PRINCIPLES AS PRESENTED HERE TODAY.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. I THINK COMMISSIONER PAPAN, I
10 THINK IF WE COULD JUST LEAVE STAFF A LITTLE BIT OF LEEWAY TO
11 KIND OF PHRASE IT RIGHT, AND WRITE THE KIND OF, YOU KNOW, THE
12 PARAGRAPH UNDERNEATH T I THINK THAT MIGHT BE -- THAT MIGHT BE
13 BEST. BUT WE SHOULD INCLUDE IT IN THE MOTION THAT THEY SHOULD
14 DO THAT. COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY?

15

16 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU. I DON'T KNOW IF I MISHEARD YOU,
17 NICK, I APOLOGIZE. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, NOT OUR ASSETS;
18 CORRECT? I MEAN -- I THOUGHT I HEARD THAT, AND BY NICK SAYING
19 DEFERRING MAINTENANCE OF BRIDGES AND THINGS LIKE THAT. THAT'S
20 NOT WHAT WE'RE DOING. OR MAYBE I MISUNDERSTOOD NICK.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** I MIGHT HAVE MISSPOKE. I MEANT TRANSIT
23 ASSETS NOT OPERATORS ASSETS.

24



December 9, 2020

1 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** I'LL USE GOLDEN GATE WHICH CAME TO MIND FIRST,
2 LAFTA WANTS TO USE MONEY FOR BUSES THEY CAN GO AHEAD. AND PUT
3 IT TOWARDS OPERATIONS, IT STAYS WITHIN THEIR POTS, CORRECT?

4

5 **AMY R. WORTH:** YES.

6

7 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THANK YOU.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** SO --

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** MAKE A MOTION? OR DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT?

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT. WHY DON'T WE
14 MAKE A MOTION NOW BECAUSE IT'S FRESH IN OUR MINDS, AND THEN
15 WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** WOULD IT BE APPROPRIATE TO, IF I MAY, MR. CHAIR,
18 MAKE THE MOTION TO APPROVE WITH AN EXPECTATION THAT A FOURTH
19 PRINCIPLE BE ADDED; STAFF WILL WORK THROUGH THAT IT WILL BE
20 CONSISTENT WITH THE BLUE RIBBON'S RECOMMENDATIONS.

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** TO ADD STAFF WOULD ADD EQUITY
23 CONSIDERATIONS TO PRINCIPLE TWO? FOR THE MOTION?

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** OH YES. I WOULD INDEED. THANK YOU.



December 9, 2020

1

2 **AMY R. WORTH:** MR. CHAIR, MAY I ALSO JUST ADD, WE HAD TALKED AT
3 THE VERY BEGINNING, THE DISCUSSION ABOUT MAYBE SOME SLIGHT
4 MODIFICATIONS TO THE FIRST BULLET, WE DON'T WANT TO PRECLUDE
5 ANY OPTIMISTIC APPOINTMENT TO HILLARY POINTS.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WHAT COMMISSIONER RONEN BROUGHT UP.
8 COMMISSIONER PAPAN WOULD YOU AGREE TO ADD?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** I ABSOLUTELY WOULD BE. THAT WOULD BE MY MOTION. IF
11 THERE IS A SECOND.

12

13 **AMY R. WORTH:** I WILL SECOND THAT.

14

15 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE THREE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
18 CURRENTLY WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. ROLAND LEBRUN, PLEASE
19 UNMUTE YOURSELF. MR. LEBRUN, ARE YOU THERE? YOU'RE UNMUTED ON
20 THIS END.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** SORRY ABOUT THAT. CAN YOU HEAR ME NOW?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES.

25



December 9, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** OKAY GREAT. OKAY. SO THE FIRST THING WOULD LIKE TO DO
2 IS GIVE A HUGE SHOUT OUT TO MTC FOR ACTUALLY REACHING OUT TO
3 THE VTA, GETTING DOWN TO THE BOTTOM OF WHAT'S GOING ON WITH
4 THE CARES ACT FUNDING. AND THIS ACTUALLY CAME OUT OF THE LAST
5 BOARD MEETING, WHICH LAST THURSDAY WAS, 8.7. WHAT YOU CAN SEE
6 THERE AT THE VTA, IS A COMPLETELY DIFFERENT PICTURE. THEIR
7 CAPITAL BUDGET IS OBVIOUSLY IN FREE FALL YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT
8 A CHAPTER IN ORDER OF MAGNITUDE, ON THE OPERATION SIDE THEY'RE
9 LOOKING VERY, VERY GOOD. AND IF YOU LOOK AT THEIR PROJECTIONS
10 FOR FY '21, THEY ARE PROJECTING BRIDGING FUNDING BALANCE AND
11 OPERATIONS SURPLUS LEFT OVER OF \$124.5 MILLION. SO THE POINT
12 I'M GETTING AT HERE IS ONE SIZE FITS ALL PROBABLY DOESN'T WORK
13 HERE. AND WHAT WE NEED TO DO IS GO AND LOOK AT ALL THE
14 AGENCIES, SEE WHAT THE SITUATION IS, ISN'T LIKE, ON THE
15 OPERATING, AND ON THE CAPITAL SIDE AND THEN COME UP WITH A
16 RECOMMENDATION. AND TO BE HONEST WITH YOU, THIS IS NOT GOING
17 TO BE A WASTED EFFORT, BECAUSE IN THE LONG-TERM THIS WILL
18 INFORM US WITH HOW WE'RE GOING TO GO AHEAD WITH A REGIONAL,
19 YOU KNOW, MEGA TAX MEASURE, WHATEVER IT'S GOING TO END UP
20 BEING. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RICHARD
23 MARK ANTONIO. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

24



December 9, 2020

1 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR AND COMMISSIONERS. I THINK WHAT
2 I'M HEARING, AND FIRST OF ALL, I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
3 BRINGING THIS FORWARD. AND, YOU KNOW, COMMISSIONER RONEN, I
4 THINK APPROPRIATELY RAISED THE QUESTION OF, ARE WE MAKING
5 EVERY TOOL AVAILABLE, AND I HEARD THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR STATE
6 THAT THAT WAS IN FACT THE INTENTION. SO IN TERMS OF THE
7 PROPOSED AMENDMENT, I WOULD JUST POINT OUT THAT IF THE
8 AMENDMENT DOES NOT APPLY TO EVERY AGENCY, REGARDLESS OF
9 WHETHER THEY CHOOSE OPERATING FLEXIBILITY WITH THESE FUNDS,
10 THEN NOT ONLY WON'T IT ACHIEVE ITS PURPOSE, BUT IT WILL
11 ACTUALLY DISCOURAGE THE USE OF THE TOOLS THAT ARE BEING
12 OFFERED. SO THAT AMENDMENT SHOULD INCLUDE ALL THE AGENCIES, OR
13 NONE. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS HALEY
16 CURRIER, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **HAYLEY CURRIER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS THIS IS HALEY C
19 POLICY ADVOCACY MANAGER AT TRANSFORM. I WANT TO THANK STAFF
20 FOR GIVING OPERATORS FLEXIBILITY THEY NEED TO CONTINUE
21 OPERATIONS DURING THE PANDEMIC. FOR THOSE WHO RELY ON TRANSIT
22 NOW, THERE ARE PLENTY OF FOLKS, AS WE MOVE INTO RECOVERY. I
23 WANT TO HIGHLIGHT RICHARD'S COMMENTS IN OUR GOALS TO ENSURING
24 EVERYTHING WE DO IN OUR POWER TO ENSURE RECOVERY LEVELS AS
25 SOON AS POSSIBLE AND THAT'S HOW WE SHOULD BE FRAMING OUR WORK



December 9, 2020

1 WHILE I APPRECIATE THE REALITY OF WHAT IS OUT OF OUR CONTROL I
2 APPRECIATE WHAT WE DO HAVE CONTROL OF IN PRIORITIZE PUBLIC
3 TRANSPORTATION SURVIVES THE CRISIS THROUGH MTC'S PROGRAMS AND
4 VOCS AT THE STATE LEVEL, AND THE REGION PLANNING SERVICE TO
5 RETURN TO PRE COVID LEVELS, AS WE COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS THAT
6 ALIGN TRANSPORTATION FUNDING WITH EQUITY AND GREENHOUSE GAS
7 REDUCTION GOALS THIS IS AN IMPORTANT STEP AND LOOK FORWARD TO
8 MTC PUSHING FOR OPTIONS AT THE STATE LEVEL AS WE WAIT FOR
9 FEDERAL SUPPORT AND THE RESULT IN GEORGE A I WOULD LIKE TO
10 SUPPORT COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ'S REQUEST FOR REQUESTING
11 EQUITY TRADEOFFS AS LOW INCOME RIDERS DETERMINATION IN THE
12 COST BENEFITS ANALYSIS. I BELIEVE THE INTENTION IS NO ENSURE
13 OPERATORS CAN MAXIMIZE SERVICE AND MINIMIZE LAYOFFS WITH THE
14 FLEXIBILITY THEY REQUEST AND I THINK THAT WILL HELP US ACHIEVE
15 THAT GOAL. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MR. CHAIR, THERE ARE NO
18 ADDITIONAL MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THIS HANDS RAISED. I DID
19 RECEIVE ONE WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT. A SUPPORT LETTER SIGNED BY
20 GM'S OF THE REGION PUBLIC TRANSIT AGENCIES. IT HAS BEEN POSTED
21 TO THE ONLINE AGENDA, AND IT WILL E-MAILED TO THE
22 COMMISSIONERS.

23

24 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND THANK YOU TO
25 TRANSFORM AND PUBLIC ADVOCATES FOR ALL YOUR WORK TO TRY AND



December 9, 2020

1 SECURE ADDITIONAL TRANSIT FUNDING BOTH EMERGENCY AND LONG-
2 TERM. SO LET'S GO, IF THERE IS NO OTHER COMMENTS FROM
3 COMMISSIONERS, PAUSING A LITTLE. SEEING NONE. SO LET'S TAKE A
4 VOTE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [ROLL CALL VOTE] ON MOTION PASSES
7 UNANIMOUSLY.

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** TERRIFIC. MOVING ON TO AGENDA FOUR A,
10 CTC UPDATE. KENNETH KAO. NOW WE HAVE TIME FOR THIS ONE.

11

12 **KENNETH KAO:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. I WILL BE BRIEF. I DID
13 WANT TO REPORT ON SOME GOOD NEWS. THE DECEMBER CTC MEETING
14 HAPPENED LAST WEEK, AND THE COMMISSION ADOPTED THE STAFF
15 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE SENATE BILL ONE COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS
16 WHICH MEANS THAT OVER IN THE BAY AREA WE RECEIVED 11 PROJECTS
17 TOTALING \$407 MILLION OUT OF A TOTAL OF \$2 BILLION AVAILABLE
18 STATEWIDE. SO THAT'S ABOUT 20 PERCENT OF THE AMOUNT THAT'S
19 AVAILABLE. SO REALLY GREAT NEWS. A LOT OF PROJECTS CAN NOW
20 MOVE FORWARD WITH THOSE STATE FUNDS. PRETTY MUCH EVERY COUNTY
21 IN THE REGION GOT A PROJECT THE ONLY COUNTY THAT DID NOT
22 RECEIVE A PROJECT WAS SAN MATEO ALTHOUGH I WANT TO NOTE SAN
23 MATEO RECEIVED \$220 MILLION FROM CYCLE ONE. WE DID WRITE A
24 LETTER OF SUPPORT TO THE COMMISSION, THE CTC, IN SUPPORT OF
25 STAFF RECOMMENDATION. I'M HAPPY TO REPORT THEY DID APPROVE



December 9, 2020

1 THAT. REALLY QUICKLY, CTC EQUITY ADVISORY RUNAWAY TABLE CTC
2 APPROVED ITS MEMBERSHIP LIST FOR THE EQUITY ROUND TABLE
3 STARTING TO MEET EARLY NEXT YEAR A GROUP OF 18 STATE EXPERTS,
4 AND SUBJECT MATTER EXPERT PRACTITIONERS AROUND THE STATE AND
5 WE EXPECT THAT TO BE KICKING OFF SOON. AND ALWAYS THE
6 ALLOCATIONS EXTENSIONS AND AMENDMENTS ARE ATTACHED FOR YOUR
7 REVIEW. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE CTC WILL BE AT THE END OF
8 JANUARY AND WE WILL BE REPORTING BACK TO YOU IN THE FEBRUARY
9 MEETING. WITH THAT HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

10

11 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

12

13 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. KENNY, THANK YOU VERY MUCH
14 FOR THAT REPORT. AND OBVIOUSLY THE CTC ACTIONS ARE SO
15 IMPORTANT TO OUR REGION, BECAUSE WITH SB1 AND THE ADDITIONAL
16 RESOURCES THAT CAN COME INTO TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT
17 PROJECTS IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE
18 TALKED ABOUT IS REALLY THE PRIORITY AND THE OPPORTUNITY FOR
19 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS DURING THIS TIME. YOU KNOW,
20 CITIES ARE INCORPORATING SLOW STREETS, THEY'RE CLOSING
21 STREETS, THEY'RE, YOU KNOW, PEOPLE ARE WALKING, PEOPLE ARE
22 GETTING ON BICYCLES, AND THOSE ARE REALLY IMPORTANT PROJECTS
23 FOR COMMUNITIES. AND OBVIOUSLY THE FLIP SIDE OF THAT IS THAT
24 CITIES, PARTICULARLY, AND COUNTIES, ARE SUFFERING SEVERE
25 FINANCIAL ISSUES AND SO PERHAPS THEY MIGHT NOT HAVE SOME OF



December 9, 2020

1 THE READY RESOURCES TO EITHER MATCH OR TO IMPLEMENT SOME OF
2 THESE IMPORTANT BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN PROJECTS THAT REALLY COULD
3 SIGNIFICANTLY IMPROVE THE QUALITY OF LIVES OF OUR COMMUNITIES
4 AND OUR RESIDENTS. SO HAS THERE BEEN ANY DISCUSSION AT THE
5 CTC? I KNOW ALLOCATION IN YOUR REPORT EXTENSIONS FOR SOME OF
6 THE SPECIFIC ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMS, BUT HAS THERE
7 BEEN ANY THOUGHT OF HOW TO ACCELERATE FUNDS TO FUND SOME OF
8 THESE PROJECTS AROUND THE STATE?

9

10 **KENNETH KAO:** I BELIEVE THERE ARE SOME DISCUSSIONS. AND I
11 BELIEVE IN THE CTC'S ANNUAL REPORT THEY DID MENTION THE NEED
12 OF ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM
13 WHICH IS THE STATEWIDE PROGRAM THAT SPECIFICALLY FUNDS THESE
14 TYPES OF PROJECTS. THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM IS
15 CURRENTLY, THE APPLICATIONS ARE DUE OVER THE SUMMER, AND WE
16 SHOULD BE HEARING THOSE AWARDS HOPEFULLY IN THE FEBRUARY TIME
17 FRAME. SO WE ARE LOOKING FORWARD TO SOME HOPEFULLY POSITIVE
18 NEWS OUT OF SACRAMENTO FOR SOME ADDITIONAL FUNDS FOR OUR
19 REGION. MTC ALSO HAS A SLICE OF THAT ATP MONEY AND WE ARE
20 WHOLLY RELEASING THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS IN FEBRUARY.

21

22 **AMY R. WORTH:** I HOPE MAYBE WE CAN REACH OUT TO OUR
23 COMMISSIONERS LOCALLY ON THIS TO CONVEY HOW IMPORTANT IT IS TO
24 OUR COMMUNITIES THAT WE TRY TO REALLY ACCELERATE FUNDS TO MAKE



December 9, 2020

1 THESE INVESTMENTS THEY ARE SO VITAL TO OUR COMMUNITY RIGHT
2 NOW. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. I WANT TO
5 BUILD ON THAT, IS THERE ANY CONSIDERATION OF MAKING MONEY
6 AVAILABLE JUST FOR BY CAPITAL ATP PROJECTS, FOR SORT OF BIKES
7 THEMSELVES E E-BIKES THEMSELVES? THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF OTHER
8 PLACES IN THE WORLD WHICH HAVE PUT IN PLACE, FOR MEANINGFUL
9 BIKE SUBSIDY PROGRAMS AS PART OF THEIR RESPONSE TO THE
10 PANDEMIC, TO HELP PEOPLE ACTUALLY ACCESS, ESPECIALLY LOW
11 INCOME FOLKS ACCESS THE BIKE VEHICLES THEMSELVES.

12

13 **KENNETH KAO:** I'M NOT AWARE OF ANY RIGHT OFF THE TOP OF MY HEAD
14 WHERE WE CAN FUND BIKES SPECIFICALLY. I DO KNOW THAT, AS A
15 PART OF THE ATP CYCLE, THERE WAS A PILOT PROGRAM FOR QUICK
16 BUILD TYPE OF PROJECTS WHERE YOU CAN GET SOMETHING OUT THERE
17 RELATIVELY QUICKLY, AND GET SOME ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
18 IMPROVEMENTS SOON. SO THAT WAS FUNDED. WE GOT ABOUT, I THINK
19 HALF OF THE MONEY AVAILABLE, FROM THAT, FROM THE STATE, SO
20 THAT'S GREAT. AND I UNDERSTAND THAT OUR DELIVERY -- DESIGN AND
21 PROJECT DELIVERY TEAM IS ALSO LOOKING AT SOME KIND OF QUICK
22 BUILD INITIATIVES. SO THOSE ARE THE TYPE OF, KIND OF, REALLY
23 SOON TYPES OF PROJECTS THAT WE ARE WORKING ON TO GET
24 IMPROVEMENTS OUT THE DOOR AS SOON AS POSSIBLE. NICK
25 JOSEFOWITZ: I THINK THOSE ARE TERRIFIC. AND I THINK IT WOULD



December 9, 2020

1 BE JUST GREAT IF YOU COULD HIGHLIGHT THOSE SORT OF THE
2 RESPONSE THE CTC IS HAVING TO THE QUESTIONS THAT COMMISSIONER
3 WORTH AND I HAVE BROUGHT UP IN YOUR NEXT REPORT, THAT WOULD BE
4 TERRIFIC. OKAY. COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY?

5

6 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OKAY, MR. CHAIR, ARE YOU DONE WITH ALL THIS?
7 ARE WE GOING TO MOVE ON? ARE WE ON PUBLIC COMMENT NOW?

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE'RE NOT ON PUBLIC COMMENT. WE STILL
10 HAVE AGENDA ITEM 4B AFTER THIS WHICH IS A --

11

12 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** OH YEAH, YOU'RE RIGHT. OKAY. I'LL BE PATIENT.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. SO, IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
15 ON ITEM 4A, KIMBERLY?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
18 HANDS RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS
19 FOR THIS ITEM.

20

21 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** TERRIFIC. THANK YOU, KENNETH, SO MUCH
22 FOR YOUR WORK ON THIS. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM 4B DRAFT 2021,
23 AIR QUALITY ANALYSIS PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 IN THE DRAFT 2021
24 TIP. ADAM CRENSHAW WILL PRESENT THIS ITEM.

25



December 9, 2020

1 **ADAM CRENSHAW:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. I'M ADAM CRENSHAW
2 WITH THE FUNDING AND POLICY PROGRAM SECTION. THIS SERVES AS A
3 PRESENTATION FOR THE DRAFT 2021 TIP AND DRAFT STATEMENT OF
4 EQUALITY CONFIRMATION ANALYSIS RELEASED TO THE PUBLIC NOVEMBER
5 9TH COPIES ARE AVAILABLE ON THE WEB SITE AND INCLUDED IN YOUR
6 PACKETS. TIP IS THE REGION'S FOUR YEAR SPENDING PLAN FOR
7 SERVICE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS THAT ARE EXPECTED TO RECEIVE
8 FEDERAL FUNDING, REQUIRE A FEDERAL ACTION OR A CONSIDERED
9 REGIONALLY SIGNIFICANT FOR AIR QUALITY. IMPROVEMENTS FOR LOCAL
10 ROADWAYS STATE HIGHWAYS AND BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN FACILITIES.
11 MTC HAS DEVELOPED THE DRAFT 2021 TIP IN COOPERATION WITH
12 PARTNER AGENCIES AND CONSULTATION FEDERAL AGENCIES AND COVERS
13 FISCAL YEAR 2020 THROUGH 2024. CONTAINS 330 PROJECTS FROM OVER
14 100 SPONSORS TOTALING \$10.3 MILLION FROM FEDERAL STATE
15 REGIONAL AND LOCAL FUNDING AS WELL AS 400 PROJECTS SHOWN FOR
16 INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES ONLY. THE VAST MAJORITY OF FUNDING
17 INCLUDED IN THE TIP SPECIFIC ELIGIBILITY REQUIREMENTS
18 ESTABLISHED IN FEDERAL REGULATIONS IN STATE STATUTE OR BY
19 VOTER APPROVAL AND ARE CONTROLLED BY GOVERNING BODIES OTHER
20 THAN MTC SUCH AS FEDERAL HIGHWAY ADMINISTRATION, CALIFORNIA
21 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, CALTRANS, COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
22 AGENCIES OR LOCAL TRANSIT DISTRICTS. FURTHERMORE, THE TIP
23 ITSELF DOES NOT SELECT SPECIFIC TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENTS
24 FOR IMPLEMENTATION IT'S RATHER A COMPILATION OF PROJECTS FROM
25 ACTIONS TAKEN BY GOVERNING BODIES THROUGH THE PROJECT



December 9, 2020

1 SELECTION PROCESS THROUGH A PARTICULAR FUND SOURCE. PROJECT
2 SELECTION OCCURS THROUGH SEPARATE ACTION BEFORE BEING INCLUDED
3 IN THE TIP SUCH AS THROUGH REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT
4 PROGRAM, TRANSIT CAPITALS PRIORITIES, TRANSIT CAPITAL
5 PRIORITIES PROGRAM, AND THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM. ALL
6 PROJECTS IN THE TIP ARE CONSISTENT WITH THE AMENDED PLANNED
7 BAY AREA 2040 AS REQUIRED BY FEDERAL REGULATIONS. THE TIP IS
8 REQUIRED TO BE FINANCIALLY CONSTRAINED MEANING THAT THE AMOUNT
9 OF FUNDING IN THE PROGRAM DOES NOT EXCEED THE AMOUNT
10 REASONABLY TO BE EXPECTED TO BE AVAILABLE ANALYSIS
11 DEMONSTRATING DRAFT 2021 TIP MEETS THESE REQUIREMENTS IS
12 INCLUDED IN THE P APPENDIX TO THE TIP DOCUMENT. MTC IS
13 REQUIRED TO ANALYZE THE TIP AND REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN
14 TO DETERMINE THAT THE REGION IS IN COMPLIANCE WITH FEDERAL AIR
15 QUALITY REQUIREMENTS FOR OZONE AND FINE PARTICULATE MATTER OR
16 PM 2.5. MTC HAS CONDUCTED THIS ANALYSIS IN ACCORDANCE WITH EPA
17 TRANSFORMATION REGULATIONS AND BAY AREA QUALITY PROCEDURES
18 ADOPTED IN RESOLUTION 3757. STAFF CONSULTED WITH THE BAY AREA
19 AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT AS PART OF THE PROCESS BASED
20 ON THE DRAFT ANALYSIS STAFF FIND COMMISSION CAN PICK POSITIVE
21 CONFIRMATION OF THE PLAN AND PRECURSORS MEANING FORECASTED
22 EMISSIONS ARE BELOW THE REQUIRED LEVELS. WE ALSO REPORT THAT
23 ALL TRANSPORTATION CONTROL MEASURES HAVE BEEN FULLY
24 IMPLEMENTED. IN MOVING AHEAD FOR PROGRESS IN THE 21st CENTURY
25 ACT ALSO KNOWN AS MAP 21 STAFF RESOLVED PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT



December 9, 2020

1 ARRANGEMENTS FOR TRANSPORTATION, METROPOLITAN ORGANIZATIONS
2 AND TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES FEDERAL REGULATIONS REQUIRE MPOS
3 TO SHOW THE TIP MAKES PROGRESS TOWARDS ACHIEVING PROJECTS
4 PERFORMANCE TARGETS AND MEETS MAXIMUM EXTENT PRACTICABLE AND
5 ANTICIPATED EFFECTS OF THE TARGET PERFORMANCE. INCLUDING
6 PERFORMANCE MEASURES AS WELL AS DRAFT 2021 TIP INVESTMENTS. TO
7 FURTHER ASSIST IN THE INVESTMENT OF THE DRAFT 2021 TIP
8 SPECIFICALLY TO ADDRESS THE EQUITY IMPLICATIONS THAT PROSE
9 INVESTMENTS MTC STAFF HAS INVESTIGATED ANALYSIS FOR LOW INCOME
10 AND MINORITY AND DISADVANTAGED POPULATIONS, QUESTIONS ARE ARE
11 THEY SHARING EQUITABLY IN THE TIP. ANALYSIS DEMONSTRATES THERE
12 IS NOT AN IMPACT ON THE DISTRIBUTION OF FEDERAL AND STATE
13 FUNDING FOR FEDERAL TRANSPORTATION PURPOSES FOR MINORITY AND
14 NON-MINORITY POPULATIONS A BRIEF SUMMARY OF THE DRAFT 2021 TIP
15 INVESTMENT ANALYSIS AS WELL AS FEDERAL PERFORMANCE REPORT AND
16 THE GUIDE TO THE TIP ARE INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKETS. OUTREACH
17 FOR THE DRAFT 2021 TIP AND DRAFT CONFORMITY ANALYSIS IS IN
18 ACCORDANCE WITH THE MTC PARTICIPATION PLAN AND SACRIFICE THE
19 PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT REQUIREMENTS FOR THE FEDERAL TRANSIT
20 ADMINISTRATION PROGRAMS PROJECTS FOR APPLICABLE SOURCES.
21 COMMENTS ON THE TIP ANALYSIS WILL BE ACCEPTED THROUGH 5:00
22 P.M. MONDAY DECEMBER 14TH, 2020 FINAL TIP WILL BE BROUGHT TO
23 THE COMMISSION IN FEBRUARY FOR APPROVAL. THIS IS AN
24 INFORMATION ITEM OFFERING OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND



December 9, 2020

1 NO COMMITTEE ACTION IS REQUIRED TODAY. THANK YOU, AND THIS
2 CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION.

3

4 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH ADAM. VERY CLEAR
5 PRESENTATION, AND WHAT LOOKS LIKE VERY GOOD WORK, ALWAYS GOODS
6 THAT WE ARE IN CONFORMITY WITH OUR AIR QUALITY AND/OR IN
7 CONFORMITY WITH OUR AIR QUALITY ANALYSIS I'M NEVER QUITE SURE
8 WHAT WE'RE CONFORMING WITH. ANY QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS ON THAT?
9 TERRIFIC. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT KIMBERLY?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT WRITTEN, RECEIVED, AND
12 NONE WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

13

14 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** GREAT. LET'S MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM
15 NUMBER FIVE. COMMISSIONER HAGGERTY. CHAIR HAGGERTY? CHAIR
16 HAGGERTY, YOU MAY BE MUTED.

17

18 **JAKE MACKENZIE:** STILL ADMIRING MY HAIRCUT.

19

20 **SCOTT HAGGERTY:** THAT IS TRUE. AND I JUST SAID SOME REALLY
21 INTUITIVE STUFF, AND YOU MISSED IT ALL. NO. I JUST WANT TO
22 REMIND EVERYBODY THAT'S ON THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, AND
23 SPECIAL THANKS TO COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ FOR BEING VERY
24 TIMELY, BUT I NEED YOUR REVIEWS OF OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS TO
25 GIVE THEM -- OF OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, GET THEM IN AS SOON AS



December 9, 2020

1 POSSIBLE. SO I CAN CORRELATE THE INFORMATION AND PUT TOGETHER
2 A PACKET FOR YOU, FOR OUR MEETING. WHAT, THERESE? ON THE 16th?
3 IS THAT THE RIGHT DATE? YEAH. ON THE 16th. SO PLEASE GET THOSE
4 IN DON'T WAIT FOR THE LAST MINUTE BECAUSE IF YOU WAIT FOR THE
5 LAST MINUTE, I MAY EXCLUDE YOU.

6

7 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENT? PUBLIC
8 COMMENT? OTHER BUSINESS? KIMBERLY?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
11 HAND RAISED AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

12

13 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ, CHAIR:** WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN PROGRAMMING AND
14 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE THE NEXT MEETING WILL BE HELD WEDNESDAY
15 JANUARY 13th 2020 9:45 A.M. REMOTELY BY WEBCAST AS APPROPRIATE
16 OR DEPENDING ON THE STATUS. THANK YOU. HAVE A GOOD AFTERNOON.

17 [ADJOURNED]

18



Broadcasting Government