

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MAY 26, 2023

1 **POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE**

2 **FRIDAY, MAY 26TH, 2023, 9:00 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GOOD MORNING. AND WELCOME TO THE POLICY
6 ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. MAY I HAVE
7 ROLL CALL, PLEASE.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** GOOD MORNING. YES. ACTING CHAIR KINMAN?

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CAMPOS?

14

15 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ESUF IS EXCUSED. MEMBER
18 FITZGERALD?

19

20 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ORANTES?

23

24 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** HERE.

25



MAY 26, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER PIMPLE IS ON HIS WAY. MR. SCOTT?
2 HE'S HERE. HAVING A PROBLEM UNMUTING. STILL MUTED, BUT I WILL
3 COUNT YOU. MEMBER WILSON?

4

5 **WALTER WILSON:** PRESENT.

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WONG IS EXCUSED. WE HAVE QUORUM.

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** DO WE HAVE REMOTE PARTICIPANTS?

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES WE HAVE TWO REMOTE PARTICIPANTS,
12 MEMBER FITZGERALD AND MEMBER SCOTT.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. THIS IS,
15 AGAIN, RANDI KINMAN, I CHAIR THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND
16 I WILL BE ACTING CHAIR FOR THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE.
17 THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF
18 THE PUBLIC MAY PARTICIPATE BY ZOOM IF YOU WISH TO SPEAK, YOU
19 SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE, AND I
20 WILL CALL UPON YOU AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE
21 ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR
22 PHONE NUMBER. WE HAVE CALLED ROLL. WE WILL GO INTO AGENDA ITEM
23 NUMBER TWO. A FEW ANNOUNCEMENTS BEFORE WE BEGIN TODAY. THE
24 RETURN TO IN-PERSON AND WORK COMMITMENTS HAS IMPACTED COUNCIL
25 MEMBERS DIFFERENTLY AND SOME FOLKS, INCLUDING MYSELF, HAVE HAD



MAY 26, 2023

1 TO MAKE CHANGES. LAST MONTH'S MEETING WAS CANCELED DUE TO A
2 LACK OF QUORUM. YOUR PRESENCE OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE IS VALUABLE.
3 SO, IT'S IMPERATIVE THAT ALL SUBCOMMITTEES ATTEND ALL
4 MEETINGS. HERE ARE SOME CHANGES THAT HAVE TAKEN PLACE.
5 SUBCOMMITTEE DWAYNE HANKERSON HAS RESIGNED EFFECTIVE FEBRUARY
6 16TH, 2023. SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBER AND VICE CHAIR MARKHAM STEPPED
7 DOWN AS EQUITY AND ACCESS VICE CHAIR AND MEMBER EFFECTIVE MAY
8 1ST. SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBER FRANK WELTE IS STEPPING DOWN
9 EFFECTIVE MAY 1ST, 2023. COUNCIL MEMBER CAMPOS WAS REMOVED
10 FROM AN ALTERNATE TO A STANDING POSITION AND FORMER CHAIR ILAF
11 ESUF STEPPED DOWN AS SECOND EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE
12 CHAIR EFFECTIVE MAY 1ST, 2023. AND I HAVE APPOINTED MYSELF AS
13 A MEMBER OF THIS BODY, ALSO. WITH THAT, IS THERE ANY COMMENTS
14 ON AGENDA ITEM TWO OR ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
17 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
18 ON THIS ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM NUMBER THREE,
21 NOMINATIONS FOR THE 2022, 2023 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY
22 AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. NOMINATIONS FOR
23 THE 2022, 2023 CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR OF THE POLICY ADVISORY
24 COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE ARE OFFICIALLY OPEN.
25 THE NOMINATION PERIOD WILL REMAIN OPEN UNTIL THE ELECTION



MAY 26, 2023

1 SCHEDULED FOR THE JUNE 23RD, 2023 MEETING. THIS IS AN
2 INFORMATION ITEM. STAFF LIAISON KY-NAM MILLER WILL PROVIDE
3 MORE INFORMATION AND GUIDANCE ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **KY-NAM MILLER:** GOOD MORNING MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE. SO,
6 YOU ALL SHOULD BE FAMILIAR WITH THE VOTING PROCESS, BUT JUST
7 TO RECAP, TODAY STARTS OFF, ESSENTIALLY A ONE MONTH OPENING
8 PERIOD FOR EITHER SELF-NOMINATION OR NOMINATING YOUR PEERS TO
9 SERVE IN LEADERSHIP ON THIS BODY. I THINK THE ONLY THING THAT
10 MIGHT BE A LITTLE DIFFERENT IS GIVEN THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE
11 STEPPING OFF AND THEN TO BE APPOINTED BEFORE THE NEXT MEETING,
12 THE POOL OF CANDIDATES COULD BE KNOW OF DIFFERENT THAN THE
13 PEOPLE WHO ARE CURRENTLY IN THIS BODY DEPENDING ON HOW CHAIR
14 KINMAN MAKES APPOINTMENTS. THAT SAID, AT THIS MOMENT, YOU ARE
15 FREE TO MAKE A NOMINATION. YOU CAN E-MAIL MARTHA OR MYSELF IF
16 YOU HAVE ANY OTHER NOMINATION YOU WANT TO MAKE BEFORE THE NEXT
17 MEETING, AND EVEN AT THE NEXT MEETING YOU CAN MAKE A
18 NOMINATION. AND THOSE NOMINEES WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE A
19 BRIEF STATEMENT AND THEN WE'LL VOTE WITH THAT CONVENTION OF,
20 YOU KNOW, IF THERE IS MORE THAN TWO MEMBERS, THE THIRD WITH
21 THE LEAST NUMBER OF VOTE DROPS OFF UNTIL WE GET A MAJORITY
22 PLUS ONE VOTING FOR EACH OF THE RESPECTIVE LEADERSHIP
23 POSITIONS OF CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR. HOPEFULLY THAT'S CLEAR. IF
24 YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS HAPPY TO ANSWER THEM. BUT, YES, THANK
25 YOU FOR THOSE WHO ARE GOING TO STEP UP.



MAY 26, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** AND WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE WE
3 TAKE COMMENT FROM THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS. IF ANYONE FROM THE
4 PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, USE THE RAISED HAND
5 FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
6 SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK WILL CALL
7 UPON YOU TO SPEAK. ARE THERE ANY ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC
8 COMMENT? I'M SORRY, WALLY. I DIDN'T REALIZE YOU WERE -- OKAY.

9

10 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES. WE HAVE THREE PUBLIC SPEAKERS.

11

12 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. IF YOU WOULD CALL UPON THEM, IN
13 ORDER? TWO MINUTES.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. ONE SECOND. FIRST SPEAKER
16 WILL BE JOHNNY PARKER. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS JOHNNY PARKER. I AM A MEMBER OF
19 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. I DON'T KNOW IF THIS IS THE
20 CORRECT PLACE TO DO THIS, BUT I JUST WANTED TO VOICE MY
21 INTEREST IN BEING A MEMBER OF THIS SUBCOMMITTEE. THANK YOU
22 VERY MUCH.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN.
25 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.



MAY 26, 2023

1

2 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS. ADINA LEVIN,
3 MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND JUST OBSERVING THE
4 SHEER AMOUNT OF TURNOVER, SHOULD OF WHICH IS PROBABLY RELATED
5 TO THE BROWN ACT CHANGES AND REVERSION TO THE IN-PERSON
6 MEETINGS WITHOUT THE EXEMPTIONS FOR THE PANDEMIC THAT
7 INCREASED PARTICIPATION AMONGST PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AND
8 PEOPLE WITH OTHER RESPONSIBILITIES. I WANT TO THANK MTC FOR
9 WORKING ON BROWN ACT REFORM AND ENCOURAGE CONTINUED WORK ON
10 THAT IN ORDER TO BE ABLE TO INCREASE THE POTENTIAL
11 PARTICIPATION OF COMMUNITY MEMBERS IN POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL,
12 ESPECIALLY AMONGST PEOPLE THAT WOULD BE ON THE EQUITY
13 SUBCOMMITTEE. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS WARREN C. YOU
16 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** AUDIO NOW UNMUTED.

19

20 **LAUREN FISHMAN:** HELLO EVERYONE, THIS IS LAUREN FISHMAN, I WANT
21 TO REFLECT ON A THEME AS THIS BALANCE MOVES FORWARD, THIS
22 COMMITTEE REFLECTS TWO IMPORTANT ARENAS, OF COURSE ONE IS
23 EQUITY, AND THE IMPORTANCE OF EQUITY AND THE OTHER IS THE
24 IMPORTANCE OF REFLECTING SENIOR AND DISABILITY ISSUES AND
25 ACCESS. I WOULD JUST URGE THE MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE THAT



MAY 26, 2023

1 END UP VOTING ON THIS PROCESS TO THINK ABOUT THAT BALANCE AND
2 THE END RESULT OF WHAT WOULD BE THE BALANCED ONE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC
5 COMMENTS.

6

7 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO ANYBODY
8 ON THE COMMITTEE WHO IS ATTENDING FOR COMMENTS. DOES ANYBODY
9 WANT TO EITHER NOMINATE SOMEBODY OR NOMINATE YOURSELF? AND
10 KEEPING IN MIND WE HAVE UNTIL NEXT MONTH, ALSO.

11

12 **WALTER WILSON:** QUESTION. WHAT ARE THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THOSE
13 WHO ARE BEING CONSIDERED FOR THOSE POSITIONS?

14

15 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THE ABILITY TO ATTEND THE MEETING. WE
16 ALSO HAVE A --

17

18 **WALTER WILSON:** SORRY. CAN YOU BE MORE SPECIFIC. THE ABILITY TO
19 ATTEND, HOW MANY MEETINGS HOW MANY TIMES A MONTH SO ON.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** ABILITY TO ATTEND THE EQUITY AND ACCESS
22 SUBCOMMITTEE MEETINGS TAKING FOR GRANTED THAT YOU'RE ALSO
23 ATTENDING THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETINGS. WE WILL BEGIN
24 MEETING, RIGHT NOW THE MEETINGS ARE WHATEVER DAY THIS IS



MAY 26, 2023

1 FRIDAY SO WE HAVE ONE MORE MOTHER OF US BEING MEETING AT 9:00
2 A.M. ON FRIDAY, STARTING -- IS IT STARTING IN JULY, KY-NAM?

3

4 **KY-NAM MILLER:** YES.

5

6 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** SO, STARTING IN JULY, WE'LL BE MEETING
7 EVERY OTHER MONTH AT 10:00 A.M., BECAUSE WE'RE SWITCHING ALL
8 THE MEETINGS TO FRIDAYS AND THEN THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
9 MEETING FOLLOWS RIGHT AFTER THAT. SO WE'RE BUNDLING THE
10 MEETINGS SO YOU DON'T HAVE TO MAKE TWO TRIPS HERE. SO YOU
11 WOULD HAVE TO BE HERE AT 10:00 A.M. EVERY OTHER FRIDAY?

12

13 **WALTER WILSON:** EVERY OTHER FRIDAY?

14

15 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** NO. EVERY OTHER MONTH, ON THE FRIDAY.
16 YES.

17

18 **WALTER WILSON:** WHICH FRIDAY?

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** IT'S THE FOURTH FRIDAY.

21

22 **WALTER WILSON:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU FOR ASKING THAT. BECAUSE
25 IT'S BEEN KIND OF UP IN THE AIR AND BEING -- THE POT KEEPS



MAY 26, 2023

1 GETTING STIRRED AROUND. ALSO, WE HAVE A MONTH HE CALL-IN
2 MEETING WITH STAFF TO GO OVER AGENDAS AND WHAT NEEDS TO BE
3 ADDRESSED IN THE UPCOMING MONTHS, AND THAT'S A 30, 45 MINUTE
4 MEETING ON WHICH DAY KY-NAM?

5

6 **KY-NAM MILLER:** WE TYPICALLY DO IT THE WEEK THE WEDNESDAY AFTER
7 THE COUNCIL MEETING WE MIGHT ADJUST IT TO KEEP THAT CADENCE.

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** CORRECT. THAT'S RIGHT BECAUSE THE
10 COUNSELOR IS NOW MOVING TO WEDNESDAYS.

11

12 **KY-NAM MILLER:** SAME AS THE FOURTH FRIDAY, RIGHT?

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** RIGHT. BUT THE COMMISSION IS MOVING TO
15 WEDNESDAYS. SO, ON A DIFFERENT DAY, OR?

16

17 **KY-NAM MILLER:** WE DO THAT PLANNING MEETING IN COORDINATION
18 WITH THE COUNCIL, RATHER THAN -- JUST BECAUSE OF THE LEAD TIME
19 FOR GETTING MATERIALS READY FOR THE NEXT MEETING.

20

21 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

22

23 **WALTER WILSON:** SO THAT -- I'M SORRY. SO NOW I'M REALLY
24 CONFUSED BETWEEN THE TWO OF YOU. SO LET'S CLARIFY.

25



MAY 26, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** WE HAVE THE IN-PERSON MEETINGS, THE
2 POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETS ON THE FOURTH FRIDAY OF EVERY
3 MONTH. EVERY OTHER MONTH WILL BE EITHER EQUITY AND ACCESS OR
4 THE TAPS SUBCOMMITTEE. SO, EVERY OTHER MONTH YOU HAVE TWO
5 MEETINGS TO ATTEND ON THE FOURTH FRIDAY. THE PHONE CHECK-IN,
6 IS A DIFFERENT MEETING THAT THE CHAIR AND THE VICE CHAIR OF
7 THE SUBCOMMITTEES AND OF THE COUNCIL ATTEND SO THAT WE CAN
8 REVIEW WHAT'S COMING UP ON THE AGENDA.

9

10 **WALTER WILSON:** RIGHT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** AND THAT ONE IS NOT IN-PERSON. OKAY. ANY
13 OF OUR REMOTE PEOPLE?

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** YES. THERE IS MEMBER FITZGERALD WITH A
16 HAND RAISED.

17

18 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** GO AHEAD CHRISTINE.

19

20 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** REAL QUICK QUESTION. WANTED TO KNOW IF
21 THE POSITIONS REQUIRE THE PERSON TO BE IN-PERSON RATHER THAN
22 REMOTE.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** AS LONG AS YOU ARE FOLLOWING THE RULES OF
25 THE BROWN ACT, THAT'S CONSIDERED, THEN YOU'RE GOOD. JUST AS



MAY 26, 2023

1 TODAY YOU'RE ATTENDING REMOTELY, VIA THE BROWN ACT RULES, THEN
2 YOU'RE GOOD.

3

4 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** GOT IT. I JUST WANTED TO CONFIRM.

5

6 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. ANYTHING ELSE? NO? WITH
7 THAT, THEN WE WILL GO ON TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FOUR, APPROVAL
8 OF THE JANUARY 27TH, 2023 AND APRIL 28TH, 2023 MEETING
9 MINUTES. DO I HAVE A MOTION TO APPROVE EITHER/OR BOTH?

10

11 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** MOTION. CAMPOS.

12

13 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** SECOND.

14

15 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** SO I HAVE CAMPOS AND FITZGERALD AND THAT
16 WAS FOR BOTH MINUTES?

17

18 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YOU AGREE CHRISTINE?

21

22 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YES.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE PUBLIC COMMENTS ON
25 THIS ITEM?



MAY 26, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO. NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED IN
3 WRITING AND NOBODY WITH HANDS RAISED.

4

5 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY COMMENT FROM
6 MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE? WITH THAT I'LL CALL FOR A ROLL
7 CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. ACTING CHAIR KINMAN?

10

11 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER CAMPOS?

14

15 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ESUF IS EXCUSED MEMBER
18 FITZGERALD?

19

20 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER ORANTES?

23

24 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** ABSTAIN.

25



MAY 26, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER PIMPLE?

2

3 **VINAY PIMPLE:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER SCOTT?

6

7 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER WILSON?

10

11 **WALTER WILSON:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER WONG IS EXCUSED. THE MOTION
14 PASSED.

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT WE WILL GO TO ITEM
17 NUMBER 5, 1 BAY AREA OBAG THREE UPDATES WITH MALLORY AND
18 THOMAS. AND THOMAS, I HAVEN'T MET YOU. I DON'T BELIEVE I HAVE.
19 BUT I HAVEN'T MET A LOT OF PEOPLE IN-PERSON LATELY. [LAUGHTER]
20 SO, TAKE IT AWAY.

21

22 **MALLORY ATKINSON:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS MALLORY ATKINSON
23 I'LL DO AN INTRODUCTION BEFORE HANDING IT OVER TO THOMAS ARNDT
24 TO GIVE THE PRESENTATION. COULD WE PULL UP THE SLIDE FOR THE
25 PRESENTATION, PLEASE? THANK YOU. WE ARE PRESENTING TODAY AN



MAY 26, 2023

1 INFORMATIONAL ITEM TO THIS GROUP ON THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT
2 PROGRAM PARTICULARLY WITH AN EQUITY LENS OF HOW EQUITY HAS
3 BEEN WOVEN IN THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS. STAFF LAST PRESENTED TO
4 THE FULL POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL LAST YEAR IN MARCH AT THE
5 START OF OUR CALL FOR PROJECTS PROCESS AT THE CALL AND LOCAL
6 PROGRAM WE WERE ASKED TO COME BACK LATER WITH MORE INFORMATION
7 ABOUT THE CALL FOR PROJECTS THE RESULTS OF HOW WE INCLUDE
8 EQUITY IN CONSIDERATION IN THE PROCESS AND WITH THAT I'LL TURN
9 IT OVER TO THOMAS TO START WITH A QUICK PREVIEW.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** THANKS VALERIE. HI CHAIR KINMAN. NICE TO MEET YOU
12 ALL. MY NAME IS THOMAS ARNDT. PLEASE ADVANCE TO THE NEXT
13 SLIDE. THE PURPOSE OF THE OBAG PROGRAM IS TO USE OUR FEDERAL
14 TRANSPORTATION FUNDS TO IMPLEMENT MTC'S LONG RANGE PLAN OR
15 PLANNED BAY AREA. THE LATEST GRANT CYCLE OBAG ADOPTED BY THE
16 COMMISSION IN JANUARY LAST YEAR AND COMMITS 768 MILLION IN
17 FEDERAL HIGHWAY FORMULA FUNDS OVER THE NEXT FOUR YEARS SPLIT
18 INTO TWO SUBCOMPONENTS, REGIONAL PROGRAM AND COUNTY AND LOCAL
19 PROGRAM. THE REGIONAL PROGRAM FUNDS MTC PROJECTS AND
20 INITIATIVES BEST SUITED FOR REGIONAL IMPLEMENTATION AND THE
21 COUNTIES LOCAL PROGRAM FUNDS LOCAL PRIORITY PROJECTS SUPPORT
22 REGIONAL OBJECTIVES AND THE FOCUS OF THIS PRESENTATION THE
23 COUNTY PROGRAM CONSISTED OF A TWO STEP PROCESS COUNTY
24 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES OR CTAS SOLICITED APPLICATIONS FOR
25 PROJECTS AND NOMINATED A PROJECT TO MTC AND SECOND MTC



MAY 26, 2023

1 EVALUATED THE NOMINATIONS AND SELECTED THE HIGHEST PERFORMING
2 PROJECTS FOR FUNDING I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE PROCESS
3 PRIORITIZED SPONSORS AND COUNTIES PRODUCING OR PLANNING FOR
4 HOUSING ESPECIALLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING BY ALLOWING THEIR CTAS
5 TO NOMINATE AND SUBMIT LARGER NOMINATION AMOUNTS. NEXT SLIDE.
6 FIRST STEP CTA EVALUATION THE OBAG PROGRAM GUIDELINES REQUIRED
7 COMPREHENSIVE EQUITABLE PUBLIC OUTREACH AND PROJECT EVALUATION
8 PROCESSES. MTC STAFF MET WITH EACH CTA TO ENSURE CALL FOR
9 PROJECT PLANS ADHERE TO REQUIREMENTS GUIDELINES INCLUDED A
10 REQUIREMENT THAT CTAS REACH OUT TO SPONSORS, STAKE HOLDERS AND
11 THE GENERAL PUBLIC DURING CALL FOR PROJECTS AND ENSURE
12 OPPORTUNITIES FOR INPUT WERE ACCESSIBLE TO ALL. MTC ALSO
13 ENCOURAGED CTAS TO LEVERAGE OTHER RECENT APPLICABLE PUBLIC
14 OUTREACH TO CONSIDER TRANSPORTATION RELATED CONCERNS AND
15 PRIORITIES THAT HAD ALREADY BEEN EXPRESSED BY THEIR
16 COMMUNITIES. PUBLIC OUTREACH ALSO NEEDED TO COMPLY WITH MTC'S
17 UPDATED COMPLETE STREETS POLICY WHICH ENSURES THAT THE NEEDS
18 OF ALL ROADWAY USERS ARE CONSIDERED DURING PROJECT
19 DEVELOPMENT, AND THIS MEANT THAT SPONSORS NEEDED TO TAKE THE
20 PROJECTS TO A LOCAL BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN ADVISORY COMMITTEE
21 FOR REVIEW AND FEEDBACK. EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS WERE ALSO
22 INCORPORATED INTO THE CTA EVALUATION CRITERIA. FOR EXAMPLE,
23 THE EVALUATION CRITERIA PRIORITIZED PROJECTS THAT BENEFITTED
24 UNDERSERVED COMMUNITIES SUCH AS EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES.
25 WHEN CONSIDERING PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR A PROJECT THE CRITERIA



MAY 26, 2023

1 GAVE ADDITIONAL WEIGHT TO INPUT FROM COMMUNITIES
2 DISPROPORTIONATELY AFFECTED BY PAST DISCRIMINATORY PRACTICES.
3 IN ADDITION THE CRITERIA PRIORITIZED PROJECTS THAT ALIGN WITH
4 MTC'S VISION ZERO POLICY AND/OR THE EQUITY PLATFORM AND WHICH
5 WERE LOCATED IN JURISDICTIONS WITH PRO HOUSING POLICIES. CTAS
6 ALSO CONSIDERED ELIGIBILITY, DELIVERABILITY AND RISK IN THE
7 PROJECT SCORES AND FINALLY CTAS CHOSE TO APPLY FOR FURTHER
8 CRITERIA BEYOND THESE MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS. NEXT SLIDE,
9 PLEASE. MOVING TO THE NEXT STEP, MTC EVALUATION. AFTER CTAS
10 PRIORITIZED PROJECTS WITHIN THEIR COUNTIES THEY NOMINATED THE
11 HIGHEST PERFORMING PROJECTS TO MTC. STAFF EVALUATED THESE
12 PROJECT NOMINATIONS FOR ALIGNMENT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA
13 STRATEGIES, EFFECTIVENESS AND REACHING REGIONAL OBJECTIVES,
14 CONTRIBUTION TO REGIONAL NETWORKS OR FACILITIES, PROJECT RISK
15 AND PRIOR SPONSOR DELIVERY AND COST EFFECTIVENESS OF AIR
16 QUALITY IMPROVEMENTS. TO DEMONSTRATE HOW EQUITY CONSIDERATIONS
17 WERE INCORPORATED IN OUR PROJECT EVALUATION WE WANTED TO SHARE
18 A SAMPLE PROJECT FROM RICHMOND, THE BAYVIEW BART BIKE PED
19 PROJECT. THIS PROJECT WOULD CREATE A BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN
20 CONNECTION IN SOUTHEAST RICHMOND BETWEEN THE DELL IN SHORTY
21 BART STATION WHICH IS JUST OUTSIDE THE IMAGINE ON THE SLIDE TO
22 THE EAST AND THE BAY TRAIL TO THE SOUTHWEST. THIS PROJECT
23 SCORED HIGHLY IN MTC'S EVALUATION PROCESS DUE TO A NUMBER OF
24 FACTORS. IN GENERAL BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN PROJECTS SUPPORT
25 REGIONAL STRATEGIES SUCH AS EXPANDING MOBILITY OPTIONS AND



MAY 26, 2023

1 ACCESS, IMPROVING SAFETY AND FACILITATING MODE SHIFT AWAY FROM
2 SINGLE OCCUPANCY VEHICLES. THE PROJECT LOCATION AND DESIGN
3 ALSO SUPPORTED PLANNED BAY AREA FOCUSED GEOGRAPHIES. THE
4 PROJECT IS LOCATED WITHIN AN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITY, UPON
5 SUPPORTING MULTI-MODAL CONNECTIVITY TO A PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT
6 AREA AND A BART STATION ADDITIONAL PROJECT AREA OVERLAPPED
7 WITH THE REGIONAL NETWORKS PORTION OF THE PROJECT IS ON THE
8 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK AND SCOPE INCLUDED
9 IMPROVEMENTS TO A PORTION OF MTC'S HIGH INJURY NETWORK BOTH OF
10 THESE NETWORKS ARE AREAS WHERE MTC WANTS TO FOCUS
11 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENT TO INCREASE SAFETY FOR VULNERABLE
12 ROADWAY USERS WHILE THIS PROJECT IS NOT PART OF THE BAY TRAIL
13 IT WOULD ENHANCE CONNECTIVITY TO THE BAY TRAIL AND BART
14 ALIGNING WITH THE BAY TRAIL EQUITY STRATEGY WHICH PRIORITIZES
15 THE BAY TRAIL IN ADDITION TO COMPLETING THE TRAIL ITSELF IN
16 ADDITION TO THIS PROJECT DEMONSTRATED PUBLIC SUPPORT ELEMENTS
17 OF THE PROJECT WERE INCLUDED IN A RECENT COMMUNITY-BASED
18 TRANSPORTATION PLAN APPLICATION WAS ENDORSED BY THE COMMUNITY-
19 BASED ORGANIZATIONS INCLUDING BIKE ADVOCATES. FINALLY THE CITY
20 OF RICHMOND'S STRONG THREE P HOUSING POLICIES, WHICH THE CITY
21 HELPS PROTECT, PRESERVE AND PRODUCE AFFORDABLE HOUSING WE'RE
22 ALSO CONSIDERING DURING PROJECT SCORING. NEXT SLIDE. MOVING TO
23 THE RESULTS OF THE CALL FOR PROJECTS PROCESS IDENTIFIED HIGH
24 PERFORMS PROJECTS ACROSS THE REGION IN EACH OF THE NINE BAY
25 AREA COUNTIES SELECTED FOR FUNDING. THIS HIGHLIGHTS THE



MAY 26, 2023

1 LARGEST GRANT AWARDS IN EACH COUNTY SELECTED AS WELL AS
2 SNAPSHOT OF SANTA CLARA COUNTY PROJECT MAP PLEASE NOTE
3 ATTACHMENTS IN THIS ITEM INCLUDE PROJECTS MAPS FOR PROJECTS
4 AND LOCATIONS OF EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES FOR REFERENCE.
5 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN TOTAL THE LOCAL COUNTY PROGRAM DIRECTS
6 \$383 MILLION TO 81 PROJECTS I'LL NOTE LARGER PROJECT AWARDS
7 THIS CYCLE WITH AVERAGE GRANT SIZE OF \$4.6 MILLION AND THE
8 PROGRAM EFFECTIVELY LEVERAGES ADDITIONAL LOCAL STATE AND
9 FEDERAL FUNDING SOURCES TO SUPPORT OVER \$1 BILLION IN TOTAL
10 PROJECT COST. AWARDED FUNDS \$200 MILLION IS DIRECTLY INVESTED
11 IN EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES AND OVER 90% OF PROJECTS
12 SUPPORT PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS WHICH EXCEED PROGRAM
13 TARGETS AND FINALLY NEARLY \$50 MILLION SUPPORT SAVE ROUTES TO
14 SCHOOL PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS WHICH IS ALMOST DOUBLE THE
15 ADOPTED TARGET. THE PIE CHART ON THE RIGHT SHOWS BREAK DOWN BY
16 INVESTMENT MODE OVER 50% SUPPORT BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN
17 PROJECTS WHICH I'LL COVER IN DETAIL, AND THE REMAINDER IS
18 DISTRIBUTED BETWEEN TRANSIT PROJECTS LOCAL STREETS AND ROAD
19 IMPROVEMENTS AND PLANNING PROJECTS NON-INFRASTRUCTURE
20 PROGRAMS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. LAST TIME STAFF PRESENTED TO
21 THIS COMMITTEE WE RECEIVED A REQUEST TO DISAGGREGATE THE BIKE
22 AND PED PROJECTS AND PROVIDE DETAIL ON THE SPECIFIC ACTIVE
23 TRANSPORTATION ELEMENTS THAT ARE BEING FUNDED. THIS SLIDE
24 SUMMARIZES THE SPECIFIC SCOPE ITEMS FUNDED AS PART OF THE 66
25 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN PROJECTS IN THE COUNTY AND LOCAL



MAY 26, 2023

1 PROGRAM. ABOUT A THIRD OF THESE INCLUDE SIDEWALK IMPROVEMENTS
2 SUCH AS ADDING THESE SIDEWALK SEGMENTS TO CLOSE GAPS OR
3 WIDENING OR REPAIRING EXISTING SIDEWALKS AND TWO THIRD INCLUDE
4 BIKEWAY FACILITY INCLUDING MULTI-USE PATHS WHICH SUPPORT BOTH
5 BICYCLE AND PEDESTRIAN TRAFFIC. OTHER COMMON ELEMENTS IN THESE
6 PROJECTS ARE INTERSECTION SAFETY, TRAFFIC CALMING, SAFETY
7 IMPROVEMENTS AND ADDITIONAL AMENITIES FOR PEDESTRIAN, CYCLISTS
8 SUCH AS LANDSCAPING LIGHTING AND WAYFINDING. FINALLY COUNTY
9 AND LOCAL PROGRAMS FUNDED SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL PROJECTS IN
10 SIX OF THE NINE REGIONAL COUNTIES PROMOTING WALKING AND BIKING
11 TO SCHOOL THROUGH VARIOUS SAFETY EDUCATION INCENTIVES AND
12 OTHER STRATEGIES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO BRIEFLY PIVOT TO THE
13 OBAG THREE REGIONAL PROGRAM TO GIVE AN UPDATE ON NEXT STEPS.
14 THIS SLIDE IS A QUICK REMINDER OF THE REGIONAL PROGRAM
15 CATEGORIES WHICH HAVE NOT CHANGED SINCE LAST PRESENTED THESE
16 ARE PLANNING AND PROGRAM IMPLEMENTATION, GROWTH FRAME WORK
17 IMPLEMENTATION, CLIMATE INITIATIVES CONSERVATION AND
18 RESILIENCE COMPLETE STREETS AND COMMUNITY CHOICE AND MULTI-
19 MODAL SYSTEMS OPERATIONS AND PERFORMANCE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
20 MOVING ON TO NEXT STEPS. THIS SLIDE HIGHLIGHTS THE CURRENT AND
21 UPCOMING CALLS FOR PROJECT WITHIN THE REGIONAL PROGRAM. OVER
22 THE PAST FEW MONTHS MTC PLANNING STAFF HAVE BEEN CONDUCTING
23 CALLS FOR PROJECTS WITHIN THE GROWTH FRAMEWORK AND CLIMATE
24 INITIATIVE CATEGORIES WITH AWARD RECOMMENDATION GOING TO THE
25 COMMISSION NEXT MONTH IN THE FOLLOWING PROGRAMS. PRIORITY



MAY 26, 2023

1 DEVELOPMENT AREA AND PRIORITY PRODUCTION AREA, PLANNING AND
2 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE GRANTS AND PARKING MANAGEMENT PROGRAM AND
3 MOBILITY HUB GRANTS. COMING UP STAFF EXPECT TO BRING
4 ADDITIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE TRANSPORTATION
5 ELECTRIFICATION PROGRAM WHICH IS THE FINAL COMPONENT OF THE
6 CLIMATE INITIATIVES GRANTS TO THE COMMISSION IN THE FALL WITH
7 OTHER CALLS ANTICIPATED FOR THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA
8 GRANTS, SAFETY PROGRAM, AND COMMUNITY-BASED TRANSPORTATION
9 PLANNING GRANTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. I'LL LEAVE WITH YOU OUR
10 CONTACT INFORMATION. AS A REMINDER, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL
11 ITEM TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE TO PROVIDE MORE INFORMATION ON THE
12 OBAG THREE COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAM, NOW THAT PROJECTS HAVE
13 BEEN SELECTED. WE WELCOME ANY QUESTIONS AND FEEDBACK FROM THE
14 SUBCOMMITTEE PARTICULARLY RELATED TO EITHER SUGGESTIONS FOR
15 IMPROVING FUTURE CYCLES TO ENHANCE EQUITY AND ACCESSIBILITY OR
16 IDEAS ON METRICS WE MAY WANT TO TRACK IN FUTURE CYCLES TO
17 BETTER MEASURE THE EQUITABLE AND ACCESSIBILITY OUTCOMES OF
18 THIS PROGRAM. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. WE'LL TAKE PUBLIC COMMENT
21 FIRST. IF ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS
22 ITEM, USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON
23 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE
24 CLERK WILL CALL UPON TO YOU SPEAK. WERE THERE ANY ITEMS



MAY 26, 2023

1 SUBMITTED AND IS THERE ANYBODY MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR
2 HAND RAISED?

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NOTHING IN WRITING. THERE IS NO ONE IN
5 THE ROOM BUT WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS ONLINE. FIRST ONE WILL BE
6 WARREN CUSHMAN.

7

8 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. TWO MINUTES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I'M GOING TO MAKE A SIMILAR COMMENT TO WHAT I USUALLY
11 MAKE. I USUALLY SAY THAT WAYFINDING MEANS DIFFERENT THINGS TO
12 DIFFERENT PEOPLE AND ALTHOUGH THAT'S TRUE TODAY I'M GOING TO
13 SAY WHAT ACCESSIBILITY MEANS TO DIFFERENT PEOPLE. I'M GOING TO
14 ASSUME THAT WHEN WE'RE USING AN ACCESSIBILITY LENS WE'RE
15 TALKING ABOUT ACCESSIBILITY TO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. I
16 HOPE THAT'S THE CASE, AND I URGE THAT THE DELIBERATIONS
17 REFLECT THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS DAVEED MEN
20 DELL. UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. FIRST I THINK THIS IS AN EXCELLENT
23 PRESENTATION. THANKS SO MUCH FOR THAT THOMAS. I HAVE A
24 QUESTION AND I MIGHT PUT ON YOU THE SPOT BUT IF I AM I WOULD
25 LIKE TO GET THE INFORMATION AT SOME POINT. HOW MANY PROJECTS



MAY 26, 2023

1 AND HOW MUCH FUNDING HAS BEEN AWARDED TO COUNTIES FOR THE
2 INSTALLATION OF ACCESSIBLE PEDESTRIAN SIGNALS? THIS IS VITAL.
3 WE IN THE CALIFORNIA COUNCIL OF THE BLIND AND THE AMERICAN
4 COUNCIL OF THE BLINDS BELIEVE THAT EVERY SIGNALIZED
5 INTERSECTIONS IN THE COUNTRY SHOULD BE ACCESSIBLE, BECAUSE IF
6 A JURISDICTION WARRANT THAT AN INTERSECTION WOULD BE SAFER
7 WITH A SIGNAL THEN IT SHOULD BE SAFE FOR EVERYONE AND NOT JUST
8 FOR CERTAIN PEOPLE. AND, SO, IT WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL TO KNOW.
9 AND, ALSO, I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW MORE ABOUT THE ACCESSIBILITY
10 PROJECT THAT HAVE BEEN DEALT WITH, IF THERE ARE ANY. AND I
11 KNOW YOU PROBABLY CAN'T ANSWER ANY OF THIS NOW. BUT IT WOULD
12 BE VERY HELPFUL IF YOU COULD FORWARD SOME OF THIS TO KY-NAM OR
13 DRENNEN, AND WE WOULD APPRECIATE THAT INFORMATION. THANK YOU
14 SO MUCH. AND, AGAIN, EXCELLENT PRESENTATION.

15

16 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. DAVEED, BEFORE I LET YOU GO,
17 WOULD YOU PLEASE OUTLINE YOUR WHAT ACCESSIBLE MEANS TO YOU
18 JUST SO WE KNOW WE'RE ALL ON THE SAME PAGE? DO YOU MEAN THE
19 BEEPING AT THE END OF THE SIDEWALK? THE -- IS HE STILL THERE?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YEAH. I'M -- I WAS MUTED. OKAY. YES. ARE YOU ASKING
22 ME? I'M SORRY.

23



MAY 26, 2023

1 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** YES. I AM, SIR. BECAUSE STAFF IS NODDING,
2 AND THEY'RE WRITING NOTES AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE NOTES ARE
3 COMPLETE.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I THINK I MADE THAT CLEAR IN MY FEBRUARY PRESENTATION
6 TO YOU ALL.

7

8 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** LET ME JUST SAY THAT ACCESSIBILITY MEANS SO WE CAN
11 NAVIGATE AN AREA OURSELVES SO WE CAN CROSS A STREET OURSELVES
12 AND KNOW WHEN IT'S SAFE TO CROSS SO THAT WE, I GUESS, TO
13 ELABORATE A LITTLE BIT ABOUT WHAT WARREN SAID, SO WE CAN
14 NAVIGATE A TRANSIT NETWORK COMPLETELY INDEPENDENTLY. MANY
15 TIMES THERE ARE NO PEOPLE AROUND TO ASK FOR HELP AND WE
16 SHOULDN'T ALWAYS HAVE TO ASK FOR HELP, ANYWAY. AND I THINK
17 THAT'S ONE OF THE MAIN DEFINITIONS. BUT I'M VERY HAPPY TO
18 DISCUSS EXTENSIBILITY AT LENGTH WITH ANYONE AT A LATER DATE.

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY THANK YOU DAVEED.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** OKAY.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY.

25



MAY 26, 2023

1 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS ONE MORE SPEAKER. ADINA LEVIN,
2 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** SO, BUILDING ON WHAT DAVEED JUST SAID, I HAVE A
5 PROCESS QUESTION AND SUGGESTION. SO, IN TERMS OF
6 ACCESSIBILITY, THERE HAS BEEN ENCOURAGEMENT OF MTC CREATING
7 ACCESSIBILITY STANDARDS FOR FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT UNDER NETWORK
8 MANAGEMENT. BUT DAVEED'S POINT SUGGESTED SOMETHING BROADER
9 WHICH IS HAVING REGIONAL ACCESSIBILITY STANDARDS FOR OTHER
10 CATEGORIES OF THINGS, INCLUDING THE SIGNALS. AND I AM
11 WONDERING WHERE IN, KIND OF UNDER MTC'S RESPONSIBILITIES AND
12 AUTHORITY COULD COME THE CREATION OF SUCH STANDARDS, AND THE
13 PROMULGATION OF THAT INFORMATION FOR ENTITIES THAT WOULD BE
14 APPLYING FOR GRANTS AND HOW IT COULD ENCOURAGE TO CREATE THESE
15 PROJECTS AND FUND THEM. SO, I THINK THAT'S THE QUESTION AND
16 SUGGESTION FOR STAFF FOR, LIKE, HOW SUCH A SET OF STANDARDS
17 WOULD BE CREATED AND HOW THEY WOULD BE MADE AVAILABLE TO THE
18 JURISDICTIONS THAT APPLY TO MTC FOR FUNDING. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE MEMBERS
21 RAISED HANDS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THERE IS MEMBER FITZGERALD
22 WHO HAS HER HAND.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. WE'LL GO TO CHRISTINE FIRST, THEN.

25



MAY 26, 2023

1 **CHRISTINE FITZGERALD:** OKAY. TO FOLLOW UP WITH ADINA, WARREN,
2 DAVEED, I'M GOING TO ADD ONE MORE PIECE TO THE PUZZLE AND THAT
3 IS TO SAY THAT IF WE CAN ENCOURAGE, NOT ONLY THE CREATION OF
4 THESE STANDARDS, TRACKING OF THESE STANDARDS, BUT A CONTINUAL
5 UPDATE OF THESE STANDARDS AS WE GO FORWARD, INCLUDING PEOPLE
6 WITH DISABILITIES, EVOLVED DISABILITIES, IN THIS PROCESS FROM
7 THE VERY GROUND UP, THAT IS THE BIGGEST AND MOST TREMENDOUS
8 THING WE CAN DO FOR EQUITY AND ACCESS. AND I DON'T THINK I
9 WOULD BE TOO FAR OFF IN SAYING THAT THIS SHOULD NOT JUST BE A
10 REGIONAL THING, THAT WE SHOULD ENCOURAGE NOT ONLY THE STATE OF
11 CALIFORNIA, BUT THE ENTIRE UNITED STATES TO MOVE IN THIS
12 DIRECTION. BECAUSE IT IS SORELY NEEDED.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS
15 ATTENDING REMOTELY THAT HAVE THEIR HAND RAISED?

16

17 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** NO. THEY DON'T HAVE THEIR HAND RAISED
18 BUT I BELIEVE MEMBER SCOTT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK BUT HE HAS
19 TROUBLE UNMUTING HIMSELF. YOU CAN TRY TO UNMUTE YOURSELF?

20

21 **TERRY SCOTT:** YES. THANK YOU. I HAVE A BRIEF COMMENTS.
22 BASICALLY I WOULD LIKE TO SAY I THOUGHT THIS WAS AN EXCELLENT
23 PRESENTATION. I THANK STAFF FOR PUTTING IT TOGETHER. IT'S
24 SUCCINCT, TO THE POINT, AND ADDRESSES EACH OF THE COUNTIES
25 THAT ARE IMPACTED AND HOW THEY ARE POSITIVELY IMPACTED. AND I



MAY 26, 2023

1 APPRECIATE THE BREVITY AND FORTHRIGHT NATURE OF THAT
2 PARTICULAR REPORT. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. MEMBERS IN THE ROOM, DO YOU
5 HAVE QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? GO AHEAD, PAM, AND THEN WALTER.

6

7 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU. I WOULD ALSO ACKNOWLEDGE THE GREAT
8 PRESENTATION AND THE WEALTH OF INFORMATION THAT WAS SHARED. MY
9 QUESTIONS ARE FOR A LITTLE BIT OF CLARIFICATION ON WHAT THE
10 NOMINATION AND APPLICATION PROCESS WAS LIKE. I'M CURIOUS TO
11 KNOW WHO IS THE INTENDED APPLICANT? IS IT AN EVERYDAY
12 RESIDENT? IS IT MEANT TO BE A CBO? AND DOES THE APPLICATION
13 PROCESS FIT INTO THE CAPACITY OF AN EVERYDAY PERSON TO ENGAGE
14 WITH THEIR LOCAL CTA? IF I COULD GET A LITTLE BIT OF
15 CLARIFICATION ON THAT, IT WOULD BE HELPFUL.

16

17 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** IF YOU GO.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY. THROUGH THE CHAIR, CERTAIN SPONSORS ARE
20 ELIGIBLE FOR THESE FUNDS FEDERAL HIGHWAY FUNDS CITIES COUNTIES
21 CTAS TRIBAL GOVERNMENTS TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE ELIGIBLE FOR
22 FUNDING BUT NOT CBOS OR INDIVIDUALS, AND CTAS ARE WORKING WITH
23 THE ELIGIBLE SPONSORS TO SOLICIT PROJECTS ALSO WORKING WITH
24 GENERAL PUBLIC TO SOLICIT PRIORITIES AND UNDERSTAND WHAT, SORT
25 OF, PROJECTS THEY SHOULD NOMINATE TO US.



MAY 26, 2023

1

2 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFICATION. SO MY COMMENTS
3 ON THAT ARE GOING TO BE, WHAT IS MTC DOING TO ENSURE THAT
4 THESE ENTITIES THAT WERE LISTED ARE DOING THEIR DUE DILIGENCE
5 AND MAKING SURE THAT THE PEOPLE WHO, IN THE END WILL BE
6 AFFECTED BY THE DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS AND THE PROJECTS THAT
7 ARE BEING IMPROVED UPON, THAT THEY ARE BEING HEARD AND THAT
8 THEIR NEEDS ARE BEING MET THROUGH THIS FUNDING? I BELIEVE
9 WE'RE IN THE THIRD YEAR OF FOUR YEARS OF FUNDING, IF THAT'S
10 CORRECT? OR AM I MISTAKEN?

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR THIS IS THE FIRST YEAR.

13

14 **PAMELA CAMPOS:** FIRST YEAR, AWESOME. WE CAN CONTINUE TO LEARN
15 AND IMPROVE THE PROCESS AS WE GO ALONG. WHAT I NOTICED IN THE
16 PRESENTATION THERE IS A LOT OF FUNDING FOR SAFE ROUTES TO
17 SCHOOLS BUT BASED ON THE SLIDE WITH ALL THE PROJECTS, THERE
18 WERE ONLY SIX PROJECTS THAT APPLIED FOR THE SAFE ROUTES TO
19 SCHOOLS PROGRAM. SO, IS THERE WORK BEING DONE TO ENSURE THAT
20 SCHOOLS OR THE ENTITIES THAT CAN APPLY FOR THAT FUNDING ARE
21 AWARE OF THIS OPPORTUNITY? IF NOT, WHAT CAN WE DO AS COUNCIL
22 MEMBERS TO HELP REACH THOSE CONNECTIONS SO THAT OUR SCHOOLS
23 ARE APPLYING FOR THIS REALLY GREAT OPPORTUNITY?

24



MAY 26, 2023

1 **SPEAKER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, I CAN SPEAK BRIEFLY TO A COUPLE OF
2 THOSE POINTS. THANK YOU, AGAIN. SO, IN TERMS OF WHAT MTC IS
3 DOING TO ENSURE THE SPONSOR'S DUE DILIGENCE FOR PUBLIC INPUT,
4 I THINK WE HAVE SOME GUIDELINES THAT WE COULD SHARE WITH YOU,
5 I, SORT OF, COVERED THEM IN THE PRESENTATION BUT WE CAN
6 CERTAINLY SEND THAT DOCUMENT OUT TO MEMBERS. SAFE ROUTES TO
7 SCHOOL THERE ARE TWO FRAMES, ONE OF THEM IS SAFER ROUTES TO
8 SCHOOL AND PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS IN GENERAL INFRASTRUCTURE
9 THAT SUPPORTS WALKING AND BIKING TO SCHOOL AND ALSO THESE
10 PROGRAMS THAT THE COUNTIES RUN, SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL
11 INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAMS, AND SO THAT WAS SIX OF THE NINE
12 COUNTIES THAT APPLIED AND RECEIVED FUNDING FOR THEIR SAFER
13 SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOLS PROGRAMS AND THE OTHER PROGRAMS DEMAND
14 SUPPLY THEY GET FUNDING THROUGH THOSE PROJECTS THROUGH
15 DIFFERENT SOURCES SOME WERE FUNDED MORE PROJECTS BEYOND THOSE
16 SIX THAT WERE, SORT OF, INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS SIDEWALK
17 IMPROVEMENTS THAT, SORT OF, THING. WE'LL TAKE FEEDBACK ABOUT
18 MAKING SCHOOLS AWARE OF THIS FUNDING

19

20 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** WALTER?

21

22 **WALTER WILSON:** YES. GREAT PRESENTATION MY CONCERNS ARE SIMILAR
23 TO THOSE COMMISSIONER COUNCIL, WHEN YOU TALK TO THE CEOS
24 TALKED OR REACH OUT THAT PART OF THE PROCESS. DO YOU HAVE A
25 LIST WHO THEY ARE, I THINK IDEALLY THE FUTURE WOULD BE GOOD TO



MAY 26, 2023

1 SHOW WHO THEY ARE SO WE KNOW WHO IS PARTICIPATING IN THE
2 COMMUNITY, AND WHO HASN'T. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT WHAT THE CRITERIA
3 IS FOR AWARDING THE CONTRACTS. IS IT BASED UPON CRIME IN THE
4 AREA OR BASED UPON -- YOU KNOW -- WHO REQUESTED IT? I THINK
5 FROM WHERE I'M SITTING, WE ARE TALKING ABOUT SAFE ROUTES TO
6 SCHOOLS, IT SEEMS THAT WE ARE TALKING ABOUT MAKING SURE KIDS
7 WHO ARE IN UNSAFE AREAS AND ARE BENEFITTING, THAT SHOULD BE
8 PRIORITY, THAT'S WHAT IT'S BASED UPON. I HAVE A MORE SPECIFIC
9 QUESTION, THE CITY IN SAN JOSE YOU MENTIONED STORY IN KEYS,
10 WHAT OCCURRED IN THAT AREA? THANK YOU.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, MEMBER WILSON. I DON'T HAVE A LIST OF CBOS
13 IN FRONT OF ME. BUT WE DO HAVE A CBO LIST ON MTC'S END AND WE
14 CAN ALSO LOOK THROUGH THE APPLICATIONS IN WHICH CBOS WERE
15 ENGAGED CTAS DID A LOT OF THE PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT FOLLOWING THE
16 CRITERIA MTC IN THE FIRST STAGE REACHING OUT TO THE CBOS AND
17 SPONSORS, SOLICITED APPLICATIONS TO SUPPORT. THAT'S WHAT WAS
18 REFERENCED IN THE PRESENTATION. IN TERMS OF SAFE ROUTES TO
19 SCHOOL PROGRAMS WE DID PRIORITIZE THIS TYPE OF PROJECT SO WE
20 DID FUND ALL APPLICANTS, 6 OF 9 COUNTIES SUPPLIED AND WE
21 FUNDED ALL SIX. PROGRAMS ORIENTED TOWARDS TRAFFIC SAFETY WE
22 CAN CONSIDER OTHER ASPECTS OF SAFETY IN THE PROJECT EVALUATION
23 AND I CAN GET YOU MORE DETAILS ON THE STORIES KEYS PROJECT AS
24 WELL.

25



MAY 26, 2023

1 **WALTER WILSON:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I APPRECIATE IT.

2

3 **SPEAKER:** I WANTED TO FOLLOW UP ON SOME THINGS THAT GOT
4 CLARIFIED WITH THE QUESTION. SO, SO FAR, \$383 MILLION HAVE
5 GONE OUT OF THE 786. AM I UNDERSTANDING CORRECTLY?

6

7 **THOMAS ARNDT:** SO, THE 383 IS FOR THE COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAM
8 AND THEN I DIDN'T GO INTO DETAIL ON THE OTHER HALF BUT THAT'S
9 THE REGIONAL PROGRAM, AND THOSE WILL INVOLVE CALLS FOR
10 PROJECTS AS MENTIONED IN THE SLIDE, AND THOSE ARE MORE
11 TARGETED PROGRAMS FOR THE MTC LEG.

12

13 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** SO THOSE ARE STILL TO BE DETERMINED?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** YES GAB GOING I WOULD AGREE WITH COUNCIL MEMBER
16 WILSON IN BEING ABLE TO SEE WHO -- WHICH CBOS OR OUTREACH THE
17 CTAS CARRIED OUT. SOUNDS LIKE THERE IS ANOTHER PROCESS THAT,
18 COMING UP FOR THE REGIONAL PROJECTS. AND SO IT WOULD BE GREAT
19 TO SEE WHO WAS ALREADY INVOLVED, AND, IN CASE THERE ARE SOME
20 MISSING STAKEHOLDERS THAT THE COUNCIL IS AWARE OF THAT WE
21 MIGHT WANT TO TAP TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THESE OPPORTUNITIES, OR
22 AT LEAST ENGAGE INDIVIDUALLY. AND THEN THE OTHER QUESTION I
23 HAD, I APPRECIATE SEEING THIS LIST OF WHAT PROJECTS -- SO, IF
24 I UNDERSTAND THIS CORRECTLY, THESE ARE -- THIS LIST, THE



MAY 26, 2023

1 PROJECTS THAT WERE SUBMITTED, BUT NOT ALL OF THEM RECEIVED
2 FUNDING? OR ARE THESE THE 66 THAT RECEIVED FUNDING?

3

4 **THOMAS ARNDT:** IN THE ATTACHMENT, ALL THOSE PROJECTS RECEIVED
5 FUNDING.

6

7 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** OKAY. WHAT WOULD BE HELPFUL, IN THE FUTURE,
8 AT LEAST FOR ME, IS, BECAUSE SOME OF THESE JUST SAY, PARADISE
9 DRIVE IN CORTE MADERA. I DON'T KNOW WHAT PARADISE DRIVE IS OR
10 WHAT IT IS, IF IT APPLIES TO SAFE -- WHAT WAS THE PROGRAM? THE
11 STREETS PROGRAM FOR SCHOOLS?

12

13 **THOMAS ARNDT:** SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL.

14

15 **GABRIELA ORANTES:** YEAH. THAT ONE. SINCE THERE ARE -- SINCE IT
16 WAS SEPARATED ON PAGE SEVEN OF THE PRESENTATION, AT LEAST,
17 LIKE, A BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN ELEMENTS, IT WOULD BE COOL TO SEE
18 WHAT OF THESE PROJECTS ACTUALLY APPLY TO TRAFFIC CALMING
19 IMPROVEMENT OR BIKEWAY IMPROVEMENT AND EVEN, I THINK,
20 SPECIFICALLY, YEAH, THE BICYCLE PEDESTRIAN WAYFINDING, JUST TO
21 UNDERSTAND A LITTLE MORE, GIVEN THE FACT THAT THESE PROJECTS
22 CAME IN. AND AS YOU PRESENTED TO US OVER A YEAR AGO, OVER A
23 YEAR HAS GONE BY, AND I WONDER IF FOR THE NEXT ROUND IF IT'S
24 POSSIBLE TO HEAR AN UPDATE BEFORE. YEAH, BEFORE THE PROJECTS



MAY 26, 2023

1 ARE DETERMINED JUST TO KNOW WHAT IS GOING ON. THAT WOULD BE
2 GREAT.

3

4 **THOMAS ARNDT:** JUST TO ADDRESS A COUPLE OF YOUR POINTS WE DID
5 COLLECT DOCUMENTATION FROM ALL OF THE CTAS ON THE PUBLIC
6 OUTREACH PROCESS I THINK THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN EASILY SHARE
7 WITH YOU. JUST GOING THROUGH MY NOTES AND WE ALSO CAN SHARE
8 WHICH ELEMENTS OF WHICH PROJECTS I'LL NOTE THAT A LOT OF
9 SPONSORS HAVE, SORT OF, COMPLETE STREETS TYPE PROJECTS SO WE
10 SEE A LOT OF ELEMENTS IN A LOT OF PROJECTS A LOT OF THEM ARE
11 DOING ROADWAY IMPROVEMENTS COMBINED WITH ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
12 SO THEY HAVE A LOT OF ELEMENTS BUT WE CAN CERTAINLY SHARE THAT
13 INFORMATION WITH YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. VINAY?

16

17 **VINAY PIMPLE:** I WANT TO SAY A FEW THINGS ABOUT A FEW DIFFERENT
18 ISSUES. FIRST ABOUT THE ACCESSIBILITY STUFF, ONE OF THE THINGS
19 I WOULD LIKE TO SEE BEING DONE IS SOME KIND OF COLLABORATION
20 WHERE SOFTWARE COMPANIES THAT KINDS WHO DO THE MAPS AND APPS
21 AND THINGS LIKE THAT, BECAUSE HONESTLY WHEN I TRY TO CROSS THE
22 STREET, HOW AM I SUPPOSED TO KNOW THERE IS ANY SIGNAL THERE?
23 UNLESS SOMEBODY HAS WALKED WITH ME THERE AND POINTED IT OUT TO
24 ME AND TOLD ME WHERE IT IS AND STUFF LIKE THAT, I DON'T KNOW
25 IF SOMETHING IS THERE. SO, IT WOULD BE NICE IF -- LET'S SAY WE



MAY 26, 2023

1 WORKED WITH GOOGLE OR WHAT HAVE YOU, AND I GO TO MAPS AND THEY
2 HAVE SOMETHING, YOU KNOW? SOME KIND OF ACCESSIBILITY FEATURE
3 WHERE IF YOU TURN IT ON, THEN IT TELLS YOU TO WALK, THERE IS A
4 SMART SIGNAL THERE OR SOMETHING ELSE THERE, WHAT HAVE YOU.
5 ALSO LIKE SOMETHING, LIKE, SAY, A ROUNDABOUT, WHICH IS A FAIR
6 AMOUNT ABOUT, IF YOU ARE A BLIND PERSON, AND YOU DON'T KNOW
7 THERE IS A ROUNDABOUT THERE, THE FIRST TIME YOU DO IT, IT CAN
8 BE PRETTY SCARY BECAUSE YOU'RE WAITING THERE, AND TRAFFIC JUST
9 DOESN'T STOP AND YOU DON'T KNOW WHY IS IT NOT STOPPING. AND
10 YOU KNOW, SOMETIMES YOU GO AND YOU TAKE THE CHANCE. IT'S JUST
11 REALLY DISORIENTING, BECAUSE YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT IS HAPPENING.
12 NOW IT'S TRUE THAT THE CHANCES OF BEING RUN OVER ARE LOW,
13 BECAUSE THE CARS DO SLOW DOWN, BUT IT'S A DIFFICULT
14 EXPERIENCE. SO, I WISH WE COULD DO THAT. AS FAR AS THE SCHOOLS
15 THING IS CONCERNED, HOW WE DEFINITELY SUPPORT COLLABORATING,
16 SAFER ROUTES TO SCHOOLS, I WOULD LIKE TO SEE BIKE PATHS TO
17 SCHOOLS BUT IT'S GOING TO WORK ONLY IF THERE IS BIKE PARKING
18 ON THE SCHOOL GROUNDS. THIRD, I WANT TO SPEAK ABOUT THE WAY
19 SOME OF THESE PROJECTS ARE DONE. ONE THING IS ABOUT THE BIKE
20 LANES AND THEN I'LL TALK ABOUT THE PROJECT THAT STAFF
21 HIGHLIGHTED. I WAS INVOLVED WHEN I WAS IN CITY COUNCIL, AND I
22 WANT TO GIVE SOME BACKGROUND TO HIGHLIGHT THE ISSUES THAT ARE
23 INVOLVED WITH THESE THINGS. THE FIRST THING WANT TO FIND OUT
24 IS, IS THERE ANY WAY FOR THE PURPOSES OF ACCOUNTABILITY, THAT
25 WE FIND OUT WHETHER THESE PRACTICES ARE PERFORMING? FOR



MAY 26, 2023

1 EXAMPLE, THERE ARE BIKE LANES ON A LOT OF THE FREEWAY EXITS IN
2 RICHMOND. MOST OF THE PEOPLE I KNOW, THEY SAY THAT THEY
3 HAVEN'T EVER SEEN ANYBODY USE THOSE BIKE LANES. THE FRIENDS I
4 KNOW WHO RIDE BICYCLES, THEY SAY THEY DON'T USE THOSE BIKE
5 LANES, BECAUSE THEY'RE TOO DANGEROUS, THEY JUST GO ON THE SIDE
6 STREETS. SO I REALLY WOULD LIKE TO FIND OUT JUST BY WAY OF
7 ACCOUNTABILITY, DO THESE THINGS ACTUALLY PERFORM? THE SECOND
8 ISSUE IS THE BAYVIEW THING. PERSONALLY, FROM MY PERSONAL POINT
9 OF VIEW, AT LEAST IN OUR CITY, CITY OF RICHMOND, I DO THINK
10 THAT THE BIKE LANES MAKE SENSE WHEN THEY ARE SAFE ROUTES TO
11 SCHOOL, THEY ARE ROUTES TO BART AND BAYVIEW. THIS THING IS
12 ABOUT THE BART, SO FOR ME, IT IS ONE OF THE BIKE LANE PROJECTS
13 THAT MAKES SENSE, WHICH IS VERY DIFFERENT FROM THE OTHER BIKE
14 LANES WHICH ARE ON FREEWAY EXITS. HOWEVER, I DO WANT TO POINT
15 OUT THAT WHEN I WAS IN CITY COUNCIL, THE BAYVIEW PROJECT, THE
16 TEAM WENT TO, I THINK, SEVEN NEIGHBORHOOD COUNCILS THAT WOULD
17 BE AFFECTED, THE NEIGHBORHOODS THAT WOULD BE AFFECTED, AND,
18 NORMALLY, WHEN YOU GO TO THE NEIGHBORHOOD COUNCIL, ASK FOR A
19 LETTER OF SUPPORT. IT'S A FOREGONE CONCLUSION THAT YOU ARE
20 GOING TO GET IT, UNLESS IT'S AN APPROVAL FOR A LIQUOR STORE.
21 OKAY? THAT APART, IT'S JUST A FOREGONE CONCLUSION THAT THEY'RE
22 GOING TO SUPPORT YOU. THIS IS THEY WENT TO SEVEN NEIGHBORHOOD
23 COUNCILS I BELIEVE AND THEY GOT SUPPORT LETTERS FROM ZERO.
24 THESE ARE HEAVILY AFRICAN AMERICAN NEIGHBORHOOD OF COUNCILS.
25 AND I HAVE BEEN TO A FEW OF THEM -- I MEAN, I HAVE TALKED WITH



MAY 26, 2023

1 ALL OF THEM, BUT THEIR MAIN OBJECTION IS, AGAIN, WELL, WE HAVE
2 NEVER SEEN ANY BICYCLISTS USING THE BIKE LANES THESE OTHER
3 ROADS THAT THERE ARE BIKE LANES ON AND SO THEY JUST THINK OF
4 IT AS YOU'RE TAKING AWAY ONE LANE FOR THE CARS. AND, SO, THE
5 WAY THAT IT IS PERCEIVED THERE IS THAT, BECAUSE WE ARE POOR,
6 WE ARE, BASICALLY TOLD THAT IF YOU WANT TO HAVE YOUR ROADS
7 IMPROVED, YOU CAN USE ONLY HALF THE ROAD NOW. THAT'S THE WAY
8 IT IS PERCEIVED. AND I JUST WANT FOR US TO BE AWARE OF THAT.
9 AND I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO SEE SOME WAY FOR ACCOUNTABILITY SO
10 THAT WE DON'T JUST KEEP PUSHING THROUGH POLICIES, BECAUSE
11 SOMEBODY SAYS THESE ARE THE BEST PRACTICES. WE ACTUALLY SHOULD
12 FIND OUT, DO THESE PRACTICES ACTUALLY WORK, AND DO THEY WORK
13 IN DIFFERENT AREAS? IT MAY WORK GREAT IN DOWNTOWN BERKELEY,
14 DOWNTOWN OAKLAND, DOES IT REALLY WORK IN RICHMOND? DOES IT
15 WORK IN MARTINEZ? YOU KNOW? SO, I WOULD REALLY LIKE TO FIND
16 OUT WHAT WE DO ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY ISSUES. THANK YOU.

17

18 **THOMAS ARNDT:** THANK YOU, MEMBER PIMPLE. AND JUST TO RESPOND TO
19 A COUPLE OF YOUR POINTS, THANK YOU FOR THE FEEDBACK CERTAINLY
20 WE CAN INCORPORATE INTO THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE NEXT CYCLE. I
21 THINK, SPEAKING TO, SORT OF, THE PROJECT STANDARDS PIECE WHICH
22 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SPOKE ON AS WELL, I JUST WANT TO
23 HIGHLIGHT THAT WE, MTC DOES HAVE FULL DISCRETION OVER WHAT
24 TYPES OF PROGRAMS ARE SELECTED, SO WE COULD CERTAINLY SET, YOU
25 KNOW, TYPES OF PROJECTS THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE FOR THIS



MAY 26, 2023

1 PROGRAM. BUT THIS PROGRAM OBVIOUSLY DOESN'T DICTATE STANDARDS
2 FOR ALL PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO WE NEED SOME, SORT
3 OF, OTHER VEHICLE FOR THAT. BUT APPRECIATE THAT FEEDBACK AND
4 WE'LL BRING IT BACK. I THINK I HAD SOMETHING ELSE. YES. THANK
5 YOU SO MUCH FOR THE FEEDBACK ON THE BAYVIEW TO BART AND, SORT
6 OF, THAT CONTEXT AND I THINK A LOT OF WHAT YOU ARE TALKING
7 ABOUT IS, SORT OF, CONTEXT DESIGN AND MAKING SURE THAT THE
8 ELEMENTS THAT ELEMENT WE'RE PUTTING INTO ROADWAYS MAKE SENSE
9 AND FOR THOSE ROADWAYS AND FOR THE COMMUNITIES THEY WILL BE
10 USING THEM CERTAINLY WE'D LIKE TO PRIORITIZE IN PROJECT
11 SELECTION

12

13 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO MORE HANDS RAISED.
14 I'M GONNA TRY AND SUM THIS UP I THINK THAT THERE IS STRONG
15 DESIRE TO CONSOLIDATE BEST PRACTICES AND CREATE BEST PRACTICES
16 FORMAT FOR ESPECIALLY FOR MONEY THAT WE'RE HANDING OUT THROUGH
17 MTC FIGURING OUT WHERE THAT'S GOING TO LIVE AND HOW TO
18 PARTICIPATE IN THAT SHOULD BE A PRIORITY OF THE NEXT YEAR
19 COMING UP WE'RE DOING A LOT OF WORK AND WE HAVE TO SHOW OUR
20 HOMEWORK TO THE STATE IF WE'RE GOING TO GET ANY MORE MONEY OUT
21 OF THEM. I THINK THIS IS AN EXCELLENT FORMAT TO GO. I WILL
22 LEAVE IT TO YOU TO FIGURE OUT WHERE THAT'S GOING TO LIVE AND
23 HOW THAT'S GOING TO COME BACK. IT COMES BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE
24 WHETHER IT'S SHARED WITH OUR OTHER SUBCOMMITTEES BUT I THINK
25 THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT, KEEPING IN MIND GOING TO BE DIFFERENT



MAY 26, 2023

1 IN THE URBAN AND RURAL ENVIRONMENTS, DIFFERENT ANIMALS, BEING
2 ABLE TO SAFELY CROSS THE STREET AND BEING THAT'S KEY AND WHEN
3 YOU HAVE PEOPLE USING SOMETHING DIFFERENT FROM COMMUNITY IT'S
4 GOING TO BE CONFUSING AND IT'S GOING TO BE HELPFUL SO THAT WAS
5 THE FIRST THING. THE FRONT END PROCESS TO BE MORE TRANSPARENT,
6 I HAVE A HARD TIME WITH AGENCIES WHO HAVE CONDUCTED OUTREACH
7 AND THE REALITY IS THEY HAVE TAPPED CBO AND THERE'S BEEN LIKE
8 SIX PEOPLE PARTICIPATING SO I AM ASSUMING THAT IN OUR
9 STANDARDS WE'RE REQUIRING PUBLIC MEETINGS AND WE'RE REQUIRING
10 ALL OF THIS STUFF FOR US RATHER THAN ASKING WHEN THE PROJECT
11 COMES HERE CAN WE SIMPLY LINK THE PROJECT, READ EVERYTHING
12 THAT ADDED INTO IT, LIKE, I LIVE WITH VTA; VTA, CONSTRUCTED X
13 NUMBER OF PUBLIC MEETINGS, LINK TO THE PUBLIC MEETINGS
14 SOMETHING LIKE THAT. WE KEEP ASKING THE SAME QUESTION WHO
15 PARTICIPATED WHO DID YOU KNOW AT LEAST FOR OUTREACH PORTION,
16 THAT WOULD BE HELPFUL, BECAUSE I CAN'T FIND THAT ON THE WEB
17 SITE SOMETIMES. THE OUTREACH AND PARTICIPANTS AND SCOPE OF THE
18 PROJECT AND DESIGN BUT IF THEY'RE SUBMITTING AN APPLICATION,
19 THAT'S A DOCUMENT THAT YOU GUYS HAVE GOT SOMEHOW
20 ELECTRONICALLY. SO, AT LEAST BEING ABLE TO LET US, BEFOREHAND,
21 BEFORE YOU COME HERE, SEE ALL THAT INFORMATION WOULD BE GREAT.
22 AND I SEE REBECCA KIND OF WEIGHING IN ON THIS. REBECCA, AM I
23 ASKING FOR A UNICORN?
24



MAY 26, 2023

1 **REBECCA LONG:** THANKS CHAIR KINMAN. NO. I THINK IT MAKES A LOT
2 OF SENSE TO TRY TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THEY ARE DOING IN TERMS OF
3 OUTREACH WHAT I WAS REACTING TO A LITTLE BIT IS PUBLIC
4 MEETINGS IN THAT, YOU KNOW, I THINK WE HAVE ALL SEEN HOW IN-
5 PERSON PUBLIC MEETINGS AREN'T NECESSARILY THE BEST WAY TO GET
6 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT JUST BECAUSE IT'S HARD FOR PEOPLE TO
7 COME, I'M NOT SAYING WE SHOULDN'T DO ANY IN-PERSON BUT THERE
8 CAN BE OTHER EFFECTIVE WAYS TO GET THE WORD OUT. I DON'T WANT
9 TO BE TOO RIGID IN THE APPROACH THAT WE'RE NOURISHING FOLKS TO
10 DO, TO GET THAT ENGAGEMENT.

11

12 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OH, ANY TYPE OF OUTREACH THAT'S DONE. I
13 MEAN, IF -- I DON'T CARE HOW IT'S DONE. IT JUST GIVES ME AN
14 IDEA OF HOW MANY PEOPLE THEY ACTUALLY TOUCHED OR HOW MANY
15 PEOPLE PARTICIPATED. LIKE, I KNOW THAT THE NEXT TIME WE'RE
16 GOING TO GO OUT AND DO PLANNED BAY AREA AND WE'RE GOING TO
17 HAVE SOMEBODY STANDING AT A FARMERS MARKET, NOBODY'S GOING TO
18 BE COUNTING THE NUMBER OF PEOPLE THAT YOU TALK TO AT ONE OF
19 THOSE THINGS, BUT AT LEAST GIVES ME AN IDEA OF WHERE AND WHEN
20 OUR STAFF WAS THERE, BUT ON THESE TYPES OF PROJECTS WE'RE
21 WONDERING IF THE COMMUNITY WAS ACTUALLY INVOLVED, THEN THAT
22 WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL.

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** YEAH. THAT'S GREAT. THAT'S COMPLETELY WHERE I'M
25 COMING FROM TOO. THANK YOU.



MAY 26, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** OKAY. THANK YOU. TO ME IT'S JUST EASY TO
3 CREATE A LINK AND SEND US TO THE INFORMATION AND WE'LL FOLLOW
4 IT RATHER THAN ASKING YOU QUESTIONS OVER AND OVER. OKAY. ARE
5 THERE ANY FURTHER COMMENTS ON THIS? GO AHEAD WALTER.

6

7 **WALTER WILSON:** THANK YOU. SO, DITTO. BUT, YOU KNOW, THAT'S --

8

9 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** [LAUGHTER]

10

11 **WALTER WILSON:** I HAVE KIND OF BEEN ASKING FOR THIS SINCE I
12 HAVE BEEN HERE BECAUSE I'M REALLY INTERESTED TO SEE, AND
13 MAKING SURE THE UNDERREPRESENTED COMMUNITIES ARE COVERED BY
14 THESE LOFTY GREAT PROGRAMS, REALLY. AND MORE OFTEN THAN NOT
15 UNLESS WE ASK THE QUESTION WE DON'T KNOW AND MORE OFTEN ARE
16 THAN NOT IF WE DON'T DO INTENTIONAL OUTREACH TO THESE
17 COMMUNITIES WE DON'T KNOW. I WANT TO SAY THIS ABOUT THE
18 OUTREACH EFFORTS. IT JUST DEPENDS ON WHO YOU HAVE DOING THE
19 OUTREACH, I CAN SAY THAT. IT REALLY DOES. PART OF MY BUSINESS
20 THAT I DO IS OUTREACH WITH -- FOR EXAMPLE, WE'RE DOING AN
21 EVENT ON THE 31st FOR VALLEY WATER DISTRICT. WE WANTED TO GET
22 100 PEOPLE, I'M LOOKING AT THE REGISTRATION, IT'S 265 AND THIS
23 IS A TWO WEEK PERIOD IT'S AN UNDERSTANDING OF SOCIAL MEDIA,
24 SOCIAL NETWORKS UNDERSTANDING THE COMMUNITY, UNDERSTANDING HOW
25 TO TARGET. WHAT'S HAPPENING TRADITIONALLY IN TERMS OF WHAT WE



MAY 26, 2023

1 HAVE DONE IN THE PAST IS JUST NOT WORKING ANY LONGER. AND WE
2 HAVE LEARNED THAT OURSELVES THE HARD WAY. I'M SAYING, TO THIS
3 BODY AND THIS AGENCY, YOU MIGHT TAKE A STEP BACK AND LOOK AT
4 WHAT YOU HAVE HISTORICALLY DONE AND THEN TAKE A LOOK AT OTHER
5 ORGANIZATIONS OR OTHER FIRMS, ESPECIALLY GRASSROOTS
6 ORGANIZATIONS AND BRING THEM INTO YOUR PROCESSES AND LINK TO
7 THESE ORGANIZATIONS AND MAKE THEM PART OF A BROADER NETWORK.
8 BECAUSE FOR US THAT'S THE KEY, IS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE NETWORK
9 WITH ALL OF THESE DIFFERENT COMPANIES, ALL OF THESE DIFFERENT
10 GROUPS, ORGANIZATIONS, CBOS CITIES COUNTIES, THEY ALL BECOME
11 PART OF OUR NETWORK AN INTENTIONAL PART IT'S NOT LIKE WE JUST
12 SEND THEM SOMETHING WE HAVE A CONTACT PERSON WE TALK TO
13 CONVERSELY WHEN WE SEND THEIR STUFF OUT AND TALK TO THEM. EVEN
14 GETTING QUORUM IN THESE GROUPS IS SOMETIMES A DIFFICULT THING.
15 SO I CAN APPRECIATE TRYING TO DO OUTREACH IN SOME OF THESE
16 COMMUNITIES BUT THOSE ARE JUST SOME IDEAS I THINK YOU MIGHT
17 THINK ABOUT. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** AND THE OTHER THING IS, I THINK WE ALL
20 RECOGNIZE, IN THE ROOM, THAT IT'S A POLITICAL THING. SAFE
21 ROUTES TO SCHOOL, ESPECIALLY, IS WHATEVER POLITICIAN IN THIS
22 PARTICULAR DISTRICT MAKES THAT THEIR PROJECT. THEY MAKE IS
23 THEIR PROJECT. AND SO THE INEQUITY OF UNDER OVER IN COUNCIL
24 DISTRICTS OR OTHER AREAS, OR YOU SIMPLY HAVE A NEW COUNCIL
25 MEMBER WHO HASN'T BEEN MADE AWARE OF THESE THINGS, SEEING



MAY 26, 2023

1 THOSE, SEEING THE PROJECTS AS THEY COME IN WILL ALLOW US, AS
2 MEMBERS, TO TARGET OTHER AREAS THAT ARE -- THAT NEED TO BE
3 FOCUSED ON. IT WILL ALLOW US TO DO THAT. SO, WE ALL HAVE A
4 SHARE IN THE WORKLOAD HERE. OKAY. WITH THAT I'M GOING TO CLOSE
5 OUT THIS ITEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. GREAT ITEM. WE'RE GOING TO
6 MOVE TO ITEM NUMBER SEVEN, PUBLIC COMMENT ON OTHER BUSINESS. I
7 WILL NOW ASK THE CLERK TO READ THE NAMES OR ORGANIZATIONS OF
8 ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED AT
9 INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY FIVE -- OH, I SKIPPED NEW BUSINESS.
10 EXCUSE ME. I TURNED MY PAGE OVER TOO SOON. ITEM NUMBER SIX NEW
11 BUSINESS. MEMBERS OF THE SUBCOMMITTEE MAY BRING UP NEW
12 BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO AGENDA AND IF ANYBODY
13 FROM THE PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM, USE THE
14 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF
15 THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE NEAR THE PODIUM AND THE CLERK
16 WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. CLERK WERE THERE ANY ITEMS
17 RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS?

18

19 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE IS NOTHING -- [INDISCERNIBLE] (NO
20 AUDIO)

21

22 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** ADINA, ARE YOU THERE?

23

24 **ADINA LEVIN:** ALL RIGHT. I'M NOT SURE I'M COMMENTING IN THE
25 RIGHT PLACE HERE, BUT I WANTED TO MAKE A GENERAL PUBLIC



MAY 26, 2023

1 COMMENT PICKING UP ON WALTER WILSON'S PREVIOUS COMMENT ABOUT
2 THE GENERAL OUTREACH AND THE CONTRACTORS THAT MTC HIRES TO DO
3 THE CBO OUTREACH AND THE IMPORTANCE OF NETWORKING AMONGST THE
4 PEOPLE WHO ARE ATTENDING AND PARTICIPATING IN THE OUTREACH.
5 AND THE CONTRACTORS THAT MTC WORKS WITH ARE DIFFERENT IN TERMS
6 OF HOW THEY SUPPORT THAT OR DO NOT SUPPORT THAT. AND THERE IS
7 SOME CONTRACTORS IN, THAT MTC DOES WORK WITH WHOSE METHOD OF
8 OPERATION IS TO GATHER PEOPLE, BUT TO TRY TO -- TO NOT SUPPORT
9 PEOPLE THAT ATTEND VERY DIFFERENT OUTREACH ACTIVITIES IN
10 CONNECTING WITH EACH OTHER AND NETWORKING WITH EACH OTHER. THE
11 MODEL IS GATHERING PEOPLE AND HAVING THEM GIVE THE FEEDBACK TO
12 MTC, BUT NOT SUPPORTING, YOU KNOW, BUILDING OF THE
13 RELATIONSHIPS AMONGST THE PEOPLE PARTICIPATING IN THAT
14 COMMUNITY OUTREACH. AND, SO, IF AS MTC IS GOING THROUGH ITS
15 REGULAR PROCESS OF IDENTIFYING THOSE ORGANIZATIONS TO WORK
16 WITH, MAYBE HAVING A CRITERIA SUPPORTING THE -- THE, MAKING IT
17 POSSIBLE FOR THE COMMUNITY MEMBERS AND COMMUNITY GROUPS TO
18 INTERACT WITH A NETWORK WITH EACH OTHER, I THINK THAT WOULD BE
19 HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NO OTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ON
22 THIS ITEM.

23

24 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS OF THE
25 COUNCIL WITH NEW BUSINESS THAT THEY WANT TO SEE ON THE AGENDA?



MAY 26, 2023

1 I SEE HAND RAISED. ITEM SEVEN PUBLIC COMMENT OTHER BUSINESS.
2 STARTED TO READ IT BEFORE WE'LL DO IT AGAIN. I WOULD ASK THE
3 CLERK TO READ THE NAMES AND ORGANIZATIONS OF GENERAL WRITTEN
4 PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M.
5 YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD I WOULD ASK THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING
6 IF THEY HAVE GENERAL COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM ON TODAY
7 AGENDA PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE
8 AND I'LL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. UNMUTE YOURSELF OR DIAL STAR
9 SIX. CLERK ARE THERE ANY NEW HANDS RAISED?

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE NO WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT WE
12 HAVE ONE HAND RAISED. WARREN CUSHMAN. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.
13 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** HELLO MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE, I WANTED TO POINT OUT
16 THE CRITICAL NATURE OF THE BAHFA ENTIRE BAHFA HOUSING ARENA
17 AND THE IMPORTANCE OF SPECIFICALLY THE HOUSING BOND MEASURE
18 THAT'S MOVING QUICKLY THROUGH THE BAHFA PROCESS AND WILL BE
19 MAKING ITS WAY BEFORE THE VOTERS IN ABOUT A YEAR. I WANT TO
20 CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO THIS BECAUSE THERE ARE A NUMBER OF
21 STEPS THAT TO BE LOOKED AT INCLUDE BE OUTREACH, PRESENTING THE
22 PLAN TO JURISDICTIONS, COMMUNITY GROUPS AND THE LIKE. SO THERE
23 IS A NUMBER OF STEPS THAT HAVE TO HAPPEN. SO I WANT TO
24 EMPHASIZE THAT IN TERMS OF FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS AND FUTURE
25 PROGRAMMING FOR THIS COMMITTEE AS WELL AS THE COUNCIL AS A



MAY 26, 2023

1 WHOLE AND JUST EMPHASIZING OF HOUSING, IN GENERAL, AND THE
2 IMPORTANCE OF HOUSING. I OFTEN BELIEVE THAT HOUSING DOESN'T
3 GET THE BUMP IT DESERVES AT TIMES, AND I WANT TO URGE THAT AS
4 THIS COMMITTEE AND THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL PROGRAMS ITS
5 AGENDA AS HOUSING TO BE A MAJOR PLAYER IN THIS SPACE. THANK
6 YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. IS THERE ANYTHING OTHER PUBLIC
9 COMMENT?

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
12 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

13

14 **CHAIR, RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. AGENDA ITEM EIGHT IS
15 ADJOURNMENT. NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL
16 EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL BE FRIDAY JUNE 23RD, 2023
17 AT 9:00 A.M. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED TO
18 THE PUBLIC. THIS MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY
19 AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE IS ADJOURNED. THANK YOU. [ADJOURNED]

20

21

22



NTT

Broadcasting Government