

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE**
3 **ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE**
4 **FRIDAY, DECEMBER 9, 2022 9:40 AM**

5
6 **JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, JESS. GOOD MORNING
7 EVERYONE THIS IS CALL TO ORDER OF THE JOINT MTC PLANNING
8 COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE. JESS, IF YOU
9 COULD RUN THE ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE? [RECORDED MEETING
10 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE
11 CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF
12 ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE
13 BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE.
14 THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND
15 OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND
16 STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
17 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS
18 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO
19 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
20 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE
21 OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
22 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
23 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED
24 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT,
25 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M.,
2 YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED
3 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF
4 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE
5 TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
6 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
7 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD
8 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE
9 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
10 TO DATE.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. IS MAYOR
13 ARREGUIN WITH US THIS MORNING?

14

15 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** YES.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SORRY JESSE, I DIDN'T SEE YOU
18 THERE. I'LL CALL THE MTC ROLL, DO OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, AND
19 JESS I'LL HAND IT OVER TO YOU FOR 4, 5, AND 6. WITH THAT IF WE
20 COULD TAKE THE ROLL FOR THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. CHAIR SPERING?

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** HERE.

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT, MTC V. CHAIR:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

10

11 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE. GIACOPINI?

12

13 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE QUORUM.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** NEXT UP IS THE MTC PLANNING

18 CONSENT CALENDAR. MARTHA DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC OLDER WRITTEN

19 COMMENTS?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH

22 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED

23 ON THIS ITEM.

24



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THESE ARE ITEMS THAT
2 REQUIRE LITTLE OR NO DISCUSSION. I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI MOVES THE ITEM.

5

6 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVID, C, ARE YOU SECONDING THAT?

7

8 **DAVID CANEPA:** SURE. I'LL SECOND IT.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** [LAUGHTER] OKAY. THANK YOU DAVID.
11 CALL THE ROLL? WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECONDS.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

18

19 **V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

5

6 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LICCARDO?

9

10 **SAM LICCARDO:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SCHAFF?

13

14 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
17 PRESENT.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
20 THE HONORABLE MAYOR OF BERKELEY FOR ITEMS 4, 5, AND 6? MAYOR?

21

22 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** WILL THE CLERK CALL ROLL.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ARREGUIN?

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** PRESENT.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EKLUND?

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HUDSON IS PRESENT. LEE?

8

9 **OTTO LEE:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MITCHOFF?

12

13 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROMERO?

16

17 **CARLOS ROMERO:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** QUORUM IS PRESENT.

20

21 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THAT BRINGS US TO OUR NEXT ITEM,

22 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE

25 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT, THE MEMBERS OF THE ABAG BOARD IN



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ATTENDANCE AT THIS MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE PER DIEM AN
2 AMOUNT OF \$150 AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH
3 EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

4

5 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT BRINGS
6 US TO ITEM SIX. ITEM 6A IS APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF NOVEMBER
7 4, 2022 I'LL ENTERTAIN A MOTION. OR IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION?

8

9 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL MOVE THE APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES. EKLUND.

10

11 **CARLOS ROMERO:** SECOND.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** MOTION BY EKLUND SECOND BY ROMERO.
14 ANY DISCUSSION? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
18 ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** OKAY. IF THE CLERK COULD PLEASE
21 CALL THE ROLL ON THE MOTION?

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION BY EKLUND. SECOND BY ROMERO.
24 ARREGUIN?

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EKLUND?

4

5 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MAYOR HUDSON?

8

9 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE?

12

13 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR MITCHOFF?

16

17 **KAREN MITCHOFF:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCILMEMBER PERALEZ? IS ABSENT.

20 SUPERVISOR RABBIT?

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, MTC V. CHAIR:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RAMOS? IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER

25 ROMERO?



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
5 PRESENT.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I'LL TURN IT
8 BACK OVER TO CHAIR SPERING.

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU MAYOR. I HOPE YOU FEEL
11 BETTER TOO. YOU SOUND A LITTLE ROUGH THERE.

12

13 **JESSE ARREGUIN, ABAG CHAIR:** TIS THE SEASON.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** WISH YOU THE BEST THERE. NEXT
16 ITEMS ARE INFORMATION ITEMS LOOKING AHEAD TO THE 2023 PLANNED
17 BAY AREA 2050+, AND TRANSIT 2050+, AND MATT ARE YOU GOING TO
18 KICK IT OFF?

19

20 **MATT MALONEY:** THERESE.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THERESE.

23

24 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THIS IS THE LAST TIME I'M GOING TO HAVE A
25 COMMITTEE FORUM TO TALK ABOUT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH IS



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ONE OF THE HIGHLIGHTS AND PRIVILEGES OF SERVING AS EXECUTIVE
2 DIRECTOR FOR MTC AND ABAG. BECAUSE IT REPRESENTED AN EFFORT, A
3 CRUCIAL EFFORT FROM BOTH OF THESE AGENCIES. AS YOU ARE AWARE,
4 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, WAS THIS EXTRAORDINARILY EFFORT THAT
5 INVOLVED THOUSANDS OF BAY AREA RESIDENTS INTEGRATED EQUITY AND
6 RESILIENCE INTO THE CORE OF OUR PLANNING AGENDA, WHICH, YOU
7 KNOW, WHILE HAD BEEN PRESENT BEFORE WAS REALLY LIFTED AND
8 ELEVATED WITH THIS PLAN. AND IT LINKED OUR LONG-RANGE PLANNING
9 INTO SPECIFIC ACTIONS. IT WAS A FIRST PLAN DEVELOPED BY THE
10 INTEGRATED AND UNIFIED MTC ABAG TEAM, AND JUST TO GIVE A HEADS
11 UP TO THAT GROUP, DOZENS OF PLANNERS AND ANALYSTS AND MODELERS
12 AND PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT PROFESSIONALS LINKING IN WITH PARTNERS
13 THROUGHOUT THE REGION, IT TRULY WAS AN AGENCY-WIDE EFFORT. AND
14 IT CONNECTED ONE OF MY FAVORITE TERMS, YOU KNOW, CONNECTED THE
15 DOTS BETWEEN ALL OF THE AGENCIES, TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING,
16 ENVIRONMENT, AND ECONOMIC RESPONSIBILITIES. REALLY,
17 IMPORTANTLY, AND IT WAS GREAT FOR IT TO HAPPEN IN ADVANCE OF
18 THIS MEETING, WE RECEIVED WORD FROM SACRAMENTO LAST WEEK THAT
19 THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD PUT ITS FINAL STAMP OF
20 APPROVAL ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AS ADOPTED BY THE COMMISSION
21 AND ABAG, BACK IN OCTOBER OF 2021. AND SO THAT WAS A HUGE,
22 HUGE MILESTONE. AND I HAD SENT A NOTE OUT TO EVERYONE ON THAT.
23 BUT I WANT TO MENTION THAT IT COMMENDED THE COMMISSION AND THE
24 EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR ITS INNOVATIVE THINKING AND LEADERSHIP IN
25 ESTABLISHING AN IMPORTANT BLUEPRINT TO GUIDE FUTURE EFFORTS.



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 AND CARB IS NOT AN AGENCY THAT GENERALLY IS EFFUSIVE IN ITS
2 PRAISE, SO IT REALLY WAS GRATIFYING TO SEE THAT IN WRITING AS
3 PART OF THEIR APPROVAL PROCESS. AS WE TALKED ABOUT LAST MONTH,
4 YOU KNOW, A PLAN IS JUST A PLAN, AND UNLESS IT'S IMPLEMENTED
5 IN A THOUGHTFUL, COLLABORATIVE, AND DELIBERATE MANNER, WE'RE
6 NOT GOING TO REALIZE THE OUTCOMES THAT WE SEEK FOR A BETTER
7 PLANNED BAY AREA -- EXCUSE ME -- FOR A BETTER BAY AREA, AND
8 ALL OF THE PEOPLE WHO LIVE HERE. SO, I THINK IT'S FITTING
9 THAT, TODAY, OUR TEAM IS GOING TO HIGHLIGHT THE PROPOSED PATH
10 FORWARD FOR OUR NEXT LONG-RANGE PLANNING EFFORT. AND IT'S
11 GOING TO BE ONE THAT BUILDS ON THE ROBUST FOUNDATION DEVELOPED
12 TO DATE, KEEPING A SUSTAINED FOCUS ON IMPLEMENTING THE MANY
13 BAY AREA STRATEGIES THAT ARE RELEVANT, REALLY, FOR YEARS
14 AHEAD, AND THE CHALLENGES THAT, LIKEWISE, WE EXPECT TO SEE.
15 SO, I WANT TO NOW THANK YOU, ALL, FOR YOUR INCREDIBLE SUPPORT
16 IN PLANNED BAY AREA, AT-LARGE, AND TURN IT OVER TO DAVE VAUTIN
17 AND, BY EXTENSION, THAT EXTRAORDINARY STAFF THAT IS BEHIND THE
18 PLANNED BAY AREA. AND, YOU KNOW, LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING WHAT
19 THAT'S GOING TO LOOK LIKE. THANK YOU SO MUCH CHAIR SPERING.

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVID, BEFORE YOU GET STARTED,
22 THERESE, I WANT TO TAKE A MINUTE HERE TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR
23 LEADERSHIP. IN ALL OF THE PLANS AND RTPS AND PLANS THAT WE
24 HAVE DONE THIS HAS BEEN THE MOST COMPREHENSIVE AND EXTENSIVE
25 AND STARTED TO ADDRESS THE PEOPLE THAT WE SERVE. I WANT TO



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 THANK YOU FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP. THIS IS JUST ONE MORE OF YOUR
2 OUTSTANDING ACCOMPLISHMENTS THROUGH YOU'RE CAREER, BUT I
3 REALLY BELIEVE THIS IS A MILESTONE THAT YOU'RE GOING TO BE
4 VERY PROUD OF. AND IT'S GOING TO SERVE THIS REGION. SO I JUST
5 WANT TO THANK YOU. AND WHEN I WAS TALKING TO MATT YESTERDAY, I
6 HAD ASKED HIM, HOPEFULLY DAVE OR SOMEBODY WILL JUST TOUCH ON
7 SOME OF THE THINGS WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO ACCOMPLISH. WE ALWAYS
8 TALK ABOUT OUR PLANNING PROCESS BUT DON'T LOOK BACK AT HERE IS
9 WHAT WE HAVE ACTUALLY DONE AND PROVIDED TO THE RESIDENTS OF
10 THIS REGION. SO HOPEFULLY DAVID OR MATT OR SOMEBODY WILL WEAVE
11 SOME OF THOSE COMPLIMENTS IN THERE IT JUST KIND OF HIGHLIGHTS
12 THAT LEADERSHIP THAT YOU PROVIDED. I WANT TO PERSONALLY THANK
13 YOU FOR THAT.

14

15 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
18 MATT OR DAVID. DAVID, YOU READY TO GO?

19

20 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YES, CHAIR SPERING. AND THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS
21 AND BOARD MEMBERS AND GOOD MORNING. I'M DAVE VAUTIN, SYSTEM
22 DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS JOINED BY MY COLLEAGUE KARA VUICICH
23 WHO IS PRINCIPLE PLANNER WITH ABAG. IF TECHNICAL STAFF COULD
24 LOAD UP THE SLIDES AT THIS TIME? THANK YOU. TODAY WE'RE GOING
25 TO PROVIDE THE COMMITTEE A FIRST LOOK AT THE UPCOMING LONG



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 RANGE REGIONAL PLANNING WORK SLATED FOR CALENDAR YEAR 202023.
2 WE ADOPTED PLANNED BAY AREA ORIGINAL PLAN IDENTIFYING 35
3 TRANSPORTATION ECONOMIC ENVIRONMENTAL STRATEGIES DESIGNED TO
4 ADVANCE EQUITABLE RESILIENT OUTCOMES WORKING TOWARDS A STATED
5 VISION OF A MORE AFFORDABLE CONNECTED DIVERSE HEALTHY AND
6 VIBRATE BAY AREA FOR ALL. DRIVEN BY ROBUST ANALYTICAL
7 EXPLORATION OF WHAT IF SCENARIOS. BUT EVERY FOUR YEARS MTC AND
8 ABAG ARE REQUIRED TO UPDATE OUR ORIGINAL PLAN AND WE'RE
9 BEGINNING TO FOCUS ON UPDATE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. ESPECIALLY
10 AS WE ADVANCE INTO A POST-COVID AREA THAT MERGES LONG-STANDING
11 BRAND-NEW CHALLENGES FOR OUR REGION. NEXT SLIDE. LET'S TAKE A
12 LOOK BACK AND ASSESS WHERE WE STAND TODAY ONE YEAR AFTER PLAN
13 ADOPTION. NEXT SLIDE. AS MANY OF YOU ARE AWARE, PLANNED BAY
14 AREA 2050 WAS THE THIRD SUCH REGIONAL PLAN THAT WENT BEYOND
15 THE SINGULAR TOPIC OF TRANSPORTATION. INTEGRATING EQUALLY
16 IMPORTANT ELEMENTS FOR HOUSING, ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, AND
17 ENVIRONMENTAL RESILIENCE. OF COURSE, ALL OF THIS INTEGRATED
18 PLANNING WORK STARTED WITH PLANNED BAY AREA ADOPTED IN 2013
19 WHICH WAS LINKED TO THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEED ALLOCATION OR
20 RHNA, CYCLE FIVE. THAT FIRST PLANNED BAY AREA HAD A HEAVY
21 EMPHASIS ON GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTIONS AS THE FIRST
22 SUCH PLAN WITH A STATUTORY TARGET UNDER SENATE BILL 375. THAT
23 EFFORT TOOK THREE AND A HALF YEARS, STARTING WITH SCENARIO
24 PLANNING IN 2010 AND 2011, DEVELOPMENT OF PREFERRED SCENARIO
25 IN 2012 AND COMPLETION IN MID-2013. PLANNED BAY AREA 2040 THE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 SECOND SUCH PLAN WAS A LIMITED AND FOCUSED UPDATE OF THE
2 ORIGINAL PLANNED BAY AREA WITH A HEAVY FOCUS ON THE REGION'S
3 HOUSING CRISIS. REQUIRING TWO AND A HALF YEARS OF EFFORT IN
4 TOTAL, STARTING IN 2015 AND COMPLETING IN 2017. AND OF COURSE,
5 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, WHICH INTEGRATED NEW ELEMENTS FOR THE
6 ECONOMY AND THE ENVIRONMENT CREATED A ROBUST EXPLORATORY
7 SCENARIO PLANNING PROCESS CALLED HORIZON IN 2018 AND 2019. THE
8 BLUEPRINT PHASE IN 2020 AND THE FINAL PHASE IN 2021, WHICH
9 INTEGRATED NOT ONLY AN EIR AND A PLAN DOCUMENT BUT A ROBUST
10 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, MOST REHABILITATE
11 PLAN WAS LINKED TO RHNA CYCLE SIX AND THE HOUSING ELEMENTS
12 THAT JURISDICTIONS ARE CURRENTLY WORKING TO UPDATE. ONE
13 IMPORTANT TAKE AWAY AS WE LOOK BACK AT PAST PLANNING CYCLES IS
14 THE MAJOR PLAN UPDATES REQUIRE HIGHER LEVELS OF STAFFING AND
15 CONSULTANT RESOURCES MEANING LESS BANDWIDTH AND CAPACITY TO
16 IMPLEMENT PLANS WE JUST ADOPTED KEY IN OUR THINKING OF HOW TO
17 SCOPE A FOCUSED UPDATE AND CONTINUING TO PRIORITIZE
18 IMPLEMENTATION. FIVE NOTABLE PLANS, UPDATING PLANS EVERY FOUR
19 YEARS IN THIS CASE THE PLAN MUST BE ADOPTED BY 2025 OR WE RISK
20 LOSING CRITICAL STATE MONEYS. SECOND FISCALLY CON STAINED
21 MEANING EXPENDITURES CAN BE NO GREATER THAN REASONABLY
22 ANTICIPATED REVENUES ONE EXAMPLE, IMPACT FUTURE PLANNED BAY
23 AREA UPDATES RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION ELEMENTS -- AND
24 PROJECTS AND LACK OF REASONABLY ANTICIPATED FUNDS. THIRD THE
25 PLAN MUST MEET YEAR 2035 GREENHOUSE GAS TARGETS SET BY THE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 STATE. IN GENERAL THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD DOESN'T
2 CHANGE THE TARGET FOR EVEN NUMBERED PLAN CYCLES LIKE THE ONE
3 WE'RE ABOUT TO START BUT THEY HAVE ABILITY TO DO SO NEXT YEAR
4 IF THEY SO CHOOSE. THE PLAN MUST BE RUN THROUGH A ROBUST
5 PROCESS THIS CYCLE WILL BE OPPORTUNITY TO LEVERAGE BEST OF
6 BOTH WORLDS WITH BOTH IN-PERSON AND VIRTUAL ENGAGEMENT THANKS
7 TO WANING OF THE PANDEMIC. AND PLANS TECHNICAL METHODOLOGY AND
8 ASSUMPTIONS MUST BE REVIEWED BY STATE AGENCIES, BY CARB, AND
9 CARB IS INCREASINGLY FOCUSED ON ENSURING THAT IMPLEMENTATION
10 IS HAPPENING AND NOT JUST PLANNING AT THE REGIONAL SCALE. NEXT
11 SLIDE. SO JUST LAST WEEK THAT LAST MAJOR HURDLE PREVENTING US
12 FROM MOVING FORWARD WITH FUTURE UPDATES WAS CLEARED NEARLY
13 FIVE YEARS AFTER WE STARTED CONSULTATION WITH PARTNERS AT
14 CARB. CARB APPROVED PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WHICH INDICATE THAT
15 IS IT SATISFIES STATE REQUIREMENTS INCLUDING ACHIEVEMENT OF
16 STATUTORY GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION TARGETS. WHILE CARB LAUDED
17 MTC AND ABAG FOR CRAFTING ONE OF THE BOLDEST PLANS IN THE
18 STATE AND ALSO SOUNDED A NOTE OF CAUTION ABOUT CHALLENGES TO
19 IMPLEMENT THE PLAN'S MANY STRATEGIES AND INDICATED IT WILL BE
20 TRACKING THE BAY AREA'S PROGRESS CLOSELY IN THE COMING YEARS.
21 NEXT SLIDE. FORTUNATELY, OVER THE PAST YEAR, THERE HAS BEEN
22 TREMENDOUS EFFORT, AGENCY WIDE, TO IMPLEMENT -- TO ADVANCE THE
23 IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS THAT EMERGE FROM PLANNED BAY AREA
24 2050'S IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. LAST MONTH, THE COMMITTEE SAW AN
25 UPDATE ON THIS TOPIC. BUT SOME RECENT HIGHLIGHTS INCLUDE THE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ADOPTION OF THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY, THE
2 ADVANCEMENT OF KEY BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY PILOT
3 PROGRAMS, THE PREPARATION OF NEW CYCLES OF PLANNING GRANTS FOR
4 PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND PILOT PRIORITY PRODUCTION
5 AREAS. ACCELERATED EFFORTS ON PARKING AND ELECTRIFICATION TO
6 ADVANCE CLIMATE STRATEGIES IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AMONG MANY
7 OTHERS AND OF COURSE THE TRANSIT SPACE HAS BEEN NO EXCEPTION
8 TO THIS WITH A SUITE OF INITIATIVES EMERGING FROM THE BAY AREA
9 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. FROM THE DEPLOYMENT OF
10 CLIPPER BAY PASS SERVING AS A DOWN PAYMENT ON GOALS OF
11 SEAMLESS TRAVEL THROUGHOUT THE REGION PROGRESS TO REGIONAL
12 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING AND RECENT ADOPTION OF THE MAJOR
13 PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY OR MAP TO REACH GREATER CONSENSUS
14 OF THE REGIONAL SCALING OF REGIONAL PROJECTS AND COORDINATION
15 OF FEDERAL, STATE, AND REGIONAL DISCRETIONARY FUNDING
16 REQUESTS. IT'S BEEN QUITE A YEAR, BUT THERE IS MUCH MORE
17 IMPLEMENTATION WORK AHEAD. SO THE KEY QUESTION WE HAVE BEEN
18 FACING AS WE GO INTO 2023, BEFORE WE SIMPLY LEAP INTO THAT
19 NEXT PLANNING CYCLE IS TO UNDERSTAND HOW MTC AND ABAG CAN BEST
20 CONTINUE TO ADVANCE IMPLEMENTATION OF CRITICAL INITIATIVES
21 THAT TURN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 FROM A VISION INTO REALITY ALL
22 WHILE MAKING TARGETED UPDATES TO OUR REGIONAL PLAN TO REFLECT
23 THE EVER CHANGING PLANNING LANDSCAPE OF THE POST-COVID ERA.
24 NEXT SLIDE. STAFF IS PROPOSING AN OVERARCHING VISION FOR THE
25 NEXT TWO REGIONAL PLAN UPDATES, STRETCHING THROUGH 2029. IT



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 WOULD START NEXT YEAR WITH AN UPDATE TO THE EXISTING PLAN
2 WHICH WE'RE CALLING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+, THE FOCUS OF
3 TODAY'S PRESENTATION. WE ANTICIPATE THIS WORK WOULD COMMENCE
4 IN THE SUMMER OF 2023 AND WRAP UP IN LATE 2025. IT WOULD
5 INVOLVE ROUGHLY YEAR-LONG UPDATE TO THE PLANNED BAY AREA
6 BLUEPRINT, FOLLOWED BY A STATUTORY FINAL PHASE INCLUDING AN
7 EIR PLAN DOC AND IMPLEMENTATION PLAN. THE GOAL OF THE PROCESS
8 WOULD BE TO MAKE HIGH IMPACT REFINEMENTS TO SELECT BLUEPRINT
9 STRATEGIES WHILE RETAIN YOU THE REMAINING STRATEGIES GIVEN THE
10 FIRM ANALYTICAL FOUNDATION OF OUR EXISTING PLAN. THIS APPROACH
11 WOULD ENABLE IMPLEMENTATIONS TO CONTINUE A PACE, RATHER THAN
12 SHIFTING CONSIDERABLE STAFF AND FINANCIAL RESOURCES TOWARDS
13 LONG-RANGE PLANNING TO ACCOMMODATE MANY MORE SIGNIFICANT
14 UPDATES IN THE NEXT YEAR. IN ADDITION, PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
15 WOULD IDENTIFY A WHOLE NEW SUITE OF IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS
16 RECOGNIZING THAT MANY OF THE IMPLEMENTATION ACTIONS IDENTIFIED
17 IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WILL BE SUBSTANTIVELY COMPLETE BY
18 2025. LOOKING AHEAD, THIS WOULD ALLOW A MAJOR UPDATE TO
19 PLANNED BAY AREA TO BE ADVANCED STARTING IN EARLY 2026 ON PAR
20 WITH A MAGNITUDE OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, WITH ROBUST
21 SCENARIO PLANNING, DEEP DIVE POLICY ANALYSIS, AND OVERHAUL OF
22 THE BLUEPRINT AND COMPLETION IN 2029. GIVEN THAT THAT
23 SUBSEQUENT PLANNING CYCLE WOULD LIKELY FACE AGGRESSIVE CLIMATE
24 GOALS FEATURE AN EXTENDED TIME HORIZON AND SYNC UP WITH A
25 BRAND-NEW RHNA CYCLE WE THINK PLANNED BAY AREA 2060 WOULD BE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 BETTER PRIMED TO ENACT SIGNIFICANT POLICY CHANGES TO THE 30
2 YEAR REGIONAL VISION. NEXT SLIDE. WITH ALL THAT CONTEXT IN
3 MIND WHAT MIGHT BE TARGETED UPDATES IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
4 LOOK LIKE. AFTER ALL PLANNED BAY AREA HAS ALWAYS BEEN INTENDED
5 TO BE A COMPREHENSIVE VISION THAT CONNECTS THE DOTS BETWEEN
6 TRANSPORTATION, HOUSING, THE ECONOMY, AND THE ENVIRONMENT.
7 GIVEN THAT THE RHNA NUMBERS REMAIN FIXED THROUGH AT THE END OF
8 THIS DECADE, THIS CYCLES AN OPPORTUNITY TO FOCUS, EMPHASIZING
9 UPDATES TO SELECT TRANSPORTATION AND ENVIRONMENT STRATEGIES
10 WHILE CONTINUING TO LEAN ON OUR VERY SALIENT HOUSING AND
11 ECONOMIC STRATEGIES TO DATE. WHILE STRATEGY REFINEMENTS
12 WOULDN'T BE LIMITED TO JUST ONE TOPIC AREA, TRANSPORTATION
13 STRATEGIES RELATED TO PUBLIC TRANSIT ARE PERHAPS THE MOST RIPE
14 FOR INVENTION RECOGNIZING FINANCIAL CHALLENGES IN THIS SPACE,
15 AND THE NEED TO REEVALUATE LEGACY, I.E. PRECOVID
16 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS TO ENSURE THEY ALIGN WITH CURRENT AND
17 FUTURE REGIONAL NEEDS. THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN
18 SUGGEST THAT IS A BRAND-NEW TYPE OF PLAN, DUBBED A CONNECTED
19 NETWORK PLAN WHICH WOULD TAKE A SERVICE ORIENTED APPROACH TO
20 CREATING AN ASPIRATIONAL TRANSIT SERVICE VISION FOR THE BAY
21 AREA SHOULD BE CREATED IN AN AREA THAT WOULD BE SUPREME COURT
22 FROM PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. NEXT SLIDE. AFTER CONSIDERING OUR
23 STAFFING AND FUNDING RESOURCES, AS WELL AS THE POLICY
24 LANDSCAPE, OUR TEAM IDENTIFIED SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES IN
25 ADVANCING A CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN IN ISOLATION. FOR ONE, THIS



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 TYPE OF UNCONSTRAINED MODAL PLAN WOULD EXCEED THE REGION'S
2 FISCAL CAPACITY EVEN WITH SUITE OF NEW REVENUE MEASURES IN
3 PLAY AND NEXT ANTICIPATED LOWER NEAR-TERM REVENUE FORECASTS AT
4 TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF AND FINALLY TAKE LONGER TO DEVELOP
5 BECAUSE IT WOULD CAN ARE IN PARALLEL WITH THE STATUTORY
6 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+. IN CONTRAST PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
7 INTEGRATED COMPREHENSIVE PLAN NOT LIMITED TO SINGLE MODE, LIKE
8 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. WHILE IT'S FISCAL CONSTRAINT PROVIDES A
9 DOSE OF REALISM TO ITS PLANNING, IT HAS BEEN OFTEN CRITIQUES
10 FOR OVEREMPHASIS ON CAPITAL INVESTMENTS. IF DEVELOPED IN
11 ISOLATION, THERE IS A RISK TOO THAT IT WOULD CONTINUE TO FOCUS
12 ON LEGACY CAPITAL TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS RATHER THAN
13 REEVALUATION PRIORITIES POST COVID. THIS COULD LEAD TO WIDELY
14 DIVERGENT VISIONS FOR OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM ONE FISCALLY
15 UNCONSTRAINED AND FOCUSED SOLELY ON SURFACE THE OTHER FISCALLY
16 CONSTRAINED ON CAPITAL PROJECTS. WHILE WE IMAGINE WHAT PLANNED
17 BAY AREA 2050 MIGHT FOCUS ON WE EXPLORED THE QUESTION IS THERE
18 A WAY TO BLEND FRAMEWORKS TOGETHER TO OVERCOME THESE
19 CHALLENGES. NEXT SLIDE. WE BELIEVE THE ANSWER TO THIS IS YES,
20 THAT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AND CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING ARE
21 BETTER TOGETHER. WE'RE RECOMMENDING A HARMONIZED APPROACH
22 WHERE CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING DIRECTLY FORMS THE CORE OF
23 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ ASSIGNING THE TASK OF COMPREHENSIVELY
24 REIMAGINING THE SIX TRANSIT RELATED STRATEGIES IN PLANNED BAY
25 AREA'S TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT USING A SERVICE-BASED HUB



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ORIENTED AND FISCALLY RESPONSIBLE APPROACH WHICH WE HAVE
2 DUBBED" TRANSIT 2050+" MTC AND ABAG WOULD WORK CLOSELY WITH
3 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO COCREATE THIS NEXT GENERATION VISION AND
4 I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THAT COLLABORATIVE PROBLEM SOLVING
5 BETWEEN MTC AND OPERATOR PARTNERS WILL BE KEY TO SUCCESS.
6 FURTHER PUBLIC STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT INCLUDING WITH COUNTY
7 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES AND ADVOCACY ORGANIZATIONS IS ALSO
8 IMPORTANT. WHILE THIS APPROACH IS NOT WITHOUT RISK, IT DOES
9 SEEM TO BE A BETTER PATH FORWARD THAN ADVANCE TWO SEPARATE
10 PLANS COMPLETELY IN PARALLEL. SO WITH THE SCHEDULE IN PROCESS
11 FOR TRANSIT 2050 PLUS AND PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS LOOK
12 LIKE? NEXT SLIDE. SO FOR THE LARGER OVERARCHING PLANNED BAY
13 AREA 2050 PASS PROCESS WE SEE THREE MAJOR STEPS INVOLVING
14 PROJECT KICKOFF IN SUMMER 2023 INCLUDING UPDATES IN PLANNING
15 ASSUMPTIONS BASED ON THE LATEST AVAILABLE DATA INCLUDING
16 REFINED PROJECTIONS LIKE LEVELS OF SQUARE FOOTAGE REQUIREMENTS
17 REVENUE FORECAST ADVANCE BLUEPRINT PHASE I RECOGNIZING EVER
18 EVOLVING PLANNING LANDSCAPE POST-COVID RECOGNIZING THE
19 BLUEPRINT CRAFTED IN 2021 WILL BETTER ASSESS OUR FINANCIAL
20 CONSTRAINTS BOTH IN TRANSPORTATION SPACE AND OTHER ELEMENTS.
21 INVOLVING UPDATED BLUEPRINT STRATEGY REFLECTING COMPLETED
22 ONGOING INITIATIVES RANGING FROM TOC POLICY SEA LEVEL RISE
23 FRAMEWORK ADVANCEMENTS IN CLIMATE INITIATIVES AND INTEGRATING
24 FINDINGS FROM HORIZON, WITH SCENARIO PLANNING WORK ABOUT POST-
25 PANDEMIC FUTURES. STRETCHING ACROSS TWO PHASES WITH THE DRAFT



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 BLUEPRINT DEVELOPED IN FALL 2023 AND WINTER 2024 AND FINAL
2 BLUEPRINT TO BE COMPLETED BY FALL OF 2024. THE FINAL PHASE OF
3 THIS PROCESS OCCURRING IN 2025 WITH NEW PLAN DOCUMENT AND EIR
4 AND OVERHAUL TO IMPLEMENTATION PRIORITIES OF COURSE ENGAGEMENT
5 WOULD REMAIN CORE WITH PRIMARY OUTREACH CYCLES OCCURRING IN
6 THE DRAFT AND FINAL BLUEPRINT PHASES. I'M NOT GOING TO GO
7 THROUGH ALL COMPONENTS OF THE LONG-RANGE PLANNING PROCESS, BUT
8 I WOULD NOTE THAT THE GOAL FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ WOULD
9 FOCUS ON WHAT IS STATUTORILY REQUIRED AND WHAT STRATEGIES
10 WOULD BENEFIT FROM THE TARGET UPDATE SPECIAL THOSE IN THE
11 TRANSPORTATION ENVIRONMENT ELEMENTS. NEXT SLIDE. PIVOTING TO
12 THE TRANSIT 2050+ EFFORT NESTED WITHIN OUR BROADER PLANNING
13 THIS WOULD BE MORE INTENSE AND RAPID PROCESS. SEEKING TO
14 OVERHAUL THE STRATEGIES. IN FIRST HALF 2023 2050+ WOULD
15 RECOGNIZE GAPS IN EXISTING SYSTEMS THROUGH WHITE PAPER PROCESS
16 DEFINING HUBS AND CORRIDORS IN THE TRANSIT NETWORK SECOND HALF
17 2023 GENERATE PROJECTS INCLUDING CAPITAL ELEMENTS, FREQUENCY
18 IMPROVEMENTS AND TRANSIT PRIORITY INVESTMENTS FOR EACH
19 CORRIDOR AND EVALUATING LEGACY PROJECTS EVALUATING CONCEPTS AS
20 WELL AS NETWORKS TO PREPARE PROJECTS TOGETHER AND UNDERSTAND
21 THEIR BENEFIT AND COST EQUITY OUTCOMES BY SUMMER 2024 WE PLAN
22 ON FISCALLY CONSTRAINED TRANSIT NETWORK STRATEGIES ASSOCIATED
23 INVESTMENTS INTEGRATED DIRECTLY INTO THE FINAL BLUEPRINT FOR
24 PLAN 2050+. LAST ACKNOWLEDGING FUNDING IMPLEMENTATION
25 CHALLENGES FOR OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM WHILE RECOGNIZING PROJECTS



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 THAT DID NOT MAKE THE CUT FOR A FISCALLY CONSTRAINED VISION IN
2 A SUPPLEMENTAL REPORT. WHILE PROPOSING A FOCUSED SCOPE FOR
3 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS THAT BUILDS ON THE ADOPTED PLAN FOR
4 THE REGION TODAY WE ARE COGNIZANT THAT THE DEEP DIVE ON
5 TRANSIT WILL NOT BE EASY IT WILL REQUIRE A RAPID 18 MONTH
6 TIMELINE AND SIMULTANEOUSLY NECESSITATE ROBUST ENGAGEMENT WITH
7 STAKEHOLDERS AND THE PUBLIC. WITH THIS APPROACH OF WEAVING THE
8 DMA OF CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING INTO THE BROADER REGIONAL
9 PLAN TO SPARK SUBSTANTIVE OVERHAUL OF OUR TRANSIT VISION IS
10 THE BEST PATH FORWARD AND MEETS THE MOMENT IN THIS POST-
11 PANDEMIC ENVIRONMENT. NEXT SLIDE. SO, WHAT'S NEXT FOR THE
12 MONTHS AHEAD? WELL, FIRST HAVING LED PLANNED BAY AREA SINCE
13 2017, I'LL BE PASSING THE TORCH TO MY COLLEAGUE CHIRAG RABARI
14 WHO WAS THE PROJECT MANAGER FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND KARA
15 VUICICH JOINING TODAY ON THE TRANSIT ORIENT THE POLICIES WILL
16 STEP INTO THE ROLE FOR THE PROJECT MANAGER FOR TRANSIT
17 PLANNING 2050+. BOTH OF PROVIDE REGULAR UPDATES AND
18 INTERRELATED POLICIES COMMITTED TO THE REFRESH CYCLE OF OUR
19 REGIONAL PLANNING. WITH THAT I'LL WRAP UP AND TAKE QUESTIONS
20 THAT THE COMMITTEE MAY HAVE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU, DAVID. AND
23 COMMISSIONERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT, RAISE YOUR HAND.
24 DAVID, QUICK QUESTION, HOW DO WE PROJECT IF REVENUES DON'T
25 COME IN. WITH THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT THE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 FACING IF WE DON'T GET THAT RESOLVED HOW DOES THIS IMPACT THE
2 PLAN?

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** WE'RE GOING REASSESSING REVENUE FORECASTS, AND WE
5 DO EXPECT THEY WILL BE LOWER THIS PLAN CYCLE. PART OF THE
6 REASON WE UPDATE THESE PLANS EVERY FOUR YEARS IS THAT AS
7 CIRCUMSTANCES CHANGE NEW MONEYS BECOME AVAILABLE, OR MONEYS
8 DON'T COME TO FRUITION, WE CAN INCORPORATE THOSE INTO OUR
9 FINANCIAL CORE CAST. SO AS WE GO FORWARD WITH THIS PLAN, WE'RE
10 GOING TO BE TAKING A HARD LOOK AT SOME OF THOSE SOURCES TO
11 MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN JUSTIFY THEM BASED ON THE LATEST
12 AVAILABLE INFORMATION.

13

14 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, DAVID. I'M GOING TO GO
15 VICE CHAIR EDDIE A AND THEN GO TO CAROL.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN:** I KNOW EQUITY WAS LIGHTLY TOUCHED ON IN
18 THIS PRESENTATION, BUT I'M CURIOUS IS THERE A PROCESS IN WHICH
19 WE CAN DISCUSS AN EVOLVING UNDERSTANDING OF EQUITY. MY HOPE IS
20 MORE GENERALLY WE'RE ABLE TO LOOK AT THINGS LIKE PROJECT
21 PERFORMANCE AND OVERALL TRY TO UNDERSTAND THE ABSOLUTE NUMBER
22 OF INDIVIDUALS SERVED IN TERMS OF LOW-INCOME COMMUNITY
23 MEMBERS. AND WONDERING IF THERE ARE JUST POINTS IN THE
24 PROCESS, AS WE MOVE THIS FORWARD TO HOPEFULLY MAKE MINOR



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 REVISIONS ACCORDING BUT VERY IMPORTANT IN MY MIND MAKING SURE
2 WE SERVE AS MANY LOW-INCOME AS POSSIBLE IN OUR WORK.

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER AHN. WITH REGARDS TO THAT,
5 WE DO ANTICIPATE THAT EQUITY IS GOING TO BE A CORE PART OF OUR
6 PROJECT EVALUATION WORK IN TRANSIT 2050+. IN PLANNED BAY AREA
7 2050+, IN THE LAST PLANNED BAY AREA, WE DID INTEGRATE A BRAND-
8 NEW TYPE OF EQUITY SCORING THAT ALLOWED US TO LOOK AT THE
9 DISTRIBUTION OF BENEFITS TO MAKE SURE THAT PROJECTS ARE
10 ADVANCING EQUITY AND BENEFITTING LOWER INCOME TRAVELERS WE'RE
11 GOING TO LIFT THAT UP IN THIS CYCLE AGAIN ESPECIALLY AS WE
12 THINK ABOUT A REENVISIONED NETWORK THIS CYCLE IT'S CRITICAL
13 THOSE INVESTMENTS ARE ADVANCING EQUITY ACROSS THE BOARD.

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. CAROL AND THEN
16 PAT EKLUND.

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I DON'T HAVE QUESTIONS BUT YOU SAID
19 COMMENTS. MY COMMENTS ARE I'M ACTUALLY EXCITED ABOUT THIS.
20 BECAUSE THE LESSONS WE HAVE LEARNED IN THE LAST COUPLE OF
21 YEARS ABOUT THE CHANGING WORLD, MORE FOLKS WORKING REMOTELY
22 AND EVERYTHING ELSE THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH. SO, THAT'S MY
23 COMMENTS. I'M JUST LOOKING FORWARD TO THIS PROCESS. AND I
24 THINK WE'RE GOING HAVE A GREAT PRODUCT WHEN WE GET OUT ON THE
25 OTHER END BECAUSE OF ALL THE STAKEHOLDER PARTICIPATION AND



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 RECOGNIZING THE NEEDS OF OUR NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. SO, THANK
2 YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU CAROL. PAT EKLUND?

5

6 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FIRST HAVE WE DONE
7 EVALUATION OF EFFORTS, THAT WE HAVE DONE, HAVE REALLY RESULTED
8 IN GREENHOUSE GAS MISSIONS RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION?
9 ESPECIALLY GIVEN THE FACT THAT PEOPLE'S PATTERNS FOR COMMUTING
10 HAVE CHANGED? AND PROBABLY WILL NOT GO BACK TO WHERE WE WERE
11 BEFORE?

12

13 **DAVE VAUTIN:** BOARD MEMBER EKLUND, THAT'S AN EXCELLENT
14 QUESTION. YOU KNOW, AS WE GO -- DO OUR WORK ON CLIMATE, WE
15 UPDATE OUR VARIOUS ESTIMATES AND CALCULATORS ON A REGULAR
16 BASIS AND THAT IS SOMETHING THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING, AS
17 PART OF THIS NEXT CYCLE. WE ALSO ARE VERY COGNIZANT THAT OUR
18 INVESTMENTS, PARTICULARLY IN OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM, OF THOSE
19 RIDERSHIP FORECASTS ARE AFFECTED SIGNIFICANTLY BY THE
20 TELECOMMUTING LEVELS. AS WE GO INTO PROJECT EVALUATION WE'RE
21 LOOKING AT HOW PROJECTS ARE PERFORMING WE'RE GOING TO BE
22 LOOKING AT THAT IN A VERY SPECIFIC PERSPECTIVE. JUST
23 ACKNOWLEDGING THAT THOSE CHANGING EXTERNAL FORCES THAT YOU'RE
24 HINTING AT, THOSE ARE GOING TO BE THINGS THAT WE'RE GOING TO
25 BE FOCUSING ON IN OUR EVALUATION THIS CYCLE.



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **PAT ECKLUND:** OKAY. GREAT. FIRST OF ALL, JUST ON THAT POINT, I
3 DO NOT BELIEVE THAT WE SHOULD BE TRYING TO CHANGE THE PATTERN
4 OF HOW PEOPLE ARE WORKING. BECAUSE I REALLY THINK THAT PEOPLE
5 BEING ABLE TO WORK-FROM-HOME, OR IN CENTRALIZED AREAS NEAR
6 THEIR HOME RATHER THAN HAVING TO COMMUTE TO A JOB IS A
7 FUNDAMENTAL CHANGE IN HUMAN BEHAVIOR, AT LEAST IN THE UNITED
8 STATES, IF NOT ACROSS THE WORLD. AND I THINK THAT WE SHOULD
9 REALLY LOOK AT TRYING TO ENHANCE THAT. NOT NECESSARILY TRYING
10 TO CHANGE IT. AND SO THIS WHOLE FOCUS ON THE UPDATE BEING ON
11 TRANSPORTATION, REALLY CONCERNS ME TREMENDOUSLY. I THINK,
12 LOOKING AT TRANSPORTATION, AND HOW WE CAN HELP SUPPORT WORKING
13 AT HOME WOULD BE A GOOD THING. BUT I ALSO THINK THAT WE NEED
14 TO FOCUS ON AREAS WHERE THE CITIES AND THE COUNTIES NEED HELP,
15 AND THAT IS, NOT ONLY ON PLANNING, BUT ALSO ON HOUSING AND
16 ENVIRONMENTAL AND ECONOMIC ISSUES. AND I THINK THAT LEAVING
17 THOSE OUT, AS A FOCUS, I THINK WE'RE DOING A DISSERVICE TO OUR
18 MEMBERS. NUMBER ONE. AND NUMBER TWO IS THAT THERE IS NO WAY
19 THAT MOST PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE ABLE TO ACHIEVE THE HOUSING
20 NUMBERS WITHOUT SOME FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE OR CREATE WAYS TO
21 ACHIEVE THE NUMBERS. THOSE NUMBERS FOR MOST OF THE
22 JURISDICTIONS ARE IMPOSSIBLE TO MEET. ARE GOING TO BE A REAL
23 STRETCH. AND THINKING THAT DEVELOPERS ARE GOING TO PAY FOR ALL
24 OF THAT IS, I THINK, NOT REALISTIC AT ALL. CITIES CAN'T AFFORD
25 IT. COUNTIES CAN'T AFFORD IT. SO WE REALLY NEED TO LOOK AT



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 INNOVATIVE WAYS TO SUPPORT THE JURISDICTIONS TO ACHIEVE THE
2 NUMBERS. SO I DO NOT JUST SUPPORT FOCUSING ON TRANSPORTATION.
3 IF WE ARE FOCUSING ON SOME OF THE OTHER THINGS, I WOULD LIKE
4 TO SEE WHAT THEY ARE. BUT I DIDN'T SEE THEM. I DIDN'T SEE ANY
5 OF COURSE SUPERVISOR OF WHAT WE WOULD BE DOING FOR HOUSING,
6 PLANNING, ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES, AND ECONOMIC. THINGS HAVE
7 DRAMATICALLY CHANGED. WE LIVE IN A DIFFERENT WORLD NOW. SO I
8 REALLY THINK THAT WE NEED TO BROADEN THE PERSPECTIVE A LITTLE
9 BIT, MAYBE NOT GO AS DEEP, BUT AT LEAST COME UP WITH SOME
10 IDEAS, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL. ANYWAY, THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, PAT. BEFORE I GO,
13 NICK, I WANT TO SEE IF THERESE HAS A COMMENT. THERESE, DO YOU
14 HAVE A COMMENT?

15

16 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** YES I DO. AND MEMBER EKLUND, I APPRECIATE
17 YOUR COMMENTS. LET'S GO BACK -- I WOULD LIKE TO GO BACK TO ONE
18 OF THE CORE OPENING STATEMENTS THAT DAVE OUTLINED FOR THIS
19 APPROACH WHICH IS, WE HAVE ADOPTED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050,
20 THIS HUGE, SIGNIFICANT, CHALLENGING IMPLEMENTATION ELEMENT AND
21 ACTION THAT IS GOING TO BE ADVANCING STRAIGHT THROUGH,
22 UNDERNEATH, ON TOP OF, THROUGH, THE EFFORTS OF THIS, OF WHAT
23 WE'RE PROPOSING AS A MORE DISCRETE PLANNING EXERCISE FOR
24 2050+. AND ALL OF THE ISSUES THAT YOU HIGHLIGHTED, BOARD
25 MEMBER EKLUND, PARTICULARLY IN THE HOUSING SPACE, ARE CENTRAL



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 TO THE CONTINUING IMPLEMENTATION ACTION ELEMENT OF PLANNED BAY
2 AREA 2050. AND AS I MENTIONED LAST MONTH, A PLAN THAT DOESN'T
3 HAVE AN ACTIVE IMPLEMENTATION ELEMENT, JUST SITS ON A SHELF.
4 AND, SO THE COMMITMENT RELATED TO THOSE IMPLEMENTATION
5 ACTIONS, INCLUDING THE NEEDED ASSISTANCE TO ALL OF OUR
6 PARTNERS, LOCAL, YOU KNOW, CITIES, AND COUNTIES, AND TRANSIT
7 AGENCIES, TRYING TO HELP THEM THROUGH THE FISCAL CLIFF, TO
8 COMMUNITIES NEEDING THE FOCUS THAT COMMISSIONER AHN
9 HIGHLIGHTED ON CONTINUING DISPARITIES AND HOW OUR PROGRAMS
10 ADDRESS THOSE, THAT IS ALL HAPPENING, AND IT'S GOING TO TAKE
11 UP A SIGNIFICANT PART OF THE PORTFOLIO WITH BOTH MTC AND ABAG.
12 WHAT WE WERE HIGHLIGHTING TO YOU, THIS TIME, IS A SIGNIFICANT
13 PIECE OF THE -- I HATE TO USE THE WORD "PURE" BUT THE MORE
14 DISCRETE PLANNING ACTIVITIES THAT, UNDER FEDERAL AND STATE
15 LAW, WE HAVE TO DO. AND WE HAVE TO DO YET ANOTHER WHOLE OTHER
16 HUGE PLAN THAT'S GOING TO WAIT FOR 2060 BUT IN THE MEANTIME IN
17 SATISFYING OUR FEDERAL AND STATE PLANNING REQUIREMENT THERE IS
18 ADDITIONAL FOCUS ON SOME ADDITIONAL HIGHLIGHTED CRITICAL
19 PLANNING ISSUES TO YOUR POINT THAT HAVE EMERGED TO BE
20 PARTICULARLY CHALLENGING GIVEN THE CHANGING CIRCUMSTANCES WE
21 HAVE SEEN WITH COVID. SO IT ALL WORKS TOGETHER AS A PACKAGE.
22 AND SO WHAT I THINK WHAT YOU WILL SEE IS A CONTINUING
23 PRESENTATION TO THE COMMISSION AND TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD
24 OF THOSE CRITICAL IMPLEMENTATION PLAN EFFORTS AND HOW WE'RE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ACHIEVING THOSE IN TANDEM WITH THE WORK THAT WAS OUTLINED FOR
2 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** WELL, I'M GLAD TO HEAR THAT, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
5 MCMILLAN. BUT WHAT I WOULD SUGGEST, THOUGH, IS TO HAVE AT
6 LEAST ONE SLIDE OR TWO THAT JUST REALLY FOCUSES IN ON THE
7 ITEMS THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE WORKING ON OVER THE NEXT FIVE
8 YEARS, OR TEN, WHATEVER IT IS, ON THOSE ELEMENTS OF HOUSING,
9 AND EQUITY, AND ENVIRONMENT, AND ECONOMICS. AND THOSE KIND OF
10 -- AND PLANNING. BECAUSE IT DOES APPEAR TO PEOPLE THAT ARE NOT
11 NECESSARILY ENGAGED IN THIS, EVERY DAY, THAT WE'RE FORGETTING
12 THE OTHER COMMITMENTS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN MADE TO, THAT
13 WE'RE GOING TO STRUGGLE TRYING TO ACHIEVE. SO, AND RECOGNIZING
14 THAT THERE ARE THINGS THAT ARE IDENTIFIED IN THE CURRENT PLAN
15 THAT ARE STILL GOING TO CARRY OVER TO THE NEXT. SO, IT WAS NOT
16 EMPHASIZED BUT IT WOULD BE NICE TO HAVE AT LEAST ONE SLIDE
17 THAT IDENTIFIES AND ACKNOWLEDGES THAT WE'RE NOT FINISHED
18 HELPING FOLKS ACHIEVING THOSE OTHER OBJECTIVES IN 2050, BUT
19 THESE ARE THE ONES THAT WE'RE GOING TO FOCUS ON TRYING TO
20 CHANGE, OR WHATEVER. BUT I THINK THAT ACKNOWLEDGMENT WOULD BE
21 EXTREMELY HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER
24 JOSEFOWITZ?

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEAH. I JUST WANTED TO COMMENT ON HOW I -- I
2 THINK THE TRANSIT 2050 PLUS APPROACH IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT.
3 AND I THINK IS GOING TO BE, SORT OF, THE FOUNDATION FOR
4 BUILDING A MUCH MORE EFFECTIVE TRANSIT NETWORK. AND DOING SO
5 IN A WAY WHICH DOESN'T KIND OF STAPLE OUR BEST PROJECTS
6 TOGETHER WHICH MAY NOT LINK UP TOGETHER BUT ACTUALLY
7 ACKNOWLEDGES THAT IF WE'RE REALLY GOING TO GET PEOPLE ON TO
8 TRANSIT, THAT WE'RE GOING TO DELIVER A MUCH RIDER FRIENDLIER
9 SYSTEM THAT WE HAVE TO PLAN IT AS A SYSTEM. IT WOULD BE -- I
10 THINK WE'RE MOVING INTO THE WHOLE HOUSE APPROACH RATHER THAN
11 TRYING TO PLAN EACH ROOM ONE AT A TIME INSTEAD OF TRYING TO
12 FIT THEM TOGETHER ONE AT A TIME AND HOPE THAT IT ACTUALLY
13 MAKES A HOUSE. I THINK IT'S REALLY GOING TO BE AN IMPORTANT
14 MOMENT TO TAKE STOCK OF WHERE WE'RE HEADED AS A REGION POST-
15 COVID, FOR ALL THE REASONS YOU LAID OUT, DAVE. AND I THINK
16 THAT'S A REALLY DIFFICULT CONVERSATION TO HAVE. AND I REALLY
17 HOPE THAT THIS CAN -- THAT WE CAN, SORT OF, BE USING THIS
18 MOMENT TO THINK, NOT ABOUT HOW WE CAN KIND OF BUILD A
19 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM FOR, LIKE, THE 2000, BUT FOR THE, KIND
20 OF, 2030S AND 2040s WHERE I THINK A LOT OF THE PATTERNS THAT
21 WE'RE SEEING ARE GOING TO PERSIST. IN SAN FRANCISCO, TO JUST
22 GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE, THERE IS -- AND IT'S -- WE'RE ON THE LOW
23 ENDS, BUT WE'RE NOT TOO DISSIMILAR, THE AVERAGE WORKER IS
24 GOING INTO THE OFFICE TWO DAYS A WEEK, THE AVERAGE OFFICE
25 WORKER. AND EVEN IN THE, SORT OF -- IN THE CITIES, WHICH ARE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ON THE OTHER END OF THE SPECTRUM, IT'S THREE DAYS A WEEK.
2 OFFICES ARE NOT GOING BACK AN AVERAGE OF FIVE DAYS A WEEK AND
3 WE NEED TO BE ACKNOWLEDGING THAT AND BEING HONEST WITH
4 OURSELVES ABOUT THAT. SO, I THINK THIS IS A REALLY -- YOU
5 KNOW, I THINK THIS IS GOING TO BE ONE OF THE UPDATES, GIVEN
6 THE KIND OF CIRCUMSTANCES THAT WE'RE FACING AND THAT HAS HAD
7 THE MOST, THAT'S GOING TO BE MOST IMPACTFUL. IN HOW WE THINK
8 ABOUT WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO HERE AS A COMMISSION AND AS A
9 REGION.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. DAVID CANEPA AND
12 DAVE HUDSON NEXT.

13

14 **DAVID CANEPA:** I'M EXTRAORDINARILY ENTHUSIASTIC ABOUT HOW WE'RE
15 MOVING FORWARD. YOU KNOW? WE HAVE TO MAKE TOUGH DECISIONS,
16 RIGHT? AND THESE DECISIONS, MOVING FORWARD, THEY DEPARTMENT ON
17 THE CURRENT ENVIRONMENT, IT'S THE HYBRID WORK AND THE EXTERNAL
18 FACTOR. AND I THINK, DAVE, YOU CAPTURED IT. A PRIORITIZATION,
19 IS IT CAPITAL? IS IT OPERATING? HOW DO WE GET AHEAD OF IT AND
20 LAND ON A PLACE THAT BALANCES THAT? AND THERE IS ALWAYS --
21 THERE IS THAT SAYING THAT SAYS, THERE IS ALWAYS A PLAN MOVING
22 FORWARD, AND IT MIGHT NOT BE THE MOST IDEAL PLAN, BUT THE PLAN
23 HAS TO ADJUST TO THE CIRCUMSTANCES. AND, SO, I WANT TO THANK
24 STAFF FOR REALLY GETTING OUT AHEAD OF IT, RECOGNIZING WHAT THE
25 CURRENT CONDITION IS, AND THEN JUST SEEING, YOU KNOW, HOW



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 WE'RE GOING TO ADJUST. I THINK THIS, SORT OF, PLANNING IS
2 REALLY GOING TO POSITION US TO BE SUCCESSFUL. YOU KNOW? ONE OF
3 THE THINGS I THINK ABOUT A LOT IS THE FISCAL CLIFF. AND WHAT
4 THAT MEANS TO ALL OF US, AND WHAT THAT MEANS TO DIFFERENT
5 TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND LOOKS LIKE -- YOU KNOW -- I DON'T WANT
6 TO BE A DOWNER HERE -- BUT IT LOOKS LIKE WE'RE MOVING INTO A
7 POTENTIAL RECESSION. SO, I THINK ALL OF THESE FACTORS REQUIRE
8 US TO PIVOT. AND I THINK THE DIRECTION WE'RE GOING IS A SMART
9 DIRECTION. I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING WHERE WE LAND ON
10 THIS. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVID. DAVE HUDSON AND
13 THEN AMY WORTH?

14

15 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** I MUST HAVE HEARD SOMETHING DIFFERENT THAN
16 WHAT I WAS HEARING FROM PAT'S INITIAL FOCUS. I THINK THE FOCUS
17 THAT YOU HEARD IN THIS PRESENTATION WAS CLIMATE CHANGE,
18 DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION. AND WHEN YOU BRING CARB INTO
19 THIS -- I GUESS YOU WOULD CALL IT THE "PLANNING PROCESS."
20 DAVE'S POINT WHERE WE'RE GOING TO BE LOOKING AT THE STATUTORY
21 REQUIREMENTS LOOMS LARGE. BECAUSE THEY'RE GOING TO BE
22 DICTATING A LOT WHERE WE'RE GOING. I THINK THE KEY POINT HERE
23 IS WE'RE ENTERING A NEW AGE WHERE IMPLEMENTATION IS FAR
24 GREATER THAN WHAT WE'RE DOING IN PLANNING. IF WE'RE NOT
25 BUILDING -- I'LL TELL WHAT YOU CAUGHT MY ATTENTION, I JUST



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 WAIVED ALL FEES FOR ANYBODY DOING 100% AFFORDABLE HOUSING I'M
2 BEGGING THEM TO COME BACK. BUT THE CONCERN SOMETHING THAT NICK
3 WAS SAYING THEY WANT TO BRING UP IS THAT ONLY TWO DAYS OUT OF
4 THE WEEK PEOPLE ARE WORKING IN THE OFFICE. THOSE PEOPLE OUT OF
5 THREE COUNTIES N PARTICULAR -- WHICH I'LL LEAVE ALONE BECAUSE
6 SAM IS BEING LOOKING AT ME -- ARE NOW MOVING OUT TO SAN
7 JOAQUIN COUNTY. WHEN IN FACT THEY'RE ASKED TO COME BACK,
8 THEY'RE GOING TO CLOG UP 580 LIKE I WOULDN'T BELIEVE. I THINK
9 WE NEED TO ADDRESS SOMETHING IN CYCLE FIVE, IS WHAT KIND OF
10 DISPLACEMENT ARE WE GOING TO BE CREATING AS WE DO THESE THINGS
11 ON. IT DOESN'T MATTER WHETHER WE LIKE IT OR NOT, IF CARB IS
12 INVOLVED WE'RE GOING TO BE FOCUSING -- AND THANK YOU FOR THAT
13 LETTER THERESE, I KEEP LOOKING AT IT IS FOCUS ON CLIMATE
14 CHANGE, DIVERSITY, EQUITY AND INCLUSION, THEY'RE THE PHRASE OF
15 THE DAY, SO TO SPEAK. I VERY MUCH WOULD LIKE TO SEE AS WE GO
16 THROUGH THE PLAN WHERE IS IT STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS ARE IN
17 THAT PORTION THAT WE DO SOMETHING SIMILAR TO WHAT WE DID
18 DURING THE APPEAL PROCESS. YOU PUT THAT IN BOLD TYPE. PEOPLE
19 NEED TO START LEARNING, WE AREN'T MAKING THIS UP. THIS COMES
20 DOWN FROM ON HIGH, AND I'LL LEAVE IT ALONE RIGHT THERE.

21

22 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU DAVID. AMY AND THEN
23 DAVID RABBIT?

24



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE
2 A COUPLE OF BRIEF COMMENTS. FIRST I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR
3 THIS PHENOMENAL PRESENTATION AND APPROACH. I THINK THE KIND OF
4 WORK BEING DONE BY OUR PLANNING TEAMS IS INCREDIBLE. AND YOU
5 KNOW, THE CHALLENGE WE FACED WHEN THE COVID HIT OUR LAST
6 PLANNING CYCLE IS, WE WERE IN THE MIDDLE OF A PLANNING PROCESS
7 AND ALL OF A SUDDEN THESE SEA CHANGES OCCURRED AND WE WERE
8 ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD EFFECTIVELY IN PLANNED BAY AREA, YOU
9 KNOW, 2050. BUT I THINK, NOW, WE HAVE, REALLY, THE OPPORTUNITY
10 TO SAY, OKAY, LET'S LOOK AT, AS OUR VICE CHAIR POINTED OUT,
11 LET'S LOOK AT THIS WHOLE HOUSE APPROACH, AND LOOK AT HOW WE
12 BUILD THE BAY AREA FOR THE FUTURE. I THINK A COUPLE OF POINTS,
13 THINKING OF 2008 SINCE SB 375 WAS ADOPTED BY THE STATE OF
14 CALIFORNIA, AND I -- VERY GRATEFUL FOR MAYOR STEINBERG, THEN
15 SENATOR PRO TEMPORE OF THE CALIFORNIA SENATE FOR HIS VISION
16 AND PUTTING THIS TOGETHER. BECAUSE WE ARE TODAY, IN OUR REGION
17 TOO, I THINK THE MID-CYCLE FOR US IS GOING TO BE INSTRUMENTAL
18 BECAUSE WE'RE GOING TO BE FOCUSING ON CITY'S RHNA
19 IMPLEMENTATION. AND THAT'S GOING TO BE A REAL IMPORTANT MID-
20 CYCLE PROCESS. WE HAVE STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS. WE'RE DEALING
21 WITH THIS JOBS/HOUSING IMBALANCE. WE CONTINUE TO. AND I THINK
22 WHERE BOTH THE OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES THAT WE'RE GOING
23 TO BE FACING THAT WE NEED TO COLLECTIVELY WORK ON WHICH IS
24 THIS PLAN AND THIS STRUCTURE PRESENTS THAT FRAMEWORK SO
25 BEAUTIFULLY, IS, ONE, IS REALLY LOOKING AT OUR TRANSPORTATION



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 INVESTMENTS, HOW DO WE KEEP THEM ROBUST AND HEALTHY, AND HOW
2 DO WE PIVOT IN TERMS OF MEETING TRANSIT NEEDS, BUT THE SECOND
3 IS, HOW DO WE ENSURE THAT WE PRODUCE HOUSING. YOU KNOW? WE'RE
4 STILL -- WE'RE IN THIS HUGE HOUSING CRISIS, CONTINUE TO BE SO.
5 AND, SO, I'M HOPEFUL. I'M PLEASED ABOUT SENATOR WIENER'S
6 INITIATIVE THAT WE ANNOUNCED THE OTHER DAY, FOR EXAMPLE, WITH
7 HIS BILL TO PROVIDE THE ABILITY TO PRODUCE HOUSING ON FAITH
8 OWNED PARCELS PROPERTY AROUND THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA WHICH
9 STATISTICALLY REPRESENTED ABOUT 40,000 ACRES OF HOUSING
10 OPPORTUNITY, AND THAT'S ALSO SIGNIFICANT IN THE BAY AREA. I
11 ALSO THINK THAT THE FACT THAT WE WERE ABLE TO STAND YOU KNOW
12 THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY, IN PARTNERSHIP WITH
13 THE CITIES, IS REALLY AN IMPORTANT ELEMENT THAT WILL BE PART
14 OF THIS, ENABLING US TO IMPLEMENT THESE GOALS. BUT, AGAIN,
15 DAVE, THANKS TO YOU AND YOUR TEAM FOR CLEARLY TAKING THAT
16 SOLID LOOK AT WHERE WE ARE, OUT MOVING FORWARD TO COMPLY WITH
17 THE STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS IN SB 375. AND OUR PLANNING
18 PROCESS, BUT, ALSO LOOKING AT WHAT ELEMENT DO WE NEED TO
19 REALLY INCORPORATE FOR THE BAY AREA GIVEN THE UNIQUE IMPACTS
20 OF THE ECONOMY, AND THE IMPACT OF BOTH HOUSING,
21 TRANSPORTATION, AND JOBS, CHANGING, LOOKING TO THE FUTURE. SO,
22 THANK YOU.

23

24 **DAVID E. HUDSON:** YOU'RE WELCOME, AMY.

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** DAVID RABBIT THEN CARLOS ROMERO.

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT WORK. IT'S BEEN AN
4 INTERESTING RIDE. EXCUSE ME. AS PRESIDENT OF ABAG WHEN WE HAD
5 THE FIRST PLANNED BAY AREA GO THROUGH, AND ALL THE ANGST THAT
6 CAME FROM THAT, DISCUSSIONS, WE HAVE AN IMPROVED DOCUMENT
7 PROCESS. AND I PERSONALLY VERY MUCH APPRECIATE THE APPROACH. I
8 WAS FORTUNATE ENOUGH TO REPRESENT SONOMA COUNTY IN RECEIVING
9 CITIES CLIMATE CHAMPION AWARD AT THE WHITEHOUSE UNDER THE
10 OBAMA ADMINISTRATION FOR BEING THE FIRST COUNTY IN THE COUNTRY
11 TO PRODUCE A REGIONAL CLIMATE ACTION PLAN. UNFORTUNATELY, WE
12 WERE SUED AFTER THAT BECAUSE IT DIDN'T GO FAR ENOUGH OR SOME,
13 QUITE HONESTLY, SOME LAND USE DECISIONS. I SEE PLANNED BAY
14 AREA AS THE NEW DOCUMENT THAT LAYS OUT THE APPROACH TO MEET
15 OUR GREENHOUSE GAS REDUCTION GOALS WHILE ACCOMMODATING GROWTH
16 THAT WILL NATURALLY OCCUR. AND IF WE'RE SERIOUS ABOUT REACHING
17 THOSE GOALS, WE CAN ONLY DO THAT REGIONALLY IF THIS DOCUMENT
18 POINTS TO THE COORDINATED ACTIONS THAT NEED TO HAPPEN. I
19 TOTALLY UNDERSTAND AND AGREE WITH DAVE HUDSON REGARDING CARB'S
20 ROLE IN THAT AND STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS AT THE SAME TIME.
21 WHILE I THINK NOW THAT EVERY JURISDICTION RIGHTFULLY SO MAKES
22 CLIMATE ACTION A TOP PRIORITY THE LACK OF THE COORDINATION IS
23 EVIDENT. AND I THINK THAT WHILE WE NIP AROUND THE EDGES A LOT
24 IN SOME JURISDICTIONS, SOME JURISDICTIONS QUITE HONESTLY DON'T
25 ADDRESS THE ELEPHANT IN THE ROOM A LOT OF THAT IS HOUSING AND



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 THE FORCING FOLKS TO BE FURTHER OUT IN THE LARGER COMMUTE
2 RADIUS. SO, I LOOK FORWARD TO THAT CONTINUING AS WE GO
3 FORWARD. THESE ARE DIFFICULT DISCUSSIONS. SOME OF THESE THINGS
4 WILL BE -- THEY WILL BE VERY ONEROUS IN SOME RESPECT TO CARRY
5 OUT. BUT IF WE DON'T DO THAT, WE'RE GOING TO BE IN EVEN MORE
6 TROUBLE IN THE LONG-TERM. SO THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR THE WORK
7 IN CONTINUING THE DISCUSSION.

8

9 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MAYOR LICCARDO OPEN. GOOD TO SEE
10 YOU THIS MORNING.

11

12 **SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU, JIM. I WANT TO PILOT THANKS TO DAVE,
13 MATT, AND THE ENTIRE TEAM AND CARA FOR THE GREAT WORK. ALSO
14 RECOGNIZING THERESE, CERTAINLY MANY GREAT ACCOMPLISHMENTS IN
15 YOUR TENURE AND LEADERSHIP. THIS WAS A BIG ONE, VERY
16 DIFFICULT, YOU HAVE A LOT OF DIVERSE STAKEHOLDERS HERE, AND I
17 THINK THE STAFF HAS REALLY NAVIGATED, THESE CHALLENGING
18 WATERS, VERY WELL. I AM GRATEFUL WE'RE HERE. I WANT TO ADDRESS
19 THE WEIGHT OF THE IMPACT ON THE PANDEMIC PATTERNS OF WORK.
20 THERE IS A LOT OF CONVICTION OUT THERE THAT THIS WORLD HAS
21 CHANGED FOREVER, AND I AM CERTAINLY NOT -- I'M NOT EXPECTING
22 TO SEE A LOT OF OFFICE CONSTRUCTION IN THE NEXT HALF DECADE,
23 CERTAINLY, BUT I THINK WE SHOULD ASSUME THAT THE FINAL CHAPTER
24 HASN'T BEEN WRITTEN ON THIS. I THINK WE'RE RUN INTO A PERIOD
25 OF UNCERTAINTY. AND I HEARD FROM A FEW EMPLOYERS THAT AS PINK



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 SLIPS START GETTING HANDED OUT -- AND UNFORTUNATELY THAT IS
2 THE REALITY RIGHT NOW, THE IMPERATIVE OF BEING SEEN AT WORK
3 WILL CERTAINLY BECOME MORE REAL TO A LOT OF WORKERS. AND I
4 SUSPECT THAT WE MAY SEE SOME REGRESSION TOWARD [INDISCERNIBLE]
5 AND A LOT OF EMPLOYERS HAVE SHARED WITH ME HOW IMPORTANT IT IS
6 TO SEE CREATIVE PEOPLE IN THE SAME WORKSPACE AS MARKETING
7 PEOPLE, AS ENGINEERS. AS ALL AT KINDS OF DIVERSE TALENTS, THAT
8 YOU GET A GREAT PRODUCT WHEN PEOPLE ARE ACTUALLY REGULARLY
9 ENGAGING ONE ANOTHER. I THINK WE SHOULDN'T ASSUME THAT WHAT'S
10 POST PROLOGUE WITH REGARD TO WHAT TO DO WITH CHANGING WORK
11 HABITS. THEY MAY COME BACK QUITE A BIT. IT'S HARD, I YOU KNOW.
12 EISENHOWER SAID ALL PLANS ARE USELESS BUT PLANNING IS
13 INDISPENSABLE IN THE WORK. IT'S IMPORTANT IF WE DON'T DO THE
14 WORK THINKING OF THE FUTURE, WE'RE GOING TO BE UNPREPARED.
15 WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO BE VERY NIMBLE.

16

17 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, SAM. I DON'T SEE ANY
18 OTHER HANDS RAISED. MARTHA DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENTS?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
21 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
22 THEIR HAND RAISED. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

23

24 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TWO MINUTES. OKAY. ADINA YOU ARE FIRST UP.
2 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN WITH
5 SEAMLESS BAY AREA. FIRST OF ALL, WANTED TO EXPRESS A LOT OF
6 KUDOS AND THANKS TO STAFF FOR THE PROPOSAL TO BE INTEGRATING
7 THAT CONNECTED NETWORK PLAN INTO PLANNED BAY AREA AND HAVING
8 OUR NEXT GENERATION OF PLANNING FOR TRANSPORTATION TO BE VERY
9 HEAVILY DRIVEN BY SERVICE. THIS IS VERY MUCH IN LINE WITH HOW
10 REGIONS AROUND THE WORLD THAT HAVE WORLD CLASS TRANSPORTATION
11 DO THIS. IN TERMS OF PLANNING FOR SERVICE, PLANNING FOR
12 FREQUENT SERVICE, PLANNING FOR HOW FAST IT TAKES TO GET FROM
13 POINT A TO POINT B, INCLUDING IF GETTING FROM POINT A TO POINT
14 B INCLUDING CROSSING JURISDICTIONS AND PLANNING FOR WELL
15 CONNECTED SERVICE. AND IN DOING THAT, SPEAKING TO SOME OF THE
16 EARLIER TOPICS BROUGHT UP BY THE MEMBERS, IN THE CITY OF
17 VANCOUVER, PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS BACK UP TO 80%, AND THEY
18 HAVE A SYSTEM THAT WAS BUILT IN A WELL CONNECTED MANNER
19 SUPPORTING PEOPLE NOT ONLY WHITE COLLAR COMMUTERS TAKING PEAK
20 TRIPS, BUT FOR A DIVERSITY OF RIDERS AND A DIVERSITY OF TRIPS
21 AND THAT IS SOMETHING THAT IS REALLY HELPFUL. AND THEN IN
22 TERMS OF HOUSING, OUR HOUSING PLANS REALLY DO DEPEND ON HAVING
23 TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS THAT IT DOESN'T CAUSE A HUGE CONGESTION
24 AND SO HAVING THE CONNECTED NETWORK PLANNING, TRANSIT PLANNING
25 IN WITH PLANNED BAY AREA WILL BE SOMETHING THAT WILL BE REALLY



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 HELPFUL TO CITIES IN SUPPORTING THE RHNA IMPLEMENTATION. SO,
2 KUDOS, AND LOOKING FORWARD TO THE PROCESS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, ADINA, FOR THOSE
5 COMMENTS.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND THEN -- OH, WE HAD CHRIS FITZGERALD
8 HAD HER HAND RAISED. I DON'T SEE IT ANYMORE. JEN CLAUS?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS JEN, EXECUTIVE
11 DIRECTOR OF GENERATION HOUSING WHERE WE ADVOCATE FOR MORE AND
12 MORE DIVERSE AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE NORTH BAY. I JUST
13 WANT TO SAY, QUICKLY, THAT WE REALLY APPRECIATE THE STAFF'S
14 WORK ON THIS. IN THE NORTH BAY, WE HAVE LIMITED AREAS THAT ARE
15 ENCOMPASSED BY THE TOC, AND SO I WANT -- AND THIS GROUP KNOWS
16 WELL, THE INTERSECTION OF HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION
17 SOLUTIONS, BUT THIS CONNECTED TRANSPORTATION NETWORK IS
18 PARTICULARLY IMPACTFUL OR CAN BE IN THE NORTH BAY TO HELP
19 BRING IN MORE PARTS OF OUR COMMUNITIES RATHER THAN THE PARTS
20 THAT ARE JUST ON THE 101 CORRIDOR. SO WE WANT TO REALLY
21 EXPRESS OUR SUPPORT FOR THIS. THANK YOU.

22

23 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

24



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE
2 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WELL, I WANT TO
5 THANK STAFF. YOU KNOW, I DON'T AGREE -- I AGREE WITH A LOT OF
6 THE COMMENTS OF MY COLLEAGUES [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES] BUT -- YOU
7 KNOW, I JUST -- AND BOARD MEMBER HUDSON. AND, SO, IF THERE IS
8 NO OTHER HANDS RAISED, AND, I SEE NO OTHER -- AGAIN,
9 CONGRATULATIONS STAFF. THERESE, THANK YOU FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP
10 ON THIS. YOU KNOW, I THINK THIS IS GOING TO BE A GREAT
11 MILESTONE FOR THE REGION AS WE MOVE FORWARD. LET'S MOVE
12 FORWARD TO ITEM 7B, THE CLIMATE PROGRAM INVESTMENT DIRECTION.
13 ONE OTHER THING I WANT TO SAY, YOU KNOW, WE TALK ABOUT
14 HOUSING, AND I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT WE CHALLENGE THE
15 CITIES AND COUNTIES, AND IT'S AN AGGRESSIVE CHALLENGE. WE HAVE
16 LOOKED THE OTHER WAY ABOUT HOUSING DEVELOPMENT, FOR A LONG
17 TIME IN A LOT OF THESE COMMUNITIES, AND I THINK THEY NEED TO
18 BE HELD ACCOUNTABLE. THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS ON THE HOUSING
19 PIECE OF THIS. WITH THAT I'LL TURN TO STAFF ON THE CLIMATE
20 PROGRAM INVESTMENT DIRECTION. MATT, ARE YOU KICKING THIS OFF?

21

22 **MATT MALONEY:** YEAH. WE CAME TO YOU A COUPLE OF MONTHS AGO WITH
23 INFORMATION ON THIS CLIMATE PROGRAM ITEM IN THE NAME OF
24 IMPLEMENTATION PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. YOU KNOW HERE IT IS
25 WE'RE BACK HERE TO SHOW YOU FURTHER DIRECTION ON THIS. WE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 DON'T HAVE EVERYTHING FIGURED OUT YET, BUT WE HAVE SOME OF IT
2 FIGURED OUT. SO, LOOKING FOR YOUR FEEDBACK TODAY. I'M GOING TO
3 PASS IT OVER TO, WE HAVE JAMES CHO WITH US TODAY, FROM OUR
4 TEAM, AS WELL AS KRUTE SINGA, AND KRUTE IS GOING TO KICK IT
5 OFF.

6

7 **KRUTE SINGA:** THANKS MATT. GOOD MORNING BOARD MEMBERS AND
8 COMMISSIONERS. I'M KRUTE SINGA WITH JAMES CHO WITH THE CLIMATE
9 TEAM AND AGENCY'S REGIONAL PLANNING SECTION. COULD THE SLIDES
10 BE BROUGHT UP PLEASE? NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE'RE HERE TO
11 PROVIDE THE PROPOSED GRANTS DIRECTION FOR THE MOBILITY HUB AND
12 PARKING MANAGEMENT PROGRAMS AND GET YOUR FEEDBACK. AND JUST TO
13 REITERATE WHAT MATT JUST SAID AND TO ADDRESS COMMISSIONER
14 SPERING'S COMMENTS THE FOCUS OF THIS ITEM IS TO ADVANCE THESE
15 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROGRAMS TO IMPLEMENTATION. ALSO BE
16 PROVIDING AN UPDATE ON THE DEVELOPING TRANSPORTATION
17 ELECTRIFICATION STRATEGY. SO NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THE NEXT
18 COUPLE OF SLIDES MAY BE FAMILIAR. AGAIN, WE CAME TO THIS
19 COMMITTEE IN SEPTEMBER WITH AN OVERVIEW OF THE CLIMATE
20 PROTECTION ADVANCEMENT STRATEGY UPDATE ON THE PLANS THE
21 CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCE BOARDS 19% PER CAPITA GREENHOUSE GAS
22 EMISSIONS REDUCTION TARGETED BY ELECTRIFYING TRANSPORTATION
23 AND REDUCTION OF SO LOW TRIPS. SUPPORTING NUMBER OF
24 TRANSPORTATION ENVIRONMENT STRATEGIES IN PLANNED BAY AREA AND
25 MOST DIRECTLY THE SEAMLESS MOBILITY, COMPETE STREETS, CLEAN



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 VEHICLES, AND TRANSPORTATION DEMAND MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES. SO
2 AS MENTIONED A SUBSET OF CLIMATE PROGRAMS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
3 TODAY ARE MOBILITY HUBS, PARKING MANAGEMENT AND TRANSPORTATION
4 ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THESE PROGRAMS
5 ARE INCLUDED IN THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM. SO, OBAG
6 THREE, TOTAL AMOUNT OF 33,000,015 MOBILITY HUBS PARKING
7 MANAGEMENT AND 65 FOR TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION. CLIMATE
8 PROGRAM INVESTMENTS APPROVED BY THE COMMISSION IN OCTOBER AS
9 PART OF THE OBAG THREE PROGRAMMING ITEM AND MOST FUNDS WILL BE
10 PROVIDED TO PARTNER AGENCIES TO GRANT PROGRAMS. AND WE'RE HERE
11 TODAY TO HIGHLIGHT UPCOMING MOBILITY HUBS AND PARKING
12 MANAGEMENT GRANT PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M GOING TO
13 START WITH THE MOBILITY HUBS GRANT PROGRAM AND THE PROGRAM
14 DEFINITION. NEXT SLIDE. AND THE DEFINITION WAS DEVELOPED
15 THROUGH A STAKEHOLDER INPUT PROCESS WITH PARTNER AGENCIES.
16 WHAT WAS AGREED ON DEFINES THE HUBS AS COMMUNITIES ANCHORS
17 THAT ENABLE TRAVELERS OF ALL BACKGROUNDS AND ABILITIES TO
18 ACCESS MULTIPLE TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS INCLUDING SHARED
19 SCOOTERS AND BIKES, CAR SHARE AND TRANSIT, AS WELL AS
20 SUPPORTIVE AMENITIES IN A COHESIVE SPACE ORIENTED TO THE
21 CUSTOMER. SO LAST YEAR WE LAUNCHED SEVEN PILOTED PROJECTS AT
22 2.7 MILLION TOTAL REPRESENTING A VARIETY OF LAND USE TYPES AND
23 TRANSIT USE SERVICES A MIX OF QUICK BUILD AND PERMANENT
24 CONSTRUCTION LOCATED IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND EQUITY
25 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. SO THE PILOT PROJECTS ARE CURRENTLY IN



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 THE FUNDING OBLIGATION AND DESIGN STAGE AND ARE EXPECTED TO
2 START CONSTRUCTION NEXT YEAR. BUT THEY HAVE ALREADY PROVIDED
3 GOOD LESSONS LEARNED ON FUNDING AMOUNTS AND PROCESS THAT WE'RE
4 INCORPORATING INTO THE NEXT ROUND THE GRANT GUIDELINES WHICH
5 I'LL GET TO IN A BIT BUT FIRST I WANT TO SHARE SOME VISUALS ON
6 WHAT WE'RE AIMING TO ACHIEVE THROUGHOUT PROGRAM AND THE
7 GRANTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE -- SORRY -- PREVIOUS ONE.
8 I'M SORRY. YES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY. SO, THE ILLUSTRATION
9 SHOWS HUBS THAT -- IT SHOWS HOW THE HUBS CAN ACHIEVE THE GOALS
10 AND DEFINITIONS OF THE PROGRAM THROUGH A VARIETY OF ELEMENTS
11 THAT COULD INCLUDE BUS SHELTERS, RETAIL SPACE, OR SPACES THAT
12 SERVE A COMMUNITIES FUNCTION. INFORMATION AND WAY FINDING
13 WITHIN THE HUB AND TO THE SURROUNDING AREA. BIKE OR SCOOTER
14 SHARE, AND ELECTRIFIED DOCKING STATIONS. ELECTRIC CAR SHARE
15 AND CHARGING, SAFE WALK AND BIKE ACCESS AND TREES OR
16 LANDSCAPING THAT FOSTER A SENSE OF PLACE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** SCHRUTI, BEFORE YOU MOVE THIS
19 SLIDE, I WAS DISAPPOINTED YOU DIDN'T HIGHLIGHT THE FOOD TRUCK.
20 THAT'S A VERY IMPORTANT COMPONENT FOR THESE HUBS. THESE TRUCKS
21 ARE BECOMING A WAY OF LIFE FOR A LOT OF THINGS THAT WE DO. I
22 APPRECIATE STAFF PUTTING THAT IN THERE. THANK YOU.

23

24 **KRUTE SINGA:** I'LL DO THAT NEXT TIME.

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. [LAUGHTER]

2

3 **KRUTE SINGA:** SO THIS IS AN EXAMPLE OF WHAT A HUB IN A DENSE
4 URBAN AREA LOOKS LIKE IT INTEGRATED A VARIETY OF ELEMENTS IN
5 THE HUB AREAS AND NEXT TO THE STREET ON THE CURB. NEXT SLIDE
6 PLEASE. THIS IS AN EXAMPLE OF WHAT A HUB IN A MEDIUM DENSITY
7 AREA COULD LOOK LIKE AROUND A BUS RAPID TRANSIT STOP FOR
8 EXAMPLE, YOU CAN SEE IN THE TWO IMAGINES THE MAKEUP OF THE
9 ELEMENTS AS DETERMINED BY THE HUB IS LOCATION, LAND USE
10 CONTACT AND COMMUNITIES INPUT. WHAT WE'RE LOOKING FOR IS A MIX
11 OF ELEMENTS THAT MEET THE OBJECTIVES OF THE PROGRAM WHICH ARE
12 THAT THE HUBS -- NEXT SLIDE PLEASE -- WHICH ARE THE HUBS THAT
13 FACILITATE EASY CONNECTIONS BETWEEN SERVICES LOCATED THERE.
14 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE HUBS PROVIDE A SAFE AND WELCOMING
15 COMMUNITY SPACE FOR USERS OF ALL BACKGROUND AND ABILITIES AND
16 ARE ORIENTED TO THE PERSON TRAVELING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND
17 HAVE GOOD INFORMATION SYSTEMS BOTH IN STATIC AND DIGITAL
18 APPLICATIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, AS MENTIONED UPCOMING
19 GRANT CALLS INCORPORATES LESSONS LEARNED FROM THE PILOT
20 PROJECTS. THIS INCLUDES INCREASING THE SIZE OF THE CAPITAL
21 GRANTS UP TO 3 MILLION TO IMPLEMENT MULTIPLE ELEMENTS TO
22 CREATE A COHESIVE COMMUNITY ORIENTED HUB. WE'RE ALSO PROPOSING
23 TO CONNECT A HUB PROGRAM TO OTHER MTC PROGRAMS. SO THIS MEANS
24 FOCUSING ON HUB LOCATIONS IN THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES.
25 SORRY -- THAT ARE SUBJECT TO TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 POLICY, OR ARE IN PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS OR EQUITY
2 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. SO, THE PURPOSE OF BOTH THE GRANT SIZE
3 AND THE LOCATIONS IS TO ALLOW A GREATER NUMBER OF HUBS TO BE
4 IMPLEMENTED THROUGHOUT THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NEXT
5 SLIDE. THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZE GRANTS GUIDELINES, COMPETITIVE FOR
6 FUND YOU TYPES, FIRST BUILDING CONSTRUCTION PLANNING OUTREACH
7 MEETING CONSTRUCTION CRITERIA LISTED ON THE SLIDE SHOWS KIND
8 OF HOW WE'LL BE EVALUATING APPLICATIONS WHICH INCLUDE DESIGN,
9 COMMUNITY PARTNERSHIPS, AND OPERATIONS AND MAINTENANCE. I ALSO
10 WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT THIS PROGRAM LINKS TO THE
11 TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAM. YOU WILL BE HEARING
12 ABOUT THAT IN A FEW MINUTES BY PRIORITIZING PROJECTS THAT
13 INCORPORATE BIKE, SCOOTERS OR ELECTRIC CAR SHARE CHARGING
14 INFRASTRUCTURE. SO, AS I MENTIONED BEFORE, THERE IS 33 MILLION
15 TOTAL FOR THE PROGRAM. WE ANTICIPATE RELEASING ONE OR TWO
16 CYCLES OF THE GRANT. RELEASING FIRSTS CYCLE EARLY NEXT YEAR
17 BASED ON RESPONSES WE MAY HAVE FUNDS REMAINING TO RELEASE
18 ANOTHER CALL IN 2024. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. NOW I'M GOING TO HAND
19 IT OVER TO JAMES WHO MANAGES THE PARKING MANAGEMENT PROGRAM TO
20 PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF WHAT WE'RE PROPOSING FOR THE GRANTS
21 PROGRAM.

22

23 **JAMES CHOE:** THANKS KRUTE. AS CRUDE MENTIONED MY NAME IS JAMES
24 CHO WITH THE REGIONAL PLANNING SECTION AND I HAVE BEEN
25 COORDINATING OUR LOCAL PARKING POLICY AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 OPPORTUNITIES. AND I PREVIOUSLY PRESENTED TO THIS COMMITTEE IN
2 JULY OF LAST YEAR ON A SET OF PLANNING RESOURCES WE WERE
3 DEVELOPING AT THE TIME TO HELP LOCAL STAFF UPDATE IMPLEMENTING
4 PARKING POLICIES AND PROGRAMS RESULTING IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF
5 A PARKING POLICY PLAYBOOK WHICH IS A GUIDEBOOK TO DEVELOPING
6 IMPLEMENTING PARKING POLICIES AND STRATEGIES THEN CULMINATING
7 IN A WEBINAR SERIOUS AND OPPORTUNITY TO MEET WITHIN OFFICE
8 HOURS FOR LOCAL STAFF. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WITH WRAP YOU OF
9 THAT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WE'RE LOOKING FOR GRANTS FOR PARKING
10 MANAGEMENT PLANNING AND IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGIES THAT WERE
11 INCLUDED IN THAT PARKING POLICY PLAYBOOK AND ALIGNED WITH
12 REGIONAL POLICY GOALS. THIS ISN'T THE FIRST TIME WE'RE
13 OFFERING THESE TYPES OF GRANTS. WE PREVIOUSLY ADMINISTERED A
14 SIMILAR SET OF PARKING MANAGEMENT GRANTS IN 2015 THROUGH THE
15 CLIMATE PRESENTLY. AND SIMILARLY, THIS GRANT OPPORTUNITY IS
16 FOCUSED ON PARKING MANAGEMENT, SO THAT'S MANAGING EXISTING OR
17 PLANNED PARKING RESOURCES BOTH ON AND OFF-STREET, AND INCLUDE
18 THE CONSIDERATION OF MULTIPLE USES OF THE CURB IN ADDITION TO
19 PARKING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. TO GIVE YOU A SENSE OF THE TYPES
20 OF ISSUES THAT WE'RE HOPING TO HELP LOCAL JURISDICTIONS
21 ADDRESS THROUGH THE PARKING MANAGEMENT GRANTS, HIGHLIGHTING
22 SOME EXAMPLES OF CHALLENGES HERE. POORLY MANAGED AND DESIGNED
23 PARKING FACILITIES CREATE CLASHES WITH OTHER MODES RESULTING
24 IN REDUCED SAFETY FOR CYCLISTS, PEDESTRIAN, TRANSIT RIDERS IN
25 ADDITION TO THE DRIVERS THEMSELVES ALSO CREATES CONGESTION OR



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 TRAFFIC FREE OR UNMANAGED PARKING RESULTS IN DRIVER CIRCLING
2 OR RESIDENTS OR WORKERS OR SHOPPERS NOT BEING ABLE TO USE THAT
3 SPACE AND ENCOURAGES DRIVING AND SUBSIDIZES PARKING OF PRIVATE
4 VEHICLES ON PUBLIC PROPERTY IN LIEU OF OTHER MODES OR USES. ON
5 STREET PARK GARAGES ARE UNDERUTILIZED WHILE SURROUNDING
6 STREETS AND CURBS ARE FILLED WITH CARS. AND UNUSED PARKING IS
7 AT THE COST OF MORE VALUABLE USE OF THAT SPACE SUCH AS
8 HOUSING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO BETTER PARKING MANAGEMENT HELPS
9 TO ADDRESS SOME OF THESE CHALLENGES. THERE ARE TOOLS AND
10 TECHNOLOGIES THAT CAN BETTER ALLOCATE AND BALANCE THE USE OF
11 SPACES FOR PARK ORGAN OTHER NEEDS SUCH AS GROWING DEMAND FOR
12 DELIVERY AND PASSENGER PICK UP AND DROP OFF. ALSO EQUIPMENT
13 AND TOOLS TO MANAGE AND ENFORCE APPROPRIATE USES OF THOSE
14 SPACES SUCH AS FOR SHORT-TERM LOADING UNLOADING OR FOR BUS
15 STOPS. NEW PROGRAMS AND EQUIPMENT THAT CAN HELP PRICE PARKING
16 TO REDUCE UNNECESSARY DRIVING AND ACCOMMODATE VEHICLES FOR
17 BOTH RESIDENTS AND VISITORS WHILE LIMITING THE SPILL OVERVIEW
18 OF PARKING FROM NEIGHBORING AREAS. AND THERE ASSAULTS A
19 GROWING SET OF NEW AND BEST PRACTICES FOR PROVIDING PARKING
20 WHILE IMPROVING SAFETY AND ACCOMMODATIONS FOR ALL USE OF THE
21 ROAD. THE VISION OF THE PARKING MANAGEMENT PROGRAM IS TO
22 SUPPORT IMPLEMENTATION OF PROJECTS THROUGH GREENHOUSE GAS
23 EMISSIONS MANAGING PARKING DEMAND FOR APPROPRIATE PRICING AND
24 OTHER STRATEGIES AND INCREASING OPTIONS TO ACCESS TO LOW
25 CARBON TRANSPORTATION OPTIONS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN JULY OF



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 THIS YEAR, STAFF INVITED LOCAL PUBLIC AGENCIES TO SUBMIT
2 PARKING MANAGEMENT IMPLEMENTATION PROJECTS FOR GRANT
3 CONSIDERATION. AND WE RECEIVED OVER 20 SUBMISSIONS. WHILE THE
4 FOCUS OF THIS OPPORTUNITY WAS ON CAPITAL IMPLEMENTATION
5 PROJECTS MANY AGENCIES SUBMITTED REQUESTS FOR PLANNING
6 ACTIVITIES PLANNING REQUESTS INCLUDED FOR EXAMPLE, DEVELOPING
7 REGULATORY FRAMEWORK OR FINANCIAL MODEL OR ENFORCEMENT
8 APPROACH FOR MODELS AND TRANSPORTATION MANAGEMENT DISTRICTS IN
9 PLANNED GROWTH AREAS AND DOWNSTAIRS CURBSIDE MANAGEMENT PLAN
10 TO ADDRESS GROWTH AND FOOD DELIVERY, DINING AND TRANSIT
11 STATION CONNECTIONS AND ADDRESSING GROWTH. PROPOSING TO OFFER
12 BOTH PLANNING GRANTS IN ADDITION TO CAPITAL GRANTS. SO FOR THE
13 CAPITAL GRANTS STAFF WILL EVALUATE THE LETTERS OF INTEREST
14 RECEIVED, COLLECT ADDITIONAL PROJECT INFORMATION FROM SPONSORS
15 AND RECOMMEND AWARDS FOR IMPLEMENTATION GRANTS IN SPRING NEXT
16 YEAR. WE'LL ISSUE A NEW CALL FOR PARK MANAGEMENT PLANNING
17 PROJECTS AT THE BEGINNING OF THE NEW YEAR. WE ALSO ANTICIPATE
18 RESERVING A PORTION OF 13 MILLION IN CAPITAL GRANT FUNDING FOR
19 FEATURE GRANT ROUNDS TO IMPLEMENT PROJECTS THAT COME OUT OF
20 THESE PLANNING EFFORTS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THIS TABLE
21 SUMMARIZES DETAILS FOR EACH TYPE OF PARKING MANAGEMENT GRANT.
22 SO FOR PLANNING WE WANT TO SUPPORT PLANS AND STUDIES THAT WILL
23 HELP MANAGE PARKING FOR STRATEGIES AND PLANNING WILL ALSO
24 SERVE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND TRANSIT ORIENTED
25 COMMUNITY AREAS BE SPONSORED BY PUBLIC AGENCIES AND GRANTS UP



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 TO \$400,000 EACH. AND THEN FOR CAPITAL OR OTHER IMPLEMENTATION
2 PROJECTS, PROJECTS CAN -- WILL BE ABLE TO INCLUDE ACQUISITION
3 OF EQUIPMENT, SOFTWARE AND SERVICES TO IMPLEMENT THESE
4 STRATEGIES, AND CAN INCLUDE INITIAL OPERATING COST OF A NEW
5 PROGRAM. AND SIMILARLY THESE PROJECTS MUST SERVE PDAS AND TOC
6 LOCATIONS ARE OPEN FOR PUBLIC AGENCIES IN THE PROJECTS WE
7 FUNDED UP TO 1.5 MILLION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, SHIFTING TO
8 THE FINAL CLIMATE PROGRAM WE'RE TALKING ABOUT TODAY, THE
9 TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVES. UNLIKE THE
10 PREVIOUS MOBILITY HUBS AND PARKING MANAGEMENT PROGRAMS YOU
11 WERE JUST DISCUSSING, THIS IS, WE'RE PROVIDING AN UPDATE ON
12 THE DEVELOPMENT PROCESS ON THE SET OF INITIATIVES FOR THIS
13 PROGRAM AREA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS A REMINDER AT THE
14 SEPTEMBER COMMITTEE MEETING WE PRESENTED ON THE FINDINGS.
15 LETTERS OF INTEREST THAT WE COLLECTED FROM LOCAL AGENCIES IN
16 WHICH THEY HAD OPPORTUNITY TO SHARE THEIR ELECTRIFICATION
17 PRESENTATION PROJECTS, BARRIERS IN OPPORTUNITIES AND
18 INVESTMENTS. LOOKING AT CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE FOR POSSIBLY
19 PUBLIC AND MUNICIPAL FLEETS ALONG WITH STRONG INTEREST FOR
20 ELECTRIC MOBILITY OPTIONS PARTICULARLY FOR E-BIKES. NEXT SLIDE
21 PLEASE. SO AS KRUTE NOTED EARLIER, COMMISSION ALLOCATED 65
22 MILLION IN OBAG THREE FOR TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION
23 INITIATIVE. BASED ON THE NEEDS THAT WERE EXPRESSED BOTH IN THE
24 LETTERS OF INTEREST AND IN ADDITIONAL DISCUSSIONS STAFF HAVE
25 BEEN HAVING WITH LOCAL AND REGIONAL STAKEHOLDERS WE'RE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 EXPLORING THE DEVELOPMENT OF INITIATIVES IN FOUR AREAS. FIRST
2 BEING PRIMARILY IN CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE, AND CONSIDERING A
3 FOCUS ON TRANSIT STATION LOTS IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES
4 WHICH ALIGN WITH OTHER REGIONAL PROGRAMS AND OBJECTIVES. ALSO
5 UPON DIRECTION FOR THIS FREE TIME WE HAVE BEEN EXPLORING
6 PARTNERSHIPS WITH OTHER AGENCIES PARTICULARLY THE AIR DISTRICT
7 AND COMMUNITIES CHOICE AGGREGATORS OR CCAS WHO HAVE EXISTING
8 PROGRAMMING IN THIS SPACE TO SEE IF WE CAN LEVERAGE EACH
9 OTHER'S WORKING INVESTMENTS. SECOND AREA, TO SUPPORT THE
10 INTEREST IN ELECTRIC MOBILITY WE WANT TO FOCUS ON ELECTRIC
11 BIKESHARE. THIS INCLUDES ELECTRIFYING DOCKING STATIONS SO THAT
12 E-BIKES CAN BE CHARGED ON-SITE. ALSO, THIS INCLUDES SUPPORTING
13 EXPANSION OF E-BIKES ACROSS THE REGIONAL BIKESHARE SYSTEM, AND
14 THEN ALSO WE WANT TO SEEK IMPROVING ACCESS TO THIS CLEAN
15 MOBILITY OPTION IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. THE THIRD
16 AREA, TO SUPPORT CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE FOR MUNICIPAL FLEET
17 VEHICLES. THIS WAS IDENTIFIED AS GAPE IN THE EXISTING FUNDING
18 OPPORTUNITIES. AND THEN, FINALLY, AS THESE WILL BE NEW
19 INITIATIVES FOR MTC, WE WANT TO EVALUATE THE PROGRAMS TO
20 INFORM FUTURE PLANNING AND PROGRAMMING. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO
21 TO WRAP UP, WE'RE INTERESTED IN FEEDBACK ON THESE CLIMATE
22 PROGRAMS DISCUSSED TODAY AND THEN FOLLOWING THAT FEEDBACK, WE
23 LOOK TO FINALIZE THE GUIDELINES AND THEN ISSUE A CALL FOR
24 PROJECTS FOR THE MOBILITY HUBS AND THE PARKING MANAGEMENT
25 PLANNING GRANTS AND THEN FOR ALL THE GRANT OPPORTUNITIES WE



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ANTICIPATE EVALUATING AND RECOMMENDING AWARDS FOR APPROVAL IN
2 SPRING OF NEXT YEAR. AND THEN FOR TRANSPORTATION
3 ELECTRIFICATION WE ANTICIPATE RETURNING TO THIS COMMITTEE IN
4 EARLY 2023 WITH PROGRAM RECOMMENDATIONS. WITH THAT WE'LL WRAP
5 UP. I'M OPEN TO DISCUSSION AND QUESTIONS. THANK YOU

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU, KRUTE AND JAMES.
8 LET'S SEE, ANY COMMISSIONERS WITH THEIR -- OKAY, CAROL, DO YOU
9 WANT TO GO FIRST?

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** THANKS. I DO HAVE A QUESTION. BECAUSE
12 OBVIOUSLY THE GOAL WAS TO GET PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR CARS AND ON
13 TO PUBLIC TRANSIT. AS WE TALK ABOUT PARKING AND THE PAID
14 PARKING, I WAS, AGAIN, THINKING ABOUT THE EQUITY. ARE LOW-
15 INCOME COMMUNITIES PART OF THIS CONVERSATION AS WE MOVE THIS
16 FORWARD, ADDRESSING THOSE THAT ARE EITHER CHOOSING TO OR ARE
17 FORCED TO USE THEIR OWN VEHICLE AND HAVE TO PAY FOR PARKING,
18 BE IT CURBSIDE OR IN GARAGES?

19

20 **JAMES CHOE:** THANK YOU FOR THE COMMENT. ONE OF THE
21 CONSIDERATIONS IN THE PARKING MANAGEMENT GRANT PROGRAM IS
22 FOCUS ON PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND TOC AREAS BUT ALSO
23 THERE IS CONSIDERATION OF EQUITY COMPONENT. BECAUSE WE WANT TO
24 BE ABLE TO BALANCE THINKING ABOUT THE USE OF THESE SPACE AND
25 THE REQUIREMENTS TO DRIVE AND PARK AND PAY, TO BALANCE BOTH,



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 WHAT ARE THE OPPORTUNITIES FOR EXAMPLE, WITH PRICING TO FUND
2 OTHER TRANSPORTATION, MORE AFFORDABLE MOBILITY OPTIONS OR ALSO
3 CONSIDER THE USE OF THESE SPACES THAT ARE CURRENTLY FOR
4 PARKING PRIVATE VEHICLES FOR OTHER MODE OPTIONS. AND SO WE
5 WANT TO BE CONSIDERING ALL THE OPPORTUNITIES IN TRANSPORTATION
6 OPTIONS AND NOT JUST THINKING ABOUT PARK ALONE.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ AND
9 THEN DAVID C.

10

11 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I WANT TO COMMEND THE AIR DISTRICT AND THE
12 CCAS ON THE TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAM. I THINK
13 IT'S INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT THAT WE LAND THAT. I KNOW IT'S
14 COMPLICATED THERE ARE A LOT OF CCAS IN THE REGION. BUT, YOU
15 KNOW, IT MAKES -- IT MAKES SO MUCH MORE SENSE TO HAVE ONE
16 REGIONAL APPROACH TO TRANSPORTATION, LIKE PUBLIC CHARGING
17 INFRASTRUCTURE FOR INSTANCE THAN, SORT OF, LIKE A PUBLIC
18 CHARGING, LIKE FOR A CITY THAT'S TRYING TO PUT TOGETHER A
19 PUBLIC CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECT IT HAS TO GO TO CCA,
20 PG&E, AND TO THE AIR DISTRICT AND CARB AND GO TO THE CEC AND
21 HAS TO ALSO GO TO MTC, AND WE'RE GOING TO END UP WITH MAKING
22 THE BUREAUCRACY OF FINANCING THESE PROJECTS BECOMING SO MUCH
23 MORE COMPLICATED. AND I THINK THERE ARE REAL REGIONAL
24 CHALLENGES TO THESE PROJECTS AROUND WORKING WITH PG&E, FOR
25 INSTANCE, KIND OF ON ELECTRIC GRID HOOK UPS, AND I KNOW STAFF



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 HAS BEEN DOING WORK ON THAT BUT I WANT TO REEMPHASIZE HOW I
2 THINK THAT IS GOING TO BE TOTALLY ESSENTIAL TO THE SUCCESS OF
3 THIS PROGRAM. AND FOR COMMUNITIES THAT DON'T HAVE CCAS,
4 FINDING WAYS TO ALSO, SORT OF, INCORPORATE PG&E AS A PARTNER
5 IN IT AS WELL BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT TO JUST LIMIT IT TO
6 COMMUNITIES THAT HAVE CCAS.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU. DAVID AND THEN PAT
9 EKLUND.

10

11 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. I'M REALLY EXCITED ABOUT THESE MOBILITY
12 HUBS. I GUESS MY QUESTION IS, RELATIVE TO EXPRESS LANES, MAYBE
13 STAFF CAN ANSWER THIS. BUT, IS THIS APPLICABLE FOR FUNDING FOR
14 THOSE MOBILITY HUBS, LIKE IN EXPRESS LANES. SO, WE HAVE IN OUR
15 COUNTY, 92 -- WE HAVE THE EXCHANGE, AND I'M JUST WONDERING IF
16 THOSE DOLLARS COULD BE PROGRAMMED FOR EXPRESS LANES IN TERMS
17 OF THE MOBILITY HUB.

18

19 **KRUTE SINGA:** WE CAN CONSIDER IT. WHAT WE'RE PLANNING ON RIGHT
20 NOW IS TO KIND OF ALIGN AT THE LOCATIONS, THE ELIGIBLE
21 LOCATIONS, WITH THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES, THE PDAS AND
22 THE EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. THAT'S A TOTAL -- IT'S NOT A
23 SMALL NUMBER. IT'S OVER A THOUSAND LOCATIONS. SO, WE CAN KIND
24 OF LOOK AT THOSE OVERLAYS WITH THE EXPRESS LANES, AS YOU
25 MENTIONED.



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** I THINK THERE IS SOME SYNERGY THERE? RIGHT?
3 ESPECIALLY WITH THE CONNECTIVITY PIECE, ESPECIALLY THE EXPRESS
4 BUSES. I THINK THAT MIGHT BE, IF YOU WILL LOOK AT AND
5 CONSIDER, I THINK IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE SHOULD LOOK INTO. I
6 WANT TO TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE ELECTRIC BIKE SHARE. I
7 READ THE REPORT, AND YOU MIGHT WANT TO CORRECT ME, WE'RE
8 POTENTIALLY LOOKING AT 15 TO \$20 MILLION, WITH A FOCUS ON BAY
9 WHEELS. I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO CONSIDER, AND BAY WHEELS, MY
10 UNDERSTANDING IS, IT'S A CERTAIN GEOGRAPHIC AREA, WHICH THEY
11 COVER. I REALLY LIKE TO SEE IF THERE IS A WAY TO LOOK OUTSIDE
12 OF THOSE GEOGRAPHIC AREAS. BECAUSE I THINK THEIR FOOTPRINT
13 DOESN'T EXTEND INTO OTHER AREAS. BUT TO REALLY MAYBE LOOK AT
14 AREAS, AND SEE, ONE AREA I'M LOOKING AT, IN PARTICULAR -- AND
15 DON'T LAUGH CHAIR SPERING -- BUT I'M REALLY, SORT OF, LOOKING
16 AT THIS CONNECTIVITY IN DALY CITY AREA AT THE BART. AND STAFF
17 CAN LOOK AT THAT, I THINK IT REALLY, SORT OF, FITS. IT'S A
18 REALLY GOOD FIT IN TERMS OF CONNECTIVITY. AND WE KNOW E-BIKES
19 ARE A GOOD TOOL WHEN IT COMES TO LIMITING GREENHOUSE GAS. BUT,
20 I DON'T KNOW IF YOU COULD SPEAK TO THAT, IF WE'RE JUST
21 RESTRICTIVE TO THIS PARTNERSHIP WITH BAY WHEELS OR IF WE COULD
22 LOOK OUTSIDE OF THAT?

23

24 **MATT MALONEY:** UH --

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** MATT, DO YOU WANT TO RESPOND?

2

3 **MATT MALONEY:** I CAN JUMP IN. I AM SURE ALIX HAS INTELLIGENT
4 THINGS TO SAY ON THIS TOPIC, AS WELL, SO I COULD ALSO DEFER TO
5 HER IN A MINUTE. COMMISSIONER, NUMEROUS OPTIONS ARE ON THE
6 TABLE FOR WHAT WE MIGHT DO WITH THAT, WHAT WE'RE CALLING 15-TO
7 20 MILLION AND IT'S VERY DRAFT AT THIS POINT. I THINK THERE
8 CERTAINLY SAY NEED TO AUGMENT MODERNIZE THE EXISTING SYSTEM
9 WITH THE EXISTING BAY WHEELS SYSTEM IT'S ONLY UNTIL A FEW
10 CITIES. SOME OF THOSE SYSTEMS HAVE ELECTRIC BIKES, SOME DON'T.
11 WE'RE FINDING THE ONES THAT HAVE THE E-BIKES DO QUITE WELL. WE
12 HAVE TO REPLACE SOME OF THESE BIKES ARE THAT GETTING A LITTLE
13 BIT OLD AND OF COURSE WE MIGHT WANT TO DO EXPANSION. I DON'T
14 THINK WE'RE LIMITED IN THOSE GEOGRAPHIES THERE IS INTEREST IN
15 EXPANDING THE SCOPE OF WHETHER IT'S THE BAY WHEELS PROGRAM
16 EXPANDING THE GEOGRAPHY OF THAT, THERE IS OTHER LOCALIZED
17 SYSTEMS SPROUTING UP AROUND THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA WE WANT
18 TO LOOK AT THOSE AS WELL AND BE STRATEGIC ABOUT WHETHER IT
19 MAKES SENSE TO SUPPORT THOSE PLACE. THE LOCATION YOU'RE
20 TALKING ABOUT WITH DALY CITY AND OBVIOUSLY THE CONNECTIONS TO
21 THE EXISTING SYSTEM UP IN SF TO ME MAKES A LOT OF STRATEGIC
22 SENSE AND WE CAN LOOK AT OPPORTUNITIES LIKE THAT FOR SURE.

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MATT. THANK YOU.

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** YEAH. THAT WAS A GOOD QUESTION,
2 DAVID. I'LL MOVE ON TO PAT EKLUND. PAT?

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR SPERING. FIRST OF ALL,
5 A QUESTION ON THE TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION. YOU
6 MENTIONED THAT STAFF INVITED LOCAL AGENCIES TO SUBMIT LETTERS
7 OF INTERESTED, IN JUNE OF 2023, WAS IT ALSO SENT TO CITIES?
8 BECAUSE IT SAID THERE IS AT LEAST ONE FROM EVERY COUNTY. BUT I
9 DON'T REMEMBER EVER BEING NOTICED BY OUR STAFF IN NOVATO,
10 WHETHER OR NOT WE RECEIVED A REQUEST FROM MTC OR LETTER OF
11 INTEREST.

12

13 **JAMES CHOE:** YEAH. THIS WAS OPENED EARLIER THIS SUMMER. WE
14 ANNOUNCED THIS AND TRIED TO GET THIS OUT TO ALL JURISDICTIONS
15 WHICH INCLUDES PLANNING STAFF AND PUBLIC WORKS STAFF ALONG
16 WITH COUNTY AGENCIES TOO, AND TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND SO THIS
17 OPPORTUNITY WAS OPEN TO ALL LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AND PUBLIC
18 AGENCIES. BUT, YOU KNOW, I KNOW THAT THERE IS SOMETIMES STAFF
19 CAPACITY ISSUES IN RETURNING SOME OF THESE RESPONSES. AND WE
20 USE THIS TO JUST MAINLY GET, ASSESS THE NEEDS ACROSS THE
21 REGION. IT'S REALLY TO GET A SAMPLE OF INTEREST ACROSS ALL THE
22 COUNTIES. AND WE DID GET RESPONSES FROM AGENCIES OR PUBLIC
23 LOCAL GOVERNMENTS ACROSS THE REGION. BUT THIS ISN'T
24 NECESSARILY HOW -- YOU KNOW, WE'RE NOT USING THESE NECESSARILY



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 TO PROVIDE GRANTS FOR OUR PROJECTS AT THIS TIME, IT WAS MOSTLY
2 AS A NEEDS ASSESSMENT STAGE.

3

4 **PAT ECKLUND:** THAT'S GREAT. I DO HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS.
5 FIRST OF ALL, IN THE LAST SET -- AND STAFF IS CURRENTLY
6 SEEKING INPUT FROM TRANSIT AGENCIES, COUNTIES TRANSPORTATION
7 AGENCIES, COMMUNITY CHOICE AGGREGATORS AND THE BAY AREA AIR
8 QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT -- I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO ADD
9 CITIES IN THERE, PLEASE. BECAUSE NOT ALL CITIES HAVE A TRANSIT
10 AGENCY. SO, I REALLY THINK THAT IT IS IMPORTANT FOR US TO GET
11 FEEDBACK FROM CITIES THAT DO NOT HAVE TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND
12 SOMETIMES THE COMMENTS FROM THE TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES IN
13 EACH OF THE COUNTY ARE NOT SUBMITTED TO THE CITY COUNCILS AND
14 ALL THE CITY COUNCIL MEMBERS IN THAT PARTICULAR COUNTY. SO I
15 WOULD REQUEST THAT WE ADD CITIES TO THAT LIST. I THINK THE \$8
16 MILLION THAT IS BEING PROPOSED FOR CHANGING THE FLEETS, AND
17 THAT'S JUST -- I THINK, HIGHLIGHTING JUST THE CHARGING
18 STATIONS. BUT I -- AND I COULD BE WRONG ON THAT, BUT, I REALLY
19 WANTED TO ENCOURAGE US TO EXPAND THAT TO, ALSO, INCLUDE A
20 PURCHASING VEHICLES, ESPECIALLY VEHICLES THAT GOING TO BE MORE
21 CHALLENGING THAT HAVE DIESEL, FROM AN EXAMPLE, BECAUSE THAT
22 REALLY THE DIRTIEST FUEL THAT WE HAVE. AND CITIES ARE
23 STRUGGLING TO FIND ALTERNATIVE VEHICLES FOR BIGGER -- BIGGER
24 VEHICLES THAN JUST CARS. [LAUGHTER] ANOTHER, POLICE HAVE ALSO
25 GOTTEN SOME HYBRIDS. BUT I REALLY THINK THAT IN ORDER FOR



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 CITIES TO REALLY BE ABLE TO JOIN -- AND I DON'T KNOW IF
2 COUNTIES ARE ALSO EXPERIENCING THIS, BUT WE JUST DON'T HAVE
3 ENOUGH MONEY. CHARGING STATIONS, REALLY -- THERE IS A LOT OF
4 GRANTS AVAILABLE FOR THOSE, BUT NOT FOR PURCHASING VEHICLES.
5 THE OTHER THING I WANTED TO SAY IS THAT, ON THIS
6 TRANSPORTATION, ELECTRIFICATION -- HOWEVER YOU SAY IT -- I
7 REALLY HOPE THAT IT'S NOT JUST FOCUSED ON TRANSPORTATION. I
8 WOULD LIKE TO SUGGEST THAT WE EXPAND IT, ALSO, TO HOUSING.
9 AND, ESPECIALLY FOR INFRASTRUCTURE FOR HOUSING TO HAVE SOLAR.
10 I -- ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I DREAM ABOUT IS, YOU KNOW, LET'S
11 HAVE SOLAR ON EVERY HOUSE IN OUR CITY. I WOULD LOVE TO HAVE
12 THAT AS A GOAL. IT WOULD BE GREAT TO HAVE THAT GOAL FOR THE
13 BAY AREA. YOU KNOW? LET'S PUT SOLAR ON EVERY HOUSE AND
14 COMMERCIAL BUILDING IN OUR BAY AREA. BECAUSE I THINK THAT
15 WOULD REALLY HELP. IF WE COULD HELP SUPPORT THE COST OF DOING
16 THAT, WHETHER IT'S A LOW INTEREST LOAN, OR OTHER THINGS LIKE
17 THAT. AND I THINK 65 MILLION COULD GO A LONG WAYS, NOT ONLY
18 TOWARDS TRANSPORTATION, BUT ALSO FOCUSING ON HOUSING. AND, YOU
19 KNOW, I ALSO FEEL, TOO, THAT BIKES AND PEDESTRIAN EXPENSES --
20 BECAUSE I HAVE NEVER SEEN, IN MY LIFETIME, ANYWAY, THE AMOUNT
21 OF PEOPLE THAT ARE BIKING AND WALKING HAVE INCREASED
22 DRAMATICALLY BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC. AND I THINK THAT -- AND
23 THERE IS -- YOU KNOW, THERE IS A RECENT DEATH, I THINK, IN
24 SOUTH BAY, A PEDESTRIAN WAS KILLED -- A VERY WELL-KNOWN WOMAN.
25 YOU KNOW, I THINK WE NEED MORE FUNDING IN ORDER TO MAKE,



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 ESPECIALLY THE PEDESTRIAN ROUTES A LOT MORE SAFE. AND WE DON'T
2 HAVE THE MONEY. CITIES DON'T HAVE IT. SO, TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE
3 TO WALK AND BIKE MORE, WE REALLY NEED SOME MONEY TO HELP MAKE
4 THAT MORE SAFE. SO, ANYWAY, THOSE ARE MY COMMENTS. AND I HOPE
5 -- IF YOU HAVE ANY FOLLOW-UP, PLEASE FEEL FREE TO GIVE ME A
6 CALL.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU, PAT. SAM, DO YOU HAVE
9 YOUR HAND UP? OKAY. THERE IS A HAND RIGHT THERE ON THE SCREEN
10 FOR YOU. WASN'T SURE WHERE THAT CAME FROM. ANY OTHER
11 COMMISSIONERS OR BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS? OKAY. MARTHA DO WE
12 HAVE ANY COMMENTS OR WRITTEN COMMENTS?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
15 ITEM. I SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED,
16 BUT I BELIEVE IT'S FOR THE PREVIOUS ITEM, AND CHRIS, YOU'RE
17 GOING TO GO UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT. OR IS YOUR COMMENT
18 FOR THIS ITEM?

19

20 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** MY COMMENT IS ON THIS ONE. AND I WANT TO
21 AGREE WITH WHAT PEOPLE ARE ELEVATING HERE AND ALSO RECOGNIZE
22 AND ELEVATE THE NEED FOR DEDICATED DROP OFF POINTS FOR FOLKS
23 WITH DISABILITIES THAT TAKE PARATRANSIT. I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO
24 SUGGEST THAT WHEN YOU LOOK AT A NEW BIKE FLEET THAT YOU
25 CONSIDER TRIKES, AS WELL. BECAUSE WE ALL KNOW THAT SOME FOLKS



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 WHO MAY BE ELDERS, OR FOLKS WITH DISABILITIES, MAY OR MAY NOT
2 HAVE THE BEST BALANCE IN THE WORLD. BUT THEY MAY NEED TO GO
3 FROM POINT A TO POINT B IN SOME WAY AND CERTAINLY HAVING A
4 TRIKE TO GET THERE WOULD BE GREAT. CERTAINLY, LOOKING AT
5 TRANSPORTATION HUBS, FIRST AND LAST MILE IS CRITICAL. BUT
6 FIRST WE HAVE TO BE FULLY COGNIZANT OF HOW THIS PROGRESS WORKS
7 OR DIDN'T WORK FOR FOLKS WHO ARE TRANSIT DEPENDENT WHO USE
8 WHEELCHAIRS WALKERS CRUTCHES ET CETERA, AND MAKING THAT A VERY
9 WORKABLE FORMATION FOR ANYONE. AND I DO LIKE THE IDEA OF
10 HAVING SOLAR PANELS ON ALL BUILDINGS, NOT JUST HOUSING TO
11 REDUCE NEED -- I THINK THAT WOULD BE GREAT. ALSO THANK YOU ALL
12 FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP ROLE FOR THE REGIONAL LETTER FOR THE
13 REGIONAL FUNDING --

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO MORE HANDS FOR THIS ITEM.

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** THANK YOU JAMES AND KRUTE. ON THE
20 MOBILITY HUBS, ARE WE LOOKING AT THE ARCHITECTURE? LOOKING AT
21 PUBLIC ART? IF YOU ARE GOING HAVE A FOOD TRUCK THERE,
22 ELECTRICAL HOOK UPS AND THEY'RE NOT RUNNING GENERATORS ARE WE
23 LOOKING AT IT IN THAT LEVEL OF DETAIL?

24



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **KRUTE SINGA:** YES. I THINK WE'RE TRYING TO LOOK AT IT AS A
2 FULLY SELF-SUSTAINING INCLUSIVE HUB IN THAT WAY. AGAIN IT WILL
3 BE BASED ON COMMUNITY INPUT, BUT WE'RE TRYING TO PUSH THE
4 SPONSORS INTO KIND OF THINKING OF THE HUB HOLISTICALLY, AND
5 ALSO INTO LONG-TERM FRACTIONS AND MAINTENANCE.

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT
8 THEY'RE PLEASING, WELCOMING, A PLACE THAT PEOPLE ARE GOING TO
9 FEEL COMFORTABLE AND SAFE AND WE HAVE SOME AMENITIES BUILT IN.
10 IT LOOKS LIKE YOU'RE GOING IN THAT DIRECTION I HOPE WE'RE
11 LOOKING AT THINGS LIKE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] [AUDIO DIFFICULTIES]
12 ON THE -- REAL QUICK, ON THE PARKING AND ON THE CAPITAL SIDE,
13 IS THERE A LOCAL COMMITMENT REQUIREMENT IN THAT FUNDING?

14

15 **JAMES CHOE:** YEAH. IT WILL BE FEDERAL FUNDING. SO THERE IS A
16 HEALTHY MINIMUM MATCH REQUIREMENT.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY GOOD. ALL RIGHT.

19

20 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** CHAIR SPERING IF I COULD REALLY QUICKLY,
21 BECAUSE YOU BROUGHT UP THE FUNDING. AN IMPORTANT POINT OF
22 CLARIFICATION WITH WHETHER THIS FUNDING COULD BE USED FOR
23 HOUSING RELATED INVESTMENTS, IT CANNOT. IT'S TRANSPORTATION
24 SPECIFIC. WHICH DOESN'T MEAN, APROPOS OF THE ITEM WE HAD
25 BEFORE, THAT IN THE LARGER IMPLEMENTATION PLAN OF PLANNED BAY



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 AREA 2050, WE'RE NOT LOOKING AT, YOU KNOW, CLEAN ENERGY
2 RELATED ELEMENTS IN OUR PLAN. BUT THIS SPECIFIC SET OF
3 RECOMMENDATIONS IS LIMITED BY FUNDING.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. AND JAMES, THE LAST
6 QUESTION IS THAT SPLIT, THE 13 AND 2 MILLION FOR THE PLANNING
7 IS THAT AT OUR DISCRETION? OR HOW IS THAT NUMBER DETERMINED?

8

9 **JAMES CHOE:** THAT WAS JUST BASED ON WHAT WE -- THE INITIAL
10 CALL, WHAT WE HEARD AND RELATIVE, SORT OF, THINKING ABOUT IF
11 WE EXPAND WHAT THE NEEDS MIGHT BE BASED ON WHAT WE HEARD FROM,
12 SORT OF, THE SAMPLE OF FOLKS WHO RESPONDED THAT NEEDED
13 PLANNING ASSISTANCE. BUT THERE IS FLEXIBILITY IN THAT. WE'RE
14 JUST TRYING GET TO A ROUGH SENSE OF WHERE WE ARE WHERE THE
15 INVESTMENT NEEDS GO BETWEEN CAPITAL AND PLANNING. BUT WE'LL
16 SEE BASED ON THE REQUESTED NEEDS.

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY SO WE'RE FLEXIBLE ON THAT.
19 BECAUSE I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE MORE MONEY NEEDED ON THE
20 PLANNING SIDE. I THINK THAT'S AN AREA WHERE A LOT OF
21 JURISDICTIONS STRUGGLING WITH IS THE PLANNING PIECE. SO, THANK
22 YOU. SO, THAT -- THERESE, YOU STILL HAVE YOUR HAND UP. ARE YOU
23 OKAY? [LAUGHTER] OKAY. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. SO, PUBLIC
24 COMMENTS? MARTHA, DO WE HAVE ANY?

25



DECEMBER 9, 2022

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON
2 THIS ITEM. BUT I BELIEVE CHRIS FITZGERALD WANTED TO SPEAK.
3 BUT, I DON'T SEE HER ANYMORE ON THE ATTENDEES LIST.

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING, MTC CHAIR:** OKAY. SO, THAT -- WE'LL MOVE ON
6 TO ADJOURNMENT. AND OUR NEXT MEETING WILL BE FRIDAY, JANUARY
7 13TH AT 9:40 AND ANY CHANGES WILL BE NOTICED. AND HOPEFULLY --
8 I DON'T SEE ANY OTHER HANDS. SO, WE'LL MOVE ON TO OUR NEXT
9 MEETING. THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37



Broadcasting Government