

An aerial photograph of a city street grid, viewed from a high angle. The streets form a complex network of lines across the frame. The entire image is overlaid with a semi-transparent blue filter, giving it a monochromatic appearance. The text is positioned in the lower right quadrant of the image.

# **ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS**

## **Meeting Transcript**



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1     **JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE AND ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE**

2                     **FRIDAY, DECEMBER 8<sup>TH</sup>, 2023, 9:40 AM**

3

4     **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I WOULD  
5     LIKE TO CALL THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG  
6     ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE TO ORDER. I WOULD LIKE TO, LET'S SEE,  
7     THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC AND ABAG WEB SITES.  
8     COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING VIA ZOOM  
9     WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL  
10    STAR NINE AND I OR MARTHA WILL CALL UPON THEM. TELECONFERENCE  
11    ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR  
12    PHONE NUMBER. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN ON ALL ACTION  
13    ITEMS DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE MEMBER PARTICIPATING TODAY.  
14    JESSE YOU'RE HERE. JESS, WHAT I'LL DO IS --

15

16    **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** YES, I'M HERE.

17

18    **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** GOOD MORNING, JESSE. I'LL TAKE  
19    THE MTC CONSENT CALENDAR AND ROLL CALL FIRST, AND THEN I'LL  
20    TURN IT OVER TO JESS, MAYOR ARREGUIN, AND HE'LL GO AHEAD AND  
21    DO THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE ROLL CALL.

22

23    **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** THANK YOU.

24

25    **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** WITH THAT TAKE THE ROLL PLEASE.



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN, MTC:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

15

16 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

19

20 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON PETERS?

23

24 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

25



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

2

3 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

6

7 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** THANK YOU. FIRST ITEM IS MTC

12 PLANNING. I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION AND A SECOND IF THERE IS NO

13 COMMENTS BY COMMITTEE MEMBERS?

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES THE ITEM.

16

17 **DAVID RABBITT:** RABBITT SECONDS.

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** MARTHA IS THERE ANY PUBLIC

20 COMMENT?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR

23 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT

24 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR

25 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OKAY. WITH THAT, WE'LL GO AHEAD  
3 AND TAKE THE ROLL CALL PLEASE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR SPERING?

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN, MTC:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

14

15 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

18

19 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MOULTON PETERS?

22

23 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** UNANIMOUS.

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OKAY THANK YOU. I'LL TURN IT

11 OVER TO MAYOR ARREGUIN. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, AS MTC

12 COMMISSIONERS KNOW, STARTING IN JANUARY, I'M HANDING THE ABAG

13 PRESIDENCY OVER TO SUPERVISOR BELIA RAMOS. SO, FOR THE LAST

14 TIME, I'LL NOW CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE ABAG

15 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE AND ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL TO

16 CONFIRM WHETHER A QUORUM IS PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, SIR. MAYOR ARREGUIN?

19

20 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER ECKLUND?

23

24 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

25



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR LEE?

2

3 **OTTO LEE:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

6

7 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG:** HERE THIRD STREET.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO?

14

15 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAYOR SILVA?

18

19 **CINDY SILVA:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND MAYOR SILVA IS AT A TELECONFERENCE

22 LOCATION. QUORUM IS PRESENT OF ABAG ADMIN COMMITTEE.

23

24 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** I'M AT MY TELECONFERENCE

25 LOCATION, BERKELEY CITY HALL, BERKELEY.



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'M, ALSO, AT MY REMOTE LOCATION WHICH IS AT THE  
3 HAMILTON COMMUNITY CENTER.

4

5 **OTTO LEE:** ALSO REMOTE ATTENDANCE HERE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY,  
6 SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA.

7

8 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE  
9 HAVE A QUORUM PRESENT. WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM FIVE, THE ABAG  
10 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. I'LL ASK THE CLERK OF THE BOARD TO  
11 PLEASE GIVE THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE  
14 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG BOARD IN  
15 ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN  
16 AMOUNT OF \$150 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH  
17 EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** THANK YOU. WE'LL NODE NOW TO ITEM  
20 SIX THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE CONSENT CALENDAR. ONE  
21 ITEM 6A APPROVAL OF THE NOVEMBER MINUTES.

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** MOVE APPROVAL.

24

25 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I'LL SECOND.



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** MOTION BY ECKLUND SECOND BY  
3 ROMERO. MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE ITEM 6A. MINUTES. IS  
4 THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? WERE THERE ANY WRITTEN  
5 COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM?

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR  
8 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT  
9 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR  
10 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

11

12 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** OKAY. UNLESS THERE IS ANY  
13 DISCUSSION FROM MEMBERS OF THE BOARD, WE CAN PROCEED TO ROLL  
14 CALL VOTE ON THE MOTION TO APPROVE ITEM 6A.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ON THE MOTION BY ECKLUND, SECOND ROMERO.  
17 MAYOR ARREGUIN?

18

19 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER ECKLUND?

22

23 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE?



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROMERO?

13

14 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SILVA?

17

18 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
21 PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL TURN IT  
24 OVER TO CHAIR SPERING.

25



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** THANK YOU MAYOR. BEFORE WE MOVE  
2 TO ITEM SEVEN, MAYOR ARREGUIN I WANT TO PERSONALLY THANK YOU  
3 FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP. YOU KNOW, BRINGING THIS COMMITTEE  
4 TOGETHER AND REALLY ADDRESSING MANY OF THE IMPORTANT ISSUES  
5 BEFORE THIS REGION. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT LEADERSHIP. AND I  
6 THINK THIS BLENDING OF MTC ABAG HAS BEEN VERY SMOOTH, AND A  
7 LOT OF IT IS DUE TO YOUR EFFORTS. SO I WANT TO PERSONALLY  
8 THANK YOU FOR THAT, MAYOR.

9

10 **CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** WITH THAT WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM  
13 SEVEN THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA GRANT PROGRAM. MATT ARE  
14 YOU GOING TO KICK THIS OFF?

15

16 **MATT MALONEY:** I'M GOING TO PASS IT OVER TO BEN, WHO IS THE  
17 PROJECT MANAGER FOR THIS EFFORT. WE HAVE A SHORT PRESENTATION  
18 FOR YOU THIS MORNING.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING MEMBERS MY NAME IS BEN I'M THE PRIORITY  
21 CONSERVATION AREA GRANT PROGRAM, SUPPORTING DEVELOPMENT OF  
22 REGIONAL PLANNING WITH DEVELOPMENT AND CONVERSATION STRATEGIES  
23 OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. SO, TODAY WE'LL BE PROVIDING A  
24 BACKGROUND ON THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA GRANT PROGRAM AS  
25 WELL AS PRESENTING STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR OBAG 3 PCA



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 GRANTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I KNOW YOU ALL ARE FAMILIAR WITH  
2 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 BUT WANTED TO FOCUS ON ELEMENT THAT IS  
3 PARTICULARLY RELATED TO THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA  
4 PROGRAM. SO, UNDER THE HEALTHY GUIDING PRINCIPLE, THIS EDITION  
5 LED TO THE ADDITION OF THE ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT TO THE PLAN  
6 WHICH PRIORITIZES PRESERVATION IMPROVEMENT OF LAND, AIR, AND  
7 WATER ACROSS THE BAY AREA AND TO ENHANCE ACCESS TO THE OUTDOOR  
8 OPEN SPACES ACROSS OUR REGION. IT ALSO PRIORITIZES REDUCING  
9 RISKS FROM HAZARD AND EXPANDING ACCESS TO PARKS AND OPEN  
10 SPACE. AND THE FOUR KEY STRATEGIES DEVELOPED UNDERNEATH THIS  
11 ELEMENT THAT REALLY RELATE TO PCAS, ADAPTING TO SEA LEVEL  
12 RISE, MAINTAINING URBAN GROWTH BOUNDARIES PROTECTING AND  
13 MANAGING HIGH VALUE CONSERVATION LANDS AND PARKS RECREATION  
14 FACILITIES. INCLUDED ACTION TO UPDATE THE PCA DESIGNATION  
15 FRAMEWORK AND THAT WORK IS ONGOING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO AS  
16 YOU KNOW, PCA GRANTS ARE ONLY FOR PROJECTS LOCATED IN  
17 DESIGNATED PCAS. CURRENTLY THERE ARE 185 DESIGNATED PCAS BY  
18 ABAG REPRESENTING APPROXIMATELY 2.3 MILLION ACRES. THIS  
19 DESIGNATION AND THE PCA PROGRAM REALLY KICKED OFF IN 2007 TO  
20 IDENTIFY AND PRIORITIZE AREAS THAT HAVE BROAD COMMUNITY  
21 SUPPORT AND URGE URGENT NEED FOR PROTECTION. THIS WAS UPDATED  
22 IN 2017 FOR LANDSCAPE CULTURAL LANDS URBAN GREENING AND  
23 RECREATION AND REGIONAL PLANNING APPLIED FOR A STATE GRANT AND  
24 RECEIVED FUNDING IN 2022 TO KICKOFF THE PCA REFRESH PROCESS  
25 THAT IS CURRENTLY UNDERWAY AND IS DEVELOPING A FRAMEWORK



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1    APPROACH TO THE WORK AND RESILIENCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
2    SHIFTING TO PAST GRANT PROGRAMS. THERE HAVE BEEN TWO PRIOR PCA  
3    GRANT ROUNDS THAT OCCURRED IN 2013 AND 20192 SEPARATELY  
4    MANAGED PROGRAMS THAT SPLIT FUNDING TO THE COMPETITIVE PROGRAM  
5    AND THE NORTH BAY PROGRAM THAT WAS MANAGED BY THE CTAS. THE --  
6    SO THAT WAS FOR MARIN, SONOMA, NAPA, AND SOLANO COUNTIES. AND  
7    THE REST OF THE BAY THAT WAS MANAGED BY MTC IN PARTNERSHIP  
8    WITH THE STATE COASTAL CONSERVANCY AND ELIGIBLE PROJECTS HAVE  
9    BEEN CONSISTENT ACROSS BOTH CYCLES BUT INCLUDE PROTECTION OF  
10   NATURAL AND CULTURAL LANDS HABITAT ENHANCEMENT BIKE PED  
11   IMPROVEMENTS AND URBAN GREENING OPPORTUNITIES. ATTACHMENT B  
12   INCLUDES ALL FUNDED PROJECTS IN YOUR PACKET. NEXT PLEASE. A  
13   DETAILED LOOK AT HOW FUNDS HAVE BEEN DISBURSED 30 MILLION IN  
14   THE CYCLE HAVE GONE TO PROJECTS TO FUND 58 PROJECTS AND DUE TO  
15   FUND SOURCE THE MAJORITY OF PROJECTS HAVE BEEN ACCESS AND  
16   TRAIL IMPROVEMENT BUT ALSO PLANNING AND ACQUISITION  
17   RESTORATION AND URBAN GREENING RESTORATION AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE  
18   PLEASE. PREVIEW OF WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING TODAY STAFF IS  
19   PROPOSING THAT OBAG THREE FUNDS BE RELEASED IN TWO CALLS FOR  
20   PROJECTS INITIALLY STAFF RELEASED ONE CALL FOR PROJECTS UPON  
21   PCA REFRESH BUT RECOGNIZING FUNDING IS AVAILABLE AND FUNDING  
22   NEEDS RECOMMENDING 2/3 APPROACH TO FUND PROJECTS NOW WHILE  
23   RETAINING FUNDING FOR AFTER COMPLETION OF THE PCA REFRESH. WE  
24   WANT TO NOTE THAT THIS PHASED APPROACH MAY ALLOW THE COASTAL  
25   CONSERVANCY TO CONTRIBUTE FUNDS UNDER OBAG THREE THE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 CONSERVANCY DOESN'T CURRENTLY HAVE FUNDING AVAILABLE TO  
2 CONTRIBUTE TO PHASE ONE BUT WE'RE WORKING TOGETHER IN HOPES OF  
3 PARTICIPATION TO PROVIDE FUNDING IN PHASE TWO. NEXT SLIDE.  
4 WHAT'S NEW? WE'RE PROPOSING A FEW CHANGES IN THE WAY THAT THIS  
5 OBAG 3PCA GRANT PROGRAM WOULD BE MANAGED. LARGELY AND DUE TO  
6 THE FEDERAL CORRECTIVE ACTION, MTC IS NO LONGER ABLE TO  
7 SUBALLOCATE FUNDS WITHIN THE REGION AND WILL NEED TO RETAIN  
8 SELECTION AUTHORITY FOR ALL PROJECTS. SO THIS WOULD BE A CALL  
9 FOR PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA. THERE IS  
10 ALSO AVAILABLE LOCAL FUNDS THAT WOULD BE ABLE TO FUND A  
11 BROADER SUITE OF PROJECTS AND WILL NOT REQUIRE LOCAL  
12 JURISDICTIONS TO FACILITATE THEIR OWN FUNDING SWAPS FOR  
13 PROJECTS THAT MIGHT HAVE BEEN INELIGIBLE FOR FEDERAL FUNDS.  
14 AND REALLY MORE FOR THE SECOND PHASE, LOOKING FORWARD TO  
15 OPPORTUNITIES TO INCORPORATE SOME OF THE DATA AND ANALYSIS  
16 THAT HAS OCCURRED AS PART OF THE PCA REFRESH INTO FUTURE  
17 FUNDING ROUNDS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, UNDER THIS TWO PHASED  
18 APPROACH FOR PROPOSING PHASE 18 AND A HALF MILLION THAT WOULD  
19 GO OUT THIS SPRING SUPPORTING NEED FOR NEAR-TERM PROJECTS AS  
20 WELL AS BUILDING ON THE -- AND EXPANDING THE GRANT PROGRAM  
21 GUIDELINES THAT WERE DEVELOPED AS PART OF THE 2019 GRANT  
22 PROGRAM THAT FUNDS SIMILAR TYPES OF PROJECTS AS PRIOR ROUNDS.  
23 WE ARE ALSO PROPOSING, AND IN NOTE THAT PCA OBAG FUNDING HAS  
24 HISTORICALLY BEEN PARTICULARLY IMPORTANT FOR THE RURAL NORTH  
25 BAY COUNTIES THAT WE WOULD TARGET 50% OF FUNDS TO PROJECTS IN



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 THOSE COUNTIES. SECOND ROUND WOULD OCCUR IN SPRING 2025  
2 INCORPORATING RECOMMENDATIONS OF PCA REFRESH AND HOPEFULLY  
3 ADDITIONAL COASTAL CONSERVANCY FUNDING AT THAT TIME. NEXT  
4 PLEASE. SO STAFF PROPOSES TO SUPPORT SIMILAR TYPES OF PROJECTS  
5 BUT TO PROVIDE GREATER EMPHASIS TO ALIGN WITH PROJECTS IN 2050  
6 STRATEGIES AND FUNDING IN THE PCA PROGRAM STAFF SEEKING TO  
7 INVEST MINIMUM OF 6 MILLION OF THE AVAILABLE EIGHT AND A HALF  
8 MILLION IN PCAS THAT SUPPORT PROTECTION RESTORATION  
9 ENHANCEMENT ORIGINALLY SIGNIFICANT NATURAL AND AGRICULTURAL  
10 LANDS. AGRICULTURAL LANDS WOULD INCLUDE THINGS LIKE FARM TO  
11 MARKET, SUPPORT PROTECTION OF AGRICULTURAL LANDS BY SUPPORTING  
12 THE AGRICULTURAL ECONOMY. WE WANT TO CONTINUE THE FOCUS TO  
13 INCLUDE EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS AS WELL AS ACCESS TO CLIMATE  
14 RESILIENCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'LL PAUSE HERE. THIS IS  
15 OVERVIEW OF OUR RECOMMENDED APPROACH BEFORE WE MOVE ON TO  
16 TIMELINE AND NEXT STEPS. ONE ITEM TO NOTE IN THE LAST BULLET  
17 ON THE RIGHT IS RECENT LEGISLATION PASSED, SB1425 THAT  
18 REQUIRES ALL JURISDICTIONS TO OPEN -- UPDATE THEIR OPEN SPACE  
19 ELEMENTS AND INCLUDE AN ACTION PLAN AS PART OF THAT, AND SO WE  
20 ANTICIPATE AS PART OF THAT PROCESS, AS MANY JURISDICTIONS ARE  
21 UPDATING THEIR OPEN SPACE ELEMENTS THAT THERE WILL BE RENEWED  
22 FOCUS AND IDENTIFICATION OF LOCAL CONSERVATION PRIORITIES AND  
23 PROJECTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. LAST SLIDE. SO, WE'RE PROPOSING  
24 THAT OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO ENGAGE  
25 WITH CTAS AND THE COASTAL CONSERVANCY AND OTHER PARTNERS TO



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 REFINE GUIDELINES AND SCORING CRITERIA IN ADVANCE OF RELEASE  
2 FOR CALL FOR PROJECTS IN FEBRUARY OR MARCH 6789 WE ANTICIPATE  
3 RETURNING TO THIS COMMITTEE WITH RECOMMENDATIONS FOR GRANT  
4 AWARDS IN SUMMER THEN LATER IN FALL OR EARLY WINTER WITH  
5 REQUEST TO AUTHORIZE THE SECOND PHASE OF PCA GRANTS. WITH  
6 THAT, THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND SUPPORT OF THIS IMPORTANT  
7 PROGRAM. I LOOK FORWARD TO ANY QUESTIONS

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** A COUPLE OF THINGS COME TO MIND.  
10 THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES HAVE ALWAYS HAD ALLOCATION, WE HAVE  
11 ALWAYS HAD A CARVE-OUT AND THE REASON FOR THAT IS WE'RE NOT  
12 RECEIVING THE MILLIONS OR BILLIONS OF DOLLARS THAT'S BEING  
13 DISTRIBUTED THROUGHOUT THE REGION BECAUSE OF OUR LIMITED  
14 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. AND, SO, THE COMMISSION AGREED THAT,  
15 YOU KNOW A PERCENTAGE OF THIS WOULD GO TO THE NORTH BAY  
16 COUNTIES. YOU KNOW? WE HAVE A LOT OF RECREATION. I KNOW UP IN  
17 MY COUNTY, ROCKVILLE PARK, OVER 80% OF THE PEOPLE USE IT,  
18 PEOPLE OUT OF THE BAY AREA. SO, THE COMMISSION HAD AGREED  
19 THERE WOULD BE THIS CARVE OUT FOR THE NORTH BAY SO THEY CAN  
20 DEAL WITH THOSE TYPES OF PROJECTS AND I AM SURE MY COLLEAGUES  
21 FROM SONOMA, MARIN AND NAPA CERTAINLY WILL AGREE. WE HAVE HAD  
22 SOME REALLY GOOD PROJECTS. AND YOU KNOW, AND I KNOW THE  
23 RESTRICTIONS, FEDERAL RESTRICTIONS, CAN'T DESIGNATE 50%, BUT -  
24 - AND I LIKE THE COMMITMENT THAT STAFF IS MAKING TO THIS FIRST  
25 ALLOCATION. BUT I THINK THE SECOND ALLOCATION OUGHT TO HAVE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 THE SAME APPLICATION, THAT THERE IS AN EFFORT TO -- WHERE 50%  
2 OF THAT TO GO TO THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES. AND, SO THAT'S ONE  
3 ISSUE. SO, YOU KNOW, I WOULD LIKE THAT CONSIDERATION. OR AT  
4 LEAST SOME COMMENTS FROM STAFF. I KNOW ALIX IS VERY FAMILIAR  
5 WITH THIS. SHE HAS SEEN A LOT OF THE PROJECTS WE HAVE DONE.  
6 THE OTHER IS IN THE LANGUAGE, WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE  
7 DESIGNATE FARM TO MARKET AND AG TOURISM ARE BOTH FARM  
8 PROJECTS. I MIGHT HAVE MISSED IT, BUT I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT  
9 IS PART OF IT. BECAUSE FOR THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES THAT'S A  
10 VERY IMPORTANT PIECE. SO THOSE ARE KIND OF MY COMMENTS. AND SO  
11 HOPEFULLY STAFF CAN RESPOND TO THAT. YOU KNOW, ON THAT  
12 ALLOCATION. AND IT WOULD BE GOOD TO HEAR FROM COMMISSIONERS.  
13 THAT IT WAS, SORT OF, AN EQUITY ISSUE FOR THE NORTH COUNTY AND  
14 HOW THAT MONEY WAS DISTRIBUTED. WITH THAT LET ME GO TO DAVID  
15 RABBITT.

16

17 **DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU FOR THE  
18 PRESENTATION. BUT THANK YOU TO THE CHAIR FOR MAKING THAT  
19 COMMENT. AND I TOTALLY AGREE IN TERMS OF THE ALLOCATION. I GET  
20 THE SUBREGIONAL PROHIBITION. I THINK HAVING A TARGET IS A  
21 DIFFERENT MATTER. AND I FELT LIKE WE WERE PHASING OUT THAT  
22 ACKNOWLEDGMENT THAT THE CHAIR MENTIONED REGARDING THE  
23 ALLOCATION OF DOLLARS BAY AREA WIDE BEING A LITTLE  
24 DISPROPORTIONATE BY NOT HAVING THAT SAME TARGET OF 50% IN THE  
25 SECOND ALLOCATION. SO, I WOULD SUPPORT US MOVING IN THAT VEIN.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 FURTHER, AND I AGREE ON THE FARM TO MARKET AND THE AG TOURISM  
2 PIECES. BUT I WOULD ALSO CHALLENGE TO US LOOKING AT THE MAP OF  
3 SONOMA COUNTY AND GRAZING LANDS AND PRIME FARMLAND. WHAT DOES  
4 IT REALLY MEAN? WE HAVE OUR QUARTER CENT SALES TAX IN COUNTER  
5 CALLED THE SONOMA COUNTY AGRICULTURAL PRESERVATION AND OPEN  
6 SPACE DISTRICT BUT YET WE CAN'T KEEP WORKING LANDS ALIVE. AND  
7 WE'RE STRUGGLING EACH AND EVERY DAY. AND I WILL TELL THAT YOU  
8 FOR THE LAST YEAR, PROBABLY ON AVERAGE, EVERY OTHER WEEK, A  
9 DAIRY GOES OUT OF BUSINESS. NOT BEING ABLE TO MAKE IT, NOT  
10 HAVING SUCCESSION PLANS OR FAMILY MEMBERS WHO WANT TO CARRY  
11 ON, BUT ALSO BECAUSE OF THE PRICING OF MILK IT'S A STRUCTURAL  
12 ISSUE AT THE FEDERAL LEVEL. AND WE CAN'T -- BUT WE ALSO, AS MY  
13 FARMERS TELL ME OFTEN, DEATH BY A THOUSAND CUTS WITH ALL THE  
14 REGULATORY, WHETHER IT'S THE WATER BOARD, THE AIR BOARD, AND  
15 EVERYTHING ELSE. AND THIS IS THE OPPORTUNITY FOR PROGRAMS SUCH  
16 AS THIS TO REALLY MAKE A DIFFERENCE TO REALLY COME TO AND  
17 PROVIDE SOME ASSISTANCE TO KEEP THOSE FARMS IN WORKING ORDER.  
18 I CAN TELL YOU IN MY COUNTY, AGAIN IF A FARM GOES OUT OF  
19 BUSINESS, THE PRESSURE ON THAT PROPERTY TO THEN CONVERT TO  
20 SOMETHING ELSE IS TREMENDOUS. AND IT GOES AGAINST WHAT WE, I  
21 THINK, ALL BELIEVE IN, IN CITY CENTER GROWTH, AND EVERYTHING  
22 ELSE, THEY BECOME RANCHETTES AND FALLOW LANDS, WHICH AREN'T  
23 DOING ANYONE ANY GOOD. I DO THINK THAT WE NEED TO LOOK AT THAT  
24 ABOUT WHAT DOES THAT TRULY MEAN AND HOW DO WE MAKE THAT GO  
25 FORWARD. IT IS HABITAT PROTECTION, RESTORATION, CLIMATE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 RESILIENCE TARGETED TOWARDS WORKING FARMS TO HELP THEM WHETHER  
2 IT'S THROUGH METHANE DIGESTERS, SOLAR PANELS TO LOWER THE  
3 OVERALL BILLS, AND TO, OBVIOUSLY, BENEFIT THE ENVIRONMENT.  
4 SPECIFIC PROGRAMS LIKE THAT. BECAUSE I THINK IT'S EASY TO SAY  
5 WE'RE ALL FOR GRAZING LANDS AND FARMLAND, BUT UNLESS YOU ARE A  
6 FARMER AND YOU UNDERSTAND THE CONSEQUENCES, IN THE BAY AREA,  
7 AT LEAST, IN THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA, AND I'M SURE IT'S TRUE  
8 IN THE EAST BAY, HOW DIFFICULT IT IS TO COMPETE WITH CENTRAL  
9 VALLEY MEGA FARMS. AND I THINK THE FAMILY FARMS THAT WE HAVE  
10 AROUND THE ENTIRE BAY AREA ARE AT RISK, AND WE NEED TO --  
11 THAT'S PRIME CONSERVATION LAND THAT NEEDS, REALLY, AN  
12 ADDITIONAL LEVEL OF ATTENTION. SO, I APPRECIATE THAT. AND I DO  
13 THINK THAT'S ANOTHER REASON THAT WE NEED TO KIND OF MAKE SURE  
14 THAT WE PROP UP THAT ALLOCATION. SO THOSE PROGRAMS THAT WOULD  
15 BE LEVERAGED AND HAVE MULTI-BENEFITS. SO, I APPRECIATE THE  
16 WORK. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** THANK YOU, DAVID. STEPHANIE?

19

20 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO JOIN MY  
21 NORTH BAY COLLEAGUES. I WANT TO OBSERVE, THE STAFF REPORT SAYS  
22 56% OF THE REGION CONSERVATION LANDS AND 81% OF THE FARMLANDS  
23 ARE IN THE NORTH BAY. I COULD IMAGINE THAT WE DESERVE 75%  
24 CARVE-OUT INSTEAD OF 50%. BUT I THINK A 50% CARVE-OUT IS  
25 REASONABLE. I UNDERSTAND THE CHANGES IN FUNDING, BUT I WANTED



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 TO UNDERSTAND, YOU HAD MENTIONED LOCAL FUNDS TO SUPPORT A  
2 BROADER SUITE OF PROJECTS, AND I NOTE THAT IT'S STIP AND CMAQ  
3 FUNDS THAT ARE NOT FEDERAL, SO IT SEEMS LIKE WE HAVE SOME  
4 FLEXIBILITY THERE. MARIN COUNTY, LIKE SONOMA, IS WORKING TO  
5 PRESERVE OUR WORKING FARMLAND, AND WE HAVE TAXED OURSELVES FOR  
6 PROGRAMS FOR RESTORATION IN HABITAT AND FARMLAND; WE'RE  
7 WORKING WITH FARMERS ON THIS AS YOU PROBABLY KNOW. AND WE'RE  
8 ALSO CONSIDERING UPDATING A RECREATION AND AGRO TOURISM PLAN.  
9 BECAUSE WE REALIZE WE HAVEN'T REALLY PLANNED FOR THIS USE AS  
10 CONCRETELY AS WE HAVE FOR SOME OF OUR TRANSPORTATION USES. I  
11 WOULD URGE CONSIDERATION OF A SECOND YEAR OF 50% FUNDING, AND  
12 ANYTHING WE CAN DO TO MAINTAIN THE ALLOCATIONS TO THE VARIOUS  
13 COUNTIES. WE NEED THE MONEY, AND WE USE IT WISELY.

14

15 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OKAY. YOU KNOW, THE LAST THING I  
16 WANT TO ADD TO THIS IS, YOU KNOW, THE ONE THING ABOUT THE BAY  
17 AREA IS THAT YOU HAVE NINE VERY UNIQUE COUNTIES. EACH COUNTY  
18 HAS CHARACTERISTICS THAT MAKE UP THE QUALITY OF THE BAY AREA.  
19 AND I THINK THIS SMALL INVESTMENT IN THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES  
20 HELPS PRESERVE THAT. AND, SO, YOU KNOW, I'M SURE STAFF IS  
21 HEARING CONCERNS AND REQUESTS THAT WE HAVE. AND STAFF HAS, YOU  
22 KNOW, I HAVE TALKED TO MATT, STAFF HAS MADE A COMMITMENT TO  
23 DEAL WITH THAT PROBLEM, AND SEE THAT THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES  
24 ARE DEALT WITH EQUITABLY. AND, SO, WITH THAT, NOT SEEING ANY  
25 OTHER -- OH, GO AHEAD. I'M SORRY. EDDIE, GO AHEAD.



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1

2 **EDDIE AHN:** I DID ACTUALLY HAVE A QUESTION FOR STAFF.

3 PARTICULARLY I WAS LOOKING AT THE RECOMMENDED APPROACH SLIDE

4 AND THE PERCENTAGE AROUND 70% WHAT I'M INTERESTING RIGHT NOW

5 IS THE OVERALL ROUND ESSENTIALLY SETTING IT FOR AG HABITAT AND

6 PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT. OF COURSE, REALLY DO BELIEVE IN 50%

7 SET ASIDE FOR NORTH BAY COUNTIES. I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT.

8 WITH THAT COMBINED WITH THE 70% IT SEEMS THE REMAINING AMOUNT

9 OF MONEY IN ROUND ONE IS BY ESTIMATION 2 TO 2.5 MILLION OR

10 OTHER PROJECTS ESSENTIALLY SCATTERED THROUGHOUT THE COUNTIES

11 AND THAT WORRIES ME BECAUSE I THINK THERE ARE OPEN ACCESS AND

12 URBAN GREENING PROJECTS THAT ARE WORTHY OF CONSIDERATION. IT'S

13 BEEN FLAGGED FOR ME, THE SAN FRANCISCO AND RECREATION ARE

14 LOOKING AT PROJECTS TWIN PEEKS, PROMENADE, McCLAREN, INDIA

15 BASIN, WHICH ARE PROJECTS IN THE SOUTHEAST SAN FRANCISCO THAT

16 HAVE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE CONSIDERATIONS. SO, I'M WONDERING

17 IF STAFF WILL BE AMENABLE TO ELIMINATING THAT 70% SET ASIDE OF

18 COURSE KEEPING THE 50% OF BAY COUNTY SET ASIDE BUT JUST TRYING

19 TO UNDERSTAND WHY IS THERE NOT MORE OPPORTUNITIES FOR OPEN

20 ACCESS AND EVERYTHING.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** I'LL TRY TO TAKE THAT, PART OF THAT DATA-DRIVEN

23 APPROACH TO 50% ALLOCATION FOR THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES JUST IN

24 RECOGNITION THAT THERE ARE MORE SIGNIFICANT AG NATURAL LANDS



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IN THOSE COUNTIES THE 70% TARGET WAS THEN TO SUPPORT THE  
2 GREATER PREDOMINANCE AND NATURAL AGRICULTURAL LANDS THERE.

3

4 **EDDIE AHN:** BASED ON THE ARGUMENT I WOULD UNDERSTAND THE 70%  
5 APPLYING TO THE 50% RIGHT WITHIN THE REALM OF 50% SET ASIDE  
6 FROM NORTH BAY COUNTIES OF COURSE AG WOULD BE PRIORITIZED BUT  
7 50% THEN ANOTHER 70% IT RESTRICTS OVERALL FUNDING IN ROUND ONE  
8 TO A SMALL AMOUNT ESSENTIALLY.

9

10 **MATT MALONEY:** WE LOOK AT THE 50 AND 70% APPLYING TO THE WHOLE  
11 PROGRAM WE HAVE TARGETS, ONE IS A 50% TARGET, A THRESHOLD AND  
12 KIND OF A FLOOR FOR THE NORTH BAY COUNTIES BUT THEN  
13 SECONDARILY, AS BEN WAS DESCRIBING, JUST THE WHOLE THRUST OF  
14 THE PROGRAM AND THE REASON IT EXISTS IS REALLY FOR THESE AG  
15 HABITAT PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT RESTORATION PROJECTS. WE WANT  
16 TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PROGRAM STAYS PRETTY LASER FOCUSED ON  
17 THOSE TYPES OF BIG INVESTMENTS WHICH I THINK ARE ALSO, YOU  
18 KNOW, VERY GOOD FOR THE NORTH BAY BUT ARE SPREAD THROUGHOUT  
19 THE REGION. URBAN GREENING IS, I THINK, A BIG ISSUE, AS WELL,  
20 AND ALSO FITS WITHIN THE PROGRAM' PRIORITIES. IT'S NOT 70% OF  
21 THE 50% THEY'RE KIND OF WORKING TOGETHER PROGRAM WIDE.

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** I UNDERSTAND THAT. I THINK MY POINT IS, AGAIN, THE  
24 WAY THESE PERCENTAGES ARE STRUCTURED, IT SHRINKS THE POT OF  
25 MONEY FOR URBAN GREENING SPACES. I AM STRUGGLING TO UNDERSTAND



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 WHAT ARE OTHER KEY PROJECTS SIMILAR TO OTHER NORTH BAY  
2 PROJECTS THAT ARE IMPORTANT. WHAT ARE OTHER PROJECTS  
3 PRIORITIZED IN OTHER COUNTIES THAT EXIST IN THE BAY AREA? THAT  
4 ARE NOT URBAN GREENING OPEN SPACES PERHAPS.

5

6 **MATT MALONEY:** I THINK SOME OF IT THIS URBAN GREENING. A LOT OF  
7 IT IS ACCESS. HISTORICALLY THE PROGRAM HAS MADE A LOT OF  
8 INVESTMENTS IN, SORT OF, TRAIL ACCESS. AND I THINK, YOU KNOW,  
9 GENERALLY SPEAKING SOME OF THOSE TYPES OF PROJECTS WOULD ALSO  
10 BES IN THE 30% PART. ALTHOUGH MANY PROJECTS HAVE COBENEFITS  
11 AND, SORT OF, HAVE BOTH THINGS GOING ON SIMULTANEOUSLY SO WE  
12 HAVE TO LOOK AT THESE PROJECTS SUBMISSIONS AS THEY COME AND  
13 MAKE THOSE DECISIONS. BUT I THINK IT'S URBAN GREENING PLUS A  
14 LOT OF TRAIL AND URBAN ACCESS. PLUS WE HAVE OTHER FUNDS OUT  
15 THERE, FEDERAL AND STATE FUNDS TO SUPPORT TRAIL PROJECTS, AS  
16 WELL. OBVIOUSLY THIS IS NOT THE ONLY FUNDING SOURCE FOR THOSE  
17 TYPE OF INVESTMENTS.

18

19 **EDDIE AHN:** WITH YOUR INDULGENCE, I APPRECIATE THAT ANSWER, AND  
20 I WOULD JUST SAY, I CONDITIONED WHY YOU'RE INSTRUCTING IT THE  
21 WAY IT'S NOW JUST TAKE A HARD LOOK AROUND PHASE TWO TO ENSURE  
22 OPEN ACCESS AND URBAN GREENING ARE PRESERVED.

23

24 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** YOU KNOW, I JUST WANTED TO  
25 ACKNOWLEDGE FORMER COMMISSIONER STEVE KINSEY OUT THERE, HE WAS



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 PART OF THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE PCA GRANT PROGRAM. STEVE, THANK  
2 YOU FOR ALL YOUR EFFORTS. WITH THAT, MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANY  
3 PUBLIC COMMENT?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MEMBER ECKLUND.

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OH I'M SORRY.

8

9 **CARLOS ROMERO:** ALSO PAT HAD HER HAND UP.

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** PAT, I'M SORRY.

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** THAT'S OKAY. AT LEAST ONLINE I WAS THE ONLY ONE  
14 THAT I CAN SEE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION. IT  
15 WAS REALLY GOOD. I HAVE ALWAYS BEEN A BIG SUPPORTER OF THIS  
16 PROGRAM AND JUST WANTED TO PUT MY TWO CENTS IN HERE TOO. IT'S  
17 AMAZING, NOVATO HAS URBAN FARMS WITHIN THE CITY LIMITS. AND,  
18 SO, URBAN FARMING, URBAN GREENING, I THINK ARE REALLY  
19 PERSONALITY FACTORS THAT NEED TO BE -- REMAIN IN THIS PROGRAM.  
20 AND I AM SUPPORTIVE OF TRYING TO EXPAND IT, ALSO, TO OTHER  
21 CITIES. BECAUSE IT'S ACTUALLY A BENEFIT FOR THE COMMUNITY THAT  
22 SURROUNDS IT TO HAVE THOSE URBAN FARMS AND URBAN GREENING  
23 PROJECTS. BECAUSE PEOPLE NEED OUTDOOR SPACE. AND IF -- WITHOUT  
24 THAT IT REALLY MAKES LIVING A LITTLE BIT MORE DIFFERENT AND  
25 DIFFICULT. SO, I SUPPORT THE SET ASIDE FOR THE NORTH BAY. WE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 HAVE BEEN STRUGGLING TO TRY TO KEEP -- WE HAVE SEVERAL  
2 WINERIES THAT SELL THEIR PRODUCTS AND GROW THEIR PRODUCTS  
3 WITHIN THE CITY OF NOVATO, AND WE HAVE SOME SMALL URBAN FARMS,  
4 AS WELL. WHICH DO MAKE A BIG DIFFERENCE IN OUR COMMUNITIES. SO  
5 I WANT TO SUPPORT THAT SET ASIDE.

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** THANK YOU, PAT. CARLOS?

8

9 **CARLOS ROMERO:** SINCE YOU ASKED COMMISSIONERS TO COME IN ON THE  
10 50%, I AM IN SUPPORT OF THAT 50%. HOWEVER, I DO WANT TO  
11 CERTAINLY SPEAK FOR SOME [INDISCERNIBLE] COUNTY -- I KNOW THAT  
12 SUPERVISOR IS HERE -- OUR COAST HAS A NUMBER OF -- ACTUALLY  
13 IS, KIND OF, REplete WITH AGRICULTURAL INTEREST AND FARMS --  
14 FOR FARM WORKERS WHO HAVE CERTAIN NEEDS, ET CETERA, AND  
15 CERTAINLY IN SAN MATEO COUNTY IF THERE HAS EVER BEEN PRESSURE  
16 IN TERMS OF LAND PRICES TO POTENTIALLY REMOVE THAT -- YOU SEE  
17 THAT IN SAN MATEO COUNTY. I THINK THE ALLOCATIONS IN THE LAST  
18 ROUND WERE SIGNIFICANT FOR ALL COUNTIES AND APPRECIATE THE WAY  
19 STAFF HAS ALLOCATED THAT MONEY. BUT WANT TO KEEP IN MIND THAT  
20 INDEED THERE ARE OTHER COUNTIES --

21

22 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OH YEAH.

23

24 **CARLOS ROMERO:** -- PARTICULARLY SAN MATEO, THAT COULD USE THIS  
25 MONEY. LASTLY, JUST, I JUST WANT TO UNDERSTAND -- AND PERHAPS



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 STAFF CAN DEFINE WHAT WE'RE CONSIDERING AS AGRA TOURISM.  
2 BECAUSE IN AGRA TOURISM MEANS WE'RE PROMOTING BED AND  
3 BREAKFASTS ON FARMLAND AND NOT PROMOTING FARMLAND, AND I THINK  
4 FROM A KIND OF GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION PERSPECTIVE, LOCAL  
5 FARMING, WHERE WE DON'T TRUCK, RIGHT, THOUSANDS OF MILES, OR  
6 HUNDREDS OF MILES, OUR PRODUCE MAKES A LOT OF SENSE ACTUALLY  
7 FOR MTC AND THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING. SO, TO THE EXTENT THAT,  
8 YOU KNOW, STAFF IF WE ARE GOING TO, YOU KNOW, SAY THAT,  
9 INDEED, AGRO TOURISM, WHICH KIND OF MAKES SENSE. THERE IS PIE  
10 RANCH WHICH IS A WONDERFUL EXAMPLE OF AGRO TOURISM. NOT BED  
11 AND BREAKFAST. SO, JUST SOME DEFINITION THERE SO WE DON'T  
12 EXPAND THIS TO THE WHOLE INDUSTRY.

13

14 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** WE HAVE RESTRICTIONS ON THAT  
15 TYPE OF DEVELOPMENT IN SOLANO COUNTY. DAVID?

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'M FINE WITH HOW WE'RE MOVING FORWARD TODAY.  
18 AND I UNDERSTAND CARLOS, YOU'RE CORRECT. WE HAVE A LOT OF  
19 NEEDS. ONE OF THE SLIDES THAT BROUGHT ME GREAT JOY WAS MALAGRA  
20 RIDGE AND THAT IS REALLY -- I THINK THIS AGENCY SHOULD BE VERY  
21 PROUD OF IT IN PACIFICA. I UNDERSTAND THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT.  
22 YOU KNOW, I'M CONVINCED THAT THIS IS THE DIRECTION THAT WE  
23 SHOULD MOVE FORWARD, AND YOU KNOW, SOME MAY SAY THAT IT'S NOT  
24 EQUITABLE. I LOOK AT IT FROM A DIFFERENT LENS. I THINK IT'S  
25 VERY EQUITABLE, AND I THINK -- YOU KNOW, WE HAVE HEARD FROM



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 DIFFERENT MEMBERS, SUPERVISOR MOULTON, AS WELL AS SUPERVISOR  
2 RABBITT, AND, SO, I THINK WE SHOULD MOVE THIS ITEM FORWARD. IT  
3 MAKES SENSE. AND IN THESE AREAS, ESPECIALLY -- AND I DON'T  
4 MEAN TO SPEAK FOR YOUR DISTRICT, OR OTHERS DISTRICTS THERE, IS  
5 THAT, SORT OF, HELP IN TERMS OF THE FINANCING, OR THE DOLLARS  
6 THAT THEY NEED. AND I RECOGNIZE THAT. AND I JUST FEEL  
7 COMPELLED TO SUPPORT THIS AND ADVANCE THIS. SO, THANK YOU SO  
8 MUCH.

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OKAY. NOT SEEING ANY OTHER  
11 LIGHTS, MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS OR WRITTEN  
12 COMMENTS?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON  
15 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK,  
16 AND THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM. HOW MUCH TIME  
17 WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** TWO MINUTES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TWO MINUTES. OKAY. RAY MUELLER, YOU'RE UP.  
22 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

23

24 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. CAN YOU HEAR ME.

25

26



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, WE CAN. YEP.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS RAY MUELLER. I'M A SUPERVISOR IN SAN MATEO  
4 COUNTY. I APPRECIATE THE BOARD'S CONSIDERATION TODAY. I WANT  
5 TO THANK THE COMMISSIONERS FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY. I DID WANT  
6 TO -- I DO REPRESENT THE SAN MATEO -- I DO REPRESENT THE SAN  
7 MATEO COUNTY COAST, WHICH THE COMMISSIONERS ALLUDED TO HAS  
8 QUITE A BIT OF FARMING. AND WANT TO MAKE SURE -- ONE OF THE  
9 DIFFICULTIES THAT WE FACE ON THE COAST WITH OUR FARMERS AND  
10 OUR RANCHERS THEY ARE STRUCTURAL DIFFICULTIES WITH BRINGING  
11 THEIR PRODUCTS TO MARKET WE ARE LOOKING AT FOOD HUB  
12 AGRICULTURAL CO-OP DISTRIBUTION CENTERS TO TRY TO ADDRESS THAT  
13 ISSUE AND I'M GRATEFUL FOR THIS FUNDING AND WANTED IT MAKE  
14 SURE AND CLARIFY THAT WOULD BE APPLICABLE TO THOSE TYPES OF  
15 PROJECTS.

16

17 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR COMMENT.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC  
20 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

21

22 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** APPROVAL FOR THE PRIORITY  
23 CONSERVATION GRANT PROGRAMS. STAFF HAS HEARD FROM COMMITTEE  
24 MEMBERS. ALIX, YOU HAVE A GOOD LONG HISTORY WITH THIS.

25



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1   **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU, CHAIR SPERING. I REALLY APPRECIATE  
2   THE COMMENTS. AND REALLY, THE HISTORY, REALLY, AS WE START  
3   INVESTING MORE AND MORE INTO PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS WE  
4   WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ALSO REALLY THINKING ABOUT THE  
5   IMPORTANCE OF PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREAS IN THE REGION. AND  
6   IN PARTICULAR, AS EVERYONE HAS NOTED AND THE STAFF MEMO NOTED,  
7   THE PREVALENCE OF THOSE, IN PARTICULAR, IN THE NORTH BAY BUT  
8   THEY ARE THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO, I APPRECIATE ALL THE  
9   COMMENTS, HERE, ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE. I THINK MY BIG TAKE AWAY  
10  IS, IDEALLY, WE NEED MORE MONEY. THAT'S ALWAYS MY TAKEAWAY. WE  
11  NEED MONEY TO INVEST IN ALL THESE IMPORTANT PROJECTS. BUT  
12  CERTAINLY HEARD ABOUT THE CONSIDERATION TO CONTINUE AT LEAST  
13  THE 50%. I WANT TO BE CLEAR IT WASN'T 50% IT WAS 50% OR MORE  
14  FOR THE NORTH BAY, I THINK WAS THE TARGET. I HEARD A LOT HERE  
15  REALLY THAT IS TO CONTINUE INTO THE SECOND ROUND. SO, YEAH, I  
16  JUST APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS. AND I THINK THAT -- I'M TRYING  
17  TO THINK IF THERE WAS ANYTHING ELSE I WANTED TO SAY. I THINK  
18  THAT WAS MOSTLY IT.

19

20  **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** THANK YOU. AND MY LAST COMMENT  
21  ON THE AG TOURISM, I KNOW IN SOLANO COUNTY, LOOKING AT THE  
22  SUISUN GREEN VALLEY, IT HAS REVITALIZED THOSE FARMS, THOUGH  
23  AGRICULTURAL PROPERTIES. AND THERE HAS BEEN NO DEVELOPMENT ON  
24  THEM. OF COURSE THAT'S RESTRICTED IN OUR COUNTY. IT'S A VERY



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1    IMPORTANT PIECE. THAT'S WHY I WANT IT MENTIONED IN THE STAFF  
2    REPORT. FARM TO MARKET AND AG TOURISM.

3

4    **CARLOS ROMERO:** MR. CHAIR. JUST SUPER QUICKLY. IT IS NOT -- AND  
5    I APPRECIATE THE WANT OF STAFF TO ASK TO ANSWER QUESTIONS THAT  
6    COME FROM THE PUBLIC, BUT I WILL RE ASK THE QUESTION THAT  
7    SUPERVISOR MUELLER ASKED, IS IF -- IS THE USE THAT HE SAID  
8    THAT WE MIGHT NEED IN THE COUNTY IN TERMS OF THESE  
9    DISTRIBUTION CENTERS, IS THAT SOMETHING THAT COULD BE, INDEED,  
10    FUNDED THROUGH THIS UPCOMING GRANT?

11

12    **MATT MALONEY:** I MEAN, I THINK WE WOULD HAVE TO SEE THE PROJECT  
13    PROPOSAL AND KIND OF GET INTO IT A LITTLE BIT. I'M NOT SURE  
14    THAT I CAN ANSWER, LIKE, YES OR NO, SORT OF, BLACK OR WHITE.  
15    ONE OF THE WAYS I WILL ANSWER THE QUESTION, AND IT KIND OF  
16    ALSO GOES BACK TO WHAT COMMISSIONER RABBITT WAS TALKING ABOUT  
17    WITH SOME OF THE NEEDS IN HIS COUNTY WITH GRAZING LANDS AND  
18    DAIRIES, AND THESE TYPE OF THINGS, WE HAVE WORKED TO BUILD A  
19    LOT OF FLEXIBILITY INTO THIS PROGRAM IN TERMS OF ELIGIBILITY  
20    WITH THE FUNDING. AT ITS BASIS THIS PROGRAM ORIGINATES FROM  
21    FEDERAL TRANSPORTATION DOLLARS. AND IN THE PAST THAT HAS LEFT  
22    US CONSTRAINED IN TERMS OF THE TYPES OF PROJECTS WE CAN DO.  
23    THEY NEED TO HAVE A STRONG NEXUS TO TRANSPORTATION. WE STILL  
24    DO WANT TO FUND A LOT OF PROJECTS THAT PROVIDE ACCESS AND  
25    TRANSPORTATION BUT WE HAVE WORKED ALSO INTERNALLY TO EXCHANGE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 THOSE FEDERAL DOLLARS FOR MORE FLEXIBLE DOLLARS AND THAT  
2 ALLOWS US TO TAKE ON A WIDER PORTFOLIO OF PROJECTS WITHOUT  
3 THOSE TYPES OF RESTRICTIONS. SO, I GUESS THAT'S HOW I WOULD  
4 ANSWER THE QUESTION ABOUT THE KIND OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT, BUT  
5 I NEED TO SEE MORE ABOUT WHAT THE PROJECT IS.

6

7 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I'M SURE SUPERVISOR MUELLER'S STAFF WILL FOLLOW  
8 UP. [LAUGHTER]

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** THANK YOU. I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER  
11 LIGHTS.

12

13 **PAT ECKLUND:** JIM? I HAVE A STATEMENT I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO  
14 MAKE.

15

16 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** GO AHEAD, PAT.

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT WAS THE QUESTION I WAS  
19 GOING TO ASK, AND I REALLY APPRECIATE CARLOS MAKING THAT  
20 QUESTION. IN MY WORK AT U.S. ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY,  
21 ONE ASPECT OF MY JOB WAS, YOU KNOW, SUPERVISING AGS AND  
22 AGRICULTURAL LANDS, THESE COME UP AND THEY ARE REALLY HELPFUL  
23 FOR URBAN FARMING. YOU NEED A PLACE TO TAKE YOUR GOODS. AND,  
24 SO, IN SOME RESPECTS, THE AGRICULTURAL FARMS IN THE URBAN  
25 AREAS ARE REALLY DEPENDENT ON THEM. SO, I REALLY THINK THERE



DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 IS A NEXUS BETWEEN THOSE AG HUBS AND TRANSPORTATION. BECAUSE  
2 THEN THAT WAY THE FOLKS DON'T HAVE TO GO ALL THE WAY OUT TO  
3 THE COAST, OR -- AND MARIN HAS COASTAL FARMS, AS WELL -- IN  
4 ORDER TO PURCHASE GOODS. SO, I REALLY THINK THAT WE NEED TO  
5 SPEND SOME TIME REALLY SEARCHING THAT OUT, AND THEN TRY TO  
6 REALLY CHANGE THE PROGRAM, THIS YEAR, SO THAT IT COULD BE  
7 ELIGIBLE. AND, SO, REALLY WANTED TO URGE FOLKS, REALLY PUSH  
8 FOR THAT, IN MY OPINION. THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. SEEING NO OTHER  
11 HANDS, OR COMMISSIONERS LIGHTS ON, MARTHA WOULD YOU TAKE THE  
12 ROLL, PLEASE?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION?

15

16 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OH YEAH. [LAUGHTER]

17

18 **SPEAKER:** I'LL MOVE THIS ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** IT WOULD HELP TO HAVE A MOTION  
21 AND SECOND.

22

23 **DAVID RABBITT:** I THINK YOU HAVE THE MOTION THERE, BUT I'LL BE  
24 THE SECOND.

25



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** AND SECOND BY RABBIT. SO, WITH  
2 THAT TAKE THE ROLL, PLEASE?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. CHAIR SPERING?

5

6 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN?

9

10 **V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN, MTC:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

13

14 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON PETERS?

21

22 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

25



## Meeting Transcript

DECEMBER 8, 2023

1     **SUE NOACK:** YES.

2

3     **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

4

5     **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

6

7     **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS  
8     PRESENT.

9

10    **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** MOVING TO ITEM EIGHT THIS, IS  
11    PUBLIC COMMENTS OR OTHER BUSINESS. MARTHA IS THERE ANY PUBLIC  
12    COMMENTS? OR WRITTEN COMMENTS?

13

14    **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS  
15    ITEM NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IN ZOOM  
16    AND NO ONES IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

17

18    **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC:** OKAY. WITH THAT, THIS MEETING IS  
19    ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

20





*Broadcasting Government*