



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD

MONDAY, NOVEMBER 27TH, 2023, 12:15 PM

CHAIR, BOB POWERS: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBERS. SO WITH THAT FRONT END, MADAM CLERK, AGENDA ITEM NUMBER ONE IS ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM QUORUM.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHAIR POWERS?

CHAIR, BOB POWERS: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHAN IS ABSENT? TOLL FOR CHAN?

SPEAKER: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHURCHILL?

BILL CHURCHILL: HERE.



1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CUMINS?

2

3 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** FREMIER?

6

7 **ANDREW FREMIER:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GONOT?

10

11 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** BIG FOR HURSH?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

18

19 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM. MULLIGAN?

22

23 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** HERE.

24



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** THE CONSENT CALENDAR HAS THREE ITEMS, TWO,
2 B, C, THIS AN ACTION ITEM. ANY COMMITTEE MEMBERS WANT TO PULL
3 ANY OF THE CONCEPT ITEMS I'M NOT SEEING ANY. ANY MOTIONS FOR
4 THE CONSENT?

5

6 **SPEAKER:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

9

10 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION BY MR. CUMINS AND
11 SECOND BY CHURCHILL FOR AGENDA ITEM CONSENT NUMBER TWO, MADAM
12 CLERK PUBLIC COMMENT EITHER IN THE ROOM OR ONLINE?

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC SPEAKERS ONLINE AND
15 THERE IS NOBODY IN THE ROOM AND NOTHING WAS RECEIVED IN
16 WRITING.

17

18 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. THEN WE ARE GOING TO GO TO THE VOTE.
19 WILL ALL THOSE -- AM I DOING THE VOTE, MADAM CLERK? OR YOU DO
20 THE VOTE? I AM. ALL IN FAVOR PLEASE NOTE BY AYE.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** AYES.

23

24 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** ANY OPPOSED? MADAM CLERK, FOR THE RECORD,
25 THE ITEM PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 THREE. AND THIS IS OUR EXECUTIVE BOARD, OUR CLIPPER EXECUTIVE
2 BOARD CALENDAR. AND EDWARD IS GOING TO WALK US THROUGH -- IS
3 EDWARD GOING TO WALK US THROUGH? OR ARE YOU, JASON?

4

5 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** ED IS GOING TO WALK US THROUGH.

6

7 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** ED IS GOING TO WALK US THROUGH. AND THIS IS
8 WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE THINKING ABOUT FOR THE CALENDAR FOR
9 2024. EDWARD, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

10

11 **EDWARD MENG:** CAN YOU HEAR ME?

12

13 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** COPY THAT.

14

15 **EDWARD MENG:** GOOD AFTERNOON. THIS ITEM CONCERNS THE PROPOSED
16 2024 CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD, CALENDAR. THE BOARD MUST ADOPT
17 THIS ANNUALLY. THIS ITEM WAS PRESENTED AS AN INFORMATION ITEM
18 TO THE BOARD LAST MONTH. AND IT REMAINS THE SAME. WE'RE
19 REQUESTING BOARD APPROVAL OF THE CALENDAR AS SHOWN IN THE
20 ATTACHMENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT EDWARD. AGAIN THIS
23 WAS HEARD AS AN INFORMATION ITEM AT THE PAST MEETING. NOW
24 WE'RE ON TO AN ACTION ITEM. IS THERE A MOTION AND SECOND ON
25 THE ITEM?



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1

2 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I MOVE APPROVAL ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

3

4 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** SECOND.

5

6 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** MOTION BY MULLIGAN, AND THE SECOND BY GONOT
7 ON THE CALENDAR. MADAM CLERK, HOW ABOUT PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
8 ITEM IN THE ROOM OR VIRTUAL?

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC SPEAKERS ONLINE,
11 NOBODY IN THE ROOM, AND NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.

12

13 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY THANK YOU FOR THAT. COMMITTEE, COUNCIL
14 MEMBERS, COMMENTS, CONCERNS, EPIPHANIES? NOT SEEING ANY. LET'S
15 GO TO THE VOTE, MADAM CLERK. ALL IN FAVOR OF MOVING THE
16 EXECUTIVE BOARD CALENDAR FORWARD, PLEASE SAY AYE.

17

18 **SPEAKERS:** AYES.

19

20 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** ALL THOSE OPPOSED? PASSES UNANIMOUSLY,
21 MADAM CLERK, FOR THE EXECUTIVE BOARD CALENDAR. THANK YOU,
22 EDWARD. NICE WORK ON DOING THE TWO-STEP APPROACH. THE
23 INFORMATIONAL ITEM THEN THE ACTION ITEM. THAT'S VERY HELPFUL.
24 THAT MOVES US TO ITEM FOUR, WHICH IS CURRENT -- THERE IS TWO
25 PARTS AGENDA ITEM 4; 4A AND 4B. 4A IS THE CLIPPER SCHEDULE



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 IMPLEMENTATION AND DEPLOYMENT UPDATE AND 4B IS THE OPERATIONS
2 AND PERFORMANCE UPDATE. SO, THE FIRST ONE KELLY JACKSON IS
3 GOING TO WALK US THROUGH, WHICH IS THE SCHEDULE IMPLEMENTATION
4 AND DEPLOYMENT.

5

6 **KELLY JACKSON:** THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. THE SYSTEM INTEGRATION
7 TESTING REQUIRED FOR CUBICS ACHIEVEMENT OF REVENUE READY IS
8 UNDERWAY. WE EXPECT TO HAVE MUCH BETTER INFORMATION AND
9 CONFIDENCE WITH THE SCHEDULE AT THE END OF DECEMBER AFTER WE
10 EVALUATE THE PROGRESS OF TESTING. THE SITUATION WITH THE
11 TESTING IS DYNAMIC. FOR EXAMPLE, LAST WEEK THE CUBIC AND MTC
12 PROJECT TEAM REALIZED THE COMPLETION OF SYSTEM INTEGRATION
13 TESTING WAS SLIPPING INTO JANUARY WITH IMPLICATIONS FOR THE
14 START OF PREREVENUE PILOT TESTING. SO, BOTH TEAMS WERE ABLE TO
15 COMMIT TO SHIFTING EMPLOYEE RESOURCES FACILITATING MOR HOURS
16 FOR TEST WITNESSING EACH WEEK. WE'RE RESPONDING TO SCHEDULE
17 ISSUES ON A DAY BY DAY BASIS WITH THE TESTING. WE WILL BE ABLE
18 TO SHARE MORE INFORMATION AT THE NEXT CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD
19 MEETING ABOUT THE START OF CUSTOMER TRANSITION. THE RISK
20 LISTED IN THE MEMO, INCLUDING IMPLEMENTATION TESTING OF NEW
21 BUSINESS RULES, EQUIPMENT INSTALLATIONS, COORDINATION OF
22 MULTIPLE CONTRACTORS INTEGRATION EFFORTS CONTINUE TO BE THE
23 MAIN POINTS OF CONCERN. HOWEVER, CUBIC AND MTC PROJECT TEAMS
24 ARE FOCUSED ON MANAGING RISK, AND CUBIC HAS MADE DEMONSTRABLE
25 PROGRESS. ONE OF THE MOST VISIBLE SIGNS OF PROGRESS IS NEW



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 EQUIPMENT INSTALLED ACROSS THE REGION WITH FINAL ON BOARD
2 EQUIPMENT INSTALLATION WRAPPING UP DURING FIRST QUARTER OF
3 2024. WE SHOULD HAVE A PICTURE OF AN AC TRANSIT BUS. BUT AC
4 TRANSIT INSTALLATIONS ARE PROGRESSING WITH AC TRANSIT ELECTING
5 TO HAVE CLIPPER READERS INSTALLED ON FRONT AND BACK DOORS OF
6 THE BUSES. FINAL BUS OPERATOR TO BE INSTALLED WILL WESCAT DUE
7 TO SOME ISSUES WITH CATAVL INTEGRATION THAT HAVEN'T BEEN
8 RESOLVED YET. ANY QUESTIONS.

9

10 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. BEFORE WE GO TO QUESTIONS, LET'S HOLD
11 OFF AND GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT, MADAM CLERK, EITHER IN THE ROOM
12 OR VIRTUALLY.

13

14 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES. WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENT. ONE
15 SPEAKER ONLINE. ONE SECOND. ALETA DUPREE, PLEASE UNMUTE
16 YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANKS. GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS.
19 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER. DID GET TO PULL UP
20 THIS BRIEF PRESENTATION. AND THANK YOU FOR THE BRIEF AND
21 SUCCINCT WORK. I AM GRATEFUL TO SEE THE AC TRANSIT BUS WITH
22 THE NEW READER ON BOARD AND I DO SUPPORT THE IDEA OF HAVING
23 THE READERS ON THE FRONT AND BACK DOORS, WHICH HELPS WHEN THE
24 BUSES GET CROWDED. WHEN I USE AC TRANSIT A LOT BECAUSE WHEN I
25 AM IN THE BAY AREA, I STAY, GENERALLY, ALMOST ALL THE TIME, IN



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 THE EAST BAY. SO, AS I HAVE SAID BEFORE, THESE NEW READERS,
2 WHICH I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO USING, WILL GIVE THE CLEARER
3 PICTURE. THESE OLD READERS, THEIR SCREENS ARE JUST FADING OUT.
4 AND SO THE TRANSBAY SWITCH IS GOING TO BE MUCH MORE OBVIOUS TO
5 PEOPLE SO THAT WAY THEY WILL KNOW WHAT THE FARE WILL BE BEFORE
6 THEY TAP THEIR CARD OR PHONE ON TO THE READER. I AM NOT REAL
7 FAMILIAR WITH THIS WESTCAT. I DO NOT KNOW MUCH ABOUT WHERE IT
8 GOES. MAYBE I'LL USE IT SOME DAY. BUT IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE
9 GETTING CLOSE WITH THIS. SO, I HOPE TO BE IN THE BAY AREA
10 BEFORE THE END OF THE YEAR. AND ONCE WE GET ALL THESE NEW
11 READERS OUT ON THE SYSTEM IT'S CERTAINLY GOING TO MAKE IT
12 EASIER FOR ME TO ESTABLISH THE STATUS OF MY CLIPPER
13 TRANSACTION AND HAVE THAT CLEAN AND SEAMLESS INFORMATION THAT
14 GOES ALONG WITH USING THE APP ON MY PHONE, IT WILL CERTAINLY
15 HELP THOSE WHO ARE USING PLASTIC CARDS. SO, THANK YOU. I
16 APPRECIATE THAT.

17

18 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
19 SPEAKERS ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. HOW ABOUT
22 COMMITTEE MEMBERS? COMMENTS? ADVICE, FOR KELLY'S PRESENTATION
23 ON THE CLIPPER SCHEDULE? I'M NOT SEEING ANY. OKAY. WITH THAT,
24 WHY DON'T WE MOVE ON TO THE SECOND PART, WHICH WOULD BE THE



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 OPERATIONS AND PERFORMANCE UPDATE THAT'S COMPLEMENTARY TO WHAT
2 KELLY JUST WALKED US THROUGH FROM EDWARD. EDWARD?

3

4 **EDWARD MENG:** THANK YOU. THANKS AGAIN. THE CONTENT REPORTED IN
5 THE MEMO PROVIDES INFORMATION AND STATISTICS ON TRANSACTIONS
6 AND REVENUE MOBILE CLIPPER CARD USAGE CUSTOMER SERVICE
7 STAFFING LEVELS AND QUARTERLY FARE CHANGES. LAST MONTH THE
8 CLIPPER SYSTEM PROCESSED 14 BILLION TRANSACTIONS AND SETTLED
9 OVER 32 MILLION IN REVENUE. I WANT TO REMIND THE BOARD THAT IN
10 ORDER TO KEEP THE WORK OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF TESTING THE C TWO
11 SYSTEM ON TRACK KELLY DISCUSSED IN THE LAST AGENDA ITEM WE'RE
12 REQUESTING THAT THE OPERATORS PUT IN QUARTERLY FARE CHANGES
13 AND A REMINDER THAT FOR APRIL 1, 2024 FARE CHANGES ARE
14 REQUESTED BY JANUARY 1ST, SO BY THE END OF THIS YEAR. SO,
15 LET'S GET INTO SOME OF THE DATAS AND TRENDS IN SYSTEM USAGE
16 FOR SOME KEY METRICS. OVER THE PAST SEVERAL MONTHS WE HAVE
17 SHOWN TO THIS BOARD DATA POINTS THAT COMPARE DATA FROM THE
18 LAST FEW YEARS IN ORDER TO ATTEMPT TO MEASURE THE IMPACT OF,
19 IN PARTICULAR, THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC ON TRANSIT RIDERSHIP.
20 THIS MONTH, FOR THE SLIDES, WE DECIDE THAT WE WANTED TO ZOOM
21 OUT A BIT MORE AND PUT SOME OF THIS CLIPPER DATA INTO CONTEXT
22 BY PROVIDING A LARGER VIEW, WHICH, FOR SOME OF THESE DATA
23 POINTS, IT'S OVER TEN YEARS. SO, IF WE CAN GO TO THE SLIDES,
24 PLEASE? IF YOU CAN PUT THEM ON THE BOARD? THANKS. THE NEXT
25 SLIDE, PLEASE. THANK YOU. SO, OVER THE LAST TEN YEARS WE HAVE



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 SEEN A STEADY INCREASE IN THE NUMBER OF CLIPPER CARDS IN
2 CIRCULATION FROM 2 MILLION TO NEARLY 15 MILLION. AND, IN FACT,
3 SINCE FORMATION OF THIS BODY, THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD IN
4 2016, APPROXIMATELY THREE OUT OF EVERY FOUR CARDS IN
5 CIRCULATION HAS BEEN DISTRIBUTED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OVER THE
6 SAME TIME PERIOD, THE UNIQUE NUMBER OF CLIPPER CARDS PER MONTH
7 HAS GROWN BY OVER 35%. OVER THE LAST TEN YEARS, THE NUMBER OF
8 CLIPPER USERS PER MONTH HAS INCREASED OVER 60%. AS YOU CAN SEE
9 FROM THE CHART WHILE THERE WAS A PERIOD OF DECLINE OVER COVID-
10 19 IT DOES APPEAR TO BE A TEMPORARY BLIP AND NOT PERMANENT.
11 CLIPPER RIDERS ARE RETURNING TO TRANSIT ESPECIALLY AS EMPLOYER
12 POLICIES ON REMOTE WORK CONTINUE TO EVOLVE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
13 WE WANT TO HIGHLIGHT GROWING INTEREST IN CLIPPER START, THE
14 MEANS BASED PROGRAM THAT OFFERS DISCOUNTS OFF OF CASH FARE. WE
15 EXPECT INTEREST AS WELL AS PARTICIPATING IN THIS PROGRAM TO GO
16 AND HAVE PLANNED FOR IT BY DESIGNING Q2 CLIPPER START AS ITS
17 OWN FARE CATEGORY THE ABILITY FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES TO OFFER
18 MORE FEATURES THAN DISCOUNTS FOR THOSE WITH MORE FEATURES MORE
19 LIMITED MEANS SINCE NOVEMBER 2023, 2.7 MILLION HAVE TAKEN TO
20 USING CLIPPER START DISCOUNT PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE. WITH THE
21 RELEASE OF CLIPPER MOBILE APP THE CARD ON PHONES IN APRIL 2021
22 THE MOBILE APP HAS BEEN A SUCCESS AND IS REMARKABLY POPULAR
23 WITH THE TRANSIT RIDERS SINCE LAUNCH 2.2 MILLION MOBILE CARDS
24 HAVE BEEN PROVISIONED UNDER RIDER PHONES WHICH IN TERMS OF
25 COMPARISON WITH THE PLASTIC CARDS ONE OUT OF EVERY THREE CARDS



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 ADDED TO CIRCULATION SINCE LAUNCH. TOTALING NEARLY 5.7 MILLION
2 TRIPS HAVE BEEN TAKEN USING MOBILE CLIPPER CARD AS FARE
3 PAYMENT. NEXT SLIDE. FINALLY THE CLIPPER OVER THE LAST TEN
4 YEARS PERIOD CLIPPER SYSTEM HAS COLLECTED AND SETTLED TWO
5 TRANSIT AGENCIES TOTAL OF 4.4 BILLED IN TRANSIT FARES TO THE
6 REGIONS TRANSIT OPERATORS THIS AVERAGES AROUND \$436 MILLION A
7 YEAR OR ON AVERAGE 35 TO \$36 MILLION A MONTH THE SYSTEM'S
8 LOWEST MONTHLY REVENUE WAS APRIL 2020 AS RESULT OF THE
9 PANDEMIC AND WAS 2.8 MILLION AND HIGHEST OF THE SYSTEM HAS
10 EVER SETTLED WAS IN OCTOBER 2019, \$62 MILLION A MONTH THE LAST
11 MONTH BEFORE THE SYSTEM COLLECTED SETTLEMENT NEARLY 32 OR \$33
12 MILLION IN FARE REVENUE SIMILAR TO PRIOR SLICE THAT IS THE
13 IMPACTS OF THE PANDEMIC, BEGINNING TO LESSEN OVER TIME THE
14 SYSTEM IS RETURNING TO STABLE STATE AND PEOPLE ARE BEGINNING
15 TO RETURN TO RIDER TRANSIT. WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO TAKE
16 COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD.

17
18 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION, EDWARD.
19 MADAM CLERK ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

20
21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** [INDISCERNIBLE]

22
23 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** VERY GOOD. COMMENTS FOR EDWARD ON HIS
24 REPORT? CAROLYN?



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** I'M CURIOUS YOU SAID THE DOLLAR NUMBERS, AND
2 WHEN THE HIGH ACTIVITY WAS, HIGHEST NUMBERS, I'M CURIOUS IF
3 YOU TAKE THE TOTAL DOLLAR VALUE AND DIVIDE BY THE NUMBER OF
4 TRIPS AT LEAST GETTING CLIPPER COST PER TRIP IS THAT TRENDING
5 LOWER NOW? I WAS CURIOUS BECAUSE TYPICALLY SEEING THE BUS
6 FARES, YOU'RE NOT CHARGED, YOU DON'T DO ZONES YOU KNOW THE
7 FLAT RATES, I'M CURIOUS THE SENSE OF WHO IN THE COMMUNITY IS
8 TAKING IT? JUST CURIOUS.

9

10 **EDWARD MENG:** WE DON'T HAVE THE EXACT NUMBER RIGHT NOW. WE CAN
11 GET THAT THAT TO YOU NEXT MONTH. BUT WE WOULD NOTE THAT RIGHT
12 NOW THERE IS A HIGHER PORTION OF BART RIDERS AS OPPOSED TO BUS
13 RIDERS, AND BECAUSE BART TENDS TO HAVE A HIGHER FARE, THE
14 AVERAGE FARE IS LIKELY HIGHER THAN IT WAS PREVIOUSLY.

15

16 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, CAROLYN. ANY
17 OTHER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FOR EDWARD? YES, GO AHEAD BILL
18 CHURCHILL.

19

20 **BILL CHURCHILL:** EDWARD, THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION.
21 EXCELLENT, AS ALWAYS, AND INFORMATIVE FOR ME. AND I WANT TO BE
22 COGNIZANT OF POTENTIALLY CREATING WORK -- AND SO IF I AM, I
23 DON'T WANT TO GO DOWN THAT ROAD. ONE THING, IN THE PAST, IF I
24 REMEMBER RIGHT, THERE WAS A REPORT THAT SHOWED PERCENTAGE BY
25 OPERATOR OF CLIPPER CARD USAGE AND THEN, ALSO, VIRTUAL -- OR



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 THE MOBILE CARD. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S POSSIBLE TO RECREATE A
2 REPORT LIKE THAT? I KNOW I USED IT IN THE PAST WITH OUR
3 MARKETING DEPARTMENT TO TRY TO PUSH OUT MARKETING FOR THE
4 VIRTUAL CARD, ON THE MOBILE APP, RECOGNIZING THAT GETTING THE
5 CARDS SOMETIMES IS CHALLENGING, AND IT MAY BE USEFUL FOR US AS
6 OPERATORS TO SEE THAT AND USE IT. BUT IF IT'S SOMETHING THAT
7 GENERATES A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK, THAT'S NOT SOMETHING I
8 WOULD ASK FOR.

9

10 **EDWARD MENG:** WE CAN TAKE A LOOK AT THAT AND GET YOU A RESPONSE
11 BY NEXT MONTH, BOARD MEMBER CHURCHILL.

12

13 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, EDWARD. OTHER
14 COMMENTS? I HAD ONE, EDWARD, FOR YOU. I THINK ON THE SLIDE
15 THAT YOU TALKED A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM,
16 AND THERE WERE SOME GLOBAL NUMBERS THERE, AT THE NEXT MEETING,
17 MAYBE A LITTLE BIT MORE DETAIL ON THAT, EDWARD. YOU KNOW, THAT
18 DATA SET IS LACKING, FROM MY PERSPECTIVE. I DON'T KNOW WHERE
19 WE TRYING TO GO. WHAT IS OUR GOAL, AS A REGION, FOR CLIPPER
20 START, AND WHERE ARE WE WITH RESPECT TO THAT GOAL. AND HOW IS
21 THAT -- YOU GAVE ME SOME BIG GLOBAL NUMBERS THERE, BUT FOR THE
22 LAST THREE MONTHS HERE IS HOW IT'S CHANGED AND YOU KNOW,
23 PROJECT THAT OUT TO WHATEVER OUR GOAL IS IN THE BAY AREA FOR
24 THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM. AND, SO, I THINK A LITTLE BIT MORE
25 SUBSTANCE TO THAT SLIDE, I THINK IT WAS SLIDE FOUR THAT YOU



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 HAD THERE, MIGHT BE TELLING FOR THIS COMMITTEE, ESPECIALLY AS
2 WE EMBARK ON THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL THAT WE JUST HAD,
3 JUST A FEW MINUTES AGO. SO, I'LL LEAVE THAT TO YOU AND JASON
4 AND ALIX TO NAVIGATE THAT. BUT I WOULD REQUEST THAT COME BACK
5 AT THE NEXT TIME THIS MEETING GETS TOGETHER. MISS BOCKELMAN?

6

7 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. AND WE DEFINITELY
8 AGREE THAT LOOKING A LOT MORE CLOSELY AT THE CLIPPER START AND
9 KIND OF WHERE WE'RE HEADED. I WOULD NOTE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO
10 PUT TOGETHER INFORMATION FOR A JANUARY UPDATE. SO, IF YOU'RE
11 AMENABLE, WE MIGHT SKIP DECEMBER AND COME BECOME IN JANUARY
12 JUST SO WE HAVE THE BEST INFORMATION FOR YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** YES. YOU SHOULD TALK TO YOUR PERSON SITTING
15 ON YOUR LEFT SIDE THERE.

16

17 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** L SO, BECAUSE WE'RE LOOKING AT A FEW THINGS,
18 RIGHT, SO NOT ONLY THE DATA. I THINK WE CAN GET YOU THE DATA
19 BUT WE'RE ALSO REQUESTED BY OUR COMMISSION TO LOOK AT, YOU
20 KNOW, OPPORTUNITIES TO REALLY GET MORE PEOPLE ON CLIPPER
21 START. SO, I THOUGHT THAT HAVING THAT WRAP AROUND ACCOUNTED BE
22 HELPFUL, ALONG WITH THE DATA. AND I THINK AS YOU ALL KNOW, WE
23 JUST RECENTLY ARE GETTING TO A PLACE WHERE WE HAVE A
24 CONSISTENT DISCOUNT OF 50%, AND ALSO HAVE ALL OPERATORS ON
25 CLIPPER START. SO, THAT'S REALLY GREAT. AND WE CERTAINLY HOPE



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 TO SEE THOSE NUMBERS GO UP. SO WE CAN GET YOU THE DATA BUT
2 THIS IS ALSO WRAP AROUND ON ADDITIONAL WORK TO REALLY -- WE
3 WANT TO SEE MORE PEOPLE HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO GET THE
4 DISCOUNT FROM CLIPPER START. AND WE STILL ARE SEEING FAIRLY
5 LOW USAGE VERSUS WHERE WE WANTED TO BE.

6

7 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** NO. I AGREE. THERE IS THE WHOLE MARKETING
8 PIECE TO IT, ALIX, AS WELL AS THE DATA SET AND BOTH ARE GOING
9 TO BE CRITICAL TO GETTING THE BAY AREA TO WHERE IT SHOULD BE
10 FOR THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM. SO, HAPPY TO COUPLE THOSE TWO
11 TOGETHER. OKAY. OTHER COMMENTS FOR EDWARD, KELLY, JASON ON
12 THESE TWO TOPICS? NOT SEEING ANY. MADAM CLERK, THAT MOVES US
13 TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE, WHICH IS OUR ACTING EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
14 REPORT. JASON, THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

15

16 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. I KNOW I HAVE SOME
17 BIG SHOES TO FILL HERE. BUT I'M CONFIDENCE THAT I CAN GET THE
18 JOB DONE. IT SEEMS LIKE ONLY YESTERDAY THAT I STARTED WORKING
19 ON THE CLIPPER PROGRAM, BUT IT'S BEEN ALMOST TEN YEARS NOW,
20 ACTUALLY, AND PREVIOUS TO THAT, I ACTUALLY RAN THE FASTRAK
21 PROGRAM FOR TWO YEARS. AND DURING MY TIME WITH CLIPPER, I HAVE
22 BUILT A SOLID TEAM, AND I HAVE ESTABLISHED A STRONG
23 RELATIONSHIP WITH THE OPERATOR STAFF THAT ALL WORKED FOR YOU.
24 MY ENGINEERING BACKGROUND HAS HELPED ME EVALUATE THE TECHNICAL
25 CHALLENGES TO MOVE THIS PROJECT FORWARD. AND WE HAVE A BIG



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 YEAR IN FRONT OF US AS WE TRY AND LAND THIS LARGE PROJECT WITH
2 MULTIPLE STAKEHOLDERS AND VENDORS ALL ON A DIME AS I
3 INDIVIDUALS IN THE PAST. I AM COMMITTED AND CONFIDENT IN MY
4 TEAM THAT WE WILL BE ABLE TO GET THAT JOB DONE BUT SHOULD
5 THERE BE BUMPS ALONG THE WAY REST ASSURED I'LL KEEP THIS BODY
6 INFORMED AND WE'LL FIND THE BEST SOLUTION TO DELIVER THE NEXT
7 GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM. I'M ALWAYS AVAILABLE TO YOU SO
8 PLEASE DON'T HESITATE TO REACH OUT TO ME IF YOU NEED SOMETHING
9 OR HAVE ANY CONCERNS. AND THAT IS MY REPORT.

10

11 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, JASON. AND YOU
12 KNOW, WORKING WITH PRIOR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, I THINK YOU'RE IN
13 A PRETTY GOOD POSITION AS THE ACTING. SO, THANK YOU FOR
14 STEPPING INTO THOSE SHOES. MUCH APPRECIATED. MADAM CLERK,
15 PUBLIC COMMENT?

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES. WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER ONLINE. AND WE
18 HAVE ONE SPEAKER IN THE ROOM. ADINA LEVIN, WOULD YOU LIKE TO
19 START?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** ALL RIGHT. ADINA LEVIN. AND I SERVE ON THE MTC POLICY
22 ADVISORY COUNCIL. I HAVE BEEN SERVING ON THE FARE INTEGRATION
23 SUBCOMMITTEE, WHICH TRANSFORMED INTO THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION
24 PLAN SUBCOMMITTEE WHICH IS SUPPORTING NETWORK MANAGEMENT
25 COUNCIL. WITH THAT, I WANTED TO KEY OFF OF SOME DISCUSSION



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 THAT HAPPENED IN THE MEETING DIRECTLY PREVIOUS TO THIS. YOU
2 KNOW, SO, FINGERS CROSSED ON THE DELIVERY OF THE CLIPPER TWO
3 THAT COMES WITH A NUMBER OF THE POLICY IMPROVEMENTS FROM THE
4 FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. IN THE INTEREST OF SOME OF THE
5 EFFICIENCY THAT GOT MENTIONED IN THE PREVIOUS MEETING, HAVING
6 THREE DIFFERENT BODIES COMPOSED OF OVERLAPPING PEOPLE, WORKING
7 ON NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND THEN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF FARE
8 POLICY, AND THE CLIPPER SYSTEM IS STARTING TO MAKE MY HEAD
9 HURT, AND I AM WONDERING WHETHER, YOU KNOW, AS NETWORK
10 MANAGEMENT ADVANCES, THERE MIGHT BE SOME OPPORTUNITIES TO
11 STREAMLINE HOW THESE, YOU KNOW, EXTREMELY RELATED THINGS ARE
12 DONE IN TERMS OF THE POLICY AND IMPLEMENTATION BODIES. SO,
13 HAVE NO IDEA OR OPINION ABOUT HOW BEST TO DO THAT, BUT IT DOES
14 SEEM LIKE A LOGICAL THING TO THINK ABOUT, AND THEN, SECONDLY,
15 IN THINKING ABOUT INCREASING THE UPTAKE OF CLIPPER START,
16 THERE -- IF IT IS POSSIBLE TO STREAMLINE -- TO AUTO ENROLL FOR
17 PEOPLE THAT ARE GETTING, LIKE, CAL-FRESH OR MEDICAID, THE BIG
18 PROGRAMS THAT HAVE MANY PEOPLE, THAT COULD HAVE A REALLY MAJOR
19 BENEFIT IF IT IS POSSIBLE TO DO THAT. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ALETA DUPREE.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR BOB POWERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
24 RECORD SHE AND HER. I FEEL THE NEED TO SPEAK. I DON'T KNOW
25 MUCH OF WHAT BEING AN ACTING EXECUTIVE, BUT I HAVE BEEN



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 FORTUNATE TO KNOW JASON IN THE SIX YEARS I HAVE BEEN ATTENDING
2 MEETINGS. AND CLIPPER IS A PROGRAM THAT FOR 13 YEARS HAS
3 CONTINUED TO WORK FOR ME. AND I IMPRESS UPON YOU THAT JASON IS
4 A LOT MORE THAN TECHNICAL MANAGERIAL LEADERSHIP. I FOUND IN
5 JASON, JUST LIKE WITH CAROL, A VERY STRONG PEOPLE ASPECT. I
6 HAVE ALWAYS ENJOYED THE WELCOME THAT I GET IN YOUR MEETINGS
7 AND IN MY CONVERSATIONS WITH JASON, AND IN JASON, SEEING THE
8 PEOPLE PERSPECTIVE IN THE ADVICE AND UNDERSTANDING THAT I GET
9 IN HELPING TO BE A MORE EMPOWERED USER OF CLIPPER. ALWAYS
10 LEARNING NEW THINGS. AND, SO, JASON, I FIND, LIKE CAROL,
11 CONTINUES TO MAKE CLIPPER A PROGRAM THAT IS APPROACHABLE AND
12 RELEVANT. I BELIEVE THAT WORK WILL CONTINUE. I ASK YOU, AS A
13 BOARD, TO CONVERSE CLOSELY WITH JASON AND TO LEARN NEW THINGS.
14 I BELIEVE THAT JASON, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE JASON BECOME A
15 PERMANENT EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF THIS PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER PUBLIC
18 SPEAKERS.

19

20 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** OKAY. COMMITTEE COMMENTS ON ACTING DIRECTOR
21 WEINSTEIN'S REPORT? NOT SEEING ANY. JASON. SO, MADAM CLERK,
22 THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER SIX. ANY OTHER PUBLIC
23 COMMENT RECEIVED ON ANY OTHER ITEMS THAT WERE NOT ON THE
24 AGENDA FOR THIS AFTERNOON?

25



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS ONE PUBLIC SPEAKER. ALETA
2 DUPREE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANKS CHAIR BOB POWERS AS WE CLOSE THE MEETING,
5 ALETA DUPREE SHE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER. I'M LOOKING
6 FORWARD TO OPEN PAYMENT FUNCTIONALITY. I BELIEVE VERY SOON I'M
7 GOING TO SEE AN OPEN PAYMENT FUNCTIONALITY ON ANOTHER SYSTEM
8 THAT I USE. I'M NOT GOING TO NAME IT RIGHT NOW, BECAUSE THE
9 SOFT OPENING HAS NOT BEGUN. I'M SURE I'LL TELL BUT THAT NEXT
10 TIME. AS THIS PROGRAM EVOLVES, HOW DO WE CONTINUE TO MAKE IT
11 MORE USER FRIENDLY? BECAUSE I DO BELIEVE THAT PAYMENT METHODS
12 DO INFORM PEOPLE'S DECISIONS TO USE CERTAIN MODES. WHEN I
13 THINK ABOUT MY MONTH IN NEW YORK, PART OF MY MONTH IN NEW YORK
14 INVOLVED ME GOING TO VISIT THE JFK, JOHN FORD KENNEDY
15 INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT WHERE I MET UP WITH FRIENDS AND DID
16 AIRPLANE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ALL OF THAT INVOLVED USING THE JFK
17 [INDISCERNIBLE] AND NOW YOU CAN USE YOUR PHONE TO PAY FOR THE
18 AIR TRAIN AND IT DID INFLUENCE HOW MUCH I USED THE AIR TRAIN
19 TICKETING ISSUES, ANTIQUATED METRO CARD VENDING MACHINES. I
20 THINK ABOUT WHEN I WAS IN NEW YORK AT THE 74th STREET STATION
21 I SAID TO MYSELF UPON ENTERING THE SYSTEM THAT IS LEGENDARY
22 AND STATELY USING MY PHONE TO ENTER THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY,
23 AND PAY THE REDUCED FARE WITH THE FARE CAPPING AND ROAD
24 ACCUMULATIONS NOW COMING INTO FASHION IT MADE IT VERY EASY BUT
25 YET SOME OTHER SYSTEMS IN NEW YORK STILL HAS NOT GOT TONE THAT



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 LEVEL HOW DO YOU STAY AHEAD OF THE PAC BECAUSE I WANT TO SEE
2 MORE PEOPLE ON THE BUSES ON, ON THE TRAIN, THEY'RE USING THEIR
3 PHONES TO PAY FOR SUBWAY AND I THINK WE SHOULD CONTINUE TO DO
4 THAT HERE IN THE BAY AREA THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ADINA LEVIN.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** I DON'T WANT TO KEEP PEOPLE FROM A STATE LEGISLATIVE
9 HEARING HAPPENING ACROSS THE HALL BUT I DID HAVE A CHANCE TO
10 LEARN A LITTLE BIT WITH OPEN PAYMENT COMING UP AS A FEATURE IN
11 CLIPPER 2.0, IT WILL NOT AT FIRST WORK WITH SENIOR DISCOUNTS
12 DISABILITY DISCOUNTS I DID HAVE A CHANCE TO LEARN ABOUT WHAT
13 THE STATE IS DOING THEY HAVE SENIOR DISCOUNTS WORKING WITH
14 TRANSIT AND ARE LOOKING TO POTENTIALLY GET DISABILITY DISCOUNT
15 WORK WITH OPEN PAYMENT THEY'RE SCHEDULED TO DO THAT BY 2024 SO
16 I'M WONDERING IF OUR REGION IS LEVERAGING SOME OF THE WORK
17 GOING ON AT THE STATE LEVEL TO ENABLE OPEN PAYMENT ALSO WITH
18 DISCOUNTS TO WHICH PEOPLE ARE ENTITLED. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC SPEAKERS.

21

22 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** THANK YOU. THAT BRINGS US TO AGENDA ITEM
23 SEVEN WHICH IS ADJOURNMENT AND NEXT MEETING. SO AFTER TALKING
24 WITH OUR ACTING DIRECTOR, WE'RE ARE GOING TO -- THE DECEMBER
25 MEETING IS GOING TO BE CANCELED, MADAM CLERK.



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** OKAY.

3

4 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** AND WE'LL WORK TO GET THE JANUARY MEETING
5 SCHEDULED BETWEEN JASON AND MYSELF, AND YOURSELF, MADAM CLERK,
6 SO, JUST THE JANUARY -- THE DECEMBER MEETING WAS CANCELED,
7 WHICH WAS DECEMBER 18TH, AND WE'LL GET THE JANUARY MEETING ON
8 THE BOOKS. AND WITH THAT, MADAM CLERK -- WHAT?

9

10 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** I DON'T KNOW WHEN WE CAN -- FOR OTHER -- I
11 THINK OTHER IS UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT -- OTHER -- BECAUSE WE
12 HAVE A COMMENT THAT IS NOT ON THE AGENDA.

13

14 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** MADAM, THE FLOOR IS ALL YOURS.

15

16 **CAROLYN M. GONOT:** I WAS WONDERING. WE GET A LOT OF STATISTICS
17 AND DATA THAT IS COMING IN. I'M NOT TRYING TO POSTPONE LEAVING
18 THIS MEETING. BUT FOR WORK PLAN TWO THINGS CAME UP, WITH THE
19 INFORMATION WE JUST GOT AT THE LAST MEETING, NOTICE ON THE
20 WORK PLAN THERE IS DISCUSSION ABOUT CLIPPER FOR MAJOR EVENTS
21 ESPECIALLY WITH MAJOR SPORTS EVENTS, FIFA AND SUPERBOWL 2026
22 WE HAVE TO PREPARE FOR THAT PUT IN THE WORK NOW. THE OTHER
23 QUESTION, I SEE WE DON'T HAVE A WORK PLAN AND I DON'T KNOW
24 WHETHER OR NOT WE NEED A WORK PLAN OR NOT FOR THIS BOARD. AND
25 THE SECOND THING, I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO GET A REPORT -- AND I



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 DON'T KNOW WHO CAN DO THIS OR WHATEVER, BUT ON RESILIENCY
2 RIGHT NOW AND SUSTAINABILITY OF CLIPPER TWO, BECAUSE IT IS
3 TAKING A WHILE TO GET IT DONE ARE WE GOING TO BE DELIVERING
4 SOMETHING THAT'S -- YOU KNOW, WHAT MIGHT WE BE BEHIND ON OR
5 WHAT WE SHOULD BE AWARE OF IN TERMS OF STATE-OF-THE-ART, AND
6 AGENCIES, I KNOW WE DISCUSS, AND WE GET A LOT OF INFORMATION
7 BUT I WANT TO BE ABLE TO HAVE THAT DISCUSSION. YOU HAVE GUYS -
8 - I KNOW YOU SPEND A LOT OF TIME IN THE INDUSTRY, JUST WANT TO
9 BE AWARE AS PART OF CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD WHEN WE MIGHT NEED
10 TO BE DOING OVER THE NEXT YEAR SINCE WE'LL START THE NEW YEAR
11 NEXT YEAR.

12

13 **JASON WEINSTEIN:** AT THE ALLOWING YOU TO GO NEXT DOOR I'LL JUST
14 BRIEFLY SAY IN TERMS OF EVENTS AND THINGS THAT WE HAVE BUILT
15 IN ALONG WITH CONSTITUTIONAL PROGRAMMING PORTALS WE'LL HAVE AS
16 PART OF NEXGEN CLIPPER SO WE CAN CERTAINLY WORK WITH STAFF
17 ABOUT EVENTS AND ALSO COMING UP IN 2025 IS THE NBA ALL-STAR
18 GAME IN SAN FRANCISCO. SO IN TERMS OF RESILIENCE, CERTAINLY
19 WHAT WE'RE BUILDING IS SCALEABLE. AND IT IS PRETTY MODERN,
20 COMPARED TO WHAT WE'RE SEEING AROUND THE UNITED STATES AND THE
21 WORLD. SO, BUT WE CERTAINLY CAN UPDATE THE BOARD ON WHERE WE
22 STAND AS IT RELATES TO THAT.

23



NOVEMBER 27, 2023

1 **CHAIR, BOB POWERS:** GOOD. GOOD RESPONSE, JASON. THAT'S WHERE I
2 WAS HOPING WE WOULD GO, WE'LL GET THEM ON THE AGENDA. OKAY.
3 MADAM CLERK, WITH THAT, THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]
4



Broadcasting Government