

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



1 **BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY AND NETWORK**

2 **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE**

3 **FRIDAY, DECEMBER 13TH, 2024, 9:35 AM**

4

5

6 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I
7 WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE BAY AREA
8 INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCE AUTHORITY NETWORK AND OPERATIONS
9 COMMITTEE DECEMBER 13TH, 2024. I'M VICE CHAIR SITTING IN FOR A
10 VACANT CHAIR. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB
11 SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
12 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR
13 DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE
14 TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST
15 FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. A VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR
16 ALL ACTION ITEMS TODAY. SO, FIRST AGENDA ITEM IS ROLL CALL,
17 PLEASE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

24

25 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.



1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NON-VOTING MEMBER EL-TAWANSY? IS ABSENT.

3 COMMISSIONER NOACK?

4

5 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

8

9 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. WE'LL NOW MOVE

14 TO THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. I'M GOING TO LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUE

15 NEXT TO ME, COMMISSIONER AHN, TO LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE. [

16 PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE

17 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT

18 STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND

19 JUSTICE FOR ALL."

20

21 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. WILL THE CLERK

22 PLEASE READ THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING

25 THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP
2 TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
3 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
4 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

5

6 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GREAT. THANK YOU. WE'LL
7 MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR THIS IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR.
8 IS THERE ANYONE WHO HAS QUESTIONS OR WISHES TO PULL AN ITEM.
9 IF NOT, I WOULD ACCEPT A MOTION.

10

11 **SUE NOACK:** SO MOVED.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SECOND.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SECOND NOACK, SECOND
16 SPERING. ALL IN FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES] PASSES.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND
19 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE
20 BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** [LAUGHTER] OUR CLERK.
23 GREAT. AGENDA ITEM FIVE, THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. ON INTERSTATE
24 80, SOLANO EXPRESS LANES. AND, SO, BETH ZELINSKI, GOOD
25 MORNING.



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1

2 **BETH ZELINSKI:** GOOD MORNING. I'M BETH ZELINSKI WITH BAIFA
3 STAFF AND I'M GOING TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON THE SOLANO EXPRESS
4 LANES AND ALSO REQUEST AN ACTION TO APPROVE A CONTRACT WITH
5 CHB. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SHOWS AN OVERVIEW OF THE PROJECT SOLANO
6 80 EXPRESS LANE WILL INCLUDE CONVERTING AN HOV LANE IN THE
7 WEST SEGMENT AND ALSO ADDING A NEW LANE IN THE EAST SEGMENT
8 AND THIS IS EXPECTED TO SIGNIFICANTLY RELIEVE THE BOTTLENECK
9 IN THE EAST SEGMENT AND WE ANTICIPATE THAT THE EXPRESS LANE
10 WILL OPEN IN THE FALL OF 2025. AND I GUESS I WOULD NOTE THAT
11 THIS IS A JOINT PROJECT WITH BAIFA AND THE SOLANO
12 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, AND CALTRANS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.
13 SO, THE CIVIL CONSTRUCTION IS CURRENTLY WELL UNDERWAY AND WE
14 DO ANTICIPATE THAT THE NEW LANE IN THE EAST SEGMENT WILL OPEN
15 IN THE FIRST QUARTER -- OR BE COMPLETED IN THE FIRST QUARTER
16 OF 2025 AND THAT ALL OF THIS CIVIL ACTIVITIES WILL BE DELETED
17 IN THE SUMMER OF 2025. THE BAIFA TOLL SYSTEM INTEGRATOR HAS
18 STARTED THE INSTALLATION OF THEIR EQUIPMENT AND THEN THEY WILL
19 CONTINUE TO TEST THE NEW SYSTEM AFTER THE CIVIL WORK IS
20 COMPLETED. AND SINCE THE NEW LANE IN THE EAST SEGMENT WILL BE
21 COMPLETED, WE ARE PLANNING TO OPEN IT AS AN HOV LANE IN THE
22 INTERIM PERIOD UNTIL THE TOLL COLLECTION SYSTEM IS READY. AND
23 THE INTERIM HOV LANE WOULD OPERATE AS AN HOV2, SIMILAR TO THE
24 WEST SEGMENT AND IT WOULD HAVE THE SAME OPERATING HOURS. NEXT
25 SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, AS MENTIONED, A TOLLING IS SCHEDULED TO



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 BEGIN IN THE FALL OF 2025, AND WE WILL BE BRINGING A TOLL
2 ORDINANCE FOR APPROVAL WITH THE NEW POLICIES FOR THE
3 OPERATIONS, AND WE'RE PLANNING FOR THE HOURS OF OPERATION TO
4 BE WEEKDAYS 5:00 A.M. TO 8:00 P.M., WHICH IS THE SAME AS ALL
5 OF OUR OTHER EXPRESS LANES. AND WE'RE ALSO PROPOSING TO HAVE A
6 WEEKEND OPERATION ON SATURDAY AND SUNDAY, AND THIS WOULD BE
7 FOR A THREE-YEAR PILOT PERIOD. AS PART OF THE TOLL ORDINANCE,
8 WE'LL ALSO BE BRINGING THE OCCUPANCY POLICIES, WHICH WOULD BE
9 HOV3, IT'S THE FREE TRIP, AND HOV2 RECEIVES DISCOUNT TOLL IN
10 THE EXPRESS LANES THEN OF COURSE SOV'S WOULD BE PAYING FULL
11 FARE. SO, AS MENTIONED, WE HAVE BEEN DISCUSSING WITH OUR
12 PARTNERS THE PLAN FOR THE THREE YEAR WEEKEND TOLLING PILOT WE
13 ARE PROPOSING THIS ON SOLANO 80 WHEN IT OPENS WE DO THINK THAT
14 SINCE THIS IS A NEW FACILITY IT'S A GOOD OPPORTUNITY TO OPEN
15 THIS AT THE BEGINNING IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO SEE HOW WEEKEND
16 TOLLING WORKS AND DOING IT WHEN IT OPENS ALLEVIATES MAKING
17 CHANGES AT A LATER POINT SOLANO 80 IS ALSO GOOD A GOOD
18 CORRIDOR BECAUSE YOLO COUNTY IS ALSO PLANNING A TOLLING
19 PROJECT. AN EXPRESS LANE PROJECT AND THEY ARE ALSO LOOKING AT
20 A WEEKEND OPERATIONS SEVERAL YEARS FROM NOW SO WE HAVE BEEN
21 WORKING WITH CALTRANS TO DEVELOP AN AGREEMENT FOR THIS PILOT
22 AND THAT WOULD DEFINE MORE AS WELL AS EVALUATION CRITERIA THAT
23 WE WOULD USE TO EVALUATE THE PILOT AT THE END OF THE THREE
24 YEAR PERIOD AND DETERMINE WHETHER TO CONTINUE IT AS A
25 PERMANENT BASIS. NEXT SLIDE. AS MENTIONED, WE WILL BE BRINGING



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 A TOLL ORDINANCE AMENDMENT, AND THE TOLL ORDINANCE NEEDS TO
2 ADD SOLANO 80 AS A BAIFA TOLL CORRIDOR AND THIS WILL ALSO
3 INCLUDE AUTHORIZATION FOR A WEEKEND PILOT. THE PROCESS FOR THE
4 TOLL ORDINANCE AMENDMENT WILL BEGIN IN FEBRUARY AND THERE WILL
5 BE A PUBLIC INPUT AND COMMENT PERIOD IN MARCH AND APRIL. AND
6 THEN WE ANTICIPATE BRINGING IT TO THE FULL AUTHORITY FOR
7 ADOPTION IN MAY WITH EFFECTIVE DATE IN JUNE WELL BEFORE THE
8 PLAN START OF TOLLING. NEXT SLIDE. ALSO IN PREPARATION FOR THE
9 START OF TOLLING, WE NEED TO EXECUTE A NEW AGREEMENT WITH CHP
10 FOR THE ENFORCEMENT. AND CHP'S ENFORCEMENT, IT'S CRITICAL FOR
11 THE EFFECTIVE OPERATION OF THE EXPRESS LANE. THEY PERFORMED
12 THE OCCUPANCY ENFORCEMENT. AND SO, WE ARE REQUESTING THAT THE
13 COMMITTEE APPROVE A CONTRACT WITH CHP FOR A THREE-YEAR PERIOD
14 IN AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED 741,000 INITIALLY FOR A THREE YEAR
15 PERIOD AND THEN AFTER WILL BE TWO YEAR EXTENSIONS WHICH IS
16 SIMILAR TO THE CHP ENFORCEMENT CONTRACTS WE HAVE FOR 680 AND
17 880. NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS THE FINAL SLIDE JUST SHOWING, SORT
18 OF, THE TIMELINE OF THE UPCOMING ACTIONS BEGINNING WITH
19 TODAY'S REQUEST FOR A CONTRACT APPROVAL WITH CHP. AND THEN,
20 AGAIN, IN THE FEBRUARY TO MAY TIME PERIOD IS THE TOLL
21 ORDINANCE PROCESS. IN JUNE, WE ALSO ANTICIPATE WE WILL HAVE
22 SOME OTHER OPERATING CONTRACTS THAT WE WILL NEED TO APPROVE,
23 PRIMARILY TO SUPPORT THE WEEKEND TOLLING OPERATIONS. IN JULY
24 AND AUGUST, WE ANTICIPATE THE ROBUST PUBLIC OUTREACH IN
25 PREPARATION FOR THE START OF TOLLING IN FALL 2025. AND THE



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 START OF TOLLING WILL ALSO INCLUDE THE START OF THE WEEKEND
2 HIGHLIGHT. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION AND I WOULD BE HAPPY
3 TO ANSWER QUESTIONS THAT YOU HAVE.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU, BETH. QUESTIONS
6 FROM COMMISSIONERS? PLEASE, COMMISSIONER SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF ON
9 THE WEEKEND TOLLING. AND I WANT TO THANK YOU PERSONALLY YOU
10 AND I HAVE BEEN TALKING ABOUT THIS FOR TEN YEARS NOW. I REALLY
11 APPRECIATE AS I LEAVE THIS COMMISSION IT'S ONE OF THE THINGS I
12 HAVE BEEN ASKING FOR FOR A LONG TIME. SO THAT'S GREAT. ON THE
13 CHP ENFORCEMENT ARE THERE ANY NEW TECHNIQUES ARE THEY DOING
14 ANYTHING DIFFERENT THAN THE CHALLENGES THEY HAVE HAD UP TO
15 THIS POINT ON ENFORCEMENT.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** CHELSEA GAMULO, I APOLOGIZE, I'M NOT THERE IN-PERSON
18 BUT HAPPY TO ADDRESS YOUR QUESTION WE ARE WORKING WITH CHP
19 SOLANO AREA TO FIND STRATEGIES FOR THE CORRIDOR OFFICERS
20 PATROL THESE LANES DAILY SO THEIR EXPERTISE WILL HELP US
21 DEVELOP THE APPROACH FOR THE CORRIDOR.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING:** A LOT OF THE CARS NOW HAVE TINTING ON THEIR
24 WINDOWS SO YOU CAN'T SEE THEM ANYMORE. IS THAT LEGAL? IS THAT
25 SOMETHING CHP IS TRYING TO ADDRESS?



1

2 **SPEAKER:** THAT'S A GREAT QUESTION. HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP WITH CHP
3 TO FIND OUT HOW THEY'RE ADDRESSING THAT ISSUE, I KNOW IT'S A
4 PROBLEM HOWEVER SURE THEY'RE SPECIFICALLY ADDRESSING THAT
5 ISSUE HAPPY TO GET BACK WITH YOU ON THAT.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WE OUGHT TO GET A LOT OF THIS, THE WINDOWS
8 TINTING, THIS HAS BEEN A PROJECT THAT SOLANO COUNTY HAS BEEN
9 WORKING ON FOR A LONG TIME APPRECIATE, YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE
10 PROBLEMS WITH THE WEEKENDS BECAUSE THE TRAFFIC GOING UP TO
11 TAHOE AND STUFF EVERY WEEKEND, THAT PORTION OF 80 JUST SO
12 CONGESTED WITH PEOPLE COMING OUT OF THE BAY AREA AND IT
13 DIVERTS SO MUCH TRAFFIC ON OUR LOCAL STREETS AND ROADS SO THIS
14 IS REALLY GREAT WORK ON THIS PROJECT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** SUE?

17

18 **SUE NOACK:** I DRIVE THAT WAY TOO OFTEN AND I'M LOOKING FORWARD
19 TO HAVING THESE AS WELL. CAN YOU ANSWER A QUESTION ON THE
20 EFFECTIVENESS OF THE CHP ENFORCEMENT PROCESS? HOW MUCH MONEY
21 DO WE BRING IN FROM FINES FROM CHP VERSUS CONTRACT? I'M NOT
22 SAYING THEY'RE NOT EFFECTIVE AND I KNOW HOW DIFFICULT IT IS TO
23 DO, I'M JUST TRYING TO UNDERSTAND FROM A COST PERSPECTIVE
24 EFFECTIVENESS OF IT.

25



1 **LISA KLEIN:** LISA KLEIN DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FOR MOBILITY,
2 BECAUSE OF THE WAY THINGS ARE SET UP IN THE STATE, STATE LAW
3 AND ADMINISTRATIVE RECORD, THE MONEYS FROM THE CHP CITATIONS
4 FLOW BACK TO THE COURT SYSTEMS IN EACH COUNTY. BAIFA DOES NOT
5 GET ANY OF THE REVENUE FROM THOSE FINES. NOW THAT SAID, THE
6 CHP ENFORCEMENT -- WE DON'T LOOK AT CHP ENFORCEMENT AS A COST
7 RECOVERY MECHANISM IN THAT WAY. THE CHP ENFORCEMENT THOUGH NOT
8 PERFECT, IN FACT OUR NEXT ITEM IS ON STRATEGIES TO KIND OF
9 IMPROVE ENFORCEMENT, OCCUPANCY ENFORCEMENT AND WE'LL TALK
10 ABOUT HOW WE'RE EXPLORING TECHNOLOGY -- SO, WHILE THE CHP
11 ENFORCEMENT IS NOT PERFECT, IT IS THE BEST TOOL WE HAVE
12 AVAILABLE, RIGHT NOW, THAT WE CAN DEPLOY. AND IT IS -- IT IS
13 VERY IMPORTANT. THEIR PRESENCE OUT THERE IS A DETERRENCE. WE
14 KNOW WHEN THEY'RE VISIBLE, WE KNOW FROM COUNTS WHEN THEY'RE
15 VISIBLE AND OUT THERE, THE RATES DROP TO SOME DEGREE. AND WE
16 KNOW IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE THEM OUT THERE, BECAUSE AS THERE
17 IS MORE AND MORE CHEATING, WHAT THAT DOES IS DRIVES THE TOLL
18 PRICE UP BECAUSE THE LANES GET MORE CROWDED. AND, SO, YOU
19 KNOW, AGAIN, WHILE WE ARE -- THIS NOTION OF OCCUPANCY CHEATING
20 IS REALLY A NATIONAL PROBLEM, AND THERE REALLY IS NOT AN IDEAL
21 SOLUTION YET, THAT WE CONTINUE TO WORK ON IT. WE DO FEEL WE
22 HAVE REVIEWED THIS MULTIPLE TIMES OVER THE YEARS, WE DO FEEL
23 THE INVESTMENT IN THE CHP IS WORTHWHILE. IT'S WORTHWHILE NOW
24 AS WE CONTINUE TO EXPLORE NEW TECHNOLOGIES THAT ENHANCE
25 TECHNIQUES.



1

2 **SUE NOACK:** DO WE GET NUMBERS OF CITATIONS JUST SO WE
3 UNDERSTAND -- WE MAY NOT GET THE DOLLARS BUT AT LEAST KNOW THE
4 EFFECTIVENESS?

5

6 **LISA KLEIN:** WE REPORT THOSE QUARTERLY FULL EXPRESS LANES
7 OPERATIONS REPORT HAPPY TO SEND THAT OUT WE DUE FOR A REPORT
8 NEXT MEETING BUT I WOULD BE HAPPY TO RESEND THAT PART OF THE
9 LAST REPORT.

10

11 **SUE NOACK:** OKAY THANK YOU.

12

13 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** CHAIR ALONG THE SAME LINES I GET THE
14 INVESTMENT THAT WE HAVE TO MAKE WITH CHP BUT I WOULD BE
15 INTERESTED TO LOOK AT TOTALITY OF WHAT WE INTEND ON
16 ENFORCEMENT FOR THE WHOLE NETWORK I UNDERSTAND BECAUSE I THINK
17 \$7 MILLION IS GET WE MUST DO THIS WE NEED IT TO BE DONE WHILE
18 I THINK LOOKING AT SPENDING ON ENFORCEMENT OPTIONS MIGHT BE
19 FROM COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS CONTRACTING WITH CHP WHILE REQUIRED
20 IT SEEMS ARCHAIC, RIGHT? TO LIVE IN CALIFORNIA IN THE 21st
21 CENTURY WITH TECHNOLOGY AND MAYBE INVESTING IN A DIFFERENT
22 SERVICE HELPS.

23



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** IN A PERFECT TIE UP FOR
2 LATER AGENDA ITEM WE'LL BE HEARING TOO. ALL RIGHT. FURTHER
3 QUESTIONS? PUBLIC COMMENT?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
6 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
7 AND NO MEMBERS IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
10 WE'LL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND BRING IT BACK TO THE BOARD ON
11 THE MOTION BEFORE US IS TO APPROVE THE EXPRESS LANE
12 ENFORCEMENT CONTRACT WITH THE HIGHWAY PATROL FOR AN AMOUNT OF
13 \$7,140,000. IS THERE A MOTION?

14

15 **SUE NOACK:** SECOND.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** OKAY MOVED BY SPERING.
18 SECOND NOACK. ALL IN FAVOR? AYE. [AYES] VERY GOOD. OPPOSITION?
19 THANK YOU VERY MUCH IT CARRIES. THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT. NEXT
20 ITEM INTERSTATE 80 EXPRESS CARPOOL, SMART PHONE APP PILOT
21 UPDATE. THERE WE GO. TECHNOLOGY, CHAIR PEDROZA. ALL RIGHT. I
22 WANT TO WELCOME SARAH BURNWORTH TO THE PODIUM.

23

24 **LISA KLEIN:** IF I MIGHT, THROUGH THE CHAIR? THIS IS LISA KLEIN,
25 DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FROM MOBILITY. I WOULD LIKE TO SAY A



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 FEW WORDS OF INTRODUCTION ESPECIALLY GIVEN WHERE WE JUST WERE
2 WITH THE PRIOR ITEM, EXPRESS LANES EXPERIENCE A HIGH RATE OF
3 VIOLATION, IN FACT WE DID CITE THIS STATISTIC IN OUR LAST
4 DIALOGUE BUT WE CAN ESTIMATE THAT ON AVERAGE 30% VEHICLES OF
5 PERHAPS NOT DECLARING THAT I OCCUPANCY ACCURATELY. AND SO
6 THIS, AS I SAID, THIS REALLY IS A CHALLENGE ACROSS THE
7 COUNTRY, AND ENFORCEMENT, THEREFORE, IS IMPORTANT. SO, IT'S
8 LONG BEEN THE CASE THERE, IS A LONG HISTORY OF COMMISSIONERS
9 BEING REALLY INTERESTED AND ENCOURAGING STAFF TO LOOK AT NEW
10 TOOLS AND NEW TECHNOLOGIES. AND WE HAVE BEEN ACTIVELY DOING
11 THAT WITH A COUPLE OF PILOT PROJECTS, AND, ALSO, FOLLOWING THE
12 NATIONAL DEVELOPMENTS IN THIS AREA SO WE CAN LEARN FROM WHAT
13 OTHERS ARE DOING. IT IS CERTAINLY AN EVOLVING SPACE. HOWEVER,
14 THERE REALLY ARE TWO PREDOMINANT TECHNOLOGY APPROACHES, AND WE
15 HAVE TESTED BOTH OF THEM [LAUGHTER] HERE IN THE BAY AREA. ONE
16 OF THEM IS AN APPROACH THAT DEPLOYS CAMERAS ALONG THE ROADSIDE
17 AND TAKES PHOTOS OF VEHICLES AND THE TINTED WINDOWS IS JUST
18 ONE OF THE CHALLENGES -- [LAUGHTER] -- FOR THAT TECHNOLOGY AND
19 THERE IS OTHERS. AND WE ACTUALLY DID A ROADSIDE CAMERA BASED
20 PILOT FIRST ON INTERSTATE 880 CORRIDOR. AND THEN WE ACTUALLY
21 CONSIDERED DEPLOYING THAT AT THE BAY BRIDGE AS A SECONDARY
22 PILOT. WE DISCONTINUED THAT EFFORT IN 2022. THERE WERE
23 CONCERNS ABOUT THE INFRASTRUCTURE COST OF DEPLOYING THOSE
24 CAMERAS THROUGH THE A NETWORK, AND THE SCALEABILITY. AND THERE
25 ARE ALSO SERIOUS ISSUES AND THINGS TO REALLY WORK OUT AND



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 THINK THROUGH IN TERMS OF PRIVACY AND INTEGRATION WITH THE
2 FASTRAK VIOLATION PROCESS. HOWEVER, THAT CAMERA TECHNOLOGY IS
3 BEING TESTED IN SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. IN FITS AND STARTS. IT
4 HASN'T BEEN EXACTLY SMOOTH GOING THERE. BUT THEY ARE MAKING
5 THEIR WAY TO TEST IT. WHAT SARA IS GOING TO TALK ABOUT TODAY
6 IS THE TECHNOLOGY BASED ON A SMART PHONE AP. AND WE COMPLETED
7 THE PHASE ONE OF THAT PILOT EARLIER THIS YEAR USING A PRODUCT
8 BY A COMPANY CALLED "RIDE FLAG" AND THIS ALLOWS USERS TO SELF-
9 VERIFY THEIR CARPOOL STATUTES USING THEIR PHONES. AS SUCH IT
10 REALLY HAS MUCH, MUCH LOWER INFRASTRUCTURE COST, AND SO THAT'S
11 ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WAS REALLY INTRIGUING TO US ABOUT IT.
12 ON THIS AP BASED TECHNOLOGY, OR THIS AP BASED TECHNOLOGY IS
13 ACTUALLY USED IN ATLANTA IT'S BEING LOOKED AT FOR
14 IMPLEMENTATION IN COLORADO AND TESTED IN SALT LAKE CITY, AND
15 IN THE DALLAS AREA THEY'RE TESTING ALTERNATIVE AP BASED
16 TECHNOLOGY, NOT THE SAME VENDOR. THIS IS ONE THAT ALSO SEEMS
17 TO HAVE NATIONAL INTEREST. SARA IS GOING TO PRESENT TODAY THE
18 RESULTS OF OUR PILOT, THAT ARE QUITE PROMISING. HOWEVER I WANT
19 TO CAUTION EVERYONE, JUST TO ACKNOWLEDGE MOVING TO A SMART
20 PHONE APP IS AT SCALE REALLY A MAJOR CHANGE TO THE WAY WE
21 CURRENTLY DO BUSINESS AND AS SUCH WE KNOW THERE WOULD BE
22 SIGNIFICANT INSTITUTIONAL REGULATORY AND CUSTOMER
23 CONSIDERATIONS, THAT SARA WILL TALK ABOUT, WE HAD APPROACHED
24 THIS APP THINKING OF IT AS A PHASED PILOT, PHASE ONE PILOT
25 LOOKED AT TECHNOLOGY ITSELF AND USER ACCEPTANCE WAS A SUCCESS



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 I WOULD SAY AND NEXT STEP WOULD REALLY BE TO THINK THROUGH
2 WHAT A NEXT PHASE MIGHT LOOK LIKE, WHICH QUESTIONS WE MIGHT BE
3 ABLE TO ANSWER SOONER RATHER THAN LATER THROUGH NEXT PHASE
4 PILOT AND WHAT MIGHT TAKE A LITTLE LONGER TO UNDERSTAND. WITH
5 THAT I'M GOING TO PASS THE MICROPHONE OVER TO SARAH.

6

7 **SARAH BURNWORTH:** THANK YOU, LISA. AND GOOD MORNING, CHAIR
8 MOULTON-PETERS AND COMMISSIONERS. I'M SARAH BURNWORTH, BAIFA
9 STAFF HERE TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE EXPRESS CARPOOL PILOT.
10 NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. CARPOOL VIOLATIONS ARE GROWING ACROSS
11 THE COUNTRY, AND OPERATORS ARE LOOKING TO ADDRESS THE ISSUE WE
12 HAVE BEEN TESTING A SMART PHONE APP THAT VERIFIES CARPOOLS AND
13 PILOT ON INTERSTATE 680 EXPRESS LANES EARLIER THIS YEAR
14 PURPOSE OF THE PILOT IS TO SEE IF THE APP TECHNOLOGY WORKS AND
15 EXPLORE POTENTIAL DEPLOYMENT TO ADDRESS CARPOOL VIOLATIONS IN
16 BAY AREA EXPRESS LANES WE HAVE ESTABLISHED A RECRUITMENT GOAL
17 OF 30% OF PARTICIPANTS FROM EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. NEXT
18 SLIDE. THE APP WE PILOTED IS PROVIDED BY RIDE FLAG AND THE APP
19 WORKS BY USING A SMART PHONE CAMERA TO VERIFY THE NUMBER OF
20 REAL HUMANS IN A VEHICLE THESE ARE THE STEPS A USER TAKES TO
21 VERIFY THEIR CARPOOL THE LEFT SCREEN SHOWS VERIFICATION
22 PROCESS BEFORE DRIVING AFTER CLICKING START CARPOOL BUTTON AT
23 BOTTOM OF THE SCREEN THE CAMERA OPENS AND IS USED TO DETERMINE
24 THE NUMBER OF REAL FACES AND PROXIMATE GEOMETRY OR OUTLINE
25 THIS STEP USES THE PHONE'S OPTICAL SENSOR BUT NO IMAGES ARE



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 CAPTURED AS PART OF THIS PROCESS THE SECOND SCREEN USER IS
2 VERIFIES AND TRIP WITH APP RUNNING IN THE BACKGROUND THERE ARE
3 NO ACTIONS REQUIRED DURING THE TRIP THE APP FEATURES CANNOT BE
4 ACCESSED FOR VEHICLES IN MOTION THE THIRD SCREEN USER IS
5 PROMPTED TO REVERIFY CARPOOL WHEN VEHICLE IS PARKED AFTER
6 CLICKING ON RED CARPOOL BUTTON THE CAMERA OPENS AND VERIFIES
7 OCCUPANTS. WE DID TEST TWO VERSIONS OF THE APP USING GEOMETRY
8 TO CONFIRM PROBABILITY AND THE SAME PEOPLE WERE PRESENT AT THE
9 BEGINNING AND END OF THE TRIP THE SECOND VERSION COUNTS THE
10 NUMBER OF PEOPLE BUT DOESN'T CHECK TO SEE IF THEY ARE LIKELY
11 THE SAME PEOPLE ON THE LAST SCREEN THE CARPOOL CREDIT IS
12 GRANTED AND FACIAL GEOMETRY INFORMATION IS ERASED AND CARPOOL
13 CREDIT REFER TO THE PILOT INCENTIVE WHICH IS AN AMAZON GIFT
14 CARD. THE PILOT INCLUDED 100 ACTIVE PARTICIPANTS COMPLETED
15 2000 TRIPS ON THE INTERSTATE 680 CONTRA COSTA EXPRESS LANES
16 AND COMPLETED 1,000 SURVEYS EXCEEDED OUR TARGET FOR
17 PARTICIPATION FROM EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES 80% OF PILOT
18 PARTICIPANTS WERE FROM EQUITY PRIORITY GROUPS. WE FOUND THE
19 APP IS ACCURATE THERE WERE NO REPORTED CASES OF SUCCESSFUL
20 CHEATING WE TESTED A BABY DOLL WHICH DID NOT FELLOW THE APP
21 AND A MAJORITY OF PARTICIPANTS HAD AN OVERALL POSITIVE
22 EXPERIENCE WITH THE APP AS WELL. THESE ARE OUR TARGET METRICS
23 AND PILOT RESULTS. ON THE TOP PORTION OF THE TABLE FOR
24 ACCURACY RESULTS ARE BASED ON TESTING OF THE DIFFERENT
25 SCENARIOS AND UNDER DIFFERENT CONDITIONS SO WE FOUND THE APP



1 WAS ACCURATE IN DETECTING OCCUPANTS AND WE MET OUR 99%
2 DETECTION ACCURACY TARGET. ON THE BOTTOM PORTION OF THE TABLE,
3 THE USER EXPERIENCE AND APP SATISFACTION METRICS WERE MEASURED
4 VIA PARTICIPANT SURVEY RESPONSES AND ONLY POSITIVE OR VERY
5 POSITIVE RESPONSES ARE COUNTED HERE. SO, 87% REPORTED THAT THE
6 APP WAS VERY EASY OR EASY TO USE. 91% REPORTED OVERALL
7 SATISFACTION WITH THE APP AND 80% RESPONDED POSITIVELY
8 REGARDING PRIVACY WHEN ASKED ABOUT THE USE OF THE TECHNOLOGY
9 TO VERIFY CARPOOLS AND TYPE OF INFORMATION THAT WAS COLLECTED
10 TO SIGN UP WHICH WAS SIMILAR TO THE INFORMATION COLLECTED WHEN
11 OPENING A FASTRAK ACCOUNT. NEXT SLIDE. IN ADDITION TO THE
12 INTERNAL TESTING AND SURVEYS WE INVITED USERS TO PARTICIPATE
13 IN FOCUS GROUPS, 70% OF FOCUS GROUP PARTICIPANTS WERE PEOPLE
14 OF COLOR AND PARTICIPANTS FELT THAT THE APP WAS EASY TO USE
15 OVERALL AND A FAIRWAY TO VERIFY CARPOOLS. NEXT SLIDE. SO,
16 OVERALL, RESULTS FROM THE INITIAL PILOT ARE PROMISING. THESE
17 ARE SOME OF THE POTENTIAL OPPORTUNITIES THAT THIS TECHNOLOGY
18 MIGHT ALLOW FOR AT SCALE. SO THIS TECHNOLOGY COULD ALLOW FOR A
19 TRANSITION TO AN ELIGIBILITY VERIFICATION APPROACH INSTEAD OF
20 A VIOLATION BASED APPROACH. IT'S AN AUTOMATED SYSTEM THAT
21 COULD REDUCE THE FIELD ENFORCEMENT NEED. THERE IS POTENTIAL TO
22 IMPROVE EXPRESS LANE PERFORMANCE AND REDUCE REVENUE LOSS DUE
23 TO OCCUPANCY VIOLATIONS AND THERE COULD BE THE POSSIBILITY TO
24 PHASE OUT ON THE SWITCHABLE TOLL TAG. AND THE APP COULD BE
25 USED AS A TOOL TO INCENTIVIZE CARPOOLING. NEXT SLIDE. ON THE



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 OTHER HAND, IMPLEMENTATION OF THIS TECHNOLOGY, AS LISA
2 MENTIONED WOULD REPRESENT A MAJOR CHANGE TO THE WAY WE DO
3 BUSINESS THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT INSTITUTIONAL REGULATORY AND
4 CUSTOMER CONSIDERATIONS. FULL DEPLOYMENT WOULD REQUIRE
5 REGIONAL CONSENSUS BOTH FOR EXPRESS LANES AND BRIDGES AND A
6 NUMBER OF PROCUREMENTS AND AGREEMENTS WOULD BE REQUIRED AS
7 WELL. WE HAVE BUILT EXTENSIVE SYSTEMS INCLUDING FASTRAK FLEX
8 SWITCHABLE TOLL TAGS THAT PEOPLE CURRENTLY USE TO DECLARE
9 THEIR CARPOOL STATUS, AND THOSE SERVE MILLIONS OF CUSTOMERS
10 EACH YEAR AND SWITCHABLE TAGS ARE USED ELSEWHERE IN CALIFORNIA
11 SO WOULD NEED TO ASSESS AND DEVELOP POLICIES FOR PRIVATE
12 EQUITY AND ACCESSIBILITY AND IMPLEMENTING THIS TECHNOLOGY MAY
13 REQUIRE LEGISLATION TO SUPPORT AN APP-BASED VERIFICATION. NEXT
14 SLIDE. WE HAVE COMPLETED THE INITIAL PHASE PILOT TO TEST THE
15 TECHNOLOGY AND GET FEEDBACK FROM USERS AND EQUITY PRIORITY
16 COMMUNITIES WE ARE EXPLORING THIS FURTHER TO SEE WHAT'S
17 POSSIBLE AT SCALE AND EVALUATING CONSIDERATIONS TO INFORM
18 DEVELOPMENT OF PHASE TWO PILOT. TESTING OF THE SMART PHONE APP
19 WAS PLANNED AS A PHASED PILOT AND STAFF INTEND TO DEVELOP
20 RECOMMENDATIONS BY THE NEXT PHASE MID-2025.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU, SARAH. AND
23 APOLOGIES TO DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR LISA FOR OVERLOOKING
24 YOU WERE INTRODUCING THE ITEM FIRST. ANYWAY QUESTIONS OR
25 COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS? CANEPA?



1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** TECHNOLOGY IS INTERESTING, AND I THINK IT'S
3 NEEDED, OBVIOUSLY THE 30% RATE. HAVE WE HAVE WE DONE
4 FORECASTING IN TERMS OF REVENUE BACK TO THE AGENCY IF WE'RE
5 ABLE TO IMPLEMENT THIS?

6

7 **SARAH BURNWORTH:** THIS'S SOMETHING WE WOULD LIKE TO GET A
8 BETTER UNDERSTANDING OF AS WE DEVELOP NEXT STEPS. THERE'S
9 AVERAGE 30% OR MORE THAT ARE MISSED DECLARING THAT I OCCUPANCY
10 SOME WHO ARE PAYING MIGHT BE ELIGIBLE FOR A CARPOOL DISCOUNT
11 AS WELL SOMETHING WE'RE LOOKING AT FOR SURE.

12

13 **DAVID CANEPA:** IN TERMS OF IMPLEMENTING THE TECHNOLOGY IS THERE
14 ANY WAY TO CONNECT THE APP TO THE ACTUAL TOLLING PIECE? IN
15 TERMS OF, LIKE, WHAT I'M BASICALLY TRYING TO SAY IS, YOU KNOW,
16 FOR THE USER YOU WANT EVERYTHING TO BE SEAMLESS. IS THERE ANY
17 THOUGHT TO USE THE TECHNOLOGY IN TERMS OF MAYBE SEEING HOW
18 THAT INTERFACES WITH THE TOLLS? DOES THAT MAKE SENSE?

19

20 **SPEAKER:** WE'RE LOOKING AT TESTING INTEGRATION WITH THE TOLL
21 SYSTEM IN ORDER FOR THE APP TO WORK WITH THE TOLL SYSTEM IN
22 THE BACK OFFICE AND THERE COULD BE OTHER OPPORTUNITIES WITH
23 THE TECHNOLOGY BUT WE HAVEN'T EXPLORED THOSE IN DETAIL.

24



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** GOT IT. IN TERMS OF [INDISCERNIBLE] OR ANYTHING
2 LIKE THAT, ARE YOU CONSIDERING IN TERMS OF DOES THAT
3 TECHNOLOGY ALREADY EXIST IN TERMS OF PEOPLE ARE ENGAGED AND,
4 SORT OF, UNDERSTAND WHAT'S GOING ON JUST CURIOUS IF ANYTHING
5 OUTSIDE OF JUST THE TECHNOLOGY YOU SEE WHO IS WHO?

6

7 **SPEAKER:** CERTAINLY POSSIBLE TO NOT BELIEVE SOMETHING LIKE
8 THAT, WE KNOW THOSE WHO ARE VERIFIED CARPOOLS THERE WOULD BE
9 OPPORTUNITY TO IMPLEMENT GAMIFICATION OR INCENTIVES SOMETHING
10 ALONG THOSE LINES.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK
13 YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE REPORT. WE'LL MOVE TO NUMBER SEVEN.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PUBLIC COMMENT.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** LET'S GO TO PUBLIC
18 COMMENT.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** A WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS.

21

22 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GOOD MORNING ADINA.

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE MTC POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
25 AND ON THIS I'M SPEAKING FOR MYSELF, AND THE USE OF THE APP IS



1 INTRIGUING IN TERMS OF ADDRESSING THE HIGH LEVEL OF NON-
2 COMPLIANCE IN THE TOLL LANES AND GLAD TO SEE THERE WAS A
3 REALLY HIGH PERCENTAGE OF PEOPLE IN EQUITY PRIORITY
4 COMMUNITIES PARTICIPATING IN THE PILOT. THERE IS A LOT OF
5 REALLY, YOU KNOW, UNDERSTANDABLE CONCERNS THAT ARE RAISED, I'M
6 GLAD ABOUT WHO IS PARTICIPATING AND PROVIDING FEEDBACK. ONE
7 CONCERN I WOULD LIKE TO RAISE AS AN INDIVIDUAL IS ESPECIALLY
8 IN DEALING WITH APPS AND THIRD PARTY VENDORS. I HEARD PRIVACY
9 MENTIONED, AND THAT IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT, AND ALL THE MORE
10 SO IMPORTANT, NOW-A-DAYS WHEN THERE ARE, FOR EXAMPLE, TYPES OF
11 MEDICAL CARE THAT ARE LEGAL AND SUPPORTED IN CALIFORNIA THAT
12 ARE, YOU KNOW, AT RISK OR NOT LEGAL ELSEWHERE IN THE COUNTRY.
13 AND I DON'T THINK THAT WE WANT TO HAVE PEOPLE DRIVING EACH
14 OTHER FOR MEDICAL CARE THAT IS ACCEPTED IN CALIFORNIA TO BE --
15 TO HAVE THAT INFORMATION FROM A THIRD PARTY, YOU KNOW, USED
16 FOR PURPOSES, YOU KNOW, NOT IN LINE WITH WHAT WE WANT TO SEE
17 IN CALIFORNIA, FOR EXAMPLE. SO, THE PRIVACY IS IMPORTANT, IN
18 ANY EVENT, AND, SORT OF, ALL THE MORE IMPORTANT NOW-A-DAYS.
19 THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND THEN WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
22 ONLINE. VINAY PIMPLE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. AND WHEN
23 YOU HAVE 15 SECONDS LEFT, I'LL SAY 15.

24



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 **VINAY PIMPLE:** THANK YOU. I ALSO SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY
2 COUNCIL, AND IN FACT WE DID HAVE A VERY DETAILED PRESENTATION
3 OF THIS SOFTWARE, AND AS A FORMER SOFTWARE ENGINEER, I THOUGHT
4 THE DESIGN OF THIS SOFTWARE WAS VERY THOUGHTFUL. SO, ONE OF
5 THE THINGS, I DO THINK THAT IT'S BETTER TO HAVE THE VERSION OF
6 THE SOFTWARE THAT ACTUALLY CHECKS THE FACES, YOU KNOW, AND
7 THEY DON'T ACTUALLY TAKE A PICTURE. THEY JUST TAKE IT AT
8 ANGLES AND NOTE OF THOSE ANGLES, BUT THE PREVENT THE KIND OF
9 CHEATING WHERE YOU HAVE YOUR PARTNER SIT IN THE CAR, GET TO
10 WORK, GET COWORKER TO SHOW UP AT THE SAME TIME TO SIT IN THE
11 CAR THEN BOTH YOU AND YOUR COWORKER CAN CHEAT, SO WE DON'T
12 WANT THOSE KIND OF THINGS SO I DON'T THINK TAKING THE FACIAL
13 ANGLE IS IMPORTANT. THE OTHER THING I'M REALLY EXCITED ABOUT
14 THIS, MAYBE WE COULD OPT IN FURTHER DOWN THE ROAD ON
15 FACILITATE MORE CARPOOLING BECAUSE PEOPLE COULD FIND OUT THE
16 PEOPLE IN THAT AREA ARE GOING TO THE SAME PLACE AND THEY COULD
17 JUST DO CARPOOLING. I THINK IS A GREAT THING. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU VINAY. THERE ARE NO OTHER
20 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM IN THE
21 BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM AND THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
22 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM.

23



DECEMBER 13, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. WE'LL TAKE
2 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT ITEM NUMBER SEVEN IS THERE ANYONE WHO
3 WISHES TO ADDRESS THE COMMISSION ON OTHER BUSINESS.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
6 ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON
7 THIS ITEM.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. BRINGS US TO
10 ITEM EIGHT ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE BAY AREA
11 INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCE AUTHORITY NETWORK AND OPERATIONS
12 COMMITTEE WILL BE HELD FRIDAY JANUARY 10TH, AT 9:35 A.M. AT
13 THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER HERE AT 375 BEALE STREET IN SAN
14 FRANCISCO. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO
15 THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU. WE'RE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

16



NTT

Broadcasting Government