

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



JUNE 12, 2024

PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE

WEDNESDAY, JUNE 12, 2024 10:40AM

1

2

3

4

CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: WELL, GOOD MORNING COLLEAGUES. I WOULD
LIKE TO CALL THIS MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
COMMITTEE TO ORDER. AND WE'RE BEING WEBCAST BY THE MTC WEB
SITE, OR THROUGH THE MTC WEB SITE OF THE COMMISSIONERS AND
MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM AND WISHING TO
SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE.
AND I WILL NOW ASK FOR A ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM THAT WE HAVE A
QUORUM.

12

13

CLERK OF THE BOARD: CERTAINLY. CHAIR CHAVEZ?

14

15

CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.

16

17

CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ PRESENT. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

18

19

V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY: HERE.

20

21

CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY PRESENT. ABE-KOGA?

22

23

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.

24

25

CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA PRESENT. NON-VOTING EL-TAWANSY?



JUNE 12, 2024

1

2 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN? PRESENT. NON-VOTING SCHAFF?

17

18 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. WE HAVE A QUORUM.

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM TWO, AND

23 THIS IS OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. THIS IS ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2F. MAY

24 I GET A MOTION FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECOND.

4

5 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** MOTION AND SECOND. PUBLIC SPEAKERS ON
6 THIS ITEM?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO ONE ONLINE, NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
9 RECEIVED AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

10

11 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A VOTE.
12 ALL THOSE IN FAVOR SAY AYE. [AYES]

13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ANY OPPOSED? ANY ABSTENTIONS? THAT PASSES
15 UNANIMOUSLY. NOW WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON. OH, ALL MEMBERS
16 PRESENT -- OF ALL MEMBERS -- UNANIMOUSLY WITH ALL OF ALL THE
17 MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU. GINA IS HERE TO HELP. ALL RIGHT.
18 WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM 3A, AND THIS IS INFORMATION
19 ON THE HOUSING ELEMENT COMPLIANCE AND RELATED ONE BAY AREA
20 OBAG GRANT FOR CYCLE 2 AND 3 POLICIES. SO, WELCOME. HEATHER IS
21 GOING TO GET US STARTED HERE.

22

23 **HEATHER PETERS:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. SO GLAD TO SEE YOU ALL
24 IN THE BUILDING. GOOD TO BE IN REAL LIFE AGAIN. SO, I WILL BE
25 TALKING YOU THROUGH THE STATUS OF HOUSING ELEMENTS, AND THEN



JUNE 12, 2024

1 MY COLLEAGUE WILL JOIN AND GIVE YOU SOME INFORMATION ABOUT THE
2 IMPACT THAT IS THE MONEY. SO, IF I CAN HAVE THE NEXT SLIDE,
3 PLEASE? HERE WE GO. CONTEXT FOR THE CONVERSATION. AS YOU ALL
4 WILL PROBABLY RECALL, THE OBAG PROGRAM IS CONDITIONED ON
5 COMPLIANCE WITH HOUSING ELEMENT LAW, AND THIS HOUSING ELEMENT
6 CYCLE HAS BEEN, LIKE, NONE THAT EVER CAME BEFORE IN SO MANY
7 WAYS. TAKING INTO ACCOUNT THE EXTRAORDINARILY MORE COMPLICATED
8 AND EXPENSIVE PROCESS THAT ALL THE JURISDICTIONS HAVE BEEN
9 GOING THROUGH. THE COMMISSION EXTENDED AND BY GRANTING A GRACE
10 PERIOD, THE DEADLINE FOR COMPLIANCE TO QUALIFY FOR THE OBAG
11 GRANTS. AND, SO, THAT GRACE PERIOD HAS BEEN GRANTED TO GO
12 THROUGH DECEMBER 31ST OF 2024. HOWEVER, YOU REQUESTED A SIX
13 MONTH UPDATE ON HOW THINGS ARE GOING. SO, WE'RE HERE ON GIVE
14 YOU THAT TODAY. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS JUST A QUICK
15 REFRESHER ON HOUSING ELEMENT PROCEDURE. GENERALLY, THE PROCESS
16 IS THERE IS AN INITIAL DRAFT THAT'S SENT TO HCD, THEY NOW HAVE
17 90 DAYS TO REVIEW, AND THEY TAKE VIRTUALLY ALL OF IT, USUALLY.
18 THERE ARE AT LEAST A SECOND DRAFT, AND OFTEN MULTIPLE DRAFTS,
19 AND THEN AN ADOPTION. AND EACH OF THOSE STEPS, HCD HAS 60 DAYS
20 TO REVIEW, AND THEY TAKE VIRTUALLY ALL OF IT. THE STATUTORY
21 DEADLINE WAS WAY BACK IN JANUARY 31ST OF 2023, BUT AS I
22 MENTIONED, WE HAVE A GRACE PERIOD FOR THE OBAG THROUGH THE END
23 OF THIS CALENDAR YEAR. A NEW THING THIS CYCLE THAT HAS BEEN
24 VERY CHALLENGING IS THERE ARE NEW REZONING DEADLINES. IN PRIOR
25 CYCLES, IT WOULD BE THREE YEARS FROM THE END OF YOUR



JUNE 12, 2024

1 CERTIFICATION TO GET YOUR REZONING DONE. AND VERY COMPLICATED
2 DETAILS UP HERE, BUT ESSENTIALLY, THE DEADLINE FOR MOST OF OUR
3 JURISDICTIONS WAS, ALSO -- WAS JANUARY 31ST OF THIS YEAR. AND
4 THAT WAS PART OF WHAT DROVE THE DECISION TO CREATE THE GRACE
5 PERIOD FOR OBAG. AND ADDITIONALLY, [LAUGHTER] ONCE YOU GET
6 CERTIFIED THAT'S NOT JUST YOU'RE DONE FOR EIGHT YEARS. HCD CAN
7 ALWAYS DECERTIFY. AND YOU CAN FOLLOW OUT OF COMPLIANCE. SO,
8 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS TABLE WAS SHOWING THE HOUSING ELEMENT
9 STATUS AS OF MAY 2ND. AND I AM VERY HAPPY TO REPORT THAT
10 THINGS HAVE BEEN GOING WELL SINCE THEN. AND THE CURRENT
11 NUMBERS ARE 81 JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE FULLY CERTIFIED, AND
12 FOUR MORE ARE FOUND IN SUBSTANTIAL COMPLIANCE. SO, WE FULLY
13 EXPECT THEM TO BE CERTIFIED SOON. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

14

15 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, MAY I ASK A QUESTION?

16

17 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** SURE.

18

19 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE, I'M JUST CURIOUS TON,
20 IT LOOKS LIKE IN GENERAL, THE GREAT MAJORITY OF CITIES AND
21 JURISDICTIONS HAVE TRIED, WHO HAS BEEN DECERTIFIED?

22

23 **HEATHER PETERS:** THE --

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:**



JUNE 12, 2024

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** APOLOGIZE. AND DECERTIFY THROUGH THE CHAIR
3 WHAT'S THE IMPACT OF IT?

4

5 **HEATHER PETERS:** OBAG IS NOT THE ONLY FUNDING SOURCE THAT'S
6 SUBJECT TO THE HOUSING ELEMENT CERTIFICATION IT MEANS THAT HCD
7 HAS REVIEWED THE ADOPTED HOUSING ELEMENT AND HAS BEEN FOUND TO
8 BE COMPLIANT IN SUBSTANCE WITH STATE LAW THAT MEANS YOU'RE
9 ELIGIBLE NOT ONLY FOR OBAG BUT FOR MANY SUBSTANTIVE FUNDING
10 SOURCES FROM THE STATE, AND YOU'RE ALSO AVOIDING SEVERE
11 CONSEQUENCES THAT CAN HAPPEN IN THEIR ESCALATING DISCIPLINARY
12 PROCESS WHICH WE'LL TALK ABOUT IN A MOMENT. BUT THEY'RE NOT
13 JUST FINANCIAL CONSEQUENCES, THEY'RE SUBSTANTIVE CONSEQUENCES.
14 MANY OF YOU HAVE HEARD OF THE BUILDERS REMEDY THAT'S HOT ON
15 EVERYONE'S MINDS. IF YOU ARE NOT CERTIFIED, AND AN APPLICATION
16 COMES IN FOR A PROJECT THEY ARE ENTITLED TO PRETTY MUCH IGNORE
17 ALL THE OF YOUR ZONING, AND YOU MUST PROCESS THE APPLICATION,
18 REGARDLESS. OTHER VERY EXTREME INSTANCES ARE THE HMM CD CAN
19 ACTUALLY COME IN AND TAKE OVER YOUR PERMITTING. FORTUNATELY,
20 WE'RE NOWHERE NEAR ANY OF THAT. [LAUGHTER] SO, DOES THAT
21 ANSWER YOUR QUESTION FOR NOW?

22

23 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND THEN VICTORIA HAD A QUESTION.
24 FOREMEN.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES CAN YOU SAY WHICH JURISDICTIONS HAVE
2 BEEN DECERTIFIED.

3

4 **HEATHER PETERS:** TWO OF THEM PORTOLA VAL AND SANTA HELENA, GOOD
5 NEWS IS ST. HELENA FINISHED THEIR REZONING AND THEY HAVE BEEN
6 RECERTIFIED. SO THE ONLY ONE THAT'S CURRENTLY DECERTIFIED IS
7 PORTOLA VALLEY AND THAT'S FOR FAILURE TO PROPERLY REZONE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** WITHIN THE DEADLINE.

10

11 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** [LAUGHTER] ALL RIGHT. PLEASE GO ON.

12

13 **HEATHER PETERS:** NEXT SLIDE TALKING ABOUT DISCIPLINARY PROCESS.
14 IT'S NOT NECESSARILY LINEAR, AND IT IS ALSO AT THE DISCRETION
15 OF HCD, WHERE THEY WANT TO DROP IN AND TAKE DIFFERENT ACTIONS.
16 BUT, GENERALLY, THE LEVELS OF SEVERITY ARE ON THE SLIDE HERE.
17 THE LEAST LEVEL IS MONITORING. THEY JUST HAVE CONVERSATION
18 WITH STAFF, THEY SAY WE'RE TAKING A LOOK AT THIS, WE WANT TO
19 MAKE SURE YOU GET IT RIGHT. IF YOU DON'T, WE MAY PROCEED TO
20 MORE FORMAL DISCIPLINE. SO THAT'S JUST A FRIENDLY
21 CONVERSATION. [LAUGHTER] LETTER OF INQUIRY IS THE NEXT LEVEL.
22 IT'S A FORMAL WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE THAT SAYS, WE ARE
23 WATCHING THIS, WE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THIS, AND YOU HAVE 30
24 DAYS TO RESPOND IN WRITING TO EXPLAIN WHAT THE PROCESS IS
25 YOU'RE GOING THROUGH TO ALLEVIATE THE CONCERNS. AND THOSE ARE



JUNE 12, 2024

1 OFTEN JUST RESOLVED RIGHT THERE. STAFF SENDS A LETTER,
2 EXPLAINS THAT THEY'RE MAKING PROGRESS. HCD IS CONVINCED THAT
3 THEY'RE MAKING GOOD FAITH EFFORT AND THAT IT JUST ENDS THERE.
4 THE NEXT LEVEL OF ACTION, AFTER THAT, IS IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED
5 THE LETTER OF INQUIRY, OR NOT NECESSARILY -- SOMETIMES THEY
6 CAN SKIP RIGHT THROUGH TO WHAT THEY CALL A LETTER OF
7 CORRECTIVE ACTION -- AND THAT IS A MORE FORMAL STEP. THE
8 LETTER OF CORRECTIVE ACTION, YOU GET ANOTHER 30 DAYS TO
9 RESPOND, BUT THE FACT THAT THE LETTER OF CORRECTIVE ACTION
10 WENT OUT INDICATES THAT HCD WASN'T REALLY HAPPY WITH THE FIRST
11 ROUND OF CONVERSATIONS THEY HAVE HAD, OR NECESSARILY THE
12 SECOND ROUND. SO, IT'S MORE SERIOUS. BUT, AGAIN, NOT
13 DECERTIFICATION. AGAIN, THERE IS A 30-DAY CHANCE TO RESPOND IN
14 WRITING, AND HCD WILL PROVIDE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AND TRY TO
15 GET YOU BACK ON TRACK. THAT LEVEL OF INVOLVEMENT -- ALL OF THE
16 LETTERS ARE PUBLIC RECORD -- BUT IT'S ONLY WHEN YOU GET TO THE
17 LEVEL OF THE CORRECTIVE ACTION THAT WHEN YOU GET OUT OF IT
18 THAT THEY ACTUALLY POST A NOTICE THAT YOU HAVE FULLY COMPLIED
19 WITH THEIR LETTER OF CORRECTIVE ACTION. SO FOR STAFF IT'S A
20 LITTLE BIT OF WHERE IS WALDO TO TRY AND FIGURE OUT WHO IS AT
21 WHAT STAGE OF THE GAME. BECAUSE WE DO SEE A LOT OF LETTERS OF
22 INQUIRY AND WE DON'T REALLY KNOW WHATEVER HAPPENED BECAUSE
23 THEY DON'T POST FOLLOW UP. SO WE HAVE SPENT TIME IN
24 CONVERSATIONS WITH HCD WITH OUR COUNTY PLANNING COLLABORATIVES
25 AND LOCAL STAFF TO TRY TO GET OUR BEST OF WHAT EVERYBODY IS IN



JUNE 12, 2024

1 THE PROCESS. ANOTHER LEVEL OF SEVERITY IS NOTICE OF POTENTIAL
2 VIOLATION AND THAT CAN BE FOR HOUSING ELEMENTS, BUT THEY CAN
3 ALSO BE FOR FAILURE TO PROPERLY PROCESS BUILDERS REMEDY
4 APPLICATIONS, OR ANY OTHER VIOLATION OF STATE LAW. IT DOESN'T
5 NECESSARILY NEED TO BE HOUSING ELEMENTS. AND THEN, AS I
6 MENTIONED, THE NEXT STEP AFTER THAT, IF YOU HAVE A RESOLVED,
7 EVERYTHING IN THE LETTERS, YOU DO GET A FORMAL LETTER OF
8 COMPLIANCE, OR COMPLETION OF THE CORRECTIVE ACTION, IF YOU
9 DON'T, THEN THEY PROCEED TO DECERTIFICATION. DOES ANYONE HAVE
10 ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THAT BEFORE I MOVE FORWARD? GREAT. CAN I
11 HAVE THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OKAY. AGAIN, AS OF MAY 2ND SUMMARY
12 OF DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS. THESE ARE ALL, HCD MONITORING FIRST
13 AND SECOND COLUMNS ARE SEVERE HMM CD MONITORING WE DETERMINED
14 THROUGH CONVERSATIONS WITH HCD LETTER AND EVERYTHING ELSE TO
15 THE RIGHT OF THAT LETTERS INQUIRY PUBLIC RECORD ALTHOUGH WE
16 DON'T KNOW HOW THEY GET RESOLVED NECESSARILY LETTERS OF
17 CORRECTIVE ACTION AND/OR PUBLIC RECORDS CERTIFICATION AND
18 SUCCESSFUL COMPLETION OF ACTION ARE ALL PUBLIC RECORD. GREAT
19 NEWS ON THIS FRONT. WE, THROUGH -- AS I MENTIONED, MANY
20 CONVERSATIONS WITH MANY DIFFERENT PEOPLE OF MANY LEVELS. WE
21 HAVE BEEN ABLE TO SLEUTH OUT THAT IT LOOKS LIKE ABOUT 75% OF
22 THESE WE'RE PRETTY SURE ARE RESOLVED. AND AS I MENTIONED, ST.
23 HELENA IS RECERTIFIED. AND THE ONES THAT ARE NOT RESOLVED,
24 SOME OF THEM ARE LETTERS OF INQUIRY. SO THEY MAY HAVE BEEN
25 RESOLVED, AND WE JUST HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO SLEUTH OUT THAT



JUNE 12, 2024

1 THEY HAVE BEEN RESOLVED. SO, EXCELLENT NEWS TO REPORT THERE.
2 KEY HERE IS EIGHT LETTERS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION. AND OF THOSE
3 LETTERS OF CORRECTIVE ACTION, FOUR HAVE BEEN FORMALLY
4 RESOLVED. AND I HAVE NOTHING ELSE ON THAT, UNLESS ANYONE HAS
5 ANY QUESTIONS, I'M GOING TO PASS IT OFF TO MY COLLEAGUE TO
6 TALK ABOUT THE FUNDING IMPLICATIONS OF ALL OF THIS.

7

8 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** WELCOME.

9

10 **THOMAS ARNDT:** FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE. I'LL
11 TALK ABOUT IMPLICATIONS AND OUTCOMES FOR GRANT PROGRAMS MOST
12 RESTRICTIONS ACTUALLY MET OUR INITIAL DEADLINE SO THEY
13 RETAINED THEIR APPLICABLE FUNDING. 169 MILLION, CERTIFICATIONS
14 DURING OUR GRACE PERIOD, FUNDS REINSTATED 43 MILLION
15 JURISDICTIONS STILL WORKING FORCED CERTIFICATION WITH HELL
16 MOST AWARDS 35,000,004 PROJECT RECEIVED EXEMPTIONS BECAUSE
17 THEY RECEIVED DISCRETIONARY STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDS AND THOSE
18 PROJECTS ARE LISTED ON THE SCREEN. WITH THAT WE'RE AVAILABLE
19 FOR QUESTIONS.

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR I WANT TO ADD ONE THING TO
22 THAT LAST PART. TWO OF THE ONES THAT ARE LISTED WITH
23 EXCEPTIONS HAVE ACTUALLY MET THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT
24 REQUIREMENTS, I THINK THAT'S MENLO PARK AND SAN JOSE. JUST TWO



JUNE 12, 2024

1 OF THOSE ARE STILL AWAITING THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT
2 CERTIFICATION. SO I JUST WANTED TO NOTE THAT.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO FIRST SEE IF
5 THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE I GO TO MY COLLEAGUES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE ZOOM SPACE.
8 NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED AND NO ONE IN THE
9 BOARDROOM.

10

11 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS
12 FROM MY COLLEAGUES? YEAH VICTORIA, GO AHEAD.

13

14 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** I JUST WANT TO NOTE THAT IT'S A LOT OF WORK
15 TO TRACK 101 JURISDICTIONS OR CITIES AND NINE -- PLUS NINE
16 COUNTIES, SO, I WANTED TO THANK YOU AND YOUR STAFF FOR
17 MONITORING THIS STUFF AND COME BACK TO US WITH SUCH A ROBUST
18 REPORT. IT'S REALLY APPRECIATED.

19

20 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. GINA?

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** THIS IS INFORMATIONAL, I GET IT. IT WOULD BE
23 HELPFUL FOR US IF WE COULD COME BACK IN NOVEMBER TO DECIDE
24 NEXT STEPS, AS FAR AS SOME OF THESE JURISDICTIONS GO. I DON'T



JUNE 12, 2024

1 THINK THE GOAL IS TO PENALIZE THE JURISDICTIONS, BUT WE'LL BE
2 WORKING WITH THEM, AS YOU ARE, AND HCD --

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** LIBBY OVER HERE LEANING IN.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** WELL, THAT'S WHY THERE IS EXTENSION TO HELP THEM
7 ALONG THE WAY. SO WITH THE CHAIR'S PERMISSION HERE, THAT WOULD
8 BE VERY HELPFUL.

9

10 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I THINK MAYBE COMMISSIONER SCHAFF DID ASK
11 FOR A REPORT BACK, THAT WOULD COME BACK, I THINK, IN DECEMBER,
12 WITH THAT LIST OF -- IF I'M REMEMBERING THIS PROPERLY, WITH
13 THE -- FRANKLY WITH WHO IS ON THE NAUGHTY LIST, RIGHT BEFORE
14 THE HOLIDAYS. AND -- I WAS GOING TO SAY IN NOVEMBER -- I THINK
15 WE VOTED ON THIS IN DECEMBER TO COME BACK. NOVEMBER MAKES A
16 LOT OF SENSE IT ACTUALLY GIVES US A LITTLE TIME. FOR STAFF?
17 APPROXIMATE THAT WOULD BE GREAT?

18

19 **HEATHER PETERS:** NO PROBLEM.

20

21 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** EVEN THOUGH I SAW MY COUNTY'S NAME ON THE
22 LIST HERE, DO THINK THAT HAVING A LIST OF WHO IS STILL
23 OUTSTANDING AND FRANKLY WITH DEEPER DISCUSSION WITH EACH OF
24 THEM ABOUT WHY IS GOING TO BE IMPORTANT. AND I WOULD ALSO
25 SUGGEST IF ANY OF THEM WANT TO COME AND EXPLAIN -- NO. I'M



JUNE 12, 2024

1 SERIOUS. BECAUSE THIS IS GOING IMPACT THEM GETTING FUNDING. IF
2 WE SHOULD GIVE THEM THAT OPPORTUNITY IF THEY WOULD LIKE TO?

3

4 **HEATHER PETERS:** I WANT TO POINT OUT YOU HAVE A LIST IN YOUR
5 PACKET THAT SHOWS WHERE EVERYBODY LIVES SO IF YOU ARE INTERESTED
6 IN A PARTICULAR JURISDICTION AND LIKE I SAID WE HAVE MADE
7 PROGRESS.

8

9 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I APPRECIATE THAT. AND JUST OUTSTANDING
10 WHAT'S THERE AND WHY IS IMPORTANT EVERYBODY HAS A DIFFERENT
11 REASON. I WILL MAKE ONE OBSERVATION I THINK THERE WAS CONCERN
12 THERE WAS RECALCITRANCE ON BEHALF OF SOME NOT WANTING TO GO
13 THROUGH THE PROCESS BECAUSE THERE WAS SUCH A CONFLICT OVER HOW
14 MANY HOUSING UNITS EACH JURISDICTION WAS BEING ASKED TO
15 SUPPORT AND IT APPEARS TO ME AT LEAST IN OUR COUNTY THAT SOME
16 OF THE CITIES I WAS MOST CONCERNED ABOUT ACTUALLY MET THE
17 DEADLINE AND THE COUNTY STILL HAS NOT. AND, SO [LAUGHTER] I'LL
18 SAVE MY JUDGMENT FOR NOVEMBER. ALL RIGHT. ANYBODY ELSE? GINA?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** A LITTLE BRAGGING POINT HERE. DEPARTMENT OF
21 FINANCE: MILLBRAE IS THE FASTER GROWING CITY IN SAN MATEO
22 COUNTY AND THE FIFTH FASTEST GROWING IN THE BAY AREA AND 10th
23 IN THE -- I GUESS IT'S CALIFORNIA. SO, OUR LITTLE CITY,
24 PERCENTAGE WISE.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I WAS GOING TO SAY, IN NOVEMBER, WE'RE
2 GOING TO HAVE TO COME WITH SOME MEDALS, AND SOME --

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** RIGHT. I STILL HAVE THE PROBLEM CHILD.

5

6 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** OKAY. SO, THAT'S AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM
7 AND WE'LL COME BACK IN NOVEMBER WITH UPDATES AND WHERE PEOPLE
8 AND ARE AND WHY -- OR WHERE JURISDICTIONS AND WHY. THANK YOU,
9 COLLEAGUES FOR THOSE GOOD QUESTIONS. MOVING TO ITEM 3B, MTC
10 RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4651 AND 4652, AND THIS IS ALLOCATION OF
11 440 MILLION -- .9 MILLION -- SORRY -- FOR FISCAL YEAR 2024,
12 2025 TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT MONEY AND TRANSIT -- STATE
13 TRANSIT ASSISTANCE AND REGIONAL MEASURE TWO AND AB1107 FUNDS
14 TO FOUR TRANSIT OPERATORS AND MTC TO SUPPORT TRANSIT
15 OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE REGION. WELCOME.

16

17 **LUIS GARCIA:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS. LUIS GARCIA WITH MTC
18 FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM STAFF TO PRESENT THIS ITEM. THIS
19 ITEM PROPOSES AND BEGINS THE ANNUAL ALLOCATION OF TDA, STA
20 RM2, AND AB 1107 FUNDS TO VTA, AC TRANSIT, TRIPLE CTA, AND VTA
21 AND MTC FOR A TOTAL \$450 MILLION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2025. THESE
22 FUNDS WILL SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN
23 THE REGION. ADDITIONAL INFORMATION ON THE BUDGET AND
24 OPERATIONS THOSE OPERATORS CAN BE FOUND IN ATTACHMENT A.
25 LASTLY, ATTACHMENT B TO THE COVER MEMO INCLUDES A SUMMARY OF



JUNE 12, 2024

1 STATUS OF SB125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES FOR OPERATORS
2 THAT SUBMITTED A CLAIM THIS MONTH. STAFF WILL RETURN IN JULY
3 TO PRESENT AN UPDATE ON THE STATUS OF REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY
4 MEASURE IMPLEMENTATIONS FOR OTHER LARGE OPERATORS RECEIVING
5 SB125 FUNDS. HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

6

7 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON
8 THIS ITEM?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
11 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
12 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
13 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

14

15 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. I WANTED TO
16 ACKNOWLEDGE, COLLEAGUES, THAT BART WAS GOING TO PRESENT,
17 BECAUSE YOU MAY RECALL, WE HAD ASKED FOR AGENCIES TO COME
18 FORWARD. THEY DID NOT, IN PART, BECAUSE WE HAD SB -- THE
19 DISCUSSION WE HAD THIS MORNING, THE SPECIAL MEETING, SO THEY
20 WILL BE COMING TO US NEXT MONTH. I SEE NO QUESTIONS. MAY I ASK
21 FOR A MOTION FOR RESOLUTIONS 4651, 4652, 4653, AND 4655, AND
22 SENDING THIS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN, MOVE APPROVAL.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** FLEMING, SECOND.

2

3 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. NICK,
4 COMMENTS?

5

6 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** UM. OF COURSE. I LOVE MY ACCOUNTABILITY. I
7 HAVE ONE QUESTION ON THE ACCOUNTABILITY SIDE OF THINGS. I
8 THOUGHT THIS WAS INCREDIBLY HELPFUL TO HAVE THIS LAID OUT, AS,
9 LIKE, THIS IS WHAT WE RECOMMENDED. BUT IT WASN'T ENTIRELY
10 CLEAR TO MERE, LIKE, IF THEY HAD -- LIKE, WHERE THE TRANSIT
11 AGENCIES HAVE ACTUALLY IMPLEMENTED THE RECOMMENDATION, OR WERE
12 WORKING TO IMPLEMENT THE RECOMMENDATION OR HAND IMPLEMENTED
13 THE RECOMMENDATIONS. I'M LOOKING AT -- IT SEEMS LIKE THE
14 RECOMMENDATION WAS OPERATOR SIGN UPS WOULD BE, SORT OF,
15 STANDARDIZED THROUGHOUT THE REGION SO THE SCHEDULE CHANGES
16 COULD HAPPEN AT THE SAME TIME SO WE HAVE BUSES MEETING TRAINS
17 AND BUSES MEETING BUSES. I COULDN'T UNDERSTAND -- I MIGHT NEED
18 A RED, SORT OF, CHECK OR GREEN CHECK -- OR ACROSS MY, SORT OF,
19 LEVEL TO UNDERSTAND IT. BUT COULD YOU HELP WITH THAT?

20

21 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I CAN TRY, I WANT TO NOTE IN JULY WE'LL BE
22 BRINGING BACK AN ITEM THAT'S RELATED TO COMPREHENSIVE
23 ACCOUNTABILITY METRICS AND WILL HAVE CHECKS THOSE KIND OF
24 THINGS.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES ARE HELPFUL, AND THE
2 OTHER THING OPERATING CAPITAL SIDE FOR TOC, IT WOULD BE
3 HELPFUL WHEN WE DO THESE CAPITAL ALLOCATIONS KIND OF LIKE THIS
4 ALLOCATION IS SUBJECT TO THE TOC POLICY, CHECK, THEY'RE
5 WORKING ON IT OR CROSS OR SOMETHING LIKE THAT. BECAUSE I HAVE
6 GOTTEN INTO A HOT MESS WITH THAT BEFORE [LAUGHTER] SO, I THINK
7 IT WOULD BE HELPFUL TO JUST HAVE THAT CLARITY SO THAT PEOPLE
8 LIKE ME DON'T RUNOFF OUR MOUTHS ABOUT PROGRAMS THAT SHOULD BE
9 COMPLIED WITH IT. OC THAT ACTUALLY DON'T NEED TO BE. THROUGH
10 THE CHAIR.

11

12 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I THINK THAT IS REALLY A GOOD IDEA
13 BECAUSE I THINK IT WOULD MAKE IT EASIER FOR US TO UNDERSTAND
14 WHAT THE STAFF IS PRIORITIZING FOR EACH OF THE PROJECTS, BUT
15 ALSO WHAT WE SHOULD BE FOCUSED ON, AND I RECOGNIZE THINGS LIKE
16 THAT ARE NOT STATIC, THEY'RE GOING TO BE ITERATIVE, BUT I
17 THINK THAT IS A REALLY EXCELLENT POINT. AND IT MIGHT
18 INDICATION IS EVEN EASIER. SOMETIMES THE REPORTS, FRANKLY,
19 BECAUSE THEY'RE WRITTEN BY DIFFERENT DEPARTMENTS, SOMETIMES
20 BECAUSE THEY HAVE DIFFERENT PEOPLE OR DIFFERENT APPROACHES,
21 BEING CONSISTENT IN REPORTING WOULD HELP THE BOARD TO WEIGH IN
22 AND EASIER TO SEE IF SOMETHING'S MISSING. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT
23 WITH MOTION AND SECOND WITH RECORD ADDITIONAL DIRECTION FOR
24 CHECK BOXES AND APPROPRIATE POLICIES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED BY
25 THE BOARD FOR PROJECTS. ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM MY COLLEAGUES?



JUNE 12, 2024

1 SEEING NONE. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK FOR ALL IN FAVOR TO SAY AYE.

2 [AYES]

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ANY OPPOSED? ANY ABSTENTIONS? AND THAT
5 PASSES WITH ALL MEMBERS PRESENT, UNANIMOUSLY. I LEFT IT -- I
6 GOT IT OUT OF ORDER THERE, BUT I'M GOING TO GET IT BY THE END
7 OF MEETING. ALL RIGHT. MOVING TO ITEM 3C, ADOPTION OF RM3 SAFE
8 ROUTES TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL GRANT PROGRAM GUIDELINES.

9 WELCOME.

10

11 **KARL ANDERSON:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CHAVEZ AND COMMISSIONERS. GOOD
12 AFTERNOON. I'M KARL ANDERSON WITH MTC STAFF. ITEM 3C PROPOSES
13 THE ADOPTION OF REGIONAL MEASURE 3 STATE ROUTES TO TRANSIT AND
14 BAY TRAIL GRANT PROGRAM GUIDELINES. REGIONAL MEASURE 3,
15 PROJECT NUMBER FOUR, PROVIDES 150 MILLION IN FUNDING FOR A
16 COMPETITIVE GRANT PROGRAM TO FUND BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN
17 ACCESS IMPROVEMENTS ON AND IN THE VICINITY OF STATE OWNED TOLL
18 BRIDGES CONNECTING TO RAIL TRANSIT STATIONS AND FERRY
19 TERMINALS. MTC IS THE PROJECT SPONSOR, AND MTC RESOLUTION
20 4639, AS PROPOSED TODAY, WOULD ESTABLISH MTC POLICIES,
21 PROCEDURES AND PROJECT SELECTION CRITERIA SPECIFIC TO THE SAFE
22 ROUTES TO TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL PROGRAM. THE PROPOSED SET OF
23 GUIDELINES FOR THE PROGRAM IS ATTACHMENT ONE TO THIS MEMO. MTC
24 STAFF DEVELOPED THE PROPOSED GUIDELINES FOR THE SAFE ROUTES TO
25 TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL PROGRAM IN CLOSE COLLABORATION TO ENSURE



JUNE 12, 2024

1 CONSISTENCY WITH MTC PRIORITIES AND TO ADVANCE THE OBJECTIVES
2 OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. STAFF SOLICITED INPUT FROM PARTNER
3 AGENCIES THROUGH MTC'S ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION WORKING GROUP,
4 LOCAL STREETS ROADS WORKING GROUP, PROGRAMING AND DELIVERY
5 WORKING GROUP, AND TWO DEDICATED GUIDELINES DEVELOPMENT
6 WORKSHOPS HOSTED IN SPRING OF 2024 TO DEVELOP THE PROPOSED
7 GUIDELINES. THE CURRENT GUIDELINES ECHO THE SAFE ROUTES TO
8 TRANSIT PROGRAM DEVELOPED UNDER REGIONAL MEASURE TWO WITH
9 ADDED EMPHASIS ON BAY TRAIL PROJECTS TO REFLECT PROGRAM'S
10 INTENT AS APPROVED UNDER RM3. OVERALL, THE PROPOSED GUIDELINES
11 ARE STRUCTURED TO PRIORITIZE PROJECTS THAT OFFER CLEAR
12 BENEFITS IN IMPROVING REAL AND PERCEIVED SAFETY FOR ACTIVE
13 TRANSPORTATION USERS, INCREASING ACCESS TO PUBLIC
14 TRANSPORTATION, ENHANCING THE BAY TRAIL NETWORK, AND REDUCING
15 CONGESTION ON STATE OWNED TOLL BRIDGE CORRIDORS. STAFF
16 RECOMMENDS THE STATE ROUTES TO TRANSIT AND BAY TRAIL PROGRAM
17 CONSIST OF TWO CYCLES. THE CALL FOR PROJECTS FIRST CYCLE OF
18 STATE ROUTES TRANSIT PROGRAM COULD BE RELEASED THIS JULY WITH
19 UP TO \$7 MILLION AVAILABLE. STAFF ANTICIPATES THAT THE CALL
20 FOR PROJECTS FOR THE SECOND CYCLE OF THE PROGRAM WILL OCCUR IN
21 THE SUMMER OF 2026. NEXT I WILL HIGHLIGHT TWO NEW PROPOSALS.
22 FIRST, STAFF RECOMMENDS SETTING ASIDE UP TO \$25 MILLION THIS
23 CYCLE FOR TRANSFORMATIVE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROJECT
24 APPLICATIONS. SECOND, STAFF RECOMMENDS ESTABLISHING A TARGET
25 OF \$3 MILLION PER CYCLE OF SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT BAY TRAIL



JUNE 12, 2024

1 FUNDS FOR QUICK-BUILD STYLE PROJECTS. THE GOAL OF THE TARGET
2 IS TO ENCOURAGE QUICK BUILD AND QUICK BUILD STYLE PROJECT
3 APPLICATIONS THROUGHOUT THE REGION THAT WILL IMPLEMENT INSTANT
4 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS THAT ADVANCE OBJECTIVES OF THE
5 PROGRAM AND MAXIMIZE SAFETY BENEFITS OF AVAILABLE FUNDS. TO
6 MAINTAIN ALIGNMENT WITH THE OTHER MTC PLANNING INITIATIVES,
7 STAFF ALSO RECOMMENDS PRIORITIZING PROJECTS THAT FURTHER
8 REGIONAL OBJECTIVES AS DISCUSSED IN THE STAFF REPORT. STAFF
9 RECOMMEND THAT THE APPLICATIONS BE REVIEWED AND EVALUATED BY
10 MULTI-DISCIPLINARY EVALUATION COMMITTEE COMPOSED OF MTC STAFF
11 AND EXTERNAL PARTNERS. THE PROPOSED GUIDELINES INCLUDE THE
12 APPLICATION EVALUATION CRITERIA AND ASSOCIATED SCORE STRUCTURE
13 FOR THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE TO RANK APPLICATIONS. IN CLOSING,
14 STAFF RECOMMENDS REFERRING MTC RESOLUTION 4639 TO THE
15 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AND AUTHORIZING THE CALL FOR PROJECTS
16 UPON THE COMMISSION'S APPROVAL OF THE GUIDELINES. THAT
17 CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

18

19 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO FIRST SEE IF
20 THERE ARE ANY COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE, NO ONE IN THE
23 BOARDROOM, AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

24



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING NOW COME BACK TO MY
2 COLLEAGUES TO SEE IF ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? IF
3 NOT, I WOULD LIKE AN ENTHUSIASTIC MOVE OF APPROVAL.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** MOTION TO APPROVE.

6

7 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** OKAY THAT WAS PRETTY ENTHUSIASTIC. ALL
8 RIGHT WE HAVE A SECOND THERE. MOTION AND SECOND. MARGARET MADE
9 THE MOTION. VICTORIA MADE THE SECOND. SEEING NO OTHER
10 COMMENTS. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR SAY AYE?

11

12 **AYES.**

13

14 **>>CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ABSTENTIONS? NO-NOS. MOTION PASSES
15 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. NOW WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO
16 ITEM 3D. AND IF I CAN -- SO, ITEM 3D. THANK YOU. AND THAT IS
17 FOR MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4411, REVISED, INITIAL PROGRAMMING
18 OF RM3 DUMBARTON CORRIDOR IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS CATEGORY. ALL
19 RIGHT. WELCOME. BOSS

20

21 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS CRAIG B MTC STAFF
22 PROGRAMMING OF REGIONAL MEASURE 3 DUMBARTON CORRIDOR
23 IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT CATEGORY UNDER RM3 CAPITAL PROGRAM. NEXT
24 SLIDE. RM3 STATUTE CATEGORY 130000000 DOLLARS TO FUND PLANNING
25 ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW DESIGN CONSTRUCTION CAPITAL PROJECTS



JUNE 12, 2024

1 WITHIN DUMBARTON BRIDGE CORRIDOR ALAMEDA SAN MATEO COUNTIES TO
2 RELIEVE CONGESTION INCREASE PERSONAL THROUGHPUT AND OFFER
3 RELIABLE TRAVEL TIMES STATUTE INCLUDES NON-EXHAUSTIVE LIST OF
4 ELIGIBLE PROJECTS ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION, SAN MATEO
5 COUNTY TRANSIT DISTRICT SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
6 AUTHORITY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN WORKING WITH COSPONSOR STAFF
7 MTC STAFF RECOMMENDS DISTRIBUTION OF THIS PROGRAM BASED ON
8 FOLLOWING PRINCIPLES FIRST GEOGRAPHIC SPONSORED BALANCE 25% OF
9 FUNDING DESIGNATED BY EACH OF ALAMEDA COUNTY, SAN MATEO COUNTY
10 AND BATA ENTITIES REMAINING 25% COMPETITIVE BASED ON APPLYING
11 THESE PRINCIPLES TO THE REQUESTS THAT ARE SUBMITTED. SECOND
12 RETAINING PURCHASING POWER OF RM3 WITH FOCUS ON NEAR-TERM
13 CAPITAL PROJECTS, THIRD REDUCING CONGESTION IN THE CORRIDOR,
14 AND FOURTH CONSISTENCY WITH PLANNED BAY AREA AND REGIONAL
15 POLICIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THERE IS A LOT ON THIS SLIDE.
16 I'LL TALK THROUGH IT A BIT. MTC STAFF SOLICITED PROJECT
17 PROPOSALS FROM SPONSORS SUBMISSIONS TOTAL \$235 MILLION,
18 INCLUDING ONE HUNDREDS 5 MILLION IN PROJECTS FROM ALAMEDA
19 COUNTY, 115 MILLION SAN MATEO COUNTY AND 15 MILLION FROM BATA
20 PROPOSED DISTRIBUTIONS OF SUBMISSIONS ACCORDING TO
21 DISTRIBUTION PRINCIPLES FROM LAST SLIDE SHOWN HERE IN INTEREST
22 TIME SLIDES DETAILING PROJECTS HAVE BEEN MOVED TO APPENDIX OF
23 THIS PRESENTATION SHOW GRAPHICS PROJECT SCOPE PHASE TOTAL COST
24 SCHEDULE OVERALL FUNDING RECOMMENDATION FOR SIX PROJECTS
25 ALAMEDA COUNTY TOTALING \$72 MILLION CONSIST OF UN-UNION CITY



JUNE 12, 2024

1 BART ENTRANCE AND GRADE CROSSING ADJACENT COMPLEMENTARY
2 PROJECTS DECOTO ROAD COMPLETE STREETS I-880 DECOTO INTERCHANGE
3 MODERNIZATION FREMONT QUARRY LAKE PARKWAY UNION CITY THORNTON
4 AVENUE COMPLETE STREETS BAY TRAIL NEWARK AND DUMBARTON BRIDGE
5 TO QUARRY LAKE TRAIL IN FREMONT. FUNDING RECOMMENDED FOR PRO
6 PROJECTS SAN MATEO COUNTY TOTALING \$53 MILLION. SAN MATEO
7 DUMBARTON BUSWAY AND 101 STATE ROUTE 84 REIMAGINED PROJECT.
8 RM3 FUNDS PROGRAMMED TO IMPROVE THE PROJECT COMPETITIVENESS IN
9 2024 CYCLE OF SB1 TRADE CORRIDOR ENHANCEMENT PROGRAM OR TCEP.
10 IF THE PROJECT IS NOT AWARDED IN THIS STATE GRANT, PROGRAMMING
11 OF RM3 FUNDS TO THIS PROJECT MAY BE REEVALUATED. FINALLY, \$5
12 MILLION IS RECOMMENDED FOR BATA FOR DUMBARTON FORWARD
13 OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS. TODAY'S RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE
14 MTC RESOLUTION 4411 REVISED WITH THE INITIAL PROGRAMMING
15 OUTLINED TODAY. STAFF WILL BRING PROPOSED ALLOCATIONS TO
16 COMMISSION FOR CONSIDERATION ON ROLLING BASIS AS PROJECTS ARE
17 READY IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE RM3 POLICIES AND PROCEDURES.
18 THANK YOU. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS

19

20 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING FIRST TO THE PUBLIC
21 TO SEE IF THERE ARE ANY COMMENTS.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE DO HAVE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE.
24 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI, IF YOU COULD UNMUTE YOURSELF.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING. SORRY I'M NOT
2 ABLE TO BE WITH YOU TODAY. I'M IN NEW YORK FOR A WEDDING. THAT
3 BEING SAID, I'M CALLING IN ON THIS ITEM IN SUPPORT OF THE
4 DUMBARTON CORRIDOR FUNDING ALLOCATIONS, PROGRAMMING, AND
5 SPEAKING FOR THE CITIES, UNION CITY, FREMONT, NEWARK, WE HAVE
6 BEEN ANXIOUSLY AWAITING THIS DAY SO WE CAN EARMARK AS FIRST
7 STEP IN THE PROCESS OF GETTING THESE IMPORTANT PROJECTS
8 UNDERWAY. THIS IS IMPORTANT FOR THE EAST WEST MOVEMENT FROM
9 ALAMEDA TO SAN MATEO COUNTY, NOT JUST FOR VEHICLES, BUT MORE
10 IMPORTANTLY FOR BUSES. THIS FUNDING IS GOING TO ALLOW US TO
11 WORK ON OUR BUS ONLY LANES AS WELL AS BUS RAPID TRANSIT. SO, I
12 DO APPRECIATE MY COLLEAGUES CONSIDERATION OF SUPPORTING THIS
13 ITEM. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP WE HAVE FLAVIO P.
16 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. CAN YOU HEAR ME?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES, WE CAN.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. THANK YOU. MY NAME IS FLAVIO PEARLMAN. I'M
23 CALLING YOU TO ASK TO YOU PLEASE REMOVE THE QUARRY LAKES
24 PARKWAY IN UNION CITY FROM THE LIST OF PROGRAMMING
25 RECOMMENDATIONS. FIRST THING I WANT TO MENTION, I UNDERSTAND



JUNE 12, 2024

1 THIS IS A LIST SUBMITTED FROM ACTC. HOWEVER, ACTC DID NOT HAVE
2 AN AGENDAIZED PUBLIC DISCUSSION ON THIS TOPIC. SO, THE PUBLIC
3 DID NOT HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT ON WHAT'S IN THAT LIST
4 OR NOT. AND THE QUARRY LAKES PARKWAY IN UNION CITY IS HIGHLY
5 CONTROVERSIAL AND DEEPLY UNPOPULAR PROJECT IN OUR AREA. THE
6 CHANGE.ORG PETITION GOT MORE THAN \$1,000 SIGNATURES AGAINST
7 THIS PROJECT. IT PROPOSES TO RUN A LARGE FOUR-LANE ARTERIAL
8 THROUGH NEIGHBORHOODS WHERE MANY FAMILIES LIVE, CREATING A
9 BARRIER TO WALKABILITY. ONE EXAMPLE IS A SEVEN-LANE
10 INTERSECTION PROPOSED BETWEEN HIGH-DENSITY HOUSING AND THE
11 BART STATION, MAKING IT HARD TO WALK TO THE BART STATION. IT
12 DUMPS MASSIVE AMOUNTS OF TRAFFIC INTO THE [INDISCERNIBLE]
13 NEIGHBORHOOD, WITH MULTIPLE SCHOOLS, ONE AN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL.
14 IT REMOVES TWO WATER RETENTION BASINS AND CONSOLIDATES INTO
15 ONE OFF-SITE, WATER RETENTION BASIN WHICH REMOVES HYDROLOGICAL
16 BUFFER, WHICH WE REALLY NEED RIDE NOW. PROJECT IS BASED ON EIR
17 FROM 2009. SO, 15 YEARS OLD; VERY OUTDATED EIR. ACTC ASKED
18 UNION CITY TO UPDATE IT, BUT ALL THEY DID WAS SUBMIT A LETTER
19 FROM THEIR ATTORNEY THAT STATED THEY'RE NOT REQUIRED TO UPDATE
20 IT. I'M ASKING TO YOU REMOVE THE QUARRY LAKE PARKWAY IN UNION
21 CITY FROM THE PROGRAMMING RECOMMENDATION SO THAT YOU CAN DO
22 DUE DILIGENCE ON THAT PROJECT, AND, ALSO, ASK ACTC TO HAVE THE
23 PUBLIC AGENDAIZED DISCUSSION ON WHAT IS IN THIS LIST AND WHAT
24 ISN'T. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GOODBYE.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, CALLER. NEXT UP WE HAVE DIANE
2 SHAW.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THIS IS DIANE SHAW REPRESENTING
5 FREMONT NEWARK AND HAYWARD. I USED TO DRIVE TAKE THIS PUBLIC
6 TRANSIT CORRIDOR EAST WEST WHEN I WORKED AT SAMTRANS THIS
7 CORRIDOR HAS NEEDED THIS KIND OF FUNDING FOR A LONG TIME I
8 LOOK FORWARD TO MOVING FORWARD WITH THESE PROJECTS SO WE CAN
9 START TO PUT THINGS IN PLACE TO KEEP THE BUS PRIORITY LANES
10 THAT WE NEED AND THE OTHER WORK THAT WE NEED TO DO IN ORDER TO
11 MOVE PEOPLE THAT GO FROM UNION CITY BART STATION ALL THE WAY
12 OVER TO SAN MATEO COUNTIES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR WORK
13 HERE AND I LOOK FORWARD TO MOVING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU CALLER. NEXT UP WE HAVE ADINA
16 LEVIN, TRANSBAY COALITION.

17

18 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN SPEAKING TRANSBAY COALITION SPEAKING
19 WITH LOCAL TRANSIT ADVOCACY COALITIONS. AS AN INDIVIDUAL, I
20 LIVE IN THE MENLO PARK ON THE WEST SIDE OF THE DUMBARTON
21 CORRIDOR, AND I AM GENERALLY EXTREMELY HAPPY TO SEE A LOT OF
22 THE PROJECTS MOVING FORWARD, IMPROVING THE TRANSIT AND ACTIVE
23 TRANSPORTATION OVER THE DUMBARTON CORRIDOR AND LOOKING AT
24 PROJECTS ACROSS THE CORRIDOR CONNECTING PEOPLE FROM POINT A TO
25 POINT B. THE ONE THING I WOULD LIKE TO CALL OUT THAT IS NOT



JUNE 12, 2024

1 DIRECTLY IN HERE, BECAUSE RM3 DOES FOCUS SEW CAPITAL, IS
2 SOMETHING RELATED THAT WAS SUFFERED IN THE VERY INITIAL
3 ANALYSIS OF THE TRANSIT 2050+, WHICH IDENTIFIED THE DUMBARTON
4 CORRIDOR AS AN AREA THAT HAD SIGNIFICANT SERVICE GAP IN TERMS
5 OF TRANSIT. SO, WE'RE MAKING IT POLL FOR THE BUSES TO GO
6 FASTER. BUT THE DUMBARTON BUS DOES NOT RUN. IT HAS NOT RUN ON
7 THE WEEKEND, IN A WORLD WHERE WE SEE, YOU KNOW, OFF-PEAK
8 TRANSIT USE, AND YOU KNOW, PEOPLE WITH NON-WHITE COLLAR JOBS,
9 ALL KINDS OF TRANSIT TRIPS OF AN INCREASING SHARE OF THE
10 REGION AND WE ALSO HAD LONG-STANDING INTENT TO SERVE REDWOOD
11 CITY AND THAT IS NOT YET HAPPENING HOPING TO SEE OPERATIONAL
12 IMPROVEMENTS IN THE TRANSIT 2050 COMING FORWARD THAT IS
13 COMPLEMENTARY TO THE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS AND LASTLY I WOULD
14 LIKE TO SUPPORT WHAT FLAVIO PEARLMAN SAID BEFORE ME, AND THIS
15 IS THE QUARRY LAKES PARKWAY WAS CONTROVERSIAL AT ACTC AND IT
16 HAS NOT COME BEFORE ACTC, AND I THINK THIS BODY SHOULD LOOK
17 FOR TO THE LOCALS FOR THAT DISCUSSION BEFORE SUPPORTING IT.
18 THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE ADDITIONAL CALLER. IS THAT
21 OKAY?

22

23 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES. THIS WILL BE OUR LAST PERSON. THANK
24 YOU.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ANNE ELDRED. IF YOU COULD PLEASE UNMUTE
2 YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MY NAME IS ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED,
5 AND I ENGAGE WITH AN ADVISOR BODIES UNDER THE POLICY ADVISORY
6 COUNCIL. I WANT TO SUPPORT TWO COMMENTS MADE, ONE BY -- TWO BY
7 ADINA LEVIN. BUT, REALLY NEEDING TO LOOK AT THE OPERATIONAL
8 SUPPORT, BUT, ALSO, THE ISSUE THAT'S BEEN RAISED AROUND THE
9 QUARRY LAKES PORTION IS REALLY DISTURBING. IT'S ESSENTIAL THAT
10 WE MEET WITH OUR LOCAL COMMUNITY, THE AMOUNT OF CONTROVERSY
11 THAT HAS BEEN -- THAT HAS COME UP AROUND THIS ISSUE IS -- I
12 MEAN, IT'S REALLY HIGH, AND WITHOUT THE OPPORTUNITY FOR A
13 DIALOGUE, WE DON'T HAVE THE ABILITY TO TRY AND FIND A SOLUTION
14 THAT ISN'T JUST CREATING MORE PROBLEMS FOR THE SAME FOLKS THAT
15 WE SAY WE WANT TO HELP. SO, I JUST -- I WOULD REALLY LOVE TO
16 SEE THAT PORTION OF IT HELD UNTIL SOME LEVEL OF APPROPRIATE
17 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT CAN HAPPEN. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO CLOSE THE PUBLIC
20 COMMENT. I'M GOING TO COME BACK TO MY COLLEAGUES FOR COMMENTS
21 AND QUESTIONS. I'LL START WITH GINA THEN GO THIS WAY.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I SUPPORT THE ALLOCATION TO
24 SAN MATEO COUNTY ON THESE TWO PROJECTS HERE. WHAT I'M CONFUSED
25 ABOUT IS WHY STAFF HAS LIMITED THE LEVERAGING FUNDS TO SB1?



JUNE 12, 2024

1 THIS INTERCHANGE PROJECT IS SO SIGNIFICANT, NOT ONLY TO SAN
2 MATEO COUNTY, BUT THE REGION, THE 101-84 INTERCHANGE FEEDS
3 INTO THE REDWOOD CITY PORT WHERE ALL OF THE BUILDING MATERIALS
4 FOR THE ENTIRE REGION PASS THROUGH HERE. SO, OF COURSE, WE
5 WANT THIS BUILT. WE WANT TO FULLY FUND IT. BUT IT LOOKS LIKE
6 STAFF IS -- YOU KNOW, HAD LIMITED IT TO WHAT LEVERAGING FUNDS
7 CAN BE OBTAINED HERE. AND THEY DIDN'T LIMIT ANY OTHER FUNDING
8 IN THIS WAY, JUST THIS FUNDING. AND, YOU KNOW, I -- I'M JUST
9 NOT COMFORTABLE. I KNOW THE LANGUAGE WAS TWEAKED SOMEWHAT TO
10 SAY THAT IT WOULD BE REEVALUATED IF THEY COULDN'T GET IT THEN
11 RETURN TO SOURCE HERE. FROM THE POINT OF SAN MATEO COUNTY,
12 HERE, WE'RE LOOKING AT WHAT WAS DESCRIBED AS BALANCED FUNDING.
13 SO, WE HAVE EVERY ANTICIPATION, EVERY COMMITMENT THAT THIS
14 DOES GO THROUGH, AND THE LEVERAGE -- AND THE FUNDING IS
15 LEVERAGED, WHETHER IT'S STATE FUNDING OR FEDERAL FUNDING, BUT
16 TO HAVE IT KIND OF PENDING IN SUCH A WAY, I DON'T THINK IS
17 REALLY APPROPRIATE. SO, CAN WE WORK THIS OUT THAT -- I MEAN,
18 THE CEQA IS DONE FOR THIS. THIS IS WHAT'S GREAT ABOUT ALL
19 THESE PROJECTS IS THEY'RE, LIKE, READY TO GO IN THE NEXT 1 TO
20 2 YEARS HERE. SO WE REALLY WANT TO SEE THEM HAPPENING, BUT I -
21 - I'M CONCERNED.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

24



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. ALIX BOCKELMAN,
2 CHIEF DEPUTY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I THINK THE WAY THIS ITEM WAS
3 PUT TOGETHER WAS REALLY MEANT TO JUST MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN
4 DELIVER ON ALL OF THESE PROJECTS. IT'S OUR UNDERSTANDING THAT
5 MOST OF THE PROJECTS, THIS RM3 PROGRAMMING WOULD BE A LAST
6 DOLLAR IN. THAT'S A LITTLE DISTINCT FROM THE 10184 WE IMAGINED
7 WHICH DOES STILL NEED -- IT HAS A SIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF
8 FUNDING, LOCAL FUNDING, BUT IT STILL DOES NEED A SIGNIFICANT
9 CHUNK OF FUNDS. SO, THE LANGUAGE IN THERE WAS REALLY MEANT TO
10 JUST MAKE SURE THAT WE -- THAT WE ARE ABLE TO DELIVER THE
11 PROJECT AND THAT WE DON'T, SORT OF, LOSE BUYING POWER BY
12 STRANDING DOLLARS ON A PROJECT FOR TOO LONG. SO, I THINK WE
13 THOUGHT THAT SB1T -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WAS OF THE MOST NEAR-TERM
14 AVAILABLE FUNDING SOURCE FOR THIS TO COMPETE FOR. BUT I DO
15 THINK STAFF IF THERE IS ANOTHER NEAR-TERM OPPORTUNITY WITH
16 FEDERAL DOLLARS, I THINK THAT CERTAINLY CONSISTENT WITH THE
17 SPIRIT OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO HERE. I THINK WE'RE SAYING
18 THAT AT SOME POINT IF WE'RE NOT SUCCESSFUL SAN MATEO AND THE
19 COMMISSION MAY WANT TO CONSIDER OTHER PRIORITIES. BUT
20 CERTAINLY THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS I THINK THERE IS OPPORTUNITY
21 FOR THE STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDS. SO I THINK THAT WAS REALLY
22 THE SPIRIT BY THIS WE PUT THIS ITEM TOGETHER.
23



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **GINA PAPAN:** I APPRECIATE YOUR SPIRIT. [LAUGHTER] I ALSO
2 UNDERSTAND IT THAT THE SB1 FUNDING CAN GO THROUGH TO VARIOUS
3 CYCLES HERE. CAN WE OPEN THE DOOR MORE SO -- I MEAN, THIS --
4

5 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** DO YOU WANT TO MAKE SURE THE LANGUAGE
6 GIVES YOU THE FLEXIBILITY TO USE WHATEVER FUNDING IS
7 AVAILABLE?
8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH CAN YOU DO THAT?
10

11 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YEAH WE CAN MAKE A CHANGE BETWEEN THIS
12 COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSION TO REFLECT --
13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GREAT.
15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** SHE SIMPLIFIES THINGS SO NICELY. YES WE ALL WANT
17 TO SEE THIS. THANK YOU.
18

19 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** NATE?
20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I'M ON THE ALAMEDA COUNTY
22 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. AND IT'S UNFORTUNATE COMMISSIONER
23 DUTRA-VERNACI IS NOT HERE. BECAUSE UNION CITY, NEWARK, AND
24 FREMONT ARE MORE IN HER AREA. AS A COUNTY SUPERVISOR, I
25 REPRESENT OAKLAND, CASTRO VALLEY AND PLEASANTON. AND WHEN



JUNE 12, 2024

1 CAROL TALKED TO ME ABOUT THIS ON ISSUE, OR THIS WHOLE ITEM,
2 THERE WAS NO CONVERSATION ABOUT QUARRY LAKES. SO I'M NOT
3 FAMILIAR WITH ANY CONTROVERSY THERE, AND I DON'T KNOW IF STAFF
4 HAS ANY UNDERSTANDING OF THAT? AND IF WE WERE TO PULL THAT
5 OUT, IS THERE ANY PROBLEM WITH THAT? AND REFER IT BACK TO
6 ACTC? YOU KNOW, I'M JUST NOT SURE.

7

8 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THERESA?

9

10 **THERESA ROMMELL:** SORRY. I WAS GOING RESPOND THAT WHAT IS
11 BEFORE YOU TODAY IS A PROGRAM, A PROJECT THAT REFLECTS
12 PRIORITIES THAT WERE COMMUNICATED TO US FROM ACTC AND THE
13 OTHER PROJECT SPONSORS. WE'RE NOT ALLOCATING ANY FUNDS AT THIS
14 TIME. SO, PRIOR TO ALLOCATION, WE WOULD HAVE ACTC BOARD
15 APPROVAL, SO THERE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY TO DISCUSS THIS PROJECT
16 IN THAT VENUE BEFORE IT EVEN COMES BACK TO THE COMMISSION --

17

18 **NATE MILEY:** OKAY.

19

20 **THERESA ROMMELL:** -- FOR AN ALLOCATION --

21

22 **NATE MILEY:** THANKS. THAT WORKS.

23

24 **THERESA ROMMELL:** SO WE WILL BE DOING RFP.

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ANY COMMENTS? NICK.

4

5 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I'M NOT SUPER FAMILIAR WITH THE QUARRY LAKES
6 PROJECTS. BUT I HAVE HEARD ABOUT ADVOCATES FOR A WHILE. I
7 WOULD BE, WHEN IT COMES BACK, INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING HOW
8 PUTTING A NEW EXPRESSWAY THROUGH A RESIDENTIAL NEIGHBORHOOD IS
9 CONSISTENT WITH PLANED BAY AREA AND THE COMMISSION'S GOALS PER
10 SLIDE -- WHATEVER IT IS -- THREE. [LAUGHTER] BECAUSE, IT MAY
11 NOT BE. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ALL RIGHT. ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM STAFF?
14 SO, ON THIS ITEM, THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM TO -- WAIT A MINUTE.
15 YES. AM I RIGHT ABOUT THIS, COLLEAGUES? THIS IS FOR 411? YES.
16 OKAY. SO, HERE IS WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO ASK FOR IS A MOTION
17 WITH THE CHANGES THAT HAVE BEEN DISCUSSED. AND I HAVE AN IDEA
18 ABOUT QUARRY LAKES THAT I WANT TO RAISE. BUT WOULD ANYBODY
19 LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE THE MOTION AS WE DISCUSSED
22 HERE, BUT ALSO I'M LOOKING FOR SOME ASSURANCES THAT WHATEVER
23 PORTION -- AGAIN, I HAVE A FIRM BELIEF THAT THE TWO SAN MATEO
24 PROJECTS ARE GOING TO GO FULL AHEAD HERE. BUT WE NEED TO KNOW



JUNE 12, 2024

1 THAT THE RM3 MONEY IS GOING TO BE BALANCED IN THE FUTURE
2 SHOULD ANY CATASTROPHE HAPPEN?

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** WHAT DOES THAT MEAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** IN OTHER WORDS, ALAMEDA COUNTY IS GETTING THE VAST
7 MAJORITY OF THE 130 MILLION, AND SAN MATEO COUNTY IS GETTING,
8 I BELIEVE, 53%. SO, IF -- I MEAN, GOD FORBID -- [LAUGHTER] --
9 REALLY. IF SOMETHING HAPPENS WITH THESE PROJECTS, AND THE
10 STAFF IS REEVALUATING IT, I NEED TO KNOW THAT THAT'S GOING TO
11 STAY IN SAN MATEO COUNTY AND NOT GO ELSEWHERE. BECAUSE IT
12 NEEDS TO BE BALANCED, AS FAR AS REGIONAL MEASURE 3.

13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I DON'T -- CAN YOU DO --

15

16 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THE CHALLENGE WE HAVE IN THESE PRO- -- ANDREW
17 FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR -- THE CHALLENGE WE HAVE IN THESE
18 PROGRAM FUNDS IS YOU RELY ON THE SPONSORS BEING ABLE TO
19 NAVIGATE A DECISION THAT IS FAIR. WE HAD A STRUGGLE WHERE WE
20 WERE NOT A SPONSOR. THIS ONE, BATA IS A SPONSOR WITH THE STATE
21 ROUTE 37 CORRIDOR; THEY EVENTUALLY GOT TO TERMS. BUT THERE IS
22 REALLY NOTHING IN RM3 POLICY OR LEGISLATION THAT REQUIRES THE
23 BALANCE. WE DO TRY TO LOOK AT STAFF A LOT MORE HOLISTICALLY AT
24 TIMES. IN OTHER WORDS, BRIDGE TOLL MONEY HAS INVESTED QUITE A
25 BIT OF REVENUE IN RINGING THE BAY FOR EXPRESS LANES ON 880 AND



JUNE 12, 2024

1 101, AS WELL AS INVESTING IN DUMBARTON FORWARD AND TRYING TO
2 MOVE GOOD IMPROVEMENTS THROUGH. THE CHALLENGE WITH THE ALAMEDA
3 SIDE IS THE SAME AS SAN MATEO'S, IF THEY CAN'T DELIVER, WE'RE
4 GOING TO COME BACK AND ASK FOR REPROGRAMMING OF MONEY TO PUT
5 IT TO WORK. BECAUSE THAT'S THE GOAL WITH RM3. BECAUSE WE ALL
6 KNOW IT LOSES VALUE. BUT THERE IS NOTHING REALLY ESTABLISHED
7 WITH, SORT OF, EQUAL DISTRIBUTION. WE'RE VERY SUPPORTIVE OF
8 TRYING TO FIND SOLUTIONS THAT WORK WELL, INCLUDING, HOPEFULLY,
9 WHAT THE BUS WAY PLANNING WORK HAS.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN:** WE'RE ALL IN AGREEMENT ON THAT. BUT WE HAVE TO
12 RESPOND TO VOTERS HERE WHO VOTED FOR REGIONAL MEASURE 3 TOO.

13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** MAY I PUT A THOUGHT ON THE TABLE? I
15 UNDERSTAND WHAT YOU'RE SAYING. TWO THINGS IN THE MOTION. SO,
16 WE HAVE A MOTION. DO WE HAVE A SECOND? THANK YOU, NATE. I
17 THINK THE FIRST PART OF THE MOTION IS MAKING SURE THERE IS
18 FLEXIBILITY IN TERMS OF WHAT RESOURCES CAN BE USED. THE SECOND
19 -- WHAT I WOULD RECOMMEND IS THAT THERE BE A MECHANISM. I KNOW
20 YOU HAVE ONE, WHICH IS TO REACH OUT TO FOLKS AND SAY, HEY
21 WE'RE GETTING CLOSE. WE THINK THE MONEY NEEDS TO BE SPENT. BUT
22 IF THAT MECHANISM CAN BE MORE -- THE CONVERSATIONS THAT WOULD
23 NEED TO BE HAPPENING WITH THE JURISDICTIONS WHERE THE MONEY IS
24 AT NEED TO BE CLEAR SO THERE IS A HEADS-UP THAT, FRANKLY, THE
25 DISCUSSION WOULDN'T JUST BE SAN MATEO, MIGHT BE SAN MATEO WITH



JUNE 12, 2024

1 ALAMEDA THINKING A BIT ABOUT OPPORTUNITIES FOR REPROGRAMMING.
2 AND IF IT'S CLEAR AND IT'S TRANSPARENT, IT GIVES EVERYBODY
3 OPPORTUNITY TO HAVE THE KIND OF DISCUSSIONS THAT, I THINK,
4 GINA, YOU MAY BE TALKING ABOUT.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** I APPRECIATE THAT. WE'RE LOOKING AT TRANSPORTATION
7 AND FUTURE FUNDING FOR TRANSPORTATION AND ALL OF THAT STUFF.
8 EVERY COUNTY AND JURISDICTION NEEDS TO KNOW THEY'RE GETTING
9 THEIR FAIR SHARE. SO, THAT WOULD BE SUFFICIENT AT THIS POINT
10 IN TIME. BUT WE NEED TO BE VERY CAREFUL. AND STAFF HAS BEEN
11 VERY HELPFUL.

12

13 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YEAH, NO. WE CAN COMMIT AND DO THAT MAYBE A
14 LITTLE MORE UNOFFICIALLY THAN --

15

16 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** IF IT'S CLEAR AND PEOPLE KNOW MONEY IS
17 NOT GOING TO BE LEAVING AND GIVING OPPORTUNITY TO LEVERAGING
18 RESOURCE AT STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL.

19

20 **ANDREW FREMIER:** JUST ASK THAT WE'RE CAREFUL ABOUT WHERE YOU'RE
21 DECIDING TO CUT THE CLOTH. RM3 IS A BRIDGE TOLL INVESTMENT
22 SPREAD OUT THROUGHOUT THE REGION DELIVERING GOOD REGIONAL
23 PROJECTS THAT ARE IDENTIFIED IN LAW. SO, I THINK WE DO, IN THE
24 LARGE EXCEL SPREADSHEET THAT CALCULATES HOW MONEY RETURNS BACK



JUNE 12, 2024

1 TO VOTERS, WE DO A GOOD JOB WITH IT. AND, SO, I'M HAPPY TO
2 INCLUDE THAT IN DISCUSSION IF YOU'RE ACCEPTING OF THAT.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I THINK IF WHAT YOU'RE SUGGESTING IS
5 CLARITY IN TERMS OF THE DISCUSSION PROCESS --

6

7 **ANDREW FREMIER:** YES.

8

9 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** -- AND TIMELINES, BECAUSE I KNOW THIS IS,
10 FOR LACK OF A BETTER WORD, A LITTLE BIT ITERATIVE. IF THERE IS
11 MORE CLARITY, THEN PEOPLE KNOW WHAT'S EXPECTED OF THEM AND
12 WHAT THEY NEED TO DO IN THEIR OWN COMMUNITIES TO BE READY TO
13 SPEND THIS RESOURCE.

14

15 **ANDREW FREMIER:** NO. ABSOLUTELY. THE BRIDGE TOLL MONEY HAS BEEN
16 PUT TO WORK WELL IN THESE CORRIDORS. 880 EXPRESS LANES CAME
17 THROUGH A DIFFERENT WAY OF GETTING BRIDGE TOLL MONEY TO WORK.
18 SAME THING HAS HAPPENED WITH FILLING -- \$100 MILLION WENT TO
19 SAN MATEO 101 THROUGH BRIDGE TOLL MONEY. THE DUMBARTON
20 CORRIDOR IS GETTING FEDERAL WELL -- AS WELL, AND THE DUMBARTON
21 CORRIDOR IS ON BOTH SIDES. WE'RE HAPPY TO DO EXACTLY WHAT YOU
22 HAVE ASKED.

23

24 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GREAT. LET ME SEE. ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A
25 MOTION AND SECOND. NATE, DID YOU WANT TO MAKE A COMMENT?



JUNE 12, 2024

1

2 **NATE MILEY:** YES. QUARRY LAKE.

3

4 **CHAIR CINDY CHAVEZ:** OH, AND THEN YOU WERE GOING TO TALK ABOUT
5 QUARRY LAKE.

6

7 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** WHAT I WAS GOING TO RECOMMEND -- OH.

8

9 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR. RELEVANT TO THAT
10 COMMISSIONER, COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI IS STILL IN THE ZOOM
11 SPACE WITH HER HAND RAISED.

12

13 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** OH. MAY WE TAKE HER COMMENTS BEFORE I
14 COME UP WITH AN IDEA THAT SHE MAY BE --

15

16 **GINA PAPAN:** ABSOLUTELY.

17

18 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I DON'T WANT HER UNHAPPY. ALL RIGHT. GO
19 AHEAD.

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. HAPPY TO
22 HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS QUARRY LAKES PARKWAY. QUARRY
23 LAKES PARKWAY IS NOT AN EXPRESSWAY; IT'S A LOCAL COMPLETE
24 STREETS ROADWAY, TWO LANES IN EACH DIRECTION WITH SEPARATED
25 BICYCLE LANES AND WALKING PATHS. IT IS IN NO WAY AN EXPRESSWAY



JUNE 12, 2024

1 BECAUSE BETWEEN MISSION BOULEVARD AND ALVARADO NILES ROAD
2 THERE WILL BE NO LESS THAN FOUR SIGNALIZED INTERSECTIONS. THAT
3 ROADWAY IS NECESSARY FOR THE ADDITIONAL 2,000 UNITS. WE ARE
4 BUILDING IN THE AREA, AND IN ADDITION TO PUBLIC SAFETY, AS
5 WE'LL DO A DEPRESSED ROADWAY BETWEEN TWO SETS OF RAILROAD
6 TRACKS AND THE BART TRACKS. THAT ROAD IS NECESSARY TO HAVE
7 DECOTO ROAD BE THE BEST RAPID TRANSIT FROM MISSION BOULEVARD
8 ALL THE WAY TO DUMBARTON BRIDGE. WITHOUT QUARRY LAKES PARKWAY,
9 WE CAN'T GET TRANSIT OFF TO DECOTO ROAD AS NECESSARY TO HAVE
10 THAT BUS ONLY LANE. ALSO, WITH QUARRY LAKES PARKWAY THERE, OUR
11 DUMBARTON EXPRESS BUS WILL HAVE DIRECT ACCESS TO THE EAST SIDE
12 OF BART STATION AND HAVE IT INSTEAD OF HAVING TO TAKE THE
13 ROUTE THAT NOW TAKES DOWN TO DECOTO ROAD UP INTO THE BART
14 STATION. SO, THE TRANSIT IS VERY IMPORTANT BOTH FOR THE BUS
15 PORTION AS WELL AS BICYCLES AND PEDESTRIAN. SO WE HAVE, IN
16 UNION CITY, HELD MULTIPLE PUBLIC MEETINGS. THE SPEAKER YOU
17 HEARD FROM EARLIER CALLING IT AN EXPRESSWAY AND EVERYTHING
18 ELSE IS NOT A UNION CITY RESIDENT. HE LIVES IN FREMONT. SO, I
19 WOULD APPRECIATE YOUR CONSIDERATION. COMMISSIONER MILEY, I'M
20 SORRY I DID NOT GO INTO MORE DETAIL ABOUT THE HISTORY OF
21 QUARRY LAKES PARKWAY WITH YOU, BECAUSE YOU WOULD HAVE BEEN
22 BETTER PREPARED TO ADDRESS THIS. HOWEVER, I AM LISTENING, SO
23 IF THERE IS QUESTIONS, YOU HAVE FOR ME NOW, I'M MORE THAN
24 HAPPY TO ANSWER THEM. OH, I ALSO -- CAN I ADD ONE MORE THING
25 THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT --



JUNE 12, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ABSOLUTELY.

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI, VICE CHAIR:** -- FOR OUR PROJECT. I DID
5 SPEAK WITH CHAIR CHAVEZ A COUPLE OF DAYS AGO ABOUT THIS, AND
6 THE ONE THING THE COMMISSION NEEDS TO UNDERSTAND IS TO GET OUR
7 LOCAL ROADWAY THIS IS ALSO IMPORTANT FOR A 500 PLUS UNIT
8 HOUSING PROJECT THAT IS ON THE FORMER CALTRANS PROPERTY THAT
9 UNION CITY IS TAKING OVER. WITH THE SALE OF THAT PROPERTY FOR
10 HOUSING -- AND WE ARE IN EXCLUSIVE NEGOTIATING AGREEMENT WITH
11 A DEVELOPER AS WE SPEAK -- AND WITH THE SALE OF THAT, IT WILL
12 BRING IN AN APPRAISED \$86 MILLION. AND UNION CITY IS IN A
13 LOWER SPOT TO RECEIVE ANY OF THAT MONEY. AND IN THE FIRST
14 PLACE, IT WILL GO TO VTA NEAR AND DEAR TO COMMISSIONER
15 CHAVEZ'S HEART, TO REPAY A LOAN THAT HAS BEEN OUTSTANDING FOR
16 YEARS. AND THEN WE HAVE GOT SOME OTHER FOLKS IN FRONT OF UNION
17 CITY, AND UNION CITY WOULD ULTIMATELY BENEFIT FROM ANY MONEYS
18 LEFT OVER TO MOVE FORWARD OUR PROJECT IN THAT AREA. SO, THIS
19 IS A VERY COMPLEX PROJECT. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING WITH ALL OF
20 THE REGULATORY AGENCIES, THE ARMY CORP OF ENGINEERS, THE FLOOD
21 CONTROL FOLKS, YOU NAME IT. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING DILIGENTLY ON
22 THIS. IT'S NOT AN EASY PROJECT. AS A MATTER OF FACT, UNION
23 CITY HAD TO TAKE OVER THE PROJECT WHEN IT WAS UNDER THE
24 SPONSORSHIP OF THE ALAMEDA COUNTIES TRANSPORTATION BECAUSE
25 THINGS JUST WEREN'T MOVING WE TOOK IT OVER A FEW YEARS BACK



JUNE 12, 2024

1 AND STARTED FROM SCRATCH AND GOT IT TO WHERE IT IS TODAY TO BE
2 A COMPLETE STREETS VERY BEAUTIFUL TRANSIT ORIENTED MULTI-MODAL
3 CORRIDOR. SO AGAIN LOCAL ROADWAY NOT AN EXPRESSWAY.

4

5 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ANDY? FOREMEN CONTEXT THAT MIGHT BE
6 HELPFUL GENERATIONALLY. THIS IS THE REMNANT OF THE AREA OF
7 HAYWARD BYPASS WHICH WAS A LONG-TERM PROJECT THAT CALTRANS
8 NEVER WAS ABLE TO SUCCESSFULLY TO GET THROUGH THE CHARGES. THE
9 COMMISSIONER IS RIGHT THIS IS A COMPLICATED AREA AND IS TRYING
10 TO CREATE A SOLUTION THAT WORKS IN TODAY'S ENVIRONMENT THROUGH
11 WHAT IS GOING TO BE A LARGE FREEWAY GOING THROUGH CITIES. SO
12 THE REMNANTS AND CLOSE OUT IS REALLY A HISTORY ASSIGNMENT FOR
13 SOME OF US ON WHAT IT TAKES TO KIND OF CONNECT COMMUNITIES
14 AGAIN. SO, I JUST WANT TO APPRECIATE THE CHALLENGES THAT THE
15 LOCALS HAVE IN TRYING TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO SOLVE IT PROPERLY
16 IN TODAY'S ENVIRONMENT.

17

18 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. NATE?

19

20 **NATE MILEY:** I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI' THOROUGH
21 EXPLANATION. IT'S VERY HELPFUL. AND ALSO WHAT ANDY JUST
22 MENTIONED BECAUSE I'M QUITE FAMILIAR WITH THE HISTORY OF
23 HAYWARD BYPASS AND I ACTUALLY VOTED AGAINST THAT WHEN I BECAME
24 A COUNTY SUPERVISOR BACK IN 2,000. SO IF THIS IS A REMNANT OF



JUNE 12, 2024

1 THAT, THEN YES I CAN UNDERSTAND. SO I'M COMFORTABLE WITH WHERE
2 WE ARE.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THE ONLY THING, ACTUALLY, WAS
5 GOING TO SAY IS THAT CAROL SHOULD BE HERE, I WAS GOING TO SAY
6 I WISH WE COULD HAVE THAT CONVERSATION WITH CAROL. ONE THING I
7 WOULD RECOMMEND BECAUSE THIS WILL CERTAINLY GET ATTENTION FROM
8 OUR COLLEAGUES -- NOW THIS WILL GO TO THE FULL BOARD, CORRECT?
9 OKAY. WOULD BE PERHAPS TO PREPARED TO TALK ABOUT THE HISTORY
10 WITH THE BOARD BUT THE OTHER IS I THINK ALL AGENCIES
11 SPONSORING THIS SHOULD SEND IN A LETTER OF SUPPORT JUST TO BE
12 CLEAR ABOUT THAT THEY DID ALREADY GO THROUGH WHATEVER
13 PROCESSES THEY V I DIDN'T SEE THAT IN MY PACKET. IF IT WAS
14 HERE I APOLOGIZE FOR MISSING IT. IF NOT IF WE COULD ASK THEM
15 IF THEY HAVE DONE THAT TO SEND US WHAT THEY HAVE.

16

17 **ANDREW FREMIER:** BEFORE THE MONEY GOES TO THE PROGRAM WE NEED A
18 RESOLUTION FROM THESE BOARDS TO APPROVE. BORROW HAND.

19

20 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YOU DID A GOOD JOB OF EXPLAINING THAT AND
21 I WOULD START THAT WITH THIS. ALL RIGHT HAVE A MOTION AND
22 SECOND. ANY DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION? I WANT TO THANK ALL
23 CALLERS FOR EDUCATING US. APPRECIATE THAT. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR
24 PLEASE SAY BY AYE. [AYES]

25



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ANY OPPOSED? AND THAT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY.

2 COLLEAGUES, I --

3

4 **SPEAKER:** ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

5

6 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. I'M SO SORRY. WITH
7 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU. COLLEAGUES, WE HAVE TWO
8 INFORMATIONAL ITEMS. AND I RECOGNIZE I TOLD MY COLLEAGUES WE
9 WOULD BE DONE BY TEN AFTER 12. SO, I HAVE LOST CREDIBILITY
10 WHERE YOU. IF WE COULD HAVE THE INFORMATION PRESENTATIONS A
11 LITTLE BRIEF. THAT WAY THE COMMITTEE UNDERSTANDS WHAT'S BEFORE
12 THEM. I DON'T KNOW WHO IS PRESENTING THE NEXT ITEM. I
13 APOLOGIZE.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** CHAIR CHAVEZ, WE CAN BE BRIEF; BUT ALSO IF --
16 3E IS IN YOUR PACKET, AS WELL AS 3F. SO, IF YOU ALL WANT TO,
17 ALSO, PERUSE IT THAT'S AN OPTION.

18

19 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M SURE PEOPLE DID. I THINK WE SHOULD DO
20 THAT. I'M SORRY YOU HAD TO WAIT SO LONG. AND I AM SURE YOU
21 WERE GOING TO BE BRILLIANT YOU DID A GOOD JOB IN WHAT'S
22 WRITTEN. THANK YOU FOR THAT. WE'LL MOVE TO OUR LAST COUPLE OF
23 ITEMS.

24



JUNE 12, 2024

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR. I'M SORRY, JUST FOR
2 HOUSEKEEPING REASONS, CAN WE JUST MAKE SURE THERE IS NO PUBLIC
3 COMMENT ON EITHER OF THOSE?

4

5 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENT ON, EITHER, ITEM
6 3.E OR 3.F?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I SEE NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE. THERE IS
9 NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
10 RECEIVED.

11

12 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. AND THANK YOU KATHLEEN FOR
13 CATCHING THAT. IS THERE ANYBODY THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK TO AN
14 ITEM THAT IS WITHIN THE PURVIEW OF THIS COMMITTEE BUT NOT ON
15 THE AGENDA TODAY? DO WE HAVE ANYBODY IN THE CHAMBERS, OR?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS A LAG SOMETIMES ON ZOOM. BUT I'M
18 SEEING NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE. NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND
19 NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

20

21 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO CLOSE PUBLIC
22 COMMENT AND GO TO ITEM FIVE. THIS IS TO ADJOURN. OUR NEXT
23 MEETING IS JULY 10TH, RIGHT HERE. AND THANK YOU, ALL. THANK
24 YOU STAFF. [ADJOURNED]

25



NTT

Broadcasting Government