

An aerial photograph of a city street grid, viewed from a high angle. The streets form a complex network of intersecting lines. The entire image is overlaid with a semi-transparent blue filter, giving it a monochromatic appearance. The text is positioned in the lower right quadrant of the image.

ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS

Meeting Transcript

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

EXECUTIVE BOARD

2

THURSDAY, JANUARY 18TH, 2024, 5:10 PM

3

4

PRES, BELIA RAMOS: GOOD EVENING. AND WELCOME TO TODAY'S ABAG

5

EXECUTIVE BOARD MEETING OF JANUARY 18, 2024. THIS MEETING IS

6

BEING WEBCAST ON THE ABAG WEBSITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC

7

PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISE

8

HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE

9

CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. AT

10

THIS TIME I WILL CALL THIS MEETING TO ORDER AND I WOULD ASK

11

YOU TO JOIN ME -- I WOULD ASK YOU TO JOIN ME IN THE PLEDGE OF

12

ALLEGIANCE. READY, BEGIN. I PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG

13

OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH

14

IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, FOR LIBERTY AND

15

JUSTICE FOR ALL. THANK YOU. IF THE ABAG CLERK WOULD NOW CALL

16

THE ROLL.

17

18

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: YES, MA'AM. MAYOR ADAMS.

19

20

SUSAN ADAMS: HERE.

21

22

CLERK, FRED CASTRO: SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN?

23

24

CANDACE ANDERSEN: HERE.

25

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** FORTUNATO BAS.

2

3 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** PRESENT.

4

5 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR BREED IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR CARLSON
6 IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER COHEN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR CORZO. IS
7 ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND.

8

9 **PAT EKLUND:** PRESENT AND I AM AT THE CITY HALL LOCATION IN THE
10 CONFERENCE ROOM AT 922 MEACHAM AVENUE IN CITY OF NOVATO.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR ELLENBERG IS ABSENT.
13 COUNCILMEMBER FIFE. COUNCILMEMBER FIFE, I SEE YOU.

14

15 **CARROLL FIFE:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER FLIGOR IS ABSENT.
18 VICE MAYOR KAMEI.

19

20 **ROSEMARY KAMEI:** HERE AND I AM IN THE SAN JOSE LOCATION ROOM
21 1734 AT 200 EAST SANTA CLARA STREET IN SAN JOSE.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR LEE.

24

25 **OTTO LEE:** HERE, PRESENT. I AM HERE WITH VICE MAYOR KAMEI.

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS ABSENT.
3 SUPERVISOR MARQUEZ.

4

5 **ELISA MARQUEZ:** THANK YOU. LISTED ON THE AGENDA.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER MARTINEZ-BELTRAN
8 IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MILEY IS ABSENT. MAYOR MOTOYAMA. MOST
9 MOST HERE --

10

11 **LISA MOTOYAMA:** HERE.

12

13 **CATHERINE MOY:** HERE.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** AND YOU ARE AT THE FAIRFIELD LOCATION.

16

17 **CATHERINE MOY:** YES.

18

19 **MARK NAGALES:** HERE. I AM AT THE CITY OF OAKLAND CITY HALL AT 1
20 -- PLAZA. HERE IN ROOM 2. AND THANK YOU FOR THE CITY OF
21 OAKLAND ALLOWING ME TO COME HERE AND CRASH THE PARTY.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER ORTIZ IS ABSENT.
24 SUPERVISOR RABBITT IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RAMOS.

25

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER REID.

4

5 **TREVA REID:** HELLO, EVERYONE. I AM ALSO HERE AT THE CITY OF
6 OAKLAND HERE IN ROOM 2. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO.

9

10 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR SACKETT.

13

14 **MARY SACKETT:** PRESENT.

15

16 **CINDY SILVA:** PRESENT.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER TIEDEMANN IS
19 ABSENT. SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS.

20

21 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. DID I MISS ANYBODY?

24

25 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MAYOR BREED'S ALTERNATE.

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

3

4 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. WE WILL MOVE TO OUR NEXT AGENDA
5 ITEM WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED
6 RECEIVED WITH THIS ITEM AGENDA 2 BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO
7 THE RECORD.

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO COMMENTS. IN THE BOOED ROOM,
10 THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. AND THE ZOOM ATTENDEE
11 SPACE, THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.
12 THANK YOU.

13

14 **PRES, BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AT THIS TIME I'LL CLOSE
15 PUBLIC COMMENT AND MOVE OVER TO OUR EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER
16 ANNOUNCEMENTS. DO WE HAVE ANY ANNOUNCEMENTS FROM BOARD
17 MEMBERS? SEEING NONE, WE WILL MOVE ON TO THE ABAG PRESIDENT'S
18 REPORT. AND I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME ALL OF MY COLLEAGUES WHO
19 ARE FIRST MEET -- TO OUR FIRST MEETING OF 2024. I AM
20 INCREDIBLY EXCITED FOR WHAT THIS NEW YEAR MEANS FOR ABAG. AND
21 I WILL SAY THAT ONE OF THE THINGS THAT REALLY COMING HERE AND
22 BEING ABLE TO SERVE AS YOUR -- AS YOUR PRESIDENT AND KNOWING
23 THE WORK THAT WE'VE DONE THAT WE STARTED, ACTUALLY FIFE YEARS
24 AGO LAST NIGHT, AND THAT WAS WITH THE COSTA COMPACT THAT WILL
25 LEAD US TO A VERY, VERY PIVOTAL YEAR FOR THIS BOARD AND FOR

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 TWO MAJOR INITIATIVES THAT WE HAVE AND THAT IS PLAN BAY AREA
2 2050 PLUS AND OUR HOUSING BOND MEASURE THAT IS BEING TAKEN UP
3 BY BAFA SO DON'T LOSE A SIGHT OF THAT EVER IN GOVERNMENT. WE
4 SOMETIMES MAY SEEM LIKE WE MOVE SLOW, BUT FIVE YEARS FROM VOTE
5 OF CASA COMPACT TO INITIATIVE IS ACTUALLY NOT THAT BAD. I'M
6 PRETTY PROUD OF THE WORK THAT OUR STAFF HAS BEEN ABLE TO DO
7 AND THAT OUR COLLEAGUES COLLECTIVELY HAVE DONE THROUGHOUT THE
8 YEARS. IN MARCH, THE EXECUTIVE BOARD WILL CONDUCT THE BULK OF
9 ITS MEETING AS A WORKSHOP ON THE HOUSING BOND MEASURE IN
10 ADVANCE OF AN APRIL DECISION OF WHETHER TO PLACE THE REVENUE
11 MEASURE ON THE NOVEMBER BALLOT SO PLEASE MAKE SURE YOU ARE IN
12 ATTENDANCE ON THE MARCH 21 MEETING AND APRIL 18 MEETING
13 BECAUSE THAT WILL BE ABSOLUTELY PIVOTAL AS WE MAKE A DECISION
14 TO MOVE COLLECTIVELY TOGETHER. NO WAY WE CAN HAVE SUCCESS IF
15 WE ARE NOT DOING THIS ON A UNIFIED FRONT. WE WILL RECEIVE A
16 REPORT AND TAKE ACTION ON THE JOINT MTC-ABAG ADVOCACY PROGRAM
17 AND WE WILL RECEIVE AN INFORMATIONAL REPORT ON ADVANCING
18 NATURE-BASED SHORELINE SOLUTIONS. BUT BEFORE WE GET TO OUR
19 BUSINESS, WE'VE HAD SOME CHANGES HERE AT THE FRONT. REALLY, WE
20 JUST EXCHANGED SEATS. THAT'S PRETTY MUCH WHAT WE DID. AND
21 REALLY TRYING TO THINK -- WE NO LONGER HAVE AN IMMEDIATE PAST
22 PRESIDENT BECAUSE OUR IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT IS OUR VICE
23 PRESIDENT. AND IT IS AN INCREDIBLE HONOR TO BE ABLE TO SERVE
24 ALONGSIDE MAYOR OF BERKELEY JESSE ARREGUIN AND TO RECOGNIZE
25 HIM FOR HIS WORK AT ABAG AS OUR PRESIDENT OVER THE LAST FOUR

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 YEARS. SO I'VE -- I'M GOING TO RUN THROUGH AND SHARE A LITTLE
2 BIT ABOUT YOUR LEADERSHIP. BUT I WILL TELL YOU THAT THE ONE
3 THAT STICKS OUT TO ME THE MOST IT THAT ON MARCH 13, 2020, WE
4 WERE ALL SITTING HERE AT AN ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MEETING
5 AND WE WERE TOLD TO LEAVE THE CITY. AND WHAT TRANSPIRED FROM
6 THAT MOMENT IN 2020 AND WHAT WE WERE TOLD TO BE TWO WEEKS
7 TURNED INTO TWO MONTHS, TURNED INTO TWO YEARS. THE LEADERSHIP
8 THAT YOU BROUGHT AND THE FORWARD-THINKING TO SAY, LIFE HAS
9 CHANGED AT THIS POINT FORWARD, AND WE NEED TO INCORPORATE
10 THOSE CHANGES THAT HAVE HAPPENED INTO OUR REGION, INTO
11 EVERYTHING THAT WE DO. SO I WANT TO -- I WANT TO START WITH
12 THAT. THEN, THERE'S THE TECHNICALITIES OF -- I DID NOT KEEP A
13 TALLY OF ALL YOUR MEETINGS, BUT THAT'S IMPRESSIVE. I KNOW. I
14 SAT WITH YOU IN MOST ALL OF THEM, AND IT IS ABSOLUTELY
15 IMPRESSIVE. ESPECIALLY, WHEN YOU EVEN LOOK AT -- LOOKING AT
16 OUR APPEALS HEARINGS THAT WE HAD. THE MOST EVER THAT WE HAVE
17 HAD. WITH TREMENDOUS GRACE, YOU LED THIS ORGANIZATION THROUGH
18 THAT. YOU HAVE -- YOU GUIDED US THROUGH A PANDEMIC WHERE
19 REALLY TO BE A LEADER IN THAT SPACE AND TO BE ABLE TO
20 INCORPORATE WHAT WE HAVE LEARNED INTO OUR LONG-RANGE PLANNING
21 THAT IS NOW BEFORE US AS PLAN BARRIER 2050 PLUS, THAT IS --
22 THAT WAS UNDER YOUR WATCH. AND SO MUCH OF THE INSIGHT THAT YOU
23 BROUGHT AS A MAYOR OF A PROGRESSIVE TOWN BUT ALSO AS A
24 REGIONAL LEADER AND SOMEONE WHO HAS ALWAYS BOUGHT INTO, WE
25 WILL ALL SUCCEED IF WE DO IT ALL TOGETHER. THE NEXT PART THAT

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 I THINK IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT FOR THE WORK THAT WE DO AS A
2 REGION AND RIGHT NOW IN THIS MOMENT THAT WE FIND OURSELVES IN
3 CONSIDERING THE BAHFA HOUSING BOND MEASURE IS REALLY THE
4 HOUSING METHODOLOGY. AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT REALLY STANDS
5 OUT IN THIS -- THROUGH YOUR LEADERSHIP AND WORKING WITH OUR
6 HOUSING COMMITTEE CHAIR, WE REALLY LOOKED AT HAVING A
7 METHODOLOGY THAT REALLY INCORPORATED WHAT WE HADN'T DONE AS A
8 REGION BEFORE, ACKNOWLEDGING IT AND BEING ABLE TO HAVE AN
9 EQUITY ADJUSTMENT TO MOVE US FORWARD. WHILE IT WASN'T
10 NECESSARILY ON AN INDIVIDUAL JURISDICTIONAL BASIS, EASY TO
11 HANDLE, YOU REALLY LED US THROUGH IN MAKING ALL OF US BUY IN
12 REGIONALLY WE WILL DO BETTER IF WE ALL LOOK OUT FOR OUR
13 REGION. AND SO I REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THAT. YOU HAVE
14 BEEN A PERSON WHO HAS BEEN ABLE TO MANAGE ALL OF THE VARIOUS
15 ASPECTS THAT WE HAVE. AND BUDGET IS -- I SAY THAT LAST, BUT
16 THAT IS ACTUALLY ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS HERE AT ABAG
17 AS WE'VE GONE THROUGH THE CONSOLIDATION, AS WE LOOK AT
18 HONORING OUR OBLIGATIONS TO OUR CLOSED PENSION SYSTEM AND
19 BEING ABLE TO LOOK AT THAT. YOU HAVE -- YOU HAVE BEEN A
20 TREMENDOUS LEADER IN THAT SPACE AND ALWAYS WILLING TO LOOK AT
21 THINGS IN A NEW WAY. YOU HAVE BEEN A COUNCILMEMBER SINCE 2008.
22 THE CITY OF BERKELEY. AND YOU'VE BEEN MAYOR SINCE 2016 AND RE-
23 ELECTED IN 2020. AND I'M JUST GOING TO PUT A PIN IN THAT.
24 WHERE YOU ARE RIGHT NOW, WE MAY LOSE YOU HERE, BUT OUR LOSS
25 HERE IS REALLY OUR GAIN AT A LARGER LEVEL. SO I JUST WANT TO,

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 ON BEHALF OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AND THE STAFF OF MTC AND
2 ABAG, I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR EVERYTHING YOU HAVE DONE IN THE
3 REGION, AND WE WILL NOW PRESENT YOU WITH THE MOST BEAUTIFUL
4 GAVEL. AND APPRECIATION FOR EVERYTHING THAT YOU HAVE DONE FOR
5 OUR ORGANIZATION. THANK YOU? ARREGUIN: THANK YOU. [APPLAUSE]

6

7 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** I WOULD INVITE YOU TO SAY ANY WORDS. THIS
8 IS MOVING SEATS.

9

10 **VICE PRESIDENT, JESSE ARREGUIN:** WELL, I AM VERY TOUCHED BY
11 THAT RECOGNITION. THIS BEAUTIFUL AWARD. I GUESS YOU'RE ALWAYS
12 A CHAIR. SO THANK YOU FOR -- THANK YOU FOR THIS. IT'S REALLY
13 BEEN MY GREATEST HONOR TO NOT ONLY SERVE ON THIS BOARD, SERVE
14 WITH I THINK INCREDIBLE LEADERS IN THIS REGION, SUPERVISORS,
15 MAYORS, COUNCILMEMBERS, REALLY THINKING ABOUT THE NEEDS OF OUR
16 WHOLE REGION, OUR STATE. AND THE BAY AREA IS REALLY LEADING
17 THE STATE IN SO MANY WAYS AND THE WORK WE DO IN THIS BUILDING
18 WITH OUR INCREDIBLE STAFF IS REALLY AT THE CORE OF REALLY
19 TRANSFORMING THIS STATE AND THIS COUNTRY BUT TO WORK WITH
20 EXCEPTIONAL STAFF WHO EVERY DAY SHOW UP AND ARE SO DEDICATED
21 AND TALENTED. WE COULD NOT DO THE WORK THAT WE DO WITHOUT
22 THEM. AND IT HAS BEEN A VERY BUSY FOUR YEARS. AND I JUST WANT
23 TO THANK THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AND ALL THE ELECTED OFFICIALS IN
24 THE BAY AREA FOR ELECTING ME AND RE-ELECTING ME TO SERVE AS
25 PRESIDENT. TO BE ABLE TO HELP LEAD OUR AGENCY DURING A PERIOD

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 OF TRANSITION, NOT JUST TO HELP CONTINUE WITH THE
2 CONSOLIDATION OF OUR STAFF BUT TO MAKE SURE OUR BOARDS, MTC
3 AND ABAG, THAT WE'RE WORKING TO COME TOGETHER AND TO WORK
4 TOGETHER TO SOLVE SOME OF OUR BIG REGIONAL CHALLENGES. AND SO
5 THE WORK WE DID WITH OUR GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE, TO LOOK AT
6 CONSOLIDATING OUR COMMITTEES, THAT WE CAN HAVE SHARED
7 GOVERNANCE FOR THE BAY AREA WAS SOMETHING THAT AND I WERE
8 INVOLVED IN AND THEN THE PANDEMIC HAPPENED. WE HAVE TO NOT
9 ONLY LOOK AT THE SAFETY OF OUR STAFF AND HOW WE'RE GOING TO
10 CONTINUE TO CONDUCT OUR BUSINESS BUT ALSO HOW WE'RE GOING TO
11 ADDRESS THE CHALLENGES FACING OUR REGION DURING THIS PANDEMIC.
12 WE WERE PART OF A LISTENING TOUR THAT MET WITH LEADERS OF
13 MAJOR BUSINESS -- BUSINESS ORGANIZATIONS IN THE BAY AREA AND
14 GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT ARE THE CHALLENGES
15 FACING OUR REGION DURING THIS PANDEMIC AND WHAT ABOUT ECONOMIC
16 RECOVERIES. WE HOPE TO BRING IDEAS FORWARD WITH THE ONGOING
17 WORK OF THIS AGENCY BECAUSE THE RECOVERY STILL CONTINUES. AND
18 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION, WE GOT A NEAR UNANIMOUS
19 VOTE AS A BOARD TO APPROVE AT THE BAY AREA ARENA PLAN. THAT
20 WAS A TESTAMENT TO REALLY LISTEN TO EVERYONE AND REALLY TRY TO
21 BUILD CONSENSUS. AND THEN THE WORK WE DID TO PASS PLAN BARRIER
22 2050. THE WORK WE'RE DOING AROUND THE REGIONAL HOUSING
23 MEASURE. THERE ARE SO MANY BIG THINGS WE HAVE DONE DURING THE
24 LAST FOUR YEARS. I WAS PROUD TO PLAY A MAJOR ROLE IN HELPING
25 MOVE FORWARD AND TO BE ABLE TO CONTINUE ON THIS BOARD FOR THE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 NEXT 11 MONTHS TO HELP MOVE FORWARD AS WELL. SO IT'S BEEN A
2 REAL HONOR AND A REAL PRIVILEGE AND I WANT TO THANK THE STAFF,
3 THANK THE BOARD AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALL OF YOU
4 THE NEXT FEW MONTHS WORKING WITH HELPING OUR REGION AND THANK
5 YOU FOR THIS RECOGNITION, THANK YOU FOR THIS HONOR.

6

7 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. AT THIS TIME IF THERE ARE ANY
8 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBERS THAT HAVE ANY REMARKS, I WILL RELY ON
9 THE CLERK HERE TO TELL ME IF I HAVE ANYONE ON ZOOM WITH THE
10 RAISED HAND FEATURE. COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO.

11

12 **CARLOS ROMERO:** JUST A BRIEF ONE. I DIDN'T REALIZE YOU WERE
13 ELECTED THE YEAR I WAS ELECTED IN 2008. YOU ARE OBVIOUSLY
14 GOING PLACE I AM NOT. [LAUGHTER] I DID WANT TO SAY THROUGHOUT
15 THE ENTIRE TIME THAT I SERVED WITH YOU -- THAT YOU HAVE
16 ALLOWED ME TO ACTUALLY SERVE ON COMMITTEES, YOU HAVE BEEN
17 VERY, VERY DELIBERATE IN TRYING TO OPEN UP COMMITTEES TO
18 WOMEN, TO PEOPLE OF COLOR, TO MAKE SURE THERE ARE DIVERSITY ON
19 THOSE BODIES. I'VE SEEN YOU DELIBERATE AND YOU ASKED ME, WHAT
20 DO I THINK ABOUT THIS PERSON? HOW COULD WE WIDEN THE -- FOR
21 LACK OF A BETTER TERM -- COMPLEXION OF A PARTICULAR BODY, AND
22 YOU WERE DELIBERATE ABOUT IT. I THINK IT IS THE ONLY WAY WE
23 ACTUALLY GET TO A PLACE WHERE SOCIETY, OUR INSTITUTIONS THAT
24 PROVIDE ADVICE AND GOVERN US ACTUALLY ARE REPRESENTATIVE OF
25 THE PEOPLE WHO LIVE HERE. SO I THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT.

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 AND REALLY HAVE LEARNED QUITE A LOT IN TERMS OF THE WAY YOU
2 LED IN ALL THESE AREAS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND.

5

6 **PAT EKLUND:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO JOIN IN GIVING JESSE AN
7 INCREDIBLE EXPRESSION OF APPRECIATION. I HAVE BEEN ON THE ABAG
8 EXECUTIVE BOARD FOR QUITE A WHILE. AND JESSE, YOU'RE ONE OF
9 THE REALLY FIRST PRESIDENTS THAT I HAVE SEEN WHERE YOU HAVE
10 BEEN FAIR, VERY THOUGHTFUL, AND VERY INCLUSIVE. I REALLY LOVE
11 HOW YOU ENGAGE PEOPLE ON THE BOARD AND YOU'RE JUST -- YOU'RE
12 GREAT. I LOVE SERVING ON THIS BOARD WITH YOU. AND REALLY GLAD
13 THAT YOU JOINED ABAG IN A LEADERSHIP ROLE AND HELPED MOVE US
14 THROUGH. THAT WHOLE PANDEMIC THING WAS A MESS, BUT YOU KEPT US
15 TOGETHER, AND WE WERE ABLE TO GET THROUGH IT ALL TOGETHER,
16 TOO. AND THEN ALLOWING US TO DO THIS REMOTELY -- AS SOME OF
17 YOU MAY KNOW, I AM GOING TO NEED A HIP REPLACEMENT, AND SO
18 DOING REMOTE PARTICIPATION HAS ALLOWED ME TO STILL PARTICIPATE
19 AND BE ENGAGED AND JUST WANT TO THANK YOU, JESSE, FOR REALLY
20 ENCOURAGING THAT AS WE CONTINUE WITH THE GOVERNANCE THROUGHOUT
21 THE WHOLE REGION SO THANK YOU FOR YOUR TREMENDOUS WORK.

22

23 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND I -- THIS WAS A
24 MOMENT IN TIME TO SAY THANK YOU FOR WHAT YOU HAVE DONE OVER
25 THE LAST FOUR YEARS AND WE ARE IN GREAT APPRECIATION AND WE'RE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 BETTER OFF FOR IT AND SUPERVISOR RABBITT GETS TO SERVE HIS
2 POST AS IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT FOR A WHILE LONGER. AT THIS
3 TIME I WILL ASK THE CLERK IF THERE WAS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
4 RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO COMMENT RECEIVED. IN THE
7 ZOOM ATTENDEE SPACE, THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THERE
8 FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU.

9

10 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. NEXT, WE
11 WILL BE MOVING ON TO ITEM 4-B AND THE EXECUTIVE BOARD HAS THE
12 OPPORTUNITY TO RECOGNIZE AND ACKNOWLEDGE THE DEDICATION AND
13 CONTRIBUTION TO THE WORK DONE BY THE ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA
14 GOVERNMENTS BY ONE OF THE LONGEST SERVING STAFF MEMBERS ON THE
15 OCCASION OF HER RETIREMENT FROM THE METROPOLITAN
16 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. I WILL ALLOW LEAH ZIPPERT TO PLEASE
17 STEP TO THE PODIUM. AND -- WHY? NO. JUST KIDDING. WHY ARE YOU
18 LEAVING US? BUT WHAT A WELL-DESERVED RETIREMENT AND I WANT TO
19 TAKE THIS OPPORTUNITY TO READ A FEW EXCERPTS FROM THE
20 RESOLUTION, A JOINT ABAG-MTC RESOLUTION FOR YOU. BECAUSE IT'S
21 TREMENDOUS THAT SOMEONE IS IN PUBLIC SERVICE BUT ALSO REGIONAL
22 PUBLIC SERVICE BECAUSE BACK WHEN YOU STARTED IN THIS, IT
23 WASN'T COOL. IT'S COOL NOW. BUT IT WASN'T COOL THEN. SO I
24 THINK THAT THAT REALLY BEARS ACKNOWLEDGMENT. SO WHEREAS, LEAH
25 ZIPPERT IS RETIRING AFTER 23 YEARS OF DEDICATED AND

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 OUTSTANDING SERVICE TO THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
2 COMMISSION AND THE ASSOCIATION OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS AS A
3 COMMUNICATIONS, PUBLIC INFORMATION, LANGUAGE AND LOGISTICS
4 EXPERT. AND WHEREAS, LEAH BEGAN WORKING AT ABAG IN 2000 AS A
5 COMMUNICATIONS OFFICER, WAS PROMOTED TO SENIOR COMMUNICATIONS
6 OFFICER IN 2015, AND JOINED MTC AS SENIOR PUBLIC INFORMATION
7 OFFICER IN 2017. AS A SIDE NOTE, THAT MAKES YOU ABAG O.G.
8 BECAUSE YOU WERE WITH THE ORIGINAL CREW BEFORE CONSOLIDATION.
9 WHEREAS, AS AN ORGANIZER AND ORCHESTRATOR OF THE ABAG GENERAL
10 ASSEMBLY MEETINGS FOR OVER 20 YEARS, LEAH THOUGHTFULLY PLANNED
11 AND SEAMLESSLY EXECUTED OVER 30 ASSEMBLIES, DURING WHICH TIME
12 SHE LARGELY ESTABLISHED THE "VOICE" OF ABAG COMMUNICATIONS.
13 AND WHEREAS, LEAH'S WORK ON HOUSING GREATLY CONTRIBUTED TO
14 ABAG AND MTC WINNING THE AWARD OF EXCELLENCE FOR THE RHTA
15 PROGRAM IN THE PLANNING AGENCY CATEGORY AS PART OF THE
16 AMERICAN PLANNING ORGANIZATIONS CALIFORNIA AND NORTHERN
17 SECTION AWARDS PROGRAM. AND WHEREAS, LEAH GRACED THE WORKPLACE
18 WITH AMAZING OUTFITS AND CREATIVE JEWELRY, PROVIDING MUCH-
19 NEEDED POPS OF COLOR AND ORIGINAL NATIONALITY TO OFTEN DRAB
20 OFFICE HALLS. AND WHEREAS, THE BAY AREA NATIVE BORN IS IN SAN
21 FRANCISCO AFTER GROWING UP IN REDWOOD CITY AND SAN MATEO WITH
22 A BRIEF SOJOURN IN SANTA ROSA, NOW SETTLED IN OAKLAND, LEAH'S
23 PERSONAL CONNECTION TO THE REGION SHE SERVES IS EVIDENT IN THE
24 QUALITY AND PASSION FOR HER WORK. NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT
25 RESOLVED -- THANKS, LEAH, FOR HER 23 YEARS OF SERVICE TO THE

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 AGENCY AND TO THE PEOPLE OF THE BAY AREA HEREBY AUTHORIZE HER
2 TO INTEGRATE THE OXFORD COMMA BACK INTO HER WRITING. WE ARE
3 GOING TO TALK ABOUT THAT. WE WISH LEAH, HER HUSBAND CHRIS, AND
4 HER CHILDREN ANDREW AND KATHERINE A VERY HEALTHY, HAPPY, AND
5 WELL-DESERVED NEXT CHAPTER THAT MAY INCLUDE TRAVEL ON THE WEST
6 COAST, HOUSE PROJECTS, NOTIONS BOTH SUING-RELATED AND
7 PHILOSOPHICAL, AND ENJOYING TIME TOGETHER AS A FAMILY.
8 CONGRATULATIONS ON YOUR RETIREMENT, LEAH. THANK YOU. 23 YEARS.
9 [APPLAUSE]

10

11 **LEAH ZIPPERT:** THANK YOU FOR EVERYONE ON ZOOM AND IN THE
12 AUDIENCE. I APPRECIATE IT. FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU, MA'AM
13 PRESIDENT. IT'S BEEN A WHILE SINCE I COULD SAY THAT. THANK
14 YOU, BOARD MEMBERS. MY FIRST JOB OUT OF COLLEGE WAS WORKING AT
15 AN UNPAID INTERNSHIP AT THIS ORGANIZATION CALLED THE ESTUARY
16 PROJECT. WRITING A FACT SHEET ABOUT THEIR GOVERNMENT PARTNERS.
17 WHO KNEW THAT THAT WOULD SHAPE THE REST OF MY WORKING LIFE?
18 CERTAINLY NOT ME. I WENT ON TO DO PUBLIC PARTICIPATION. I WAS
19 A CONSULTANT FOR TWO CALIFORNIA STATE AGENCIES AND THEN WORKED
20 DOING MARKETING AND P.R. FOR ARCHITECTS AND ENGINEERS. WHEN I
21 STARTED AT ABAG IN 2000 WITH AN ACTUAL PAYCHECK, I HAD NO IDEA
22 I WOULD BE HERE IN 2024 RETIRING. IT WAS GOING TO BE A GOING
23 BACK TO MY ROOTS JOB, BUT I DIDN'T KNOW THAT IT WOULD BE MY
24 CAREER. ONE OF MY VERY FIRST PROJECTS AT ABAG WAS TO EDIT AND
25 THEN WORK WITH GRAPHIC DEPARTMENT TO PRINT THIS HANDBOOK

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 ENTITLED "BLUEPRINT FOR HOUSING", A GUIDE FOR LOCAL
2 GOVERNMENTS IN IMPLEMENTING THE REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS
3 ALLOCATION. AND HERE WE ARE 23 YEARS LATER AND I'M STILL
4 EDITING DOCUMENTS ON HOW TO IMPLEMENT THAT WITH THE VERY SAME
5 PLANNING CONSULTANTS. [LAUGHTER] AT LEAST NOW WE'VE BEEN ABLE
6 TO DO MUCH MORE TO ASSIST LOCAL GOVERNMENTS WITH THE REGIONAL
7 HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM. PRODUCTS SUCH AS THE 32
8 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WEBINARS THAT I HELPED PRODUCE OVER THE
9 LAST THREE YEARS NOW DRAW PLANNERS AROUND THE STATE AS WELL AS
10 THE REGION. ALONG THE WAY, I WORKED WITH 10 ABAG PRESIDENTS,
11 11 AS OF TODAY, FROM THROUGHOUT THE REGION, SIX EXECUTIVE
12 DIRECTORS, AND MANY, MANY AMAZING PEOPLE FROM THROUGHOUT THE -
13 - ON A VARIETY OF PROJECTS THROUGHOUT THE AGENCY. THE ODDEST
14 PROJECTS I EVER WORKED ON WAS THE SEWER SUMMIT AND ITS
15 ASSOCIATED GUIDE BOOK WHERE WE PROVIDED INFORMATION ABOUT FREE
16 SEWER POP-UPS. TO JURISDICTIONS RESIDENTS. YES. SEWER POP-UPS.
17 ALSO KNOWN AS BACK FLOW DEVICES. I'LL PAUSE -- ALTHOUGH I
18 PROBABLY DON'T NEED TO -- TO ALLOW YOU TO THINK ABOUT WHAT
19 THAT REALLY IS. I ALSO WORKED ON 36 GENERAL ASSEMBLIES AND
20 THREE SPECIAL GENERAL ASSEMBLIES. THESE DISCUSSED EVERYTHING
21 FROM ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT, WATER AND LAND USE PLANNING, INDIAN
22 AND GAMING IN THE BAY AREA TO PLAN BAY AREA, ENERGY
23 EFFICIENCY, AND, OF COURSE, HOUSING. MANY, MANY TIMES. OTHER
24 THAN SOME INCLUDED THE ABAG 40TH ANNIVERSARY, THE JOINT ABAG
25 AND MTC ABAG'S 50th AND MTC'S 40th AND THE 60th PARTIES WHICH

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 MAKES IT SEEM LIKE I HAVE BEEN AT ABAG WAY LONGER THAN I
2 ACTUALLY HAVE. WHEN I STARTED MY HUSBAND AND I HAD BEEN
3 MARRIED FOR SIX YEARS AND WERE DINKS IN PLANNING SPEAKS LIVING
4 OFF PIEDMONT AVENUE IN OAKLAND. WE WILL BE CELEBRATING OUR
5 30th ANNIVERSARY LATER THIS YEAR AND HAVE TWO CHILDREN, ONE A
6 JUNIOR IN HIGH SCHOOL AND ANOTHER A JUNIOR IN COLLEGE. WE
7 GAINED OUR OWN FAMILY ALONG THE WAY AND LOST OUR PARENTS. WE
8 WERE FEDDED BY THE GOOD TIMES BY MY WORK COLLEAGUES AND
9 SUPPORTED DURING THE CHALLENGING TIMES. I KNOW MY CAREER HERE
10 WAS A GOOD FIT FOR THIS SELF-DECLARED GOVERNMENT AND POLICY
11 WONK. IT HAS BEEN MY PRIVILEGE AND MY HONOR TO WORK IN
12 REGIONAL GOVERNMENT FOR THE BAY AREA. I THINK I MADE AN
13 EXCELLENT CHOICE TO COME BACK TO THE AGENCY AND THEN TO STAY
14 WITH THE AGENCIES AS I WANTED TO MAKE A DIFFERENCE. I'M
15 LOOKING FORWARD TO SPENDING MY DAY-TO-DAY A LITTLE BIT
16 DIFFERENTLY, BUT I WILL FONDLY REMEMBER MY TIME HERE AND THE
17 PEOPLE I WORKED WITH. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. [APPLAUSE]

18

19 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** I WILL ASK YOU TO STAY HERE FOR JUST A
20 LITTLE BIT BECAUSE WE DO GET TO SAY NICE THINGS TO YOU. I WILL
21 NOW CALL UPON MY COLLEAGUES. I SEE COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND.

22

23 **PAT EKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, PRESIDENT RAMOS. I HAVE TO
24 SAY, LEAH, I THINK WE WORKED TOGETHER FOR -- IT'S BEEN OVER A
25 DECADE, MAYBE CLOSE TO TWO. I'M NOT QUITE SURE. I JUST HAVE --

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 I WANTED TO DO A SHOUT-OUT ON ALL THE CONTRIBUTIONS YOU MADE
2 TO ABAG. AND I ALSO WANTED TO RECOGNIZE THAT YOUR -- YOU HAVE
3 ALWAYS HAD A GREAT ABILITY TO WORK WITH A LOT OF DIFFERENT
4 PEOPLE. ANSWERED CHALLENGING QUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT IS ABAG AND
5 ARE WE REALLY DOING ENOUGH AND ARE WE DOING TOO MUCH. I JUST
6 REALLY HAVE BEEN JUST BLESSED TO BE ABLE TO HAVE WORKED WITH
7 YOU AND, FRANKLY, GOING TO MISS YOU A LOT. EVEN THOUGH WE
8 HAVEN'T SEEN EACH OTHER A LOT OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS SINCE
9 THE PANDEMIC. BUT JUST CONGRATULATIONS ON WHAT A SUCCESSFUL
10 CAREER YOU'VE HAD. AND BESIDES THAT, YOU'RE A WONDERFUL PERSON
11 AND I REALLY ENJOYED WORKING WITH YOU A LOT. HAVE FUN IN
12 RETIREMENT. THERE IS LIFE AFTER WORK. I WORK, AS YOU KNOW, FOR
13 THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT FOR 43 YEARS, SEVEN MONTHS AND 11 DAYS
14 BUT WHO'S COUNTING. THAT THERE'S -- THERE'S ANOTHER LIFE THERE
15 FOR YOU. YOU'RE GOING TO ENJOY EVERY MINUTE OF IT. JUST KEEP
16 GOING. LOVE YOU A LOT, LEAH. AND GOOD LUCK.

17

18 **LEAH ZIPPERT:** THANK YOU, PAT.

19

20 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER OF OUR COLLEAGUES?

21

22 **V. PRES., JESSE ARREGUIN:** VERY SAD YOU'RE LEAVING BUT YOU MADE
23 SUCH AN IMPACT HERE. ALL THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY LEASE AND ALL
24 THE EVENTS -- ASSEMBLIES AND ALL THE EVENTS WE DO, SHE'S THE
25 PERSON THAT MAKES IT HAPPEN. AND IS REALLY THE CORE OF ALL OF

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 OUR COMMUNICATIONS, ALL THE INFORMATION WE'RE PUTTING OUT TO
2 THE COMMUNITY AND WE HAD A LOT OF BIG INITIATIVES THAT WE
3 WORKED ON OVER THE PAST SEVERAL YEARS AND YOU'VE REALLY BEEN
4 LEADING ALL THOSE THINGS. I REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR
5 DEDICATION, YOUR PROFESSIONALISM, AND YOUR COMMITMENT TO
6 REGIONALISM IN THE BAY AREA. AND I JUST WANT TO WISH YOU ALL
7 THE BEST IN YOUR RETIREMENT AND JUST THANK YOU, YOU KNOW. I
8 NEVER HAD TO WORRY ABOUT HAVING TO WRITE A SPEECH BECAUSE LEAH
9 ALWAYS HAD ONE READY TO GO. [LAUGHTER] AND JUST DID -- ALWAYS
10 DID SUCH AN INCREDIBLE JOB, NOT JUST HELPING US ORGANIZE ALL
11 OF OUR PUBLIC FACING COMMUNICATIONS BUT HELPING ORGANIZE A LOT
12 OF OUR MAJOR EVENTS THAT WE HAD. TO BRING ALL THE DELEGATES
13 AND ELECTED OFFICIALS TOGETHER AND ALWAYS DOING SO WITH GREAT
14 PROFESSIONALISM AND JUST REALLY WANT TO THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR
15 ALL YOUR WORK. IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE TO WORK WITH YOU.

16
17 **LEAH ZIPPERT:** THANK YOU.

18
19 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. SO NOW IF YOU'LL BEAR WITH US,
20 WE HAVE SOME TECHNICALITIES. AND THEN VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN
21 AND MYSELF HAVE SOMETHING TO PRESENT TO YOU. NEXT, I WILL ASK,
22 DO I HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO ADOPT ABAG RESOLUTION
23 NUMBER 1, 2024?

24
25 **PAT EKLUND:** I'LL MOVE IT. PAT EKLUND.

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** WE HAVE A MOTION BY SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS
3 AND SECOND BY COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND. ROLL CALL, PLEASE. BEFORE
4 I GET THERE, PUBLIC COMMENT.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED FOR
7 THIS ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARD ROOM FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AND
8 IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC FOR
9 COMMENT. IT'S MY PRIVILEGE TO CALL THE ROLL ON THIS MOTION.
10 VICE MAYOR ADAMS.

11

12 **SUSAN ADAMS:** YES.

13

14 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE. COUNCILMEMBER BAS IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
15 CARLSON IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER COHEN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
16 CORZO IS ABSENT. COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND.

17

18 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR ELLENBERG IS ABSENT.
21 COUNCILMEMBER FIFE. COUNCILMEMBER FIFE IS ABSENT. OH, THANK
22 YOU. I'LL TAKE THAT AS A YES. MAYOR GARCIA.

23

24 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

25

20

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DIRECTOR HILLIS IS ABSENT. VICE MAYOR
2 KAMEI.

3

4 **ROSEMARY KAMEI:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR LEE.

7

8 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
11 MARQUEZ.

12

13 **ELISA MARQUEZ:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER MARTINEZ-BELTRAN IS ABSENT.
16 SUPERVISOR MILEY IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MOTOYAMA.

17

18 **LISA MOTOYAMA:** AYE.

19

20 **CATHERINE MOY:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. VICE MAYOR NAGALES. VICE MAYOR
23 NAGALES. IS ABSENT.

24

25 **SPEAKER:** NO, HE'S HERE.

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** VICE MAYOR NAGALES IS AN AYE.

3 COUNCILMEMBER ORTIZ IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RABBITT IS ABSENT.

4 SUPERVISOR RAMOS.

5

6 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

7

8 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** OAKLAND IS HAVING TECHNICAL PROBLEMS.

9 COUNCILMEMBER BOS VOTES AYE. SUPERVISOR SACKETT.

10

11 **MARY SACKETT:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER TIEDEMANN IS ABSENT.

14 COUNCILMEMBER WILLIAMS.

15

16 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** YES. COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ.

17

18 **COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ:** YES.

19

20 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THE PRESENTATION OF THE RESOLUTION. I

21 CANNOT PROMISE THAT ALL MEETINGS WILL BE THIS FUN. [LAUGHTER]

22 WE WILL NOW MOVE ON TO ITEM 5 AND IT'S OUR EXECUTIVE

23 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. AND WITH THAT, GIVE THE REPORT.

24

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU, PRESIDENT RAMOS AND WELCOME TO YOUR
2 NEW ROLE. AND I ALSO JUST WANTED TO NOTE THAT IT IS VERY
3 BITTERSWEET TO BE SAYING GOODBYE TO LEAH BUT WE ARE GOING TO
4 CELEBRATE HER BEGIN NEXT WEEK AT MTC AND WE WILL HAVE A FUN
5 WAY TO THANK HER FOR HER PRESENTATION. I ALSO JUST FROM THE
6 STAFF PERSPECTIVE WANT TO DEEPLY APPRECIATE THE LEADERSHIP OF
7 I GUESS NOW VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. I DON'T KNOW WHAT TO CALL
8 YOU. BUT THANK YOU. EVERYTHING THAT WAS STATED, OBVIOUSLY,
9 FROM A STAFF PERSPECTIVE, YOU KNOW, LEADING US THROUGH THE
10 PANDEMIC. ALSO EXECUTIVE LEADERSHIP CHANGES. HOW YOU MADE
11 YOURSELF AVAILABLE EVEN THOUGH YOU HAD ABOUT A THOUSAND THINGS
12 GOING ON, YOU WERE ALWAYS AVAILABLE FOR, YOU KNOW, RESPONSES
13 TO STAFF AND STRATEGY SESSIONS WHEN NEEDED SO I JUST REALLY
14 WANTED TO LEND MY VOICE TO THE APPRECIATION AND WE'RE EXCITED
15 YOU'RE PROVIDING CONTINUITY AS YOU ALL SWITCH YOUR SEATS AND
16 WE ARE EXCITED, PRESIDENT RAMOS, AS YOU TACKLE SOME REALLY
17 IMPORTANT TOPICS THIS YEAR WITH THE HOUSING BOND AND PLAN
18 BARRIER UPDATE. I WILL NOTE SEVERAL THINGS IN THE EXECUTIVE
19 DIRECTOR'S REPORT. THE FIRST TWO HAVE TO DO WITH THE BAY AREA
20 HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY AND SOME VERY EXCITING FIRSTS. ONE
21 IS THE LAUNCH OF THE FIRST CAPITAL PROGRAM. SO IN NOVEMBER,
22 BAHFA DID LAUNCH ITS FIRST LOAN PROGRAM THAT WILL REALLY HELP
23 WITH THE CONSTRUCTION OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING ON PROPERTIES THAT
24 HAVE REALLY BEEN IDENTIFIED BY LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AND WE ARE
25 CALLING PRIORITY SITES AND THIS WILL MAKE AVAILABLE \$28

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 MILLION THAT WAS MADE AVAILABLE FROM THE STATE AND WE'RE
2 REALLY LOOKING TO BORROWERS THAT ARE ABLE TO START
3 CONSTRUCTION QUICKLY WITHIN 24 MONTHS AND THERE WILL BE LOANS
4 UP TO \$5 MILLION. SO EVERYTHING COUNTS WITH THE HOUSING
5 CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE. WANT TO NOTE THAT. BAHFA AWARDED THE
6 \$5 MILLION TO HELP NAPA COUNTY SENIORS AVOID HOMELESSNESS. SO
7 THIS IS ANOTHER PILOT PROGRAM. IT WILL PROVIDE A LOT OF
8 ASSISTANCE FOR SENIORS FACING HOMELESSNESS IN NAPA COUNTY BUT
9 THEN ALSO PROVIDE SOME REALLY -- SOMETHING WE CAN HOPEFULLY
10 SCALE AS BAHFA HAS MORE MONEY AND HELP OTHERS. IT WILL HELP BY
11 SUBSIDIZING RENT BY UP TO 48 MONTHS SO THIS WILL BE REALLY
12 IMPORTANT AS SENIORS ARE SECURING LONG-TERM HOUSING. LOOKING
13 AHEAD, WE ARE EXCITED TO BRING BACK THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY
14 CONFERENCE THAT WE TYPICALLY HOLD EVERY TWO YEARS. THAT WILL
15 BE HELD IN EARLY -- OR MID-MARCH. MARCH 12 AND 13.
16 REGISTRATION IS OPEN AND WE HAVE SOME EXCITING SPEAKERS,
17 INCLUDING THE SECRETARY OF THE CALIFORNIA E.P.A. AND THE
18 E.P.A. REGION 9 ADMINISTRATOR. AND LASTLY, YOUR REPORT JUST
19 RE-EMPHASIZES WHAT PRESIDENT RAMOS MENTIONS, THAT WE HOPE TO
20 SEE YOU AS MANY IN MARCH SO WE WILL HAVE A FOCUSED INFORMATION
21 SESSION ON THE REGIONAL HOUSING BOND AND WE THINK IT WILL BE A
22 GOOD OPPORTUNITY TO ASK QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS, HEAR FROM A
23 SPEAKER AND WE WILL BE PROVIDING SOME LIGHT REFRESHMENTS
24 BEFORE AND AFTER IF THAT HELPS YOU GET TO THE METRO CENTER SO
25 THAT CONCLUDES MY REPORT. THANK YOU.

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, MS. BOCKELMAN. IS THERE
3 ANY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR DISCUSSION? DISCUSSION, QUESTIONS? DO
4 NOT SEE ANY. IF THE CLERK CAN CONFIRM JUST MAKE SURE I AM NOT
5 MISSING ANY SCREEN.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE ARE NO EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS IN ZOOM
8 WITH HANDS RAISED.

9

10 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** NEXT. WE DO HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
11 SUBMITTED FOR THIS ITEM, IS THAT CORRECT?

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** CORRECT. NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE
14 BOARD ROOM OR ATTENDEE SPACE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

15

16 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** EXCELLENT. THE NEXT IS OUR CONSENT ITEM
17 AND THAT IS 6-A. DO WE HAVE A MOTION? SECOND?

18

19 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I MOVE WE MOVE, ROMERO.

20

21 **LEON GARCIA:** SECOND.

22

23 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** MOTION BY ROMERO AND SECOND BY GARCIA. IS
24 THERE DISCUSSION AMONG THE BOARD? SEEING NONE, I'LL ASK FOR
25 PUBLIC COMMENT?

25

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS. IN THE
3 BOARD ROOM, NO MEMBERS. IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBER OF
4 THE PUBLIC FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

5

6 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. I'LL CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT AND
7 ASK THE CLERK TO CALL THE ROLL.

8

9 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR ADAMS.

10

11 **SUSAN ADAMS:** YES.

12

13 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR ARREGUIN.

16

17 **V. PRES., JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

18

19 **NIKKI FORTUNATO BAS:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR CARLSON IS ABSENT.
22 COUNCILMEMBER COHEN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR CORZO IS ABSENT.
23 COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND.

24

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE. SPOKE SUPERVISOR ELLENBERG IS ABSENT.
2 COUNCILMEMBER FIFE. I SEE THAT SHE'S BEHIND YOU THERE. AND SHE
3 IS WAVING. AYE. THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER -- MAYOR GARCIA.

4

5 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DIRECTOR HILLIS IS ABSENT. VICE MAYOR
8 KAMEI.

9

10 **ROSEMARY KAMEI:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR LEE.

13

14 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS ABSENT.
17 SUPERVISOR MARQUEZ.

18

19 **ELISA MARQUEZ:** AYE. APOLOGIZE.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER MARTINEZ-BELTRAN
22 IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR MILEY IS ABSENT. MAYOR MOTOYAMA.

23

24 **LISA MOTOYAMA:** AYE.

25

27

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **CATHERINE MOY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** YES. VICE MAYOR NAGALES.

4

5 **MARK NAGALES:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER ORTIZ IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR

8 RABBITT IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RAMOS.

9

10 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER REID.

13

14 **TREVA REID:** AYE.

15

16 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR SACKETT -- SORRY, SUPERVISOR

19 SACKETT.

20

21 **MARY SACKETT:** YES.

22

23 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

24

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER TIEDEMANN IS ABSENT.

2 SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS.

3

4 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COLLECTOR GLUCKSTEIN. MOTION PASSES

7 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. WE WILL MOVE ON TO ITEM

10 7-A UNDER THE EXECUTIVE BOARD AGENDA. THIS IS THE ABAG

11 COMMITTEE REPORT FOR JANUARY 18, 2024. THE ABAG COMMITTEE MET

12 JOINTLY WITH THE MTC ON DECEMBER 8. PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA

13 GRANT PROGRAM, MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE APPROVAL TO RELEASE

14 PROJECTS FOR THE PRIORITY CONSERVATION AREA. THE PCA GRANT

15 PROGRAM. THE ITEM ALSO SUMMARIZED THE PROGRAM'S HISTORY AND

16 OUTLINE PROPOSED PRIORITIES. THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE

17 MET JOINTLY WITH THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE ON JANUARY 12,

18 2024. THEY RECEIVED THE FOLLOWING REPORT. TRANSPORTATION

19 ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVES 2023 TRANSIT STATION, PUBLIC

20 CHARGING GRANT AWARD RECOMMENDATIONS OF \$10 MILLION. MTC

21 COMMISSION APPROVAL OF \$10 MILLION IN GRANTS TO SUPPORT THE

22 DEPLOYMENT OF ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS, TRANSIT

23 STATIONS AS PART OF THE CLIMATE PROGRAM ELECTRIFYING

24 INVESTMENTS TO ADVANCE PLAN BAY AREA 2050. THE ADMINISTRATIVE

25 COMMITTEE AND MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE APPROVED 2050-PLUS DRAFT

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 BLUEPRINTS, STRATEGIES AND UPDATE ON THE 2050 DRAFT BLUEPRINT
2 INCLUDING STRATEGIES AND GROWTH GEOGRAPHIES AS WELL AS NEXT
3 STEPS FOR LONG RANGE REGIONAL PLANNING IN 2024. THIS CONCLUDES
4 THE COMMITTEE REPORT. IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION BY EXECUTIVE
5 BOARD MEMBERS? SEEING NONE, I WILL ASK IF THERE IS PUBLIC
6 COMMENT. MR. CLERK.

7

8 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED.
9 IN THE BOARD ROOM, NO MEMBER. IN THE ZOOM SPACE, THERE ARE NO
10 MEMBERS THERE IN THE ATTENDEES' ROOM FOR COMMENT.

11

12 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. NEXT, WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM 8-A
13 AND ASK VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN TO GIVE THE REPORT.

14

15 **V. PRES., JESSE ARREGUIN:** I WILL GIVE YOU THE REPORT ON
16 DECEMBER 8, 2023 AND JANUARY 12, 2024. THE JOINT COMMITTEE MET
17 ON DECEMBER 8, 2023 AND RECEIVED THE FOLLOWING REPORT. WE
18 RECEIVED A VOTE OF SURVEY REPORT ON A POTENTIAL -- POTENTIAL
19 REVENUE MEASURES TO ADDRESS OUR REGION'S TRANSPORTATION NEEDS.
20 WE RECEIVED AN ANALYSIS OF A POLL CONDUCTED BY EMC RESEARCH
21 WHICH EXAMINED VOTER OPINIONS ON TRANSPORTATION FUNDING
22 MEASURES. GENERAL CONCERNS AND PRIORITIES AND PERCEPTIONS OF
23 TRANSPORTATION TO INFORM A FEATURE JOINT TRANSPORTATION
24 MEASURE ENABLING LEGISLATION. I DEFINITELY ENCOURAGE YOU TO
25 TAKE A LOOK AT THAT PRESENTATION. WE ALSO RECEIVED AN UPDATE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 ON A POTENTIAL 2026 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE,
2 INCLUDING BACKGROUND ON POTENTIAL FORM CONCEPTS THAT COULD
3 ACCOMPANY ENABLING LEGISLATION AND UPDATE ON PREPARATIONS FOR
4 MTC-ABAG'S 2024 SACRAMENT IN WASHINGTON, D.C., LEGACY ADVOCACY
5 TRIP. THEY MET ON JANUARY 12, 2024 AND RECEIVED THE FOLLOWING
6 REPORTS. OVERSEE ON THE GOVERNOR'S 2024-2025 STATE BUDGET
7 PROPOSAL. INCLUDING PLANNED TRANSIT INVESTMENTS AND CHANGES TO
8 HOUSING AND RESILIENCE FUNDS. WE RECEIVED A PRESENTATION AND
9 PROVIDED DIRECTION ON POTENTIAL ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A
10 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. AND MTC WILL TAKE
11 ACTION ON THAT I BELIEVE THIS MONTH. AND ALSO, APPROVED THE
12 FINAL JOINT MTC-ABAG ADVOCACY PROGRAM WHICH IS ITEM 8-B ON OUR
13 AGENDA. THAT CONCLUDES OUR REPORT AND I'LL ASK IF THERE ARE
14 ANY QUESTIONS. OKAY.

15
16 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** DO I SEE ANY QUESTIONS ON THIS ITEM, 8-A,
17 IF WE CAN HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT.

18
19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS. IN THE
20 BOARD ROOM, NO MEMBERS. IN THE ATTENDEE ZOOM SPACE, NOBODY
21 THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU.

22
23 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. NOW, MR. VICE
24 PRESIDENT, ITEM 8-B ON OUR JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM, PLEASE, THE
25 REPORT.

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **V. PRES., JESSE ARREGUIN:** OKAY. NEXT UNDER OUR AGENDA ITEM 8-B
3 IS THE PROPOSED FINAL 2024 MTV/ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM.
4 THIS IS THE STATE AND FEDERAL LEVEL. THEY RECOMMENDED
5 EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVAL. JUST WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A FEW THINGS.
6 SPECIFICALLY WE INCLUDED A LOT OF THE PRIORITIES THAT WE
7 INCLUDED IN OUR PRIOR ADVOCACY PROGRAM WITH A FEW CHANGES.
8 ADVOCATING TO MAINTAIN STATE TRANSIT FUNDING COMMITMENTS THAT
9 WERE MADE AS PART OF THE BUDGET DEAL LAST YEAR. ENGAGING IN
10 ONGOING CONVERSATIONS ON HOW TO ADDRESS TRANSIT OPERATING
11 FUNDS FOR THE REGION. ENGAGING IN EFFORTS AROUND ACA-1 AND
12 THEN ENGAGING DISCUSSIONS TO OUR REGIONAL NEEDS ALLOCATION
13 PROCESS. THERE WILL BE SOME CLEANUP LEGISLATION THAT THE
14 LEGISLATURE WILL BE MOVING FORWARD AROUND THE ARENA PROCESS. I
15 ALSO WANT TO HIGHLIGHT SOMETHING I MENTIONED AT THE JOINT
16 COMMITTEE THAT IS PART OF THE GOVERNOR'S JANUARY BUDGET.
17 INCLUDED SOME PRETTY SIGNIFICANT CUTS TO A VARIETY OF CRITICAL
18 HOUSING PROGRAMS. THE IMAGE P PROGRAM. FOR EXAMPLE, AND THESE
19 ARE PROGRAMS THAT ARE NONPROFIT PROVIDERS AND LOCAL
20 GOVERNMENTS RELY ON TO BE ABLE TO HELP MAKE AFFORDABLE HOUSING
21 PROJECTS PENCILLED. SO THIS PLATFORM DOES PROVIDE THE
22 OPPORTUNITY FOR OUR AGENCY TO JOIN HOUSING ADVOCATES AND OTHER
23 PARTNERS IN THE REGION AND THE STATE TO ADVOCATE FOR THE
24 RESTORATION OF THOSE CRITICAL FUNDS. AND JUST WANT TO CALL
25 ATTENTION TO THAT AS WELL. SO WITH THAT I WILL MAKE A MOTION

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 WE APPROVE THE PROPOSED FINAL 2024 MTC/ABAG JOINT ADVOCACY
2 PROGRAM.

3

4 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND BY MAYOR
5 ADAMS. IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION? COUNCILMEMBER
6 EKLUND.

7

8 **PAT EKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, PRESIDENT RAMOS. I WANTED TO
9 JUST ALSO MAKE A COMMENT AND I DON'T KNOW IF IT WILL
10 NECESSITATE ANY CHANGES. BUT I JUST WANTED TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT
11 THE NUMBER THREE, ADVANCING THE HOUSING INITIATIVES, I THINK
12 IT'S NUMBER C THAT'S ON THE LIST OF THE -- PART OF THE
13 ADVOCACY PORTION OF IT. WHAT IS NOT LISTED IN THERE UNDER
14 ARENA IS WITH THE GOVERNOR'S DECISION NOT TO GIVE ANY MONEY
15 OUT SO FAR -- HE'S GOT A WAYS TO GO, I THINK. IT'S GOING TO
16 MAKE OUR JOB EVEN HARDER. AND SO IT WOULD BE -- I JUST WANT TO
17 MAKE SURE THE RECORD REFLECTS, YOU KNOW, WE CAME UP WITH THIS
18 ADVOCACY PROGRAM WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT SOME MONEY WAS
19 GOING TO BE ALSO INCLUDED IN THAT. SO I THINK AT SOME POINT WE
20 MAY NEED TO REVISIT THIS JUST SO WE CAN FIGURE OUT WHAT CAN WE
21 DO IF YOU DON'T HAVE MONEY FROM THE STATE. SO I'M JUST --
22 WANTED TO MAKE THAT COMMENT. JUST PUT IT OUT ON THE TABLE.
23 OTHERWISE, I WILL BE SUPPORTING THE MOTION BUT WITH THE
24 UNDERSTANDING THAT THERE MAY BE SOME NEED TO REVISIT THIS
25 BASED ON LACK OF FUNDING.

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. VICE PRESIDENT ARREGUIN.

3

4 **V. PRES., JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. ONE OTHER POINT I MADE
5 WHEN WE DISCUSSED THIS AT THE JOINT COMMITTEE WAS THAT WE HAVE
6 AN OPPORTUNITY HERE AT THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD TO HAVE A
7 CONVERSATION AROUND ANY POTENTIAL RECOMMENDATIONS ON CHANGES
8 TO THE ARENA STATUTE. ONE OF THE OUTCOMES OF THE ARENA PROCESS
9 WAS, YOU KNOW, WE REALLY TOOK VERY COPIOUS NOTES ON SOME OF
10 THE COMMENTS AND INPUT WE RECEIVED FROM CITIES THAT APPEALED,
11 LOCAL GOVERNMENT LEADERS AROUND, NOT JUST THE STATUTE BUT THE
12 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE ARENA PROCESS AND THERE WERE A NUMBER OF
13 POLICY ISSUES THAT CAME OUT OF IT THAT WE DISCUSSED I THINK IN
14 PROBABLY ABOUT A YEAR AGO AND NOW THE LEGISLATURE WILL BEGIN
15 LOOKING AT LEGISLATIVE CHANGES IT WILL BE GOOD TO LOOK AT THAT
16 LIST AND HAVE ANY CONVERSATIONS WHETHER THERE ARE ANY POLICY
17 RECOMMENDATIONS WE'D LIKE TO PROVIDE TO STAFF AS WE ENGAGE IN
18 THOSE DISCUSSIONS IN THE LEGISLATURE.

19

20 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** ANY OTHER EXECUTIVE COMMENTS? MAYOR.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I DO HAVE A QUESTION ABOUT THE BLI
23 FRAMEWORK. I WAS WONDERING IF SOMEONE COULD EXPLAIN WITH THAT?

24

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THANK YOU. I WORK IN THE LEGISLATIVE
2 SIDE OF THE SHOP. THE BLI FRAMEWORK, IT'S A BIPARTISAN
3 INFRASTRUCTURE LAW FRAMEWORK TO TRY TO POSITION THE REGION AS
4 BEST WE CAN AND COMPETING FOR FEDERAL TRANSPORTATION RESOURCES
5 THAT WERE PROVIDED THROUGH U.S. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
6 COMPETITIVE GRANT PROGRAMS THROUGH THE INFRASTRUCTURE LAW. SO
7 IT'S SURROUNDED THE TRANSPORTATION SPACE.

8

9 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO.

10

11 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I WAS GOING TO ASK A QUICK QUESTION NOW THE
12 VICE PRESIDENT BROUGHT UP THE ARENA -- I GUESS, FEEDBACK
13 ISSUE. I UNDERSTAND THAT DECEMBER 31 WAS WHEN THE STATE
14 LEGISLATURE WAS SUPPOSED TO EITHER ISSUE OR HAVE ITS REPORT
15 DONE. IS THAT SOMETHING -- IT'S A COUPLE WEEKS AGO. IS THAT
16 SOMETHING THAT IS OUT AND THAT WE MIGHT INDEED BE ABLE TO LOOK
17 AT AND POTENTIALLY MAYBE TO PROVIDE FEEDBACK BECAUSE OF THE
18 PROCESS BUT CERTAINLY UNDERSTAND WHETHER THEY HEARD SOME OF
19 OUR CONCERNS. THANK YOU.

20

21 **REBECCA LONG:** WE UNDERSTAND THAT THEY DID NOT NECESSARILY MEET
22 THAT DEADLINE. IT MAY HAVE BEEN PRESENTED BY NOW BUT OUR STAFF
23 DOES PLAN TO COME BACK TO THE BOARD ONCE THAT REPORT OF
24 RECOMMENDATIONS IS COMPLETED AND PRESENT THOSE FINDINGS TO
25 YOU. YOU KNOW, AND I THINK THAT'S GOING TO PROVIDE FOR THE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 CONVERSATION THAT THE VICE PRESIDENT WAS JUST DESCRIBING, THAT
2 WE DO PLAN TO DO THAT. I AM NOT SURE IF IT WILL BE IN MARCH
3 BUT SOON.

4

5 **CARLOS ROMERO:** PERHAPS THERE IS A BUILDER'S REMEDY THAT WE CAN
6 APPLY ON THERE.

7

8 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** TOO SOON. [LAUGHTER] OKAY. NO OTHER
9 QUESTIONS FROM THE BOARD. I'LL ASK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

10

11 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** ACTUALLY. WE HAVE A QUESTION HERE BY
12 COUNCILMEMBER SILVA.

13

14 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** OH, THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER SILVA.

15

16 **CINDY SILVA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. TON ONE OF MY VARIOUS
17 ASSIGNMENTS AS I'M PART OF THE CALIFORNIA SEISMIC SAFETY
18 COMMITTEE AND I WANT TO THANK ABAG FOR INCLUDING THAT IN THE
19 CLIMATE RESILIENCY AREA BUT I NEED TO POINT OUT WHEN WE TALK
20 ABOUT SEISMIC RETROFITS AND THE PROTECTION OF HOUSING, WE'RE
21 TALKING ABOUT IT FROM A HOUSING PRESERVATION STANDPOINT, NOT
22 FROM CLIMATE RESILIENCY. AND IT'S A GREAT WAY TO ADVOCATE FOR
23 ADDITIONAL HOUSING DOLLARS WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT PRESERVING
24 HOUSING AND KEEPING HOUSING INVENTORIES HIGH IS A WAY OF

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 PROTECTING THE INVENTORY OF HOUSING THAT IS OLDER AND
2 PARTICULARLY AFFORDABLE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER EXECUTIVE MEMBER
5 DISCUSSIONS? SEEING NONE, I'LL MOVE ON TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
8 FOR THIS ITEM. NO PUBLIC COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
9 IN THE BOARD ROOM AND IN THE ATTENDEE ZOOM SPACE, NO MEMBERS
10 OF THE PUBLIC THERE FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. THANK YOU.

11

12 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR ADAMS.

15

16 **SUSAN ADAMS:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR ANDERSEN.

19

20 **CANDACE ANDERSEN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR ARREGUIN.

23

24 **V. PRES., JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

25

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER FORTUNATO BAS IS ABSENT.
2 COUNCILMEMBER COHEN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR CORZO IS ABSENT.
3 COUNCILMEMBER EKLUND.

4

5 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR ELLENBERG IS ABSENT. CONGRESS
8 MEMBER FIFE. I SAW THAT YOU SPOKE. AYE. THANK YOU. MAYOR
9 GARCIA.

10

11 **LEON GARCIA:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DIRECTOR HILLIS IS ABSENT. VICE MAYOR
14 KAMEI.

15

16 **ROSEMARY KAMEI:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR LEE.

19

20 **OTTO LEE:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** SUPERVISOR MANDELMAN IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
23 MARQUEZ.

24

25 **ELISA MARQUEZ:** AYE.

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER MARTINEZ-BELTRAN IS ABSENT.
3 SUPERVISOR MILEY IS ABSENT. MAYOR MOTOYAMA.

4

5 **LISA MOTOYAMA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** MAYOR MOY.

8

9 **CATHERINE MOY:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** VICE MAYOR NAGALES.

12

13 **MARK NAGALES:** AYE AND I ACTUALLY GOT DEMOTED. I'M ACTUALLY
14 COUNCILMEMBER NOW. [LAUGHTER]

15

16 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER ORTIZ IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
17 RABBITT IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR RAMOS. RECLAIMING MY TIME

18

19 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER REID.

22

23 **TREVA REID:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO.

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

3

4 **MARY SACKETT:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER SILVA.

7

8 **CINDY SILVA:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER TIEDEMANN IS ABSENT.

11 SUPERVISOR WILLIAMS.

12

13 **WANDA WILLIAMS:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. DIRECTOR.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ.

20

21 **COUNCILMEMBER LOPEZ:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** DID I MISS ANYONE? MOTION PASSES.

24

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. WE WILL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM
2 9-A AND IT'S OUR REPORT ON THE ABAG HOUSING COMMITTEE MEETING
3 OF NOVEMBER 8. AND I WOULD INVITE THAT CHAIR ROMERO TO GIVE
4 THE REPORT.

5

6 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU, MADAM PRESIDENT. WE MET ON NOVEMBER
7 8, 2023. THERE WERE TWO ITEMS THAT WE DISCUSSED AND APPROVED.
8 ONE WAS A BAHFA LEGAL SERVICES BENCH. IT'S A PREQUALIFICATION
9 OF THE FOLLOWING FIRMS TO PROVIDE LEGAL SERVICES TO BAHFA.
10 THAT IS OUR BENCH OF LEGAL SERVICES FOR BAHFA. AND THE OTHER
11 ITEM WE ADDRESSED WAS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE.
12 THIS IS ACTUALLY PRETTY EXCITING. ENTER INTO A CONTRACT WITH
13 THE NAPA COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND HOMELESS SERVICES
14 FOR AN AMOUNT NOT TO EXCEED \$5 MILLION TO LAUNCH AND
15 ADMINISTER ONE OF OUR BAHFA RENTAL PILOT PROGRAM WHICH WITH
16 ANY LUCK WHEN OUR BOND PASSES WE WILL BE ABLE TO REPLICATE THE
17 GREAT WORK THAT WILL HAPPEN WITHIN NAPA ON THIS PILOT PROGRAM
18 SO REALLY LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT PROGRAM ROLLING OUT. THE
19 HOUSING COMMITTEE DID NOT MEET IN DECEMBER AND JANUARY. SOME
20 OF MY WIND HAS BEEN STOLEN FROM MY SAILS BY THE BOARD
21 PRESIDENT BUT THIS IS REALLY -- NO, NO. IT'S FINE. THIS IS
22 REALLY FROM CASA TO CASH. WE'RE GETTING THERE. [LAUGHTER] AND
23 I JUST WANTED TO LET FOLKS KNOW CERTAINLY THIS NEXT QUARTER IS
24 GOING TO BE QUITE IMPORTANT. THERE IS A TIMELINE THAT IS IN
25 THE PACKET THAT INDICATES WHAT ARE THE KEY DATES AND ACTIONS

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 THAT HAVE TO OCCUR FOR US TO APPROVE A BAY AREA \$10 BILLION,
2 \$20 BILLION BOND, WHATEVER WE WANT TO DO. I JUST WANT TO
3 REMIND BOARD MEMBERS THIS WILL BE A VERY SIGNIFICANT YEAR FOR
4 THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY AND OUR HOUSING
5 EFFORTS. STAFF WILL BE COMING BEFORE US TO SEEK APPROVAL BY
6 THE EXECUTIVE BOARD OF DOCUMENTS THAT REPRESENT THE
7 CULMINATION OF TWO YEARS AND WE'VE ALL KIND HAVE BEEN INVOLVED
8 IN THESE DISCUSSIONS OF FOCUSED WORK ON HOUSING AND ADDITIONAL
9 TWO YEARS OF PLANNING BEFORE THAT. THAT'S PART OF THE GENESIS
10 OF THIS WHOLE CASA PROJECT. NIECE WILL INCLUDE BAHFA'S PLAN,
11 THE EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR THE 20% OF THE FUNDING THAT WOULD GO
12 TO BAHFA. WE ARE NOT CREATING AN EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR THE
13 COUNTIES. THE COUNTIES GET TO DO THAT AND THE CITIES. AND ALSO
14 A RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE THE NOVEMBER, 2024 BALLOT MEASURE
15 WITH RELATED BALLOT DOCUMENTS. THE ABAG BOARD APPROVAL IS
16 REQUIRED BEFORE THE BAHFA BOARD CAN TAKE ITS FINAL VOTE TO
17 PLACE A MEASURE ON THE NINE-COUNTY BALLOTS IN THIS BODY. IT IS
18 COMING TO THIS BOARD I BELIEVE IT IS IN APRIL. ATTACHED TO
19 THIS ITEM THAT I MENTIONED EARLIER IS THAT SPECIFIC TIMELINE
20 FOR THIS PROCESS. WE HOPE TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE A FULL HOUSE
21 WHEN WE DISCUSS THESE AND ACTUALLY GO AHEAD AND PUT THIS ITEM
22 ON THE BALLOT. SO, AGAIN, WE WILL BE REVIEWING BOTH THE ABAG
23 HOUSING COMMITTEE AND THE BAHFA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE IN
24 FEBRUARY. WE WILL BE LOOKING AT THESE TIMELINES AND DEALING
25 WITH OTHER ACTIONS THAT WILL THEN BE PASSED ON TO THE ABAG

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 EXECUTIVE BOARD AT THE SPECIAL APRIL MEETING. SO STAFF HAS
2 BEEN REACHING OUT TO MANY OF OUR COMMUNITIES, TO MANY OF OUR
3 COMMUNITY MEMBERS, AS WELL AS THE CITIES. DO WANT TO POINT
4 OUT, AGAIN, AS I MENTIONED, OVER 70 PRESENTATIONS HAVE BEEN
5 MADE TO CITIES AND DIFFERENT ENTITIES IN THE BAY AREA AND
6 THERE IS STILL MORE TO COME. SO THERE'S A PRETTY ROBUST
7 OUTREACH EFFORT HERE. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE KEEP THAT UP IF
8 WE WANT TO GET ACCEPTANCE OF THIS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SORRY
9 THAT IT TOOK A LITTLE LONGER THAN I WANTED TO.

10

11 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** NO. VERY IMPORTANT. IS THERE ANY EXECUTIVE
12 BOARD MEMBER DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM? DON'T SEE ANYTHING. I'LL
13 JUST GO AHEAD AND ADD MARCH 21 IS THE WORKSHOP ON THE BOND
14 MEASURE AND THEN THE EXECUTIVE BOARD'S APPROVAL IS ON APRIL
15 18. I WILL PROBABLY SAY THIS THREE MORE TIMES TO YOU THIS
16 EVENING. [LAUGHTER]

17

18 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** PLEASE TAKE NOTE. SEEING -- WE HAVE -- WE
19 DO HAVE COMMENT.

20

21 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** COUNCILMEMBER REID.

22

23 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** COUNCILMEMBER REID.

24

25 **TREVA REID:** CAN YOU HEAR ME OKAY?

JANUARY 18, 2024

1

2 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** YES. PLEASE GO AHEAD.

3

4 **TREVA REID:** I WANT TO ENCOURAGE AS WE TALK ABOUT OUTREACH, I'M
5 NOT CERTAIN IF ABAG HAS MADE CONNECTIONS WITH A STAKEHOLDER
6 GROUP, PARTICULARLY ONE CALLED THE BLACK HOUSING ADVISORY TASK
7 FORCE. IT'S A COALITION OF AT LEAST IN OUR REGION OVER 35
8 BLACK-LED ORGANIZATIONS. THEY PROPOSED STATE BUDGET --

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I GOT THE MARCH 21 --

11

12 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** IF YOU COULD PLEASE MUTE YOURSELF. I
13 BELIEVE THAT'S THE SAN JOSE LOCATION.

14

15 **TREVA REID:** IT'S AN ORGANIZATION THAT I WOULD LIKE TO ADD TO
16 OUR OUTREACH STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT IF THAT'S NOT YET HAPPENED
17 WITH THE EFFORTS THEY'VE BEEN LEADING WITHIN OUR BAY AREA
18 REGION AND STATEWIDE WITH THE COALITION. IT'S LED AT THE STATE
19 BY ASSEMBLY MEMBER LORI WILSON AND ANOTHER HAS BEEN A CHAMPION
20 AND A NUMBER OF US DOWN HERE IN THE LOCAL BAY AREA HAVE BEEN
21 STRONG ADVOCATES FROM THE BEGINNING OF THE EFFORTS THAT THIS
22 COALITION IS LEADING THAT I AM A PART OF. WOULD JUST LIKE TO
23 MAKE SURE THEIR INPUT IS GATHERED AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH THAT
24 ITEM.

25

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU, COUNCILMEMBER REID. AND STAFF
2 HAS TAKEN NOTE OF THAT RECOMMENDATION FOR INTEGRATION. ANY
3 OTHER EXECUTIVE BOARD COMMENTS ON THIS? I DO NOT SEE ANYTHING.
4 I WOULD ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

5

6 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
7 FOR THIS ITEM. NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARD ROOM PUBLIC FOR THIS
8 COMMENT AND IN THE ZOOM ATTENDEE SPACE, NO. I SEE
9 COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO'S LIGHT IS LIT.

10

11 **CARLOS ROMERO:** MY MISTAKE.

12

13 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** EXCELLENT. THANK YOU SO MUCH. OUR NEXT
14 ITEM, THE SAN FRANCISCO THREAT PARTNERSHIP. WE WILL BE
15 RECEIVING A REPORT ON ADVANCING NATURE-BASED SHORELINE
16 SOLUTION. I WOULD ASK -- OH, CAITLIN HAS ALREADY JOINED US.
17 MS. SWEENEY, PLEASE GIVE THE REPORT TO THE COMMITTEE.

18

19 **CAITLIN SWEENEY:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. IF WE CAN BRING THE
20 PRESENTATION UP. THANK YOU. GOOD EVENING. DIRECTOR OF THE
21 ESTUARY PROJECT. THE SAN FRANCISCO ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP IS PART
22 OF THE U.S. E.P.A.'S NATIONAL ESTUARY PROGRAM SITTING WITHIN
23 ABAG, IT BRIDGES BETWEEN AGENCIES AND ORGANIZATIONS WITHIN THE
24 REGION REALLY WORKING TO ACHIEVE OUR COLLECTIVE VISION OF WHAT
25 A HEALTHY ESTUARY CAN BE. AND THE PARTNERSHIP WORKS TO HAVE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 KEY PARTNERS TO SCALE UP INNOVATIVE SOLUTIONS TO MEET THE
2 CHALLENGE OF CLIMATE CHANGE AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. SO TODAY,
3 MY COLLEAGUE, HEIDI NUTTERS, AND I WILL BE TALKING ABOUT A
4 CORE PART OF THE PROJECT WHICH IS ADVANCING NATURE-BASED
5 SOLUTIONS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. FIRST, JUST A BIT OF BACKGROUND
6 ON WHAT WE MEAN BY THE TERM NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS. I THINK
7 THIS IS A DETERMINE WE'RE -- THIS IS A TERM WE'RE HEARING MORE
8 AND MORE. NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS IS ESSENTIALLY THE IDEA OF
9 WORKING WITH NATURE TO CREATE MULTIBENEFIT SOLUTIONS. THERE
10 ARE LOTS AND LOTS OF DEFINITIONS OUT THERE. AND THIS SLIDE
11 JUST INCLUDES ONE FROM THE INTERNATIONAL UNION FOR THE
12 CONSERVATION OF NATURE AND NATURAL RESOURCES THAT I
13 PARTICULARLY LIKED. AND IT STATES THAT NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS
14 LEVERAGE NATURE AND THE POWER OF HEALTHY ECOSYSTEMS TO PROTECT
15 PEOPLE, OPTIMIZE INFRASTRUCTURE AND SAFEGUARD A STABLE AND
16 BIODIVERSE FUTURE. SO ANOTHER WAY OF THINKING ABOUT IT IS THAT
17 NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS ARE AN INTENTIONAL AND AN INTEGRATED
18 APPROACH TO DELIVER ENVIRONMENTAL, ECONOMIC, AND SOCIAL
19 BENEFITS. AND HOPEFULLY IN AN EFFICIENT AND SUSTAINABLE WAY.
20 SO TODAY, WE'RE GOING TO SPECIFICALLY FOCUS ON SHORELINE
21 NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS TO INCREASE RESILIENCE TO CLIMATE
22 CHANGE. NEXT, PLEASE. AS WE ALL KNOW, IN THE FACE OF GLOBAL
23 CLIMATE CHANGE, COASTAL CITIES ARE EXPERIENCING MORE INTENSE
24 STORM EVENTS AND THE CONSTANT CREEP OF SEA LEVEL RISE. AND IN
25 RESPONSE TO THESE ISSUES, THERE REALLY IS AN URGENT NEED TO

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 IMPLEMENT CLIMATE ADAPTATION PROJECTS ALONG OUR SHORELINE. AND
2 THIS PROVIDES A GREAT OPPORTUNITY TO ADVANCE PROJECTS THAT USE
3 NATURE-BASED APPROACHES TO PROVIDE, AGAIN, MULTIPLE BENEFITS,
4 INCLUDING FLOOD PROTECTION, HABITAT, OPEN SPACE, AND OTHER
5 BENEFITS. MANY OF OUR REGIONAL PLANNING EFFORTS CALL OUT THE
6 IMPORTANCE OF NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS, INCLUDING THE ESTUARY
7 PARTNERSHIPS ESTUARY BLUEPRINT, WHICH I PRESENTED TO YOU ALL
8 ABOUT LAST YEAR, AND THE BAY ADAPT JOINT PLATFORM, COMING OUT
9 OF THE BIG CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION. AND ALSO
10 AS A REMINDER, PLAN BAY AREA 2050 INCLUDES ACTION WITHIN THE
11 ENVIRONMENT ELEMENT TO, QUOTE, PRIORITIZE IMPLEMENTATION OF
12 NATURAL AND NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS INCLUDING THE ESTUARY
13 PROJECTS, PROGRAMS. WE ALSO HAVE SEVERAL STATE AND FEDERAL
14 EXECUTIVE ORDERS SIMILARLY FOCUSING ON SUPPORTING AND
15 ADVANCING NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS THROUGHOUT THE STATE AND
16 NATION. NEXT. SO THERE ARE SEVERAL DIFFERENT TYPES OF
17 SHORELINE NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS. AS THOSE NATURAL OR RESTORED
18 HABITATS STABILIZE THE SHORELINE AND PROVIDE PROTECTION
19 AGAINST STORM SURGES AND SEA LEVEL RISE. WE CAN ALSO UTILIZE
20 HYBRID APPROACHES THAT AND AN EXAMPLE OF THAT MIGHT BE A SEA
21 WALL THAT'S ENGINEERED TO ALSO GROW PLANTS AS AN EXAMPLE OR
22 FLOOD PROTECTION LEVEE THAT INCLUDES VEGETATIVE AREAS. AND
23 THEN ECOTONE AND HORIZONTAL LEVEES ARE SIMILAR TYPE OF NATURE-
24 BASED SOLUTIONS CENTERING AROUND ESSENTIALLY A GENTLY SLOPED
25 VEGETATED LEVEE. FOR TODAY'S PRESENTATION I WILL DIG IN A

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 LITTLE MORE SPECIFICALLY ON HORIZONTAL LEVEES BECAUSE THIS IS
2 REALLY AN EXCITING INNOVATIVE SOLUTION TO A MYRIAD OF PROBLEMS
3 WE'RE FACING AND WE'RE REALLY EXCITED FOR THE SPECIFIC TYPE OF
4 NATURE-BASED APPROACH. NEXT. SO I'LL WALK THROUGH THIS GRAPHIC
5 TO SHOW REALLY WHAT THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE IS AND HOW WE CAN
6 MEET OUR SHORELINE ADAPTATION NEEDS. SO ON THE LEFT OF THIS
7 GRAPHIC IF SHOWS ESSENTIALLY THE CONVENTIONAL APPROACH THAT
8 INVOLVES BUILDING A VERTICAL FLOOD PROTECTION LEVEE OR A SEA
9 WALL. IT'S HEAVILY ARMORED ON THE SHORE SIDE. REALLY AN
10 ENGINEERED APPROACH TO PROTECT INLAND INFRASTRUCTURE SUCH AS
11 WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANTS WHICH IS SHOWING ON THIS GRAPHIC.
12 THIS APPROACH IS VERY EXPENSIVE. AND ALSO SUSCEPTIBLE TO
13 FAILURE WITH THE FORCE OF MORE FREQUENT AND POWERFUL STORMS
14 THAT WE'RE SEEING. IT ALSO DOESN'T PROVIDE ANY SPACE TO
15 ACCOMMODATE RISING WATERS. WE'RE -- THE ONLY OPTION TO KEEP
16 BUILDING HIGHER AND HIGHER. THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE IS AN
17 ALTERNATIVE TO THIS HARD LANDSCAPE. AS SHOWN IN THE GRAPHIC ON
18 THE RIGHT, A HORIZONTAL LEVEE IS A GRADUALLY SLOPED LEVEE
19 PLANTED WITH NATIVE VEGETATION. SO THIS APPROACH PROVIDES
20 HABITAT FOR NATIVE SPECIES. IT PROVIDES WAVE ATTENUATION.
21 PROTECTING FROM STORMS. AND IT PROTECTS SPACE FROM RISING SEA
22 LEVELS. ADDITIONALLY, A HORIZONTAL LEVEE CAN BE ENGINEERED TO
23 RECEIVE TREATED WASTEWATER AT THE BACKSIDE AND RUN IT THROUGH
24 A SUBSURFACE TREATMENT LAYER TO REMOVE NUTRIENTS, ADDITIONAL
25 NUTRIENTS, AND ALSO OTHER CONTAMINANTS, ADDING IMPROVED WATER

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 QUALITY TO THE BENEFITS IT CAN PROVIDE. NEXT. IN PARTNERSHIP
2 WITH WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANTS, HORIZONTAL LEVEES ARE
3 ADVANCING THE REIMAGINING OF WASTEWATER AS A NUISANCE TO A
4 RESOURCE. SO TREATED WASTEWATER CAN PROVIDE A SOURCE OF
5 IRRIGATION FOR THE VEGETATION PLANTED OR THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE
6 PROVIDING A DROUGHT-PROOF SUPPLY. AND ALSO PROVIDING FRESH
7 WATER TO THE BACKSIDE OF THE LEVEE CAN HAVE A HABITAT TYPE
8 THAT WE DON'T HAVE A LOT AROUND THE BAY. ADDITIONALLY, AS I
9 SAID, HORIZONTAL LEVEES CAN BE ENGINEERED TO REMOVE NUTRIENTS
10 FROM WASTEWATER WHICH IS A REGULATED IMPERATIVE. WE'VE SEEN
11 SOME GREAT SUCCESS THUS FAR IN CONSTRUCTED PILOT PROJECT THAT
12 HEIDI WILL TALK ABOUT LATER. NEXT. HORIZONTAL LEVEES ARE ALSO
13 REIMAGINING OF SHORELINE WETLANDS. OF INFRASTRUCTURE FOR
14 MULTIPLE BENEFITS. SO THEY PROVIDE HABITAT FOR CRITICAL
15 SPECIES. THEY ALLOW FOR SPACE FOR WETLANDS TO MIGRATE LANDWARD
16 AS SEA LEVELS RISE. THEY CAN PROTECT INFRASTRUCTURE FROM STORM
17 SURGES, OTHER CLIMATE-RELATED HAZARDS AND PROVIDE RECREATIONAL
18 SPACE WHICH WE KNOW NOW MORE THAN EVER HOW IMPORTANT IT IS TO
19 PEOPLE'S HEALTH AND WELL-BEING. NEXT. SO THE ESTUARY
20 PARTNERSHIP WORKS WITH A MYRIAD OF FUNDERS AND PARTNERS TO
21 ADVANCE NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS. WE HOST TECHNOLOGY TRANSFER
22 WORKSHOPS AND OTHER KINDS OF CONVENES AND WORKING FOR BARRIERS
23 OF IMPLEMENTATION PART OF THESE NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS SUCH AS
24 FUNDING, REGULATORY HURDLES, GOVERNANCE CHALLENGES, THINGS OF
25 THAT NATURE. AT THE SUBREGIONAL SCALE, WE'RE WORKING IN

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 SEVERAL AREAS AROUND THE BAY TO SUPPORT SUBREGIONAL CLIMATE
2 ADAPTATION PLANNING. AGAIN, WITH THE FOCUS ON NATURE-BASED
3 OPPORTUNITIES. IN ADDITION, WE ALSO WORK WITH LOCAL PARTNERS
4 TO ADVANCE LOCAL ON-THE-GROUND IMPLEMENTATION PROJECTS. NEXT.
5 SO THIS MAP SHOWS THE AREAS WHERE WE ARE CURRENTLY PARTNERING
6 TO IMPLEMENT SHORELINE NATURE-BASED PROJECTS. SPECIFICALLY
7 HORIZONTAL LEVEES AND ALSO ENGINEERED WETLANDS. AND AT THIS
8 POINT I'D LIKE TO TURN IT OVER TO HEIDI NUTTERS, SENIOR
9 PROGRAM MANAGER AT THE PARTNERSHIP WHO WILL SPEAK ABOUT THESE
10 PROJECTS IN MORE DETAIL.

11

12 **HEIDI NUTTERS:** THANK YOU. AS CAITLIN TALKED ABOUT, WE'VE BEEN
13 PARTNERING WITH AREAS IN THE SAN FRANCISCO BAY TO ADVANCE
14 NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS AND THE HORIZONTAL LEVEE. SO THIS MAP
15 SHOWS SOME OF THE COMMUNITIES THAT WE'VE PARTNERED WITH ON THE
16 SHORELINE. THERE'S A LOT OF STORIES TO TELL ABOUT THIS WORK
17 BUT I'M JUST GOING TO HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF PLACES WHERE WE'VE
18 ADVANCED THESE PARTNERSHIPS IN THE LAST FEW YEARS. SO NEXT
19 SLIDE. SO THE FIRST HORIZONTAL LEVEE WAS A PROOF OF CONCEPT,
20 CONCEPTUAL DESIGN AT THE ORO LOMA SANITARY DISTRICT AND IT WAS
21 A PILOT PROJECT BUILT IN 2015 TO REALLY TRY TO TEST THIS
22 CONCEPT OUT AND IN PARTICULAR THE USE OF TREATED WASTEWATER
23 AND STUDY THE WATER QUALITY IMPROVEMENT BENEFITS OF THIS
24 CONCEPT. SO WE'VE BEEN PARTNERING AT THIS LOCATION SINCE THEN.
25 WE PARTNERED WITH THEM THROUGH DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION OF THE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 HORIZONTAL LEVEE AND HAVE BEEN MONITORING EVER SINCE WITH UC
2 BERKELEY AND VALLEY WATER KIND OF LEADING THE CHARGE ON THAT
3 AND WE CONTINUE TO STUDY DIFFERENT DESIGN APPROACHES AND
4 DIFFERENT KINDS OF WATER QUALITY IMPROVEMENTS AT THIS SITE. SO
5 IN PARTICULAR, WE'VE SEEN INCREDIBLE RESULTS WITH THE REMOVAL
6 OF NUTRIENTS FROM TREATED WASTEWATER. PHARMACEUTICALS. AND
7 ALSO, ADDITIONAL CONTAMINANTS OF EMERGING CONCERN WE'RE
8 STUDYING RIGHT NOW PFAS, THE FOREVER CHEMICAL, HOW THAT CAN BE
9 REMOVED AS WELL AS MICROPLASTICS. SO THIS IS AN ONGOING KIND
10 OF LIVING LABORATORY WHERE WE'RE STUDYING THIS CONCEPT AND
11 EVOLVING OUR UNDERSTANDING. NEXT SLIDE. THE OTHER PROJECT I
12 WANTED TO TALK ABOUT -- AND I REALIZE THIS IS OUT OF ORDER.
13 THE PALO ALTO HORIZONTAL LEVEE WHICH IS A PROJECT THAT ABAG
14 AND SFEP HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THROUGH DESIGN AND WILL NOW BE
15 BUILDING IN 2024. SO THIS YEAR. THIS WILL BE THE FIRST
16 HORIZONTAL LEVEE THAT WE'LL SEE IN THE REGION THAT WILL
17 ACTUALLY BE ON THE SHORELINE WITH TREATED WASTEWATER CONVEYED
18 THROUGH THE SYSTEM OUT INTO THE BAY SO IT'S A REALLY BIG
19 ADVANCE FOR THE REGION. IT'S IMPLEMENTS ARE ESTUARY BLUEPRINT
20 AND PAVES THE WAY FOR FUTURE PROJECTS LIKE IT. IT WAS REALLY A
21 PILOT FOR US TO MOVE IT TO THIS PHASE AND TO UNDERSTAND AND
22 LEARN A LOT IN THE PROCESS. NEXT SLIDE. SO THE PALO ALTO
23 HORIZONTAL LEVEE, WHICH IF YOU KNOW THAT AREA, IS IN HARBOR
24 MARSH RIGHT NEXT TO THE PARK IN THE CITY OF PALO ALTO. HAS
25 SEVERAL GOALS THEY ARE TRYING TO ACHIEVE. IMPROVING HABITAT

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 ALONG THE PERIMETER OF HARBOR MARSH. ADAPTING TO SEA LEVEL
2 RISE. AND THIS PROJECTS IS WITH THE SAFER BAY AND SHORELINE
3 STUDY. IF YOU'RE FAMILIAR WITH THAT. THE PREFERRED ALIGNMENT
4 OF THAT PROJECT FOR FLOOD PROTECTION. MAINTAINING AND
5 IMPROVING PUBLIC ACCESS TO THE TRAIL SYSTEM. ENSURING
6 PERSPECTIVES OF MARGINALIZED COMMUNITIES THAT ARE INCORPORATED
7 WITH SOCIAL INFRASTRUCTURE. THERE'S BEEN EXTENSIVE ENGAGEMENT
8 WITH SURROUNDED COMMUNITIES. AND ONGOING COMMUNITY-BASED
9 MONITORING PROGRAM THAT'S BEING DEVELOPED AND WILL CONTINUE
10 THROUGH CONSTRUCTION AND BEYOND. AND TO PROVIDE THIS POLISHING
11 TREATMENT OF TREATED WASTEWATER THROUGH THE SYSTEM. I JUST
12 WANT TO HIGHLIGHT OUR INCREDIBLE PARTNERSHIP WITH THE CITY OF
13 PALO ALTO, SAVE THE BAY, AND SEVERAL COMMUNITY-BASED
14 ORGANIZATIONS, INCLUDING EAST PALO ALTO THAT HAVE REALLY
15 CHAMPIONED THIS PROJECT AND HAVE BEEN WITH US THROUGH THIS
16 WHOLE THING. NEXT SLIDE. SO JUST TO TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT
17 THE TIMELINE OF THIS PROJECT, BECAUSE THIS IS A GREAT STEP FOR
18 SFEP. WE BEGAN THIS IN 2017 WITH JUST EARLY FEASIBILITIES AND
19 DESIGN AND COMMUNITY-BASED WORKSHOPS. AND HAVE BEEN WORKING
20 THROUGH THE LAST FEW YEARS ON PERMITTING, STUDIES,
21 GEOTECHNICAL SUPPORTS. WE HAVE ALMOST ALL OUR PERMITS IN HAND
22 RIGHT NOW. I THINK WE HAVE ONE OR TWO MORE THAT WE'RE WAITING
23 ON. AND THE DESIGN IS ALMOST ABOUT TO BE STAMPED BY THE
24 ENGINEERS IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF WEEKS. AND AS I SAID, AS WE
25 MOVE INTO THIS YEAR, THIS BIG CONSTRUCTION YEAR FOR THE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 PROJECT, WE HAVE SEVERAL ABAG/SFEP WILL BE MANAGING
2 CONSTRUCTION OF THE PROJECT WHICH IS EXPECTED TO BEGIN IN JUNE
3 OR JULY OF THIS YEAR. NEXT SLIDE. SO WITH ALL OF THESE
4 ADVANCES, THIS IS THE FOUR SORT OF KEY IMPLEMENTATION
5 CHALLENGES THAT WE SEE. AND CAITLIN TALKED ABOUT OUR REGIONAL
6 COORDINATION WORK WHERE WE ARE TRYING TO GET INTO THESE
7 CHALLENGES AND ADDRESS THEM AND THAT IS REALLY PACE AND SCALE.
8 REALLY ADVANCING NATURE-BASED SOLUTIONS AT THE KIND OF SCALE
9 AND PACE THAT WE NEED TO SEE IN ORDER TO ADAPT TO SEA LEVEL
10 RISE. ADDRESSING REGULATORY CHALLENGES. NOT ALL OF THESE
11 PROJECTS HAVE A CLEAR PATH THROUGH THE PERMITTING PROCESS AND
12 WE'RE WORKING VERY HARD ON THAT WITH OUR REGULATORY PARTNERS.
13 LOOKING AT GOVERNANCE ON THE SHORELINE. REALLY, THESE ARE
14 CROSS-JURISDICTIONAL PROJECTS THAT OFTEN REQUIRE EXTENSIVE
15 COORDINATION ON THE GROUND WITH MULTIPLE ENTITIES. AND
16 FINALLY, CENTERING COMMUNITIES AND EQUITY AND KEEPING THAT AT
17 THE HEART OF THESE PROCESSES. SO WE'RE WORKING CLOSELY WITH
18 OUR ON-THE-GROUND PARTNERS ON ALL FOUR OF THESE AREAS. NEXT
19 SLIDE. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO YOU.

20

21 **CAITLIN SWEENEY:** THAT CONCLUDES OUR PRESENTATION. THANK YOU
22 VERY MUCH.

23

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. DO WE HAVE ANY
2 EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER DISCUSSION, QUESTIONS? SUPERVISOR
3 SACKETT.

4

5 **MARY SACKETT:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS AND
6 COMMENTS. THANK YOU SO MUCH. I'M EXCITED ABOUT THE NOTION OF
7 NATURE-BASED. I THINK IT DOES SEEM LIKE THE RIGHT THING TO DO
8 AND THE MOST ECONOMICAL THING TO DO. WE'VE GOT A COUPLE OF
9 SMALL PROJECTS IN MARIN THAT KIND OF FIT UNDER THIS NOTION.
10 AND WHEN WE HEARD THE PRESENTATION ON BAY ADAPT FROM BCDC, I
11 KIND OF RAISED THE SAME QUESTION. I THINK WE HAVE THE
12 VISIONING DOCUMENTS. I THINK WE HAVE THE VISION, BUT I'M NOT -
13 - IT DOESN'T FEEL LIKE IT'S TRICKLING DOWN INTO THE AGENCIES
14 AND THE RULEMAKING AND REGULATORY PIECE OF IT. I APPRECIATE
15 THE COUPLE OF PLACES WHERE YOU TALK ABOUT THOSE REGULATORY
16 HURDLES. BUT IT'S ALMOST AS THOUGH,ING YOU KNOW, ONE OF THE
17 PROJECTS I'M LOOKING AT IS BREACHING A TURN OF THE CENTURY
18 AGRICULTURAL LEVEE IN ORDER TO LET NATURE RESTORE THE AREA AND
19 THE AMOUNT OF REGULATORY HURDLES. IT'S AS THOUGH WE'RE
20 BUILDING A HUGE ENGINEERED PROJECT. AND GOING -- YOU KNOW, IF
21 IS INTENDED TO WORK THROUGH SOME OF THESE BUT EACH TIME WE'VE
22 GONE BACK TO THE BRIT, A DIFFERENT AGENCY HAS COME UP WITH
23 SOMETHING ELSE. I THINK WE NEED TO WORK WITH THAT PIECE TO
24 MAKE SURE THE RULES LINE UP WITH THE GREATER VISION AND REALLY
25 A CHANGE IN THEORY FROM ENGINEER TO NATURE-BASED. AND THE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 OTHER BIG THING THAT'S COMING OUT OF, AGAIN, A SORT OF SMALL
2 IDEA OF A PILOT PROJECT IS THE LONG-TERM MITIGATION AND
3 HABITAT MONITORING. AND I DIDN'T, SEE, LIKE, IN THE PALO ALTO
4 PROJECT, THAT'S NOT ON THE TIMELINE. I'M CURIOUS KIND OF WHAT
5 YOU HAVE TO SAY IN THAT REGARD AND WHAT YOU'RE ANTICIPATING.
6 BECAUSE THE ONE I'M LOOKING AT IS SORT OF HOW WE'RE -- YOU
7 KNOW, THE HARVEST MICE GOING TO BE DOING 10 YEARS FROM NOW AND
8 HOW THAT ADDS, YOU KNOW, THAT LONG-TERM MONITORING ADDS TO THE
9 COST AND COMPLEXITY, FRANKLY, OF WHO'S DOING THE PROJECT.

10

11 **CAITLIN SWEENEY:** YEAH. SO FOR THE PALO ALTO HORIZONTAL LEVEE
12 PROJECT, WE ARE PARTNERING WITH UC DAVIS AND USGS ON
13 MONITORING.

14

15 **HEIDI NUTTERS:** WE JUST GOT RESULTS THAT THEY DID MONITORING
16 FOR SALT HARVEST MICE IN PARTICULAR. AND WE REALLY THINK THIS
17 IS AN OPPORTUNITY TO UNDERSTAND HOW QUICKLY THOSE SPECIES RE-
18 ESTABLISH ONCE THE HABITAT IS IMPROVED AND THE IMPACT OF
19 CONSTRUCTION ON SENSITIVE SPECIES. SO THEY DID THEIR
20 PRECONSTRUCTION SURVEYS AND WILL CONTINUE TO MONITOR POST-
21 CONSTRUCTION TO SEE HOW THESE SPECIES RETURN OR EVEN INCREASE
22 IN NUMBERS AT THE SITE. AND WE'LL ALSO BE STUDYING THE WAY
23 THAT THE PROJECT EFFECTS SEDIMENT DYNAMICS AND LOOK AT
24 SEDIMENT PRE AND POST CONSTRUCTION AS WELL. THERE WAS MULTI-
25 YEAR MONITORING THAT WAS DEVELOPED WITH THE BRIT THROUGH AN

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 ADAPTIVE MONITORING AND ADAPTIVE MANAGEMENT PLAN. SO
2 DEFINITELY COULD ADD THAT TO THE TIMELINE.

3

4 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** GREAT. MAYOR GARCIA.

5

6 **LEON GARCIA:** THANKS FOR THE PRESENTATION. I'VE SEEN SEVERAL
7 WITH THE STATE AND THE NORTH BAY WATERSHED ASSOCIATION. EXCUSE
8 ME. AND WE'RE VERY FORTUNATE WITH THE PROJECT MOVING FORWARD
9 BY LOCAL NONPROFIT. THE AMERICAN PARKS FOUNDATION IS BUILDING
10 AN ECOLOGY CENTER IN WHAT WAS FORMALLY THE CITY COOPERATION
11 YARD WHICH IS RIGHT ON THE WETLANDS. IT HAS BEEN EDUCATION FOR
12 THE COMMUNITY. OUR VISITORS OR WHOEVER WOULD LIKE TO HAVE
13 INTEREST IN THAT. IT'S A TIDAL MARSH. MORE THAN 450 ACRES.
14 VERY SIMILAR TO THE STATE ROUTE 37 ON THE WETLANDS THERE.
15 WE'RE TRYING TO EXPAND EDUCATION ON THIS SUBJECT MATTER.
16 MIDDLE SCHOOLS ACROSS THE STREET. THERE'S AN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
17 NEXT TO THE MIDDLE SCHOOL. THERE'S ANOTHER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
18 ABOUT TWO OR THREE BLOCKS ON THE NORTH SIDE OF THAT. SO I LOOK
19 FORWARD TO CONFIRMATION THAT CAN BE MADE ON THIS TYPE OF
20 PROJECT. WOULD LIKE TO SHARE THE INFORMATION WITH OUR
21 COMMUNITY PARKS FOUNDATION. THANK YOU.

22

23 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU, MAYOR. ANY OTHER EXECUTIVE
24 BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? COUNCILMEMBER ROMERO.

25

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU. THIS PROJECT IS ACTUALLY VERY --
2 ALMOST IN MY BACKYARD, RIGHT, BECAUSE IT'S RIGHT THERE BY THE
3 DUCK POND. THE AIRPORT IS QUITE CLOSE TO PALO ALTO. THE
4 QUESTION, IT'S A VERY SMALL PIECE, RIGHT, IF YOU LOOK AT THE
5 MAP. I'M ON THE WEBSITE. IN TERMS OF COST, HOW MUCH MORE
6 EXPENSIVE IS THIS THAN, LET'S SAY, BUILDING, YOU KNOW, ONE OF
7 THOSE HORRIBLE LEVEES, RIGHT? AND SOMETIMES THEY'RE MADE OUT
8 OF SHEET PILES AND OTHER STUFF. THAT DOESN'T LOOK VERY GOOD.
9 COMPARED TO THAT, DO WE KNOW KIND OF WHAT IS THE COST RELATIVE
10 TO, YOU KNOW, DOING THIS PROJECT? OBVIOUSLY, THERE ARE PLENTY
11 OF OTHER ENVIRONMENTAL BENEFITS THAT WOULD GO ALONG WITH THIS.
12 WHICH MIGHT OFFSET THE COST, OBVIOUSLY. BUT CAN YOU SHARE WITH
13 US WHAT WE KNOW? OR ARE WE GOING TO LEARN THAT FROM THIS
14 PROJECT?

15

16 **CAITLIN SWEENEY:** BOTH. THINKING ABOUT COST BENEFIT, WE'RE
17 THINKING ABOUT ALL OF THE BENEFITS, INCLUDING THE
18 ENVIRONMENTAL AND THE OPEN SPACE AND COMMUNITY BENEFITS. I
19 THINK, ALSO, COST OVER TIME IS SOMETHING TO CONSIDER. IT MAY
20 BE, YOU KNOW, DEPENDING ON THE SITE, CHEAPER TO PUT UP A QUICK
21 LEVEE THAN INVEST IN SOMETHING MORE -- MORE LIKE A NATURE-
22 BASED SOLUTION. MAYBE. BUT OVER THE LONG TERM, YOU MAY HAVE
23 COST BENEFITS OVER TIME RATHER THAN HAVING TO CONTINUE TO
24 BUILD YOUR LEVEE UP AND UP AND UP. SO I THINK, YOU KNOW, YOU
25 HAVE TO CONSIDER OVER TIME AND ALSO CONSIDER MULTIPLE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 BENEFITS. I DON'T KNOW IF WE HAVE INFORMATION ABOUT THIS
2 PARTICULAR PROJECT, THE COST-BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF A SEA WALL
3 VERSUS WHAT THEY ARE OPPOSING.

4

5 **CARLOS ROMERO:** SORRY. WAS SOMEONE GOING TO TRY TO ANSWER?
6 YEAH. IF YOU WANT TO ANSWER THAT. NOT GETTING THE MATH RIGHT
7 IN MY HEAD. SHALL I ASK IT OR DO YOU WANT TO -- OKAY. SO LET'S
8 ASSUME WE ARE LOOKING AT -- CERTAINLY -- IN PALO ALTO WE'RE
9 TRYING TO DESIGN EIGHT FEET ABOVE WHICH WOULD INCLUDE THREE
10 FEET OF FREE BOARD, SEA LEVEL RISE, RIGHT? TO DESIGN FOR THAT,
11 SO THAT'S 100-YEAR EVENT, TECHNICALLY, RIGHT, PLUS FLOODING.
12 IF YOU HAVE A HORIZONTAL LEVEE THAT IS NOT THAT HIGH, RIGHT,
13 AND WE DO GET TO, YOU KNOW, FIVE FEET OF SEA LEVEL -- FIVE
14 FEET OF SEA LEVEL RISE AND LET'S SAY IT'S 2050, WHICH IT'S NOT
15 SUPPOSED TO HAPPEN BUT HOW DO WE KNOW, HOW DOES THAT
16 HORIZONTAL LEVEE HOPE, MITIGATE TOPPING OVER THAT LEVEE?
17 THAT'S THE ONE THING I DON'T UNDERSTAND. I UNDERSTAND HOW IT
18 CERTAINLY SLOWS THE MOTION OF WAVES WHICH CAN BE DEVASTATING,
19 RIGHT, BUT CAN YOU EXPLAIN WHAT WOULD HAPPEN THERE?

20

21 **HEIDI NUTTERS:** SO WITH THE COMPARISON OF THE CONVENTIONAL SEA
22 WALL COMPARED TO A HORIZONTAL LEVEE, IT REALLY DEPENDS ON THE
23 PROJECT. SO IN SOME CASES, YOU WOULD HAVE A -- UTILIZE A
24 CONVENTIONAL SEA WALL WHICH IS VERY EFFECTIVE WITH HABITAT
25 ADJACENT TO IT SO THAT YOU'RE GETTING THE LONG-TERM FLOOD

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 PROTECTION BENEFIT WHILE ALSO GETTING THAT REDUCTION OF THE
2 IMPACT OF, YOU KNOW, WAVE RUN-UP OR EXTREME STORMS BECAUSE WE
3 DO KNOW THAT THE VEGETATION, YOU KNOW, ON THE HABITAT SLOWS
4 THE IMPACT OF THAT FROM STORMS. AND THEN WITH WETLANDS, WE
5 KNOW THEY NATURALLY INCREASE IN THEIR HEIGHT OVER TIME.
6 PARTICULARLY, AS WE HAVE A HEALTHY SYSTEM WITH SEDIMENT
7 FLOWING INTO THOSE WETLANDS. SO THEY HAVE THE ABILITY TO
8 CONTINUE TO INCREASE OVER TIME. SO AS LONG AS WE ENSURE THE
9 HEALTH OF OUR ESTUARY, THEN, THEY CAN CONTINUE TO DO THAT.
10 ALTHOUGH, THERE'S DEFINITELY A SEDIMENT DEFICIT FOR OUR REGION
11 THAT'S BEEN HEAVILY STUDIED.

12

13 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THANK YOU. THAT WAS HELPFUL IN KIND OF
14 UNDERSTANDING HOW THAT GETS MITIGATED. APPRECIATE IT.

15

16 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. CONGRESS MEMBER EKLUND.

17

18 **PAT EKLUND:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, PRESIDENT RAMOS. CAITLIN, I'M
19 REALLY, REALLY SUPER EXCITED ABOUT THIS PROJECT. ONE OF THE
20 CONCEPTS IS -- COULD YOU TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE REUSE OF
21 THE WASTEWATER, THE TREATED WASTEWATER? BECAUSE LOVE TO KNOW
22 HOW THAT'S GOING TO BE USED. I DON'T REMEMBER HEARING IT IN
23 THE PRESENTATION BUT MAYBE IT WAS THERE. BECAUSE WHEN I WORKED
24 FOR THE E.P.A., I WAS VERY INVOLVED IN ACTUALLY -- AND
25 ACTUALLY WENT BACK TO D.C. TO HELP WRITE THE AGENCY'S POLICIES

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 ON THE REUSE OF MUNICIPAL SLUDGE AS WELL AS THE REUSE OF
2 MUNICIPAL WASTEWATER. AND SO THAT WAS DECADES AGO. AND SO IT'S
3 REALLY EXCITING TO SEE BECAUSE MOST PEOPLE DON'T -- MOST
4 MUNICIPALITIES OR SANITARY DISTRICTS JUST DISCHARGE IT INTO
5 THE BAY OR WHATEVER. I'D LIKE TO KNOW HOW IT'S GOING TO BE
6 USED IN THIS PARTICULAR PROJECT AND THEN HOW -- THAT'S ONE OF
7 THE BENEFITS OF DOING A HORIZONTAL LEVEE AS WELL AS USE OF
8 TREATED WASTEWATER AND IS THERE ANY TYPE OF ANALYSIS --
9 FINANCIAL ANALYSIS OF WHAT COULD BE SAVED, POSSIBLY, BY
10 MUNICIPALITIES OR SANITARY DISTRICTS?

11

12 **CAITLIN SWEENEY:** THANK YOU, PAT. YES, THE IDEA WITH THE
13 HORIZONTAL LEVEE, AS WE USE THAT TERM, IS ONE THAT HAS TREATED
14 WASTEWATER FILTERED THROUGH THE LEVEES. THIS IS WASTEWATER
15 THAT CAN BE TREATED TO THE BAY BUT FILTERING IT THROUGH THIS
16 LEVEE ALLOWS MORE ADDITIONAL REMOVAL OF NUTRIENTS AND OTHER
17 CONTAMINANTS. AND IT IS A TOOL THAT I THINK LOCAL
18 MUNICIPALITIES ARE LOOKING AT IN PARTICULAR WITH THE IDEA THAT
19 THEY ARE EXPECTING, PERHAPS, INCREASED REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS
20 WITH REGARD TO NUTRIENT REMOVAL. SO THIS MIGHT BE A WAY TO
21 ADDRESS THOSE COMING DOWN -- COMING DOWN THE PIPE SOON, THOSE
22 ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS FROM REGULATORY AGENCIES WITHOUT
23 HAVING TO UNDERTAKE A MASSIVE OVERHAUL OF THEIR GRAY
24 INFRASTRUCTURE OF THEIR TREATMENT PLANT.

25

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **PAT EKLUND:** THAT'S -- THAT'S REALLY EXCITING. BECAUSE I NEVER
2 -- WHEN WE DID THE AGENCY'S POLICY, WE NEVER CONSIDERED THIS
3 PART OF IT. SO -- BUT THERE'S NO QUESTION IN MY MIND THAT
4 THERE WILL BE INCREASED REQUIREMENTS FOR HIGHER LEVEL OF
5 TREATMENT. BECAUSE I KNOW SOME -- SOME OF THE FOLKS AT E.P.A.
6 AND ELSEWHERE ARE STILL LOOKING TO HAVE DIRECTORY USE OF
7 WASTEWATER TREATMENT WHICH ARE -- TREATED WATER WHICH IS, I
8 THINK, ON THE HORIZON BUT MAY TAKE A FEW MORE YEARS. JUST
9 REALLY APPRECIATE, CAITLIN, YOUR INVOLVEMENT, YOUR PERSONAL
10 INVOLVEMENT, YOUR PROFESSIONAL INVOLVEMENT, AND YOUR WHOLE
11 TEAM WORKING ON THIS PROJECT IS REALLY EXCITING. THANK YOU.

12

13 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER EXECUTIVE BOARD
14 MEMBER COMMENTS? I DO NOT SEE ANYTHING. MR. CLERK, DO WE HAVE
15 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

16

17 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THERE WERE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED
18 FOR THIS ITEM. NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARD ROOM FOR
19 THIS COMMENT AND NO ONE IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE FOR PUBLIC
20 COMMENT. THANK YOU.

21

22 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** I'D LIKE TO THANK BOTH, CAITLIN AND HEIDI,
23 FOR SHARING THIS PILLAR OF THE ESTUARY PARTNERSHIP WITH US,
24 BUT I WOULD ACTUALLY LIKE TO ASK YOU TO, AGAIN, ANNOUNCE THE

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 ESTUARY CONFERENCE DATES JUST SO -- THAT WAS THE BEGINNING,
2 SHORT BRAIN SPAN.

3

4 **CAITLIN SWEENEY:** VERY KIND OF YOU. THANK YOU. WE'RE GLAD TO
5 HAVE THE STATE OF THE ESTUARY CONFERENCE BACK IN PERSON FIRST
6 TIME SINCE 2019, PRE-COVID. MARCH 11, APPROXIMATE 12, 13.
7 EXCUSE ME. THE 11TH WILL BE A PRECONFERENCE WORKSHOP AND 12
8 AND 13 WILL BE A MAJOR PORTION OF THE CONFERENCE. REGISTRATION
9 IS OPEN AT OUR WEBSITE, SFESTUARY.ORG. THANK YOU.

10

11 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** THANK YOU SO MUCH. THAT CONCLUDES THIS
12 ITEM. AND REALLY, OUR -- OUR BUSINESS FOR THE DAY. BUT AS A
13 REMINDER, I SHOULD GIVE YOU A QUIZ NOW. OUR WORKSHOP ON THE
14 HOUSING BOND AND ALL THINGS BAHFA IS GOING TO BE ON THURSDAY,
15 MARCH 21, AND THE EXECUTIVE BOARD APPROVAL IS ON APRIL 18. SO,
16 AGAIN, FOR THOSE IN THE BACK, MARCH 21 AND APRIL 18. THIS --
17 WE ARE NOW GOING TO ADJOURN TO OUR NEXT REGULAR MEETING OF THE
18 ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD WHICH IS SCHEDULED HERE AT THE BAY AREA
19 METRO CENTER ON THURSDAY, MARCH 21, 2024, AND ANY CHANGES TO
20 THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. WE ARE
21 ADJOURNED. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** PRESIDENT RAMOS, THERE WAS A HAND RAISED
24 IN SAN JOSE.

25

Meeting Transcript

JANUARY 18, 2024

1 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** I DO SEE THAT. JUST ONE MOMENT. I

2 APOLOGIZE FOR THAT.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** I JUST WANTED TO NOTE FOR THE RECORD THAT HOUSE

5 MEMBER MARTINEZ-BELTRAN DID SHOW UP HERE DURING THE ESTUARY

6 PRESENTATION.

7

8 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** OKAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'LL HAVE THE

9 CLERK NOTE THAT. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU.

12

13 **PRES., BELIA RAMOS:** WE ARE ADJOURNED. THANK YOU, ALL, FOR YOUR

14 ATTENDANCE.

15



Broadcasting Government