

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE  
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 13<sup>TH</sup>, 2024, 9:45 AM**

**V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COUNCIL MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE. SPEAKERS WILL BE CALLED UPON AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. WILL THE CLERK PLEASE TAKE THE ROLL? THANK YOU

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR MILEY?

**V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** I'M HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

**CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER NON-VOTING EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

2

3 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

10

11 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. ITEM TWO IS THE CONSENT

16 CALENDAR; IT INCLUDES ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2I. IS THERE ANY

17 COMMISSIONER THAT WOULD LIKE TO PULL AN ITEM FROM THE CONSENT

18 CALENDAR? IF NOT, DO WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND TO APPROVE

19 THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVES APPROVAL.

22

23 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

24

25 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** DO WE HAVE ANY SPEAKERS?



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED IN WRITING NO  
3 ONE IN THE BOARDROOM AND NONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** MOTION PAPAN. SECOND BY GLOVER. OKAY.  
6 ALL RIGHT. IF THERE ARE NO OTHER COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM AND WE  
7 HAVE NO SPEAKERS, DO WE NEED -- CAN WE JUST DO ROLL CALL?

8

9 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** YOU CAN DO A VOICE VOTE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VOICE VOTE.

12

13 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL IN FAVOR? [AYES]

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY ABSTENTIONS? VERY GOOD. ITEM 3A  
16 REGIONAL SENATE BILL 125, REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE  
17 PROGRESS UPDATE ADOPTION OF THE FRAMEWORK FOR THE \$300 MILLION  
18 REGIONAL CONTRIBUTION TO COMPLEMENT SENATE BILL 125, EMERGENCY  
19 TRANSIT OPERATION FUNDING. AND AN INFORMATIONAL UPDATE ON THE  
20 STATUTES OF LARGE OPERATOR'S PROGRESS TOWARDS BILL 125  
21 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE. RALEIGH MCCOY WILL PRESENT  
22 THIS ITEM FOR COMMISSION APPROVAL.

23

24 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** THANK YOU AND GOOD MORNING. I'M RALEIGH MCCOY  
25 MTC FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM STAFF. I'M HERE TO PRESENT



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 UPDATE ON STATUTES OF THE SB125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY  
2 MEASURES FOR LARGE OPERATORS RECEIVING THOSE EMERGENCY  
3 OPERATIONS FUNDS AS WELL AS REQUEST APPROVAL FOR \$300 MILLION  
4 REGIONAL FUNDING FRAMEWORK WHICH WILL COMPLEMENT STATE SB125  
5 TO ADDRESS THE OPERATOR'S NEAR-TERM NEEDS. TODAY'S ACTION  
6 BUILDS ON ACTION OF THE COMMISSION IN DECEMBER 2023 WHEN THE  
7 APPROVED MTC'S SHORT-TERM FINANCIAL PLAN SUBMITTAL TO  
8 CALIFORNIA STATE TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY AND TODAY'S ACTION  
9 IS THE START OF OPERATIONALIZING USE OF \$300 MILLION IN  
10 REGIONAL FUNDS. NEXT SLIDE. LAST YEAR'S SENATE BILL 125 MADE  
11 \$5.1 BILLION AVAILABLE STATEWIDE ACROSS FISCAL YEARS IN LIGHT  
12 OF NEAR-TERM OPERATING SHORTFALLS FOLLOWING COVID-19 PANDEMIC  
13 STATE LEGISLATION ALLOWS FUNDS TO BE USED FLEXIBLY FOR  
14 OPERATING AND CAPITAL PURPOSES OF DISCRETION OF REGIONAL  
15 AGENCIES AND MTC REGIONAL AROUND \$500 MILLION OF SB125 FUNDS  
16 PLUS \$300 MILLION IN REGIONAL FUNDS WILL BE USED TO ADDRESS  
17 THE FISCAL CLIFF THROUGH END OF FISCAL YEAR 2025, 2026. NEXT  
18 SLIDE. STAFF HAS IDENTIFIED 300 MILLION IN UNPROGRAMMED FUNDS  
19 FROM FOUR FUND SOURCES AS YOU CAN SEE IN THE TABLE ON YOUR  
20 SLIDE. FIRST FTA FEDERAL FUNDS WHICH SUPPORT STATE OF GOOD  
21 REPAIR VEHICLE PROCUREMENT NEEDS THROUGH TRANSIT CAPITAL  
22 PRIORITIES OR TCP PROGRAM. SECOND TP CMAQ FUNDS WHICH SUPPORT  
23 LOCAL REGIONAL PRIORITIES THROUGH BAY AREA GRANT OBAG 1  
24 PROGRAM. THIRD BRIDGE TOLLS NAMELY RM3 OPERATING FUNDS FOR  
25 EXPRESS BUS SERVICE AND STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE POPULATION



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 BASED FUNDS SUPPORTING REGIONAL PRIORITIES SUCH AS OPERATIONS  
2 OF CLIPPER AND FARE PROGRAMS IMPORTANTLY WE WOULD LIKE TO  
3 EMPHASIZE THE REGIONAL FUNDS DO NOT AFFECT CURRENT FUNDING  
4 COMMITMENTS THAT WERE MADE THROUGH OBAG PROGRAMMING ACTIONS  
5 THROUGH EXISTING PROJECTS MAY DELAYED DUE TO CONSTRAINTS ON  
6 AMOUNT OF FUNDS THAT CAN BE OBLIGATED WITHIN A GIVEN YEAR WITH  
7 THAT SAID UTILIZING FUNDS FOR FISCAL CLIFF WILL DOES HAVE  
8 TRADE-OFFS WITH PRIORITIES INCLUDING LOCAL PRIORITIES FUNDED  
9 THROUGH OBAG PROGRAM AND OPERATOR'S OWN ASSET MAINTENANCE  
10 NEEDS. FOR EXAMPLE, THE CONTRIBUTION OF \$93 MILLION IN STP  
11 CMAQ FUNDS IS EQUIVALENT TO SHAVING OFF AROUND A HALF YEAR OF  
12 THE FOUR YEAR OBAG FOUR CYCLE. NEXT SLIDE. THE PROPOSED  
13 FUNDING FRAMEWORK TAKES THOSE FUNDING TABLES YOU SAW ON THE  
14 PREVIOUS SLIDE AND ASSIGNS TO OPERATORS BASED ON ELIGIBILITY  
15 REQUIREMENTS BY FUND SOURCE AND ABILITY TO MAKE USE OF FUNDS.  
16 TABLE ON THIS SIDE PROVIDE THE HIGH LEVEL SUMMARY OF THE  
17 REGIONAL FUNDING TOTALS THAT WOULD BE PROVIDED WITHIN THE  
18 FRAMEWORK AND THERE'S MORE DETAILED INFORMATION IN YOUR PACKET  
19 AS ATTACHMENT D TO RESOLUTION 4619. IN DEVELOPING THIS FUNDING  
20 FRAMEWORK STAFF SOUGHT TO MINIMIZE USE OF STP CMAQ FUNDS WHERE  
21 POSSIBLE ON LOCAL AND REGIONAL PRIORITIES AND TRANSIT AGENCY  
22 PARTNERS WERE INVOLVED IN DEVELOPMENT OF THE FRAMEWORK AND  
23 HAVE CONFIRMED ITS FEASIBILITY. NEXT SLIDE. THROUGH SHIFTING  
24 TO THEY SECOND HALF OF THIS PRESENTATION FOCUS ON SENATE BILL  
25 125 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES MTC ADOPTED LAST YEAR.



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 THE TABLE ON THE SLIDE SUMMARIZES REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY  
2 MEASURES. FOR ALL OPERATORS THAT ARE FACING A SHORTFALL THERE  
3 ARE REQUIREMENTS RELATED TO PARTICIPATION IN REGIONAL  
4 INITIATIVES, SCHEDULE COORDINATION, AND ADHERENCE TO BEST  
5 PRACTICES FOR GTFS DATA STANDARDS. ADDITIONALLY THE COMMISSION  
6 IDENTIFIED REQUIREMENTS THAT WERE SPECIFIC TO CERTAIN  
7 OPERATORS AS SHOWN ON THIS SLIDE INCLUDING ASSESSMENTS OF  
8 AMBASSADOR IN CRISIS PREVENTION PROGRAMS ADVANCEMENT TO  
9 EFFORTS TO CURTAIL FARE EVASION AND PROGRESS TOWARDS SERVICE  
10 OPTIMIZATION PLANNING. NEXT SLIDE. THIS GRAPHIC WILL WALK YOU  
11 THROUGH THE PROCESS FOR REPORTING ON THE REGIONAL  
12 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES. FIRST, THE OPERATORS PROVIDE AN  
13 INITIAL UPDATE ON THE STATUTES OF THEIR SENATE BILL 125  
14 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES TO MTC WHEN THEY SUBMIT THEIR ANNUAL  
15 CLAIM OF OPERATING FUNDS SO WE'RE ALREADY ON STEP ONE NOW AND  
16 HAVE RECEIVED MANY REPORTS TO DATE. NEXT MTC REVIEWS PROGRESS  
17 FOR ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES PRIOR TO ALLOCATING SENATE BILL  
18 125 FUNDS SUMMARY OF PROGRESS IS SHARED ALONG WITH REQUEST FOR  
19 APPROVAL AS ATTACHMENT. IF PROGRESS HAS NOT BEEN MADE MTC WILL  
20 IMPOSE REMEDIES AND COULD POTENTIALLY WITHHOLD SENATE BILL 125  
21 FUNDS UNTIL PROGRESS CAN BE DEMONSTRATED. FINALLY OPERATORS  
22 PROVIDE SECOND MID-YEAR UPDATE SCHEDULED FOR EARLY 2025 AND  
23 PAC WILL RECEIVE ANOTHER SUMMARY AT THAT TIME. NEXT SLIDE. SO,  
24 THE FOLLOWING SLIDES WILL PROVIDE HIGH-LEVEL UPDATE OF THE  
25 STATUTES OF REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES FOR FIVE LARGE



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 OPERATOR PRESIDENCY MORE DETAIL INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKETS AS  
2 ATTACHMENT A. FOR EACH MEASURE, STAFF HAS ASSESSED PROGRESS  
3 ASSIGNED IN THREE COLOR CODED DETERMINATIONS GREEN MAINTAIN  
4 CURRENT PERFORMANCE INDICATES OPERATORS CURRENTLY FULFILLING  
5 REQUIREMENTS AND SHOULD MAINTAIN CURRENT STANDARD OF PROGRESS.  
6 YELLOW IN PROGRESS WITH SATISFACTORY PROGRESS MADE INDICATING  
7 THE OPERATORS ON TRACK TO FULFILL THE ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE  
8 SO THEY'RE STILL A FINAL OUTCOME OR DELIVERABLE THAT IS  
9 PENDING. AND FINALLY THE RED IN PROGRESS WITH UNSATISFACTORY  
10 PROGRESS MADE INDICATING THE OPERATOR MUST ACCELERATE EFFORTS  
11 IN ORDER TO REMAIN ELIGIBLE FOR SB 125 FUNDS. TURNING TO AC  
12 TRANSIT AS YOU SEE ON YOUR SLIDE, AC TRANSIT IS CURRENTLY IN  
13 FULL COMPLIANCE WITH THE MEASURE TO PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL  
14 INITIATIVES AND HAS MADE SATISFACTORY PROGRESS ON THE  
15 REMAINING THREE INITIATIVES RELATED TO SCHEDULE COORDINATION  
16 DCFS DATA AND SERVICE OPTIMIZATION. ONE HIGHLIGHT FROM AC  
17 TRANSIT TRANSIT 2050+ INTEGRATED PLANNING EFFORT TOGETHER WITH  
18 MTC. LOOKING AHEAD STAFF LOOKING FOR AC TRANSIT TO PRIORITIZE  
19 ADOPTING COMMON OPERATOR SIGN UP SCHEDULE IN UPCOMING LABOR  
20 NEGOTIATION. NEXT SLIDE. TURNING TO BART, BART IS IN  
21 COMPLIANCE WITH THE MEASURE TO PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL  
22 INITIATIVES AND HAS MADE SATISFACTORILY PROGRESS ON  
23 ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES. HIGHLIGHT FOR YOU BART PROVIDED  
24 ADDITIONAL DETAILS ON THE CURRENT STATUTES UPCOMING MILESTONES  
25 RELATED TO INSTALLATION OF NEW FARE GATE SYSTEM WIDE NEW FARE





NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 GATES ARE OPEN AT EIGHT OF THE 50 STATIONS ACROSS THE BART  
2 SYSTEM AND BART ANTICIPATING CONSTRUCTION OF ADDITIONAL EIGHT  
3 STATIONS BEFORE CLOSE OF THIS CALENDAR YEAR IN PREPARATION FOR  
4 NEXT UPDATE STAFF MONITORING BART'S PROGRESS TOWARD  
5 INSTALLATION EVER ADDITIONAL FARE GATES AND ONGOING WORK TO F  
6 FULLY FUND THE PROJECT AND TRACK EFFECTS ON FARE COLLECTION.  
7 THIRD TURNING TO CALTRAIN CURRENTLY IN FULL COMPLIANCE WITH  
8 THE MEASURE PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL INITIATIVES SATISFACTORY  
9 PROGRESS ON REMAINING INITIATIVES ONE ITEM TO HIGHLIGHT  
10 CALTRANS UPDATE ON CRISIS PREVENTION PROGRAM MULTIFACETED  
11 APPROACH TO IMPROVING SAFETY ON TRAINS WITHIN THE CORRIDOR.  
12 SIGNAGE COORDINATION WITH PARTNER AGENCIES AND FUTURE PROGRAMS  
13 LOOKING FORWARD TO RECEIVING REPORT FROM CALTRAIN ASSESSING  
14 EFFECTIVENESS OF CRISIS PREVENTION PROGRAM AND LESSONS  
15 LEARNED. FOURTH OPERATOR GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT IN COMPLIANCE  
16 WITH THE MEASURE PARTICIPATING IN REGIONAL INITIATIVE IT IS  
17 SATISFACTORY PROGRESS TOWARD REMAINING MEASURES UPDATE GOLDEN  
18 GATE DOCUMENTED WORK ON THE COORDINATED TRANSIT SHORT  
19 INITIATIVE WHICH IS JOINT EFFORT BETWEEN LOCAL AND REGIONAL  
20 TRANSIT OPERATORS MTC SEEKING TO IMPROVE COORDINATION AROUND  
21 TRANSIT SERVICE ON YOU U.S. 101 CORRIDOR MOVING FORWARD STAFF  
22 LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUED ADVANCEMENT OF THE MASCOT'S WORK AND  
23 THE CONTINUED PARTNERSHIP INITIATIVES SUCH AS DEPLOYMENT OF  
24 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PILOTS. SFMTA IS CURRENTLY IN FULL  
25 COMPLIANCE WITH MEASURES TO PARTICIPATE IN REGIONAL



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 INITIATIVES AND HAVE MADE SATISFACTORY PROGRESS ON REMAINING  
2 MEASURES HIGHLIGHT SFMTA UPDATE IN PARTICIPATION UPCOMING  
3 MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROTOTYPE AT POWELL STREET STATION  
4 PROTOTYPE PROVIDING INSIGHTS TO INFORM FUTURE MAPPING AND  
5 WAYFINDING WORK REGION-WIDE LOOKING AHEAD STAFF ARE LOOKING  
6 FORWARD TO RECEIVING MORE INFORMATION ON SFMTA ON  
7 IMPLEMENTATION AND RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THEIR SAFETY EQUITY  
8 ACTION PLAN AS WELL AS ONGOING EFFORTS TO CURTAIL FARE EVASION  
9 ON MINI BUSES AND TRAINS. NEXT SLIDE. FINAL SLIDE CONCLUDING  
10 STAFF ARE TRACKING WORK ON SB125 FUNDING AND ACCOUNTABILITY  
11 MEASURES FUNDING MADE ITS FIRST ALLOCATION OF SB125 OPERATING  
12 FUNDS LAST OCTOBER TO BART AND ACE AND CONSIDER SFMTA'S  
13 ALLOCATION THIS MONTH TODAY'S RECOMMENDATION REFERRAL OF MTC  
14 RESOLUTION 4619 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL  
15 FORMALIZE \$300 MILLION IN REGIONAL FUNDING FRAMEWORK ADOPTION  
16 OF FUNDING FRAMEWORK STAFF WILL RETURN TO PAC IN DECEMBER TO  
17 REQUEST APPROVAL OF PROGRAMMING AND REGIONAL FUNDS TO ALIGN  
18 WITH FRAMEWORK TO START THOSE DOLLARS MOVING ADDITIONALLY  
19 PROGRESS TO CONTINUE ON REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES STAFF  
20 WILL CONTINUE TO PROVIDE ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE PROGRESS AS WE  
21 RECEIVE THEM FROM OPERATORS AND ANTICIPATE RETURNING TO PAC IN  
22 EARLY 2025. MID-YEAR UPDATE MTC STAFF ACROSS AGENCY ADVANCING  
23 COMPLEMENTARY REGIONAL INITIATIVES THAT WILL BE KEEPING THE  
24 COMMISSION UPDATED THROUGH FORUMS SUCH AS REGIONAL NETWORK



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE. THIS CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. HAPPY TO  
2 TAKE QUESTIONS

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** COMMISSIONERS?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU FOR THE INFORMATION ALSO FOR THE UPDATE.  
7 I APPRECIATE THAT. I AM CONCERNED ABOUT THE REGIONAL  
8 ACCOUNTABILITY. WHAT ARE THE REAL CONSEQUENCES? I SEE ALL THE  
9 GREAT EFFORTS AND THE -- ESPECIALLY THE UPDATE FROM BART, THAT  
10 THEY HOPE TO COMPLETE THE FARE GATES IN FEBRUARY, END OF  
11 FEBRUARY NEXT YEAR, WHICH WOULD BE FANTASTIC, BUT THEY HAVEN'T  
12 REACHED OUT TO COUNTY, AND THEY'RE EXPECTING A LARGE CHUNK OF  
13 MONEY FROM THERE. SO, WHAT CONSEQUENCES ARE THERE?

14

15 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERESA ROMMEL WITH MTC. THE CONSEQUENCES  
16 WOULD BE UP TO THE COMMISSION. BUT, OBVIOUSLY, WE WILL COME  
17 BACK IN EARLY 2025 WITH ANOTHER UPDATE ON THE PROGRESS MADE ON  
18 THOSE ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES. AND, ULTIMATELY, IF THE  
19 COMMISSION WERE TO FIND THAT AN OPERATOR WAS NOT LIVING UP TO  
20 THE ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURES THAT ARE PART OF RESOLUTION 4619,  
21 THEN YOU WOULD HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY, OR THE ABILITY TO  
22 WITHHOLD FUNDING.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN:** MTC HAS NEVER REALLY DONE THAT BEFORE. SOMEHOW, WE  
25 NEVER FOLLOW-THROUGH WITH ACCOUNTABILITY. AND WE ALL



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 UNDERSTAND HOW SIGNIFICANT THIS IS FOR EVERYBODY HERE. SO,  
2 AND, AGAIN, I APPRECIATE STAFF WORKING CLOSELY WITH THE  
3 OPERATORS, IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE, THOUGH,  
4 REALLY FORMALIZED, THE COORDINATION EFFORTS HERE. JUST TO SAY  
5 THEY'RE WORKING ON IT, THERE HAS BEEN MORE THAN ENOUGH TIME.  
6 WE IMPLEMENTED THE BLUE RIBBON RECOMMENDATIONS OVER -- LIKE  
7 FIVE YEARS AGO -- I DON'T KNOW -- BUT IT'S BEEN FIVE YEARS. I  
8 DON'T THINK IT'S ASKING TOO MUCH FOR ALL THESE OPERATORS TO  
9 GET IT FORMALIZED NOW. AND THERE HAS BEEN HUGE STEPS. BUT I  
10 WOULD LIKE TO SEE ASSURANCES AS TO FORMAL COORDINATION EFFORT  
11 WHERE IT CAN HAPPEN, INSTEAD OF JUST THE WORKING ON. AND, TWO,  
12 WITH EFFORT YOU MENTIONED WITH CALTRAIN HERE, I'M NOT SURE IF  
13 THAT WOULD INCLUDE ADA ACCOMMODATIONS. BECAUSE THEY NEED TO  
14 WORK ON ALTERNATIVES. I THINK, PROBABLY ALL THE OPERATORS NEED  
15 TO WORK ON ALTERNATIVES AT STATIONS WHEN THE ELEVATOR IS DOWN.  
16 WHEN THE ESCALATORS ARE BROKEN HERE. I HEARD A HORRIFIC STORY  
17 ON NEW YEAR'S EVE WHO GOT TO A STATION IN SAN MATEO COUNTY IN  
18 A WHEELCHAIR AND THERE WAS NO WAY OUT. UNLESS THE FIRE  
19 DEPARTMENT CAME AND SCARY CARRIED HIM OUT. AND THAT'S JUST NOT  
20 ACCEPTABLE. IN ANY WAY SHAPE OR FORM OR STANDARD EVERYWHERE.  
21 BECAUSE I GET THAT THE ELEVATOR IS OUT, I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE  
22 ANSWER IS, BUT THERE HAVE TO BE VIABLE ALTERNATIVES WHETHER  
23 IT'S DEPLOYABLE RAMP OF SOME KIND YOU KNOW, PROBABLY WOULD  
24 WORK BUT WE CANNOT HAVE PEOPLE PUT IN THAT POSITION. I DON'T  
25 THINK THIS IS A HUGE EXPENDITURE. I'M THINKING YOU JUST PUT A



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 RAMP SOMEWHERE AND ALLOW THAT TO HAPPEN. AND I SEE  
2 COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI HERE. AND, SO, IN ADDITION TO THAT, I  
3 WOULD LIKE TO MAKE SURE WE FORMALIZE AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE HERE.  
4 AND AS IT RELATES TO -- WHERE AM I. SLIDE THREE I GUESS I'M  
5 NOT THE ONLY ONE, SLIDE FOUR HERE 125 FUNDING BECAUSE PART OF  
6 THAT IS REGIONAL MONEY AND PART OF IT IS LOCAL MONEY. AND I  
7 KNOW WE'RE NOT GOING TO DISCUSS DISTRIBUTION HERE BUT IT'S  
8 GOING TO BE QUITE A BELOW AND I DON'T THINK MY JURISDICTION OR  
9 OTHER JURISDICTIONS WILL BE ABLE TO ACCEPT BECAUSE THOSE FUNDS  
10 ARE REALLY ACTIVELY USED THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO IT'S A  
11 CONCERN AS TO HOW THAT'S DISTRIBUTED -- MY APOLOGIES -- HOW  
12 THAT'S GOING TO HAPPEN. SO, I'M EXPRESSING THAT HERE. AND I  
13 THINK SOME OTHER PEOPLE MAY DO THE SAME. BECAUSE I DON'T THINK  
14 WE'RE GOING TO GET AGREEMENT ON THAT ASPECT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **THERESA ROMMELL:** AND THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF I CAN JUST RESPOND  
17 THE ISSUE YOU'RE RAISING ON LOCAL VERSUS REGIONAL FUNDING IS  
18 NOT SOMETHING THAT WE NEED TO ADDRESS TODAY I THINK YOU'RE  
19 REFERRING TO THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM OF WHICH THIS  
20 PROPOSAL WOULD REDUCE CAPACITY FOR THAT PROGRAM IN THE NEXT  
21 CYCLE. THAT DEFINITELY IS A TRAIT-OFF BUT HOW THAT PROGRAM IS  
22 STRUCTURED IS SOMETHING -- WHETHER FUNDING COMES OFF THE TOP  
23 OR COMES FROM ONE SIDE OR THE OTHER IS A DECISION YOU ALL WILL  
24 BE MAKING IN COMING MONTHS AS WE START TO STRUCTURE THAT  
25 PROGRAM.



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** WELL, AND THERE IS A LAST FACTOR HERE TOO. THIS  
3 FUNDING THAT GOES OUT, I THINK WE SHOULD HAVE DETAILS ON HOW  
4 IT'S BEING SPENT. WE SAY IT'S OPERATIONS. BUT I THINK IT'S  
5 FAIR TO ASK EVERY OPERATOR HOW YOU SPEND THIS MONEY. BECAUSE,  
6 LOOK, WE'RE LOOKING TO GO TO THE BALLOT IN THE FUTURE HERE.  
7 HOW ARE THEY -- HOW IS THAT MONEY GOING TO BE SPENT? IS IT,  
8 YOU KNOW -- IF IT'S OPERATIONS, WHAT ARE THE OPERATIONS?  
9 BECAUSE WE'RE GETTING DIFFERENT NUMBERS FROM DIFFERENT  
10 OPERATORS AS TO, WELL, YOU'RE GOING TO INCLUDE OPERATIONS THAT  
11 INCLUDE PART OF YOUR DEBT, PART OF YOUR CAPITAL EXPENDITURE.  
12 AND I KNOW THIS, OUR STAFF, REALLY STANDARDIZED, I BELIEVE, I  
13 HAVE BEEN TOLD, THIS WAS STANDARDIZED DEFICIT ANALYSIS. THAT  
14 NEEDS TO BE MAINTAINED, AND I BELIEVE THIS BODY SHOULD KNOW  
15 HOW THESE FUNDS REALLY GET SPENT OVER THE NEXT -- THIS GOES TO  
16 2026. WE NEED TO HOLD EVERYBODY ACCOUNTABLE, AND WE NEED TO  
17 LEARN FROM WHAT DOLLARS ARE BEING SPENT HERE FOR, BECAUSE  
18 NOBODY WANTS THE SAME OLD OPERATIONS. WE NEED IMPROVED  
19 OPERATIONS ESPECIALLY IF WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THE VOTERS ON  
20 SOMETHING. THANK YOU.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** WHAT GINA SAID. I DON'T MEAN TO BELABOR IT, BUT THOSE  
23 ARE THE CONCERNS FROM MY LOCAL STAFF AT OUR -- AT SONOMA  
24 COUNTY TRANSIT ABOUT THE FUTURE. AND I KNOW WE'LL GET TO HOW



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 WE ALLOCATE IT BUT I WANT TO GIVE YOU ALL PLENTY OF LEAD TIME  
2 TO KNOW THAT IS A REAL CONCERN. THANK YOU.

3

4 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I DO AGREE WITH WHAT  
5 COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAID. BUT I THINK, THERE IS ALSO A STORY TO  
6 TELL. AND I THINK WE HAVE GOT TO REMIND OURSELVES OF THAT.  
7 THERE ARE FOLKS DOING GOOD WORK AND I THINK NATURALLY WE TEND  
8 TO HIGHLIGHT OR OTHERS HIGHLIGHT THINGS THAT AREN'T WORKING  
9 BUT IN SPITE OF REGIONAL MEASURE THEY THINK FOLKS ARE GOING TO  
10 WORK ON, WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT WHAT IS WORKING. I WANT TO MAKE  
11 SURE THAT ALL OUR PARTNERS UNDERSTAND THAT AND WE ARE A  
12 PARTNER IN THAT. BUT WHEN WE LEARN THROUGH THIS REGIONAL  
13 MEASURE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO PUT TOGETHER IS THAT SOMETIMES WE  
14 ALL JUST GET INWARD FOCUS AND WE HAVE GOT TO CHALLENGE  
15 OURSELVES UNDERSTAND IT AS A REGION ALL THESE OPERATORS NEED  
16 TO DO GOOD AND THEY NEED TO PERFORM, AND I THINK OUR RESIDENTS  
17 EXPECT THAT IN THE FUTURE AND IF WE'RE GOING TO GO TO THEM AND  
18 ASK FOR ADDITIONAL FUNDS WE START TELLING THAT NARRATIVE  
19 BETTER. I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE DON'T LOSE SIGHT OF  
20 OPPORTUNITY, ACCOUNTABILITY, BUT ALSO STORY TELLING OF THE  
21 OUTCOME.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANYBODY ELSE? DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC  
24 COMMENT? ANY ITEMS FROM THE PUBLIC ON THIS?

25



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE.  
2 HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** IS TWO MINUTES.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** OKAY. VINAY PIMPLE. IF YOU COULD UNMUTE  
7 YOURSELF. YOUR TIME BEGINS NOW.

8

9 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I'M VINAY PIMPLE, I SERVE ON THE POLICY  
10 ADVISORY COUNCIL. THERE WAS WHEN YOU HAD THE FOUR THINGS, FOUR  
11 COMPLIANCE, AND ONE WAS SERVICE OPTIMIZATION, ET CETERA, I  
12 DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT MEANS. WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO KNOW IS,  
13 PARTICULARLY WITH THE BUS SERVICES, DO THEY HAVE ANY DATA  
14 ABOUT HOW OFTEN THE BUSES SHOW UP ON TIME? AND IN THE CASE OF  
15 THE BUS DELAYS, WHAT KIND OF DELAYS ARE EXPERIENCED. BECAUSE  
16 THAT REALLY IS THE SINGLE MOST IMPORTANT THING WHEN IT COMES  
17 TO BUS SERVICE. I DID NOT HEAR ANYTHING ABOUT THAT. THE OTHER  
18 THING I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO KNOW IS ABOUT THE FARE RECOVERY  
19 THING. AND JUST PARTICULARLY CONCERNED ABOUT THE SFMTA, WHICH  
20 EXPECTS EVERYBODY ELSE TO SUBSIDIZE IT, IT'S AN IMPORTANT  
21 SYSTEM OF BART, BUT HOW MUCH FARE RECOVERY ARE THEY DOING. I  
22 ALSO WANT TO KNOW WHETHER, WHEN WE HEAR ABOUT RIDERSHIP  
23 NUMBERS, THAT IT'S BACK AGAIN, ET CETERA, IS IT BEING RIDERS  
24 WHERE THE FARES ARE RECOVERED? OR IS THIS JUST AN ESTIMATE OF  
25 RIDERS THAT INCLUDES ON PAYING ONES? AGAIN THIS IS IMPORTANT





NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 BECAUSE YOU'RE ASKING PEOPLE OUTSIDE SAN FRANCISCO TO  
2 SUBSIDIZE IT BUT YOU'RE NOT COLLECTING THE FARES THAT YOU'RE  
3 SUPPOSED TO BE COLLECTING. AND THIS APPLIES FOR OTHER  
4 AGENCIES, AS WELL. BUT THOSE ARE THE TWO THINGS THAT I HOPE WE  
5 GET INFORMATION ABOUT. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE. NONE  
8 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

9

10 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT. SO, WOULD YOU LIKE TO RESPOND  
11 TO THE SPEAKERS'S QUESTIONS?

12

13 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** I CAN BRIEFLY. I HEARD A QUESTION ABOUT THE  
14 SERVICE ABOUT THE OPTIMIZATION SPECIFIC REQUIREMENTS FOR  
15 GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT AND AC TRANSIT HAS COMPLETED IT WITH THE  
16 REALIGN PLAN ALSO ON FARE COLLECTION FROM SFMTA, WE HEARD FROM  
17 SFMTA THEY'RE INCREASING STAFFING ON THE FARE COLLECTION  
18 MONITORS. I KNOW THAT IS AN AREA OF EMPHASIS THEY'RE PUTTING  
19 DOLLARS TOWARDS. I BELIEVE THERE WERE MORE TECHNICAL QUESTIONS  
20 WE CAN DEFINITELY GET BACK TO YOU ON THOSE. BUT THANK YOU FOR  
21 THE QUESTIONS.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** COMMISSIONER?

24



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** JUST TO COMMENT, I THINK ONE OF THE SPEAKER'S  
2 QUESTION WAS ABOUT ON TIME PERFORMANCE OF BUS OPERATORS. ONE  
3 OF THE THINGS THAT MIGHT BE WORTH CONTINUING TO FOLLOW UP ON  
4 ARE THE INTER JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES BECAUSE OF COURSE THE BUS  
5 OPERATORS ARE OPERATING ON STREETS THAT ARE OWNED, OFTEN, BY  
6 JURISDICTIONS OTHER THAN THE BUS OPERATORS THEMSELVES. AND,  
7 SO, THERE HAVE BEEN IMPORTANT PROJECTS WITH AC TRANSIT TO  
8 OPTIMIZE TRAFFIC SIGNAL TIMING, BUS LANES, QUEUE JUMPS, AND OF  
9 COURSE AC TRANSIT, THOSE JUST HAPPEN TO BE THE ONES I'M MOST  
10 FAMILIAR WITH, AND SOME ISSUES REQUIRE PARTICIPATION OF THE  
11 PEOPLE BEYOND THE BUS OPERATORS BUT THEY WERE GREAT AND HAVE  
12 BEEN SUCCESSFUL WITH THINGS THAT CAN BE DONE WITHIN SOME OF  
13 THE AREAS WITH BUS LANES AND TRAFFIC SIGNAL OPTIMIZATION AND  
14 THAT CAN DO A LOT TO IMPROVE THE TIMELY AND SPEED OF THE BUS  
15 ROUTES. THANK YOU.

16

17 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANYONE ELSE? ALL RIGHT CAN I GET A  
18 MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE REFERRAL OF SENATE BILL 125  
19 REGIONAL ACCOUNTABILITY MEASURE PROGRESS UPDATE, ADOPTION  
20 FRAMEWORK TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL?

21

22 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

23



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 **GINA PAPAN:** CAN I -- I WOULD LIKE TO SECOND, BUT I ALSO WOULD  
2 LIKE TO ENSURE THAT THE INFORMATION REQUESTED IS INCLUDED IN  
3 THE MOTION? IS THAT -- WOULD THAT --

4

5 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** OKAY TO THAT.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** I'LL SECOND.

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** MOTION BY GLOVER SECOND BY PAPAN. ALL IN  
10 FAVOR, SAY AYE. [AYES]

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ABSTENTIONS? ANY OPPOSITION? MOTION  
13 PASSES. OKAY. ITEM 4A. INFORMATIONAL. HOUSING ELEMENT  
14 COMPLIANCE RELATED ONE BAY AREA GRANT OBAG 2 AND 3 POLICIES.

15

16 **THOMAS ARNDT:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, FUNDING POLICY  
17 PROGRAM STAFF JOINED BY HEATHER PETERS PLANNING SECTION WE'RE  
18 HERE TO UPDATE ON THE HOUSING ELEMENT CERTIFICATIONS ONE BAY  
19 AREA GRANT OBAG PROGRAM SPONSORS JURISDICTIONS WHO ARE  
20 IMPACTED. NEXT SLIDE. RECAP OF RECENT COMMISSION ITEMS RELATED  
21 TO OBAG HOUSING ELEMENT REQUIREMENTS. JANUARY 2022 THE  
22 COMMISSION ADOPTED THE OBAG 3 PROGRAM WHICH INCLUDED A  
23 REQUIREMENT THAT JURISDICTIONS CERTIFIED THEIR HOUSING  
24 ELEMENTS FOR THE CURRENT REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION  
25 RHNA BY THE END OF 2023 IN RECOGNITION THAT HOUSING ELEMENT



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 CERTIFICATION WOULD BE MORE DIFFICULT THIS CYCLE SO THAT  
2 DEADLINE, THAT INITIAL DEADLINE GAVE JURISDICTIONS 11 MONTHS  
3 AFTER THE STATE DEADLINE OF JANUARY 2023. HOWEVER, IN DECEMBER  
4 OF 2023, IT WAS APPARENT THAT MANY OBAG RECIPIENTS WOULD NOT  
5 MEET MTC'S HOUSING ELEMENT CERTIFICATION DEADLINE. SO, AT THAT  
6 TIME, THE COMMISSION ADOPTED A GRACE PERIOD APPROACH, WHICH  
7 EXTENDED THE DEADLINE AND GAVE JURISDICTIONS ANOTHER YEAR TO  
8 CERTIFY THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS. AND AS PART OF THAT ACTION,  
9 THE COMMISSION REQUESTED A MID-YEAR UPDATE ON STATUTES EVER  
10 HOUSING ELEMENT COMPLIANCE AND STAFF PROVIDED THAT UPDATE IN  
11 JUNE. AT THE JUNE MEETING COMMISSIONERS REQUESTED TODAY'S ITEM  
12 WHICH GOES DEEPER INTO THE REASONS BEHIND THE HOUSING ELEMENT  
13 CERTIFICATION DELAYS. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE CURRENTLY WITHHOLDING  
14 A TOTAL \$16 MILLION IN ONE BAY AREA GRANT FUNDING FROM JUST  
15 FOUR JURISDICTIONS THAT ARE LISTED ON THE SLIDE THESE INCLUDE  
16 ALAMEDA COUNTY, DALY CITY, SAN MATEO COUNTY, AND VALLEJO, OUR  
17 CURRENT POLICY ADOPTED LAST YEAR IS TO RESCIND FUNDS FOR ANY  
18 JURISDICTION THAT DOESN'T HAVE HOUSING ELEMENT CERTIFIED BY  
19 DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING HCD BY END OF THIS YEAR. WITH THAT  
20 BACKGROUND IN MIND I'LL BE HANDING OFF TO HEATHER TO DISCUSS  
21 EACH JURISDICTION IN DETAIL.

22

23 **HEATHER PETERS:** HELLO MY NAME IS HEATHER PETERS, PRINCIPLE  
24 REGIONAL HOUSING PLANNER HERE WITH MTC ABAG RUNNING OUR  
25 REGIONAL HOUSING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM THAT HELPS LOCAL



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 JURISDICTIONS NAVIGATE THIS RATHER DIFFICULT PATH WITH HCD TO  
2 GET THEIR HOUSING ELEMENTS CERTIFIED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I  
3 HAVE BEEN IN CLOSE CONVERSATION WITH STAFF FROM ALL FOUR  
4 JURISDICTIONS THAT WE'RE DISCUSSING TODAY AS WELL AS STAFF  
5 FROM HCD AND IN YOUR PACKET YOU HAVE ATTACHMENT A THAT  
6 INCLUDES A LOT MORE DETAIL THAN YOU SEE ON THE SLIDE FOR EACH  
7 OF THESE JURISDICTIONS. HOWEVER, THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT  
8 COMMONALITIES, COMMON CHALLENGES IN ALL THE JURISDICTIONS,  
9 INCLUDING STAFFING AND CONSULTANT SHORTAGES, AS WELL AS SOME  
10 UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES IN EACH JURISDICTION. AS WE ALL KNOW WE  
11 ALL HAVE OUR UNIQUE CHALLENGES. ALAMEDA COUNTY HAD A CHALLENGE  
12 THAT WAS UNIQUE IN THAT THEY PROVIDE THAT EACH DRAFT OF THE  
13 HOUSING ELEMENT IS PRESENTED TO MULTIPLE MUNICIPAL WILL  
14 ADVISORY COUNCILS. AND EACH OF THOSE MEET UNDER THE BROWN ACT  
15 SO THAT HAS ADDED SOME DELAY. DALY CITY DID NOT COMPLETE ITS  
16 REQUIRED ZONING ON TIME. SAN MATEO COUNTY HAD CHALLENGES IN  
17 IDENTIFYING SUITABLY DEVELOPABLE LAND, GIVEN ITS TOPOGRAPHY  
18 AND THE COASTAL ZONE. AND VALLEJO HAD SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES  
19 ENGAGE THEIR VERY DIVERSE POPULATION. I DO HAVE SOME GOOD  
20 NEWS, HOT OFF THE PRESSES IN THE LAST COUPLE OF DAYS, IN  
21 SPEAKING TO THESE STAFFERS, HAS BEEN UPDATED SINCE YOUR PACKET  
22 WAS PRESENTED. HAPPY TO REPORT THAT ALAMEDA COUNTY HAS  
23 RECEIVED A LETTER IN HCD FINDING THAT ITS HOUSING ELEMENT IS  
24 SUBSTANTIALLY COMPLIANT SUBJECT TO FINAL ADOPTION. AND THEY  
25 ARE STILL FACING FOUR MORE PUBLIC MEETINGS BEFORE THE END OF



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 THE YEAR, AND WILL REQUIRE HCD APPROVAL. BUT HCD IS AWARE AND  
2 READY TO ACT PROMPTLY. SO, THEY DO HAVE A PATH FORWARD. AND WE  
3 WILL SEE WHAT HAPPENS AT THOSE PUBLIC MEETINGS. I ALSO HAVE  
4 GREAT NEWS FROM DALY CITY. LAST NIGHT, THEY ADOPTED THEIR  
5 ZONING AND THEIR HOUSING ELEMENT AS URGENCY ACTION. SO,  
6 THEY'RE IMMEDIATELY APPLICABLE. AND HCD IS EXPECTED TO CERTIFY  
7 FULLY VERY SHORTLY. UNFORTUNATELY, VALLEJO IS FACING SOME  
8 CONTINUING CHALLENGES IN IDENTIFYING SUITABLE SITES. THEIR  
9 STAFF REPORTS THAT THEY HAVE A PATH, THEY'RE TRYING TO SET A  
10 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING FOR 11/25, WHICH IS THE WEEK OF  
11 THANKSGIVING. SO THAT WILL BE A CHALLENGE, AND ADOPTION AT  
12 COUNCIL IN DECEMBER. SO, THEY ALSO HAVE A PATH, BUT IT'S  
13 GETTING SIGNIFICANTLY MORE NARROW AS TIME PASSES. AND SAN  
14 MATEO COUNTY, UNFORTUNATELY, CONFIRMED AS A NEW REPORT, THAT  
15 THEY WILL NOT BE ABLE TO MEET THE DEADLINE. THEY HAVE REZONING  
16 AND DO THEY HAVE CONSULTANTS THAT DO NOT EXPECT TO BE ABLE TO  
17 GET THAT DONE UNTIL EARLY 2025. ALL THAT BEING SAID, ONE THING  
18 ALL OF THEM HAVE IN COMMON IS THAT THEY ALL GOT SIGNIFICANTLY  
19 LATE STARTS ON THE PROCESS. SUBMITTING THEIR FIRST DRAFTS TO  
20 THE STATE BETWEEN 6 AND 16 MONTHS LATER THAN RECOMMENDED BY  
21 ABAG STAFF. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SHOWS THE TIMING OF THE  
22 FIRST DRAFT AND BREAKS DOWN EXACTLY WHEN THEY WERE SUBMITTED  
23 TO HCD AND HOW LATE THEY WERE COMPARED TO ABAG'S  
24 RECOMMENDATION. AND, AGAIN, THAT'S A RECOMMENDATION. THERE WAS  
25 NO STATUTORY REQUIREMENT OF WHEN THEY NEEDED TO PROVIDE FIRST



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 DRAFTS, BUT THERE WERE MANY STEPS YOU NEED TO TAKE TO GET  
2 CERTIFIED. SO THAT WAS OUR RECOMMENDATION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE.  
3 SO, OUR NEXT STEPS IN THIS PROCESS, WE WILL CONTINUE TO HELP  
4 NON-COMPLIANT JURISDICTIONS TO MEET THEIR DEADLINES. HCD STAFF  
5 HAS BEEN VERY GRACIOUS AND HAS AGREED TO EXPEDITE REVIEW OF  
6 ALL SUBMISSIONS BY THESE JURISDICTIONS. AND THEY ARE  
7 PREVIEWING THE REZONING PROPOSALS THAT ARE REQUIRED. AND  
8 THAT'S A HUGE HELP. BECAUSE A LOT OF FOLKS ARE TRIPPING UP ON  
9 THE REZONING. MTC STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO COORDINATE WITH THE  
10 JURISDICTIONS, AND WE'LL RETURN TO YOU EARLY NEXT YEAR WITH  
11 THE FINAL UPDATE AS TO HOW THINGS TURNED OUT ON DECEMBER 31ST.  
12 AND WE'LL RECOMMEND ANY PROGRAMMING ACTIONS NECESSARY TO  
13 RESCIND FUNDS IF REQUIRED. AND WITH THAT, WE'RE CONCLUDED,  
14 UNLESS YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS.

15

16 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

17

18 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU TO MTC STAFF. BECAUSE YOUR  
19 RELATIONSHIP WITH HCD IN GETTING THESE EXPEDITED, IT'S HUGE.  
20 AND WALKING THEM THROUGH THE PROCESS AND REALLY GETTING THEM  
21 MOVING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. BECAUSE I KNOW IT'S BEEN  
22 DIFFICULT FOR SOME OF THESE CITIES TO GET EXPERTS ON BOARD TO  
23 HELP WITH THE WHOLE PROCESS. BUT MTC HAS REALLY COME TO REALLY  
24 HELP EVERYBODY. AND THAT'S BEEN GREAT. BECAUSE THE  
25 JURISDICTIONS DO WANT TO DO THE RIGHT THING HERE. I HAD



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 UNDERSTAND DIFFERENTLY -- AND I'M NOT THE COUNTY  
2 REPRESENTATIVE [LAUGHTER] FOR SAN MATEO, BUT I UNDERSTAND  
3 THEY'RE WORKING ON SOMETHING TO COMPLY HERE. YOU'RE PRESENTING  
4 SOMETHING SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT IN THAT REALM.

5

6 **HEATHER PETERS:** I JUST MAY NOT BE SPEAKING AS CLEAR AS I  
7 SHOULD.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** THERE WAS GOING TO BE A TRANSFER OF LAND TO THE  
10 CITY OF REDWOOD CITY?

11

12 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THERESA ROMMEL MTC. THROUGH THE CHAIR, THERE  
13 IS A LETTER I THINK YOUR PACKET ATTACHED FROM SEAN C, CCAG  
14 EXPLAINS THE SITUATION THEY HAVE REQUESTED SINCE ONE OF THE  
15 PROJECTS IS A JOINT SPONSORED PROJECT BETWEEN SAN MATEO COUNTY  
16 AND REDWOOD CITY THEY HAVE REQUESTED TO TRANSFER SPONSORSHIP  
17 SOLELY TO REDWOOD CITY WHICH IS SOMETHING THAT WE WILL PRESENT  
18 DURING WHEN WE COME BACK AS AN OPTION AND I THINK THEY HAVE  
19 ALSO ASKED FOR EXTENSION FOR DALY CITY, BRINGING BACK TO YOU  
20 IN JANUARY OR FEBRUARY.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN:** HOPEFULLY DALY CITY WON'T NEED THE EXTENSION,  
23 RIGHT. THEY CAN GET THAT DONE. FINGERS CROSSED. I WOULD LIKE  
24 TO POINT OUT FOR MY COLLEAGUES, DEVELOPMENT ON THE COAST  
25 EXTREMELY DIFFICULT BECAUSE YOU RUN INTO COASTAL COMMISSION.





NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 CITIES GET MIXED MESSAGES. YOU CAN DO THAT I MEAN IT'S BEEN A  
2 DISASTER I MEAN LEGISLATION SIMPLIFYING IT WOULD BE GREAT WE  
3 HAVE GOT SEVERAL COASTAL CITIES THAT ARE JUST LIKE WHAT DO WE  
4 DO. WE CAN PLAN BUT THEN COASTAL COMMISSION IS GOING TO OBJECT  
5 AND WE KNOW WE'RE NOT MEETING OUR REQUIREMENTS HERE SO I DON'T  
6 KNOW IF THIS BODY CAN HELP IN THAT REALM BECAUSE IT'S BEEN  
7 DIFFICULT TO GET THINGS DONE. I KNOW THE COUNTY HAS A LOT OF  
8 LAND OUT THERE THEY WOULD LIKE TO MAKE WORK AND PROVIDE  
9 HOUSING, ESPECIALLY FARM WORKER HOUSING, WHICH THEY NEED. SO,  
10 AGAIN, I'M JUST MENTIONING THIS TO MY COLLEAGUES THAT THIS IS  
11 NOT A PURPOSEFUL THING HERE, BUT ANY WAY THAT THIS BODY, OR  
12 ANYBODY, CAN HELP IN SIMPLIFYING THAT PROCESS OR AT LEAST  
13 GETTING SOME STANDARDIZATION SO PEOPLE CAN FOLLOW IT, IT WOULD  
14 BE VERY HELPFUL. BUT FIRST AND FOREMOST THANK YOU TO OUR STAFF  
15 FOR BEING SO HELPFUL TO THE JURISDICTIONS IN TRYING TO  
16 EXPEDITE, ESPECIALLY WITH HCD, [LAUGHTER] SO, YOUR  
17 RELATIONSHIP WITH THEM, KEY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. YES, THANK YOU TO STAFF, AND  
20 THANK YOU FOR ASSISTING ALL OF OUR MUNICIPALITIES. MY QUESTION  
21 IS ABOUT MOVING FORWARD. AND APOLOGIZE IF THIS IS TANGENTIAL,  
22 BUT IF -- AS THEY COME TOWARDS THE END OF THIS WHOLE PROCESS,  
23 I WAS WONDERING WHAT OUR RULE IS IN TERMS OF TAKING FEEDBACK  
24 FROM THE DIFFERENT CITIES AND COUNTIES OF THE PROCESS. AND,  
25 JUST BECAUSE, IN OUR -- WELL, I MEAN, WE HEAR FROM EVERYWHERE,



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 BUT -- THERE WAS A VERY ARDUOUS PROCESS, AND I COMPLETELY  
2 UNDERSTAND AND AM SYMPATHETIC WITH THESE AGENCIES THAT HAVE  
3 HAD STAFFING CHALLENGES, AND THEY'RE -- THIS WAS NOT A LOT OF  
4 ACCOMMODATE -- OR CONSIDERATION TAKEN. WE HAVE HAD TO PULL  
5 STAFF FROM ACTUALLY WORKING ON HOUSING PROJECTS TO DO THIS  
6 PLANNING. THERE IS ALSO THE FACT THAT WE'RE GOING INTO AN  
7 ECONOMY THAT MAY NOT BE PRODUCING HOUSING. WE HAVEN'T SEEN A  
8 HOUSING PROJECT, I THINK, THIS WHOLE YEAR, OTHER THAN BUILD A  
9 REMEDY PROJECT. SO, I DON'T, FRANKLY, THINK ANYONE IS GOING TO  
10 MEET THESE TARGETS BY 2031. [LAUGHTER] AND, SO, THERE IS  
11 OBVIOUSLY A LOT OF, YEAH, A LOT OF FEEDBACK TO BE GIVEN, AND  
12 JUST WAS WONDERING WHAT VEHICLES THERE WILL BE. THE OTHER  
13 ISSUE IS JUST FRESH OFF MY MIND, BECAUSE WE TALKED ABOUT IT  
14 LAST NIGHT AT OUR COUNCIL MEETING WHERE WE HAD TO APPROVE THE  
15 ELIMINATION OF PARKING REQUIREMENTS FOR RESIDENTIAL. AND WHAT  
16 I FOUND WAS THAT THINGS LIKE BIKE PARKING AND CAR SHARE  
17 PARKING ARE ALL TIED TO THAT. SO, WE HAD TO ELIMINATE ALL OF  
18 THAT. AND IT SEEMS SO TO GO COUNTER TO WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO  
19 HERE AND TRYING TO PROMOTE LESS SOV USAGE. SO THERE'S JUST A  
20 LOT OF THESE DETAILS THAT HAVE COME UP THAT REALLY SEEM TO  
21 CONFLICT AND IT'S MAKING IT REALLY KIND OF UNREALISTIC,  
22 FRANKLY, SO HOW DO WE PROVIDE THAT FEEDBACK TO HCD AND TO THE  
23 STATE THAT THIS NEEDS TO BE A MUCH BETTER PROCESS AND A  
24 REALISTIC ONE?  
25



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 **HEATHER PETERS:** WE CERTAINLY APPRECIATE THAT AND OUR HOUSING  
2 TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE PROGRAM HEARS QUITE FREQUENTLY [LAUGHTER]  
3 OF ALL THE CHALLENGES. THERE IS GOOD NEWS THAT HCD HAS A  
4 FORMAL REVIEW AND INPUT PROCESS FOR RHNA REFORM THAT ARE PART  
5 OF THE KITCHEN CABINET ON THAT BEING LED BY CALCOG STATEWIDE  
6 ASSOCIATION OF COGS IN CONVERSATION WITH HCA A LOT OF IT IS  
7 LEGISLATIVE. HCD IMPLEMENTS REQUIREMENTS OF THE LEGISLATURE SO  
8 THAT'S ALSO A PLACE TO BE HEARD ON THE PARKING IT. OC WORK.  
9 ALSO NOT THE PERSON WHO DOES THAT BUT OUR COLLEAGUES ARE IN  
10 CONSTANT CONVERSATION WITH THE JURISDICTIONS ABOUT THAT AND  
11 THOSE CHALLENGES I'M HAPPY TO REPORT THAT WE HAVE \$60 MILLION  
12 OUT IN CALL FOR PROJECTS RIGHT NOW FOR TOC COMPLIANCE SO IF  
13 YOUR JURISDICTIONS HAVEN'T BEEN PART OF THAT PLEASE GET THEM  
14 LOOKING AT IT AND YES WE CONTINUE TO HAVE CONVERSATIONS ACROSS  
15 ALL OF THOSE REALMS WITH THE STATE AND MY COUNTERPARTS IN THE  
16 LEGISLATIVE TEAM.

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. WHEN I SEE THERE IS A SHORTAGE IN  
21 CONSULTANTS AND STAFF, I'M BLOWN AWAY ESPECIALLY ON THE  
22 CONSULTANT SIDE. WHEN WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT ABAG AND THE  
23 OPPORTUNITY TO FIND VALUE WHERE WE CAN HELP I THINK ACCEPTING  
24 THERE IS A SHORTAGE OF STAFF, I THINK IT'S A MISSED  
25 OPPORTUNITY FOR ABAG AND TECHNICAL EXPERTISE THAT WE CAN



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 HOUSE. AND IT'S NOT THE FIRST TIME WE HAVE HEARD THIS. I THINK  
2 WHEN PRESIDENT ARREGUIN WAS PRESIDENT OF ABAG AND WE DID A  
3 LISTENING TOUR IN THE REGION IT WAS A CONSTANT THING WE HEARD  
4 SHORTAGE OF STAFF. IF WE CONTINUE TO SEE THAT WE HAVE TO LOOK  
5 AT HOW WE CAN BE PART OF THAT SOLUTION. AND I KNOW IN SOME  
6 COMMUNITIES THERE IS A BIT OF LOCAL CONTROL AND I DON'T WANT  
7 AN OUTSIDE PERSON COMING IN BUT HERE IS AN OUTCOME THAT I THEY  
8 DON'T WANT EITHER, WITHHOLDING FUNDS. SO I THINK WE HAVE TO GO  
9 BACK TO THAT DRAWING BOARD AND FIGURE HOW THE -- WE CAN PLAY A  
10 ROLE IN IT AND SOMETHING WE SOME FOLLOW UP ON. AND ON THE  
11 NIMBY'S COMING IN AND SAYING I DON'T WANT THAT ZONING HERE I  
12 THINK WE HAVE TO LOOK AT THE PROCESS, I THINK THE PROCESS FOR  
13 THOSE HOUSING CHAMPIONS WE USE A LOT OF POLITICAL CAPITAL BUT  
14 WE ALSO OPEN OURSELVES UP TO CRITICISM FROM THAT NEIGHBOR THAT  
15 DOESN'T WANT IT NEAR THEM. I THINK WE HAVE TO LOOK AT REFORMS  
16 WHAT PROCESSES WE DO, WHERE WE CAN PLAY A ROLE AND WHAT  
17 LEGISLATION DO WE PLAY IN THAT. IT DOESN'T MEAN THAT THE  
18 PUBLIC DOESN'T HAVE A CHANCE TO PARTICIPATE IT JUST MEANS WE  
19 HAVE TO BE A BIT MORE EFFICIENT IN HOW WE DO IT I DON'T KNOW  
20 IF THERE IS ANYTHING TO RESPOND IT WAS JUST MORE COMMENTS.  
21 THANK YOU.

22

23 **LIBBY SCHAAF:** YEAH, I JUST THOUGHT I WOULD PILE ON. AND I WANT  
24 TO UNDERSCORE WHAT COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA SAID. AND I HOPE,  
25 ANDY, IN YOUR TRAVELS WITH YOUR COLLEAGUES IN THESE MPOS,



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 THERE SHOULD BE AN OVERARCHING CONVERSATION ABOUT THE BALANCE  
2 BETWEEN PLANNING AND PRODUCING. AND I HOPE WE DON'T JUST LIMIT  
3 IT TO RHNA AND THE HOUSING ELEMENTS, BUT I -- RECENTLY, I WANT  
4 TO THANK DAVE VAUTIN WHO CAME OUT TO MY CLASS AT UC BERKELEY  
5 ON CLIMATE, POLITICS, FINANCE, AND INFRASTRUCTURE, TO REALLY  
6 DIG INTO SB 375 AND THAT PLANNING PROCESS AND HOW IT IS NOT  
7 ACTUALLY IN SYNC WITH THESE OTHER PLANNING PROCESSES. AND SO I  
8 JUST -- I HOPE THAT AS YOU DIG INTO THE INEFFICIENCIES,  
9 POTENTIALLY, OR WASTED OPPORTUNITIES OF RHNA AND THE HOUSING  
10 ELEMENTS THAT, WE ACTUALLY LOOK AT ALL, ALL OF THE  
11 LEGISLATIVELY MANDATED PLANNING PROCESSES AND SEE IF WE CANNOT  
12 ACTUALLY MARRY AND COMBINE THEM, ONE, SO THAT WE ACTUALLY HAVE  
13 A BETTER PLAN, TWO, SO THAT IT ACTUALLY IS EASIER TO PUT SOME  
14 TEETH INTO, WHICH IS ONE OF THE SHORTCOMINGS, PARTICULARLY, OF  
15 SB 375, AND, 4, SO THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY TAKE OUR LIMITED  
16 RESOURCES AND USE THEM TO ACTUALLY PRODUCE THE RESULT THAT IS  
17 OUR COMMUNITIES NEED. SO, JUST -- I WANTED TO NOT FORGET SOME  
18 OF THE OTHER PLANNING PROCESSES THAT WE -- WE -- THEY'RE  
19 IMPORTANT, BUT BECAUSE THEY'RE SO DISPERSED, I DON'T THINK  
20 WE'RE ACTUALLY GETTING WHAT WE NEED OUT OF THEM AND IT'S TIME  
21 TO STEP BACK AND HAVE THAT CONVERSATION, AND I KNOW WE'RE  
22 ALWAYS IN THE DAILY GRIND. BUT, ANYWAY, I'M VERY EXCITED ABOUT  
23 HAVING THAT TYPE OF CONVERSATION. I SEE WILD NODDING FROM YOUR  
24 STAFF IN THE -- I THINK YOU KNOW WHAT I'M TALKING ABOUT. THANK  
25 YOU.



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1  
2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** A FEW COMMENTS. LET ME -- LET'S SEE HOW  
3 I WANT TO PHRASE THIS. I APPRECIATE EVERYTHING I HAVE HEARD  
4 FROM MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS, AND I WILL SECOND THAT. BUT, I  
5 WANT TO SAY, THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS IN ALAMEDA COUNTY, WE'RE  
6 NOT PLEASED TO SEE OUR COUNTY ON THIS LIST. I AM THE PRESIDENT  
7 OF THE BOARD, AND WE'RE NOT PLEASED. I KNOW THE AGENCY  
8 DIRECTOR FOR OUR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AGENCY IS HERE. I  
9 SUSPECT SHE'S GOING TO SPEAK. SHE'S A DIRECT HIRE OF THE  
10 BOARD, AND THE PLANNING DIRECTOR FOR THE COUNTY, SHE HIRES. WE  
11 EXPECT TO GET THIS ACCOMPLISHED. NOW, ON MUNICIPAL ADVISORY  
12 COUNCILS, THEY'RE ADVISORY. AND IT'S ABOUT 130,000 PEOPLE THAT  
13 ARE WITHIN THE URBAN UNINCORPORATED AREA, IF THE COUNT THE  
14 RURAL AREA, PROBABLY 150,000, 14 CITIES IN ALAMEDA COUNTY,  
15 CORPORATE AREA WOULD BE FOURTH LAW ENFORCEMENT CITY OR  
16 UNINCORPORATED, ONLY OAKLAND, FREMONT, HAYWARD WOULD BE  
17 LARGER. SO THE MUNICIPAL ADVISORY COUNCILS HAVE MET. THEY  
18 OPPOSE THE HOUSING ELEMENT. MY CHIEF OF STAFF INFORMED ME OF  
19 THAT. SO THIS HAS TO GO TO OUR PLANNING COMMISSION AND THEN  
20 COME TO THE COMMITTEES FOR THE BOARD AND ULTIMATELY FULL BOARD  
21 OF SUPERVISORS. SO, WE'RE GOING TO GET IT DONE. AND IT'S AN  
22 EMBARRASSMENT TO BE ON THIS LIST. AND I DON'T WANT TO THROW  
23 ANYONE UNDER THE BUS. I KNOW MY FRIENDS FROM OAKLAND, FORMER  
24 MAYOR SCHAFF AND COUNCIL PERSON KAPLAN, WHO KNOW ME WELL, AND  
25 I HAVE KIND OF MELLOWED OVER THE YEARS [LAUGHTER] BUT, TRUST



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 ME, I STILL CARRY A BIG STICK. SO, THAT'S ALL I WANT TO SAY AT  
2 THE MOMENT. AND I KNOW THERE IS CORRESPONDENCE, BUT I'LL WAIT  
3 FOR IT, HOPEFULLY SANDY IS GOING TO SPEAK. ANYONE ELSE?  
4 COMMISSIONER KAPLAN?

5

6 **REBECCA KAPLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH CHAIR MILEY. IT'S A PLEASURE  
7 TO BE HAVING THIS REUNION GOING ON HERE TODAY. I DO WANT TO  
8 SUPPORT THE COMMENTS ABOUT LOOKING MORE SYSTEMATICALLY ABOUT  
9 THE PROCESS BARRIERS THAT ARE IMPEDING THE DEVELOPMENT OF  
10 NEEDED HOUSING AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO HAVE THE BIG  
11 PICTURE PERSPECTIVE OF HOW MUCH IT'S HURTING OUR REGION TO NOT  
12 HAVE ENOUGH HOUSING. THE HARM THAT IS IT CAUSES WIDESPREAD  
13 IMPACTS FAR BEYOND ANY ONE JURISDICTION AND THAT OUR REGION AS  
14 A WHOLE IS SUFFERING AND LOSING PEOPLE ARE MOVING OUTSIDE OUR  
15 REGION THEN COMMUTING BACK INTO IT OR IN OTHER CASES JUST  
16 LEAVING CALIFORNIA ALTOGETHER, AND IT'S CAUSING ISSUES WITH  
17 CONGRESSIONAL APPORTIONMENT AND ISSUES WITH LOCAL BUDGETS SO  
18 MAKING SURE WE'RE ADDRESSING THE BARRIERS BEING ABLE TO HAVE  
19 SUFFICIENT HOUSING IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT AND SO WE HEARD THE  
20 COASTAL COMMISSION I WANT TO UPLIFT THAT AND MAKE SURE THAT  
21 DOESN'T GET DROPPED, THEN WE HAVE POTENTIAL UNIFIED ADVOCACY  
22 AT THE STATE LEVEL AND SOME OF THE BARRIERS THAT WE'RE FACING  
23 AS A REGION ALSO KEEP IN MIND THAT OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT  
24 OPERATORS ARE FACING SEPARATELY IN TERMS OF REGIONAL FUNDING  
25 MEASURES AND IMPROVED BY HAVING MORE HOUSING BUILT AROUND



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 TRANSIT HUBS THAT WOULD HELP SOLVE LONG-TERM LEVEL OF TRANSIT  
2 USAGE THAT WOULD SUPPORT THOSE FUNDING THAT HAVE IMPEDIMENTS  
3 THAT HAVE IMPACTS TO OUR TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM AS WELL, AND  
4 ALSO SHOULD LOOK AT IN TERMS OF STATE DECISIONS THAT ARE  
5 IMPEDING BAY AREA HOUSING PRODUCTION THERE WERE CHANGES MADE A  
6 COUPLE OF YEARS AGO TO TCAC AND SDLAC SCORING WHICH IS  
7 DEVASTATINGLY HARMFUL TO THE BAY AREA AND AS A WHOLE IS DOWN  
8 SCORED INTENTIONALLY THERE IS SYSTEMIC PRACTICE WHEN PROJECTS  
9 APPLY FOR STATE TAX CREDITS FOR HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT IF  
10 YOU ARE IN THE BAY AREA YOUR SCORE IS REDUCED FOR BEING IN THE  
11 BAY AREA RELATIVE TO OTHER PARTS OF THE STATE IT'S CALLED  
12 REGIONAL INFORMING OR REGIONAL SMOOTHING BUT THEY CREATE  
13 SCORES BASED ON VARIOUS CRITERIA THEN THE BAY AREA, AS A  
14 WHOLE, IS SCORED DOWN. THE OTHER THING THAT HAPPENED A COUPLE  
15 OF YEARS AGO WAS BONUS POINTS FOR TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT  
16 WAS REMOVED. SO THAT'S DEVASTATING TO THE STATE'S STATED  
17 CLIMATE GOALS AND TRANSPORTATION GOALS IT UNDERMINES  
18 EVERYTHING ELSE THAT MTC DOES AND IT ALSO HURTS BAY AREA  
19 PROJECTS WHICH HAVE A LOT OF ADOPTED PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT  
20 AREAS THAT WOULD MAKE POINTS FOR TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT  
21 IF THOSE POINTS WERE GIVEN IN THAT CCAC/CDLAC PROCESS. IF  
22 WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE PACKAGE OF STATE IMPEDIMENTS, I  
23 WANTED TO TALK ABOUT THAT. AS WELL I WANTED TO SECOND WHAT  
24 COMMISSIONER SCHAFF SAID ABOUT LOOKING AT HOW WE CAN DIRECTLY  
25 SUPPORT PRODUCTION MORE STRONGLY IN THIS AREA ESPECIALLY





NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 TRANSIT ORIENTED PRODUCTION BUT BAY AREA REGIONAL PRODUCTION,  
2 SO WE DON'T KEEP PUSHING PEOPLE OUTSIDE OUR REGION THEN TO  
3 DRIVE BACK OR UNDERMINE THE REGION. THANK YOU.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** THANK YOU. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC  
6 SPEAKERS?

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** YES. FIRST WE RECEIVED WRITTEN  
9 CORRESPONDENCE FROM ALAMEDA COUNTIES COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT  
10 AGENCY WHICH WAS ADDED TO THE AGENDA AND POSTED ONLINE. OUR  
11 FIRST MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE COMMENT  
12 IS SANDY RIVIERA FROM ALAMEDA COUNTY COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT  
13 AGENCY. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE?

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** I'M GOING TO GIVE HER TWO MINUTES.  
16 HOPEFULLY E SHE'LL MAKE IT GOOD. [LAUGHTER]

17

18 **SPEAKER:** WELL, I -- HELLO, I'M SANDY RIVERA WITH ALAMEDA  
19 COUNTY DEVELOPMENT AGENCY. AND I THINK HEATHER TOOK AWAY THE  
20 REAL PUNCH LINE WHICH IS THAT WE'RE PLEASED TO PRESENT THAT  
21 THE STATE HCD DID GIVE US A LETTER LAST WEEK THAT STATED THAT  
22 WE MEET STATE STATUTE. SO, THAT IS A MAJOR MILESTONE IN THIS  
23 ITERATIVE PROCESS THAT WE HAVE WITH THE STATE HCD AND IT DOES  
24 PUT US ON A SHORT PATH TO FINAL COMPLETION IN TERMS OF  
25 RECEIVING CERTIFICATION. AND AS YOU KNOW, PART OF THE



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 CERTIFICATION, IT REQUIRES REZONING, AS WELL AS GENERAL PLAN  
2 AMENDMENTS, AND THAT'S REQUIRED BEFORE THE STATE CAN GIVE US A  
3 LETTER OF SUBSTANTIAL COMPLIANCE OR CERTIFICATION. AND OUR  
4 HOUSING ELEMENT, AS COMMISSIONER MILEY HAD NOTED, COVERS MUCH  
5 OF THE UNINCORPORATED AREAS. AND MANY OF THE SITES ARE IN  
6 AREAS SUCH AS ASHLAND, CHERRYLAND, CASTRO VALLEY AND FAIRVIEW.  
7 AND WE DO HAVE ADVISORY COMMITTEES IN EACH OF THOSE  
8 COMMUNITIES. AND AS COMMISSIONER MILEY HAD STATED, THEY ARE  
9 LESS APPRECIATIVE OF HIGHER DENSITY ZONING, AS WELL AS MIXED  
10 USE DEVELOPMENT IN COMMERCIAL ZONES. BUT WE ARE IN THAT  
11 REZONING AND ADOPTION PHASE RIGHT NOW. WE JUST COMPLETED THE  
12 ADVISORY COMMITTEE MEETINGS LAST NIGHT. AND THEN WE'LL BE  
13 MOVING ON TO OUR PLANNING COMMISSION NEXT WEEK ON NOVEMBER  
14 18TH. AND WITH OUR ASSOCIATED REZONINGS AND GENERAL PLAN  
15 AMENDMENTS. FOLLOWED BY THAT, WE'LL BE AT THE BOARD  
16 TRANSPORTATION PLANNING COMMITTEE. AND THEN TO OUR FULL BOARD  
17 IN DECEMBER 12TH AND DECEMBER 17TH FOR FINAL ADOPTION. AND  
18 THAT GETS US TO MEETING THE DECEMBER 31ST COMPLIANCE DATE. OF  
19 COURSE, WITH ALL THESE COMMUNITY MEETINGS, AND THEN WITH THE  
20 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETINGS AND BOARD MEETINGS, IT'S  
21 DIFFICULT TO PREDICT WHAT THE OUTCOMES WILL BE, BUT WE'RE  
22 CAUTIOUSLY OPTIMISTIC THAT THE SCHEDULE WILL BE MADE. AND IT'S  
23 A POSSIBILITY, THOUGH, OF COURSE, THAT THROUGH THIS PROCESS,  
24 THAT IT MAY EXTEND TO THE BEGINNING OF NEXT YEAR. AND WITH  
25 THAT, WITH THE COMMUNITY MEETINGS'S SUPPORT, OR LACK OF



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 SUPPORT FOR THE HOUSING ELEMENT, THAT WILL POST CHALLENGES AS  
2 IT RELATES TO OUR REQUIREMENTS. 29 HOW MUCH MORE TIME DO YOU  
3 NEED?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** 30 SECONDS. THE RECESSION OF FUNDING ALAMEDA COUNTY  
6 PROJECTS WILL JEOPARDIZE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PROJECTS  
7 AND THAT'S NOTABLY THE UPPER SAN LORENZO CREEK WAY TRAIL  
8 PROJECT AND THAT CREATES MUCH NEEDED PEDESTRIAN CYCLING  
9 TRANSPORTATION CORRIDOR WITHIN THREE EQUITY PRIORITY  
10 COMMUNITIES AND FIVE PRIORITY DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND CONNECTS  
11 IT TO REGIONAL PARKS SO IT'S REALLY IMPORTANT AND APPRECIATE  
12 YOUR CONSIDERATION OF OUR CHALLENGES AS WE COMPLETE OUR  
13 HOUSING ELEMENT AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO PRESENTING A COMPLIANT  
14 HOUSING ELEMENT BY THE END OF THE YEAR. ANYWAY, THANK YOU FOR  
15 YOUR TIME AND LIZ MIGUEL ASSISTANT PLANNING DIRECTOR WOULD BE  
16 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS ABOUT THE HOUSING ELEMENT PROCESS.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NEXT MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC VINAY PIMPLE, IF  
19 YOU CAN UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOUR TWO MINUTES BEGINS NOW.

20

21 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I'M VINAY PIMPLE, AGAIN. SO, A SMALL FACTOR  
22 WITH COMMISSIONER PAPAN MENTIONED ABOUT CAN'T LAND, IT'S BASED  
23 ON THE BACK OF THE ENVELOPE CALCULATIONS. EVERY COUNTY, OTHER  
24 THAN SAN FRANCISCO AND ORANGE COUNTY, AND THE STATE OF  
25 CALIFORNIA, HAS MORE LAND THAT IS COUNTY, THAN LAND OF THE



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 CITIES. AND THAT IS ALSO WHY ORANGE COUNTY, NEXT TO SAN  
2 FRANCISCO, HAS THE HIGHEST POPULATION DENSITY OF ANY COUNTY IN  
3 THE WHOLE STATE. AND, SO, I THINK WE SHOULD LOOK A BIT ABOUT  
4 THAT, HOW MUCH OF THE COUNTY LAND CAN ACTUALLY BE USED FOR  
5 HOUSING. BECAUSE WE ALWAYS PUSH THE CITIES ONLY. WHICH IS NOT  
6 TO SAY THE CITIES CAN'T HAVE MORE HOUSING, AND I THINK ONE WAS  
7 THE THINGS THAT WE DO NEED TO WORK ON IS THE WHOLE ZONING BY  
8 RIGHT THING. AND ZONING BY RIGHT, RIGHT NOW EXISTS FOR NEW  
9 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. AND PARTICULARLY OWNER OWNED AFFORDABLE  
10 HOUSING IS DEFINED SO NARROWLY. THAT BASICALLY 25% OF INCOME  
11 PAYMENT FOR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, THAT'S JUST NOT ECONOMICALLY  
12 FEASIBLE FOR ANYBODY TO BUILD IT. BUT IF WE REDEFINE THE  
13 AFFORDABLE HOUSING A BIT, SAY, 35 TO 40% OF INCOME FOR AREA  
14 MEDIAN INCOME, THEN ALLOW ZONING BY RIGHT, WE COULD SEE A LOT  
15 OF ENTRY LEVEL HOUSING. SO, IF YOU COULD PUSH FOR SOMETHING  
16 LIKE THAT, IT COULD BE A REALLY GOOD APPROACH TO HAVING  
17 HOUSING FOR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE SO NOT EVERYBODY HAS TO DEPEND  
18 ON SUBSIDIZED RENTAL HOUSING AND CAN OWN THEIR OWN HOMES.  
19 THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT.

22

23 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. ANY OTHER RESPONSE FROM STAFF?

24



1 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THROUGH THE CHAIR F I MAY ANDREW F, EXECUTIVE  
2 DIRECTOR. I THINK THIS PART OF THE CONVERSATION IS HELPFUL IN  
3 HIGHLIGHTING WHAT WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING ABOUT NOON TODAY.  
4 I THINK AUTO A GOOD PRECURSOR. THE FOUR BIG MPOS DO MEET ON A  
5 REGULAR BASIS TO TALK ABOUT STRATEGIES WITH STATE AND HOW WE  
6 CAN COMMUNICATE BETTER WITH HCD AND OTHERS WE MEET WITH THEIR  
7 STAFF AS WELL, IN FACT THERE IS A MEETING MONDAY WE'LL BE  
8 ATTENDING TO CONTINUE THOSE DISCUSSIONS AND WE'RE ACTIVELY  
9 INVOLVED IN THE SPACES YOU'RE ASKING ABOUT AND AT 12:00 WE'LL  
10 HAVE GOOD DISCUSSION MOVING FORWARD WITH HOUSING.

11

12 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** JUST FOR THE RECORD, AND THE CALLER, 68% OF THE  
15 SAN MATEO COUNTY IS DESIGNATED OPEN SPACE AND WE HAVE ABOUT  
16 2500 UNITS THAT WERE FULLY ENTITLED AND APPROVED, BUT HIGH  
17 SPEED RAIL HAS INTERFERED WITH. SO, EVERYBODY IS TRYING TO DO  
18 THE BEST THEY CAN WITH LIMITED LAND, BUT I JUST WANTED TO GET  
19 THAT ON THE RECORD. THANK YOU.

20

21 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANYONE ELSE?

22

23 **COUNSEL, KATHLEEN KANE:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, IF I MIGHT? AFTER  
24 PUBLIC COMMENT WAS CLOSED BY THE CLERK, WE HAD TWO MORE PEOPLE  
25 WISHING TO SPEAK. WE'RE JUST INFORMING YOU OF THAT SO YOU CAN



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT YOU WANT TO HEAR FROM THEM. WE HAVE  
2 ONE IN THE ROOM AND ONE ON ZOOM.

3

4 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** WELL, ALL RIGHT. LET'S HEAR FROM THEM IF  
5 WE MUST. I'M JUST BEING FACETIOUS. YES? [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **SPEAKER:** OKAY. MICHAEL C WILLIAMS, I WORK FOR THE HAYWARD AREA  
8 RECREATION PARK DISTRICT AND I'M HERE IN SUPPORT OF THE SAN  
9 LORENZO CREEK WAY PROJECT THAT MISS RIVERA JUST MENTIONED IT'S  
10 MORE THAN JUST A -- IT'S NOT A PET PROJECT FOR THE COUNTY OF  
11 ALAMEDA, ALAMEDA COUNTY PUBLIC WORKS AGENCY FLOOD CONTROL  
12 DISTRICT IN PARTNERSHIP WITH HAYWARD AREA RECREATION PARK  
13 DISTRICT IT'S A MULTI-JURISDICTIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION  
14 CORRIDOR RECREATION TRAIL FOR PUBLIC HEALTH THAT HAS A PUBLIC  
15 HEALTH ELEMENT IT HAS SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL PROGRAM THAT HAS A  
16 PART OF IT INVOLVES MULTIPLE JURISDICTIONS CITY OF HAYWARD  
17 EAST BAY REGIONAL PARKS, SO THERE IS A LARGE -- IT'S MORE THAN  
18 JUST A PET PROJECT WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE IT GET THROUGH IT'S  
19 ONE OF THOSE THINGS THAT CONNECTS TO SAN FRANCISCO BAY TRAIL  
20 AND ALSO CONNECTS TO THE BAY RIDGE TRAIL. SO, IT'S ONE OF  
21 THOSE PROJECTS THAT REALLY KIND OF DOES THE THINGS THAT MTC  
22 WANTS TO SEE. AND WE'RE WORKING OUT OF OUR SILOS TO MAKE THIS  
23 PROJECT HAPPEN, AND I'M HERE IN SUPPORT OF THE EXTENSION THAT  
24 ALAMEDA COUNTY IS ASKING FOR TO SUPPORT THIS PROJECT. THANK  
25 YOU VERY MUCH.



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HECTOR ROJAS, VALLEJO PLANNING. PLEASE  
3 UNMUTE YOURSELF.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF MTC  
6 STAFF MY NAME IS HECTOR ROJAS, HERE PRESENTING THE CITY OF  
7 VALLEJO'S PLANNING DIVISION LONG RANGE PLAN JUST CAME ON BOARD  
8 WITH CITY OF VALLEJO ON SEPTEMBER 23RD MY ARRIVAL HERE AT  
9 VALLEJO IS RECENT AND BEFORE COMING ON BOARD WE DIDN'T REALLY  
10 HAVE STAFF WORKING ON THE LATEST DRAFT OF THE HOUSING ELEMENT  
11 SO MY WORK HERE IS DEDICATED TO GETTING THIS BACK ON TRACK,  
12 AND POISED TO ADOPT AND GET OUR HOUSING ELEMENT CERTIFIED BY  
13 THE END OF THE YEAR. IT DOES MAKE ME ANXIOUS WE'RE AT THE 11th  
14 HOUR HERE. HERE TO IMPLORE YOU THAT IF POTENTIALLY WE DON'T  
15 MAKE THE CUT OFF LINE HERE THAT WHEN YOU RETURN AND RECEIVE AN  
16 UPDATE ON THIS ITEM IN EARLY JANUARY, THAT IS THE CITY OF  
17 VALLEJO HAS ADOPTED AND CERTIFIED IT'S ELEMENT BY THEN THAT  
18 POTENTIALLY YOU CONSIDER IF YOU WILL AT THE LAST MINUTE. THAT  
19 WRAPS UP MY COMMENTS HERE AND AGAIN I APOLOGIZE FOR THE LAST  
20 MINUTE HAND RAISING.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE.

23

24 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ALL RIGHT THANK YOU. ANY OTHER  
25 COMMISSIONER COMMENT? OKAY. SO, THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 REPORT. SO, I THINK NOW WE'RE READY TO GO TO ITEM 4B. UPDATE  
2 ON CALIFORNIA TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION AND STATE FUNDING  
3 PROGRAMS UNDER CTC'S PURVIEW. KENNETH KAO.

4

5 **KENNETH KAO:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS KENNETH KAO MTC STAFF  
6 HERE TO PROVIDE UPDATE ON CTC MEETING MET IN OCTOBER IN  
7 BAKERSFIELD DISCUSSED A NUMBER OF ITEMS THEY DID APPROVE ALL  
8 THE CITIES AND COUNTIES THAT ARE ELIGIBLE FOR SB1 LOCAL  
9 STREETS AND ROADS FUNDING SO THAT'S GREAT NEWS ALL OF OUR  
10 JURISDICTIONS IN THE BAY AREA APPROVED NUMBER OF OTHER  
11 EXCEPTIONS AND ALLOCATIONS. GOVERNOR DID APPOINT COMMISSIONER  
12 ELLIOTT TO THE COMMISSION. OCTOBER WAS HIS FIRST MEETING.  
13 HAPPY TO WELCOME HIM. AND SECOND, I HAVE SOME UNFORTUNATELY  
14 BAD NEWS, PREVIEW NEXT MONTH. THE STATE DID RELEASE THEIR  
15 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM, ATP, STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR  
16 THE STATEWIDE POT, WHICH HAD ABOUT \$85 MILLION AND THE BAY  
17 AREA, UNFORTUNATELY, IS NOT RECOMMENDED FOR ANY PROJECTS.  
18 THERE WERE ONLY SEVEN OR EIGHT PROJECTS STATEWIDE BECAUSE IT'S  
19 SUCH A SMALL AMOUNT OF FUNDING. USUALLY WE GET 200 PLUS  
20 STATEWIDE. AND SO BECAUSE OF THE CUTS MADE FROM THE LAST STATE  
21 BUDGET, THAT WAS GREATLY REDUCED. SO, RIGHT NOW, THE CTC STAFF  
22 ORGANIZATION IS THAT THERE WILL BE NO BAY AREA PROJECTS IN  
23 THAT LIST. HOWEVER WE HAVE OUR OWN REGIONAL LIST 14 TO \$15  
24 MILLION AVAILABLE THERE SO WE'LL BE BRINGING OUR  
25 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE REGIONAL POT AND EARLY NEXT YEAR AS





NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1 WELL AS OUR THREE SAFE ROUTES TRANSIT POT WHICH HAS UP TO \$75  
2 MILLION SO STAFF WILL BE BRINGING THAT TO THIS COMMISSION  
3 EARLY NEXT YEARLY THAT WILL BE A PREVIEW OF THE DECEMBER  
4 MEETING AND CTC WOULD BE MEETING IN DECEMBER AND EARLY  
5 DECEMBER IN RIVERSIDE AND WE'LL REPORT BACK AT THAT DECEMBER  
6 PAC MEETING WITH THAT. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

7

8 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** ANY QUESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS? SEEING  
9 NONE. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT?

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO COMMENTS IN THE ZOOM SPACE, NO ONE IN  
12 THE BOARDROOM AND NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

13

14 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** OKAY. THIS WAS INFORMATIONAL. WE'RE UP  
15 TO ITEM SEVEN. I'LL NOW ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED  
16 UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM AS INFORMATION.  
17 BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD ALSO  
18 IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING IN  
19 TELECONFERENCE WITH YOUR COMMENTS RELATED TO AN ITEM NOT ON  
20 TODAY'S AGENDA PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR  
21 NINE AND IN-PERSON MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC SHOULD FORM A LINE SO  
22 YOU CAN SPEAK. DO WE HAVE ANY SPEAKERS?

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED, NO ONE  
25 IN THE BOARDROOM AND NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE.



NOVEMBER 13, 2024

1

2 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** VERY GOOD. OKAY. SO, WE'RE NOW GOING TO  
3 ADJOURN THIS MEETING. PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE  
4 MEETING, SCHEDULED FOR THE NEXT MEETING SCHEDULED FOR  
5 WEDNESDAY DECEMBER THE 11th. AND WE'LL SEE EVERYONE AT THAT  
6 POINT IN TIME. THANK YOU, ALL. [ADJOURNED]

7



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*