

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**
2 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**
3 **WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 8, 2023 9:45 AM**
4
5

6 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. GOOD MORNING. THANK YOU. I AM
7 DAVID RABBIT CHAIR OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
8 COMMITTEE JOINED BY MY VICE CHAIR GINA PAPAN. CALLING THE
9 MEETING OF FEBRUARY 8TH TO ORDER. WILL THE BROADCASTING TEAM
10 PLEASE PLAY THE MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT? [RECORDED MEETING
11 PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE
12 CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF
13 ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE
14 BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE.
15 THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND
16 OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND
17 STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
18 PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS
19 ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO
20 VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
21 BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE
22 OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
23 APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
24 BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED
25 THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT,



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC
2 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M.,
3 YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED
4 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF
5 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE
6 TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
7 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
8 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD
9 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE
10 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
11 TO DATE.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ONCE AGAIN,
14 AS A REMINDER THE GOVERNOR'S EMERGE PROTOCOLS WILL BE
15 SUNSETTING FEBRUARY 28TH, 2023. WHICH MEANS THE ADMINISTRATION
16 -- ACTUALLY -- WHICH MEANS THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
17 COMMITTEE, IN SPITE OF WHAT IT SAYS HERE, WILL RETURN TO IN-
18 PERSON MEETINGS AS WAS THE PRACTICE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC. THAT
19 WILL BE STARTING MARCH 8TH, 2023. PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS
20 COMMITTEE MEETINGS WILL BE IN-PERSON, AS BEFORE YOU WILL BE
21 COMPENSATED FOR TRAVEL COSTS, REFRESHMENTS WILL BE PROVIDED
22 MORE GUIDANCE AROUND THIS IN ASSEMBLY BILL 2449 WILL BE
23 PROVIDED AT THE FEBRUARY 22ND MTC COMMISSION MEETING NOW ON TO
24 REGULAR BUSINESS OF THE DAY. FIRST ITEM IS ROLL CALL PLEASE.

25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR RABBITT?

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

6

7 **GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT.

10 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY? IS ABSENT.

15 COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

20

21 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

24

25 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. FIRST ON TO
5 THE CONSENT CALENDAR. TODAY THERE IS FOUR ITEMS ON THE CONSENT
6 CALENDAR. I HAVE BEEN GIVEN ADVANCED WARNING THAT WE'RE GOING
7 TO PULL 2D FOR SOME QUESTIONS OF STAFF. SO, WHY DON'T WE GO
8 AHEAD AND, LET'S -- I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES, IF THERE IS
9 ANY OTHER QUESTIONS ON 2A THROUGH 2C. AND I AM NOT SEEING ANY
10 HANDS RAISED. WITH THAT, WE'LL TAKE, HOPEFULLY -- WELL, WE'LL
11 MOVE TO 2D, AND I'LL TURN TO MY VICE CHAIR WHO HAD A QUESTION.
12 VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

13

14 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBITT, YES THIS, IS
15 THE BAY WHEELS BIKE PROGRAM. AND WE FULLY SUPPORT THIS. I JUST
16 WANT TO MAKE SURE, MOVING FORWARD HERE, BECAUSE IT'S LIMITED
17 AT THIS POINT IN TIME TO SAN FRANCISCO, SAN JOSE, OAKLAND,
18 BERKELEY, AND EMERYVILLE. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE AS WE MOVE
19 FORWARD HERE, EQUIVALENT AMOUNTS WILL BE AVAILABLE FOR E-BIKES
20 OUTSIDE THE BAY WHEELS SERVICE AREA. AND I RECEIVED AN E-MAIL
21 FROM ALEC, HERE, THAT THERE WILL BE MORE IN DEPTH REPORT
22 COMING UP, BUT, JUST, PLEASE FOR THE RECORD I HOPE WE CAN MAKE
23 SURE THAT THIS IS A REGION-WIDE PROJECT AND FUNDING WILL BE
24 EQUIVALENT AS WE MOVE FORWARD. SO THAT WAS MY ONLY ACTUALLY,
25 COMMENT. THANK YOU TO STAFF AND LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 EVERYBODY. NOW I WOULD LIKE TO MOVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR IF
2 TOTAL FORWARD.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THAT'S GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

5

6 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECOND.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND ON THE CONSENT
9 CALENDAR, TODAY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO VICE CHAIR PAPAN FOR
10 SUPPLYING THAT QUESTION IN ADVANCE. I'LL LOOK TO OUR CLERK, IS
11 THERE ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THE
12 CONSENT CALENDAR TODAY?

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
15 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
16 ON THIS ITEM.

17

18 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THAT BEING THE CASE, CAN WE HAVE A ROLL
19 CALL TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR RABBITT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1

2 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER?

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

13

14 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

17

18 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
21 PRESENT.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO AGENDA

24 ITEM 3A FISCAL YEAR 2022, 2023 TRANSIT PERFORMANCE INITIATIVE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 CALL FOR PROJECTS, AWARD, RECOMMENDATIONS, AND WE HAVE ANNE
2 SPEVACK TO MAKE A PRESENTATION.

3

4 **ANNE SPEVACK:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS ANNE
5 SPEVACK, MTC STAFF. THIS ITEM IS CONSIDERATION FOR
6 RECOMMENDATION FOR RECENT COMPETITIVE CALL FOR PROJECTS FOR
7 THE TRANSIT PERFORMANCE INITIATIVE PROGRAM I WILL REVIEW THE
8 BACKGROUND AND PROGRAM, UPON SUMMARIZE AWARDED AND HAPPY TO
9 TAKE QUESTIONS. THE TPI PROGRAM STARTED IN 2012 INVESTMENT
10 PROGRAM TASKED WITH FUNDING LOW COST AND IMPLEMENTATION OF
11 PROJECTS TO IMPROVE OPERATIONS ON MAJOR TRANSIT CORRIDORS
12 SINCE 2,012,104 MILLION PROGRAMS HAVE THROUGHOUT TPI PROGRAM
13 35 PROJECTS COMPLETED PI PROJECTS IMPROVED TRANSIT RELIABILITY
14 SPEED AND RIDER EXPERIENCE THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA IN 2021 THE
15 BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE APPROVED THE BAY AREA
16 TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN ONE OF THE ACCELERATED
17 ACTIONS IN THE ACTION PLAN DELIVERY OF NEAR-TERM TRANSIT
18 PROJECTS AND TASK FORCE HAS SPECIFICALLY NAMED BUS TRANSIT
19 PRIORITY IMPROVEMENTS AS HIGH PRIORITY STRATEGIES FOR FUTURE
20 FUNDING TO ADDRESS TRANSIT PRIORITIES IDENTIFIED AS PART OF
21 IMPLEMENTING ACTION PLAN TRANSIT PRIORITY NEEDS CALL FOR
22 PROJECTS FOR THE TPI INVESTMENT PROGRAM. CALL FOR PROJECTS
23 UTILIZING 15 MILLION IN ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM OR OBAG
24 FUNDS PREVIOUSLY SET ASIDE FOR TRANSIT PRIORITY AND
25 APPROXIMATELY 6 MILLION IN FY 2023 LOW CARBON TRANSIT



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 OPERATIONS PROGRAM OR LC TOP FUNDS AVAILABLE FROM THE STATE
2 FOR MTC TO USE ON MAJOR TRANSIT CORRIDORS. IN RESPONSE TO THIS
3 \$21 MILLION CALL FOR PROJECTS MTC RECEIVED SEVEN CAPITAL
4 PROJECT APPLICATIONS AND FIVE PLANNING OR PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
5 APPLICATIONS FOR A TOTAL COMBINED REQUEST OF APPROXIMATELY 23
6 MILLION. A PANEL OF MTC STAFF AND ONE TRANSIT OPERATOR
7 REPRESENTATIVE REVIEWED AND SCORED THE APPLICATIONS. THEN MTC
8 STAFF DEVELOPED AWARD RECOMMENDATIONS BASED ON THE SCORES MUCH
9 THE PANEL. STAFF RECOMMEND AWARDED A TOTAL APPROXIMATELY 21.2
10 MILLION INCLUDING FULL OR PARTIAL FUNDING FOR ALL 12 PROJECTS
11 SUBMITTED. DETAILS OF THE AWARD RECOMMENDATIONS AND PROJECT
12 PROFILES ARE INCLUDED AS ATTACHMENTS TO THIS ITEM. THE AWARD
13 RECOMMENDATIONS INCLUDE IMPLEMENTATION OF TRANSIT SIGNAL
14 PRIORITY ON AC TRANSIT'S McDONALD AVENUE CORRIDOR IN RICHARD
15 AND VTA'S ROUTE 66 CORRIDOR IMPROVING OPTIMIZING BUS STOPS
16 ALONG SFMTA'S SUNSET ROUTE PART-TIME TRANSIT LANE ON SHOULDER
17 OF 101 MARIN COUNTY AND PLANNING FOR SFMTA'S NEXT GENERATION
18 FIVE MINUTE BUS NETWORK AMONG OTHER PROJECTS IMPROVEMENTS WILL
19 IMPROVE TRANSIT SPEEDS AND RELIABILITY AND KEY TRANSIT
20 CORRIDORS THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA AND TEE UP NEXT ROUND OF
21 TRANSIT PRIORITY IMPROVEMENTS THROUGH INVESTMENT IN PLANNING
22 AND PROJECT DEVELOPMENT. IN CONCLUSION, STAFF RECOMMEND THE
23 COMMITTEE FORWARD THESE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE TPI2022, 2023
24 AWARDS TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THANK YOU, AND I AM
25 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, ANNE FOR THAT. I'LL LOOK TO MY
3 COLLEAGUES FOR QUESTIONS OF STAFF ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM. I
4 HAVE A HAND RAISED THAT'S OUR VICE CHAIR PAPAN.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MY QUESTIONS ARE MORE RELATED
7 TO THE POLICY REENFORCEMENTS. SO, FIRST AND FOREMOST, COULD
8 SOMEBODY PLEASE TELL ME HOW MANY TRANSIT OPERATORS OFFER BAY
9 PASS AND SHOULD THAT BE A POLICY THRESHOLD? ALIX GOT HER HAND
10 UP.

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** YEAH, COMMISSIONER PAPAN, I THINK YOU EXCITED
13 TO GET TO THE MAP ITEM THE MAJOR PROJECT. WE HAVEN'T QUITE
14 GOTTEN TO THAT YET.

15

16 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** YES. THANK YOU. SORRY.

17

18 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. ANYONE ELSE HAVE
21 QUESTIONS ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM? I AM NOT SEEING ANY. BEFORE
22 WE TAKE A MOTION, LET'S TURN AND SEE IF THERE IS ANYONE FROM
23 THE PUBLIC WHO WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.

24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I DO SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE
2 PUBLIC WITH A HAND RAISED, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
3 WRITING. JONATHON CASS, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL
4 HAVE TWO MINUTES.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. I'M JONATHON KASS, TRANSPORTATION POLICY
7 MANAGER AT SPUR, AND JUST WANT TO CONGRATULATE STAFF AND THE
8 COMMISSION ON MOVING FORWARD WITH THESE REALLY IMPORTANT
9 PROJECTS. THESE SORT OF TRANSIT PRIORITY ROADWAY INTERVENTIONS
10 ARE PRECISELY WHAT WE NEED TO, BOTH IMPROVE THE TRANSIT
11 EXPERIENCE, AND BE ABLE TO BETTER COORDINATE TRANSIT, AND
12 ALLOW TRANSIT AGENCIES TO DELIVER THE SAME SERVICE WITH FEWER
13 RESOURCES. I'M GLAD THAT THIS INCLUDES PLANNING AND PROJECT
14 DEVELOPMENT WORK, IN ADDITION TO SOME IMPLEMENTATION, AS YOU
15 CAN SEE FROM THE FACT THAT THERE WERE JUST ENOUGH APPLICATIONS
16 TO CLAIM THE FUNDS AVAILABLE. AGENCIES REALLY NEED TO BE
17 FUNDED TO PROPERLY BUILD A PIPELINE OF THESE IMPORTANT
18 PROJECTS THAT ARE READY FOR IMPLEMENTATION FUNDING. SPUR IS
19 PLEASED THAT THERE ARE -- THERE IS SIGNIFICANT FUTURE FUNDING
20 ON THE HORIZON, AND WE HOPE THAT THIS FUTURE FUNDING WILL
21 ENCOURAGE STREAMLINING OF SUCH PROJECTS AT THE LOCAL LEVEL,
22 AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO ONGOING WORK ON TRANSIT PRIORITY. THANK
23 YOU.

24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU, MR. CASS. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL
2 HANDS RAISED MR. CHAIR.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND WITH THAT, I'LL
5 LOOK BACK TO MY COLLEAGUES. IF THERE IS ANY -- IF THERE IS NOT
6 ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS, COMMENTS OR CONCERNS, I CAN GET A
7 MOTION TO APPROVE?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. SECOND.

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECONDS.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL ON ITEM 3A
16 TRANSIT PERFORMANCE INITIATIVE CALL FOR PROJECTS.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR RABBITT?

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:**

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. CHAVEZ?

2

3 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GLOVER IN.

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RONEN?

14

15 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

18 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

19

20 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU EVERYONE. MOVING TO AGENDA ITEM

21 3B, THIS IS MTC RESOLUTION 4556, THE FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024

22 MTC FUND ESTIMATE. AND TERENCE LEE IS GOING TO GIVE US A

23 PRESENTATION ON THIS ONE. TERENCE, GO AHEAD.

24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **TERENCE LEE:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. TERENCE LEE, MTC
2 STAFF I'M HERE TO PRESENT AGENDA ITEM 3B FY 2023, 2024 MTC
3 FUND ESTIMATE. SLIDES PLEASE. NEXT SLIDE. THE MTC FUND
4 ESTIMATE IS STATUTORY REQUIREMENT FOR MTC AND CONSISTS OF
5 REVENUE FORECAST ON SEVERAL MAJOR FUND SOURCES TO ASSIST AT
6 THIS TIME OPERATORS WITH BUDGETING, TWIT OPERATIONS. NEXT
7 SLIDE PLEASE. THIS TABLE SUMMARIZES MAJOR REVENUE SOURCES IN
8 THE FUND INVESTMENT I'LL REVIEW PROGRAMS INDIVIDUALLY IN
9 SUBSEQUENT SLIDES BUT FOR THE MOST PART THESE FUNDS PRIMARILY
10 TIED TO SALES TAX AND DIESEL FUEL TAXES ARE EITHER STABLE OR
11 GROWING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE DETAILS THE FUNDS FROM
12 THE TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT OR TDA, WHICH IS A RETURN
13 TO SALES TAX COLLECTED AND APPORTIONED WITHIN COUNTIES FOR
14 CURRENT YEAR FISCAL YEAR 2023 ESTIMATES REVISED UPWARDS BY 5%
15 TO \$8 MILLION UPCOMING FISCAL YEAR 2024 REVENUES ESTIMATED TO
16 BE 2% HIGHER AT \$519 MILLION FOR THE REGION. ON THE RIGHT TDA
17 FORECAST FY 2024 FOR EACH OF THE NINE COUNTIES IN THE BAY AREA
18 REGION. THE LAST BULLET ON THE SLIDE ALLUDED TO A PENDING
19 APPEAL OVER SALES TAX ATTRIBUTIONS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY IN
20 OCTOBER 2021 SANTA CLARA RECEIVED NOTICE FROM THE CALIFORNIA
21 DEPARTMENT OF TAX AND FEE ADMINISTRATION ABOUT SALES TAXES FOR
22 ONLINE SALES ON eBAY THAT WERE ERRONEOUSLY ATTRIBUTED TO SANTA
23 CLARA. AN APPEAL WAS FILED BY BOTH CITY OF SAN JOSE AND COUNTY
24 OF SANTA CLARA AND IT'S STILL PENDING IN AN UNFAVORABLE RULING
25 AND WOULD HAVE SIGNIFICANT REVENUE IMPACTS FOR SANTA CLARA AND



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 POSSIBLE IMPLICATIONS FOR SALES TAX ATTRIBUTIONS FOR OTHER
2 COUNTIES MTC STAFF IS MONITORING THE APPEAL AND WILL UPDATE
3 THE COMMISSION AS APPROPRIATE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE
4 DETAILS FUNDS FROM THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE, OR STA
5 FORMULA PROGRAMS. STA REVENUES GENERATING FROM STATEWIDE SALES
6 TAX ON DIESEL FUEL DISTRIBUTED THROUGH A REVENUE BASED FORMULA
7 AND POPULATION BASED FORMULA. WITH INCREASED PRICE IN DIESEL
8 FUEL THIS PAST YEAR FISCAL YEAR 2023 STA REVENUES FOR BAY AREA
9 OPERATORS ARE PROJECTED TO BE \$90 MILLION GREATER THAN ACTUALS
10 FROM FY 2022. THE SLIGHT DETAILS FISCAL 24 ESTIMATES STAFF
11 RECENTLY UNCOVERED ISSUES WITH UNDERLYING CALCULATIONS WHICH
12 CALLS INTO QUESTION THE ASSESSMENTS I'LL DISCUSS THIS ISSUE IN
13 THE FOLLOWING SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE. AS MENTIONED ON THE LAST
14 SLIDE, 50% OF STA PROGRAM REVENUES ARE CALCULATED THROUGH
15 DISTRIBUTION FACTORS BASED ON AN OPERATOR'S QUALIFYING REVENUE
16 IN REVIEWING THE FY 2024 ESTIMATES STAFF HAS DISCOVERED
17 DISCREPANCIES IN QUALIFYING REVENUES WITH SFMTA IN PARTICULAR
18 AND WE HAVE ALERTED THE STATE CONTROLLER'S OFFICE ACCORDINGLY
19 THEY HAVE SINCE REMOVED THEIR INITIAL ESTIMATES FOR 2024 AND
20 MTC STAFF WILL UPDATE ESTIMATES. AS RELATED TO THE TDA AND STA
21 PROGRAM PERTAINS TO AGREEMENT THAT ESTABLISHED FUNDING
22 MECHANISM FOR APART TO SUPPORT EAST BAY BUS OPERATORS USING
23 BART STA AND TDA FUNDS BART HAS EXPRESSED DESIRE TO
24 RESTRUCTURE THIS AGREEMENT DISCUSSIONS ARE ONGOING AND
25 RESTRUCTURING INCLUDING MEETING THIS MONDAY BETWEEN ALL



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 PARTIES WHILE AN AGREEMENT WAS NOT REACHED CONVERSATION WAS
2 PRODUCTIVE AND STAFF WILL RETURN TO THE COMMISSION WITH AN
3 UPDATE AS APPROPRIATE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS LAST SLIDE ON
4 REVENUE FORECAST IS ON ASSEMBLY BILL 1107 FUNDS WHICH IS A
5 HALF CENT SALES TAX COLLECTED IN ALAMEDA, CONTRA COSTA, AND
6 SAN FRANCISCO COUNTIES. MTC IS RESPONSIBLE FOR ALLOCATING 25%
7 OF THESE FUNDS AND PER LONG STAND YOU COMMISSION POLICY
8 DISTRIBUTES 50% TO AC TRANSIT AND 50% TO SFMTA STAFF
9 FORECASTING TOTAL OF \$14 MILLION IN 1107 REVENUES FOR FISCAL
10 YEAR 2024. NEXT SLIDE. REMAINING SLIDES HIGHLIGHT ECONOMIC
11 FACTORS THAT ARE RELEVANT TO TRANSIT REVENUES FIRST UP ON THE
12 SLIDE IS BAY AREA POPULATION WHICH HAS DECLINED IN RECENT
13 YEARS. POPULATION IS NOW EQUAL TO 2015 LEVELS AND REGIONAL
14 POPULATION DECLINED AT A FASTER RATE AT THE STATE LEVEL
15 SIGNIFICANT DIRECTLY BECAUSE OF POPULATION BASED FORMULA
16 PROGRAMS THAT ARE USED TO DISTRIBUTE FUNDING BUT ALSO IT
17 IMPACTS SALES SPACE FOR THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SLIDE
18 DETAILS UNEMPLOYMENT RATE FOR THE UNITED STATES, STATE OF
19 CALIFORNIA, AND THE NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES. BARS SHOW THE
20 UNEMPLOYMENT RATE IN NOVEMBER OF 2019 THROUGH 2022. THE BLUE
21 LINE SHOWS THE NATIONAL RATE, IN NOVEMBER 2022, AND THE RED
22 LINE SHOWS THE STATEWIDE RATE. AFTER SIGNIFICANT SPIKE IN
23 2020, WITH THE ONSET OF THE PANDEMIC, UNEMPLOYMENT RATES HAVE
24 LARGELY RETURNED TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS AND THE BAY AREA
25 COUNTIES ARE LARGELY BELOW BOTH THE STATEWIDE AND NATIONAL



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 RATES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THIS LAST SLIDE HIGHLIGHTS THE
2 IMPACT OF INFLATION. THE GRAPH SHOWS TDA SALES TAX REVENUES IN
3 BOTH NOMINAL AND REAL TERMS AND SO WHEN ADJUSTED FOR
4 INFLATION, TAX REVENUES HAVE, IN FACT, DECLINED 6% SINCE 2,000
5 DESPITE A NEAR CONTINUOUS INCREASE IN NOMINAL TERMS. NEXT
6 SLIDE PLEASE. STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS TO FORWARD MTC
7 RESOLUTION NUMBER 4556, FISCAL YEAR 2023, '24 FUND ESTIMATE TO
8 THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION.
9 THANK YOU FOR YOUR ATTENTION, AND I AM HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
10 QUESTIONS.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES TO
13 SEE IF THERE ARE ANY QUESTIONS ON THIS PARTICULAR ITEM.
14 DIRECTOR CHAVEZ.

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT. COULD YOU JUST
17 TALK ABOUT THE NOMINAL TAX RATE? I DON'T THINK I HAVE SEEN
18 THAT SLIDE BEFORE. AND I APOLOGIZE IF THEY'RE NUMBERED -- LET
19 ME SEE IF I CAN FIND IT.

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I BELIEVE IT'S SLIDE TEN.

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **TERENCE LEE:** THAT SLIDE TRACKS THE TDA SALES TAX RECEIPTS ONE
2 LINE SHOWS THE RECEIPTS IN NOMINAL TERMS AND THE OTHER ADJUSTS
3 RECEIPTS FOR INFLATION FOR CURRENT PRESENT YEAR DOLLARS WHEN
4 COMPARING TO DESPITE CONTINUOUS INCREASE IN NOMINAL TERMS
5 AFTER ADJUSTING FOR INFLATION THERE'S ACTUALLY A DECREASE AND
6 PURCHASING POWER THAT HAS BEEN LOWERED.

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I MISUNDERSTOOD THE POINT OF THAT
9 SLIDE. THAT'S HELPFUL. AND THE OTHER QUESTION I WANTED TO ASK
10 IS THAT WHEN YOU WERE TALKING ABOUT THE REVENUE AS IT COMES
11 IN, ONE QUESTION I HAD IS THAT, WHEN WE RECEIVE FUNDS THAT ARE
12 WHERE YOU -- WHERE MTC HAS MORE FLEXIBILITY IN TERMS OF HOW
13 THOSE FUNDS ARE SPENT VERSUS FUNDS THAT ARE LOCKED INTO A VERY
14 SPECIFIC KIND OF PROJECT OR A SPECIFIC TYPE OF TASK, DOES MTC
15 GET, WHAT I GUESS A NON-PROFIT WOULD CALL, OPERATING FUNDS
16 FROM ANY PARTICULAR SOURCE? OR DOES JUST ALL OF THE PROGRAMS
17 AND PROJECTS, SORT OF, FUND THE WORK THAT YOU DO TO MANAGE
18 THOSE FUNDS?

19

20 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THROUGH THE CHAIR THIS, IS THERESA ROMMEL
21 WITH FUNDING AND POLICY PROGRAMS FOR THE TRANSPORTATION
22 DEVELOPMENT ACT WE DO TAKE ADMINISTRATIVE FEES FOR THE
23 ADMINISTRATION OF THAT PROGRAM WE ALSO USE STATE TRANSIT
24 ASSISTANCE POPULATION BASED FUNDS TO FUND SOME OF OUR REGIONAL
25 PROGRAMS WE TAKE A PERCENTAGE OF THOSE FUNDS THAT COME



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 THROUGH, TO FUND THINGS LIKE CLIPPER OUR MEANS BASED PROGRAM
2 OR OTHER REGIONAL TYPE PROGRAMS AND THAT ARRANGEMENT IS
3 INCLUDED IN AN MTC RESOLUTION THAT GUIDES OUR POLICY RELATED
4 TO THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE POPULATION BASED FUNDS.

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THAT'S REALLY HELPFUL. THANK YOU.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU. ANY OTHER QUESTIONS
9 FROM MY COLLEAGUES? THERE ARE A FEW THINGS THAT WERE -- I
10 WOULDN'T SAY -- THERE IS STILL A FEW THINGS THAT NEED TO GET
11 SORTED OUT. MOVING FORWARD TODAY, NOT A PROBLEM, BECAUSE WE
12 FIGURE THEY WILL BE SORTED BY THE TIME WE GET TO THE
13 COMMISSION. IS THAT TRUE?

14

15 **TERENCE LEE:** THAT'S THE HOPE.

16

17 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WE WILL DEFINITELY BE PUBLISHING THE AMOUNTS
18 FOR THE TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT BY THE COMMISSION
19 MEETING BECAUSE WE ARE KIND OF STATUTORILY REQUIRED TO DO THAT
20 BY MARCH 1ST EACH YEAR. REGARDING THE STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE
21 NUMBERS WE HOPE TO HAVE SOME RESOLUTION FROM THE STATE
22 CONTROLLERS OFFICE PRIOR TO THE COMMISSION MEETING BUT IT IS
23 POSSIBLE THAT THAT COULD DRAG ON A LITTLE BIT LONGER UNTIL WE
24 KNOW EXACTLY WHAT TO EXPECT FOR STATE TRANSIT ASSISTANCE
25 REVENUE BASED FUNDING FOR FISCAL YEAR '24.



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** OKAY BUT WE'RE GOING TO DO OUR PART
3 TODAY. WE'RE GOING TO -- COMMISSIONER GLOVER, DID YOU HAVE
4 SOMETHING?

5

6 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YEAH, JUST WANTED TO KNOW IF YOU COULD TALK
7 A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT BART'S MEETING WITH THE OTHER FEEDER
8 OPERATORS?

9

10 **THERESA ROMMELL:** SURE. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO TOUCH ON THAT
11 TOPIC, BECAUSE I KNOW IT'S ONE OF CONCERN FOR A LOT OF TRANSIT
12 OPERATORS AND COMMISSIONERS, AS WELL. WE HAVE BEEN WORKING
13 WITH THE FEEDER BUS OPERATORS, FOUR OF THEM, THREE IN CONTRA
14 COSTA, AND ONE IN ALAMEDA COUNTY THAT PROVIDE FEEDER SERVICES
15 TO BART, AND, BY A LONG-STANDING AGREEMENT, IT'S BEEN IN PLACE
16 SINCE 1997 WHERE IT PROVIDES A SUBSIDY TO THOSE OPERATORS. AND
17 IN THE NEAR-TERM, BART HAS ASKED FOR US TO KIND OF WORK WITH
18 THOSE OPERATORS TO, POTENTIALLY, NEGOTIATE A REDUCTION IN THE
19 NEAR-TERM, AS WELL AS UPDATE THE BASIS FOR THOSE AGREEMENTS
20 GOING FORWARD TO REFLECT MORE MODERN FACTORS. SO WE HAVE BEEN
21 TALKING WITH ALL PARTIES, AND I THINK WE ARE NEARING SOME,
22 SORT OF, AN AGREEMENT. I THINK, BART, IN THE NEAR-TERM, GIVEN
23 THEIR FINANCIAL DIFFICULTIES, WOULD LIKE TO SEE A REDUCTION IN
24 THE NEAR-TERM PAYMENT, WHICH THEY ANTICIPATE WILL HELP THEM.
25 YOU KNOW, EVERY LITTLE BIT HELPS THEM KIND OF EXTEND THEIR



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 RUNWAY AND ABILITY TO OPERATE UNTIL THERE'S SOME, SORT OF,
2 BRIDGE FUNDING THAT COULD HELP WITH THE FINANCIAL SITUATION.
3 WE HOPE AGAIN BY THAT TIME YOU MEET FOR YOUR COMMISSION
4 MEETING, WE'LL HAVE SOME RESOLUTION TO THAT, AS WELL.

5

6 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** THANK YOU.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. BACK TO OUR VICE CHAIR, PAPAN.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** SORRY. I DROPPED OFF FOR A MINUTE. YEAH,
11 I AM WITH COMMISSIONER GLOVER ON THIS ONE. YOU KNOW, IT SEEMS
12 LIKE PASSING THE BUCK TO THOSE OPERATORS WHO CAN LEAST AFFORD
13 IT, AS WELL, HERE. I JUST THINK WE NEED TO BE A LITTLE MORE
14 CONCERNED WITH BART AND HOW THEY SPEND THEIR MONEY. WE JUST
15 WERE SENT SOME OF THE INVESTIGATORS REPORTS. THEY SPENT
16 300,000 ON HOMELESS AND ONLY RELOCATED ONE PERSON. SO, YOU
17 KNOW, I JUST THINK INSTEAD OF IT BEING PUT ON THE OPERATORS
18 WHO ARE REALLY STRUGGLING TO GET PEOPLE TO BART, LET'S JUST
19 TAKE A CLOSER LOOK, PLEASE, BECAUSE WE NEED TO GET PEOPLE ON
20 TRANSIT ANY WAY WE CAN. SO, THANK YOU FOR WORKING WITH --
21 THROUGH THIS DEAL, BUT, I AM CONCERNED. THANK YOU.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** DULY NOTED. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY
24 QUESTIONS, COMMENTS? AGAIN, I'LL LOOK TO OUR CLERK AND SEE IF



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 THERE IS ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WHO HAS ANYTHING TO SAY ON
2 THIS PARTICULAR ITEM?

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
5 WRITING, AND I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND
6 RAISED.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WITH THAT I'LL BRING IT BACK TO MY
9 COLLEAGUES. IS THERE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE
10 REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTION 4556 TO THE COMMISSION FOR
11 APPROVAL?

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO MOVED CHAVEZ.

14

15 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AND THE SECOND BY?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** SECOND, GLOVER.

18

19 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. ROLL CALL PLEASE.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR RABBITT?

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** AYE.

24

25 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1

2 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

7

8 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

9

10 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

13

14 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

17

18 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

21 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

22

23 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING ON,

24 THEN, TO AGENDA ITEM 4A. THE UPDATE ON THE TRANSIT OPERATIONS



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 FISCAL CLIFF. WILLIAM BACON IS HERE TO TALK ABOUT WHERE THAT
2 CLIFF IS AND HOW WE CAN TAKE A DETOUR.

3

4 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBITT. GOOD MORNING
5 COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS BILL BACON WITH MTC STAFF IN THE
6 FUNDING POLICY AND PROGRAM SECONDS. ITEM 4A ON YOUR AGENDA AND
7 TODAY IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM TO CONTINUE THE CONVERSATION
8 THAT THIS COMMITTEE HAS HAD OVER THE COURSE OF THE PANDEMIC
9 ABOUT THE FINANCIAL CHALLENGES FACING THE CONTINUED OPERATION
10 OF BAY AREA TRANSIT SYSTEMS AT THE MOST BASIC LEVEL OF
11 DELIVERY OF TRANSIT SERVICE TO RIDERS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
12 SORRY. THANK YOU FOR BRINGING UP THE SLIDES. THANK YOU. THIS
13 ITEM AIMS TO PROVIDE THE COMMITTEE WITH A BETTER UNDERSTANDING
14 OF WHAT HAS BEEN REFERRED TO AS THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF. AND
15 WE'RE FRAMING A DISCUSSION INTO FOUR KEY AREAS. FIRST, I'LL
16 PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW OF SOME OF THE KEY THEMES TO EMERGE FROM
17 THE RECENTLY COMPLETED REIMAGINED SHORT RANGE TRANSIT PLAN
18 PROCESS, WHICH PRESENTED OPERATORS WITH A SCENARIO PLANNING
19 EXERCISE TO CONSIDER WHAT THEIR AGENCY SERVICE MIGHT LOOK LIKE
20 OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS AROUND VARYING LEVELS OF REVENUE NEXT
21 LOOKING AT SETTING SYSTEMS HERE IN THE BAY AREA TODAY AND
22 USEFUL TO UNDERSTAND HOW RIDERS ARE USING TRANSIT RIGHT NOW
23 AND MOST IMPACTED CHANGES IN SERVICE. OUTCOMES OF TRANSIT IN
24 THE ACKNOWLEDGE YEARS BY DISCUSSING CHALLENGE REVENUE AND
25 BUSINESS MODELS OF SOME OF OUR OPERATORS AND THE FINANCIAL



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 PRESSURE THIS HAS PLACED ON SOME OF THE MOST IMPORTANT TRANSIT
2 SERVICES. AND THEN FINALLY I'LL TALK BRIEFLY ABOUT HOW MTC AND
3 TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE WORKING TOGETHER TO ADVOCATE AND
4 IDENTIFY SOLUTIONS TO SAVE TRANSIT SERVICE AND KEEP THE SYSTEM
5 RUNNING. GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, AS I MENTIONED,
6 THIS FIRST SECTION WILL FOCUS ON THE REIMAGINED SHORT RANGE
7 TRANSIT PLANNING PLANS OR SRT POWERS. NEXT SLIDE. IN APRIL
8 LAST YEAR MTC KICKED OFF A REIMAGINED SRTP PROCESS WITH EACH
9 OF THE BAY AREA OPERATORS PREPARATION OF THE NEAR-TERM TRANSIT
10 PLAN HAS BEEN A LONG-STANDING MTC POLICY GUIDED BY FEDERAL
11 PLANNING REGULATIONS. TYPICALLY THOSE SRTPS IN THE BAY AREA
12 HAVE COVERED A TEN YEAR PERIOD WITH SINGLE SET OF REVENUE
13 ASSUMPTIONS FOR ACROSS ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS GIVEN IMPACTS OF
14 THE PANDEMIC STAFF FELT DEVELOPMENT OF THE SRTP PRESENTED A
15 CRITICAL OPPORTUNITY TO ENGAGE WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS IN A
16 FOCUSED SCENARIO PLANNING EXERCISE EXPLORE HOW OVER A FIVE
17 YEAR PERIOD, REVENUE WOULD IMPACT SERVICE PROVIDED TO USERS.
18 GOAL OF THE SRTP WAS TO EXPLORE WHAT SERVICE MIGHT LOOK LIKE
19 UNDER DIFFERENT REVENUE CONSTRAINTS AND IT'S IMPORTANT THAT I
20 EMPHASIZE THAT THE SCENARIOS AND THE REVENUE ENVELOPES WERE
21 NOT INTENDED TO BE PREDICTIVE OF EXACT OUTCOMES OR EVEN THE
22 MOST LIKELY OUTCOME. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE REIMAGINED SRTPS
23 PRESENTED OPERATORS WITH A KEY QUESTION, WHAT MIGHT BAY AREA
24 TRANSIT SERVICE LOOK LIKE OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS UNDER
25 DIFFERENT REVENUE CONSTRAINTS. SO MTC STAFF IN COLLABORATION



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 WITH TRANSIT OPERATORS DEVELOPED THREE COMMON REVENUE SCENARIO
2 CONCEPTS THAT EVERY OPERATOR WOULD RESPOND TO IN THEIR SRTPS.
3 THE FIRST WHICH WE CALL ROBUST RECOVERY LOOKED AT WHAT IF
4 TOTAL REVENUES RETURN TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS ADJUSTED FOR
5 INFLATION. THE NEXT WAS WHAT WE CALL THE TAX REVENUE RECOVERY
6 WITH FEWER RIDERS. SO THIS IS WHAT IF FARE REVENUES REMAIN
7 DEPRESSED BUT OTHER REVENUE SOURCES RECOVER TO PRE-PANDEMIC
8 LEVELS AND THEN FINALLY WHAT WE CALL SOME PROGRESS REVENUE AT
9 85% THIS IS WHAT IF REVENUES RECOVERED TO ABOUT 85% OF PRE-
10 PANDEMIC LEVELS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS FIRST SCENARIO
11 EXPLORED WHAT TRANSIT SERVICE WOULD LOOK LIKE IF TRANSIT
12 OPERATING REVENUES RETURNED TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS, ADJUSTED
13 FOR INFLATION, AND A KEY THEME THAT EMERGED ACROSS OPERATORS
14 IS THAT IT COSTS MORE TO DO LESS TODAY THAN IT DID FOUR YEARS
15 AGO. COSTS HAVE INCREASED SUBSTANTIALLY, ABOUT 30% ACROSS THE
16 REGION DUE TO LABOR CONTRACTS AND HIGHER FUEL COSTS IN
17 PARTICULAR OVER THE LAST FEW YEARS. AND ACROSS THE REGION,
18 EVEN WITH INFLATION ADJUSTED REVENUE LEVELS BACK TO PRE-
19 PANDEMIC LEVELS WE WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO DELIVER THE LEVEL OF
20 TRANSIT SERVICE THAT WE HAD PRE-PANDEMIC. ON THE RIGHT HAND
21 SIDE OF THE SLIDE HERE AS WELL AS NEXT FEW SLIDES YOU'LL SEE
22 KEY THEMES AND DATA HIGHLIGHT AND TRENDS THAT EMERGE ACROSS
23 THE DESSERTS OF S RTP THAT WERE PREPARED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
24 THE SECOND SCENARIO LOOKED AT WHAT IF TRANSIT FARE REVENUES
25 REMAIN DEPRESSED MEANING WE HAVE FEWER RIDERS BUT OTHER



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 REVENUES, MOSTLY TAX REVENUES, RECOVER TO PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS.
2 HERE THE STARK STORY THAT EMERGED IS THE KEY REGIONAL TRANSIT
3 SERVICES AROUND THE BAY AREA WOULD FACE HOLLOWING OUT OF
4 SERVICE TO A DEGREE THAT WE NEVER BEFORE EXPERIENCES.
5 UNFORTUNATELY, THIS SCENARIO MOST CLOSELY TRACKS WITH WHAT
6 WE'RE SEEING TODAY IN THE BAY AREA. UNDER THE SECOND SCENARIO,
7 FISCAL AND SERVICE IMPACTS WOULD VARY TREMENDOUSLY ACROSS
8 OPERATORS AND OPERATORS THAT WERE DEPENDENT ON TRANSIT FARES
9 BEFORE THE PANDEMIC WOULD BE MOST IMPACTED FINANCIALLY AND
10 THOSE IMPACTS WOULD FILTER DOWN INTO THE SERVICE THAT THEY
11 COULD PROVIDE THEIR RIDERS. HERE ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE I'LL
12 HIGHLIGHT BART WHICH IN THIS SCENARIO WOULD ONLY BE ABLE TO
13 OPERATE ABOUT 22% OF PRE-PANDEMIC REVENUE VEHICLE HOURS. NEXT
14 SLIDE PLEASE. IN THIS THIRD SCENARIO, WE ASK THE QUESTION,
15 WHAT IF TOTAL REVENUES DON'T RECOVER BEYOND 85% OF PRE-
16 PANDEMIC LEVELS. HERE WE WOULD SEE, AS YOU MIGHT IMAGINE,
17 ACROSS THE BOARD REDUCTIONS IN TRANSIT SERVICE. THIS SCENARIO
18 HELPS ILLUSTRATE THERE IS NOT A 1-TO-1 LINK BETWEEN REVENUE
19 AND AMOUNT OF SERVICE THAT CAN BE DELIVERED BY OPERATORS. YOU
20 WILL SEE DESPITE ONLY 15% DROP IN OPERATING REVENUES WE WOULD
21 EXPECT TO SEE 30% REDUCTION IN THE LEVEL OF TRANSIT SERVICE
22 HOURS DELIVERED. THANKFULLY THIS APPEARS MOST UNLIKELY IN THE
23 THREE SCENARIOS BUT NONETHELESS ILLUSTRATES HOW SMALL DECREASE
24 IN REVENUE CAN HAVE SIGNIFICANT IMPACT ON THE LEVEL OF SERVICE
25 THE BAY AREA OPERATORS CAN DELIVER. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 DATA YOU SEE HERE ON THIS SLIDE IS COMPARING THE LAST FULL
2 PRE-PANDEMIC FISCAL YEAR, 202018, 2019, TO UPCOMING FISCAL
3 YEAR 2023, 2024 ON A PERCENTAGE OF PRE-PANDEMIC BASIS. YOU CAN
4 SEE ON THE LEFT-HAND SIDE OF THE SLIDE COMPARISON ACROSS THE
5 THREE REIMAGINED SRTP SCENARIOS, LEFT TO RIGHT, REVENUE
6 VEHICLE HOURS, MILES, EMPLOYEES NUMBER OF OPERATORS AND
7 RIDERSHIP. ON THE RIGHT SIDE OF THE CHART FOUR LARGEST TRANSIT
8 OPERATORS SFMTA, BART, AC TRANSIT, AND VTA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
9 BEFORE I WRAP UP THIS FIRST PART OF THE PRESENTATION, I WANT
10 TO EMPHASIZE THREE KEY THEMES THAT EMERGE FROM THE SCENARIO
11 PLANNING EXERCISE. FIRST, THAT FARE BOX DEPENDENT OPERATORS
12 REMAIN ACUTELY VULNERABLE TO SLUGGISH RIDERSHIP RECOVERY. 100%
13 OF PRE-PANDEMIC REVENUES ARE NOT SUFFICIENT TO RESTORE 100% OF
14 PRE-PANDEMIC SERVICE. THIRDLY AND QUITE IMPORTANT THE FISCAL
15 CLIFF IS NOT THE ONLY CHALLENGE FACING OPERATORS FOR SOME
16 AGENCIES OPERATOR AND RECRUITMENT RETENTION ARE AND REMAIN A
17 SIGNIFICANT CHALLENGE IF NOT MORE THAN THE FISCAL CHALLENGE
18 THAT THE AGENCIES FACE, AND THAT CREATES A SIGNIFICANT BARRIER
19 TO RESTORING TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS CLOSER TO THE LEVELS THAT
20 WERE PROVIDED PRE-PANDEMIC. FOR COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF
21 THE PUBLIC WHO ARE INTERESTED IN LOOKING AT THE DETAILS OF THE
22 REIMAGINED SRTP SCENARIOS AS THEY WERE SUBMITTED TO MTC BY
23 OPERATORS THEY ARE AVAILABLE FOR DOWNLOAD ON THE MTC WEBSITE
24 AT THE ADDRESS NOTED HERE ON THE SLIDE. YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT
25 SLIDE, PLEASE. IN THIS NEXT PORTION OF THE PRESENTATION, I'LL



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 FOCUS ON SOME KEY STATISTICS ABOUT OUR TRANSIT OPERATING
2 SYSTEM HERE IN THE BAY AREA. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE BAY AREA
3 HAS BEEN EXTREMELY FORTUNATE OVER THE LAST THREE YEARS TO HAVE
4 RECEIVED \$4.4 BILLION IN EMERGENCY FEDERAL TRANSIT OPERATING
5 SUPPORT. THESE FUNDS HAVE BEEN CRITICAL FOR AGENCIES DEPENDENT
6 ON PASSENGER FARES, BRIDGE TOLLS, PARKING REVENUES AND ALL OF
7 OUR OPERATORS. SIMPLY PUT, WITHOUT THE FEDERAL RELIEF, THE BAY
8 AREA WOULD NOT HAVE A FUNCTIONING REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM
9 TODAY. YOU CAN SEE HERE ON THE TWO CHARTS, THE AMOUNTS OF
10 FEDERAL RELIEF THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS HAVE RELIEVED ACROSS THE
11 FOUR TRANCHING OF FUNDING REPRESENTED BY DIFFERENT COLORS AS
12 ALLOCATED BY MTC AND THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION. NEXT
13 SLIDE PLEASE. MTC STAFF HAVE REGULARLY UPDATED THIS COMMITTEE
14 WITH RIDERSHIP DATA OVER THE COURSE OF THE PANDEMIC AND BASED
15 ON THE MOST RECENT COMPLETE SET OF DATA AVAILABLE FROM
16 NOVEMBER 2022 RIDERSHIP ACROSS THE BAY AREA HAS REACHED 55%
17 PRE-PANDEMIC LEVELS ON A MONTHLY BASIS. WHILE MUCH BELOW THE
18 PRE-PANDEMIC LEVEL IT'S IMPORTANT NOT TO UNDERSTATE HOW
19 IMPORTANT TRANSIT SERVICE REMAINS IN THE BAY AREA WITH OVER 2
20 MILLION TRIPS TAKEN TRANSIT DURING THE MONTH OF NOVEMBER. NEXT
21 SLIDE PLEASE. ON THIS SLIDE YOU CAN SEE THE ACTUAL RIDERSHIP
22 RECOVERY RELATIVE TO NOVEMBER 2019 LEVELS FOR EVERY OPERATOR
23 IN THE BAY AREA. THE OPERATORS IN RED HAVE SEEN BETWEEN A 32
24 AND 49% RECOVERY, IN YELLOW, 50 TO 59, BLUE, 60 TO 79%
25 RECOVERY, AND MARIN TRANSIT IN GREEN WAS THE ONLY OPERATOR IN



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 NOVEMBER OF LAST YEAR THAT TOPPED 80% OF ITS PRE-PANDEMIC
2 LEVELS AT 86% OF 2019 LEVELS RECOVERY BY OPERATOR GENERALLY
3 REFLECTS TYPE OF DESTINATIONS SERVED AND DEMOGRAPHICS OF
4 RIDERS EACH AGENCY OPERATORS PRIMARILY SERVING RIDERS WITHOUT
5 ACCESS TO OTHER MODES OF TRANSPORTATION HAVE TYPICALLY SEEN
6 THE MOST ROBUST RECOVERY. IN THESE FOUR SECTIONS, WE ZERO IN
7 ON OUTLOOK FOR TRANSIT OVER THE COMING YEARS BY DISCUSSING THE
8 CHALLENGED REVENUE AND BUSINESS MODELS OF SOME OPERATORS AND
9 FINANCIAL PRESSURE. WHY OPERATES ARE FACING IMMINENT FISCAL
10 CRISIS WHILE OTHERS HAVE A LONGER RUNWAY FOR FACING
11 SIGNIFICANT OPERATING CHALLENGES IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND
12 THE REVENUE MODELS OF OUR REGION'S TRANSIT OPERATORS BASED ON
13 THEIR BUDGETS BEFORE THE PANDEMIC EACH AGENCY IS UNIQUE BUT
14 ACROSS OUR TWO DOZEN OPERATORS THEY CAN BE GROUPED INTO FOUR
15 DIFFERENT MODELS. FIRST MODEL UPPER LEFT ORANGE COLORED BOX
16 REPRESENTS USER FEE FOCUSED REVENUE MODEL FARE TOLLS PARKING
17 REVENUES FORMED COERCE OF OPERATING BUDGET AGENCIES LIKE BART
18 AND GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT FERRY ARE EXAMPLES EVER USER FEE
19 FOCUSED AGENCIES. YELLOW ARE AGENCIES WHERE SALES TAX
20 DOMINATES PROVIDING 70% OR MORE OF OPERATING REVENUES A
21 COMBINATION OF LOCAL APPROVED SALES TAX MEASURES AS WELL AS
22 DEVELOPMENT OF TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT AGENCIES LIKE VTA
23 SAMTRANS ARE EXAMPLES OF OPERATORS WHERE SALES TAX REVENUE
24 FORMED OVERWHELMING MAJORITY OF OPERATING REVENUES. SALES TAX
25 REVENUES HAVE PROVED RESILIENT OVER THE COURSE OF THE PANDEMIC



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 RELATIVE TO OTHER TYPES OF REVENUE AND SOMEWHAT INSULATED FROM
2 IMPACTS OF INFLATION. MOVING TO THE LOWER LEFT, IN GREEN, ARE
3 AGENCIES WITH MIXED OF TAX BASED REVENUE SOURCES, SUCH AS
4 PROPERTY TAXES, PARCEL TAXES, ALONG WITH SALES TAXES. AGENCIES
5 LIKE AC TRANSIT AND MARIN TRANSIT ARE GOOD EXAMPLES ARE
6 AGENCIES THAT RELY ON A MIX OF SOURCES. MORE DIVERSE SET OF
7 REVENUE IS A GOOD THING FOR RESILIENCE MOSTLY TRUE BUT THE
8 MARKETS OF HIGH INFLATION HAVE ERODED PURCHASING POWER OF MANY
9 PROPERTY AND PARCEL TAXES TRANSIT OPERATORS. FINALLY LOWER
10 RIGHT GRAY AGENCIES, AGENCIES WITH A TRULY UNIQUE MIX OF
11 REVENUE SOURCES SUPPORTING THEIR OPERATING BUDGET THESE CAN BE
12 MUSEUM GENERALLY FUND REVENUES PARKING CITATION REVENUES
13 TRANSFERS FROM OTHER TRANSIT OPERATORS FUNDS FROM OUTSIDE THE
14 BAY AREA EXAMPLES OF THESE TYPES ARE OPERATORS ARE SFMTA,
15 WESTCAT, AND ACE. EACH OPERATOR IN THIS GROUP FACES UNIQUE
16 CIRCUMSTANCES AS A RESULT OF THE PANDEMIC. THIS SLIDE FOCUSES
17 ON THE REVENUE MODEL OF TRANSIT OPERATORS WHICH IS AN
18 IMPORTANT PART OF THE REASON WHY TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE IN
19 THEIR RESPECTIVE FINANCIAL POSITIONS TODAY IT'S IMPORTANT TO
20 UNDERSTAND THAT TRANSIT OPERATORS BUSINESS MODELS ARE THE
21 TYPES OF BUSINESS THEY PROVIDE AND DEMOGRAPHICS OF RIDERS THEY
22 TARGET IS KEY TO UNDERSTANDING THEIR CURRENTLY FINANCIAL
23 POSITION. I'LL GO INTO THIS NEXT IF YOU CAN GO ON TO THE NEXT
24 SLIDE. EACH OF THE BAY AREA'S TWO DOZEN TRANSIT OPERATORS HAS
25 A BUSINESS MODEL. WE MAY NOT TALK ABOUT IT THAT FREQUENTLY BUT



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 THE SERVICES ARE BUILT TO SERVE UNIQUE TRAVEL MARKETS
2 OPERATING AT DIFFERENT TIMES OF THE DAY OR WEEK TRAVELING AT
3 DIFFERENT SPEEDS, FREQUENCIES AND AT DIFFERENT COSTS TO USERS.
4 IN OUR REGION THE TRANSIT BUSINESS MODEL THAT'S BEEN MOST
5 IMPACTED BY THE EFFECTS OF THE PANDEMIC IS THE MODEL THAT
6 FOCUSED ON MOVING HIGH VOLUMES OF WEEKDAY TRAVEL PATTERNS INTO
7 DENSE BUSINESS DISTRICTS OR JOB RICH CORRIDORS PLACES LIKE
8 DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO OAKLAND, SERVICES LIKE BART CALTRAIN
9 FERRIES COMMUTER FOCUSED EXPRESS OR TRANSBAY SERVICES HAVE
10 SEEN FUNDAMENTAL CHANGES IN THE PATTERNS OF THEIR CORE
11 RIDERSHIP GIVEN RISE OF REMOTE AND HYBRID WORK. ON THIS SLIDE
12 YOU CAN SEE IN THE GRAPH RESULTS OF ONGOING DOWNTOWN RECOVERY
13 STUDY JOINTLY CONDUCTED BY UC BERKELEY AND UNIVERSITY OF
14 TORONTO WHICH HAS BEEN TRACKING ACTIVITY IN DOWNTOWNS AND
15 CITIES ACROSS NORTH AMERICA HERE ARE SELECTED REGIONS YOU SEE
16 SAN FRANCISCO HAS THE LOWEST RECOVERY RATE IN THEIR
17 TERMINOLOGY OF ANY DOWNTOWN ACTIVITY RELATIVE TO ANY OTHER
18 CITY IN NORTH AMERICA. AS OF LAST FALL, DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO
19 WAS IT'S ONLY DELIVER% OF PRE-PANDEMIC ACTIVITY LEVELS. WHERE
20 THERE ARE SIGNS ACTIVITY IN CORE BUSINESS DISTRICTS STARTING
21 TO PICK UP IN EARLY 2023 RELATIVE TO THE PAST FALL IT'S CLEAR
22 THAT THE BAY AREA LAGS FAR BEHIND MANY PEER REGIONS INCLUDING
23 SOUTH OF LOS ANGELES IN THE RECOVERY DEMAND FOR PEEK TRAVEL
24 HOUR TO DOWNTOWN BUSINESS DISTRICTS. THIS REPRESENTS ONGOING
25 CHALLENGES TO THE BUSINESS MODEL FOR SOME OF THE BAY AREA'S



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 KEY REGIONAL TRANSIT SERVICES THAT OPERATE THE BACKBONE OF THE
2 INTERCOUNTY TRANSIT NETWORK IN OUR REGION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
3 JUST TO ILLUSTRATE SOME OF THE CHALLENGES, THE CHANGES TO
4 THESE BUSINESS MODELS HAVE FORCED UPON OPERATORS HERE ARE A
5 FEW IMAGINES SHOWING THE STATE OF OUR SYSTEM TODAY, ESPECIALLY
6 FOR THE KEY REGIONAL SERVICES. AND A FEW KEY THEMES THAT HAVE
7 EMERGED INCLUDE RELATIVELY STRONG DID DEMAND FOR TRAVEL ON
8 WEEKENDS, SHIFTING OF TRAVEL PATTERNS TO OTHER TRAVEL SERVICE
9 DUE TO SOMETIMES STILL SUSPENDED TRANSIT ROUTES OR REDUCED
10 FREQUENCIES ON SOME ROUTES, AND OVERALL LESS DEMAND FOR PEAK
11 RAIL PEAK HOUR TRAVEL RAIL AND BUS SERVICES THIS REALITY HAS
12 BEEN ESPECIALLY CHALLENGING TO AGENCIES LOGOS YOU SEE HERE
13 OTHER OPERATORS INCLUDING SFMTA HAVE BEEN IMPACTED BY
14 CHALLENGES TO THEIR BUSINESS MODEL OVER THE LAST THREE YEARS.
15 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. GETTING AT THE HEART OF THE CHALLENGE
16 BEFORE US AS A REGION IS THE SOBERING FINANCIAL OUTLOOK FOR
17 THE BAY AREA'S TRANSIT OPERATORS. OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS,
18 BAY AREA TRANSIT OPERATORS ANTICIPATE ACCUMULATIVE OPERATING
19 SHORTFALL SO THIS IS A SHORTFALL TO DELIVER AND OPERATE
20 SERVICE OF BETWEEN TWO AND A HALF AND \$3.3 BILLION DOLLARS.
21 THIS RANGE OF POTENTIAL SHORTFALLS REFLECTS UNCERTAINTY OF
22 COMING YEARS LOWER END OF THE RANGE WOULD REQUIRE MAKING HARD
23 DECISIONS SUCH AS DELAYING THE ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS TRANSITION,
24 CANCELLING KEY VISION ZERO STRAIGHT SAFETY PROJECTS AND
25 CUSTOMER-FACING REPAIRS ASSETS LIKE ESCALATES AND ELEVATORS.



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 YOU SEE ANTICIPATED SHORTFALLS FOR THE HIGH END OF THAT
2 POSSIBLE RANGE \$3.3 BILLION OVER THE COMING YEARS OUT TO
3 FISCAL YEAR 2027, 2023. THIS REPRESENTS A POTENTIAL TRANSIT
4 OPERATING SHORTFALL UNLIKE ANYTHING THE BAY AREA HAS EVER
5 EXPERIENCED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND FINALLY IN THESE LAST
6 COUPLE OF SLIDES I'LL TALK ABOUT HOW MTC AND TRANSIT OPERATORS
7 ARE WORKING TOGETHER TO ADVOCATE AND IDENTIFY SOLUTIONS TO
8 PROTECT TRANSIT SERVICE AND KEEP THE SYSTEM RUNNING. NEXT
9 SLIDE PLEASE. GIVEN THE MAGNITUDE OF THE CHALLENGE FACING THE
10 REGION AND TO PRESERVE TRANSIT SERVICE, MTC TRANSIT OPERATORS
11 AND ADVOCATES FROM A BROAD CROSS SECTION OF THE COMMUNITY HAVE
12 BEEN WORKING TOGETHER TO ADVOCATE IN SACRAMENTO AND TELL THE
13 STORY OF TRANSIT RIDERS AND THE CONSEQUENCES OF NOT ADDRESSING
14 THIS LOOMING FISCAL CLIFF. NEXT SLIDE. FINALLY, AS A PART OF
15 MTC AND TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF'S WORK TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL
16 CLIFF, WE REMAIN FOCUSED ON DELIVERING THE PRIORITIES
17 IDENTIFIED IN THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, WHICH
18 ARE KEY TO MAKING OUR TRANSIT SYSTEM WORK BETTER FOR USERS.
19 MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF HAVE PRESENTED TO THE BAY AREA
20 LEGISLATIVE CAUCUS TO HELP MEMBERS OF THE LEGISLATURE BETTER
21 UNDERSTAND THE CRISIS WE FACE WHEN IT COMES TO FUNDING TRANSIT
22 OPERATIONS. AND MTC HAS LED A COALITION OF OVER 50 PUBLIC
23 AGENCIES NON-PROFIT ORGANIZATIONS, BUSINESS GROUPS, AND LABOR
24 SENDING A LETTER TO THE SENATE AND ASSEMBLY COMMITTEES WHICH
25 YOU CAN SEE IN A SCREENSHOT ON THE RIGHT. THIS CHALLENGE IS



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 FRONT AND CENTER FOR MTC AND STAFF AND WE'LL KEEP THIS
2 COMMITTEE AND COMMISSION UPDATED OVER THE COURSE OF THE YEAR,
3 ABOUT THE PROGRESS WE MAKE HOPEFULLY, TO ADDRESS THE FISCAL
4 CLIFF AND PROTECT TRANSIT SERVICE FOR COMMUNITIES. NEXT SLIDE.
5 AND THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. AND A REMINDER THAT ITEM
6 4A IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY TODAY. THANK YOU.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, BILL. VERY MUCH
9 APPRECIATE THAT. AND AS SOMEONE INVOLVED IN BOTH THE CHAIR OF
10 SMART UP HERE IN THE NORTH BAY, ALSO AS A MENTIONED EARLIER,
11 FINANCE CHAIR OF THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, IT APPEARS TO ME THAT
12 THE FISCAL CLIFF IS CERTAINLY THERE FOR SOME ENTITIES AND
13 PERHAPS FOR OTHERS, IT'S JUST REALLY A STEEP -- THE ROADWAY IS
14 A VERY STEEP GRADIENT AS OPPOSED TO JUST A CLIFF BECAUSE IT
15 ALL DEPENDS ON THE FUNDING MECHANISM THAT YOU RELYING UPON.
16 AND TO REBECCA, PART OF THE CHALLENGE IS HOW MANY, TRULY, IN
17 THE BAY AREA ARE SO DEPENDENT UPON THOSE USER FEES, IS IT
18 AROUND FIVE OR SIX, IN MY ESTIMATION, AND I KNOW THERE IS
19 PERHAPS ONLY ONE IN SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA AT METROLINK? AND DOES
20 IT MAKE IT THAT MUCH MORE DIFFICULT TO CONVINCING FRIENDS AT
21 SACRAMENTO THAT WE'RE FACING THIS DILEMMA AND CERTAINLY BEING
22 FELT DIFFERENTLY BY ALL TRANSIT ENTITIES THROUGHOUT STATE.

23

24 **REBECCA LONG:** THROUGHOUT CHAIR?

25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** YES. PLEASE.

2

3 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER RABBITT. YEAH, CERTAINLY
4 THOSE AGENCIES THAT HAD FARE BOX RATIOS, YOU KNOW, OVER 60%,
5 WERE IN THE MINORITY. BUT WHAT'S INTERESTING IS, YOU KNOW, AS
6 BILL NOTED, BECAUSE OF COST INCREASES, AS WELL, ALMOST ALL
7 AGENCIES ARE FACING SOME KIND OF FISCAL CLIFF OVER THE NEXT
8 FIVE YEARS. RIGHT? BECAUSE THEIR REVENUE CERTAINLY HAVEN'T
9 RECOVERED AND IF YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT A RECOVERY OF OUR GOLD
10 STANDARD HERE LIKE WITH MARIN TRANSIT, WHERE IT'S AROUND 80%,
11 THAT STILL MAKES A DIFFERENCE. RIGHT? AND SO YOU DO HAVE
12 DEFICITS, YOU KNOW, ACROSS MANY, MANY AGENCIES, AND WE ARE
13 STILL CULLING THROUGH THE RESEARCH, THE SURVEY DATA THAT
14 TRANSIT AGENCIES STATEWIDE HAVE PROVIDED THE CALIFORNIA
15 TRANSIT ASSOCIATION. BUT SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA HAS A LARGER
16 FISCAL CLIFF THAN WE DO ACCORDING TO THAT SURVEY DATA. SO,
17 EVEN THOUGH THEY'RE OVERALL FARE BOX RATIO WASN'T AGAIN NEARLY
18 AS HIGH AT BART OR CALTRAIN'S, THEY'RE STILL STRUGGLING WHEN
19 THEY LOOK OUT INTO THE FORECAST.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THAT. THANK YOU. TO OUR CHAIR,
22 ALFREDO PEDROZA.

23

24 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU CHAIR RABBITT. AND THANK YOU FOR
25 YOUR PRESENTATION. I WAS LOOKING FORWARD TO THAT. I'LL START



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 OFF WITH A COMMENT. I WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE OPERATORS THEY
2 HAVE BEEN DOING THE BEST JOB THEY CAN, GIVEN THE SITUATION
3 WE'RE IN. AND I KNOW THERE HAS BEEN A LOT OF COLLABORATION
4 AMONG THEM. SO I JUST WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THEM. SLIDE 14 WHERE
5 YOU TALK ABOUT THE FISCAL CLIFF -- YOU DO NOT NEED TO PULL IT
6 UP, I THINK ILLUSTRATING HOW EVERY AGENCY MIGHT HIT IT AT A
7 DIFFERENT TIME, I THINK THAT'S A VERY IMPORTANT POINT TO TAKE
8 AWAY. RIGHT? THAT NOT IS ALL EQUAL AT THAT POINT BUT
9 UNDERSTAND WHAT THAT IS AND ONE THING THAT I DIDN'T SEE MAYBE
10 I MISSED IT -- AS WE TALK ABOUT THAT, I THINK ABOUT THE
11 TRANSIT DEPENDENT RIDER AND TO ME THAT HAS TO COME UP TOP.
12 RIGHT? AND AS YOU CONTINUE TALKING TO OPERATORS, TO ME THAT'S
13 WHAT WE LEARNED THROUGHOUT PANDEMIC, FOLKS THAT HAVE CHOICES,
14 GOOD, SO WHAT YOU TAKE PUBLIC TRANSIT, BUT FOR THOSE WHO
15 DON'T, I WANT TO HAVE A QUICK RESPONSE TO THAT, BUT JUST
16 WANTED TO SHARE THAT.

17

18 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU CHAIR PEDROZA. WE COMPLETELY AGREE AS
19 STAFF. ONE OF THE THINGS WE WERE TRYING TO HIGHLIGHT IS
20 OPERATORS THAT HAVE SEEN A HIGHER RECOVERY OF RIDERSHIP ARE
21 OPERATOR THAT IS PRIMARILY CARRYING PASSENGERS THAT HAVE NO
22 OTHER CHOICES, ESSENTIAL WORKERS TO USE A, SORT OF, PANDEMIC
23 TERM PEOPLE WHO RELY ON TRANSIT TO GET AROUND. SO I AGREE THAT
24 STORY IS SOMETHING WILL CONTINUE TO TELL AND ELEVATE HIGHER IN
25 FUTURE DISCUSSIONS.



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1

2 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** AND TO REBECCA, MAKING SURE WU WOO WHEN WE'RE
3 TALKING TO OUR PARTNERS NO SACRAMENTO AND THE FEDERAL
4 GOVERNMENT TO KNOW THAT FOLKS WE NEED TO HELP MOST NEED OUR
5 HELP RIGHT NOW AND IT'S A PARTNERSHIP WITH THE FEDERAL
6 GOVERNMENT.

7

8 **REBECCA LONG:** CERTAINLY.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

11

12 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** I WANT EXCITED TO SEE THIS. I THINK THIS
13 IS THE HARSH REALITY, AND YOU KNOW, IT'S -- TO HEAR THAT WE
14 MAY BE PUSHING A SIDE OUR VISION FOR ZERO TRANSITIONS, ALL THE
15 AMAZING THINGS THAT WE HAVE BEEN FOCUSING TOWARDS, I FEEL FOR
16 THE OPERATORS. THE STARK STATISTIC WAS 30% MORE TO DO LESS,
17 AND, OKAY, I GET IT. IT'S A REALITY HERE. I WOULD LIKE TO
18 POINT TO MAKING THE CASE, THE SLIDE THERE, AS WE MOVE FORWARD
19 HERE, WE ABSOLUTELY, POSITIVELY, MUST BE POSITIONED IN SUCH A
20 WAY THAT WE ARE SERVICING, AS OUR CHAIR SAID, THE MOST -- THE
21 PEOPLE WHO ARE MOST DEPENDENT ON RIDERSHIP. BUT IF YOU ARE
22 DESCRIBING THIS TO THE LEGISLATURE HERE, AS YOU DID, IT'S NOT
23 TRANSPARENT. DELIVERING TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN, IT
24 JUST SAYS FARE PAYMENT, CUSTOMER INFORMATION. I THINK WE
25 TALKED ABOUT -- AND I HOPE, BECAUSE WE REALLY -- WE WANT TO



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 PREVENT THE CLIFFS WHERE WE CAN, AND WE WANT TRANSIT TO BE IN
2 A POSITION WHERE CUSTOMERS KNOW, THIS IS GOING TO BE GREAT
3 MOVING FORWARD HERE. THE WAY IT'S DESCRIBED DOES NOT REALLY
4 EMPHASIZE WHAT THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE SAID. IT'S NOT REALLY
5 IN, LIKE, ENGLISH, HERE. IF IT'S FARE INTEGRATION WE'RE
6 TALKING ABOUT, IF IT'S SIGNAGE, AND TIME TABLES, THAT KIND OF
7 THING, THESE ARE THE THINGS THAT, I THINK WE DISCUSSED, THAT
8 WE WOULD LIKE SOME, SORT OF, A RESOLUTION FROM THE TRANSIT
9 BOARDS, THAT THEY'RE ON BOARD WITH, BUT IT'S JUST NOT
10 PRESENTED IN SUCH A WAY THAT ANYBODY LOOKING AT IT WOULD SAY,
11 OH, WOW, THE FUTURE IS GOING TO BE GREAT WHEN WE DO SPEND THE
12 MONEY AND TRY TO PREVENT THESE CLIFFS FROM HAPPENING. SO I
13 KIND OF GET WHAT WE ARE SAYING HERE, FARE PAYMENT CUSTOMER
14 INFORMATION TRANSIT NETWORK PRIORITY, ACCESSIBILITY IT'S JUST
15 NOT COMPASSIONATE ENOUGH AND I DO NOT REALLY THINK IT REFLECTS
16 WHAT THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEE SET FORWARD HERE. SO IF WE CAN
17 BE A LITTLE MORE, I GUESS, SPEAKING IN ENGLISH, AND PRESENTING
18 WHERE ANYBODY WHO LOOKS AT IT KNOWS WE'RE HEADING IN THE RIGHT
19 DIRECTION, ABSOLUTELY MUST GET FUNDING TO MOVE FORWARD, THE
20 CONSUMER, STATE LEGISLATURE, EVERYBODY WHO IS GOING TO PUT
21 THAT MONEY IN NEEDS TO KNOW IT'S GOING TO BE BETTER AND IT'S
22 GOING TO REALLY ENCOURAGE PEOPLE MAKE IT A BETTER EXPERIENCE.
23 AM I GETTING THROUGH? IS IT -- [LAUGHTER] CAN SOMEBODY --
24 [LAUGHTER]
25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

2

3 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** PLEASE.

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** ALIX BOCKELMAN, DEPUTY DIRECTOR FOR POLICY.

6 THANK YOU VERY MUCH VICE CHAIR PAPAN YOU'RE REALLY

7 HIGHLIGHTING, AND WHAT OUR CHAIR SAYS, FOCUSING ON THE

8 OUTCOMES WE'RE TRYING TO GET OUT OF THE ACTION PLAN AND SEE

9 DEFINITELY WHAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT THE SLIDE DOESN'T DO THAT

10 WELL SO CERTAINLY DO BETTER IN OUR FUTURE PRESENTATIONS.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** BECAUSE IT F WE ARE ABLE TO DO BETTER IT

13 WILL BE MORE EXCITING IT WILL BRING PEOPLE INTO THE FOLD HERE

14 WE WANT OUR OPERATORS TO SUCCEED NO DOUBT ABOUT IT BUT IT HAS

15 TO BE PUT IN A WAY THAT CUSTOMERS UNDERSTAND AND THE STATE

16 LEGISLATURE WILL SEE THAT SO I HOPE WHEN WE WORK WITH THE

17 OPERATORS ARE WE'RE WORKING WITH THEM ON SOME, SORT OF,

18 PRESENTATION OR RESOLUTION FOR THEIR BOARDS TO GET THE BUY-IN

19 AS WELL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. REBECCA, PLEASE.

22

23 **REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, CHAIR RABBITT. I DID WANT TO ADD ON

24 IN RESPONSE TO COMMISSIONER PAPAN'S COMMENTS. WE HAVE HAD THE

25 OPPORTUNITY TO PRESENT TO THE BAY AREA CAUCUS NOW A COUPLE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 EVER TIMES UPON INVITATION. AND LAST WEEK WE PRESENTED WITH A
2 NUMBER OF THE GENERAL MANAGERS, AND TO YOUR POINT, ONE OF THE
3 THINGS THAT I REALLY TRIED TO BRING TO THE CAUCUS WAS, WHAT
4 DID WE LEARN DURING THE BLUE RIBBON PROCESS IN TERMS OF ALL
5 THE RESEARCH THAT WE DID? WE DID POLLING, WE DID FOCUS GROUPS.
6 WE HAD ONE OF OUR CONSULTANTS DO A SURVEY, 90 DIFFERENT
7 STUDIES ABOUT WHAT'S DRIVING PEOPLE TO TAKE TRANSIT. AND THE
8 BIGGEST THING IS, IT'S CONVENIENT, WHAT DOES THAT MEAN? FAST,
9 RELIABLE, SAFE. SO IT REALLY EMPHASIZED THAT AND THAT DID
10 RESONATE. I WANT TO LIFT UP YOUR COMMENT HERE ABOUT TALKING
11 ABOUT THE RIDERS AND THOSE WHO ARE MOST RELIANT ON TRANSIT
12 BECAUSE THAT'S SOMETHING WE HEARD FROM THE CAUCUS WHEN, YOU
13 KNOW, I THINK IT WAS AC TRANSIT'S GENERAL MANAGER WHO SPOKE
14 ABOUT WHO THEIR RIDERS ARE, AND THE HUGE NUMBERS OF LOW-INCOME
15 RIDERS, PEOPLE OF COLOR, AND STUDENTS WHO WERE RELIANT ON
16 TRANSIT, AND I THINK THAT REALLY RESONATED. SO IT'S A GOOD
17 REMINDER FOR ALL OF US TO LEAD WITH THE PEOPLE WHEN WE'RE
18 TALKING ABOUT THIS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** JUST AS A QUICK FOLLOW UP, PLEASE?

21

22 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** YES.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** SO, REBECCA, THANKS. THAT'S GREAT. BUT
25 WHAT WE DON'T -- WE -- YOU KNOW, THE CONSUMER HAS BEEN CLEAR



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 ON WHAT THEY'RE LOOKING FOR HERE. BUT WE'RE NOT SEEING IN THE
2 REQUESTS FOR FUNDING AND PREVENTING PEOPLE GOING OFF A CLIFF
3 IS KIND OF WHAT THE OPERATORS WOULD BE DOING TO ACCOMMODATE.
4 AND I THINK THAT IS REALLY GOING TO BE KEEP FOR BUY-IN FROM
5 ANYBODY MOVING FORWARD HERE. SO, IF WE CAN, SOMEHOW
6 INCORPORATE THAT IN INTO WHAT'S GOING HAPPEN WITH FUTURE
7 FUNDING AND FUTURE OPERATIONS. THEY TALK ABOUT THE CASE, OR
8 THE BUSINESS MODEL, SO MAYBE THAT'S WHERE IT CAN BE INSERTED
9 HERE. THE BUSINESS MODEL HERE IS GOING TO PIVOT, WE'RE GOING
10 TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS SEE THIS WHEN WE DO HEAD IN THIS
11 DIRECTION, AND WE CONTINUE OUR BUSINESS PLANS, THEY WILL
12 INCLUDE THESE THINGS. YOU KNOW? AND I GET IT, NOBODY CAN
13 AFFORD A WHOLE BUNCH OF NEW THINGS. BUT COMMON SENSE, WE DO
14 HAVE TO SHOW SOME IMPROVEMENT SOMEHOW ON THOSE ELEMENTS. THANK
15 YOU VERY MUCH.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY COMMENTS?
18 I JUST GOT TO SAY, AGAIN, I THINK, AS THE CHAIR STATED IT, IT
19 JUST GOES TO SHOW YOU HOW DIFFICULT IT IS TO BE IN THE TRANSIT
20 WORLD RIGHT NOW, AND REALLY TRYING TO NAVIGATE THE POST-COVID
21 LIFE. NOT ONLY IS TELECOMMUTE GOING TO TAKE A PERCENTAGE OF
22 FOLKS AWAY FROM THE TRANSIT, WHICH, ON THE COMMUTE SIDE OF
23 THINGS -- AND WE HAVE THE COMMUTE SIDE VERSUS TRANSIT
24 DEPENDENT SIDE BOTH OF WHICH HONESTLY NEED TO BE SERVED. AND
25 ONE OTHER UNIQUE ASPECT OF THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, WHICH I



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 THINK PUTS IT IN ALMOST A SEPARATE CATEGORY IS FOR EVERY
2 DOLLAR SPENT ON TOLLS, 50% OF THAT STAYS AT THE BRIDGE TO
3 MAINTAIN THE BRIDGE. SO, WHEN TOLLS GO DOWN BY 30%, THE BRIDGE
4 KEEPS THE SAME AMOUNT OF DOLLARS. IT'S THE BUS AND FERRY THAT
5 RECEIVE THAT MUCH LESS. SO, IT GETS A LITTLE MORE EXPONENTIAL,
6 AND QUITE HONESTLY THE BEST THING FOR THE BRIDGE DISTRICT IS
7 FOR DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO TO REOPEN. AND ONE COULD ASK THE
8 QUESTION WHETHER OR NOT IT'S BETTER TO HAVE PEOPLE
9 TELECOMMUTING GOING FORWARD. I KNOW THERE IS COMPLICATED ISSUE
10 THERE IS, AS WELL SO DO APPRECIATE THE DISCUSSION AND THE
11 BREADTH OF THE PROBLEM ACROSS ALL SECTORS. BUT DO KNOW THAT
12 HOW WHERE THOSE FUNDS COMES FROM, MAKE A BIG DIFFERENCE TO THE
13 DIFFERENT AGENCIES, AND WHEN THEY WILL HIT THAT CLIFF OR WALL,
14 OR WHATEVER IT IS THAT'S GOING TO FORCE THEM TO MOVE IN A
15 DIFFERENT DIRECTION. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANYTHING BEEN BEFORE WE
16 -- WE WILL GO TO THE PUBLIC. THIS IS AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM. NO
17 ACTION IS REQUIRED. I SEE HANDS RAISED AND I'LL LET KIMBERLY
18 LEAD US TO THAT.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
21 WRITING. I HAVE BOB ALAN AND ADINA LEVIN WITH A HAND RAISED.
22 OH THERE ARE MORE. DO YOU WANT TO STICK WITH TWO MINUTES? OR
23 DO YOU WANT TO CHANGE THE TIME?

24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** ONE MINUTE 30 SECONDS. WE'RE RUNNING
2 SHORT OF TIME.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** 90 SECONDS. BOB ALAN, UNMUTE YOURSELF.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** BOB ALLEN URBAN HABITAT, THE RIDERS, AND ALSO THE
7 WORKERS I KNOW THIS WASN'T THE INTENTION BUT WE WENT
8 THROUGHOUT TRANSPORTATION SUSTAINABILITY PLAN BEFORE LOOKED AT
9 WAGES HEARD A LOT ABOUT STATEMENTS INITIALLY ABOUT WHAT WAS
10 DRIVING COST WENT BACK AND LOOKED AT DISAGGREGATE WAGES FROM
11 HEALTH CARE COST AND MENTIONED ESSENTIAL WORKERS, THE
12 PRESENTATION IS BROKEN OUT, I DON'T THINK IT WAS THE INTENTION
13 BUT WHAT'S IN LABOR CONTRACTS, HEALTH CARE COST WAGES TO KEEP
14 PEOPLE WORK IN THE BAY AREA AND IN HOURGLASS ECONOMY I DON'T
15 THINK THAT WAS THE INTENTION BUT WITH THE WORKER SHORTAGE I
16 THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE TO PAY PEOPLE TO HAVE THE ABILITY TO
17 LIVE AND WORK HERE IT'S ABOUT ALL OF THE OTHER TRIPS THAT ARE
18 NON-COMMUTER TRIPS MOST COMMUTE TRIPS ARE NON-COMMUTE TRIPS,
19 AS SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS MENTIONED I APPRECIATE THAT LOOKING
20 FORWARD WE DON'T KNOW THE ECONOMIC GEOGRAPHY OF THE BAY AREA
21 WE APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY I WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE NUANCE
22 IN TERMS OF COST OF RUNNING SERVICE BUT ALSO THE BENEFIT TO
23 PROVIDING LIVING WAGE QUALITY JOBS IN A VERY UNEQUAL BAY AREA.
24 THANK YOU.

25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN,
2 FOLLOWED BY VEDA FLOREZ.

3

4 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN WITH
5 SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND TRANSBAY COALITION, PAR TO VOICES FOR
6 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION DOING WHAT WE CAN TO SUPPORT
7 INITIATIVE FOR FISCAL GAP FUNDING TO PREVENT THE FISCAL CLIFF.
8 WE HAVE HAD A PETITION WITH GOING ON A THOUSAND SIGNATURES
9 THAT WE ARE ENCOURAGING PEOPLE TO CONTACT THEIR STATE
10 LEGISLATORS. WE ARE HAVING WORKSHOPS AND EVENTS AND
11 PRESENTATIONS WORKING WITH A VARIETY OF COALITION AND
12 COMMUNITY GROUPS, ENCOURAGING PEOPLE TO CONTACT THEIR
13 LEGISLATORS SO THAT THEY WILL HEAR FROM VOTERS. WANTED TO
14 BUILD ON ALSO SOME THINGS THAT BOB ALLEN SAID AND THAT WERE
15 BROUGHT UP IN TERMS OF THAT TRANSFORMATION. THE DATA AND
16 STORIES THAT ARE STARTING TO COME OUT OF THAT BAY PASS, ALL
17 AGENCY TRANSIT PASS PILOT FROM UNIVERSITIES AND AFFORDABLE
18 HOUSING, IS REALLY COMPELLING IN TERMS OF PROVIDING THAT
19 INCREASED CONVENIENCE THAT ALSO PROVIDES GREATER MOBILITY AND
20 MORE EQUITABLE ACCESS AND INCREASING TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AMONGST
21 PEOPLE WHO REALLY NEED THAT MOBILITY AND LOOKING AT THOSE
22 SCHEDULES IN TERMS OF SERVING MORE KINDS OF RIDERS AND MORE
23 KINDS OF TRIPS. AND BEING MORE HUMAN CENTERED IN TELLING THAT
24 STORY IS GOOD. THANK YOU.

25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. VEDA FLOREZ? MISS FLOREZ,
2 PLEASE GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **VEDA FLOREZ:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS VEDA FLOREZ,
5 I'M ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL HERE IN MARIN COUNTY. AND I
6 WANTED TO POSE A QUESTION OR A COMMENT. AND OUT OF ALL THE
7 TRANSIT OPERATORS IN THE REGION, THE SMALLER OPERATORS IN THE
8 NORTH BAY ARE MORE RESILIENT AT OR ABOVE THE 60% RIDERSHIP
9 RECOVERY. IS THERE ANYTHING THAT WE CAN LEARN FROM THESE NORTH
10 BAY OPERATORS? SO, I'M TALKING ABOUT MARIN TRANSIT, SMART,
11 SOUL TRAIN, PETALUMA TRANSIT THAT COULD BE TRANSLATE TO OTHER
12 AREAS OF THE REGION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
15 RAISED, FROM MR. CHAIR.

16

17 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
18 RAISED. THANK YOU VERY MUCH TO MY COLLEAGUES, BILL, ALIX,
19 REBECCA, THERESA APPRECIATE IT. MOVING TO ITEM 4B MAJOR
20 PROJECTS ADVANCEMENT POLICY MAP KENNETH F IS GOING TO GIVE A
21 PRESENTATION.

22

23 **KENNETH FOLAN:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR RABBITT MTC STAFF. KENNETH
24 FOLAN MTC STAFF. PLEASE PULL UP THE POWERPOINT. THIS IS THE
25 MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY UPDATE. THE MAP. NEXT SLIDE,



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 PLEASE. AS YOU RECALL, IT WAS ADOPTED IN OCTOBER OF 2022. IT'S
2 REALLY FOCUSED ON IMPLEMENTING PLANNED BAY AREA FUNDING
3 STRATEGIES, PRIORITIES, POLICY REENFORCEMENTS AND RISK
4 MANAGEMENT. AND AS WE'RE NOTING TODAY, CONTINUAL UPDATES WILL
5 BE REQUIRED TO MOVE ALL OF THESE PROJECTS FORWARD. NEXT SLIDE
6 PLEASE. SO TODAY IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. AND WE PLAN TO HAVE
7 A, SORT OF, THREE MONTH PROCESS HERE FOR THIS UPDATE. TODAY
8 WE'RE GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE STAGE GATES AND MAP PROGRAMMATIC
9 CATEGORIES. IN MARCH WE'LL BE COMING BACK WITH UPDATED
10 INFORMATION ON THE ENDORSEMENT TABLE, INCLUDING NEW PROJECT
11 COST INFO, FUNDING AWARDS SINCE OCTOBER, AND ANY OTHER NEW
12 IDENTIFIED SOURCES. AND FINALLY WE WOULD BE BRINGING AN ITEM
13 TO THE COMMITTEE TO CONSIDER ADOPTIONS OF MAP REVISIONS THAT
14 WOULD GO IN APRIL, AN ACTION ITEM, BASED ON THOSE THREE AREAS.
15 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS THE ENDORSEMENT TABLE ADOPTED IN
16 OCTOBER. THERE ARE NO CHANGES TO THIS TABLE TODAY. THIS WILL
17 COME BACK TO YOU IN MARCH SHOWING YOU THE SUGGESTED TABLES.
18 MOST OF THE INFORMATION WILL BE FACTUAL FROM PROJECT RESPONSES
19 ON PROJECT COST INFORMATION, AS WELL AS ON RECENT AWARDS. AND
20 WE'LL TALK ABOUT THOSE AWARDS IN A COUPLE OF SLIDES. AND
21 ALWAYS TO, SORT OF, REMEMBER THAT THE BASELINE OF THE MAP IS
22 FROM PLANNED BAY AREA, THE PROJECTS HAVE TO BE IN PLANNED BAY
23 AREA TO BE IN THE MAP. AND THEN THE MAP WILL ALSO BE
24 CONSISTENT WITH OUR REGIONAL STRATEGIES, THE BIPARTISAN
25 INFRASTRUCTURE LAW REGIONAL STRATEGY, THE CAP-AND-TRADE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 FRAMEWORKS INCLUDING THE TRANSIT AND INNER CITY RAIL CAPITAL
2 PROGRAM, AND FINALLY THE STATE SENATOR BILL REGIONAL POLICIES
3 THAT WE HAVE ADOPTED THROUGH MTC. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS
4 JUST SHOWING YOU THE TIRCP FRAMEWORK CONSISTENT WITH THE LAST
5 SLIDE. WE'LL TALK IN A SECOND ABOUT AUGMENT ONE COLUMN.
6 BECAUSE THAT IS THE COLUMN THAT THERE HAVE BEEN SOME AWARDS
7 THAT WERE ANNOUNCED IN JANUARY. SO I'LL GET TO THOSE SOON. THE
8 AUGMENT ONE, FOR TIRCP IN SOME OF THE AWARDS WERE ANNOUNCED
9 FOR EXISTING PROJECTS, BUT THERE WILL BE FURTHER AWARDS
10 ANNOUNCED FOR NEW PROJECTS AND FOR THE PROJECT DEVELOPMENT
11 CATEGORY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, HOW WILL THE ENDORSEMENT
12 TABLE CHANGE AS PART OF THE MARCH INFORMATION ITEM, AND WITH
13 THE PROPOSED ACTION IN APRIL. THERE WILL BE UPDATED ANNOUNCED
14 COST INCREASES, UPDATED GRANT AWARDS, INCLUDING SALES TAX
15 EXPENDITURE PLAN APPROVALS IF THAT IS THE CASE. AND POTENTIAL
16 CONSIDERING ANY REBALANCING BASED ONWARDS TO DATE THAT WOULD
17 BE A SHIFTING OF SOME ENDORSEMENT TARGETS THAT ARE IN THE
18 COLUMNS LISTED ON THE TABLE. FUTURE REBALANCING WILL BE
19 REQUIRED AS MORE CYCLES IN FEDERAL AND STATE FUND BECOME
20 AVAILABLE AND AWARDS ARE ANNOUNCED. NEXT SLIDE. THIS IS
21 HIGHLIGHTING SOME OF THE PROPOSED CHANGES THAT WE'LL SHOW YOU
22 IN MARCH. OBVIOUSLY SOME GREAT NEWS FOR BAY AREA PROJECTS AS
23 PART OF THE STATE TRANSIT AND INNER CITY RAIL ANNOUNCEMENTS
24 FOR THE EXISTING PROJECTS. LISTED HERE, THE AWARD FOR \$367
25 MILLION TO COMPLETE THE FUNDING PLAN FOR THE ELECTRIFICATION



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 PROJECT, THE BARC CORE CAPACITY PROJECT WAS AWARDED 250
2 MILLION, AS WELL AS BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE 2, 375
3 MILLION. THERE WAS ALSO AN AWARD FOR THE SMART PROJECT THAT
4 WASN'T ON THIS SLIDE, BECAUSE IT WASN'T PART OF THE NAMED
5 PROJECTS, BUT THAT WAS A 30-OR-SO MILLION DOLLARS AWARD FOR
6 THAT PROJECT. THESE WERE THE EXISTING PROJECTS. NEXT PART OF
7 THE TIRCP AWARDS WILL BE FOR NEW PROJECTS AND/OR PROJECT
8 DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, ON TO THE SECOND
9 PART OF THE PRESENTATION IS THE STAGE GATE PROCESS FOR THE
10 MAP. SO, WHAT I WANT TO WALK THROUGH NOW IS THE PRINCIPLES,
11 THE FRAMEWORK, AND THEN, IMPORTANTLY, THE PROCESS OF HOW WE
12 ARE GOING TO, SORT OF, DEVELOP THE EVALUATIONS AND BRING TO
13 YOU FOR PROPOSED ACTION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, ON THE
14 PRINCIPLES AND WELCOME INPUT ON THIS, AND OBVIOUSLY THE ENTIRE
15 PRESENTATION THAT WE HAVE PUT TOGETHER TODAY, WE'RE TRYING TO
16 MAKE IT A PRACTICAL CUSTOMER FOCUSED EVALUATION. OBVIOUSLY,
17 AGAIN, PLANNED BAY AREA IS THE BASELINE. A REGIONAL
18 PERSPECTIVE WITH PARTNERSHIP AT ITS CORE, AND, REALLY, WE'RE
19 STARTING TO INVIGORATE OUR PARTNERSHIP WITH STATE AND FEDERAL
20 FUNDING PARTNERS THAT ARE OBVIOUSLY BIG INVESTORS IN MANY OF
21 THESE PROJECTS. AND THEN FINALLY, NOTING THAT THERE MAY BE A
22 NEED FOR A REGIONAL FORUM OF PEERS WITH EXPERTISE AND PROJECT
23 DELIVERY TO ASSIST WITH THIS EVALUATION PROJECT BEFORE IT GOT
24 TO THE COMMISSION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, THIS IS AN
25 ILLUSTRATION THAT WE BROUGHT TO YOU IN OCTOBER. WE ADDED SOME



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 INFORMATION HERE, BUT IT JUST KIND OF SHOWS WHERE PROJECTS
2 ARE. AGAIN, STARTING WITH THE BASELINE OF PLANNED BAY AREA,
3 MOVING PROJECTS AND MAP LEVEL THREE WOULD BE IN THE CONCEPTUAL
4 PHASE OR EARLY STAGES OF A PROJECT, ALL THE WAY UP TO LEVEL
5 ONE PROJECTS IN REVENUE SERVICE. THE STATE GATE PROCESS WILL
6 NEED FLEXIBILITY TO ADOPT TO CHANGES IN PLANNED BAY AREA. SO
7 AGAIN THAT CYCLE OCCURS EVERY FOUR YEARS, IN THE MIX OF
8 PROJECTS, THE FISCAL CONSTRAINT COULD CHANGE. SO, THE MAP
9 WOULD NEED TO REACT TO THAT. ONE OTHER THING I'LL NOTE ON THIS
10 IS THAT AT THE COMMISSION WORKSHOP THAT WE HAD LAST YEAR BOTH
11 THE COMMISSIONERS AND SOME OF THE GUEST SPEAKERS NOTED A FEW
12 THINGS, ONE WAS TO MAKE SURE WE ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THE EXISTING
13 FTA PROJECT OVERSIGHT PROCESS, IN THAT IS A ROBUST PROCESS,
14 AND THAT REALLY OCCURS UP TOWARDS THE TOP RIGHT OF THIS SLIDE,
15 PROJECTS IN LEVEL ONE THAT HAVE FULL FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENTS.
16 AND PART OF THE ROLE OF THE FUNDING PARTNERS AT PROJECTS IN
17 THAT AREA IS TO WORK WITH FTA, USE THEIR PROCESS AND
18 PARTICIPATE IN THAT PROCESS TO MITIGATE RISK AND TO BRING THE
19 PROJECTS TO REVENUE SERVICE. BUT THE OTHER THING NOTED BY MANY
20 OF THE PARTICIPANTS AND COMMISSIONERS AT THAT WORKSHOP WAS THE
21 IMPORTANCE OF, SORT OF, RISK IDENTIFICATION AND RISK
22 MITIGATION EARLIER IN THE PROJECT PIPELINE PROCESS. SO, THAT
23 WOULD BE PROJECTS AT MAP LEVEL THREE OR JUST NEW INPUT INTO
24 PLANNED BAY AREA, PROJECTS, THERE CERTAINLY IS A ROLE FOR
25 THIS, SORT OF, REGIONAL GUIDANCE FOR PROJECTS THERE TO MAKE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 SURE WE'RE IDENTIFYING RISK AND DEALING WITH THEM EARLY IN THE
2 PROJECT CYCLES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS IS AN EVALUATION
3 PROCESS. AN EXAMPLE. WE'RE TRYING TO KEEP THE PROCESS CLEAR,
4 FLEXIBLE, TRANSPARENT. AND JUST TO WALK THROUGH HOW IT WOULD
5 WORK. A PROJECT SPONSOR IS ASSIGNED A CERTAIN LEVEL, AND THEY
6 MAY REQUEST TO MOVE UP FROM LEVEL ONE TO LEVEL TWO OR MAYBE
7 MTC STAFF IDENTIFIES POTENTIAL OBSTACLES THAT NEED TO BE
8 ADDRESSED WITH THE PROJECT. SO MAYBE THAT COULD BE AN IMPETUS
9 FOR DOING AN EVALUATION. NEXT UP WOULD BE MTC STAFF WOULD LEAD
10 WITH CONSULTANT TO ASSIST IN DEVELOPMENT AND EVALUATION
11 PROCESS SPECIFIC TO THE PROJECT BASED INPUTS AND MAIN
12 ESTABLISHED EVALUATION RATING SYSTEM. MTC REQUESTS FURTHER
13 DETAIL IF NEEDED, DEVELOPING RECOMMENDATIONS, AND THOSE
14 RECOMMENDATIONS WOULD THEN BE BROUGHT TO THE COMMISSION FOR
15 APPROVAL. I KNOW WE COULD POTENTIALLY HAVE A STEP BEFORE THAT
16 LAST ONE WHERE THERE COULD BE SOME, SORT OF, PEER REVIEW OF
17 THIS EVALUATION AS WELL. SO I THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. NEXT
18 SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS IS A MATRIX WITH SOME OF THE POLICY
19 REENFORCEMENTS UNDER CONSIDERATION. COMMISSIONER PAPAN HAD A
20 QUESTION, I BELIEVE, RELATED TO THIS SLIDE ON THE BAY PASS,
21 AND HER QUESTION WAS "WHICH AGENCIES ARE PARTICIPATING? " AND
22 I BELIEVE FOR AT THE BAY PASS PILOT PROGRAM, IT IS ALL THE BAY
23 AREA AGENCIES THAT ARE PARTICIPATING IN CLIPPER. SO,
24 ESSENTIALLY IT'S ALL OF OUR AGENCIES IN THE BAY AREA ON THAT.
25 AND I THINK THAT QUESTION BRINGS JUST AN INTERESTING



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 OBSERVATION. WE HAVE PROJECTS IN THE MAP THAT HAVE BEEN AROUND
2 FOR TEN YEARS IN PROJECT DEVELOPMENT. SOME WILL BE AROUND FOR
3 ANOTHER TEN YEARS OR MORE. AND POLICIES MAY CHANGE. IN PLANNED
4 BAY AREA WE'LL HAVE UPDATES. SO, A TABLE LIKE THIS IS WHAT WE
5 HAVE TODAY, IN SOME CONSIDERATIONS. BUT THE VALUATION WILL,
6 ULTIMATELY BE WHATEVER THE COMMISSION HAS AT THAT MOMENT, AS
7 THEIR ADOPTED POLICIES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS JUST SHOWS
8 SOME OF THE POTENTIAL AREAS OF RISK TO BE EVALUATED IN THE
9 PROCESS. AGAIN, PARTNER AND REINFORCE WITH EXISTING PROCESSES,
10 LIKE THE FTA PROJECT OVERSIGHT PROCESS, AND THEN TRYING TO
11 IDENTIFY RISKS EARLIER IN THE PROJECT PIPELINE. NEXT SLIDE,
12 PLEASE. AND FINALLY THE THIRD AREA THAT WE WILL BE PROPOSING
13 UPDATES TO IS THE PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES. THIS IS AN
14 IMPORTANT PART OF THE MAP, PLANNED BAY AREA NOTED IMPORTANCE
15 OF LOW COST, HIGH PERFORMING PROJECTS TO THE TRANSPORTATION
16 NETWORK, AS IMPORTANT. SO, REALLY ELEVATING THOSE TYPE OF
17 PROJECTS TO HAVE SOME EQUAL FOOTING WITH SOME OF THE MEGA
18 PROJECTS. AND THIS IS JUST TO NOTE THAT THESE PROGRAMMATIC
19 CATEGORIES WILL BE HANDLED, SORT OF, SEPARATELY, EACH CATEGORY
20 MAY HAVE A DIFFERENT PATH TO INCLUSION IN THE MAP. NEXT SLIDE,
21 PLEASE. SO THIS IS JUST A LIST OF THE PROPOSED CATEGORIES, THE
22 NEXT STEPS, A LOT OF THE PROJECTS WILL BE KIND OF IDENTIFYING
23 LEVELS IN MAP WITHIN 2023, SUMMER, INTO THE FALL. WE ARE
24 NOTING ONE, SORT OF, ADJUSTMENT HERE WITH THE TRANSIT
25 EXPANSION CATEGORY, THE FOURTH ONE ON THE LIST, AND THE FIFTH



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 ONE ON THE LIST. AND THAT, I THINK, REALLY SPEAKS TO THE
2 CONVERSATION YOU ALL JUST HAD ABOUT THE IMPORTANCE OF SMALL
3 TRANSIT IMPROVEMENTS IN IMMEDIATE IMPROVEMENTS FOR PEOPLE WHO
4 ARE USING TRANSIT TODAY. SO, WHAT WE'RE ATTEMPTING TO DO HERE
5 IS REALLY ELEVATE TRANSIT PRIORITY NETWORKS. YOU HAD AN ITEM
6 EARLIER ON THE AGENDA, THE TRANSIT PERFORMANCE INITIATIVE
7 WHERE YOU AWARDED \$21 MILLION IN GRANTS FOR SOME REALLY KEY
8 PROJECTS THAT WOULD FIT INTO THIS TRANSIT PRIORITY PROGRAM, AC
9 TRANSIT, McDONALD AVENUE, AND THEN THE MUNI FIVE MINUTE
10 FORWARD -- FIVE MINUTE NETWORK AND THE 29 SUNSET. SO SOME OF
11 THOSE PROJECTS ARE GOING TO BE GOING AROUND CONSTRUCTION IN
12 THE NEXT COUPLE YEARS AND BRINGING IMMEDIATE BENEFIT TIME
13 SAVINGS TO RIDERS WHO ARE ON THE SYSTEM TODAY. THE IDEA HERE
14 CARVING OUT A CATEGORY IN THE MAP FOR THOSE TYPES OF PROJECTS
15 IS TO ELEVATE THEM INTO SHOWING THE IMPORTANCE OF PROJECTS
16 LIKE THAT TO CURRENT RIDERS. SO THAT'S THE END OF MY
17 PRESENTATION, AND AGAIN WE'LL BE BACK WITH THIS IN MARCH THEN
18 PROPOSED ACTION IN APRIL. AND CHAIR RABBITT I'LL GIVE IT BACK
19 TO YOU RIGHT NOW. THANK YOU.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** EXCUSE ME THERE. THANK YOU. APPRECIATE
22 THE PRESENTATION. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES TO SEE IF THERE
23 IS ANY QUESTIONS. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** I'M SORRY. I GOT MY LIST OF QUESTIONS.
2 AS I'M SUPPOSED TO PRESENT HERE. THANK YOU FOR THE
3 PRESENTATION. YOU MENTIONED THE BAY PASS. NOW, THESE ARE
4 QUESTIONS AS THEY RELATE TO THE POLICY REENFORCEMENTS. SO,
5 SHOULD THAT BE A POLICY THRESHOLD? MOVING FORWARD? HAS THAT
6 BEEN ADDRESSED?

7

8 **KENNETH FOLAN:** I THINK WE ARE NOT IDENTIFYING AT THE MOMENT AS
9 POLICY THRESHOLDS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO GIVE THE
10 COMMISSION FLEXIBILITY TO EVALUATE WHAT THE COMMISSION WANTS
11 TO EVALUATE. AND THAT, REALLY, FOUNDED IN RISK, IN MAKING SURE
12 THAT WE ARE MITIGATING RISK, MANAGING RISK, AND REINFORCING
13 POLICIES THAT WE HAVE. I DON'T THINK WE WOULD CALL IT A
14 THRESHOLD BUT WE WANT TO MAXIMIZE FLEXIBILITY ON EACH
15 INDIVIDUAL PROJECT EVALUATION LOOKING INTO WHAT WE FEEL ARE
16 THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS TO LOOK INTO.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** DO YOU THINK WE COULD -- ALIX HAS HER
19 HAND UP.

20

21 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I WAS GOING TO ADD THAT AS THE COMMISSION
22 FURTHER CONSIDERS ITS ROLE IN NETWORK MANAGEMENT, I THINK THIS
23 QUESTION OF WHETHER SOME OF THESE SHOULD BE THRESHOLDS, SHOULD
24 BE CONSIDERED AND EVALUATED FURTHER. I THINK IF WE'RE GOING TO
25 MAKE SIGNIFICANT INVESTMENTS IN THESE SYSTEMS, MAKING SURE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 THAT THEY'RE AS AFFORDABLE TO PEOPLE, AS POSSIBLE, I THINK
2 THAT HAVING ALL THE OPERATORS PARTICIPATE IN THESE PROGRAMS IS
3 LIKELY VERY IMPORTANT FOR THAT. I'M THINKING OF CLIPPER START,
4 BUT ALSO THE CLIPPER BAY PASS. SO, OBVIOUSLY SOME OF THOSE
5 STILL IN PILOT. WE NEED TO PROVE THAT THEY ARE, YOU KNOW,
6 PROVIDING THE GOOD AFFORDABILITY AND THE OUTCOMES WE WANT FOR
7 THE CUSTOMERS. BUT IF THEY ARE, THEY MAY, OVER TIME, YOU MAY
8 WANT TO CONSIDER THEM BEING THRESHOLDS TO ENSURE THAT EVERYONE
9 IS GETTING THE BENEFITS.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALIX. I JUST WANT TO MAKE SURE
12 WE'RE TRANSPARENT WITH THE EXPECTATIONS MOVING FORWARD. SO, I
13 THINK WE'RE HEADING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION THERE. QUESTION
14 TWO, REGARDING TRANSIT AND GRADE SEPARATION PROJECTS. THE
15 TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITY POLICY DOES NOT REQUIRE COMPLIANCE
16 FOR A FEW YEARS. OUR LOCAL JURISDICTIONS ARE OVERWHELMED WITH
17 THE HOUSING ELEMENTS. WE'RE REALLY TRYING HARD. I ASSURE YOU,
18 AND HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DIVERT -- HAVE NOT BEEN ABLE TO DIVERT
19 THEIR ATTENTION TO COMPLYING WITH ALL OF THE ELEMENTS OF THE
20 NEW TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES PROJECTS HERE. SO, THE TOC
21 COMPLIANCE SHOULD NOT BE A FACTOR OR THRESHOLD FOR SEVERAL
22 YEARS UNTIL OUR CITIES HAVE HAD THE CHANCE TO MAKE NECESSARY
23 CHANGES FOR COMPLIANCE. SO WE ARE REALLY JUST ASKING, PLEASE,
24 WORK WITH US. WE CAN'T REALLY -- JURISDICTION YOU CAN'T JUST
25 REALLY THROW THEM ALL ON THEM AT ONCE. THE ELEMENTS HAVE BEEN



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 COMPLIED WITH BUT WE DO NEED TO BE CAREFUL AS WE MOVE FORWARD
2 ON THOSE RESTRICTIONS. SO I HOPE YOU WILL WORK WITH US ON
3 THAT. BUT, AGAIN, SINCE THEY DON'T COME INTO PLAY FOR A COUPLE
4 OF YEARS, AND THIS FUNDING NEEDS TO MOVE FORWARD HERE, I DON'T
5 THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE, REALLY TO MAKE IT A RESTRICTION AT
6 THIS POINT IN TIME. CAN SOMEBODY ANSWER THAT?

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SURE, COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I THINK THAT YOUR
9 COMMENT ABOUT ALLOWING JURISDICTIONS A SIMILAR TIME FRAME THAT
10 WE HAVE SET FORTH IN THE TOC POLICY I THINK THAT WE ARE
11 MINDFUL OF THAT, AND I THINK WE'LL TAKE THAT AS GOOD INPUT.
12 YOU KNOW, THIS IS STILL IN DEVELOPMENT, AND I THINK THAT, THAT
13 WAS LIKELY, SORT OF, WHAT WE WERE ASSUMING WHEN WE WERE GIVING
14 JURISDICTIONS TIME WITHIN THE TOC POLICY THAT WE WOULD PROVIDE
15 SIMILAR TIME FRAME HERE.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THAT WOULD BE GREATLY APPRECIATED. THANK
18 YOU. A COUPLE MORE HERE. EXPRESS LANES STRATEGIC PLAN
19 CONTEMPLATES HOV CONVERSION PROJECTS AND STRATEGIC EXPANSION
20 PROJECTS. THE EXPRESS LANE PROJECT'S DESCRIPTION SHOULD BE
21 UPDATED TO REFLECT A RANGE OF PROJECTS INCLUDED IN THE
22 STRATEGIC PLAN. I'M NOT QUITE SURE I'M CLEAR ON THAT ONE.
23 [LAUGHTER] BUT, I HOPE YOU CAN WORK WITH US. AND THEN, TWO, I
24 REALLY WANTED TO NOTE A COUPLE OF THINGS HERE. WHEN WE TALK
25 ABOUT GRADE SEPARATIONS HERE, THEY'RE EXTREMELY IMPORTANT, WE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 ARE ALL EXCITED ABOUT THE ELECTRIFICATION OF CALTRAIN, BUT
2 THREE COUNTIES HAVE MANY GRADE SEPARATIONS, TOO, AND THAT
3 SHOULD NOT BE FORGOTTEN. WE KEEP JUMPING FROM THE DTX TO
4 DIRIDON, AND EVERYTHING IN BETWEEN DOES NEED TO BE -- IT IS A
5 MEGA PROJECT. AND WE NEED TO REALLY MAKE THAT A PART OF THIS
6 PROCESS. I'M HOPING TO TALK TO SOME OF MY COLLEAGUES HERE ON
7 MTC, AND WE'RE HOPING, REALLY, THAT WE CAN LOOK AT THEM AS A
8 GROUP AND, HOPEFULLY GET SOME EFFICIENCIES MOVING FORWARD
9 HERE. BUT WE DO NEED TO UNDERSTAND THAT THAT IS A KEY ELEMENT
10 IN REALLY MAKING ELECTRIFICATION MORE SUCCESSFUL MOVING
11 FORWARD HERE. AND THEN YOUR EXPRESS LANES, GRADE SEPARATIONS,
12 THE ZERO-EMISSIONS, I THINK IS SUPER IMPORTANT TO REALLY
13 MAKING MOVEMENTS THROUGHOUT OUR COUNTY HERE. SAMTRANS, I JUST
14 FOUND OUT CARRIES LOWEST INCOME RIDERS THROUGHOUT THE REGION
15 HERE. AND THEY REALLY -- WE WANT TO MAKE SURE EVERYBODY
16 SUCCEEDS ON. SO, THE TRANSITION TO THESE ZERO-EMISSIONS BUSES
17 IS SOMETHING I AM HOPING ALL THE OPERATORS CAN GET TO. SO,
18 AND, YOU KNOW, WE JUST TALKED ABOUT THE FISCAL CLIFF. SO, I
19 HOPE WE CAN MAKE MAGIC HAPPEN IN ALL OF THIS MOVING FORWARD.
20 [LAUGHTER] I LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH EVERYBODY HERE, AND
21 THE OPERATORS, AND WE CAN TRY TO MAKE THIS REALLY WORK. THIS
22 PRESENTATION IS GOOD, BUT WE REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE IT WORKS
23 FOR EVERYBODY IN THE REGION. THANK YOU.
24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ANYONE ELSE HAVE ANY
2 QUESTIONS? I'M NOT SEEING ANY. AGAIN THIS, IS AN INFORMATIONAL
3 ITEM. I DO SEE A HAND RAISED FROM THE PUBLIC. OH I'M SORRY.
4 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

5

6 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YEAH, THANK YOU. I WAS GOING TO WAIT UNTIL THE
7 PUBLIC COMMENT. BUT I'M HAPPY TO GO NOW AT THE WISH OF THE
8 CHAIR.

9

10 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** SURE.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT I JUST WANTED TO GET
13 STAFF'S FEEDBACK ON. I THOUGHT THAT THE POINT THAT WAS MADE BY
14 OUR PRESENTER ABOUT WHAT ARE THE KEY, REALLY, THRESHOLD
15 QUESTIONS, AND ALIX, THAT YOU JUST REINFORCED AND WHAT THE
16 BOARD SEES AS PRIORITIES RELATIVE TO ASSESS, HOW YOU
17 PRIORITIZE THESE PROJECTS -- AND ONE THING I WAS WONDERING
18 ABOUT WAS, WHAT IS THE TOOL OR MECHANISM THAT YOU WOULD
19 RECOMMEND FOR EACH OF US TO GIVE THAT KIND OF FEEDBACK IS,
20 WOULD BE QUESTION ONE, I'M PRESUMING THAT'S FEEDBACK YOU'RE
21 GETTING REGIONALLY FROM THE OPERATORS, AS WELL? AND HOW IS
22 THAT HAPPENING? AND WHEN WILL THAT BE INCORPORATED?

23

24 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** I'M HAPPY TO START AND KENNETH CAN ADD TO IT.
25 CERTAINLY TODAY WE WERE HOPING TO GET SOME FEEDBACK, BUT I



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 THINK STAFF IS HAPPY TO GET FEEDBACK OFFLINE FROM THE
2 COMMISSIONERS, AS YOU, SORT OF, WORK WITH YOUR JURISDICTIONS
3 OR TRANSIT OPERATORS, IF YOU HAVE CERTAIN, YOU KNOW, POLICY,
4 OR RISK METRICS THAT YOU THINK ARE IMPORTANT FOR US TO LOOK
5 AT. I THINK, YOU KNOW, WE ARE MEETING WITH THE GENERAL
6 MANAGERS, I THINK WE'RE MEETING WITH OTHER STAKEHOLDERS. WE'RE
7 CERTAINLY HAPPY TO TAKE THE INPUT AS IT COMES. WE WERE GOING
8 TO COME BACK IN MARCH WITH A LITTLE BIT MORE INFORMATION. BUT
9 ULTIMATELY WE WERE TARGETING APRIL AS THE TIME THAT WE WOULD
10 ADD IN THE POLICY AND RISK COMPONENTS INTO THE MAP, AS WELL
11 AS, SORT OF, AN UPDATE ON SOME OF THE FUNDING AND COST FOR THE
12 PROJECTS.

13

14 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANKS ALIX, THAT'S VERY HELPFUL. I THINK, JUST
15 BROADLY, THREE CATEGORIES THAT I WOULD BE VERY INTERESTED IN
16 SEEING ARE OVER, YOU KNOW, RIDERSHIP INCREASES, SAFETY ISSUES,
17 WHERE THEY ARE, YOU KNOW, PROFOUND. AND THAT ACTUALLY COULD
18 KIND OF GO INTO A COUPLE OF BUCKETS, BUT I THINK SAFETY IS
19 ONE. AND OVERALL CONGESTION MANAGEMENT. AND PART OF REASON I'M
20 INTERESTED IN THAT IS THAT AS WE'RE SEEING PEOPLE GET BACK ON
21 THE ROADS AND NOT INTO TRANSIT IT'S GOING REQUIRE US TO BE
22 THINKING ABOUT THE KIND OF FLEXIBILITY THAT WE'RE GOING TO
23 HAVE TO, YOU KNOW, HOW PROJECTS COULD ASSIST US IN ADDRESSING,
24 IN ADDRESSING THAT ISSUE, SPECIFICALLY. AND THEN, I WANTED TO
25 JUST REMIND MY COLLEAGUES THAT IN JUNE OF 2022, THE MTC



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 DIRECTED STAFF TO WORK WITH VTA ON LOOKING AT AN EXPRESS LANE,
2 AT THE EXPRESS LANES IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY, TO LOOK AT FUNDING
3 OPTIONS; AND IT MAY ROLL INTO THIS BIGGER CATEGORY THAT I SAW
4 ON ONE OF THE SLIDES. BUT WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO DO IS MAKE SURE
5 THAT STAFF HAS HAD A DISCUSSION WITH SOME RECOMMENDATIONS
6 BEFORE THIS COMES BACK TO THE FULL COMMISSION. BECAUSE I THINK
7 THAT'S IMPORTANT. AND I -- PERIOD. I THINK YOU ALL KNOW WHY I
8 THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT. SO LET ME NOT GO ON ABOUT THAT. AND
9 THEN IF I COULD, I WOULD LIKE TO GO TO ITEM -- SLIDE 15. AND I
10 -- THIS SLIDE WAS INTERESTING TO ME, BECAUSE I THINK THAT I --
11 REVIEWING THIS -- THIS PRESENTATION, I HADN'T FULLY
12 APPRECIATED THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE TRANSIT EXPANSION BECOMING
13 SOMETHING OUTSIDE OF BUS RAPID TRANSIT. AND IN THIS CATEGORY,
14 I WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT I UNDERSTOOD THAT THIS IS -- THIS
15 COULD BE RIDERSHIP ENHANCEMENT, NOT JUST EXPANSION. OR ARE WE
16 REALLY TRYING TO LOOK AT EXPANSION AS A -- YOU KNOW, AS A
17 CATEGORY?

18

19 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THIS IS KENNETH FOLAN MTC STAFF. I THINK THE
20 STAFF THINKING BEHIND THIS WAS THAT WE WANTED TO ALIGN TRANSIT
21 EXPANSION WITH THE FTA SMALL STARTS CATEGORY. THE FTA SMALL
22 STARTS CATEGORY ALLOWS FOR DIFFERENT MODES. IN POTENTIALLY
23 MORE IMPORTANTLY, WE WANTED TO PROVIDE ITS OWN SPACE FOR
24 THESE, SORT OF, TRANSIT PRIORITY PROJECTS THAT AREN'T QUITE AS
25 BIG AS THE FTA SMALL STARTS CATEGORY. SO, WHAT THIS DOES,



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 AGAIN, THE TRANSIT PRIORITY NETWORKS AND STATE OF GOOD REPAIR
2 IS IT ALLOWS FOR PROJECTS TO BE, SORT OF, ROLLED UP INTO A
3 PROGRAM, JUST LIKE THE PROJECTS THAT WERE PRESENTED TO YOU ALL
4 EARLIER WITH THE TRANSIT PERFORMANCE INITIATIVE THAT ARE, SORT
5 OF, THESE QUICK WINS, PROJECTS THAT ARE FOCUSED ON BUS SPEEDS,
6 ON SIGNAL PRIORITIZATION, AND THOSE TYPE OF PROJECTS TO HAVE
7 ITS OWN SPACE ON THE MAP. BECAUSE FROM THE BLUE RIBBON PANEL,
8 FROM OUR OWN ANALYSIS, THOSE TYPE OF PROJECTS GET DONE FASTER.
9 THEY ARE VERY HIGH PERFORMING AND THEY DESERVE THEIR OWN SPACE
10 IN THIS, SORT OF, EQUAL TO OTHER CATEGORY. SO THAT WAS THE
11 STAFF THINKING ON THAT.

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** ONE THING I WOULD JUST ASK THE STAFF TO CONSIDER
14 IS, WHETHER OR NOT -- BECAUSE I THINK ALL OF THAT MAKES SENSE,
15 BECAUSE IT HAS THE ADDED BENEFIT OF NOT ONLY BEING GOOD FOR
16 OUR CURRENT CUSTOMERS, BUT, POTENTIALLY INCREASING RIDERSHIP.
17 BUT WHAT I -- THE REASON I'M REALLY KIND OF STRUGGLING WITH
18 THAT, THEN WHAT THAT MEANS FOR TRANSIT EXPANSION. I THINK THEN
19 THE CATEGORY IS REALLY RIDERSHIP EXPANSION ON TRANSIT VERSUS
20 TRANSIT EXPANSION. BECAUSE WHAT YOU JUST DESCRIBED DOESN'T
21 EXPAND TRANSIT, IT MAKES IT MORE USABLE AND BETTER, WHICH I
22 THINK IS GREAT. AND I THINK THE CAVEAT -- AND IF THE INTENT IS
23 TO HAVE BOTH, THEN I THINK YOU MIGHT EITHER NEED TO BREAK IT
24 UP, OR EXPLAIN IT DIFFERENTLY. BECAUSE WHAT YOU JUST EXPLAINED
25 -- AND I LIKE IT, YOU KNOW, I LIKE -- SOME PROJECTS POPPED TO



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 MIND RIGHT NOW THAT I THINK ARE REALLY WORTH TAKING A LOOK AT.
2 AND THE OTHER THING I JUST WANTED TO SAY IS I REALLY LIKE THE
3 ADDITION OF GOODS MOVEMENT. I THINK SOMETIMES WE FORGET THAT,
4 YOU KNOW, OUR JOB IS MOVING PEOPLE, BUT ALSO MAKING IT
5 POSSIBLE FOR GOODS AND SERVICES TO MOVE EASILY AND FREELY
6 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. IT'S ONE OF THE REASONS THAT, YOU KNOW,
7 FRANKLY, THE BUSINESSES ARE STILL GOING TO OPEN UP HERE, UNTIL
8 -- UNLESS WE DON'TS UNCLOG THESE ROADS WHICH IS A DIFFERENT
9 ISSUE. MY LAST POINT THAT I WANTED TO RAISE IS THAT I DID WANT
10 TO ASK STAFF A QUESTION ABOUT GRADES SEPARATIONS RELATIVE TO
11 THE PRESENTATION YOU JUST GAVE, WHERE WOULD THAT FIT IN
12 CATEGORICALLY IN THIS PRESENTATION?

13

14 **KENNETH FOLAN:** GRADE SEPARATIONS WOULD BE THEIR OWN
15 PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORY, THE SECOND ONE ON SLIDE 15, AND WHAT WE
16 WOULD RELY ON FOR THAT WOULD BE, IMPORTANTLY, THE BILL
17 STRATEGY THAT THE COMMISSION ADOPTED. THAT WOULD BE THE
18 FOUNDATION FOR THIS. THERE IS OBVIOUSLY, ALSO, THE CPUC LIST
19 THAT WOULD INFORM ANY KIND OF LEVELLING OF PROJECTS THERE, BUT
20 THAT'S THE CATEGORY THERE, THE SECOND ONE ON THE LIST.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO, AND KENNETH, THANK YOU FOR NOT SAYING, ON
23 THE SAME PAGE, CINDY, THAT YOU HAVE BEEN ON. WHAT I SHOULD
24 ASK, IN A DIFFERENT WAY IS, DO WE SEE GRADE SEPARATIONS AS, AS
25 GIN WAS A DESCRIBING THEM, I THOUGHT IT WAS INTERESTING -- AS



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 ONE PROJECT OR AS GRADE SEPARATIONS OR AS INDIVIDUAL STREET
2 PROJECTS? AND FOR EXAMPLE WOULD WE BE LOOKING AT GRADE
3 SEPARATIONS ALONG CALTRAIN OR ALONG ANOTHER CORRIDOR? IF I'M
4 LOOK AT JUST TO BETTER UNDERSTAND HOW TO USE THAT CATEGORY?

5

6 **KENNETH FOLAN:** I THINK WE ORIGINALLY STARTED THE MAP WITH MEGA
7 PROJECTS THAT WERE ABOVE THE BILLION DOLLARS. AND THEN WE MADE
8 PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES BECAUSE THERE WERE IMPORTANT PROJECTS
9 THAT KIND OF ROLLED UP TO MORE THAN A BILLION DOLLARS. SO, I
10 WOULD THINK THAT GRADE SEPARATIONS, THERE COULD BE PROJECTS
11 GETTING CLOSE TO A BILLION DOLLARS IN GRADE SEPARATIONS, BUT
12 IT'S A PROGRAM OF PROJECTS THAT WE'RE PUTTING TOGETHER, THE
13 LIST OF PROJECTS, AND AGAIN, SUPPORTED BY THE BILL STRATEGY,
14 THE CPUC LIST, AND NOT ONLY OBVIOUSLY IN THE CALTRANS
15 CORRIDOR, THERE ARE SOME OTHER PARTS OF THE REGION AS WELL,
16 BUT THE IDEA WOULD BE THAT IT SITS ALONE AS GRADE SEPARATIONS
17 IN THE PAP, THAT WE WOULD WORK WITH JURISDICTIONS, TRANSIT
18 AGENCIES, TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ADVOCATING FOR THE FUNDING IN
19 THOSE, AND TO MAKE SURE THEY HAVE AMOUNTS IN THAT ENDORSEMENT
20 TABLE FOR NAMED PROJECTS.

21

22 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO DISCRETE SINGLE PROJECTS VERSUS -- VERSUS YOU
23 KNOW, A CALTRAIN APPROACH, OR A UP APPROACH, OR WHATEVER THE
24 APPROACH IS? IS THAT CORRECT, KENNETH?

25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **KENNETH FOLAN:** GO AHEAD ALIX.

2

3 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SORRY ALIX, THROUGH THE CHAIR.

4

5 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** TO ADD TO WHAT KENNETH WAS SAYING, WE'RE STILL
6 WORKING ON THE GRADE SEPARATION CATEGORY. I THINK TO THE
7 EXTENT THAT WE DID HAVE A SET OF PROJECTS WHETHER IT'S THROUGH
8 CALTRAIN DOING ON ITS CORRIDOR I THINK HAVING SOME, SORT OF, A
9 SET OF PROJECTS THAT CAN BE DELIVERED TOGETHER I THINK COULD
10 REALLY OBVIOUSLY HAVE SOME EFFICIENCIES, WE CERTAINLY WOULD BE
11 LOOKING AT THAT I'M NOT SURE THAT WE'RE QUITE THERE IN THE
12 PLACES IN THE REGION ALONG CORRIDOR, THAT'S A PLACE WE WOULD
13 LIKE TO SUPPORT GETTING THERE NOT NECESSARILY JUST HAVING A
14 SINGLE PROJECTS DELIVERED BY SINGLE JURISDICTIONS BUT SEEING A
15 SET OF GRADE SEPARATION PROJECTS I THINK AGAIN I'M NOT SURE
16 THAT'S QUITE DEFINED YET TO THAT EXTENT IN THE MAP, THIS
17 PRESENTATION WENT DEEPLY, AND WE TALKED ABOUT THE MAP BACK AT
18 THE WORKSHOP, REALLY THE IDEA IS, YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A SET OF
19 REALLY AMAZING PROJECTS THAT YOU ALL APPROVED AS PART OF
20 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND WHAT WE ARE REALLY TRYING TO DO
21 WITH THE MAP, AND THAT'S REALLY WHERE WE ASSESSED THE PROJECTS
22 AND LOOKED AT HOW WELL THEY DID WITH RIDERSHIP AND HOW WELL
23 THEY REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES ET CETERA, WHAT WE TRYING TO DO
24 NOW IS FIGURE OUT HOW WE SEQUENCE AND MAKE SURE WE HAVE THE
25 FUNDING TO DELIVER THOSE PROJECTS AND ESPECIALLY WHEN WE HAVE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 VERY COMPETITIVE FEDERAL AND STATE RESOURCES, HOW DO WE KIND
2 OF ALIGN AND COME TOGETHER AS A REGION AROUND A CERTAIN
3 PROJECT AT CERTAIN CYCLES SO WE COULD BE MOST COMPETITIVE TO
4 GET THEM FUNDED. I DON'T WANT TO LOSE THAT OVERALL, WE'RE
5 TRYING TO BE TAKE THE PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES AS WE CAN, BUT
6 THERE IS STILL MORE WORK TO BE DONE SUCH AS YOUR QUESTIONS ON
7 THE EXPRESS LANES. I THINK WE WANT TO HAVE A STRATEGIC PLAN ON
8 OUR EXPRESS LANES AND OUR TIMING FOR THAT IS SUMMER OF 2023 SO
9 WHEN WE COME BACK IN APRIL I'M NOT SURE WE'LL HAVE ALL THE
10 ANSWERS THAT WE MIGHT WANT ON EXPRESS LANES.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I APPRECIATE THAT. ON THAT, I APPRECIATE ALIX, I
13 WANT TO MAKE SURE THERE IS SERIOUS DISCUSSION THAT HAPPENS
14 BETWEEN THE AGENCIES BEFORE WE COME BACK. I'M CONCERNED,
15 FRANKLY, THAT WE'RE NOT -- THAT WE HAD AN INITIAL DISCUSSION,
16 BUT NOT A VERY DEEP ONE. BECAUSE I REALLY DID EXPECT TO BE
17 ABLE TO HAVE A DISCUSSION ABOUT THAT, AS WE MOVE FORWARD. AND
18 I THINK AS IT RELATES TO EXPRESS LANES THAT, YOU KNOW,
19 ESPECIALLY WHERE WE HAVE OPPORTUNITIES THAT REALLY DO ADDRESS
20 CONGESTION MANAGEMENT, IT'S JUST SOMETHING THAT I'M CONCERNED
21 ABOUT. BUT ALIX THE OTHER POINT YOU RAISED IS A GOOD ONE. I
22 THINK WHAT I'M HOPEFUL ABOUT AND THE REASON I'M LOOKING AT
23 ISSUES, YOU KNOW, GRADE SEPARATIONS IS JUST ONE. BUT IT'S AN
24 IMPORTANT ONE IN A NUMBER OF AREAS. I THINK ONE IS, OBVIOUSLY,
25 ALSO CONGESTION MANAGEMENT. YOU KNOW? WE HAVE GOT -- WE'RE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 HOLDING EACH OTHER UP. OUR MODES OF TRANSPORTATION, WE'RE
2 HOLDING THEM UP, AND THEN WE HAVE GOT SAFETY ISSUES BUT PART
3 OF THE REASON I WAS PRESSING ON THIS, I DO ALSO THINK THAT
4 IT'S SOMETHING THAT WE'RE GOING TO NEED TO CONSIDER IN TERMS
5 OF WHAT OTHER STRATEGIES FOR FINANCING MAY NEED -- THAT WE MAY
6 NEED TO BE THINKING ABOUT RELATIVE TO THE DIFFERENT WAYS THAT
7 WE ADDRESS PROJECT MANAGEMENT. AND IN MY OPINION, IF I THINK
8 ABOUT THE ROLE OF MTC RELATIVE TO MEGA PROJECTS, YOU KNOW, I
9 DON'T KNOW THAT WE EVER WANT TO BE IN THE SITUATION --
10 ALTHOUGH, YOU MAY STOP ME -- FEEL DIFFERENT ABOUT THIS OR
11 COLLEAGUES MAY FEEL DIFFERENTLY ABOUT MANAGING PROJECTS -- BUT
12 I DO THINK THAT HAVING A BIG VISION AROUND REALLY HOW WE'RE
13 GOING TO KEEP THE RESOURCE, ROLLING AND WE'RE ABLE TO REALLY
14 CONTINUE TO IMPROVE THE SYSTEM PART OF THE REASON THAT I WAS
15 RAISING THE QUESTION I THINK FRANKLY BY LOOKING AT IT HELPS US
16 MAKE SOME DECISIONS ABOUT THE APPROACH WE'RE TAKING TO TRYING
17 TO GET MONEY FOR DIFFERENT TYPES OF PROJECTS AND TO ME GREAT
18 STEPS ARE VERY DIFFERENT IN MANY RESPECTS. I REALLY APPRECIATE
19 THE DISCUSSION AS ALWAYS I LEARNED A LOT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** EXHIBITION ARE PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALL OF THAT. ONE
24 LAST QUESTION. I'M SORRY. HIGHWAY 101, 84 PORT OF REDWOOD CITY
25 INTERCHANGE IS IN THE MAP, BUT WILL IT BE INCLUDED IN THE



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 MOVEMENT OF GOODS CATEGORY OR ROADWAY CATEGORY? WE'RE IN A
2 UNIQUE POSITION. WE HAVE GOT A MAJOR PORT IN REDWOOD CITY, AND
3 JUST TO THE NORTH HERE, GOODS COMING IN THROUGH THE AIRPORT.
4 YOU DO NOT HAVE TO ANSWER AT THIS POINT IN TIME IF WE CAN TALK
5 OFFLINE, TO SEE WHERE THAT'S GOING FALL, I WOULD APPRECIATE
6 IT.

7

8 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** LAST CHANCE. NOT SEEING ANYONE. KIMBERLY
9 LEAD US TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOTHING IN WRITING RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM.
12 ADINA LEVIN'S HAND IS RAISED. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF.
13 YOU HAVE 90 SECONDS.

14

15 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS ADINA LEVIN,
16 SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION I SERVE
17 ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL. REPRESENTING MYSELF. WITH THE
18 MAP, ONE THING THAT WAS BRIEFLY MENTIONED IN THE STAFF REPORT
19 WAS ABOUT THE ENTRANCE INTO THE MAP, IN TERMS OF THE PLANNED
20 BAY AREA 2050. AND SINCE THIS COMING YEAR IS GOING TO BE
21 WORKING ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PLUS WITH THE POTENTIAL OF
22 REFINING WHICH NEW PROJECTS MAY GET INTO THE PLAN I THINK IT
23 WOULD BE REALLY HELPFUL AND ALSO EXTREMELY TIMELY TO BE A
24 LITTLE BIT MORE CONCRETE ABOUT HOW THIS WILL REFINE WHICH
25 PROJECTS GET IN AND WHAT CRITERIA AND WHAT STANDARDS WILL



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 ENABLE PROJECTS TO GET IN. I WANT TO AGREE WITH THE DIRECTION
2 IN TERMS OF GOING MORE TOWARDS STANDARDS AND LESS TOWARDS A
3 COMPLETELY AD-HOC CASE BY CASE BASIS. YOU KNOW, HAVING, THERE
4 HAS BEEN A LOT OF WORK, FOR EXAMPLE, IMPROVING STATION ACCESS
5 FOR BART PHASE TWO AND HAVING SOME PASSENGER ACCESS STANDARDS,
6 THAT'S A THING THAT WOULD SAVE MONEY BY STARTING EARLIER ON
7 THAT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
10 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THANK YOU
13 EVERYONE FOR THE DISCUSSION. THANK YOU, STAFF, FOR THE
14 PRESENTATION AND FOR TAKING THAT UNDER CONSIDERATION MOVING
15 FORWARD. WE'LL MOVE TO ITEM 4C WHICH IS HOPEFULLY A FEEL GOOD
16 ITEM ON THE MEASURE THREE UPDATE AND WHEN THOSE CHECKS ARE
17 GOING TO BE WRITTEN. MS. ROMMELL IS GOING TO TELL US THAT.

18

19 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THANK YOU. GIVEN THE LATE HOUR. THIS IS AN
20 INFORMATION ITEM, I THINK YOU'RE ALL UNDOUBTEDLY AWARE BY NOW
21 THAT THE CALIFORNIA SUPREME COURT RECENTLY ISSUED A FAVORABLE
22 RULING AND REGIONAL MEASURE THREE AND WE THOUGHT TODAY'S
23 COMMITTEE WOULD BE A GOOD OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE BRIEF REFRESH
24 INFORMATION UPDATE ON THE LITIGATION AND AS WE'RE INTO THE
25 NOON HOUR I'M HAPPY TO COME BACK AT A LATER TIME. SUFFICE TO



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 SAY THAT WITH THE CALIFORNIA STATE RULING WE'RE PRIMARILY NOW
2 WAITING FOR FINAL ORDERS FROM THE COURT AND THAT WOULD MARK
3 OUR ABILITY TO MOVE FORWARD. IN THE ITEM ITSELF THERE'S A
4 REMINDER FOR WHAT THE EXPENDITURE PLAN FOR RM3 IS. ALSO NOTE
5 WE HAVE ALREADY DEVELOPED POLICIES AND PROCEDURES FOR THE
6 CAPITAL PORTION OF RM3 WHICH WOULD NEED TO BE UPDATED AT SOME
7 POINT, PERHAPS MINOR REVISIONS TO THE CAPITAL PORTION AND WE
8 WILL NEED TO UPDATE OPERATING PROGRAM POLICIES AND PROCEDURES
9 TOO, IN THE COMING MONTHS. AND WE DID HAVE A REMINDER IN THE
10 ITEM ABOUT THE FACT THAT WE HAVE ISSUED APRIL \$600 MILLION IN
11 LETTERS OF NO PREJUDICE TO ALLOW PROJECT SPONSORS TO MOVE
12 FORWARD, KIND OF AT-RISK, WHILE THE RM3 STATUTE WAS UNDER
13 LITIGATION. IN TERMS OF NEXT STEPS, AS I NOTED, WE'RE JUST
14 WAITING FOR THOSE FINAL ORDERS TO COME THROUGH, AND IN THE
15 MEANTIME WE'RE PREPARING THOSE UPDATES TO THE POLICIES AND
16 PROCEDURES. WE DO INTEND TO GO BACK OUT TO THE PROJECT
17 SPONSORS TO PROVIDE UPDATED INFORMATION ON THEIR PROJECTS IN
18 TERMS OF FUNDING PLANS AND EXPENDITURE NEEDS, AND THAT WOULD
19 HELP US TO INFORM HOW QUICKLY WE CAN GO FORWARD WITH
20 ALLOCATIONS AND WHAT OUR FINANCING NEEDS, LONG-TERM, MIGHT BE
21 AS WELL. AND IF THERE ARE PROJECTS THAT NEED ALLOCATIONS, WE
22 BELIEVE THAT IT WILL BE POSSIBLE, IN LATE SPRING, TO MAKE SOME
23 OF THOSE TARGETED ALLOCATIONS AND THEN FOLLOW UP IN LATER
24 MONTHS WITH MORE ALLOCATIONS OF RM3. SO, I'LL STOP THERE, JUST



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 IN THE INTEREST OF TIME, BUT I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS
2 IF THERE ARE ANY.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. REAL QUICK, THERESA, IS THERE A
5 DEFINITIVE DATE ON THE COURT ISSUING THOSE FINAL ORDERS OR IS
6 IT STILL AMBIGUOUS?

7

8 **THERESA ROMMELL:** I BELIEVE IT'S STILL AMBIGUOUS. I BELIEVE WE
9 ARE ANTICIPATING WEEKS NOT YEARS NOW SO IT SHOULD BE IN THE
10 SHORT-TERM.

11

12 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** MUCH APPRECIATION.

13

14 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** KATHLEEN IS HERE IF SHE WANTS TO ADD ANYTHING
15 TO THAT, TO WHAT THERESE SAID, KATHLEEN IS ON THE LINE.

16

17 **KATHLEEN KANE:** THAT'S CORRECT. IT SHOULD BE ADMINISTERIAL AT
18 THIS TIME, BUT ADMINISTERIAL THINGS TAKE A LITTLE BIT TO
19 PROCESS THE PAPERWORK.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WE FOUND THAT OUT. APPRECIATE THE UPDATE.
22 REALLY QUICKLY, ANY QUESTIONS ON THAT, MY COLLEAGUES? AND,
23 KIMBERLY, ANYONE FROM THE PUBLIC WANTING TO SPEAK ON THAT
24 PARTICULAR ITEM?

25



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. MOVING TO 4D CALIFORNIA
6 TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION STATE FUNDING PROGRAMS UPDATE. WE
7 HAVE KENNETH KAO TO GIVE US A BRIEF PRESENTATION. KENNETH?

8

9 **KENNETH KAO:** GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS KENNETH KAO MTC.
10 GIVEN THE LATE HOUR IN THE AFTERNOON, EVERYTHING IS IN YOUR
11 PACKET I WOULD BE HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

12

13 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** APPRECIATE THAT KENNETH. TO MY COLLEAGUES
14 ANYONE WITH QUESTIONS TO KENNETH THAT WAS WITHIN THE PACKET?
15 ANY RAISED HANDS?

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
18 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
19 ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** WRAPPING IT UP, ITEM FIVE GOING BACK TO
22 KIMBERLY SEE IF THERE IS ANYONE WHO WANTS TO SPEAK TO THIS
23 BODY ON ANYONE WITHIN OUR JURISDICTION?

24



FEBRUARY 8, 2023

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
2 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
3 ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** GREAT. THAT LEADS US TO ITEM SIX
6 ADJOURNMENT OUR NEXT MEETING IS GOING TO BE MARCH 8TH
7 WEDNESDAY, AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER. LOOKING FORWARD TO
8 SEEING EVERYONE THERE. TOOK ADVANTAGE OF THE ZOOM OPPORTUNITY
9 WHILE YOU CAN, BUT SEE YOU ALL BACK IN THE SHOP NEXT TIME
10 AROUND. THANK YOU TO EVERYONE. MOSTLY THANK YOU TO STAFF FOR
11 ALL THE GREAT WORK. [ADJOURNED]

12



NTT

Broadcasting Government