

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

2 **WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 22, 2023 9:35 AM**

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. I'M GOING TO
5 CALL TO ORDER THE JOINT METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
6 AND BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY MEETING TO ORDER. I'M
7 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA AND NICK JOSEFOWITZ, OUR VICE CHAIR.
8 PLEASE PLAY THE MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING
9 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A
10 HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL
11 AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS
12 ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
13 COMMISSION WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
14 PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE
15 HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM
16 AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE
17 CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT
18 IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND
19 ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY.
20 WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5
21 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND
22 ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL
23 CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND
24 ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
2 TO DATE.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, TEAM, FOR THAT. WE'RE GOING
5 TO MOVE TO ANNOUNCEMENT. FOR THOSE IN THE BOARDROOM, IF YOU
6 WANT TO PATIENT MAKE SURE WE CAN SEE YOUR RED LIGHT FOR THOSE
7 REMOTE PLEASE RAISE YOUR HAND AND WE'LL CALL UPON YOU AT THE
8 RIGHT TIME. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC, APPROACH AND PRESENT YOUR
9 CARD. WE'LL PROCEED TO ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL. OUR ROSTER HAS
10 BEEN FILLED WITH THE ADDITION OF STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS, WHO
11 IS FILLING THE SEAT VACATED BY COMMISSIONER [INDISCERNIBLE]
12 REPRESENTING MARIN, COUNTY AND CITIES. AND SUE NOACK FILLING
13 THE SEAT LEFT BY AMY WORTH REPRESENTING CITY OF CONTRA COSTA.
14 WELCOME ABOARD COMMISSIONERS. I THINK WE HEARD FROM STEPHANIE
15 LAST TIME, AND I'LL SEE IF COMMISSIONER NOACK IF SHE WOULD
16 LIKE TO SAY A FEW WORDS.

17

18 **SUE NOACK:** I WANT TO APPRECIATE EVERYONE HERE AND THE MANY
19 PHONE CALLS I HAVE RECEIVED. I HAVE ENORMOUS SHOES TO FILL
20 STEPPING INTO AMY WORTH'S SPOT, AND I'LL DO MY BEST TO FILL
21 THOSE SHOES.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. AND, ALSO,
24 WORTH SPEAKS HIGHLY OF YOU. ROLL CALL.

25



1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PEDROZA?

2

3 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

6

7 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

10

11 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

14

15 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?

18

19 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

22

23 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

24



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
2 FLEMING?

3

4 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI?

7

8 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER? IS PRESENT.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

13

14 **MATT MAHAN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY? IS. MOULTON PETERS?

17

18 **PETER LEE:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

4

5 **JAMES P. SPERING:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER -- IS ABSENT. QUORUM IS
8 PRESENT.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, AND I'M NOT GOING
11 TO MISS HAVING TO DO THE ROLL EVERY TIME. NOR WILL YOU, I
12 THINK. ITEM TWO, PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. IF COMMISSIONER CANEPA
13 CAN LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE, PLEASE? [PLEDGE OF
14 ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED
15 STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS,
16 ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE
17 FOR ALL."

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PROCEEDING TO THE COMPENSATION
20 ANNOUNCEMENT.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE
23 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY
24 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A
25 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
2 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. ITEM FOUR, JOINT
5 MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE
6 MTC AND BAHFA CONSENT CALENDAR. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
7 ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR? I DON'T SEE ANY IN BOARD CHAMBERS.
8 VIRTUALLY?

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET'S DO TWO MINUTES.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ACTUALLY, WE HAVE A COMMISSIONER NEEDING
15 TO BE PROMOTED AND I HAVE PROMOTED COMMISSIONER MILEY TO
16 PANELIST. HOPEFULLY THAT WILL WORK.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PERFECT. WELCOME ABOARD COMMISSIONER
19 MILEY.

20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONERS?

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** MOVE APPROVAL.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SPERING. ROLL
3 CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA?

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

18

19 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

22

23 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAVEZ?



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

5

6 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

13

14 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

17

18 **MATT MAHAN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

21

22 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** FLEMING?

4

5 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES. ABSTENTION ON 4A. PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

18 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT WITH ONE ABSTENTION ON ITEM 4A.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH,

21 KIMBERLY. PROCEEDING TO ITEM FIVE, PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK

22 THE CLERK IF WE HAVE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC COMMENT.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN

25 WRITING. I HAVE ONE MEMBER WITH A HAND RAISED WITH THE LAST



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 FOUR DIGITS OF 9209. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF YOU
2 WILL HAVE 90 SECONDS. I WILL START THE CLOCK.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS CLARENCE FISHER I HAVE A TWO MINUTE SPEECH
5 FEBRUARY 10TH LATE MORNING AFTERNOON OPERATION BETWEEN
6 DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO SFO AIRPORT DUE TO A HAZMAT OPERATION
7 NEAR DALY CITY AND COLUMBUS STATION BETWEEN SAN FRANCISCO TO
8 MILLBRAE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] HOWEVER, I KNOW A COUPLE WHO
9 BOARDED A TRAIN IN DUBLIN AND EXPERIENCED SERVICE DISRUPTION,
10 AND [AUDIO DISTORTION] EMERGE PASSENGER -- SFO SHUTTLE BUS
11 FROM BART STATION SFO -- AFTER EXPLAINING THE SITUATION WITH
12 THE DRIVER IN WHICH THE DRIVER GAVE A COLD STARE 'WHICH WOULD
13 PROBABLY SEND ROCKET MAN PUTIN -- TO THEIR GRAVES --
14 [INDISCERNIBLE] EMERGENCY PASSAGE TO THE AIRPORT DUE TO
15 SERVICE DISRUPTION, YOU COMMISSIONERS TO BOARD A FLIGHT TO
16 WASHINGTON, D.C. TO SECURE FUNDING FOR THE REGION BUT BECAUSE
17 THE DRIVER REFUSED YOU, YOU WOULD MISS YOUR FLIGHTS TO
18 WASHINGTON, D.C. AND THE REGION LOSS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS,
19 IF OPERATION OF SHUTTLES FROM BART STATIONS SFO HAVE EVER BEEN
20 GIVEN A SINGLE WOODEN NICK FREQUENTLY MTC THAT UNLESS CHANGING
21 ARROGANT ATTITUDE -- [AUDIO DISTORTION] THAT FLY SFO, AND --
22 MTC.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THAT IS YOUR TIME. THANK YOU.
25 THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS, MR. CHAIR.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY. AND
3 THANK YOU TO THE PUBLIC FOR COMMENTS. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED
4 TO ITEM SIX ADJOURNMENT, BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY IS
5 ADJOURNED, AND WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE THE BALANCE OF THE MTC
6 AGENDA. MOVING TO 7A CLOSED SESSION. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE
7 PUBLIC COMMENT?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I DO
10 SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH A HAND RAISED. ALETA DUPREE,
11 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** ALETA DUPREE. FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. I SIMPLY
14 SPEAK AS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, IN READING YOUR PUBLIC
15 DOCUMENTS HERE I SEE YOU HAVE SELECTED ANDREW FREMIER TO BE
16 YOUR NEW EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I FEEL FORTUNATE THAT I HAVE
17 GOTTEN TO KNOW ANDREW FREMIER OVER TIME, BOTH WITH COMING TO
18 YOUR MEETINGS, MOSTLY PRE-PANDEMIC. I WAS AT ONE IN-PERSON
19 MEETING, I THINK IT WAS IN DECEMBER. AND THEN AT MANY ZOOM
20 CONVERSATIONS. AND ANDREW REALLY HELPED TO MAKE MTC
21 ACCESSIBLE. AND, SO, AS I THOUGHT ABOUT YOUR SELECTION FOR A
22 NEW ED -- AND IS OF THE WONDERING WHO THAT WILL BE. I'M
23 LOOKING FORWARD TO THE WORK THAT ANDREW IS GOING TO DO TO
24 CONTINUE TO BUILD MTC AS THE PUBLIC FACING AND WELCOMING
25 ORGANIZATION THAT IT IS. BECAUSE, FOR ME, AS AN ORDINARY



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, MTC MAKES, AS I HAVE SAID BEFORE,
2 TRANSPORTATION AND ACCESS REAL TO ME. SO, I ASK THAT YOU
3 APPROVE THIS DOCUMENT AND THAT WHEN YOU ARE DONE, THAT ANDREW
4 FREMIER WILL BE YOUR NEW EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL
7 RAISED HANDS MR. CHAIR.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AT THIS POINT
10 PROCEEDING TO 7B CLOSED SESSION PUBLIC EMPLOYEE APPOINTMENT.
11 THE COMMISSION WILL MEET IN CLOSED SESSION REGARDING EXECUTIVE
12 DIRECTOR APPOINTMENT PURSUANT TO GOVERNMENT CODE 54957.
13 COMMISSIONERS USE THE ZOOM LINK PROVIDED BY KIMBERLY TO JOIN
14 THE CLOSED SESSION. PLEASE JOIN US IN THE CLAREMONT CONFERENCE
15 ROOM. AT THE END OF CLOSED SESSION WE WILL REJOIN THE ORIGINAL
16 ZOOM LINK BY THE ZOOM COORDINATOR IN OPEN SESSION. AT THIS
17 POINT WE'RE GOING TO GO INTO CLOSED SESSION. THANK YOU ALL.

18 [CLOSED SESSION]

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONERS, WE'RE SLOWLY
21 COMING BACK. I'LL CHECK WITH KIMBERLY IF COMMISSIONERS ARE
22 MAKING THE TRANSITION?

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SLOWLY.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. WE'RE BACK FROM CLOSED
2 SESSION PROCEEDING TO ITEM 7C OPEN SESSION APPOINTMENT OF
3 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND APPROVAL OF EMPLOYMENT AGREEMENT IN
4 CLOSED SESSION RECOMMENDATION OF APPOINTMENT OF ANDREW FREMIER
5 MTC EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND HIS APPROVAL EMPLOYMENT AGREEMENT
6 COMMENCING FEBRUARY 22ND, 2023 SALARY SHALL BE \$380,000
7 ANNUALLY FURTHER DETAILS OF MR. FREMIER'S EMPLOYMENT ATTACHED
8 TO THE AGREEMENT. LOOKING FOR A MOTION?

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION.

11

12 **JAMES P. SPERING:** SECOND.

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE.
15 BEFORE WE DO THAT LET'S MAKE SURE THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT
16 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM?

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED IN WRITING
19 AND NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

20

21 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION BY PEDROZA, SECONDS BY SPERING.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

24

25 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

3

4 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

7

8 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

11

12 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

19

20 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES.

25



1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

2

3 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

10

11 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

14

15 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

18

19 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILE RABBITT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER -- [INDISCERNIBLE] IS
5 ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT, COMMISSIONERS. BEFORE WE
8 TURN IT OVER TO OUR NEW EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, I WANT TO
9 WHOLEHEARTEDLY THANK THE COMMISSION. THE COMMISSION MADE THE
10 RIGHT DECISION AND WE HAD A LOT OF DISCUSSION AROUND IT AND I
11 APPRECIATE HOW THIS DISCUSSION IS COMING OUT OF IT WITH DEEP
12 COMMITMENT TO OUR FUTURE. TO ALL OUR COMMISSIONERS, JUST KNOW
13 I APPRECIATE THAT WE APPRECIATE THAT. I HAVE THREE PAGES OF
14 NOTES TO READ ABOUT ANDY, OR MR. PREMIER OUR EXECUTIVE
15 DIRECTOR. I'LL JUST SAY THIS, MR. PREMIER THANK YOU FOR BEING
16 INTERESTED IN THIS MOMENT TO LEAD THE ORGANIZATION WITH THE
17 COMMISSION. WE HAVE AN INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE A
18 DIFFERENCE TO MAKE A REAL DIFFERENCE IN THE LIVES OF SO MANY
19 PEOPLE THAT ARE PART OF THIS REGION. AND YOU'RE THE RIGHT
20 PERSON AT THE RIGHT TIME. WE A LOT OF GOALS AND OUTCOMES THAT
21 WE NEED TO ACHIEVE AND YOU'RE UP FOR THE CHALLENGE. I THINK
22 YOU HAVE DEMONSTRATED THAT THROUGHOUT THIS PROCESS BEING
23 STEADFAST AND COMMITTED WE DON'T NEED TO GOY OVER YOUR
24 ACCOMPLISHMENTS. THESE ARE GREAT NOTES AND THE PUBLIC KNOWS
25 THAT. WE LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU TO MAKE CHANGE IN



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 OPPORTUNITIES PRESENTED, AND YOU'RE GOING TO LEAD OFF THE
2 LEGACY OF HEMINGER AND MCMILLAN AND WITH COMMISSIONERS WHO
3 HAVE HAD A GREAT HISTORY. EXCITED. I WOULD SAY A LOT MORE WE
4 WANT TO GET THE JOB DONE, WHICH YOU KNOW YOU DO TOO, WE NEED
5 OUTCOMES AND YOU'RE THE RIGHT PERSON TO ACHIEVE THESE
6 OUTCOMES. MR. PREMIER, THE FLOOR IS YOURS.

7

8 **ANDREW PREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA, AND I AM HONORED FOR
9 THIS OPPORTUNITY AND THANK YOU FOR NOT READING THREE PAGES OF
10 THIS STUFF. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK MY WIFE, CONNIE HAS BEEN
11 SUPPORTIVE THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS. THIS IS A VERY HUMBLING
12 EXPERIENCE AND IT WAS CERTAINLY CHALLENGING BUT SHE AND MY
13 EXTENDED FAMILY HELPED THROUGHOUT AND I WANT TO THANK FOLKS
14 WHO ARE WATCHING ON THE LIVESTREAM ALSO ON THE EAST COAST AND
15 PARTS OF CALIFORNIA. THANK YOU GUYS FOR SAYING YES. THE
16 COMMISSION IS STRONG BECAUSE OF ITS LEADERSHIP AND I HAVE HAD
17 THE OPPORTUNITY OVER THE YEARS TO WORK WITH SO MANY WONDERFUL
18 CHAIRMAN AND CHAIR WOMEN AND I JUST REALLY RESPECT THE WORK OF
19 THE COMMISSION AND I'M EXCITED ABOUT THE OPPORTUNITY. I HAD
20 THE GOOD FORTUNE TO WORK WITH THERESE AND STEVE, AND I ALSO
21 GOT TO INTERFACE WITH LARRY DOMS, AND I LEARNED A LOT FROM ALL
22 OF THEM. PLAN ON USING A LOT OF THOSE LESSONS MOVING FORWARD,
23 AND I AM GRATEFUL FOR THEIR MENTORSHIP. AS THERESE SAID ON HER
24 WAY OUT, MTC IS REALLY THE STAFF. AND I AM CONFIDENT THAT 350
25 PEOPLE THAT ARE DUTIFULLY MEMBERS OF YOUR TEAM ARE EAGER TO



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 MEET THE GOALS YOU DESCRIBED, CHAIR PEDROZA, OF DELIVERY AND
2 MAKING A DIFFERENCE FOR ABAG AND THE COMMISSION. IN ADDITION,
3 WE HAVE AN EXCEPTIONAL SENIOR MANAGEMENT TEAM LED BY
4 EXECUTIVES TO MY LEFT AND MY ONE AT COLLEGE AT DISNEYLAND. WE
5 ARE READY AND ABLE TO KEEP MOVING AT THE PACE YOU HAVE ASKED
6 US TO MOVE AT. YOU HAVE GIVEN US VERY SPECIFIC CHALLENGES AND
7 WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO IT. I ACCEPT THE CHALLENGE. I AM
8 APPRECIATIVE OF THE OPPORTUNITY ON GIVING MY TEAM THIS
9 OPPORTUNITY TO MOVE FORWARD AND THANK YOU ALL FOR THAT.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU MR. PREMIER. AND I'LL JUST
12 SAY, THE WORD YOU SAID ABOUT TEAM, MR. PREMIER, I THINK THAT'S
13 SOMETHING THAT WE AS COMMISSIONERS GET TO LOOK AT THE TEAM,
14 STRENGTH OF THE TEAM THAT GIVES US THE CONFIDENCE THAT WE'RE
15 UP FOR THE CHALLENGE. BECAUSE WE'RE WORKING ON A LOT THERE IS
16 NO DOUBT ABOUT THAT. IT REALLY TAKES A STRONG TEAM TO DELIVER
17 THOSE OUTCOMES. MOVING ON TO WORK NOW. ITEM 8, COMMITTEE
18 ASSIGNMENTS. COMMISSIONERS YOU WILL NOTICE THAT WE SENT OUT A
19 COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENT REQUEST. WE'LL DO OUR BEST TO ACCOMMODATE
20 EVERYONE AS MUCH AS WE CAN. PLEASE SUBMIT. WE WILL WORK
21 DILIGENTLY TO ACCOMMODATE REQUESTS. PLEASE MAKE SURE YOU MAKE
22 SELECTIONS AND SUBMIT TO KIMBERLY BY MARCH 3RD, THAT WAY
23 COMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS CAN BE FINALIZED BY THE MARCH 22ND
24 MEETING. IN THE MEANTIME, ALL CHAIRS AND VICE CHAIRS REMAIN
25 THE SAME AS THEY ARE ASSIGNED CURRENTLY. MOVING TO ITEM 8A,



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 RESOLUTION OF APPRECIATION FOR LONG TIME STAFF MEMBER BRUCE
2 MAR WHO RETIRED AT THE END OF JANUARY AFTER 28 YEARS OF
3 SERVICE. HE WAS A KEY MEMBER OF THE IT TEAM. I CAN'T THINK OF
4 A TIME WHERE THERE WAS STRESS MORE THAN DURING THE PANDEMIC,
5 BRUCE WAS INTEGRAL PART OF THAT. WE HAVE A FULL AGENDA, I'M
6 NOT GOING TO READ THREE PAGES OF WHEREAS'S; I'M GOING TO BE
7 CONSISTENT AND JUST READ A FEW. WHEREAS BLESSED WITH A RARE
8 GIFT OF UNIVERSAL PATIENCE, WHENEVER SOMEONE MESSED UP HIS OR
9 HER CELL PHONE OR COMPUTER OR FORGOT THEIR PASSWORD, BRUCE WAS
10 ALWAYS WILLING TO HELP, NEVER RAISING A VOICE, JUST TRYING TO
11 SOLVE THE PROBLEM EVEN WHEN IT WAS THE TEDIOUS TASK OF NOT
12 REMEMBERING YOUR PASSWORD. WHEREAS DURING MANY OF HIS ABAG
13 YEARS BRUCE WAS ONE OF TWO FULL-TIME MEMBERS OF THE
14 ASSOCIATION'S INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY TEAM SUPPORTING TASKS
15 RELATED TO IT INCLUDING ORDERING EQUIPMENT, BUILDING OF THE
16 SERVER ROOM RACKING, CONFIGURING NETWORK EQUIPMENT, PERFORMING
17 OPERATIONAL MAINTENANCE AND REPAIRS OF HARDWARE THAT MAY OR
18 MAY NOT HAVE INCLUDED A TOASTER - MUST BE MORE TO THE STORY --
19 WHEREAS BRUCE EARNED AS AA IN A COURSE AT COLLEGE, HE KNEW AS
20 MUCH ABOUT NETWORK AS HIS INSTRUCTOR DID AND LEAD STUDENTS ON
21 A SHORT WALK TO ABAG HEADQUARTERS FOR A TOUR OF THE SERVER
22 ROOM. THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT MTC HONOR DEDICATED
23 SERVICE TO MTC AND ABAG AND COMMEND HIS DECISION NOT TO RETIRE
24 BACK IN 2016 WHEN HE RELOCATED TO OAKLAND. BRUCE, THANK YOU
25 FOR YOUR SERVICE. DO WE HAVE THE PROCLAMATION. BRUCE WE'RE



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 GOING TO MAIL YOU OR SEND YOU THE PROCLAMATION. ARE YOU WITH
2 US TO SAY A FEW WORDS?

3

4 **BRUCE MAR:** CONGRATULATIONS TO ANDY, WELL DESERVED. ALSO, I
5 WOULD LIKE TO CONGRATULATE MAYOR MATT MAHAN FROM SAN JOSE.
6 IT'S WAS A REAL PLEASURE WORKING WITH ABAG AND MTC. AND I AM
7 SO GLAD I COULD MAKE IT. AS YOU KNOW THE IT AT ITS COST VALUE
8 OF TEN YEARS I'M WORKING ALMOST 280 YEARS IN MATTER OF IT, AND
9 REACHED THE POINT THAT I CANNOT UPDATE MYSELF WITH THIS
10 ONGOING CRAZY IT WORK. THAT'S WHY I DIDN'T QUIT I JUST TRY TO
11 GIVE MYSELF A REST. THANK YOU ALL, THANK YOU, AGAIN FOR ALL
12 THOSE PEOPLE AT MTC AND ABAG, WHICH ONLY BRAD IS FROM ABAG,
13 THE REST MTC. BUT I NEVER FORGET ANY OF YOU. MAYBE I FORGET
14 YOUR NAME BUT YOUR FACE IS ALWAYS IN MY HEART. THANK YOU, ALL.
15 APPRECIATE IT.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, BRUCE. THANK YOU
18 COMMISSIONERS, WE NEED A MOTION TO ACCEPT RESOLUTION 4566.

19

20 **MATT MAHAN:** SO MOVED, MAHAN.

21

22 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER, SECOND.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECOND BY GLOVER. KIMBERLY, DO WE HAVE
25 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
3 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
4 ON THIS ITEM.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY MAHAN SECOND BY GLOVER? ROLL
7 CALL VOTE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

14

15 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

22

23 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

9

10 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING? IS ABSENT AT THE MOMENT.

13 COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

18

19 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

22

23 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT?

5

6 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

9

10 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
13 PRESENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU BRUCE FOR YOUR YEARS OF
16 SERVICE. ITEM 5A AD-HOC NOMINATING COMMITTEE REPORT
17 COMMISSIONER SPERING?

18

19 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. ON BEHALF OF THE COMMITTEE, I
20 WANT TO MOVE ALFREDO PEDROZA AS THE NEXT CHAIR OF THE
21 COMMISSION AND V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ AS VICE CHAIR AND
22 CLOSE THE NOMINATIONS.

23

24 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** I'LL GO AHEAD AND SECOND THAT, DUTRA-
25 VERNACI.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MR. CHAIRMAN, THE COMMITTEE FELT THAT
3 BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC THAT OUR CHAIR PEDROZA NEVER REALLY
4 HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO LEAD THE COMMISSION, AS PREVIOUS
5 COMMISSIONERS HAVE, AS CHAIRMAN, AND WITH THAT -- AND I DON'T
6 WANT TO REPEAT COMMENTS OF LAST TIME -- THE PAST TWO YEARS
7 HAVE BEEN VERY DIFFICULT, AND IT'S THE INTENTION OF THIS
8 COMMITTEE THAT VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ WILL HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO
9 SERVE AS CHAIR OF THE COMMISSION IN FOUR YEARS AFFORDED THE
10 SAME OPPORTUNITIES THAT WE ARE GIVING COUNTER CHAIR. AND WE
11 WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER DAVID RABBIT AND VICE CHAIR
12 JOSEFOWITZ. I KNOW, FOR BOTH OF THEM, IT'S A LITTLE
13 DISAPPOINTING FOR THEM BUT THE COMMITTEE FELT AT THIS TIME
14 WITH THE INSTABILITY AND A LOT OF CHANGES, I WANT TO THANK
15 BOTH OF THEM FOR THEIR SUPPORT AND CONSIDERATION.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. MOTION BY COMMISSIONER
18 SPERING SECOND BY COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI. COMMISSIONERS
19 ANY COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS? I DON'T SEE ANY. DO WE HAVE ANY
20 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
23 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
24 ON THIS ITEM.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, I WILL SAY, I
2 WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSION FOR YOUR WORK. I DO WANT TO THANK
3 THE AD-HOC COMMITTEE AND IT AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH
4 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ. I THINK HIM AND I HAVE DEMONSTRATED WE
5 HAVE A GOOD WORKING RELATIONSHIP. AND I KNOW THIS COMMISSION
6 IS UP FOR THE CHALLENGE AND I APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO
7 CONTINUE TO SERVE YOU AND OUR REGION WORKING TOGETHER. AND WE
8 HAVE A LOT OF WORK TO DO. SO, I INTEND TO CONTINUE TO MAKE
9 SURE THAT WE'RE GUIDING OUR REGION TOWARDS A REGION WHERE IT'S
10 A PLACE THAT PEOPLE CONTINUE TO WANT TO BE A PART OF AND
11 BELIEVE WE HAVE THE INCREDIBLE OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO. I
12 APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE PART OF THIS COMMISSION. ROLL
13 YOU CALL VOTE

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

20

21 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

24

25 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

11

12 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

15

16 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

19

20 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

23

24 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

2

3 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT?

6

7 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

10

11 **HILLARY RONEN:** NO.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. WITH THAT

18 THE MOTION PASSES WITH ONE NO AND ONE ABSENT.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM, ITEM POLICY

21 ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. COMMISSIONER KINMAN?

22

23 **RANDI KINMAN:** TUTU CHAIR PEDROZA. AS SOMEONE WHO HAS DRAFTED

24 TO BE CHAIR MULTIPLE TIMES IT'S NOT AN EASY THING AND IT'S

25 ALWAYS CONFUSING. ON MY PART IT'S NOT BEEN A FUN EXPERIENCE AT



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 TIMES BUT I APPLAUD THE LEADERSHIP AND I APPLAUD MR.
2 JOSEFOWITZ, BEING SO GRACIOUS ABOUT THIS BECAUSE I THINK THE
3 CONTINUITY WE HAVE GOING FORWARD IS NEEDED AND HAVING BOTH OF
4 YOU IN THOSE SEATS IS NECESSARY. WITH THAT, ON TO MY REPORT. I
5 WANT TO THANK, BOTH, THE CHAIR AND THE VICE CHAIR FOR BEING AT
6 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL LAST MONTH -- EARLIER THIS MONTH,
7 TO DISCUSS OUR WORK PLAN WHICH HAS BEEN SOMETHING THAT WE TRY
8 AND DO YEARLY, BUT, HONESTLY, WE HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO DO MUCH
9 -- RANDI.

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** RANDI, THIS IS CHAIR PEDROZA. YOUR
12 VIDEO IS CUTTING IN AND OUT. MAYBE YOU WANT TO TURN OFF YOUR
13 VIDEO SO THE AUDIO CAN BE CLEARER.

14

15 **RANDI KINMAN:** LET ME TRY THAT BECAUSE THEN YOU CAN'T SEE ME
16 BLUSHING WHEN I MAKE MISTAKES. AS YOU BOTH APPEARED BEFORE THE
17 COUNCIL WE HAD GREAT DISCUSSION. OUR WORK PLAN I'M NOT GOING
18 TO GO INTO A DETAILED REPORT ABOUT WHAT OUR COMMITTEES HAVE
19 BEEN DOING BECAUSE WE HAVE HAD COMMITTEES THAT HAVE BEEN
20 CANCELED THIS MONTH. BUT I DO WANT TO ADVISE THE COMMISSION,
21 AS A WHOLE, THAT THIS COUNCIL RUNS ON THE BACKS OF PEOPLE WHO
22 ARE VOLUNTEERS, WHO, WHILE THEY MAY GET A STIPEND, GIVE A LOT
23 OF THEIR TIME AND ENERGY, THE CHANGE THAT WE'RE GOING TO BE
24 GOING THROUGH NEXT MONTH, WITH THE MANDATORY IN-PERSON, HAS
25 CAUSED THE COUNCIL TO LOSE SEVERAL MEMBERS ON KEY COMMITTEES.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 IT'S CAUSING A LEADERSHIP CHANGE THAT I HAD NOT ANTICIPATED. I
2 WAS TRYING TO BUILD SUCCESSION PLANS ALL ALONG THE LINES, BUT
3 THAT'S JUST GOTTEN THROWN INTO THE GARBAGE DISPOSAL. SO I WANT
4 YOU TO BE A LITTLE PATIENT WITH US. WE'RE HERE TO SERVE, AND
5 WILL CONTINUE TO DO THAT, AND I'LL HAVE A CHEERIER REPORT NEXT
6 MONTH THAT I'M GOING AT THAT POINT STOP MY REPORT AND GO BACK
7 TO CLEANING UP THE MESS FROM THE STORM LAST NIGHT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** RANDI, THANK YOU FOR JOINING US. AND
10 I'LL ECHO, WE DID HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO CHECK IN WITH YOU, BOTH
11 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ AND MYSELF, WE HAD CONVERSATION ABOUT
12 BEING FOCUSED AND VALUABLE AND MAKING SURE THE POLICY ADVISORY
13 COUNCIL FEELS THEIR FEEDBACK IS VALUABLE NOT AS AN
14 AFTERTHOUGHT. SO WE HAVE A GOOD PLAN IN PLACE TO MAKE SURE
15 THEIR PERSPECTIVE IS BEING TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT AND THERE IS
16 GOOD COMMUNICATION GOING FORWARD. AND THAT YOUR FOCUS IS ALSO
17 ALIGNED WITH THE COMMISSION. I APPRECIATE YOUR LEADERSHIP AND
18 COMMITMENT TO THAT. THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT
19 ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL?

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING AND I
22 SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ADINA
23 LEVIN. WOULD YOU LIKE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF? YOU WILL HAVE 90
24 SECONDS.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN, MEMBER
2 OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND SERVING AS CHAIR OF THE
3 TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN. SUBCOMMITTEE. EXCITED ABOUT OUR
4 WORK PLAN GOING FORWARD, AND THANK THE CHAIR AND THE VICE
5 CHAIR FOR DISCUSSING THAT WITH US. WITH REGARD TO CHAIR
6 KINMAN'S REMARKS, I DO SEE THAT THERE ARE SOME BROWN ACT
7 REFORM BILLS COMING FORWARD THAT CAN LOOSEN THE NEWLY -- OR
8 THE -- GOING BACK TO STRICTER BROWN ACT RULES, AND DURING THE
9 PANDEMIC WE HAD REALLY ACTIVE PARTICIPANTS AND COMMITTEES AND
10 LEADERSHIP IN OUR COMMITTEES WHO, YOU KNOW, LIVE IN THE, YOU
11 KNOW, FURTHER AREAS OF THE REGION, AND/OR HAVE PHYSICAL
12 LIMITATIONS THAT MAKE COMING INTO THE BUILDING FREQUENTLY
13 REALLY DIFFICULT, AND, SO, I AM GLAD TO SEE THAT THIS ISSUE IS
14 ON MTC'S RADAR SCREEN, AND WOULD, YOU KNOW, REALLY APPRECIATE
15 ANYTHING YOU ALL CAN DO TO GET THOSE RESTRICTIONS LOOSENED SO
16 THAT WE CAN HAVE BETTER COMMUNITY LEADERSHIP ON OUR POLICY
17 ADVISORY COUNCIL AND COMMITTEES. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I DO SEE -- EXCUSE ME --
20 ANOTHER MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, IS ANNE
21 OLIVIA ELDRED. PLEASE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL
22 HAVE ONE MINUTE. EXCUSE ME -- 90 SECONDS.

23

24 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. I DO WANT TO THANK THE CHAIR
25 AND VICE CHAIR FOR COMING TO THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 EARLIER THIS MONTH. IT DOES MAKE A BIG DIFFERENCE TO HAVE YOU
2 HEAR FROM US DIRECTLY AND SEE THE BREADTH OF VOICES AND
3 PERSPECTIVES THAT ARE REPRESENTED. AND I WANT TO AFFIRM THE
4 IMPORTANCE OF COMMENTS ADINA MENTIONED. ONE OF THOSE IS
5 FIGURING OUT HOW TO STAY ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND
6 THE MANY SUBCOMMITTEES THAT I AM HONORED TO SERVE ON, AND PUT
7 A LOT OF ENERGY AND EFFORT INTO. BUT, GETTING THE AMOUNT OF
8 TIME OFF WORK THAT IT TAKES TO GO TO THOSE MEETINGS IN-PERSON
9 IS SOMETHING THAT I WOULD FIND REALLY CHALLENGING, AS WELL AS
10 PROVIDING ELDER CARE AT THE MOMENT. SO ANY LEADERSHIP THAT YOU
11 CAN TAKE IN HELPING ENACT LEGISLATION THAT IS REFLECTIVE OF
12 OUR CURRENT TECHNOLOGICAL CAPACITY AND THE PROVEN ABILITY TO
13 PERFORM THESE ROLES MORE EFFECTIVELY WHEN A REMOTE OPTION IS
14 AVAILABLE, WOULD BE GREATLY APPRECIATED. THANK YOU FOR YOUR
15 TIME AND HAVE A GREAT DAY.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
18 HANDS MR. CHAIR.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU TO THOSE MEMBERS OF THE
21 PUBLIC. PROCEEDING TO ITEM 11, OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
22 REPORT. MR. FREMIER TAKE IT AWAY.

23

24 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA. ANDREW FREMIER,
25 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I WANT TO THANK MY PARTNER HERE, KIMBERLY



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 AWARD SHE HAD A PLACARD CREATED WITH MY NAME ON IT. THANK YOU,
2 KIMBERLY. I WANT TO THANK ALIX BOCKELMAN WHO ACTUALLY PRODUCED
3 THIS REPORT SHE STEPPED IN FOR THE MONTH THAT THERESE WAS OUT
4 AND CERTAINLY WE'RE GRATEFUL FOR THAT STEPPED IN AND PRODUCED
5 THIS REPORT. I HAVE A COUPLE OF ITEMS. YOU DO HAVE A LOT ON
6 YOUR AGENDA, A COUPLE OF THINGS COMINGS AND GOINGS, THERESE
7 AND BRUCE. WE HAVE A COUPLE OF APPOINTMENTS COMING IN AND
8 THEY'RE LISTED IN THE DOCUMENT. IN TERMS OF KEY UPDATES WE'RE
9 EXCITED ABOUT RELEASE OF RM3 AND SENATE BILL 595 FROM ITS
10 PURGATORY AND WE'RE LOOKING FORWARD TO WORKING WITH ALL TO GET
11 THAT MONEY PUT TO WORK IT'S CERTAINLY A COMMITMENT TO THE BAY
12 AREA AND IT'S TIME TO DO THE WORK. WITH THE BAY AREA DOING
13 WELL SOME STATE FUNDS THAT CAME FROM THE CALIFORNIA STATE
14 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY THAT WILL HELP OUT BART TO SILICON
15 VALLEY CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION FINISHING UP THAT PROJECT AND
16 ADDITIONAL WORK FOR BART TRANSBAY CORE CAPACITY WE DID GET
17 SOME HOUSING MONEY FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES
18 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AND FINALLY SOME SUCCESS FOR STATE ROUTE 37
19 IN EXECUTING A PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENT WITH THE STATE
20 TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, THE STATE NATIONAL RESOURCES BOARD,
21 AGENCIES, AS WELL AS CALTRANS, AND THE METROPOLITAN
22 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION. SO WE LOOK FORWARD WORKING WITH OUR
23 COUNTIES AND WORKING ON LONG-TERM GOALS THAT WE ANTICIPATE FOR
24 IMPROVEMENTS IN THAT CORRIDOR. FINALLY LOOKING AHEAD AND
25 REMINDING FOLKS THAT WE'RE WORKING ON OUR TRIP TO SACRAMENTO



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 TO MEET WITH THE LEGISLATIVE FOLKS UP THERE AS GIANT MTC AND
2 ABAG FORUM. THAT WILL BE FEBRUARY 28TH, AND THROUGH MARCH 1ST,
3 AND I KNOW INFORMATION IS COMING OUT. AND FINALLY WE'RE
4 LOOKING FORWARD TO WELCOMING YOU ALL BACK NEXT MONTH INTO 375
5 BEALE AND HOPEFULLY YOU WILL ENJOY -- WE'LL MAKE IT EASY FOR
6 YOU TO ENJOY YOUR SPACE AND EASY TO TRAVEL.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE DEPUTY
9 DIRECTOR BOCKELMAN WHO DID A FINE JOB OF STEPPING IN,
10 APPRECIATE WHEREVER SHE IS IF IT'S DISNEYLAND OR WHEREVER.
11 KIMBERLY PUBLIC COMMENT?

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. ALETA DUPREE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** CHAIR PEDROZA, ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND
16 HER VERY GOOD REPORT VERY GOOD PLACARD I NOTICED THAT AS WELL.
17 I'M HOPING THAT WE CAN GET THE DIRECT DEPOSITS FOR THE RM3
18 MONEY SOON AND I APPRECIATE THE CLARIFICATION AS TO PROCEDURE.
19 WE'RE AWAITING ON SOME PROCEDURAL ORDERS FROM THE APPEALS
20 COURT WHICH WILL HOPEFULLY SOON UNLOCK THAT MUCH NEEDED MONEY
21 FOR US SO WE CAN DO THE THINGS THAT NEED TO BE DONE WITH THAT.
22 THAT'S TOLL PAYERS MONEY. AND I HAVE PAID INDIRECTLY,
23 SOMEWHAT, INTO THAT AND RIDING WITH OTHER PEOPLE WHO HAVE
24 DRIVEN ME ACROSS THE BRIDGE. SO, THAT'S A HUGE STEP. AND THE
25 MENTIONS OF BART AND CALTRAIN ARE VERY IMPORTANT. I'M



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 FOLLOWING THE CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION VERY CLOSELY. THE ONLY
2 TIME I EVER GET TO RIDE ON A FULLY ELECTRIFIED FRA QUALIFIED
3 RAILROAD IS IN DENVER. THEY HAVE THE A LINE, WHICH I HAVE USED
4 A NUMBER OF TIMES. THANK YOU FOR THIS REPORT. MAYBE IF THE
5 WEATHER IS RIGHT, I'LL BE AT THE MARCH MEETING. THANK YOU.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL RAISED
8 HANDS MR. CHAIR.

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THAT CONCLUDES OUR REPORT. ITEM 12
11 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. COMMISSIONERS ANY GENERAL COMMENTS?
12 SEEING NONE. PROCEEDING TO CONSENT CALENDAR. COMMISSIONERS WE
13 HAVE ITEMS 13A THROUGH 13D ON OUR CONSENT CALENDAR FOR MTC. IS
14 THERE ANY QUESTIONS? KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON
15 OUR CONSENT CALENDAR?

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EXCUSE ME -- I SEE NO RAISED HANDS FROM
18 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT COMMISSION IF THERE IS NO
21 QUESTIONS I'LL LOOK FORWARD TO A MOTION FOR THE CONSENT
22 CALENDAR. FIRST BY SPERING SECOND BY MOULTON PETERS. ROLL CALL
23 VOTE, PLEASE?

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

5

6 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

13

14 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

17

18 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** --

23

24 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** I'M SORRY. I FORGOT TO

25 RECUSE MYSELF FROM ITEM 13D.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE MAID NOTE OF THAT.

3 THAT WAS VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

4

5 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU SO MUCH,

6 KIMBERLY.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU'RE WELCOME. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS

9 ABSENT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

10

11 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

14

15 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

18

19 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

22

23 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?



1

2 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS?

5

6 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

9

10 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT?

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

21

22 **HILARY RONEN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION
4 PASSES WITH ONE RECUSAL FOR ITEM 13D.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PROCEEDING TO ITEM 14, COMMITTEE
7 REPORT, PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS. COMMISSIONER RABBITT.

8

9 **DAVID RABBIT:** REPORT OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS FOR
10 FEBRUARY 22ND, 2023 REFERRING TO THE FOLLOWING FOR APPROVAL:
11 AGENDA ITEM 14A, FISCAL YEAR 2022/2023 TRANSIT PERFORMANCE
12 INITIATIVE TPI CALL FOR PROJECTS AWARD RECOMMENDATION FOR
13 FISCAL YEAR 2023 TPI INVESTMENT PROGRAM CALL FOR PROJECTS
14 INCLUDING AWARD OF \$15 MILLION IN STP OR CMAQ FUNDING, AND
15 APPROXIMATELY \$6 MILLION IN LOW CARBON TRANSIT OPERATIONS
16 PROGRAM FUNDING, AND I SO MOVE.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBITT. LOOKING
19 FOR A SECOND.

20

21 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SECOND, CHAVEZ.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I HEARD SECOND BY CHAVEZ. KIMBERLY, DO
24 WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. FIRST BY RABBITT SECOND BY
6 CHAVEZ. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

9

10 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

17

18 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN? COMMISSIONER AHN?

21

22 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

25



1 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

4

5 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

8

9 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

12

13 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN? COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT.

20

21 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE. SORRY. AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NO PROBLEM. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER

24 MILEY?

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

4

5 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT?

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

20

21 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION

24 PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **DAVID RABBITT:** GREAT. ITEM AGENDA ITEM 14B, MTC RESOLUTION
2 4556. FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024 MTC FUND ESTIMATE. THIS APPROVES
3 ANNUAL FUND ESTIMATE PROPOSED APPORTIONMENT AND DISTRIBUTION
4 OF APPROXIMATELY \$1 MILLION IN TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT
5 LOCAL TRANSPORTATION FUND STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE STATE OF
6 GOOD REPAIR PROGRAM, ASSEMBLY BILL 1107. TRANSIT RELATED
7 BRIDGE TOLL AND CARBON TRANSIT OPERATIONS PROGRAM FUNDS FOR
8 FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024. STAFF HAS UPDATED THE ATTACHMENT
9 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM TO INCLUDE ATTACHMENT A TO MTC
10 RESOLUTION 4556. AND I MOVE APPROVAL TO MTC RESOLUTION 4556.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** WE HAVE A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER
13 RABBITT. LOOKING FOR A SECOND?

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'LL GIVE IT TO THE VIRTUAL FOLKS.
18 SECOND BY GLOVER. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
21 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
22 ON THIS ITEM.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY RABBITT, SECOND BY GLOVER.
25 ROLL CALL VOTE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

11

12 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

15

16 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ? IS ABSENT.

23 COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

24

25 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

3

4 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

7

8 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN?

11

12 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

15

16 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

19

20 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

23

24 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT?

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

6

7 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

14 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. THANK YOU,
17 COMMISSIONER RABBITT FOR THE REPORTS. MOVING TO ITEM 15, JOINT
18 MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. AS VICE CHAIR OF THIS
19 COMMITTEE I'LL GIVE THE REPORT FOR THE JOINT MTC COMMITTEE
20 THAT MET REMOTELY FEBRUARY 10TH, 2023. REFERS FOLLOWING 15A
21 CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT, AGUILAR CURRY, VOTED THRESHOLD,
22 LOCAL INFRASTRUCTURE BONDS AND SPECIAL TAXES FOR AFFORDABLE
23 HOUSING, TRANSPORTATION, RESILIENCE, AND OTHER PUBLIC
24 INFRASTRUCTURE. BASED ON STAFF RECOMMENDATION I MOVE TO



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 SUPPORT THE POSITION AS DESCRIBED IN THE SUMMARY SHEET. AND
2 I'LL LOOK FOR A SECOND.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECONDS.

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** CAN I ASK A QUESTION?

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES. COMMISSIONER NOACK.

9

10 **SUE NOACK:** WHEN THEY DID THIS FOR THE SCHOOL BONDS, PROP
11 [INDISCERNIBLE] THEY PUT SOME CONDITIONS ON IT -- OVERSIGHT
12 COMMITTEE. DID THEY DO ANY CONDITIONS?

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GREAT QUESTION. I'LL TURN IT TO STAFF.
15 I BELIEVE, EITHER, REBECCA LONG?

16

17 **REBECCA LONG:** GOOD MORNING. REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF
18 LEGISLATION AND AFFAIRS. UNFORTUNATELY I DON'T HAVE AN EXACT
19 ANSWER FOR YOU BUT WE CAN GET BACK TO YOU.

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER WOULD YOU WANT TO TABLE?
24 OR DO YOU FEEL COMFORTABLE --

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **SUE NOACK:** [INDISCERNIBLE].

2

3 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU FOR THE CLARIFYING QUESTION.
4 KIMBERLY, HAVE WE RECEIVED PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I
7 HAVE ONE CALLER WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. CALLER WITH THE LAST
8 FOUR DIGITS OF 5936. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL
9 HAVE 90 SECONDS. I WILL START THE CLOCK.

10

11 **SPEAKER:** MEMBER OF SAN FRANCISCO NEIGHBORHOOD, SPEAKING ON MY
12 BEHALF. IN STRONG OPPOSITION OF ACA-1 IN THE AREA OF CITIZENS
13 UNITED. TAX AND DARK MONEY WHICH MAY STAND TO BENEFIT DIRECTLY
14 FROM GENERAL OBLIGATION BOND CAN SPEND SIGNIFICANT AMOUNTS OF
15 MONEY AND MOUNT SLICK CAMPAIGNS TO GET BONDS PASSED. OPPONENTS
16 MAY NOT HAVE THE SAME RESOURCES AS THE SPECIAL INTEREST WHICH
17 ARE SUPPORTING THE BOND. THE ONLY EQUALIZER IS A HIGHER
18 THRESHOLD. CHANGING THE HEIGHT OF THE THRESHOLD FROM 2/3 TO
19 55% WOULD ELIMINATE THAT EQUALIZER.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NO FURTHER HANDS RAISED.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** FIRST BY PEDROZA AND SECOND BY PAPAN.
24 GETTING BACK TO COMMISSIONER [INDISCERNIBLE] ON HER QUESTION.
25 SEEING NO FURTHER DISCUSSION. ROLL CALL VOTE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

11

12 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-

19 VERNACI?

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

3

4 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MAHAN? COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

7 IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

8

9 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS?

12

13 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

16

17 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT?

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

24

25 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
7 PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PROCEEDING TO ITEM 15. ASSEMBLY BILL
10 84 PROPERTY TAX WELFARE EXEMPTION REDUCES AFFORDABILITY
11 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT COST BY REVISING WELFARE TAX EXEMPTION
12 FROM A REBATE TO [INDISCERNIBLE] SAVINGS. BASED ON STAFF'S
13 RECOMMENDATION, I'M IN SUPPORT ON AB 84 AS DESCRIBED IN THE
14 SUMMARY SHEET. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

15

16 **DAVID RABBIT:** SECOND.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION AND SECOND. PUBLIC COMMENT?

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
21 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
22 ON THIS ITEM.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? SEEING NONES.
25 ROLL CALL VOTE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

11

12 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

15

16 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-

19 VERNACI?

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

24

25 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

3

4 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY? IS
7 ABSENT.

8

9 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GOT YOU. COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS?

12

13 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBITT?

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

24

25 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES
7 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ITEM 16, THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE. THE
10 EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING REMOTELY FEBRUARY 10TH, REFERS THE
11 FOLLOWING ACTION TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL MTC RESOLUTION
12 4564 WOULD ADOPT POLICY FOR THE SUPPORT FOR NEAR-TERM REGIONAL
13 NETWORK MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK RECOMMENDATIONS NOTE STAFF WILL
14 RETURN IN COMING MONTHS WITH AN IMPLEMENTATION FOR
15 COMMISSIONER'S REVIEW AND APPROVAL. I MOVE APPROVAL OF
16 RESOLUTION 4564. DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

17

18 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI WILL SECOND.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DUTRA-
21 VERNACI. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED
22 WITH THIS ITEM.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH
25 THEIR HAND RAISED. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. ALETA



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 DUPREE, PLEASE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE 90
2 SECONDS. I WILL START THE CLOCK.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA, ALETA DUPREE SHE
5 AND HER FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS A VERY IMPORTANT. THERE WAS A
6 PRESENTATION YESTERDAY AT MUNI MEETING THIS IS PART OF THE
7 PROGRESS BEING MADE TO SIMPLIFY TRANSPORTATION SERVICES ACROSS
8 THE BAY AREA FARE INTEGRATION IS AN ESSENTIAL PART AS IS
9 WAYFINDING. I GOT INVOLVED WITH WAYFINDING WHICH I CAME ACROSS
10 A MISSING SIGN IN THE DENVER AIRPORT AND TRYING TO GET TO THE
11 A LINE. SOMEBODY SHOWED ME HOW TO GET TO THE A-LINE. BECAUSE
12 WHEN I AM IN DENVER, AND I WANT TO GET TO THE A-LINE, I WANT
13 TO GET THERE SO I CAN PUT ON SOME JOHN DENVER AND LISTEN TO
14 SOME ROCKY MOUNTAIN HIGH. WAY FIND SUGGEST A VERY IMPORTANT
15 PART OF THIS ELEMENT. ESPECIALLY FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES
16 BE IT LOW VISION OR LOW HEARING, HAVING THAT UNIFORM SIGNAGE
17 TO GO TO THE NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY, WHICH I AM SURE SOME OF YOU
18 HAVE GOTTEN TO SEE, THERE IS A LOT OF REALLY GOOD UNIFORM
19 SIGNAGE THROUGHOUT THAT SYSTEM. SO, THIS PASSAGE TODAY IS AN
20 ESSENTIAL PART OF GETTING THIS WORK GOING. AND I AM VERY
21 APPRECIATIVE OF BILL BACON AND MIKE EISEMAN WHO HAVE BEEN
22 DOING A LOT OF WORK. IT'S BECOMING CLEAR TO ME, CLEARER. IT'S
23 NO LONGER LIKE MUD. LET'S GET THIS DONE. THANK YOU.

24



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
2 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION.
5 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. THIS IS A GREAT STEP IN THE
8 RIGHT DIRECTION. WE HAVE HAD A LOT OF DISCUSSIONS ABOUT THIS,
9 AND PART OF THOSE DISCUSSIONS IS REALLY GETTING THE 27 TRANSIT
10 BOARDS ON BOARD WITH THIS. AND I REALLY HOPE THAT PART OF THIS
11 PROCESS INCLUDES SOME, SORT OF, A RESOLUTION IN CONCEPT THAT
12 THOSE BOARDS CAN APPROVE AND AGREE WITH SO THAT WE PRESENT A
13 UNITED FRONT. I THOUGHT THE WATERS PARTED LAST NIGHT, WHEN I
14 SAW ON THE NEWS BART WAS GOING TO FOCUS ON CLEANING UP THEIR
15 STATIONS AND MAKING TRAINS SAFER, AND A WHOLE BUNCH OF THINGS
16 WE TALKED ABOUT FOR A LONG TIME. I AM THANKFUL THAT ALIX
17 BOCKELMAN ACTUALLY CAME OUT TO MILLBRAE RECENTLY AND THE
18 SIGNAGE IS THE FIRST THING SHE NOTICED THAT STATION HAS BEEN
19 THERE FOR 20 YEARS. BRAND-NEW DEVELOPMENT SO THIS IS REALLY
20 KEY TO OUR SUCCESS AND ALL THE WORK FROM THE BLUE RIBBON
21 TRANSIT RECOVERY WE WANT TO SEE THIS WORK AND I APPRECIATE ALL
22 THE OPERATORS HELPING US OUT HERE WE NEED THE BUY-IN FROM
23 THOSE BOARDS SO I HOPE THIS MOVING FORWARD INCLUDES JUST THAT,
24 COMING OUT OF THE PANDEMIC IT'S KEY THAT THIS IS AN ENJOYABLE
25 EXPERIENCE THAT PEOPLE WANT TO GET ON TRANSIT. SO, THANK YOU



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 VERY MUCH. AND I LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH EVERYBODY AS
2 THIS MOVES FORWARD.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN.
5 COMMISSIONER SPERING?

6

7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN. I WANT TO AGREE
8 WITH THE RESOLUTION OR SOME TYPE OF ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF WHAT
9 WE'RE DOING AMONG ALL THE OPERATORS. I THINK WE NEED TO
10 STIMULATE THAT DISCUSSION AND MAKE SURE THAT EVERYBODY IS
11 SUPPORTABLE. THE OTHER ISSUE I WANT TO RAISE MR. CHAIRMAN IS I
12 WANT STAFF TO REALLY MONITOR THE SMALL OPERATORS THAT THEY'RE
13 NOT LEFT BEHIND IN THIS PROCESS. THE WAY IT'S STRUCTURED RIGHT
14 NOW -- AND I'M VERY SUPPORTIVE OF GOING FORWARD, BUT I AM
15 CONCERNED ABOUT THE POTENTIAL IMPACTS IT COULD HAVE ON THE
16 SMALLER OPERATORS I WOULD LIKE STAFF TO MONITOR THAT CLOSELY.

17

18 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER
19 SPERING. ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? I WANT TO ECHO
20 APPRECIATION TO THE OPERATORS AND ALL THE AD-HOC MEMBERS WHO
21 HAVE BEEN A PART OF THIS, IT'S A PRODUCT OF THE BUILDING BLOCK
22 WHERE WE WANT TO GO AND I REALLY LOOK FORWARD TO THE
23 IMPLEMENTATION PART AS A PUBLIC COMMENTER WE HAVE WORK TO DO,
24 AND I THINK THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN APPROXIMATELY ALLOW US
25 OPPORTUNITY TO GET TO WORK. MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL VOTE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

7

8 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES ABE-KOGA?

9

10 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

13

14 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ? IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

21

22 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

4

5 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

8

9 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS?

12

13 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

16

17 **SPEAKER:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

24

25 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

3

4 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

11 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU KIMBERLY MOVING

14 TO ITEM 17A, MEETING IN-PERSON BROWN ACT A.B. 2449. KATHLEEN

15 KANE WILL TAKE IT AWAY.

16

17 **KATHLEEN KANE:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE WHO KNEW THE BROWN ACT

18 WAS A HOT TOPIC. THIS IS CAUSING CONSIDERABLE INTEREST FOR

19 PEOPLE AND ATTACHED TO THIS ITEM IS BOTH A SHORT COVER BLURB

20 AND THEN A SHORT LEGAL MEMO. I CAN CERTAINLY GO INTO MORE

21 DEPTH FOR ANYBODY WHO WANTS IT BUT WANTED TO KEEP IT TO TWO

22 PAGES. KEY ISSUES FOR YOUR REVIEW ARE THAT THE GOVERNOR'S

23 ORDER, AND I AM SURE EACH OF YOU ARE FAMILIAR WITH THIS FROM

24 YOUR RESPECTIVE JURISDICTIONS BUT FOR THOSE WHO MAY BE

25 WATCHING GOVERNOR'S ORDERS FOR EMERGENCY COVID PROTOCOL ARE



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 LAPSING NEXT WEEK THEREFORE WE GO BACK TO THE REGULAR BROWN
2 ACT THAT WE HAD PRE-PANDEMIC, WHICH IS TO SAY THAT THESE
3 HYBRID MEETING THAT DID NOT REQUIRE NOTIFICATION OF WHERE
4 MEMBERS ARE PARTICIPATING FROM, THAT OPTION AS AN AUTOMATIC
5 DEFAULT GOES AWAY AND NOW WE HAVE TWO OPTIONS UNDER THE BROWN
6 ACT IN WHICH MEMBERS CAN PARTICIPATE REMOTELY ONE IS WHAT I'M
7 CALLING THE ANY TIME TELECONFERENCING RULES FAMILIAR TO YOU
8 FROM THE PRE-PANDEMIC DAYS IN THOSE CIRCUMSTANCES A MEMBER OF
9 A COMMITTEE OR BOARD NOTICES THEIR LOCATION, THEIR REMOTE
10 LOCATION, ON THE PUBLIC AGENDA SO THAT ANY MEMBER OF THE
11 PUBLIC KNOWS WHERE THAT IS, THE LOCATION HAS TO BE NOTICED AT
12 THE LOCATION ITSELF, SO IF THAT'S FOR EXAMPLE, CITY HALL AND
13 YOU ARE PARTICIPATING FROM A CONFERENCE ROOM YOU WOULD POST A
14 NOTICE ON CITY HALL. AND THAT LOCATION HAS TO BE OPEN AND
15 ACCESSIBLE TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO CAN THEN PARTICIPATE
16 IN THE MEETING REALTIME WITH THE MEMBER WHO IS PARTICIPATING
17 FROM THAT LOCATION. SO, THAT'S KIND OF THE STANDARD THAT YOU
18 ALL ARE FAMILIAR WITH FROM BEFORE. WE HAVE NEW OPTIONS UNDER
19 A.B. 2449, BECAUSE THERE WAS A RECOGNITION THAT THERE ARE
20 CIRCUMSTANCES UNDER WHICH IT'S DIFFICULT TO POST OR MAKE
21 ACCESSIBLE A REMOTE LOCATION, SO, FOR EXAMPLE, IF SOMEBODY IS
22 SUFFERING, YOU KNOW, HAS SURGERY AND HAS A ONE MONTH RECOVERY,
23 IT MAY BE DIFFICULT TO SAY, OKAY I'M GOING TO HAVE A PUBLIC
24 MEETING IN THE ICU, I'M ABLE TO, IN THE RECOVERY WING ABLE TO
25 PARTICIPATE AS A MEMBER OF THE BODY BUT I DO NOT WANT MEMBERS



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 OF THE PUBLIC COMING IN AND JOINING ME THERE. OR IF SOMEBODY
2 HAS CARE GIVING OBLIGATIONS FOR A CHILD OR AS MENTIONED IN
3 PUBLIC COMMENTS, WORK RESPONSIBILITIES IT MIGHT HARD TORE OPEN
4 UP THOSE PLACES. SO A.B. 2449 PROVIDES A VERY LIMITED, SORT
5 OF, PRESSURE VALVE RELEASE FOR THOSE SITUATIONS WHERE MEMBERS
6 OF THE BODY CAN PARTICIPATE REMOTELY WITHOUT NOTICING THEIR
7 LOCATION AND MAKING IT OPEN TO THE PUBLIC. BUT THERE ARE VERY
8 SPECIFIC CRITERIA UNDER WHICH THAT KIND OF PARTICIPATION IS
9 ALLOWED. AND THE OTHER ISSUE THAT IT CREATES IS THAT IT DOES
10 NOT JIVE WELL WITH THE ANY TIME TELECONFERENCING. SO IF ANY
11 MEMBER OF A BODY INVOKE THE A.B. 2449 PROVISIONS THEN A QUORUM
12 OF THE BODY HAS TO APPEAR IN ONE PHYSICAL LOCATION TOGETHER.
13 SO, IF WE HAVE A SITUATION WHERE A NUMBER OF PEOPLE HAVE
14 NOTICED REMOTE LOCATIONS UNDER THE REGULAR OLD BROWN ACT
15 OPTION, COUNTY, YOU KNOW, COUNTY OFFICE BUILDINGS, CITY HALLS,
16 ET CETERA, AND THEN ANY MEMBER OF THE BOARD SAYS, OH, YOU KNOW
17 WHAT, I'M HAVING A MEDICAL ISSUE, I NEED TO USE A.B. 2449 THEN
18 THOSE PEOPLE WHO PREVIOUSLY NOTICED THOSE REMOTE LOCATIONS
19 MIGHT HAVE TO EITHER COME INTO BEALE STREET OR OTHER LOCATIONS
20 SO WE HAVE A QUORUM IN ONE PHYSICAL LOCATION TOGETHER. FURTHER
21 COMPLICATION, IF THOSE OTHER LOCATIONS HAD BEEN PREVIOUSLY
22 NOTICED THEY STILL NEED TO BE OPEN EVEN IF THE MEMBER ISN'T
23 THERE. YOU CAN IMAGINE THE POTENTIAL COMPLICATIONS THIS
24 CREATES AT LEAST WHERE WE OVERLAP 2449 AND REGULAR OLD
25 TELECONFERENCING. THE ONE THING I WILL NOTE THOUGH IS THAT



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 A.B. 2449 WAS TRYING TO ADDRESS A REAL PROBLEM IS THAT THERE
2 ARE PEOPLE WHO WANT TO PARTICIPATE IN PUBLIC BODIES AND CAN'T.
3 IN-PERSON, BECAUSE THAT I HAVE PHYSICAL LIMITATIONS THAT MAKE
4 IT DIFFICULT TO COME IN WE HAVE A LARGE REGION AND THE TRANSIT
5 TIMES ARE SIGNIFICANT SOMEBODY WHO HAS A PHYSICAL IMPAIRMENT
6 AND IS TRANSIT DEPENDENT MIGHT HAVE A HARD TIME GETTING INTO
7 BEALE STREET FROM MORGAN HILL ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. TRYING TO
8 IDENTIFY FOLKS WHO HAVE CERTAIN CONDITIONS OR MEDICAL
9 CONDITIONS OR CARE GIVING RESPONSIBILITIES FOR PERHAPS YOU
10 KNOW, IMMUNE COMPROMISED SITUATION THEY WOULD STILL HAVE THE
11 ABILITY TO PARTICIPATE WITHOUT HAVING TO MAKE THEIR LOCATIONS
12 PUBLIC. A.B. 2449 LIMITS THE NUMBER OF TIMES IN A GIVEN YEAR
13 THAT YOU CAN DO THAT IT'S NOT, SORT OF, FOR ALL-TIME GETTING
14 OUT OF NOTICING FOREVER IT'S A LIMITED, SORT OF, TARGET FORMAT
15 FOR THAT. THAT'S LEGAL FRAMEWORK WHAT YOU ALL WANT TO DO WITH
16 IT IS MORE OF A QUESTION FOR YOU. AND I KNOW THAT PREDATES MY
17 TIME BECAUSE I STARTED IN THE MIDDLE OF THE PANDEMIC WHEN WE
18 WERE ALL FULLY REMOTE. MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT MTC HAD A
19 STANDARD WHEREBY THE EXPECTATION WAS THAT THE COMMISSIONERS
20 WOULD COME IN. THE TELECONFERENCING RULES WERE AVAILABLE BUT
21 YOU DIDN'T USE THEM, THE, SORT OF, ANYTIME TELECONFERENCING
22 RULES THE EXPECTATION WAS THAT YOU WOULD COME IN-PERSON. STAFF
23 IS OPERATING ON THE ASSUMPTION UNTIL WE'RE TOLD OTHERWISE THAT
24 THAT'S LARGELY WHAT YOU WANT TO DO. THAT'S THE DISCUSSION NOW
25 WITH THAT YOU SHOULD HAVE TWO AND A HALF YEARS OF EXPERIENCE



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 UNDER YOUR BELTS WITH REMOTE MEETINGS. THERE MAY BE SOME, SORT
2 OF, DIFFERENCE OF OPINION ABOUT HOW TO PROCEED. YOU HAVE A LOT
3 OF AUTHORITY TO DECIDE WHAT WORKS FOR YOU CAN CREATE STANDARDS
4 WHEREBY YOU SAY THESE KINDS OF MEETINGS ARE OKAY IN-PERSON,
5 THESE OKAY TO PARTICIPATE BY TELECONFERENCE SOME PERCENTAGE OF
6 PEOPLE CAN PARTICIPATE VIA TELECONFERENCE, COMMISSION LEVEL
7 MEETINGS AND COMMITTEES YOU HAVE ONE REAL BUT FOR VOLUNTEER
8 COMMITTEES YOU MIGHT HAVE DIFFERENT SET OF EXPECTATIONS
9 PARTICULARLY A LOT OF THOSE MEMBERS OF THOSE COMMUNITIES DON'T
10 HAVE THE SAME RESOURCES THAT MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION MIGHT
11 IN TERMS OF GETTING TO IN-PERSON MEETINGS. FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE
12 GENUINE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT ISSUES WE WANT TO MAKE
13 SURE WE'RE NOT CUTTING OFF THEIR ABILITY TO PARTICIPATE AND WE
14 WANT TO MAKE SURE WE DO OUR BEST TO ACCOMMODATE THEIR NEEDS.
15 THAT'S MY REPORT. HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS.

16

17 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. THIS WAS AN INFORMATION
18 ONLY. I AGREE WITH THE SENTIMENT THAT YOU SHARED FOR
19 INDIVIDUALS WHO HAVE DISABILITIES OR NEED SPECIAL
20 ACCOMMODATION, I BELIEVE WE NEED TO -- [INDISCERNIBLE] WITH
21 THE WORK AHEAD US I HOPE WE STAND BY THAT WHERE COMMISSIONERS
22 CAN COME TO THE BUILDING WE ALL COME FROM DIFFERENT PARTS OF
23 THE REGION BUT THAT TYPE OF RELATIONSHIP BUILDING IS CRITICAL
24 TO WHAT WE'RE ABOUT TO EMBARK ON IN THE WORK OF THIS
25 COMMISSION. I'LL MAKE THOSE COMMENTS. AGAIN INFORMATION ITEM



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 ONLY. FOR VOLUNTEER COMMITTEES THERE WILL BE LATITUDE THERE
2 ACKNOWLEDGING MULTIPLE COMMITTEES THAT WE HAVE. AGAIN FOR
3 LATER DISCUSSION. COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS OR QUESTIONS?
4 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** I COMPLETELY AGREE WITH THE ACCOMMODATIONS THAT WE
7 NEED TO INCLUDE IN HERE. I DO BELIEVE THAT OUR COMMISSIONS ARE
8 SO IMPORTANT. THE COMMITTEES THAT WE HAVE, PARTICULARLY THE
9 VOLUNTEER ONES AND I HOPE THAT WE CAN BE FLEXIBLE IN DEALING
10 WITH THOSE PEOPLE WHO ARE GIVING THEIR VALUABLE TIME HERE.
11 BECAUSE WE ARE SO MUCH BETTER FOR THEIR PARTICIPATION. WE ALSO
12 TALK ABOUT REDUCING GREENHOUSE GASSES. I JUST THINK WE HAVE TO
13 BE FLEXIBLE. IT'S GREAT TO BE HERE. ONE THING I DIDN'T HEAR
14 THAT I THINK WE NEED TO BE REALISTIC ABOUT, IS ACTS OF GOD
15 THESE DAYS. WE HAVE HAD MAJOR ROADS COLLAPSE. SO, I DON'T KNOW
16 HOW THAT WOULD FIT IN WITH, IF YOU ARE ISOLATED ONE WAY OR
17 ANOTHER, BUT STILL HAVE ELECTRONICS. THERE IS REALLY NO TIME
18 TO REACT OR POST REGARDING THAT. BUT IT IS IMPORTANT TO HAVE
19 PARTICIPATION. SO, IS THAT -- DID I MISS IT? IS THAT INCLUDED
20 SOMEHOW? KANE CAN DID YOU NOT MISS IT, BECAUSE I DIDN'T COVER
21 THAT IN MY DISCUSSION. SO THERE ARE A COUPLE OF THINGS. UNDER
22 THE BROWN ACT ITSELF, THERE ARE, SORT OF, EMERGENCY PROVISIONS
23 WHICH YOU ARE FAMILIAR WITH, SITTING ON A CITY COUNCIL THAT
24 HAVE TO DO WITH ACTS OF GOD REGIONAL EMERGENCIES, RIGHT, WHERE
25 IT'S DIFFICULT TO CONVENE. SEPARATELY UNDER A.B. 2449 THERE IS



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 THE PERSONAL EMERGENCY OPTION WHICH DOESN'T HAVE TO BE DEALT
2 WITH, WITH AS MUCH NOTICE. IN THAT CASE, IF IT, SORT OF,
3 AFFECTS ONE OR TWO PEOPLE, THEY CAN DECIDE -- THEY CAN ASK, UP
4 UNTIL THE DAY OF THE MEETING, AND IT DOES NOT HAVE TO BE
5 POSTED 72 HOURS IN ADVANCE FOR EXEMPTION FOR PERSONAL
6 EMERGENCIES BUT THE BODY DOESN'T HAVE TO SAY YES SAYING FOR
7 EXAMPLE, IF IT WERE TO DESTROY ABILITY TO HAVE A MEETING,
8 BECAUSE OF REMOTE PARTICIPATION, IF IT WOULD DESTROY A QUORUM
9 TO ACCEPT A PERSONAL EMERGENCY THEN THE BODY CAN SAY NO. BUT
10 IF SOMETHING CATASTROPHIC WERE TO HAPPEN IN ONE LOCATION, YOU
11 KNOW, REDWOOD CITY GETS HIT HARD BY SOMETHING THEN THE REDWOOD
12 CITY PEOPLE CAN MAKE THAT REQUEST UNDER THE PERSONAL
13 EMERGENCY.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN:** MOTHER NATURE IS SHOWING OFF A LOT LATELY. THAT'S
16 GOOD TO KNOW. I HOPE WE'RE INCLUSIVE AND CONCERNED ABOUT
17 ACCOMMODATIONS HERE. I LOVE MEETING WITH THE COMMITTEE ALL AT
18 ONCE BUT SOMETIMES PEOPLE CAN'T. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I DON'T
21 SEE ANY COMMISSIONERS IN THE BOARDROOM. DO WE HAVE ANYONE
22 VIRTUALLY?

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES WE DO. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI,
25 FOLLOWED BY COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO VENT
3 FOR JUST A SECOND, IF YOU DON'T MIND. THE PANDEMIC CREATED A
4 SITUATION WHERE SO MANY PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES FOR THE FIRST
5 TIME COULD REALLY PARTICIPATE AND TAKE ON LEADERSHIP ROLES IN
6 PUBLIC LIFE. AND THAT SEEMS TO BE COMING TO AN END BECAUSE OF
7 THESE CHANGES. I UNDERSTAND THAT WE HAVE SOME FLEXIBILITY ON
8 SOME OF THE MEETINGS. BUT I GUESS MY -- WELL, SO, AS FAR AS I
9 CAN TELL, THE BROWN ACT VIOLATES THE AMERICANS WITH
10 DISABILITIES ACT. AND, SO, WHICH DO WE FOLLOW? THE BROWN ACT
11 OR THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT? AND WHAT ARE WE AT --
12 WHAT IS -- WHAT IS HAPPENING IN THE LEGISLATURE TO ADDRESS
13 THIS ISSUE? AND WHAT IS MTC DOING ABOUT SUPPORTING CHANGES?
14 AND, FINALLY, ALFREDO, YOU SAID THAT SOME OF THE DECISIONS
15 WOULD BE MADE LATER REGARDING THE ADVISORY COMMITTEE, AND
16 WHETHER, YOU KNOW, AND HOW THAT MIGHT BE WORKED WITH. AND I
17 GUESS MY QUESTION IS WHEN? BECAUSE THIS TAKES EFFECT ON MARCH
18 FIRST. SO WHEN IS -- WHEN ARE WE GOING TO MAKE DECISIONS ABOUT
19 THIS? AND HOW IS NOT MAKING A DECISION AS OF MARCH 1ST GOING
20 TO AFFECT THE WORK OF, FOR EXAMPLE, OF POLICY ADVISORY
21 COUNCIL? SO, THOSE ARE SOME OF MY QUESTIONS, AND I REALLY -- I
22 FIND THIS SO DISTURBING THAT WE ARE GOING BACKWARDS IN TERMS
23 OF ALLOWING LEADERSHIP PARTICIPATION IN PUBLIC MEETINGS. THANK
24 YOU.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI.

2

3 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOU DID RAISE SOME QUESTIONS I HOPE
4 STAFF CAN ANSWER. ON THE QUESTION OF WHEN, I KNOW WE'RE
5 REACTING TO THE INFORMATION WE'RE GETTING. I THINK IT'S AN
6 INTENTION TO COME BACK AT OUR NEXT MISSION COMMITTEE TO
7 PROVIDE DIRECTION. I'LL CONFIRM WITH COUNSEL.

8

9 **KATHLEEN KANE:** ONE OF THE ISSUES WE WANTED TO FLESH OUT HERE
10 IS WHAT IS THE INTEREST. BECAUSE THERE HAS BEEN SOME PREVIOUS
11 DISCUSSIONS AMONG COMMISSIONERS WITH STAFF OFFLINE ABOUT
12 MAKING REMOTE LOCATIONS AVAILABLE. WE WANTED TO POKE AT THE
13 QUESTION OF WHAT DOES THE COMMISSION WANT US TO BRING BACK BY
14 WAY OF A STRUCTURE. WHAT I'M HEARING SO FAR IS THAT IT'S
15 IMPORTANT TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR VOLUNTEER COMMITTEES HAVE THE
16 SUPPORT THAT THEY NEED TO CONTINUE PARTICIPATING. I'LL NOTE
17 THAT, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE, AND MAY BE MEMBERS OF THE
18 COMMISSION ITSELF, THAT ALSO NEED SUPPORT AND THEIR ABILITY
19 TOO PARTICIPATE. SO WE WANT TO BE SENSITIVE TO THAT. MY OWN
20 VIEW IS THAT, AS STAFF, WE ARE OBLIGATED, SIMULTANEOUSLY TO
21 NAVIGATE THE BROWN ACT AND ADA MANDATED BY THE ADA TO FIGURE
22 OUT HOW TO ACCOMMODATE. THE PROBLEM THAT COMMISSIONER
23 GIACOPINI CORRECTLY IDENTIFIES IS THAT THE BROWN ACT DOESN'T
24 HAVE EXCEPT WHERE ACCOMMODATIONS REQUIRE OTHERWISE KIND OF A
25 CLAUS IN IT SO WE ARE LEFT WITH INHERENT TENSION AT VARIOUS



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 POINTS IN OUR ABILITY TO PROVIDE FOR EXAMPLE, LONG-TERM
2 ACCOMMODATIONS FOR SOMEBODY WITH IMMUNE SUPPRESSIVE ISSUES WHO
3 CANNOT OPEN THEIR LOCATION TO THE PUBLIC. WE DON'T HAVE A GOOD
4 TOOL FOR THAT BUT AS STAFF WE'RE COMMITTED TO WORKING WITH
5 FOLKS WHO NEED VARIOUS KINDS OF SUPPORT WHETHER IT'S
6 ADDITIONAL HELP GETTING HERE OR FINDING WAYS TO ALLOW THEM TO
7 CONTINUE THEIR PARTICIPATION. BECAUSE WE ALSO RECOGNIZE IT'S
8 INCREDIBLY USEFUL TO HAVE THE CREW WE HAVE NOW AND THAT WE MAY
9 HAVE IN THE FUTURE TO BE ABLE TO CONTINUE TO PARTICIPATE AND
10 SUPPORT IT. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO NOT PREEMPT THE REST OF THE
11 DISCUSSION, BUT IF THE COMMISSION WANTS TO GIVE SOME THOUGHT
12 ABOUT WHAT YOU WANT BROUGHT BACK TO YOU WE CAN DO THAT BY WAY
13 OF KIND OF AN INTERIM RULES RESOLUTION THAT WE CAN THEN AMEND.
14 I WOULDN'T SUGGEST AMENDING THE COMMISSION PROCEDURES AT THIS
15 POINT UNTIL THERE IS TIME FOR IT TO KIND OF SETTLE OUT OVER
16 THE NEXT MONTHS BECAUSE THIS IS GOING TO BE DIFFERENT FOR
17 PEOPLE AND FOLKS MAY HAVE AN EVOLVING UNDERSTANDING. I AM ALSO
18 GOING TO TAKE IT AS, SORT OF, OUR PERCENTAGE DIRECT I JUST
19 BECAUSE WE'RE ALWAYS BOUND BY THE ADA TO MAKE SURE THAT STAFF
20 ARE WORKING TO ACCOMMODATE WHEREVER WE CAN, REGARDLESS OF WHAT
21 THE COMMISSION, YOU KNOW, ON THOSE BROADER POLICY QUESTIONS,
22 HOW THAT DISCUSSION EVOLVES.

23

24 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COUNSEL. I KNOW THAT WE
25 ALSO HAVE COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA. IN YOUR
3 REPORT, KATHLEEN, YOU MENTIONED THAT, UNDER 2449, THERE IS THE
4 ABILITY FOR AN ELIMINATED REMOTE NOTICE. SO, WHAT IS THE
5 NUMBER INVOLVED WITH THE LIMITED TIMES YOU CAN USE IT?

6

7 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I'M GOING TO HAVE TO LOOK THIS UP, BECAUSE IT'S
8 A LITTLE COMPLICATED. [LAUGHTER] BUT IT IS -- LET'S SEE HERE -
9 - YOU ARE LIMITED TO THREE CONSECUTIVE MONTHS IN WHICH YOU CAN
10 INVOKE THESE PROVISIONS. AND YOU CANNOT EXCEED 20% OF THE
11 MEETINGS IN A YEAR. SO IT, SORT OF, DEPENDS ON HOW OFTEN
12 REGULAR MEETINGS ARE SCHEDULED FOR ANY PARTICULAR COMMITTEE OR
13 BODY. AND THEN YOU CANNOT EXCEED TWO MEETINGS IF THE BODY
14 MEETS FEWER THAN TEN TIMES IN THE CALENDAR YEAR.

15

16 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU FOR ANSWERING THAT.
17 THAT JUST CAUGHT MY ATTENTION. THEN, I DO APPRECIATE THE
18 EXPANSION ON COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENTS, WHERE YOU ARE
19 TALKING ABOUT THE PERSONAL EMERGENCY OPTION, BECAUSE WE ALL
20 KNOW THAT THERE IS THINGS THAT COME UP, SOMETIMES YOU HAVE GOT
21 TO GET TO THE DOCTOR AND THEY TELL YOU THIS IS THE ONLY TIME
22 WE CAN SEE YOU AND THAT CONFLICTS WITH THE MEETING SO HAVING
23 THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE ABLE TO STAY HOME TAKE THE MEETING
24 REMOTELY AND STILL GET TO THAT DOCTOR'S APPOINTMENT IS VERY



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 IMPORTANT, I THINK. SO, THANK YOU, AGAIN, FOR ANSWERING MY
2 QUESTIONS. AND THAT'S ALL I GOT CHAIR PEDROZA.

3

4 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.
5 DO WE HAVE ANYONE?

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. COMMISSIONER FLEMING THEN RANDY K,
8 AND THEN DO HAVE A COUPLE OF MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

9

10 **VICTORIA FLEMING:** THANK YOU. MY COMMENTS ARE LARGELY
11 REFLECTIVE OF COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI'S COMMENTS. I WANT TO
12 SUPPORT THE PARTICIPATION OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES AND NOT
13 MAKING ANY UNDUE HARDSHIPS FOR THEM IN GETTING TO BEALE
14 STREET. ADDITIONALLY, I WANT TO RAISE UP OUR VOLUNTEERS AND
15 NOT CAUSE THEM ANY UNDUE HARDSHIPS. I WANT TO POINT OUT THAT
16 NOT ALL MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSIONER PAID TO DO THE JOB THAT WE
17 DO, AND THAT TRAVEL FOR SOME OF US IS VERY CHALLENGING. AT THE
18 SAME TIME I RECOGNIZE THAT SOME IN-PERSON PARTICIPATION MAY BE
19 INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT FOR TEAM BUILDING, BUT SAID THAT, YOU
20 KNOW, TAKING A FEW HOURS TO GET FROM REMOTE REACHES OF THE BAY
21 AREA TO DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO IS A PRETTY BIG ASK. AND I JUST
22 WOULD LIKE US TO BE MINDFUL THAT IT'S NOT JUST LIMITED TO OUR
23 VOLUNTEERS BUT THAT SOME OF OUR COMMISSIONERS ARE, INDEED,
24 VOLUNTEERS, AS WELL.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER FLEMING.

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RANDI KINMAN?

4

5 **RANDI KINMAN:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO TURN OFF MY VIDEO SO WE
6 DON'T GLITCH. I'M A HEARTY PLUS ONE ON COMMISSIONER
7 GIACOPINI'S STATEMENTS. BECAUSE, AND I WANT TO FOLLOW UP ON,
8 FOR SOMEBODY TO GET FROM MORGAN HILL TO BEALE STREET IS AN
9 ONEROUS TASK AT BEST AND I WANT TO REMIND THE COMMISSION THAT
10 WE HAVE GONE YEARS WITHOUT A FULL REPRESENTATION FROM NAPA
11 COUNTY, SIMPLY BECAUSE OF THE TRANSPORTATION PROBLEMS. THAT
12 HASN'T BEEN THE CASE IN THE LAST FEW YEARS, BUT WE HAVE HAD
13 COUNTIES THAT HAVE NEVER HAD REPRESENTATION FROM REMOTE AREAS.
14 THE COAST OF SAN MATEO, I'M GOING TO GUARANTEE YOU HAS NEVER
15 HAD REPRESENTATION. SOUTH SANTA CLARA COUNTY, I CAN'T SPEAK TO
16 ALL THE EASTERN COUNTIES, BUT I KNOW THE NORTHERN COUNTIES
17 HAVE THESE PROBLEMS. AS A TRUSTEE FROM A SCHOOL BOARD, I
18 UNDERSTAND THE NEED FOR ME AS A TRUSTEE TO BE THERE IN-PERSON
19 AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE, BUT I WOULD -- I'M A LITTLE DISAPPOINTED
20 THAT THIS CONVERSATION DIDN'T HAPPEN EARLIER, BECAUSE I HAVE
21 PEOPLE ON THE COUNCIL THAT ARE NOW RESIGNING THEIR POSITIONS,
22 BECAUSE WE DID NOT HAVE A FULL UNDERSTANDING OR KNOW THAT
23 THERE MAY BE A WAY OUT FOR SOME OF THIS. SO, I JUST REALLY
24 HOPE THAT YOU BRING THIS BACK. AND I KNOW THAT THIS IS THE
25 COMMISSION'S BUSINESS, BUT THE COUNSEL IS THE BODY THAT DOES



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 THE LEG WORK BEFORE POLICIES GET TO YOU, AND I THINK THAT WE
2 SHOULD BE AS CONSCIOUS OF THEIR NEEDS AS ANYBODY ELSE'S. AND I
3 REALLY WANT TO SEE THE REPRESENTATIONS I HAVE ON MY CURRENT
4 BODY. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU RANDI.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA'S HAND IS
9 NOW RAISED.

10

11 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. THANK YOU, CHAIR. I APPRECIATE
12 THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE ALREADY BEEN MADE. I -- AND I RECALL, I
13 THINK WE HAD TALKED ABOUT THIS BEFORE AND TRYING TO COME UP
14 WITH A COMPROMISE WHERE PERHAPS THE COMMITTEE MEETINGS COULD
15 HAVE MORE FLEXIBILITY TO ALLOW FOR FOLKS TO COME IN VIRTUALLY
16 AND THEN MAKE A CONCERNED EFFORT TO ATTEND THE COMMISSION
17 MEETINGS. I HAD HOPED THERE WOULD BE MORE PROGRESS TOO IN
18 TERMS OF FINDING REMOTE LOCATIONS FOR US TO CALL IN FROM,
19 AND/OR -- IF WE NEED TO DO IT OURSELVES, YOU KNOW, WE CAN DO
20 THAT, BUT I GUESS I'M LOOKING FOR, YEAH, SOME DIRECTION AS TO
21 WHAT THE COMMISSION WILL ALLOW, FIRST, AND THEN WE CAN GO, I
22 GUESS, AND FIGURE OUT WHERE -- WHAT LOCATIONS AND WHAT NOT,
23 THE LOGISTICS OF IT, BUT THAT WOULD BE MY SUGGESTION. I DO
24 COME FROM SOUTH COUNTY, THE SOUTH BAY, AND IT USED TO TAKE ME
25 A GOOD TWO HOURS, TWO HOURS AND 15 MINUTES TO GET IN, AND I AM



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 A COUNCIL MEMBER, AND I DON'T -- THIS ISN'T MY FULL-TIME JOB.
2 SO, I -- I APPRECIATE -- WOULD APPRECIATE MORE UNDERSTANDING
3 AND FLEXIBILITY FOR US WHO ARE TRYING TO DO THIS PART-TIME.
4 THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WOULD YOU LIKE TO MOVE TO MEMBERS OF THE
9 PUBLIC?

10

11 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET'S GO TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THEN
12 COME BACK TO THE COMMISSION.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DO YOU WANT TO STICK WITH 90 SECONDS?

15

16 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET'S GO TO 60 SECONDS.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. FIRST SPEAKER WILL BE VINAY
19 PIMPLE. MR. PIMPLE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL
20 HAVE 60 SECONDS.

21

22 **VINAY PIMPLE:** HI. I AM ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL,
23 APPOINTED TO REPRESENT THE DISABLED FOLKS IN CONTRA COSTA
24 COUNTY. FIRST, I DO WANT TO THANK COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI, AND
25 I 100% SUPPORT EVERYTHING SHE SAID, AND I'M JUST YOU WONDERING



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 WHY IS IT THAT THE BROWN ACT GETS TO TRUMP THE ADA? THE SECOND
2 THING IS, I HAVE A SCENARIO, LET'S SAY THERE IS AN IN-PERSON,
3 ENOUGH PEOPLE FOR A QUORUM, AND THEN THERE IS SOMEBODY WHO
4 WANTS TO PARTICIPATE BUT DOES NOT WANT TO NOTICE THEIR
5 LOCATION, WHAT IS THEIR STATUS THEN? ARE THEY PANELISTS WHO
6 CAN VOTE? OR ARE THEY PANELISTS WHO CAN DISCUSS OR RELEGATED
7 TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO CAN ONLY, YOU KNOW, MAKE COMMENTS
8 DURING THE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD? THANK YOU.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS HOWARD
11 WONG. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

12

13 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY
14 COUNCIL.

15

16 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MR. WONG, IF YOU ARE THERE, WE CAN'T
17 HEAR YOU.

18

19 **HOWARD WONG:** HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF THE POLICY ADVISORY
20 COUNCIL. THIS IS A VERY WIDE SWEEPING ISSUE OF CONCERN IT'S
21 NOT JUST FOR THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY, THE ADA COMMUNITY OR
22 PEOPLE WHO HAVE TO TRAVEL LONG DISTANCES, SENIORS, LOW-INCOME
23 COMMUNITIES, TRANSIT DEPENDENT PEOPLE ALSO HAVE DIFFICULTY
24 GETTING TO PUBLIC AGENCY MEETINGS. AND PERHAPS MTC COULD
25 FORMULATE A MODEL THAT OTHER AGENCIES AND OTHER CITIES COULD



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 FOLLOW, LOOKING AT HOW TO EQUALIZE THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK AT
2 PUBLIC MEETINGS. AND ONE OF THE POSSIBILITIES MIGHT BE TO
3 COMBINE THE NUMBER OF SPEAKERS, OR SOMEHOW ENABLE GROUPS TO
4 HAVE A SPOKESMAN AT A KIND OF DISCOUNTED PERCENTAGE OF TIME.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, MR. WONG. SORRY. THAT'S YOUR
7 TIME. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED, FOLLOWED BY
8 ALETA DUPREE.

9

10 **ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED:** THANK YOU. THIS IS AN ISSUE FOR ALL KINDS
11 OF FOLKS. GETTING TIME OFF WORK IN THE MIDDLE OF MY WORK DAY
12 IS SOMETHING THAT IS POSSIBLE FOR ME IF I CAN DO IT FOR THE
13 DURATION OF A MEETING WHICH IS OFTEN ARE BETWEEN 2 AND 3
14 HOURS. SO GETTING THAT MUCH TIME OFF IS A FEAT IN AND OF
15 ITSELF. BUT TRYING TO GET THE AMOUNT OF TIME OFF THAT IT WOULD
16 TAKE ME TO THEN COMMUTE. AND I AM RELATIVELY CLOSE. IT WOULD
17 BE FROM HAYWARD TO SAN FRANCISCO, AND THAT, LIKE, THAT WOULD
18 MAKE IT IMPOSSIBLE. I WOULD HAVE TO TAKE AN ENTIRE DAY OF
19 VACATION FOR EVERY COMMITTEE THAT I HAVE PARTICIPATED IN. AND
20 I CAN'T, I CAN'T AFFORD TO DO THAT. AND THAT'S NOT HOW I WANT
21 TO SPEND MY VACATION ANYWAYS. I REALLY ENCOURAGE THAT WE GO
22 WITH THE VERSION OF THE BROWN ACT THAT ALLOWS FOR MEETING IN
23 MULTIPLE LOCATIONS, AND THEN ACCOMMODATIONS FOR VOLUNTEER
24 COMMITTEES. THANK YOU.

25



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. AND THE FINAL SPEAKER IS
2 ALETA DUPREE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR; ALFREDO PEDROZA. ALETA DUPREE
5 FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER. I YOU THINK COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI
6 SAID IT VERY WELL, AND I WONDERS WAS THE DISABILITY COMMUNITY
7 CONSULTED WITH THESE NEW BROWN ACT REGULATIONS FROM THE
8 LEGISLATURE. I DON'T WANT TO SEE MEETINGS ADJOURNED BEFORE
9 THEY START, BECAUSE WE CAN'T HASTILY ASSEMBLE A QUORUM BECAUSE
10 SOMEBODY HAS AN EMERGENCY. AND I DON'T WANT TO SEE PEOPLE
11 DENIED PARTICIPATING IN OUR MEETINGS BECAUSE THEY HAPPEN TO
12 HAVE A BAD RUN OF MEDICAL ISSUES WHERE THEY HAVE TO INVOKE
13 THESE EXEMPTIONS. MAYBE A COURT CASE IS THE WAY TO TRY TO
14 SOLVE THIS AND GET SOME KIND OF INJUNCTION TO MAKE THIS NEW
15 BROWN ACT RULE COMPLIANT WITH THE ADA. THE ADA IS FEDERAL LAW
16 AND IT SHOULD TAKE PRECEDENCE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NO ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC AND
21 COUNSEL FOR BRINGING THIS FORWARD. THIS IS AN INFORMATION
22 ITEM. WHAT I HAVE HEARD IS ABSOLUTELY TRY TO ACCOMMODATE THOSE
23 WITH DISABILITIES IT IS CLEAR I HAVE HEARD FROM COMMISSIONERS
24 AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. THANK YOU TO COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI
25 FOR RAISING THOSE ISSUES, WHICH SHE HAS DONE BEFORE. I HAVE



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 HEARD ABOUT LOOKING AT VOLUNTEER COMMITTEES PROVIDING
2 FLEXIBILITY. AND FOR THOSE WHO HAVE MULTIPLE JOBS AND TRYING
3 TO COME TO COMMISSION MEETINGS WE SHOULD ALLOW FOR FLEXIBILITY
4 WHERE POSSIBLE WITH THE EXEMPTIONS OF 2449 BUT I THINK FOR THE
5 WORK THAT WE'RE DOING, TRYING TO BE IN-PERSON, IS SOMETHING I
6 AM INTERESTED, WITH PROVIDING ON, YOU KNOW, WITH EXCEPTIONS
7 WHERE POSSIBLE AND BEING FLEXIBLE FOR THOSE SITUATIONS. I
8 WELCOME COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. COMMISSIONER SPERING AND PAPAN
9 AND MOULTON PETERS.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. WE SHOULD WORK WITH STAFF AND
12 COMMISSIONS IN JURISDICTIONS TO IDENTIFY LOCATION AND PUBLIC
13 THAT LOCATION, SORT OF, A PERMANENT, TO THAT COMMISSIONER, IF
14 IT HAPPENS TO BE A SUPERVISOR, GIVE NOTICE AND POST IT SO IT'S
15 NOT MOVING AROUND. I THINK THE COMMITTEE MEETINGS SHOULD BE
16 IN-PERSON. IF YOU LOOK TO THE COMMISSION PRIOR TO THE
17 PANDEMIC, HOW IT OPERATED PRIOR AND DURING THE PANDEMIC, IT'S
18 REALLY DRAMATICALLY DIFFERENT. AND THOSE WHOLE DYNAMICS HOW
19 DECISIONS WERE MADE, THOSE RELATIONSHIPS SO WE SHOULD
20 ENCOURAGE THE IN-PERSON MEETING FOR THE MEMBERS THAT ARE
21 VOTING. AND SO THE COMMITTEES, I THINK THEY SHOULD TRY TO MEET
22 IN-PERSON. IF A COMMISSIONER WANTS TO ATTEND A COMMITTEE
23 MEETING, THEY'RE IN THE A VOTING MEMBER, THAT THEY SHOULD BE
24 ABLE TO DO THAT REMOTELY. AND I DON'T KNOW THAT THAT HAS TO BE
25 POSTED IF THEY'RE NOT A VOTING MEMBER. THAT'S SOMEBODY YOU



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 COULD LOOK INTO TOO. THAT WILL CUT DOWN ON SOME OF THE TRAVEL.
2 I THINK ON ALL OF OUR SUBCOMMITTEES AND COMMITTEES THAT
3 SUPPORT THIS COMMISSION, EVERY ACCOMMODATION SHOULD BE MADE TO
4 MAKE IT CONVENIENT TO THOSE MEMBERS THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT THEY
5 CAN PARTICIPATE, THAT THEY CAN VOTE, AND I WOULD LIKE TO SEE
6 US ESTABLISH SOME GUIDELINES TO PURSUE WHATEVER WE HAVE TO, TO
7 MAKE THAT POSSIBLE. I THINK THERE IS A LOT OF LEAD WAY IN IT,
8 A.B. 2449, I THINK THERE IS ENOUGH LEAD WAY WHERE WE CAN
9 PACKAGE IT IN A WAY SO IT WILL MEET THOSE REQUIREMENTS. I
10 WOULD LIKE STAFF TO LOOK AT THAT AND IF WE HAVE TO PUSH THE
11 ENVELOPE WE SHOULD DO THAT.

12

13 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS.

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** A BRIEF COMMENT ON SOME OF THE
16 BODIES I HAVE SERVED ON BCDC TALKING ABOUT REGIONAL CENTERS
17 COMBINED WITH OTHER AGENCIES. SO THAT'S ANOTHER OPTION.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN:** YEAH. I WAS WONDERING, FROM LEGAL COUNSEL HERE, IS
20 THERE ANY WAY -- I THINK WE HAVE SOME COMMON GROUND HERE, CAN
21 WE PROPOSE EMERGENCY LEGISLATION FOR THE BROWN ACT TO BE
22 FLEXIBLE FOR COMMITTEES THAT DO NOT SET POLICY OR BINDING
23 ACTIONS? OR I THINK, AS WAS MENTIONED, NON-VOTING MEMBERS? IS
24 THAT POSSIBLE? BECAUSE I -- WE'RE LOSING MEMBERSHIP HERE, TO A



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 VERY VITAL COMMITTEE, THE POLICY COMMITTEE, AND I DO NOT WANT
2 TO SEE THAT.

3

4 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THERE ARE A NUMBER OF ISSUES ARE ACTUALLY THAT
5 I DIDN'T GET TO RESPOND TO, STARTING WITH THE LAST ONE FIRST
6 THERE, THERE IS SOME LEGISLATIVE ATTEMPTS GOING ON RIGHT NOW,
7 ONE IN EACH HOUSE TO ADDRESS SOME OF THESE ISSUES. SB 411 IS
8 CURRENTLY PENDING AND WOULD TAKE CARE OF A LOT OF THESE
9 THINGS. SO, THERE IS PLACES FOR LEGISLATIVE ADVOCACY. AND THIS
10 ALSO GOES TO COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI'S QUESTION, WHICH I FORGOT
11 TO ANSWER WHEN I WAS RESPONDING THAT OUR LEGISLATIVE STAFF IS
12 TRACKING THAT, AND I'M NOT SURE, REBECCA WOULD HAVE TO TELL US
13 WHAT THE COUNTER STATUS IS. IS THAT GOING TO BE ON A FUTURE
14 AGENDA? YEAH. SO, REBECCA, WHO IS OUR LEGISLATIVE PERSON IS
15 SAYING THAT WE WILL BE TAKING A POSITION IN THE FUTURE ON 411?
16 OR, I WANT TO NOT PREEMPT YOU ON THAT.

17

18 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YES.

21

22 **REBECCA LONG:** REBECCA LONG, DIRECTOR OF LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC
23 AFFAIRS. UNFORTUNATELY, WE HAVE LEARNED THAT IS. B 411 BY
24 SENATOR PORTENTINO IS INTENDED TO BE REVISED ONLY TO APPLY TO
25 LA COUNTY. I'M NOT SURE HOW THAT'S GOING TO FLY. THAT'S A BILL



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 WE WERE INTERESTED IN SUPPORTING BUT AT THIS POINT IT DOESN'T
2 MAKE A LOT OF SENSE FOR US WE'LL COMMUNICATE WE WOULD LOVE FOR
3 IT TO BE STATEWIDE, THERE IS ANOTHER BILL, 8817 ASSEMBLYMEMBER
4 PACHECO, SOMETHING WE'RE DEFINITELY PLANNING ON LOOKING AT
5 RIGHT NOW, PORTANTINO PROPOSED TO BE AN URGENCY BILL, THE
6 OTHER BILL IS NOT. WE'RE IN CONVERSATIONS ARE WITH OTHER
7 REGIONAL AGENCIES, CALCOG, CALIFORNIA COUNCIL OF ASSOCIATIONS
8 OF GOVERNMENTS THIS IS TOP PRIORITY FOR US IT'S NOT AN EASY
9 ISSUE IN SACRAMENTO BUT THE PASSION WITH WHICH WE HAVE HEARD
10 DISCUSSION ON TODAY REALLY NEEDS TO BE COMMUNICATED TO
11 SACRAMENTO AND CERTAINLY TAKE THAT BACK ESPECIALLY ON THE
12 ACCESSIBILITY PIECE.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN:** I'M DEEPLY CONCERNED WE'RE LOSING MEMBERSHIP RIGHT
15 NOW IS THERE AN EMERGENCY RESOLUTION WITHIN OUR OWN
16 ORGANIZATION TO ACCOMMODATE OUR POLICY COMMITTEES SO WE DON'T
17 LOSE THESE PEOPLE? CAN WE DO THAT? THEY'RE NOT VOTING.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ONE CLARIFICATION -- IF THIS IS ABOUT
20 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, WHEN IS THEIR NEXT MEETING AND IF
21 THERE IS OPPORTUNITY THAT WE MIGHT TALK ABOUT THIS BEFORE THE
22 NEXT MEETING? I THINK THAT'S WHAT YOU'RE REFERRING TO
23 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

24



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** KIMBERLY SAYS THEIR NEXT MEETING IS MARCH 8TH.
2 STAFF IS ALREADY ON THE PATH OF TRYING TO ACCOMMODATE
3 INDIVIDUAL PEOPLE AND IF WE CAN CONTINUE ON THAT PATH AT LEAST
4 FOR THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL UNTIL SUCH TIME THE COMMISSION
5 CAN TAKE OFFICIAL ACTION THAT SHOULD GET US OVER THE HUMP FOR
6 MARCH. WE DON'T WANT TO, AS STAFF, WE DON'T WANT TO LOSE
7 PEOPLE EITHER THAT'S SOMETHING WE WERE ALREADY WORKING ON
8 DOING. BUT, IT IS IMPORTANT THAT THIS COMMISSION SET DIRECTION
9 FOR ITSELF, AS YOU HAVE HEARD, THERE IS -- YOU KNOW, A WIDE
10 VARIETY OF EXPERIENCES AND APPROACHES HERE. I WANTED, IF I
11 COULD, JUST TAKE THE LIBERTY, THROUGH THE CHAIR TO MENTION A
12 COUPLE OF OTHER THINGS THAT CAME UP, AS TO THE REGIONAL
13 CENTERS THAT IS SOMETHING A NUMBER OF OTHER BODIES ARE NODE
14 TYPE LOCATIONS ON, AND DRIVES WITH WHAT COMMISSIONER SPERING
15 WAS TALKING ABOUT PERMANENT OR SEMI PERMANENT REMOTE LOCATIONS
16 THAT PEOPLE CAN COINCIDENT ON BE AVAILABLE. WE DON'T HAVE ANY
17 RESOURCES FOR US TO STAFF THOSE PARTICULARLY MAKING SURE
18 REMOTE CONNECTIONS ARE WORKING, BUT COMMISSIONER WHO IS HAVE
19 ACCESS FOR EXAMPLE, A COUNTY BUILDING WHERE THEY CAN DIRECT
20 THAT AVAILABILITY, THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN COORDINATE WITH
21 THEM IF THE COMMISSION GIVES OKAY TO DO THAT.

22

23 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** BRINGING THAT BACK FOR LOGISTICAL
24 CHALLENGES, AT THE MARCH MEETING IS WHAT WOULD BE OF INTEREST
25 TO THE COMMISSION.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **KATHLEEN KANE:** WE CAN PROCEED WITH WHAT THAT LOOKS LIKE THERE
3 MAY BE A VARIETY OF HURDLES.

4

5 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** IF THERE'S A PATHWAY, THIS IS A FIRST
6 BITE TO THE DISCUSSION WE'RE TRYING. AT THE MARCH MEETING
7 WE'LL BE ABLE TO OUT THOSE ALTERNATIVES.

8

9 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THE ADA BROWN ACT IS ONE SHARED BY LEGAL
10 COUNSEL ALL OVER THE STATE WE DO OUR BEST TO NAVIGATE THAT
11 SPACE SO NOT TO EXCLUDE PEOPLE. AND TO COUNCIL MEMBER PIMPLE
12 ABOUT WHAT HAPPENS IF SOMEBODY'S NOT OFFICIALLY PARTICIPATING,
13 IN THE CAPACITY OF A PUBLIC, IF THEIR LOCATION ISN'T NOTICED
14 THEY DON'T OTHERWISE QUALIFY UNDER THESE PROVISIONS
15 UNFORTUNATELY.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** WE HAVE SENT LETTERS TO SACRAMENTO THAT WE SUPPORT
18 THE FLEXIBILITY FOR COMMITTEES THROUGHOUT OUR COUNTY I HOPE
19 MTC DOESN'T WAIT TOO LONG FOR THAT AND IF WE CONTACT OUR LOCAL
20 LEGISLATORS I KNOW THEY'RE SUPPORTIVE OF SUCH MEASURES.
21 SENATOR PORTENTINO, IF SAN MATEO COUNTY OR OUR JURISDICTION
22 NEEDS SOMETHING I'M SURE OUR LEGISLATIVE REPRESENTATIVES WOULD
23 ADDRESS SOMETHING LIKE THAT OR BE SUPPORTIVE. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** I BELIEVE FLEXIBILITY IS KEY. ONE OF THE THINGS,
3 REBECCA, MAYBE THROUGHOUT LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE, OR MAYBE TO
4 THE BOARD IF YOU CAN JUST PROVIDE FOR US, WHAT THE BILLS ARE,
5 SO I CAN REVIEW THAT. I THINK THAT WOULD BE EXTRAORDINARILY
6 IMPORTANT. I THINK COMMISSIONER PAPAN BRINGS A REALLY GOOD
7 POINT TO THE TABLE. WE HAVE IN SAN MATEO COUNTY, THERE ARE
8 ELECTED OFFICIALS THAT ARE REALLY, SORT OF, OPPOSED TO A.B.
9 2449. AND IT'S NOT FLEXIBILITY. IF YOU LOOK AT THE
10 LEGISLATION, THERE ARE A COUPLE OF FLAWS I THINK THAT NEED TO
11 BE CORRECTED. I THINK, I DON'T KNOW WHERE IT IS WITH OTHER
12 COUNTIES, BUT THERE IS THIS NOTION THAT A REMOTE WORK SHOULD
13 BE THERE. WE LOOK SPECIFICALLY AT THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL,
14 THROUGH COUNSEL, THEY'RE NOT COMPENSATED, ARE THEY?

15

16 **KATHLEEN KANE:** NO THEY SERVE ON A TRAVEL BASIS THEIR TRAVEL
17 EXPENSES ARE COMPENSATED.

18

19 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** I DON'T THINK THAT'S CORRECT.

20

21 **KATHLEEN KANE:** I'M SORRY. DID GET THAT WRONG?

22

23 **CLERK, MARTHA SILVER:** THEY ARE COMPENSATED.

24

25 **KATHLEEN KANE:** APOLOGIES. THEY ARE COMPENSATED.



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** MY CONCERN THAT'S SHARED BY OTHER MEMBERS IS
3 WHAT ARE WE GOING TO BE ABLE TO MAKE SURE THAT WE DON'T
4 CONTINUE TO LOSE MEMBERS? AND, SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK ONE OF
5 THE COMMISSIONERS HAD MENTIONED THIS ISSUE OF REGIONAL
6 CENTERS. I THINK, WITHIN THE LEGISLATION, I THINK THAT'S, YOU
7 KNOW, A GOOD PATH TO MOVE FORWARD. AND I THINK REGIONAL
8 CENTERS ARE IMPORTANT. BUT MY PERSONAL OPINION OF A.B. 2449,
9 AND I THINK THAT'S WHY IT'S GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT ON
10 STAFF TO KEEP US APPRISED IS I DO THINK THERE ARE GOING TO BE
11 CHANGES. AND I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE GOING TO CONTINUE TO
12 TRACK THOSE CHANGES. THAT STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO COMMUNICATE
13 WITH THE BOARD SO THAT WE CAN FOLLOW THAT. BECAUSE I JUST
14 DON'T THINK IN ITS CURRENT FORM, A.B. 2449 WITH MY
15 UNDERSTANDING OF WHAT'S GOING ON IS GOING TO -- IT NOW MAY BE
16 SUBJECT TO CHANGE, I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE AHEAD OF THOSE
17 CHANGES OR AT LEAST FOLLOWING THEM.

18

19 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA. AND I
20 THINK COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI IS GOING TO CLOSE US OUT. DID YOU
21 HAVE YOUR HAND RAISED?

22

23 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** I DID. YES. I JUST WANT TO SAY, I THINK
24 AT THIS POINT WE NEED TO LOOK AT THIS AS AN URGENT ISSUE THAT
25 WE DEAL WITH RIGHT AWAY. I DON'T KNOW THAT -- I THINK WE DO



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 NEED TO HAVE SOME ABILITY TO MAKE ACCOMMODATIONS AND DECISIONS
2 PRIOR TO THE NEXT -- OUR NEXT BOARD MEETING. AND THAT -- AND I
3 WOULD HOPE THAT MTC IS CURRENTLY -- SINCE IT SOUNDS LIKE
4 MEETING A.B. 8717 OR SB 411 ARE GOING TO PROVIDE ANY RELIEF
5 THAT OUR COMMISSION OUGHT TO BE SPEAKING WITH MEMBERS OF OUR
6 LEGISLATURE TO INTRODUCE LEGISLATION ASAP. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI. I
9 BELIEVE COUNCIL MEMBER KINMAN HAS FINAL COMMENTS. AND I -- NOT
10 THAT I WANT TO CUT THIS CONVERSATION SHORT BECAUSE IT'S VERY
11 IMPORTANT BUT I DO WANT TO RECOGNIZE THERE ARE A FEW OTHER
12 COMMITTEES THAT WE HAVE TO GET TO.

13

14 **RANDI KINMAN:** NOT A PROBLEM. I WANT TO ALLAY ANY FEARS THAT
15 WITH THIS INFORMATION, THE PEOPLE THAT I AM LOSING, THAT ARE
16 ON COMMITTEES BROWN ACT, I'M GOING TO SET WITH THAT FOR A
17 WHILE AND NOT MAKE THE CHANGES UNTIL WE COME BACK AND HAVE
18 BETTER DISCUSSION ON IT. I THINK WE CAN GO A MONTH WITHOUT
19 HAVING SOME PEOPLE ATTEND MEETINGS AND STILL MAINTAIN OUR
20 QUORUMS. SO I JUST WANTED TO ALLAY THOSE FEARS.

21

22 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU. COUNSEL WOULD YOU LIKE TO
23 PROVIDE A WRAP UP?

24



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** SURE GIVEN DISCUSSION TODAY HERE IS WHAT WE'RE
2 GOING TO DO AS STAFF. WE WANTED TO ACCOMMODATE INDIVIDUAL
3 REQUESTS WE'RE STILL GOING TO INVITE THOSE PARTICULARLY WITH
4 OUR VOLUNTEER COMMITTEES GOING TO CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THEM
5 IN THE NEAR-TERM AS THINGS SETTLE OUT AND PRIORITIZE AS ALWAYS
6 OUR DUTY ACCOMMODATIONS UNDER THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES
7 ACT. ALSO UNDER THE COMMISSION, NEXT COMMISSION MEETING, IT'S
8 NOT INCUMBENT ON STAFF TO DECIDE WHAT YOUR POLICY IS GOING TO
9 BE. THE COMMISSION HAS HEARD THIS DISCUSSION, IF INDIVIDUAL
10 COMMISSIONERS APPROACH US AND ASK FOR ASSISTANCE, WE WILL
11 PROVIDE THAT ASSISTANCE. AND THEN WHATEVER, SORT OF, ONGOING
12 GUIDANCE EMERGES FROM --

13

14 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** PERFECT. AND WHAT I HAVE HEARD FROM
15 COUNCIL JUST TO KIND OF TO GET TO IT TOO, I HAVE HEARD
16 COMMISSIONERS TALK ABOUT REGIONAL CENTERS EFFORT COMMISSIONERS
17 POTENTIALLY EXPRESSING HAVING HOME BASE IN THEIR MUNICIPALITY,
18 ALLOWS THEM TO ATTEND IF THERE IS AN EMERGENCY ISSUE I HAVE
19 HEARD COMMISSIONERS EXPRESS DESIRE TO BE IN-PERSON AS MUCH AS
20 POSSIBLE, THAT'S GENERAL CONSENSUS I HAVE HEARD FROM
21 COMMISSIONERS ON SCENARIOS, THE REGIONAL CENTER MIGHT BE
22 CHALLENGES IMPEDIMENTS THAT'S WHAT WE WANT TO HEAR SO WE'RE
23 AWARE OF WHAT THAT MEANS.

24



FEBRUARY 22, 2023

1 **KATHLEEN KANE:** WE WILL BRING BACK ARRAY OF OPTIONS FOR YOU TO
2 CONSIDER WILL INCLUDE REGIONAL CENTERS AND WHAT'S INVOLVED AND
3 ALSO TOGGLE POINTS FOR EXPECTATIONS ABOUT COMMISSIONER VERSUS
4 COMMITTEES, AND THE COMMISSION CAN MAKE WHATEVER OUTCOME YOU
5 ALL WANT ON THAT.

6

7 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONERS, THANK YOU FOR YOUR
8 THOUGHTFUL COMMENTS ON THIS. WE'RE TRYING TO HOLD ON TO THE
9 PARTICIPATION ENGAGEMENT, BALANCE WANTING TO BUILD
10 RELATIONSHIPS WHICH IS THE TRUE METHOD FOR THIS ORGANIZATION.
11 THANK YOU FOR YOUR PARTICIPATION. MOVING TO ITEM 18 PUBLIC
12 COMMENT. I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT GENERALLY.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ONE LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED
15 DISTRIBUTED TO THE COMMISSION LAST EVENING FROM KYLE BAKER OF
16 GET A CUSTOM ONE AND THAT WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA.
17 I SEE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AT THIS
18 TIME.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONERS WE'RE GOING TO ADJOURN
21 TO OUR NEXT MEETING, WEDNESDAY MARCH 22ND IN PERSON AT THE
22 METRO CENTER. ANY CHANGE TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED.
23 MR. FREMIER YOU PASSED YOUR FIRST COMMISSION MEETING.
24 CONGRATULATIONS. UP NEXT WE HAVE BATA. [ADJOURNED]

25



NTT

Broadcasting Government