# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 25 <sup>TH</sup> , 2024, 9:35 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE MY NAME IS
6	ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION
7	COMMISSION ALONG WITH VICE CHAIR NICK JOSEFOWITZ. THIS MEETING
8	IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. ITEM ONE, ROLL CALL, PLEASE.
9	
10	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR PEDROZA?
11	
12	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE.
13	
14	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? VICE CHAIR
15	JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
16	
17	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER AHN?
20	
21	EDDIE AHN: HERE COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
22	
23	DAVID CANEPA: HERE.
24	
25	CI.FDK MADTHA STIMED. COMMISSIONED CHAMET?



1	
2	CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.
3	
4	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?
5	
6	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY ON NON-
7	VOTING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
8	
9	VICTORIA FLEMING: PRESENT.
10	
11	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WE WILL LOOP BACK.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI NON-VOTING?
14	
15	DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.
16	
17	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
18	
19	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
20	
21	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS
22	ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-
23	PETERS? COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS, WE'LL LOOP BACK.
24	COMMISSIONER NOACK? THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?



1	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RABBITT?
4	
5	DAVID RABBITT: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER RONEN?
8	COMMISSIONER RONEN, WE'LL OH, IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER
9	SCHAFF, NON-VOTING? THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SPERING?
10	
11	JAMES P. SPERING: PRESENT.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER THAO? IS ABSENT
14	WE HAVE A QUORUM.
15	
16	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU. I BELIEVE WE HAVE TWO
17	REQUESTS FOR REMOTE PARTICIPATION UNDER AB2449. I'M GOING TO
18	START WITH COMMISSIONER FLEMING.
19	
20	VICTORIA FLEMING: THANK YOU, CHAIR. I REQUEST ACCOMMODATION
21	UNDER AB 2449 DUE TO A MEDICAL CONDITION AND THERE IS NOBODY
22	OVER THE AGE OF 18 HERE WITH ME.
23	



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER FLEMING. YOUR 1 REQUEST IS NOTED AND YOU'RE ADDED AS PRESENT FOR THE MEETING. 2 3 MOULTON PETERS? 4 5 STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: ALSO REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER AB2449 BECAUSE OF A MEDICAL ILLNESS. AND THERE 6 7 IS NO ONE PRESENT IN THE ROOM. 8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU BOTH YOU BOTH AND SPEEDY 9 RECOVERY. PROCEEDING TO ITEM ONE, THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. [ 10 PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE 11 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT 12 STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND 13 JUSTICE FOR ALL." 14 15 16 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER. ITEM 17 THREE, OUR COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT. 18 19 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW, I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE 20 21 TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A 22 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH 23

MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

25



- 1 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE GOING TO
- 2 PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR, THE CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT. THE
- 3 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE SELECT COMMITTEE DID MEET
- 4 AUGUST 26TH, AND AGAIN ON MONDAY SEPTEMBER 23RD OF THIS WEEK.
- 5 I, ALONG WITH FELLOW COMMISSIONERS WHO WERE IN ATTENDANCE. I
- 6 WANT TO GIVE COMMISSIONER SPERING AN OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE AN
- 7 UPDATE, WHO IS CHAIRING THIS COMMITTEE. I JUST WANT TO SAY, I
- 8 HAVE TALKED TO JIM QUITE A BIT, AND EVERY TIME I TALK TO HIM
- 9 HE'S IN A DIFFERENT PART OF THE REGION. THE AMOUNT OF WORK
- 10 THAT HE'S PUTTING INTO THIS, REGARDLESS OF THE OUTCOME, WHICH
- 11 THAT WILL BE POSITIVE. WE OWE A LOT TO COMMISSIONER SPERING. I
- 12 KNOW YOU'RE DOING TREMENDOUS WORK, JIM, TO KEEP THE REGION
- 13 TOGETHER ALSO REMINDING WHAT BEING A REGIONALIST IS. THESE ARE
- 14 NOT EASY DECISIONS WE HAVE TO MAKE AS A REGION. BUT THIS
- 15 ORGANIZATION IS THE RIGHT ORGANIZATION RIGHT PLATFORM TO HAVE
- 16 THE CONVERSATION. TAKE IT AWAY, COMMISSIONER.
- 17
- 18 JAMES P. SPERING: YOU KNOW, I AGREE. AND THIS COMMISSION IS
- 19 GOING TO HAVE A REAL CHALLENGE AHEAD OF IT WHEN IT COMES TO
- 20 THE COMMISSIONERS. FROM IS A LOT OF MOVING PIECES AND A CRISIS
- 21 THAT REALLY NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED. AND FROM WHERE I SIT, THIS
- 22 IS SIMILAR TO CLIPPER AND IS A PROBLEM THAT MTC NEEDS TO BE
- 23 INVOLVED IN. AS MOST OF YOU KNOW, SENATOR WIENER AND WAHAB
- 24 ASKED US TO WORK WITH OUR PARTNERS TO PUT TOGETHER A SELECT
- 25 COMMITTEE TO COME UP WITH TO BUILD A CONSENSUS IN THE COMMON.



- 1 ONLY CONSENSUS AND COMMON THREAD I HAVE BEEN TELLING THAT RUNS
- 2 THROUGH THIS IS NOBODY LIKES ANYTHING. [INDISCERNIBLE] IT
- 3 IMPACTS THE REGION. AND I HAVE BEEN MEETING WITH LEADERS
- 4 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA TO HEAR WHAT THEY HAVE TO SAY ABOUT
- 5 THE FISCAL CLIFF AND THE FOUR AGENCIES THAT WE HAVE BEEN
- 6 FOCUSING ON. BUT WE HAVEN'T LOST SITE OF THE SMALLER
- 7 OPERATIONS BART, MUNI, AC, AND CALTRAIN. AND IF THOSE CUTBACKS
- 8 ARE CHALLENGES THAT FACE THEM, IT'S GOING TO BE DISASTROUS AND
- 9 IT'S GOING TO AFFECT THE ECONOMY, THE ENVIRONMENT, OUALITY OF
- 10 LIFE, AND, ESPECIALLY, HURT THE TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDERS, THE
- 11 PEOPLE THAT WERE LOYAL TO US THROUGH THE PANDEMIC AND RODE THE
- 12 SYSTEM AND THEY HAVE A TREMENDOUS NEED. I URGE THE SELECT
- 13 COMMITTEE IS NOT JUST TO PLUG A HOLE IT'S TO LOOK AT THE
- 14 FUTURE. THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION HAS TO BE A VERY IMPORTANT
- 15 PIECE OF THIS. THE PUBLIC IS GOING TO WANT THAT CHANGE, AND SO
- 16 IT'S GOING TO BE MORE THAN JUST FILLING THE GAP. THE COMMITTEE
- 17 I THINK HAS ACCEPTED THAT CHALLENGE. BART IS NOT THE ONLY
- 18 TRANSIT AGENCY -- [INDISCERNIBLE] HIGH FAREBOX A NUMBER OF
- 19 COMMUTERS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. THE MULTI-COUNTY TRANSIT
- 20 SYSTEM, WHICH BART IS, AND SO MANY OF THE OTHER COMMISSIONERS
- 21 FUNDING DECISIONS HAVE BEEN BASED ON B.A.R.T.'S NOW OUTDATED
- 22 BUSINESS MODEL. SO THE COMMISSION IS GOING HAVE TO TAKE A LOOK
- 23 AT HOW THESE OPERATIONS ARE FUNDED. AS MOST OF YOU KNOW, I
- 24 THINK BART'S REVENUES FROM FARES IS ABOUT 70% AND THAT IS NOT
- 25 GOING TO RECOVER ANY TIME IN THE NEAR FUTURE. THAT'S WHY THIS



- 1 PAST MONDAY WE PROPOSED TO THE SELECT COMMITTEE THAT THE 2026
- 2 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE BE CONSIDERED BY THE VOTERS AND AT
- 3 LEAST FOUR COUNTIES SERVED BY BART, ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, SAN
- 4 FRANCISCO AND SAN MATEO. AS WE MEET WITH ALL THESE COUNTIES
- 5 AND ARE TALKING TO EVERYBODY, EVERYBODY WANTS TO BE TREATED
- 6 FAIRLY, THEY WANT TO DO THEIR PART AND RECOGNITION THAT THIS
- 7 IS A CRISIS, I THINK IS UNIVERSAL. I HAVEN'T HEARD ANYONE SAY
- 8 THIS ISN'T A CRISIS AND IS NOT IMPORTANT. THE TWO SCENARIOS
- 9 BEING CONSIDERED, SCENARIO ONE IS THOSE FOUR COUNTIES AND IT
- 10 FOCUSES ON BART, SAN FRANCISCO, MUNI AND MTC, WHO ARE THE
- 11 LARGE OPERATORS. WE'RE NOT LOSING SIGHT OF THE SMALL OPERATORS
- 12 WHO HAVE THE SAME CHALLENGE. THIS SCENARIO AIMS TO COVER THE
- 13 BUDGET GAP CREATED BY THE DROP IN FARE REVENUE SINCE THE
- 14 PANDEMIC WITH A 30-YEAR HALF-CENT SALE -- SAN FRANCISCO, SAN
- 15 MATEO COUNTIES, OTHER COUNTIES COULD OPT INTO THE MEASURE. WE
- 16 CAN GO INTO MORE DETAIL LATER. I'M NOT GOING TO DO THAT RIGHT
- 17 NOW. FUNDING FOR TRANSIT SCENARIO ONE DECLINED AFTER 2034
- 18 ALLOWING MORE REVENUE TO GO TO THE OTHER COUNTY PRIORITIES.
- 19 THOSE ARE OUR FLEX FUNDS, AND EVERYBODY'S CRUNCHING THOSE
- 20 NUMBERS AND YOU KNOW THE ABILITY TO DEAL WITH THOSE CHALLENGES
- 21 THAT THE CITIES AND COUNTIES HAVE. SCENARIO TWO, THE HYBRID
- 22 SCENARIO EVERYBODY REFERS TO AS "GO BIG" INCLUDES TWO FUNDING
- 23 SOURCES, HALF-CENT SALES TAX, GENERATING \$1 BILLION ANNUALLY,
- 24 COMPLIMENTARY BY PAYROLL TAX GENERATING \$500 MILLION ANNUALLY,
- 25 PROVIDES HIGHER LEVEL OF FUNDING THAT COMES CLOSE TO ADDRESS



- 1 THE OPERATORS ESTIMATED DEFICITS AND INCLUDES NEW EMPLOYEE
- 2 COMMUTER BENEFIT PROGRAM TO HELP WITH RECRUITMENT AND
- 3 RETENTION AND REDUCES SINGLE-OCCUPANCY VEHICLE TRAVEL AND
- 4 CONGESTION. WE, AT OUR LAST MEETING, WE HAVEN'T BEEN VOTING ON
- 5 ANYTHING, BUT WE'RE TESTING THE TEMPERATURE OF THE COMMITTEE
- 6 MEMBERS AND WE'RE USING GRADIENTS FROM 1 TO 5 SCALE. AND I
- 7 JUST WANT TO GO OVER SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT ARE BEING BROUGHT
- 8 FORWARD AND BEING DISCUSSED. TAX BURDEN ON CERTAIN COUNTIES,
- 9 ESPECIALLY ALAMEDA IS A PROBLEM WITH THE SALES TAX FOR SOME
- 10 COMMITTEE MEMBERS WHICH, IS WELL OVER 10%, THERE IS A
- 11 CURIOSITY AND INTEREST IF A MEASURE WHICH HAS A SHORTER TERM
- 12 THAN 30 YEARS, FIVE-YEAR EMERGENCY MEASURE THERE IS AN
- 13 INTEREST IN A MEASURE THAT PROVIDES HIGHER LEVEL OF FUNDING
- 14 FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS FOR THE ENTIRE 30 YEARS AND TRANSIT
- 15 OPERATORS ARE LOOKING FOR STABILITY SO THEY CAN DO SOME LONG
- 16 RANGE PLANNING AND THE FAIR SHARE CONVERSION IS ALIVE AND FIG
- 17 VOWS WE'RE HAVING THAT CONVERSATION WHICH I THINK IS A FAIR
- 18 OUESTION AND NEEDS TO BE ANSWERED THERE WAS CONCERN THAT
- 19 PAYROLL TAX WOULD HARM THE ECONOMY AND FACE OPPOSITION FROM
- 20 THE BUSINESS COMMUNITY AND THE IMPACT MIGHT HAVE ON
- 21 BUSINESSES, SOME WANT US TO SEE A PARCEL TAX CONSIDERED AND
- 22 THERE IS A WHOLE SERIES OF OPTIONS, I THINK THE INCOME TAX IS
- 23 ANOTHER ONE THAT PEOPLE ARE BRINGING FORWARD AND WANTING US TO
- 24 LOOK AT. THE CHALLENGE WILL BE BEFORE THE COMMISSION TO
- 25 PRESENT SOMETHING THE SENATE AND THREE OBJECTIVES THAT WE HAVE



- 1 BEEN FOCUSING ON IS ADDRESSING AND FOCUSING ON THE SHORTFALL,
- 2 TWO IS TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION REALLY GET CHANGE THIS IS ONE
- 3 TIME GOING TO BE ABLE TO LEVERAGE, SO YOU CAN IMAGINE
- 4 BALANCING ALL THREE OF THOSE. THE SELECT COMMITTEE ONLY HAS
- 5 ONE MORE MEETING REMAINING IN OCTOBER. AND WE HAVE WORK VERY
- 6 HARD TO KEEP THIS MOVING THIS ISSUE FORWARD. WILL THIS COME

ANDREW FREMIER: IN EARLY DECEMBER, SO WE GET A COUPLE OF

7 BEFORE THE COMMISSION IN OCTOBER?

8

10 CRACKS AT IT.

11

9

14

16

- 12 JAMES P. SPERING: THAT'S MY -- I'M TRYING TO MEET WITH ALL
- 13 COMMISSIONERS, INCLUDING YOU.

15 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT.

- 17 JAMES P. SPERING: I'M TRYING TO MEET WITH ALL THE
- 18 COMMISSIONERS BUT I HAVE BEEN MEETING WITH MOST OF THE TRANSIT
- 19 OPERATORS. I HAVE MET WITH MOST OF THEM. I CONTINUE TO DO THAT
- 20 AND TAKEN FEEDBACK. YOU KNOW, STAFF AND OUR FACILITATOR IS
- 21 DOING AN OUTSTANDING JOB. JUST A TREMENDOUS EFFORT PUTTING ALL
- 22 THIS MATERIAL TELLS AND TRYING TO SATISFY MANY OF THE REQUESTS
- 23 THAT WE'RE HEARING. BUT, AS I SAID, THE ONLY ENCOURAGING THING
- 24 ABOUT THIS IS PEOPLE SAY THAT WE NEED TO PROVIDE A SOLUTION,
- 25 AND IT'S AN ISSUE THAT NEEDS TO BE ADDRESSED IN SOME FASHION,



- 1 BECAUSE THIS COULD BE A DISASTER OUTCOME IF WE DON'T ADDRESS
  2 THIS ISSUE AND THE THOUSANDS OF PEOPLE IT'S GOING TO IMPACT IN
- 3 A VERY NEGATIVE WAY AND THEIR QUALITY OF LIFE. SO WITH THAT
- 4 MR. CHAIRMAN.

5

6 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GREAT.

7

- 8 JAMES P. SPERING: AND IF ANYBODY WANTS TO MEET ONE-ON-ONE --
- 9 BUT I AM GOING TO TRY TO MEET ALL COMMISSIONERS.

10

- 11 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I DO NOT THINK I HAVE YET TO MEET
- 12 SOMEONE WHO WONT MEET WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING. AGAIN THANK
- 13 YOU FOR THAT. A REMINDER, WE WERE TALKING ABOUT 1031 WE WANTED
- 14 TO HAVE THIS VERY DISCUSSION AT THE DAIS WITHIN THIS GROUP. IF
- 15 ANY COMMISSIONERS HAVE COMMENTS WE'LL HAVE OPPORTUNITY DO SO
- 16 UNDER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. PROCEEDING TO ITEM FIVE, POLICY
- 17 COUNCIL, DO WE -- LET ME ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON
- 18 THE CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT.

19

- 20 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
- 21 RECEIVED ON THAT ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
- 22 ZOOM LISTENING --

- 24 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I SEE BLUE CARDS IS THAT FOR A
- 25 SEPARATE ITEM?



1 2 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: DIFFERENT ITEM. 3 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. NEXT ITEM FIVE POLICY 4 5 ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT. MISS CAMPOS, TAKE IT AWAY. 6 PAMELA CAMPOS: HI EVERYONE. GOOD MORNING. I'M UPDATING YOU ON 7 8 THE MEETING THAT WE HAD IN AUGUST. THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MET FOR A RETREAT. WE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO LEARN MORE ABOUT 9 HOW THE PREVIOUS MTC ADVISORY COUNCILS HAVE HELPED SHAPE THE 10 COMMISSION IT WAS A VERY INFORMATIVE MEETING AND ENJOYED BY 11 MOST OF ALL OF OUR COUNCIL MEMBERS WHICH IS WHY I HIGHLY 12 RECOMMEND ANOTHER RETREAT WITH SIMILAR CONTENT IN 2026 WHEN WE 13 HAVE NEWLY APPOINTED COUNCIL. THE SECOND HALF OF OUR RETREAT 14 15 FOCUSED ON DISCUSSING PRIORITIES FOR OUR REGIONAL 16 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE MEASURE. THESE RECOMMENDATIONS HAVE BEEN REPORTED OUT AT PREVIOUS MEETINGS. BUT I JUST WANTED TO 17 DIVE INTO THE CONVERSATION A LITTLE DEEPER BECAUSE IT WAS A 18 VERY ROBUST CONVERSATION WITH THE COUNCIL MEMBERS THAT WERE 19 PRESENT. AND OVERALL SOME OF THE THINGS THAT WERE HIGHLIGHTED 20 21 WERE THE STRENGTH AND FLEXIBILITY, THE STRENGTH IN COLLABORATIVE EFFORTS THAT ARE GOING TO BE NEEDED TO ADDRESS 22 OUR REGIONAL TRANSIT CHALLENGES, AND THE CRITICAL ROLES THAT 23 THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CAN PLAY IN SHAPING EFFECTIVE 24 TRANSPORTATION POLICY. SO, ARE THE COUNCIL WITH 16 MEMBERS 25



- 1 PRESENT, WE HAD 11 AYES, [INDISCERNIBLE] -- ABSTAIN, AND ONE
- 2 NO VOTING IN FAVOR OF THE FOLLOWING MOTION SO THE
- 3 RECOMMENDATION FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TRANSPORTATION
- 4 REVENUE MEASURE IS AS FOLLOWS. ONE, WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE A
- 5 REGIONAL TRANSIT MEASURE THAT COVERS 27 TRANSIT AGENCIES AND
- 6 THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. TWO, WE WANT THE MEASURE TO BE
- 7 FOCUSED ON RIDER EXPERIENCE, AND THIS INCLUDES MAINTAINING AND
- 8 IMPROVING SERVICE WITH WELL COORDINATED FARES, SCHEDULES,
- 9 WAYFINDING AND OTHER ASPECTS OF THE USER EXPERIENCE PUTTING
- 10 THE RIDER EXPERIENCE FRONT AND CENTER, AND THEN HAVING A
- 11 REGIONAL MEASURE THAT IS TRANSFORMATIONAL WITH BENEFITS FOR
- 12 CURRENT AND FUTURE GENERATIONS. SO, THE REASON WHY HAVING A
- 13 REGION FALL MEASURE IS SO IMPORTANT TO US IS BECAUSE WE HAVE
- 14 THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND CONNECTED NETWORK
- 15 MANAGEMENT GOALS THAT ARE ESSENTIAL TO US AS COUNCIL AND OUR
- 16 RIDE SPERING A BIG REASON WHY WE HAVE BEEN SO LOCAL ABOUT
- 17 ENSURING THAT WE HAVE BUY-IN AND SUSPECT FROM OUR NINE BAY
- 18 AREA COUNTIES. WE ALSO HAVE MANY RESIDENTS WHO ARE TRANSIT
- 19 DEPENDENT, WHEN THAT'S DUE TO PHYSICAL DISABILITY, OR OTHER
- 20 REASONS, WHICH IS WHY THIS MEASURE MUST BE LED WITH RIDERS IN
- 21 MIND AND WHY WE HAVE TO LISTEN TO RIDERS. BECAUSE I KNOW THAT
- 22 THERE ARE MANY VOICES AT THE TABLE. WE HAVE HEARD A LOT OF
- 23 CONCERN ABOUT THE POTENTIAL OPPOSITION BUSINESSES MIGHT HAVE
- 24 IF THERE ARE REVENUE MEASURES THAT ARE LESS FAVORABLE TO THEM.
- 25 AND I'M HERE TO SAY THAT WE LISTEN TO BOTH OF THOSE VOICES.



- 1 BUSINESSES ARE IMPORTANT, RIDERS ARE IMPORTANT, AND I HOPE
- 2 THAT YOU WILL TRULY ALLOW FOR BOTH OF THESE VOICES TO
- 3 INFLUENCE YOUR DECISION-MAKING. BECAUSE ULTIMATELY, WE ARE A
- 4 SYSTEM -- A REGIONAL SYSTEM THAT IS TOO BIG TO FAIL, WHETHER
- 5 IT'S ENSURING THAT WE HAVE TRANSIT FOR RIDERS TO GET TO WORK
- 6 OR RESIDENTS AND VISITORS ALIKE FOR THE REGION AND TO PROVIDE
- 7 LOCAL DOLLARS TO OUR LOCAL ECONOMY WE NEED WORLD CLASS TRANSIT
- 8 AND SOLUTIONS TO GET US THERE. AND THE LIST IS ON YOU ALL TO
- 9 MAKE THOSE DECISIONS IN THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. I WANT TO
- 10 EMPHASIZE THAT YOU ARE ALL THE RIGHT FOLKS TO DO THIS AND LEAD
- 11 THIS WORK. MTC STAFF, AND AS ELECTED LEADERS, I KNOW THAT YOU
- 12 ARE GOING TO MAKE THE COMPROMISES THAT NEED TO BE MADE AND
- 13 FIND SOLUTIONS THAT ARE GOING TO MAKE THIS WORK. BECAUSE WE,
- 14 AS RESIDENTS, VOTERS, WE'RE COUNTING ON YOU ALL AND I HOPE
- 15 THAT OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS YOU CAN TRULY PRIORITIZE
- 16 THESE VERY IMPORTANT CONVERSATIONS REGARDING OUR TRANSIT
- 17 MEASURES TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE A POSSIBLE REGIONAL MEASURE
- 18 BEFORE THE END OF THE YEAR. BECAUSE JUST LIKE COUNCIL TERMS
- 19 ARE COMING TO AN END IN THE NEXT YEAR, I KNOW WE'RE GOING TO
- 20 HAVE A NEW COMMISSION, AS WELL. WE HAVE BEEN PUTTING IN SO
- 21 MUCH WORK, TIME, EFFORT, AND ENERGY INTO THESE CONVERSATIONS.
- 22 SO, I'M SO GRATEFUL TO YOU ALL FOR ALL OF THE WORK THAT'S BEEN
- 23 DONE AND ALL THE WORK THAT CONTINUES TO BE DONE. I'M ALWAYS
- 24 AVAILABLE FOR QUESTIONS NOW OR IN THE FUTURE. AND THANK YOU,
- 25 ALL, AGAIN, FOR THE TIME TO ADDRESS YOU ALL.



1 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH MISS 2 3 CAMPOS. ANY QUESTIONS? I DO THANK YOU FOR THE VOTE OF CONFIDENCE ACKNOWLEDGING THIS IS THE RIGHT PLATFORM TO HAVE 4 5 THESE DISCUSSIONS FOR ALL THE RIGHT REASONS. I DO NOT SEE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL REPORT? 6 7 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM THERE IS ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM WISHING TO 9 10 SPEAK HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE? 11 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: TWO MINUTES. 12 13 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: ADINA LEVIN. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. 14 15 16 ADINA LEVIN: GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN, I SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND WANTED TO STRONGLY SUPPORT 17 CHAIR CAMPOS'S REPORT FROM THE SENSE OF THE POLICY ADVISORY 18 COUNCIL AND HER ENCOURAGEMENT FOR THE LEADERS AT MTC AND OTHER 19 LEADERS TO REALLY WORK ON THE TRANSIT FUNDING SOLUTIONS FOR A 20 21 SYSTEM THAT IS REALLY TOO CRITICAL TO FAIL, AS CHAIR CAMPOS SAID. WITH MY TRANSIT ADVOCACY HAT, THROUGH TRANSIT MONTH, AND 22 MANY, MANY DIFFERENT ACTIVITIES, I HAVE BEEN, YOU KNOW, OUT ON 23 THE STREET, AND OUT IN PUBLIC SPACES TALKING TO MANY TRANSIT 24 RIDERS AND PEOPLE WHO WOULD LIKE TO BE TRANSIT RIDERS. AND THE 25



- 1 PERSPECTIVE THAT WE HEAR FROM PEOPLE ON THE STREET IS THEY,
- 2 YOU KNOW, USE AND WANT TO USE TRANSIT. THEY USE AND WANT TO
- 3 USE MULTIPLE AGENCIES TO GET TO WHERE THEY'RE GOING IN ONE
- 4 COUNTY OR ACROSS COUNTY, PEOPLE'S TRAVEL NEEDS ARE DIVERSE,
- 5 AND USE MULTIPLE PIECES OF OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM.
- 6 AND THEY WANT THIS SYSTEM TO GET BETTER AND IMPROVE, THAT IN
- 7 THE WHOLE REGULARLY SHOW. IN THE REGIONAL FUNDING DISCUSSIONS,
- 8 THE LEADERS OF DIFFERENT PARTS OF THE REGION UNDERSTANDABLY
- 9 WANT THEIR PIECE OF THE SYSTEM TO BE TREATED FAIRLY, AND,
- 10 ALSO, THE VOICE OF THE PUBLIC IS SPEAKING UP FOR THE NEED FOR
- 11 THAT GOOD RIDER EXPERIENCE, BETTER AND IMPROVED RIDER
- 12 EXPERIENCE, AND IS FOCUSING ON THE NEEDS OF THOSE RIDERS THAT
- 13 WILL HELP BRING TO US WHERE WE NEED TO GO IN A SYSTEM THAT
- 14 WILL ADDRESS OUR CLIMATE AND HOUSING AND ECONOMIC GOALS AND
- 15 THE NEEDS OF OUR POPULATION. THANK YOU.

17 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU.

19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU.

- 21 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU ADINA, THERE ARE NO OTHER
- 22 MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.
- 24 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ITEM SIX, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S
- 25 REPORT. MR. FREMIER, TAKE IT AWAY.

16

18

20



1	
2	ANDREW FREMIER: GOOD MORNING CHAIR PEDROZA AND MEMBERS OF THE
3	COMMISSION. WELCOME BACK FROM SUMMER RECESS IT SEEMS LIKE WE
4	WERE HARDLY GONE LONG SINCE WE HAVE BEEN PUTTING SO MUCH
5	EFFORT INTO THE TRANSPORTATION SELECT COMMITTEE WORK AND OF
6	COURSE PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. I WANT TO OPEN MY EXECUTIVE
7	DIRECTOR'S REPORT TO TALK ABOUT THE DEVELOPMENT OF MY
8	EXECUTIVE TEAM AS PART OF THE AGENCY'S REORGANIZATION. WE WENT
9	THROUGH RIGOROUS PROCESS OVER THE SUMMER AND I HAVE CONFIDENCE
10	THAT THE TECHNICAL SKILLS OF THE SELECTED THREE ARE WELL-
11	SERVED AND WELL-QUALIFIED CANDIDATES. BUT I HAD THE ULTIMATE
12	DECISION TO MEDICATE SELECTIONS SO I TAKE RESPONSIBILITY FOR
13	WHATEVER CONCERNS ARE GENERATED. I'M AWARE THAT WHILE OUR
14	ORGANIZATION AS A WHOLE IS BROADLY REPRESENTATIVE WITH THESE
15	SELECTIONS WITH THE REGION OUR EXECUTIVE STAFF DOESN'T REFLECT
16	THAT DEMOGRAPHIC MAKE UP. I WANT TO SPEND A FEW MINUTES TO
17	OUTLINE WHAT OUR COMMITMENT TO THE COMMISSION THE ASSOCIATION
18	OF BAY AREA GOVERNMENTS IS AND MORE IMPORTANTLY THE RESIDENTS
19	OF THE BAY AREA FOR ADDRESSING THAT CONCERN. THE TEAM IS
20	ALREADY ENGAGED WITH AN OUTSIDE ORGANIZATION SPECIALIZING IN
21	CULTURAL AWARENESS AND EXECUTIVE COACHING TO HELP US DEVELOP A
22	SPECIFIC ROADMAP TO ENSURE WE RECEIVE CRITICAL INPUT FROM A
23	DIVERSE PERSPECTIVE PRIMARILY AFFECTING OUR RESIDENTS IN
24	COMMUNITIES OF CONCERN. I HAVE, ALSO, PERSONALLY STARTED TO
25	REACH OUT TO THE COMMUNITY TO GET ADVICE AND COUNSEL HOW BEST



- 1 TO INCORPORATE THAT ADVICE GOING FORWARD. THE GOAL IS TO SEE
- 2 IF THERE ARE SPECIFIC ADJUSTMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ON HOW
- 3 BEST TO INCORPORATE A BROAD PERSPECTIVE INTO OUR
- 4 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE BOARD BOTH IN POLICY AND OPERATIONS.
- 5 I'M ALSO SCHEDULED TO SIT DOWN WITH LEADERSHIP IN EARLY
- 6 OCTOBER TO SEE IF OUR APPROACH IS SHOWING PROGRESS AND
- 7 ADDRESSING DIRECTLY THE CONCERNS GENERATED. I WOULD ALSO LIKE
- 8 TO SPEND A MINUTE ON SOME OF THE POSITIVE ASPECTS OF THE WORK
- 9 IN THIS SPACE THAT THE AGENCY DOES. I ROUTINE HE PRESENT A
- 10 LIST OF PROMOTIONS AND HIRING THROUGHOUT THE AGENCY, THE NAMES
- 11 MOVING FORWARD DO REPRESENT A BROAD SPECTRUM OF THE REGION'S
- 12 ETHNIC AND GENDER MAKE UP TRUE BOTH AT STAFF LEVEL AND
- 13 MANAGEMENT LEVEL FROM PRINCIPLE THROUGH DIRECTOR THESE ARE THE
- 14 PEOPLE THAT DO THE CRITICAL WORK THAT DEVELOPS OUR
- 15 RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE BOARDS. WE WORK HARD AT MENTORING AND
- 16 DEVELOPING CANDIDATES AT ALL LEVELS OF THE ORGANIZATION AND
- 17 FOR THE REGION AND WE WILL CONTINUE TO IMPROVE ON TECHNIQUES
- 18 DESIGNED TO ELEVATE TO POSITIONS OF EXECUTIVE LEADERSHIP. OUR
- 19 OPERATIONAL PROGRAMS ARE NATIONAL LEADERS IN MEANS BASED
- 20 PROGRAMS AND WE HAVE A ROBUST SMALL BUSINESS PROGRAM FOR BOTH
- 21 CONTRACTS AND PROFESSIONAL SERVICES. I GIVE YOU ALL MY
- 22 COMMITMENT TO CONTINUE TO LEARN AND TO ENSURE THIS
- 23 ORGANIZATION CONTINUES TO PRESENT GOOD POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
- 24 LIKE WE HAVE DONE IN THE HOUSING ELEMENTS FOR ABAG, THE
- 25 BUSINESS AND EQUITY PLANS IN THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE



- 1 AUTHORITY AND OF COURSE THE GUIDING PRINCIPLES OF PLANNED BAY
- 2 AREA. I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE TO A WHOLE BUNCH OF ITEMS IN MY
- 3 EXECUTIVE REPORT THAT REALLY ARE THE BUSINESS OF THE AGENCY.
- 4 THROUGHOUT THE SUMMER MTC AND ABAG STAFF HAVE CONDUCTED PUBLIC
- 5 ENGAGEMENT TO SEEK FEEDBACK ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 AND
- 6 TRANSIT 2050+ DRAFT NETWORK. IN 40 LOCATIONS ACROSS ALL NINE
- 7 BAY AREA COUNTIES, INCLUDING TRANSIT CENTERS, FARMERS MARKETS
- 8 AND COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATIONS. WE'RE TAKING ALL OF THAT
- 9 INPUT SERIOUSLY AND WILL REPORT BACK OVER THE COURSE OF THE
- 10 YEAR ON THE PROGRESS TO DELIVER THE PLAN ON TIME AND MEET ITS
- 11 ENVIRONMENTAL REQUIREMENTS. I ALSO WANTED TO MENTION THAT MTC
- 12 RECEIVED \$535 MILLION AS A FIRST INSTALLMENT OF THE \$1.1
- 13 BILLION IN SENATE BILL 125. WE ACTUALLY RECEIVED A CHECK FOR
- 14 \$535 MILLION. IT'S IN THE BANK AND DEREK IS MAKING IT GO TO
- 15 WORK BECAUSE PART OF OUR PLAN WAS TO GENERATE INTEREST ON THAT
- 16 MONEY SO WE COULD MOVE IT AND USE IT AS MUCH AS POSSIBLE. I
- 17 HAVE ALSO ATTACHED A LETTER THAT THE BIG FOUR METROPOLITAN
- 18 PLANNING ORGANIZATIONS HAVE SENT TO CARB. IT'S IN YOUR PACKET.
- 19 WE DO REALLY RESPECT THAT THERE ARE SIGNIFICANT IMPROVEMENTS
- 20 THAT CAN BE MADE TO SENATE BILL 375 WHILE ITS DONE EXCEPTIONAL
- 21 WORK MOVING THE REGION'S ACROSS THE STATE FORWARD WE DO THINK
- 22 IT'S TIME FOR ADDITIONAL WORK BECAUSE AS YOU KNOW OUR PLANS
- 23 BECOME MORE CHALLENGING AS WE MOVE FORWARD AND WE STILL HAVE
- 24 AN EXTREMELY STRONG COMMITMENT TOWARDS OUR LIMELIGHT GOALS AND
- 25 CONTINUE TO LOOK FOR NEW TOOLS DO SO. I WANT TO MENTION GOOD



- 1 NEWS AROUND THE MEGA AWARDS, WHICH IS SOME OF THE FEDERAL
- 2 MONEY COMING FROM THE BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE GRANTS, CONTRA
- 3 COSTA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITIES INNOVATE 680 PROJECT WHICH WE
- 4 HAVE BEEN A GREAT PARTNER WITH CONTRA COSTA ON SECURED \$166
- 5 MILLION FROM THE U.S. DEPARTMENT EVER TRANSPORTATION'S LARGE
- 6 MEGA GRANT PROGRAM WE EXPECT TO HEAR SOME MORE NEWS ABOUT
- 7 OTHER POTENTIAL PROJECTS IN THE COMING WEEKS. I ALSO WANT TO
- 8 MENTION SOME OF THE SUCCESS WE HAVE HAD IN THE HOUSING
- 9 ENVIRONMENT. INCLUDED IN MY EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT IS AN
- 10 IMPORTANT MILESTONE FOR BAHFA. EARLIER THIS WEEK BAHFA CLOSED
- 11 ITS FIRST PRIORITY SITES PREDEVELOPMENT LOAN TO SUPPORT
- 12 CONSTRUCTION OF 97 AFFORDABLE HOMES FOR SENIORS AT THE LAKE
- 13 MERRITT BART STATION, VERY CLOSE TO THE HOME OF OUR OLD
- 14 OFFICES. THIS PROJECT IS PART OF A LARGER MASTER PLAN REDESIGN
- 15 OF THE BART PLAZA THAT WILL EVENTUAL BRING 460 NEW HOMES TO
- 16 THAT STATION AREA. THE PRIORITY SITES PROGRAM INCLUDES \$28
- 17 MILLION IN REAP 2.0 FUNDS THAT THE BAHFA BOARD AWARDED TO TEN
- 18 TRANSFORMATIVE PROJECTS AROUND THE REGION. COLLECTIVELY, THESE
- 19 PROJECTS WILL RESULT IN OVER A THOUSAND NEW UNITS OF
- 20 AFFORDABLE HOUSING. STAFF ARE BUSY COMPLETING DUE DILIGENCE
- 21 AND NEGOTIATING TERMS WITH THE DEVELOPMENT TEAM TO ENSURE THE
- 22 NINE PROJECTS CLOSE SUCCESSFULLY. ADDITIONALLY TODAY, THE
- 23 COMMISSION WILL VOTE WHETHER TO ENDORSE PROPOSITION FIVE WHICH
- 24 IS A STATEWIDE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT TO SET THE VOTER
- 25 THRESHOLD FOR HOUSING AND INFRASTRUCTURE BONDS AT 55%. LAST



1	MONTH HOUSING ADVOCATES REQUESTED THAT BAHFA BOARD MEMBERS
2	REMOVE REGIONAL MEASURE FOUR FROM THE BALLOT SO THEY COULD
3	FOCUS ON PROPOSITION FIVE. TODAY IS OPPORTUNITY FOR THE
4	COMMISSION TO LEND SUPPORT TO THOSE EFFORTS. IF PROPOSITION
5	FIVE IS SUCCESSFUL IT WILL INCREASE VIABILITY OF A REGIONAL
6	HOUSING MEASURE. IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS FOR BAHFA THE CHAIR
7	WILL PROVIDE MORE EXTENSIVE UPDATE AT THE BAHFA BOARD MEETING
8	IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING THE COMMISSION BUT WE ARE ABSOLUTELY
9	COMMITTED TO CONTINUING TO ADVANCE THE PROGRESS WHILE WE
10	FIGURE OUT WHAT NEXT STEPS ARE IN BAHFA AS WE USE THE TOOLS WE
11	HAVE AVAILABLE IN THAT SPACE. LAST THING I WOULD LIKE TO
12	MENTION IS THE RECOGNITION OF THE FOURTH ANNUAL NORMAL MINETA
13	BAY AREA SUMMER ACADEMY WHICH IS PAID WORK EXPERIENCE
14	SPONSORED BY MTC, ABAG, BCDC, AND THE AIR DISTRICT ALL MEMBERS
15	LIVING TOGETHER IN THIS BUILDING. 200 PARTICIPANTS FROM HIGH
16	SCHOOLS ALL ACROSS THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES WERE INTRODUCED
17	TO PUBLIC SECTOR AND LEARNED HOW REGIONAL AGENCIES WORK ACROSS
18	JURISDICTIONS ON CHALLENGING ISSUES LIKE ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE
19	HOUSING TRANSPORTATION EQUITY COMMUNITY HEALTH AND SOCIAL
20	JUSTICE. I ALSO WANT TO MENTION WE FINISHED THE ROOM NEXT DOOR
21	CONFERENCE ROOM ON TIME ON BUDGET AND IT'S NOW AVAILABLE FOR
22	USE BY THE PUBLIC FOR ALL OF OUR SERVICES. THANK YOU.
23	

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I WANT TO SAY I DO NOT THINK WE WENT

DARK THIS YEAR BECAUSE WE HAD MEETINGS THROUGHOUT THE YEAR.

24



- 1 MERIT WITH THAT PROJECT I THINK PART OF THE STORY TELLING IS
- 2 VISUALIZING AND I THINK SOME TYPE OF STORY TELLING VIDEO WOULD
- 3 BE APPROPRIATE AS WE EMBARK ON NEXT STEPS. I SOMETIMES HEAR
- 4 ABOUT, WELL, EVERYONE HAS TO DO THEIR PART BUT HOW DO WE DO IT
- 5 REGIONALLY AND THAT'S AN IMPORTANT STORY TO TELL. AT THIS
- 6 POINT IF THERE IS PUBLIC COMMENT, THEN WE'LL GO TO OUR
- 7 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT.

8

- 9 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
- 10 RECEIVED, AND THERE ARE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM
- 11 WISHING TO SPEAK. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

12

13 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: TWO MINUTES.

14

- 15 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CINDY WU, FOLLOWED BY DOUG SHOW MAKER,
- 16 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. IT WILL BE UP ON THE SCREEN. HIT THE --
- 17 PUSH THE BUTTON.

- 19 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. HI EVERYONE. I'M CINDY WU. I'M HERE AS AN
- 20 INDIVIDUAL, BUT TO SPEAK TO MY EXPERIENCE I'M CURRENTLY
- 21 BUILDING A NATIONAL ASIAN AMERICAN, NATIVE HAWAIIAN, PACIFIC
- 22 ISLANDER SERVING CDFI. I MOST RECENTLY WAS THE EXECUTIVE
- 23 DIRECTOR OF LISC BAY AREA AND WORKED FOR OVER A DECADE NOT TOO
- 24 FAR FROM HERE AT CHINATOWN CDC IN SAN FRANCISCO'S CHINATOWN.
- 25 THE EP, TODAY, REFERRED TO A RECENT EMPLOYMENT SEARCHES THAT



- 1 WERE COMPLETED. I UNDERSTAND IT WAS A NATIONAL SEARCH WITH THE
- 2 SUPPORT OF THIRD-PARTY RECRUITER, AND THAT DIVERSITY WAS ONE
- 3 OF THE PILLARS OF THE RECRUITMENT AND THAT THERE WERE WELL-
- 4 OUALIFIED CANDIDATES OF COLOR. BUT THE END RESULT IS THERE IS
- 5 LEADERSHIP TEAM THAT IS NINE PEOPLE, FAIRLY HOMOGENOUS AND THE
- 6 FOLKS ARE ALL WHITE. THIS REGION IS A MAJORITY OF PEOPLE OF
- 7 COLOR. THE DEPENDENT TRANSIT RIDERS ARE PEOPLE OF COLOR, MOST
- 8 PEOPLE APPLYING FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING, THOSE EXPERIENCING
- 9 HOMELESSNESS, MOSTLY PEOPLE OF COLOR. THE COMPOSITION OF THE
- 10 LEADERSHIP TEAM NEEDS TO BE ABLE TO REPRESENT IN LIVED
- 11 EXPERIENCE, IN UNDERSTANDING, AND I THINK THAT THE RESULTS OF
- 12 THESE SEARCHES REVEALS EITHER EXPLICIT OR IMPLICIT BIAS IN THE
- 13 PROCESS. SO, MY ASK TO YOU IS THAT YOU OVERSEE WHAT THE
- 14 STRUCTURE IS OF DECISION-MAKING THAT YOU THINK ABOUT WHAT THE
- 15 PROCESSES ARE THAT COULD LEAD TO A LEADERSHIP TEAM THAT
- 16 DOESN'T SEEM TO BE REPRESENTATIVE. TO DEVELOP CRITERIA TO
- 17 UNDERSTAND THAT BIAS IS BEING COMBATTED. THE BUSINESS OF THIS
- 18 AGENCY IS TO SERVE THE RESIDENTS OF THE BAY AREA, TO
- 19 REPRESENT, UNDERSTAND, AND MAKE DECISIONS THAT INCORPORATE
- 20 THEIR DIVERSITY, RACE, CLASS, GEOGRAPHY, LIVED EXPERIENCE, AND
- 21 UNDERSTANDING OF PRIVILEGE. THANK YOU.
- 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU.
- 25 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: DOUG SCHUMACHER. KATE WHITE?

22



1	
2	SPEAKER: HELLO COMMISSIONERS. KATE WHITE. I'M HERE AS AN
3	INDIVIDUAL TODAY, NOT REPRESENTING ANY ORGANIZATION, JUST AS A
4	BAY AREA SAN FRANCISCO RESIDENT FOR ALMOST 30 YEAR YEARS. AND
5	I APPRECIATE THE DIRECTOR'S REPORT ON THE MTC EXECUTIVE TEAM
6	HIRING PROCESS, AND THE FACT, AS CINDY SAID, THERE WAS AN
7	OUTSIDE RECRUITER HIRING SEARCH FIRM WITH DIVERSITY BEING THE
8	PILLAR OF THE SEARCH. HOWEVER, AS SHE NOTED, WE ARE NOW AT A
9	POINT WITH A NINE-PERSON, ALL WHITE EXECUTIVE TEAM AT MTC. AND
10	MEANWHILE, THE BAY AREA IS MAJORITY, PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND THE
11	MOST DEPENDENT TRANSIT RIDERS, THOSE FACING HOUSING INSECURITY
12	AT MUCH HIGHER NUMBERS ARE PEOPLE OF COLOR. AND, SO, WE'RE
13	FACING SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGES IN THE BAY AREA, ALSO TREMENDOUS
14	OPPORTUNITIES THAT YOU HAVE DISCUSSED THIS MORNING ALREADY
15	COMING UP, AND I AM VERY CONCERNED ABOUT OUR COLLECTIVE
16	SUCCESS AND FUTURE OF OUR REGION WHEN THE LEADERSHIP TEAM IS
17	NOT REPRESENTATIVE, NATURALLY BRINGING BIASES. AND MY ASK IS
18	TO REALLY TAKE A HARD LOOK AT REEXAMINING THE HIRING PROCESS
19	AND LOOK AT HOW WE ARE SHUTTING THE DOOR TO PEOPLE OF COLOR
20	CANDIDATES, I KNOW WELL QUALIFIED CANDIDATES OF COLOR THAT
21	WERE APPLIED FOR SOME OF THESE EXECUTIVE POSITIONS. AND IT
22	NEEDS TO BE EXECUTIVE, NOT JUST THROUGHOUT THE ORGANIZATION.
23	THANK YOU.
24	

25 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH.



1 2 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC 3 WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM IN THE BOARDROOM OR ON ZOOM. 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND TO THOSE WHO SPOKE, I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR COMING UP AND SHARING YOUR 6 CONCERNS AND THOUGHTS WITH US. AND I WILL SAY, IT IS A 7 8 DECISION THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR MADE. HE ALSO KEPT ME APPRISED THROUGHOUT THE PROCESS AND WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE GOOD 9 10 PROCESSES IN PLACE AND I WANT TO WORK WITH YOU, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO UNDERSTAND THE PROCESS AND UPDATE THE ENTIRE 11 COMMISSION. ANY TIME WE CAN DO BETTER THIS REGION DESERVES 12 THAT WE ALSO NEED TO BE OPEN IN AREAS OF IMPROVEMENT AND DO IT 13 TRANSPARENTLY WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE REPRESENT THIS REGION 14 15 AND CONTINUE TO ACHIEVE THE OUTCOMES THAT THE PEOPLE DEPEND ON 16 US AND I APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION. APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS. WE'LL FOLLOW UP AND REPORT-OUT ON THE PROCESS WHERE WE CAN 17 IMPROVE ON THOSE OPPORTUNITIES. HAPPY TO PROVIDE ANY 18 OPPORTUNITIES. COMMISSIONER CHAFF? 19 20 CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA, AND DIRECTOR FREMIER 21 AND I HAVE HAD THIS CONVERSATION ALREADY. SO, I'M NOT GOING TO 22 SAY ANYTHING PUBLICLY I HAVEN'T SAID TO HIM PRIVATELY ALREADY. 23 I RECOGNIZE THAT BEING AN EXECUTIVE AND MAKING THESE DECISIONS 24 IS VERY DIFFICULT. AND THAT THAT DECISION HAS BEEN MADE. WE 25



1	ARE MOVING FORWARD. BUT THIS CONCERN IS SOMETHING I HAVE BEEN
2	HEARING IN A WAY I HAVE NEVER HEARD ABOUT MTC BEFORE IN MY
3	LONG SERVICE ON THIS COMMISSION. AND I THINK IT IS A SYMPTOM
4	OF A LARGER CONCERN ABOUT THE OVERALL DIRECTION AND COMMITMENT
5	OF THE ORGANIZATION. SO, I HOPE THAT WE DON'T JUST LOOK AT
6	THIS HIRING DECISION, WHICH IS ACTUALLY BEHIND US, AND THAT WE
7	LOOK FORWARD TO THE OPPORTUNITIES TO REALLY HEAR AND NOT JUST
8	PLAY LIP SERVICE TO THE REAL CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED
9	TODAY, BUT THAT I AM HEARING NOT INSIDE THESE CHAMBERS OUT IN
10	THE COMMUNITY. AND THAT REQUIRES HUMILITY. IT REQUIRES
11	CURIOSITY. IT REQUIRES CONSTANT REMINDERS OF OUR PRIVILEGE.
12	AND I HOPE THAT WE DON'T JUST MOVE FORWARD WITHOUT REALLY
13	AGGRESSIVELY LOOKING FOR WAYS, WRIT LARGE, TO ADDRESS THE
14	VERY, VERY LEGITIMATE CONCERNS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED HERE
15	TODAY. BECAUSE IT'S GOT JUST ABOUT ONE HIRING PROCESS, IT'S
16	ABOUT AN ORGANIZATION THAT IS BEING SEEN AS INSULAR, THAT IS
17	BEING SEEN AS DISCONNECTED FROM THE COMMUNITY, THAT IT IS
18	TASKED WITH SERVING, AND IS BEING SEEN AS NOT COMMITTED TO
19	EQUITY. AND THOSE ARE REAL CONCERNS THAT I BELIEVE WE HAVE
20	MANY OPPORTUNITIES TO ADDRESS GOING FORWARD. THANK YOU.
21	
22	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

23

24

AHN?



EDDIE AHN: I SECOND COMMISSIONER SCHAFF'S COMMENTS AND 1 APPRECIATE THE NUANCE IN IT. I WANT TO THANK THE PUBLIC 2 3 COMMENTERS TODAY FOR THEIR EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS AND EVEN COMMENTING ON THIS. SOMETHING I INTEND TO FOLLOW UP 4 5 OFFLINE LIKE THIS COMMISSION TO CONSIDER IN PUBLIC IN THE 6 FUTURE TOO. 7 8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ABSOLUTELY. COMMISSIONER GLOVER? 9 FEDERAL GLOVER: I CERTAINLY WANT TO THANK THE SPEAKERS THAT 10 CAME FORWARD AND COMMISSIONER SCHAFF, AND HER PERSPECTIVE, 11 BECAUSE THIS IS SOMETHING THAT WE CONTINUE NOT TO WORK AT AS 12 HARD AS WE CAN. WE HAVE OPPORTUNITIES TO REALLY DO A GREATER 13 JOB AND MAKING SURE THAT THE DIVERSITY OF THIS STAFF LOOKS 14 15 LIKE THE COMMUNITY IN WHICH WE REPRESENT. AND WE'RE MISSING 16 THE MARK. SO, I HOPE THAT THIS IS NOT JUST SOMETHING THAT'S GOING TO FALL ON DEAF EARS, BUT THAT WE START TO WORK TO MAKE 17 SURE THAT WE ARE DEALING WITH EQUITY AND DIVERSITY ISSUES IN 18 TERMS OF REPRESENTATION ON THE STAFF, AS WELL AS THE 19 20 COMMISSION. 21 22 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER. I DO 23 NOT SEE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FREMIER, YOU HAVE HEARD FROM THE COMMISSION. THIS IS SOMETHING 24 WE'RE NOT JUST GOING TO REACT BECAUSE WE HEARD PUBLIC COMMENT. 25



THESE HAVE TO BE THE CONSTITUTIONAL VALUES OF THIS 1 2 ORGANIZATION AND WHAT COMMISSIONER SCHAFF WAS APPROPRIATE, THE 3 DISCONNECT IN THE AGENCY SOMETHING WE HAVE ON TAKE SERIOUSLY, ACHIEVING OUTCOMES WE HAVE TO WORK WITH THE COMMUNITY, AND WE 4 5 HAVEN'T EARNED THE TRUST OF THE COMMUNITY. I KNOW IN CONVERSING WITH YOU THAT YOU HAVE THOSE VALUES BUT I THINK 6 7 IT'S APPROPRIATE TO HAVE THAT DISCUSSION AND DO IT IN PUBLIC. 8 ANDREW FREMIER: ADD I ABSOLUTELY APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS AND 9 THAT'S PART OF THE CURIOSITY I WANT TO EVALUATE THAT AND I 10 GAVE YOU MY COMMITMENT AND I MEAN IT. I'M SERIOUS ABOUT IT. 11 12 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. IN THE SPIRIT OF MOVING 13 FORWARD WE'RE GOING MOVE TO OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. DO WE HAVE A 14 15 FEW ITEMS ON CONSENT. 16 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AGENDA ITEM SEVEN. 17 18 19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER COMMENTS ON AGENDA ITEM SEVEN? YOU ABSOLUTELY ARE ALWAYS WELCOME TO COMMENT 20 21 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. LET ME OPEN IT UP OFFICIAL E ITEM SEVEN 22 IS COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. DO WE HAVE ANY? 23 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: I DO WANT TO ALSO THANK COMMISSIONER

SPERING FOR THE WORK THAT IS TAKING PLACE WITHIN THE REGION

24



- 1 AND TRYING TO GET TO SOME CONSENSUS ON HOW WE MOVE FORWARD
- 2 WITH THE MEASURE. I WOULD SAY, THOUGH, THAT I WANT TO BE VERY
- 3 CLEAR THAT I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE DO NOT MINIMIZE THE
- 4 ENGAGEMENT THAT NEEDS TO TAKE PLACE WITH OUR SMALL OPERATORS.
- 5 AND I HOPE THAT THIS IS NOT GOING TO BE SOMETHING THAT IS
- 6 GOING TO BE A PART OF A DIALOGUE THAT TAKES PLACE IN A SMALL
- 7 WAY, BUT THAT THAT CONSIDERATION IS BROAD AND OPEN FOR MAJOR
- 8 DISCUSSION AS WE GO FORWARD. BECAUSE IT'S SO IMPORTANT TO A
- 9 LOT OF COMMUNITIES, ESPECIALLY IN CONTRA COSTA COUNTY.

11 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER

12 GLOVER. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

14 CINDY CHAVEZ: I DO -- IN THE SPIRIT OF THE DISCUSSION THAT WAS

- 15 JUST HAD, YOU KNOW, ONE THING THAT -- THAT I THINK WE HAVE TO
- 16 BE THINKING ABOUT IS HOW WE'RE NOT JUST ADDRESSING STAFFING,
- 17 BUT I JUST WANT TO REINFORCE LOOKING AT HOW WE'RE ADDRESSING
- 18 CONTRACTING. AND I KNOW WE HAVE RAISED IT A COUPLE OF TIMES.
- 19 AND I JUST -- AND I APOLOGIZE, COLLEAGUES, THAT I CAN'T RECALL
- 20 THE LAST TIME THAT WE HAD A PRESENTATION ON HOW WE'RE
- 21 APPROACHING, REALLY MAKING SURE THAT THE COMMUNITY IS
- 22 BENEFITTING FROM INVESTMENTS THAT WE'RE MAKING AS A REGION. I
- 23 KNOW THIS IS A STRUGGLE AT EVERY SINGLE LEVEL OF GOVERNMENT.
- 24 WE'RE HAVING THIS STRUGGLE AT VTA AND ALSO HAVING THIS
- 25 STRUGGLE AT THE COUNTY OF SANTA CLARA REALLY TRYING TO RETHINK

10



- 1 AND UNDERSTAND BETTER HOW OUR PROCUREMENT PROCESS CAN BE
- 2 ADDITIVE AND MORE INCLUSIVE. AND, FRANKLY, USING THE -- SOME
- 3 OF THE FEDERAL GUIDELINES IS REALLY SUCH A FLOOR -- I MEAN,
- 4 IT'S NOT EVEN REALLY A FLOOR. WE'RE ALL TREATING THEM LIKE
- 5 CEILINGS, BUT THEY'RE REALLY -- THEY'RE TOO LOW FOR US TO EVEN
- 6 CONSIDER THOSE AS ACCOMPLISHMENTS. SO, ANYWAY, I WANTED TO
- 7 MENTION THAT. AND THE SECOND THING I WANTED TO SAY, I WANT TO
- 8 THANK MY COLLEAGUES. AS MANY OF YOU KNOW, THERE WAS A -- A VTA
- 9 EMPLOYEE WHO WAS KILLED LAST FRIDAY NIGHT BY ANOTHER VTA
- 10 EMPLOYEE, AND I JUST WANT TO SAY HOW MUCH I APPRECIATED ALL OF
- 11 THE SUPPORT THAT WE GOTTEN FROM ALL OF YOUR AGENCIES, AND THAT
- 12 THE SENIOR STAFF AND LINE STAFF, WHEN GETTING CALLS, REPORT
- 13 THEM OUT IN A REALLY POSITIVE WAY. I GOT A CALL FROM
- 14 [INDISCERNIBLE] TO SEE IF HE COULD HELP, FROM DIFFERENT
- 15 AGENCIES. THIS'S IMPORTANT. KEEP VTA IN YOUR THOUGHTS AND
- 16 PRAYERS, BECAUSE THIS IS TRAGIC IN AND OF ITSELF. BUT BECAUSE
- 17 WE DID HAVE A BIGGER TRAGEDY, YOU KNOW, OF EVEN MORE LOSS OF
- 18 LIFE, THAT THE WAY IT'S IMPACTING VTA IS PRETTY DRAMATIC.
- 19 BECAUSE WE HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE SUFFERING FROM ALMOST
- 20 A POST-TRAUMATIC STRESS EXPERIENCE. SO, ANYWAYS, AS LONG AS
- 21 YOU'RE REMEMBERING TO JUST CHECK IN WITH YOUR FELLOW LEADERS
- 22 AT VTA, WOULD BE REALLY APPRECIATED IT. THANK YOU FOR THE WAY
- 23 YOU HAVE ALREADY REACHED OUT. THANK YOU.



1	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. ANY
2	FURTHER COMMENTS? NOT SEEING ANY. PROCEEDING TO OUR CONSENT
3	CALENDAR.
4	
5	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
6	RECEIVED ON THAT ITEM NO ONES IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING
7	TO SPEAK.
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I'M GOING SLOW DOWN, MARTHA. ALL
10	RIGHT. ITEM EIGHT THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL LOOK FOR A
11	MOTION.
12	
13	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: MOTION.
14	
15	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: SECOND.
16	
17	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY GLOVER, SECOND BY DUTRA-
18	VERNACI. ROLL CALL VOTE.
19	
20	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR PEDROZA?
21	
22	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
23	
24	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? VICE CHAIR
25	JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. COMMISSION ARE ABE-KOGA?



MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER AHN?
EDDIE AHN: AYE.
CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
DAVID CANEPA: AYE.
CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?
CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?
CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
CLEDY MADEUR CITIED, COMMISSIONED FLEMINGS
CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
VICTORIA ELEMINO. AVE
VICTORIA FLEMING: AYE.
CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
CLEAR, FRANCIA CILVER. TIMME 100. COMMISSIONER GLOVER.



1	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT.
4	COMMISSIONER MILEY? MILEY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-
5	PETERS?
6	
7	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK?
10	COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
11	
12	GINA PAPAN: YES.
13	
14	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?
15	
16	DAVID RABBITT: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RONEN? COMMISSIONER RONEN
19	IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER NOPE. COMMISSIONER SPERING?
20	
21	JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER THAO? IS ABSENT. MOTION
24	PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.



CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE GOING TO 1 PROCEED TO OUR COMMITTEE REPORTS. FIRST UP IS THE PROGRAMMING 2 3 AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. CHAIRED BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. 4 5 CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MET ON JULY -- YEAH, JULY 10TH. GOSH 6 THAT SEEMS LIKE JUST YESTERDAY AND REFERRED EIGHT ITEMS TO THE 7 8 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL OF WHICH FIVE ARE ON TODAY'S CONSENT CALENDAR CONSENT CALENDAR. IF WE CAN MOVE TO 9A MISS 9 RESOLUTIONS 4614 REVISED, 4586 REVISED AND 4595 REVISED 10 ALLOCATES \$85 MILLION OF THE REGIONAL THREE CAPITAL FUNDS TO 11 WATER EMERGENCY TREATMENT -- I MEAN TO WATER, TO WETA AND TO 12 CCTA AND TO SGA. I DON'T KNOW IF STAFF WANTS TO PRESENT ON 13 14 THAT BEFORE I MAKE A MOTION? 15 16 SPEAKER: NO PRESENTATION ON THIS ITEM. 17 CINDY CHAVEZ: I MOVE APPROVAL, COLLEAGUES. 18 19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. 20 21 22 GINA PAPAN: PAPAN SECONDS. 23 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: SECOND BY PAPAN. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC 24

25

COMMENT?



1	
2	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
3	RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM, AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
4	ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.
5	
6	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY CHAVEZ AND SECOND BY PAPAN.
7	ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR PEDROZA?
10	
11	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. ABE-
14	KOGA?
15	
16	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AHN?
19	
20	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
21	
22	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CANEPA?
23	
24	DAVID CANEPA: AYE.
25	



1	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAVEZ?
2	
3	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
4	
5	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: DUTRA-VERNACI?
6	
7	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YES.
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: FLEMING?
10	
11	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: GLOVER? STEPPED AWAY. COMMISSIONER MAHAN
14	IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-
15	PETERS?
16	
17	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK?
20	COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
21	
22	GINA PAPAN: YES.
23	
24	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?
25	



DAVID RABBITT: AYE. 1 2 3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SPERING? 4 5 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 6 7 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: IT PASSES WITH 12 -- COMMISSIONER GLOVER 9 STEPPED AWAY, SO WON'T BE COUNTED. 10 CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM 9B, 11 AND THIS IS MTC RESOLUTIONS 4663 AND 4664. IT RECOMMENDS 12 ENDORSEMENT AND NOMINATIONS FOR 2024 STATE FUNDING 13 14 OPPORTUNITIES TRANSIT AND INNER CITY RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM, 15 TIRCP, SOLUTIONS FOR CONGESTED CORRIDORS, SEC AND TRADE 16 OUARTER ENHANCEMENTS TCEP SUMMARY SHEET AND UPDATE ON RECOMMENDED COMMISSION ENDORSEMENTS REGIONAL APPLICATIONS TO 17 THE STATE NOMINATIONS FOR SEC, AND TCEP FUNDING PROGRAMS. THE 18 COMMITTEE DIRECTED STAFF TO CONTACT THE CITY OF HEALDSBURG 19 ABOUT UTILIZING MTC'S TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICIES 20 21 PROGRAM, THIS IS TSC POLICY EVEN THOUGH IT'S NOT REQUIRED AS A CONDITION WAS THE ENDORSEMENT STAFF CAN NOT HEAR BACK FROM THE 22 CITY WHEN THE MATERIALS WERE POSTED BUT DID MEET WITH THE CITY 23 EARLY THIS WEEK VOLUNTARY MEASURE HEALDSBURG STAFF HAVE 24

SUBMITTED A LETTER ACKNOWLEDGING THAT THEY WILL BE SUBJECT



TOTS TOC POLICY IN THE FUTURE THIS WILL INCLUDE 26 COMPLIANCE 1 DEADLINE FOR HEALDSBURG SMART STATION PENDING ADDITION OF 2 3 SMART TO HEALDSBURG PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 STAFF WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE NEW INFORMATION SINCE THE PACKET IS 4 5 POSTING AND IS AVAILABLE. 6 KENNETH KAO: KENNETH KAO MTC FUNDING POLICY PROGRAM STAFF 7 8 WANTED TO PROVIDE UPDATES SINCE OUR COMMITTEE MET TWO WEEKS AGO FIRST I WANT TO RECOGNIZE THE COMMENTS ABOUT HEALDSBURG 9 COLLECTING YOU TO THE LETTER WE RECEIVED ON THAT WANTED TO 10 GIVE UPDATES ON THE TWO PROJECTS REQUIRING ADDITIONAL 11 CONSIDERATION IN THE SENATE BILL ONE SOLUTIONS FOR CONGESTED 12 CORRIDORS PROGRAM. PENINSULA CALTRAIN SEPARATION PROJECT WE 13 REFERRED WORK FROM VTA THAT THEY WOULD LIKE TO PROCEED WITH 14 15 THE MOUNTAIN VIEW RANGE SEPARATION STAFF IS RECOMMENDING 16 ADDING THAT PROJECT TO SECOND PROJECT THE BROADWAY SEPARATION BURLINGAME THAT ONE HAS COST PRESSURES WE'LL BE WORKING WITH 17 18 SAN MATEO TO CONTINUE TO FIND OPPORTUNITIES THERE. VTA STAFF REQUESTED EARLIER THIS WEEK THAT MTC CONSIDER ADDING THE BART 19 TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO EXTENSION TO OUR LIST STAFF WILL 20 21 BE EXAMINING THE REQUEST AND WILL RETURN TO THE PROGRAMMING 22 AND ALLOCATIONS NEXT MONTH TO BRING THAT FOR CONSIDERATION WE'LL BE REOUESTING VTA STAFF PRESENCE AT THE OCTOBER 23 PROGRAMMING COMMITTEE TO PROVIDE UPDATE AND ANSWER QUESTIONS 24

YOU MAY HAVE. FINALLY WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE EXECUTIVE



7

9

11

### **SEPTEMBER 25, 2024**

- 1 DIRECTOR'S COMMENTS ABOUT THE SUCCESS IN FEDERAL MEGA GRANTS
- 2 FOR INNOVATIVE 680 WANT TO NOTE THAT MTC STAFF WILL BE WORKING
- 3 CLOSELY WITH CCTA STAFF TO DETERMINE A REVISED FUNDING AMOUNT
- 4 FOR THE SEC FOR I 680 EXPRESS LANES GAP CLOSURE PROJECT WHICH
- 5 IS PART OF THE INNOVATE 680 SUITE OF PROJECTS WITH THAT HAPPY
- 6 TO ANSWER YOUR QUESTIONS.

8 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: SURE.

10 CINDY CHAVEZ: ALL RIGHT GINA JUMP IN THERE. [LAUGHTER]

- 12 GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU TO STAFF ON THE BROADWAY GRADE
- 13 SEPARATION, I KNOW THEY'RE WORKING VERY INTENSELY, BECAUSE WE
- 14 HAVE MANY GRADE SEPARATIONS FROM THE FUTURE. AND WE REALLY
- 15 HOPE TO COME TO A SOLUTION AND REALLY MAKE THIS A MEGA PROJECT
- 16 FOR THE FUTURE. BECAUSE WE HAVE THIS BEAUTIFUL ELECTRIFIED
- 17 TRAIN NOW, AND THE GRADE SEPARATIONS ARE VERY IMPORTANT TO ALL
- 18 OF OUR COMMUNITIES. SO, I THINK THERE WERE LESSONS LEARNED IN
- 19 THIS ONE. AND WE WILL PROGRESS IN SUCH A WAY THAT HOPEFUL WILL
- 20 BE A LOT MORE EFFICIENT. AND I REALLY APPRECIATE STAFF WORKING
- 21 WITH CALTRAIN AS THIS MOVES AHEAD, BECAUSE, REALLY, THIS IS
- 22 THE MOST DANGEROUS GRADE SEPARATION IN THE WHOLE STATE
- 23 [LAUGHTER] SO, WE LOOK FORWARD TO RESOLVING THAT MATTER AND
- 24 PROGRESSING THROUGHOUT THE ENTIRE CORRIDOR. THANK YOU.



CINDY CHAVEZ: COLLEAGUES, I'M GOING MAKE A MOTION TO APPROVE 1 2 4663 AND 4664 AND ASK FOR A SECOND BEFORE WE GO TO PUBLIC 3 COMMENT. 4 5 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GREAT. A SECOND? 6 7 MARGARET ABE-KOGA: SECOND. 8 9 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ABE-KOGA. ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? 10 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE WAS CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED FROM 11 HEALDSBURG, THEIR ACKNOWLEDGMENT LETTER, AND THERE IS NO ONE 12 IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. 13 14 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY CHAVEZ, SECOND BY ABE-KOGA. 15 16 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? 17 GINA PAPAN: THERE WAS OTHER CORRESPONDENCE THAT'S IN THE PACK, 18 RIGHT? WE DON'T HAVE TO MENTION? 19 20 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: CLARIFY IF THERE IS ADDITIONAL. 21 22 ALIX BOCKELMAN: THERE WERE ADDITIONAL COMMENTS RECEIVED AT THE 23 OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING AND THEY 24

ARE POSTED TO THE PACKET AS WELL.



1	
2	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY CHAVEZ SECOND ABE-KOGA OF THE
3	ROLL CALL VOTE.
4	
5	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: CHAIR PEDROZA?
6	
7	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? IS ABSENT.
10	COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
11	
12	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
13	
14	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER AHN?
15	
16	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
19	
20	DAVID CANEPA: AYE.
21	
22	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?
23	
24	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
25	



1	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?
2	
3	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
4	
5	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
6	
7	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
10	
11	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MAHAN? COMMISSIONER MAHAN
14	IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY? COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT.
15	COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?
16	
17	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER NOACK? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
20	
21	GINA PAPAN: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSION ARE RABBITT?
24	
25	DAVID RABBITT: AYE.



1	
2	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RONEN? COMMISSIONER RONEN
3	IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SPERING?
4	
5	JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER THAO? THAO IS
8	ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
9	
10	CINDY CHAVEZ: THANK YOU. KENNETH, THANK YOU FOR THAT GOOD
11	WORK. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 9C, MTC RESOLUTIONS 4645 AND
12	4646, AND IT ADOPTS THE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT TIP AND
13	TRANSPORTATION AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS FOR 2025 TIP.
14	I'M GOING SEE IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS FROM MY COLLEAGUES.
15	SEEING NONE. I'M GOING ASK FOR A MOTION. ACTUALLY, I GET TO DO
16	IT. I MOVE 4645, AND 4646.
17	
18	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY CHAVEZ. DO WE HAVE A SECOND?
19	SECOND CANEPA?
20	
21	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
22	
23	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS
24	ITEM?
25	



1	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED ON THIS
2	ITEM AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.
3	
4	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: FIRST BY CHAVEZ SECOND BY CANEPA. ROLL
5	CALL VOTE.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PEDROZA?
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
10	
11	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? IS ABSENT.
12	COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
13	
14	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
15	
16	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER AHN?
17	
18	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
19	
20	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
21	
22	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
23	
24	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?
25	



1	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSION ARE DUTRA-VERNACI?
4	
5	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
8	
9	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
10	
11	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
12	
13	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
14	
15	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MAHAN? IS ABSENT.
16	COMMISSIONER MILEY? MILEY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON
17	PETERS?
18	
19	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
20	
21	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK?
22	COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
23	
24	GINA PAPAN: YES.
25	



CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RABBITT? 1 2 3 DAVID RABBITT: AYE. 4 5 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS ABSENT. 6 COMMISSIONER SPERING? 7 8 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 9 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER THAO? IS ABSENT. 10 MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 11 12 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, MARTHA AND THANK YOU 13 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ FOR YOUR REPORTS. ITEM TEN LEGISLATION 14 COMMITTEE REPORT. CANEPA? 15 16 DAVID CANEPA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE JOINT MTC LEGISLATION 17 COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE MET SEPTEMBER 13TH, 18 2024 AND REFERRED THREE ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION. ONE OF WHICH 19 WAS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR. NOW WE'RE BRINGING THE REMAINING 20 21 ITEMS TO THE FULL COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. AGENDA ITEM 10A 22 PROPOSITION FIVE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND PUBLIC INFRASTRUCTURE VOTER THRESHOLD, STATE CONSTITUTIONAL AMENDMENT TO ALLOW LOCAL 23 BONDS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING, OR FOR PUBLIC INFRASTRUCTURE TO 24



BE APPROVED BY 55% OF THE VOTERS. I MOVE A SUPPORT POSITION ON 1 2 PROPOSITION FIVE. 3 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I THINK EVERYONE IS GOING TO SECOND 4 5 THIS. BUT [LAUGHTER] ALL RIGHT. I'M GOING TO GIVE IT TO GLOVER. SO, WE HAVE FIRST BY CANEPA, SECOND BY CANEPA. DO WE 6 7 HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE 9 RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE SEEING NONE IN THE BOARDROOM 10 OR ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. 11 12 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSION ARE SCHAFF? 13 14 LIBBY SCHAFF: YOU KNEW I WOULD WANT TO --15 16 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: I DIDN'T EVEN HAVE TO LOOK THAT WAY. 17 18 LIBBY SCHAFF: I WANT TO BE CLEAR THAT I AM NOT ADVOCATING FOR 19 A POSITION EITHER WAY I'M VERY CLEAR THAT THAT IS NOT 20 21 APPROPRIATE IN THIS FORUM. BUT I DEPARTMENT TO SHARE IS HOW SURPRISED I HAVE BEEN AT HOW FEW PEOPLE EVEN KNOW WHAT PROP 22 FIVE S AND SO I WANT TO ESPECIALLY, FROM THIS BOARD WHERE 23 PARTICULARLY MANY IN THE BAY AREA WERE AWARE OF, I KNOW IT'S 24

ALMOST PAINFUL TO BRING UP, THE BAHFA BOND, VERY FEW PEOPLE



- 1 KNOW WHAT PROP FIVE IS SO I JUST WANT TO ENCOURAGE US ALL TO
- 2 USE WHATEVER MEANS WE HAVE TO ENSURE OUR CONSTITUENTS ARE
- 3 INFORMED ABOUT WHAT THEIR CHOICES ARE, WHAT THOSE CHOICES
- 4 MEANS. I THINK -- AND THIS IS FACTUAL INFORMATION -- IT'S
- 5 INTERESTING THAT WHEN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA WANTS TO
- 6 AUTHORIZE BONDS, IT REQUIRES FAVORITE% VOTE, BUT WHEN LOCAL
- 7 COMMUNITIES WANT TO AUTHORIZE BONDS AT THIS TIME IT REQUIRES A
- 8 2/3 VOTE. AND THAT THE 55% IS ENJOYED BY SCHOOL FACILITIES
- 9 ALREADY. SO, THESE ARE JUST FACTUAL ASPECT. I'M NOT ADVOCATING
- 10 ONE WAY OR ANOTHER, BUT I AM ENCOURAGING US TO ENSURE THAT
- 11 PEOPLE KNOW WHAT PROP FIVE IS. IT IS MAKING -- IT IS
- 12 EMPOWERING LOCAL COMMUNITIES TO HAVE A BETTER CHANCE OF
- 13 ALLOWING THEIR OWN VOTERS TO -- SORRY -- AM I CROSSING THE
- 14 LINE INTO ADVOCACY? OKAY. -- NO, IT IS A MATHEMATICALLY BETTER
- 15 CHANCE OF ALLOWING THEIR VOTERS TO DETERMINE THE
- 16 INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENTS THAT ARE APPROPRIATE FOR THEIR
- 17 COMMUNITIES. SO, THANK YOU FOR INDULGING ME, CHAIR PEDROZA AND
- 18 COLLEAGUES.
- 20 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. I DON'T SEE
- 21 ANY OTHER COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. WE HAVE NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON
- 22 THIS ITEM. FIRST CANEPA, SECOND GLOVER. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
- 24 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PEDROZA?

25

23



1	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ABSOLUTELY. [LAUGHTER]
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ? IS ABSENT.
4	COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?
5	
6	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
7	
8	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER AHN?
9	
10	EDDIE AHN: AYE.
11	
12	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?
13	
14	DAVID CANEPA: YES.
15	
16	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: UPON COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?
17	
18	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
19	
20	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: DUTRA-VERNACI?
21	
22	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.
23	
24	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY IS ABSENT.
25	MOULTON-PETERS?



1	
2	STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.
3	
4	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK?
5	COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
6	
7	GINA PAPAN: YES.
8	
9	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?
10	
11	DAVID RABBITT: AYE.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS ABSENT.
14	COMMISSIONER SPERING?
15	
16	JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.
17	
18	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER THAO? IS ABSENT. MOTION
19	PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
20	
21	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT BACK TO 10B CANEPA.
22	
23	DAVID CANEPA: 10B PROPOSITION FOUR AUTHORIZES BONDS FOR SAFE
24	DRINKING WATER WILDFIRE PREVENTION AND PROTECTING COMMUNITIES
25	AND NATURAL LANDS FROM CLIMATE RISK AUTHORIZES \$10 BILLION IN



1	STATE GENERAL OBLIGATION BONDS FOR VARIOUS PROJECTS TO REDUCE
2	CLIMATE RISK AND IMPACT. I MOVE A SUPPORT POSITION ON
3	PROPOSITION FOUR.
4	
5	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. FIRST BY CANEPA.
6	
7	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: SECOND.
8	
9	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: SECOND DUTRA-VERNACI. DO WE HAVE ANY
10	PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?
11	
12	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
13	RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE'S NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR
14	ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK.
15	
16	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS? FIRST BY
17	CANEPA, SECOND DUTRA-VERNACI. ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: PEDROZA?
20	
21	CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: JOSEFOWITZ? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER ABE-
24	KOGA?



1	MARGARET ABE-KOGA: AYE.
2	
3	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: AHN?
4	
5	EDDIE AHN: YES.
6	
7	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: UPON CANEPA?
8	
9	DAVID CANEPA: YES UPON CHAVEZ?
10	
11	CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.
12	
13	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: DUTRA-VERNACI?
14	
15	CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE COMMISSIONER FLEMING?
16	
17	VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.
18	
19	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
20	
21	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.
22	
23	CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY IS
24	ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?
25	



STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES. 1 2 3 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER NOACK? IS COMMISSIONER PAPAN? 4 5 6 GINA PAPAN: YES. 7 8 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: RABBITT? 9 10 DAVID RABBITT: AYE. 11 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: RONEN? IS ABSENT. SPERING? 12 13 JAMES P. SPERING: AYE. 14 15 16 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: UPON THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 17 18 19 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM 11, THIS IS GENERAL PUBLIC 20 21 COMMENT. 22 23 CLERK, MARTHA SILVER: THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM OR 24 ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK. 25



1		

- 2 CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: PROCEEDING TO ITEM 12 ADJOURNMENT. THE
- 3 NEXT MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS
- 4 TO BE HELD AT THE SAME PLACE SAME TIME WEDNESDAY OCTOBER 23RD.
- 5 [ADJOURNED]





Broadcasting Government