



SAN FRANCISCO BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT
2150 Webster Street, P.O. Box 12688
Oakland, CA 94604-2688
(510) 464-6000

2022

December 9, 2022

Rebecca Saltzman
PRESIDENT

Janice Li
VICE PRESIDENT

Robert Powers
GENERAL MANAGER

Alfredo Pedroza
Chair, Metropolitan Transportation Commission
Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street, Ste. 800
San Francisco, CA 94105-2066

DIRECTORS

Debora Allen
1ST DISTRICT

Mark Foley
2ND DISTRICT

Rebecca Saltzman
3RD DISTRICT

Robert Raburn, Ph.D.
4TH DISTRICT

John McPartland
5TH DISTRICT

Elizabeth Ames
6TH DISTRICT

Lateefah Simon
7TH DISTRICT

Janice Li
8TH DISTRICT

Bevan Duffy
9TH DISTRICT

Chairman Pedroza,

Thank you and the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) for your leadership on regional transit coordination. As BART celebrates our 50th anniversary of regional public transportation service, MTC and BART have had many opportunities to work together to provide sustainable mobility choices for Bay Area residents.

On November 17, 2022, the BART Board had an opportunity to review and discuss the preliminary proposal put forward at the November 14, 2022 Advisory Group meeting as part of the Regional Network Management Business Case effort. Improving the customer experience is of utmost importance to BART.

As President and Vice President of the BART Board of Directors, we wanted to offer the following comments on the preliminary proposal.

1. **Focus on Funding:** Due to the impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic and the rise of remote work, it is imperative for MTC and transit operators to continue to work together to identify near-term and long-term funding to sustain critical transit services for the region. We appreciate MTC partnership on this so that operators can continue to provide adequate service for riders.
2. **On the Right Path:** The preliminary proposal for the Near-Term Regional Network Management Structure is moving in a good direction, with some minor modifications (identified below). We agree that there is an urgent need for action to improve the customer experience, after two and a half years of planning efforts. We need to show continuous customer improvements in order to build back the trust of the public. A Near-Term period of approximately two-years seems reasonable, but there will need to be performance measures to assess how the Near-Term Framework is performing, with some ability to iterate on the metrics.
3. **Long-Term Evolution:** We appreciate MTC acknowledging the need to establish a Near-Term Framework to show progress now, and the need for a transition to a Long-Term Framework. While we don't know what the end state will look like, it will be important to identify a clear and robust transition process, with a definite timeline. More definition is needed on how to get from Step A to Step B, and beyond.

December 9, 2022

Page 2

4. **Policy Direction Needed:** For both the Near-Term and Long-Term Frameworks, one thing lacking is a clear definition of role for transportation policy makers. The Near-Term Structure would be greatly enhanced with a separate and distinct role for a policy maker committee representing the MTC Commission, and directly elected transit agency board members that do not currently have representation on the Commission. This policy committee would be held accountable by the public.

5. **Transit Board Representation:** For the Long-Term Framework, we continue to advocate for having a seat at the regional table. As directly elected public officials, both the AC Transit and BART Board have accountability to our transit riders. If MTC and the State are seeking transformational changes in the regional transit network to improve the customer experience, it is very important for both AC Transit and BART to have a Board representation on the Commission.

We look forward to reviewing the draft recommendations as they emerge in the next several weeks. Please do not hesitate to contact us if you have any questions.

Sincerely,



Rebecca Saltzman
Board President



Janice Li
Board Vice President

cc: Therese McMillan, MTC Executive Director
Alix Bockelman, MTC Deputy Executive Director, Policy
Bob Powers, BART General Manager
Val Menotti, BART Chief Planning & Development Officer



December 14, 2022

Metropolitan Transportation Commission
Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105-2066

Dear Chair Pedroza and MTC Commissioners,

We write to you jointly as Chair and Vice Chair of the Network Management Business Case Advisory Group to express our support for the Regional Network Management (RNM) proposal presented by staff at our final, December 12, 2022, Advisory Group meeting. The proposed RNM framework provides a thoughtful approach to advancing the integration of our region's transit system in a manner that will benefit customers in the near term while also providing the flexibility to adapt and evolve over time and we are excited to see it move forward.

Every day, our buses, ferries and trains carry tens of thousands of customers around the region, bringing them to their destinations safely and conveniently. When customers use transit, everyone in the region benefits. A robust and well utilized transit system reduces congestion on our streets, supports compact development and intensified land uses, eliminates air pollutants and greenhouse gas emissions and ensures that all members of our community can rely on a foundation of equitable access and mobility. For these reasons, the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) and local jurisdictions around the Bay Area are counting on transit ridership and mode share to grow over the coming decades. Without a strong, well-utilized transit system we will not be able to achieve the sustainable, equitable future we envision for our region.

Yet our transit system faces real challenges. Prior to the COVID-19 Pandemic, Bay Area Transit was troubled by stagnant ridership, institutional fragmentation and escalating costs. Now, while the worst of the pandemic is behind us, shifts in mobility and travel patterns have resulted in significant loss of ridership and the collapse of revenue streams that have long been essential to the business models of our transit operators. If we are to stabilize and grow our transit system over the coming years we need to work together as a region to deliver the services our customers need. The development of a coordinated, Regional Network Management function is a key step in making this transformation happen.

The proposed Regional Network Management framework is a significant and practical step toward a more integrated, customer focused transit system. It provides a dedicated forum and staff resourcing to address regional transit and empowers a decision-making structure that

leverages the existing authorities of the MTC Commission and individual transit agencies to implement needed customer improvements quickly. Further, the proposal harnesses the expertise and formalizes coordination of the transit general managers and elevates the voice of the customer and its importance throughout the framework. The near-term RNM structure also provides flexibility to evolve and strengthen over time, allowing us to understand what works well and what changes may be needed as we navigate the years ahead. This proposal is the result of a collective regional effort that began with the Blue Ribbon Transit Recovery Taskforce in 2020 and has continued with the Network Management Business Case process. The work has shifted and changed a number of times based on input from stakeholders, transit operators and policymakers and the final result is a proposal that has been shaped and guided by all of these voices. We are grateful for the sustained efforts of the consultant team, MTC and transit agency staff, and all who dedicated their time and energy to this important work.

As we reach the conclusion of the year and of this Advisory Group, we look forward to advancing this important work for consideration by the MTC Commission and by individual transit agency boards. Working together we are confident that we can build a large and thriving regional transit system that is financially sustainable and delivers the value our customers and our public need and deserve.



Denis J. Mulligan

Chair, Network Management Business Case Advisory Group



Alicia John-Baptiste

Vice-Chair, Network Management Business Case Advisory Group

cc: Therese McMillan, Executive Director, MTC



Memorandum

To:

Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC)

From:

MTC Policy Advisory Council Chair Randi Kinman

CC:

MTC Policy Advisory Council members

Policy Advisory Council Transit Transformation Action Plan Subcommittee members

Date:

November 14, 2022

Work Item Number:

1114

Regarding:

Network Management Business Case

Summary:

At its Wednesday, November 9, 2022 meeting, the Policy Advisory Council received a report from the Policy Advisory Council Transit Transformation Action Plan (TAP) Subcommittee Chair Adina Levin regarding the Network Management Business Case.

TAP Subcommittee Chair Levin relayed the suggestion from the Subcommittee that the Council vote on the statement below, which passed with 18 “ayes” and 1 “abstention.”

Council Statement to Metropolitan Transportation Commission:

“The Network Management business case should prioritize movement toward a network management structure for Bay Area transit that establishes one governing body that is fully accountable to the public for the performance, connectivity, accessibility and user experience of Bay Area transit.”

Regards,



Randi Kinman, Council Chair



January 12, 2023

Re: MTC Executive Committee Meeting, January 13, 2023
Item 4a. Regional Network Management (RNM) Business Case Evaluation Update
and Draft Recommendations

Joint MTC ABAG Legislation Committee, January 13, 2023
Item 3b. Stakeholder Outreach for Potential Bay Area Transportation Measure

Chair Pedroza, Vice Chair Josefowitz; Chair Arreguin and Commissioners

The Draft Recommendations of the Region's Network Management Business Case Evaluation presented this week caps off over a year of work that was initiated as a result of the Blue Ribbon Task Force's acknowledgment that the Bay Area currently does not possess the *"Network management resources and authority... [to] ensure frequent, reliable service to key destinations across boundaries of multiple agencies, with efficient connections at multimodal hubs"*.

What has been presented is described as an interim, near-term regional network management framework. We support this framework as an interim next step that can immediately begin advancing many of the initiatives.

We are also very pleased to see that today's MTC/ABAG Legislation Committee is reviewing a proposal to start a year-long process to lay the groundwork for authorizing legislation for a regional transportation funding measure. This work is a critical element of the Transformation Action Plan, with a goal to provide funding to support frequent, reliable, accessible well-integrated service with coordinated, affordable fares, streamlined wayfinding. Regional integration has been identified as a key goal, and one of the most popular selling points of a regional funding measure.

The development of the transportation funding measure will consider not only what to spend the money on, but the policies for how to spend the funds. For those policies, it will be essential to ensure that new funding will deliver and maintain a system that is consistently well-integrated for riders.

This will require governance over the new funding to make stable policy decisions, and to ensure that transit agencies participate in and follow key regional programs and standards, while protecting agencies from any financial imbalances caused by coordination. This will require an update to the interim network management structure that is coming forward today.

In order for a regional funding measure to deliver on the promises of fare, service, and system integration - the network management structure will need to be updated to ensure that new money can deliver an integrated system.

The proposed timeline for 'evolving' the interim structure into a longer term structure is 3-10 years from now, to be based on reviews 'every 2 years' of performance.

This timeline is not soon enough to be incorporated into enabling legislation for a regional measure. We urge you to use the critical window of opportunity in the coming year - as part of the groundwork for a regional measure - to define governance for new funding that will lead to a well-coordinated, affordable, accessible system.

Doing so would set our region on a much stronger foundation for transforming transit over the coming years, and in partnership with our state legislators - who are eager to see structural transformation as a condition of new funding.

Thank you,

Ian Griffiths
Policy Director, Seamless Bay Area

Adina Levin
Advocacy Director, Seamless Bay Area



Center for Independent Living, Inc.

January 11, 2023

MTC Executive Committee - Agenda 3A - Network Management

Dear Commissioners and staff

As people with disabilities and allies, the Bay Area Cross Disability and Allies Coalition (BAXDAC) would like to thank the Metropolitan Transportation Commission and agencies for working together on a Network Management Business Case study examining how to manage a more coordinated and accessible public transportation system that is accountable to riders.

In reviewing the proposal, we are happy to see that the refined Short/Near-Term RNM structure has incorporated feedback from Advisory Group members and the Policy Advisory Group TAP Subcommittee members:

- We support the concept of having a new “MTC RNM Committee” made up of both MTC commissioners and others with relevant roles - including transit agency board members not represented on MTC, and a state appointee. We feel that this proposal would be further strengthened if the non-MTC committee members had voting seats on the committee instead of having a non-voting status.
- We support having the “Voice of the Customer” Advisory Committee provide input directly to the MTC RNM Committee, rather than the RNM Council. We continue to believe that a representative of the Voice of the Customer Advisory Committee should have a seat directly on the MTC RNM Committee to ensure centering of customer perspectives.
- We support the proposal for dedicated staffing, particularly the potential for the seconding of transit agency and MTC staff within a unified structure. As part of the increase in staff capacity, we want to ensure that the staff responsibilities for accessibility should refer not only to needed changes to the Paratransit system, but also covering standards for accessibility for seniors and people with a broad spectrum of disabilities to the full public transportation system, with ADA

requirements considered the floor not the ceiling, and covering communications practices that include seniors and people with disabilities.

- Relatedly, we urge MTC to create an accessibility task force, composed of well-informed people with disabilities, who have researched accessibility best practices in the US and abroad, and who are aware of and have ideas about improving accessibility for public transit in the Bay Area. This task force would outline the fundamental principles and requirements of accessibility, and propose standards for development and promulgation in the Bay Area, to make accessibility and universal design a reality and the norm.
- A significant concern about this proposal is the lack of clarity about when and how the Long-Term RNM Structure will be developed. Staff and consultants have stated repeatedly in past meetings that the near-term structure is an interim solution. In addition, the MTC is taking the lead in laying the groundwork for a regional funding measure with a goal of funding that can create an integrated, accessible system. In order for new funding to create an integrated system, it would be valuable for accountability and authority to be aligned. Therefore, we urge the Commission to set a defined term for the preliminary RNM structure, and undertake a parallel process to identify and work toward the implementation of a long-term RNM Model, with work beginning in 2023.

Thank you for your consideration of these comments and your ongoing work to deliver an equitable and accessible transportation system for the Bay Area.

Daveed Mandell
California Council of the Blind

Theresa Pedrosa
Student Senate President, Chabot College

Zayda Ortiz
Center for Independent Living

Ian Griffiths
Seamless Bay Area

Sandra Lang

Amy Thomson
Transportation Policy and Programs Manager