

**METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Transcript**



JULY 14, 2023

1 **JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE**

2 **FRIDAY, JULY 14<sup>TH</sup>, 2023, 9:40 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. I WOULD LIKE TO CALL  
6 TO ORDER THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE. THIS  
7 MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE AND CONSISTS OF  
8 SIMULTANEOUS TELECONFERENCE LOCATIONS AS INDICATED ON THE  
9 AGENDA. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE  
10 RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON  
11 THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE  
12 CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS MUCH THEIR PHONE NUMBER.  
13 VOTE FOR ACTION ITEMS WILL BE TAKEN TODAY DUE TO REMOTE  
14 COMMITTEE PARTICIPATION. WITH THAT, WOULD THE CLERK CONDUCT  
15 ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM WHETHER A QUORUM IS PRESENT?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. CHAIR CANEPA?

18

19 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

22

23 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN:** PRESENT. AND I AM TELECONFERENCING  
24 FROM 44 WEST 63RD STREET, NEW YORK, NEW YORK.

25



JULY 14, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

2

3 **EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON? IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EKLUND?

10

11 **PAT EKLUND:** PRESENT. I'M AT 922 NATION AVENUE, CITY OF NOVATO,

12 IN THE CONFERENCE ROOM.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MEMBER GIACOPINI NON-VOTING IS

15 ABSENT. MEMBER MAHAN IS ABSENT. MEMBER MOULTON-PETERS?

16

17 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS** HERE.

18

19 **>>CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

20

21 **SUE NOACK:** PRESENT.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

24

25 **BELIA RAMOS:** HERE, 11195 FERRIN STREET, NAPA CALIFORNIA, 3310.



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

3

4 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN? WE HAVE A QUORUM.

7

8 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH  
9 THAT. BRINGS US TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR WHICH CONSISTS OF  
10 AGENDA ITEM 2A THROUGH 2B. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. DO ANY  
11 MEMBERS WISH TO PULL AN ITEM FROM THE CONSENT CALENDAR? SEEING  
12 NONE. DO WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT  
13 CALENDAR?

14

15 **SPEAKER:** MOTION.

16

17 **SPEAKER:** SECOND.

18

19 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN, CHAIR:** CLERK WERE THERE PUBLIC  
20 COMMENTS RECEIVED IN ASSOCIATION WITH THIS ITEM?

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
23 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
24 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON  
25 THIS ITEM.



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. WITH THAT CAN I HAVE A ROLL CALL  
3 PLEASE?

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR CANEPA?

6

7 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

14

15 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CARLSON IS ABSENT. DUTRA-VERNACI?

18

19 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** EKLUND?

22

23 **PAT EKLUND:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

5

6 **SUE NOACK:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

13

14 **BELIA RAMOS:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

17

18 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN IS ABSENT. IT PASSES UNANIMOUSLY

21 BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. BRINGS US TO 3A

24 FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024 STATE BUDGET UPDATE. THIS IS OVERVIEW

25 OF THE FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024 STATE BUDGET, INCLUDING UPDATE



JULY 14, 2023

1 ON THE TRANSIT OPERATING FISCAL CLIFF NEGOTIATIONS SUMMARY OF  
2 THE BUDGET'S HOUSING, HOMELESSNESS, AND RESILIENCE COMPONENTS.  
3 THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. REBECCA LONG AND GEORGIA GANN  
4 DOHRMANN WILL PRESENT ON THIS ITEM.

5

6 **REBECCA LONG:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR CANEPA, VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN,  
7 AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS. REBECCA LONG LEGISLATION AND PUBLIC  
8 AFFAIRS. THIS IS OVERVIEW OF THE STATE BUDGET WHICH HAS NOW  
9 BEEN ASSIGNED. AT THE TIME WE WERE FINALIZING THIS MEMO WE  
10 HADN'T SEEN THE TRANSPORTATION BILL SIGNED BUT THAT DID HAPPEN  
11 EARLIER THIS WEEK. WE'RE GRATEFUL THAT THE LEGISLATURE AND  
12 GOVERNOR DID AGREE TO RESTORE THE \$2 BILLION FOR TIRCP THE  
13 INNER CITY RAIL AND CAPITAL PROGRAM THAT WAS PROMISED IN LAST  
14 YEAR'S TRANSPORTATION BILL, LAST YEAR AGREED TO AS I FOUR  
15 PACKAGE WITH 2 BILLION AT A TIME OVER THE NEXT TWO YEARS. WE  
16 HAVE THE 2 BILLION IN HAND AND THAT WILL BRING THE REGION TO  
17 ABOUT 400 MILLION THE BUDGET DOES ALLOW THOSE FUNDS TO GO  
18 TOWARDS CAPITAL OR OPERATIONS. OVER THE PAST YEAR THE  
19 COMMISSION HAS TAKEN ACTION AS FAR AS PRIORITIZING THOSE FUNDS  
20 AND WE HAVE MAJOR CAPITAL PROJECTS THAT WE'RE HOPING TO SEE  
21 FUNDING BY THOSE. THE BIG WIN ON THE TRANSIT OPERATING SIDE  
22 THEY DID PROVIDE \$1.1 BILLION IN NEW FUNDING FOR WHAT'S CALLED  
23 THE ZERO-EMISSIONS TRANSIT CAPITAL PROGRAM, BUT IT IS VERY  
24 CLEAR THAT IT'S FLEXIBLE TO BE USED FOR OPERATIONS. AND THOSE  
25 FUNDS ARE TO BE DISTRIBUTED BY FORMULA. I SHOULD NOTE THE 1.1



JULY 14, 2023

1 BILLION, WHILE THAT WAS WHAT'S DESCRIBED AS PART OF AN  
2 AGREEMENT WITH THE GOVERNOR AND A THREE PARTY AGREEMENT, ONLY  
3 410 MILLION OF THAT IS APPROPRIATED IN THIS YEAR'S BUDGET.  
4 IT'S GOING TO BE CRITICAL EVERY YEAR THAT WE SECURE THE REST  
5 OF THAT 700 MILLION. THE OUT-YEAR IS TO COME FROM CAP-AND-  
6 TRADE FUNDING. THAT DEFINITELY IS REASSURING BECAUSE IT'S NOT  
7 AS MUCH OF A FIGHT AS WITH THE GENERAL FUND. IT'S NOT QUITE  
8 AS, YOU KNOW, UP-AND-DOWN, IF TERMS OF DEFICITS, BUT, AGAIN,  
9 SOME OF THAT FUNDING IS AN OUT-YEAR. THE 410 MILLION THAT HAS  
10 BEEN APPROPRIATED IS GOING TO COME TO THE REGION BY FORMULA TO  
11 MTC AND ALLOCATIONS IN THE FIRST YEAR WE'LL GET ABOUT 150  
12 MILLION TOTAL TO THE REGION IS ABOUT 400 MILLION. WE'RE HAPPY  
13 THAT WAS THE FORMULA USED IT'S THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE  
14 FORMULA VERSUS POPULATION FORM WHAT DON'T FEEL THAT IS QUITE  
15 FAIR FOR OUR REGION GIVEN HOW MANY RIDERS WE HAVE. THAT'S SNAP  
16 SHOT OF FUNDING THERE IS A TRAILER BILL MENTIONED IN THE PRIOR  
17 COMMITTEE SB125 THAT PROVIDES A NUMBER OF REPORTING  
18 REQUIREMENTS AND GIVES MTC AND REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION  
19 PLANNING AGENCIES ACROSS THE STATE A REALLY IMPORTANT ROLE IN  
20 PROVIDING INFORMATION TO THE STATE AS TO THE FINANCIAL  
21 CONDITION OF TRANSIT AGENCIES IN THEIR REGION AS WELL AS WORK  
22 UNDERWAY TO IMPROVE RIDERSHIP. SO, AGAIN, SIMILAR TO WHATEVER  
23 WAS DISCUSSED IN THE PRIOR COMMITTEE BRINGING BACK RIDERS AND  
24 WHAT'S BEING DONE. THE COMMISSION IS GOING TO BE REQUIRED TO  
25 ADOPT A SHORT RANGE FINANCIAL PLAN BY THE END OF THIS CALENDAR



JULY 14, 2023

1 YEAR IN ORDER TO ACCESS THOSE FUNDS. SO WE'RE GOING TO WAIT  
2 FOR THE STATE TO PROVIDE SOME GUIDELINES ENDS OF SEPTEMBER AND  
3 THEN AGAIN WE'LL NEED TO SUBMIT THAT SHORT-TERM FINANCIAL PLAN  
4 AND I DID WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT, BECAUSE THE NEXT ITEM IS  
5 GOING TO BE PROVIDING SOME INITIAL INFORMATION THAT STAFF HAS  
6 BEEN DOING LOOKING AT THE FINANCES FACING OUR OPERATORS AND  
7 YOU'RE GOING TO HEAR FROM A NUMBER OF THE GENERAL MANAGERS BUT  
8 THE COMMISSION IS BEING CHARGED WITH SYNTHESIZING THIS  
9 INFORMATION, PROVIDING IT TO THE STATE AS A CONDITION OF BEING  
10 ABLE TO ALLOCATE THESE FUNDS TO THE OPERATORS. SO WE DO HAVE  
11 AN IMPORTANT ROLE THERE. AND SAFETY ISN'T A FACTOR THAT'S  
12 INCORPORATED, AS WAS ALSO MENTIONED EARLIER INTO THESE PLANS  
13 IN TERMS OF THE COMMISSION NEEDING TO DISCUSS WHAT'S BEING  
14 DONE, WHAT'S BEING INVESTED IN THAT AREA. MOVING ON TO HOUSING  
15 AND HOMELESSNESS. DESPITE IT BEING A VERY DIFFICULT BUDGET  
16 YEAR, THE LEGISLATURE AND THE GOVERNOR MAINTAINED THEIR  
17 COMMITMENTS TO HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS PROGRAMS. AND, SO,  
18 ANTICIPATED FUNDING FROM THE PRIOR YEAR WAS HONORED, AND SO  
19 THAT WAS A BIG RELIEF. IN YOUR PACKET YOU DO HAVE ATTACHMENTS  
20 TO THE MEMO THAT HAVE DETAILS BY PROGRAM. SO I'M NOT GOING TO  
21 GO INTO THAT HERE. THE BIGGEST DISAPPOINTMENT IN AREAS OF  
22 PRIORITY FOR MTC AND ABAG IS IN THE CLIMATE ADAPTATION AND  
23 RESILIENCE CATEGORY. LAST YEAR, THERE WAS KIND OF A MULTI-YEAR  
24 PACKAGE ADOPTED, SIMILAR TO TRANSPORTATION, THE LEGISLATURE  
25 CAN'T BIND ITSELF TO WHAT IT'S GOING DO IN THE OUT-YEARS. SO



JULY 14, 2023

1 IN THIS CASE THEY REALLY DID PULL BACK SUBSTANTIALLY, AND I  
2 GUESS THE SILVER LINING, OR THE HOPE IS THAT A LOT OF THOSE  
3 INVESTMENTS THAT WERE ANTICIPATED FOR, FOR EXAMPLE, SEA LEVEL  
4 RISE ADAPTATION BOTH PLAN SUPPORTING INFRASTRUCTURE, WILL BE  
5 FUNDED THROUGH A BOND MEASURE. SO THERE IS A COUPLE OF BILLS  
6 THAT ARE STILL PENDING. SB 867, AND A.B. 1567 THAT WOULD  
7 AUTHORIZE ABOUT 16 BILLION IN BONDS. SO, WE'LL SEE IF THOSE  
8 GET THROUGH THE PROCESS. BECAUSE, CLEARLY, CLIMATE CHANGE IS  
9 PRESENTING A LOT OF CHALLENGES AND WE DO THAN WE NEED TO BE  
10 DOING THAT PLANNING AND INFRASTRUCTURE WORK AS SOON AS  
11 POSSIBLE. SO, WITH THAT, I WILL CLOSE AND SEE IF THERE IS ANY  
12 QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS.

13

14 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE  
15 PRESENTATION, REBECCA. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS? MR. AHN?

16

17 **EDDIE AHN:** FOLLOW UP, EARLIER AT COMMISSION MEETING HEARING  
18 YOU HEARD ABOUT NEEDING TO ITEMIZE SAFETY ON PUBLIC TRANSIT. I  
19 WAS WONDERING TUCKED TALK ABOUT PUBLIC FUNDS AND THE SO-CALLED  
20 STRINGS ATTACHED. LIKE WHAT SPECIFICALLY AROUND PUBLIC SAFETY  
21 YOU THINK MTC SHOULD BE DISCUSSING IN THE FUTURE AS IT RELATES  
22 TO CLARIFY TO THE STATE FUNDING THAT YOU'RE DESCRIBING?

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** RIGHT. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. SO, IN THE SHORT  
25 RANGE FINANCIAL PLAN, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE'RE REQUIRED TO



JULY 14, 2023

1 REPORT ON IS WHAT IS BEING SPENT TODAY ON SAFETY AND SECURITY.  
2 AND, SO, THAT'S MORE OF A TRANSPARENCY TYPE OF REQUIREMENT  
3 THAT THE STATE WANTS TO KNOW, YOU KNOW, WHAT'S BEING DONE. AND  
4 WE'LL BE WORKING WITH OPERATORS TO PROVIDE THAT INFORMATION.  
5 IN THE SUBSEQUENT PLANS WE NEED TO BE REPORTING BASED ON WHAT  
6 WE LEARN FROM THE OPERATORS IS WHAT ARE THE OPERATORS DOING TO  
7 IMPROVE SAFETY ON THEIR SYSTEMS. SO, I THINK, YOU KNOW, WE  
8 DON'T PRETEND TO BE EXPERTS ON SAFETY ON TRANSIT. CLEARLY THE  
9 OPERATORS WHO ARE DEALING WITH THAT DAY IN AND DAY OUT HAVE  
10 THAT EXPERTISE BUT AT THE PLEASURE OF THE COMMISSION WE CAN  
11 ELEVATE THAT AS A TOPIC TO TALK ABOUT AND SEE WHAT KIND OF  
12 ROLE THERE MIGHT, BECAUSE, CERTAINLY, YOU KNOW, WHAT WE HAVE  
13 SEEN IN POLLING DONE BY MTC, AS WELL, IT'S NOT A SCENARIO  
14 WHERE A LOT OF IMPROVEMENT IS NEEDED BOTH IN REALITY AND WITH  
15 PERCEPTION.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. I WAS GOING SAY SUPERVISOR PAPAN.  
18 COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. [LAUGHTER] JUST ALONG THOSE  
21 LINES, TOO, SAYING SOMETHING, REPORTING TO THE LEGISLATURE, I  
22 MEAN, WE REALLY NEED TO BE RESPONSIBLE HERE IN ORDER FOR THE  
23 CONSUMERS TO FEEL SAFE. IF SOMETHING ISN'T WORKING DON'T JUST  
24 TELL US YOU HAVE AN AMBASSADOR GOING SOMEWHERE BECAUSE THE  
25 RESULTS ARE NOT SUFFICIENT TO REALLY IMPACT THE COMMUNITY. SO,



JULY 14, 2023

1 REALLY, HOLDING TO THAT, IT'S JUST -- IT SHOULDN'T BE A  
2 REPORT; THERE SHOULD BE RESULTS HERE ON HOW PEOPLE FEEL ABOUT  
3 THAT TO BE IMPACTFUL. THANK YOU.

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. AND VICE CHAIR  
6 ARREGUIN?

7

8 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN:** THANK YOU. WELL, ALSO ON THAT VEIN,  
9 AS WELL, YOU KNOW, THIS IS A REALLY CRITICAL ISSUE, NOT JUST  
10 FOR THE SURVIVAL OF TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA, BUT IT'S ALSO  
11 GOING TO BE CRITICAL FOR OUR ABILITY TO GET FUNDING TO ENSURE  
12 LONG-TERM OPERATIONS OF TRANSIT. SO, WE HAVE TO SHOW RESULTS.  
13 AND REBECCA, ARE WE EXPECTING THE STATE TO PROVIDE MORE  
14 SPECIFIC GUIDANCE ON THIS? OR IS IT REALLY UP TO THE REGIONS  
15 TO DEVELOP THEIR OWN PLANS AND METRICS? AND MY SECOND QUESTION  
16 IS, I THINK WE DO NEED TO PROBABLY DEVELOP SOME METRICS. AND  
17 I'M CURIOUS, I DO THINK A CONVERSATION OF SAFETY IS WELCOME.  
18 I'M CURIOUS IF THERE ARE BEST PRACTICES FROM TRANSIT AGENCIES  
19 IN THE UNITED STATES THAT WE CAN LOOK TO ON THINGS THAT THEY  
20 HAVE DONE THAT WE CAN LEARN FROM, AS WELL.

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** REBECCA?

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, PRESIDENT ARREGUIN. YOU KNOW, I DON'T  
25 EXPECT THE STATE TO KIND OF MANDATE A PRESCRIPTIVE APPROACH TO



JULY 14, 2023

1 SAFETY. BECAUSE, YOU KNOW, IT VERY MUCH IS NOT ONE SIZE FITS  
2 ALL. HAVING SAID THAT, I IMAGINE THE BEST PRACTICES THAT  
3 ORGANIZATIONS LIKE ASSOCIATION OF PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION  
4 AGENCIES AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL WOULD HAVE, FOR NOW IT'S GOING  
5 TO BE, TELL US WHAT YOU'RE DOING, AND SHOW US HOW THAT IS  
6 EFFECTIVE. AND I THINK THE SUGGESTION YOU JUST MADE ABOUT  
7 METRICS, I THINK, IS AN EXCELLENT 1, AND 1 THAT WE CAN THINK  
8 ABOUT INSTITUTING AT A REGIONAL LEVEL SO THAT WE CAN, SORT OF,  
9 BENCHMARK AND SEE PROGRESS. RIGHT? WE DON'T WANT TO SIMPLY  
10 TALK ABOUT ADDITIONAL MONEY GOING TOWARDS SOMETHING WITHOUT  
11 BEING ABLE TO FIND A WAY TO MEASURE IT.

12

13 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN:** YEAH. ON THAT, MR. CHAIR, IF I MAY?  
14 YOU KNOW, I THINK IT'S OUR ABILITY TO DEMONSTRATE TO THE  
15 PEOPLE OF THE BAY AREA THAT WE ARE MAKING PROGRESS AND  
16 ADDRESSING THIS ISSUE, AND TO THE STATE. AND I THINK THAT'S  
17 GOING TO BE REALLY IMPORTANT, YOU KNOW, A FEW YEARS FROM NOW  
18 WHEN WE'RE GOING TO BE LIKELY GOING TO THE VOTERS TO ASK FOR  
19 ONGOING OPERATING FUNDS. SO, I THINK, ASKING TO DEVELOP PLANS  
20 IS GOOD BUT WE MAY WANT TO THINK ABOUT, ARE WE LOOKING AT A  
21 REDUCTION OF CERTAIN POLICE CALLS? YOU KNOW, X NUMBER OF  
22 AMBASSADORS, X NUMBER OF POLICE. I THINK WE NEED TO THINK  
23 ABOUT HOW WE QUANTIFY THAT. I KNOW THAT'S DIFFICULT BECAUSE  
24 DIFFERENT TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE DIFFERENT APPROACHES. BUT I  
25 THINK HAVING SOMETHING THAT WE CAN DEMONSTRATE AND MEASURE SO



JULY 14, 2023

1 WE CAN SHOW THAT THE PROGRESS THAT WE'RE MAKING IN THE BAY  
2 AREA, I THINK IT'S WORTHWHILE. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT COMMENTS. THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR.  
5 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?

6

7 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I WANT TO AGREE WITH MY COLLEAGUES,  
8 LET'S GET STANDARDS AND METRICS AND LET'S USE THEM AND SHOW  
9 THE PUBLIC WHAT WE'RE DOING.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. ANY OTHER COMMENTS FROM BOARD  
12 MEMBERS? SEEING NONE. CLERK, WERE THERE ANY COMMENTS RECEIVED  
13 UNDER THE PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPOND RECEIVED  
16 ON THIS ITEM. NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED  
17 IN ZOOM AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDS ROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON  
18 THIS ITEM.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. WITH THAT BEING SAID, LET'S MOVE  
21 TO ITEM 3B, THE FINANCIAL CHALLENGES AND STRATEGIC EFFORTS IN  
22 BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATIONS. OVERVIEW OF NEAR-TERM OPERATING  
23 DEFICITS REPORTED BY BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES AND EFFORTS  
24 UNDERWAY TO ADDRESS THEM AT STATE AND LOCAL LEVELS. THIS IS AN  
25 INFORMATION ITEM. THERESA ROMMEL OF MTC AND JEFFREY TUMLIN



JULY 14, 2023

1 FROM SFMTA, MICHAEL JONES OF BART, AND MIKE HURSH OF AC  
2 TRANSIT WILL PRESENT ON THIS ITEM. COLLEAGUES I WOULD JUST  
3 SAY, FIRST, THANK YOU TO THOSE OPERATORS WHO ARE HERE. WE  
4 REALLY APPRECIATE IT. I KNOW YOU HAVE OTHER THINGS THAT YOU  
5 COULD BE DOING, BUT YOU'RE ATTENDANCE IS VALUED AND  
6 APPRECIATED. SO THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE.

7

8 **THERESA ROMMELL:** OKAY. I THINK I'LL START THINGS OFF. THERESA  
9 ROMMEL MTC. ON THE HEELS OF THE STATE BUDGET PRESENTATION THAT  
10 WAS JUST MADE THIS PRESENTATION IS INTENDED TO PROVIDES AN  
11 UPDATE ON THE NEAR-TERM OPERATING DEFICITS AS REPORTED BY BAY  
12 AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES AND EFFORT UNDERWAY TO ADDRESS THEM AND  
13 TO ATTRACT AND RETAIN CUSTOMERS. FOLLOWING MY PRESENTATION OF  
14 JUST A FEW BRIEF SLIDES I'LL TURN IT OVER TO SOME OF OUR  
15 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO REPORT ON THE SPECIFIC FINANCIAL  
16 SITUATIONS AT THEIR AGENCIES AND WHAT THEY'RE DOING TO  
17 INCREASE RIDERSHIP ON THEIR SYSTEMS. YOU ALREADY INTRODUCED  
18 THEM BUT WE HAVE DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER MICHAEL JONES FROM  
19 BART, GENERAL MANAGER MICHAEL HURSCH FROM AC TRANSIT AND  
20 GENERAL MANAGER JEFFREY TUMLIN FROM SFMTA, AND ADDITIONAL  
21 OPERATORS IN THE AUDIENCE, WE HAVE CALTRAIN HERE AND MEMBERS  
22 FROM GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT, AND BILL CHURCHILL FROM COUNTY  
23 CONNECTION IS HERE TO GIVE THE SMALL OPERATOR REPRESENTATION,  
24 AS WELL. SO IF WE CAN PULL THE SLIDE DECK UP PLEASE? THANK  
25 YOU. NEXT SLIDE. JUST AS A QUICK RECAP OF THE LAST ITEM ON THE



JULY 14, 2023

1 STATE BUDGET AS IT PERTAINS TO THE NEAR-TERM TRANSIT OPERATING  
2 FUNDING GAP. STATE BUDGET AS YOU HEARD DID HOLD SOME RELIEF  
3 FOR THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. \$2 BILLION IN TIRCP WAS ADDED BACK  
4 TO THE BUDGET AFTER HAVING BEEN CUT IN THE GOVERNOR'S BUDGET  
5 PROPOSAL. THIS RESTORING THE FULL 4 BILLION AND FUNDING OVER A  
6 TWO YEAR PERIOD THAT HAD BEEN PROMISED AT THE BEGINNING OF THE  
7 LAST FISCAL YEAR. THE BUDGET MAKES THESE FUNDS FLEXIBLE FOR  
8 EXPENDITURE ON OPERATIONS. THE BAY AREA SHARE OF THESE FUNDS  
9 OVER TWO YEARS IS EXPECTED TO BE ABOUT 800 MILLION. THE TIRCP  
10 FUNDS ARE COMMITTED TO CAPITAL PROJECTS THROUGH MTC'S MAJOR  
11 ADVANCEMENT POLICY AND TIRCP FRAMEWORK. IT'S UNLIKELY THAT A  
12 LARGE PORTION OF THESE FUNDS WILL BE ABLE TO BE USED FOR  
13 TRANSIT OPERATIONS. BUT IT'S GOOD NEWS FOR PROJECTS THAT  
14 NEEDED THESE FUNDS IN ORDER TO FULLY DELIVER WHILE LEVERAGING  
15 SIGNIFICANT AMOUNTS OF STATES AND FEDERAL GRANTS FUNDING.  
16 THERE WAS 1.1 BILLION IN NEW STATEWIDE FUNDING FOR THE NEW  
17 ZERO-EMISSIONS CAPITAL PROGRAM WHICH CAN BE USED FOR TRANSIT  
18 OPERATIONS AND THE BAY AREA SHARE OF THESE FUNDS IS EXPECTED  
19 TO BE ABOUT 37% OR FOUR HUNDREDS MILLION THESE FUNDS WOULD  
20 COME TO THE REGION OVER A FOUR YEAR TIME SPAN AS REBECCA  
21 NOTED. BOTH OF THESE FUNDING PROGRAMS CAN BE USED FOR TRANSIT  
22 OPERATIONS. TRAILER BILL SB125 SPELLS OUT THE ACCOUNTABILITY  
23 REQUIREMENTS TIED TO THESE FUNDS WHICH STAFF ARE CURRENTLY  
24 WORKING TO DEVELOP A PROCESS FOR COMPLYING WITH. ONE OF THE  
25 REQUIREMENTS IS THE MPO SET FORTH THE REGIONAL SHORT-TERM



JULY 14, 2023

1 FINANCIAL PLAN WITH DETAILS ON HOW WE'LL BE ADDRESSING THE  
2 OPERATIONAL DEFICITS AND HOW WE'LL BE SPENDING AND  
3 CONTRIBUTING THE STATE FUNDS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. TO GAIN AN  
4 UNDERSTANDING OF HOW BIG THE PROBLEM IS THAT WE'RE TRYING TO  
5 SOLVE FOR IN REGARD TO THE TRANSIT OPERATING SHORTFALL.  
6 TRANSIT OPERATORS WERE ASKED TO PROVIDE MTC WITH THEIR  
7 ESTIMATED FUNDING GAPS OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS. AS YOU CAN  
8 SEE FROM THE TABLE, THAT ESTIMATED GAP IS NEARLY TWO. \$7  
9 BILLION OVER THAT PERIODS. MOST OF THIS FUNDING GAP IS HELD BY  
10 OPERATORS THAT PRECOVID WERE HEAVILY RELIANT ON FARE OR TOLL  
11 REVENUE AS AN OPERATIONS FUNDING SOURCE, OR WERE RELIANT ON A  
12 HEALTHY DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO ECONOMY, BOTH FOR FARE REVENUE  
13 GENERATED BY COMMUTERS OR ON TAXES AND FEES GENERATED BY  
14 BUSTLING URBAN ENVIRONMENT. ANOTHER REASON FOR TODAY'S  
15 PRESENTATION IS FOR MTC WHO WERE TASKED WITH WORKING WITH  
16 TRANSIT OPERATORS TO BETTER UNDERSTAND ESTIMATES AND  
17 ASSUMPTIONS AND AREAS OF FORECAST COMPARABLE TO AREAS THAT ARE  
18 DIFFERENT OVER THE COURSE OF THE LAST TWO MONTHS AND MTC STAFF  
19 HAVE BEEN COORDINATING WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS TO TRY TO  
20 PROVIDE SOME OF THOSE ANSWERS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASES. ONE THING  
21 TO HIGHLIGHT ABOUT THE OPERATOR SHORTFALL ESTIMATES IS THEY  
22 WERE DEVELOPED USING OPERATOR SPECIFIC ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT A  
23 HOST OF FACTORS. THESE ASSUMPTIONS CAN SIGNIFICANTLY IMPACT  
24 THE SHORTFALL ESTIMATES IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE HOWEVER THAT  
25 MANY ASSUMPTIONS SHOULD VARY ACROSS OPERATORS GIVEN



JULY 14, 2023

1 DIFFERENCES IN MODE, GEOGRAPHIC LOCATION HISTORICAL AGREEMENTS  
2 AND HOST OF OTHER REASONS THAT ARE UNIQUE TO EACH OPERATOR.  
3 FOR EXAMPLE, RIDERSHIP MAY VARY ACCORDING TO DESTINATION  
4 SERVED GROWTH AND LABOR EXPENSE AND LABOR CONTRACT AGREEMENTS  
5 DIFFERENCES AND ASSUMPTIONS CONTRIBUTE TO A VARIATION OF THE  
6 SHORTFALL ESTIMATES ACROSS OPERATORS THIS TABLE CONTAINS  
7 SAMPLE FACTORS AND RANGES OF VARIATION BETWEEN OPERATORS. KEY  
8 SERVICE PROVISION RELATIVE TO FISCAL YEAR 2019 OR PRE-PANDEMIC  
9 SOME OPERATORS ARE STILL ONLY PROVIDING 65%, UP TO PRE-  
10 PANDEMIC LEVELS, OTHER OPERATORS 150% OF 2019 LEVELS HOWEVER  
11 MUCH OF THAT DISCREPANCY HAVE TO DO WITH THE DIFFERENCES  
12 BETWEEN MARGINAL COST IN PROVIDING THAT SERVICE BETWEEN RAIL  
13 AND BUS OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT  
14 WE LOOKED AT, WHICH IS WHICH FORECAST FACTORS COULD WE  
15 POTENTIALLY STANDARDIZE TO IMPROVE COMPARABILITY OF NEEDS AND  
16 PUT OPERATORS ON A MORE EQUAL FOOTING WITH ONE ANOTHER. THIS  
17 INFORMATION, AS IT EVOLVES WILL BE IMPORTANT GIVEN FUNDING  
18 BEING PROVIDED THROUGH THE STATE BUDGET WILL NOT BE SUFFICIENT  
19 TO CLOSE THE FUNDING GAP AND THE COMMISSION WILL BE  
20 RESPONSIBLE FOR MAKING FUNDING DECISIONS WITH SCARCE RESOURCES  
21 TO ADDRESS THE PROJECTED SHORTFALLS, AND MAY ALSO BE NECESSARY  
22 TO MARSHALL OTHER EXISTING RESOURCES TO MAINTAINS TRANSIT  
23 SERVICE FOR RIDERS ANOTHER REASON IT'S IMPORTANT IS TO ENSURE  
24 ESTIMATES ACROSS OPERATORS ARE UNDERSTOOD, FAIR, AND  
25 CONSISTENT. THIS ISN'T TO SAY IN ANY WAY THAT'S SHORTFALL



JULY 14, 2023

1 ESTIMATES WERE PROVIDED BY OPERATORS ARE INCORRECT IN ANY WAY,  
2 BUT RATHER IF EVERY OPERATOR WERE HELD TO CONSISTENT  
3 ASSUMPTIONS WHERE IT MADE SENSE WHAT WOULD THE IMPACT OF THAT  
4 TYPE OF STANDARDIZATION BE FROM A REGIONAL STANDPOINT? FOR  
5 EXAMPLE, IF WE WERE TO HOLD ALL OPERATORS TO A BASELINE LEVEL  
6 OF SERVICE THAT WAS CONSISTENT WITH FISCAL YEAR 2019, FISCAL  
7 YEAR 2022, OR FISCAL YEAR 2023 LEVELS, WHICHEVER IS LOT OF.  
8 SO, NO ASSUMED SERVICE INCREASES OVER THE FIVE-YEAR PERIODS.  
9 THE IMPACT ON THE FIVE YEAR SHORTFALL WOULD BE ABOUT \$325  
10 MILLION COMBINING FIRST TWO LEADERS ON THE TABLE ON YOUR  
11 SLIDE. IF WE ASSUME THE STANDARDS LEVEL OF GROWTH EQUIVALENT  
12 TO A STANDARD CPI RATE FOR CERTAIN LIVE NEW SOURCES LIKE TDA,  
13 STA, THAT WOULD HAVE IMPACT OF TWO HUNDREDS 25 MILLION ON THE  
14 SHORTFALL BECAUSE THERE WOULD BE MORE ASSUMED REVENUE. ALSO IF  
15 WE REMOVED ANY ASSUMED TRANSFERS OF OPERATING REVENUE TO PAY  
16 FOR CAPITAL EXPENDITURES THAT WERE NOT ESSENTIAL UNDER THE  
17 PRESUMPTION THOSE CAPITAL EXPENDITURES NEEDS MIGHT BE DEALT  
18 WITH IN ANOTHER WAY THE IMPACT ON THE SHORTFALL WOULD BE ABOUT  
19 ONE HUNDREDS \$25 MILLION. I THESE ARE ESTIMATES. OTHER FACTORS  
20 SUBJECT TO STANDARDIZATION THAT COULD BE EMPLOYED THIS IS NOT  
21 A COMPLETE LIST. THIS REVIEW AND ANALYSIS REINFORCES THE  
22 CHALLENGES THAT WE HAVE BEFORE US AS DIFFERENT ASSUMPTIONS DO  
23 NOT FUNDAMENTALLY CHANGE THE SHORTFALLS OF THE OPERATORS, BUT  
24 THEY DO LEAD TO DIFFERENT RESULTS. ONE OF THE LAST THING, THAT  
25 I WILL NOTE PRIOR TO TURNING THE PRESENTATION OVER TO MR.



JULY 14, 2023

1 JONES WITH BART IS THAT THE ATTACHMENT TO THE MEMO INCLUDES A  
2 SUMMARY BACKGROUND INFORMATION ABOUT CHANGES IN RIDERSHIP AND  
3 SERVICE LEVELS AND INITIATIVES THAT THE TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE  
4 UNDERTAKEN TO IMPROVE SERVICE FOR CUSTOMERS. SO MAKE SURE THAT  
5 YOU LOOK AT THOSE HANDOUTS. MTC STAFF WILL CONTINUE TO  
6 COLLABORATE WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS AS WE WORK TOWARDS THE  
7 DEVELOPMENT OF A PROCESS AND PRINCIPLES RELATED TO THE  
8 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE STATE REQUIRED REGIONAL TRANSIT  
9 FINANCIAL PLAN. BEFORE WE TURN IT OVER TO TRANSIT OPERATORS,  
10 I'LL PAUSE HERE IF THERE IS ANY QUESTIONS, OTHERWISE WE CAN  
11 PROCEED WITH THE PRESENTATION AND GO TO QUESTIONS AFTER.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** I HAD ONE QUICK QUESTION IS THERE A WAY TO GET A COPY  
14 OF THE TIRCP CAPITAL PROJECTS MONEY CURRENTLY ALLOCATED JUST  
15 TO I HAVE BETTER UNDERSTANDING.

16

17 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WE HAVE PROJECTS CURRENT EXPECTING BART TO  
18 SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO AND BART'S CORE CAPACITY THERE IS  
19 OTHER FUNDING ASSOCIATED WITH THE 800 MILLION THAT IS  
20 CURRENTLY DESIGNATED FOR ADDITIONAL CONTINGENCY OR FOR ZERO  
21 EMISSION BUS TRANSITION PROJECTS.

22

23 **SUE NOACK:** THANKS.

24

25 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** ARE THERE IN ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS? OKAY.



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **THERESA ROMMELL:** OKAY. HERE WE GO.

3

4 **MICHAEL JONES:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. I THINK I HAVE BEEN  
5 INTRODUCED A COUPLE EVER TIMES. I APPRECIATE THAT. I'LL DO IT  
6 ONE MORE TIME. I'M THE DEPUTY GENERAL MANAGER MICHAEL JONES AT  
7 BART. THE GENERAL MANAGER SENDS REGARDS HE'S ON A MUCH NEEDED  
8 AND PREPLANNED VACATION OTHERWISE HE WOULD CERTAINLY BE HERE  
9 WITH YOU THIS MORNING. THERE'S AN OPERATOR REPORT-OUT THAT CAN  
10 GET PULLED UP, PLEASE? THERE IS AN OPERATOR REPORT-OUT  
11 PRESENTATION, SLIDE DECK. THANK YOU. THANK YOU. IF YOU WOULD  
12 JUST MOVE TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE? THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT. SO  
13 STATING THE OBVIOUS THE PAST FEW YEARS HAS BEEN CHALLENGES FOR  
14 TRANSIT AND PARTICULARLY BAY AREA OPERATORS. IN THE EARLY DAYS  
15 OF THE PANDEMIC BART'S RIDERSHIP PLUMMETED TO 6% OF OUR DAILY  
16 AVERAGE. AS OF THIS WEEK WE'RE CARRYING ABOUT 40% OF OUR PRE-  
17 PANDEMIC EXPECTATIONS. THE GRAPH ON THIS SLIDE, HIGHLIGHTS HOW  
18 CLOSELY BART'S OVERALL RIDERSHIP COMPARES WITH DOWNTOWN SAN  
19 FRANCISCO'S RETURN TO THE OFFICERS. AS THE CHART ILLUSTRATES  
20 THERE IS DIRECT CORRELATION BETWEEN COMMUTE TRIPS INTO THE  
21 CITY AND OUR RIDERSHIP RECOVERY. LOW BART RIDERSHIP ALSO  
22 AFFECTS OTHER TRANSIT OPERATORS. 90% OF ALL TRANSFERS BETWEEN  
23 TRANSIT OPERATORS INVOLVE A TRIP ON BART. AND ONE OUT OF EVERY  
24 FIVE BART RIDERS CONNECT TO ANOTHER TRANSIT AGENCY AS PART OF  
25 THEIR COMMUTE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. PRIOR TO 2019 BART RELIED



JULY 14, 2023

1 HEAVILY ON RIDERSHIP ON FARE REVENUE TO FUND OPERATIONS AS  
2 WELL AS CAPITAL PREDICTION APPLICATIONS. FARE CONTRIBUTED 500  
3 MILLION ANNUAL TOW FUNDS OPERATIONS AS SHOWN ON THE BAR ON THE  
4 SLIDE. FORTUNATE TO RECEIVE 1.6 BILLION IN FEDERAL EMERGENCY  
5 ASSISTANCE SINCE 2020 AS DEPICTED IN THE GREEN BARS ON THE  
6 CHART HOWEVER DESPITE BEST EFFORTS TO EXTEND OUR FISCAL RUNWAY  
7 WE PROJECT WE WILL FULLY EXPEND FUNDS BY EARLY 2025. ONCE  
8 FEDERAL ASSISTANCE IS FULLY EXPENDED BART'S ANNE GULL DEFICIT  
9 OF 300 MILLION OR 1/3 OF OUR OPERATING BUDGET AS INDICATED IN  
10 THE RED BARS ON THE RIGHT. BART IS TAKING STEPS TO CLOSE THE  
11 GAP RECENTLY APPROVED FARE AND PARKING FEE INCREASES TO KEEP  
12 PACE WITH INFLATION AND WE'RE WORKING TO REDUCE EXPENSES AND  
13 MINIMIZE COST INCREASES. NEXT SLIDE. BART IS MAKE EVERY EFFORT  
14 TO IMPROVE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE AND BRING RIDERS BACK TO  
15 TRANSIT. LASER FOCUSED ON IMPROVING THE SIX PRIORITY AREAS  
16 LISTED ON THIS SLIDE. IN SEPTEMBER WE ROLLED OUT A NEW  
17 SCHEDULE THAT BETTER ALIGNS SERVICE WITH DEMAND WITH A 50%  
18 IMPROVEMENT TO HEADWAYS ON WEEKENDS AND EVENINGS. IMPROVING  
19 OUR SAFETY EFFORTS BY INCREASING BOTH SWORN AND NON-SWORN  
20 UNIFORM STAFF THROUGH THE OUR SYSTEM. OUR CURRENT BPD  
21 DEPLOYMENT REPRESENTS THE MOST CONSTANT PRESENCE WE HAVE EVER  
22 HAD ON OUR SYSTEM. WE HAVE RECENTLY COMMITTED COMPLETE MARKET  
23 INVESTMENTS TO PERSONNEL SALARIES TO ENHANCE RECRUITING AND  
24 RETENTION OF POLICE OFFICERS. WE ARE FULLY STAFFED TEAM OF  
25 CARS CLEANERS AND STATION CLEANERS PRIORITIZING OVERNIGHT DEEP



JULY 14, 2023

1 CLEANING OF CARS AND STATIONS AND CONTINUE TO DEPLOY ELEVATOR  
2 AND RESTROOM ATTENDANCE IN OUR DOWNTOWN STATIONS NEXT  
3 GENERATION FAR DAY PROGRAM WILL REPLACE MORE THAN 700 NEW FARE  
4 GATE SYSTEM RIDE OVER THE NEXT 30 MONTHS AND CONTINUING TO  
5 PARTNER WITH BOTH MTC AND OTHER BAY AREA OPERATORS IN OUR  
6 REGIONAL COORDINATION EFFORTS LASTLY CONTINUING OUR  
7 REHABILITATION EFFORTS WITH THE LAST TWO LARGEST BEING CORE  
8 CAPACITY PROGRAM & MEASURE RR AND INCLUDE. THAT CONCLUDES MY  
9 COMMENTS HAPPY TO TAKE QUESTIONS.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** ANY QUESTIONS?

12

13 **SPEAKER:** IS THERE ANY ANALYSIS ON INCREASING FARES INCREASE IN  
14 PARKING WHAT THAT MIGHT DO TO NEGATIVELY IMPACT RIDERSHIP?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** THERE WAS NO DIRECT RESEARCH ON HOW IT WOULD  
17 NEGATIVELY IMPACT RIDERSHIP BUT WE HAVE GOTTEN INTO OURSELVES  
18 OF A SPIRAL OF NOT DOING CPIS IN THE PAST AND BY THE TIME IT  
19 WAS ACCEPTABLE OR POLITICALLY AMENABLE TO DOING IT WE WERE  
20 BEHIND SO WE TOOK THE STEP TO IMPLEMENT THE PREPLAN PROGRAM  
21 CPI IN ORDER TO KEEP PACE WITH CURRENT INFLATION.

22

23 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. MISS PAPAN AND THEN MR. SPERING?

24



JULY 14, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. APPRECIATE ALL THE EFFORTS  
2 THAT ARE HAPPENING HERE AND YOU HAVE SAID YOU RELY HEAVILY ON  
3 RIDERSHIP, AND I HAVE SEEN SOME IMPROVEMENTS HERE. BUT IN THE  
4 OVERALL PERSPECTIVE HERE, BART HAS LOST, I DON'T KNOW, HOW  
5 MANY MILLIONS DUE TO FARE EVASIONS AND THAT SEEMS TO CONTINUE  
6 TO HAPPEN HERE, AND I THINK THERE IS ALSO A DIRECT CORRELATION  
7 TO THE FACT THAT OTHER PEOPLE DON'T FEEL SAFE ON BART, AND IF  
8 THERE IS A COMMITMENT HERE, AND YOU ARE EXPENDING YOUR  
9 1,600,062,020, WHAT EFFORTS HAVE BEEN MADE SINCE THEN? AND  
10 WHAT EFFORTS WILL BE TAKEN IN THE FUTURE TO -- BECAUSE YOU  
11 WILL GET INCREASED RIDERSHIP, BUT, AGAIN, THAT FARE  
12 INTEGRATION WE HAVE ALL SEEN FOREVER, IT SEEMS LIKE, IS LOST  
13 DOLLARS AND REALLY DOES NOT IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER SERVICE. SO  
14 IT'S A DEEP CONCERN FOR US, AS IS THE COMMENTS YOU MADE ABOUT  
15 IMPROVEMENTS JUST TO DOWNTOWN. THIS IS A SYSTEM-WIDE,  
16 THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA, AND SO MANY PEOPLE RELY ON YOUR  
17 SERVICES THAT DOWNTOWN DEFINITELY NEEDS IT. DON'T GET ME WRONG  
18 HERE, SO A LOT OF OTHER ASPECTS OF YOUR SYSTEMS.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** IF I MAY COMMENT, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. THE BOX ON  
21 SLIDE FOUR IN FRONT OF YOU, I BELIEVE I BRIEFLY MENTIONED IN  
22 MY TALKING POINTS -- WE REPLACED 700 FARE GATES IN OUR ENTIRE  
23 SYSTEM WENT NEXT TWO AND-A-HALF YEARS THAT WILL DIRECTLY  
24 BENEFIT DOWNTOWN AND ALSO MILLBRAE AND OTHER STATIONS.

25



JULY 14, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN:** I BELIEVE IT WILL BENEFIT YOUR ENTIRE SYSTEM. GOOD  
2 IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF YEARS?

3

4 **SPEAKER:** 2026.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. NICE TO HEAR.

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** WHAT IS THE LAST ESTIMATED ANNUAL LOSS.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THE LAST ESTIMATE OF BART STAFF -- I KNOW THERE ARE A  
11 LOT OF NUMBERS OUT THERE, BUT LAST NUMBERS ARE 15 MILLION.

12

13 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THAT'S GOOD RECOVERY IF YOU CAN GET THAT.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE. OUR INTERESTS ARE  
20 ALIGNED WE WANT TO SEE YOU GET RIDERS BACK. THE CHALLENGE IS  
21 SOME OF THE ASSUMPTIONS, THE BIG NUMBERS CREATES A DAUNTING  
22 PICTURE BUT IN TERMS OF THE ASSUMPTIONS YOU CAN SHARE HOW  
23 YOU'RE CALIBRATING SOME OF THE SHORTFALLS? THAT LEADS TO  
24 PRESSURE HOW WE'RE TRYING TO MAKE OUR POSITION ON GETTING  
25 RIDERS BACK. YOU CAN SHARE A LITTLE BIT ABOUT ASSUMPTIONS?



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. IT'S KIND OF HARD TO CALIBRATE A \$500  
3 MILLION SHORTFALL. OUR NUMBERS ARE TRANSPARENT. PRIOR TO 2019  
4 WE WERE CARRYING CLOSE TO OVER 400,000 AND THAT GENERATED 500  
5 MILLION IN REVENUE. RIGHT NOW WE'RE CARRYING 40% OF THAT  
6 TOTAL. YOU CAN'T REPLACE 1/3 OF YOUR BUDGET AND CALIBRATE IT  
7 IT'S JUST IMPOSSIBLE TO DO IT ESPECIALLY WHEN UPWARDS OF 60%  
8 OF YOUR COST ARE FIXED. FIXED GUIDEWAY, YOU HAVE TO MAINTAIN  
9 CARRYING ONE PASSENGER, OR 2000 PASSENGERS IN A RAIL CAR, YOU  
10 HAVE TO PAY MECHANICS, TRAIN OPERATORS, YOU HAVE TO PAY POLICE  
11 OFFICERS TO POLICE THE SYSTEM. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF THAT  
12 ANSWERS YOUR QUESTION. WE'RE WORKING AND OBVIOUSLY WE'RE GOING  
13 TO DO WHAT WE CAN TO SELF-HELP BUT IT'S PRETTY HARD TO  
14 CALIBRATE \$300 MILLION SHORTFALLS, 5, 6 YEARS INTO THE FUTURE.

15

16 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I APPRECIATE IT IT'S AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
17 PROVIDE THE RIGHT SET OF FACTS OUT THERE. THANK YOU FOR DOING  
18 THAT. ON THAT, THOUGH, I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE CONFIDENCE  
19 IN THE NUMBERS THAT YOU'RE PUTTING OUT THERE. BECAUSE WE'RE  
20 HAVING TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ON THE SAME TEAM FIGHTING FOR THE  
21 SAME DOLLAR, BUT WHEN NUMBERS CHANGE IT IMPACTS OUR  
22 CREDIBILITY AND WE HAVE MAKE SURE THE ASSUMPTIONS ARE WHAT  
23 THEY ARE, GOOD BAD AND DIFFERENT. IN TERMS OF THE OTHER SIZE  
24 MINIMIZING COST YOU CAN SHARE WHAT BART HAS DONE TO RESPOND TO  
25 THE CRISIS THAT WE'RE IN?



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** SURE. STARTING IN 2020 WHEN THE PANDEMIC FIRST HIT  
3 THE ENTIRE WORLD, OBVIOUSLY, WE IMMEDIATELY CUT 700 POSITIONS  
4 FROM THE BUDGET AND WE HAVEN'T REINSTITUTED THOSE POSITIONS.  
5 WE REDUCED OUR SERVICE LEVEL YOU WERE WARD TO 40% STILL  
6 STARTED CLOSING IT'S NINE INCLUDE RUNNING 30 MINUTE HEADWAYS  
7 THREE LINE SERVICE THROUGHOUT THE DAY LOADED MOST OF OUR  
8 OPERATING FOLKS OVER TO CAPITAL PROJECTS, AND ADVANCE PROJECTS  
9 BECAUSE ONE, [INDISCERNIBLE] AND TWO VIRTUALLY NO ONE IS  
10 RIDING THE SYSTEM. WE HAVE DONE ALL THOSE THINGS IN ADDITION  
11 TO A 300 PERSON VOLUNTARY INCENTIVE PROGRAM TO RETIRE THOSE  
12 FOLKS OUT. BUT AS SOON AS THAT PENDULUM SHIFTED AND THE BAY  
13 AREA STARTED TO REOPEN THE BAY AREA DEMAND BART REOPEN WITH IT  
14 SO WE HAD TO SHIFT THE PENDULUM THE OTHER WAY AND START  
15 REHIRING TRAIN OPERATORS, CONTROLLERS TO RUN THE TRAIN SYSTEM.  
16 RIGHT NOW OUR EFFORTS ARE TRYING TO MAINTAIN EXPENSES AND NOT  
17 EXCEED WHERE WE ARE. BUT WE DID MOST OF OUR CUTS AT THE  
18 BEGINNING AND THE MIDDLE. PANDEMIC.

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GOT IT. I ALSO THINK THIS IS OPPORTUNITY ON  
21 TO LEARN FROM THIS. I'M GOING TO ASK AS WE CONTINUE GOING  
22 FORWARD TRACKING WHAT DATA AND TRENDS ARE DIFFERENT. WAY WE  
23 FELL OFF THE HORSE IS NOT THE SAME WAY WE GET BACK ON. SOMEONE  
24 SAID THAT AND IT'S WISE IN THIS COMMISSION. TO ME THAT'S WHAT  
25 WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WE'RE PARTNERING ON THIS. WE'RE ALL



JULY 14, 2023

1 ROLLING UP OUR SLEEVES. I RIDE ON BART I HAD A GREAT  
2 EXPERIENCE. THERE ARE SAFETY ISSUES IT'S REAL NOT A PERCEPTION  
3 AND I SEE YOUR MAKING IMPROVEMENTS IT'S CRITICAL WE UNDERSTAND  
4 THE NUMBERS AND ASSUMPTIONS. WE AS POLICY MAKERS HAVE TO MAKE  
5 TOUGH DECISIONS I APPRECIATE YOU COMING BEFORE US TODAY TO  
6 ANSWER THESE QUESTIONS.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** WE CONTINUE TO BE TRANCE IMPORTANT WITH THE NUMBERS  
9 AND THE MPO. FOR SURE.

10

11 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU FOR WHAT YOU'RE DOING.

12

13 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY.

14

15 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YOU SAID SOMETHING PERSONALITY. WE'RE  
16 ALLS ON THE SAME TEAM BUT THERE ARE CERTAIN QUESTIONS THAT  
17 NEED TO BE ANSWERED. WE TALK ABOUT ACCOUNTABILITY. WE TALK  
18 ABOUT SAFETY, I MEAN, YOU'RE WORKING TOWARDS THAT. THAT'S  
19 GREAT. THE DATA PIECE, SEVERAL MEMBERS MENTIONED THIS, ARE THE  
20 DATA PIECE AND HOW WE DRIVE DECISIONS IS REALLY PERSONALITY.  
21 AS YOU KNOW, THERE ARE NUMEROUS OPERATORS, EVERYONE HAS  
22 DIFFERENTLY NEEDS, RIGHT. WHAT'S IMPORTANT FOR US IS REALLY,  
23 SORT OF, WORKING COLLECTIVELY TOGETHER SOLVING THESE ISSUES  
24 BUT AT THE SAME TIME TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHAT THE PUBLIC IS  
25 REALLY DEALING WITH, IS THE ISSUES AROUND SAFETY. THESE ARE --



JULY 14, 2023

1 YOU KNOW, THESE ARE OUR TAX DOLLARS MAKING SURE THEY'RE BEING  
2 SPENT WISELY. I THINK THIS HAS BEEN A ROBUST DISCUSSION ON  
3 THAT. MISS PAPAN?

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** ONE QUICK FOLLOW UP.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN:** CONCERNING YOUR SERVICE LEVELS AND AS WE COME  
10 BACK, PLEASE -- AND I'M NOT GOING TO ANALYZE EVERYTHING HERE --  
11 - BUT SAN FRANCISCO AIRPORT, 40,000 EMPLOYEES, AND THEIR  
12 RIDERSHIP IS COMING BACK I GUESS YOU WOULD CALL IT RIDERSHIP,  
13 BUT JUST CONSIDERATION TO MAKE HERE BECAUSE THOSE EMPLOYEES  
14 HAVE TO BE THERE AT ALL DIFFERENT HOURS. SO, IF YOU COULD,  
15 REALLY -- AS MOVE FORWARD HERE, MAKE CONSIDERABLE EFFORT TO  
16 LOOK AT THOSE BIG HUGE EMPLOYERS LIKE THE AIRPORT AND SOME  
17 OTHER AREAS HERE WHEN WE'RE PUTTING THE PIECES TOGETHER, THAT  
18 WOULD BE VERY, VERY HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** ABSOLUTELY. AND JUST TO BE CLEAR, COMMISSIONER WE'RE  
21 NOT CUTTING SERVICE. WE'RE BACK 292019 LEVELS AND WE'RE GOING  
22 TO SPREAD SERVICE IN SEPTEMBER THAT WILL ALLOW FOR ADDITIONAL  
23 HEADWAYS GOING INTO SFO.

24

25 **GINA PAPAN:** NOW YOUR CLOSING AT NINE.



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **SPEAKER:** BACK IN AUGUST 2020 WE RESTORED SYSTEM BACK TO PRE-  
3 PANDEMIC LEVELS.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN:** I DON'T WANT TO GET INTO DETAILS HERE. THANK YOU  
6 VERY MUCH.

7

8 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** WE HAVE A COUPLE MORE SPEAKERS. THANK YOU  
9 THERESA. WHO IS NEXT?

10

11 **THERESA ROMMELL:** MIKE HURSH.

12

13 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I'LL BE BRIEF. IS HAPPY TO BE HERE TODAY. I  
14 WANT TO COMMENDATION CHAIR SPERING FOR ALL THE WORKS ON THE  
15 BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE. COMMISSIONERS STOOD UP, AND I SHOUTED  
16 OUT AC TRANSIT RIDERSHIP I STARTED 1919 IT'S SAN FRANCISCO  
17 MUNI REPLACING THE TRAIN CONTROL SYSTEM I WAS CHIEF OPERATING  
18 OFFICER AT VTA. STRONGEST MESSAGE TODAY WHILE WE'RE GETTING  
19 PASSENGERS SAFELY TO DESTINATIONS HAVING WORKED AS SENIOR  
20 EXECUTIVE AT THREE AGENCIES THERE ARE IMPORTANT NUANCES. NO  
21 ONE AGENCY CITIZEN SAME NO FUNDING IS THE SAME. I'M HERE TO  
22 TALK ABOUT AC TRANSIT, BUT HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS I  
23 CAN, TO THE STATE OF TRANSPORTATION AND PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE  
24 BAY AREA. I ALSO WANT TO TALK ABOUT WHEN YOU HEAR \$300- AND  
25 \$400 HUNDRED MILLION DOLLARS DEFICITS, WE SHOULD BE TALKING



JULY 14, 2023

1 ABOUT PERCENTAGES. I'M VERY PROUD THAT OUR BUDGET HELD FLAT  
2 THIS YEAR. WE'RE AT ABOUT FIVE HUNDREDS \$50 MILLION,  
3 APPROACHING \$550 MILLION OPERATING BUDGET, INDUSTRY HUNDREDS  
4 EMPLOYEES, 650 BUSES WE NEGOTIATED ROLLOVER INCLUDING COST OF  
5 LIVING CONTRACTS WITH OUR TWO UNIONS BUT WERE ABLE TO KEEP  
6 BUDGET FLAT THIS YEAR BECAUSE WE HAVE DONE SO MANY COST  
7 CUTTING MEASURES. WITH THAT SAID AGAIN TALKING ABOUT COST  
8 PERCENTAGES WE'RE LOOKING AT \$133 MILLION DEFICIT. WE ARE  
9 GRATEFUL FOR THE FEDERAL FUNDING. AND WE'RE GRATEFUL FOR THE  
10 RECENT STATE BUDGET BUT THERE ARE SOME HIDDEN CONCERNS WE HAVE  
11 WITH THE STATE BUDGET I ADVOCATED IN SACRAMENTO TO MAKE THE  
12 ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS FUNDING AVAILABLE. HOWEVER, IN THE STATE OF  
13 CALIFORNIA EVERY INTERNAL COMBUSTION POWERED BUS OVER \$10,000  
14 OF THEM NEEDS TO BE REPLACED, REPLACED BY 20,040 WE'RE PROUD  
15 OF THAT WE'RE THE LEADERS ON THAT BUT SOLUTIONS COMING UP ARE  
16 A TEMPORARY BAND-AID. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT EFFICIENCIES, BUT I  
17 WANT TO REMIND WHEN WE WORKED ON FASTER, WE NEED A SUSTAINABLE  
18 ADDITIONAL REVENUE SOURCE FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT IN THE BAY AREA.  
19 WHAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT IS NOT POSSIBLE. WE'RE A BUS ONLY  
20 AGENCY WE DON'T HAVE LARGE CAPITAL PROJECTS. BUT COMMISSIONER  
21 SPERING, OUR RIDERSHIP LAST WEEK I LOOKED IT UP, ONE HUNDRED  
22 \$4,000, TYPICAL IN THE SUMMER TIME. WE CARRY OVER \$30,000  
23 STUDENTS, 65% OF OUR RIDERS ARE PEOPLE OF COLOR, 45% DON'T  
24 EVEN OWN AN AUTOMOBILE. IF WE CAN'T FIX THIS AS MUCH AS WE  
25 WANT TO BUILD A REGIONAL NETWORK -- AND WE CAN'T FIX PUBLIC



JULY 14, 2023

1 TRANSPORTATION AND I'M REPRESENTING NEEDS NEED AND CONTRA  
2 COSTA COUNTY, THE WORST MOST DISADVANTAGED SITUATION IN  
3 COMMUNITIES, MY COMMUNITIES, OUR COMMUNITIES ARE GOING TO BE  
4 WITHOUT A WAY TO GET TO JOBS, TO PHARMACY, TO SAFE TO SCHOOL.  
5 30,000 STUDENTS PRE-PANDEMIC. APPROACHING 15,000 BAYVIEW  
6 RIDERS ON THE BAY BRIDGE PRE-PANDEMIC; LESS THAN A THOUSAND  
7 RIGHT NOW. AND THAT WAS NO TRANSIT SERVICE. PARTICULARLY BUS  
8 SERVICE MAKES A PROFIT, BUT OUR BAY BRIDGE SERVICE WAS THE  
9 LEAST -- OR MAYBE THE LEAST LOSS SERVICE OF WE OPERATE AND  
10 IT'S VIRTUALLY DISAPPEARED. NEXT SLIDE. WE'RE DOING A LOT. I  
11 WON'T READ THIS SLIDE TO YOU, BUT WE HAVE ALMOST 16,000  
12 SURVEYS ALREADY COLLECTED OUT IN THE COMMUNITY. WE HAVE  
13 LAUNCHED A TWO YEAR EFFORT WHAT WE'RE CALLING REALIGN TO NOT  
14 ONLY TALK TO OUR RIDERS BUT TALK TO OUR RESIDENTS THOSE MAYBE  
15 THAT AREN'T RISING PUBLIC TRANSIT. WE HAVE ENGAGED WITH TEN  
16 COMMUNITY BASED ORGANIZATIONS TO REALLY GET OUT AND FIND OUT  
17 HOW TRAVEL PATTERNS ARE CHANGING WE HAVE CONTRACTED WITH  
18 STREET LIGHT WHICH IS A COMPANY THAT PROVIDES ANONYMIZED CELL  
19 PHONE DATA, SO WE CAN SEE WHAT TRAVEL PATTERNS ARE NOT ONLY IN  
20 OUR TRANSIT BUT WHAT PEOPLE ARE DOING IN AUTOMOBILES RIGHT  
21 NOW. WE DID NOT LAY OFF BUT WE STOPPED BUS OPERATOR HIRING.  
22 THE NUMBER ONE COMPLAINT ABOUT AC TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, I MAY  
23 HEAR FROM SOME MTC PAST EMPLOYEES WHO RIDE AC TRANSIT, SERVICE  
24 RELIABILITY. WE ARE OVER 120 OPERATORS SHORT. WE ARE OFFERING  
25 A \$2,000 HIRING BONUS. AC TRANSIT.ORG/CAREERS, LIVING WAGE



JULY 14, 2023

1 UNION JOBS. WE CANNOT HIRE FAST ENOUGH. IF YOU CAN HELP US  
2 FIND OPERATORS. I'M SPEAKING FOR AC TRANSIT BUT COMPETING WITH  
3 MY FRIEND TUMLIN AND COMPETING WITH TWO, THREE CTA TRANSIT,  
4 EVERY OPERATOR IN THE BAY AREA ARE STRUGGLING TO HIRE  
5 OPERATORS AS A RESULT WE'RE 65% RIDERSHIP, 85% SERVICE LEVELS  
6 COMPARED TO PRE-PANDEMIC. RELIABILITY HAS BEEN A CONCERN. WE  
7 HAVE IMPROVED SIGNIFICANTLY BUT THAT'S WHERE OUR MAJOR FOCUS  
8 IS COMBINED WITH THE TWO YEAR PLAN TO REDEPLOY OUR SERVICE FOR  
9 THOSE OF YOU WHO MIGHT DRIVE ON THE BRIDGE WE WOULD LOVE TO  
10 HAVE YOU ON OUR BRANDS NEW BUS, IN THE PICTURE TO THE RIGHT  
11 JUST DEPLOYED 37 STATE-OF-THE-ART, LOW FLOOR ENTRY AREA  
12 LOCATION FOR ADA PASSENGERS WITH MOBILE DEVICES TO GET RID OF  
13 OVER 20-YEAR-OLD OVER MCI OVER THE COACH BUSES. WE HAD A LOAD  
14 IN 15 YEAR CONTRACT WITH -- [INDISCERNIBLE] HE DIDN'T WANT TO  
15 DO IT ANYMORE. WE'RE USING A LOCAL DISADVANTAGED BUSINESS TO  
16 DO THE MAINTENANCE AND GRAFFITI REMOVAL AND FINDING A COMPANY  
17 THAT WILL DO ADVERTISING AND NOT WORRY ABOUT MAINTENANCE. WE  
18 INTEND TO USE THAT TO MAXIMIZE REVENUE ON OUR SHELTER PROGRAM.  
19 WE HAVE MORE THAN 4,500 STOPS, MORE THAN 600 SHELTERS IN OUR  
20 SERVICE AREAS. LASTLY, TALKING ABOUT CONVERSATIONS ON SAFETY  
21 WE HAVE AN INCREDIBLY SAFE NETWORK ON THE BUS. THIS IS NOT  
22 JUST ABOUT TRANSIT OPERATORS. WE ARE EARLY INE FRUSTRATED WITH  
23 THE ENVIRONMENT AROUND OUR BUS STOPS, THE SIDE SHOWS THAT  
24 HAPPEN IN COMMUNITIES, THE LACK OF SOCIAL SERVICES TO DEAL  
25 WITH HOMELESSNESS, THE UNHOUSED IN OUR SERVICE AREA. WE'RE



JULY 14, 2023

1 GOING TO HAVE TO DO THIS TOGETHER. I WOULD LOVE TO FUND OUR OR  
2 FIVE SOCIAL WORKERS TO BE ON MY SYSTEM BUT WHILE FACING A \$133  
3 MILLION DEFICIT I CANNOT AFFORD DO THAT. THIS IS MY LAST  
4 SLIDE. I'LL WRAP UP REAL QUICK. HAVING DONE THIS SINCE 1993 I  
5 FIND THIS TO BE THE MOST UNIQUE SITUATION ON POURING DOLLARS  
6 IN TO TRY TO HIRE OPERATORS AT THE SAME TIME DOING EVERYTHING  
7 -- WE ARE DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN TO BE AS EFFICIENT AS  
8 POSSIBLE WORKING WITH LABOR UNIONS LAST THING I'LL TOUCH ON  
9 SAFETY WE HAD WORKING WITH LABOR OPERATORS ON TRAINING. EVERY  
10 EMPLOYEE GOES THROUGH DEESCALATION TRAINING TO TEACH HOW TO  
11 DIFFUSE A SITUATION BEFORE IT TURNS INTO SOMETHING MORE. TWO  
12 OF OUR SINGLE LARGEST INDIVIDUAL CONTRACT ITEMS ARE CONTRACT  
13 WITH ALAMEDA AND CONTRA COSTA SHERIFF DEPARTMENT'S  
14 RESPECTIVELY. WE'RE NOT GOING TO POLICE OUR WAY OUT OF THIS.  
15 RIDING FARE ENFORCEMENT WRITING EVASION TICKETS TO OUR MOST  
16 DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY MEMBERS IS NOT GOING TO CHANGE  
17 BEHAVIOR WE'RE NOT GOING TO MAKE REVENUE FROM TICKETS THIS IS  
18 A SOCIAL SERVICES ISSUE WE NEED ALL OF THE COMMUNITY TO GET  
19 BEHIND. DON'T USE SIGHT IF WE DON'T FIND ADDITIONAL REVENUE IN  
20 2026, WE'RE GOING TO BE BACK HERE TALKING ABOUT REVENUE. I'M  
21 GRATEFUL TO BE HERE TODAY, AND I'LL HAND IT OVER TO MY  
22 COWORKER MR. JEFFREY TUMLIN. ATTENDEE. I'M SORRY. DOES ANYBODY  
23 HAVE ANY QUESTIONS? [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU, SIR. THANK YOU,  
24 CHAIR.  
25



JULY 14, 2023

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. I'M JEFFREY  
2 TUMLIN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF SFMTA. UNLIKE TRANSIT OPERATORS  
3 IN THE REGION WE ARE A CITY DEPARTMENT, AND WE ARE BOTH A  
4 DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION WE MANAGE ALL THE OF THE STREETS  
5 IN SAN FRANCISCO AND WE OPERATE MUNI WHICH CARRIES MORE THAN  
6 HALF OF ALL TRANSIT RIDERS IN THE NINE COUNTY BAY AREA. LIKE  
7 ALL OF THE OTHER OPERATORS WE HAVE BEEN HIT HARD FINANCIALLY  
8 BY THE PANDEMIC. WE'RE AN ENTERPRISE ORGANIZATION AND REQUIRED  
9 TO BE SELF-FUNDING. EVERY ONE OF OUR MAJOR SOURCES OF REVENUE  
10 WAS HIT HARD BY COVID. OUR TRANSIT FARE REVENUE IS DOWN ABOUT  
11 55%, OUR PARKING FEES AND FINES ARE DOWN ABOUT 15%, AND TO THE  
12 SAN FRANCISCO GENERAL FUNDS HAS BEEN HIT HARD BY SALES TAX AND  
13 BY NOW PROPERTY TAX LOSSES AS A RESULTS OF WHAT'S HAPPENING  
14 DOWNTOWN. WE KNEW AT THE BEGINNING OF THE PANDEMIC IMPACTS  
15 WERE GOING TO BE SIGNIFICANT AND LONG LASTING AND I MADE A  
16 PROMISE TO MY WORKFORCE THAT I WOULD NEVER BALANCE OUR AGENCY  
17 BUDGET ON THE BACKS OF THE PEOPLE WHO GOT SAN FRANCISCO  
18 THROUGH THE WORST OF THE PANDEMIC. AND, SO, WE IMMEDIATELY  
19 SLOWED HIRING AND STRANGE THE AGENCY BY A THOUSAND PEOPLE. WE  
20 LOST 20% OF OUR WORKFORCE OVER THE LAST THREE YEARS IN ORDER  
21 TO CONTROL EXPENSES. AND FOR ALL OUR FINANCIAL PLANNING WE  
22 MAINTAIN A GLIDE PATH THAT IF ADDITIONAL REVENUE DOESN'T COME  
23 THROUGH, WE CAN STOP HIRING AND SHRINK THROUGH ATTRITION,  
24 RATHER THAN HAVING TO SHRINK THROUGH LAYOFFS. NONETHELESS, IN  
25 ORDER TO BE ABLE TO CUT EXPENSES THROUGH THE SHRINKS OF THE



JULY 14, 2023

1 WORKFORCE, WE HAVE DRASTICALLY CUT SERVICE. SERVICE THAT HAS  
2 MADE IT IMPOSSIBLE FOR MANY VULNERABLE SAN FRANCISCANS TO BE  
3 ABLE TO ACCESS SCHOOL, OR WORK, OR SERVICES. WE HAVE ALSO BEEN  
4 WORKING HARD AT TRYING TO BRING IN NEW REVENUE SOURCES, BOTH  
5 TARGETING THE '26 BALLOT FOR REVENUE MEASURE BUT ALSO DOING  
6 VERY POLITICALLY UNPOPULAR THINGS LIKE PROPOSING PARKING METER  
7 ENFORCEMENT EVENINGS AND WEEKENDS THROUGH SAN FRANCISCO IN  
8 ORDER TO SAVE THREE MUNI LINES WHICH IS WHAT IT DOES.  
9 NONETHELESS, DESPITE ALL OF OUR EFFORTS IN SELF-HELP, IN ORDER  
10 TO AVOID DRASTIC SERVICE CUTS, THE END OF THE NEXT CALENDAR  
11 YEAR WE DO NEED TO IDENTIFY ADDITIONAL STATE OR REGIONAL  
12 SOURCES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. IN THE MEANTIME, SINCE THE  
13 BEGINNING OF COVID, WE HAVE BEEN DOING EVERYTHING THAT WE CAN  
14 TO MAKE MUNI FAST, FREQUENT, RELIABLE, CLEAN, AND SAFE DESPITE  
15 THE DRASTIC SERVICE CUTS AND STAFFING SHORTAGES THAT HAVE  
16 RESULTED FROM THE CHANGES THAT WE HAVE NEEDED TO MAKE.  
17 COUNTERS RIDERSHIP SHOWS US AT ABOUT 423,000 RIDERS PER DAY,  
18 THAT'S ABOUT 62% OF OUR AVERAGE RIDERSHIP RECOVERY BUT WELL  
19 OVER 75% WEEKEND AND MIDDAY RIDERSHIP RECOVERY. IN THE CITY,  
20 IN THE COUNTRY THAT HAS THE SLOWEST RATE OF RETURN TO OFFICE,  
21 MUNI IS ALSO ENJOYING THE HIGHEST RIDERSHIP GROWTH OF ANY  
22 AGENCY THAT WE CAN FIND IN THE COUNTRY BECAUSE OF INVESTMENTS  
23 THAT WE HAVE MADE. WE HAD 21 MILES OF NEW TRANSIT ONLY LAND  
24 ACROSS SAN FRANCISCO WE HAVE MADE RADICAL INVESTMENTS IN SPEED  
25 AND RELIABILITY WE HAVE REROUTED LINES AND INVESTED IN THE NEW



JULY 14, 2023

1 TRAVEL DEMAND PATTERNS. WE'RE AT 20,000% OF WEEKDAY PRECOVID  
2 RIDERSHIP RECOVERY AND 130% ON WEEKENDS. 22 FILLMORE RECRUITED  
3 TO BETTER SERVE HOSPITALS AND ESSENTIAL WORKERS WE'RE AT 106  
4 OF WEEKDAY AND ONE HUNDREDS 50% OF RIDERSHIP RECOVERY ON  
5 WEEKENDS. WE KNOW HOW TO BRING TRANSIT RIDERS BACK. WE ALSO  
6 KNEW DURING THE PANDEMIC THAT THE WORST THING THAT WE COULD DO  
7 IS DEFER MAINTENANCE IN ORDER TO SUSTAIN OPERATIONS. WE  
8 DOUBLED DOWN ON MAINTENANCE THROUGH FIX IT WEEKS THAT HAPPEN  
9 EVERY QUARTER NOW, WE HAVE BEEN ABLE TO REDUCE SIGNIFICANT  
10 DELAYS IN THE SUBWAY BY OVER 60%. WE HAVE ALSO CONTINUE TO  
11 INVEST IN CUSTOMER INFORMATION WE KNOW THE SYSTEM IS CHANGING  
12 A LOT AND OUR CUSTOMERS NEED REAL INFORMATION ABOUT WHEN THE  
13 NEXT BUS IS COMING OR HOW THE ROUTES HAVE BEEN RESTRUCTURED WE  
14 HAVE CONTINUED TO INVEST IN A BETTER CUSTOMER INFORMATION  
15 INCLUDING CLEAR SIGNAGE IN OUR SHELTERS. WE ALSO HEAR FROM  
16 CUSTOMERS AGAIN THAT CLEANLINESS IS SUPER IMPORTANT WE HAVE  
17 INCREASED SHELTER MAINTENANCE BY 50% AND MAINTAINED OUR COVID  
18 ERA LEVEL OF CLEANING AND REARRANGE IT IN ORDER TO ADDRESS  
19 REALITIES THAT RIDERS CARES ABOUT AND FINALLY CONCERNS ABOUT  
20 SAFETY. WE KNOW FROM OUR DATA REPORT THAT CRIME ON MUNI IS  
21 HALF OF WHAT IT WAS PRECOVID AND LESS THAN A QUART OF WHAT IT  
22 WAS TEN YEARS AGO BOTH IN REAL NUMBERS AND IN THE RATE  
23 THRESHOLD I ENCOURAGE YOU TO LOOK AT OUR DATA BY GOING TO  
24 SFMTA.COM AND SAFETY DATA. SAN FRANCISCO IS EXPERIENCING  
25 INCREASE IN UNTREATED MENTAL HEALTH AND ADDICTION ISSUES ON



JULY 14, 2023

1 OUR STREETS. THIS IS A SIGNIFICANT CONCERN. IT'S ACTUALLY WHAT  
2 WE USUAL OUR PASSENGERS ARE COMPLAINING ABOUT WHEN THEY SAY  
3 SAFETY THAT NEEDS A SPECIAL APPROACH ONE WE'RE PARTNERING WITH  
4 OTHER SAN FRANCISCO AGENCIES IN ORDER TO MAKE SURE PEOPLE WHO  
5 ARE FACING THOSE MENTAL HEALTH AND ADDICTION ISSUES ARE  
6 DIRECTED INTO TREATMENT AND NOT USING MUNI BUSES AS THEIR  
7 SHELTERS WE HAVE STAFFED UP OUR MUNI TRANSIT AMBASSADORS. OUR  
8 SECURITY TEAM REVIEWING OUR VIDEO FOOTAGE AND TAKING ADVANTAGE  
9 THAT THERE ARE 11 CAMERAS ON EVERY VEHICLE AND IN EVERY  
10 STATION IN ORDER IT MAKE SURE THAT WHEN A CRIME DOES OCCUR ON  
11 MUNI THAT THOSE PERPETRATORS ARE HELD ACCOUNTABLE. THERE ARE  
12 FOUR THINGS THAT ARE NECESSARY IN ORDER TO BRING TRANSIT  
13 RIDERSHIP BACK, NOT ONLY TO WHERE IT WAS PRECOVID BUT WE  
14 BELIEVE EVEN HIGHER THAN IT WAS PRECOVID. ONE IS GETTING  
15 SERIOUS ABOUT UNTREATED MENTAL HEALTH AND ADDICTION ISSUES IN  
16 OUR STREETS. TWO IS KNOWING THAT DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO WILL  
17 COME BACK BUT IT NEEDS TO BE SUPPORTED IN REDUCING COMMERCIAL  
18 RENTS WHICH WE'RE ALREADY STARTING TO SEE. THERE HAVE BEEN,  
19 EVERY 15 YEARS, HEADLINES IN THE PAPER THAT DOWNSTAIRS SAN  
20 FRANCISCO IS COMPLETELY DEAD. THIS IS YET ANOTHER ONE OF SAN  
21 FRANCISCO'S BOOM, BUST CYCLES AND THE FIRST SIGN OF THE  
22 BEGINNING OF A BOON CYCLE IS THE 60 TO 80% DROP IN COMMERCIAL  
23 RENTS THAT WE'RE FINALLY STARTING TO SEE. WE NEED TO WORK  
24 TOGETHER TO MAKE TRANSIT FAST, FREQUENT, AND RELIABLE. AND,  
25 FINALLY, WE NEED BRIDGE FUNDING IN ORDER TO GET US THROUGH NOW



JULY 14, 2023

1 TO 2028 WHEN WE THINK THINGS WILL BE RECOVERED. THANK YOU SO  
2 MUCH. QUESTIONS?

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

5

6 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU BOTH MIKE AND JEFF FOR ACKNOWLEDGE  
7 AND I APPRECIATE BEING ABLE TO CALL ON YOU WHEN WE HAVE SOME  
8 QUESTIONS. SO, LOOK, AGAIN, THE SAME MESSAGE, WE'RE ALL IN  
9 THIS TOGETHER. TELL ME MORE ABOUT LOOKING FORWARD, RIGHT,  
10 LOOKING AT 2025, 2026. BECAUSE WE LIVE IN THE MOMENT OF NOW.  
11 AND WE KNOW THE CERTAINTY NOW BUT WE'RE TRYING TO PLAN FOR THE  
12 FUTURE AND WANTING FUNDING FOR THE FUTURE. SO, JUST HELP US  
13 UNDERSTANDS THE NEED TO HAVE PREDICTABILITY NEW FOR DECISIONS  
14 THAT MIGHT NEED TO BE MADE.

15

16 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** FOR THAT QUESTION. THIS IS A QUESTION THAT'S  
17 VERY -- THAT I ACTUALLY GET RATHER EMOTIONAL ABOUT BECAUSE OF  
18 MY ATTACHMENT TO OUR WORKFORCE. WE COULD CONTINUE SUSTAINING  
19 OUR CURRENT SERVICE AND ROLL THE DICE ON SOME MAJOR NEW  
20 REVENUE MEASURE IN 2026 AND HOPE FOR THE BEST. BUT IF THAT  
21 FAILS, I ENDS UP HAVING TO LAY OFF A HUGE PERCENTAGE OF MY  
22 WORKFORCE AND I DON'T WANT TO DO THAT. ALL OF US DO AT LEAST 3  
23 TO 5 YEARS OF FINANCIAL PLANNING AND WE DO SCENARIO PLANNING  
24 AND I NEED TO MAKE SURE -- OR AT LEAST I HAVE MADE A  
25 COMMITMENT TO MAKING SURE THAT I CAN SHRINK THE AGENCY THROUGH



JULY 14, 2023

1 ATTRITION IN ORDER TO BALANCE OUR BUDGET IN THE OUTER YEARS  
2 RATHER THAN THROUGH LAYOUTS BUT THAT'S GOING TO TAKE ME A  
3 COUPLE OF YEARS. WHAT WE NEED NOW IN ORDER TO SUSTAIN OUR  
4 CURRENT LEVEL OF SERVICE LET ALONE GROW IS SOME GREATER  
5 ASSURANCE THAT MONEY IS GOING TO BE THERE TO FILL THE GAP IN  
6 PARTICULARLY '25. THIS THE STATE MONEY THAT CAME THROUGH TWO  
7 WEEKS AGO, THAT HAS ALLOWED ME TO NOT HAVE TO CUT MUNI SERVICE  
8 IN THIS CALENDAR YEAR, BUT IT'S NOT ENOUGH TO AVOID MUNI  
9 SERVICE CUTS IN THE NEXT CALENDAR YEAR UNLESS THERE IS  
10 SOMETHING THERE IN '25 IN ORDER TO BACKSTOP IT.

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND I APPRECIATE THAT RESPONSE. RIGHT? AND I  
13 APPRECIATE YOUR COMMITMENT TO YOUR WORKFORCE. WE SHOULD ALL  
14 HAVE THAT. WE NEED TO UNDERSTANDS HOW EACH DAY PROGRESSES WE  
15 THAN WE'RE SICK, BUT DON'T KNOW THE MEDICINE WE NEED TO TAKE  
16 JUST YET. I'M ASKING FOR US TO UNDERSTAND AS WE'RE NOT GOING  
17 TO LET TRANSIT FAIL. THAT'S NOT ON THE TABLE FOR ME. WE NEED  
18 TO TALK ABOUT ASSURANCES THAT YOU NEED IN A WAY THAT ALLOWS US  
19 TO PLAN NOW. BEING ABLE TO UNDERSTAND THE PRESSURE POINTS. I  
20 APPRECIATE YOU ALL BEING CANDID WITH THAT, BUT WE HAVE TOUGH  
21 DECISIONS TO MAKE JUST LIKE I SHARED YOUR WORKFORCE WE'RE  
22 TRYING TO GRAPPLE WHAT IS IT GOING TO HURT AND WHERE IS IT  
23 GOING TO HURT. WE'RE ALL IN THIS WE JUST HAVE TO FIGURE OUT  
24 THAT. THE OTHER POINT YOU MENTIONED IS SOME OF THE SOCIAL  
25 ISSUES WE'RE GRAPPLING WITH THAT ARE NOT WITHIN OUR WHEELHOUSE



JULY 14, 2023

1 WE DON'T HAVE AUTHORITY OVER SOME OF THE THINGS THAT YOU  
2 MENTIONED BUT THAT IMPACT WHAT WE DO. THAT'S A DIFFERENT  
3 PARADIGM WE HAVE TO THINK ABOUT ON HOW DO WE ADDRESS THAT IN  
4 TERMS OF HOMELESSNESS AND MENTAL HEALTH. I THINK SAN FRANCISCO  
5 IS GOING TO COME BACK. BUT THERE'S NOT MUCH WE CAN DO IN THAT  
6 SPACE IN TERMS OF COMMERCIAL REAL ESTATE. BUT FOLKS ARE GOING  
7 TO HAVE TO LEAN INTO THAT. APPRECIATE YOUR COMMITMENT.

8

9 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I APPRECIATE YOUR ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF THAT. IT'S  
10 ONE OF THE REASONS I BROUGHT UP MENTAL HEALTH AND ADDICTION  
11 ISSUE UP TO ALL OF YOU BECAUSE IT'S AN AREA THAT TRANSIT  
12 AGENCIES CAN'T SOLVE FOR BUT A POLITICAL CONSENSUS HERE IN THE  
13 BAY AREA ABOUT THE DIFFICULT CHALLENGES WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO  
14 FACE IN ORDER TO ACTUALLY ADDRESS NOT JUST HOMELESS BUT  
15 PARTICULARLY ADDICTION AND MENTAL HEALTH ISSUES ON THE STREETS  
16 THOSE ARE CHALLENGING ISSUES AND IT'S GOING REQUIRE CONSENSUS  
17 TO BE ABLE TO ADDRESS THAT EFFECTIVELY AND WITH COMPASSION.

18

19 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I APPRECIATE THAT I'M NOT INTERESTED IN  
20 CREATING ANOTHER COMMITTEE LOOKING AT ANDY. THERE ARE CERTAIN  
21 THINGS WE PARTNER ON AND SUPPORT ON, AND I THINK THIS IS  
22 SOMETHING WE MIGHT WANT TO LOOK AT WHAT OTHER AGENCIES WE NEED  
23 TO COLLABORATE TO SUPPORT THEM UNDERSTANDING DOWNSTREAM IMPACT  
24 IT'S CREATING ON US BUT WERE SEE VITAL TO THE REGION. IT'S A



JULY 14, 2023

1 DIFFERENCE PARADIGM DIFFERENT OF THINKING ABOUT IT, I HEAR YOU  
2 AND WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE FOLLOWING UP ON. THANK YOU.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER AHN AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

5

6 **EDDIE AHN:** I APPRECIATE YOU AND ALL OF YOUR EFFORTS DIRECTOR  
7 TUMLIN ON THE PARKING METERS AND EXTENSION EFFORTS. I'M  
8 PERSONALLY NOT A FAN ACTUALLY AND EVEN FELLOW COMMISSIONERS  
9 YOU MIGHT REMEMBER THE FIRE STORM OF COST VERSING ENSUING FROM  
10 THE PROPOSITIONS WE NEED DON'T NEED TO REHASH THE ENTIRE  
11 DEBATE BUT THE LARGER STRUGGLES WE'RE FACING, THE \$18.5  
12 MILLION, AND REVENUE TICKET PENALTIES COMBINED REVENUE I'M  
13 WONDERING, TWO QUESTIONS STEMMING OFF OF IT, WHAT IS THE  
14 CURRENT STATUS OF IT AND WHAT IS YOUR GENERAL VIEWPOINT. ARE  
15 CUTS IMPORTANT TO FACE A DEFICIT WHEN WE'RE FACING AT SFMTA  
16 HUNDREDS OF MILLIONS OF DOLLARS YEAR TO YEAR, ARE CUTS MORE  
17 IMPORTANT OR INCREASE SAID FUNDING IN THE FORM OF DIVERSIFIED  
18 MODEL MORE IMPORTANT?

19

20 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** WITH REGARDS TO THE PARKING METERS WE'RE  
21 WAITING FOR THE SAN FRANCISCO CONTROLLERS OFFICE TO CONDUCT AN  
22 ECONOMIC IMPACT ANALYSIS ON THE PARKING METER PROPOSAL. WE  
23 KNOW FROM NATIONAL DATA AS WELL AS OUR OWN DATA IN SAN  
24 FRANCISCO THAT ESTABLISHING A PARKING METER RATE AT LOWEST  
25 RATE THAT CREATES ONE OR TWO PARKING SPACES TO BE AVAILABLE AT



JULY 14, 2023

1 ALL TIMES THAT'S THE OPTIMAL RATE FOR SMALL BUSINESS SUCCESS.  
2 IF YOU CHARGE MORE THAN THAT, YOU HAVE TOO MANY EMPTY PARKING  
3 SPACES YOU DRIVE CUSTOMERS AWAY. IF YOU CHARGE LESS THAN THAT,  
4 CUSTOMERS CAN'T FIND A PARKING SPACE AND YOU DRIVE CUSTOMERS  
5 AWAY. SO PARKING IS ALWAYS AN OPTIMIZATION GAME AND OUR JOB IS  
6 FIRST AND FOREMOST TO SUPPORT THE ECONOMIC RECOVERY OF SAN  
7 FRANCISCO AND ARE PARTICULARLY OF SMALL BUSINESSES. BECAUSE WE  
8 MAKE MORE MONEY OFF OF THAT AND THE CITY GENERAL FUNDS THAN WE  
9 EVER WOULD OFF PARKING METERS. SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO THE  
10 ECONOMIC IMPACT ANALYSIS TO DETERMINE WHETHER IN FACT THE  
11 NATIONAL AND OUR LOCAL ASSUMPTIONS ARE TRUE. SECOND THING I  
12 WOULD SAY IS WITH REGARD TO THE DECISIONS ABOUT CUTS VERSUS  
13 NEW REVENUE, WE ARE VERY CONSCIOUS OF THE TRANSIT DEATH  
14 SPIRAL, WHEREBY IF YOU START CUTTING FREQUENCY TO THE POINT  
15 WHERE TRANSIT IS NO LONGER CONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE WHO HAVE A  
16 CHOICE OF MODES, THEN PEOPLE CHOOSE ANOTHER MODE AND YOU START  
17 LOSING REVENUE AND THAT REQUIRES ADDITIONAL SERVICE CUTS AND  
18 ADDITIONAL REVENUE LOSS AND ADDITIONAL SERVICE CUTS. SO, WE  
19 TOOK A VERY STRONG STANCE DURING COVID TO NOT CUT FREQUENCY,  
20 BUT RATHER TO CUT ENTIRE LINES. WHICH ALSO HAS A DEVASTATING  
21 IMPACT, PARTICULARLY ON PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES OR PEOPLE WHO  
22 HAVE LIMITED ABILITY TO WALK LONG DISTANCES IN ORDER TO ACCESS  
23 THEIR BUS STOP. BUT THE CHOICE BETWEEN DEATH SPIRAL VERSUS  
24 HAVING TO WALK TWO MORE BLOCKS TO THE BUS STOP WAS A VERY  
25 PAINFUL CHOICE THAT WE MADE, BUT ONE THAT WE HAD TO MAKE AND



JULY 14, 2023

1 WOULD LIKELY BE PRESSURED INTO MAKING SIMILAR CHOICES IF,  
2 INDEED, WE NEED TO START CUTTING SERVICE AGAIN IN '25 OR IN  
3 '26.

4

5 **EDDIE AHN:** AND, GENERALLY, I HOPE IT'S CLEAR I'M ALSO  
6 SYMPATHETIC TO THE HARD PUBLIC POLICY CHOICES YOU'RE MAKING  
7 IT'S SFMTA AND OBVIOUSLY IT'S NOT ONE OR THE OTHER PROBABLY  
8 BOTH.

9

10 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** THERE IS NO SILVER BULLET HERE IN ORDER TO  
11 CLOSE THE GAP WE NEED TO MAXIMIZE THE NUMBER OF SOURCES OF  
12 REVENUE AND WE NEED TO ASSUME THAT EVERYTHING IS ON THE TABLE  
13 UNTIL WE ARE FORCED TO TAKE THINGS OFF THE TABLE.

14

15 **MICHAEL HURSH:** MIKE HURSH, GENERAL MANAGER AC TRANSIT ON THIS  
16 QUESTION OF CUT VERSUS FUNDING. I WANTS TO REPRESENT OR SPEAK  
17 UP FOR MY SMALL TRANSIT OPERATORS AND EVEN FOR MYSELF WHETHER  
18 WE HAVE A LARGE SYSTEM OAR SMALLER SYSTEM WITH LESS PLACES TO  
19 CUT. CUT IS NOT AN OPTION. WE'RE AT A POINT NOW WHERE WE  
20 BECOME IRRELEVANT. JUST PARTICULARLY IN SMALL AND MEDIUM  
21 SIZES, IF WE CUT FURTHER EVERYBODY GOES TO THE CAR AND WE DIE.  
22 SO, AS YOUR ASSIGNMENTS HERE IN POSITION THE IMPACT OF LARGE  
23 AND SMALLER OPERATORS, WHO PROVIDE SUCH A CRITICAL SERVICE.  
24 THANK YOU.

25



JULY 14, 2023

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** LET ME ASK YOU A QUESTION YOU MENTIONED  
2 SOMETHING TO THE SHORTAGE OF OPERATORS. WHO OWNS THAT IT'S NOT  
3 JUST YOUR PROBLEM YOU OUTLINED EVERYONE IS FACING THIS ISSUE,  
4 A LOT OF FOLKS ARE FACING THIS ISSUE. IT'S IMPACTING OUR  
5 CURRENT SITUATION. WHAT CAN WE DO TO SUPPORT --

6

7 **MICHAEL HURSH:** OUR YOUNGER GENERATION IS FAILING OUR OLDER  
8 GENERATION.

9

10 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I'M NOT SURPRISED, ACTUALLY.

11

12 **MICHAEL HURSH:** WE'RE COMPETING WITH THE AMAZON AND UNIVERSITY  
13 GIG WORKERS THEY CAN GET A JOB TOMORROW NO BACKGROUND CHECK  
14 NOR DRUG TESTING THEY CAN GET AN EQUIVALENT PAYCHECK WHAT THEY  
15 DON'T REALIZE IS WHEN THEY HAVE A FAMILY AND GET TO THE BIG  
16 50'S HE DIDN'T HAVE A RETIREMENT OR BENEFITS PACKAGE WE ADDED  
17 A WEEK TO OUR OPERATOR TRAIN THAT'S NOT ABOUT BUS DRIVING.

18 WE'RE DOING A SOCIAL NEEDS ASSESSMENT. WE'RE GIVING A  
19 FINANCIAL 101 EXPLAINING ABOUT THE BENEFITS. THE OTHER THING  
20 WE NEED TO DO -- THE QUESTION IS WHO OWNS IT -- WE ALL OWN IT.

21 BUT AS LEADERS IN OUR COMMUNITIES IF WE CAN EDUCATE THE  
22 CANDIDATES ABOUT THE BENEFITS OF PUBLIC SERVICE YOU CAN GO  
23 WORK FOR A FORGOTTEN 100 AND CHASE THE BUCK BUT WHEN YOU FIND  
24 OUTS THROUGH YOUR CAREER THE STUDENTS THAT WE SERVE THE  
25 ELDERLY DISABLED POPULATION I HAVE A 24-YEAR-OLD SON WHO MADE



JULY 14, 2023

1 THE CONNECTION HE WANTS TO BE A PUBLIC SERVANTS. I KNOW WE'RE  
2 CONCERNED ABOUT WAGES BUT IN PUBLIC SERVICE THAT'S NOT A WHOLE  
3 LOT WE CAN DO OTHER THAN HAVING A LIVING WAGE WITH UNION  
4 REPRESENTATION WHAT WE HAVE TO DO IS NOT COMPETE AGAINST EACH  
5 OTHER. I CAN'T GIVE MY OPERATORS A DOLLAR RAISE AND THEN HAVE  
6 MICHELLE AT CALTRAIN OR JEFF OUGHT MUNI DOING THE SAME THING  
7 WE HAVE TO TRY TO BE TOGETHER IN THAT RESPECT WE NEED TO WORK  
8 WITH COMMUNITY COLLEGES AND HIGH SCHOOLS TO EDUCATE THE FOLKS.  
9 WE TRADITIONALLY HIRED FROM THE MILITARY BEFORE THE GIG  
10 ECONOMY THAT RULE HAS CHANGED WE NEED TO EDUCATE THE YOUNGER  
11 FOLKS ABOUT HOW VITAL AND HOW CAREER WAGE LIVING THESE JOBS  
12 ARE.

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** I APPRECIATE THAT AND I'M NOT PULLING AWAY  
15 FROM THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH BUT BOTH OF YOU  
16 HAVE OUTLINED OTHER FACTORS IMPACT BEYOND THE FISCAL CLIFF IN  
17 THE SENSE OF DOLLARS. I THINK TO RESTORE I'M NOT SURE WE WHAT  
18 WE CAN DO ABOUT IT BUT IT'S SOMETHING THAT HAS TO BE  
19 ADDRESSED.

20

21 **MICHAEL HURSH:** I'LL REMIND EVERYONE WHERE WE WERE SIX WEEKS  
22 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC THE PROBLEMS HAVEN'T GOTTEN AWAY. I HAVE  
23 TO CONFESS, I HAD TO DRIVE TODAY AND I FOLLOWED 3 AC TRANSIT  
24 BUSES THAT WERE STUCK IN TRAFFIC THE BRIDGE. YES, THERE WAS AN  
25 INCIDENT, CONGESTION ON THE BRIDGE, CLIMATE CHANGE THAT NEED



JULY 14, 2023

1 TO SHIFT TO ZERO-EMISSIONS BUSES, GETTING PEOPLE OUT OF THEIR  
2 CARS ON TO PUBLIC TRANSIT. ALL OF THAT'S STILL THERE. WE JUST  
3 HAD A LITTLE PANDEMIC DELAY. BUT WE'RE ALL GOING TO BE BACK  
4 THERE HERE IN THE NEXT 18 TO 24 MONTHS. THANK YOU.

5

6 **CHAIR DAVID CANEPA:** WOULD YOU LIKE TO SAY SOMETHING.

7

8 **BILL CHURCHILL:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS BILL CHURCHILL, I AM THE  
9 GENERAL MANAGER OF COUNTY CONNECTION, AND I DO REPRESENT ALL  
10 19 SMALL OPERATORS WITHIN THE LARGER BAY AREA. AND WHAT I  
11 REALLY WANTED TO PIGGYBACK ON A LITTLE BIT WAS THE QUESTION  
12 ABOUT DO WE CUT OR DO WE FIND FUNDING. AND WHERE IS THAT  
13 BALANCE. ONE THING THAT MR. TUMLIN POINTED OUT IS THERE IS A  
14 BOOM AND BUST CYCLE THAT SEEMS TO BE PLAGUING SAN FRANCISCO.  
15 IT GOES BACK FOR DECADES. WE KNOW WE'RE AT THE BOTTOM. WE KNOW  
16 THAT THERE IS GOING TO BE RECOVERY COMING. IF PUBLIC TRANSIT  
17 IS NOT THERE TO PROVIDE THE BASE SERVICE TO MOVE PEOPLE TO  
18 THOSE JOBS, THEN THAT ECONOMIC RECOVERY IS GOING TO TAKE  
19 LONGER TO ACTUALLY HAPPEN. WHAT A LOT OF PEOPLE SEEM TO NOT  
20 UNDERSTAND IS HOW PROFOUNDLY PUBLIC TRANSIT ACTUALLY PROVIDES  
21 SUPPORT TO AN ECONOMIC BOOM. WITHOUT PUBLIC TRANSIT, YOU CAN'T  
22 HAVE THE ECONOMICS. AND I JUST WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT  
23 CONNECTION IS MADE IN ALL OF OUR MINDS AS WE THINK ABOUT HOW  
24 WE FUNDS PUBLIC TRANSIT, WHAT WE DO WITH IT, HOW WE LOOK FOR  
25 FUTURE FUNDING TO MAINTAIN THE EXISTING SERVICES AND/OR GROW



JULY 14, 2023

1 THE SERVICES THAT WE CURRENTLY PROVIDE. SO, I JUST WANTED TO  
2 ADD THAT LITTLE BIT OF A NUANCE AND IF THERE IS ANY QUESTIONS  
3 I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER.

4

5 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS  
6 FOR MR. CHURCHILL?

7

8 **MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU.

9

10 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. AND EVERYBODY YOU'RE ALL RELATIVE.  
13 THAT'S WHY WE'RE ALL HERE. ON THE SAN FRANCISCO PARKING, WHEN  
14 PEOPLE SCRATCH OFF THE INFORMATION SOME OF US ENDS UP WITH  
15 TICKETS THAT DIDN'T DESERVE THEM IF YOU DON'T KNOW WHAT THE  
16 HOURS OF OPERATION ARE SO WHEN YOU ARE DOING YOUR SYSTEM WIDE  
17 THING TAKE A LOOK AT EMBARCADERO WHERE ALL OF THE INFORMATION  
18 HAS BEEN REMOVED. FOR THOSE VISITING THE CITY TO NOTE WE ARE  
19 ALL DEALING WITH THESE SOCIAL ISSUES AND TRANSPORTATION TENDS  
20 TO EXASPERATE THAT IN CERTAIN JURISDICTIONS. BUT IT IS A TEAM  
21 EFFORT HERE AND SOMETHING WE ALL TAKE VERY SERIOUSLY. MY  
22 COMMENT IS WE'RE GOING BACK AND FORTH HERE, AND YOU TALK ABOUT  
23 DEATH SPIRAL, YOU NEED TO TALK ABOUT BURNOUT TOO. BECAUSE  
24 FUNDING, FUNDING, FUNDING, AND WE GET THAT, AND WE DO NOT WANT  
25 ANYBODY TO FAIL, BUT THEN WE ALSO HAVE TO JUMP TO SOMETHING



JULY 14, 2023

1 NOBODY HERE IS GOING TO GIVE UP, WHICH IS A REVENUE BOND. SO,  
2 WHAT THE PUBLIC AND THE LEGISLATURE, I THINK, ARE DEEPLY  
3 CONCERNED DID IS WHAT I THINK MTC IS TRYING TO DO HERE,  
4 STANDARDIZING, SO WE KNOW ABOUT THE FUTURE HERE. WE CANNOT  
5 JUST KEEP GOING. WE NEED MONEY, WE NEED MONEY, WE NEED MONEY.  
6 AND I'M REALLY EXCITED TO SEE IMPROVEMENTS HAPPENING HERE. AND  
7 THE EFFORTS TO BRING PEOPLE BACK HERE BUT WE DO NEED, I THINK,  
8 AN OVERALL PLAN, BECAUSE YOU HAVE ALL IDENTIFIED WHERE YOU ARE  
9 AND WHEN THE CLIFF ACTUALLY HAPPENS HERE AND YET THERE IS  
10 STILL WE ALL NEED MORE RIGHT NOW. WE ALL HAVE TO PROVE TO THE  
11 PUBLIC IT'S GOING TO GET BETTER, YOU'RE GOING TO WANT TO TAKE  
12 TRANSIT ALL OF THAT STUFF, YOU HAVE THROWN IN A REVENUE BOND  
13 AND THE BIG PLAN HAS TOOK ONE SOLUTION HERE INSTEAD OF  
14 PIECEMEALING AND GOING BACK AND FORTH HERE I DON'T HAVE THE  
15 ANSWER TO THAT BUT LET'S COME TOGETHER AND TRY TO FIGURE OUT  
16 SO THAT WE'RE NOT GIVING THE IMPRESSION THAT IT'S NEVER GOING  
17 TO GET FIXED AND IT'S NEVER GOING TO WORK. I HOPE THAT MAKES  
18 SENSE.

19

20 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** RABBITT?

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE TODAY. I APPRECIATE AS  
23 A NATIVE SAN FRANCISCO AN, THE CITY WILL BOUNCE BACK, AND THE  
24 WRENCH IS THE WHOLE IDEA OF REMOTE WORK IT'S GOING TO BE THE  
25 BIG UNKNOWN, WHATEVER THE VACANCY RATE IS AROUND HERE IN THE



JULY 14, 2023

1 NEIGHBORHOOD WHETHER 29% OR 71% OF OFFICE SPACE THAT DOES NOT  
2 HAVE FULL OCCUPANCY EACH AND EVERY DAY I THINK WE ALL KNOW  
3 THAT'S HERE TO STAY. AROUND THE COUNTRY AND NEGOTIATIONS WITH  
4 OUR LABOR FORCE THAT'S NOW BECOME A BENEFIT FOR LACK OF A  
5 BETTER WORD THAT IT'S NEGOTIATED SO I THINK THAT'S WORTH  
6 THROWING OUT HERE THAT'S JUST DIFFERENT GOING FORWARD. AND I  
7 THINK THE OTHER THING FOR ME I HAVE ALWAYS STRUGGLED WITH, AND  
8 I SIT ON SMART, GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, I SEE JOE WIRE HERE OUR  
9 CFO. THANK YOU, JOE. AS A SUPERVISOR, WE HAVE SONOMA COUNTY  
10 TRANSIT, WE HAVE THE SMALLER OPERATES, THE COMMUTE CENTERED  
11 OPERATORS. THE COMMUTE HAS REALLY -- YOU KNOW, AT THE BRIDGE  
12 HAS BEEN OUR -- DOWN 16%, JOE, ON THE BUS, IN THE CITY. 16%.  
13 AND WHILE IT'S TRICKLING A BIT IT'S NOT COMING BACK THE WAY WE  
14 ONCE THOUGHT IT WOULD. AND THAT'S WHERE WE GO, USE THE WORD  
15 RIGHT SIZE. WE HAVE RIGHT SIZED OUR COMMUTE SERVICE INTO THE  
16 CITY BASED ON UPON OUR DEMANDS OF CUSTOMERS BUT AT THE SAME  
17 TIME I DON'T WANT TO NECESSARILY RIGHT SIZE, FOR INSTANCE,  
18 SFMTA'S INTERNAL SERVICE FOR THOSE THAT ARE GOING TO BE MORE  
19 TRANSIT DEPENDENT INCLUDING TWO OF MY THREE KIDS, TO BE  
20 HONEST. ONE HERE AND ONE IN DC, WHO DON'T HAVE CARS. I'M  
21 POINTING OUT ALL OF OUR DILEMMA AND THOUGHTS. I APPRECIATE THE  
22 CONVERSATION TODAY. I THINK AS WE GO FORWARD, THE NUMBERS,  
23 WHILE THEY MAY GROW NATURALLY DUE TO DEMOGRAPHICS ARE GOING TO  
24 SHIFT, THE PATTERNS ARE GOING TO SHIFT SLIGHTLY BECAUSE OF THE  
25 REMOTE WORK COMPONENT THAT I THINK IS QUITE HONESTLY HERE TO



JULY 14, 2023

1 STAY, GOING FORWARD. I LOOK FORWARD TO THOSE CONTINUED  
2 DISCUSSIONS. AND I ALSO AGREE ON THE STANDARDIZATION OF  
3 FUNDING STREAMS. BECAUSE I HEAR THAT EVERYONE IS FUNDED  
4 DIFFERENTLY. IS THAT GOOD OR BAD? I'M NOT SURE. IT'S JUST A  
5 MATTER OF WHEN YOUR FISCAL CLIFF COULD COME AROUND THE CORNER,  
6 WHEN YOUR SALES TAX IS TAKING A DIVE AND THE NEXT RECESSION AS  
7 OPPOSED TO YOU KNOW, WHETHER THE TOLLS ARE STILL UP OR WHAT  
8 NOT. I THINK WE KIND OF NEED TO ANALYZE THOSE KIND OF THINGS  
9 IN A MUCH BETTER FASHION. BECAUSE I DO THINK THAT -- AND I  
10 KNOW THAT AS ELECTED'S WE'RE USUALLY SENSITIVE TO GOING TO THE  
11 VOTERS AND ASKING FOR DOLLARS ON DIFFERENT THINGS. AND YOU CAN  
12 SEE THAT IN DIFFERENT APPEARANCE ON WHAT GETS APPROVED AND  
13 WHEN. I LOOK FORWARD TO THE DISCUSSIONS AND THE ANSWERS,  
14 EVERYTHING I HEARD TODAY IT'S ALL OF THE ABOVE, IN THE BIG MIX  
15 OF STEW AND WE'LL NEED TO COME OUT THE OTHER SIDE WITH  
16 SOMETHING THAT'S PALATABLE.

17

18 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

19

20 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU, JEFF. I AM TO COMPLEMENT YOU ON  
21 STARTING TO SEPARATE THIS HOMELESSNESS FROM MENTAL HEALTH AND  
22 DRUG ADDICTION. WE HAVE A PUBLIC HEALTH PROBLEM AND  
23 UNFORTUNATELY WE LUMP THAT INTO THE UNHOUSED. THEY'RE TWO  
24 TOTALLY DIFFERENT THINGS. YOU CAN PROVIDE ALL THE HOUSING IN  
25 THE WORLD, BUT THERE ARE PEOPLE THAT -- YOU KNOW, THE PUBLIC



JULY 14, 2023

1 HEALTH SIDE OF IT, DRUG ADDICTION, AND MENTALLY ILL, THE  
2 HOUSING ISSUE DOESN'T SOLVE THEIR PROBLEM. SO, WE HAVE GOT TO  
3 DEAL WITH THEM IN A DIFFERENT WAY. WE HAVE TO START SEPARATING  
4 THOSE TWO. THAT IS AFFECTING -- I'M ON A SMALL TRANSIT BOARD,  
5 THE HOMELESSNESS AND MENTAL HEALTH AND IT'S AFFECTING ALL OF  
6 US. I APPRECIATE THE FACT THAT YOU'RE TAKING IT ON. ARE YOU IN  
7 AGREEMENT WITH OUR BLUE RIBBON RECOMMENDATIONS? AND ARE YOU IN  
8 AGREEMENT ON IMPLEMENTING THOSE AND REALLY TRYING TO BUILD  
9 THIS SYSTEM THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT SO IT'S A SEAMLESS SYSTEM  
10 AMONG ALL OF THE OPERATORS? IT SEEMS LIKE WHEN WE HEAR FROM  
11 EACH ONE OF YOU ALL HAVE DIFFERENT PROBLEMS DIFFERENT THINGS  
12 YOU'RE TRYING TO SOLVE BUT I DON'T HEAR THAT COMMON THREAD  
13 THAT'S RUNNING THROUGH THAT WE'RE ALL LOOKING FOR AND WE SEE  
14 IT A LITTLE BIT DIFFERENT THAN THE OPERATORS DO. AND, SO, I  
15 MEAN, YOU HAVE HEARD COMMENTS WE SHOULD ONLY HAVE ONE SYSTEM.  
16 THAT WILL NEVER HAPPEN IN MY LIFETIME. BUT WE CAN CERTAINLY  
17 BUILD IT LIKE ONE SYSTEM. THAT COMMITMENT TO THE BLUE BLUE  
18 RIBBON WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO HEAR FROM THE OPERATORS ARE THEY  
19 SERIOUSLY COMMITTED TO THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS.

20

21 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I SPEAK FOR ALL OF THE OPERATORS IN THE ROOM I  
22 HAVE BEEN ON THE PHONE WITH THEM EVERY MONDAY MORNING FOR THE  
23 LAST THREE YEARS WE'RE WHOLEHEARTEDLY 100% COMMITTED TO EVERY  
24 SINGLE RECOMMENDATION IN THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION  
25 PLAN. WE'RE WAITING FOR PARTNERSHIP FROM ALL OF YOU, AND THAT



JULY 14, 2023

1 IS TO STAFF-UP OUR COLLEAGUES HERE AT MTC IN ORDER TO JUMP-  
2 START THE NECESSARY STAFF WORK TO GET THAT MOVING. IN THE  
3 MEANTIME, WHAT WE'RE DOING IS ONCE AGAIN, AS WE DID DURING  
4 COVID WORKING WITH OUR OWN STAFF IN ORDER TO WORK TOGETHER  
5 WITH MTC IN ORDER TO JUMP-START THAT WORK. THERE IS A  
6 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF NERD TECHNICAL STUFF GOING ON IN THE  
7 BACKGROUND. WE KNOW WE HAVE TO ACTUALLY BE DELIVERING ON THOSE  
8 COMMITMENTS IN A VISIBLE WAY IN ORDER TO GAIN YOUR TRUST AND  
9 IN ORDER TO GAIN THE TRUST OF THE VOTERS.

10

11 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I MEANS WITHOUT THE OPERATORS DURING THAT  
12 BLUE RIBBON WE WOULD NEVER HAVE GOTTEN THE UNANIMOUS CONSENT  
13 THAT WE GOT. SO, MICHAEL, AND YOU KNOW, BOB, THE WHOLE LIST, I  
14 SEE SOME OF THEM SITTING THERE, SOME OF THE SMALLER OPERATORS.  
15 BUT MINE THE PUBLIC IS EXPECTING THIS TRANSFORMATION IN PUBLIC  
16 TRANSIT, AND A LOT OF ITS OPTICS ROLE I THINK MTC NEEDS TO  
17 PLAY REALLY PROMOTING TRANSIT, SAFE, RELIABLE, DEPENDABLE, WE  
18 HAVE FAILED IN THAT RELATIONSHIP WITH THE PUBLIC. SO THAT'S  
19 GOT TO BE RENEWED AND RESTORED AND I THINK WE ALL HAVE  
20 OBLIGATION DO THAT. BUT THE OPERATORS, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE TO  
21 HEAR THAT YOU ARE COMMITTED TO THAT -- THOSE RECOMMENDATIONS  
22 AND WE WORK TOGETHER. AS WE HELP SOLVE YOUR PROBLEMS YOU HELP  
23 SOME OF CONCERNS WE'RE ABOUT.

24



JULY 14, 2023

1 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** ABSOLUTELY AND IF THE AUDIENCE NEEDS TO HEAR  
2 THAT FROM ANY OF US PLEASE LET US KNOW.

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** OUR BOARDS HAVE NOT SIGNED OFF.

5

6 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** BOARDS HAVE SIGNED OFF.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN:** COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES IF THEY HAVE, THIS  
9 IS NEW.

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN, I FORGOT I DO HAVE  
12 COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS. I'M SORRY ABOUT THAT. THEN WE'LL  
13 GET BACK TO YOU.

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** GREAT. THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK  
16 ALL OF OUR TRANSIT GM'S FOR WEIGHING IN TODAY. I HAVE RIDDEN  
17 ALL OF YOUR SYSTEMS. I KNOW THEM. I USE THEM. I WANT TO THANK  
18 YOU FOR SHARING THE INFORMATION. VERY POWERFUL MESSAGES YOU  
19 SHARE ABOUT THE STEPS YOU'RE TAKING TO STABILIZE YOUR SYSTEMS  
20 AND WHAT YOU NEED TO KEEP THEM RUNNING IN THE FUTURE. I DON'T  
21 THINK THERE IS ANY DISAGREEMENT ON THIS BOARD THAT WE ALL  
22 SUPPORT TRANSIT AND WE WANT TO SEE IT GOING AND WE UNDERSTANDS  
23 THE VALUE, THE COMMUTE AND SOCIAL SERVICE TO COMMUNITIES, AND  
24 THE POWER THE ROLES PLAYS. I THINK THE BOARD NEEDS CHARITY ON  
25 TRANSPARENCY AND FACTORS WHAT YOU CALL ASSUMPTIONS CALL THEM



JULY 14, 2023

1   WHATEVER YOU WANT WE NEED STANDARD AND GRANULAR DATA POINTS AS  
2   TO WHAT WE NEED TO BE CONSIDERING SO WE CAN ALLOCATE FUNDING  
3   IN A FAIR MANNER RECOGNIZING THE DIFFERENCES IN ALL OF YOUR  
4   TRANSIT AGENCIES AND HOW THEY'RE FUNDED. AND THEY'RE REAL. I  
5   SERVE ON OUR LOCAL TRANSIT BOARD AND I APPRECIATE THE  
6   DIFFERENCES. BUT I HOPE WE CAN ALL COME TOGETHER TO SUPPORT  
7   THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE RECOMMENDATIONS AND FIGURE OUT THIS  
8   COMPLICATED PROCESS OF PARSING THE SOURCES AND NEEDS YOU HAVE  
9   AND DISTRIBUTING THE PUNT FUNDING WE HAVE IN A FAIR AND  
10  EQUITABLE MANNER.

11

12  **THERESA ROMMELL:** THROUGH THE CHAIR, MAY RESPOND. THANK YOU FOR  
13  THE COMMENT I WANT TO TAKE THE OPPORTUNITY, TO NOTE, THE DATA  
14  HAS BEEN BROUGHT UP A COUPLE OF TIMES IN THIS PRESENTATION.  
15  MTC STAFF HAS BEEN WORKING CLOSELY WITH OPERATORS ON  
16  UNDERSTANDING THEIR DATA. OPERATOR STAFF HAVE SUBMITTED  
17  DETAILED SPREADSHEETS ON THEIR ASSUMPTIONS LINE BY LINE WHAT  
18  HAS GONE INTO THEIR SHORTFALL ESTIMATES AND HAVE BEEN VERY  
19  TRANSPARENT. I'LL GIVE THEM A NOD, THROUGH CONVERSATIONS WE  
20  HAVE H WE HAVE MET ONE ON ONE, MET IN GROUPS. WE FEEL  
21  CONFIDENT WE'RE GETTING THE INFORMATION WE NEED IN ORDER TO DO  
22  THE ANALYSIS THAT WE DO IN ORDER TO DO SOME OF THESE  
23  STANDARDIZATIONS FACTORS ET CETERA IN TERMS OF DISTRIBUTING  
24  THE SCARCE RESOURCES. I WANT TO CLARIFY THAT WE ARE CONTINUING  
25  TO WORK WITH THE TRANSIT OPERATORS WITH THEIR QUESTIONS AND



JULY 14, 2023

1 WE'RE GOING DIRECTLY TO THEIR STAFFS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT GOES  
2 INTO THOSE. I WANT TO GIVE EVERYBODY ON THIS COMMITTEE THE  
3 ASSURANCE THAT WE'RE LOOKING AT THAT ON AN ONGOING BASIS AND  
4 FEEL COMFORTABLE WITH THE RESPONSE AND THE LEVEL OF ENGAGEMENT  
5 THAT WE'RE RECEIVING FROM THE OPERATORS.

6

7 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** THANK YOU. KEEP IN MIND THAT IF  
8 WE'RE GOING WITH THE SURVIVE AND THRIVE ROADMAP THAT WE AGREE  
9 TO THAT IS GOING TO INVOLVE CHANGE FOR EVERYBODY WE NEED TO  
10 KNOW GOALS GOING FORWARD AND ACKNOWLEDGE THE CURRENT NEEDS  
11 THEN ASPIRATIONS FOR FUTURE THAT WE'RE TRYING TO CREATE.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THERESA ANY OTHER COMMENTS?

14

15 **THERESA ROMMELL:** NO MORE COMMENTS.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I'M GOING TO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.  
18 GIVING ONE MONDAY. ADINA?

19

20 **ADINA LEVIN:** ADINA LEVIN WITH SEAMLESS BAY AREA. AND GLAD TO  
21 HEAR THE MESSAGES ON WE'RE ALL IN THIS TOGETHER AND ON THE  
22 CONNECTION BETWEEN THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION AND RECOVERING  
23 THE RIDERSHIP AND BRINGING IN FUNDING. ONE THING THAT I WANTED  
24 TO MENTION IS THAT THE INTEGRATED CONVENIENT SERVICE IS PART  
25 OF THAT TRANSFORMATION. WE'RE USED TO THINKING ABOUT A BIG



JULY 14, 2023

1 GULF BETWEEN LOCAL SERVICE AND REGIONAL COMMUTER SERVICE. BUT  
2 IN THE PARTS OF THE WORLD THAT HAVE WELL INTEGRATED SIDES,  
3 THERE IS NOT THAT LARGE GULF, AND YOU HAVE PUBLIC  
4 TRANSPORTATION BEING USED BY A VARIETY AND DIVERSITY OF PEOPLE  
5 FOR A VARIETY AND DIVERSITY OF PURPOSES. AND HAVING THAT  
6 SEAMLESS INTEGRATION BRINGS THAT ABOUT, AND SO I THINK THIS  
7 ALL WORKS TOGETHER. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LET'S SEE. THERE WAS NO WRITTEN  
10 CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED ON THIS ITEM AND NO MEMBERS OF THE  
11 PUBLIC IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** SPERING?

14

15 **JAMES P. SPERING:** THERESA WHEN WE TALKED ABOUT THE FINANCIAL  
16 SIDE OF IT, WHEN WE MET WITH LEGISLATORS IN SACRAMENTO, ALMOST  
17 TO THE PERSON THEY QUESTIONED THE NUMBERS. OKAY? SO SOMEHOW AS  
18 WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS WE HAVE TO BE ABLE TO ASSURE THEM  
19 THAT THESE ARE THE REAL NUMBERS. AND, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE NOT  
20 MANUFACTURED, OR THEY'RE NOT JUST BEING PRESENTED TO MAKE A --  
21 TO TAKE A POSITION. SO, BUT THAT WAS A REAL ISSUE. AND WE  
22 SHOULDN'T TAKE THAT LIGHTLY. I APPRECIATE THE WORK YOU'RE  
23 DOING. I MEAN, MY GOD, I DON'T KNOW HOW YOU ANALYZE ALL THAT.  
24 BUT WE HAVE TO MAKE SURE WHAT WE SAY IS THE WAY IT REALLY IS.  
25 AND I THINK THAT'S GOING TO BE CRITICAL.



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **THERESA ROMMELL:** CAN I JUST REITERATE ONE THING IS THAT THE  
3 OPERATORS HAVE THEIR SHORTFALLS, WHICH ARE VALID AND TRUE, AND  
4 THEN THERE ARE SHORTFALLS THAT WE ESTIMATE THAT USE  
5 STANDARDIZATION FACTORS, WHICH CAN, AND ON OCCASION, BRING THE  
6 OVERALL NEED OR FUNDING GAP DOWN, BUT THAT DOESN'T CHANGE THE  
7 OPERATOR'S ACTUAL SHORTFALL THAT IS PERCEIVED FOR THEIR  
8 AGENCY. I JUST WANT TO MAKE THAT CLEAR. IN SOME CASES WE'RE  
9 PROJECTING A BEAR MINIMUM, A SURVIVE KIND OF SCENARIO WHICH  
10 MAY OR MAY NOT BE APPROPRIATE FOR EVERY OPERATOR. I WANT TO  
11 MAKE SURE THAT IS DISTINCT POINT.

12

13 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. I WANT TO THANK YOU, THERESA, AND  
14 OPERATORS THAT WERE HERE TODAY. IT'S GREAT TO SEE FROM MY  
15 DISTRICT, CALTRAIN CEO, GREAT TO SEE YOU MISS BOUCHARD. THERE  
16 IS A LOT OF HEAVY LIFTING THAT WE HAVE TO DO MOVING FORWARD.  
17 WE HAVE TO BALANCE PRIORITIES. AND THAT, COLLEAGUES, IS A VERY  
18 DIFFICULT DECISION. AND, SO, I JUST WANT TO THANK REBECCA AND  
19 THE TEAM FOR REALLY DOING THE WORK THAT'S GOING TO COME  
20 FORWARD. AND THIS BOARD IS GOING TO BE TASKED WITH MAKING SOME  
21 VERY, VERY TOUGH DECISIONS. AND THERE MAY BE SOME OPERATORS  
22 THAT MAY NOT BE HAPPY. WE DON'T KNOW. BUT I THINK WITH THE  
23 BOARD AND THE COMPETENCE OWE THIS BOARD, I THINK -- AND THE  
24 THOUGHTFULNESS THIS BOARD WE'LL LAND IN A PLACE AND MAKE  
25 DECISIONS THAT I THINK ULTIMATELY WILL BENEFIT THE REGION.



JULY 14, 2023

1 THANK YOU ALL WHO HAVE ATTENDED TODAY. THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM  
2 3C. ASSEMBLY BILL 1085, HOUSING SUPPORT SERVICES. THAT'S  
3 HOUSING SUPPORT SERVICES, A NEW MEDICAL BENEFIT FOR ENROLLEES  
4 EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. WE HAVE  
5 GEORGIA. GOOD MORNING GEORGIA.

6

7 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN,  
8 MTC ABAG STAFF. I THINK A QUESTION MIGHT BE WHY ARE WE  
9 BRINGING A BILL ABOUT MEDICAL. AND THE REASON IS IT'S BECAUSE  
10 OF OUR ROLE AT THE BAY AREA HOUSING FINANCE AUTHORITY AND THE  
11 WORK SERVED UNDER THAT UMBRELLA TO MAKE HOUSING AVAILABLE TO  
12 THOSE IN THE BAY AREA THAT NEED IT. IT ALSO CONVERSATIONS TO  
13 EXTERNAL CHALLENGES THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE FACING THAT  
14 HAVE TO DO WITH UNSHELTERED INDIVIDUALS INCLUDING INDIVIDUALS  
15 WITH MENTAL HEALTH CHALLENGES AND UNTREATED ADDICTION ISSUES  
16 AND FINDING SHELTER. FOR THE ISSUES REALLY TO SOLVE THE  
17 HOUSING CRISIS TO GET PEOPLE HOUSED AND KEEP THEM HOUSED YOU  
18 NEED MORE THAN JUST A ROOF OVER THEIR HEADS YOU NEED  
19 SUPPORTIVE SERVICES TIED TO THAT. AND I SEE A LOT OF NODS.  
20 YOU'RE ALL WELL AWARE OF THE PERMANENT SUPPORTIVE HOUSING  
21 MODEL. THERE IS A LOT OF DATA SHOWING THE PERMANENT SUPPORTIVE  
22 MODEL IS HIGHLY EFFECTIVE HELPING PEOPLE GET HOUSED AND  
23 IMPORTANTLY HELPING PEOPLE STAY HOUSED. WITH THE 2024 HOUSING  
24 MEASURE WE'RE ALL LOOKING AT, THE CITIES AND COUNTIES AND THE  
25 NON-PROFITS AND HOUSING PARTNERS WILL HAVE THE TOOLS TO GET



JULY 14, 2023

1 THE CONSTRUCTION AND OPERATING COVER TO KEEP THE LIGHTS ON FOR  
2 FOLKS, FOR PERMANENT SUPPORTIVE HOUSING BUT THERE IS STILL A  
3 GAP IN COVERING ONGOING SUPPORTIVE HOUSING SERVICES. SO THIS  
4 BILL IS TRYING TO COME UP WITH A CREATIVE SOLUTION TO BRING IN  
5 ANOTHER PARTNER TO HELP FUND THOSE ONGOING SERVICES THE IDEA  
6 IS THAT THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT THROUGH MEDICARE ACTUALLY CAN  
7 COVER SUPPORTIVE HOUSING SERVICES AND THE TIE TO MEDICARE IS  
8 THAT ONCE PEOPLE ARE HOUSED THERE IS A LOT OF DATA THAT SHOWS  
9 THAT TYPE OF PREVENTATIVE MEASURE CAN SHAVE COSTS DOWN THE  
10 ROAD WITH EMERGENCY ROOM VISIT SAYS ET CETERA. OTHER STATES  
11 AROUND THE COUNTRY INCLUDING NORTH DAKOTA TEXAS HAVE BEEN  
12 DOING A LOT AROUND EXPANDING THE USE OF MEDICARE TO COVER  
13 SUPPORTIVE HOUSING SERVICES. CALIFORNIA IS DOING IT RIGHT NOW  
14 IN A PILOT MODEL WHAT THIS WOULD DO IS, SORT OF, SPEED UP YOUR  
15 WORK SEE IF IT'S POSSIBLE FOR THE STATE TO OFFER THIS AS A  
16 STRAIGHT UP MEDICAL BENEFIT WHICH WOULD PROVIDE MORE CERTAINTY  
17 AND EXPAND FOR FOLKS WHO WOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR IT. AND TO  
18 POLICEMEN STATE YOU MUST APPLY TO THE FEDS TO ASK TO MAKE THIS  
19 BENEFIT IF IT IS FEDERAL GOVERNMENT COVERING 90% OF THE COST  
20 OFFERING SERVICES AND THE STATE WOULD COVER 10% AGAIN BRINGING  
21 IN A PRETTY STRONG FEDERAL PARTNER AND FOR THAT REASON WE'RE  
22 RECOMMENDING A SUPPORT POSITION ON THE BILL.

23

24 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** ANY QUESTIONS ON THE BILL?

25



JULY 14, 2023

1 **JAMES P. SPERING:** I THINK WE SHOULD SUPPORT IT. BUT, YOU KNOW,  
2 FORMER SUPERVISORS. IF WE FOUNDATION A WOMAN WITH CHILDREN  
3 JUST GOT HOMELESS FOR VARIOUS REASONS, OFFERED SERVICES,  
4 SHELTER, TAKES IT, NOT BACK ON THE STREET. THE MENTALLY ILL,  
5 DRUG ADDICTED WE CAN PUT THEM IN HOUSING. THE NEXT DAY HE  
6 DIDN'T STAY IN THAT HOUSING. SO WE HAVE TO ADDRESS THAT MENTAL  
7 HEALTH, THAT PUBLIC HEALTH ISSUE. YOU CAN BUILD ALL THE HOUSES  
8 YOU WANT, BUT THERE HAS TO BE SOME INSTITUTIONAL CHANGE TO  
9 DEAL WITH THAT POPULATION. AND, SO, I THINK THIS IS A STEP IN  
10 THE RIGHT DIRECTION. BUT WE HAVE TO START SEPARATING THE TWO.

11

12 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** IN ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS? YES?

13

14 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** TO COMMISSIONER SPERING'S POINT IN THE  
15 CONVERSATION WE HAVE HAD TODAY AROUND MENTAL HEALTH. IN  
16 READING THE DESCRIPTION IN OUR STAFF REPORT IT DOES ALLUDE TO  
17 SOME MEDICAL SERVICES. SO, HAS THERE BEEN ANY CONVERSATION IN  
18 SACRAMENTO ABOUT THE MENTAL HEALTH COMPONENT AND THIS NEW  
19 SERVICE HELPING WITH THOSE IN NEED OF THE MENTAL HEALTH?

20

21 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** IT'S A COMMON USE OF SUPPORT SERVICES  
22 RESOURCES WOULD BE PROVIDING TREATMENT OPTIONS OTHER AND  
23 THINGS THAT HELP KEEP PEOPLE WHO ARE IN A HOME HOUSED.

24



JULY 14, 2023

1 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** MY FOLLOW UP QUESTION, IS THIS BILL  
2 DESIGNED FOR THOSE THAT ARE MEDICAL FOLKS INITIATING THE  
3 CONVERSATION, OR IS THERE GOING TO BE -- I DON'T KNOW WHAT  
4 THEY WOULD BE CALLED -- COUNSELORS OR ADVOCATES OR WHAT HAVE  
5 YOU, COULD LOOK AT SOMEBODY'S SITUATION HERE THIS IS WHAT WE  
6 THINK YOU NEED AND GO FROM THERE?

7

8 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** IT'S BUILDING OFF A PILOT THAT'S BEEN  
9 GOING ON IN CALIFORNIA FOR A WHILE LOOKING WHOLE PERSON CARE  
10 ASSESSING WHAT FOLKS NEEDS ARE WITH THIS BILL. PROVIDING LONG-  
11 TERM CERTAINTY THAT ONE OF THE BENEFITS FOLKS COULD OFFER,  
12 SUPPORTIVE SERVICES AND EXPANDING THE POOL OF WHO WOULD BE  
13 ABLE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THOSE HOUSING SUPPORTIVE SERVICES.

14

15 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** FANTASTIC. THANK YOU.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THERE ARE IN ADDITIONAL QUESTIONS? SEEING  
18 NONE. VIRTUALLY. DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT MARTHA?

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MORE ARREGUIN HAS THEIR HAND RAISED.

21

22 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** I'M SORRY VICE CHAIR ARREGUIN.

23

24 **V. CHAIR JESSE ARREGUIN:** JUST TO SAY WITHOUT HOUSING SUPPORT  
25 SOMEBODY WHO HAS BEHAVIORAL HEALTH ISSUES OR SUBSTANCE ABUSE



JULY 14, 2023

1 ISSUES ARE NOT GOING TO BE SUCCESSFUL THE DATA SHOWS THAT  
2 HAVING PEOPLE HAVE STABLE HOUSING IS CRITICAL TOWARD THE  
3 ABILITY TO NOT JUST STAY STABLY HOUSED BUT ALSO TO MANAGE  
4 THESE CHALLENGES. I MOVE THAT WE RECOMMEND A SUPPORT POSITION  
5 ON THE BILL TO THE ABAG EXECUTIVE BOARD AND MTC COMMISSION.

6

7 **PAT EKLUND:** I'LL SECOND THE MOTION.

8

9 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** BEFORE WE TAKE ROLL CALL DO WE HAVE  
10 PUBLIC COMMENT, MARTHA?

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
13 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
14 ON THIS ITEM. AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON  
15 THIS ITEM.

16

17 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. ROLL CALL.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

24

25 **EDDIE AHN:** YES.



JULY 14, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CAN DUTRA-VERNACI?

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN IS ABSENT. MOULTON-PETERS?

7

8 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SPERING?

15

16 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** TIEDEMANN? IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

19 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM 4A, WASHINGTON,

22 D.C. LEGISLATIVE UPDATE. I THINK IT'S IN OUR PACKET. BUT,

23 GEORGIA, IF YOU MIGHT?

24



JULY 14, 2023

1 **GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** IT'S IN YOUR PACKET FOR REVIEW. HAPPY  
2 TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

3

4 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. PUBLIC COMMENT MARTHA? THANK YOU.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
7 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
8 ON THIS ITEM. NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK ON THIS  
9 ITEM. [LAUGHTER]

10

11 **CHAIR, DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. SHE MAY BE THE BEST CLERK. THE  
12 NEXT MEETING OF THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE WILL  
13 BE HELD FRIDAY SEPTEMBER 28th 2023 NINE 40 A.M. AT THE BAY  
14 AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET SAN FRANCISCO ANY CHANGES  
15 WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THE MEETING OF THE JOINT  
16 MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

17

18

19



**NTT**

*Broadcasting Government*