

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MARCH 08, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 08, 2023, 1:30 PM

CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN: GOOD DAY THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS CALLED TO ORDER. THE MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC MEETING WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED BY THE LAST DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. WE'RE MEETING REMOTELY AND ROLL CALL WILL BE CALLED IN THE SAME WAY WE'RE USED TO DOING IT. ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: BALDINI?

MICHAEL BALDINI: HERE.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CAMPOS?

PAMELA CAMPOS: PRESENT.

CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: DEUTSCH-GROSS? IS EXCUSED. ELDRED?

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: PRESENT.



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF IS EXCUSED. FITZGERALD? FLOREZ IS
2 EXCUSED. GLASER?

3

4 **GERRY GLASER:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** GOODWIN?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HANKERSON?

11

12 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** KALLINS IS EXCUSED. LEVIN?

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MARKHAM IS EXCUSED. NICKENS? ORANTEZ IS
19 IN THE BACK. PARKER? PIERCE?

20

21 **PHILIPPE PIERCE:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** IS EXCUSED.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE?



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT IS EXCUSED. WELTE?

5

6 **FRANK WELTE:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THANK YOU. WILSON? WONG?

9

10 **HOWARD WONG:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ZACK? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND JUST AS A REMINDER, WHEN
15 YOU ARE SPEAKING, TO TURN ON YOUR MICS, PLEASE. I WANT TO OPEN
16 BY SAYING HAPPY INTERNATIONAL WOMEN'S DAY. IT'S A DAY WHERE
17 WE'RE SUPPOSED TO BE CELEBRATING THE GAINS THAT WE HAVE MADE -
18 - AND I WILL SAY THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS FEELS LIKE WE'RE
19 GOING BACKWARDS A LITTLE BIT. BUT I APPRECIATE WE'RE HERE
20 WORKING FOR A GROUP OF PEOPLE WHERE EQUITY AND EQUALITY IS THE
21 FOUNDATION OF THE WORK WE DO, AND I TRULY APPRECIATE WHAT WE
22 DO FOR THAT REASON. JUST TO REMIND OURSELVES, WE HAVE TO
23 SUBMIT OUR NOTICES AHEAD OF TIME IF WE'RE GOING TO BE ABSENT
24 AND GOING TO BE ATTENDING REMOTELY BECAUSE OF THE BROWN ACT.
25 THERE IS NO WAY OF GETTING AROUND IT, AND I WILL TELL THAT YOU



MARCH 08, 2023

1 OUR DIFFICULTY IN MEETING AS AN ADVISORY BODY WAS THOROUGHLY
2 DISCUSSED BY THE COMMISSION AT THEIR LAST MEETING. IF YOU EVER
3 DOUBT THAT THEY APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT WE DO HERE, GO BACK
4 AND LISTEN TO THE LAST TAPE. BECAUSE THEY WERE ADAMANT THAT WE
5 HAVE TO FIND A SOLUTION SO WE'RE NOT DRAGGING PEOPLE IN FROM
6 THE FOUR CORNERS OF THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES WHEN IT'S
7 REALLY DIFFICULT FOR US TO DO THAT. SHOUT OUT TO THE
8 COMMISSION FOR BEING ON TOP OF THAT. THE OTHER THING THAT I
9 WANTED TO BRING UP AS PART OF MY CHAIR'S REPORT, AND I'M
10 SORRY, I HAVE MOVED INTO CHAIR'S REPORT HERE IS, IF YOU EVER
11 WANT TO KNOW WHAT'S GOING ON WITH OTHER AGENCIES, OR, I WOULD
12 SUGGEST THAT YOU GO THROUGHOUT LEDGE STARR -- THE, WHERE YOU
13 CAN FIND ALL THE MEETINGS AND LOOK AT THE PAST ONES AND ATTEND
14 OR GO AND LOOK AT THE BAY AREA REGIONAL COLLABORATION BECAUSE
15 YOU CAN SEE HOW ALL THE OTHER AGENCIES ARE WORKING WITH US.
16 AND IT MAKES SOME OF THIS BIG PROBLEM THAT WE HAVE MAKE SENSE.
17 WITH THAT I'M ENDING MY INTRODUCTION, AND MY REPORT AND WITH
18 THAT WE'LL GO TO AGENDA ITEM FOUR APPROVAL OF THE FEBRUARY
19 8TH, 2023 MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE?

20

21 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** BALDINI MOVES APPROVAL.

22

23 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** BALDINI MOVES.

24

25 **ILAF ESUF, V. CHAIR:** SECOND.



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I HAVE A FIRST AND A SECOND. ANYONE FROM
3 THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, USE THE RAISE
4 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE
5 PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL
6 CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. CLERK WERE THERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED
7 UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM?

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
10 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
11 ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE BODY
14 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. WOULD YOU PLEASE CALL THE ROLL CALL
15 VOTE?

16

17 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILL DO. BALDINI?

18

19 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CAMPOS?

22

23 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** DEUTSCH-GROSS IS EXCUSED. ELDRED?



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** ESUF IS EXCUSED. FITZGERALD?

5

6 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:**

9

10 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** YES.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** [INDISCERNIBLE] IS EXCUSED. NICKENS?

19 ORANTEZ?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PARKER?

24

25 **JOHNNY PARKER:** AYE.



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** PIMPLE?

3

4 **VINAY PIMPLE:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** SCOTT IS EXCUSED. WELTE?

7

8 **FRANK WELTE:** NO.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WILSON? WONG?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** AND ZACK. IT PASSES WITH 13 AYES. ONE
15 NO.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE,
18 PUBLIC COMMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS. I'LL NOW ASK THE CLERK TO
19 READ THE NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC
20 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M.
21 YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD. I'LL ALSO ASK IF ANY MEMBERS OF THE
22 PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS
23 ON ITEMS NOT ON TODAY AGENDA PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND AND/OR
24 DIAL STAR NINE AND I'LL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. WHEN CALLED
25 UPON UNMUTE YOURSELF OR DIAL STAR SIX. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC



MARCH 08, 2023

1 COMMENT? THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER
2 SIX, THE 2023 YOUTH PROGRAMS UPDATE. JOHN AND KY-NAM WILL BE
3 PRESENTING. AND, GO AHEAD AND TAKE IT AWAY. THANK YOU.

4

5 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR KINMAN. AND IF THE IT
6 TEAM COULD PULL UP THE SLIDES, I APPRECIATE IT. GOOD TO SEE
7 EVERYBODY IN-PERSON. THIS FEELS LIKE A VERY MONUMENTAL DAY. I
8 APPRECIATE EVERYONE MAKING THE EXTRA EFFORT TO COME OUT HERE.
9 I'M TAKING OFF MY STAFF LIAISON HAT AND SPEAKING TO YOU IN MY
10 CAPACITY HELPING TO RUN THE SUMMER HIGH SCHOOL ACADEMY. I'M
11 ALSO JOINED BY MY COLLEAGUE JOHN KANNEGEISER WHO IS ATTENDING
12 REMOTELY AND WILL BE JOINING VIA ZOOM IN A MOMENT. THE BASIC
13 PURPOSE OF TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS TO PROVIDE YOU A SUMMARY OF
14 THE RANGE OF OUR YOUTH PROGRAMS. PATHWAY TO UNDERREPRESENTED
15 YOUTH TO GAIN EXPOSURE FOR PUBLIC SECTOR CAREERS. CAN YOU
16 PLEASE ADVANCE THE SLIDE. OVERVIEW OF TODAY'S PRESENTATION
17 WHICH WILL SUMMARIZE THE NORM MINETA SUMMER ACADEMY. THE
18 PATHWAY TO GOVERNMENT COLLEGE MENTORSHIP. THE SPARE THE AIR
19 YOUTH PROGRAM WHICH IS A COLLABORATIVE EFFORT AT THE AIR
20 DISTRICT, THE BAYREN'S WORKFORCE AND EDUCATION AND TRAINING
21 PROGRAM, AND THE NEWEST EFFORT, THE LOCAL YOUTH INNOVATION
22 CHALLENGE. NEXT SLIDE. WE'LL TAKE QUESTIONS AT THE CONCLUSION.
23 BUT IF YOU'RE SO MOVED, PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND. JOHN AND I CAN
24 ANSWER QUESTIONS THAT COME UP. THE BAY AREA SUMMER ACADEMY WAS
25 RENAMED LAST SUMMER TO HONOR THE DECEASED LOCAL TRANSPORTATION



MARCH 08, 2023

1 AND PUBLIC SERVICE ICON, NORMAN MINETA. THE GOALS FOR THE
2 SECOND SUMMER ACADEMY WERE TO INCREASE THE BREADTH AND DEPTH
3 OF PARTICIPATION PARTICULARLY FROM EQUITY PRIORITY
4 COMMUNITIES. MTC STAFF CONDUCTED OUTREACH IN ALL NINE COUNTIES
5 TO ENSURE REPRESENTATION TARGETING PUBLIC SCHOOLS ACROSS THE
6 BAY AREA AS WELL AS PAROCHIAL SCHOOLS SERVING LOW INCOME
7 STUDENTS. WE'RE ABLE TO GET YOUTH FROM ALL NINE COUNTIES
8 RECRUITING HEAVILY FROM SCHOOLS SERVING FROM EQUITY PRIORITY
9 COMMUNITIES THAT REFLECT ETHNIC AND GENDER IDENTITIES THAT
10 REFLECT THE BAY AREA'S POPULATION. SOME STUDENTS SHARED THAT
11 THEY HAD DISABILITIES AND ENSURING THAT THERE IS A WIDER
12 PARTICIPATION FROM STUDENTS WITH DISABILITIES IS A KEY GOAL
13 FOR THIS UPCOMING SUMMER. AND STAFF IS ALSO GOING TO
14 APPRECIATE THE COUNCIL'S HELP IN REACHING UNDERSERVED
15 POPULATIONS INCLUDING YOUTHS EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS, FOSTER
16 YOUTH, AND OTHER KEY POPULATIONS. THERE IS A BAR CHART ON THE
17 SLIDE DEPICTING DEMOGRAPHIC REPRESENTATION AMONGST APPLICANTS.
18 THERE WAS 109 TOTAL APPLICANTS, 58 IDENTIFIED AS ASIAN, 22
19 WHITE, 17 AS LATINX OR HISPANIC, 10 AS BLACK OR AFRICAN
20 AMERICAN, 7 AS OTHER, 2 AS NATIVE HAWAIIAN OR PACIFIC
21 ISLANDER, AND 2 PREFER NOT TO SHARE. IN TERMS OF GEOGRAPHIC
22 BREAKDOWN, A THIRD WERE FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY, LESS THAN A
23 QUARTER FROM SANTA CLARA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN MATEO, AND SAN
24 FRANCISCO. SORRY -- A QUARTER FROM SANTA CLARA, THOSE LATTER
25 THREE: CONTRA COSTA, SAN MATEO, SAN FRANCISCO, EACH HAD ABOUT



MARCH 08, 2023

1 AN 8TH OF THE SHARE OF STUDENTS WHILE SONOMA-MARIN, SOLANO,
2 AND NAPA, IN SINGLE DIGITS ROUGHLY IN LINE WITH THEIR SHARE OF
3 THE BAY'S POPULATION. NEXT SLIDE. WE POLLED STUDENTS TO
4 MEASURE SUCCESS. THE FIRST GRAPHIC ON THE LEFT SHOWS STUDENTS
5 RESPONSES TO THE PROMPT OVERALL HOW WOULD YOU RATE THE SUMMER
6 ACADEMY. OVER 30% RATED THE ACADEMY EXPERIENCE AS EXCELLENT
7 50% RATED IT AS VERY GOOD 18% RATED IT AS GOOD, 1% OR ONE
8 STUDENT RATED AS FAIR, FAIR ENOUGH, AND ZERO RATED IT AS POOR.
9 THE SECOND GRAPH ON THE RIGHT SHOWS THE SURVEY RESULTS FROM
10 WHAT'S CALLED THE NET PROMOTOR SCORE, WHICH MEASURES ON A
11 NEGATIVE 100, POSITIVE 100 SCALE HOW MUCH THEY WOULD RECOMMEND
12 THE SUMMER ACADEMY IN THEIR PEERS; ZERO SCORE IS NEUTRAL. A
13 NEGATIVE SCORE WOULD MEAN THEY WOULD NOT RECOMMEND THE COURSE
14 TO THEIR PEERS. AT THE CONCLUSION OF THE PROGRAM NET PROMOTER
15 SCORE STOOD AT 39 WHICH IS CONSIDERED SOLID ACROSS INDUSTRY
16 STANDARDS. AT THE BOTTOM, CONSTRUCTIVE FEEDBACK STUDENTS HAD
17 PROVIDED TO IMPROVE THE PROGRAM, SUGGESTED: MAKE EVENTS MORE
18 INTERACTIVE, TAKE MORE BREAKS DURING THE EVENT, ADDRESS TOPICS
19 MORE RELEVANT TO MY LIFE, HAVE MORE KNOWLEDGEABLE SPEAKERS,
20 USE A DIFFERENT PLATFORM TO HOST THE EVENT -- IT WAS HOSTED
21 OVER ZOOM -- IN-PERSON EVENTS, AND YOUNGER SPEAKERS. WE'RE
22 TAKING ALL THAT IN AND APPLYING THEIR FEEDBACK TO IMPROVE THE
23 CURRICULUM. NEXT SLIDE. THE AIM FOR THE SUMMER ACADEMY,
24 ENGAGING CURRICULUM WHERE STUDENTS LEARN SOMETHING NEW
25 CONNECTING BETWEEN AGENCIES NEIGHBORHOODS AND LIVES, AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 SEEKING PATHWAYS FOR SPEAKERS EVERY SPEAKER STARTED OFF BY
2 DESCRIBING THEIR PATH TO REGIONAL GOVERNMENT SPEAKERS INCLUDE
3 EDDIE AHN, HELPING HIS FAMILY RUN A SMALL BUSINESS,
4 CONGRESSMAN MINETA PROVIDED LECTURE FOR STUDENTS TO UNDERSTAND
5 THE HUMAN BEING BEHIND THE ICONIC PUBLIC SERVE -- STUDENTS
6 HEARD FROM A STAFFER WHO NOW INSPECTS CHEVRON PLANTS IN
7 RICHMOND ANOTHER SPEAKER GREW UP IN THE SOUTH, AND MADE HIS
8 WAY BY FOLLOWING LATE MOTHER'S ADVICE TO DO WORK THAT MADE HIS
9 HEART SING STUDENTS PARTICIPATED IN KEY ISSUES PRESENTED BY
10 STAFF AND MTC AND THE AIR DISTRICT, THE STUDENTS SUBMITTED CAP
11 STONE PROJECTS 58 STUDENTS COMPLETED THE ENTIRE ACADEMY OUT OF
12 THE ORIGINAL 100 PLUS APPLICANTS STUDENTS COMPENSATED WITH A
13 STIPEND EQUIVALENT TO LIVING WAGE OF \$25 AN HOUR. WITH THAT
14 I'M GOING TO PASS IT TO MY COLLEAGUE JOHN KANNEGEISER WHO WILL
15 DISCUSS THE PATHWAY TO COLLEGE MENTORSHIP.

16

17 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** THANKS KY-NAM. I AM THE RECRUITING MANAGER
18 HERE AT MTC. NEXT SLIDE, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU. I'M
19 HERE TO DISCUSS LAST SUMMER'S 2022 PATHWAY TO MENTORSHIP
20 PROGRAM. SO, IN REGARDS TO OUR PROGRAM, WE WANT IT TO BE A
21 FOCUS ON MENTORSHIP VERSUS TRADITIONAL INTERNSHIP. STUDENT HAD
22 A JOB AND WERE ASSIGNED A MANAGER BUT HE OR SHE WAS A MENTEE
23 WITH A GOAL TO HELP THE STUDENT -- OR THE MENTEE LEARN MORE
24 THAN JUST HAVE A JOB. THEY HAD REGULAR CHECK INS HAD A WORK
25 PLAN WHEN THEY FIRST STARTED AT MTC TO TALK ABOUT WHAT THEY



MARCH 08, 2023

1 WERE GOING TO DO OVER THE NEXT EIGHT WEEKS, WITH EXPOSURE TO
2 DIFFERENT GROUPS WITHIN MTC, MOST OF IT WAS REMOTE. WE HOPE IN
3 2023 TO HAVE MORE OF A HYBRID ENVIRONMENT WITH INTERACTION
4 WITH PEERS. MORE OF A LEARNING EXPERIENCE WITH MENTEES THAN A
5 TRADITIONAL JOB. WE HAD RÉSUMÉ WRITING, CAREER PATH AND THINGS
6 OF THAT NATURE. IN TERMS OF DEMOGRAPHICS WE HAD SIX STUDENTS.
7 WE HAD SEVEN BUT ONE HAD TO DROP OUT FOR A FAMILY EMERGENCY.
8 WE HAD SIX THAT FINISHED THE EIGHT WEEK PROGRAM AND THEY WERE
9 ALL FROM EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. REPRESENTING SCHOOLS
10 SUCH AS SONOMA STATE, SAN FRANCISCO STATE, BERKELEY, AND
11 STANFORD UNIVERSITY. 83% OR FIVE OF THE STUDENTS OF THE SIX
12 STUDENTS WERE STUDENTS OF COLOR, FOUR WERE FEMALE AND TWO MALE
13 STUDENTS. WE PROBABLY WILL HAVE ABOUT SEVEN MENTEES THIS
14 SUMMER IN TERMS OF THE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] NUMBER, WE'RE GOING
15 TO TRY TO INCREASE OUR OUTREACH TO COMMUNITY COLLEGES AND
16 HOPEFULLY HAVE MORE REPRESENTATION FROM SOME OF THE REMOTE
17 COUNTIES. LAST SUMMER STUDENTS WERE PLACED IN FINANCE,
18 CONTRACTS, REGIONAL PLANNING PROGRAMS, AND OUR FPP GROUP. SO
19 WE HAD A PRETTY GOOD DISBURSEMENT THERE. EXCUSE ME. AND IN
20 REGARDS TO THE MTC INTERNSHIP ALUMNI GROUP WE'RE KEEPING
21 CONNECTED WITH OUR STUDENTS TO SEE HOW THEY'RE PROGRESSING AND
22 TO ASK FOR REFERRALS ON THEIR EXPERIENCE TO HAVE OTHER
23 STUDENTS THAT THEY KNOW WHO HAVE INTEREST AS WELL IN OUR
24 PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, IN TERMS OF SURVEYS, WE DID
25 ASK STUDENTS A NUMBER OF QUESTIONS. I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT, OF



MARCH 08, 2023

1 COURSE, THE LEVEL OF EXPERIENCE THAT THEY HAD. THE STUDENTS,
2 AS YOU CAN SEE HERE, EXCUSE ME -- SORRY. JUST LOST MY SPOT
3 THERE. IN TERMS OF EXPERIENCE, THEY HAD HIGH OR VERY GOOD
4 EXPERIENCE. VERY POSITIVE FROM STUDENT'S PERSPECTIVE. IN TERMS
5 OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PROGRAM, ALL STUDENTS RECOMMENDED
6 THE PROGRAM, ABSOLUTELY RECOMMEND THE PROGRAM. I'M GOING TO
7 TURN IT BACK TO KY-NAM WHO WILL CONTINUE THE PRESENTATION.

8

9 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANKS JOHN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M GOING
10 TO DESCRIBE BRIEFLY SOME OF THE OTHER PROGRAMS ACTIVE IN OUR
11 AGENCY AND PARTNER AGENCIES. FIRST ONE IS SPARE THE AIR YOUTH
12 PROGRAM, RUN FOR OVER A DECADE STARTED AS PART OF MTC'S
13 CLIMATE INITIATIVES PROGRAM IN PARTNERSHIP WITH THE AIR
14 DISTRICT TO REACH STUDENTS AND THEIR FAMILIES TO SPREAD
15 AWARENESS ABOUT TRAVEL BEHAVIOR AND REDUCE TRANSPORTATION
16 RELATED GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS THROUGH A VARIETY OF PROGRAMS
17 AND ACTIVITIES. THROUGH THIS PROGRAM, MTC FUNDS THE BAY AREA
18 BIKE MOBILE WHICH DELIVERS FREE BIKE REPAIR AND EDUCATION TO
19 STUDENTS AND EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES ACROSS THE BAY AREA
20 AND FAMILY BIKING WORKSHOPS WHICH TEACHES PARENTS HOW TO
21 SAFELY RIDE BIKES WITH THEIR CHILDREN VERY POPULAR YOUTH FOR
22 THE ENVIRONMENT SUSTAINABILITY OR YES CONFERENCE RUN IN
23 PARTNERSHIP WITH THE AIR DISTRICT ON HIATUS SINCE THE
24 GUIDELINES LIFTED MTC ADVISORY COMMITTEE EACH QUARTER ALONG
25 WITH RELATED WORKING GROUPS THAT BRING TOGETHER SAFE ROUTES TO



MARCH 08, 2023

1 SCHOOL PROGRAM STAFF IN THE REGION AS WELL AS OTHER YOUTH
2 ORIENTED ENVIRONMENTAL CLIMATE TRANSPORTATION AND BEHAVIORAL
3 CHANGE PROGRAMS. MERITS FURTHER INVESTMENT TO REACH FAMILIES
4 PARTICULARLY IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES TO GROW INTEREST
5 IN ALTERNATIVE TRAVEL MODES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE BAYREN'S
6 WORKFORCE EDUCATION AND TRAINING PROGRAMS DATING BACK TO 2019
7 BAYREN HAS PARTNERS WITH THE RISING SUN CENTER FOR OPPORTUNITY
8 TO OFFER THE GREENHOUSE CALLS PROGRAM SUMMER PROGRAM FOR YOUTH
9 PROVIDES TECHNICAL TRAINING AND HANDS ON EXPERIENCE INSTALLING
10 ENERGY EFFICIENCY MEASURES IN-HOUSE HOLDS THROUGHOUT THE
11 REGION PROVIDERS LOW-INCOME YOUTH, AS PART OF THE BAYREN
12 BUSINESS PLAN FILED WITH THE CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES
13 COMMISSION IN 2022 A NEW WORKFORCE TRAINING PROGRAM PROPOSED,
14 AND JOB PLACEMENT. NEWLY PROPOSED WORKFORCE INFORMATION AND
15 TRAINING PROGRAM AIMS TO CREATE OPPORTUNITIES FOR YOUTH FROM
16 LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES PROVIDING
17 REAL WORK EXPERIENCE IN TARGETED SECTORS PROGRAM ADDRESSING
18 BAY AREA YOUTH EMPLOYMENT THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION WILL
19 CONSIDER ADOPTING THE BUSINESS PLAN LATER THIS YEAR WITH
20 IMPLEMENTATION SET TO BEGIN IN 2024. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. LAST
21 MONTH FEBRUARY 2023, MTC AND ITS PARTNERS INCLUDING AC
22 TRANSIT, BART, CALTRAIN, GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE HIGHWAY AND
23 TRANSPORTATION DISTRICT SAMTRANS SFMTA AND VTA RECRUITED SIX
24 YOUTH PARTICIPANTS TO FORM A REGIONAL TEAM TO THE BAY AREA
25 LOCAL INNOVATION CHALLENGE IN 2023. SPONSOR SAID BY THE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 NATIONAL NON-PROFIT INTRODUCING YOUTH TO INFRASTRUCTURE AND
2 AWARENESS OF POTENTIAL CAREERS WITHIN THE TRANSPORTATION FIELD
3 AND IDENTIFY WAYS TO MODERNIZE THE WORKFORCE AND WORKPLACE FOR
4 THE 21st CENTURY CHALLENGE FOCUSED ON ENGAGING YOUTH WHO HAVE
5 BEEN HISTORICALLY UNDERREPRESENTED IN CAREER FIELDS SUCH AS
6 YOUNG WOMEN AND PEOPLE OF COLOR ELEVATING YOUTH IN
7 UNDERREPRESENTED VOICES AND ATTRACTING EMPLOYEES. AIM TO
8 CONTINUE THE BAY AREA SUMMER ACADEMY AND RETURN TO IN-PERSON
9 EXPERIENCE AS EXPRESSED BY PAST STUDENTS APPLICATIONS OPEN
10 NEXT WEEK AND RUN THROUGH MID-APRIL YOU WILL RECEIVE MATERIALS
11 TO SHARE WITH YOUR NETWORKS AND WE ASK FOR YOUR SUPPORT IN
12 REACHING YOUTH IN YOUR COMMUNITIES WHO WOULD BENEFIT FROM THIS
13 PROGRAM. ULTIMATELY PATH FORWARD RETURN TO PLACE YOUTH WITH
14 LOCAL AGENCIES WITH SUMMER ACADEMIES SERVING AS A BOOK END OF
15 THAT EXPERIENCE. AS FOR THE COLLEGE PROGRAM I'LL HAND IT BACK
16 TO MY COLLEAGUE TO WALK THROUGH CONSIDERATIONS.

17

18 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** WE WANT TO ENHANCE OUR COLLEGE MENTORSHIP
19 PROGRAM BASED ON FEEDBACK FROM LAST YEAR A LOT OF IT WAS
20 HAVING MORE INTERACTION WITH PEERS WE ARE PLANNING SOCIAL
21 EVENTS TO HAVE A HYBRID WORK ENVIRONMENT, AND OF COURSE
22 INTERACTION WITH LEADERS AS MUCH AS POSSIBILITY. SO WE'RE
23 TRYING TO MAKE SURE THAT HAPPENS. WE'RE LOOKING AT POTENTIALLY
24 HAVING A YEAR ROUND COLLEGE INTERNSHIP PROGRAM RESEARCHING
25 FROM A FINANCIAL PERSPECTIVE AND MAKING SURE WE HAVE ENOUGH



MARCH 08, 2023

1 INTEREST TO HAVE IT YEAR ROUND VERSUS SUMMER WEEK PROGRAM. WE
2 WANT STUDENTS TO PARTICIPATE IN THE BAY AREA SUMMER ACADEMY
3 BECAUSE THEY GOT A GOOD UNDERSTANDING ON REGIONAL GOVERNMENT
4 AND WE WANT TO CONTINUE THAT PROCESS. KY-NAM.

5

6 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH, JUST TAKE QUESTIONS, LET'S GO TO
7 THE NEXT SLIDE. ANY QUESTIONS FROM THE COUNCIL, ARE WELCOME.

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I'LL TAKE QUESTIONS FROM THE COUNCIL
10 MEMBERS THAT ARE IN THE ROOM FIRST. GO AHEAD PAM.

11

12 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I
13 WANT TO EXPRESS MY GRATITUDE FOR THE WORK THAT WAS DONE WITH
14 THIS PROGRAM. IT SEEMS LIKE THE STUDENTS REALLY APPRECIATE IT.
15 YOU CAN TELL BY THE METRICS THAT THEY PROVIDED. IT SEEMS LIKE
16 EXCELLENT WORK, AND I WANT TO GIVE KUDOS TO THE SURVEY
17 QUESTIONS BECAUSE I WAS ABLE TO LOOK AT THOSE, AND I THINK THE
18 WAY THE LANGUAGE PHRASES THEM IS VERY APPROPRIATE AND FRIENDLY
19 TO OUR YOUTH. I HAD A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS ABOUT THE, ONE OF
20 THE FIRST SLIDES WITH THE DEMOGRAPHICS, IT MENTIONED GENDER
21 REPRESENTATION BUT I DIDN'T SEE THOSE STATISTICS THERE. SO I
22 WAS WONDERING IF WE COULD HAVE THAT STAT AVAILABLE AS WELL AS
23 A BREAK DOWN FOR THE COUNTIES, AND WHAT SPECIFICALLY WHAT
24 CITIES THOSE STUDENTS WERE LIVING IN AND, ALSO, CONFIRMING
25 WHETHER THAT DEMOGRAPHIC INFORMATION WAS ONLY FOR THAT FIRST



MARCH 08, 2023

1 PROGRAM, THE SUMMER BAY ACADEMY OR ALL DEMOGRAPHICS FOR THE
2 PROGRAM? THE NEXT POINT I WANTED TO ASK ABOUT WAS THE
3 SPEAKERS, IT SOUNDED LIKE THE YOUTH WANTED YOUNGER SPEAKERS,
4 AND I'M WONDERING IF THERE IS WORK BEING DONE TO ALSO ENSURE
5 THAT THE SPEAKERS ARE DIVERSE AND REPRESENTING THE COMMUNITIES
6 THAT ARE BEING SERVED, WHETHER IT'S ETHNIC, OR SOCIO-ECONOMIC
7 STATUS, BUT MAKING SURE THAT THE YOUTH CAN SEE THEMSELVES IN
8 THE PEOPLE WHO ARE SPEAKING TO THEM. SORRY. I HAVE ONE LAST
9 QUESTION, AND IT'S ABOUT THE FINANCIAL COMPENSATION WHICH I
10 WAS REALLY PLEASED TO SEE, IS A STRONG STARTING POINT, AND
11 PERHAPS BECAUSE IT WAS VIRTUAL LAST YEAR, I'M WONDERING IF
12 TRANSPORTATION IS GOING TO BE INCLUDED IN THIS NEXT ROUND, AND
13 NOT JUST REIMBURSEMENT TO EVENTS, BUT IT COULD BE POSSIBLE TO
14 OFFER FREE TRANSIT FOR THE YOUTH TO EXPLORE OTHER REGIONS
15 THROUGH PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. THOSE ARE MY QUESTIONS. THANK
16 YOU.

17

18 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER CAMPOS. I'LL
19 TAKE A SHOT, AND JOHN, YOU ARE WELCOME TO PIPE IN. I'LL WORK
20 BACKWARDS FROM THE TRANSPORTATION SUPPORTS THAT'S A WRINKLE
21 NOW THAT WE'RE LOOKING IN-PERSON. AND I WANT TO MAKE THEIR IN-
22 PERSON EXPERIENCE A REALLY POSITIVE ONE AND BREAK DOWN ANY
23 BARRIERS THEY MAY EXPERIENCE WHETHER TRANSPORTATION OR OTHER
24 CHALLENGES, PART OF THAT IS SURVEYING THEM AND I THINK WE
25 WOULD HAVE TO SEE WHAT RESOURCES ARE AVAILABLE. LAST I



MARCH 08, 2023

1 CHECKED, THERE WAS A CLIPPER CARD SHORTAGE SO OUR ABLE TO
2 OBTAIN THOSE AND MAIL THEM OUT PRO ACTIVELY WITHIN A COUPLE
3 MONTH TURN AROUND, IT MIGHT FALL BACK TO COMPENSATION
4 AFTERWARDS BECAUSE OF LIMITED AVAILABILITY. WE DO WANT TO, AS
5 A KIND OF GUIDING LIGHT MAKE SURE THAT ALL BARRIERS ARE BROKEN
6 DOWN SO STUDENTS CAN ATTEND NO MATTER THEIR CIRCUMSTANCES. WE
7 REALLY EMPHASIZE THAT THE SPEAKERS WHO ARE BASICALLY ALL
8 PROFESSIONALS IN THIS INDUSTRY START OUT WITH THEIR STORIES
9 AND WE DID RECRUIT SPEAKERS WHO REFLECTED THE DIVERSE
10 COMMUNITIES THAT THE BAY AREA HAS. SO, I MEAN, EVERYONE HAS
11 THEIR OWN PATHWAY. BUT WE FELT LIKE, I HAD THEM START OUT WITH
12 A PICTURE OF THEMSELVES IN HIGH SCHOOL, AND SHOW LIKE THESE
13 GOOFY PICTURES THAT YOU WOULD NOT NECESSARILY GET THE BABY IN
14 A REGIONAL GOVERNMENT AGENCY THAT I THINK EVERYONE HAD THEIR
15 OWN KIND OF STORY AND PATHWAY THERE NARRATIVE AND THIS WAS TWO
16 SUMMERS AGO SOMETHING WE WANT TO CONTINUE. ON THE GENDER
17 DEMOGRAPHICS, I SHOULD HAVE READ IT OUT. I THINK WE HAD A
18 SLIDE BUT IT WAS A BLURRY PICTURE. I THINK IT WAS ABOUT 56%
19 MALE AND 46% FEMALE, AND 2% WAS EITHER NON-BINARY OR CHOSEN
20 NOT TO DISCLOSE OR OTHER. IT WAS PREDOMINANTLY MALE THIS YEAR.
21 IN TERMS OF THE SPECIFICS OF THEIR CITIES AND STUFF, WE COULD
22 GET A LITTLE SPECIFIC WITHOUT GIVING OUT THEIR ADDRESSES AND
23 STUFF. BUT WE HAVE, YEAH, ALL THAT INFORMATION IN SPREADSHEETS
24 WHICH I COULD EITHER WALK THROUGH WITH YOU INDIVIDUALLY, OR IF



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THERE IS A PUBLIC CLAIM FOR THAT TYPE OF INFORMATION, I COULD
2 RUN A REPORT FOR THAT, AS WELL. WAS THAT EVERYTHING YOU ASKED?

3

4 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES. THANK YOU.

5

6 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** AND REGARDING THE COLLEGE STUDENTS THEY WILL
7 BE GIVEN A \$250 MONTHLY FOR BART FOR CLIPPER CARDS OR WHAT
8 THEY'RE USING.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GERRY?

11

12 **GERRY GLASER:** IF HE DIDN'T HAVE A CLIPPER CARD COULD YOU SET
13 UP ACCOUNTS ON THEIR PHONES? ALL KIDS SEEM TO HAVE PHONES NO
14 MATTER WHAT ECONOMIC LEVEL THEY'RE AT. THE ONE QUESTION I HAD
15 IS THIS. DO WE HAVE FOLLOW UP ON THE PROGRAM? THE STATED
16 OBJECTIVE IS TO INTEREST THEM IN CAREERS AND TRANSPORTATION.
17 DO WE HAVE ANY INDICATION WHAT THE SUCCESS RATE IS?

18

19 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THE SUCCESS RATE TAKES A FEW YEARS OR
20 EVEN A DECADE TO YIELD. ONE INTERESTING STORY WAS KRISTINE
21 GOTUACO WHO STARTED AN INTERNSHIP PROGRAM AND RECENTLY STEPPED
22 OFF THE COUNCIL AND HAS HAD A PUBLIC CAREER IN HOUSING AND
23 GOVERNMENT. ONE OF THE PLATFORMS WE USE TO ENCOURAGE THE
24 STUDENTS AND REMAIN CONNECTED IS HAVE THEM SET UP A LINKEDIN
25 PROFILE TO HAVE THEIR FIRST FORAY INTO NETWORKING. WE HAVE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 TRIP ELIMINATE DIGITS IN MEMBERSHIP NOW. I'LL HAVE TO CHECK.
2 IT'S A PRIVATE GROUP THEY CAN JOIN ONCE THEY'RE AN ALUMNI OF
3 THE ORGANIZATION. THE KIDS ALSO WHEN THEY GET TOGETHER IN
4 VIRTUAL SPACES OF THEIR OWN ACCORD WILL EXCHANGE THEIR SOCIAL
5 MEDIA HANDLES AND THERE IS A PRETTY LIVELY -- I'M NOT SURE
6 WHAT THE TWITTER HASHTAG IS BUT TRANSIT NERD KIND OF COMMUNITY
7 IN THE BAY AREA. AND KIDS ARE REALITY INTO IT. SOME KIDS WHO
8 HAVE -- THIS IS LIKE THEIR OWN REAL BEDROOMS, THEY HAVE MAPS
9 OF THE BAY AREA, DIFFERENT, THEIR OWN, WHAT THEY HAVE CONJURED
10 UP WHAT TRANSIT MAPS SHOULD LOOK LIKE THE KIDS ARE CERTAINLY
11 INTO IT MORE THAN I WAS IN HIGH SCHOOL. AND EVERYONE GIVES OUT
12 THEIR E-MAIL AND CONTACT FOR FOLLOW UP, BUT I HAVEN'T TRACKED,
13 AMONGST STAFF AND VARIOUS AGENCIES HOW MUCH FOLLOW UP THERE S.

14

15 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GO AHEAD DWAYNE.

16

17 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** IN REGARDS TO REPRESENTATION BY THE
18 DIFFERENT COUNTIES, SOME OF THE LOWER REPRESENTED COUNTIES
19 SUCH AS SOLANO, IS THERE, LIKE, AN EFFORT TO RECRUIT MORE
20 PEOPLE AND BALANCE OUT THE NUMBER OF PARTICIPANTS PER COUNTY?

21

22 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I'M GLAD YOU ASKED. BECAUSE I AM ASKING
23 OUR SOLANO COUNTY REPRESENTATIVES FOR YOUR HELP IN SPREADING
24 THE WORD. WE DID HAVE, I THINK WE GREW FROM ONE OR 2 TO 6 OR
25 SEVEN IN SOLANO COUNTY. SO THAT WAS A SIGNIFICANT JUMP FROM



MARCH 08, 2023

1 LAST YEAR. BUT WE ALWAYS WANT MORE PARTICULARLY FROM THE
2 NORTHERN COUNTIES. SANTA CLARA WAS A SUCCESS STORY. SANTA
3 CLARA HAS ALSO UNDERPERFORMED. THIS YEAR THEY REALLY HIT IT
4 HATS OFF TO JOHN CLAIR. JOHN?

5

6 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** WE HAVE SMALLER PROGRAMS, 6 TO 7 STUDENTS
7 BUT OUR GOAL IS TO INCREASE THE OUTER COUNTIES, SANTA CLARA,
8 SONOMA. BUT DUE TO OUR HYBRID ENVIRONMENT, WE HOPE THAT WE
9 STILL CONTINUE TO GAUGE INTEREST OR ENCOURAGE INTEREST FROM
10 THOSE COUNTIES SO THEY DON'T HAVE TO COMMUTE TO SAN FRANCISCO
11 EVERY DAY BUT WE WILL BE DOING MORE OUTREACH TO THE SCHOOLS
12 AND THOSE AREAS AND WE HAVE PREVIOUSLY.

13

14 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** ADINA AND THEN --

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, WITH MY -- YEAH, THAT'S ON -- SO, WITH MY
19 NON-PROFIT HATS, YOU KNOW, WE HIRE INTERNS, AND I'M WONDERING,
20 IS THE ALUMNI ASSOCIATION ACCESSIBLE FOR ORGANIZATIONS THAT
21 WORK IN RELATED AREAS TO POST FOR INTERNS?

22

23 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH I MEAN IT'S NOT A PUBLIC GROUP BUT
24 CERTAINLY IF YOU SENT IT TO ME OR A COUPLE OF THE OTHER -- I



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THINK JOHN IS AN ADMIN AND CHRISTINE, WE HAVE COLLEAGUES FROM
2 MTC WHO COULD PLACE JOB OPPORTUNITIES THERE.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** THAT PROVIDES INSIGHT. I AM HAPPY TO BE PART OF
5 THIS MEETING BUT THERE ARE OTHER NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS AND
6 OTHER RELATED ORGANIZATIONS THAT DO HAVE INTERNSHIPS AND
7 WOULDN'T KNOW TO ASK SO I'M WONDERING IF THERE IS ANY WAY TO,
8 LIKE, EXPOSE THAT -- THE EXISTENCE OF AN ALUMNI NETWORK AND
9 MAYBE WITH AN INSULATED ADDRESS, TO YOU ABOUT MAKE IT MORE
10 DISCOVERABLE SO THAT PEOPLE THAT DO WANT TO RECRUIT CAN
11 RECRUIT FROM AMONGST PEOPLE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IN THE PROGRAM.

12

13 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I'M OPEN TO ANY AND ALL IDEAS. I THINK
14 THE SENSITIVITIES BECAUSE KIDS ARE AS YOUNG AS 14 AND WE'RE
15 GENERALLY PROTECTIVE OF ACCESS TO COMMUNICATION OUTSIDE THEIR
16 COHORT AND PROACTIVELY SHARING WITH NON-PROFITS LIKE, HEY,
17 WOULD YOU LIKE TO RECRUIT FROM THIS POOL OF STUDENTS WHO ARE
18 STARTING ON AGE OUT 18 TO 19 PLEASE LET US KNOW AND WE CAN
19 POST THOSE OPPORTUNITIES.

20

21 **ADINA LEVIN:** EVEN POSTING, IF THERE IS SOMETHING ON THE WEB
22 SITE ABOUT THE PROGRAM TO SAY, YOU KNOW, ARE YOU INTERESTED IN
23 SHARING INTERNSHIP OPPORTUNITIES WITH ALUMS, SEND INFORMATION,
24 SEND YOUR REQUEST TO INFOATPROGRAM.ORG.

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH. ON THE INTERN WEB SITE, WE CAN ADD
2 THAT LANGUAGE IN THE PROGRAM, WE CAN OFFER THAT, IF YOU'RE
3 INTERESTED, WE CAN MAKE THAT AVAILABLE.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** HOWARD?

6

7 **HOWARD WONG:** IT'S OBVIOUS THE PARTICIPATING STUDENTS HAVE A
8 GREAT -- YOU KNOW, BENEFIT GREATLY. I THINK ALL OF US IN OUR
9 OWN PERSONAL LIVES HAVE HAD ONE INCIDENT OF AN ENCOUNTER WITH
10 SOMEBODY OF THE INFLUENCE OR IMPORTANCE OR SOMEBODY THAT
11 RESONATES WITH YOU. I CAN REMEMBER PRESENTATIONS IN MIDDLE
12 SCHOOL, OTHERS IN HIGH SCHOOL, OTHERS IN COLLEGE, WHICH MAY
13 NOT HAVE IMPACT AT THAT MOMENT, BUT IT SEEMS TO LEAVE A,
14 SOMETHING IN THE SUBCONSCIOUS OR EXPERIENCE THAT, WHEN YOU
15 LOOK BACK, LEAD YOU TO SOME PATH THAT WAS A VERY GOOD OUTCOME.
16 WHEN ONE HAS THESE EXPERTS AND LIFE STORIES BROUGHT TOGETHER,
17 IT SEEMS TO BRING TO A BROADER AUDIENCE IT'S NOT JUST
18 PROMISING MENTEES, BUT TO BROADER GROUPS IN SCHOOLS AT EVERY
19 LEVEL SO HAS THAT EVER BEEN THOUGHT ABOUT CREATING A PROGRAM
20 WHICH GOES OUT AND AFFECTS HUNDREDS OR THOUSANDS OF YOUNG
21 MINDS?

22

23 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I THINK BRINGING IT TO SCALE PARTICULARLY
24 SINCE IT'S OVER ZOOM IS SOMETHING THAT'S TECHNICALLY FEASIBLE.
25 AT THIS POINT, THIS IS LIKE THE THIRD ITERATION AND IT'S KIND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 OF INVENTED FROM SCRATCH BUT YOU'RE RIGHT THERE IS ROOM FOR
2 GROWTH AND EXPANDING THE AUDIENCE. SO, IT WOULD REALLY DEPEND
3 ON WHAT RESOURCES WE WOULD WANT TO APPLY TOWARDS BRINGING THIS
4 TO A WIDER AUDIENCE ACROSS THE BAY AREA OR OTHER PLACES. JOHN?

5

6 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO COMPENSATION THE
7 INDIVIDUALS WHO PARTICIPATE OF COURSE THERE ARE RESTRICTIONS
8 AS WELL, BUT WE EXPAND AS MUCH AS WE POSSIBLY CAN.

9

10 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGHOUT CHAIR? ON.

11

12 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I THINK THAT WE REALLY APPRECIATE ALL OF
13 YOUR IDEAS AND INPUT. ONE THING THAT I HAVE, I HAVE BEEN IN
14 MEETINGS ON THIS MOST RECENT PROGRAMS THE WORKFORCE
15 DEVELOPMENT THROUGH NON-PROFIT, THEY'RE LOOKING AT CREATIVE
16 IDEAS TO BUILD THE WORKFORCE AND AS I'M LISTENING TO THIS I
17 THINK THEY SHOULD INTERVIEW SEVERAL OF YOU BECAUSE THERE ARE
18 OPPORTUNITIES NOT JUST WITH MTC, WE'RE WORKING WITH OUR
19 TRANSIT PARTNERS WHERE THEIR BIGGEST CHALLENGES ARE BESIDES
20 THE FISCAL CLIFF ARE THE VACANCIES AND ATTRACTING TALENT. THE
21 IDEAS YOU ARE BRINGING UP WORKING EFFECTIVELY AND BRINGING
22 FORWARD OPPORTUNITIES THIS IS REALLY HELPFUL FOR US, OBVIOUSLY
23 THE PART ABOUT RESOURCES IS IMPORTANT BUT WE'RE LOOKING FOR
24 CREATIVE IDEAS ON HOW TO BE MORE EFFECTIVE IN THIS CASE.

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. VINAY? PIMPLE.

2

3 **VINAY PIMPLE:** KY-NAM, WHEN THE STUDENTS SAID THEY NEED YOUNGER
4 SPEAKERS, I THINK YOU NEED TO TAKE THAT ON BOARD, BECAUSE WHEN
5 YOU'RE MY AGE AND YOU SHOW PICTURES OF ME, THE KIDS ARE NEVER
6 GOING TO BELIEVE THAT I WAS EVER YOUNG. JUST KEEP THAT IN
7 MIND. I HAVE TAKEN CLASSES WITH 18-YEAR-OLDS WHEN I WAS IN MY
8 30S, SO I KNOW HOW THEY RESPOND. I HAVE TAUGHT 18-YEAR-OLDS. I
9 HAVE TUTORED AND MENTORED 15 AND 16-YEAR-OLDS, SO WHEN THEY
10 SAY YOUNGER SPEAKERS, IT MEANS YOUNGER SPEAKERS. SO THAT'S
11 ALL. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. BEFORE WE GO TO OUR ONLINE
14 MEMBERS AND THE PUBLIC, I DO WANT TO POINT OUT TO ALL OF YOU
15 THAT ORIGINALLY, WE HAD A HIGH SCHOOL PROGRAM THAT DISTRIBUTED
16 STUDENTS INTO AGENCIES AND IT WAS, FOR THE SOLE PURPOSE OF
17 INTRODUCING THEM TO SOMETHING THAT THEY WOULD NOT HAVE, YOU
18 KNOW, UNDERSTOOD, OR THOUGHT OF AS A CAREER PATH, AND ALL OF
19 THE WORK THAT'S BEING DONE NOW WAS KIND OF, THEN I WOULD ALSO
20 RECOMMEND AN IN-PERSON KICKOFF, NOT JUST A WRAP UP, BUT AN IN-
21 PERSON KICKOFF, LIKE, WE JUST ALL MET TODAY FOR THE FIRST
22 TIME, IN-PERSON, IT MAKES A DIFFERENCE WHEN YOU HAVE THE TIME
23 TO SIT AND CHAT WITH EACH OTHER. AND I REALLY WANT TO SEE US
24 GET BACK TO THAT POSITION OF BEING ABLE TO PARTNER WITH
25 AGENCIES WHO DO THEIR OWN INTERNSHIP PROGRAMS, BUT CROSS



MARCH 08, 2023

1 CONNECT WITH THEM AND I AM GOING TO VOLUNTEER MY CAMPUS,
2 BECAUSE WE HAVE THE ONLY COMMUNITY COLLEGE THAT ACTUALLY WORKS
3 WITH A TRANSIT AGENCY THAT TRAINS BUS DRIVERS, THAT TRAINS
4 LIGHT WHEEL DRIVERS THAT THE PEOPLE WHO GO TO SCHOOL WITH US
5 GET COLLEGE CREDITS AND THEY BECOME PART OF THE VTA SYSTEM. SO
6 THAT'S ANOTHER -- IT'S ANOTHER TOUCH STONE POINT FOR BOTH
7 BAYREN AND FOR -- FOR OUR INTERNSHIP PROGRAM. BECAUSE IF THEY
8 WANT TO HEAR SOMEBODY WHO IS ENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT THEIR JOB,
9 THEY CAN TALK TO THE BUS DRIVER, WHEN I ASKED THE BUS DRIVER
10 WHY ARE YOU DRIVING A BUS SHE HAD BEEN IN THE CORPORATE WORLD
11 HAD TEAMS WORKING UNDER HER AND COULDN'T AFFORD TO BUY A
12 HOUSE, AND HER FAMILY ALL WORKED FOR VTA AND THEY ALL BOUGHT
13 HOUSES. SO THAT'S WHAT SHE DID. SHE WENT THROUGH OUR TRAINING,
14 SHE GOT COLLEGE CREDITS. SHE KEEPS COMING BACK FOR MORE
15 COLLEGE CREDITS AND MORE TRAINING, AND SHE BOUGHT HER HOUSE.
16 SO WHEN HER FRIENDS IN THE CORPORATE WORLD WERE STARING AT
17 HER, SHE SAID YOU CAN COME TO A BARBECUE AT THE HOUSE I BOUGHT
18 BY WORKING WITH VTA, BECAUSE I EARN A GOOD LIVING HERE. THAT'S
19 WHAT WE WANT TO ENCOURAGE IN OUR COMMUNITIES. WE HAVE LOW-
20 INCOME STUDENTS WHO DON'T SEE A PATHWAY. I'M REALLY EXCITED
21 ABOUT THIS AND I THINK WE CAN -- I KNOW THAT SUPERVISOR CHAVEZ
22 HAS A GREAT INTERNSHIP PROGRAM WITHIN HER OWN OFFICE MOST OF
23 THE COUNTY'S SUPERVISORS HAVE INTERNSHIP PROGRAMS. YOU MIGHT
24 WANT TO CHAT WITH HER BECAUSE SHE REALLY BRINGS IN SOME YOUNG
25 INTERNS AT TIMES AND HOW WE CAN KIND OF FIGURE OUT THE -- HOW



MARCH 08, 2023

1 TO CONNECT PEOPLE WHO HAVE JOBS FOR AN INTERN AFTER THEY HAVE
2 BEEN THROUGH OUR PROGRAM WITH, YOU KNOW, WITH THE NON-PROFIT
3 THAT IS OUT THERE. WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO ASK THE CLERK TO
4 CALL ON ANY MEMBERS, AND MEMBERS WHO ARE ATTENDING REMOTELY,
5 PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND WE WILL ALSO
6 TAKE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AT THIS POINT.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MORE BALDINI, I SAW YOU WITH YOUR HAND
9 RAISED EARLIER.

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I'LL COME BACK TO YOU IF YOU DON'T MIND
12 OR YOU CAN GO NOW.

13

14 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** I'LL WORK WITH MY COLLEAGUE TERRY SCOTT IN
15 NAPA AND WE'LL BE MORE THAN HAPPY TO HELP IN THAT EFFORT TO
16 BRING IT. ALSO THE QUESTION RESOLVED AROUND SPECIFICALLY
17 TRANSIT, YES, IT'S GREAT TO HEAR ABOUT YOUR PROGRAM, RANDI,
18 THAT WE'RE SHORT DRIVERS UP IN THE NAPA VALLEY, TRANSIT
19 SYSTEM, IT WOULD BE NICE TO EXPLORE THAT FURTHER, WE COULD
20 PERHAPS TOO AT NAPA COLLEGE. IS THIS LIMITED TO THE -- THERE
21 IS A PRETTY ROBUST MANUFACTURED GOODS UP IN THE NORTH BAY
22 COUNTIES? OR IS IT STRICTLY LIMITED TO TRANSIT OR AGENCIES
23 RATHER THAN THE PUBLIC, AS AN EXAMPLE? WOULD THEY ARE A SOURCE
24 OF FUNDS AS FAR AS DEVELOPING THIS MENTORSHIP PROGRAM?

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** WELL, WE HAVEN'T CONTEMPLATED THE
2 FINANCING ASPECT OF IT. I CAN SAY PREVIOUSLY IT WAS LIMITED TO
3 TRANSIT OPERATORS, THAT WAS WHERE OUR INTERNSHIPS WERE WITH, I
4 THINK WE'RE OPEN TO OTHER PUBLIC AGENCIES, HOUSING WORK, YOU
5 KNOW, I THINK NOW THAT MTC HAS EVOLVED AND WORKING WITH ABAG
6 THERE ARE PLACES WE COULD CONSIDER.

7

8 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION.

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?
11 THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.
12 DAVEED MANDELL. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO
13 MINUTES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES WE CAN.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** GREAT. GLAD TO BE HERE. I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT
20 YOUR YOUTH PROGRAMS ARE EXCITING AND INVIGORATING AND KY-NAM
21 YOU MADE REFERENCE TO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND I'M
22 WONDERING HOW -- IF YOU HAVE BEEN WORKING ON ANY PLANS TO
23 INTEGRATE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES INTO THE ACADEMY AND OTHER
24 YOUTH PROGRAMS AND IF YOU HAVE AN IDEA OF HOW YOU PLAN TO DO
25 IT? AND SOME OF US CAN PROBABLY ASSIST YOU. THERE ARE CAREER



MARCH 08, 2023

1 PROGRAMS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, AND NOT ONLY PLACEMENT
2 PROGRAMS BUT PROGRAMS WHERE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES CAN COME,
3 ESPECIALLY HIGH SCHOOL KIDS, STUDENTS, AND THEY CAN INTERVIEW
4 PEOPLE WHO WORK IN THE FIELD. YOU MIGHT CONSIDER BRINGING IN
5 PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES WHO ARE TRANSIT INDUSTRY
6 PROFESSIONALS, SO THAT FOLKS CAN HEAR ABOUT HOW THEY WERE ABLE
7 TO INTEGRATE INTO VARIOUS SECTORS OF THE INDUSTRY, AND THE
8 KIND OF ACCOMMODATIONS THEY RECEIVE, THE ASSISTIVE TECHNOLOGY
9 THEY USE AND THAT KIND OF THING. SO I'M JUST CURIOUS AS TO HOW
10 YOU PLAN TO INTEGRATE PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES?

11

12 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** THANK YOU DAVEED. EXCELLENT QUESTION.
13 IT'S A TWOFOLD APPROACH. ONE IS THE RECRUITMENT, WE NEED TO DO
14 A BETTER JOB MAKING SURE THE APPLICANT POOL HAS STUDENTS WITH
15 DISABILITIES AND THAT STUDENTS WITH DISABILITIES SEE
16 THEMSELVES BEING ABLE TO PARTICIPATE. AND THEN TWO, ONCE THOSE
17 STUDENTS IN THE PROGRAM THEN KIND OF PROACTIVELY AND
18 INDIVIDUALLY, WORKING WITH THEM TO SEE WHAT ACCOMMODATIONS CAN
19 BE PROVIDED TO THEM SO THEY CAN FULLY PARTICIPATE. I THINK
20 THAT THERE IS ALSO, I THINK YOU HAVE AN EXCELLENT SUGGESTION
21 ABOUT BRINGING IN PEOPLE WHO WORK IN THE FIELD WITH DISABILITY
22 WHO IS CAN LEND THAT INSIGHT TO ALL THE STUDENTS. WITH THE
23 PASSING OF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] RECENTLY, THERE IS A CURRICULUM
24 SPACE THIS SUMMER TO BRING ABOUT WHAT IS IT LIKE TO THINK IN
25 TERMS OF UNIVERSAL DESIGN AND HOW DO WE BRING THAT NOT JUST



MARCH 08, 2023

1 INTO OUR TRANSIT PROGRAMS BUT OUR SIBLING AGENCIES, WHAT ARE
2 THEY DOING TO THINK THROUGH THE CHALLENGES THAT A QUARTER OF
3 OUR POPULATION FACES WITH A DISABILITY. I WELCOME YOUR IDEAS
4 AND PARTICULARLY HELP IN RECRUIT STARTING NEXT WEEK WHEN THE
5 PROGRAM OPENS FOR APPLICATIONS.

6

7 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** I WOULD ECHO THAT IF THERE IS ANYTHING WE
8 CAN DO TO HELP MAKE CONTACT AT COLLEGES FOR RECRUITMENT, I
9 WOULD LOVE TO HELP THE MORE RESOURCES THE BETTER. WE HAVE
10 INCREASED ADVERTISING ON DIVERSIVE SITES AND REACHED OUT TO
11 COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES. THIS PAST SUMMER DESPITE OUR
12 EFFORTS WE WEREN'T ABLE TO RECRUIT SOMEONE WITH VISIBILITY
13 DISABILITIES WE WOULD LIKE TO OF COURSE CONTINUE TO HAVE THAT
14 FOR SUMMER OF 2023 WE F WE COULD IF THERE IS SOME WAY TO WORK
15 WITH YOU, I WOULD CERTAINLY APPRECIATE THAT.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. THIS WILL BE THE LAST CALL FOR
18 PEOPLE WHO ARE WATCHING THE MEETING REMOTELY TO EITHER RAISE
19 YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE. MARTHA ARE THERE ANY HANDS
20 RAISED? WITH THAT I'LL BRING IT BACK FOR LAST MINUTE -- GO
21 AHEAD.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** I HAD A QUESTION IN REGARDS TO OUTREACH. ARE YOU ABLE
24 TO DO IN-PERSON OUTREACH? YEAH. JUST WONDERING. I KNOW OF
25 SEVERAL COLLEGE CAMPUSES WHERE THAT IN-PERSON CONNECTION AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 WITH THE FESTIVALS THAT ARE COMING UP IN THE SPRING, SO THAT.
2 AND, ALSO, JUST APPRECIATIVE OF THE TIMING OF THIS
3 PRESENTATION, KNOWING THAT THERE ARE SOME REALLY GREAT
4 OPPORTUNITIES FOR RECRUITMENT COMING UP ON OUR LOCAL COLLEGE
5 CAMPUSES.

6

7 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** WE HAVE NOT DONE, BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC,
8 WE HAVE NOT DONE A LOT OF IN-PERSON COLLEGE EVENTS. WE DO GET
9 A NUMBER OF APPLICATIONS THOUGH BASED ON ADVERTISING, AND BUT
10 I CERTAINLY CAN UNDERSTAND AND APPRECIATE THAT MAYBE IN-PERSON
11 WOULD BE HELPFUL PERHAPS WITH SOME OF THE COMMUNITIES COLLEGES
12 WHERE WE DON'T HAVE AS MUCH OF A RELATIONSHIP PERHAPS WE CAN
13 DO MORE IN-PERSON EVENTS. PART OF IT IS TIMING, PART OF IT IS
14 RESOURCES, GIVEN THE PANDEMIC IS CERTAINLY AT BAY, THIS MIGHT
15 BE THE RIGHT TIME TO START DOING SO.

16

17 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** JUST NOTED WE HAVE APRIL 17TH IS THE
18 CURRENT DEADLINE I'M NOT SURE WHAT EVENTS YOU WERE
19 CONTEMPLATING WITH THAT SAID BETWEEN NOW AND APRIL 17TH IS
20 HAPPENING. I THINK I COULD BE PERSUADED TO GO TO SONOMA OR
21 NAPA TO DO SOME OUT REACH.

22

23 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** MYSELF AS WELL OUR DEADLINE WOULD PROBABLY
24 BE APRIL WE'LL START ADVERTISING NEXT WEEK AFTER NEXT AND MAY



MARCH 08, 2023

1 WILL BE OUR DEADLINE. IF THERE IS SOMETHING YOU WOULD
2 RECOMMEND I WOULD CERTAINLY BE OPEN TO THAT AS WELL.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** TABLING WAS ON MY LIST OF NOTES.
5 COMMUNITIES COLLEGES HAVE A NETWORKS OF PIOS THAT HAVE THEIR
6 OWN GROUP AND WE CAN CERTAINLY CONNECT YOU WITH THE PIOS IN
7 CAMPUSES WHO IS PUT THAT INFORMATION OUT. I DON'T KNOW ABOUT
8 OTHER CAMPUSES BUT WE HAVE A USER'S GROUP WHERE I GET FAR TOO
9 MUCH MAIL THAT I CANNOT READ BUT THAT COULD BE PLACED IN
10 PLACES WHERE STUDENTS COULD SEE. I WOULD LOVE TO WORK ON THIS,
11 EVEN IF YOU CAN'T BE THERE TO TABLE I CAN TABLE IT FOR YOU.
12 THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS, USE US AS MUCH AS YOU CAN WHEN WE'RE
13 AVAILABLE TO DO THESE THINGS. GO AHEAD.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** AMAZING PRESENTATION. ALL OF THESE PROGRAMS ARE
16 WONDERFUL. THANK YOU FOR SHARING WITH US. I WILL CALL OUT A
17 SUGGESTION, GIVEN THE VERY YOUNG NICHE DEMOGRAPHIC YOU'RE
18 TRYING TO REACH, AND THERE IS THAT SOCIAL MEDIA CULTURE WHO
19 LOVE TRANSPORTATION AND THE MEMES ARE AMAZING. JUST A THOUGHT
20 F YOUR BUDGET IS REALLY LIMITED, AND I KNOW TABLING IS ALSO
21 FANTASTIC BUT IF YOU WANT TO TAKE RESOURCES AND GO A LONG WAY,
22 DO GEO TARGETED ADS ON TIK-TOK. JUST FROM PERSONAL EXPERIENCE
23 THE CONVERSION RATE FOR YOUTH IS HIGH ON THAT APP IN TERMS OF
24 DRIVING INFORMATION ON THESE PROGRAMS GETTING THEM TO APPLY,
25 AND I WOULD SUGGEST AS YOU'RE GOING THROUGH THESE PROGRAMS, I



MARCH 08, 2023

1 KNOW RESOURCING IS AN ISSUE BUT CAPTURING THE NARRATIVE OF
2 THEIR EXPERIENCES IS SO POWERFUL ESPECIALLY AS YOU ARE
3 BUILDING ON THE PROGRAM FOR THE FUTURE, AND THE GREAT THING
4 ABOUT THAT IS SOMETIMES YOU CAN EMPOWER THESE YOUNG PEOPLE TO
5 DO THE STORY TELLING THEMSELVES ABOUT THEIR EXPERIENCES, ABOUT
6 THE PEOPLE THEY MIGHT. EVEN IF THEY HAVE ONE OF THE MEETINGS
7 HERE -- WHEN I WALK IN, I THOUGHT THE BUILDING WAS SO COOL
8 IT'S AN AMAZING EXPERIENCE THEY CAN TAKE IN, JUST SOME
9 THOUGHTS AND SUGGESTIONS. IF YOU WANT WE CAN CONNECT.

10

11 **JOHN KANNEGIESER:** WE'RE WORKING WITH COLLEGES, AND I THINK
12 TIK-TOK IS THE WAY TO GO. AND WITH THE BUDGET TO DO MORE
13 ADVERTISING ON TIK-TOK, IN THE WAY OF THE FUTURE.

14

15 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I'LL CIRCLE BACK WITH OUR SOCIAL MEDIA
16 TEAM LAST YEAR WE ADVERTISED ACROSS INSTAGRAM AND TIK-TOK, AND
17 TIK-TOK YIELDED THE MOST ACTIVITY WE POLLED APPLICANTS AND
18 ASKED HOW DID YOU HEAR ABOUT IT AND SOCIAL MEDIA, AND MOST
19 PEOPLE SAID THEY PROACTIVELY GOOGLED IT. I DON'T THINK THAT'S
20 THE ENDS ALL, I THINK TIK-TOK IS THE DEMOGRAPHIC IF WE WANT TO
21 REACH, ONE OF OUR FIRST WAS MR. BARRICADE WHO HAS GOT A
22 MILLION FOLLOWERS AND TALKS ABOUT DRAINAGE AND TRANSIT, AND I
23 THINK GETTING INFLUENCERS IN THE TRANSIT AND IN THE TRANSIT
24 NERD SPACE WOULD BE EXCELLENT. ANY POINTERS WOULD BE GREAT.
25 JOHN, YOU MADE A GREAT POINT KY-NAM, AT COLLEGES WERE IN THE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 COLLEGE PLACEMENT OFFICE OR LOOKING ONLINE AT LEAST THEY
2 DIDN'T DISCLOSE IT WAS FROM A TIK-TOK AD OR SOMETHING DOESN'T
3 MEAN WE COULDN'T EXPAND ON THAT IN THE FUTURE.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. MARTHA?

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** MORE ONE COUNCIL MEMBER WITH THEIR HAND
8 RAISED.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** ONLINE?

11

12 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. ZACK, GO AHEAD.

13

14 **ZACH GROSS:** CAN YOU HEAR ME ALL RIGHT? SORRY. I CAN'T BE WITH
15 YOU IN PERSON. I WAS WONDERING IN RELATION TO THE MENTORSHIP
16 PROGRAM, THAT YOU MENTIONED I THINK IT'S FANTASTIC AND HOPE WE
17 CAN CONTINUE TO PROMOTE AND GROW. WHAT KIND OF AGENCY ARE WE
18 INCLUDING IN THESE PROGRAMS MANY TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE YOUTH
19 ADVISORY BOARDS HOW CAN WE MAKE SURE WE'RE NOT CREATING A
20 GENERATION OF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] BUT MOVING FORWARD ON THEIR
21 NEEDS AND PERSPECTIVES WHILE ENGAGE THEM THROUGH THIS PROCESS.

22

23 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** ONE THING WE HAVE BEEN WARY WITH THIS
24 COUNCIL HAS BEEN THE CREATION OF NEW BOARDS, BECAUSE THAT
25 TENDS TO NATURALLY HAPPEN, AND AT THE SAME TIME, I THINK, YOU



MARCH 08, 2023

1 KNOW, WE CAN DO A BETTER JOB OF RECRUITING FOR BOTH
2 REPLACEMENTS AND FUTURE ITERATIONS OF THIS COUNCIL TO MAKE
3 SURE YOUTH PERSPECTIVES ARE INCLUDED. WE HAVE THE VOICE OF THE
4 CUSTOMER ADVISORY COUNCIL WHICH WILL HAVE THE YOUTH AND
5 STUDENT PERSPECTIVES INSTITUTIONALLY BUILT INTO THAT, ONE OR
6 TWO SLOTS DEDICATED TO STUDENTS. I THINK THAT IT WILL BE A
7 NATURAL PROVING GROUNDS FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE INTERESTED IN
8 PUBLIC SERVICE AND INTERESTED IN REPRESENTING THAT AT THIS
9 STAGE IF THEIR LIVES. WE'RE WELCOMING IDEAS WE REALLY WANT
10 YOUTH, THIS GENERATION IS GOING TO BE USING TRANSIT MORE THAN
11 ANY OTHER GENERATION TO BE EMPOWERING AND INFLUENCING THESE
12 DECISIONS THAT ARE GOING TO IMPACT THEIR LIVES FOR DECADES.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT --

15

16 **ADINA LEVIN:** CAN I JUST --

17

18 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GO AHEAD.

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** YOU JUST MENTIONED THE RECRUITING, THE VOICE OF
21 THE CUSTOMER SUBCOMMITTEE, COULD WE -- [INDISCERNIBLE]
22 INTERESTED IN THAT -- THE ADVISORY BODY?

23

24 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** YEAH IT'S A DISCUSSION WE ALL NEED TO
25 FIGURE OUT WHAT'S POOL OF FOLKS AND WHO IS THE MOST



MARCH 08, 2023

1 REPRESENTATION. THERE WAS SENSE THAT SONOMA STATE OR SF STATE
2 SINCE THEY HAVE THE BAY PASS PROGRAMS WOULD BE A LOGICAL POOL,
3 ALUMNI FROM THE HIGH SCHOOL WOULD BE GRIT AS WELL.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE ANOTHER AGENDA ITEM.
6 WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM SEVEN NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY
7 STUDIES ANALYSIS. LOOKS LIKE IT WILL BE DAVE VAUTIN.

8

9 **ANUP TAPASE:** ANUP TAPASE.

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OH THERE YOU ARE.

12

13 **ANUP TAPASE:** MY NAME IS ANUP TAPASE, PLANNER MAJOR PLANS I
14 WOULD LOVE TO BE THERE IN-PERSON BUT UNABLE TO TRAVEL TODAY.
15 JOINED BY DAVE VAUTIN WHO IS THERE IN-PERSON AND ALSO
16 AVAILABLE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS. THIS IS MY THIRD TIME COMING TO
17 THIS COUNCIL ON THE STUDY. THE FIRST TIME WAS BACK IN FEBRUARY
18 OF LAST YEAR WHEN WE INTRODUCED THE STUDY AS A FIRST AND EARLY
19 IMPLEMENTATION ACTION OF STRATEGY T5 IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050
20 TO HELP NARROW DOWN FUTURE EFFORTS AND WE WENT OVER WHY WE'RE
21 STUDYING PRICING, SPECIFICALLY OUR TRAVEL FORECAST FOR 2035
22 SHOWING DETERIORATION IN TRAVEL TIMES AND EMISSIONS TARGET
23 THAT'S DIFFICULT TO ACHIEVE IN ABSENCE OF BOTH STRATEGIES I
24 WENT OVER HOW THE GROUND IS SHIFTING IN THE U.S. AS MORE URBAN
25 REGIONS THROUGHOUT THE NATION ARE CONSIDERING PRICING, AND THE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 FEDERAL LAW HAS OPENED CONVERSATION ON MANAGING DEMAND ON
2 INTERSTATE HIGHWAYS. THEN IN OCTOBER WE HAD OUR SECOND
3 INTERACTION WHERE I SHARED OUR EARLY LEARNINGS FROM SMALL
4 GROUP DISCUSSIONS WITH COMMUNITY MEMBERS WHERE WE HEARD
5 FRUSTRATION WITH TRAFFIC AND UNAFFORDABILITY IN THE REGION AND
6 NEGATIVE FEEDBACK ABOUT ROAD PRICING ESPECIALLY AS WE DID NOT
7 HAVE BETTER THOUGHT OUT PROPOSALS FOR PATHWAYS AND DATA AND
8 WHAT OUTCOMES WE WOULD EXPECT. TODAY I WANT TO SHARE UPDATE ON
9 THE PROGRESS OUR ADVISORY GROUP HAS MADE OVER THE LAST FEW
10 MONTHS THIS IS DENSE MATERIAL AND THE DEVILS ARE IN THE
11 DETAILS HOPEFULLY YOU HAD A CHANCE TO REVIEW THE ATTACHMENTS I
12 KNOW THERE WAS A LONG LIST BUT AS REQUESTED WE'RE KEEPING
13 TODAY'S PRESENTATION BRIEF AND TOUCHING ON THE HIGHLIGHTS.
14 THIS IS MATERIAL WE ARE CURRENTLY REVIEWING WITH MULTIPLE
15 STAKEHOLDERS WITH GOVERNMENTAL AND NON-GOVERNMENTAL. SO BEFORE
16 TAKING THIS TO OUR POLICY MAKERS I AM LOOKING FOR YOUR
17 FEEDBACK TODAY AND INCORPORATING IT. WITH THAT, BRING UP THE
18 SLIDES, PLEASE. JUMP TO THE SECOND SLIDE, PLEASE? STARTING
19 WITH CONTEXT ON FREEWAYS TO REMIND OURSELVES. OUR FREEWAYS ARE
20 EXTREMELY VALUABLE PUBLIC GOOD A QUARTER OF MILES IN THE
21 REGION BUT CARRY 60% OF ALL VEHICLE MILES. FREEWAY PEAK
22 VOLUMES ARE BEYOND PRE-PANDEMIC VOLUMES BAY AREA DRIVERS SPEND
23 20 MINUTES EACH DAY IN TRAFFIC. CONSIDERED PRE-PANDEMIC AND
24 THAT HAS SURGED BACK. THE SITUATION MAY BE WORKING FOR SOME OF
25 US WHO WORK-FROM-HOME AND USE FREEWAYS OCCASIONALLY BUT IT IS



MARCH 08, 2023

1 FRUSTRATING TO MANY USERS WHO ARE NEVER ABLE TO WORK-FROM-HOME
2 DON'T HAVE THE OPTION TO TAKE TRANSIT OR DO NOT LIVE CLOSE TO
3 THEIR JOB. FREEWAYS ASSOCIATED WITH MOBILITY AND EQUITY
4 CHALLENGES WHETHER THAT'S CONGESTION, INFREQUENT TRANSIT
5 OPTIONS AND WEATHER BARRIERS. NEXT SLIDE. WHERE DO WE GO FROM
6 HERE. WE CAN STICK WITH OUR EXISTING STRATEGY TOOLKIT THAT
7 INCLUDES EXPRESS LANES, EXPRESS BUSES HELPING PEOPLE VANPOOL
8 AND CARPOOL AND USING E-BIKES THESE ALL RESULT IN MARGINAL
9 CHANGES IN MODE SHIFT NOT CHANGING OUR RELATIONSHIP WITH
10 FREEWAYS AND WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO ACHIEVE OUR STATE-MANDATED
11 TARGET. WE COULD INTRODUCE PRICING STRATEGIES ON OUR FREEWAYS
12 THAT HELPS MAXIMIZE PRICING INVESTMENTS. PRICING ON ITS OWN
13 HAS SPECIFIC EQUITY CONCERNS OR EXPLORE PRICING STRATEGIES.
14 HOW WE CAN LEVERAGE PRICING AND RELATED REVENUES AS A TOOL TO
15 ADVANCE EQUITY OUTCOMES NOT HURT EQUITY THAT'S THE FOCUS OF
16 OUR STUDY. THERE ARE MULTIPLE THINGS WE SHOULD BE DOING
17 CONCURRENTLY TO MEET OUR GOALS BUILDING MORE HOUSING NEAR
18 JOBS, ELECTRIFY TRANSPORTATION, HIGH SPEED INTERNET SO PEOPLE
19 CAN WORK-FROM-HOME THESE ARE STRATEGIES THAT ARE PART OF THE
20 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WITH SEPARATE CONCURRENT PLANNING OR
21 IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS. OUR FINDING IN THE PLAN WAS PRICING
22 UNLOCKS POTENTIAL TO MAKE REAL HEADWAYS ON MANY OF OUR GOALS
23 AND THERE IS A NEED TO UNDERSTAND THE POTENTIAL OF PRICING
24 BETTER. SO, OUR STUDY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE -- WHERE WE KNOW THE
25 CONCEPT OF PRICE SUGGEST WROUGHT WITH CHALLENGES OUR STUDIES



MARCH 08, 2023

1 IDENTIFY WHETHER THERE ARE EQUITABLE PATHWAYS CENTERED ON
2 PRICING TOWARD VISION OF NEXGEN FREEWAYS. IF WE'RE HERE AT THE
3 BOTTOM TODAY AND WHAT NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY IS 15 TO 20
4 YEARS AHEAD ARE THERE PATHWAYS TO GET US THERE. I SAY PATHWAYS
5 REFERRING TO PRICING STRATEGIES COMBINED WITH MEANINGFUL SUITE
6 OF STRATEGIES. TODAY'S FOCUS, I WOULD LIKE TO COMMUNICATE
7 THREE THINGS. WHAT HAVE WE HEARD FROM COMMUNITIES, WHAT IS THE
8 SHARED VISION FOR NEXT GENERATION FREEWAYS AND FITTING INTO
9 THE SHARED VISION. A QUICK REFRESHER, THIS IS A TWO YEAR STUDY
10 WE'RE AT THE MIDPOINT NOW. WE HAVE TWO ROUTES OF COMMUNITY
11 ENGAGEMENT ONE COMPLETE AND ONE PLANNED FOR LATER IN THIS YEAR
12 TWO ROUNDS OF TECHNICAL ANALYSIS JUST GETTING STARTED ON THE
13 FIRST ONE. WE HAVE BEEN ENGAGING IN TWO ADVISORY GROUP, A
14 STAFF LEVEL GROUP AS WELL AS EXECUTIVE LEVEL GROUP. NEXT
15 SLIDE. WHAT WE HEARD FROM COMMUNITIES LESS TRAFFIC NUMBER ONE
16 PRIORITY ALONG WITH SAFE FREEWAYS. WE HEARD EARLY REACTIONS TO
17 ROAD PRICING, QUOTES LIKE WE ALREADY PAID FOR THIS, DOUBLE
18 TAXATION. IT WAS CLEAR TO US THAT WE NEEDED TO BE UP FRONT
19 ABOUT MISCONCEPTIONS THAT PEOPLE HOLD LIKE MORE LANES CAN
20 SOLVE CONGESTION OR WE WERE TRYING TO SIMPLY RAISE REVENUES OR
21 LACK OF UNDERSTANDING OF HOW GAS TAX AND BRIDGE TOLL REVENUES
22 ARE DRIVING CONGESTION. LIMITING OUR ABILITY TO HAVE
23 PRODUCTIVE CONVERSATIONS. WE HAD WEBINARS IN THE FALL, WE
24 ADDED HISTORICAL CONTEXT, TALKED ABOUT HOW EXISTING TAX AND
25 TOLL REVENUES ARE BEING USED AND HOW WE'RE STILL NOT SEEING



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THE OUTCOMES WE WANT MOST IMPORTANTLY IN THE CONTEXT OF PUBLIC
2 FEEDBACK, YES TRAFFIC. THROUGH POLLS WE CONDUCTED DURING THOSE
3 WEBINARS WE SAW HOW THIS EDUCATIONAL AND TRUST BUILDING
4 APPROACH WAS HELPFUL IN EXPLAINING WHY WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT
5 BOLDER STRATEGIES. AND SO THAT KIND OF APPROACH THAT YOU SAW
6 ON THE WEBINARS WILL CONTINUE TO DEFINE OUR FUTURE ENGAGEMENT
7 LATER THIS YEAR. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. NEXT PAGE PLEASE. JUMPING
8 INTO THE SECOND TOPIC OF FOCUS, WHAT IS A SHARED VISION OF
9 NEXT GENERATION FREEWAYS? BASED ON WHEN WE HEARD DURING THE
10 SMALL GROUP DISCUSSIONS AND WORKING WITH OUR ADVISORY GROUP WE
11 LAID OUT THIS VISION FOR ALTERNATIVE FUTURE SOMETHING WE ALL
12 WANT TO WORK TOWARDS ONE WHERE EVERYONE HAS AFFORDABLE TRAVEL
13 OPTION THAT IS ALSO COST EFFECTIVE. MORE PEOPLE HAVE
14 COMPETITIVE ALTERNATIVES TO DRIVING SO FREEWAYS ARE EFFICIENT
15 FOR EVERYONE BOTH DRIVER SUPERVISOR THOSE WHO LEAVE THEIR CAR
16 BEHIND OR DON'T OWN ONE. NOT EVERYONE CAN HAVE ALTERNATIVES
17 BUT IF MORE PEOPLE AT LEAST SOME PEOPLE WILL GET OFF THE
18 FREEWAYS AND SOMEONE HAS TO GET OFF THE FREEWAY FOR TRAFFIC TO
19 BE BETTER COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE BEEN ADVERSELY IMPACTED BY
20 FREEWAY INFRASTRUCTURE AND POLICIES ARE SUPPORTED AND PEOPLE
21 EXPERIENCE SAFER TRAVEL CONDITIONS WHETHER THAT IS ON FREEWAYS
22 OFF FREEWAYS OR TRANSIT ALL TO IMPROVE FREEWAYS. I WANT TO
23 HIGHLIGHT WHILE WE DON'T CALL OUT THE WORD EQUITY ANYWHERE ON
24 THIS PAGE IT'S THE LENS OF HOW WE WANT TO MAKE PROGRESS, WE
25 WANT TO SEE BETTER OUTCOMES FOR OUR EQUITY PRIORITY



MARCH 08, 2023

1 COMMUNITIES. OUR AGREEMENT FOR GOALS WE UNDERSTAND PEOPLE FEEL
2 DIFFERENT ABOUT THESE GOALS AND THAT'S FINISH, ALL GOALS
3 RECEIVE MAJORITY SUPPORT DURING OUR WEBINARS. THESE GOALS ARE
4 MEANT TO BE A COMMON POINT THAT WE STRIVE TOWARD WITH OR
5 WITHOUT PRICING. THESE ARE THE GOALS WE WANT TO ACHIEVE FOR
6 THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAYS. SHIFTING TO THE RIGHT SIDE OF
7 THE PAGE LET'S THINK ABOUT PRICING FITTING INTO GOALS. PRICING
8 MAY ENABLE TIME SAVINGS THAT CREATE VALUE, IF SOMEONE PAYS 4
9 TO \$6, TO CREATE VALUE AND GET 20 MINUTES BACK, CAN WE
10 MITIGATE FOR TARGETED DISCOUNTS, PRICING ENCOURAGING MODE
11 SHIFT WHEN OPTIONS ARE AVAILABLE AND GENERATE REVENUE SAYS TO
12 IMPROVE THOSE OPTIONS. PRICING CAN HELP LOWER TRAVEL TIMES AND
13 INCENTIVIZE DRIVERS TO SHIFT TRAVEL FOR OFF PEAK WHERE
14 POSSIBLE BUT IMPORTANTLY, PRICING COULD PUSH USERS TO LOCAL
15 STREETS, THAT NOT ONLY CREATING CONGESTION BUT SAFETY
16 CHALLENGES. PRICING REVENUE ADJUSTMENTS AND COMMUNITY FOR
17 INSTANCE MAKE UNDERPASSES SAFER TO WALK OR FIND MORE GREEN
18 TREES TO BALANCE OUT THE CONCRETE. THE COST BURDEN OF PRICING
19 FALLS ON THE SAME COMMUNITIES FOR INVESTMENTS. PRICING COULD
20 GENERATE REVENUES FOR SAFETY INVESTMENTS BEG THE QUESTION WHAT
21 ARE SAFETY INVESTMENTS ON LOCAL STREETS HAVE TO DO WITH A
22 DRIVER PAYING A TOLL. I HAVE TO REITERATE, SOMEONE HAS TO GET
23 OFF THE FREEWAY FOR THERE TO BE LESS TRAFFIC, IF CAN MAKE
24 TRANSIT SAFER SO PEOPLE WOULD TAKE TRANSIT THEN THAT DRIVER IS
25 EXPERIENCING DIRECT BENEFIT BY PEOPLE PAYING THE TOLL. THERE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 ARE MULTIPLE PROS AND CONS FOR PRICING WE END GOING INTO THIS
2 STUDY AND WE WANT TO STUDY THIS FURTHER THROUGH THE ANALYSIS.
3 NEXT PAGE. WHAT DO WE WANT TO EVALUATE IN OUR ANALYSIS WHEN WE
4 TALK ABOUT THESE PATHWAYS OUR ADVISORY GROUP HAS DEVELOPED
5 TRADEOFFS IN THE PROCESS OF DESIGNING PATHWAYS PATHWAYS
6 REFERRING TO COMBINATION OF STRATEGIES. FOR PRICING STRATEGIES
7 THEY CONSIDERED PRICING STRATEGIES IMPACT DRIVING CHANGE IN
8 THE LONG-TERM, HOW EXTENSIVE SHOULD TOLLING BE, PLACE AND
9 TIME. STRATEGIES FOR LOCAL STREETS AND ACTIVITY WHAT WE CALL
10 PATHWAY YOU SEE AN IMAGINE OF THE GAME ON THE RIGHT, MEMBERS
11 THOUGHT ABOUT HOW TO REINVEST A LIMIT OF POOL OF REVENUES FROM
12 A POTENTIAL MEGA MEASURE INTO VARIOUS STRATEGIES DEMONSTRATING
13 REVENUE INVESTMENT ACROSS DIFFERENT STRATEGIES INCLUDE HAD
14 TRANSIT FREQUENCY IMPROVEMENTS TRANSIT PRIORITY LANES TOLL
15 DISCOUNTS TRANSFER DISCOUNTS TOLL CREDITS IMPROVEMENTS TO
16 FREEWAY CROSSINGS NOISE MITIGATION. WHAT SHOULD WE PUT THE
17 TOLLING REVENUES TOWARDS DEBATING THINGS LIKE IMPORTANCE,
18 TRANSIT USER EXPERIENCE, IF PROVIDING DISCOUNTS SHOULD IT
19 BENEFIT DRIVERS OR INCENTIVIZE MORE TRANSIT USE. LET ME
20 ADDRESSING THE PRICING STRATEGIES ON THE NEXT PAGE. THE GROUP
21 LANDED ON EXPLORING THREE PRICING STRATEGIES FOR OUR FIRST
22 ROUND OF ANALYSIS. THE FIRST IS ALL-LANE TOLLING HIGHWAY
23 TOLLING IN TRANSIT-RICH CORRIDORS. THIS WOULD TOLL ALL LANES
24 OF HIGHWAYS IN CORRIDORS WITH EXISTING OR PLANNED REGIONAL
25 RAIL OR EXPRESS BUS SERVICE. WHEN I SAY "FREQUENT," I MEAN



MARCH 08, 2023

1 ABOUT TEN-MINUTE HEADWAYS. TOLLS WOULD VARY BY PLACE AND TIME
2 OF DAY. THEY WOULD BE ZERO IF THERE WERE NO CONGESTION,
3 ESPECIALLY IN THE OFFBEAT HOURS. IT SHOULDN'T COST TO DRIVE IF
4 THERE WERE NO CONGESTION. WE'RE NOT CONSIDERING TOLLING TO
5 RAISE REVENUES BUT IMPROVING EXPERIENCE TRAVELING ON FREEWAYS.
6 THE SECOND IS A VARIATION. THE ADVISORY GROUP MEMBERS WANT TO
7 UNDERSTAND WHETHER TOLLING MAJOR ARTERIALS IN ADDITION TO
8 HIGHWAYS WOULD HELP WITH DIVERSION ON TO LOCAL STREETS. THIS
9 IS, ADMITTEDLY, PERPLEXING TO IMAGINE HOW WE MIGHT TOLL
10 ARTERIALS. BUT THERE IS SOMETHING TO LEARN FROM IN EVALUATING
11 THIS IN OUR FIRST ROUND OF ANALYSIS. IN BOTH THESE STRATEGIES,
12 NUMBER ONE AND NUMBER TWO, ALL HIGHWAY LANES WOULD BE TOLLED
13 IN THOSE PLANNED CORRIDORS, AND THEY WOULD NOT BE EXPRESS
14 LANES BUT THEY CONTINUE TO EXIST AS CARPOOL LANES. THE THIRD
15 IS TOLL LANE VEHICLES ENTERING THE DOWNTOWNS OF THE THREE
16 LARGEST CITIES. [INDISCERNIBLE] MAY BE A PRICING STRATEGY THAT
17 SUIT LOCAL TRIPS RATHER THAN INTERCOUNTY TRIPS BUT THIS IS A
18 SUBSTANTIAL SHARE OF TRIPS INTO THE THREE URBAN DOWNTOWNS THAT
19 DO OCCUR ON FREEWAYS AND A SUBSTANTIAL AMOUNT OF TRIPS THAT
20 OCCUR IN CITIES WITHIN, PEOPLE GETTING FROM DOWNTOWN OAKLAND
21 THAT WOULD USE THE 880 OR 580. IF THOSE FOLKS ARE ABLE TO
22 SHIFT TO BETTER OPTIONS IT CAN IMPROVE FREEWAY CONDITIONS
23 WE'RE TALK BY THE TIME FUTURE IN 2035 WHERE DOWNTOWNS MIGHT
24 HAVE BETTER OPTIONS LIKE BART TO SAN JOSE AND THE CALTRAIN
25 PORTAL. NOW ALONGSIDE THESE THREE PRICING STRATEGIES, THE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 ADVISORY GROUP WOULD LIKE TO EVALUATE A FEW WITH NO NEW
2 PRICING INITIATIVES BUT FUNDING FROM POTENTIAL REGIONAL
3 MEASURES CAN BE USED EFFECTIVELY AND WHETHER THEY CAN BE USED
4 EFFECTIVELY TO ADVANCE THE FIVE GOALS THAT WE'RE LOOKING
5 FORWARD TO NEXT GENERATION FREEWAYS. SO THAT ADDRESSES THE
6 PRICING STRATEGIES LET ME GET INTO THE COMPLEMENTARY
7 STRATEGIES ON THE NEXT PAGE. WITH THOSE STRATEGIES FORMING THE
8 BASIS OF PATHWAYS OUR ADVISORY GROUP LANDED ON A PORTFOLIO OF
9 SEVEN PATHWAYS TO EVALUATE IN OUR FIRST ROUND OF TECHNICAL
10 ANALYSIS. THE ATTACHMENT WE PROVIDED HAS MORE DETAILS ON
11 WHAT'S IN THE PATHWAYS BUT LET ME PROVIDE THE HIGHLIGHTS. THE
12 IDEA HERE WAS TO CREATE DIVERGENT APPROACHES FOR THE FIRST
13 ROUND OF ANALYSIS SO WE CAN BEGIN TO UNDERSTAND THE IMPACT OF
14 DIFFERENT WAYS OF REINVESTING REVENUES. THE PORTFOLIO IS A
15 MATRIX OF THREE PRICING STRATEGIES, YOU SEE ON THE LEFT, AND
16 TWO VERSIONS OF COMPLIMENTARY STRATEGY PACKAGES THAT REINVEST
17 ALL REVENUES AND ALIGN A SHARE OF REVENUES FROM FUTURE
18 REGIONAL MEASURE FUNDING. A TOTAL POOL OF FUNDING THAT'S
19 AVAILABLE DIFFERS BY PRICING STRATEGY. WE DON'T EXACTLY KNOW
20 HOW MUCH UNTIL WE DO THE ANALYSIS BUT THE BARS INDICATES
21 RELATIVE SCALE WE EXPECT. GETTING INTO THE COLORFUL BARS THAT
22 YOU SEE, ACROSS PATHWAYS THERE IS ONE THING THAT THE ADVISORY
23 GROUP MEMBERS CONSISTENTLY READ ON THERE NEEDS TO BE A TRANSIT
24 FIRST FOCUS. SO THAT'S THE TRANSIT FIRST THAT YOU SEE IN RED
25 AND THAT INCLUDES INVESTING 40% OF TOTAL REVENUES IN A BUNDLE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 OF FOUR STRATEGIES. ONE, TO BOOST FREQUENCIES ON RAIL AND ALL
2 EXPRESS BUSES TO TEN MINUTE HEADWAYS, TO, TO IMPROVE OUR
3 CARPOOL LANES, AND MORE STRATEGIES TO IMPROVE ACCESS TO
4 TRANSIT, LOCAL SAFETY IMPROVEMENTS AND BIKE AND PED
5 IMPROVEMENTS ALL STRATEGIES IN THE FIRST BUNDLE REPRESENTING
6 40% OF THE INVESTMENT MOVING INTO THE TURQUOISE BOXES IS WE
7 WHERE WE SEE VERSIONS OF THE PATHWAYS, WITH REMAINDER OF 60%
8 OF INVESTMENT. ONE VERSION FOCUSING ON DOUBLING DOWN FROM
9 TRANSIT. WHAT IF WE POOLED A LARGE SHARE OF FUNDING TO DOUBLE
10 DOWN ON TRANSIT. THIS INCLUDES FOUR STRATEGIES, A LIMITED SET
11 OF NEW FREQUENT EXPRESS BUS ROUTES THAT ALSO OPERATES AT TEN
12 MINUTE HEAD WAYS LOCAL TRANSIT AGENCY BOOST TO INCREASE
13 HEADWAYS ON FEEDER BUSES TO ENABLE RAIL BUSES EXTEND SERVICE
14 HOURS INTO THE EVENING ON SOME BUSES, AND MORE PRIORITY LANES
15 IN CITIES. THAT'S THE BUNDLE OF FOUR STRATEGIES, THAT'S CALLED
16 TRANSIT DOUBLE DOWN. THE LIGHTER TURQUOISE BOX ON THE RIGHT,
17 CALLED SECOND REFOCUS 20% OF FUNDING FOR TRANSIT FAIR
18 DISCOUNTS AND REPARATIVE COMMUNITY INVESTMENTS. SECOND VERSION
19 IS CALLED AFFORDABILITY FOCUS. MORE DIRECTLY RESPOND TO WHAT
20 WE HEAR ON CONCERNS FOR AFFORDABILITY IN THE REGION WHAT IF WE
21 RESERVE A LARGE SHARE OF THE FUNDING FOR ADDRESSING
22 AFFORDABILITY? WE STILL HAVE THE TRANSIT FIRST STRATEGIES BUT
23 THIS AFFORDABILITY FOCUS IN TURN INCLUDES FOR MORE STRATEGIES
24 50% TRAVEL DISCOUNTS FOR LOW TO MEDIUM INCOME, 50% DISCOUNTS
25 FOR VERY LOW INCOMES, AND TOTAL -- [INDISCERNIBLE] REBATES AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 GROUPS DISCOUNTS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. SECOND FOCUS
2 RESERVES 20% OF FUNDING FOR COMMUNITY INVESTMENTS AS WELL AS
3 TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS. SIX PATHWAYS THREE PATHWAYS WITH TWO
4 STRATEGY BUNDLES, AND 7TH ADDITIONAL PATHWAY, WITH NO NEW
5 PRICING AND GIVEN LACK OF TOLLING REVENUES THIS FOCUSES ON THE
6 TRANSIT FIRST STRATEGIES AND, TRANSIT FARE DISCOUNTS. NOW I
7 DON'T BELIEVE ANY OF THESE SEVEN PATHWAYS WOULD THEMSELVES
8 ENDS UP BEING ONE OF OUR RECOMMENDATIONS AT THE END OF THE
9 STUDY. THESE ARE FOR ANALYSIS UNDERSTANDING IMPACTS OF
10 DIFFERENT WAYS OF INVENTING OUR REVENUES. SO WE CAN HAVE A
11 MORE INFORMED DISCUSSION ABOUT THE SECOND ROUND OF ENGAGEMENT
12 AND ANALYSIS. WHAT LIES AHEAD? ON THE NEXT PAGE PLEASE. THE
13 LAST TWO MONTHS HAVE BEEN SPEND ON WHICH PATHWAY TO STUDY WE
14 HAVE FINISHED OUR FIRST ROUND OF ANALYSIS AND ANALYSIS
15 INCLUDES A SET OF REGIONAL PERFORMANCE INDICATORS TO EVALUATE
16 IMPACT ON THOSE FIVE GOALS FOR BOTH PRICING AS WELL AS NO
17 PRICING PATHWAYS AND FOR ALL PERFORMANCE INDICATORS, WE INTEND
18 ON SHOWING IMPACTS ON PEOPLE WITH LOW-INCOMES AND PEOPLE IN
19 EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES SO WE CAN UNDERSTAND THE
20 POPULATION AND IMPACTS. WE WANT TO SHOW FROM THE ANALYSIS
21 CORRIDOR LEVEL OUTCOMES TO UNDERSTAND HOW DIFFERENT CORRIDORS
22 RESPOND DIFFERENTLY. FOR EXAMPLE, HOW DO TRIPS CHANGE ON THE
23 101 CORRIDOR, AND EFFECT ON MAJOR PARALLEL ARTERIAL, EXPRESS
24 BUSES AND RAPID TRANSIT. WE WANT TO LOOK AT DIFFERENT
25 CORRIDORS ACROSS THE REGION WHAT CHANGED IN FREEWAYS AND HOW



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THAT IMPACTS LOCAL STREETS AND LOCAL TRANSIT. WITH THESE
2 FINDINGS IN LATE SPRING AND SUMMER WE WANT TO SPEND SOME TIME
3 WITH OUR ADVISORY GROUP TO DETERMINE WHAT PATHWAYS WE WANT TO
4 PRIORITIZE FOR OUR SECOND ROUND OF ANALYSIS AND ALSO WHAT CORRIDORS
5 ARE BETTER SUITED FOR ANALYSIS. YOU MIGHT MAKE INITIAL
6 FINDINGS TO PATHWAYS THEN IN LATE SUMMER, 2023, WE PLAN ON THE
7 SECOND ROUND OF COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT WHERE WE WANT COMMUNITY
8 MEMBERS TO VISUALIZE THESE PATHWAYS IN 2035. NOT ALL PATHWAYS
9 SHOWN IN THE PREVIOUS PAGE BUT PRIORITIZED PATHWAYS WHERE
10 THEY'RE ABLE TO SEE WHAT OUTCOMES MIGHT BE WITH PRICING AND
11 THEN GATHER INPUT TO DEFINE PATHWAYS. THEN LOOKING AT SECOND
12 ROUND OF ANALYSIS TO EVENTUALLY MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS ABOUT
13 WHAT PATHWAY, AND ALSO WHAT CORRIDOR HAS POTENTIAL FOR
14 STUDIES, AND IF WE FIND ACCEPTABLE PATHWAYS FOR POTENTIAL
15 PILOT IMPLEMENTATION. MY FIND SLIDE NEXT. WE ARE IMAGINING
16 FUTURE UPDATES TO THE COUNCIL, AT LEAST TWO, WE CAN DEFINITELY
17 THINK OF. FIRST WOULD BE IN THE SUMMER WHEN WE HAVE ANALYSIS
18 OUTCOMES FROM OUR FIRST ROUND OF ANALYSIS AND HAVE WORKED WITH
19 OUR ADVISORY GROUP TO PRIORITIZE PATHWAYS AND THE SECOND BOTH
20 OUR SECOND ROUND OF ANALYSIS THAT WOULD BE WINTER OF NEXT
21 YEAR. SO, WITH THAT, I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS. THANKS
22 FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO COME BACK AGAIN. OKAY. IF PEOPLE COULD
23 RAISE -- OKAY, I SEE HANDS RAISED. I'M WRITING NAMES DOWN. SO
24 BEAR WITH ME. ANYBODY ELSE? GO AHEAD, FRANK, YOU'RE THE FIRST
25 ONE UP THEN IT WILL BE GERRY AND THEN HOWARD.



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **FRANK WELTE:** QUICK OBSERVATION. FIRST OBSERVATION IS YOU, SORT
3 OF, INDICATED THAT THERE WAS A NEGATIVE REACTION TO THE
4 IMPOSITION OF NEW TOLLS. AND I WANT TO ELABORATE QUICKLY, I
5 HOPE EVERYBODY IN THIS ROOM UNDERSTANDS THAT THE WORD FREEWAY
6 MEANS SOMETHING VERY DEEP IN CALIFORNIA CULTURE. PEOPLE
7 BELIEVE DRIVING ON THOSE ROADS IS A RIGHT. YOU CAN DRIVE THAT
8 UNTIL THE COWS COME HOME BUT THEY WILL NOT AGREE WITH YOU.
9 BOTTOM LINE IS THIS: NOW EVERY DRIVER WHO DRIVES ON A FREEWAY
10 FOR FREE WHO STARTS PAYING A TOLL WILL REGARD THAT AS A
11 BETRAYAL AND A THEFT. AND THAT DRIVER WILL REACT AT THE POLLS
12 IN WAYS THAT WILL BE VERY DESTRUCTIVE TO OUR SOCIETY. SO, THE
13 QUESTION IS -- AND WHAT I'M HEARING IS YOU ARE ATTEMPTING TO
14 SKIRT AROUND THAT WITH CLEVER PLANS, BUT THEY'RE ALREADY
15 COMPLICATED. SO, DO YOU HAVE IDEAS AS TO HOW YOU CANNOT TRICK
16 PEOPLE BUT ACTUALLY CONVINCED THEM THAT PAYING A TOLL IS NOT A
17 BETRAYAL? BECAUSE THEY'RE GOING TO TAKE IT THAT WAY, AND IT'S
18 NOT GOING TO BE PRETTY.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** WOULD YOU LIKE TO ANSWER NOW OR LIKE TO
21 ANSWER ALL THE QUESTIONS WHEN WE'RE DONE?

22

23 **ANUP TAPASE:** UP TO YOU, CHAIR. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO TAKE THE
24 QUESTION NOW.

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GO AHEAD AND TAKE THAT NOW.

2

3 **ANUP TAPASE:** THANKS FOR THAT QUESTION. IT IS TRUE THAT IT'S
4 DEEP-ROOTED IN CALIFORNIA, THAT TOLLING ROADS IS UNIMAGINABLE
5 FREEWAYS ARE SUPPOSED TO BE FREE. WE HAVE HEARD THIS. I WILL
6 SAY THAT THE CONCEPT OF PAYING TO USE ROADS OR TO USE HIGHWAYS
7 IS NOT NEW IN SO MANY OTHER PARTS OF THE NATION. RIGHT? PEOPLE
8 FREQUENTLY PAY TO USE TOLLED FREEWAYS IN SO MANY STATES IN THE
9 EAST, MIDWEST, AND THE SOUTH. AND SO AGREE THAT THIS IS GOING
10 TO BE A BRAND-NEW CONCEPT IN THE BAY AREA AND THAT'S A HUGE
11 PART ABOUT WHY WE'RE HAVING THIS DETAILED STUDY AND WORKING
12 WITH SO MANY STAKEHOLDERS IN TRYING TO DETERMINE WHAT ARE SOME
13 PATHWAYS TO DO THAT. AND SO THAT'S WHY WE DON'T WANT TO, AS
14 YOU SAW ON THE LAST DISCUSSION AS WELL, WE DON'T NECESSARILY
15 WANT TO GO TO THE PUBLIC WITHOUT WELL THOUGHT OUT PROPOSALS
16 AND THAT'S WHY WE'RE TAKING THE TIME DO THIS AND COME UP WITH
17 A WAY TO EFFECTIVELY COMMUNICATE WHAT ARE TRADE-OFFS ARE IF WE
18 DON'T DO PRICING WHAT OUTCOMES WE'RE EXPECTING IN A NEW
19 PRICING SCENARIO, SO WE HAVE TIME IN THE STUD OVER THE NEXT
20 FEW MONTHS TO ACTIVELY THINK ABOUT THAT BEFORE OUR NEXT ROUND
21 OF ENGAGEMENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** FRANK, DID THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?

24



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **FRANK WELTE:** NOT REALLY. I JUST WANT TO REITERATE, THAT YOU
2 NEED A PLAN THAT IS GOING TO TELL EVERY DRIVER THAT THEY'RE
3 GOING TO GET SOMETHING REALLY GOOD OUT OF THIS TOLL. NOT
4 SOMETHING INDIRECT, LIKE, OH THERE IS GOING TO BE LESS TRAFFIC
5 OR WE'RE GOING TO HELP THE ENVIRONMENT OR WE'RE GOING TO --
6 IT'S NO, IT'S GOING TO BE WHAT AM I GETTING OUT OF THIS THING
7 OR I'M GOING TO HATE YOU FOR THE REST OF MY LIFE. THAT'S WHAT
8 THEY'RE GOING TO BE THINKING SO PLEASE THINK ABOUT THAT.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GERRY?

11

12 **GERRY GLASER:** I'M NOT GOING TO ASK A QUESTION. I'M GOING TO
13 MAKE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. ONE WAS TODAY I DROVE IN EVEN
14 THOUGH I TRIED TO TAKE TRANSIT IN EACH TIME; THIS TIME I ENDED
15 UP AT SAN FRANCISCO AIRPORT DRIVING SO I DROVE OUT TO RICHMOND
16 AND EL CERRITO AND BART AND AS I DROVE IN I NOTICED ALL THE
17 TRAFFIC COMING IN ON THE BAY BRIDGE STACKED AND NOT MOVING AT
18 ALL. AND IT OCCURRED TO ME ONE OF OUR STRATEGIES WE HAVE
19 TALKED ABOUT IS CORDON, AND IN THE MEETING WE HAD WE REACTED
20 NEGATIVELY TO CORDON PRICING. IT OCCURRED TO ME WE HAVE CORDON
21 PRICING ON THE GOLDEN GATE, IF WE WANT TO FIGURE OUT HOW THE
22 PRICING WORKS WE CAN INCREASE THE PRICES AND SEE IF WE CAN
23 REDUCE THE TRAFFIC ON THE TWO BRIDGES, IF WE THINK ABOUT
24 DYNAMIC PRICING, IF THOSE THINGS DON'T WORK WE KNOW THOSE
25 STRATEGIES ARE NOT GOOD STRATEGIES FOR US TO FOLLOW. I LIKE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 YOUR WORD BOLD YOU USE IN EACH ONE OF THE MEETINGS THAT YOU
2 WALK INTO. ONE OF THE GUYS I WORKED FOR ALWAYS TALKED ABOUT
3 ORTHOGONAL THINKING. I GO ORTHOGONAL THINKING AND BOLD THINK
4 DIFFERENTLY THAN WE THOUGHT BEFORE. PRICING A HIGHWAY IS
5 DIVERGENT FROM WORK WE DO AND CONTRARY TO WHAT FRANK THINKS, I
6 THINK IT'S THE SAME THING THAT WE'VE HAD BEFORE*WE WILL REDUCE
7 THE TRAFFIC WILL INCREASE THE PRICE UNTIL THE TRAFFIC REDUCES.
8 FOR ME, I MENTIONED THIS IN OUR OTHER MEETINGS, THE HIGHWAYS
9 HAVE A CAPACITY AIRPLANES HAVE A CAPACITY TRAINS HAVE CAPACITY
10 THEATRES HAVE CAPACITY WE SELL JUST ENOUGH TICKETS FOR THE
11 CAPACITY. OKAY LET'S THINK ORTHOGONALLY, IS THERE ANY WAY WE
12 COULD COME UP WITH SAYING, THIS IS THE CAPACITY WE HAVE; DO
13 YOU WANT TO BUY A TICKET. AND THAT'S ONE WAY OF POSITIONING
14 THIS SAYING THE CAPACITY ON THE HIGHWAY IS THIS WE HAVE THAT
15 NUMBER OF CARS IF YOU WANT TO BUY A TICKET FINE WE COULD DO
16 RESERVATION SYSTEM AND THAT'S THE WAY WE HANDLE PRICING
17 INSTEAD OF DYNAMICALLY WHERE WE WON'T KNOW WHAT THE RESULT
18 WILL BE THIS'S GOING TO BE HARD TO SELL THE STUDIES YOU
19 FOLLOWED THROUGH THAT WERE IF OTHER PLACES AROUND THE WORLD
20 SHOWED THAT YES IF YOU INCREASE THE PRICE THE TRAFFIC REDUCES
21 FOR A PERIOD OF TIME AND THEN COMES BACK AGAIN BECAUSE WE ALL
22 GET USED TO IT. I CAME IN TODAY, I DON'T LOOK AT IT. I USE MY
23 CLIPPER CARD, I USED MY FASTRAK, I NEVER LOOK AT WHAT I'M
24 PAYING. IF IT WENT UP, IT WENT UP. I DIDN'T KNOW HOW MUCH THE
25 BAY BRIDGE COSTS OR HOW MUCH THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE COSTS IT



MARCH 08, 2023

1 COSTS A HELL OF A LOT MORE THAN I REMEMBER IT COSTING AND I'M
2 STILL PAYING IT. IT DOESN'T CHANGE THINGS. DIFFERENT COMMENT,
3 HOV LANES, SINCE I STARTED DOING THIS IN THE LAST YEAR IT'S
4 FORCED ME TO THINK ABOUT TRANSIT AND TRANSPORTATION. I NOTICED
5 OUR HOV LANES ONLY RUN FOR CERTAIN HOURS DURING THE DAY. I
6 CAN'T FIGURE OUT WHEN I THINK THAT IT WHY IS THAT AND SOMEBODY
7 SAID WELL BECAUSE WE DON'T NEED THEM THE OTHERS TIMES DURING
8 THE DAY IF WE DON'T NEED THEM THEY COULD STILL BE HOV LANES
9 AND WE COULD STILL HAVE THE SAME TRAFFIC ON THE REST OF THE
10 HIGHWAY. OKAY LET'S TAKE THE HOV LANES STOP EV DRIVERS LIKE ME
11 USING THE HOV LANES IT COULD BE FOR TWO OR MORE, AND BUSES
12 BECAUSE BUSES TAKE JUST AS LONG TO GET THROUGH THE TRAFFIC AS
13 EVERYBODY ELSE WE COULD DO THAT THROUGH 2050 AND 2035 AND MAKE
14 THOSE CHANGES ON THE HIGHWAY TODAY. THOSE ARE THE MAJOR POINTS
15 I WANT TO MAKE. IF WE'RE GOING TO BE BOLD LET'S BE BOLD AND DO
16 IT DIFFERENTLY THAN HAS BEEN DONE BEFORE AND GET THE RESULT WE
17 WANT. LET'S DO THE TRIALS WE NEED TO DO TO FIND OUT IF THE
18 THINGS WE HAVE IN MIND ACTUALLY WILL WORK. BECAUSE WE HAVE THE
19 PLACES WHERE WE COULD DO THE TRIALS A LITTLE BIT AT A TIME AND
20 FIND OUT WHAT HAPPENS. SO, NO QUESTION.

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. HOWARD AND THEN DWAYNE.

23

24 **HOWARD WONG:** IT IS TRUE THAT MOST PEOPLE PROBABLY HAVE
25 PRECONCEPTIONS OF A MOTIVATION OF A STUDY LIKE THIS AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THEY'RE PROBABLY THINKING OH THEY'RE JUST PROBABLY TRYING TO
2 GET MORE REVENUE. SO, IT IS IMPORTANT TO CONTINUALLY EMPHASIZE
3 THAT THERE ARE NO PRECONCEPTIONS TO A STUDY; THAT IT IS
4 GATHERING SENTIMENT AND INFORMATION BUT IT HAS TO BE INFORMED
5 INFORMATION. SO IT SEEMS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE, LOOKING AT
6 TRAFFIC IN THIS COUNTRY, AROUND THE WORLD, THAT THERE ARE
7 CERTAINLY VERY INNOVATIVE TRAFFIC CONTROL OR GUIDANCE METHODS
8 ALREADY IN USE AND ALREADY IMPLEMENTED. SO RATHER THAN TRYING
9 TO JUST SAY, WELL, WE'RE JUST GATHERING INFORMATION TOWARD A
10 ULTIMATE GOAL, WHY DON'T WE JUST CONTINUOUSLY HAVE, BEFORE THE
11 PEOPLE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO EDUCATE OR GATHER INFORMATION FROM
12 THE BEST CASE STUDIES, THE BEST EXAMPLES OF ALL THESE THINGS
13 THAT WE SEE AROUND THE WORLD ALREADY AND THEN JUST LIST THE
14 PLUSES, MINUSES, WHAT ARE THE PEOPLE IN GERMANY GETTING FROM
15 TOLL ROADS? OR ITALY? WHAT ARE PEOPLE OBTAINING IN TERMS OF
16 LESSENING THEIR SITTING IN TRAFFIC AND HAVING MORE FREE TIME.
17 AND THERE ARE PLENTY OF EXAMPLES, I THINK, OF PROGRAMS AROUND
18 THE WORLD AND THE COUNTRY, AND, SO, WE -- ONE, WOULD JUST HAVE
19 A RUNNING LIBRARY OF THESE THAT YOU CAN JUST PICK UP IN
20 STOCKHOLM, OR HELSINKI, SINGAPORE, AND PEOPLE START TO SEE A
21 LOT THIS IS REALITY, THIS HAS BEEN WORKING FOR A DECADE OR
22 TWO, OR RECENTLY, AND THEN PEOPLE WILL START TO KIND OF MELD
23 IN THEIR MINDS, COMP POINTS OF THOSE THAT MIGHT WORK FOR THEM
24 BECAUSE IT'S BENEFICIAL BECAUSE THE PEOPLE IN THOSE CITIES AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 COUNTRIES ARE ALREADY BENEFITTING. SO I WOULD SUGGEST THAT
2 KIND OF APPROACH. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** DWAYNE? HANK THANK YOU FOR YOUR
5 PRESENTATION. I BELIEVE AS YOU PRESENTED BEFORE.

6

7 **DWAYNE HANKERSON:** TOLL SUGGEST JUST NOT A GOOD TIME FOR IT IN
8 MY OPINION. IN CALIFORNIA WE PAY MORE FOR GAS THAN ANYBODY
9 ELSE. CAN WE THINK OF A WAY TO DECREASE THE AMOUNT OF TRAFFIC
10 ON THE FREEWAYS? WHEN I GO TO THE MAC ARTHUR MAZE, WHEN I GO
11 TO POINT RICHMOND, TO SAN PABLO AVENUE, IT'S ALWAYS CROWDED.
12 BUT WHEN I'M COMING FROM VALLEJO, OR NOT VALLEJO, VACAVILLE TO
13 VALLEJO, THERE IS NO TRAFFIC. SO IS IT POSSIBLE THAT MAYBE WE
14 CAN THINK OUTSIDE THE BOX? I KNOW IT'S NOT ADVISABLE TO BUILD
15 NEW FREEWAYS BUT CAN WE DESIGN NEW FREEWAYS SO THE TRAFFIC IS
16 NOT SO ONSET EVERYWHERE? I THINK WE NEED TO THINK OUTSIDE THE
17 BOX. WE CAN'T BE LIKE EVERYBODY ELSE AND TAKE A CAPITALIST
18 APPROACH AND TRY TO GET MORE MONEY, MORE MONEY. WE SHOULD TRY
19 TO SOLVE THE PROBLEM THEN WE CAN SAY WE NEED MORE MONEY, BUT
20 IF WE DON'T TRY TO SOLVE THE PROBLEM BEFORE WE SAY WE NEED
21 MORE MONEY I DO NOT SEE HOW THAT'S GOING TO MAKE SENSE AND I'M
22 NOT TRYING TO BE NEGATIVE OR DEROGATORY BUT TO ME THIS ISSUE
23 HAS BEEN AROUND FOR A LONG TIME. I DON'T UNDERSTAND HOW ONLY
24 CERTAIN PLACES ARE CROWDED ON THE FREEWAY AND CERTAIN PLACES
25 ARE NOT CROWDED ON THE FREEWAY. I DON'T GET IT. IS IT A DESIGN



MARCH 08, 2023

1 FLAW IN THE FREEWAYS. THAT'S WHAT I'M GETTING TO, IT'S A
2 DESIGN FLAW THEN MAYBE WE CAN REDESIGN THE AREAS SO THERE IS
3 NOT SO MUCH TRAFFIC. SOMEONE SAID IF YOU START ALL LANE
4 TOLLING ON FREEWAYS, YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE A DISASTER BECAUSE
5 YOU'RE NOT GOING TO HAVE WHAT YOU EXPECTED. PEOPLE ARE GOING
6 TO BLAME THE POLITICIANS, GOING TO GET NEW POLITICIANS. WE'RE
7 GOING TO THINK OUTSIDE THE BOX, AND THINK ABOUT THE
8 ARCHITECTURAL ENGINEERING TYPE OF ANSWER TO THIS QUESTION.
9 BECAUSE IF THAT'S WHAT WE WANT, WHY DON'T WE GO TO THE CAR
10 MAKERS AND SAY MAKE LESS CARS IT'S A NUMBER OF DIFFERENT
11 QUESTIONS YOU CAN ASK YOURSELF TO TRY TO RESOLVE THIS ISSUE.
12 THANK YOU FOR LISTENING TO ME. THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. GABRIELA?

15

16 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** FOR ME, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL, THIS TOPIC IS
17 COMPLEX AND THERE ARE PARTS I UNDERSTAND AND OTHER PARTS I
18 DON'T UNDERSTAND. IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR ME WHEN LOOKING AT
19 HOW THIS APPLIES TO SONOMA COUNTY, NAPA COUNTY, MARIN, A LOT
20 OF THE FOCUS IS ON PENINSULA, SOUTH BAY, SAN FRANCISCO AREA,
21 BUT IT WOULD BE HELPFUL FOR ME TO UNDERSTAND HOW THIS WOULD
22 IMPACT OR WHAT CORRIDORS, SOME OF THE LINGO, I DON'T
23 NECESSARILY KNOW WHICH ONES ARE TRAVELED BY -- THERE IS A
24 CERTAIN BUS YOU MENTIONED THAT, I DON'T KNOW WHICH CORRIDORS
25 QUALIFY. WE HAVE THE 101 BUT WHAT PARTS OF THE 101 WOULD THIS



MARCH 08, 2023

1 APPLY TO? I HAVE ONE IN MIND BUT I DON'T KNOW IF IT APPLIES TO
2 THIS STUDY. IT WOULD BE HELPFUL IN MY UNDERSTANDING OF THIS
3 TOPIC AND HOW I CAN TALK TO OTHERS ABOUT IT ABOUT WHAT'S
4 COMING WITH THIS STUDY. I HOPE THAT MAKES SENSE. MARTHA ARE
5 THERE ANY MEMBERS ONLINE, THIS IS THE TIME TO REMOTELY RAISE
6 YOUR HAND OR DIAL STAR NINE.

7

8 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** I'LL CALL IN ORDER. FIRST UP IS.

9

10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** I'M FORTUNATE ENOUGH TO BE ONE OF THE
11 MEMBERS WHO GETS TO SIT ON THIS COMMITTEE, AND I REALLY WANT
12 TO COMMEND STAFF FOR THE THOUGHTFULNESS THAT THEY HAVE PUT
13 INTO THE GROUP SESSIONS, LIKE THE QUALITY AND LEVEL OF
14 DISCUSSION. SO I REALLY DO WANT TO REALLY COMMEND, ESPECIALLY
15 ANUP FOR THAT. THERE ARE -- THERE IS A COUPLE OF THINGS, ONE
16 IS IN RESPONSE TO MY FELLOW COMMITTEE MEMBER WHO SAID HE
17 DIDN'T KNOW HOW MUCH TOLLS COST, AND THEY DON'T PAY ATTENTION
18 TO HOW MUCH THINGS COST. I WILL TELL YOU THAT YOU ARE A LUCKY
19 PERSON. AND THAT MANY OF US DO NOT HAVE THAT LUXURY. I AM
20 SUPPOSED TO BE AT AN MTC MEETING ON MONDAY, AND I CAN'T AFFORD
21 TO CROSS THE BRIDGE. SO, THE FACT THAT YOU GET TO DO THAT
22 WITHOUT THINKING, THAT IS NOT A SHARED EXPERIENCE. I'M REALLY
23 HAPPY FOR YOU, BUT I HOPE THAT OUR FREEWAYS THAT HAVE ALREADY
24 BEEN PAID FOR WITH OUR TAX DOLLARS, THAT ALL OF THOSE THINGS,
25 THAT ALL OF US REMAIN ABLE TO USE THEM AND NOT JUST PEOPLE WHO



MARCH 08, 2023

1 CAN'T -- WHO DON'T EVEN KNOW HOW MUCH IT COSTS TO CROSS A
2 BRIDGE. SO, A LOT OF US HAVE THAT EXPERIENCE. THE -- I DID
3 WANT CLARIFICATION ON ONE OF THE SENTENCE DURING THE
4 PRESENTATION, THE SENTENCE WAS THAT A DRIVER -- GET OFF THE
5 FREEWAY AND IT'S TRUE IT WILL LIKELY GET PEOPLE OFF FREEWAYS
6 LIKELY TO PUT THEM ON TO SIDE STREETS AND I'M TRYING TO FIGURE
7 OUT HOW THAT WOULD MAKE ANYONE SAFER ON SIDE STREETS AS
8 TRAFFIC INCREASES ON SIDE STREETS WE SEE INCREASES OF
9 PEDESTRIAN ACCIDENTS, BICYCLE ACCIDENTS, HIGHER LEVELS OF
10 DISCHARGE INTO THOSE NEIGHBORHOODS AND IT INCREASES VEHICLE
11 MILES TRAVELED AND THE AMOUNT OF TIME THAT IT TAKES TO MAKE
12 THOSE SAME COMMUTES SO YOU ACTUALLY GET INCREASED VEHICLE
13 MILES TRAVELED. AND INCREASED POLLUTIONS CONCENTRATED IN
14 COMMUNITIES THAT LIVE NEXT TO FREEWAYS AND OFTENTIMES IN THE
15 BAY AREA THAT HAS A RELATIONSHIP TO INCOME LEVEL AND THERE IS
16 ALSO SOME RACIAL CORRESPONDENCE THERE AS WELL. THE SECOND
17 THING, IT WAS A REALLY GREAT PRESENTATION, AND I APPRECIATED
18 HOW WELL YOU LAID OUT THE RESULTS OF OUR DISCUSSIONS. I FEEL
19 LIKE IT WAS A REALLY ACCURATE PORTRAYAL. I WAS A LITTLE
20 CONFUSED ABOUT PATHWAY FOUR THAT WAS PRESENTED. THE THING
21 HEARD OVER AND OVER REFLECTS THE LAST SPEAKERS THAT TUESDAY
22 THIS IS NOT A GREAT TIME FOR THIS. AND I'M WONDERING IF,
23 INSTEAD OF NO PRICING, ALTERNATIVE PRICING IS BEING EXPLORED
24 IN ANY WAY? LIKE, IS THERE A WAY TO RAISE THE REVENUES IN
25 DIFFERENT FASHIONS? LIKE, IDEAS THAT CAME UP DURING OUR



MARCH 08, 2023

1 DISCUSSION GROUPS INCLUDED IF EMPLOYERS ARE NOT ALLOWING
2 PROFESSIONAL WORKERS TO TELECOMMUTE AND ARE REQUIRING THAT
3 THEY COME TO THE OFFICE, THAT THOSE EMPLOYER ARE THE ONES WHO
4 PAY THE TOLL, RIGHT? IF SOMEBODY HAS TO DO IN-PERSON WORK, AN
5 EMPLOYER SHOULD NOT BE PENALIZED BECAUSE YOU CAN'T CLEAN A
6 FLOOR FROM A COMPUTER, BUT PEOPLE'S WORK WHO CAN BE DONE FROM
7 A COMMUTER THERE IS A WAY TO EXPLORE THE VARIETY OF OPTIONS
8 THERE WAS OPTION BROUGHT UP AND I'M WONDERING WHETHER THOSE
9 ARE BEING CONSIDERED AS OPPOSED TO NO PRICING AS PUTTING
10 PAYMENT ON INDIVIDUALS WHO DO NOT HAVE THE LUXURY OF TAKING
11 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, AND FOR ALL THE MANY NUMBER OF REASONS
12 THAT PEOPLE CANNOT TAKE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION OR THAT PUBLIC
13 TRANSPORTATION IS NOT SAFE, AFFORDABLE, RELIABLE, OR GOES IN
14 THE NINE DIRECTIONS THAT OUR CHILDREN AND OUR JOBS NEED TO GO
15 OR WE CAN'T TAKE OUR TOOLS ON BECAUSE WE'RE CONSTRUCTION
16 WORKERS AND OUR JOB SITE ENDS AT A DIFFERENT PLACE EVERY DAY
17 INSTEAD OF PUTTING THOSE ON INDIVIDUALS WE LOOK AT OTHER WAYS
18 TO RAISE THAT REVENUE THAT MAY ENCOURAGE SYSTEMIC CHANGE, LIKE
19 NOT REQUIRING PEOPLE TO DRIVE INTO OFFICES, WHICH WOULD ALSO
20 GET PEOPLE OFF THE FREEWAY.

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. DID YOU WANT TO JUST PUT THAT
23 IN THE HOPPER OF THINGS TO RESPOND TO WHILE WE'RE DOING THE
24 STUDY AND ANALYSIS?

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **ANUP TAPASE:** YES.

2

3 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

4

5 **ADINA LEVIN:** THANKS TO ANNE FOR MAKING THE POINT IT'S NOT
6 NOTICED HOW MUCH YOU PAY. I HEARD THAT COMMENT FROM LEADERS IN
7 OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM WHOSE SALARY IS PUBLISHED CAUSE THEY
8 WORK AT PUBLIC AGENCIES AND THE PEOPLE THAT I NOTICED WHO SAID
9 THAT HAVE PRETTY HIGH INCOMES AND OR NET WORTH AND SO THANKS
10 TO ANNE OLIVIA -- I WOULD HAVE SAID THAT TOO. THERE ARE A
11 COUPLE OF ARE THE THINGS IN TERMS OF -- I THINK THAT MAKING
12 SURE THAT IF THERE IS FUNDING COMING IN, THAT IT PAYS FOR
13 COMPETITIVE AND AFFORDABLE OPTIONS IS GOOD, AND I HAVE A
14 COUPLE OF SUGGESTIONS ON THAT. SO, I SEE AFFORDABILITY BEING
15 DISCUSSED AS DISCOUNTS, BUT THERE IS ALSO SOME OF THE
16 STRATEGIES IN THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THAT ARE ABOUT
17 THINGS LIKE A FREE TRANSFERS AND MULTI-AGENCY PASSES OR CAPS
18 THAT ARE MORE ABOUT EVERYDAY AFFORDABILITY RATHER THAN INCOME
19 QUALIFIED AFFORDABILITY. SO I THINK THAT THOSE STRATEGIES
20 WOULD BE GOOD TO BE SUPPORTED. ANOTHER STRATEGY THERE THAT
21 AFFECTED FOR AFFORDABILITY IS, LIKE, PUSHING DOWN THE DISTANCE
22 PRICE CURVE FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. SO, HAVING A COMPLETELY
23 FLAT FEE IS FINANCIALLY EXTREMELY DIFFICULT BECAUSE IT WOULD
24 REQUIRE, LIKE, A -- YOU KNOW, A SHORT LOCAL TRIP TO BE
25 EXTREMELY EXPENSIVE. BUT, ALSO, THE WAY THE DISTANCE CURVE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 WORKS, THE PEOPLE THAT HAVE THE FURTHEST TRIPS, THOSE TRIPS
2 WOULD BE EXPENSIVE SO IS IT POSSIBLE TO BUY DOWN THE CURVE? IF
3 THAT MAKES SENSE. AND THEN THE -- LET'S SEE -- AND, YEAH, SO,
4 ALSO, FOR PEOPLE THAT ARE TRAVELING LONGER DISTANCES AND
5 COMING TO OR FROM SOME PLACE OFF THE HIGHWAY, YOU KNOW, MAKING
6 SURE THAT THOSE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLANS, STRATEGIES,
7 AND/OR NEW EXPRESS ROUTES HELP PEOPLE TO GET CONVENIENTLY FROM
8 WHERE THEY'RE COMING FROM AND WHERE THEY'RE GOING TO. SO, ALSO
9 INCLUDING THE SAFETY AND AVAILABILITY OF FIRST AND LAST MILE
10 OPTIONS. LET ME SEE. SO, ANOTHER QUESTION THAT I HAD, MAYBE
11 RESEARCH TRACKABLE, ANNE OLIVIA'S QUESTION ABOUT CONCERNS AND
12 PRICING THIS'S GOING TO PUSH PEOPLE OFF OF FREEWAYS AND ON TO
13 SIDE STREETS BECAUSE THERE ARE SO MANY PLACES THAT HAVE DONE
14 FREEWAY PRICING, THERE SHOULD BE DATA ABOUT DID THAT YOU KNOW,
15 DID THAT EFFECT ACTUALLY OCCUR. I KNOW WE HAVE A LOT OF
16 INTUITIONS LIKE FOR EXAMPLE, IF WE EXPAND FREEWAY CAPACITY
17 THEN WON'T THAT SOLVE OUR CONGESTION PROBLEM. BUT THERE IS
18 QUITE OF A LOT OF IMPERIAL EVIDENCE THAT IT DOESN'T WORK LIKE
19 THAT AND THAT IT INDUCES CAR TRAVEL. SO THE QUESTION IS, WHEN
20 YOU PUT IN PRICING, LIKE, WHEN'S ACTUALLY THE IMPACT THEN WHEN
21 IT'S IN PRACTICE, I THINK THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO KNOW. LET'S
22 SEE IF I HAVE ANY MORE COMMENTS. THAT WAS IT. THANKS.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. MARTHA, PLEASE GO BACK TO OUR
25 -- WE'LL GET TO THE PEOPLE BACK IN THIS BUILDING, BUT WE'RE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 GOING TO OUR ONLINE PEOPLE FIRST THAT ARE MEMBERS. I HAVE BOTH
2 ZELLY AND RENEE HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS ZACK. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
5 YOURSELF.

6

7 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** HI. CAN YOU HEAR ME ALL RIGHT?

8

9 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** YES. YOU ARE GOOD.

10

11 **ZACH DEUTSCH-GROSS:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I WANT TO REALLY
12 APPRECIATE BOTH VINAY'S -- EXCUSE ME -- THE PRESENTATION, AND
13 THE COMMENTS MADE BY ALL OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
14 MEMBERS TODAY. I THINK IT'S CLEAR HOW MANY DIFFERENT WAYS WE
15 CAN GET THIS WRONG. AND WE SHOULD BE CONSCIOUS AND THOUGHTFUL
16 OF HOW WE CENTER EQUITY AND HOW WE CENTER FOLKS WHO NEED TO
17 DRIVE WHO DON'T HAVE OTHER OPTIONS WITHIN THESE DISCUSSIONS. I
18 WANT TO ADD TWO PIECES OF MAYBE OPTIMISM AS WE MOVE FORWARD.
19 ONE IS THAT I THINK WE'RE TALKING ABOUT SOMETHING THAT'S --
20 WHAT I HEARD FROM ANUP, WAS 2035, AND THAT'S A LONG TIME AWAY,
21 I'M REFLECTING ON MY OWN PERSPECTIVE, THAT WORDLVIEW OF HOW I
22 THOUGHT THE WORLD SHOULD LOOK TEN YEARS AGO IS VERY DIFFERENCE
23 FROM WHAT IT LOOKS LIKE NOW, AND I THINK WE SHOULDN'T DISCOUNT
24 FOLKS ABLE TO CHANGE AND TO CONSIDER HOW OUR SOCIETY SHOULD BE
25 SHAPED AND WHAT ACCESS TO MOBILITY LOOKS LIKE. THE SECOND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THING IS THINKING HOW FAR AWAY THIS TIMING IS, I THINK
2 REIMAGINING WHAT THE WORLD LOOKS LIKE 15 YEARS FROM NOW, AND
3 WHAT THE STATUS QUO LOOKS LIKE IF WE DON'T IDENTIFY SOLUTIONS
4 AND THAT MAY OR MAY NOT BE ALL HIGHWAY ALL FREEWAY PRICING BUT
5 I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOT JUST HAVE OPTION FOUR BE THE
6 NULL HYPOTHESIS, BUT REALLY BUILD-OUT WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE,
7 WHAT THAT MEANS. IT'S NOT LIKE WE'RE TAKING AWAY SOMETHING
8 THAT'S FREE, IT'S LIKE OUR HIGHWAY AND FREEWAY SYSTEM IS NOT
9 GOING TO WORK BY 2035. SO I THINK IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT TO
10 MAKE THE CASE OF WHAT WE LOSE WITH ACTION RATHER THAN JUST
11 TRYING TO SELL FOLKS ON WHAT WE GAIN FROM THIS PARTICULAR
12 ACTION. I THINK THAT WILL HELP US REDEFINE WHAT OUR GOALS ARE
13 HERE. AND THE NEED TO COME WITH AN OPTIMAL SOLUTION GOING --
14 UNDERSTANDING THAT WE HAVE SOME -- A LOT OF TIME TO GET THERE.
15 THANK YOU SO MUCH.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. MARTHA?

18

19 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** NEXT UP IS GOING TO BE TERRY SCOTT
20 FOLLOWED BY CARINA LIEU. TERRY, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE.

21

22 **TERRY SCOTT:** THANK YOU. I GUESS MY COMMENTS ARE IN TUNE WITH
23 WHAT HOWARD SAID EARLIER, AND THAT IS WHAT WE'RE FACING IN
24 THIS BAY AREA COMMUNITY IS NOT UNIQUE IN THE DEVELOPED WORLD,
25 IF YOU WILL. AND NOT JUST INTERNATIONALLY, BUT WITHIN THE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 UNITED STATES, THERE ARE OTHER COMMUNITIES THROUGHOUT THE
2 COUNTRY THAT HAVE DEALT WITH THE SAME KIND OF, AND ARE DEALING
3 WITH THE SAME KIND OF TRAFFIC CHALLENGES AND TRANSPORTATION
4 CHALLENGES THAT WE ARE. AND IT SEEMS TO ME THAT WE DON'T NEED
5 TO REINVENT THE WHEEL. WE NEED TO FIND THE BEST EXAMPLE OF
6 WHAT IS WORKING NOW, NATIONALLY, OR INTERNATIONALLY, AND
7 CERTAINLY INTERNATIONALLY WOULD BE EASIER, LESS COMPLICATED,
8 BUT TO FIND A SYSTEM THAT IS -- HAS DEALT WITH THE PROBLEMS
9 THAT WE'RE FACING NOW IN THE BAY AREA, AND HAS BEEN DEALT WITH
10 IN OTHER SECTIONS OF THE COUNTRY WITH SOME DEGREES OF SUCCESS,
11 I'M SURE. BUT LET'S DO MORE OF FINDING OUT THE DIRECTION THAT
12 WE NEED TO TALK BEFORE WE JUST REACH OUT IN A DIRECTION
13 THINKING THAT THERE IS ONE SOLUTION TO THIS PROBLEM. THERE
14 ISN'T ONE SOLUTION. IT'S A QUESTION OF CHOICES THAT HAVE TO BE
15 MADE. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE TAKE IT FROM A
16 STRATEGIC PLANNING PERSPECTIVE WHERE WE'RE LOOKING DOWN THE
17 ROAD AT LEAST 20 TO 30 YEARS. AND THAT MAY TAKE A LITTLE MORE
18 TIME, BUT IT WOULD -- IT WOULD ENHANCE THE DIRECTION THAT WE
19 CHAOS TO GO IN. AND SO I THINK THAT, AS THE SAYING, YOU KNOW,
20 "TIME IS MONEY." BUT IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE GO IN THE RIGHT
21 DIRECTION, AND THAT WE UTILIZE A SOLUTION THAT HAS WORKED
22 ELSEWHERE, AND THERE CERTAINLY ARE OTHERS THAT WE CAN EXAMINE
23 AND WE CAN EVALUATE. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** CARINA? YOUR TURN.



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **CARINA LIEU:** FIRST OFF, I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE IMPORTANCE
3 OF EDUCATION THAT FREQUENT OVERLOOKED. THE CONCEPTS WE'RE
4 TALKING ABOUT NEED TO BE BROKEN DOWN FOR OUR COMMUNITY MEMBERS
5 TO HAVE THOUGHTFUL AND MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT. TWO THINGS COME
6 TO MIND, THE OAKLAND REPRESENTATIVE RAISED AN EYEBROW FOR ME
7 GAVE ME A RAISED HEART RATE SIMPLY BECAUSE I THINK THE IMPACTS
8 ON OUR LOW-INCOME AND COMMUNITIES ARE COLOR ARE GOING TO BE
9 INCREASED, INCREASED TRAFFIC, AND THE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
10 CONCERNS AND MOREOVER JUST KNOWING THAT CLIMATE CHANGE IS
11 GOING TO HAVE A BIGGER IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES ARE COLOR, LOWER
12 INCOME ONES. SO I'M JUST REALLY CONCERNED ABOUT THAT STRATEGY
13 NOT BEING THOUGHT OUT ABOUT HOW THE RACIAL EQUITY IMPACTS ARE
14 GOING TO PLAY OUT AND HOW THIS'S REALLY GOING TO HURT THE
15 COMMUNITY HERE THE MOST. SO, REALLY, LIKE, TO LIKE TAKE A
16 PAUSE AND SPENDS SOME ENERGY AND THOUGHT PUT INTO HOW YOU KNOW
17 THAT POLICY CAN BE FIGURED OUT A LITTLE BIT MORE. I KNOW IT'S
18 EARLY, BUT, DEFINITELY, LIKE, THERE NEEDS TO BE MORE WORK
19 SPELLED OUT THERE. THE OTHER PIECE IS, I FIND IT INTERESTING
20 AND ZACK ALLUDED TO THIS, HOW MUCH THINGS CHANGE IN 15 YEARS
21 AND I THINK WHAT WE'RE GOING THROUGH RIGHT NOW IS WE'RE SEEING
22 THE ECONOMY CHANGE SO MUCH THAT MANY PEOPLE DO HAVE THE OPTION
23 OF WORKING FROM HOME. AND I JUST KIND OF HOPE THAT WE HAVE AN
24 ABILITY TO ALSO IMPLEMENT POLICY THAT'S FLEXIBLE AND FORWARD
25 THINKING ENOUGH AND THINKING ABOUT HOW OUR SOCIETY HAS CHANGED



MARCH 08, 2023

1 AND HOW SOME OF THOSE CHANGES MIGHT BE PERMANENT AND HOW THAT
2 MIGHT CHANGE THE WAY PEOPLE LIVE IN CITIES AND HOW THEY MOVE
3 THROUGH CITIES AND THINGS LIKE THAT. SO, THOSE ARE JUST MY
4 COMMENTS, AND REALLY APPRECIATE THE PRESENTATION TODAY AND
5 HAVING THIS CONVERSATION.

6

7 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE ARE NO MORE COUNCIL MEMBERS WITH
8 THEIR HAND RAISED.

9

10 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** WE'RE GOING TO COME BACK TO COUNCIL
11 MEMBERS HERE THEN GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. AND I WANT TO ADVISE
12 YOU THAT WE ARE RUNNING LONG. ZELLY AND THEN VINAY.

13

14 **SPEAKER:** I'LL KEEP MY COMMENTS QUICK. THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK
15 SETTING UP THE BACKGROUND FOR THAT STUDY. IT'S ONE OF THE
16 BIGGEST CHALLENGES FACING THE BAY AREA IT'S GREAT DISCUSSION
17 THAT WE'RE HAVING IT'S NOT SUPPOSED TO BE EASY. AND I WANT TO
18 UNDERSCORE FROM AN ENVIRONMENTAL PERSPECTIVE THAT I THINK THE
19 LONG-TERM GOAL IS WE DO WANT TO MOVE PEOPLE OFF THE ROADS, AND
20 I AGREE, I BELIEVE, LIKE DWAYNE OVER THERE I LOVE EXPANSION, I
21 JUST DROVE OVER HERE FROM SACRAMENTO AND I GOT CUT ON THE 580,
22 880 JUNCTION IT DOESN'T MATTER WHAT TIME, THERE IS ALWAYS
23 TRAFFIC AND IF THERE IS AN ACCIDENT YOU'RE THERE ALL DAY. I
24 WANT TO CALL OUT THAT MOVING PEOPLE TO PUBLIC TRANSIT SEEMS TO
25 BE THE LONG-TERM GOAL BECAUSE CLIMATE CHANGE IS NOT A



MARCH 08, 2023

1 HYPOTHETICAL, IT'S HERE. WE WANT TO PROTECT THE ECONOMY WE
2 WANT TO MOVE IN A DIRECTION THAT'S FORWARD THINKING. BUT I
3 REALLY WANT TO CALL THIS OUT, ANUP, THE BIGGEST CHALLENGES
4 HERE IS BUY-IN, EVEN FROM THIS BOARD. WHAT YOU'RE SAYING
5 HYPOTHETICALLY MAKES SENSE TO ME BUT I HAD AN ALLERGIC
6 REACTION. I DO KNOW WHO TOLL COSTS. I DRIVE FROM SAN FRANCISCO
7 TO CONTRA COSTA CAN'T EVERY WEEKEND, IF THE TOLL GOES UP IT
8 DOESN'T STOP ME FROM SEEING MY FAMILY, IT'S JUST THAT MY
9 INCOME GOES DOWN. AND ONE LAST NOTE I'LL MAKE -- SORRY -- ONE
10 MORE NOTE ABOUT THE BUY-IN. DRIVING FROM SACRAMENTO TO HERE
11 THERE IS A GIANT BILLBOARD THAT SAYS THE DIFFERENCE IN YOUR
12 GAS TAX FROM CALIFORNIA AND THE REST OF THE STATE'S IS LIKE \$2
13 AND SOMETHING CENTS OR A DOLLAR, SO THAT MESSAGING THAT THIS
14 STATE IS, YOU KNOW, TAX AND SPEND, TAX AND SPEND THAT'S
15 SOMETHING THAT WE DO NEED TO BE AWARE OF, TO THE POINT THAT
16 WAS MADE OVER HERE. AND THE LAST POINT I'LL MAKE IS CONCERN
17 FOR LOW-INCOME FOLKS, YOU KNOW, ANUP, WE TALKED ABOUT A
18 DISCOUNT PROGRAM BUT HOW EASY AND ACCESSIBLE ARE THOSE
19 PROGRAMS SOMETIMES THOSE PROGRAMS EXIST. SOMETIMES PEOPLE
20 DON'T UTILIZE THEM DON'T KNOW THEY CAN UTILIZE THEM AND ALSO
21 WANT TO CALL OUT THE WORKING CLASS FOLKS WHO MAKE JUST ENOUGH
22 TO NOT BE CONSIDERED LOCATION, IN THIS PROGRAM I'M NOT GOING
23 TO SAY I DON'T SUPPORT IT, THEY'RE GOING TO GET THE BIGGEST
24 SQUEEZE:

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. VINAY AND THEN GERRY.

2

3 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I HAVE ONE MAYBE QUESTION AND ONE JUST A
4 COMMENT. SO, YOU KNOW, I MEAN, FRANKLY, I, MYSELF, AM A LITTLE
5 CONFUSED, BECAUSE I THOUGHT THAT A SIGNIFICANT CHUNK OF THE
6 IMPETUS BEHIND THIS PROGRAM WAS THAT MONEY FROM GAS TAXES OF
7 GOING TO GO DOWN SO WE NEED TO RAISE MONEY TO MEND OUR ROADS
8 AND SOMEHOW AS PEOPLE DIDN'T WANT TO HEAR IT, I'M NOT HEARING
9 IT FROM THE FOLKS MANAGING THIS PROGRAM EITHER THAT, WELL,
10 IT'S ACTUALLY ABOUT SOMETHING ELSE. SO, WHAT I WANT TO KNOW
11 IS, LIKE, IS THAT REALLY PRESENTED TO PEOPLE THAT, YOU KNOW,
12 HOW MUCH DO YOU EXPECT THE MONEY TO GO DON, IF THAT MONEY GOES
13 DOWN, WHAT ARE THE CONSEQUENCES AND THE INFRASTRUCTURE THAT WE
14 ANTICIPATE AND HOW WOULD THAT SHUT THINGS DOWN, AND WHAT
15 PEOPLE'S REACTION TO THAT IS. OR DO PEOPLE JUST THINK THAT
16 SOMEHOW MONEY IS GOING TO MATERIALIZE FROM SOME PLACE ELSE?
17 THE SECOND THING I WANT TO SAY, AND THIS IS A COMMENT, THIS
18 MAYBE IS FOR BOSSES AND STUFF, IS THIS. YOU KNOW, WHEN YOU
19 HAVE A PROJECT JUST LIKE THIS, NORMALLY WHEN YOU SAY YOU WANT
20 TO CHANGE SOME STUFF, YOU TYPICALLY SAY THIS IS THE GOOD SIDE,
21 THIS IS THE BAD SIDE. YOU DON'T HAVE A PROJECT THAT JUST SAYS,
22 HEY, I'M THE BAD SIDE OF THE PROJECT. AND THAT IS
23 UNFORTUNATELY THE KIND OF CARDS THAT YOU HAVE BEEN DEALT HERE.
24 SO I JUST FELT THAT SOMETHING LIKE THIS SHOULD GO HAND IN HAND
25 WITH SOMETHING ELSE THAT IS POSITIVE, AND ONE OF THE THINGS



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THAT I KIND OF DON'T GET ABOUT THE BAY AREA, AND MAYBE I JUST
2 DON'T KNOW ABOUT THIS, BUT, BACK WHEN I WAS IN JERSEY IN THE
3 LAST CENTURY, WE USED TO HAVE A LOT OF COMMERCIAL BUSES THAT
4 USED TO GO INTO NEW YORK CITY, A LOT OF THEM. AND I DON'T SEEM
5 TO HAVE HEARD ABOUT THOSE IN THE BAY AREA. I MEAN, THIS
6 MORNING, I CAME HERE, BY BUS, YOU KNOW, STRAIGHT BUS FROM
7 RICHMOND TO HERE. WHAT ARE WE DOING TO ENCOURAGE BUSES LIKE
8 THAT? EXPRESS BUSES, EVEN SMALLER BUSES, 10, 15 PEOPLE, WHAT
9 HAVE YOU, SO THE FREQUENCY IS BETTER, ET CETERA. AND I JUST --
10 JUST DON'T SEE THAT THERE ARE ANY PROGRAMS WHERE WE SAY, HEY,
11 WE ARE GOING TO MAKE YOUR LIFE BETTER THIS WAY. ALL WE'RE
12 HEARING IS, WELL, YOU KNOW, YOU'RE GOING TO DO THIS, AND IT
13 MAKES YOUR LIFE HARD, OR YOU GET OFF THE ROAD. THAT'S NOT A
14 VERY POSITIVE THING TO SAY. AND, AGAIN, THIS IS FOR BOSSES.
15 THAT'S ALL.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. GERRY?

18

19 **GERRY GLASER:** ANNE OLIVIA KNOWS THIS. A NUMBER OF YOU ASKED
20 THE QUESTIONS WHY DON'T STAFF JUMP IN, ONE OF THE THINGS STAFF
21 DID EARLY IN THE PROJECT WAS SURVEY DIFFERENT PLACES IN THE
22 COUNTRY AND AROUND THE WORLD WHERE THEY HAD TRAFFIC ISSUES AND
23 THEY INSTITUTED DIFFERENT MECHANISMS DESCRIBED THE DIFFERENT
24 MECHANISMS AND WHATEVER RESULTS THEY COULD GET BECAUSE IN MANY
25 CASES THERE IS JUST NOT ENOUGH TRAFFIC YET, TIME, ENOUGH OF



MARCH 08, 2023

1 THOSE PLACES WHERE IT'S PREDICATE PART OF MY COMMENT IT
2 RESULTS IN SOME OF THOSE PLACES WAS IT DOESN'T LAST AND THAT'S
3 THE REASON. HOPEFULLY YOU CAN FIND THAT MATERIAL, STAFF CAN
4 PROVIDE THAT TO YOU, TO SHOW YOU SO YOU GETS YOUR OWN RESULTS
5 ON IT. THEY HAVE BEEN OBJECTIVE AND PRETTY GOOD ABOUT PUTTING
6 COMPANIES TOGETHER. VINAY'S COMMENT ON THE BUSES, I USED TO
7 COMMUTE INTO NEW YORK, AND THE MAJOR TRAFFIC ON THE HIGHWAYS,
8 THEY WOULD STACK THE BUSES GOING INTO THE CITY BECAUSE NOBODY
9 DRIVES A CAR THERE BECAUSE IT'S JUST COST TOO MUCH TO THE PARK
10 WHICH IS WHICH ACTUALLY IS THE CASE HERE AND WHY I TOOK BART
11 COMING IN.

12

13 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. PAM. THEN WE'LL WRAP UP.

14

15 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO MAKE COMMENTS UPLIFTING
16 WHAT A LOT OF OTHERS HAVE SAID. FOCUSING ON EQUITY, I SEE
17 HIGHWAY CONGESTION AS A SYMPTOM OF A LOT OF PROBLEMS THAT WE
18 SEE IN OUR REGION WITH REGARD TO ACCESS TO AFFORDABLE HOUSING,
19 ACCESS TO HIGH QUALITY JOBS THAT PAY A LIVABLE AND FAMILY
20 SUSTAINING WAGE, AND SO, IN ADDITION TO UPLIFTING WHAT
21 SOLUTIONS CAN WE IMAGINE BEFORE CHARGING FOLKS TO USE THE
22 HIGHWAY, I THINK THAT WE SHOULD REALLY LOOK INTO HOW CAN WE
23 CREATE MORE JOBS, MORE ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITY IN THE REGION
24 WHERE IS FOLKS ARE COMMUTING IN FROM. BECAUSE I CAN IMAGINE
25 THE NUMBER ONE REASON FOLKS ARE HOPPING ON TO HIGHWAYS IS TO



MARCH 08, 2023

1 GET TO A JOB. SO IF WE COULD MAKE SURE THERE IS JOBS IN THEIR
2 LOCAL COMMUNITIES THAT DON'T REQUIRE THEM TO DRIVE ON THE
3 HIGHWAY THAT'S ONE SOLUTION I'M SURE WE'RE LOOKING INTO AND I
4 WOULD REALLY LIKE TO UPLIFT THAT. BECAUSE IT TAKES A
5 MARGINALIZED COMMUNITY THAT MOVES INTO THE REGION. SO, WHAT
6 I'M TRYING TO SAY IS THAT A LOT OF OUR COMMUNITIES THAT WE'RE
7 TRYING TO FOCUS ON EQUITY IMPROVEMENTS ON, ARE COMMUNITIES
8 THAT HAVE BEEN PUSHED OUT OF WHERE THEY LIVE AND ARE TRYING TO
9 STAY CONNECT TO THE REGION IN WHATEVER WAY THEY CAN. BY
10 ENSURING THOSE COMMUNITIES THEY MOVE TO PLACES OF ECONOMIC
11 OPPORTUNITY SO ENSURING THE LOCAL COMMUNITIES HAVE ACCESS TO
12 LOCAL TRANSIT LIKE BUS PRESIDENCY, TO GET TO THEIR LOCAL
13 SERVICES. GETTING TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO OR OAKLAND, SAN
14 JOSE IS PUTTING FOCUS ON THOSE CENTRAL LOCATIONS BUT WE HAVE
15 FAMILIES IN SUBURBS AND RURAL AREAS AND THEY NEED ACCESS TO
16 SERVICES, JOBS, AND HIGH QUALITY SCHOOLS. THANK YOU.

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** VERY BRIEFLY. I HEARD VINAY EXPRESS CONCERN THAT
19 THERE ARE NOT BENEFITS BEING PROPOSED. THERE WAS A SLIDE THAT
20 TALKED ABOUT INVESTING IN A RANGE OF TRANSPORTATION
21 IMPROVEMENTS. AND IT WAS GOOD, BUT IT WAS EXTREMELY ABSTRACT,
22 IT HAD A BUNCH OF COLORED BARS. AND THE WORDS WERE GOOD BUT IF
23 YOU JUST LOOK AT THE PICTURES YOU WOULD SEE IT'S TALKING ABOUT
24 EXPRESS BUS, AND SAFER TRANSIT OPTIONS. IN THE INTEREST OF
25 COMMUNICATING, HAVING THAT SLIDE HAVE PICTURES ON IT AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 MAKING IT REALLY CLEAR AND CONCRETE, THE BENEFITS THAT ARE
2 PROPOSED TO BE FUNDED AND DELIVERED. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AND I'M GOING TO WRAP UP WITH
5 MY COMMENTS HERE. AND I'M GOING ON CIRCLE BACK TO FRANK'S
6 ORIGINAL COMMENT. PEOPLE ARE GOING TO REVOLT, BECAUSE WHAT
7 THEY'RE HEARING DOESN'T -- THERE IS NO OPTIONS AT THIS POINT
8 IN TIME. SO IF YOU ARE ASKING PEOPLE ABOUT ADDING TOLLS TO
9 FREEWAYS, THERE ARE NO OPTIONS. WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT THE
10 BUSES THAT MAY BE THERE. WE'RE TALKING SIMPLY ABOUT ONE PART
11 OF A BIG PUZZLE, AND WE NEED TO INCORPORATE THE BIG PUZZLE IN
12 A BETTER MANNER BUT THIS YEAR WITH WE PREDICT THERE WILL BE,
13 BASED ON THESE PLANS, BUS TRAPPED TRANSIT DOWN EL CAMINO,
14 THERE WILL BE DEDICATED BUS LINES, THERE WILL BE ALL THESE
15 OTHER THANKS THAT WE CAN DO BETWEEN NOW AND THEN THAT WILL
16 HELP ALLEVIATE THAT, AND IT'S NEVER EVER MENTIONED. SO, PULL
17 IN THOSE PLANS. IF THERE ARE PLANS, TO DO THAT. SO PEOPLE CAN
18 SEE THAT COMING UP FRONT. BECAUSE THIS'S THE BIGGEST PUSH BACK
19 THAT YOU'RE GOING TO GET. WHEN IT COMES TO TALKING ABOUT THE
20 MONEY AND THE BENEFITS THAT WE'RE GOING TO GAIN, THAT NEEDS TO
21 BE A PRIORITY LIST. BECAUSE THE NEGATIVE IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES
22 NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED BEFORE ANYTHING ELSE. IT -- THE NEGATIVE
23 IMPACT IS THE FIRST THING THAT WE SHOULD BE ADDRESSING. THOSE
24 BUSES SHOULD BE THERE. THE OPPORTUNITY SHOULD BE THERE. ALL OF
25 THAT NEEDS TO BE IN PLACE BEFORE WE CAN START TALKING ABOUT,



MARCH 08, 2023

1 ABOUT ALL LANE TOLLING. IT'S JUST, SIMPLY, MITIGATING THE
2 ARTERIALS THAT YOU'RE DISCUSSING. THOSE ARTERIALS REPRESENT
3 PEOPLE WHO HAVE ALREADY BEEN JERKED AROUND ONCE BY A SYSTEM OF
4 FREEWAYS BUILT THROUGH THEIR NEIGHBORHOOD AND THE ARTERIALS
5 ARE THE ONLY WAY THEY CAN GET OUT OF THEIR HOUSE TO GO TO
6 LOCAL SHOPPING. HOW DO YOU MITIGATE THAT AHEAD OF TIME? WHAT'S
7 GOING TO PAY FOR THAT. AND THAT'S PART OF THE BIG ISSUE THAT I
8 PERSONALLY HAVE WITH THIS. WE'RE -- I THINK THAT THERE IS A
9 LOT OF MESSAGING THAT NEEDS TO BE CHANGED. PLEASE, PLEASE,
10 DON'T SAY THAT THIS IS DONE IN A LOT OF STATES, THAT IT'S DONE
11 ACROSS THE COUNTRY, THAT IT'S DONE IN OTHER COMMUNITIES, AND
12 EVERYBODY WAS HAPPY WITH IT. BECAUSE WE'RE THE BAY AREA, WE'RE
13 DIFFERENT FROM EVERYBODY ELSE. WE HAVE A DIFFERENT SET OF
14 PROBLEMS, AND YOU CAN PULL IN THE INFORMATION FROM THOSE OTHER
15 AREAS, BUT I CAN TELL YOU THAT THE TOLL ROAD IN ORANGE COUNTY,
16 FOR INSTANCE, HAS -- I HAVE AN OPTION. I CAN TAKE THE TOLL
17 ROAD AND BE ON IT ALL BY MYSELF, OR I CAN TAKE THE OTHER
18 FREEWAYS. YOU DON'T HAVE THOSE OPTIONS WITHOUT GOING ON TO
19 CITY STREETS IN A LARGE PART OF OUR COMMUNITIES. YOU DON'T
20 HAVE THE OPTION IF YOU ARE TOLLING 101 EXCEPT PUSHING THAT
21 TRAFFIC ON THE OLD 101 THAT RUNS THROUGH POEM'S DOWNTOWNS THAT
22 ARE STILL TWO-LANE ROADS. SO, I SEE THAT THERE CAN BE
23 BENEFITS, BUT I THINK THAT WE HAVE TO DO TWO THINGS. WE HAVE
24 TO TIE IN THE REST OF THE PROGRAMS, WE HAVE TO -- WHICH ALSO
25 TIE IN OUR EQUITY ISSUES -- AND WE HAVE TO MESSAGE BETTER WHAT



MARCH 08, 2023

1 WE'RE GOING TO BE GET PROGRESS THIS AND WHEN WE'RE GOING TO BE
2 GETTING IT. OF THE BECAUSE AS LONG AS I HEAR WE CAN'T HAVE --
3 WE WENT HAVE MONEY FOR BUSES TO TAKE THE LOAD OFTEN OF PEOPLE
4 DRIVING, IT'S GOING TO BE SOMETHING THAT I WOULD SORELY REACT
5 TO. BECAUSE MY LIFE -- ESPECIALLY IF YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT THE
6 ARTERIALS, I LITERALLY CAN'T GO OUT OF MY HOUSE TO GET
7 ANYWHERE WITHOUT BEING ON ONE OF THOSE ARTERIALS. SO, AND I'M
8 NOT THE ONLY PERSON. THAT WHOLE ROUTE THROUGH SAN JOSE ON THE
9 280, THE 680 ROUTE, KIND OF THE SAME THING. SO FAR LET'S BRING
10 IN THE OTHER STUFF THAT WE KNOW IS HAPPENING AND MAKE THAT THE
11 SELLING POINT, AS YOU GO ALONG. IT'S BEEN A GREAT DISCUSSION.
12 I APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S PATIENCE, AND WE WILL CONTINUE THIS
13 DISCUSSION GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU, ANUP. YOU DISAPPEARED
14 FROM MY SCREEN, AND THANK YOU, DAVE FOR BACKING UP. AND WE'LL
15 MOVE ON TO OUR NEXT AGENDA ITEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NEXT
16 AGENDA ITEM IS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS. WE HAVE FIRST UP, THE
17 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. ILAF, ARE YOU ON THE LINE
18 STILL? NOPE. AND GENAY IS NOT HERE. AND THEY DIDN'T HAVE A
19 MEETING. SO, DID THEY NOT HAVE A MEETING THIS MONTH? ALL
20 RIGHT. SO. OKAY. SO, THAT'S A QUICK SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT.
21 ADINA, THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN.

22

23 **ADINA LEVIN:** YES. SO WE DID NOT MEET IN BETWEEN OUR LAST
24 MEETINGS BUT WE HAVE AN EXCITING MEETING COMING UP WHERE WE'RE
25 GOING TO BE COVERING NEW, THE LATEST AND GREATEST ON THE FARE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 INTEGRATION PILOTS, AND WHAT'S HAPPENING AS WE MOVE FORWARD,
2 AND ON THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING, WHICH IS GOING TO BE
3 STARTING VERY SHORTLY. SO IF YOU ARE INTERESTED IN THE
4 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, THAT'S A GREAT THING TO LOOK UP
5 THE AGENDA AND COME IN AND COMMENT IF YOU WOULD LIKE.

6

7 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON
8 AGENDA ITEM NUMBER EIGHT?

9

10 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED
11 ON THIS ITEM AND THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
12 HAND RAISED AND NOBODY IN THE BOARDROOM.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER NINE,
15 THE STAFF LIAISON REPORT.

16

17 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I MERCIFULLY DO NOT HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD
18 TO MY REPORT.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** I DO, CAN WE HAVE A BRIEF RUN DOWN ON
21 RM3? I THINK THIS BODY HAS NOT HAD A MEETING WHERE WE HAVE
22 BEEN ABLE TO UNDERSTAND RM3. WHAT MONEY WE MOVED AROUND PRIOR
23 TO WINNING IN COURT, WHERE IT'S GONE. JUST A BRIEF RUN DOWN SO
24 WE UNDERSTAND WHERE NOT ALL THAT MONEY -- SOME OF THAT MONEY
25 IS ALREADY SPOKEN FOR BUT WHAT PROJECTS GET TO GET GOING AND



MARCH 08, 2023

1 WHAT DIFFERENCE IT MAKES. THAT WOULD HELP ME REFRESH MY MIND
2 TOO.

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I MEAN, WE ALSO DID A VERY
5 SHORT PRESENTATION -- PRESENTATION IS MAYBE OVERSTATING IT, TO
6 THE PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE WITH SOME OF THIS INFORMATION SO WE
7 COULD ACTUALLY GET THIS OUT TO THE COUNCIL. AND I COULD JUST
8 TELL YOU THAT, YOU KNOW, WE HAVEN'T DONE ANY ALLOCATIONS BUT
9 WE DID APPROVE ABOUT 500 MILLION IN LETTERS OF NO PREJUDICE
10 FOR VARIOUS PROJECTS SOME OF THE INFORMATION IS IN THAT REPORT
11 AND WE COULD CERTAINLY GET THIS OUT TO THE COUNCIL.

12

13 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU. IS THERE
14 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON ITEM NUMBER NINE? I LOST MY CLERK.

15

16 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** SHE STEPPED OUT BUT I DON'T THINK THERE
17 WAS WHEN I LAST CHECKED.

18

19 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YOU CAN SEE IF THERE IS ANYBODY WITH
20 THEIR HAPPENED.

21

22 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** I DON'T SEE ANY PEOPLE.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** COUNCIL MEMBER REPORTS CONCLUDED. ANY
25 RELEVANT ISSUES ANYBODY WANTS TO TALK ABOUT. GERRY?



MARCH 08, 2023

1

2 **GERRY GLASER:** YOU ASSIGNED ME ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE FUNDING
3 WITH THAT GROUP THERE WERE SOME STARTLING RESULTS AND I ASKED
4 WHETHER OR NOT IT WAS POSSIBLE FOR A PRESENTATION TO COME BACK
5 TO THIS COUNCIL AT SOME POINT WITH THOSE RESULTS. I JUST WANT
6 TO KNOW IF THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN.

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ONE THING CHAIR KINMAN IS WORKING WITH US, WE
9 WANT TO MAKE SURE WE MANAGE THE WORK PLAN ON CERTAIN ITEMS
10 WE'RE GOING TO BE BRINGING AN UPDATE ON THE SEA LEVEL RISE
11 FUNDING INVESTMENT FRAMEWORK TO THE JOINT PLANNING COMMITTEE
12 IN APRIL OR MAY SO WE CAN CERTAINLY SHARE THAT WITH THIS
13 GROUP. I DON'T KNOW IF WE'LL BE ABLE TO COME IN AND DO A LONG
14 DISCUSSION OF IT HERE BUT WE'LL WORK WITH THE CHAIR.

15

16 **GERRY GLASER:** THE BOTTOM LINE WOULD BE THE MOST PERSONALITY
17 PART.

18

19 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YEAH IT'S A BIG NUMBER.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** FRANK?

22

23 **FRANK WELTE:** I WANT TO REMIND STAFF THAT I'M A BLIND PERSON
24 WHO READS ALL OF THE MATERIALS THAT I RECEIVE USING SOFTWARE
25 ON MY COMPUTER, THAT MEANS COLOR BARS, CHARTS, MAPS, ARE



MARCH 08, 2023

1 PRETTY MUCH UNUSABLE FOR ME. AND, FOR EXAMPLE, THIS ITEM
2 NUMBER SEVEN, THAT REPORT WAS VERY DIFFICULT TO READ.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU, FRANK. ANYBODY ELSE? I DO WANT
5 TO NOTE THAT IN KY-NAM'S REPORT, IS A NOTICE FOR TRADES
6 ORIENTATION PROGRAM. SO, IF YOU HAVE ISSUES, AND THIS IS -- WE
7 TALK ABOUT WORKPLACE INVESTMENT AND TRAINING PEOPLE AND
8 GETTING THEM INTO JOBS. THERE IS A FLIER IN THERE THAT YOU CAN
9 PASS ALONG. IT'S IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY AND I THINK SAN MATEO.
10 BUT PLEASE GIVE KY-NAM THAT INFORMATION SO HE CAN ATTACH IT TO
11 OUR AGENDA. ADINA?

12

13 **ADINA LEVIN:** YEP. SO, ONE THING THAT MTC AND BAY AREA TRANSIT
14 AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON IS A BUDGET ASK TO HELP ADDRESS
15 THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF WHERE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, THE FEDERAL
16 RELIEF FUNDING THAT TRANSIT RUNNING HAS BEEN USING RIDERSHIP
17 HAS BEEN GROWING BACK AND WE RISK HAVING SEVERE TRANSIT CUTS
18 THERE IS AN IMPORTANT SENATE BUDGET COMMITTEE HEARING TOMORROW
19 AND THEY WILL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT IF ANYBODY IS INTERESTED IN
20 SUPPORTING MTC AND THREAT AGENCIES AND A VARIETY OF NON-PROFIT
21 GROUPS AND INCLUDING SEAMLESS AND TRANSFORM AND MANY OTHERS,
22 THAT IS AN OPPORTUNITY. I DON'T -- I DON'T KNOW, IS IT
23 APPROPRIATE TO SEND OUT THE LINK TO THE SENATE BUDGET HEARING
24 TO MEMBERS?

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **TEDDY KY-NAM MILLER:** GENERALLY -- SURE, WE CAN MAKE IT HAPPEN.

2

3 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE ON COUNCIL MEMBER
6 REPORTS? ITEM TEN. DO I WANT SEE ANYTHING. MARTHA ANYBODY
7 ONLINE? THANK YOU. ITEM 11, NEW BUSINESS. IS THERE ANYBODY
8 WITH NEW BUSINESS? AND IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO
9 SPEAK ON THIS ITEM USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR
10 NINE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN-PERSON SHOULD FORM A LINE
11 BEHIND THE PODIUM. NOT SEEING ANYONE. CALLING ON YOU TO SPEAK.
12 ANY NEW BUSINESS? NO.

13

14 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** WE --

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** WE HAVE ONE? NO?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** MICHAEL.

19

20 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** THANK YOU. I WAS JUST CURIOUS, WITH THE
21 FUNDING DILEMMA OR CRISIS THAT WE'RE IN AS FAR AS TRANSIT, HAS
22 THERE BEEN ANY ACTION ON POSSIBLE CONSOLIDATION OF SOME
23 AGENCIES? IS THAT -- OR PURCHASING OR ANYTHING THAT COULD BE
24 DONE TO SAVE MONEY ON THAT REGARD?

25



MARCH 08, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE NOT SUPPOSED TO GO BACK AND FORTH. I COULD
2 COMMENT OR TAKE IT OFFLINE?

3

4 **MICHAEL BALDINI:** TAKE IT OFFLINE.

5

6 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. BEFORE WE CLOSE NEW BUSINESS, I DO
7 WANT TO SAY THAT ONE OF OUR PIECES OF NEW BUSINESS WILL BE
8 WELCOMING CHARLIE. WHO IS SITTING THERE, WAVE YOUR HAND.
9 EVERYBODY INTRODUCE YOURSELF. HE HAS NOT BEEN -- HE HASN'T
10 GONE THROUGH THE PROCESS OF THE COMMISSION YET. IT WAS GREAT
11 OF HIM TO SHOW UP AND TAKE THE TOUR AND BE HERE FOR ALL OF
12 THIS. CLOSING ITEM 11 TAKING US TO ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT
13 MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WILL BE HELD WEDNESDAY
14 APRIL 12th 1:30 P.M., 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO
15 CALIFORNIA. ANY CHANGES WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. I
16 WANT TO NOTE YOU NEED TO LET MARTHA KNOW IF YOU'RE GOING TO BE
17 HERE BECAUSE WE BARELY MADE QUORUM TODAY. THANK YOU. AND THIS
18 MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL IS ADJOURNED. OH I GET
19 TO DO THIS. [GAVEL TAP] YAY. THEY GAVE ME A HAMMER.

20 [ADJOURNED]

21

22



NTT

Broadcasting Government