

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



APRIL 12, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PLANNING COMMITTEE

FRIDAY, APRIL 12TH, 2024, 9:40 AM

JAMES P. SPERING, CHAIR: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE. THIS MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC AND ABAG WEB SITES COMMITTEE AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND STAFF WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER THERE WILL BE ROLL CALL VOTE TAKEN TODAY BECAUSE OF THE REMOTE PARTICIPANTS. ON OUR AGENDA WE HAVE ACTION ITEM AND INFORMATION ITEM. I THINK THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE IS GOING TO TAKE SOME TIME SO IF WE CAN, STAFF CAN BE QUICK AS THEY GO THROUGH THEIR PRESENTATIONS, I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE LEAVE ENOUGH TIME FOR THE LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE. SO, AS WE GO THROUGH THIS. PLEASE TAKE ROLL CALL.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR SPERING?

CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC: PRESENT.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: AHN?

V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN: HERE.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

3

4 **DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI? GIACOPINI, NON-VOTING?

7

8 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

9

10 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER MAHAN?

11

12 **MATT MAHAN:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS?

15

16 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

19

20 **SUE NOACK:** HERE.

21

22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE A QUORUM.

23

24 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE

25 CONSENT CALENDAR AGENDA ITEM 3A DO WE HAVE EYE MOTION?



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** MOTION.

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** MOTION. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC
5 COMMENT ON THIS ITEM.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR
8 THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH PUBLIC COMMENT
9 AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH RAISED HANDS FOR
10 PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

11

12 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. IF THERE IS NO FURTHER
13 DISCUSSION, TAKE A ROLL CALL, PLEASE, ON THE MTC CONSENT
14 CALENDAR.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR SPERING?

17

18 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** VICE CHAIR AHN.

21

22 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES DUTRA-VERNACI?

2

3 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MAHAN?

6

7 **MATT MAHAN:** AYE.

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOULTON-PETERS? NOACK?

10

11 **SUE NOACK:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

14

15 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
18 PRESENT.

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. I THINK AT
21 THIS TIME I'LL HAND THE MEETING OVER TO THE ABAG
22 ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE, AND THAT WILL BE BELIA R.

23

24 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU CHAIR SPERING. I WOULD
25 LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 COMMITTEE A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS
2 DUE TO REMOTE COMMITTEE PARTICIPATION TODAY. IF WE COULD
3 PLEASE HAVE THE ABAG CLERK CALL THE ROLL AND CONFIRM WE HAVE
4 QUORUM.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU CHAIR RAMOS. MAYOR ARREGUIN?
7 COUNCIL MEMBER ECKLUND?

8

9 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE -- [LAUGHTER] -- OR HERE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR LEE IS ABSENT. SUPERVISOR
12 RABBITT?

13

14 **DAVID RABBITT:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** SUPERVISOR RAMOS?

17

18 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER ROMERO? ROW.

21

22 **CARLOS ROMERO:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND COUNCIL MEMBER SILVA?

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **PAT ECKLUND:** I AM PRESENT AT THE TODD SENIOR CENTER.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. I SEE YOU
4 COMMISSIONER SILVA.

5

6 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. COULD WE HAVE THE ABAG
7 COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT?

8

9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. ACCORDING TO STATE LAW I AM
10 MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT THE MEMBERS OF THE BAG
11 ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE MEETING ARE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$150
12 PER DIEM AND PROVIDING CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
13 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT PER DIEM. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU WE HAVE ONE ITEM FOR
16 OUR CONSENT CALENDAR FOR CONSIDERATION. THAT IS ITEM 6A, OUR
17 MINUTES OF OUR LAST MEETING, DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO
18 APPROVE?

19

20 **CARLOS ROMERO:** I MOVE APPROVAL.

21

22 **PAT ECKLUND:** I'LL SECOND THE MOTION.

23

24 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** MOTION BY ROMERO. SECOND BY
25 ECKLUND. ARE THERE ANY MEMBERS THAT WOULD LIKE TO COMMENT ON



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THIS ITEM? SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK IF THERE IS ANY PUBLIC
2 COMMENT.

3

4 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NO WRITTEN COMMENT FOR
5 THIS ITEM. THERE IS NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK
6 AND NO ONE IN THE ZOOM SPACE WITH THEIR HAND UP WISHING TO
7 PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU SO MUCH WOULD THE CLERK
10 PLEASE CONDUCT A ROLL CALL VOTE.

11

12 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** WILL DO. MAYOR ARREGUIN?

13

14 **V. CHAIR, JESSE ARREGUIN:** AYE.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ECKLUND?

17

18 **PAT ECKLUND:** AYE.

19

20 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** LEE IS ABSENT. RABBITT?

21

22 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

23

24 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RAMOS?

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** ROMERO?

4

5 **CARLOS ROMERO:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** COUNCIL MEMBER SILVA? THE MOTION PASSES
8 UNANIMOUSLY.

9

10 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** THANK YOU. WE WILL GO AHEAD AND
11 RECORD THAT AS AN AYE. I WILL NOW TURN IT OVER TO MY CO-CHAIR,
12 MR. SPERING.

13

14 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. NEXT ITEM IS
15 AGENDA ITEM 7A. THIS IS A WELL-RECEIVED ITEM HERE IN THE
16 REGION, VERY POPULAR AT THIS POINT. THIS IS THE TRANSPORTATION
17 ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVE, 2024 LOCAL PUBLIC FLEET
18 ELECTRIFICATION PLANNING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE RECOMMENDATION
19 THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM FOR THE MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE. JAMES
20 ARE YOU PRESENTING THIS?

21

22 **JAMES CHOE:** YES, I AM.

23

24 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** ALL RIGHT.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **JAMES CHOE:** THANK YOU, CHAIR AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS. I'M JAMES
2 CHO, CLIMATE PROGRAM MANAGER WITH PLANNING AND SECTION AND I
3 COORDINATE OUR TRANSPORTATION ELECTRIFICATION INITIATIVE. THE
4 ITEM I'M PRESENTING ON IS TO PROVIDE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO
5 LOCAL AGENCIES FOR FLEET ELECTRIFICATION PLANNING. NEXT SLIDE
6 PLEASE. THIS PROGRAM IS PART OF OUR TRANSPORTATION
7 ELECTRIFICATION, OR TE INITIATIVES, WHICH IS A SET OF PLANNING
8 AND CAPITAL PROGRAMS WE HAVE BEEN ROLLING OUT OVER THE PAST
9 YEAR SINCE THIS COMMITTEE APPROVED THESE INITIATIVES. THE
10 FOCUS OF THIS ITEM FOR THE MEETING IS THE PUBLIC FLEET
11 ELECTRIFICATION PLANNING ASSISTANCE PROGRAM HIGHLIGHTED IN
12 RED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS PROGRAM IS TO HELP LOCAL
13 GOVERNMENTS AND PUBLIC AGENCIES PLAN THE TRANSITION OF THEIR
14 FLEETS TO 0-EMISSION VEHICLES WHICH SUPPORTS A NUMBER OF
15 GOALS, INCLUDING IMPLEMENTING PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, KEY
16 STRATEGY, WHICH IS A CLEAN VEHICLE STRATEGY WHICH IS A KEY
17 ELEMENT TO HELP MEETING OUR LIGHT-DUTY VEHICLE GREENHOUSE GAS
18 EMISSION REDUCTION TARGETS FOR THE PLAN. THIS PROGRAM WILL
19 ALSO HELP PUBLIC ENTITIES MEET VARIOUS POLICIES TO TRANSITION
20 THEIR FLEETS THIS INCLUDES THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARDS
21 ADVANCED CLEAN FLEETS REGULATION WHICH REQUIRES LOCAL
22 GOVERNMENTS TO TRANSITION THEIR FLEETS TO ZERO-EMISSIONS AND
23 HAS COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS THAT STARTED THIS YEAR. WE
24 ANTICIPATE THAT PLANNING ASSISTANCE WILL BETTER POSITION
25 AGENCIES TO SECURE CAPITAL GRANT FUNDING TO TRANSITION FLEETS.



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THE CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION HAS THE CHARGING
2 INFRASTRUCTURE FOR GOVERNMENT FLEETS GRANT OPPORTUNITY OPEN
3 NOW THAT MANY AGENCIES ARE COMPETING FOR. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.
4 THE PROGRAM WAS OPEN TO ANY BAY AREA PUBLIC AGENCIES OPERATING
5 FLEETS WITH FIVE OR MORE VEHICLES OR MOBILITY DEVICES. WE
6 ISSUED A CALL FOR APPLICATIONS IN EARLY JANUARY THAT WAS
7 DISTRIBUTED TO ALL PLANNING AND PUBLIC WORKS DIRECTORS, COUNTY
8 TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES, AND OTHER LOCAL STAFF AND WORKING
9 GROUPS. WE ALSO HOSTED AN ONLINE INFORMATIONAL WEBINAR WHICH
10 WAS RECORDED AND MADE AVAILABLE ONLINE. THE APPLICATION,
11 ITSELF, IS RELATIVELY FORM IN WHICH WE ASK FOR INFORMATIONS
12 ABOUT THE FLEET MAKE UP, THE NEED FOR ASSISTANCE AND KEY
13 POINTS OF CONTACT IN EACH DEPARTMENT MANAGING FLEET VEHICLES.
14 WE ALSO REQUESTED THAT A GIVEN PUBLIC ENTITY OR LOCAL
15 GOVERNMENT SUBMIT ONLY ONE APPLICATION FOR ALL FLEETS THAT
16 THEY OPERATE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE RECEIVED 32 APPLICATIONS,
17 WHICH REPRESENTS A SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF THE CITIES AND
18 COUNTIES IN THE BAY AREA. HOWEVER, WE ALSO KNOW THAT A NUMBER
19 OF OTHER LOCAL GOVERNMENTS IN THE REGION WHO GOT IN SUPPORT
20 FROM FLEET PLANNING THROUGH OTHER PROGRAMS, FOR EXAMPLE,
21 SILICON VALLEY CLEAN ENERGY HAS ALSO PROVIDED FLEET PLANNING
22 ASSISTANCE TO A NUMBER OF THEIR MEMBER JURISDICTIONS. THE
23 TABLE SHOWN HERE SHOWS THE NUMBER OF AGENCIES THAT APPLIED AND
24 THE NUMBER OF FLEET VEHICLES AGGREGATED BY COUNTY. THE SUMMARY
25 SHEET IN YOUR PACKETS PROVIDE MORE DETAILS ABOUT THE FLEETS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 AND ASSISTANCE REQUESTED BROKEN DOWN BY EACH INDIVIDUAL PUBLIC
2 AGENCY. THE AGENCIES THAT APPLIED HAVE FLEETS RANGING IN SIZE
3 FROM 15 VEHICLES TO 1600 VEHICLES COVERING A WIDE VARIETY OF
4 SERVICES FROM PUBLIC WORKS, PARKS AND REC AND WASTE MANAGEMENT
5 TO POLICE, FIRE, AND PUBLIC HEALTH DEPARTMENTS IN TOTAL
6 APPLICATIONS REPRESENT OVER 12,500 VEHICLES HOUSED AT 450
7 LOCATIONS UPON REVIEWING APPLICATIONS RECOMMENDING ALL 32
8 APPLICANTS RECEIVED TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO SUPPORT THE
9 PLANNING WORK THEY REQUESTED. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. EACH OF THE
10 AGENCIES WILL RECEIVE CONSULTANT ASSISTANCE TO DEVELOP A PLAN
11 FOR BOTH THEIR FLEET TRANSITION AND THE ASSOCIATED CHARGING
12 INFRASTRUCTURE NECESSARY TO SUPPORT THOSE FLEETS. THE PLANNING
13 WILL INCLUDE EVALUATING THE EXISTING FLEETS ENGAGING WITH
14 VEHICLE OPERATORS AND FLEET MANAGERS, ACCESSING SUCCESS
15 REPLACEMENT OPTIONS AND CHARGING INFRASTRUCTURE NEEDS AND
16 DEVELOPING TRANSITION PROCUREMENT UTILITY COORDINATION
17 OPERATIONS MAINTENANCE AND FINANCING OPTIONS BASED ON SIZE OF
18 FLEETS NUMBERS OF VEHICLE LOCATIONS AND LEVEL OF ASSISTANCE
19 NEEDED WE ESTIMATE PLANNING FOR EACH RECIPIENT WILL COST UP TO
20 100,000 UP TO 400,000 FOR TOTAL OF UP TO 6 MILLION. NEXT SLIDE
21 PLEASE. IF APPROVED, WE'LL WORK WITH THE PUBLIC AGENCIES TO
22 CONFIRM INFORMATION ABOUT THE FLEETS, REFINE THE SCOPE OF
23 ASSISTANCE NEEDED AND DEVELOP SCHEDULES FOR THAT ASSISTANCE.
24 WE'LL CONTRACT WITH CONSULTANTS FROM THE TRANSPORTATION
25 ELECTRIFICATION PLANNING AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE BENCH WHICH



APRIL 12, 2024

1 IS A NEW CONSULTANT BENCH APPROVED BY THE ADMINISTRATION
2 COMMITTEE THIS PAST WEDNESDAY AND INCLUDES 32 FIRM THAT HAVE
3 FLEET PLANNING EXPERIENCE MANY OF WHICH HAVE WORKED WITH BAY
4 AREA GOVERNMENTS AND AGENCIES. SO WE'RE SEEKING APPROVAL FOR
5 STAFF TO MOVE FORWARD WITH DEVELOPING FLEET ELECTRIFICATION
6 PLANNING TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE WORK SCOPES UP TO \$6 MILLION FOR
7 THE PUBLIC AGENCIES LISTED IN ATTACHMENT A. ALSO NOTE THAT
8 ASSOCIATED PROGRAMMING REVISIONS TO MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4505
9 WILL BE INCLUDED IN THE MAY 8TH, 2024 PROGRAMMING AND
10 ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE PACKET. NEXT SLIDE. AND WITH THAT I'M
11 HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

12

13 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU, JAMES.
14 COMMITTEE MEMBERS ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? OKAY I'LL
15 ENTERTAIN A MOTION TO APPROVE THE ITEM.

16

17 **DAVID RABBITT:** MOVED RABBITT.

18

19 **V. CHAIR, EDDIE AHN, MTC PC:** AHN SECONDS.

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** AHN FIRST SECOND RABBITT. YOU
22 WERE CLOSEST, I HEARD YOU. [LAUGHTER] IS THERE ANY WRITTEN
23 COMMENTS OR ONLINE?

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN COMMENTS RECEIVED ON
2 THIS ITEM NO ONE IN ZOOM WITH THEIR HAND RAISED AND NO ONE IN
3 THE BOARDROOM TO SPEAK.

4

5 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. ROLL CALL PLEASE.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CHAIR SPERING?

8

9 **CHAIR MTC PC, JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AHN?

12

13 **V. CHAIR MTC PC, EDDIE AHN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** CANEPA?

16

17 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

20

21 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES.

22

23 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NOACK?

24

25 **SUE NOACK:** YES.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** RABBITT?

3

4 **DAVID RABBITT:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** UNANIMOUS.

7

8 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY THANK YOU. THANK YOU
9 JAMES. OUR NEXT ITEM IS -- DO, DO, DO. OKAY. EXPLORING THE
10 PAST PRESENT AND FUTURE OF HIGHWAYS. DAVE VAUTIN, ANOTHER ONE
11 OF HIS OUTSTANDING PRESENTATIONS IS AHEAD OF US.

12

13 **ANDREW FREMIER:** CHAIR SPERING, IF YOU DON'T MIND, I WOULD LIKE
14 TO MAKE A FEW OPENING COMMENTS. ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE
15 DIRECTOR. JUST AS A REMINDER WHILE MTC HAS BEEN ENGAGING IN A
16 TRANSIT SPACE ESPECIALLY IN THE PAST FEW YEARS WITH THE
17 IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN,
18 HIGHWAYS ARE EQUALLY CRITICAL TO OUR REGION'S MOBILITY. THEY
19 ACCOUNT FOR 70 MILLION VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED EVERY DAY AND
20 HELP MOVE A SIGNIFICANT SHARE OF THE \$1.6 TRILLION IN GOODS
21 MOVEMENTS THAT HAPPEN WITH AND BEYOND CALIFORNIA -- WITHIN AND
22 BEYOND CALIFORNIA. IN MUCH OF THE BAY AREA THAT WAS DEVELOPED
23 POST WORLD WAR II THE HIGHWAY SYSTEM GREW IN TANDEM WITH
24 EMERGING SUBURBAN COMMUNITIES MAKING THE HIGHWAY NETWORK FOR
25 BETTER OR WORSE A FUNDAMENTAL BACKBONE OF OUR REGION'S



APRIL 12, 2024

1 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. GIVEN ALL THIS, THIS COMMISSION HAS
2 LONG RECOGNIZED THAT THE CENTRAL POLICY QUESTION. QUESTION IS
3 NOT WHETHER TO INVEST IN OUR HIGHWAY SYSTEM, BUT INSTEAD WHAT
4 IS APPROPRIATE AND ALIGNING INVESTMENTS WITH POLICY PRIORITIES
5 OF TODAY AND TOMORROW. OVER THE PAST 15 YEARS, THE COMMISSION
6 WITH COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AGENCIES HAS ADVANCED CRITICAL
7 INVESTMENTS IN THE BAY AREA EXPRESS LANES NETWORK THAT
8 PROVIDES RELIABLE TRAVEL TIME OPTIONS FOR TRAVEL IN THE
9 REGION'S CORRIDORS WHILE IMPROVING MOBILITY FOR CARPOOLS AND
10 PUBLIC TRANSIT. WHILE THE COMMISSION FACES KEY DECISIONS
11 ACROSS A RANGE OF PROJECTS FROM THE CONNECTED BAY AREA
12 TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TO PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ AND NOW THIS
13 NEXT GENERATION FREEWAYS DISCUSSION, THERE ALL RELATED TO THE
14 HIGHWAYS AND WE WANTED TO ZOOM OUT AND PROVIDE A 30,000 FOOT
15 VIEW THIS MORNING TO SET THE TABLE FOR THE MONTHS AHEAD. THIS
16 MORNING, WE'LL REFLECT ON KEY QUESTIONS HOW THE BAY AREA'S
17 APPROACH TO HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS INVOLVED IN RECENT DECADES AND
18 HOW IT MIGHT EVOLVE FURTHER IN THE YEARS AHEAD, AND THINKING
19 ABOUT THE FUTURE OF HIGHWAYS. WITH THAT, TURN IT OVER TO DAVE
20 VAUTIN.

21

22 **DAVE VAUTIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMITTEE MEMBERS. DAVE VAUTIN,
23 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR OF MAJOR PLANS WITH MTC AND ABAG. I'M HAPPY
24 TO BE HERE THIS MORNING TO SHARE INSIGHTS ON THE PAST AND
25 PRESENT FUTURE OF OUR REGION'S LIMITED HIGHWAY NETWORK WHICH



APRIL 12, 2024

1 MANY FOLKS REFER TO AS THE FREEWAY SYSTEM I WANT TO
2 ACKNOWLEDGE MY COLLEAGUES ON THE PLANNING AND OPERATIONS
3 LEGISLATIVE TEAMS WHO CONTRIBUTED TO TODAY'S PRESENTATION.
4 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS ANDY MENTIONED, THIS TOPIC OF HIGHWAYS
5 IS NOT NEW TO THE COMMISSION OR TO REGIONAL STAKEHOLDERS. THE
6 2021 EXPRESS LANES STRATEGIC PLAN EXPLORED MANY KEY POLICY
7 QUESTIONS WITH REGARD TO OUR EXPRESS LANES SYSTEM, PLANNED BAY
8 AREA 2050, AND ITS PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT, LOOKED AT
9 TRADE-OFFS RELATED TO EXPRESS LANES AND EXPRESS BUS AND MORE.
10 BUT IN THE LAST TWO YEARS, WE HAVE DIVED DEEPER INTO THIS
11 TOPIC THROUGH THE ONGOING NEXT GENERATION BAY AREA FREEWAY
12 STUDY. WITH CALTRANS, OUR COUNTY TRANSPORTATION PARTNERS AND
13 OTHERS, SPARKING A CRITICAL DIALOGUE ABOUT THE ROLE OF
14 EXPANDED PRICING STRATEGIES TO BETTER MANAGE DEMAND AND MAKE
15 HIGHWAYS MORE SUSTAINABLE. TODAY'S PRESENTATION TRIES TO WEAVE
16 TOGETHER THE DISPARATE THREADS RECOGNIZING THAT HIGHWAYS WRIT
17 LARGE REMAIN A KEY FOCUS FOR THE COMMISSION THIS YEAR WITH
18 IMPORTANT DECISIONS RELATED TO THE 2026 MEASURE PLANNED BAY
19 AREA 2050+ AND NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY TEN YEAR IMPLEMENTATION
20 ROADMAP SLATED FOR MONTHS AHEAD. WE WANT TO ZOOM OUT AND TALK
21 ABOUT THE PAST PRESENT AND FUTURE OF HIGHWAYS. NEXT SLIDE.
22 WITH THOUGHT IT WAS IMPORTANT TO START WITH THE PAST AND
23 ACKNOWLEDGE THE LEGACY OF 20th CENTURY HIGHWAY INVESTMENTS
24 THAT ARE STILL BEING FELT TODAY IN OUR REGION. HIGHWAYS ACROSS
25 THE COUNTRY, INCLUDING THOSE BUILT IN THE BAY AREA THE LAST



APRIL 12, 2024

1 CENTURY DEEPENED SOCIAL INEQUITIES AND DISPROPORTIONATELY
2 BURDENED BLACK AND BROWN COMMUNITIES, LOCATION SHOWN HERE IN
3 WEST OAKLAND WITH ADVERSE IMPACTS OF EMISSIONS NOISE AND
4 TRAFFIC. DESPITE HIGHWAYS AIM OF BETTER CONNECTING CITIES,
5 SUBURBS, AND REGIONS TO YIELD GREATER ECONOMIC GROWTH, DRIVING
6 URBAN NEIGHBORHOODS WERE DIVIDED AND HOLLOWED OUT BY
7 INVESTMENTS. IN DECADES SINCE, BUILD-OUT OF GENERAL PURPOSE
8 LANES HAS PROVIDED TEMPORARY CONGESTION RELIEF WITH COMMUTE
9 TIMES HOLDING STEADY OR GROWING DESPITE THOSE INVESTMENTS. IN
10 THE MEANTIME, THE EQUITY PRIORITY POPULATIONS WHO ARE HARMED
11 AND CONTINUE TO BE HARMED BY EXTERNALITIES OF OUR HIGHWAY
12 SYSTEM ARE SIMULTANEOUSLY DEPOSIT ON IT TODAY GIVEN OUR
13 DISPERSED LAND USE PATTERNS. LIKE INTERSTATE 980 IN OAKLAND OR
14 U.S. 101 SAN FRANCISCO WHICH ARE IMPORTANT TO REMEDIATE HARMS,
15 IN THE REGION HIGHWAYS ARE LIKELY TO REMAIN IN PLACE FOR
16 DECADES TO COME DISTINGUISH -- BUT THAT DOESN'T MEAN WE DON'T
17 HAVE CHOICES HOW TO MAKE THEM WORK BETTER FOR TRAVELERS OF ALL
18 MODES AS WELL AS THE COMMUNITIES THEY PASS THROUGH. THE
19 TURNING FROM THE PAST TO THE PRESENT. WHILE CONSTRUCTION OF
20 AND GENERAL PURPOSE WIDENING OF HIGHWAYS DEFINED
21 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS IN THE 20th CENTURY NEW REGIONAL
22 VISION HAS EMERGED IN THE 21st CENTURY. THE BAY AREA HAS
23 GENERALLY PIVOTED AWAY FROM GENERAL PURPOSE HIGHWAY WIDENING
24 IN RECENT DECADES AND PRIORITIZED DIVERSE RANGE OF
25 TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS. SINCE THE START OF THIS CENTURY, A



APRIL 12, 2024

1 NEW GENERATION OF PROJECTS HAVE BEEN BUILT-OUT, RANGING FROM
2 THE MARIN SONOMA NARROWS CARPOOL LANES TO BUS RAPID TRANSIT
3 LINES IN EAST OAKLAND, AND SAN FRANCISCO, AS WELL AS BART
4 EXTENSION TO DIVERSE PLACES SUCH AS ANTIOCH AND NORTH SAN
5 JOSE. STARTING WITH TRANSPORTATION 2035, THE REGIONAL PLAN
6 ADOPTED BY THIS COMMISSION IN 2009 AND FOLLOWED BY CTC
7 AUTHORIZATION IN 2012 ACROSS THE BAY AREA LEGACY OF CARPOOL TO
8 BUILT OUT A NETWORK OF EXPRESS LANES WITH NETWORK CONVERSIONS
9 AND NEW PRICE CAPACITY SHIFT AWAY FROM PRICED CAPACITY SHIFT
10 AWAY IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 SHOWN ON THIS SLIDE GIVEN
11 INCREASINGLY AMBITIOUS TARGETS SET BY THE STATE DIVING INTO
12 PLANNED BAY AREA 2050'S TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT OF THE NEARLY
13 \$600 BILLION IN FUTURE TRANSPORTATION SPENDING ANTICIPATED
14 THROUGH MID-CENTURY INVESTMENTS ARE ENVISIONED TO BE HIGHLY
15 MULTIMODAL INTENDED TO CHANGE THE STATUS QUO. WE KNOW AUTO
16 COMMUTE MODE SHARES HAVE DECLINED FROM 80% IN THE 2000s TO
17 LESS THAN 70% TODAY. OUR PLAN IS TO FURTHER REDUCE AUTO
18 COMMUTE MODE SHARE BY 50% BY 2050. ROAD EXPANSION PROJECTS,
19 LIKE EXPRESS LANES, INCREASING INTERCHANGES, ARTERIAL
20 WIDENING, AND THE LIKE, ACCOUNT FOR 3% OF FUTURE
21 TRANSPORTATION SPENDING GROWING NETWORK BY 2% OVER A THREE-
22 DECADE TIME HORIZON. THE REST OF THE PLAN THE 97% OF MONEYS
23 ARE GOING TOWARDS CLIMATE NEUTRAL AND CLIMATE FRIENDLY
24 INVESTMENTS. 19% OF THOSE TOWARDS OPERATING AND MAINTAINING
25 OUR EXISTING HIGHWAY AND ROADWAY NETWORK AND A SUBSTANTIAL 70%



APRIL 12, 2024

1 GOING TOWARDS PUBLIC TRANSIT. THE PLAN'S VISION WOULD MORE
2 THAN DOUBLE PRECOVID TRANSIT SERVICE LEVELS AND QUADRUPLE
3 AMOUNT OF BIKE INFRASTRUCTURE IN THE BAY CONTINGENT ON NEW
4 MONEY INCLUDING AT THE BALLOT BOX REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
5 MEASURE IMPLEMENTATION OF ROBUST SUITE OF PRICING STRATEGIES
6 AND AT LOCAL REGIONAL AND STATE LEVELS BY 2035 THE PLAN IS
7 JUST THAT, IT IS A PLAN THAT COMES DOWN TO FUNDING DECISIONS
8 EVERY YEAR FOR PROGRAMS LARGE AND SMALL TO ENSURE THAT NEAR-
9 TERM DECISIONS ALIGN WITH THE LONG-TERM NORTH STAR. NEXT SLIDE
10 PLEASE. LOOKING INTO THAT PORTFOLIO OF PROJECTS THAT ARE BEING
11 ADVANCED TODAY AND IN THE NEAR FUTURE IT REALLY ALL STARTS, AS
12 I MENTIONED WITH THOSE CLIMATE NEUTRAL MAINTENANCE
13 MODERNIZATIONS AND SAFETY PROJECTS THAT CONSTITUTES THE VAST
14 MAJORITY OF OUR ROADWAY SPENDING AGING HIGHWAY SYSTEM BUILT IN
15 POSTWAR DECADES AND NEEDS SUBSTANTIAL INVESTMENTS TO UPKEEP
16 IT. THE PLAN INCLUDES SOME NEW CAPACITY INCREASING AS WELL AND
17 THIS IS PRIMARILY IN THE FORM OF THE EXPRESS LANES NETWORK
18 WHICH CONSTITUTES NEARLY HALF OF OUR NEAR-TERM ROADWAY
19 EXTENSION PROJECT PORTFOLIO IN TERMS OF DOLLARS. THAT EXPRESS
20 LANES NETWORK HAS BEEN AUGMENTED BY A NEW GENERATION OF
21 TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS ON OUR HIGHWAYS FROM RESILIENT 37 ON
22 THE NORTH BAY AND INNOVATE 680 IN EAST BAY PROJECTS TO DEVELOP
23 IN THE LAST DECADE BROADER MORE MULTI-MODAL PACKAGE OF
24 IMPROVEMENTS FOCUS ON EMERGING POLICY GOALS LIKE RESILIENCE
25 AND EQUITY. THERE ARE CHALLENGES IN THIS SPACE DECADES OF



APRIL 12, 2024

1 HIGHWAY AND ROAD PROJECTS PARTIALLY FUNDED INCLUDING THROUGH
2 VOTER APPROVED SALES TAX MEASURES ONE MUST PASS VOTER
3 COMMITMENTS ALONG WITH SHIFTING LOCAL AND STATE PRIORITIES
4 THAT MAY HAVE SHIFTED OVER TIME POLICY SENATE BILL 743 REQUIRE
5 PROJECTS TO MITIGATE IMPACTS FROM ADDITIONAL DRIVING STATE
6 FUNDING FORMULAS HAVE CHANGED INFORMED BY CAPTII AND ATTACHED
7 TO SENATE BILL \$ONE AND LANDSCAPE FORCES SOME FURTHER THINKING
8 MITIGATIONS FOR IF NEW HIGHWAY CAPACITY UNDER MILLIONS OF
9 DOLLARS TO PROJECT COST THAT INVOLVE ROAD EXPANSION INNOVATE
10 680 SERVES AS CASE IN POINT VMT MITIGATION NECESSARY TO COMPLY
11 ROUGHLY DOUBLE THE PRICE TAG OF THE PROJECT. THIS PARADIGM
12 SPARKS THE NEED FOR ESSENTIAL AND VALUABLE CONVERSATIONS ABOUT
13 HIGHWAY CAPACITY AND WHETHER TO PRIORITIZE STRATEGIES THAT
14 EQUILIBRIUM OUT MORE BENEFITS FROM THE PAVEMENT WE ALREADY
15 HAVE THE GROUND TODAY. NEXT SLIDE. THAT BRINGS US TO THE
16 LONGER TERM FUTURE, THE BAY AREA IS NOT ALONE IN EXPLORING
17 EXPANDED PRICING STRATEGIES. OUR COLLEAGUES IN LOS ANGELES,
18 BOSTON, AND NEW YORK CITY, AMONG OTHERS HAVE BEEN EXPLORING
19 EXPANDED PRICING STRATEGIES THAT MOVE THE NEEDLE BEYOND WHAT
20 IS POSSIBLE WITH EXPRESS LANES. THESE STRATEGIES ARE DESIGNED
21 TO MAKE FURTHER HEADWAY TOWARDS A RANGE OF POLICY GOALS FROM
22 CONGESTION MANAGEMENT TO GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS REDUCTION.
23 THIS HAS BEEN CENTRAL TO THE NEXT GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY
24 OVER THE PAST TWO YEARS. THE STUDY WAS A CRITICAL COMMITMENT
25 TO CARB, THE CALIFORNIA AIR RESOURCES BOARD PRIOR TO APPROVAL



APRIL 12, 2024

1 OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IT ALLOWED THE REGION TO CONTINUE
2 REMAINING ELIGIBLE FOR KEY SENATE BILL ONE MONEYS AND THE
3 STUDY REMAINS ONGOING WITH INTENT TO RELEASE ITS FINAL REPORT
4 TOWARDS THE END OF THIS YEAR WITH A TEN YEAR IMPLEMENTATION
5 ROADMAP DELINEATING INTERMEDIATE MILESTONES VISION BEFORE ANY
6 IMPLEMENTATION OF EXPANDED PRICING ON BAY AREA HIGHWAYS. NEXT
7 SLIDE. WE HAVE GIVEN A BRIEF OVERVIEW OF THE PAST PRESENT AND
8 FUTURE SPANNING A CENTURY OF TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS. THESE
9 INVESTMENTS IN SIMPLIFIED TERMS, YOU KNOW, SPAN THIS CONTINUUM
10 FROM GENERAL PURPOSE WIDENING TO DIFFERENT TYPES OF EXPRESS
11 LANE PROJECTS TO ALL-LANE TOLLING. BUT WHAT HAVE WE LEARNED
12 FROM REAL-WORLD EXPERIENCE AS WELL AS FROM THE VARIOUS
13 ANALYSIS CONDUCTED TO DATE ABOUT HOW THESE VARIOUS INVESTMENT
14 TYPES COMPARE? IT'S IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT EVERY
15 CORRIDOR IN OUR REGION IS UNIQUE IT HAS ITS OWN LAND USE
16 CONTEXT TRAFFIC PATTERNS AND THE LIKE. BUT, FOR THE SAKE OF
17 UNDERSTANDING THESE TRADEOFF IT IS POSSIBLE TO SET UP A SIMPLE
18 EXAMPLE OF A CONGESTED HIGHWAY CORRIDOR WITH THREE GENERAL
19 PURPOSE LANES TODAY WHERE TRAFFIC IS CREEPING ALONG AT RUSH
20 HOUR. IT IS POSSIBLE TO WIDEN THAT CORRIDOR, EITHER ADDING A
21 GENERAL PURPOSE LANE OR AS WAS DONE IF DECADES PAST OR ADDING
22 A NEW EXPRESS LANE THAT MAY PROVIDE TEMPORARY CONGESTION
23 RELIEF FOR GENERAL PURPOSE DRIVERS, BUT LONG-TERM MOST OF
24 THOSE GAINS ARE LIKELY TO DISSIPATE AS ADDITIONAL TRAVEL IS
25 INDUCED BY THE PROJECT. ALTERNATIVELY ONE BEING SEEK TO USE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THE EXISTING CAPACITY MORE EFFICIENTLY CONVERTING ONE OR MORE
2 LANES TO BE PRICED. THIS WOULD PROVIDE FASTER TRAVEL TIMES TO
3 THOSE LANES, AS THE PRICE CAN BE ADJUSTED TO ENSURE SMOOTHER
4 TRAFFIC FLOW. THE REMAINDER OF THE PRESENTATION WILL DIG INTO
5 THESE FOUR CONCEPTUAL TYPES ACROSS A SUITE OF KEY PLANNING
6 LENSES. NEXT SLIDE. SO THIS FIVE LENSES WE'LL LOOK AT TODAY
7 ARE NOT AN EXHAUSTIVE LIST OF PLANNING OBJECTIVES BUT DESIGNED
8 TO CAPTURE A SPECTER OF TOPICS LIKE TRADITIONALITY
9 TRANSPORTATION TOPICS LIKE RELIABILITY AND MOBILITY, EMERGING
10 TOPICS LIKE CLIMATE, TRANSIT, AFFORDABILITY AND EQUITY FOR ALL
11 THE FIVE QUESTIONS WE'LL ASK HERE ARE FIRSTS RELIABILITY, DOES
12 THE PROJECT PROVIDE RELIABLE TRAVEL TIMES WHEN TRAVELERS NEED
13 IT MOST. SECOND, FOR MOBILITY DOES THE PROJECT MAXIMIZE NUMBER
14 OF PEOPLE WHO CAN GET TO THEIR DESTINATION? THIRD FOR CLIMATE
15 DOES THE PROJECT ALIGN WITH STATE CLIMATE GOALS THAT REQUIRE
16 REDUCTIONS IN MILES DRIVEN, FOR TRANSIT DOES THE PROJECT
17 INTEGRATE TRANSIT SERVICES THAT CAN GROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP AND
18 ADVANCE EQUITY AND FIFTH FOR AFFORDABILITY DOES THE PROJECT
19 ENSURE THAT ALL TRAVELERS CAN GET TO WHERE THEY NEED TO
20 AFFORDABILITY? NEXT SLIDE. STARTING WITH RELIABILITY,
21 RELIABILITY REMAINS ONE OF THE MOST COMPELLING ARGUMENTS FOR
22 OUR EXPRESS LANES INVESTMENTS NOTABLY THE AREA WHERE THEY HAVE
23 BEEN MOST SUCCESSFUL BECAUSE GENERAL PURPOSE WIDENING TENDS TO
24 PROVIDE FASTER SPEED AND TRAVEL TIMES ONLY OVER SHORT TO
25 MEDIUM TERM THOSE TYPES OF PROJECTS RELIABILITY GAINS ARE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 OFTEN MERELY TEMPORARY. BUT WITH EXPRESS LANES, WHEN WE MANAGE
2 THOSE LANES, IT GIVES US OPPORTUNITY TO SET A PRICE AND ENSURE
3 THE CONSISTENT TRAVEL SPEED OF 45 MILES PER HOUR OR BETTER FOR
4 TRAVELERS IN THAT LANE AND CREATE AN INCENTIVE TO USE MODAL
5 OPTIONS THAT LEVERAGE THAT FACILITY. ONE STATISTIC HERE ON THE
6 BAY CORRIDORS 880 AND 680 DIFFERENT TOLL ZONES. 14% RECEIVED
7 100% PERFORMANCE RELIABILITY IN THE CALENDAR YEAR 2023, WHICH
8 IS A NOTABLE SUCCESS. NOW, WITH EXPANDED PRICING, THERE WOULD
9 BE OPPORTUNITY NOT TO NOT JUST PROVIDE RELIABILITY TO USERS OF
10 THE EXPRESS LANES, BUT TO ALL HIGHWAY USERS. AND NEXT
11 GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY INDICATED THAT WE COULD SEE TRAVEL
12 TIME SAVINGS OF AROUND 10% REGION-WIDE AND BE ABLE TO PRESERVE
13 THOSE TRAVEL TIMES SAVINGS OVER THE LONG TERM. NEXT SLIDE.
14 TURNING TO MOBILITY, THROUGHOUT THE 20th CENTURY VEHICLE
15 THROUGHPUT WAS A GAUGE OF CORRIDOR'S CAPACITY. BUT AS WE'RE
16 WELL AWARE OF THE SHARE OF FOLKS WHO CARPOOL AND TAKE TRANSIT
17 CAN ALSO IMPROVE MOBILITY IN A CORRIDOR. THAT'S WHY MTC HAS
18 FOCUSED ON PERSON THROUGHPUT IN RECENT YEARS. IMPROVING PERSON
19 THROUGHPUT CAN AVOIDING DIVERSION ONTO NEARBY PARALLEL
20 ARTERIALS, WHICH CAN HELP AVOID ADVERSE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS
21 FROM TRAFFIC MOVING THROUGH OUR LOCAL STREETS THROUGH
22 COMMUNITIES. NOW, IN THEORY, THE PERSON THROUGHPUT POTENTIAL
23 OF MANAGING LANES IS SIGNIFICANT. FOR EXAMPLE, CONVERTING A
24 SINGLE LANE TO AN EXPRESS LANE CAN MOVE THE SAME NUMBER OF
25 PEOPLE THROUGH A CORRIDOR AS WIDENING THAT WITH A GENERAL



APRIL 12, 2024

1 PURPOSE EXPRESS LANE WITH FEWER ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS.
2 SIMILARLY, CONVERTING CORRIDOR TO ALL-LANE TOLLING, WE'RE ABLE
3 TO ACHIEVE THE SAME PERSON THROUGHPUT AS BUILDING OUT A BRAND-
4 NEW EXPRESS LANE. THE BOTTOM LINE WITH THIS GRAPHIC IS IT'S
5 POSSIBLE TO ADVANCE MOBILITY GOALS WITHOUT ADDING ADDITIONAL
6 ASPHALT TO THE CORRIDOR. BUT THERE ARE REAL HEADWINDS TO
7 ACHIEVING THESE THEORETICAL GAINS, RANGING FROM INSUFFICIENT
8 ENFORCEMENT TO PREFERENCE SHIFTS IS AWAY FROM CARPOOLING AND
9 TRANSIT IN RECENT YEARS. NEXT SLIDE. THIRD WE'LL LOOK AT
10 CLIMATE THROUGH THE LENS OF VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED. SO,
11 EXPRESS LANES OFFER SIGNIFICANT UPSIDES COMPARED TO
12 TRADITIONAL WIDENING PROJECTS IN TERMS OF WIDENING AND
13 MOBILITY GOALS ON HIGHWAY CORRIDORS BUT WHEN WE LOOK AT
14 CLIMATE IMPACTS THAT'S WHERE CHALLENGES START TO EMERGE WITH
15 EXPRESS LANES COMPARED TO MORE EXPANSIVE PRICING STRATEGIES
16 LIKE ALL-LANE TOLLING. THE WE HAVE KNOWN FOR QUITE A WHILE AND
17 IDENTIFIED THAT CAPACITY INCREASING PROJECTS TEND TO INCREASE
18 VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED THEN IN TURN GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS
19 OUR PROJECT PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT FOR THE LAST THREE CYCLES
20 OF PLANNED BAY AREA HAS COME TO THIS CONCLUSION. GIVEN STATE
21 MANDATES TO DRIVE DOWN GHG AND VMT, WE RELEASED AN ANALYSIS IN
22 FEBRUARY, 2020, AS PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, THIS
23 ANALYSIS UNDERSCORED THAT THE AUTHORIZED EXPRESS LANE NETWORK
24 YIELDS VMT INCREASE ON PAR WITH VMT REDUCTION POTENTIAL OF
25 FIVE OF OUR LAW ENFORCEMENT TRANSIT MEGA PROJECTS COMBINED



APRIL 12, 2024

1 BASICALLY THE SUM OF BART CORE CAPACITY EXTENDING BART TO
2 DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE, CALTRAIN PORTAL VALLEY LINK AND DUMBARTON
3 REDUCTIONS ACHIEVE PROJECTS EQUIVALENT TO THE INCREASE FROM
4 THE EXPRESS LANES NETWORK BUILD-OUT TRANSIT MEGA PROJECTS CAN
5 WORK TOGETHER TO IMPROVE MOBILITY OUTCOMES BUT WORKING AT ODDS
6 WITH ONE ANOTHER IN THE CLIMATE SPACE ANALYSIS SHOWS
7 CONVERTING LANES TO EXPRESS LANES RATHER THAN ADDING NEW LANES
8 YIELDS SMALLER VMT INCREASE THAN NEW CAPACITY BUT STILL MOVES
9 US IN THE WRONG DIRECTION THAT ONLY EXPANDED PRICING
10 STRATEGIES CAN SHIFT BEHAVIOR AND CONTRIBUTE TO SUBSTANTIAL
11 VMT REDUCTIONS BRINGS US TOWARDS THE STATE MANDATED IT CLIMATE
12 GOALS. NEXT SLIDE. GIVEN THOSE CLIMATE CHALLENGES, THE TOPIC
13 OF TRANSIT, AND TRANSIT INVESTMENTS IN OUR HIGHWAY CORRIDORS
14 OFTEN COMES UP. IN CONTRASTED GENERAL PURPOSE WIDENING WHICH
15 RISKS ENTICING EXISTING TRANSIT RIDERS AWAY FROM BUSES AND
16 TRAINS EXPRESS LANES HAVE BEEN PITCHED AS CREATING
17 OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC TRANSIT. MOST NOTABLY CREATING
18 PRIORITY TREATMENTS FOR EXPRESS BUS SERVICES. HOWEVER, THERE
19 ARE A NUMBER OF CHALLENGES IN THIS SPACE IN TERMS OF BOTH
20 SUPPLY AND DEMAND. STARTING WITH SUPPLY, IN MANY EXPRESS LANE
21 CORRIDORS EXISTING EXPRESS BUS SERVICES ARE LIMITED. FOR ONE
22 KEY STATISTIC, HIGHWAY EXPRESS BUS RIDERSHIP IN THE BAY AREA
23 TODAY ACCOUNTS FOR LESS THAN 3% OF ALL BOARDINGS. SO MOST OF
24 OUR RIDERSHIP IS ACTUALLY ON ARTERIALS AND OTHER FACILITIES.
25 ON THE DEMAND SIDE, WE EXPLORED THE SO-CALLED REGIONAL PRESS



APRIL 12, 2024

1 BUS NETWORK AS PART OF PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, WHICH, IMAGINED
2 VERY FREQUENT EXPRESS BUS SERVICE ON ALL EXPRESS LANE
3 CORRIDORS. HOWEVER WE DID FIND THAT FOR MANY OF THESE
4 CORRIDORS, NOT ALL, BUT MANY, THAT THE RIDERSHIP WOULD BE
5 FAIRLY LIMITED. RESULTING IN A REGION-WIDE BENEFIT-COST RATIO
6 OF JUST ZERO.5 PART OF THIS FINDING DRIVEN BY THE BAY AREA'S
7 JOG FEE. WE KNOW THAT HIGHWAY CORRIDORS AS SHOWN IN THE
8 PICTURE HERE TEND TO BE FULL OF LOWER DENSITY, AUTO ORIENTED
9 LAND USES AND MANY HIGHWAY CORRIDORS THAT HAVE THE RIGHT
10 INGREDIENTS FOR EXPRESS BUS HAVE SEEN HEAVY INVESTMENT IN
11 RELIABLE FAST RAIL ALTERNATIVES THAT PROVIDE DIRECT ACCESS TO
12 DOWNTOWNS. FOR EXAMPLE, THE INTERSTATE 80 CORRIDOR HAS BART
13 PARALLELING RUNNING THROUGH DOWNTOWN BERKELEY AND OAKLAND
14 WHERE PEOPLE CAN EXIT TRANSIT AND WALK TO THEIR DESTINATION.
15 OR 101 AND THE CALTRAIN CORRIDOR, WHERE THE CALTRAIN STATIONS
16 ARE LOCATED CLOSER TO CITY CENTERS OF PENINSULA COMMUNITIES.
17 ANOTHER CHALLENGE WITH EXPRESS LANES AND EXPRESS BUS IS
18 DESIGN. UNLESS PRICEY ACCESS RAMPS ARE ADDED TO THE SCOPE,
19 ONLY LONG DISTANCE NON-STOPS ARE ABLE TO MAKE THEIR WAY OVER
20 TO THE LEFT-MOST LANE AND USE THE EXPRESS LANE FACILITY AND
21 ACHIEVE THOSE SPEED GAINS. NOW, THERE ARE SOME INTERESTING
22 EXAMPLES, INCLUDING LOS ANGELES METRO'S J-LINE SHOWN HERE
23 WHERE OTHER REGIONS HAD SUCCESS IN THIS SPACE. BUT IT'S REALLY
24 IMPORTANT TO CONSIDER THE UNIQUE CONTEXT OF EACH CORRIDOR AND
25 ULTIMATELY REALIZE THAT MANY PEOPLE DON'T WANT TO START THEIR



APRIL 12, 2024

1 JOURNEY ALONG A BUSY HIGHWAY OR IN THE CENTER OF AN
2 INTERCHANGE. THEY NEED TO GET TO AND FROM THEIR ULTIMATE
3 DESTINATION. IF AND WHEN EXPRESS LANES START TO GENERATE
4 MEANINGFUL NET REVENUE THERE MAY BE UNIQUE OPPORTUNITIES FOR
5 REINVESTING IN TRANSIT SPECIFICALLY, INVESTMENT THAT COULD BE
6 EXPANDED MUCH MORE IF THE PRICING COVERED MORE LANES SO WHILE
7 EXPRESS BUS EXPANSION IS OFTEN CITED AT SOME SILVER BULLET TO
8 THE EXPRESS LANES ADVERSE CLIMATE EFFECT IT IS MAY OR MAY NOT
9 BE HIGHEST AND BEST USE FOR REINVESTMENT DOLLARS IT'S
10 IMPORTANT TO FIGURE OUT IF WE'RE TRYING TO MITIGATE
11 ENVIRONMENT IMPACTS IN THE HIGHWAY CORRIDOR ITSELF OR IN THE
12 BROADER COMMUNITIES THAT IT SERVES. NEXT SLIDE. FINALLY LAST
13 BUT NOT LEAST WE NEED TO TALK ABOUT AFFORDABILITY.
14 AFFORDABILITY HAS BEEN CENTRAL TO THE CONCERNS FACED BY BAY
15 AREA RESIDENTS TODAY, ALONG WITH CRIME AND HOMELESSNESS. OF
16 THE AND NONE OF THESE HIGHWAY INVESTMENT TYPES DO ANYTHING TO
17 MAKE REAL HEADWAY ON THIS CHALLENGE. AS INDICATED BY THE
18 SCORES ON THE RIGHT SLIDE. WHILE WE CAN ADD MITIGATIONS TO
19 MINIMIZE THE INCREASED BURDENS ON THOSE WHO CAN LEAST AFFORD
20 IT JUST AS WE HAVE ACTIVELY CENTERED EQUITY IN THE NEXT
21 GENERATION FREEWAY STUDY WE MUST ACKNOWLEDGE THIS IS AFFECTING
22 PUBLIC PERCEPTION OF ALL HIGHWAY PRICING IDEAS AT THE MOMENT.
23 NOW NEAR-TERM THERE ARE INTERESTING EFFORTS OBVIOUSLY THE 880
24 EXPRESS LANES START PROGRAM AS WELL AS PILOTS ALONG 101 AND
25 SAN MATEO COUNTY WHICH SERVE AS CRITICAL FIRST STEPS TO TACKLE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THIS CHALLENGE AND WE CONTINUE TO EXPAND AFFORDABILITY
2 STRATEGIES IN OUR NEXGEN ANALYSIS INCLUDING EXPLORATION OF
3 INCOME-BASED TOLL CAPS. GIVEN HOW CENTRAL THIS ISSUE HAS
4 BECOME FOR SO MANY BAY AREA RESIDENTS, IT MUST REMAIN A KEY
5 AREA OF FOCUS AS WE THINK ABOUT OUR HIGHWAY PROJECT PORTFOLIO.
6 NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES THE TAKE-AWAY'S FROM
7 TODAY'S PRESENTATION, AND I WANT TO UNDERSCORE THAT THERE IS
8 NO RIGHT ANSWER TO HOW WE PROCEED IN THIS SPACE. IT'S ALL
9 ABOUT TRADEOFFS AND PRIORITIZATION BETWEEN THESE DIFFERENT
10 TYPES OF INVESTMENTS. AT THE ONE END OF THE SPECTRUM NEW
11 CAPACITY PROJECTS CAN ADVANCE MOBILITY AND RELIABILITY GOALS,
12 BUT THEY OFTEN COME AT A HIGH COST BOTH IF TERMS OF TAXPAYER
13 DOLLARS AND CLIMATE IMPACTS. AT THE OTHER END OF THE ASPECT 1
14 MILLION LEVERAGING EXISTING CAPACITY TO BOOST PERSON
15 THROUGHPUT CAN ADVANCE CLIMATE GOALS AT LOWER COST BUT
16 CREATING NEW COST BURDENS FOR DRIVERS RECOGNIZING ANALYSIS IS
17 HIGH-LEVEL AND THERE ARE UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES THROUGHOUT THE
18 REGION BUT WE HOPE IT ILLUSTRATES WHAT WE FOUND THROUGH THE
19 VARIETY OF PROJECTS FROM NEXGEN STUDY PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+
20 AND WE'LL HAVE QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS ON TOPICS THROUGH SUMMER
21 OF 2024 WITH ADDITIONAL DATA. NEXT SLIDE. TO WRAP UP
22 CONCLUDING THOUGHTS. AS THIS PRESENTATION INDICATES, THE STATE
23 IS REALLY PUSHING REGIONS TO GRAPPLE WITH HIGHWAY INVESTMENT
24 STRAIGHT OFFS. AND WHILE MITIGATION MIGHT SEEM SIMPLE IT ISN'T
25 SO SIMPLE WHEN YOU HAVE TO THINK ABOUT THE FINANCIAL



APRIL 12, 2024

1 IMPLICATIONS OF IT. AS A REGION, WE HAVE A CHOICE BETWEEN
2 FUNDING AND DELIVERING MORE CLIMATE SMART PROJECTS THAT
3 REQUIRE FEWER MITIGATION COSTS, OR FUNDING FEWER PROJECTS AND
4 SPENDING MORE ON MITIGATION DOWN THE ROAD. SECOND, INVESTING
5 IN TRANSIT ALONG HIGHWAY CORRIDORS IS NO GUARANTEE OF MODE
6 SHIFT, BUT MORE EXPANSIVE PRICING STRATEGIES PRESENT MORE
7 OPPORTUNITIES FOR REINVESTMENT IN THIS SPACE. IT'S EASIER TO
8 MAKE PROGRESS WITH MORE FUNDING AVAILABLE, AND REGARDLESS, HOW
9 WE INVEST THOSE MONEYS AND NOT JUST DEFAULTING TO A HIGHWAY
10 EXPRESS BUS EVERY TIME WILL DETERMINE THEIR EFFICACY. THIRD
11 OPTIMIZING EXISTING INFRASTRUCTURE RATHER THAN BUILDING NEW
12 CAPACITY CAN ADVANCE NEAR-TERM GOALS AND REMAIN MORE RELEVANT
13 IN A FUTURE WITH EXPANDED PRICING AND NEW LANE CAPACITY MAY BE
14 LESS NECESSARY IN DECADES AHEAD IF WE CAN MAKE MOST OUT OF
15 CAPACITY WE HAVE BUILT OUT IN RECENT DECADES. FINALLY REDUCE
16 TRANSPORTATION REVENUE FORECAST IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 WILL
17 REQUIRE MORE CHALLENGING TRADE-OFFS THAN PAST CYCLES AND THIS
18 WILL AFFECT TRANSIT AND HIGHWAY PROJECTS ALIKE. WHILE PLANNED
19 BAY AREA 2050 WAS INITIATED IN THE LATE 2010S IN AN ERA OF
20 MORE ABUNDANT RESOURCES IMPACTS OF INFLATION AND DECLINING
21 TRANSPORTATION REVENUES WILL FORCE HARDER DECISIONS THIS
22 PLANNING CYCLE. WITH THAT, THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME THIS
23 MORNING AND I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.
24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** DAVID, ON YOUR FIVE KEY
2 POLICY AREAS, WHERE DOES CONGESTION FIT IN THIS? AND WHEN I
3 TALK ABOUT CONGESTION, I'M TALKING ABOUT THE IMPACT IT HAS ON
4 LOCAL JURISDICTIONS. YOU KNOW, I USE THE -- MOST PEOPLE TRAVEL
5 I80 THROUGH SOLANO COUNTY ON A WEEKEND HOLIDAYS AND IT'S JUST
6 STOPPED AND A LARGE NUMBER OF PEOPLE ARE GETTING OFF 80 AND
7 TRAVERSING THROUGH SOLANO IT'S IMPACTING OUR LOCAL
8 COMMUNITIES. YOU KNOW SEVERAL OF THE ROUTES WE HAVE IN OUR
9 COUNTY ARE CONGESTED BECAUSE OF THAT. DO YOU LOOK AT THAT? I
10 THINK THAT NEEDS BE PART OF THIS PROCESS.

11

12 **DAVE VAUTIN:** YEAH, WE ARE ABSOLUTELY LOOKING AT THAT. I WOULD
13 PUT THAT UNDER THE BROADER GOAL OF MOBILITY, ISSUE OF
14 CONGESTION AND DIVERSION LOOKING AT TYPES OF HIGHWAY PROJECTS
15 LOOKING AT PARALLEL ARTERIALS UNDERSTANDING WHAT THE TRADE-
16 OFFS ARE THERE AND IMPACTS BEING FELT SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO
17 SHARING MORE ON THAT TOPIC.

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** I APPRECIATE IT. LOOK MY
20 COLLEAGUES FOR QUESTIONS? SUE?

21

22 **SUE NOACK:** I HAD A QUESTION ON THE ALL-LANE TOLLING CAPACITY.
23 IS THAT JUST THE ASSUMPTION THAT PEOPLE WILL MOVE TO TRANSIT?
24 BECAUSE YOU -- YOUR ONE CHART HAD 8,000 EQUIVALENT TO THREE
25 LANES. I'M, LIKE, I DON'T KNOW HOW THAT WORKS, UNLESS A WHOLE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 LOT OF CARS GET OFF THE ROAD AND GO TO TRANSIT. IS THAT THE
2 UNDERLYING ASSUMPTION THERE?

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO THERE, IS A COUPLE OF THINGS GOING ON THERE.
5 YES SOME FOLKS SHIFTING TO TRANSIT, SOME FOLKS SHIFTING TO
6 CARPOOLING BUT IT'S ACTUALLY ALSO POSSIBLE TO MOVE MORE
7 VEHICLES AND MORE PEOPLE THROUGH A CORRIDOR WHEN IT'S AT AN
8 OPTIMAL SPEED. SO, IN THE BASIC OF TRAFFIC ENGINEERING WHEN
9 VEHICLES ARE CREEPING ALONG AT 20 MILES AN HOUR YOU'RE GETTING
10 LESS THROUGHPUT THAN WHEN THE CORRIDOR IS OPERATING AT 45 TO
11 50 MILES AN HOUR THERE IS A KEY TRADEOFF AS YOU DECONGEST A
12 CORRIDOR AND MAINTAIN THAT OPTIMAL SPEED YOU CAN GET MORE
13 VEHICLES AND PEOPLE THROUGH THE CORRIDOR AND THE MODE SHIFT TO
14 TRANSIT AND CARPOOLING COMPOUNDS THAT BENEFIT.

15

16 **SUE NOACK:** AND, SO, ARE YOU CHARGING DIFFERENT TOLLS FOR
17 DIFFERENT LANES IN ORDER TO MOVE THOSE PEOPLE THROUGH? IS THAT
18 THE UNDERLYING CONCEPT THERE?

19

20 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO, AGAIN, IT IS VERY CONCEPTUAL, BUT THE ALLOW
21 LANE TOLLING CONCEPT BASICALLY HAS A CARPOOL LANE THAT IS
22 AVAILABLE FOR FREE -- FOR A DISCOUNT FOR CARPOOLERS TO
23 CONTINUE USING THE CORRIDOR AND THE REMAINING LANES HAVE A
24 PRICE A CONSISTENT PRICE ACROSS THE REMAINING.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **SUE NOACK:** FOR ALL THE LANES?

2

3 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THAT'S CORRECT.

4

5 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

8

9 **CARLOS ROMERO:** TO FOLLOW UP ON THAT CONVERSATION, THE
10 DECONGESTION OCCURS AS WE HAVE FEWER CARS ON THE ROADWAY,
11 BECAUSE THERE IS A PRICING INCENTIVE. I MEAN, I THINK -- LET'S
12 JUST MAKE THAT CLEAR. NOW, I'M NOT SAYING I'M AGAINST THAT.
13 BUT I THINK THAT WHAT WE WIND UP HAVING HAPPEN HERE IS PEOPLE
14 MIGHT THINK TWICE BEFORE THEY HOP ON THAT FREEWAY FROM, LET'S
15 SAY EAST PALO ALTO, MY CASE, EAST PALO ALTO TO SAN CARLOS,
16 RIGHT? AND MAYBE YOU WILL TAKE THE TRAIN, MAYBE YOU WON'T, OR
17 MAYBE BIKE. IT'S ABOUT DECONGESTION THROUGH FEWER CARS ON THE
18 ROAD THAT THEN CREATES THIS GREATER THROUGHPUT BECAUSE 20 MILE
19 AN HOUR TRAFFIC DOESN'T MOVE AS MANY PEOPLE AS 40 OR 50 MILE
20 PER HOUR TRAFFIC AND IS THAT ALSO WHERE YOU GET SOME OF THE
21 ENVIRONMENTAL POSITIVE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS? BECAUSE IT SEEMS
22 LIKE WITH THE EXPRESS LANES THAT WE PRESENTLY HAVE, WE DON'T
23 GET ANY SIGNIFICANT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT. IS THAT CORRECT?

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **DAVE VAUTIN:** THAT'S CORRECT. IT'S THE ALL-LANE TOLLING YIELDS
2 A REDUCTION IN VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED, WHEREAS THE EXPRESS
3 LANE NETWORK YIELDS AN INCREASE IN VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED.
4 AND, SO, THAT -- THAT IS THE DIFFERENTIATION IN TERMS OF THE
5 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT BETWEEN THOSE CORRIDOR THOSE INVESTMENT
6 TYPES.

7

8 **CARLOS ROMERO:** THEN ONE FINAL QUESTION, MY COLLEAGUE AND I
9 BOTH FROM SAN MATEO COUNTY LOOKED AT THE \$300 A YEAR POTENTIAL
10 IMPACT THAT IS NOT A DI MINIMIS NUMBER RIGHT WE HAVE
11 UNDERSTAND THERE ARE GOING TO BE SOME EQUITY IMPACTS HERE HOW
12 WE DEFRAY THEM I DON'T KNOW AND SOME FOLKS HAVE JOBS THAT
13 REQUIRE THEM TO BE ON THE FREEWAY, WHETHER THEY'RE DOING
14 GARDENING OR CONSTRUCTION I WANT TO MAKE SURE THE EQUITY PIECE
15 IT'S BEEN BROUGHT UP BEFORE AND YOU ALL HAVE TALKED ABOUT IT,
16 BUT THAT THEY BECOME AN ESSENTIAL PIECE OF WHAT WE'RE TALKING
17 ABOUT HERE IN ADDITION TO THE THROUGHPUT AND ENVIRONMENTAL
18 PIECE. I THINK THAT'S [INDISCERNIBLE]. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** RABBITT.

21

22 **DAVID RABBITT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, AND THANK YOU FOR THE
23 PRESENTATION. PIGGYBACKING ON THAT, ALL-LANE TOLLING MAKING IT
24 PROHIBITIVELY EXPENSIVE, WHICH IS THE INTENT. IT DOESN'T MEAN
25 EVERYONE IS GOING TO TURN TO TRANSIT. NOT EVERYONE CAN. UP MY



APRIL 12, 2024

1 WAY, IF YOU COMMUTE EARLY FROM SONOMA COUNTY, YOU SEE A LOT OF
2 TRADES PEOPLE COMMUTING TO WORK, WHO OBVIOUSLY DON'T HAVE
3 ALTERNATIVE WAY TO WORK. SO, YOU CAN CHARGE THEM MORE, IT WILL
4 JUST BE ADDITIONAL COST, ADDITIONAL BURDEN AND THEY PROBABLY
5 LIVE IN THE REMOTE AREAS BECAUSE OF ECONOMIC REASONS TO BEGIN
6 WITH. TO ME, IT'S ALMOST THE SAME THING IS IF YOU DON'T HAVE
7 THE FREEWAY AT ALL, YOU KNOW, NO PROBLEM. AND I ALSO KNOW, UP
8 OUR WAY, AND IT WAS TRUE WITH THE FREEWAY WORK, ALL IT DOES IS
9 PUSH TRAFFIC ELSEWHERE. SO, I HOPE WHATEVER WE LOOK AT IN
10 TERMS OF DATA ANALYSIS THAT WE ALSO LOOK AT THE CONSEQUENCES
11 OF THOSE DECISIONS GOING FORWARD. LOVE TO SEE THE SOURCES AND
12 DATA. I STILL WOULD LOVE TO SEE THE AMOUNT OF FOLKS. THERE IS
13 A LOT OF ASSUMPTIONS, I THINK, THAT IF YOU PRICE IT HIGH
14 ENOUGH PEOPLE WILL JUST JUMP INTO BUSES. I'M NOT SURE THAT'S
15 REALLY BASED UPON ANYTHING TANGIBLE. OR WHAT PERCENTAGE THAT
16 WOULD BE. I WOULD LOVE TO SEE THAT KIND OF SOURCES AND DATA
17 GOING FORWARD. AND THEN THE LAST THING I WAS JUST THINKING
18 ABOUT, YOU KNOW, THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE AND WHAT NOT, AM/PM
19 PEAK TRAFFIC IS DIFFERENT NOW POST-PANDEMIC, I WONDER IF MANY
20 OF THESE SCENARIOS WOULD CHANGE BECAUSE OF THAT. MIDDAY
21 TRAFFIC IS MUCH BUSIER AND HOURS ARE ALL INFLUX. SO, I DO
22 APPRECIATE. I KNOW IT'S A HUGE DILEMMA TO TRY TO FIGURE OUT TO
23 RIGHT-SIZE THE ENTIRE SYSTEM, ESSENTIALLY, AND TO MAKE --
24 MAXIMIZE THROUGHPUT AS IT WERE, BUT WE ALSO HAVE TO HAVE
25 ALTERNATIVES THERE FOR PEOPLE TO TURN TO. THANK YOU.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YEAH. I APPRECIATE THAT
3 COMMENT. AND I REFLECT BACK. I CAN REMEMBER WHEN MTC SAID IF
4 YOU GASOLINE UP TO \$5 A GALLON, EVERYBODY WILL BE IN TRANSIT.
5 WELL, GUESS WHAT? [LAUGHTER]

6

7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** WHAT?

8

9 **SPEAKER:** [OFF-MIC INDISCERNIBLE]

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YEAH YOU REMEMBER THAT. IT
12 JUST SHOWS. DAVID, I WANT TO ASK, YOU KNOW, I DROVE DOWN THIS
13 MORNING, AND YOU KNOW, I TAKE BART AND CAPITAL CORRIDOR, AND I
14 DROVE DOWN THIS MORNING AND I DIDN'T SIT IN ONE DELAY INTO SAN
15 FRANCISCO. WHAT CREATED THAT AND WHY CAN'T THAT BE DUPLICATE
16 FIVE DAYS A WEEK?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** FRIDAY.

19

20 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YEAH I KNOW BUT IF IT'S
21 FRIDAY PEOPLE AREN'T WORKING -- I MEAN, ARE WE LEARNING
22 ANYTHING FROM WHAT'S HAPPENING TODAY ON THE ROAD?

23

24 **DAVE VAUTIN:** ONE OF THE BIGGEST DATA UPDATES WE'RE WORKING ON
25 FOR PLANNED BAY AREA 2050+ IS INTEGRATING ALL OF THE NEW



APRIL 12, 2024

1 INFORMATION ON WORK-FROM-HOME AND ITS IMPLICATIONS. AND SO
2 THAT IS SOMETHING WE'RE ACTIVELY WORKING ON WHAT YOU'RE
3 DESCRIBING IS AN EFFECT OF A SIGNIFICANT ONCE IN A GENERATION
4 INCREASE IN CHANGE IN MODAL SHARES AND ESPECIALLY PREVALENT ON
5 MONDAYS AND FRIDAY. SO, THAT IS KEY. I WANT TO CLARIFY, THE
6 IDEA ON THE PRICING STRATEGIES IS NOT TO CHARGE ALL THE TIME
7 IF THERE IS NO CONGESTION THE POSITION IS TO NOT HAVE A PRICE
8 THE IDEA IS TO TARGET AT TIMES OF DAY AND LOCATIONS WHERE
9 THERE IS CONGESTION TO ENCOURAGE THE MODAL SHIFT IN ORDER TO
10 HELP ALLEVIATE THOSE CHALLENGES. SO I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFY
11 THAT.

12

13 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

14

15 **SUE NOACK:** CAN I FOLLOW UP?

16

17 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

18

19 **SUE NOACK:** ONE OTHER QUESTION, ONE OF THE ASSUMPTIONS AS FAR
20 AS TRYING TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IS ASSUME YOU ALL
21 THE CARS OUT THERE ARE GAS, RIGHT? CALIFORNIA, OR ANYWHERE,
22 HAS INCREASING AMOUNT OF ELECTRIC VEHICLES OUT THERE, SO HOW
23 IS THAT TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT AS FAR AS THAT FOCUS ON GREENHOUSE
24 GAS EMISSIONS, ARE NOT NECESSARILY ON CONGESTION. THERE IS A



APRIL 12, 2024

1 LOT OF TALK ABOUT VMT BUT I WOULD LOVE TO SEE WHAT THE NUMBERS
2 DO AS A RESULT OF INCREASED ELECTRIC VEHICLES OUT THERE?

3

4 **DAVE VAUTIN:** TWO QUICK THOUGHTS ON THAT. YOU'RE ABSOLUTELY
5 RIGHT THE STATE IS MOVING TOWARDS ELECTRIC VEHICLES THAT BEING
6 SAID OUR TARGET IS FOR 2035 AND THE STATE WILL BAN SALES OF
7 GAS POWERED VEHICLES IN 2035. THAT DOESN'T MEAN THAT EVERY
8 VEHICLE OUT THERE WILL BE AN ELECTRIC VEHICLE IN 2035. SO, IN
9 ORDER TO ACHIEVE THAT TARGET, IT IS IMPORTANT FOR US TO
10 ADVANCE, BOTH THE ELECTRIC VEHICLE TYPE STRATEGIES YOU HEARD
11 ABOUT EARLIER AND STRATEGIES THAT REDUCE VMT. THE SECOND QUICK
12 THOUGHT ON THAT IS VMT REDUCTION HAS A LOT OF CO-BENEFITS,
13 RIGHT? SO WE TALKED ABOUT IN TERMS OF CLIMATE AND GREENHOUSE
14 GAS EMISSIONS BUT IT'S CONNECTED TO REDUCING TRAFFIC
15 CONGESTION AS WE'RE GETTING CARS OFF THE ROAD. CONNECTED TO,
16 FEWER MILES DRIVEN MEANS LESS MONEY PEOPLE ARE SPENDING IN
17 TERMS OF THEIR COST FOR OPERATING AND OWNING A CAR, RIGHT? SO,
18 THERE ARE A VARIETY OF CO-BENEFITS AND REASONS BY THE STATE OF
19 CALIFORNIA AS PRIORITIZING NOT JUST GHG REDUCTION BUT VMT
20 REDUCTION.

21

22 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** DOREEN, YOU HAVE YOUR HAND
23 UP. THEN VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. I JUST WANT TO MAKE
2 SURE WE KEEP IN THE MIX THE ISSUE OF, AS SOME PEOPLE HAVE,
3 SORT OF, REFERRED TO, THE ISSUE OF PEOPLE WHO CANNOT MAKE
4 CHANGE -- DECISION CHANGES BASED ON MONEY, ALONE, OR ON MONEY,
5 AT ALL. PEOPLE WHO HAVE NO CHOICE BUT TO FOR EXAMPLE, DRIVE A
6 -- A GAS VEHICLE, BECAUSE THERE ARE NO VEHICLES FOR THEM THAT
7 ARE ELECTRIC. PEOPLE WHO HAVE NO ABILITY TO WALK. NO ABILITY
8 TO RIDE A BIKE. THERE -- I HEARD A LOT OF TALK ABOUT
9 AFFORDABILITY, BUT THERE NEEDS TO BE, ALSO, AN AWARENESS OF
10 POSSIBILITY, WHETHER THERE IS EVEN THE POSSIBILITY OF CHANGING
11 BEHAVIOR. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. NICK, ARE
14 YOU?

15

16 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YEP. THANK YOU. YOU KNOW, I THINK THIS IS ALL
17 VERY SOBERING IN TERMS -- AND THAT SLIDE THAT YOU PUT UP
18 THEREABOUT HOW THE, SORT OF, THE EVEN THE, SORT OF, THE
19 LIMITED EXPANSION -- HIGHWAY EXPANSION THAT'S CONTEMPLATED
20 UNDER THE EXPRESS LANE BUILD-OUT, EVEN THAT WOULD, SORT OF,
21 NEGATE ALL THE CLIMATE BENEFITS, LIKE THE TENS OF BILLIONS OF
22 DOLLARS THAT WE WOULD PUT INTO NEW RAIL INFRASTRUCTURE AND NEW
23 RAIL SERVICE, INCLUDING BART CORE CAPACITY WHICH IS ONE OF
24 THE, SORT OF, HIGHEST -- WHICH GENERATES PROBABLY THE MOST
25 RIDERS, THE MOST OF ANY OF THE, SORT OF, RAIL PROJECTS OR



APRIL 12, 2024

1 MAYBE ANY EVER THE TRANSIT PROJECTS THAT ARE CONTEMPLATED IN
2 THE PLAN. AND, YOU KNOW, I THINK WE ALL -- I THINK THAT'S JUST
3 A VERY, JUST, SORT OF, VERY SOBERING INFORMATION. AND I HOPE
4 WE CAN ALL KIND OF, YOU KNOW, TAKE THAT -- TAKE THAT ON BOARD.
5 I THINK THE OTHER -- YOU KNOW, ON THE -- ON THE TOLLING SIDE,
6 I THINK, YOU KNOW, I THINK ALL THE POINTS ARE BROUGHT UP ARE
7 REALLY VALID. I THINK IT WOULD BE REALLY -- AND ONE OF THE
8 THINGS THAT I THINK WE SHOULD REALLY BETTER UNDERSTAND, DAVE,
9 IS WHERE DO THE BENEFITS OF ALL-LANE TOLLING REALLY COME FROM?
10 LIKE, YOU CAN GIVE US A PIE CHART OF, LIKE, IF WE DID ALL-LANE
11 TOLLING, THIS IS, LIKE, THE PERCENTAGE OF THE BENEFITS THAT
12 WOULD COME FROM PEOPLE JUST MAKING SHORTER TRIPS? SO, INSTEAD
13 OF GOING TO THE MOVIES IN DALY CITY, WE WOULD GO TO THE MOVIES
14 IN DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO. OR THE BENEFITS FROM AVOIDING
15 TAKING TRIPS. WHAT ARE THOSE -- YOU KNOW, ARE THERE -- IS
16 THERE ACTUALLY REALLY ANYBODY THAT'S GOING TO BE JUMPING ON
17 THE BUS AS A RESULT OF ALL-LANE TOLLING? LIKE BEING ABLE TO
18 HELP US UNDERSTAND THAT, I THINK THERE IS PROBABLY PEOPLE
19 BRING A BUNCH OF DIFFERENT ASSUMPTIONS TO THE TABLE ON THAT,
20 AND I THINK THAT WOULD BE VERY, VERY HELPFUL TO KIND OF HELP
21 CLARIFY WHAT THIS ALL-LANE TOLLING BUSINESS IS ALL ABOUT. SO,
22 THAT'S ONE REQUEST TO STAFF. YOU KNOW, THE OTHER POINT I WANT
23 TO MAKE SING THE AFFORDABILITY ISSUES ARE SUPER REAL. AND WE
24 CAN DO ALL-LANE TOLLING IN A REVENUE NEUTRAL WAY. WE CAN, YOU
25 KNOW, INCREASE REVENUES FROM WILLING TO, AND REDUCE REVENUES



APRIL 12, 2024

1 FROM SALES TAXES. OR WE COULD INCREASE REVENUES FROM TOLLING
2 HIGHWAYS, WE COULD REDUCE -- YOU KNOW -- I THINK THERE IS A
3 WAY OF DOING THAT, AS WELL AS -- AS WELL AS THINKING ABOUT
4 WAYS THAT WE CAN ADDRESS THOSE, YOU KNOW, THE CASES THAT WERE
5 BROUGHT UP AROUND, YOU KNOW, TRADES PEOPLE THAT ARE COMING
6 INTO -- HAVE TO DRIVE A LONG WAY TO GET INTO WORK, OR NURSES,
7 OR YOU KNOW, PEOPLE WHO DON'T REALLY HAVE ANY OTHER CHOICES.
8 YOU KNOW? LESS THAN 30% OF THE TRIPS TAKEN ARE WORK TRIPS. AND
9 I THINK WE -- YOU KNOW, I WOULD REALLY LIKE STAFF TO COME BACK
10 WITH SOMETHING THAT KIND OF REALLY LOOKS TO ADDRESS THOSE
11 ISSUES. BECAUSE I THINK IF THE IDEA IS THAT WE WOULD
12 INCORPORATE IN THE -- IF YOU'RE GETTING US READY TO
13 INCORPORATE INTO THE PLAN, AS, SORT OF, AN ALL-LANE TOLLING,
14 PLUS A VMT FEE, AND ALL OF THAT, IT'S JUST LIKE ADDING ON NEW
15 COSTS TO BAY AREA RESIDENTS. AND WE DON'T HAVE, LIKE, WE DON'T
16 DEAL WITH THE ISSUES THAT WERE BROUGHT UP BY COMMISSIONER
17 RABBITT, COMMISSIONER SPERING, AND OTHERS, WHICH I THINK ARE
18 RIGHT-ON ISSUES ABOUT PEOPLE WHO -- YOU KNOW, LABORS AND
19 OTHERS, I JUST DON'T SEE THAT AS -- AS BEING SOMETHING THAT
20 MAKES SENSE. FOR THIS REGION, AT THIS TIME, EVEN TO PUT IN A
21 PLAN. SO, SO, I HOPE WE -- I HOPE -- I HOPE STAFF CAN AT LEAST
22 COME BACK WITH SOME OPTIONS ON THOSE THINGS FOR US ALL TO BE
23 ABLE TO KIND OF TALK ABOUT AND CONSIDER. THANK YOU.
24



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. THANK YOU. THANK YOU,
2 NICK. I WANT TO DO PUBLIC COMMENTS. SEBASTIAN, ARE YOU STILL
3 HERE?

4
5 **SPEAKER:** YES.

6
7 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY.

8
9 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** AND HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** TWO MINUTES. AND ZACK, YOU
12 WILL FOLLOW SEBASTIAN.

13

14 **SEBASTIAN PETTY:** SEBASTIAN PETTY WITH SPUR I WANT TO THANK
15 STAFF FOR BRINGING FORWARD THIS IMPORTANT INFORMATION AND
16 CONTEXT SETTING AS YOU CONSIDER MAJOR POTENTIAL REGIONAL
17 MEASURE ENABLING LEGISLATION AS WELL AS TRANSIT 2050 PLUS. THE
18 REALITY IS WE'RE AT A MOMENT WHERE WE'RE LOOKING AT-LARGE
19 SCALE SYSTEMIC CHANGE IN OUR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM
20 AND THAT'S DRIVEN BY A CLIMATE EMERGENCY THAT'S BEEN
21 TRANSLATED INTO SOME VERY REAL AND VERY CHALLENGING STATE
22 STANDARDS FOR VMT REDUCTION. THAT'S GOING TO BE A PROCESS, AND
23 IT'S GOING TO BE A DIFFICULT ONE THAT'S FINANCIALLY
24 CHALLENGING, TECHNICALLY CHALLENGING, AND POLITICALLY
25 CHALLENGING. SPUR SHARES SOME OF THE CONCERNS EXPRESSED BY



APRIL 12, 2024

1 COMMISSIONERS HERE AROUND THE EQUITY IMPLICATIONS OF ALL-LANE
2 TOLLING, NON-SUBSTITUTABILITY OF CERTAIN FREEWAY TRIPS WITH
3 TRANSIT TRIPS AND THIS IS A PROCESS WHERE WE HAVE TO GET IT
4 RIGHT WE NEED TO STOP EXPANDING HIGHWAYS AND STOP BUILDING
5 INTERCHANGES WE NEED TO THINK ABOUT ITERATION OF PLANNED BAY
6 AREA REGIONAL MEASURE THINK ABOUT STEPS WE CAN TAKE TO STOP
7 THE DAMAGE AT THE EXTREME END AND THAT'S SOMETHING WE'LL
8 CONTINUE TO ADVOCATE FOR AS WE ADVANCE IN THESE PROCESSES.
9 THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME.

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. ZACK?

12

13 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS, ZACK DEUTSCH-
14 GROSS, POLICY REFORM THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION TODAY.
15 SEBASTIAN STOLE ALL MY COMMENTS.

16

17 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. [LAUGHTER] THEN YOU CAN
18 SIT DOWN. ZACK DID YOU HAVE ANYTHING YOU WANTED TO ADD TO
19 THAT?

20

21 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** NO. [INDISCERNIBLE]

22

23 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** COME UP TO THE MIC REAL
24 QUICK.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **ZACK DEUTSCH-GROSS:** PARTICULARLY TO EQUITY, FOR FOLKS WHO
2 DON'T HAVE TRANSIT OPTIONS, AND ARE FORCED TO DRIVE. IT'S AN
3 INCOME OR LACK OF ACCESS. WE NEED TO GET THIS RIGHT. IT'S
4 FUNDAMENTAL TO OUR REGION TO GET THIS RIGHT. I THINK ALL-LANE
5 TOLLING PRESENTS OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO, BUT WE NEED TO MOVE
6 CAREFULLY AND DELIBERATELY. SO, APPRECIATE COMMISSIONERS
7 DELIBERATION ON THIS AND MOVING FORWARD WITH THIS WITH
8 INTENTIONALITY AND PRIORITIZING CONVERSIONS WHEN POSSIBLE AND
9 ADVANCING EQUITY FOR USERS. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANKS, ZACK. I DON'T SEE ANY
12 -- ALFREDO DID YOU --

13

14 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** QUICK COMMENT, CHAIR SPERING. FIRST OF ALL,
15 THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I TOTALLY UNDERSTAND THAT
16 THERE IS A KNOWN IMPACT THIS WE HAVE ON ROADWAYS TODAY. WHAT
17 I'M STRUGGLING TO UNDERSTAND IS WE'RE LIVING AT A MOMENT WHERE
18 THERE IS A LOT OF UNCERTAINTY, WHERE JOBS ARE BEING MOVED TO
19 OR NEW JOB CENTERS ARE BEING CREATED. WHERE PEOPLE LIVE IS
20 FUNDAMENTALLY DIFFERENT WHEN I WAS GROWING UP YOU WANT THE
21 CORNER LOT IN THE BACKYARD AND THEN YOU HAVE KIDS AND YOU HAVE
22 TO MO IT PEOPLE DON'T WANT THAT TYPE OF HOUSING ANYMORE.
23 THINGS ARE CHANGING WE CAN'T BE POSITIONAL IT HAS TO BE
24 FLEXIBLE TO UNDERSTAND WHAT THE NEW TRENDS THAT ARE CHANGING
25 WHEN YOU HEAR FOLKS SAY NO MORE X I DON'T THINK WE CAN AFFORD



APRIL 12, 2024

1 TO DO THAT BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW WHAT CHANGES ARE GOING TO BE
2 SO MONUMENTAL FOR OUR REGION BECAUSE THERE ARE SO MANY
3 PASSENGERS CHANGING HOW DO YOU LEVEL SET THE CURRENT IMPACT
4 WHICH IS KNOWN WITH SO MUCH OF WHAT MIGHT CHANGE FOR US?

5

6 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. STEPHANIE? [LAUGHTER]

7

8 **SPEAKER:** HE DOESN'T HAVE TO ANSWER THAT QUESTION.

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** HE CAN ANSWER IN A MOMENT I
11 WANT TO GET EVERYTHING OUT OF THE WAY.

12

13 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** I'M GOOD. THANK YOU, DAVE FOR A
14 THOUGHT PROVOKING PRESENTATION, I'M GOING TO THROW IN ANOTHER
15 FACTOR ROAD USAGE CHARGES OPPOSED TO GAS TAX WHERE IS ALL THAT
16 FITS INTO THE DISCUSSION.

17

18 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY DAVE, ANSWER THE CHAIR'S
19 -- [LAUGHTER] -- AND BE SUCCINCT.

20

21 **DAVE VAUTIN:** [LAUGHTER] THANK YOU FOR THOSE QUESTIONS. THAT IS
22 THE MILLION DOLLARS -- BILLION DOLLARS QUESTION IN
23 TRANSPORTATION RIGHT NOW, HOW DO WE RESPOND TO THIS INCREDIBLE
24 UNCERTAINTY. YOU KNOW WHAT I WOULD SAY IS WE HAVE SOME
25 EXPERIENCE OF DOING THIS, RIGHT BEFORE THE PANDEMIC WE WERE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 DOING THE HORIZON EFFORT AS PART OF THE PRIOR PLAN, WE WERE
2 TESTING OUT ALL THESE DIFFERENT STRATEGIES, DIFFERENT LEVELS
3 OF TELECOMMUTING AND PREFERENCES AND SHIFTS IT'S NOT LIKE
4 ANSWERED ALL THOSE QUESTIONS, BUT WE NEED TO CONTINUE TO
5 ENGAGE IN EXPLORING THESE QUESTIONS NOT WITH A SINGLE LENS OF
6 WHAT THE FUTURE WILL BE, BUT EXPLORING THROUGH THE LENS OF HOW
7 THIS MIGHT SHAKE OUT AND WHAT ARE ALL THE DIFFERENT SCENARIOS
8 THAT WE FACE. NOT TO SAY WE HAVE SOLUTIONS TODAY, BUT THAT'S A
9 PLANNING TECHNIQUE THAT HELP US KNOW THINK THROUGH THAT MORE.
10 THE OTHER THING I WOULD SAY TO YOUR QUESTION IS THE SMALLER
11 AND MORE TACTICAL INTERVENTIONS IN THE TRANSPORTATION SPACE
12 ARE OFTEN THE MOST FLEXIBLE AND RESILIENT SO WHEN WE LOOKED AT
13 THESE TYPES OF THINGS IN THAT LAST CYCLE WHAT WE FOUND IS THAT
14 THESE BIG GIANT MEGA PROJECTS I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT HIGHWAYS
15 OR TRANSIT SPECIFICALLY, BUT JUST WRIT LARGE ACROSS, BUT THE
16 BIG MULTIBILLION DOLLARS PROJECTS WHERE YOU'RE PUTTING IN
17 CONCRETE THAT ARE GOING TO LAST HUNDREDS OF YEARS, THOSE TENDS
18 TO BE VERY EXPENSIVE, FOR ONE, AND LESS FLEXIBLE THAN
19 SOMETHING WHERE WE ARE TRYING TO BE TACTICAL WHETHER PUTTING
20 IN A BIKE LANE, OR USE EXISTING PAVEMENT IN A DIFFERENT WAY
21 AND WE CAN ALWAYS CHANGE THAT LATER IF THE PROJECT IS NOT
22 WORKING. I THINK THERE WAS SUCH A SPIRIT OF EXPERIMENTATION
23 DURING THE PANDEMIC, THAT I THINK IS WORTH REFLECTING ON IN
24 THE TRANSPORTATION SPACE FOR THE YEARS AHEAD. THEN TO
25 COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETER'S QUESTION, SO, WITH REGARDS TO THE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 ROAD USER CHARGE, WE ARE BAKED, THE ASSUMPTIONS THAT THE STATE
2 WHICH HAS INDICATED ITS COMMITMENT TO SHIFTING TO A ROAD USER
3 CHARGE WE HAVE BAKED THAT INTO THE ASSUMPTION OF PLANNED BAY
4 AREA 2050+ IT'S SOMETHING I THINK THEY'RE ENVISIONING DOING IN
5 THE FIRST HALF OF 2030S IT'S A NUMBER OF YEARS AWAY CALTRANS
6 IS ACTIVELY LEADING THE CHARGE IN THAT SPACE BUT THE DESIGN IS
7 REVENUE NEUTRAL APPROACH FROM GAS TAX

8

9 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** CARLOS.

10

11 **CARLOS ROMERO:** QUICK INFORMATIONAL QUESTION, WHO HAS, IN THE
12 COUNTRY, ALL-LANE TOLLING AT THIS POINT?

13

14 **DAVE VAUTIN:** SO, THERE ARE A NUMBER OF ALL -- FACILITIES WHERE
15 ALL LANES ARE TOLLED, RIGHT? THERE ARE TOLL WAYS IN THE
16 NORTHEAST, THERE ARE TOLL WAYS IN ILLINOIS, AND TEXAS AND
17 FLORIDA.

18

19 **CARLOS ROMERO:** ALL-LANE TOLLING.

20

21 **DAVE VAUTIN:** WHAT IS DIFFERENT AND DOES NOT EXIST IN THE U.S.
22 BAY, IS REALLY TOLL LANE EXISTING INTERSTATE HIGHWAYS AND IN
23 PART, THE REASON WHY NONE OF -- ALL THESE REGIONS ARE
24 EXPLORING THAT NOW AND WHY THEY HAVEN'T BEEN EXPLORING IT
25 BEFORE IS UNDER THE BIDEN ADMINISTRATION, THEY UNLOCK THE



APRIL 12, 2024

1 ABILITY TO TOLL EXISTING HIGHWAYS SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION
2 CAN AUTHORIZE UP TO TEN METRO AREAS IN THE COUNTRY TO DO THAT
3 THAT'S WHY YOU SEE IN STATES WITH THESE TO FACILITIES YOU SEE
4 COEXISTING WITH FREE FACILITIES A MIX BECAUSE INTERSTATE AND
5 NON-LEGACY INTERSTATES CANNOT BE TOLLED IT'S EMERGING IN THE
6 SPACE OF MOST CONGESTED REGIONS.

7

8 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU DAVE. WE LOOK
9 FORWARD TO YOUR NEXT INFORMATIVE RIVETING PRESENTATION.

10

11 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE.

12

13 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** I'M GOING TO DO PUBLIC
14 COMMENTS RIGHT NOW. GO AHEAD.

15

16 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. FIRST UP IS SCOTT MACE. GO
17 AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

18

19 **SPEAKER:** HELLO CAN YOU HEAR ME?

20

21 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** YES.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** OKAY GREAT. ACTUALLY, I LIVED IN DC AREA FOR NINE
24 YEARS AND THEY DO HAVE ALL-LANE TOLLING ON I66 INSIDE THE
25 BELTWAY, I THINK THAT WAS SPECIAL ENABLING LEGISLATION. SO



APRIL 12, 2024

1 THERE IS A PRECEDENT. I WANTED TO SAY THAT I THOUGHT THAT
2 ALTHOUGH THERE MAY BE NO RIGHT ANSWER, I THINK THERE ARE WRONG
3 ANSWERS. I WOULD BE VERY CONCERNED ABOUT A PLAN THAT DOES
4 ENABLE FREEWAY OR HIGHWAY EXPANSION. I'M VERY INTERESTED TO
5 HEAR THAT LESS THAN 30% OF THE TRIPS ON OUR HIGHWAYS ARE WORK
6 RELATED. THAT SUGGESTS THAT THE HARDSHIPS TO WORKERS ARE
7 CERTAINLY LIMITED IF WE CONSIDER SOME OF THESE MITIGATIONS TO
8 CONTROL CONGESTION. I'M CALLING FROM MONTEREY COUNTY. AND I
9 JUST WANT TO REMIND PEOPLE THAT THERE ARE PEOPLE OUTSIDE THE
10 NINE BAY AREA COUNTIES NOW THAT HAVE A CONSIDERABLE NEED TO
11 TRAVEL TO AND FROM THE BAY AREA, AND IN SOME SENSE, THEY'RE
12 NOT AT THE TABLE. I UNDERSTAND THAT THAT'S NOT REALLY WHAT MTC
13 IS SET UP TO DO BUT WE HAVE TO THINK ABOUT THE FACT THAT IF WE
14 DO EVERYTHING WE CAN TO CONTROL CONGESTION. YOU HAVE PEOPLE
15 SETTLING IN THESE EX-URBS WHO WILL ADD TO THAT CONGESTION, NO
16 MATTER WHAT YOU DO. THAT'S SOMETHING TO THINK ABOUT. THANK YOU
17 FOR YOUR TIME.

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU.

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THERE ARE NO OTHER MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC
22 WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED FOR THIS ITEM.

23

24 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU. IF THERE ARE NO
25 FURTHER COMMENTS, I'M GOING TO ADJOURN THE MEETING.



APRIL 12, 2024

1

2 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

3

4 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OH, I THOUGHT THAT'S WHAT WE
5 WERE DOING.

6

7 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** UH-HUH. PUBLIC COMMENT ON 8A. THAT'S WHAT
8 HE WAS COMMENTING ON.

9

10 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** OKAY. DO PUBLIC COMMENT. DO
11 YOU HAVE ANY?

12

13 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** NO. THERE WAS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE --
14 [LAUGHTER] -- BUT WE STILL HAVE TO DO IT. SO, THERE WAS NO
15 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED UNDER GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS,
16 THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC IN ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK,
17 AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM WISHING TO SPEAK.

18

19 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** ALL THAT FOR NO ONE?

20

21 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** [LAUGHTER] YEAH.

22

23 **CHAIR, JAMES P. SPERING, MTC PC:** THANK YOU, MARTHA. [LAUGHTER]
24 WITH THAT, THE MEETING IS ADJOURNED.

25



APRIL 12, 2024

1 **CHAIR, BELIA RAMOS, ABAG AC:** WE'LL ADJOURN TO OUR NEXT REGULAR
2 MEETING OF THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE COMMITTEE WITH THE JOINT
3 MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE. OUR NEXT MEETING IS FEBRUARY -- MAY --
4 SORRY. FRIDAY MAY 10TH AT 9:40. [ADJOURNED]

5



NTT

Broadcasting Government