METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	WEDNESDAY, MARCH 26 TH , 2025, 9:40 AM
3	
4	
5	
6	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING
7	OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. THIS MEETING IS
8	WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE
9	PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE
10	RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON
11	THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE
12	CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.
13	ROLL CALL VOTE FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. ITEM ONE ROLL CALL
14	PLEASE.
15	
16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR NOACK?
17	
18	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?
21	
22	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
25	



1	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
4	
5	EDDIE AHN: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ANDERSEN?
8	
9	CANDACE ANDERSEN: HERE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ASHCRAFT?
12	
13	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: HERE.
14	
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BURT?
16	
	PAT BURT: HERE.
18	CIEDE EIMPEDIV WADD. DI _ TAMANICVO
20	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EL-TAWANSY?
	DINA EL-TAWANSY: HERE.
22	tarrange : manu :
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
24	,
25	VICTORIA FLEMING: HERE.



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GIACOPINI?
3	
4	DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOHN-BAPTISTE?
7	
8	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: HERE.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN IS ABSENT. MAHAN?
11	
12	MATT MAHAN: HERE.
13	
14	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MANFREE? COMMISSIONER MELGAR? MILEY?
15	
16	NATHAN MILEY: HERE.
17	
18	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?
19	
20	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS?
23	
24	BELIA RAMOS: HERE.
25	



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? 1 2 3 LIBBY SCHAFF: HERE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT. 6 7 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM TWO, CHAIR'S REPORT. 8 NOTHING. AGENDA ITEM 2A, MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4694 RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION FOR HAROLD ON THE OCCASION OF HIS RETIREMENT 9 FROM MTC. HAROLD IS RETIRING THIS MONTH AFTER 23 YEARS OF 10 SERVICE AS THE COMMISSION'S AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY SPECIALIST. 11 AS IS CUSTOMARY I'LL WHERE FREEZING RAIN FROM READING THE 12 RESOLUTION BUT READ PASSAGES TO APPRECIATE HAROLD'S 13 CONTRIBUTION IN THE COURSE OF CAREER IN PUBLIC SERVICE THAT 14 15 BEGAN 37 YEARS AGO. THE REGIONAL GOVERNMENT AGENCY TO WHICH 16 HAROLD FIRST LENDED SKILLS IS TO SOUTHEAST MICHIGAN COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS TO DECADES OF AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY WORK 17 INVOLVING COMMUNICATION WITH OTHER METROPOLITAN PLANNING 18 ORGANIZATIONS INCLUDING MTC EVENTUALLY LENDED TO A SERIES OF 19 CONVERSATIONS WITH THEN MTC PLANNING DIRECTOR CHRIS, THAT 20 21 PEAKED HAROLD'S INTEREST -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WHO WRITES THIS STUFF? SORRY. [LAUGHTER] WHEREAS HAROLD'S TECHNICAL ANALYSIS 22 OF PROJECT LEVEL EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS INFORMING FUNDING 23 DECISIONS AND GRANT APPLICATIONS HELPING TO DIRECT INVESTMENTS 24

TOWARD CLEAN AIR TRANSPORTATION SOLUTIONS. TO CALIFORNIA AIR



1	RESOURCES	BOARD	AND	EMISSIONS	MODEL,	MISSING	OPPORTUNITY	TO

- 2 NAVIGATE THE WORLD OF -- [INDISCERNIBLE] 2025 DELAYED THIS
- 3 YEAR. WHEREAS HERALD PARTICIPATED IN REGIONAL PLANS FROM
- 4 TRANSPORTATION 2030 TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ TEAMED WITH
- 5 COLLEAGUES FROM MTC'S FUNDING SECTION ON ENUMERABLE UPDATES TO
- 6 TIP AND JOINT FORCES WITH COUNTERPARTS AT THE BAY AREA AIR
- 7 DISTRICT ON A PHOTO CHEMICAL MODELING STUDY TO CURB OZONE
- 8 EMISSIONS. AND WHEREAS JUST AS HAROLD HAS DEMONSTRATION OF
- 9 COMMITMENT TO CLEAN AIR SO TOO DEDICATING HIMSELF TO CLEAN
- 10 PLAY ON THE PITCH BEGINNING HIS CAREER AS A MICHIGAN HIGH
- 11 SCHOOL SOCCER REFEREE IN THE LATE 1990S. A CALLING HE PURSUED
- 12 AFTER RETURNING TO THE BAY AREA BY AFFILIATING WITH TWO EAST
- 13 BAY REFEREE ASSOCIATIONS. THEREFORE IT BE RESOLVED THAT STAFF
- 14 AND COMMISSIONERS AT MTC THANK HAROLD FOR DECADES OF SERVICE
- 15 TO THE AGENCY AND THE PEOPLE OF THE BAY AREA, SALUTING LONG
- 16 LASTING CONTRIBUTIONS TO AIR QUALITY, ALLEGIANCE TO UNIVERSITY
- 17 OF MICHIGAN, AND EXTEND BEST WISHES TO HAROLD, HIS WIFE,
- 18 FLORENTINE, AND THEIR DAUGHTER HARPER FOR GOOD TIMES, GOOD
- 19 GAMES GRAND ADVENTURES AND UNPARALLELED SUCCESS ON THE ROAD TO
- 20 ELWOOD. GO BLUE! I'M MISSING THAT. CONGRATULATIONS, HAROLD, ON
- 21 YOUR UPCOMING RETIREMENT. SO GLAD TO HAVE YOU WITH US THIS
- 22 MORNING. ARE THERE ANY VALEDICTORY -- VALADIC -- SORRY --
- 23 WORDS YOU WANT TO SHARE WITH YOUR COLLEAGUES [LAUGHTER] OR
- 24 COMMISSION? SOMEONE HAS TO GIVE ME SIMPLER WORDS TO READ.



- 1 SPEAKER: THE ELWOOD IS A BAR YEAH THAT I USED TO LIVE ACROSS
- 2 THE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] YEAH, OLD FASHIONED BAR, KIND OF DECO
- 3 STUFF GOING ON. AND IT'S SUCH A GOOD BAR, SMALL BAR, WHEN THEY
- 4 BUILT THE NEW FOOTBALL STADIUM IN DETROIT, NEW BASEBALL
- 5 STADIUM IN DETROIT, THEY LITERALLY PICKED UP THE BAR AND MOVED
- 6 IT CLOSER TO THE FOOTBALL STADIUM. ANYWAYS. WANT TO SAY GOOD
- 7 MORNING, COMMISSIONERS AND EVERYONE. I'M HAROLD BRAZIL, IN THE
- 8 PLANNING SECTION SINCE 2002. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
- 9 OPPORTUNITY TO TALK TODAY AS I START THE NEXT PHASE OF MY
- 10 LIFE. MY CAREER JOURNEY IN REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLANNING
- 11 ACTUALLY STARTED IN DETROIT IN 1988 WHEN I STARTED AS AN
- 12 INTERN AT SIMCOG, AND AT THE TIME THE FEDERAL TRANSIT
- 13 ADMINISTRATION WAS STILL CALLED UMTA. BUT, YOU KNOW, I THINK
- 14 FTA SOUNDS BETTER I'M GLAD THEY CHANGED IT. THE CLEAN AIR ACT
- 15 WAS AMENDED IN 1990 AND ICED TEA PASSED RIGHT AFTER THAT.
- 16 THOSE TWO ACTIONS DIRECTED MY CAREER PATH TO WHERE I AM TODAY.
- 17 I HAD MY FIRST INTERVIEW FOR THIS JOB OVER LANDLINE PHONE IN
- 18 MY APARTMENT IN DETROIT, AND THE INTERVIEW WAS ACTUALLY AN
- 19 ENJOYABLE EXPERIENCE WHERE I REMEMBER PEOPLE LAUGHING
- 20 THROUGHOUT THE INTERVIEW. SO, I FELT PRETTY GOOD ABOUT THE
- 21 INTERVIEW. ANYWAYS, THE WORK, ITSELF, I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED
- 22 WITH DURING MY TIME AT MTC HAS BEEN TRULY YOU REWARDING. AND
- 23 MY JOB HAS INCLUDED SEVERAL PROJECTS AND MULTIPLE COMMITTEES
- 24 WORKING WITH OUR COLLEAGUES AT THE AIR DISTRICT. I ALWAYS FELT
- 25 I HAD THE BEST OF TWO WORLDS BY BEING EMPLOYED AT MTC AND



- 1 HAVING A GREAT SOURCE OF KNOWLEDGE AND INSIGHT PROVIDED BY THE
- 2 AIR DISTRICT. IT REALLY HELPED ME DO MY WORK BY BEING
- 3 CONNECTED TO THE AIR DISTRICT. BUT LOOKING BACK AT MY TIME AT
- 4 MTC, I THINK ABOUT MTC'S OAKLAND DAYS AND GOING OUT TO LUNCH
- 5 AND HAVING A GREAT COMMUTE BECAUSE THE OFFICE WAS ON TOP OF A
- 6 BART STATION. BUT I WILL SAY THIS, I HAVE LEARNED TO
- 7 APPRECIATE SAN FRANCISCO AND IT'S BEEN GREAT TO WITNESS ALL
- 8 THE DEVELOPMENT THAT'S BEEN HAPPENING AROUND THE AREA HERE.
- 9 AGAIN, WHEN I STARTED AT MTC, I WAS A BACHELOR WITH TEN-PLUS
- 10 YEARS OF EXPERIENCE IN TRANSPORTATION AND AIR QUALITY
- 11 PLANNING. NOW, AFTER BEING INVOLVED WITH -- I COUNTED FIVE
- 12 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLANS [LAUGHTER] AND SEVERAL
- 13 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS, I'M NOW A 20-YEAR MARRIED
- 14 GUY WITH A DAUGHTER GETTING READY TO START COLLEGE IN HER OWN
- 15 LIFE JOURNEY. SO, IN CLOSING I WANT TO EXPRESS MY GRATITUDE
- 16 AND APPRECIATION FOR SUPPORT AND FRIENDSHIPS HERE. I WISH
- 17 EVERYBODY CONTINUED SUCCESS, MUCH SUCCESS WITH PLANNED BAY
- 18 AREA 2050+. I'M SURE IT WILL BE A WINNING ACHIEVEMENT, DAVE,
- 19 YOU KNOW, SO [LAUGHTER] -- AND BEST WISHES TO EVERYONE GOING
- 20 FORWARD AND THANKS AGAIN. AND, "GO BLUE." [LAUGHTER]

- 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: HAROLD, WOULD YOU MEET THE CHAIR AT THE
- 23 PODIUM.
- 24
- 25 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: DO THE MOTION FIRST?



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: IT'S UP TO YOU.
3	
4	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: WELL, I'M STANDING.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE YOU GO.
7	
8	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ANYBODY HAVE COMMENTS OR CAN I GET A MOTION
9	AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE RESOLUTION?
10	
11	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: ASHCRAFT
12	
13	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. ANY
14	ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? OKAY. CAN WE HAVE OH, ANY SORRY
15	PUBLIC COMMENTS?
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING I SEE
18	NO RAISED HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED
19	THE PODIUM.
20	
21	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ALL RIGHT. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR NOACK?
24	
25	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?



1	
2	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: YES.
3	
4	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
5	
6	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
7	
8	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER AHN?
9	
10	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
11	
12	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON.
13	
14	CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE.
15	
16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BURT?
17	
18	PAT BURT: YES.
19	
20	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
21	
22	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
23	
24	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOHN-BAPTISTE?



1	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE:	AYE.
2		
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:	KAPLAN IS ABSENT. MAHAN?
4		
5	MATT MAHAN: AYE.	
6		
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:	MANFREE? COMMISSIONER MASHBURN?
8		
9	MITCH MASHBURN: AYE.	
10		
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:	MELGAR? MILEY?
12		
13	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.	
14		
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:	PAPAN?
16		
17	GINA PAPAN: AYE.	
18		
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:	RAMOS? IS.
20		
21	BELIA RAMOS: YES.	
22		
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:	THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
24	ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.	



- CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM 2B WHICH 1 IS NEW COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS. THANK YOU, EVERYONE, COLLEAGUES 2
- 3 FOR YOUR INPUT AND INTEREST IN STANDING COMMITTEES AND OTHER
- MEETING BODIES. I DID MY BEST TO MAKE ASSIGNMENTS IN 4
- 5 ACCORDANCE WITH PREFERENCES BUT NOTE THERE WAS MORE INTEREST
- IN SOME COMMITTEES THAN COMMITTEE SEATS SO YOUR COMMITTEE 6
- ASSIGNMENTS REFLECT MY JUGGLING ACT. INCLUDING CHAIR AND VICE 7
- 8 CHAIR ASSIGNMENTS WHERE APPROPRIATE I APPRECIATE YOUR INTEREST
- AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING CLOSELY WITH ALL OF YOU IN YOUR 9
- NEW ROLES. ANY QUESTIONS ON THE COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS? NO? OH, 10
- JUGGLING ACT WORK DONE PRETTY WELL. OKAY MOTION AND SECOND TO 11
- APPROVE THE NEW COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS? 12
- VICTORIA FLEMING: SECOND, FLEMING. 14
- 16 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: MOTION AND SECOND. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS?
- ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS? 17
- CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO 19
- ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM. 20
- 22 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
- CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR NOACK. 24

13

15

18

21

23



1	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS.
4	
5	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: YES.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
8	
9	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANN?
12	
13	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON?
16	
17	CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT?
20	
21	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
24	
25	DAVID CANEPA: YES.



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? 3 VICTORIA FLEMING: AYE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN IS ABSENT. MAHAN? PAPAN? 6 7 8 GINA PAPAN: AYE RAMOS? 9 10 BELIA RAMOS: YES. 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 12 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 13 14 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. MOVE ON TO ITEM THREE WHICH IS 15 16 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIR CARINA LIEU WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE YOUR REPORT? WELCOME. 17 18 CARINA LIEU: GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS CARINA LIEU AND I 19 RECENTLY WAS THE ELECTED THE CHAIR OF THE POLICY ADVISORY 20 21 COUNCIL. SO I'M HERE TO PRESENT THE REPORT FOR FEBRUARY 25TH, 22 2025'S MEETING. WE COVERED THREE ITEMS AND HELD AN ELECTION. I REPRESENT OAKLAND AND ALAMEDA COUNTY AND I'LL BE SERVING UNTIL 23 DECEMBER 2025. AND OUR NEW VICE CHAIR IS GABRIELA ORANTES WHO 24

IS BASED IN SONOMA COUNTY AND SHE WAS ELECTED ALONG WITH ME



- 1 AND NOTABLY, WE ARE BOTH YOUNG PARENTS AND SO IT'S VERY
- 2 EXCITING FOR US TO BE ABLE TO HAVE THE LEADERSHIP SEAT IN THE
- 3 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. AND I'M HONORED TO BE ABLE TO SERVE
- 4 IN THIS CAPACITY BECAUSE OUR COUNCIL IS VERY INTELLIGENT AND
- 5 VERY, VERY THOUGHTFUL. SO, THE THREE TOPICS THAT WE DISCUSSED,
- 6 THE FIRST ONE IS PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, THE IMPLEMENTATION
- 7 PLAN UPDATE. AND IN THAT PRESENTATION, STAFF HIGHLIGHTED
- 8 ACHIEVEMENTS OVER THE PAST FOUR YEARS AND DISCUSSED THE PUSH
- 9 FOR UNIFIED REALTIME SYSTEMS AMONGST TRANSIT OPERATORS. THERE
- 10 WAS DISCUSSION ABOUT THE PUBLIC OPINION SHIFTS, AND POLITICAL
- 11 WILL, PARTICULARLY DUE TO ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES AND WORK-
- 12 FROM-HOME SCENARIOS. THE STAFF ALSO DISCUSSED SURVEY
- 13 DISTRIBUTION AND HOW EARLY STAGES OF DEVELOPING THE
- 14 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN WILL SUPPORT THE -- I'M SORRY -- HOW THE -
- 15 THE ENGAGEMENT STRATEGIES USED IN THIS PLAN WILL SUPPORT THE
- 16 EARLY STAGES FOR DEVELOPING THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN OF TRANSIT
- 17 2050+. THE COUNCIL MEMBERS WERE VERY INTERESTED IN SUPPORTING
- 18 TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS THAT ENHANCE LOCAL TRANSIT SERVICES AND
- 19 FASTER MORE RELIABLE PROJECTS. THEY WERE VERY INTERESTED IN
- 20 THE ABILITY TO BUILD ON PAST ENGAGEMENT PROCESS SAYS AND
- 21 EXPLORE NEW OPPORTUNITIES TO TARGET NON-TRANSIT USERS. AND
- 22 SOME OF THE NEXT STEPS WOULD BE THAT THE COUNCIL MEMBERS WOULD
- 23 BE INTERESTED IN HELPING TO DISTRIBUTE THE SURVEYS, ESPECIALLY
- 24 FOR THE NEXT ROUND PLANNED FOR THE SUMMER. NEXT WE RECEIVED AN
- 25 UPDATE ON THE DRAFT TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. THE



- 1 PRINCIPLES AND THE POLLING UPDATES AND I WON'T GO INTO THE
- 2 DETAILS OF THAT BECAUSE YOU HAVE HEARD THAT UPDATE. BUT THE
- 3 COUNCIL MEMBERS WERE VERY INTERESTED IN THE NEED FOR MORE
- 4 RELIABLE DATA, PARTICULARLY IN THE NORTH BAY. SECOND, THEY
- 5 WERE CONCERNED WITH ASSURANCES AROUND FEDERAL FUNDS SECURITY
- 6 AND EMPHASIS ON FAIRNESS AND CONTRIBUTIONS FROM ALL COUNTIES,
- 7 AND, FINALLY, THEY WERE INTERESTED IN UPDATES ABOUT POTENTIAL
- 8 AMENDMENTS TO SB63, WHICH WE DID RECEIVE SOME YESTERDAY. AND
- 9 THE THIRD ITEM, WE TALKED ABOUT IS THE COUNCIL WORKPLAN. SO,
- 10 COUNCIL'S WORKPLAN ADDRESSES THESE KEY AREAS, PLANNED BAY AREA
- 11 2050+, TRANSIT 2050+, THE TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE AND
- 12 CORRIDOR PRICING. OUR COUNCIL IS VERY INTERESTED IN EQUITY,
- 13 PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT, DISABILITY COMMUNITY NEEDS AND
- 14 SUSTAINABILITY OF TRANSIT SERVICES. AND THEREFORE THEY ARE
- 15 ALSO INTERESTED IN THE EOUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES METHODOLOGY
- 16 AND CONTINUING THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT INITIATIVES.
- 17 COUNCIL MEMBERS ARE ALSO VERY INTERESTED IN THE COMBINED
- 18 COUNCIL AND ITS ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE AND BEING ABLE TO
- 19 WEIGH IN ON WHAT THAT STRUCTURE MAY LOOK LIKE. THEY'RE ALSO
- 20 VERY INTERESTED IN FARE COORDINATION, REALTIME DATA
- 21 STANDARDIZATION AND, PARTICULARLY, VERY INTERESTED IN
- 22 DISABILITY AND SENIOR SERVICES. WE WANT TO CONTINUE SUPPORTING
- 23 TOPICS ABOUT EOUITY AND ACCESS. AND ARE ALSO VERY INTERESTED
- 24 IN THE NEED FOR TRANSIT DISTRICTS TO ADDRESS SEA LEVEL RISE.
- 25 AND, FINALLY, THE COUNCIL SPEAKS VERY FREQUENTLY ABOUT THE



- 1 IMPORTANCE OF DELIVERING SERVICES, NOT JUST COST EFFECTIVELY,
- 2 BUT ALSO TO BUILD TRUST WITH VOTERS, SO MAKING SURE THAT
- 3 INFORMATION THAT THE MTC COMMUNICATES OUT TO VOTERS AND USERS,
- 4 THAT IT'S CLEAR THAT IT MAKES SENSE THAT, IT'S EASY TO
- 5 UNDERSTAND. AND THEY KNOW HOW TO USE THE SYSTEMS AND WITH THEY
- 6 KNOW HOW TO USE THE TOOLS THAT ARE AT THEIR DISPOSAL. THANK
- 7 YOU

8

- 9 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. AND CONGRATULATIONS ON YOUR
- 10 ELECTION, AND PLEASE PASS ON OUR CONGRATULATIONS TO YOUR VICE
- 11 CHAIR AS WELL LIEU.

12

13 SPEAKER: WILL DO.

14

- 15 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? OKAY. ARE THERE
- 16 ANY WRITTEN OR PUBLIC COMMENTS?

17

- 18 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
- 19 WRITING NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND THERE ARE NO
- 20 RAISE HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

21

- 22 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM FOUR IS THE EXECUTIVE
- 23 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FREMIER, YOUR REPORT,
- 24 PLEASE.



- 1 ANDREW FREMIER: THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK AND GOOD MORNING
- 2 COMMISSIONERS IT'S NICE TO SEE SO MANY OF ON YOU THE DAIS
- 3 TODAY. MY FIRST ITEM WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT A LOT MORE AS
- 4 THE DAY PROGRESSES. BUT ON MONDAY SENATORS ARREGUIN AND WIENER
- 5 HELD A PRESS CONFERENCE, CHAIR NOACK AND MTC COMMISSIONER
- 6 JOHN-BAPTISTE REPRESENTING THE CITY OF SAN FRANCISCO AND THE
- 7 MAYOR'S OFFICE HAD OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK THERE WAS A HOST OF
- 8 SPEAKERS LINED UP TO SUPPORT FOR IT SO HOPEFULLY IT BODES A
- 9 LITTLE BIT OF GOOD NEWS AS WE MOVE FORWARD OVER THE NEXT
- 10 CHALLENGING FEW MONTHS ON THAT SUBJECT. ALSO LAST WEEK
- 11 CONTINGENT OF MTC COMMISSIONERS AND ABAG LEADERSHIP WENT TO
- 12 SACRAMENTO ON OUR ANNUAL LEGISLATIVE VISIT WE HAD A SERIES OF
- 13 EFFECTIVE MEETING WHERE IS WE TALKED ABOUT MTC'S TOP
- 14 LEGISLATIVE PRIORITIES WHICH REALLY INCLUDE AGAIN FUNDING FOR
- 15 TRANSIT SERVICES, AS WELL AS AN ASK FOR \$30 MILLION TO HELP
- 16 SUPPORT AND KEEP THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY WORK
- 17 MOVING FORWARD ON A GOOD PACE. I THINK WE WERE WELL-RECEIVED.
- 18 AND I APPRECIATE ALL THE EFFORT THAT STAFF PUT INTO GETTING US
- 19 THERE. ON MARCH 17th, THE DAY BEFORE OUR VISIT, DEPUTY
- 20 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF METRO PLANNING AND POLICY, MATT MALONEY
- 21 AND MYSELF MET WITH COLLEAGUES FROM THE OTHER LARGE MPOS. WE
- 22 ALSO MET WITH LEADERSHIP AT THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES
- 23 BOARD, THE CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, CALTRANS, THE
- 24 CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
- 25 DISCUSSIONS -- OR DEVELOPMENT, REALLY TO DISCUSS THE



- 1 CHALLENGES WE ALL FACE IN MOVING OUR PLANS FORWARD UNDER SB
- 2 375. A LOT OF US WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME CHANGES THAT REALLY
- 3 KIND OF SUPPORT OUR EFFORTS TO BE SUCCESSFUL. THE CHALLENGES
- 4 ARE SIMILAR ACROSS THE STATE, BUT, ALSO, VERY DIFFERENT IN THE
- 5 DIFFERENT LARGE METROPOLITAN AREAS. WE DO EXPECT THAT THE AIR
- 6 RESOURCES BOARD WILL PURSUE CHANGES TO THE EXISTING GREENHOUSE
- 7 GAS TARGETS IN THE COMING MONTHS THROUGH THEIR REGULATORY
- 8 PROCESSES. AND PART OF YOUR LEGISLATIVE STRATEGIES ARE LOOKING
- 9 AT WAYS TO IMPROVE AND BUILD ON THE SUCCESS AND CHALLENGES OF
- 10 A LOT OF THE BILLS THAT ARE IN PLACE. I ALSO WANT TO MENTION,
- 11 RELATIVE TO THE BRIDGES, THE NATIONAL TRANSPORTATION SAFETY
- 12 BOARD ISSUED RECENTLY AN INVESTIGATION BASED ON THE
- 13 CONTAINERSHIP DOLLY'S COLLISION WITH THE FRANCIS SCOTT KEY
- 14 BRIDGE IN BALTIMORE LAST MARCH. THEY BASICALLY FOUND THAT A
- 15 LOT OF OUR OLDER BRIDGES, BRIDGES BUILT BEFORE 1995 NEED TO
- 16 HAVE A RISK ASSESSMENT DONE ON THEIR FENDER SYSTEMS. SEVERAL
- 17 OF OUR BRIDGES, NOT THE BAY BRIDGE, BECAUSE OF THE WORK THAT
- 18 WE'RE DOING WITH CALTRANS ON THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED AS
- 19 NEEDING SOME EFFORT. AS HAS THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE SO WE'RE
- 20 WORKING CLOSELY WITH COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY AND SUPPORTING
- 21 HER EFFORTS WITH WHATEVER RESOURCES SHE NEEDS TO MAKE SURE
- 22 THAT WE'RE ASSISTING IN THE RESPONSE AND MAKING SURE THAT OUR
- 23 BRIDGES ARE IN GOOD SHAPE. WE'RE ALSO IN COMMUNICATION WITH
- 24 THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT TO FOLLOW THEIR LEAD AS WELL
- 25 AND LEARN FROM IT. WE DON'T THINK THAT THERE IS ANYTHING REAL



- 1 SURPRISES BUT IT'S IMPORTANT TO RECOGNIZE THAT THE BRIDGES ARE
- 2 WELL PROTECTED IN THE SHIPPING CHANNELS BUT AS YOU MOVE UP THE
- 3 RIVER AND CONSIDERING AGES OF BRIDGES REALLY MAKING SURE WE'RE
- 4 DOING A QUALIFIED ASSESS OMIT THEM IS IMPORTANT AND AS WE HAVE
- 5 TALKED ABOUT WITH TOLL BRIDGE INCREASES IT'S BATA'S
- 6 RESPONSIBILITY TO FUND THESE KINDS OF IMPROVEMENTS SO WE
- 7 DEFINITELY ANTICIPATE YOUR ENGAGEMENT. I ALSO WANT TO
- 8 APOLOGIZE FOR OUR SPELLING OF BENICIA. I KNOW THERE IS AN "I"
- 9 IN BENICIA, I MISSED THAT ONE. CHAIR MASHBURN. AND WANT TO
- 10 MENTION THAT PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREAS WHICH ARE NOMINATED
- 11 BY LOCAL GOVERNMENTS THAT INCLUDE NATURAL LANDS WORKING LANDS
- 12 RECREATION AREAS URBAN GREEN SPACES AND LOCATIONS WHERE
- 13 NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS CAN BE USED TO ADAPT TO CLIMATE CHANGE
- 14 WHILE GETTING NOMINATED THERE IS ELIGIBILITY FOR FUTURE FUNDS
- 15 ASSOCIATED WITH THEM. SO WE HAVE A WINDOW TO NOMINATE NEW
- 16 PCAS, YOU HAVE A WINDOW ON YOUR LOCAL AREAS, HAVE A WINDOW TO
- 17 OPEN THROUGH MAY 2ND '25, THAT WILL HELP YOU IDENTIFY AREAS
- 18 THAT CAN BE PUT INTO THAT WORK. AND WITH THAT, I WOULD BE
- 19 HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS

- 21 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: GREAT. THANK YOU. I WANT TO ADD MY THANKS TO
- 22 STAFF FOR ALL THE ARRANGING OF THE TRIP TO SACRAMENTO LAST
- 23 WEEK. I THOUGHT IT WAS REALLY WELL DONE AND VERY HELPFUL. PASS
- 24 ON MY THANKS TO EVERYONE. IS THERE ANY COMMISSIONER WHO WOULD



LIKE TO COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? NO? OKAY. ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN 1 PUBLIC COMMENTS OR -- YES. I'M GETTING A NOD. 2 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I'M JUMPING THE GUN. NO WRITTEN 4 5 CORRESPONDENCE FOR THIS ITEM NO RAISED HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM FOR THIS ITEM. 6 7 8 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY GREAT. WE'LL MOVE ON TO ITEM FIVE. 9 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. OOPS. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? GENERAL COMMENTS? OKAY. ITEM SIX WE'LL 10 MOVE ON TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR. INCLUDES ITEMS 6A THROUGH 6I. 11 DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND FOR THE CONSENT CALENDAR? 12 13 SPEAKER: SECOND. 14 15 16 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: [LAUGHTER] OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND. ANDERSEN, ASHBURN. YES. 17 18 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. 20 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? 21 22 ARE THERE ANY WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS OR ANY PUBLIC WISHING TO

23

24

SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES WE DID RECEIVE ONE LETTER OF
2	CORRESPOND FOR ITEM 6D FROM VICTORIA DEWITT THAT WAS POSTED TO
3	THE ONLINE AGENDA AND HIS BEEN DISTRIBUTED TO YOU LAST NIGHT
4	IN E-MAIL. NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND NO ONE IN THE
5	ZOOM SPACE.
6	
7	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ROLL CALL VOTE.
8	
9	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR NOACK.
10	
11	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
12	
13	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS?
14	
15	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: YES.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
18	
19	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
22	
23	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
24	
25	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON?



1	
2	CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE.
3	
4	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT?
5	
6	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE.
7	
8	SPEAKER: YES.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
11	
12	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
13	
14	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
15	
16	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
17	
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOHN-BAPTISTE?
19	
	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: AYE.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN ABSENT. MAHAN?
23	
24	MATT MAHAN: AYE.



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MANFREE? MASHBURN? MELGAR? MILEY?
2	
3	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?
6	
7	GINA PAPAN: AYE.
8	
9	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS?
10	
11	BELIA RAMOS: YES.
12	
13	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
14	ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
15	
16	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO COMMITTEE
17	REPORTS. AGENDA ITEM SEVEN PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS.
18	COMMISSIONER MILEY WILL YOU PLEASE GIVE THE REPORT?
19	
20	NATHAN MILEY: THANK YOU. THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS MET
21	ON MARCH 12th AND REFERRED SIX ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION FOR
22	APPROVAL. FIVE OF WHICH ARE ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. AND THE
23	OTHER ONE IS AS FOLLOWS: ITEM 7A, MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4537
24	REVISED. AROUND OF THE MAJOR PROJECTS ADVANCED POLICY MAP,
25	THIS ITEM WOULD APPROVE THE ADVANCEMENT OF TJPA'S THE PORTAL



- 1 PROJECT INTO THE MAP, LEVEL ONE CONTINGENT FORMATION OF A
- 2 CHANGE CONTROL BOARD WITH MTC AS A MEMBER AND CHARTER EXECUTED
- 3 PRIOR TO THE START OF THE PORTAL PROJECT. PHASE TWO
- 4 PRECONSTRUCTION. IN DEVELOPMENT OF AN UPDATED OPERATING COST
- 5 ESTIMATE AND FUNDING STRATEGY BY DECEMBER 31, 2025. READY FOR
- 6 THE MOTION?

7

9

11

13

15

18

8 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: SURE.

10 NATHAN MILEY: I MOVE MTC RESOLUTION 4537 REVISED.

- 12 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY DO WE HAVE A SECOND?
- 14 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.
- 16 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS FROM
- 17 THE COMMISSIONERS? OKAY. ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?
- 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. I DID RECEIVE ONE LETTER OF
- 20 CORRESPONDENCE FROM ROLAND LEBRUN THAT WAS POSTED TO THE
- 21 ONLINE AGENDA AND DISTRIBUTED TO YOU IN E-MAIL. I DO HAVE IN
- 22 THE BOARDROOM SEBASTIAN PETTY TO SPEAK. AND THEN A COUPLE
- 23 RAISED HANDS IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

25 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY.



1 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONERS SEBASTIAN 2 3 PETTY, SPUR, WE REMAIN CONCERNED ABOUT THE FEDERAL FUNDING ENVIRONMENT AND STATE OF TRANSIT OPERATIONS FINANCES SPUR 4 5 SUPPORTS THE RECOMMENDATION TO ELEVATE PORTAL PROJECT TO LEVEL ONE OF THE MAP AND WE SUPPORT ACCOMPANYING TERMS FOR 6 ADVANCEMENT THIS PROJECT IS ESSENTIAL IN THE LINK IN THE BAY 7 8 AREA CORE REGIONAL RAIL SYSTEM AND WE URGE ITS MOVE FORWARD. 9 THANK YOU. 10 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. 11 12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: IN THE ZOOM SPACE WE HAVE ROLAND LEBRUN 13 14 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES MADAM CHAIR IS THAT CORRECT? 15 16 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES. 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MR. LEBRUN? 18 19 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONERS. ROLAND 20 21 LEBRUN, SAN JOSE. THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY. I'M NOT GOING TO GO THROUGH IT, BUT THE LETTER IN YOUR PACKET INCLUDES A 22 LETTER FROM THE FORMER CHIEF EXECUTIVE WHICH ESSENTIALLY 23 CONFIRMS THE STATEMENT I MADE AT PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS, 24

THAT THE PROJECT, AS PROPOSED, WILL NEVER BE ABLE TO



- 1 ACCOMMODATE FULL-LENGTH HIGH SPEED TRAINS WITHOUT COMPROMISING
- 2 A FUTURE CONNECTION TO THE EAST BAY. IN CLOSING, I BELIEVE WE
- 3 ARE FACING A BAY BRIDGE MOMENT HERE. AND MTC, MOVING FORWARD,
- 4 NEEDS TO ENSURE THAT WE DO NOT EMBARK ON THIS PROJECT UNTIL
- 5 ALL ISSUES WITH ADJACENT PROJECTS HAVE BEEN RESOLVED. MY
- 6 RECOMMENDATION, MOVING FORWARD, IS THAT YOU LOOK VERY, VERY
- 7 CAREFULLY AT THE ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR THE GATEWAY
- 8 DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION, WHICH IS THE NEW CROSSING AROUND THE
- 9 HUDSON TUNNEL IN NEW YORK. AND THAT, I BELIEVE, WOULD GIVE YOU
- 10 A PRETTY GOOD IDEA OF WHEN WE NEED TO DO TO MOVE FORWARD.
- 11 THANK YOU.

12

13 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT WE HAVE MICHAEL BALDINI.

14

- 15 MICHAEL BALDINI: THANK YOU CHAIR, COMMISSIONERS. I HAVE READ
- 16 THE SUBMISSIONS, 7A, SUBMITTED BY ROLAND LEBRUN. I HAVE BEEN
- 17 28 YEARS IN RAILROAD TRACK AND CONSTRUCTION AND TRANSPORTATION
- 18 FOR A MAJOR CLASS ONE CARRIER, AND THE RECOMMENDATIONS, I
- 19 FOUND, REVIEWING HIS PROPOSAL MAKE -- SHOULD BE ADOPTED. THEY
- 20 MAKE GREAT SENSE, PARTICULARLY WHEN WE LOOK AT THE TIMING AND
- 21 THE FUTURE CONNECTIONS THROUGH THE BAY, AND AS WELL AS
- 22 SURVEYING THE MISSION BAY DISTRICTS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I
- 23 HOPE YOU SUPPORT IT, AS WELL AS THE MAP. THANK YOU.

24

25 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN.



1 ADINA LEVIN: HELLO. ADINA LEVIN, SEAMLESS BAY AREA, ALSO WANT 2 3 TO ENCOURAGE THE COMMISSION TO PROMOTE WANT PORTAL PROJECT TO THE TIER ONE. THIS IS A -- A KEY PROJECT FOR SAN FRANCISCO AND 4 5 FOR THE ENTIRE CORRIDOR IN TERMS OF HAVING A MORE CONVENIENT TRIP FOR MANY PURPOSES, AS WELL AS FOR CONTRIBUTING IN THE 6 LONG RUN WITH THE STATEWIDE SYSTEM. AND VERY MUCH ENCOURAGE 7 8 APPROVAL. THANK YOU. 9 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT IS HOWARD WONG. 10 11 HOWARD WONG: HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE TJPA CAC STAKEHOLDERS 12 GROUP, PAST TJPA CAC, AND CURRENT MEMBER OF THE MTC POLICY 13 ADVISORY COUNCIL, BUT SPEAKING AS AN INDIVIDUAL. IT'S BEEN A 14 15 LONG TIME COMING. THE PROJECT HAS HAD ENVIRONMENTAL CLEARANCE 16 FOR OUITE A WHILE. MANY PEOPLE HAVE ELEVATED THE PROJECT AND FAST TRACKED IT BY BUILDING THE UNDERGROUND BOX. THIS IS A 17 GENERATIONAL PROJECT THAT HAS BEEN DELAYED FAR TOO LONG. BEEN 18 DEFERRED MUCH TOO LONG. HAS HAD OTHER PROJECTS JUMP THE OUEUE 19 WHEN THIS PROJECT HAS THE HIGHEST REGIONAL PRIORITY PROVIDES 20 21 THE GREATEST REGIONAL BENEFIT. IT WILL BE A GENERATIONAL TYPE OF TRANSPORTATION HUB UPON WHICH OTHER PROJECTS CAN BE BUILT 22 UPON. SO, WE REALLY NEED TO JUST PUSH IT, ACCELERATE IT, GET 23 THE FUNDING, DEMONSTRATE TO VOTERS WHO APPROVED THE FUNDING 24 FOR THIS PROJECT DECADES AGO, SO THAT WE IN THE CITY AND THIS 25



REGION CAN GET SOMETHING DONE THAT WILL BENEFIT US AND FUTURE
GENERATION. THANK YOU.
CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
RAISED MADAM CHAIR.
CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. WITH THAT ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES MOTION BY MILEY, SECOND MELGAR.
CHAIR NOACK?
CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?
V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: YES.
CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
EDDIE AHN: AYE.



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON?
2	
3	CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE.
4	
5	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT?
6	
7	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE.
8	
9	SPEAKER: YES.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BURT IS AN AYE. CANEPA?
12	
13	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
16	
17	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOHN-BAPTISTE?
20	
21	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN IS ABSENT. MANFREE? MELGAR?
24	MILEY?
25	



1	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
4	
5	GINA PAPAN: AYE.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS?
8	
9	BELIA RAMOS: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
12	ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
13	
14	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: GREAT. THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM EIGHT,
15	PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT. COMMISSIONER AHN.
16	
17	EDDIE AHN: YES. SO, RIGHT NOW, THE JOINT MTC PLANNING
18	COMMITTEE IS NOW REFERRING ONE ITEM TO THE COMMISSION FOR
19	APPROVAL. MET ON MARCH 14th ABOUT AGENDA WHAT'S LISTED AS
20	AGENDA ITEM 8A, THE CAPITAL IMPLEMENTATION GRANT AWARDS FOR
21	\$40.7 MILLION FOR ACTION BY THE COMMISSION TODAY. THIS WOULD
22	APPROVE 40.7 MILLION IN GRANTS TO LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO
23	SUPPORT CAPITAL INVESTMENT ACROSS FOUR PROGRAM AREAS: PARKING
24	MANAGEMENT, REGIONAL MOBILITY HUBS, AND TRANSPORTATION
25	ELECTRIFICATION CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE, AND ACTIVE



1	TRANSPORTATION CAPITAL DESIGN TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE. I MOVE TO
2	ADOPT MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4687.
3	
4	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE A SECOND?
5	
6	SPEAKER: SECOND.
7	
8	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. ANY COMMENTS? COMMISSIONER
9	COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM? OKAY. ARE THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS?
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I
12	SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE ZOOM SPACE WITH THEIR
13	HANDS RAISED AND NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM.
14	
15	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION BY AHN; SECOND BY RAMOS. CHAIR
18	NOACK?
19	
20	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?
23	
24	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: AYE.



1	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
2	
3	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE. ANDERSEN?
4	
5	CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT?
8	
9	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BURT?
12	
13	PAT BURT: YES.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
16	
17	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? JOHN-BAPTISTE? MAHAN? MASHBURN?
20	MELGAR? MILEY?
21	
22	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.
23	
24	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?



1	GINA PAPAN: AYE.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS?
4	
5	BELIA RAMOS: YES.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY
8	BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
9	
10	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM NINE
11	LEGISLATION COMMITTEE REPORTS. COMMISSION CANEPA?
12	
13	DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MADAM CHAIR. THE JOINT MTC
14	ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET ON MARCH 14th 2025 AND REFERRED
15	FOUR ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION, TWO OF WHICH WERE ON THE CONSENT
16	CALENDAR AND THE OTHER TWO ARE AS FOLLOWS: AGENDA ITEM 9A CAP-
17	AND-TRADE UPDATE AND ADVOCACY PRINCIPLES, OVERVIEW OF CAP-AND-
18	TRADE EXTENSION DISCUSSIONS IN SACRAMENTO AND REQUESTED
19	SUPPORT OF THE RECOMMENDED PRINCIPLES TO GUIDE MTC AND ABAG
20	ADVOCACY. I MOVE APPROVAL OF SUPPORT FOR THE POSITION FOR CAP-
21	AND-TRADE ADVOCACY PRINCIPLES.
22	
23	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: DO I HAVE A SECOND?
24	
25	SPEAKER: SECOND.



1 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS OR 2 3 QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMISSIONERS? NO? IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR 6 7 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM. ONE 8 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC HAS JUST RAISED THEIR HAND IN THE ZOOM 9 SPACE. 10 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. 11 12 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ADINA LEVIN, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE 13 14 YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES. 15 16 ADINA LEVIN: HELLO. ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA, PART OF A COALITION OF ORGANIZATIONS SUPPORTING PUBLIC 17 TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING AND CLIMATE, GENERALLY SUPPORTIVE 18 OF CAP-AND-TRADE REAUTHORIZATION WITH A NUMBER OF GOALS WITH 19 THAT, AND GENERALLY IN SUPPORT OF MTC'S DIRECTION ON WHICH 20 21 DOES INCLUDE SUPPORT FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING FOR SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITIES. I WANTED TO SUPPORT A 22 TOPIC THAT WAS DISCUSSED EARLIER IN TERMS OF WITH SUPPORT FOR 23 HIGH SPEED RAIL, INCLUDING FUNDING FOR THE FAMILIES OF 24 PROJECTS ON THE BOOK ENDS, INCLUDING HERE IN THE BAY AREA AND 25



- 1 INCLUDING PROJECTS LIKE THE PORTAL AND DIRIDON AND GRADE
- 2 SEPARATIONS ON THE CORRIDOR, AND WITH, ALSO, WITH QUESTIONS
- 3 ABOUT, THERE IS SOME INTEREST IN BEING ABLE TO HAVE A FIXED
- 4 AMOUNT OF FUNDING IN ORDER TO BOND FOR LARGER CAPITAL
- 5 PROJECTS, WHICH, ON THE ONE HAND HAS A CONSIDERABLE AMOUNT OF
- 6 MERIT, ON THE OTHER HAND, THAT MEANS THAT THAT MONEY CANNOT BE
- 7 USED FOR OPERATIONS, AND THERE IS AN IMPORTANT NEED TO BALANCE
- 8 THE FLEXIBILITY FOR OPERATIONS, GIVEN THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT
- 9 OPERATING NEEDS AND THE RISKS TO OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM. AND WE
- 10 NEED TO HAVE THE FUNDING FOR OPERATIONS. SO, WHATEVER DEAL IS
- 11 MET, IT SHOULD ALLOW FOR ENOUGH FLEXIBILITY FOR TRANSIT
- 12 OPERATIONS TO HELP CONTRIBUTE TO KEEPING OUR BAY AREA SYSTEM
- 13 RUNNING AND IMPROVING. THANK YOU.
- 15 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU.
- 17 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU.
- 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS.
- 21 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
- 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. I'LL STOP SHARING MY SCREEN. OKAY.
- 24 CHAIR NOACK.

25

14

16

18

20



```
METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION
Meeting Transcript
```

1	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS?
4	
5	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: YES
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
8	
9	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
12	
13	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON?
16	
17	CANDACE ANDERSEN: AYE.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT?
20	
21	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BURT?
24	

25

PAT BURT: YES.



1	CLEDY WINDERLY WINDS CANEDIO
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
3	
	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
7	
8	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOHN-BAPTISTE?
11	
12	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: YES.
13	
14	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN IS ABSENT. MAY THAT?
15	
16	MATT MAHAN: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MASHBURN?
19	COMMISSIONER MELGAR? COMMISSIONER MILEY?
20	
21	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
24	
25	GINA PAPAN: AYE.



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS?
3	
4	BELIA RAMOS: YES.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
7	ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
8	
9	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU.
10	
11	DAVID CANEPA: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AGENDA ITEM 9B
12	ASSEMBLY BILL 736 WICKS AND SENATOR BILL 417 CABALDEN
13	AFFORDABLE HOUSING BOND ACT 2026 PLACES A \$10 BILLION GENERAL
14	OBLIGATION BOND MEASURE ON THE JUNE 2026 STATEWIDE BALLOT FOR
15	VARIETY OF HOUSING PRODUCTION PRESERVATION PROGRAMS I MOVE
16	APPROVAL IN SUPPORT AND SEEK AMENDMENT OF 736 WICKS AND SB 417
17	CABALDEN.
18	
19	SPEAKER: MOTION.
20	
21	SPEAKER: SECOND.
22	
23	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: GOING TO MAKE ON THIS ONE. QUESTIONS OR
24	COMMENTS? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
25	



1	GINA PAPAN: I APOLOGIZE, SO THIS IS A REPEAT OF OUR BAHFA
2	EFFORT? OR WE HAVE I MEAN, I KNOW THE STATE HAS ALREADY HAD
3	HOUSING BONDS ON THERE SO THIS IS IN ADDITION TO. DO WE HAVE
4	MORE CLARIFICATION ON THIS, PLEASE?
5	
6	REBECCA LONG: THROUGH THE CHAIR, THIS IS A \$10 BILLION
7	STATEWIDE HOUSING BOND AND THE PROPOSED AMENDMENT WHICH IS A
8	FRIENDLY AMENDMENT WE'LL SUPPORT IT NO MATTER WHAT BUT WE
9	WOULD LIKE CONSIDERATION FOR SOME OF THOSE FUNDS BEING
10	AVAILABLE TO REGIONAL AGENCIES SUCH AS BAHFA SO THAT WE CAN
11	ESTABLISH A REVOLVING LOAN FUND.
12	
13	GINA PAPAN: BUT WE DON'T HAVE THAT YET.
14	
15	REBECCA LONG: CORRECT.
16	
17	GINA PAPAN: WORK IN PROGRESS.
18	
19	REBECCA LONG: RIGHT. WE DON'T HAVE THE SEED MONEY TO DEVELOP
20	IT.
21	
22	GINA PAPAN: UNDERSTOOD. THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. HOPE
23	WE DO GET THAT. SENDING THE MESSAGE FORWARD. THANK YOU.
24	

CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ANY QUESTIONS? COMMENTS?



1	
2	SPEAKER: CHAIR, IF I COULD JUST QUICKLY. YEAH, NO PROBLEM. I
3	DO SUPPORT THIS. I THINK IT'S CONCERNING THAT THE MEASURE
4	CONTINUES TO BE PRIORITIZING WHAT FEELS LIKE A ONE-SIZE-FITS-
5	ALL APPROACH TO ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING AFFORDABILITY CRISIS,
6	AND I WOULD LIKE TO ARGUE THAT WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED IN SANTA
7	CLARA COUNTY, HAVING ALREADY PASSED AND DEPLOYED A BILLION
8	BOND PLUS A CITY-LEVEL TRANSFER TAX THAT GENERATES 50- TO \$100
9	MILLION A YEAR FOR ADDRESSING OUR HOUSING AFFORDABILITY AND
10	HOMELESSNESS CRISIS IS THAT WE OUGHT TO BE SUPPORTING MORE
11	FLEXIBLE MODELS. AND, FRANKLY, ANYTHING THAT MEETS HUD
12	STANDARDS FOR HOUSING QUALITY STANDARDS OUGHT TO QUALIFY. AND
13	I THINK WE SHOULD BE EMBRACING TRANSITIONAL HOUSING,
14	RESIDENTIAL TREATMENT, PREFABRICATED MODULAR UNITS. WE HAVE A
15	NUMBER OF SUCCESSFUL IN FACT, THIS YEAR 1,000 PREFABRICATED
16	MODULAR UNITS IN WHAT WE CALL QUICK-BUILD COMMUNITIES
17	LITERALLY BUILDING IN LESS THAN 12 MONTHS AND UNDER 100,000 A
18	DOOR. WE NEED A SPECTRUM OF SOLUTIONS AND THE FASTER WE GET
19	PEOPLE OFF THE STREETS, STABILIZED, CONNECTED TO SERVICES
20	AND I UNDERSTAND THIS IS ABOUT AFFORDABLE HOUSING SUPPLY MORE
21	BROADLY BUT I JUST WORRY THAT WE WILL NOT FIND TRUST IN
22	GOVERNMENT AND VOTER CONFIDENCE IN THESE APPROACHES IF WE
23	DON'T EMBRACE A BROADER PORTFOLIO. AND WE'RE SEEING THAT IN
24	OUR OWN COUNTY. WE HAVE GONE OUT AND DONE THE POLLING AGAIN.

NOW THAT WE HAVE SPENT OVER A BILLION AND ARE PUTTING 50- TO



- 1 100 MILLION YEARLY ACTUALLY SUPPORT FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING FOR 2 AFFORDABLE HOUSING IS DECLINING BECAUSE THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE
- 3 IN OUR STREETS HAS NOT COME DOWN. [LAUGHTER]. AND SO, UNLESS
- 4 WE EMBRACE A WIDER SPECTRUM AND PRIORITIZE FIRST GETTING THE
- 5 MOST VULNERABLE PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITIES INDOORS AND
- 6 STABILIZED -- AND THAT, AGAIN, CAN BE MEETING HOUSING QUALITY
- 7 STANDARD ROOMS, INDIVIDUAL ROOMS, DOORS THAT LOCK, PRIVATE AND
- 8 SUITE BATHROOM. KITCHENETTES. WE JUST BUILT A SITE WITH
- 9 KITCHENS IN EACH UNIT. SO, THERE ARE WAYS TO DO THIS. I WOULD
- 10 JUST URGE -- AND I HAVE SHARED THIS WITH THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER
- 11 BUT AUTHOR OF THE BILL AND PROPONENTS OF THE BILL TO GIVE US
- 12 THE FLEXIBILITY TO MAKE CLEAR TO THE PUBLIC THAT THEY WILL SEE
- 13 AND FEEL THE IMPACT, IN ADDITION TO US PRIORITIZING THE SUPPLY
- 14 OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING WHICH IS TOP PRIORITY. BUT I HAVE
- 15 CONCERNS THAT IF WE'RE OVERLY RESTRICTIVE, RIGID, ORTHODOX IN
- 16 SOLUTIONS WE PRIORITIZE, WE'LL HAVE A HARD TIME GETTING VOTERS
- 17 TO SUPPORT ADDITIONAL REVENUE. I'LL VOTE TO SUPPORT, BUT I
- 18 FEEL NEED TO SHARE THAT EXPERIENCE GIVEN THAT TEN YEARS AGO WE
- 19 PASSED A BILLION DOLLARS BOND AND NOW ARE SEEING LESS MAJORITY
- 20 SUPPORT FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDING IN OUR COUNTY. SO, I THINK
- 21 THERE'S A LESSON THERE.

23 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

24



GINA PAPAN: WOULD IT BE POSSIBLE TO SEND THAT MESSAGE ALONG 1 WITH THE APPROVAL? BECAUSE WE WANT TO HELP THE AUTHOR AND THE 2 3 PUBLIC. I DO BELIEVE THAT WAS A VERY SIGNIFICANT MESSAGE [LAUGHTER] THAT WOULD BENEFIT MOST OF US HERE. AGAIN, I 4 5 BELIEVE WE'RE SUPPORTIVE, BUT WE REALLY -- THE PUBLIC IS LOOKING FOR RESULTS. SO, CAN WE ADD THAT TO OUR MESSAGE? 6 7 8 SPEAKER: I WOULD SUGGEST IF WE WERE GOING TO CONSIDER AN INCREDIBLE AMENDMENT THAT AT MINIMUM, I UNDERSTAND THAT 9 SHELTER IS CONTROVERSIAL TREATMENT CENTERS MIGHT FEEL OUT OF 10 SCOPE BUT MINIMUM I SUGGEST THAT WE SEND A MESSAGE THAT ANY 11 HOUSING SOLUTION THAT MEETS OUALITY STANDARDS FROM HUD SHOULD 12 BE ELIGIBLE AND MAKING THAT CLEAR MIGHT GIVE GREATER 13 FLEXIBILITY IN THE TYPES OF SOLUTIONS THAT THIS REVENUE STREAM 14 15 COULD FUND. SO AT MINIMUM I WOULD BE LOOKING FOR, PERSONALLY 16 ARGUE GOING BEYOND THAT BUT I UNDERSTAND THAT WOULD PROBABLY 17 BE A LONGER DEBATE. 18 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. REBECCA, DID YOU WANT TO COMMENT? 19 20 REBECCA LONG: I THINK THE COMMISSION SHOULD CONSIDER WHAT IT 21 22 WANTS TO DO. WE CAN EITHER INCORPORATE THAT AS A SUGGESTED AMENDMENT TO THE BILL OR WE ACCOUNT ALSO KEEP WHAT WAS THE 23 STAFF RECOMMENDATION, BUT INDICATE THERE IS ALSO INTEREST IN 24



THIS, RIGHT? SO, I THINK THERE IS NUANCED WAYS TO GO. AND I 1 LOOK TO THE COMMISSION TO DECIDE HOW IT WANTS TO APPROACH IT. 2 3 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? 4 5 LIBBY SCHAFF: THANK YOU. THROUGH THE CHAIR, ALSO TO 6 COMMISSIONER MAHAN, IT'S MY HOPE THAT BY ACTUALLY HAVING AN 7 8 EFFECTIVE CAMPAIGN TO GET, WHETHER IT'S A SET ASIDE OF THE EXISTING 10 BILLION OR EXTRA, THAT'S ACTUALLY RESERVED FOR 9 REGIONAL HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITIES THEN WE HAVE THE POWER TO 10 DO WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. AND THAT IS PROBABLY A MORE 11 REALISTIC PATH TO GETTING WHAT YOU WANT DONE THAN TRYING TO 12 REVISE THE ENTIRE BILL, WHICH IS ALREADY GONE THROUGH A 13 PROCESS. I DO THINK THERE IS VALUE IN SENDING THE MESSAGE THAT 14 15 YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. I THINK THERE IS VALUE IN THAT. AND, AS SOMEONE WHO HAS SEEN HOW FAR ALONG THIS BILL IS, I THINK, AND 16 THE WAY WE WOULD ACTUALLY MAKE IT HAPPEN IN THE REAL-WORLD IS 17 BY GETTING A SET ASIDE THAT WE. 18 19 SPEAKER: IF I MIGHT, I THINK IT'S TOTAL AGREE ON 20 21 IMPLEMENTATION PROBABLY RIGHT I'LL SAY I THINK I SPEAK FOR THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER IT'S OPEN TO THIS MOTION, I DON'T WANT TO SPEAK 22 FOR HER AND OTHERS IN THE LEGISLATURE I THINK THIS IS HOW WE 23 PASS IT NOT JUST HOW WE SPEND IT IF WE'RE GOING TO PASS THESE 24

WE HAVE TO GIVE OURSELVES FLEXIBILITY UP FRONT IN THE MESSAGE



- 1 THAT WE'RE SERIOUS ABOUT GETTING MORE PEOPLE OFF THE STREETS
- 2 AND FASTER MORE COST EFFECTIVELY THAN WHAT WE HAVE BEEN DOING.
- 3 I'LL STOP THERE.

4

5 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: BACK AND FORTH A LITTLE BIT.

6

- 7 LIBBY SCHAFF: PROMISE I'M NOT GOING BACK AND FORTH IT'S
- 8 SOMETHING SLIGHTLY RELATED BUT UNRELATED TO COMPLEMENT YOUR
- 9 SUGGESTION, A PROPOSAL GOING ON RIGHT NOW TO CREATE
- 10 CONSOLIDATION IN HOUSING FINANCE PROGRAMS AND THE CURRENT
- 11 PROPOSED BILL LISTS EIGHT DIFFERENT HOUSING FINANCE PROGRAMS
- 12 IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AT THE LEAST WE SHOULD HIGHLIGHT
- 13 THAT THE BILL HAS, LIKE, RECOGNIZES THAT AND PROVIDES THE
- 14 FLEXIBILITY THAT SHOULD HOUSING FINANCE PROGRAMS BE
- 15 CONSOLIDATED, THAT THERE IS NOTHING IN THIS BILL THAT WOULD
- 16 NOT PROVIDE THE FLEXIBILITY TO KIND OF DO WHAT YOU'RE TALKING
- 17 ABOUT. BECAUSE THAT IS IN THE WORKS. IT'S IN THE GOVERNOR'S
- 18 PROPOSAL. AND THAT IS CONSISTENT WITH, I THINK, A LOT
- 19 CONVERSATIONS ABOUT THE SPOKED NATURE OF HOUSING FINANCE AND
- 20 HOW IT'S NOT SERVING OUR OVERALL NEEDS.

21

22 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

- 24 MYRNA MELGAR: I WAS GOING TO SAY THE SAME THING COMMISSIONER
- 25 SCHAFF DID.



1	
2	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: MILEY?
3	
4	NATHAN MILEY: BASED ON WHAT I'M HEARING, I DON'T SEE WHY WE
5	CAN'T HAVE THAT AS PART OF THE MESSAGE. BECAUSE I THINK
6	COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS RIGHT ON. AND I NEVER DISAGREE WITH MY
7	MAYOR, MY FORMER MAYOR.
8	
9	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: [LAUGHTER]
10	
11	NATHAN MILEY: SO, A MESSAGE I DON'T THINK WOULD HURT.
12	
13	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? YEAH.
14	[LAUGHTER] NO? ADDITIONAL COMMENTS? SO, RIGHT NOW WHAT I'M
15	HEARING IS SUPPORT WITH AMEND, WITH A MESSAGE ADDED REGARDING
16	COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S MAY.
17	
18	SPEAKER: SPECIFICALLY THE FUNDING ELIGIBLE WE WOULD RECOMMEND
19	FUNDING BE ELIGIBLE FOR SOLUTIONS THAT MEET HUD'S HOUSING
20	QUALITY STANDARDS AS A MINIMUM FLOOR. THAT MORE OR LESS
21	CONVEYS IT.
22	
23	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY COMMISSIONER BURT?



PAT BURT: AND SHOULD WE ADD MEMBER SCHAFF'S PATH OF GIVING THE 1 2 GREATER REGIONAL DISCRETION, HOWEVER SHE PLACED IT, AND PUT 3 BOTH ELEMENTS IN OUR AMENDMENT? 4 5 MATT MAHAN: FINE WITH ME YOU MAY ARTICULATE HOW YOU WANT TO WORD IT. IT WORKS. 6 7 8 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YOU HAVE THAT WORDING? 9 REBECCA LONG: WE UNDERSTAND IT. 10 11 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: GREAT, WITH THAT, WE HAVE A MOTION AND 12 SECOND ON THAT WITH ALL THOSE AMENDMENTS. THANK YOU. IS THERE 13 14 A SECOND? 15 16 SPEAKER: I SECOND. 17 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. WE HAVE A MOTION FROM MASHBURN, SECOND 18 19 FROM ANDERSEN. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? 20 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN 21 22 WRITING FOR THIS ITEM, NO ONE HAS APPROACHED THE PODIUM AND NO 23 HANDS RAISED IN THE ZOOM SPACE. CONFIRMING MASHBURN AND ANDERSON ARE MOTION AND SECOND, AND THEN THE AMENDED MOTION. 24



Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

MARCH 26, 2025

1	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU.
4	
5	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK.
8	
9	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
10	
11	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON-PETERS?
12	
13	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: YES.
14	
15	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
16	
17	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
18	
19	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AHN?
20	
21	EDDIE AHN: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ANDERSON?
24	

25

CANDACE ANDERSEN: YES.



Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN

MARCH 26, 2025

1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ASHCRAFT.
3	
4	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: YES.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BURT?
7	
8	PAT BURT: YES.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?
11	
12	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
13	
14	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING?
15	
16	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
17	
18	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOHN-BAPTISTE?
19	
20	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: YES.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN?
23	
24	MATT MAHAN: YES R YES.



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING? MILEY? 1 2 3 NATHAN MILEY: AYE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS. 6 7 BELIA RAMOS: AYE. 8 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS 9 10 PRESENT. 11 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. 12 13 DAVID CANEPA: SENATE BILL 63, WIENER ARREGUIN TRANSPORTATION 14 15 REVENUE MEASURE ENABLING LEGISLATION UPDATE ON LEGISLATION 16 REVIEW OF ANTICIPATED AMENDMENTS AND CONSIDERATION OF SUPPORT POSITION. I'LL TURN THIS OVER TO ANDREW FREMIER TO KICK IT OFF 17 AND LET REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC 18 AFFAIRS TO WALK THROUGH THE REPORT. 19 20 ANDREW FREMIER: THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CANEPA. ANDREW 21 22 FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. AS MANY OF YOU HAVE JOINED THE COMMISSION IN THE LAST FEW MONTHS, I THOUGHT IT WAS IMPORTANT 23 TO PROVIDE CONTEXT AROUND THE SIGNIFICANCE OF THIS 24 LEGISLATION. MTC WAS ESTABLISHED IN 1970 TO GIVE THE NINE BAY 25



- 1 AREA COUNTIES A REGIONAL BODY TO HELP COORDINATE, FUND, AND
- 2 PLAN TRANSPORTATION. OVER TIME OUR ROLL AND RESPONSIBILITIES
- 3 RELATED TO TRANSIT GREW AND TODAY WE ALL PLAY AN ENORMOUSLY
- 4 IMPORTANT ROLE IN DISTRIBUTING LOCAL, STATE, AND FEDERAL
- 5 TRANSIT FUNDS IN PROMOTING A SEAMLESS TRANSIT EXPERIENCE FOR
- 6 APPROXIMATELY 900,000 TRANSIT TRIPS EVERY DAY. WHILE WE HAVE
- 7 ABOUT TWO DOZEN TRANSIT OPERATORS, 80% OF THE TRIPS ARE TAKEN
- 8 ON JUST FOUR OF THEM IN THIS ORDER, IN THE ORDER OF RIDERSHIP,
- 9 MUNI, BART, AC TRANSIT, AND CALTRAIN. SINCE THE PANDEMIC, MTC
- 10 LED THE REGION'S EFFORTS TO SUCCESSFULLY SECURE ADDITIONAL
- 11 STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDS TO AVERT MAJOR TRANSIT SERVICE CUTS
- 12 AND ENCOURAGE OPERATORS TO IMPLEMENT KEY IMPROVEMENTS THAT
- 13 WILL ENTICE MORE PEOPLE TO RIDE AND REDUCE THE FUNDING GAP.
- 14 OPERATORS ARE MAKING GOOD PROGRESS, AS IS BORNE OUT IN GRADUAL
- 15 RIDERSHIP GAINS AND RECENT CUSTOMER SERVICE SATISFACTION
- 16 SURVEYS ACROSS THE REGION. BUT THE REAL 8,000 POUND GORILLA IS
- 17 THAT THESE FOUR OPERATORS ARE FACING A FUNDING GAP OF OVER
- 18 \$700 MILLION PER YEAR STARTING IN JULY 2026. PRIMARILY DUE TO
- 19 THE CHANGES IN TRAVEL PATTERNS, POST -- THAT ARE POST-
- 20 PANDEMIC, AND THAT ARE NOT EXPECTED TO CHANGE ANY TIME SOON.
- 21 PUT SIMPLY, THESE OPERATORS NEED A NEW BUSINESS MODEL THAT
- 22 INCLUDES A NEW RELIABLE SOURCE OF REVENUE AT THE REGIONAL
- 23 LEVEL THAT CAN'T BE DIVERTED BY THE STATE OR BY CONGRESS. SB63
- 24 AUTHORIZES A BALLOT MEASURE IN THE THREE BART COUNTIES OF
- 25 ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, AND SAN FRANCISCO, WITH AN OPT IN FOR



- 1 SANTA CLARA AND SAN MATEO, BUT WITH A PREFERENCE FOR SAN MATEO
- 2 TO OPT IN. THE BILL BUILDS ON THE WORK OF OUR TRANSPORTATION
- 3 REVENUE MEASURE, SELECT COMMITTEE LED BY FORMER COMMISSIONER
- 4 JIM SPERING, AS WELL AS THE 2021 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE THAT
- 5 LED TO THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN IN OUR REGIONAL
- 6 NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK. WE'RE VERY FORTUNATE TO HAVE
- 7 SENATORS WE KNOWER AND ARREGUIN AUTHORIZING THE BILL,
- 8 AUTHORING THE BILL, AS THEY BOTH RECOGNIZE HOW IMPORTANT
- 9 TRANSIT IS TO THIS REGION AND THE BILL -- AND APPRECIATE THE
- 10 COMPLEXITY OF THE TRANSPORTATION GOVERNANCE IN THIS REGION.
- 11 AND BECAUSE OF THAT, THE BILL LEAVES ROOM FOR FURTHER ANALYSIS
- 12 AND NEGOTIATION TO CONTINUE ENTRUSTING THE REGION TO DO THE
- 13 DIFFICULT WORK OF FIGURING OUT THE SPECIFIC EXPENDITURE PLAN
- 14 OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. THAT'S A REAL DEMONSTRATION OF
- 15 TRUST. AND WITH THAT, I WOULD LIKE TO TURN THIS OVER TO
- 16 REBECCA TO RUN THROUGH SPECIFICS OF THE AMENDMENTS.
- 18 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU ANDY. GOOD MORNING. I WANT TO ORIENT
- 19 COMMISSIONERS TO THE VARIOUS HANDOUTS THAT ARE POSTED. THERE
- 20 ARE THREE. ATTACHMENT A IS THE OVERALL SUMMARY MEMO OF STAFF'S
- 21 RECOMMENDATION THAT THE COMMISSION SUPPORT THE BILL TODAY.
- 22 ATTACHMENT A TO THAT SUMMARY SHEET IS STAFF'S DETAILED
- 23 ANALYSIS, WHICH WALKS THROUGH KEY PROVISIONS OF THE BILL, AS
- 24 WELL AS A SIDE BY SIDE RELATIVE TO THE PRINCIPLES THAT THE
- 25 COMMISSION ADOPTED UNANIMOUSLY LAST MONTH. ATTACHMENT --



- 1 EXCUSE ME -- ATTACHMENT B, IS A DETAILED SECTION BY SECTION
- 2 SUMMARY THAT THE AUTHOR'S OFFICE SHARED SELF DAYS AGO, AND
- 3 MANY OF YOU MAY HAVE SEEN IT. IT'S BEEN CIRCULATED QUITE
- 4 WIDELY, AND THAT'S THE LANGUAGE THAT STAFF AND SENATOR
- 5 WIENER'S AND SENATOR ARREGUIN'S OFFICE GAVE TO LEGISLATIVE
- 6 COUNCIL FOR THEM TO DRAFT THE BILL AND THAT'S THE BASIS OF OUR
- 7 ANALYSIS AND THAT THE LANGUAGE IS GOING TO FOLLOW THAT. THE
- 8 BILL IS IN PRINT WAS POSTED LAST NIGHT IF YOU ARE INTERESTED
- 9 IN LOOKING AT THE BILL LANGUAGE IT'S POSTED. LASTLY ATTACHMENT
- 10 C ARE THE PRINCIPLES IN THE LANGUAGE THAT YOU ADOPTED LAST
- 11 MONTH. SO, ANDY GAVE A PRETTY THOROUGH OVERVIEW OF WHAT THE
- 12 BILL CONTAINS, BUT I'LL DRILL DOWN, LOOKING PRIMARILY AT PAGE
- 13 TWO OF ATTACHMENT A OF THE HAND OUT AND WALK THROUGH THE
- 14 PRINCIPLES WHICH IS OUR RATIONALE FOR RECOMMENDING SUPPORT
- 15 TODAY. THE FIRST PRINCIPLE WAS REALLY ABOUT THE MEASURE MUST
- 16 BE PASSABLE. SEEMS OBVIOUS BUT WE DID BREAK THAT DOWN INTO KEY
- 17 COMPONENTS FIRST IS TAX RATE AND TAX TYPE. THE BILL DOES
- 18 FOLLOW THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SELECT COMMITTEE AND WHAT
- 19 THE COMMISSION POLLED IN JANUARY. AND WITH THAT IS A HALF CENT
- 20 SALES TAX AT A -- IS ESTABLISHED FOR ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA,
- 21 AND THEN FOR SAN FRANCISCO THERE IS OPTION TO GO UP TO A FULL
- 22 CENT IN ONE 8TH CENT INCREMENTS AS A REMINDER WE POLLED THAT,
- 23 POLLED HALF CENT IN FOUR COUNTIES INCLUDING SAN MATEO AND
- 24 POLLED A VERSION WHERE SAN FRANCISCO HAD 7/8 CENT AND POLLED
- 25 1% HIGHER WITHIN MARGIN OF ERROR NOT TRYING TO TAKE TOO MUCH



- 1 INTO THAT BUT THAT'S WHAT THE RESULT SHOWED. KEEPING IT
- 2 SIMPLE, IN OUR TABLE HERE WE SAY THIS IS KIND OF TO BE
- 3 DETERMINED. IT IS A LONG BILL. BUT IT IS WHAT WE HAD IN MIND
- 4 PARTICULARLY AROUND KEEPING IT SIMPLE WAS THE EXPENDITURE
- 5 PLAN. AND AS ANDY JUST NOTED, RIGHT, THE EXPENDITURE PLAN IS
- 6 FOCUSED ON TRANSIT. IT'S REALLY TRANSIT OPERATIONS TO AVERT
- 7 THE FISCAL CLIFF OF THESE CORE OPERATORS AS WELL AS TRANSIT
- 8 TRANSFORMATION. AND YOU I THINK THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT KEEPING
- 9 IT SIMPLE THERE MAY BE OTHER ASPECTS OF THE BILL THAT SOME
- 10 FIND TOO COMPLEX. I THINK AS WE GO THIS TIES BACK TO THE FINAL
- 11 BULLET HERE WHICH IS POLITICAL SUPPORT. RIGHT? WE NEED THIS
- 12 MEASURE, THIS LEGISLATION F IT IS TO BE SUCCESSFUL TO GARNER
- 13 STRONG POLITICAL SUPPORT THAT MAY MEAN JETTISONING SOME
- 14 COMPONENTS SOME VIEW AS TOO COMPLICATED. CITIZEN INITIATIVE IS
- 15 DIRECTLY AUTHORIZED AND I'LL TAKE A MINUTE ON THAT. IT'S A
- 16 LITTLE KIND OF -- THERE IS A LOT OF LEGAL EASE AROUND THIS IN
- 17 ORDER TO MAKE THIS VIABLE. THERE HAS TO BE A DISTRICT OF WHICH
- 18 THE CITIZENS THEMSELVES PUT A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT. SO THE
- 19 BILL ESTABLISHES A TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE DISTRICT OF
- 20 THE THREE COUNTIES. IF THAT CHANGES AND OTHER COUNTIES OPT IN
- 21 THEN IT WOULD BE A BIGGER GEOGRAPHY. AND THEN THE VOTERS OF
- 22 THAT DISTRICT CAN DO THE SIGNATURE GATHERING TO PUT THE
- 23 MEASURE ON THE BALLOT. AND THEN THE GOVERNING BOARD OF THAT
- 24 DISTRICT IS THE COMMISSION, SO COCHAIRMAN, JUST AS BAHFA AND
- 25 OTHER AUTHORITIES THAT WE OPERATE AS. THE NEXT PRINCIPLE THAT



- 1 WE ALSO INDICATE, YOU KNOW, IS TO BE DETERMINED, IS THAT THE
- 2 MEASURE PREVENT MAJOR TRANSIT SERVICE CUTS FOR REGIONAL MULTI-
- 3 COUNTY OPERATORS. YOU KNOW, THAT IS, RIGHT, OBVIOUSLY WHY
- 4 WE'RE PROPOSING TO DO THIS. WE KNOW THAT SAN FRANCISCO, MTA'S
- 5 DEFICIT IS TOO LARGE FOR A REGIONAL MEASURE TO FULLY SOLVE
- 6 THAT'S WHY WE'RE HIGHLIGHTING THE PURPOSES OF THIS MULTI-
- 7 COUNTY MEASURE TO REALLY ADDRESS THOSE MULTI-COUNTY REGIONAL
- 8 OPERATORS SHORTFALLS AND, YOU KNOW, UNDERSTAND AND WANT TO
- 9 PARTNER WITH SAN FRANCISCO ON A COMPLEMENTARY MEASURE THAT CAN
- 10 ALSO AVERT MAJOR SERVICE CUTS FOR MUNI AND THAT PIECE IS GOING
- 11 TO BE ON THE REGION AND COUNTIES AND TRANSIT OPERATORS TO WORK
- 12 OUT AN EXPENDITURE PLAN THAT CAN ACHIEVE THIS OBJECTIVE. WE DO
- 13 FIND THAT THE BILL, AS DRAFTED, MEETS THE PRINCIPLE OF TAKING
- 14 LOCAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING NEEDS INTO CONSIDERATION, SETTING
- 15 MAXIMUM TERM OF 15 YEARS BUT LEAVING THAT OPEN FOR FURTHER
- 16 DISCUSSIONS SO IT'S A MINIMUM OF TEN MAXIMUM OF 15. THE BILL
- 17 DOES FUND TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, AND THAT'S BEEN A CORE
- 18 OBJECTIVE AS WELL. IT'S SET A CAP OF 10% OF THE REVENUE GOING
- 19 TO FINISHED CUSTOMER-FACING IMPROVEMENTS AND THAT'S CONSISTENT
- 20 WITH WHAT THE SELECT COMMITTEE RECOMMENDED, AND PRINCIPLES THE
- 21 COMMISSION ADOPTED, AS WELL. ON THE VERY IMPORTANT QUESTION OR
- 22 PRINCIPLE OF ENSURING FAIRNESS, RIGHT, THAT IS TO BE
- 23 DETERMINED, AND I THINK THAT'S GOING TO PROBABLY BE THE
- 24 HARDEST PART OF THIS. THE BILL ESTABLISHES THIS TRANSIT
- 25 FINANCIAL -- TRANSIT OPERATIONS FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY AND



- 1 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, OR TFRIP PROCESS, WHICH IS ESSENTIALLY TO
- 2 IDENTIFY IN HOW MUCH FUNDING IS COMING FROM REVENUE GENERATING
- 3 IN A GIVEN COUNTY, TO OPERATORS AND TO ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF
- 4 ALL OF THESE FOUR AGENCIES THAT ARE CALLED OUT IN THE BILL,
- 5 AND THAT THAT'S SOMETHING THAT THE -- AGAIN, WOULD BE
- 6 DEVELOPED WITHIN THE REGION, AND THEN HELP PROVIDE THAT
- 7 INFORMATION TO BE ADDED TO THE LEGISLATION BEFORE IT'S
- 8 FINALIZED. AND THEN, LASTLY, ON ACCOUNTABILITY, THE BILL DOES
- 9 KIND OF FOLLOW WHAT THE COMMISSION HAS RECOMMENDED WITH
- 10 RESPECT TO EFFICIENCY, TRANSPARENCY FOR OPERATORS. IT REQUIRES
- 11 MTC TO DEVELOP WITH A SELECT COMMITTEE OF KEY STAKEHOLDERS,
- 12 INCLUDING REPRESENTATIVES OF THE STATE, AND INDEPENDENT
- 13 FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY REVIEW AND IT REQUIRES THAT OPERATORS
- 14 DEVELOP SPECIFIC IMPLEMENTATION PLANS AND INDICATE HOW THEY'RE
- 15 GOING TO FOLLOW-THROUGH ON THAT REVIEW. SO, WITH THAT, THAT IS
- 16 OUR ANALYSIS OF HOW THE BILL ALIGNS WITH OUR PRINCIPLES.
- 17 AGAIN, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF AREAS WHERE, YOU KNOW, THERE IS
- 18 STILL WORK TO DO, BUT WE FEEL THAT THE FRAMEWORK THAT IS IN
- 19 THE LEGISLATION RIGHT NOW REALLY IS CONSISTENT WITH THE
- 20 DIRECTION FROM THE COMMISSION, AND THAT WE WOULD COMMUNICATE
- 21 TO THE AUTHORS THAT TO HOLD ON TO MTC'S SUPPORT AND REALLY TO
- 22 BE SUCCESSFUL, YOU KNOW, AT THE BALLOT, WE ENCOURAGE THEM TO
- 23 MAKE FURTHER AMENDMENTS THAT ARE CONSISTENT WITH THESE
- 24 PRINCIPLES. SO, WITH THAT, I'LL TURN IT BACK TO CHAIR NOACK



- 1 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. I WANT TO MAKE A COUPLE OF
- 2 COMMENTS. MYSELF HAVING BEEN ON THE COMMISSION DURING THE
- 3 DISCUSSIONS ON 1031, ON THE SELECT COMMITTEE, AND BEEN PART OF
- 4 THE DISCUSSIONS IN THE PAST, I THINK BOTH, JOHN-BAPTISTE AND I
- 5 SPOKE AT THE PRESS CONFERENCE ON MONDAY AND EXPRESSED THE REAL
- 6 NEED TO MAINTAIN AND NOT HAVE DEEP SERVICE CUTS IN OUR TRANSIT
- 7 OPERATIONS, NOT ONLY TO ENSURE THAT PEOPLE ARE ABLE TO GET
- 8 AROUND THIS REGION, BUT, REALLY, IT'S SO VITAL TO THE ECONOMY.
- 9 I THINK MY STATISTIC WAS 160,000 PEOPLE TRAVEL ON BART EVERY
- 10 DAY, AND 120,000 GO OVER THE BRIDGE. SO, YOU CAN IMAGINE WITH
- 11 DEEP SERVICE CUTS IT TOOK ME AN HOUR AND 10 MINUTES TO DRIVE
- 12 HERE THIS MORNING FROM THE EAST BAY. AND YOU CAN SEE EVEN THE
- 13 PEOPLE WILL BE HARSHEST IMPACT THAT RELY ON TRANSIT BUT THOSE
- 14 THAT DON'T NECESSARILY RELY ON TRANSIT, THAT HAVE CARS, WILL
- 15 BE HIT EXTREMELY HARD ON OUR ECONOMY AND I THINK IT'S SUPER
- 16 IMPORTANT. I APPRECIATE SENATOR WIENER AND ARREGUIN, ENSURING
- 17 THAT CONSOLIDATION WHICH WAS ONE OF THE BIGGEST ISSUES LAST
- 18 YEAR WITH 1031 IS NOT INCLUDED IN THIS BILL. I REALLY
- 19 APPRECIATE THEM HEARING US IN THE CONCERNS ABOUT
- 20 CONSOLIDATION. THERE IS DISCUSSION ABOUT FINANCIAL
- 21 EFFICIENCIES, AND I THINK THAT'S SUPER IMPORTANT. BUT I'M
- 22 REALLY GLAD THEY WERE ABLE TO KEEP THE CONSOLIDATION PIECE OUT
- 23 OF THAT BECAUSE I THINK THAT MUDDIED THE WATERS. I'M GLAD TO
- 24 SEE THE ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES. I THINK IT'S PERSONALITY FOR
- 25 US AS MTC EVEN LEADING UP TO THIS BILL TO ENSURE THAT ALL



THESE TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE ALSO LOOKING, RIGHT NOW, TO IMPROVE 1 THEIR FINANCIAL EFFICIENCY, WHAT THEY'RE DOING FACING THESE 2 3 MASSIVE HURDLES, SO IT'S NOT JUST US BAILING THEM OUT BUT THEM BAILING THEMSELVES OUT AS WELL, SO I THINK THAT'S ALSO SUPER 4 5 IMPORTANT FOR US TO KEEP IN MIND OVER THE NEXT YEAR AND A HALF AND TO BE ABLE TO COMMUNICATE THAT TO THE PUBLIC TO GIVE THEM 6 A BETTER UNDERSTANDING THAT EVERYONE IS WORKING TOWARD A GOAL 7 8 OF TRYING TO SAVE TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA FOR OUR ECONOMY. I WANT TO MAKE THOSE COMMENTS BEFORE I TAKE ADDITIONAL COMMENTS 9 10 FROM ANYBODY. COMMISSIONER MILEY? 11 NATHAN MILEY: YEAH, THANK YOU. I GOT A COUPLE OF OUESTIONS 12 FROM STAFF SO YOU GOT THE LETTER FROM LIVERMORE -- AND VALLEY 13 TRANSPORTATION OBVIOUSLY ALAMEDA COUNTY IF NOT ALL ROADS MANY 14 15 ROADS LEAD THROUGH ALAMEDA COUNTY AND TO PASS THE ELECTORATE, 16 YOU'RE GOING TO HAVE TO STIPULATE SO WHAT'S THE POSITION ON RETURN TO SOURCE? BECAUSE THE VOTERS ALAMEDA COUNTY IF WE FEEL 17 MONEY IS GOING OUTSIDE THE COUNTY FROM THE SALES TAX MEASURE I 18 DON'T THINK THE VOTERS ARE GOING TO BE LIKELY TO WANT TO 19 SUPPORT SOMETHING LIKE THAT. 20 21 22 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MILEY. I THOUGHT IT WAS A THOUGHTFUL LETTER CLEARLY ACCESS TO BART FROM THE 23 JURISDICTIONS, FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY AND THE PORTION THAT LAVTA 24

SERVES IS CRITICAL AND ENSURING THAT SERVICE CAN CONTINUE IS



- 1 VITAL. I THINK THAT THIS PROCESS THAT IS RECOMMENDED IN THE
- 2 BILL TO DEVELOP THE TFRIP, AS IT'S CALLED IS REALLY ABOUT
- 3 BALANCING THE DISTRIBUTION OF THE FUNDS GENERATED IN ANY GIVEN
- 4 COUNTY SO WE'LL TALK ABOUT ALAMEDA COUNTY AND FIGURING OUT
- 5 WHAT IS THE APPROPRIATE PORTION OF THOSE REVENUES THAT IS
- 6 GOING TO BART, THAT IS GOING TO AC TRANSIT, THAT MIGHT BE
- 7 GOING TO SUPPORT WITH FEEDER BUS, PARATRANSIT, ET CETERA. SO,
- 8 I THINK IT'S REALLY PREMATURE TO SAY THERE SHOULD BE A
- 9 SPECIFIC FORMULA. AND I THINK, YOU KNOW, PARTICULARLY GIVEN
- 10 THAT WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THE FINAL GEOGRAPHY IS OF THE MEASURE,
- 11 I THINK WE -- IT'S JUST TOO EARLY TO SAY THIS SHOULD BE THE
- 12 FORMULA IN THE BILL. BUT I DO THINK THAT, CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW,
- 13 FROM STAFF'S PERSPECTIVE, AND I WOULD ASSUME FROM THE AUTHOR'S
- 14 PERSPECTIVE THEY WANT TO SEE FEEDER SERVICE TO CONTINUE TO
- 15 THESE REGIONAL SYSTEMS AND IF IT'S NECESSARY TO HAVE SOME OF
- 16 THE FUNDING FROM THE MEASURE TO GO TOWARDS THAT, I THINK THAT
- 17 WILL BE VERY MUCH ON THE TABLE.
- 19 NATHAN MILEY: ONCE AGAIN EVEN IF IT'S FEEDER RETURN TO SOURCE
- 20 BECAUSE IT'S GOT TO BE PASSABLE. AND I'M TELLING YOU AND MAYBE
- 21 MARILYN MIGHT DISAGREE OR LIBBY, BUT THE POINT IS, I DON'T
- 22 KNOW IF THE ELECTORATE VOTERS IN ALAMEDA COUNTY BE GOING TO
- 23 SUPPORT THE MONEY, SALES TAX MONEY GENERATED IN ALAMEDA COUNTY
- 24 GOING OUTSIDE THE COUNTY.

25



REBECCA LONG: THROUGH THE CHAIR IF I COULD MAKE ONE CLARIFYING 1 POINT, ONE OF THE CONCEPTS THAT WAS PUT FORWARD AT THE SELECT 2 3 COMMITTEE AND WAS INTEGRATED INTO SCENARIO 1A WHICH IS THE HALF CENT SALES TAX FOR A SHORTER DURATION WAS THAT ALL OF THE 4 5 REVENUE GENERATED IN GIVEN COUNTY SHOULD BE FUNDING SOME PORTION FOR TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION, WHICH IS KIND OF REGION-6 WIDE, BUT WITH RESPECT TO ANY OF IT GOING TO TRANSIT 7 8 OPERATIONS, IT SHOULD ONLY BE SERVING OPERATORS THAT PROVIDE SERVICE WITHIN THAT COUNTY. SO THAT'S SOMETHING THAT I THINK, 9 10 YOU KNOW, REALLY HELPED GENERATE FURTHER SUPPORT WITHIN THE SELECT COMMITTEE. SO I'LL GIVE AN EXAMPLE, RIGHT, FOR THE 11 ALAMEDA COUNTY PORTION OF A MEASURE, AGAIN, THAT WOULD ONLY BE 12 FUNDING BART AND AC TRANSIT. AND ANY FEEDER SERVICE. BUT IT 13 WOULD NOT BE GOING TO FUND CALTRAIN. IT WOULD NOT BE GOING TO 14 15 FUND MUNI. AND SO, AGAIN, YOU KNOW, WHAT EXACT PROPORTION, 16 RIGHT, IS GOING TO BART FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY, AUTO A DIFFERENT 17 QUESTION. BUT, YOU KNOW, WE WOULD RECOMMEND THAT, FROM THE STANDPOINT OF COMMUNICATING TO VOTERS AND ALL OF THAT, THAT 18 YOU WOULD BE ABLE TO SAY, YOU KNOW, YOUR REVENUE THIS'S COMING 19 FROM THIS TAX IS GOING TO FUND SERVICE THAT'S BEING PROVIDED 20

22

21

IN YOUR COUNTY.

- 23 NATHAN MILEY: IN YOUR COUNTY. OKAY. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S
- 24 GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, HISTORICALLY,
- 25 LOOKING BACK, AND I HAVE SAID IT BEFORE, I MEAN, OBVIOUSLY IF



- 1 BART HAD BEEN THROUGHOUT THE ENTIRE BAY AREA WHEN IT WAS
- 2 INITIATED, WE WOULDN'T BE HAVING THIS DISCUSSION NOW. BUT
- 3 POLITICIAN AT THAT POINT IN TIME HAD TO MAKE COMPROMISES
- 4 JUSTICE LIKE WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO MAKE COMPROMISES,
- 5 INCLUDING SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA AND OTHER COUNTIES MAYBE
- 6 NOT BEING CONSIDERED FOR THIS MAKES IT CHALLENGING. BUT I'M
- 7 JUST SAYING IF IT'S CONTRA COSTA, SAN FRANCISCO, THE FUNDS
- 8 HAVE TO GENERATE AND SERVE THE INTEREST OF OUR COUNTY,
- 9 OBVIOUSLY LOOKING AT THE ENTIRE REGION. BUT WE CAN'T LIFT UP
- 10 THE ENTIRE REGION, THE REST OF THE REGION HAS GOT TO COME TO
- 11 BAT. OKAY. AND I THINK YOU ANSWERED THE QUESTION ABOUT FEEDER.
- 13 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
- 15 VICTORIA FLEMING: I DIDN'T HAVE MY LIGHT ON.
- 17 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: CHAIR CANEPA?
- 19 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU. WE WENT UP TO SACRAMENTO AND HAD A
- 20 PRODUCTIVE CONVERSATION WITH SENATOR ARREGUIN AND SENATOR
- 21 WIENER. AND SO, YOU KNOW, THE THREE-COUNTY MEASURE, WITH THE
- 22 ABILITY OF SAN MATEO COUNTY AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY TO OPT IN,
- 23 YOU KNOW, I'M FINE WITH THAT FOR NOW. ONE OF MY CONCERNS, AND
- 24 I WANT STAFF TO ADDRESS, IT, SORT OF, HIGHLIGHTS WITH WHAT
- 25 SUPER MILEY HAD SAID IS THIS ISSUE OF CALTRAIN. WE UNDERSTAND

12

14

16



- 1 THAT CALTRAIN HAS A VERY HUGE DEFICIT. CAN YOU TALK, WITHIN
- 2 THE LEGISLATION -- I KNOW IT JUST CAME OUT LAST NIGHT -- IS
- 3 THAT ADDRESSED IN TERMS OF THE RESPONSIBILITIES OF WHO FUND
- 4 THAT? JUST CURIOUS IF THE LEGISLATION SPEAKS TO, SORT OF, THE
- 5 ROLE AROUND CALTRAIN.

- 7 REBECCA LONG: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA. THE LEGISLATION
- 8 DOES LIST CALTRAIN AS ONE OF THE OPERATORS THAT WOULD BE
- 9 FUNDED FROM THE MEASURE, AND THEN WITH RESPECT TO THE
- 10 DEVELOPMENT OF THE EXPENDITURE PLAN, RIGHT, IT TALKS ABOUT
- 11 THIS TFRIP PROCESS THAT I MENTIONED, AND ALSO IT DOES SAY I
- 12 BELIEVE, AGAIN I'M THINKING WHAT'S IN THE SECTION BY SECTION
- 13 DOCUMENT, THAT THE AMOUNTS FOR CALTRAIN SHALL BE DETERMINED.
- 14 AND THIS IS, SORT OF, STEPPING BACK, THIS IS HOW WE'RE
- 15 ADDRESSING CALTRAIN'S DEFICIT, NOT WITH WHAT FUNDING SOURCE,
- 16 BUT HOW THE PARTICIPATING M MEMBERS OF THE JPA ARE ADDRESSING
- 17 THE CALTRAIN'S DEFICIT IS TO BE DETERMINED THROUGH CALTRAIN'S
- 18 WORK WITH THOSE MEMBER AGENCIES. IN OTHER WORDS IT'S NOT GOING
- 19 TO BE DETERMINED BY OTHER COUNTIES THAT ARE NOT PART OF THE
- 20 JPA. SO, THAT, I THINK IS SOMETHING CALTRAIN HAS BEEN
- 21 ADVOCATING FOR OVER THE LAST FEW MONTHS THEY HAVE BEEN HAVING
- 22 CONVERSATIONS WITH THE MEMBER COUNTIES TO ADDRESS THEIR
- 23 SHORTFALL WHICH IS APPROXIMATELY, I THINK 75 MILLION, SO IT
- 24 DOES SPEAK TO THAT. THAT'S, SORT OF, A SEPARATE QUESTION FROM
- 25 WHETHER CALTRAIN WOULD BE FUNDED IN A THREE-COUNTY MEASURE.



1	
2	DAVID CANEPA: I'M ALL FOR FAIRNESS. I THINK WE LOOK AT SAN
3	FRANCISCO COUNTY, SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY, IF THEY ENTER THIS
4	MEASURE I'M ABOUT FAIRNESS AND EQUITY, IF I WAS ANOTHER
5	COUNTY LIKE SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY OR CONTRA COSTA COUNTY OR
6	ALAMEDA COUNTY, YOU KNOW, I WOULDN'T WANT TO CONTRIBUTE.
7	BECAUSE THEIR TAXPAYERS ARE EXPECTING A DIRECT BENEFIT. SO, I
8	UNDERSTAND CLEARLY WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT. I THINK ONE OF
9	THE THINGS THAT'S IMPORTANT TO ME, AS WE MOVE FORWARD, AND YOU
10	KNOW, THESE CONVERSATIONS OF HOW WE FUND CALTRAIN, MOVING
11	FORWARD, WHAT I WOULD HATE TO SEE IS FOR US TO MOVE FORWARD
12	WITH A MEASURE THAT REALLY DOESN'T HELP US SOLVE THE CALTRAIN
13	PROBLEM. AND THAT BEING SAID, LET ME GIVE AN EXAMPLE. YOU
14	KNOW, WE HAVE THESE DIFFERENT COUNTIES, WE HAVE DIFFERENT
15	LOCAL MEASURES, ARE WE ABLE, AS COUNTIES, THROUGH A LOCAL
16	MEASURE, ABLE TO SOLVE THE CALTRAIN DEFICIT? I DON'T KNOW WHAT
17	THAT ANSWER IS. I THINK I MIGHT HAVE A LITTLE INDICATION. BUT
18	TO ME, THAT REALLY WEIGHS TOP OF MIND. I'M GOING TO SUPPORT
19	WHAT'S BEFORE US TODAY, AND THEN I THINK, JUST FROM A
20	BROADLY THINKING ABOUT POTENTIALLY ENGAGING, YOU KNOW, THROUGH
21	THE CHAIR, YOU KNOW, ENGAGING WITH THE AUTHORS TO REALLY
22	UNDERSTAND THIS CALTRAIN ISSUE. BECAUSE IT IS IT IS
23	WEIGHING ON ME. BECAUSE IT EXTEND FROM, YOU KNOW, IN SAN MATEO

COUNTY, FROM BRISBANE, TO MENLO PARK. IT TRANSCENDS THE WHOLE

COUNTY. AND SO THAT'S WHAT'S REALLY TOP OF MIND. BUT I

24



1	UNDERSTAND IF I WAS, YOU KNOW, SUPERVISOR MELGAR, OR SUE NOACK
2	OR SUPERVISOR MILEY, I UNDERSTAND THAT RATIONALE SO WE REALLY
3	NEED TO KIND OF WORK OUR WAY THROUGH THAT. SO, THANK YOU,
4	MADAM CHAIR.
5	
6	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
7	
8	GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. THANK YOU TO EVERYONE INVOLVED HERE. I
9	THINK THIS IS A GREAT OPPORTUNITY AND A START MOVING FORWARD
10	HERE I DO HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS BEFORE I SUM UP HERE. I
11	DON'T BELIEVE WE POLLED 15 YEARS.
12	
13	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THAT'S JUST THE LEGISLATOR CAPPING IT.
14	
15	REBECCA LONG: WE POLLED TEN THEN 11 FOR THE VARIABLE RATE.
16	
17	GINA PAPAN: DO WE HAVE ANY IDEA HOW THAT WOULD IMPACT THE
18	VOTERS?
19	
20	REBECCA LONG: IF I CHANNEL RUTH BERNSTEIN, I THINK SHE WOULD
21	PROBABLY SAY IT WOULD NOT LIKELY HAVE A BIG IMPACT, A COUPLE
22	OF YEARS BUT WE OBVIOUSLY WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO TELL WITHOUT

23

24

POLLING DIRECTLY.



GINA PAPAN: CAN YOU CLARIFY TRANSIT FINANCIAL RESPONSIBILITY 1 AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN? IT SOUNDS LIKE IF IT'S A THREE-COUNTY 2 MEASURE, AS IT IS NOW, AND THE OTHER ONES ARE LOOKING IN, THAT 3 THIS PLAN WOULD DETERMINE WHAT OTHER COUNTIES WOULD BE PAYING? 4 5 IS THAT AN INTERPRETATION? 6 REBECCA LONG: I DON'T BELIEVE THAT THAT'S THE INTENTION. I 7 8 THINK IT -- THERE IS A RECOGNITION ON THE PART OF THE AUTHORS THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE THESE VARIOUS OPERATORS THAT HAVE 9 FUNDING NEEDS, RIGHT? SOME OF WHICH, RIGHT NOW, ARE LISTED AS 10 -- OR SOME OF WHICH ARE SERVED BY OPERATORS, WHICH ARE LISTED 11 RIGHT NOW AS OPT IN, AND THAT THEY HAVE -- SOME OF THEM HAVE 12 INDICATED THAT I WANT TO CONTRIBUTE TO THE DEFICITS OF THOSE 13 OPERATORS THROUGH OTHER FUNDING. AND I THINK THERE IS A 14 15 RECOGNITION IN REACHING AN AGREEMENT ABOUT THAT, THERE IS A 16 NEED TO LOOK AT THE FULL PICTURE, BUT NOT LEGISLATE THAT. SO, NOT NECESSARILY LEGISLATE AMOUNTS THAT ARE NOT COMING FROM THE 17 MEASURE IN THE BILL. 18 19 GINA PAPAN: OKAY. BECAUSE I WOULD OUESTION THE LEGALITY OF 20 21 SOMETHING LIKE THAT AND I WOULD BE CAREFUL WHEN YOU SAY LANGUAGE IT'S THE PREFERENCE OF THE LEGISLATURE TO DO THINGS, 22 WHEN THE LEGISLATURE HAS YET TO DECIDE ANY OF THIS. SO, YOU 23 HAVE SPECIFIC LANGUAGE HERE. THE LEGISLATURE PREFERS SAN MATEO 24

COUNTY OPT IN. I THINK THAT WOULD BE CONSULTING OUR



1	LEGISLATIVE REPRESENTATIVES AT THIS POINT. SO, I UNDERSTAND
2	THAT MIGHT SET SOME PEOPLE OFF AT ANOTHER LEVEL HERE. SO,
3	LET'S BE VERY CAREFUL, WITH DESIRE, MAYBE [LAUGHTER] BUT WHEN
4	YOU MAKE A STATEMENT LIKE THAT, IT'S SENDS THE WRONG
5	MESSAGE, BECAUSE WE HAVEN'T INCLUDED ALL THE LEGISLATORS HERE,
6	AND AS SAID BEFORE WE WANT TO BRING EVERYBODY IN. I'M PROBABLY
7	GOING TO ABSTAIN ON THIS. BECAUSE WE HAVE "MUST HAVE
8	PRINCIPLES" THIS WE HAVE LISTED HERE, AND THERE IS SO MUCH, AS
9	YOU HAVE IDENTIFIED "TO BE DETERMINED" AND ONE OF WHICH IS
10	LOCAL INITIATIVES WHICH I KNOW WE'RE ALL WORKING ON AND WILL
11	CONTINUE WORKING ON. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT START AND
12	OPPORTUNITY BUT TO COME OUT SPECIFICALLY WITHOUT HAVING THE
13	SPECIFICS AS WAS MENTIONED HERE, THE EFFICIENCY MEASURES, I
14	THINK ARE SO DELAYED, ALMOST, WHY BOTHER. RIGHT NOW, I DO
15	BELIEVE THERE IS ANOTHER BILL THAT'S GOING TO HAVE SOME MORE
16	GAP FUNDING. IS THAT STILL IN THE WORKS? SENATOR ARREGUIN?
17	
18	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THE \$2 BILLION REQUEST? IT IS STILL THE
19	REQUEST IS STILL THERE. I THINK IT'S THE REQUEST TO THE
20	BUDGET, RIGHT?
21	
22	REBECCA LONG: CORRECT IT'S A BUDGET REQUEST NOT LEGISLATION
23	
24	GINA PAPAN: UNDERSTOOD. I WOULD HOPE THERE WOULD BE IMMEDIATE

EFFICIENCY MEASURES IMPLEMENTED THERE. THE PUBLIC IS LOOKING



- 1 FOR THAT NOW, TO TALK ABOUT IT IN GENERAL. WE ARE LOOKING TO
- 2 THE AUDIT THAT MTC IS DOING NOW. BECAUSE THAT'S GOING TO BE
- 3 IMPORTANT AS TO HOW EVERYTHING IS ANALYZED HERE. WE'RE ALSO
- 4 LOOKING AT WHEN YOU SAY "RETURN TO SOURCE," HOW THAT'S
- 5 DETERMINED HERE. BECAUSE WE'RE FINDING, BART, FOR ONE, I'LL
- 6 JUST POINT THIS OUT, SAN MATEO COUNTY CAN'T INCLUDE THE
- 7 RIDERSHIP NUMBERS FROM DALY CITY. SO, WHO IS GETTING THOSE
- 8 RIDERSHIP NUMBERS? WHO IS GETTING THE RIDERSHIP NUMBERS FROM
- 9 SFO? THESE TYPES OF INFORMATION ARE IMPORTANT PARTICULARLY IF
- 10 WE'RE GOING TO PRESENT TO THE VOTERS. AGAIN MY REASONS WOULD
- 11 BE WE LISTED "MUST HAVE" PRINCIPLES WE LACK DETERMINATION ON
- 12 SOME STUFF I WOULD SUGGEST WE NEED TO HAVE MORE MEANINGFUL
- 13 ACCOUNTABILITY. THIS'S WHAT THE VOTERS ARE GOING TO LOOK FOR.
- 14 THIS IS LACKING AT THIS POINT. AND, SO, I HESITATE. I HOPE WE
- 15 GET THERE. BUT TO HAVE JUST 10% GO TO MTC AND SAY WE'RE GOING
- 16 TO HAVE TRANSFORMATION; I DON'T THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE
- 17 ENOUGH FOR THE VOTERS. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE MORE TRANSFORMATIVE
- 18 MEASURES BUILT IN SO WHEN THEY GO TO THE POLLS, AND VOTE,
- 19 THEY'RE GOING TO SEE EXACTLY HOW THIS IS GOING TO BE BETTER,
- 20 AND WE KNOW RIDERSHIP, WE HAVE TO KEEP THEM GOING HERE, BUT
- 21 UNLESS THAT IS PRESENT AND WE STICK TO OUR PRINCIPLES, THEN I
- 22 THINK IT'S GOING TO BE DIFFICULT. SO, I WILL BE ABSTAINING,
- 23 HOPING WE CAN GET TO ALL THESE "TO BE DETERMINED" BECAUSE I
- 24 THINK THEY'RE REALLY IMPORTANT BUT THEY HAPPEN NOW.



CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. I HAVEN'T ARE 1 2 FORGOTTEN ABOUT YOU THERE. 3 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU 4 5 TO THE ENTIRE COMMISSION STAFF FOR WORKING SO HARD ON THIS. AND I FEEL LIKE THE REFINEMENTS ARE MOVING US TOWARDS A 6 POSITIVE OUTCOME. I JUST WANT TO RESPOND TO COMMISSIONER 7 8 CANEPA'S COMMENTS A BIT. AND ALSO GET SOME CLARIFICATION. SO, I'M CONCERNED ABOUT CAL TRAIN AND I HAVE BEEN APPOINTED TO AN 9 AD HOC COMMITTEE TO WORK OUT GOVERNANCE ISSUES AND AS WELL AS 10 THIS ISSUE OF EACH OF THE COUNTIES WHAT FAIR SHARES SHOULD BE, 11 AND I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THE LEGISLATION LANGUAGE WILL 12 ALLOW FOR US TO MAKE THOSE DETERMINATIONS. BECAUSE I THINK 13 THERE IS ACTUALLY, I'M FINDING A LOT MORE INVOLVED THAN JUST 14 15 LOOKING AT, WELL, THERE IS A LOT -- WE HAVE TO FIGURE OUT THE 16 FORMULAS, I GUESS, FOR HOW TO DETERMINE OUR FAIR SHARES, AND THERE IS SOME OTHER FACTORS TOO THAT WILL GO INTO, I'LL CALL 17 IT A NEGOTIATION. SO, TO STAFF, CAN YOU CLARIFY THAT WE WILL 18 HAVE THAT FLEXIBILITY TO MAKE OUR OWN DETERMINATION AT 19 20 CALTRAIN? 21 REBECCA LONG: THROUGH THE CHAIR, I DID FIND THE SPECIFIC 22 PROVISION IN THE BILL. IT'S SECTION 67751, PARAGRAPH C, AND IT 23 SAYS "TARGET CONTRIBUTIONS AND IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES FOR 24

CALTRAIN TO BE DETERMINED THROUGH CONVERSATIONS BETWEEN



- 1 CALTRAIN MEMBER AGENCIES." SO, AND THIS IS INTENT LANGUAGE.
- 2 AGAIN, THAT THAT'S WHAT HAPPENS AND THEN AFTER THAT WORK IS
- 3 DONE BY THE CALTRAIN MEMBER AGENCIES, THAT INFORMS HOW THE
- 4 EXPENDITURE PLAN IS DEVELOPED IN THE LEGISLATION.

5

- 6 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SO, THEN THAT MEANS THAT WE -- THAT OUR,
- 7 YOU KNOW, OUR AD-HOC AND THE CALTRAIN BOARD WILL HAVE TO MAKE
- 8 A DECISION BY WHEN?

9

10 REBECCA LONG: BY JULY 31ST IS WHAT'S REQUESTED, OR SUGGESTED.

11

- 12 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OKAY. WELL, THAT'S HELPFUL TO KNOW.
- 13 [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU. I GUESS WE'LL HAVE TO GET ON IT. AND
- 14 THEN I WANTED TO ASK ABOUT THE TFRP. AS EVERYONE IS AWARE,
- 15 SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAS THE OPPORTUNITY TO OPT IN BUT IF WE
- 16 WERE TO OPT OUT, ARE WE STILL GOING TO BE REQUIRED TO BE A
- 17 PART OF THE TFRP?

- 19 REBECCA LONG: THE TFRP IS GOING TO BE A PLACEHOLDER, THE
- 20 INTENTION IS THE LANGUAGE IS IN THE BILL, WILL TAKE PLACE AND
- 21 COMPLETED BY JULY 31ST AND THEN THE BILL WILL TAKE OUT ALL
- 22 THAT REFERENCE TO TFRP AND THE PLAN IN THE BILL NOBODY IS
- 23 REOUIRED TO DO ANYTHING ABOUT THE TFRP IT'S NOT LAW IT'S JUST
- 24 LANGUAGE IN A BILL AS ANDY MENTIONED IT'S REALLY THE AUTHOR
- 25 SAYING WE TRUST THE REGION TO DO THIS WORK AND CAN PUT



1	SOMETHING INTO THE BILL THAT HAS CONSENSUS BASED ON BUY-IN OF
2	THE PARTICIPATING AGENCIES. DOES THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?
3	
4	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: I GUESS I'M STILL NOT CLEAR ON WHAT THE
5	REQUIREMENT IS.
6	
7	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I THINK THE OPT INS ARE ALSO BY THE END OF
8	JULY SO AT THAT POINT WE'LL KNOW WHICH COUNTIES ARE GOING TO
9	BE IN THE MEASURE OR NOT IN THE MEASURE SO THE CALCULATIONS
10	THAT ARE DONE BEFORE JULY TO DETERMINE THE ALLOCATIONS AND
11	THEIR RESPONSIBILITIES WILL THEN BE PUT INTO THE MEASURE BASED
12	ON WHO IS IN THE MEASURE AT THE END OF JULY. DOES THAT MAKE
13	SENSE? SO IF SANTA CLARA OPTS OUT DESPITE THE NUMBERS THAT
14	WILL HAVE BEEN DETERMINED BY THE TFRP, YOU WON'T BE IN THE
15	MEASURE SO THE LANGUAGE ISN'T IN THE MEASURE. THEY DETERMINE
16	TO BE SANTA CLARA'S FAIR SHARE DURING THE TFRP, WOULD NOT BE
17	IN THE EXPENDITURE PLAN BECAUSE YOU WOULDN'T BE IN THE
18	MEASURE.
19	
20	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: OKAY. GREAT. THANK YOU. APPRECIATE THAT.
21	
22	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I HAVE NODDING PEOPLE AT ME. SO I THINK I
23	GOT THAT RIGHT. SORRY, WAS THAT IT, MARGARET?
24	

25

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: YES. THANK YOU.



1 2 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT. 3 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND THANK YOU TO 4 5 STAFF FOR BRINGING THIS FORWARD TO US. A LOT OF GREAT DETAILS. I WAS IN SACRAMENTO, LOBBYING WITH ALAMEDA COUNTY 6 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION NOT LAST WEEK BUT THE WEEK BEFORE 7 8 AND SO THIS WAS EVEN NEWER THAN BUT THEN I DID SEE SENATOR ARREGUIN LAST WEEK BECAUSE HE CAME TO THE STATE OF THE CITY IN 9 ALAMEDA AND WE TALKED ABOUT THE AMENDMENTS. I HAVE SOME 10 CLARIFYING QUESTIONS THIS IS ALL KIND OF NEW TO ME. BUT I DO 11 THINK IT'S VERY IMPORTANT. I THINK OUR TRANSIT SYSTEMS ARE SO 12 REGIONAL. FOR ALAMEDA WE WOULD ONLY HAVE AC TRANSIT, AND BART, 13 RIGHT? COMMISSIONER MILEY? AS -- AS FAR AS THE AGENCIES THAT 14 15 ARE COVERED. AND THEN YET RESIDENTS OF OUR COUNTIES CROSS 16 COUNTY LINES ON A REGULAR BASIS. I JUST TOOK THE FERRY HERE TODAY ACROSS THE WATER. AND BY THE WAY, I THINK WE COULD ALL 17 TAKE -- OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES COULD TAKE A PAGE FROM THE 18 FERRIES. I WAS SPEAKING TO WETA STAFF LAST WEEK, FERRY 19 RIDERSHIP IS BACK TO 95% OF PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS. I'M NOT SURE 20 21 WHAT IT IS, BUT NOW PEOPLE ARE COMPLAINING ABOUT HAVING TO SIT NEXT TO PEOPLE ON THE FERRY. I WOULD REMIND THEM IF YOU WANT 22 TO BUY TWO TICKETS YOU CAN HAVE TWO SEATS. BUT ANYWAYS, BACK, 23 TO JUST MY QUESTION ABOUT THIS BILL, SO, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR 24

FREMIER, I THINK YOU SAID IN YOUR REPORT THAT SAN MATEO COUNTY



IS NOT A BART COUNTY. DID I UNDERSTAND THAT CORRECTLY? AND IF 1 2 SO, WHY NOT? 3 ANDREW FREMIER: IT'S A COMPLICATED ANSWER, BUT IT'S NOT PART 4 5 OF THE BART DISTRICT AND NEITHER IS SANTA CLARA. THE BART DISTRICT, AS DEFINED IN LAW, IS JUST THE THREE COUNTIES. 6 7 8 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: OKAY. HMM. OKAY. AND, SO, THEN, FOR ANOTHER COMPLICATED OUESTION, OR OUESTION WITH A COMPLICATED 9 10 ANSWER -- AND I REALLY DON'T UNDERSTAND THE BACKGROUND, AND I DON'T WANT TO ASSUME WHY IT IS THAT THERE IS CLEARLY A 11 HESITATION FOR SAN MATEO COUNTY AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY TO JOIN 12 IN ON THIS, I DO RECALL THAT WHEN I WAS A STUDENT LIVING IN 13 SAN FRANCISCO ATTENDING LAW SCHOOL AT SANTA CLARA I GOT TO GO 14 15 TO SCHOOL EVERY DAY ON THE CALTRAIN AND IT WAS GREAT CROSSING 16 COUNTY LINES BUT IF SAN MATEO COUNTY AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY OPT NOT TO PARTICIPATE -- BUT APPROXIMATE THEY DO NOT 17 PARTICIPATE, THEY WON'T GET ANY FUNDING FROM THIS MEASURE? 18 19 REBECCA LONG: I'LL TAKE THE HARD OUESTION. I THINK THAT 20 21 REMAINS TO BE DETERMINED IF THEY WERE TO GET FUNDING THE WAY THAT WE WERE DESCRIBING THE SELECT COMMITTEE'S RATIONALE WOULD 22 THAT BE THAT WOULD ONLY BE COME FROM SAN FRANCISCO'S PORTION 23 OF THE TAX GENERATED WHETHER OR NOT THAT'S DECIDED THROUGH THE 24 TFRIP PROCESS IS REALLY TO BE DETERMINED.



1

MARCH 26, 2025

2 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: OKAY. AND AGAIN, WHILE I RECOGNIZE THAT 3 SUPPORTING REGIONALISM IS IMPORTANT, EVEN MORE IMPORTANT IS THAT WE HAVE TO PASS THIS MEASURE. SO, I GUESS THAT SPEAKS TO 4 5 WHAT THE VOTERS WANT, AND THEN IN -- LET'S SEE -- OKAY. OH, AND BY THE WAY, COMMISSIONER MILEY, THANK YOU FOR RAISING THE 6 LAVTA LETTER, AND I WAS READING THAT TOO, AND I KNOW WE'LL 7 8 HEAR FROM OUR ALAMEDA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION COLLEAGUES FROM LIVERMORE ABOUT THAT, BUT IN THIS IS 9 10 ATTACHMENT B, PAGE FOUR, IT TALKS ABOUT THE ELECTION PROCEDURES, SECTION FOUR REQUIRES THE BOARDS OF SUPERVISORS OF 11 THE COUNTIES THAT MAKE UP THE TRANSIT REGIONAL MEASURE 12 DISTRICT TWO CALL A SPECIAL ELECTION FOR A MEASURE APPROXIMATE 13 THAT THE TRMD PROPOSES FOR THE BALLOT, IF THE IS SIGNATURE 14 15 GATHERING OF VOTER INITIATIVE, WHY DOES IT REQUIRE THE BOARDS 16 OF SUPERVISORS TO APPROVE? AND COULD THEY VOTE NOT TO APPROVE PUTTING IT ON THE BALLOT? 17 18 REBECCA LONG: I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT I'M ANSWERING CORRECTLY 19 AND THE BILL CAME OUT LAST NIGHT AND TAKE THIS WITH A GRAIN OF 20 SALT BUT IMPORTANT POINT IS THE BILL DOES ALLOW THE DISTRICT, 21 TO PUT A MEASURE ON THE BALLOT AS WELL AS CITIZEN INITIATIVE 22 SO IT'S NOT EXCLUSIVELY CITIZEN INITIATIVE AND THE DISTRICT, 23 WE SAW POLLING WAS 2/3 WE MIGHT GO THIS ROUTE AND IN WHICH 24 25 CASE SIMILAR TO REGIONAL MEASURE THREE, AND REGIONAL MEASURES,



ONCE THE DISTRICT, THE COMMISSION TAKES AN ACTION, IT BECOMES 1 A, SORT OF, PER FUNK TORI MATTER FOR THE COUNTY TO CALL A 2 3 SPECIAL ELECTION AND PUT IT ON THE BALLOT. 4 5 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: REMIND ME AGAIN, HOW AND WHEN IS THE 6 TRMD CREATED? 7 8 REBECCA LONG: THE STATUTE, IT WOULD BE CREATED AND BECOME LAW JANUARY 20, 2026 IF THE BILL PASSES. 9 10 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: THE INK IS STILL DRYING. BUT IT 11 REQUIRES SPECIAL ELECTION TO BE CONSOLIDATED WITH THE NOVEMBER 12 2026 STATEWIDE ELECTION. I MEAN WE'RE TALKING GENERAL ELECTION 13 IN NOVEMBER. SO WHERE DOES THAT SPECIAL ELECTION COME IN? 14 15 16 REBECCA LONG: I'LL LOOK TO OUR COUNSEL THAT'S TERMINOLOGY THAT WE SEE IN THESE BILLS. BUT THE INTENTION IS IT BE PART OF THE 17 GENERAL ELECTION. 18 19 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: RIGHT. ABSOLUTELY. ANYTHING TO ADD, 20 21 MADAM COUNSEL. 22 23 COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE: THIS LINE WAS STILL SUBJECT TO SMALL AMOUNT OF REFINEMENT. BUT PART OF WHAT THIS IS DESIGNED TO DO 24

IS IN THE REGIONAL MEASURE FOUR CONTEXT. THERE WAS AMBIGUITY



ABOUT WHAT WOULD HAPPEN IF THE BOARDS OF SUPERVISORS DIDN'T 1 WANT TO PUT IT ON. THIS IS A "SHALL," SO IT CLARIFIES THAT 2 3 IT'S A MINISTERIAL ACTION AND NON-DISCRETIONARY ON THEIR PART. SO, IT'S TRYING TO DEAL WITH LOGISTICS OF GETTING IT ON EACH 4 5 COUNTY'S BALLOT FOR A MULTI-COUNTY DISTRICT. BUT WE'LL MAKE SURE THIS TIES OUT WITH ALL OF OUR LITTLE ELECTION CODE 6 7 ISSUES. 8 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: ALL RIGHT. THOSE ARE MY OUESTIONS. 9 THANK YOU SO MUCH. 10 11 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: JOHN-BAPTISTE? 12 13 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF CLARIFYING 14 15 QUESTIONS FOR STAFF AND THEN A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. FIRST, DID 16 I HEAR YOU SAY THAT AT THE OUTSET STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IS TO SUPPORT THIS BILL? 17 18 REBECCA LONG: YES. 19 20 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: THANK YOU. AND WE WERE TO SEE 21 MODIFICATIONS TO THE BILL OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS, CAN 22 23 WE MODIFY OUR POSITION?

24

25

REBECCA LONG: ABSOLUTELY.



1

MARCH 26, 2025

2	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: IN TERMS OF MY THOUGHTS ON THIS I WANT
3	TO WEIGH IN ON THE TFRP PROCESS I THINK SAN FRANCISCO IS IN
4	SOMEWHAT A UNIQUE POSITION BECAUSE UNLIKE MOST OF THE OTHER
5	COUNTIES WE HAVE A VESTED INTEREST IN THE HEALTH AND WELL-
6	BEING OF ALL FOUR OF THE SYSTEMS BEING CONSIDERED, AS
7	POTENTIAL BENEFICIARIES OF THIS MEASURE. AND FOR US TO REALLY
8	UNDERSTAND KIND OF WHAT OUR POSITION IS RELATIVE TO THE
9	SPECIFIC FUNDING MECHANISMS UTILIZED THROUGH THIS MEASURE, WE
10	DO ACTUALLY NEED TO UNDERSTAND THE BIGGER PICTURE OF HOW EACH
11	OF THESE SYSTEMS GET FUNDED, BY WHOM, AND BY WHAT MECHANISM SO
12	AS WE'RE THINKING ABOUT THE ROLE OF COUNTIES IN TERMS OF OPT
13	IN, WHILE I UNDERSTAND AND SUPPORT BOTH SANTA CLARA AND SAN
14	MATEO HAVING THE DISCRETION TO OPT IN OR TO OPT OUT OF A
15	MEASURE, I DON'T THINK THAT WE WOULD BE SUPPORTIVE OF SANTA
16	CLARA OR SAN MATEO NOT BEING PART OF THE UPFRONT CONVERSATION
17	ABOUT WHAT IS THE KIND OF SHARED OBLIGATION APPROXIMATE SHARED
18	RESPONSIBILITY TO EACH OF THESE SYSTEMS AS WE MOVE FORWARD.
19	BECAUSE I DON'T SEE HOW WE CONDITIONED WHERE WE SIT IF WE
20	DON'T HAVE THE FULLER PICTURE. SO WANTED TO BE UP FRONT ABOUT
21	THAT. I DO APPRECIATE THAT THIS BILL DOES TWO VERY IMPORTANT
22	THINGS, AND ONE IS I THINK IT CLARIFIES WHO NEEDS TO ACTUALLY
23	BE AT THE SPECIFIC TABLES. AND WE HAVE STRUGGLES OVER THE LAST
24	YEAR AND A HALF OR SO, I THINK, AS A REGION, TO REALLY, REALLY
25	COME TO RESOLUTION ON THE TRICKIEST OURSTONS AMONG US AND



- 1 WHAT I SEE THIS BILL DOING IS REALLY HONING IN ON KIND OF THE
- 2 PRINCIPLE OF NOTHING ABOUT US WITHOUT US, RIGHT? SO, IF YOU
- 3 ARE TOUCHED BY THIS, YOU SHOULD BE PART OF THE CONVERSATION. I
- 4 APPRECIATE THAT THE CALTRAIN DELIBERATIONS HAVE BEEN
- 5 CLARIFIES, THE JPA NUMBERS MAKE SENSE TO ME I WANT TO
- 6 ACKNOWLEDGE THE WORK THAT WENT INTO IT BECAUSE THAT MATTERS
- 7 ALSO APPRECIATE WHAT AUTHORS HAVE DONE GIVEN US A PATH FORWARD
- 8 THAT FLEXIBILITY THAT WE NEED, BECAUSE AT THE END OF THE DAY
- 9 WE NEED TO BE ABLE TO GIVE-AND-TAKE A BIT IN ORDER TO GET TO A
- 10 PLACE WHERE EVERYBODY'S CORE NEEDS ARE MET WHILE NOT CUTTING
- 11 OFF POTENTIAL EVOLUTION. FROM MY STANDPOINT, I'M COMFORTABLE
- 12 SUPPORTING THIS BILL AS CONSTRUCTED NOW AND KNOWING WE CAN
- 13 ADJUST OUR POSITION. AS DELIBERATIONS MOVE FORWARD, THEY START
- 14 TO VEER IN A DIRECTION THAT DOESN'T FUNDAMENTALLY WORK FOR THE
- 15 CORE PARTICIPANTS HERE. THANK YOU.

16

17 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: COMMISSIONER MELGAR?

- 19 MYRNA MELGAR: THANK YOU CHAIR NOACK. BUILDING OFF COMMISSIONER
- 20 JOHN-BAPTISTE'S POINTS VERY WELL SAID, I THINK THERE ARE GOING
- 21 TO BE DECISIONS THAT EACH OF THE COUNTIES ARE GOING TO HAVE TO
- 22 MAKE AFTER WE FINALIZE THE LANGUAGE IN THIS BILL AND THAT IS A
- 23 GOOD THING. I'M REALLY GRATEFUL TO SENATORS ARREGUIN AND
- 24 WIENER. I'M PARTICULARLY GRATEFUL TO RYAN MOSHEMI AND STAFF
- 25 BECAUSE I KNOW THEY WENT ABOVE AND BEYOND MEETING EVERYONE'S



- 1 NEEDS FOR THAT FLEXIBILITY WHICH WE ARE ALL GOING TO NEED, AS
- 2 WE'RE ALL CONNECTED. I WAS AT THE PRESS CONFERENCE ON MONDAY.
- 3 THANK YOU SO MUCH CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE
- 4 FOR YOUR WORDS. I REALLY APPRECIATED THE TONE AND THE POINTS
- 5 THAT WERE MADE BY EVERYONE, ESPECIALLY BY SUPERVISOR NOELIA
- 6 CORZO FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY WHO STRESSED ABOUT THE BENEFITS TO
- 7 WORKFORCE, TO OUR WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT GOALS FOR THE ENTIRE
- 8 REGION. AND ONE THING THAT DIDN'T GET MENTIONED THAT I WANTED
- 9 TO BRING UP AS A DISTRICT SEVEN SUPERVISOR WHICH IS ON THE
- 10 WEST SIDE OF SAN FRANCISCO IT HAS BOTH CITY COLLEGE, SAN
- 11 FRANCISCO STATE, AND UCSF PARNASSUS IN MY DISTRICT IS THE
- 12 INCREDIBLE ACCESS THAT THE REGIONAL OF OUR TRANSPORTATION
- 13 SYSTEMS BRIDGES TO EDUCATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES FOR YOUNG AND NOT
- 14 SO YOUNG PEOPLE ALL OVER THE REGION, PARTICULARLY BETWEEN SAN
- 15 MATEO COUNTY AND SAN FRANCISCO. SAN FRANCISCO STATE IS A VERY
- 16 LARGE COMMUTER SCHOOL. THE BART, SAMTRANS, AND MUNI
- 17 CONNECTIONS THAT EXIST AND WITH THAT DEPEND ON ONE ANOTHER, IS
- 18 CRUCIAL FOR THE SUCCESS OF THAT INSTITUTION, AND CITY COLLEGE,
- 19 AND UCSF PARNASSUS AND I THINK WE CAN TALK ABOUT THAT AND
- 20 LOOKING TOWARDS GETTING THIS PASSED AND GETTING SIGNATURES
- 21 GATHERED YOUNG PEOPLE WHO DEPEND ON THESE TRANSIT SYSTEMS FOR
- 22 OPPORTUNITIES AND ACCESS ARE GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT FOR
- 23 US GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.

25 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: CHAIR MAHAN?



1	
2	MATT MAHAN: THANK YOU CHAIR. I WANT TO THANK OUR FORMER SELECT
3	COMMITTEE CHAIR SPERING AND MTC STAFF FOR ALL THE WORK, I
4	THINK, TO ANDY'S POINT, WE HAVE MADE A LOT OF PROGRESS OVER
5	THE LAST YEAR AND THIS BODY HAS HELPED GUIDE THE CONVERSATION
6	IN A PRODUCTIVE WAY. APPRECIATE ALL THE DIALOGUE HERE THIS
7	MORNING. I WANTED TO PICK UP ON THE LINE OF QUESTIONING FROM
8	COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. IT SOUNDED, WITH THE BACK AND FORTH,
9	REBECCA, LIKE WE CLARIFIED THAT WHILE AND IT'S ONLINE MY
10	POSITION, I THINK IT'S PROBABLY MAJORITY POSITION HERE, THAT
11	WE SUPPORT THE ABILITY OF FELLOW TRANSIT OPERATORS TO SEEK
12	RELIEF AND TO BE ABLE TO GO TO THE BALLOT AND FIND A PATH TO
13	GENERATING THOSE RESOURCES AND I HAVE SPOKEN, I WILL NOT
14	YOU HAVE HEARD ME SAY THIS FAR TOO MANY TIMES BUT WE OBVIOUSLY
15	OURSELVES HAVE OUR OWN RENEWALS COMING UP IN SANTA CLARA
16	COUNTY AND ABOUT A BILLION DOLLAR WORTH OF EXISTING REVENUE
17	MEASURES BECAUSE WE HIT OUR FISCAL CLIFF 20 YEARS AGO SO WE
18	ARE PLANNING ON THOSE SIGNIFICANT RENEWALS COMING UP IT SOUNDS
19	LIKE WE HAVE ESTABLISHED THAT THE EXISTING GOVERNANCE OF
20	CALTRAIN AND FAIR SHARE CONTRIBUTIONS NEED TO BE WORKED OUT
21	THROUGH THE EXISTING JUDGE JPA WHICH HAS A NUMBER OF FINANCIAL
22	GOVERNANCE QUESTIONS BOUND UP THERE IS CONVERSATION WORK
23	HAPPENING ON CALTRAIN BOARD AMONGST THE THREE THAT BE MEMBERS
24	OF JPA IS THAT CORRECT.



REBECCA LONG: RIGHT THAT'S CORRECT THE LANGUAGE SAYS 1 2 CONTRIBUTIONS WILL BE DETERMINED THROUGH THE JPA MEMBER 3 AGENCIES. 4 5 MATT MAHAN: AND I THINK I HEARD THEREFORE THE NEW FRAMEWORK AND IT'S WORTH NOTING THIS LANGUAGE CAME OUT LESS THAN 24 6 HOURS AGO I HAVEN'T EVEN HAD A CHANCE, SINCE THE LANGUAGE CAME 7 8 OUT I HAVE NOT HAD A CHANCE TO GET ON THE PHONE WITH OUR STATE SENATOR WITH CORTESE WHO HAPPENS TO BE CHAIR OF THE 9 TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE THIS IS REALTIME AND I'M HESITANT TO 10 GIVE TOO MUCH DIRECTION ON WHAT WE'RE ALL SAYING AS A BODY 11 UNTIL WE HAVE DUG IN AND INTERPRETED IT, AND DEBATED IT OUT. I 12 THINK THERE IS AN ARGUMENT, FRANKLY, FOR DELAYING GIVEN 13 DIRECTION TO SUPPORT BUT I THINK THAT'S KIND OF STAFF REC, SO 14 15 JUST TO TALK THAT OUT FOR A MINUTE, THE INCEPTION, THEN, WAS THE TFRP FRAMEWORK, WHICH IS A RELATIVELY NEW CONCEPT HERE 16 WOULD APPLY TO THOSE JURISDICTIONS THOSE COUNTIES THAT ARE 17 OPTED IN TO RAISE REVENUE. IS THAT CORRECT? THAT'S WHAT I 18 THOUGHT I HEARD TEN MINUTES AGO BUT I'M SEEING PEOPLE SHAKE 19 THEIR HEADS NO. I'M NOT CLEAR WHAT THIS LEGISLATION IS 20 21 ACTUALLY PROPOSING. 22 REBECCA LONG: LET ME TRY AND CLARIFY, PAGE TEN OF THE BILL IF 23 ANYONE WANTS TO PULL IT UP PDF VERSION 67751A, SAYS LOCAL AND 24

REGIONAL STAKEHOLDERS, INCLUDING THE OPERATORS WE DISCUSSED,



COUNTIES THAT HAVE FUNDING RELATIONSHIP WITH AT LEAST ONE OF 1 THESE OPERATORS -- THIS IS INTENT LANGUAGE, INTENT OF THE 2 3 LEGISLATURE THAT THOSE ENTITIES COLLABORATIVELY DEVELOP A TFRP TO INFORM THE EXPENDITURE OF REVENUES FROM A MEASURE PURSUANT 4 5 TO THIS TITLE. SO I THINK THE IDEA IS THAT ALL OF THE COUNTIES THAT ARE SERVED BY THESE OPERATORS THAT WOULD INCLUDE SANTA 6 CLARA SAN MATEO EVEN THOUGH THEY'RE OPT IN WOULD BE AT THE 7 8 ABLE TO FIGURE OUT THIS TFRP BUT AGAIN THE ACTUAL DISCUSSION IN THE BILL OF DOLLARS, WHERE IT'S GOING, ALL OF THAT, WOULD 9 BE PERTAINING JUST TO THE REVENUE MEASURE. 10 11 MATT MAHAN: SURE. SO IT'S ONE THING IF IN LEGISLATION WE SAY 12 THAT MEMBER AGENCIES NEED ON HAVE A FRAMEWORK FOR FAIR SHARE 13 CONTRIBUTIONS. IF IT'S THAT HIGH-LEVEL GREAT, WE ALREADY AS A 14 15 COUNTY SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAVE BILATERAL AGREEMENTS WITH BOTH 16 BART AND CALTRAIN WE DON'T WANT TO REOPEN BILATERAL AGREEMENT I DON'T THINK BART WOULD WANT TO WE'RE PAYING 8% OPERATING 17 COSTS FOR 2% OF RIDERS IT'S A GOOD DEAL I WANT TO BE CAREFUL 18 ABOUT WHAT THE IMPLICATIONS ARE IT'S ONE THING TO SAY CERTAIN 19 JURISDICTIONS CERTAIN OPERATORS NEED RELIEF AND NEED ABILITY 20 21 TO GO TO VOTERS FOR MORE REVENUE EXISTING BILATERAL AGREEMENTS WITH BART AND CALTRAIN 2% OF BART'S RIDERSHIP TO BE CLEAR 22 CONTRIBUTING 8% OF OPERATING COST I THINK THE BILATERAL 23 AGREEMENTS INCLUDING JPA WHICH IS TRILATERAL AGREEMENT FOR 24

CALTRAIN IS THE APPROPRIATE VENUE TO WORK OUT FAIR SHARE



- 1 CONTRIBUTION OF EACH OF THE MEMBER PARTIES I CAN ONLY VOTE TO
- 2 SUPPORT TODAY IF THAT'S THE INTENTION, I DON'T THINK WE HAVE A
- 3 MOTION ON THE FLOOR I'M HAPPY TO MAKE ONE BUT IF AMENDED TO
- 4 CLARIFY THAT THE TFRP FRAMEWORK TO THOSE JURISDICTIONS THAT
- 5 ARE OPTING IN TO RAISE REVENUE THROUGH THIS REGIONAL
- 6 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE OUTSIDE OF THAT AND THIS IS WHAT I
- 7 THINK I'M HEARING FROM STAFF IS INTENT, IT'S NOT CLEAR TO ME I
- 8 THINK WUI SHOULD BE CLEAR WE OUGHT TO WORK THAT OUT THROUGH
- 9 JPA WHICH IS THE CONVERSATION WE'RE HAVING NOW.

10

- 11 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: LET ME ASK TO CLARIFY SOME OF THIS. THERE IS
- 12 A THIRD PARTY ENTITY WORKING ON NUMBERS RIGHT NOW TO ANALYZE,
- 13 SORT OF, CONTRIBUTIONS OR FAIR SHARE FOR THESE TRANSIT
- 14 AGENCIES. I BELIEVE THOSE NUMBERS WILL, SORT OF, BE THE
- 15 STARTING POINT FOR TFRP. SO THESE NUMBERS WILL HAVE ALREADY,
- 16 SORT OF, BEEN DEVELOPED AS TO FIRST STEPS AS TO FAIR SHARES BY
- 17 EACH OF THE COUNTIES. AM I -- DO YOU WANT TO TAKE IT FROM
- 18 THERE?

- 20 ALIX BOCKELMAN: THANK YOU, CHAIR. MTC, I THINK YOU ALL ASKED
- 21 THAT MTC CONVENE A THIRD PARTY FINANCIAL INDEPENDENT REVIEW.
- 22 SO WE'RE DOING THAT AND THAT PROVIDES INFORMATION THAT
- 23 HOPEFULLY CAN BE TRUSTED BY THE COUNTIES, THE TRANSIT
- 24 OPERATORS, AND BE USED AS, YOU KNOW, AS THEY DEVELOP
- 25 COLLABORATIVELY, YOU KNOW, THESE TARGET CONTRIBUTIONS. SO, I



1	THINK I THINK, AS I UNDERSTAND IT, AND WE'RE ALL TRYING TO
2	UNDERSTAND WITH THE INK DRYING IS REPRESENTS A PROCESS THAT
3	THE LEGISLATURE WOULD LIKE TO BE CONCLUDED BY JULY 31ST TO
4	ALLOW WHOEVER IS IN THE MEASURE THREE COUNTIES RIGHT WITH OPT
5	IN FOR TWO TO UNDERSTAND FAIR CONTRIBUTIONS ARE MAKING TO
6	THESE MULTI-COUNTY OPERATORS AND THAT STATES THAT WOULD ALLOW
7	FOR CALTRAIN JUST AS AN EXAMPLE TO FOLLOW ITS PROCESS THROUGH
8	THE MEMBER JPAS TO COME UP WITH WHAT THEY BELIEVE IS FAIR
9	CONTRIBUTIONS FROM THE COUNTY. I THINK ALL OF THIS IS TRUE AND
10	I VIEW THE TFRP AS AN IMPORTANT PROCESS TO ALLOW EVERYONE TO
11	HAVE UNDERSTANDING BY JULY 31ST TO GET AT WHAT I THINK
12	COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE WAS MENTIONING IS THAT IF SAN
13	FRANCISCO IS PARTICIPATING IT NEEDS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT ITS
14	CONTRIBUTION IS AND HOW THAT FITS ALONGSIDE ITS MEMBER
15	AGENCIES. THAT'S HOW I UNDERSTAND IT BUT IT FEELS COMPLICATED
16	WHEN I JUST SAID IT.
17	

- 18 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: IT SEEMS LIKE THE THIRD PARTY IS GOING TO BE
- 19 AT LEAST A STARTING POINT FOR THE JPA TO DISCUSS THE NUMBERS
- AMONGST THE THREE OF YOU. THAT'S WHAT IT SOUND LIKE TO ME. 20

- 22 MATT MAHAN: THANKS CHAIR. I APPRECIATE THE CLARIFICATION.
- LOOK, I THINK THE THIRD PARTY INDEPENDENT ANALYSIS OF WHAT IS 23
- FAIR SHARE, SERVICE LEVELS, AND UTILIZATION, AND ALL THE REST, 24
- I THINK THAT'S GREAT. FULLY SUPPORT THAT. THE NOTION THAT IN 25



1	STATE LAW WE MIGHT SAY HEY ALL MEMBER AGENCIES OUGHT TO COME
2	TOGETHER AND HAVE A SHARED FRAMEWORK FOR FAIR SHARE, GOOD
3	ENOUGH. WHERE DO THE NUMBERS LIVE AND WHO DECIDES WHAT IS THE
4	FAIR SHARE. I'M ARGUING FOR CALTRAIN THAT'S THE JPA LEVEL
5	BETWEEN THE THREE PARTIES I DO NOT BELIEVE AND AT LEAST FOR ME
6	TO VOTE ON ANYTHING TODAY I WOULD NEED TO BE CLEAR THOSE
7	NUMBERS DO NOT END UP IN STATUTE OR BECOME THE DESIGNATIONS OF
8	THE LEGISLATURE GOING FORWARD THERE IS A LOT TO DISCUSS AND
9	NEGOTIATE. LET'S BE HONEST IT'S NOT ALWAYS JUST ABOUT THE
10	NUMBERS SOMETIMES IT'S ABOUT GOVERNANCE QUESTIONS IT'S ABOUT
11	OTHER FACTORS. AND I AM CONCERNED ABOUT A MOVING FORWARD
12	LEGISLATION THAT MIGHT BE USURP ALL EXISTING AGREEMENTS FOR
13	JPA, CALTRAIN, BILATERAL AGREEMENT WITH BART WHICH BY THE WAY
14	PART OF WHAT WENT INTO THAT NEGOTIATION WAS DISCUSSION AND
15	DESIRE TO EXTEND PART BATA TO SILICON VALLEY AND GET TO
16	STATION AND THERE ARE RELATIONSHIPS, AND FAIR SHARE I'M
17	COMFORTABLE WITH THE LANGUAGE THAT CAME OUT LESS THAN 24 HOURS
18	AGO I CAN SUPPORT IF AMENDED TO CLARIFY WARE CLEAR ABOUT WHAT
19	WE SAID OR HAPPY TO ABSTAIN. DO YOU WANT A MOTION?
20	
21	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I HAVE A COUPLE OF HANDS THEN I'LL COME BACK
22	TO YOU. HOW'S THAT? COMMISSIONER MILEY?
23	

24 NATHAN MILEY: A FEW THINGS WANT TO SAY. I AGREE WITH

25 COMMISSIONER MAHAN. I DON'T THINK THE STATE SHOULD DICTATE.



- 1 BUT WHAT REALLY FRUSTRATES ME IS, AS WHEN BART WAS CREATED IT
- 2 WAS THREE COUNTIES. BACK IN THOSE DAYS, THE POLITICAL WILL
- 3 WASN'T THERE IT WOULDN'T HAVE GONE FORWARD MORE COUNTIES
- 4 SHOULD HAVE BEEN INCLUDED, SANTA CLARA, SAN MATEO, MINIMALLY,
- 5 WHERE WE ARE TODAY, LIKE MARILYN SAID, I HOPE SANTA CLARA AND
- 6 SAN MATEO JOIN THIS. BECAUSE WE'RE NOT PLANNING FOR TODAY
- 7 WE'RE PLANNING FOR TOMORROW WE CAN'T ANTICIPATE EVERYTHING, WE
- 8 COULDN'T ANTICIPATE THE PANDEMIC, NEW TECHNOLOGIES, WE CAN'T -
- 9 THE POPULATION OF THE BAY AREA IS GOING TO CONTINUE TO GROW.
- 10 AND IF WE DON'T HAVE THESE TWO COUNTIES IN THIS, I THINK WE'RE
- 11 DOING A DISSERVICE TO OUR CONSTITUENCIES THROUGHOUT AREA. I
- 12 THINK ALL NINE COUNTIES SHOULD BE IN. BUT LET'S PUT THAT
- 13 ASIDE.
- 14
- 15 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: PLEASE [LAUGHTER] LET'S NOT START ON THAT.
- 16 MILE NILE WE GET WITH THOSE FIVE COUNTIES IN, THAT'S A GOOD --
- 17 [LAUGHTER] THAT'S A BEGINNING. I THINK INSANITY IS JUST
- 18 REPEATING THE PROBLEMS OF THE PAST AND NOT CORRECTING. AND
- 19 LIKE COMMISSION ARE PAPAN PUT IT OUT, TRANSFORMATIVE AND
- 20 ACCOUNTABILITY. AND I KNOW WE'RE TRYING TO MIX A LOT OF STUFF
- 21 TOGETHER HERE BUT THE POINT IS IF WE DON'T GET IT AS RIGHT AS
- 22 WE CAN GET IT ALL WE'RE DOING IS 20 YEARS FROM NOW ANOTHER
- 23 GROUP OF ELECTED OFFICIALS ARE GOING TO FACE ANOTHER PROBLEM
- 24 FOR 20 YEARS AFTER THAT. I HOPE WE CAN GET SANTA CLARA AND SAN
- 25 MATEO TO JOIN US.



1 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER? BELIA RAMOS. THIS 2 3 IS THE PROBLEM -- GO AHEAD. I WANTED TO CALL YOU BY YOUR FIRST NAME AND GOT YOUR 50 NAME AS YOUR LAST NAME. [LAUGHTER] 4 5 BELIA RAMOS: IT'S ALL GOOD. COMMISSIONER SPERING USED TO CALL 6 ME WING WOMAN. SO, WHATEVER, I'LL RESPOND. I JUST WANT TO MAKE 7 8 SOME COMMENTS THAT ARE MORE GEARED TOWARDS OUR LEGISLATIVE STAFF AND COUNSEL IN LIGHT OF COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S COMMENTS. 9 THERE IS A COUPLE OF SECTIONS THAT IN THE ACTUAL BILL MAKE ME 10 CONCERNED. SO, EVEN THOUGH THE TFRP PROCESS OF 67751 SAYS 11 EVERYONE IS GOING TO BE AT THE TABLE, LET'S ALL PLAY NICE IN 12 THE SAND BOX AND FIGURE OUT THIS CALCULATION, WHICH I 13 ABSOLUTELY AGREE, THE INDEPENDENT AUDIT ANALYSIS IS GOING TO 14 15 REALLY BE THAT STARTING POINT. CALTRAIN IS SPECIFICALLY LEFT 16 OUT AND SAYING SECTION 67751C THAT THAT CONTRIBUTION IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY SHALL ONLY BE BY THE MEMBER AGENCIES. 17 SO, CALTRAIN IS ALREADY OFF AND ON ITS OWN. THE CONCERN I HAVE 18 FOR HOW THIS IS WRITTEN, AND I REALLY -- I AM -- I'M READING 19 IT AND HOW IT IS WRITTEN, I KNOW WHAT THE INTENT SAYS, BUT HOW 20 IT IS WRITTEN, IT IS ENVISIONING ALL FIVE COUNTIES AND THAT IS 21 BECAUSE IN SECTION 67751, SUBSECTION B, IT SAYS THE TFRP 22 IDENTIFIES TARGET CONTRIBUTIONS FROM THOSE CANDIDATES TO THOSE 23 TRANSIT OPERATORS. WELL, THAT'S ALL FIVE. AND, SO, THEN YOU GO 24 TO THE FUNDING MECHANISM PART, WHERE IT DOES IN FACT REFERENCE 25



- 1 THE TFRP, AND IN THE FUNDING MECHANISM, WHICH IS 67750 C-SUB-
- 2 E, SOMEONE TALKED TO THEM ABOUT THEIR TOO MANY LETTERS --
- 3 [LAUGHTER] E, THE 10% ALLOCATION TO MTC IS BASED ON THE
- 4 ADOPTED TFRP. AND THE TFRP HAS THE PROCESS OF ALL FIVE
- 5 COUNTIES. AND SO IF THE CONCERN OF MY COLLEAGUES FROM SANTA
- 6 CLARA IS THAT THIS IS GOING TO LIVE -- THESE NUMBERS ARE GOING
- 7 TO LIVE EMBODIED SOMEWHERE, IT SOUNDS TO ME LIKE THEY'RE GOING
- 8 TO LIVE HERE, DELEGATED THROUGH THIS SUBSECTION, AND THEN LIVE
- 9 HERE AT MTC. AND IF THAT IS NOT WHAT IS BEING SUPPORTED, AND
- 10 THERE ARE CONCERNS FROM BOTH SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA, I
- 11 THINK WE DO NEED TO -- TO UNDERSTAND WHAT IS BEING EXPECTED.
- 12 NOW, PERHAPS -- I UNDERSTAND THE INTENT OF THE SENATORS HERE,
- 13 THEY WANT YOU ALL IN. RIGHT? I HOPE YOU UNDERSTAND -- I DON'T
- 14 KNOW HOW MANY DIFFERENT WAYS WE CAN SAY YOU ALL NEED TO --
- 15 THERE IS THE SAND BOX FIGURE IT OUT AND GET ALL IN. THAT'S
- 16 WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO ACHIEVE HERE THEY'RE TRYING TO IMPOSE IT
- 17 UPON YOU. BUT WHAT I DON'T SEE CLEARLY WRITTEN IS A PATH FOR
- 18 THE OUT, FOR SAN MATEO AND SANTA CLARA. AND, SO, I THINK WHEN
- 19 WE LOOK AT WHAT A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT LOOKS LIKE, IS THAT IS TO
- 20 SECTION 67751, ADD AN E THERE THAT SAYS IF THERE IS A COUNTY
- 21 IN WHICH THOSE TRANSIT OPERATORS SERVE THAT DOES NOT
- 22 PARTICIPATE IN THE MEASURE, PROVIDE THE OUT. THERE IS NO OUT
- 23 HERE. THIS IS -- I THINK THIS IS INCREDIBLY WELL WHEREIN FOR A
- 24 FIVE-COUNTY AGREEMENT. WITH ALL DUE RESPECT TO COMMISSIONER
- 25 MILEY, I'M NOT GETTING IN THAT TRAIN HAS LEFT THE STATION. BUT



- 1 WE NEED TO LOOK AT HOW WE CAN SEEK AN AMENDMENT TO ACTUALLY
- 2 CARVE-OUT SPACE IF WE DON'T HAVE THAT JOINING. WHAT THIS ALSO
- 3 SOUNDS LIKE, AND IS AWKWARD, I THINK, IS THIS IS A CONDITION
- 4 PRECEDENT FOR US TO BE ABLE TO GET THIS BILL. RIGHT? LIKE, YOU
- 5 -- SAN FRANCISCO HAS TOO MANY EGGS IN THIS BASKET, AND SAN
- 6 MATEO AND SANTA CLARA, YOU'RE HOLDING A LOT OF POWER HERE.
- 7 AND, SO, I THINK THAT THIS DIALOGUE HAS BEEN INCREDIBLY
- 8 PRODUCTIVE FOR US TO REALIZE JUST HOW MUCH YOUR OTHER
- 9 CANDIDATES NEED YOU AT THE TABLE. BUT I THINK, FOR OUR STAFF,
- 10 WHAT WE REALLY DO NEED TO DO IS PROVIDE THE DIRECTION TO
- 11 ENSURE THAT THIS BILL DOES ENVISION A WAY OUT FOR TWO
- 12 COUNTIES, A METHOD FORWARD, AND THAT THE CONTINUE% MTC
- 13 REGIONAL TRANSFORMATION PORTION REALLY DOES, IN FACT, ADDRESS
- 14 THE CONCERNS RAISED BY COMMISSIONER MILEY ABOUT WHERE THAT
- 15 TRANSFORMATION IS GOING TO HAVE A LINKAGE TO THE RETURN TO
- 16 SOURCE. WE'RE NOT GOING TO GET THERE AT THE BALLOT BOX IF WE
- 17 CANNOT CONTINUE ON RETURN TO SOURCE PROMISES IF IT MEANS
- 18 SOMETHING DIFFERENT FOR EVERY JURISDICTION.

20 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: PAPAN.

- 22 GINA PAPAN: WOW. AGAIN, THIS CAME OUT YESTERDAY GOT EVERYTHING
- 23 5:00 P.M. LAST NIGHT THIS IS RUSH AHEAD LOOK BACK LATER.
- 24 DEEPLY CONCERNS. WE HAVE AN EXISTING AGREEMENT WITH BART AND
- 25 THEY'RE NOT ABIDING BY IT SO TO THINK EVERYBODY IS BEING

19



- 1 TREATED FAIRLY, THEY ARE NOT. OKAY? WE DO -- WE ARE PART OF
- 2 THE CALTRAIN JPA HERE, WE STAND BY THAT. BUT TO PUT SOMETHING
- 3 IN HERE, WHICH I HAD SUSPECTED, IS JUST WHAT COMMISSIONER
- 4 RAMOS IDENTIFIED HERE, THAT IS A HUGE, HUGE PROBLEM. AND DON'T
- 5 THINK WE DON'T PLAY REGIONALLY. WE HAVE SAN FRANCISCO'S JAIL,
- 6 WE HAVE THEIR AIRPORT, WE HAVE A LOT OF REGIONAL THINGS HERE
- 7 THAT WE'RE PARTICIPATING IN HERE. AND BART NOW GOES TO THE
- 8 AIRPORT BECAUSE SAN MATEO COUNTY PARTICIPATED IN THAT. SO,
- 9 THIS IS REGIONAL. BUT THE EQUITY IS NOT THERE. AND TO HAVE
- 10 SOMEBODY, THIS LEGISLATION DETERMINE WHAT EVERYBODY ELSE IS
- 11 GOING TO PAY, IS NOT ACCURATE. BECAUSE WE'RE NOT GETTING THE
- 12 SAME RESULTS FROM THAT AND AS I POINTED OUT, BART WILL NOT
- 13 INCLUDE DALY CITY IN THE RIDER NUMBERS HERE. BUT YET ARE
- 14 ASKING US TO PROVIDE \$3 MILLION FOR THE FARE GATES GOING INTO
- 15 DALY CITY. AND WE'RE ASKING TO PAY FOR ALL THE FACEBOOK GATES
- 16 WITHIN SAN MATEO COUNTY THERE IS A DOUBLE STANDARD HERE. WE
- 17 WANT REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION IT'S NOT SIMPLE HERE WE'RE
- 18 WORKING WITH SENATOR WIENER, PLEASE TONIGHT THINK EVERYONE IS
- 19 BEING TREATED THE SAME HERE WILL. THE AGREEMENT COMMISSIONER
- 20 MAHAN POINTED OUT IS IN EXISTENCE HERE WE DO HAVE A LOCAL
- 21 MEASURE THAT PROVIDES MOST OF OUR TRANSPORTATION FUND THAT'S
- 22 COMING UP IN 2027 IT PROVIDES ROADS EVERYTHING ELSE HERE THESE
- 23 ARE MAJOR ISSUES AS WELL AS TEN OF OUR CITIES WILL BE BROUGHT
- 24 UP TO THE 10% SALES TAX LINE. SO, AGAIN THERE IS A WHOLE BUNCH
- 25 OF PRINCIPLES I AGREED TO. THERE IS TOO MUCH THAT IS YET TO BE



- 1 DETERMINED. SO, I WILL BE ABSTAINING AT THIS POINT IN TIME AND
- 2 I HOPE SOME PEOPLE WILL JOIN US UNTIL WE WORK OUT THE DETAILS.
- 3 THANK YOU

4

5 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE.

- 7 ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: THANK YOU. JUST TO CLARIFY, I THINK I
- 8 HAVE A MORE FLEXIBLE UNDERSTANDING OF THE TFRP PROCESS THAN
- 9 PART OF WHAT I HAVE BEEN HEARING FROM FOLKS. I AM CERTAINLY
- 10 SUPPORTIVE OF HAVING CLARIFYING LANGUAGE THAT MAKES IT MORE
- 11 EXPLICIT THAT THIS IS AN OPT IN PROCESS, OR THE MEASURE ITSELF
- 12 IS OPT IN. I THOUGHT I SAW THAT PRETTY CLEARLY IN THE DRAFT
- 13 BUT CERTAINLY DON'T HAVE ANY ISSUE WITH MAKING THAT MORE
- 14 CLEAR. THE WAY THAT I'M UNDERSTANDING THE QUOTE UNQUOTE TFRP
- 15 IS THAT BY THE TIME WE ACTUALLY HAVE SOMETHING THAT GOES TO
- 16 THE BALLOT, IT HAS TO BE VERY, VERY CLEAR HOW MANY MONEY
- 17 SUCCESS RAID AND HOW IT IS BEING SPENT. AND THE BLUEPRINT FOR
- 18 HOW MUCH MONEY IS BEING RAISED AND HOW IT IS BEING SPENT IS
- 19 THIS PROCESS THAT THE STATE LEGISLATORS, I THINK, WISELY, ARE
- 20 SAYING, HEY, REGION, YOU HAVE TO DECIDE HOW MUCH IS BEING
- 21 RAISED AND HOW IT IS BEING SPENT. WE ARE NOT DECIDING THAT. WE
- 22 ARE THE STATE LEGISLATORS. THIS IS YOUR RESPONSIBILITY. SO,
- 23 BECAUSE IT DOESN'T ACTUALLY GET MORE SPECIFIC THAN THAT, AT
- 24 LEAST IN WHAT I READ, I THINK THERE IS ALL KINDS OF ROOM FOR
- 25 US TO BUILD ON OUR EXISTING FRAMEWORKS, OUR EXISTING BOTH



1	BILATERAL AND TRILATERAL AGREEMENTS. THOSE AGREEMENTS ARE
2	DIRECTLY RELEVANT TO WHAT HAPPENS WITH NEWSPAPERING BECAUSE
3	WHERE SANTA CLARA SAY WE'RE READY TO REVISIT THE BART
4	CONTRIBUTION THAT CREATES A WHOLE SOMEWHERE ELSE THAT THEN HAS
5	TO BE CONSIDERED. I SEE THESE, SORT OF, INPUT TO A LARGER
6	PROCESS WHICH IS GIVING COMFORT TO TRUST COLLECTIVE CAPACITY
7	AND FLEXIBILITY THAT'S BEEN WRITTEN INTO THIS ENABLING
8	LEGISLATION AT THIS POINT.
9	
10	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU. ASHCRAFT?
11	
12	MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: I APPRECIATE COMMENTS FROM ALL OF YOU
13	ESPECIALLY SAN MATEO COUNTY AND SANTA CLARA COUNTY IT GIVES A
14	BETTER UNDERSTANDING. THIS IS PROBABLY AN OBTUSE QUESTION BUT
15	WOULDN'T IT BE A MATTER OF FUNDAMENTAL FAIRNESS THAT IF SANTA
16	CLARA IS ALREADY PAYING 8% OF BART COSTS FOR THE 2% OF
17	RIDERSHIP, IT CONTRIBUTES AND WHATEVER IS GOING ON IN SAN
18	MATEO COUNTY WITH BART I'M READY TO STEP IN AND HELP MEDIATE
19	THAT BUT WOULDN'T THEY GET SOME CREDIT IF THEY'RE ALREADY
20	CONTRIBUTING TO THESE TRANSIT AGENCIES?
21	
22	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OH MARILYN. [LAUGHTER]



MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: SHOULD I WITHDRAW THAT QUESTION? WELL, 1 I UNDERSTAND FISCAL CLIFF AND WE NEED TO NOT GO OVER IT, BUT I 2 3 -- I MEAN. 4 5 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: OKAY. I WANTED YOU --6 7 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: I'M LEAVING WITH THAT. 8 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YOU CAN STAY FIVE MINUTES? YEAH, JUST STAY 9 10 PUT. 11 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: OKAY. 12 13 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I'M TELLING THE MAYOR THIS. 14 15 16 MARILYN EZZY-ASHCRAFT: AS A NEW COMMISSIONER I CAN ASK THESE OBTUSE QUESTIONS. IT'S OKAY. 17 18 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: IT'S OKAY. I'LL EXPLAIN IT TO YOU LATER. 19 HOW'S THAT? I THINK THAT'S BETTER [LAUGHTER] SO, WOULD YOU 20 LIKE TO MAKE THE AMENDED MOTION? I APPRECIATE YOUR WORDS AND 21 YOUR COMMENTS AND YOUR SUGGESTIONS. I THINK IT'S PERSONALITY 22 THAT WE REALIZE THAT THE TFRP, WHEN IT COMES DOWN TO THE END 23 OF THE BILL, ONLY INCLUDES THOSE COUNTIES THAT HAVE OPTED IN. 24

I THINK THE THIRD PARTY NUMBERS THAT WILL COME OUT WILL GIVE



US ALL AN IDEA ESPECIALLY FOR COMMISSIONER JOHN-BAPTISTE'S 1 COMMENT TO UNDERSTAND, SORT OF, WHERE EVERYBODY SITS AND THE 2 3 END ULTIMATE THE BILL HAS GOT TO OUTLINE THE TFRP NUMBERS FOR THOSE COUNTIES THAT ARE IN WHICH GOES TO COMMISSIONER RAMOS'S 4 5 POINT. FIRE AWAY. 6 MATT MAHAN: HAPPY TO TRY TO FORMULATE A MOTION. APPRECIATE 7 8 EVERYBODY'S COMMENTS AND I KNOW WE ACT IN GOOD FAITH TOGETHER COLLABORATIVELY AND ARE GOING TO ADDRESS THIS FISCAL CLIFF AND 9 MOVE OUR REGION FORWARD I APPRECIATE COMMISSIONER RAMOS'S 10 COMMENTS AND WOULD ASK IF YOU HAVE ANY FRIENDLY AMENDMENTS ON 11 MY MOTION I WOULD APPRECIATE IT I THINK YOU GOT TO THE HEART 12 OF THE MATTER BETTER THAN I DID BUT I'LL MOVE SUPPORT IF 13 AMENDED WITH THE AMENDMENT BEING INTENDED TO SIMPLY ENSURE 14 15 THAT THE LANGUAGE IS EXTREMELY CLEAR THAT EXISTING 16 ARRANGEMENTS FOR FUNDING OF CALTRANS -- BASICALLY THE TFRP APPLIES ON AN OPT IN BASIS I KNOW SANTA CLARA COUNTY IS STILL 17 CONSIDERING, IF WE'RE FOUR OR FIVE COUNTIES WOULD BE GREAT, 18 AND TO COMMISSIONER RAMOS'S POINT WE NEED TO RENEW AND WE WILL 19 MAKE GOOD ON OUR OBLIGATION TO CALTRAIN AND BART. 20 21 COMMISSIONER? 22 23 BELIA RAMOS: I WILL HELP YOU CLARIFY. I BELIEVE WHAT YOU ARE

SAYING IS SUPPORT -- SUPPORT IF MANNED TO REFLECT A CLEAR PATH

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



FORWARD FOR A 3, 4, AND 5 COUNTY OPTION THAT INCLUDES 1 2 REFLECTION IN THE TFRP PROCESS. 3 MATT MAHAN: WITH TFRP APPLYING TO THOSE WHO OPT IN. 4 5 SPEAKER: RIGHT. 6 7 8 MATT MAHAN: THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE A SECOND? 9 10 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: WE HAVE ANOTHER FRIENDLY AMENDMENT, I THINK. 11 SPEAKER: I HOPE THIS IS FRIENDLY. I HOPE IT'S FRIENDLY. 12 13 MATT MAHAN: I ALWAYS TAKE YOUR AMENDMENTS AS FRIENDLY. 14 15 16 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. TO ME IT MAKES MORE SENSE IF IT IS CONSTRUCTED THAT PARTICIPATION IN TFRP DOES NOT CONSTITUTE 17 PARTICIPATION IN THE MEASURE. BECAUSE IF WE -- I STILL DON'T 18 KNOW HOW WE UNDERSTAND WHAT EVEN A THREE-COUNTY MEASURE FUNDS 19 IF WE DON'T KNOW WHAT THE FIVE COUNTIES ARE DOING. 20 21 22 MATT MAHAN: I'M SAYING THE OPPOSITE IN THAT WE MAY HAVE OUR OWN MEASURE IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. WE CERTAINLY NEED TO HAVE A 23 RENEWAL MEASURE WE'RE LOOKING TO GO EARLY TO GENERATE 24

ADDITIONAL REVENUE OR EVEN POTENTIALLY JOIN. IF WE JOIN, I



- 1 THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE FOR US TO FALL UNDER THE TFRP
- 2 FRAMEWORK. IF WE DON'T, HOWEVER, I THINK IT CONTINUES TO BE
- 3 MOST APPROPRIATE TO HAVE THE CALTRAIN JPA, THE THREE COUNTIES
- 4 WORK OUT WHAT FAIR SHARE LOOKS LIKE, RESOLVE EXISTING
- 5 GOVERNANCE QUESTIONS THAT ARE OUTSTANDING, AND THAT GETS BAKED
- 6 IN. AND SAN FRANCISCO'S CONTRIBUTION TO CALTRAIN WOULD
- 7 PRESUMABLY BE PARTLY GENERATED BY THE NEW REVENUE FROM
- 8 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. BOUT OURS WOULD COME THROUGH
- 9 SOME OTHER MECHANISM AND WE NEED TO FIGURE THAT OUT.

10

- 11 SPEAKER: RIGHT. WHAT I'M SUGGESTING IS THAT TFRP DOES NOT
- 12 DESIGNATE THE MECHANISM BY WHICH THE FUNDING HAPPENS TO THE
- 13 VARIOUS COUNTIES. BUT WE DO ACTUALLY NEED TO KNOW BETWEEN NOW
- 14 AND THE END OF JULY WHERE EVERYBODY STANDS. AND, SO, IF WE
- 15 DON'T HAVE --

16

- 17 MATT MAHAN: I'M FINE WITH THAT. I DON'T WANT TO DELEGATE THAT
- 18 TO THE STATE LEGISLATURE TO DETERMINE. WE HAVE A JPA FOR A
- 19 REASON AND WE HAVE AN EXISTING BOARD AND GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE
- 20 FOR CALTRAIN. AND I'M VERY HESITANT TO DELEGATE TO THE STATE
- 21 LEGISLATURE, ALL THE WAY IN SACRAMENTO, HOW WE'RE GOING TO
- 22 FIGURE OUT OUR FAIR SHARE FINANCIALLY BETWEEN THE THREE
- 23 COUNTIES. I THINK THERE'S A LOT MORE --



- 1 SPEAKER: I'M NOT SUGGESTING THAT WE MESS WITH JPA AT ALL. IN
- 2 FACT THE LEGISLATION SPECIFICALLY CALLS OUT, JPA HANDLES
- 3 CALTRAIN. WHAT I'M SAYING IS, IF WE ARE NOT -- IF THE FIVE
- 4 COUNTIES CAN'T HAVE A COLLECTIVE CONVERSATION OVER THE NEXT
- 5 FEW MONTHS ABOUT WHO CONTRIBUTES WHAT TO WHOM, THEN I DON'T
- 6 KNOW HOW WE PROCEED WITH A MULTI-COUNTY MEASURE.

7

- 8 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: AND I THINK THAT, AS COMMISSIONER RAMOS
- 9 SAID, IT EXCLUDES THE CALTRAIN PIECE. BUT THE NUMBERS
- 10 GENERATED GIVES YOU, AT LEAST, A STARTING POINT TO HAVE THAT
- 11 DISCUSSION, BUT I DON'T THINK IT LEGISLATES YOU.

12

13 SPEAKER: IT DOESN'T REQUIRE YOU TO PARTICIPATE.

- 15 BELIA RAMOS: IN MY COMMENTS AND WHAT I SAID IS IT SEEMS TO ME
- 16 THE INTENT OF THE LEGISLATURE HERE IS TO MAKE THE TFRP PROCESS
- 17 A CONDITION PRECEDENT TO MOVING FORWARD ON THE BILL. AND, SO,
- 18 THAT, WHILE I ABSOLUTELY UNDERSTAND THE CONCERNS, MY
- 19 RECOMMENDATION IN THE OFFLOADING IS POST TFRP. BECAUSE NOT TO
- 20 GET YOU OUT OF THE TFRP, BECAUSE I AGREE WITH COMMISSIONER
- 21 JOHN-BAPTISTE THAT THAT COLLECTIVE DISCUSSION IS IMPORTANT.
- 22 WHAT I'M SAYING IN THE RECOMMENDATION THAT I MADE, THAT THE
- 23 TFRP DOES STAY INCLUDED, THE NUMBERS COME OUT, AND THAT THE
- 24 OFFLOADING OF COUNTY 4 AND 5 HAPPEN POST TFRP, AND THEY DO NOT



GET PUT IN STONE AT MTC IF YOU'RE NOT IN THE BILL. SO, SHALL I 1 2 TRY AND MAKE THIS MOTION FOR YOU? 3 MATT MAHAN: YOU'RE DOING A GREAT JOB OF IT, BUT I WILL JUST 4 5 SAY WE HAVEN'T DISCUSSED WHETHER IT'S BINDING OR NOT. THE 6 ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION IS ONE THING. 7 8 BELIA RAMOS: I ABSOLUTELY -- SO, I AGREE WITH YOU ON THAT. SO IF YOU LOOK AT THE SPECIAL REPORT THAT CAME OUT BEFORE MY 9 TIME, THE SPECIAL REPORT DOES IN FACT HAVE THAT AS A STARTING 10 POINT TO FIND A COLLABORATIVE CONSENSUS IS THE LANGUAGE IN OUR 11 REPORT. I BELIEVE IT DOES NOT, AND MY MOTION WOULD BE THAT IT 12 WOULD NOT BE BINDING IF WE ALLOW THE OFFLOADING OF COUNTIES 4 13 AND 5, I'M JUST GOING TO CALL YOU THAT, YOU ALL DECIDE WHICH 14 NUMBER YOU LIKE BETTER BUT IF YOU ALLOW OFFLOADING OF 4 AND 5 15 16 POST TFRP SO THAT WHEN THE TFRP PROCESS COMES OVER ON THE 10% THAT IS IN LINE FOR REGIONAL TRANSFORMATIVE WORK AT MTC, SANTA 17 CLARA AND SAN MATEO, IF YOU CHOOSE TO STAY OUT, YOU'RE NOT 18 PART OF THAT. IT IS NOT EMBODIED ANYWHERE, ALTHOUGH YOUR 19 NUMBER CONTRIBUTIONS ARE IN FACT UTILIZED TO INFORM THOSE 20 21 PARTS THAT DO GET BAKED INTO THE 10% TFRP TRANSFORMATIVE WORK 22 THAT'S GOING HAPPEN THROUGH THE MEASURE. DID YOU GET THAT? 23 MATT MAHAN: THINK SO. THAT MAKES SENSE. 24

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



BELIA RAMOS: COOL IF YOU DID, BUT IT'S MORE STAFF, DID STAFF 1 GET WHAT I SAID? 2 3 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES? HAD. 4 5 BELIA RAMOS: OKAY. DOES THAT ACTUALLY PLEASE COMMISSIONER 6 7 JOHN-BAPTISTE AND COMMISSIONER MAHAN? 8 9 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES? 10 BELIA RAMOS: IF IT DOES I WOULD BE HAPPY TO GIVE A SECOND 11 BECAUSE THAT WAS YOUR MOTION. 12 13 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. MAHAN, RAMOS. 14 15 OKAY. NOW WE HAVE TO GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT. YEAH. [LAUGHTER] 16 WE'RE GOING TO STICK TO ONE MINUTE ON PUBLIC COMMENT. 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU GOT IT. EXCUSE ME. FIRST UP IS IN 18 THE BOARDROOM, STILL HERE, SEBASTIAN PETTY IF YOU WILL 19 APPROACH THE PODIUM? 20 21 22 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING CHAIR NOACK AND COMMISSIONERS SEBASTIAN PETTY WITH SPUR. SPUR APPRECIATES THE WORK OF MTC AND SENATORS 23 ARREGUIN AND WIENER TO BRING US TO THIS POINT AND HAPPY TO SAY 24

THAT THE SPUR BOARD HAS TAKEN A PRELIMINARY SUPPORT POSITION



- 1 ON SB63 EVEN AS WE KNOW THE LEGISLATION WILL CONTINUE TO
- 2 EVOLVE. THIS IS A PRAGMATIC CHOICE WE HAVE TAKEN THE LEAP TO
- 3 SUPPORT THIS BILL NOT BECAUSE OF SPECIFIC POLICY PROVISIONS OR
- 4 BECAUSE WE'RE ESPECIALLY EXCITED ABOUT A SALES TAX BUT BECAUSE
- 5 OF HOW DEEPLY NECESSARY THIS BILL IS. THE BAY AREA SIMPLY
- 6 CANNOT FUNCTION WITHOUT TRANSIT. OUR ECONOMY, ENVIRONMENT, AND
- 7 OUALITY OF LIFE AND OUR VISION FOR THE REGION'S FUTURE ARE ALL
- 8 TIED TO THE SURVIVAL AND SUCCESS OF THESE SYSTEMS IS. WE
- 9 RECOGNIZE THAT THERE IS MORE WORK TO DO BEFORE THE LEGISLATION
- 10 WILL WORK FOR EVERYONE BUT WE'RE CONFIDENT WITH YOUR CONTINUED
- 11 WORK AND LEADERSHIP WE CAN GET TO A BILL NA IS PRACTICAL,
- 12 FAIR, AND LAYS THE GROUPED WORK FOR A SUCCESSFUL MEASURE.
- 13 THANK YOU.

14

- 15 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP BEFORE WE GO TO THE
- 16 ZOOM SPACE, I DID RECEIVE A LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE FROM
- 17 CHRISTY WEGENER OF LAVTA, THAT WAS POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA
- 18 AND DISTRIBUTED TO YOU LAST NIGHT.

19

- 20 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: IF ANYONE WANTS TO SPEAK PUBLICLY REMOTELY
- 21 IF THEY RAISE THEIR HAND NOW?

- 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I THINK YOU JUST DID. THOSE WHO WANT TO
- 24 SPEAK ENSURE YOUR HAND IS RAISED NOW SO THAT YOU ARE CALLED TO



SPEAK. ONE MINUTE. KEN BUKOWSKI, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. 1 2 FLUSH. 3 SPEAKER: CAN YOU HEAR ME? 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YES. 6 7 8 SPEAKER: ONE OF THE THINGS THAT REALLY ESCAPES ME HERE IS THAT TRANSPORTATION PROVIDES BENEFITS TO PROPERTY OWNERS. THE VALUE 9 OF LAND IS DETERMINED BY TRANSPORTATION ACCESS. WHY IS THERE 10 NO CONSIDERATION THAT -- PROPERTY OWNERS CONTRIBUTES TO THIS 11 THEY'RE REALLY THE ONES THAT MAKE THE MONEY FROM THE 12 TRANSPORTATION. THANK YOU. 13 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ROLAND LEBRUN. 15 16 SPEAKER: HELLO AGAIN, COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU FOR THE 17 18 VIGOROUS CONVERSATION. THIS IS A GREAT START. THE ONLY THING I WOULD RECOMMEND AT THIS POINT IS THAT YOU CONSIDER EXTENDING 19 THE EFFICIENCY AND TRANSPARENCY OVERSIGHT TO ALL FIVE BAY AREA 20 COUNTIES, WHETHER THEY OPT IN OR NOT. BECAUSE THIS WOULD GO A 21

LONG WAY TOWARDS BUILDING -- [INDISCERNIBLE] DEFICITS. WITHOUT

[INDISCERNIBLE] MEASURE WHICH PASSED BACK IN 2020. THANK YOU.

INCOME TAX MEASURE OVER AND ABOVE IN THREE COUNTIES,

25

22

23



CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ADINA LEVIN. 1 2 3 ADINA LEVIN: ADINA LEVIN, SEAMLESS BAY AREA, VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION FOUNDED TO SUPPORT REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION 4 5 FUNDING. WE ARE NOT YET TAKING A POSITION. I'M WAITING FOR SOME ADDITIONAL INFORMATION COMING FROM VOTER SURVEYS THAT 6 WILL HELP VALIDATE THE OPTIONS FOR FUNDING MECHANISMS AND THE 7 8 SIZE OF A FUNDING MECHANISM. WE WANT TO BE ABLE TO SUPPORT A BILL. ONE THING THAT WE REALLY CARE ABOUT IS THE TRANSIT 9 TRANSFORMATION. THANKS SO MUCH TO MTC FOR LEADERSHIP ON THIS 10 PROPORTION. YOU KNOW, THINGS LIKE THE BAY PASS, THE WHOLE IS 11 GREATER THAN THE SUM OF THE PARTS. RIDERSHIP HAS GROWN BY 12 AUTHORITY TO 40%, YOU KNOW, BENEFITTING EVERYONE. SO, THAT'S 13 SOMETHING WHERE YOU CAN'T PUT HUMPTY DUMPTY BACK TOGETHER. 14 15 LASTLY THANKS TO THE COMMISSIONERS WHO HAVE BEEN URGING FOR 16 THE TFRP TO WORK OUT ALL OF THE INVESTMENTS ACROSS THE COUNTIES, VOTERS NORTE GOING TO VOTE FOR A MEASURE EVEN IF 17 THERE IS PUZZLE PIECES THAT PLUG IN IF CALTRAIN AND BART ARE 18 GOING TO COLLAPSE BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW THE WHOLE PICTURE. 19 20 THANK YOU. 21 22 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RANDI KINMAN? 23

RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. RANDI KINMAN. I AM FROM THE POLICY

ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND I WISH WE HAD THIS BIT OF INFORMATION

24



- 1 YESTERDAY AT OUR MEETING. I WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER RAMOS
- 2 FOR SUCCINCTLY SUMMING UP COMMISSIONER MAHAN'S AND PAPAN'S
- 3 CONCERNS BECAUSE THEY'RE QUITE SERIOUS CONCERNS. WITH THAT I
- 4 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT ALL FIVE COUNTIES STAY IN THE MIX AND
- 5 STAY IN THE CONVERSATION UNTIL THE BITTER END HERE. BECAUSE I
- 6 THINK THAT'S THE ONLY WAY THAT WE'RE GOING TO RESOLVE ALL THE
- 7 OUESTIONS AND RESOLVE ALL THE ISSUES, AND AS SOMEBODY WHO SAT
- 8 ON THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE, I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR
- 9 CONTINUING TO MOVE THIS PROCESS FORWARD.

10

11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. HOWARD WONG.

- 13 HOWARD WONG: HOWARD WONG, I WOULD LIKE TO FOCUS ON A MORE
- 14 REGIONAL BENEFITS APPROACH TO THE MEASURES. SUPPORTING A
- 15 VISION THAT BENEFITS EVERYONE, IF SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA WERE
- 16 A COUNTRY, ITS ECONOMY WOULD BE THE WORLD'S 19th LARGEST WITH
- 17 GTP OF \$1 TRILLION. SO, WE NEED TO COMMUNICATE TRANSIT AND
- 18 MOBILITY AS A REGIONAL ECONOMIC DRIVER. TRANSFORMING MOBILITY
- 19 OPTIONS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA WOULD BE A VERY IMPORTANT
- 20 ISSUE TO BRING BEFORE PEOPLE THE UNIVERSAL BENEFITS OF
- 21 REDUCING MOBILITY COSTS, FOR CITIZENS AS A PERCENTAGE OF
- 22 ANNUAL INCOME IS SOMETHING EVERY VOTER WOULD UNDERSTAND. SO WE
- 23 NEED TO REALLY FOCUS ON THE REGIONAL TRANSIT TRANSFORMATIONS
- 24 THAT HAVE ALREADY TAKEN PLACE AND THAT HAVE BEEN PRETTY
- 25 AMAZING. THANK YOU.



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
3	RAISED HANDS.
4	
5	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: GREAT. MOTION SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION COMMISSIONER MAHAN; SECOND,
8	COMMISSIONER RAMOS. CHAIR NOACK?
9	
10	CHAIR, SUE NOACK: YES.
11	
12	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EXCUSE ME. VICE CHAIR MOULTON-PETERS?
13	
14	V. CHAIR, STEPHANIE MOULTON PETERS: YES.
15	
16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
17	
18	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
19	
20	SPEAKER: AYE.
21	
22	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER AHN IS AN AYE.
23	COMMISSIONER ANDERSON? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER ASHCRAFT?
24	
25	MADII.VN F77V-ACHCDAFT. AVE



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: BURT?
3	
4	PAT BURT: YES.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA? FLEMING?
7	
8	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES JOHN-BAPTISTE?
9	
10	ALICIA JOHN-BAPTISTE: AYE.
11	
12	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: KAPLAN IS ABSENT. MAHAN IS ABSENT.
13	MANFREE?
14	
15	AMBER MANFREE: AYE.
16	
17	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MASHBURN? MELGAR?
18	
19	MYRNA MELGAR: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MILEY?
22	
23	NATHAN MILEY: AYE.
24	
25	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN? ABSTAIN.



1 2 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RAMOS? 3 BELIA RAMOS: AYE. 4 5 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES WITH ONE ABSTENTION. 6 7 8 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: THANK YOU EVERYBODY FOR THAT. ITEM TEN IS GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENCEMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS. DO WE HAVE ANY 9 10 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING NO 12 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM TO SPEAK THERE ARE A COUPLE OF PERSONS IN 13 14 THE ZOOM SPACE HOW MUCH TIME? 15 16 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: ONE MINUTE. 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICTORIA DEWITT FOLLOWED BY ADINA LEVIN. 18 19 SPEAKER: I SUBMITTED A LETTER TO THE COMMISSION EARLIER --20 21 PRESENTED EARLIER IT WAS ABOUT THE SAN RAFAEL SECOND AND 4TH STREET INTERSECTION IMPROVEMENT PROJECT WHICH IS PART OF THE 22 ONE BAY AREA GRANT THREE PROGRAM. I EXPRESSED BY CONCERNS 23 ABOUT PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT AND THE EXPANDING SCOPE OF THIS 24 PROJECT. I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW WHO IS THE APPROPRIATE PERSON AT 25



MTC THAT I COULD TALK WITH ABOUT THIS PROJECT. THANK YOU. 1 2 FLUSH. 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. NEXT UP WILL BE ADINA LEVIN. 4 5 ADINA LEVIN: YES. SO, BUILDING ON THE PREVIOUS DISCUSSION 6 ABOUT REGIONAL FUNDING IN ORDER TO ENABLE PUBLIC 7 8 TRANSPORTATION IN THE BAY AREA TO BE ABLE TO CONTINUE AND DO A BETTER JOB OF SUPPORTING OUR EOUITY GOALS, OUR CLIMATE GOALS, 9 OUR HOUSING GOALS. THE FUNDING IS GOING TO BE ESSENTIAL AND 10 THE REGIONAL FUNDING IS ONE PIECE OF A BROADER PUZZLE THAT 11 WILL INCLUDE STATE FUNDING. THE WORK AT THE BUDGET RIGHT NOW, 12 THE WORK ON THE CAP-AND-TRADE RENEWAL, AND THE WORK ON SOME 13 LONGER TERM SOLUTIONS, AS WELL, IT WILL TAKE STATE AND 14 REGIONAL AND IN SOME CASES, SOME LOCAL SOLUTIONS. ALL THE 15 16 BUDGET, ALL THE PUZZLE PIECE NEED TO FIT TOGETHER AND WE ARE ALL DEPENDENT ON THAT SYSTEM TO WORK TO REACH THOSE GOALS. WE 17 WILL ALL HANG TOGETHER OR WILL HANG SEPARATELY. THANK YOU. 18 19 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL 20 21 RAISED HANDS. 22 23 CHAIR, SUE NOACK: GREAT THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM 11 IS ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN 24

TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD AT THE BAY



- 1 AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO ON WEDNESDAY
- 2 APRIL 23RD, 2025. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY
- 3 NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE ARE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]





Broadcasting Government