



# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript





OCTOBER 12, 2022

**METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE  
WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 12, 2022 9:45 AM**

**GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU. WELCOME TO THE PROGRAMS AND ALLOCATION COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS GINA PAPAN. I'LL BE FILLING IN TODAY FOR CHAIR RABBIT. CAN WE CALL THE MEETING? I'M GOING TO CALL THE MEETING TO ORDER AND REQUEST THE BROADCASTING OF THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M.,  
2 YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED  
3 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF  
4 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE  
5 TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL  
6 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE  
7 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD  
8 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE  
9 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP  
10 TO DATE.

11

12 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING ON TO AGENDA  
13 ITEM TWO IS THE CONSENT CALENDAR. ITEMS --

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I'M SORRY.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** ROLL CALL. I MISSED. ITEM ONE. PLEASE  
18 ROLL CALL TO CONFIRM QUORUM.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR RABBIT IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR  
21 PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. COMMISSION ARE  
5 GLOVER?

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

14

15 **HILLARY RONEN:** HERE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WORTH?

18

19 **AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. QUICK COMMISSIONERS. ITEM  
24 TWO, CONSENT CALENDAR. ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2H. DO WE HAVE ANY  
25 COMMENTS? DID WE RECEIVE ANY CORRESPONDENCE?





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING, AND  
3 I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED AT THIS  
4 TIME.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. COMMISSIONERS, DO I HAVE A MOTION  
7 TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. A SECOND IN.

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** CHAVEZ, A SECOND.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ROLL CALL PLEASE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR RABBIT IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR  
18 PAPAN?

19

20 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** YES.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT.  
23 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

24

25 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

3

4 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

7

8 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

11

12 **HILLARY RONEN:** YES.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

15

16 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

19 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. MOVING ON TO WHAT I THINK IS

22 GOING TO BE A VERY POPULAR ITEM, ITEM THREE. MTC RESOLUTION

23 4537 AND 4130 REVISED, MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY AND

24 TRANSIT INTER-AGENCY RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM FRAMEWORK. I BELIEVE

25 WE HAVE A PRESENTATION. TAKE IT AWAY, KEN.





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I'M KENNETH FOLAN  
3 WITH MTC STAFF. AND WE I HAVE PRESENTATION COMING UP RIGHT  
4 NOW. AS COMMISSIONER PAPAN SAID, THIS IS THE ITEM FOR THE  
5 MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCEMENT POLICY, IN THE TRANSIT AND INTERCITY  
6 RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM FRAMEWORK. SO, I WILL REFER TO THE POLICY  
7 AS THE MAP, AND THE TRANSIT AND INTERCITY RAIL CAPITAL PROGRAM  
8 IS THE TIRCP PROGRAM, SO THAT WE CAN GET THROUGH THIS  
9 PRESENTATION. THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. WE ARE -- STAFF IS  
10 RECOMMENDING THAT THE COMMITTEE REFER THIS ITEM TO THE  
11 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL AT THE END OF THE MONTH, AT THE  
12 COMMISSION MEETING, AND THEREFORE THERE ARE TWO RESOLUTIONS,  
13 4537 FOR THE MAP AND 4130 FOR THE STATE TIRCP/MTC ENDORSEMENT  
14 FRAMEWORK. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. A QUICK OVERVIEW. WE HAD A  
15 PRESENTATION ON THE MAP IN JULY. WE ALSO HAD A WORKSHOP ON  
16 PROJECT DELIVERY BACK IN MAY, AND THE PURPOSES OF THE MAP, IN  
17 A NUTSHELL, TO IMPLEMENT PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, ALL THE MAP  
18 PROJECTS ARE READY IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050, AND THIS IS A WAY  
19 TO KIND OF GET THEM TO REVENUE SERVICE. HAVING SAID THAT, IT'S  
20 NECESSARY TO SEQUENCE AND PRIORITIZE, ESPECIALLY IN THE MEGA  
21 PROJECT CATEGORY, BECAUSE THERE IS GREAT FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES  
22 AT THE MOMENT, BUT STILL NOT TO GET ALL THE PROJECTS MOVING AT  
23 ONCE. THE THIRD BULLET THERE IS MAKING SURE WE ACKNOWLEDGE  
24 THAT THERE IS SPACE IN FUNDING TARGETS FOR HIGH PERFORMING AND  
25 LOWER COSTING PROJECTS AND OUR PLANNED BAY AREA DEMONSTRATED





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 THAT THOSE ARE VERY IMPORTANT PROJECTS THAT BRING GREAT VALUE  
2 TO THE REGION AND TO THE RIDERS, AND THAT THOSE ARE ADDRESSED  
3 WITH PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES. FINALLY, AT THE END OF THIS  
4 PRESENTATION, I'LL TALK A LITTLE BIT ABOUT THE RISK MANAGEMENT  
5 ROLE IN MAKING SURE THAT THE DECISIONS MADE THROUGH THE MAP  
6 ARE CONSISTENT WITH BOTH THE PLANNED BAY AREA POLICIES, AS  
7 WELL AS MORE RECENT POLICIES ADOPTED BY THE COMMISSION. NEXT  
8 SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS SLIDE GIVES YOU AN IDEA OF THE TIMING.  
9 TODAY WE'RE HERE FOCUSING ON THE ENDORSEMENTS, ESPECIALLY FOR  
10 THE TIRCP STATE FUNDING ROUND BECAUSE THAT CALL FOR PROJECTS  
11 IS HAPPENING IN FALL 2022 WITH RESULTS KNOWN AS EARLY AS THE  
12 END OF THE YEAR AND INTO 2023. IN THE FALL AND WINTER, IN THE  
13 COMING MONTHS, WE WILL BE REFINING SOME OF THE WORK IN THE MAP  
14 RELATED TO THE PROGRAMMATIC CATEGORIES, AND AS I MENTIONED,  
15 ALSO, FURTHER DEVELOPING THE POLICY AND RISK PROGRAMS. I THINK  
16 IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE, IN THE LAST BULLETS SHOW THIS, THIS  
17 WILL REQUIRE CONTINUAL UPDATES AND REBALANCING OF THE FUNDING  
18 PLANS AS PROJECTS ARE AWARDED FUNDS THROUGH THE STATE AND  
19 FEDERAL COMPETITIVE PROGRAMS, WE'LL NEED OF A REBALANCE TO  
20 MAKE SURE WE CLOSE THE FUNDING GAPS AND DELIVERY ALL OF THESE  
21 PROJECTS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. HERE IS A LOOK AT THE MAP FROM  
22 THE PROJECT PERSPECTIVE. WE GROUPED THEM INTO THREE BULLETS  
23 THERE. THE FIRST ONE IS THE MEGA PROJECTS THAT ARE PLANNED BAY  
24 AREA PROJECTS, AND WE HAVE DEFINED THEM INTO TWO LEVELS AND  
25 WE'LL TALK MORE ABOUT THAT LATER. NEXT CATEGORY IS THE HIGH





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 PERFORMING LOWER COST SMALLER PROJECTS THAT HELP THE LOCAL  
2 TRANSIT NETWORKS AND IMPROVE FACILITIES. AND FINALLY AN  
3 IMPORTANT COMPONENT, ALSO, IS TO ELEVATE THE ZERO-EMISSIONS  
4 TRANSITION OF OUR FLEET, UP TO THE STATUS OF A MEGA PROJECT.  
5 BECAUSE THAT WILL -- THAT INCLUDES UP TO ABOUT 4,000 VEHICLES  
6 THAT NEED TO BE TRANSITIONED TO ZERO-EMISSIONS TO MEET CERTAIN  
7 POLICIES OF THE COMMISSION, AS WELL AS STATE REQUIREMENTS.  
8 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS SLIDE HAS BEEN PART OF THE PACKET  
9 THAT WENT TO YOU IN JULY, AND WE'RE JUST KIND OF DEFINING,  
10 HERE, IN SUMMARIZING WHAT THE LEVELS ARE WITHIN THE MAP, AND I  
11 THINK THAT VERY FIRST BULLET -- OR HIGHLIGHTED STATEMENT IS  
12 IMPORTANT. WE HAD TO START SOMEWHERE, SO THE PROJECT PLACEMENT  
13 IN MAP LEVELS IS INITIALLY BASED ON THE READINESS AND FUNDING  
14 COMMITMENTS AND THAT'S WHERE YOU GET THE LEVELS WITH THE  
15 CERTAIN AMOUNT COMMITTED FUNDING AND THE CERTAIN CONSTRUCTION  
16 START DATE. FUTURE ITERATIONS OF THIS WILL ALSO KIND OF TAKE  
17 INTO CONSIDERATION THE RISK IN POLICY PIECE. NEXT SLIDE,  
18 PLEASE. NOW, ON TO THE TIRCP FRAMEWORK. AND WE'LL SHOW YOU THE  
19 ACTUAL FRAMEWORK IN A COUPLE OF SLIDES. BUT WE WANTED TO JUST  
20 GIVE YOU A SUMMARY. ESSENTIALLY, WE DIVIDED IT THE WAY THE  
21 STATE DIVIDES IT, INTO THE THREE FUNDING PIECES THAT ARE  
22 HIGHLIGHTED IN BOLD THERE. THE IMMEDIATE ONE IS WE ARE  
23 TARGETING 1.3 BILLED FOR THE IMMEDIATE CALL FOR PROJECTS THAT  
24 WILL BE COMING SOON, AND WE'RE REFERRING TO THAT AS AUGMENT  
25 ONE. AUGMENT TWO IS A TARGET FOR THE BAY AREA THAT WE'RE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1     SETTING AT 800 BILLION, AND THAT IS FUNDING THAT WAS  
2     IDENTIFIED IN THE STATE BUDGET. HOWEVER, IT REQUIRES FURTHER  
3     ACTION BY THE STATE TO MAKE SURE THAT THAT FUNDING WILL COME  
4     TO FRUITION. FINALLY IS THE ACTUAL BASELINE TIRCP PROGRAM. AND  
5     WE HAVE A TARGET 2040 AND THAT IS ASSUMES THAT CAP-AND-TRADE  
6     LEGISLATION WILL BE RENEWED AND DOES NOT GO AWAY. NEXT SLIDE,  
7     PLEASE. THIS IS THE ENDORSEMENT TABLE, SO THAT IS ONE OF THE  
8     TWO TABLES THAT WE ARE RECOMMENDING THAT THE COMMITTEE REFER  
9     TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. IN THIS, DEFINES A FUNDING  
10    STRATEGY TO CLOSE THE FUNDING GAPS FOR LEVEL ONE PROJECTS. THE  
11    INFORMATION FOR LEVEL ONE PROJECTS WAS PRESENTED TO THE  
12    COMMITTEE IN JULY. THERE HAS BEEN SOME REFINEMENTS TO IT, BUT  
13    MOST OF THAT IS WHAT YOU ALREADY SAW IN JULY. WHAT WE FILLED  
14    OUT, A LITTLE MORE, IS DOWN BELOW, THE LEVEL TWO PROJECTS. WE  
15    HAVE OUTLINED A STRATEGY FOR THE TIRCP FRAMEWORK, AND THOSE  
16    ARE WHERE THE NUMBERS ARE PINK BELOW, AND WE HAVE ALSO SHADED  
17    OTHER CATEGORIES IN PINK WHERE WE BELIEVE FUNDING SOURCES WILL  
18    BE GOOD FOR PROJECTS. SO WE'LL BE COMING BACK TO YOU IN FUTURE  
19    MONTHS, WE INTENT TO WORK WITH OUR PARTNERS AND FURTHER  
20    UNDERSTAND THE UPCOMING CALLS FOR PROJECTS AT THE FEDERAL AND  
21    STATE LEVEL, AND WE WOULD BE FILLING IN MORE INFORMATION THAT  
22    IS SHADED IN PINK RIGHT NOW. TODAY'S PRESENTATION IS REALLY  
23    FOCUSED ON THE IMMEDIATE TIRCP. SO, THOSE ARE THE -- THERE IS  
24    THREE COLUMNS IN THE MIDDLE OF THIS BIG SPREADSHEET HERE.  
25    TIRCP BASED, TIRCP AUGMENT ONE, AND TIRCP AUGMENT TWO. THE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 NEXT SLIDE WILL SHOW THAT IN DETAIL. SO, THE INFORMATION IS  
2 THE SAME AS ON THIS SLIDE. SO, IF YOU COULD PLEASE GO TO THE  
3 NEXT SLIDE? IT LOOKS -- THERE WE GO. THANK YOU SO THIS IS THE  
4 TIRCP FRAMEWORK THAT WE HAVE DEVELOPED. AND AGAIN IT'S DIVIDED  
5 INTO THE AUGMENT ONE, AUGMENT TWO, AND THEN THE TIRCP BASE. IT  
6 REALLY GOES IN THAT ORDER. AUGMENT ONE IS WHAT WE'RE DEALING  
7 WITH IMMEDIATELY. AUGMENT TWO REQUIRES FURTHER ACTION AND IS A  
8 YEAR OR SO DOWN THE LINE AND THE BASE IS THE PROJECTION OF  
9 2040 AND ALSO REQUIRES FURTHER STATE ACTION. WE HAVE IN  
10 AUGMENT ONE, AS YOU CAN SEE, THERE IS SOME FUNDING FOR  
11 SPECIFIC PROJECTS, THE TOP 3, 250 FOR BART, 450 FOR VTA, AND  
12 350 MILLION FOR CALTRAIN, THOSE ARE ALL PROJECTS WITH EXISTING  
13 TIRCP GRANTS. THEN BELOW THAT, IN AUGMENT ONE COLUMN, IS SOME  
14 PROJECT DEVELOPMENT FUNDING FOR TWO PROJECTS THAT ARE LEVEL  
15 TWO PROJECTS, THE DOWNTOWN RAIL EXTENSION, AS WELL AS THE  
16 VALLEY LINK PROJECT. AND THEN IMPORTANTLY IS A \$200 MILLION  
17 MARKER FOR CERTAIN PROJECTS THAT INCLUDES 0 MARKS  
18 TRANSMISSION, TRANSIT MODERNIZATION, AS WELL AS GRADE  
19 SEPARATIONS. OUR TOTAL TARGET HERE IS \$1.3 BILLION. THE \$1.5  
20 BILLION AVAILABLE TO NORTHERN CALIFORNIA -- SORRY -- FOR  
21 PROJECTS OUTSIDE OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. I'LL GET INTO THAT  
22 FURTHER ON THE NEXT SLIDE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS SLIDE  
23 GIVES A SNAPSHOT OF THE FUNDING AVAILABLE TO THE BAY AREA IN  
24 THIS IMMEDIATE TIRCP AUGMENT ONE CYCLE. THERE IS A WHOLE CHUNK  
25 OF FUNDING THAT IS ONLY AVAILABLE TO SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. THAT





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 IS NOT AVAILABLE ON THIS SLIDE. SO, WHAT IS AVAILABLE TO NON-  
2 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA PROJECTS IS 1.5 BILLION. EXISTING TIRCP  
3 PROJECTS ARE GUARANTEED 900 MILLION, AND COULD RECEIVE UP TO A  
4 MAX OF 1.2 BILLION. SO OUR EXISTING TIRCP PROJECTS, AS YOU SAW  
5 ON THE PRIOR SLIDE, INCLUDE THAT BART TRANSBAY CORE CAPACITY  
6 FOR 250 MILLION. BART TO SILICON VALLEY PHASE TWO FOR 450  
7 MILLION AND THE CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION FOR 300 MILLION. SO  
8 WE'RE TARGETING RECEIVING 1 MILLION OF THAT EXISTING TIRCP  
9 ELEMENT OF THE FUNDING CALL, WHICH IS GOING TO BE SOMEWHERE  
10 BETWEEN 900,000,000 AND 1.2 BILLION. WE ARE ALSO TARGETING FOR  
11 THAT FINAL NEW PROJECTS CATEGORY, OR PROJECT DEVELOPMENT. I  
12 THINK THE SLIDE IS A LITTLE, MAYBE MISSING SOMETHING HERE --  
13 BUT WE ARE TARGETING THERE, IS A CATEGORY CALLED PROJECT  
14 DEVELOPMENT AND THAT IS WHERE WE'RE TARGETING 60 MILLION FOR  
15 THE DOWNTOWN RAIL EXTENSION, AND 40 MILLION FOR VALLEY LINK.  
16 SO, AS YOU CAN SEE, THE FUNDING CALL, THE IMMEDIATE CALL IS  
17 REALLY FOCUSING ON EXISTING TIRCP PROJECTS AND TRYING TO GET  
18 THOSE PROJECTS DELIVERED AND OVER THE FINISH LINE. AND WHAT  
19 THAT WILL DO FOR US IN THE REGION IS MOVE THOSE PROJECTS ALONG  
20 AND THEN THERE IS CAPACITY TO MOVE THE LEVEL TWO PROJECTS UP  
21 TO LEVEL ONE. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE NEXT THREE SLIDES, I  
22 WILL JUST KIND OF GIVE YOU A SUMMARY OF WHAT'S NEXT IN THE  
23 AREA OF POLICY AND RISK COMPONENTS. AGAIN, AS I NOTED, THE  
24 ENDORSEMENTS WILL BE ONGOING IN THE FUTURE TO REINFORCE THESE  
25 ENDORSEMENTS AND REFINE THE MAP STRATEGY WE WILL BE DEVELOPING





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 A POLICY AND RISK PROGRAM. AND WE PLAN TO BRING THAT FOR YOUR  
2 CONSIDERATION EITHER IN LATE 2022, OR EARLY IN THE NEW YEAR.  
3 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND WHERE WE ARE, THE INITIAL STAFF  
4 THINKING ON THIS, AND IT'S -- IT REALLY IS VERY INFLUENCED BY  
5 THE MAY COMMISSION WORKSHOP, IN THE DIRECTION THAT YOU ALL  
6 GAVE US AT THAT WORKSHOP, IS TO DEVELOP SOME, SORT OF, A STAGE  
7 GATE PROCESS THAT BRINGS THE PROJECTS ALONG FROM THE ADOPTION  
8 OF THE PLANNED BAY AREA, THROUGH PROJECT DEVELOPMENT, AND ON,  
9 EVENTUALLY TO REVENUE SERVICE. AT THE WORKSHOP, THE  
10 COMMISSIONERS REALLY WERE FOCUSED IN ON THE BOTTOM LEFT OF  
11 THIS -- OF THIS AMOUNT HERE, AND, SORT OF, IDENTIFIED PLANNED  
12 BAY AREA IS STAGE GATE ZERO. AND SOME OF THE IDEAS THAT WERE  
13 BROUGHT UP IN COMMENTS FROM COMMISSIONERS, I'LL JUST -- THE  
14 IMPORTANT THEMES IN GOING THROUGH STAGE GATES FOR THEM WERE  
15 OPERATING CAPACITY AND FUNDING; APPROPRIATE CONTINGENCY;  
16 AWARENESS OF ESCALATION; THE CORRECT PROJECT DELIVERY  
17 GOVERNANCE; CUSTOMER-FOCUSED PROJECT DELIVERY; AND A  
18 TRANSPARENT PROCESS. SO, AS THE PROJECTS MOVE ALONG THROUGH  
19 THE GATES, AT THE TOP RIGHT, IT BECOMES MORE OF AN OVERSIGHT  
20 RISK MANAGEMENT ROLE WITH PARTNERS AND FTAS AS AN EXAMPLE  
21 THERE. SO THAT IS, SORT OF, THE PATHWAY A PROJECT WOULD TAKE  
22 AS AN ILLUSTRATION, AND THESE ARE THE, SORT OF, GATES WE WILL  
23 BE DEVELOPING FOR PROJECTS IN BRINGING TO YOU, FOR MOVING  
24 PROJECTS FROM ONE-LEVEL TO THE NEXT. I'LL GO A LITTLE BIT  
25 FURTHER THROUGH THE PROCESS BEFORE I GIVE IT BACK TO YOU,





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 COMMISSIONER PAPAN. IF YOU WOULD GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE?  
2 SO, AGAIN, THIS IS THE PROPOSED THINKING AT THE MOMENT IS TO  
3 MOVE PROJECTS THAT ARE ALREADY ASSIGNED LEVELS. A PROJECT  
4 SPONSOR MAY REQUEST THAT IF CONDITIONS CHANGE THAT A PROJECT  
5 BE MOVED BETWEEN LEVELS STAFF WOULD DO AN EVALUATION IS BRING  
6 A RECOMMENDATION TO THE COMMISSION. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THIS  
7 IS SOME INFORMATION ON WHAT IS MIGHT LOOK LIKE TO MOVE BETWEEN  
8 THE GATES. AGAIN, THE GATE A IS EARLIER IN THE PROCESS. THAT'S  
9 A MOMENT WHERE A PROJECT SCOPE, FUNDING PLAN, OR OTHER DETAILS  
10 COULD CHANGE, OR WE COULD WORK WITH THE SPONSORS TO PROVIDE  
11 RECOMMENDATIONS WHERE THERE COULD BE REFINEMENTS TO SCOPE OR  
12 FUNDING PLANS BEFORE APPROVAL TO MOVE THROUGH THAT GATE. AS I  
13 NOTED BEFORE, GATE B IS GETTING CLOSER TO CONSTRUCTION, AND  
14 THAT WOULD BE IN CONJUNCTION WITH OTHER FUNDING PARTNERS AND  
15 OVERSIGHT AGENCIES WHERE YOU'RE TRYING TO DEAL WITH RISK  
16 THAT'S CLOSER TO CONSTRUCTION. AND THE FINAL SLIDE, PLEASE?  
17 THESE ARE A SET OF CONSIDERATIONS OR ISSUES THAT WE HAVE  
18 DEVELOPED. THERE IS MORE INFORMATION IN THE MEMO ABOUT THIS.  
19 BUT A COUPLE OF OBSERVATIONS. EVEN WITH THE AUGMENTED STATE  
20 AND FEDERAL FUNDING PROGRAMS, THERE IS NOT ENOUGH MONEY  
21 AVAILABLE THAT'S WHY WE'RE DOING THIS EFFORT TRYING TO  
22 SEQUENCE AND PRIORITIZE PROJECTS SO WE CAN MOVE PROJECTS INTO  
23 REVENUE SERVICE. THE SECOND THING THAT WE'RE OBSERVING IS THAT  
24 WE WILL ABSOLUTELY NEED TO HAVE REGULAR UPDATES TO THE MAP AND  
25 REBALANCE FUNDING PLANS FOR PROJECTS, AS PROJECTS ARE AWARDED





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 DIFFERENT FUNDING FROM THE STATE AND FEDERAL GOVERNMENT. THE  
2 THIRD BULLET IS JUST A NOTE THAT TRANSIT EXPANSION CREATES  
3 ANNUAL OPERATING EXPENSES. AND, AS YOU ALL KNOW, OPERATING  
4 BUDGETS FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE VERY STRESSED AT THE MOMENT,  
5 AND THIS IS AN IMPORTANT THING MOVING FORWARD. FINALLY, IT'S,  
6 SORT OF, A REALLY IMPORTANT THING THAT COULD BE PART OF THE  
7 DEVELOPMENT OF THE NEXT PLANNED BAY AREA, BUT WE NEED TO  
8 MONITOR THE INTERSECTION OF THESE NEW CAPITAL EXPENSES,  
9 TRANSIT OPERATING SUSTAINABILITY, AND TRANSIT RIDERSHIP, IS  
10 MAKE SURE WE'RE GETTING THE RIGHT BALANCE THERE. SO,  
11 COMMISSIONER PAPAN, THAT'S THE STAFF REPORT. AGAIN, IT IS --  
12 THERE ARE TWO RESOLUTIONS THAT WE ARE RECOMMENDING YOU REFER  
13 TO THE COMMISSION, AND I'LL HAND IT BACK TO YOU.

14

15 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KENNETH. APPRECIATE THAT.  
16 OKAY. I CAN TELL ALREADY WE'RE GOING TO HAVE A LOT OF  
17 CONVERSATION ON THIS ONE. SO, KIMBERLY IF WE COULD LIMIT THE  
18 PUBLIC COMMENTS, AT LEAST TO ONE MINUTE. BECAUSE I THINK AS  
19 COMMISSIONER COMMENTS COME IN, MORE OF THOSE COMMENTS WILL IN.  
20 OKAY. I SEE COMMISSIONER WORTH'S HAND UP.

21

22 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND I WANT TO THANK YOU,  
23 STAFF, FOR YOUR INCREDIBLE WORK ON THIS. IT'S ALWAYS A  
24 CHALLENGE WHEN WE HAVE MONEY, IT'S A CHALLENGE WHEN WE DON'T  
25 HAVE MONEY, AND SOMETIMES IT'S EVEN HARDER WHEN WE KNOW THERE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 ARE RESOURCES THAT WE CAN TRY TO COMPETE TO COMPLETE ALL THESE  
2 IMPORTANT PROJECTS AND I JUST HAD ONE QUICK QUESTION FOR YOU.  
3 I KNOW THAT, OBVIOUSLY, LINK 21 IS AN IMPORTANT PROJECT FOR  
4 OUR REGION, AND PARTICULARLY, THE EAST BAY, AND I KNOW THAT  
5 LINK 21 WAS INTENDING ON APPLYING FOR \$25 MILLION THROUGH THIS  
6 PROGRAM. AND I JUST WONDERED WHAT YOUR THOUGHT PROCESS WAS IN  
7 TERMS OF THE LINK 21 PROJECT AND WHERE THAT MIGHT FIT, EITHER  
8 NOW OR IN THE FUTURE.

9

10 **KENNETH FOLAN:** THIS IS KENNETH FOLAN AGAIN, COMMISSIONER  
11 WORTH. WITHIN THE TIRCP REGIONAL FRAMEWORK, WE HAVE A POLICY  
12 THAT ANY PROJECT THAT IS CONSISTENT WITH PLANNED BAY AREA THAT  
13 IS NOT NAMED, AS THE PROJECTS ARE NAMED THERE, CAN APPLY FOR  
14 TIRCP FUNDING AND THAT THE REGION AND MTC WOULD ENDORSE THEM  
15 FOR UP TO \$25 MILLION. THAT'S WHERE WE ADDRESS THAT AND I  
16 WOULD NOTE THE PROJECT YOU MENTIONED, THE PROJECT FOR OUR BILL  
17 REGIONAL STRATEGY, ESPECIALLY WHEN THERE ARE FUNDS AVAILABLE  
18 FOR PROJECT DEVELOPMENT THAT'S ONE PROJECT THAT'S IDENTIFIED  
19 AS PART OF THAT AS WELL.

20

21 **AMY R. WORTH:** GREAT. THANK YOU FOR THAT CLARIFICATION. I  
22 APPRECIATE IT KENNETH.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CANEPA? WELCOME.

25





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **DAVID CANEPA:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE CALTRAIN PROJECT AS IT  
2 CONTINUES TO MOVE ALONG, YOU KNOW, IT WILL BE SUCCESSFULLY  
3 COMPLETED IN ABOUT TWO YEARS, AND I SEE THROUGH THE FUNDING WE  
4 HAVE \$300 MILLION IT REALLY DOESN'T GET US THERE. ONE OF THE  
5 THINGS, THIS IS SUCH AN IMPORTANT PROJECT, IT AFFECTS THREE  
6 BAY AREA COUNTIES, AND REALLY FOR US TO LOOK AT THE \$410  
7 MILLION FROM THE TIRCP AUGMENT ONE TO FILL THE ENTIRE FUNDING  
8 GAP WHICH WILL ENSURE THE PROJECT IS COMPLETED BY 2024. AND I  
9 THINK, YOU KNOW, IT'S REASONABLE IF CALTRAIN RECEIVES ANY  
10 FEDERAL FUNDS WHICH IS A POSSIBLE, TIRCP FUNDS COULD BE  
11 RETURNED. NOW THIS PROJECT IS A LOT FARTHER ALONG WITH THE  
12 OTHER PROJECTS, AND I THINK THAT'S WHY THIS PARTICULAR  
13 PROJECT, THE ELECTRIFICATION REALLY RISES TO THE TOP. IN TERMS  
14 OF WHAT CAN BE COMPLETED AND WHAT CAN BE DONE. I JUST URGE  
15 THAT THE ALLOCATION IS \$410 MILLION FROM THE TIRCP AUGMENT  
16 ONE. AND I DO HAVE A QUESTION.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** GO AHEAD WITH YOUR QUESTION.

19

20 **DAVID CANEPA:** MY QUESTION S CAN YOU TALK WITHIN THE  
21 ALLOCATIONS HOW MUCH IS THE CONTINGENCY FUNDING ALIX?

22

23 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SORRY. I WAS GOING TO CORRECT THIS WITH MR.  
24 FOLAN. ARE YOU ASKING FOR CONTINGENCY ACROSS THE PROJECT SO  
25 THAT KENNETH CAN MAYBE SPEAK TO THAT?





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **DAVID CANEPA:** YES. MR. FOLAN, I'M SORRY. I WAS THINKING OF  
3 JOHN FORAN THERE, ALIX.

4

5 **KENNETH FOLAN:** FOR THE MEGA PROJECTS, THERE WOULD BE DEFINED  
6 CONTINGENCIES THAT ARE REQUIRED BY THE FTA, AND IT WOULD  
7 DEPEND WHERE THE PROJECT IS IN THE PROJECT CYCLE, SO THEY  
8 WOULD BE DIFFERENT FOR EACH PROJECT. WE ARE CONTEMPLATING, AS  
9 PART OF THE MAP, IDENTIFYING A GENERAL CONTINGENCY, THAT IS  
10 NOT ASSIGNED TO PROJECTS, AND THAT WAS PART OF THE ENDORSEMENT  
11 TABLE THERE. BUT THAT WOULD NEED TO BE AWARDED BY A FUNDING  
12 AGENCY. JUST TO MAKE SURE, COMMISSIONER BECAUSE YOUR QUESTION  
13 BROUGHT TO MIND FOR ME, THESE ARE MTC'S PROPOSED ENDORSEMENT  
14 STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND CALSTA ARE THE ONES THAT ULTIMATELY  
15 THE ONES WHO DECIDE ON THESE TIRCP FUNDING. WE ARE PROVIDING  
16 THIS ENDORSEMENT AS A ROADMAP ON A PATH FORWARD.

17

18 **DAVID CANEPA:** IN THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING, MR. FOLAN, THANK  
19 YOU FOR BRINGING THAT UP, IT'S IMPORTANT BECAUSE WHEN THE  
20 STATE LOOKS AT MTC, AND THERE IS A RECOMMENDATION THAT IT'S  
21 REALLY LOOKED UPON, BECAUSE WE ARE, SORT OF, THE  
22 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY. SO THERE IS AN EMPHASIS, I THINK YOU  
23 WOULDN'T ARGUE WITH ME, I THINK THERE IS AN EMPHASIS PLACED ON  
24 THIS. BUT YEAH, I'M WELL AWARE, AND THANK YOU, THAT THE STATE  
25 ULTIMATELY MAKES THE DECISION. BUT I THINK, WITHIN THE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 RECOMMENDATION THAT WE MAKE TODAY -- OR BEFORE IT COMES TO THE  
2 FULL BOARD, EXCUSE ME -- THAT I'M IN SUPPORT OF THE ALLOCATION  
3 OF \$410 MILLION FOR THE TIRCP AUGMENT ONE. AND I'M SORRY FOR  
4 CALLING YOU MR. FORAN, MR. FOLAN.

5

6 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU CHAIR COMMISSIONER CANEPA.  
7 VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

8

9 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU FOR BRINGING FORWARD THIS COMPLEX  
10 SET OF ISSUES AND BRINGING THEM BEFORE US, I WANT TO THANK  
11 THERESE AND ALIX AND MR. FOLAN AND EVERYBODY, AND THERESA  
12 ROMMEL, AND JOE P PEDROZA WHO SPENT A LOT OF TIME SPEAKING  
13 WITH SAN FRANCISCO STAKEHOLDERS AND DTX STAKEHOLDERS I  
14 APPRECIATE THAT. AND I ALSO SUPPORT THE, SORT OF -- THE  
15 CALTRAIN ASK ABOUT HOW WE CAN MAKE SURE THAT THAT PROJECT GETS  
16 FULLY FUNDED AND THAT CONSTRUCTION ENDS, THAT'S A CRITICAL  
17 PROJECT FOR THE REGION, AND ALSO INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT FOR SAN  
18 FRANCISCO AND TO MAKE -- AND FOR DTX. I ALSO WANTED TO, SORT  
19 OF, REALLY MAKE A POINT ABOUT HOW, ABOUT DTX, AND HOW IT'S ON  
20 THIS VERY, SORT OF, CRITICAL PATH RIGHT NOW, WHERE THERE'S A  
21 REAL OPPORTUNITY FOR IT TO BE ABLE TO GET ITS FULL FUNDING  
22 GRANT AGREEMENT WITH THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT DURING THE BIDEN  
23 ADMINISTRATION IN 2023, IF WE CAN KIND OF KEEP IT ON TRACK,  
24 AND IF WE CAN GET SUFFICIENT STATE RESOURCES TO MATCH THE  
25 ENORMOUS AMOUNT OF LOCAL RESOURCES THAT SAN FRANCISCO HAS PUT





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 IN, AND HAS COMMITTED BOTH TO THE KIND OF THE DTX EXTENSION,  
2 AS WELL, AS TO THE -- TO THE STATION AT THE TRANSBAY TERMINAL,  
3 AND TO COMPLEMENT THE, SORT OF, ENORMOUS AMOUNT OF REGIONAL  
4 RESOURCES BEING PUT IN BOTH AT THE STATION AND COMMITTED  
5 THROUGH RM3 AND OTHERS TO DTX ITSELF. AND, SO, I WOULD REALLY,  
6 YOU KNOW, THERE ARE CRITICAL PATHWAYS CRITICAL OPPORTUNITIES  
7 THAT WE HAVE HERE ABOUT, SORT OF, REALLY, SORT OF, MAKING A  
8 COMMITMENT OF SUPPORTING DTX IN ASSESSING THE TIRCP FUNDS THAT  
9 ARE NECESSARY THROUGH A COMBINATION OF BASE, ALONG A LONGER  
10 TIME GRANT AGREEMENT, OVER MULTIPLE CYCLES FOR A TIRCP BASE,  
11 AS WELL AS TIRCP AUGMENT ONE, AND AUGMENT TWO, AND, SORT OF,  
12 PUTTING TOGETHER THAT PACKAGE OF ACROSS THE THREE TIRCP  
13 BUCKETS, SUBBUCKETS, IS GOING TO BE REALLY, REALLY IMPORTANT  
14 FOR DTX. AND THAT'S SOMETHING THEY REALLY HOPE THAT WE CAN  
15 KIND OF WORK ON OVER THE NEXT 2, 3 WEEKS, BETWEEN WHEN THIS  
16 GOES -- BETWEEN NOW WHEN IT COMES TO THE FULL COMMISSION SO  
17 THAT -- AND PORTABLY EVEN, SORT OF, HAVE SOME MORE MEETINGS  
18 WITH CALSTA AND OTHERS TO KIND OF REALLY UNDERSTAND HOW DTX  
19 CAN BE KIND OF, TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THOSE THREE BUCKETS MOST  
20 SUCCESSFULLY TO, SORT OF, GET ON TRACK TO MEET THAT TIMELINE  
21 AND BRING THIS PROJECT, THIS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT PROJECT TO  
22 FRUITION. SO, I WAS, YOU KNOW, IT'S A BIT LONG WINDED, BUT I  
23 REALLY HOPE -- I'M SUPPORTIVE OF MOVING THIS MAP FORWARD,  
24 OBVIOUSLY, BUT I REALLY HOPE THAT THE COMMITTEE, AND THEN THE  
25 COMMISSION AND STAFF WILL GIVE DTX THE OPPORTUNITY TO CONTINUE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 WORKING WITH STAFF TO CONTINUE WORKING WITH THE CHAIR TO  
2 CONTINUE WORKING WITH CALSTA TO BUILD-OUT IT'S KIND OF TIRCP,  
3 THE, SORT OF, STRATEGY FOR HOW TO GET, HOW TO ACCESS  
4 SUFFICIENT AMOUNTS OF TIRCP FUNDING, THAT IT CAN GET FULLY --  
5 THAT WE CAN, SORT OF, MEET OUR MILESTONE TO GET THE FULL  
6 FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT BY 2020 -- BY THE END OF 2023. AND IT  
7 WOULD BE GREAT IF SOMEONE COULD JUST PIPE UP THAT THEY HAVE  
8 UNDERSTOOD WHAT I HAVE SAID, THAT THAT MAKES SENSE.

9

10 **THERESA ROMMELL:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER JOSEFOWITZ. THERESA  
11 ROMMEL, PLANNING POLICY AND PROGRAM APPRECIATE THAT REQUEST  
12 AND DIRECTION, AND CERTAINLY WE CAN EXPLORE OPPORTUNITIES TO  
13 WORK WITH CAL WITHIN THE POTENTIAL MULTI-CYCLE COMMITMENT,  
14 WE'LL MAKE SURE TO REACH OUT TO CALSTA AND START THOSE  
15 CONVERSATIONS.

16

17 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. AND I HOPE MY FELLOW COMMISSIONERS  
18 ON THE COMMITTEE AND FULL COMMISSION WILL CERTAINLY GIVE  
19 USUALLY WAY AS WE MAKE PROGRESS IN CONVERSATIONS OVER THE NEXT  
20 THREE WEEKS TO BE ABLE TO INCORPORATE SOME OF THAT INSIGHT,  
21 CHANGES, WHEN THIS COMES TO THE FULL COMMISSION.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR. I SEE  
24 COMMISSIONER MILEY.

25





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES. THANK YOU. I JUST WANT TO WEIGH IN TO MAKE  
2 SURE THAT WE DON'T MINIMIZE ANY OPPORTUNITIES FOR VALLEY LINK.  
3 YOU KNOW, VALLEY LINK HAS OVER \$700 MILLION OF LOCAL SUPPORT.  
4 IT'S MUCH MORE QUALIFIED TO MOVE ALONG TO LEVEL ONE, AND I DO  
5 NOT WANT ANYTHING THAT'S GOING TO IMPEDE THE ABILITY TO  
6 CONTINUE PROGRESS ON VALLEY LINK. YOU KNOW? I DO NOT HAVE TO  
7 TALK ABOUT THE MERITS OF VALLEY LINK, GIVEN WITH COUNTER IN  
8 SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY, CONNECT ACTIVITY EQUITY ASPECTS OF VALLEY  
9 LINK, ET CETERA, ET CETERA, ET CETERA. SO, I JUST WANT TO  
10 CONTINUE TO BE -- OR MAKE SURE STAFF IS MINDFUL OF WORKING  
11 WITH PROJECT SPONSORS TO VALLEY LINK TO CONTINUE TO MOVE THAT  
12 PROJECT ALONG. AND IF THERE ARE OPPORTUNITIES TO MOVE IT INTO  
13 LEVEL ONE, THAT THOSE CONSIDERATIONS ARE BEING MADE, AND THERE  
14 IS NO DIMINUTION AND WORK ON THE PART OF STAFF TO ENSURE THAT  
15 HAPPENS. THANK YOU.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

18

19 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THE  
20 IMPLICATIONS OF NICK'S REQUEST OF STAFF, THERESA, FROM YOUR  
21 PERSPECTIVE? AND I MEAN THAT FOR OTHER PROJECTS. I'M NOT SURE  
22 I UNDERSTOOD EXACTLY THE REQUEST AND THEN THE IMPACTS OF WHAT  
23 THAT MIGHT BE.

24

25 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THIS IS ALIX BOCKELMAN.





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** OKAY THANKS.

3

4 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGHOUT CHAIR. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER  
5 CHAVEZ. AS I UNDERSTOOD THE REQUEST IT WAS REALLY BETTER TO  
6 UNDERSTAND, THROUGH CALSTA, HOW THE DIFFERENT FUNDING CYCLES  
7 CAN WORK TOGETHER. CURRENTLY, AS WE ARE PROPOSING, WE ARE  
8 RECOMMENDING TO SUPPORT BOTH DTX AND VALLEY LINK FOR PROJECT  
9 DEVELOPMENT FUNDS, BUT THEN ALSO FOR FUTURE BASE CYCLE  
10 FUNDING. AND SO I THINK IT'S REALLY A MATTER OF WORKING WITH  
11 CALSTA TO UNDERSTAND, YOU KNOW, IS THERE AN OPPORTUNITY TO  
12 START THINKING ABOUT MULTI-YEAR COMMITMENTS FOR THESE PROJECTS  
13 AS THEY CONTINUE TO WORK TOWARDS BEING READY FOR A FULL  
14 FUNDING GRANT AGREEMENT, AND WHAT MIGHT THAT LOOK LIKE. SO, I  
15 THINK THE REQUEST, AS I UNDERSTOOD -- AND WE CAN CLARIFY  
16 THROUGH VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ, TO HONE IN MORE ON WHAT MIGHT  
17 BE THE OPPORTUNITIES THERE WITH CALSTA. I THINK THIS IS A  
18 LITTLE BIT UNIQUE IN THAT WE HAVE THESE THREE CYCLES OF  
19 FUNDING AND IN THE PAST THEY HAVE PROVIDED MULTI-YEAR  
20 COMMITMENTS INCLUDING BART TO SILICON VALLEY PROJECT, IT'S AN  
21 UNDERSTANDING OF HOW THAT MIGHT WORK WHERE WE HAVE SEVERAL  
22 CYCLES AND DIFFERENT TYPES OF CYCLES OF TIRCP FUNDING SO I  
23 THINK WE'RE COMMITTED TO WORKING TOWARDS THAT TO MAKE SURE  
24 THAT ALL THE PROJECTS CAN CONTINUE TO ADVANCE.

25





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THAT'S VERY HELPFUL. AND THEN COULD  
2 YOU JUST BROADLY RESPOND TO THE CONCERN OF CALTRAIN RELATIVE  
3 TO -- IT SEEMS LIKE THERE IS I DISAGREEMENT -- OR I'M NOT EVEN  
4 SURE IF IT'S AN AGREEMENT ABOUT WHAT MONEY'S AVAILABLE TO  
5 CALTRAIN TO FEDERAL GOVERNMENT ASSISTANCE AND HOW THAT WEIGHED  
6 IN ON YOUR RECOMMENDATION TODAY?

7

8 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** SURE. I CAN START AND CERTAINLY KENNETH AND  
9 THERESA CAN JUMP IN. YOU KNOW, AS WE NOTED, A BIG COMPONENT OF  
10 THE MAP IS REALLY TRYING TO MAKE SURE THAT WE CAN COMPLETE  
11 THOSE PROJECTS THAT ARE IN CONSTRUCTION OR ARE VERY CLOSE TO  
12 CONSTRUCTION. SO, LOOKING JUST AT THOSE PROJECTS, I THINK, YOU  
13 KNOW, AGAIN, WE TRY TO FULLY FUND THE GAPS FOR THOSE PROJECTS,  
14 BUT WE ALSO HAVE TO KIND OF LOOK AT THE AVAILABILITY OF TIRCP,  
15 AND UNFORTUNATELY, OUR BEST SLIDE IN THE DECK WAS, SORT OF, A  
16 -- YOU COULDN'T SEE IT VERY WELL TODAY. IN OUR TIRCP SLIDE,  
17 THERE WAS A GLITCH IN THAT, BUT ANYWAY, WE HAVE TO KIND OF  
18 LIVE WITHIN THE CONSTRAINTS OF THE TIRCP PROGRAM TO TRY TO  
19 FILL THE GAPS FOR THESE PROJECTS. SO JUST AS AN EXAMPLE, I  
20 THINK IF YOU LOOK AT THE GAPS THAT EXIST FOR CALTRAIN  
21 ELECTRIFICATION, THAT EXIST FOR THE BART TO SILICON VALLEY  
22 PHASE TWO PROJECTS, AS WELL AS THE BART CORE CAPACITY  
23 PROJECTS, ALL OF WHICH ARE IN CONSTRUCTION, OR, YOU KNOW, HAVE  
24 -- ARE IMMINENTLY TOWARDS CONSTRUCTION, THE REQUESTS FOR ALL  
25 OF THOSE PROJECTS, I THINK, IN TERMS OF WHAT THEY WOULD ALL





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 LIKE TO SEE IMMEDIATELY, WOULD BE ABOUT 1.7 -- OVER 1.7  
2 BILLION AND THE AMOUNT AVAILABLE FOR OUTSIDE OF SOUTHERN  
3 CALIFORNIA FOR TIRCP, IN THIS NEXT CYCLE, THE TOTAL AMOUNT IS  
4 1.5 BILLION BUT ONLINE 1.2 BILLION IS UP TO A MAXIMUM OF 1.2  
5 BILLION FOR PROJECTS, WHAT THEY'RE CALLING EXISTING PROJECTS,  
6 PROJECTS THAT HAVE ALREADY RECEIVED TIRCP FUNDS WHICH RELATES  
7 TO ALL THREE OF THOSE PROJECTS. SO, AGAIN, WE WERE TRYING TO  
8 LOOK AT A FUNDING PACKAGE THAT COULD HELP ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF  
9 ALL OF THOSE PROJECTS, AND WE ALSO NOTED THAT FOR THE  
10 ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT, THEY WERE ALSO LOOKING FOR SOME STATE  
11 AND FEDERAL -- SORRY -- SOME FEDERAL MONEY IN TWO DIFFERENT  
12 CATEGORIES, ONE TRYING TO GET THROUGH THE APPROPRIATIONS  
13 PROCESS, WHICH IS ONE ARE IN ONE OF THE BILLS, AND ALSO THE  
14 FEDERAL STATE PARTNERSHIP AND ALSO NOT TO GO INTO A LOT OF  
15 DETAIL FOR CALIFORNIA ELECTRIFICATION, BUT THE BOARD HAS TAKEN  
16 ACTIONS TO COMMIT TO LOCAL MONEYS ALREADY AND OBVIOUSLY IF  
17 THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO GET FEDERAL AND TATE MONEY INSTEAD OF  
18 THAT WE WOULD CERTAINLY SUPPORT THAT. WE'RE TRYING TO NAVIGATE  
19 THE FACT THAT THE DEMAND FOR THE TIRCP CYCLE IS MUCH LARGER  
20 THAN THE AMOUNT OF THE BAY AREA CAN GET AND SO THAT'S, SORT  
21 OF, REFLECTED IN WHAT'S BEFORE YOU. AND IF I MISSED ANYTHING,  
22 THERESA OR KENNETH CAN JUMP IN.

23

24 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** NO JUMPING. SO IT LOOKS LIKE ALIX, THEY THOUGHT  
25 YOU DID A GOOD JOB. JUST TO MAKE SURE, AGAIN, TO MAKE SURE I





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 UNDERSTAND THIS, THE -- AS YOU ALL ARE LOOKING AT THE INDICES  
2 FOR WHAT YOU MOVE FORWARD, I GUESS WHAT IS STILL A LITTLE  
3 PERPLEXING TO ME IS THE RECOGNIZING THE, TO YOUR POINT, THERE  
4 IS ALWAYS MORE OF A REQUEST THAN MONEYS AVAILABLE. SO I  
5 ABSOLUTELY UNDERSTAND THAT, AND ALIX, I'M WONDERING, THE  
6 IMPLICATION OF CALTRAIN IN PARTICULAR NOT GETTING FEDERAL  
7 FUNDING THAT IT'S LOOKING FOR ON OTHER PROJECTS. I'M WONDERING  
8 IN TERMS OF HOW YOU ASSESS THAT, AND WHAT IMPLICATIONS AGAIN  
9 IF WE'RE LOCKED IN AND STUCK BECAUSE THERE IS NOWHERE TO GO.  
10 WE CAN'T DO A BAKE SALE FOR IT, I GUESS IS THE POINT.

11

12 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

13

14 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** YES, PLEASE.

15

16 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THAT'S A GOOD POINT. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE  
17 TALK ABOUT IN THIS ITEM IS THE NEED TO DEFINITELY UPDATE OUR  
18 FUNDING TABLE, AS WE GET NEW INFORMATIONS ON THE TIRCP  
19 AUGMENTATION ONE, AS WELL AS OTHER FEDERAL OPPORTUNITIES. SO,  
20 THERE CERTAINLY ARE OPPORTUNITIES, YOU KNOW, AS WE LEARN MORE,  
21 TO MAKE ADJUSTMENTS. THAT SAID, I THINK ALL OF THE PROJECTS,  
22 INCLUDING CALTRAIN, YOU KNOW, IF THEY'RE NOT ABLE TO FULLY  
23 FUND THEIR CAPITAL GAP WITH, YOU KNOW, SORT OF, FOUND FEDERAL  
24 STATE MONEY, THEN THAT COULD HAVE SOME REPERCUSSIONS ON, YOU  
25 KNOW, THEIR OPERATING BUDGETS OR OTHER CAPITAL PROJECTS. AND





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 AGAIN, I THINK WHAT WE HAVE HEARD FROM THE SPONSORS IS THAT  
2 KIND OF APPLIES FOR THE THREE PROJECTS THAT ARE MAJOR PROJECTS  
3 THAT ARE LEVEL ONE, CALTRAIN, BART, AND EVEN, I THINK, I HAVE  
4 HEARD TO SOME EXTENT, VTA. SO I THINK WE HAVE HEARD THAT ARE  
5 FROM ALL THE SPONSORS, SO WE'RE TRYING TO, YOU KNOW, WORK  
6 WITHIN THE CHALLENGE THAT ALL OF THEM ARE FACING.

7

8 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'LL LOOK FORWARD TO LISTENING TO THE  
9 PUBLIC. THANK YOU.

10

11 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** NOT SEEING ANY MORE COMMISSIONER  
12 COMMENTS. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SUGGEST THAT WE ADJUST OUR  
13 RECOMMENDATIONS AND ENDORSE THE REQUEST FROM CALTRAIN, UP TO  
14 410 MILLION, BECAUSE IT IS JUST SO CLOSE TO COMPLETION. IT  
15 WOULD BE SO IMPACTFUL TO THREE DIFFERENT JURISDICTIONS HERE.  
16 IT WOULD ACTUALLY ENABLE THE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION, HELP ENABLE  
17 THE DIRIDON PROJECT. I THINK THIS IS SO IMPORTANT, FROM THE  
18 STATE'S PERSPECTIVE, AS WELL. BECAUSE IT WOULD -- IT FITS INTO  
19 THE REDUCTION OF GREENHOUSE GASSES, REDUCING NOISE. IT FITS IN  
20 SO MANY DIFFERENT PLACES. AND WE ARE SO FAR ALONG IN THIS  
21 PROJECT, THE READINESS. AND I THINK WHAT WAS SPELLED OUT, TOO,  
22 IS THERE IS SUCH A REDUCED RISK HERE. BECAUSE THEY'RE NO  
23 LONGER DOING THE UNDER GROUND. THEY ARE WORKING ABOVE GROUND.  
24 THE REALITY IN JUST CLOSING THIS GAP, GETTING THIS MONEY TO  
25 CALTRAIN AT THIS POINT IN TIME WILL OPEN THE DOOR FOR OTHER





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 PROJECTS IN THE FUTURE. AS I UNDERSTAND IT, IT WOULD REDUCE  
2 THE DEBT SERVICE THAT CALTRAIN WOULD HAVE, IT WOULD LET THINGS  
3 MOVE FORWARD MORE QUICKLY OPENS THE DOOR FOR SAFETY, CREATION  
4 OF JOBS, EQUITY BENEFITS. I KNOW WE'RE OVERPRESCRIBED. BUT TO  
5 BE SO CLOSE IN THIS PROJECT, AT THIS POINT IN TIME, AND NOT  
6 TRYING TO GET IT TO COMPLETION, WE RARELY HAVE THIS  
7 OPPORTUNITY. SO, WITH THE COMMITTEE'S UNDERSTANDING HERE, I  
8 HOPE THAT WE CAN RECOMMEND THIS SLIGHT MODERATION SO WE CAN  
9 CLOSE THE FUNDING GAP MOVE AHEAD IN SUCH A WAY -- AND I SEE  
10 OUR CHAIRPERSON PEDROZA IS HERE

11

12 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN FOR CHAIRING THE  
13 COMMITTEE MEETING. I SEE THE REALITY COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND  
14 STAFF HAS DONE A TREMENDOUS JOB OF TRYING TO FIGURE OUT WHAT'S  
15 IN THE FINANCIAL ENVELOPE, HOW TO ACHIEVE EQUITY, AND MAKING  
16 SURE WE'RE THE MOST COMPETITIVE IN THE REGION. TO ME IT'S  
17 SIMPLE MATH. I WANT TO ASK THERESA OR ALIX, REMIND US, WE  
18 DON'T HAVE MONEY TO BE ABLE TO MOVE IT FROM ONE TO ANOTHER, IT  
19 WOULD BE COMING FROM ANOTHER PROJECT. SO THAT'S ONE THING I  
20 WANT TO CLARIFY. SECOND PART, I KNOW COMMISSIONER PAPAN OUR  
21 STAFF HAS BEEN REACHING OUT TO MICHELLE, AND HAVING  
22 CONVERSATIONS, SO CAN YOU JUST SHARE, THERESE, OR ALIX, A  
23 LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT THAT. I DON'T WANT TO WALK BACK OUR  
24 COMMITMENTS TO THESE PROJECTS. WE ARE ALL EAGER TO GET THESE  
25 PROJECTS GOING. I HAVE NEVER HEARD A COMMITMENT TO WALK THAT





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 BACK. BUT I WANT TO BE CANDID IN TERMS OF WHAT WE CAN AFFORD  
2 TODAY AND DETERMINE WHAT THOSE REGIONAL INVESTMENTS ARE, THAT  
3 ARE REALISTIC. LETS KICK IT OVER TO THERESE OR ALIX?

4

5 **SPEAKER:** SURE. I THINK THERESA HIT THE POINTS ON THE BASIC  
6 MATH. AND CHAIR, YOUR COMMENTS OR QUESTION MAY BE FULLY  
7 GROUNDED AFTER WE HEAR OUT FROM THE PUBLIC IN TERMS OF WHAT'S  
8 COMING OUT. BUT, AGAIN, TWO THINGS. FIRST OF ALL, THE -- WITH  
9 RESPECT TO TIRCP, THERE ARE STASHED NORTHERN CALIFORNIA  
10 LIMITS. AND WHAT ALIX ILLUSTRATED, JUST TO REFRESH AGAIN, THE  
11 THREE MAJOR PROJECTS THAT ARE POSITIONING, AGAIN, FOR THIS  
12 AUGMENT ONE, IF EVERYONE -- THEY ALL HAVE A CASE TO MAKE,  
13 EVERY SINGLE ONE HAS THIS, IN SOME WAYS, THE SAME CASE TO  
14 MAKE, THAT IF THEY GOT ALL THEIR MONEY FROM AUGMENT ONE,  
15 THEY'RE GOOD, AND THEY CLEAR THE DECK. THAT WOULD TOTAL 1.76  
16 BILLION, WHICH EXCEEDS THE ENTIRE NORTHERN CALIFORNIA MAP LET  
17 ALONE THE LIMIT ON ACTUAL SPACE THEY'RE COMPETING IN WHICH IS  
18 THIS QUOTE EXISTING PROGRAM. WHICH SHOULD THE STATE MAXIMIZE  
19 THAT, TO POUND, THAT'S THE CAP, WE'RE ALREADY FLIRTING WITH  
20 ASKING FOR MORE THAN THE ENTIRE PART OF OUR REGION, WHICH,  
21 SORT OF, PUTS US IN THIS AWKWARD POSITION IN WHAT ARE WE  
22 ADVISING THE STATE TO DO IN ARE WE BRINGING FORTH MORE THAN  
23 THEY CAN FUND? WELL THAT STARTS PUTTING FINAL DECISIONS IN  
24 THEIR LAPSE AS OPPOSED TO OURS. THE OTHER IMPORTANT THING TO  
25 REMEMBER IS THAT WHILE CALTRAIN DID MAKE THE CASE THAT, SURE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 MONEY IS ALWAYS BETTER THAN MONEY COMING DOWN THE PIKE THAT'S  
2 THE SAME FOR EVERYBODY ELSE LOOKING AT ALL THOSE  
3 CIRCUMSTANCES, WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO WITH SCALE TO OUR  
4 PARTICULAR ASK CLEAR TO THE MATHEMATICAL LIMES AND WITH THE  
5 SHARED RISK THAT EACH ONE OF OUR THREE MAJOR PROJECTS ARE  
6 FACING. IF YOU MAKE ADJUSTMENTS, AS A COMMISSION, YOU JUST  
7 HAVE TO UNDERSTAND THAT THOSE ARE SOME TIGHT BOUNDARIES, AND  
8 THAT WE ENDS UP POTENTIALLY, WHAT IS THE TERM YOU DON'T LIKE  
9 TO USE IT? GORING SOMEONE ELSE'S OX, I THINK IS AN OLD-TIME  
10 TERM, OF SOMETHING WHO GIVES UP SOMETHING TO CREATE CAPACITY  
11 FOR MEMBER ELSE. THAT WOULD BE THE CHALLENGE THAT WOULD BE  
12 SHIFTING TO STAFF, TO ADDRESS, AGAIN, DEPENDING ON THE  
13 SUMMATION OF THE ASK AND MODIFICATIONS THAT WE MAY BE HEARING  
14 TODAY, THAT WOULD BE THE POSITION WE WOULD BE IN. SO JUST TO  
15 KIND OF ADDRESS THAT.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** CAN I ASK A QUESTION IN THAT REALM,  
18 PLEASE, MR. CHAIR?

19

20 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** GO AHEAD.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** MY APOLOGIES FOR NOT THANKING STAFF FOR  
23 ALL THE HARD WORK THEY HAVE DONE I REALLY APPRECIATE IT  
24 BECAUSE IT'S SO DIFFICULT. AS I UNDERSTAND IT CALTRAIN HAS A  
25 LOWER PROBABILITY OF GETTING THAT, BUT THEY ARE CLEARLY





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 STATING THAT IF THEY DID GET ANY OF THAT, THEY WOULD RETURN  
2 WHATEVER EXCESS THEY'RE ASKING FOR HERE, IS ANYONE ELSE  
3 PROPOSING THAT AS WELL? OR HOW DOES THAT PLAY OUT? I KNOW,  
4 CRYSTAL BALL, NOBODY HAS GOT IT HERE. BUT IN KIND OF BALANCING  
5 OUT WITHOUT FULLY GORING SOMEBODY, HOPEFULLY EVERYBODY GETS  
6 ALL THE MONEY THAT I WANT. [LAUGHTER] BUT WITH THAT KIND OF  
7 PROMISE THERE, ARE WE GETTING THAT ANYWHERE ELSE? BECAUSE WE  
8 WOULD LIKE TO SPREAD ALL THE MONEY AROUND WHEREVER WE COULD.  
9 SO, JUST A QUESTION.

10

11 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WELL, I THINK THAT'S, AGAIN, SOMETHING WE  
12 WOULD WANT -- AND ALIX AND MY TEAM CAN JUMP IN, IF THEY HAVE  
13 HEARD SOMETHING DIFFERENT -- HOW ABOUT WE OTHER THAN TO THAT  
14 AFTER PUBLIC COMMENT SO WE CAN HEAR IF THERE IS SOMETHING ELSE  
15 THAT MAY BE BROUGHT BEFORE THE COMMISSION TODAY. I KNOW THERE  
16 IS STACKING OF FOLKS IN THE QUEUE. SO, PERHAPS LOOP BACK TO  
17 THAT.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** NO PROBLEM. COMMISSIONER CANEPA, I HAD  
20 ANOTHER QUESTION FOR STAFF HERE REAL QUICK. ON THE BART CORE  
21 CAPACITY -- HAS ANYONE CLEARLY ASKED -- BECAUSE YOU KNOW I'M  
22 GOING TO ASK -- THE STORAGE AREA, OR THE YARD THAT THEY'RE  
23 DEVELOPING, WILL THAT -- CAPACITY FOR THAT, INCLUDE ALL OF THE  
24 NEW CARS AND THE OLD CARS MOVING FORWARD HERE? BECAUSE MANY  
25 OTHER JURISDICTIONS, THAT IS OF CONCERN -- AND IF YOU DON'T





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 KNOW IT AT THIS POINT IN TIME, THAT'S PERFECTLY FINE BUT THAT  
2 SAY CONCERN FOR SOME OF US THAT THE CORE PROJECT IS BIG  
3 ENOUGH, OUT THERE DOING THIS PROJECT, THAT WE CAN BE ASSURED  
4 THAT OLD CARS WON'T BE PARKED IN OUR AREAS, IF YOU KNOW?

5

6 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** ONE OF THE THINGS -- WELL, WE COULD GET  
7 SPECIFICS ON TIMING. BUT WE HAVE SPECIFICALLY ASKED WHETHER  
8 THERE IS A PROGRAM FOR GETTING RID OF THE OLD CARS, AND THERE  
9 IS. THERE IS A PROCESS AND PROCEDURE FOR CONSIDERING THAT. SO,  
10 NOW, THE TIMING OF ALL OF THAT, OF COURSE, HAS TO BE PHASED.  
11 THE NEW ONES COME N THE OLD ONES, BLAH, BLAH, BLAH, BUT THAT'S  
12 SOMETHING THEY'RE WORKING INTO THEIR DESIGN AND TIMING AS I  
13 UNDERSTAND.

14

15 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** WE DID GET A BRIEFING FROM BART STAFF THEY  
16 TOUCHED ON TWO POINTS DISPOSITION AND CLARIFIED THAT WITH  
17 THESE PLANS THEY HAVE ENOUGH CAPACITY FOR STORAGE FOR THE  
18 EXISTING CARS AND AS WELL THE NEW CARS THAT THEY PLAN THROUGH  
19 THE CORE CAPACITY PROGRAM. SO.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** FANTASTIC. THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER  
22 CANEPA, DID YOU HAVE SOMETHING REAL QUICK?

23

24 **DAVID CANEPA:** JUST REAL QUICK, ONCE WE GET BACK FROM PUBLIC  
25 COMMENT, THERESE AND STAFF, I REALLY WANT TO, SORT OF,





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 UNDERSTAND AND GET AN EXPLANATION RELATIVE TO THE CONTINGENCY  
2 FUNDING. AND HOW THAT MONEY, YOU KNOW, DOES IT STAY THERE? OR  
3 IS THAT ANOTHER SOURCE TO, SORT OF, HELP BACKFILL SOME OF  
4 THESE PROJECTS? AND, SO, I KNOW WE HAVE SPEAKERS HERE, BUT  
5 WHEN WE GET BACK, I WOULD LOVE TO HEAR THE ANSWER ON THAT.

6

7 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. WE'LL GET CLARIFICATION FROM  
8 THERE. KIMBERLY, CAN WE ROLL INTO PUBLIC COMMENT, PLEASE?

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OF COURSE. YOU GOT IT. FIRST NOTE WE DID  
11 RECEIVE FOUR LETTERS OF CORRESPONDENCE FIRST FROM INNOVATION  
12 TRI-VALLEY LEADERSHIP GROUP SIGNED BY TIM SBRANTI, NEXT WAS  
13 FROM REM TAN, AND THIRD FROM SPURS AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA AND  
14 LAURA T SIGNED OFF BY ADINA LEVIN, AND LAST FROM TRI-VALLEY  
15 SAN JOAQUIN VALLEY REGIONAL RAIL AUTHORITY SIGNED BY KEVIN  
16 SHERIDAN. THE FIRST SPEAKER WITH LAST FOUR DIGITS 1533 PLEASE  
17 GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE. CALLER  
18 WITH LAST FOUR DIGITS OF 1533. IF YOU ARE THERE, WE CAN'T HEAR  
19 YOU. OKAY. MAYBE WE'LL GO AHEAD AND JUMP TO THE NEXT SPEAKER.  
20 JASON BAKER, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. JASON BAKER THANK YOU FOR ALL THE HARD  
23 WORK ON THIS REPORT. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE SEND THE RIGHT  
24 MESSAGE OF UNITY AND THAT WE HAVE OUR HOUSE IN ORDER AND THAT  
25 WE CAN BE COUNTED ON TO FOLLOW-THROUGH PROJECTS, WE NEED TO





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 SEND THAT MESSAGE TO THE STATE AND VOTERS. SUPPORTING THE  
2 PROJECT LIKE BART TO SILICON VALLEY, MEASURES PASSING WITH TWO  
3 THIRDS VOTER SUPPORT. UNDER THE CURRENT SPENDING PLAN FOR BART  
4 PHASE TWO IS LOCAL SALES TAX, SUPPORTING CALTRAIN AND FEW  
5 THINGS WILL SUPPORT MORE THAN SEEING BIG POSITIVE CHANGES IN  
6 WAKE OF INVESTMENT WE'RE GOING TO NEED VOTER TRUST AGAIN. WE  
7 NEED TO SEND THE RIGHT MESSAGE TO COMPANIES AND DEVELOPERS WHO  
8 ALREADY INVESTED AND THE NEXT GROUP OF COMPANIES AND BUILDERS  
9 WHO WILL INVEST IN BIG PROJECTS WHEN LEADERS DON'T WAIVER WHEN  
10 THINGS GET HARD WE CAN DO BIG HARD THINGS IF WE KEEP MOVING  
11 FORWARD TOGETHER. THANK YOU.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS PRIYAMATHER.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. I'M THE DETECTOR OF FUNDING STRATEGY AT  
16 BART. THANK YOU FOR HEARING THIS ITEM. WE APPRECIATE THE  
17 SENSITIVE BALANCING ACT BETWEEN REGIONAL PARTIES AND MTC IS  
18 SEEKING TO ACHIEVE WE EXPRESS THE COMMISSION INCREASE THEIR  
19 FUNDING CORE CAPACITY AND AUGMENT THE PROGRAM, THIS PROJECT IS  
20 ALREADY UNDERWAY AND APPROXIMATELY ENSURE THIS KEY BACKBONE OF  
21 THE REGION OF THE REGIONAL TRANSIT NETWORK IS ABLE TO MEET  
22 FUTURE DEMAND OVER DECADES TO COME AND PREPARE THE REGION AND  
23 THE ECONOMY OVER THE NEXT SEVERAL DECADES. I ALSO JUST WANT TO  
24 NOTE THAT THIS PROJECT HAS EXPERIENCED SIGNIFICANT COST  
25 INCREASES DUE TO SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES, AS WELL AS ESCALATION OF





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 MATERIALS AND OTHER COSTS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR  
2 ATTENTION.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS PETER  
5 STRAUSS. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. THIS IS PETER STRAUSS. I'M  
8 PART OF THE FRIENDS OF VTX, AND ALSO ON THE BOARD OF SAN  
9 FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS. AS SEVERAL COMMISSIONERS HAVE  
10 ALREADY SPOKEN, I STRONGLY URGE YOU TO -- ALTHOUGH I DO NOT  
11 HAVE THE ANSWER -- BUT I URGE YOU TO FIND A WAY TO FINESSE THE  
12 NUMBERS TO ADVANCE DTX, IN THE TIRCP FRAMEWORK FUNDING, AND,  
13 ALSO, TO ELEVATE THE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION IN THE MAP PRIORITIES  
14 TO LEVEL ONE AS TJPA HAS REQUESTED. DTX IS THE COMPONENT OF  
15 THE TRANSBAY TRANSIT PROGRAM THESE ARE ALL INTEGRATED PIECES  
16 AT THE STATION BOX WHICH WAS CONSTRUCTED AS PART OF THE  
17 CENTER. THE TRANSBAY PROGRAM IS VIEWED AS A WHOLE, THEN TOTAL  
18 COST OF 9.7 BILLION, FAVOR.1 BILLION HAS BEEN RAISED,  
19 COMMITTED, AND EXTENDED OVER 50%. WE WANT MTC TO BE A PARTNER  
20 NOT AN IMPEDIMENT AND WE URGE YOU TO DO WHAT YOU CAN TO  
21 ADVANCE THE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION FUNDING COMMITMENT AND  
22 PRIORITIES. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER ENDING IN 1533.  
25 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **SPEAKER:** THIS IS JANICE LEE, BART BOARD VICE PRESIDENT ELECTED  
3 TO SERVE, THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK IN DEVELOPING THE POLICY.  
4 THESE PRESENTATIONS AND ALL THE PUBLIC SPEAKER TODAY GIVE ME  
5 HOPE CLEARLY WE DON'T HAVE ENOUGH FUNDING BUT WE NEED TO FUND  
6 PUBLIC TRANSIT, FIGURE OUT IMPACTS AND CONTINUE TO KEEP THE  
7 REGION MOVING. I CARE ABOUT PUTTING RIDER TRANSIT FIRST. BART  
8 CORE CAPACITY PROGRAM WILL DO JUST THAT THE PROGRAM PROJECT  
9 ALREADY UNDERWAY WILL PREPARE THE REGION FOR THE NEXT 50  
10 YEARS. WE KNOW IF BART CAN'T KEEP PACE AND BEGINNING FALLING  
11 APART, RESULTS QUICKLY AFFECTING THE REGION AND TRANSIT  
12 OPERATORS. INCREASING OVERCROWDING. PLEASE CONSIDER INCREASING  
13 THE AMOUNT FOR BART TIRCP ONE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME TODAY.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, MS. LEE. THERE IS A GLITCH  
16 WITH MY TIMER, IT'S NOT SOUNDING. SO WHEN YOUR TIME IS UP I'LL  
17 CUT YOU OFF WHEN YOU HAVE REACHED YOUR MINUTES. NEXT SPEAKER  
18 IS DENISE.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** DENISE BLAIR SENIOR DIRECTOR OF GOVERNMENT RELATIONS  
21 HEALTH CARE TRI-VALLEY CALLING TO SUPPORT THE PRIORITIZATION  
22 OF THE VALLEY LINK RAIL PROJECT AND MTC'S MAJOR ADVANCEMENT  
23 POLICY. WE APPLAUD EFFORTS TO ESTABLISH A PRINCIPLE POLICY BY  
24 WHICH TO PRIORITIZE THE POLICY OF MAJOR CAPITAL PROJECTS IN  
25 THE BAY AREA. VALLEY LINK IS VITAL COST EFFECTIVE PASSENGER





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 RAIL SYSTEM THAT WILL PROVIDE EQUITABLE NEAR-TERM ACCESS TO  
2 MORE THAN 100,000 BAY AREA WORKERS WHO COMMUTE DAILY TO THE  
3 ALTAMONT WORKING IN JOBS OF CONSTRUCTION, MANUFACTURERS HEALTH  
4 CARE SOCIAL DISTANCE REPORT WORK WILL NEVER BE AN OPTION TO,  
5 WE ENCOURAGE TO YOU SUPPORT THE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION UNDER  
6 TRANSFORMATIONAL PROJECT DELIVERY.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS VINCENT JAMES.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU FOR YOUR EFFORTS I'M WITH THE NORTHERN  
11 CALIFORNIA DISTRICT COUNCIL LABOR CALLING ON BEHALF OF  
12 LABORERS, FOR ALAMEDA COUNTY WE'RE SUPPORTING STAFF  
13 RECOMMENDATION IN CONNECTION WITH VALLEY LINK AND WANT YOU TO  
14 BE COGNIZANT OF THE FACT THAT MANY WORKERS ARE UNION MEMBERS  
15 WHO ARE CHECK TO CHECK WHO STRUGGLE COMMUTING EACH AND EVERY  
16 DAY WE WANT TO ADVOCATE FOR THE 22,000 JOBS AND THE \$3.5  
17 BILLION THAT THE VALLEY LINK IS REALLY GOING TO RESULT IN  
18 PRIORITIZE, NOT JUST WHAT'S GOING ON IN SAN FRANCISCO BUT ALSO  
19 WHEN'S GOING ON IN THE OUTER AREAS AND IN THE REGION IN  
20 GENERAL. SO THANK YOU FOR HEARING ME TODAY.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS NATE  
23 LABLANC.

24





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** MY NAME IS NATE, BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT MANAGER AT THE  
2 SAN JOSE DOWNTOWN, SJPA WORKERS ASSOCIATION APPRECIATE THE  
3 WORK WITH MTC AND BART AND DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE WE LOOK FORWARD  
4 TO IMPROVEMENTS AND GETTING UNDER CONSTRUCTION. STATE AND  
5 FEDERAL FUNDING IS CRITICAL TO MOVING THIS PROCESS FORWARD OUR  
6 COMMUNITY HAS LOOKED FOR TO THIS FOR MORE THAN 20 YEARS AND  
7 TAXED THEMSELVES AS THE SPEAKER MENTIONED IF WE WORK TOGETHER  
8 WE CAN MAKE THIS A REALITY FOR OUR RESIDENTS, AND OUR  
9 BUSINESSES, THANK YOU.

10

11 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS LAST FOUR DIGITS 0138.  
12 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. CALLER 0138. YOU NEED TO UNMUTE ON  
13 YOUR END. WE HAVE UNMUTED YOU ON THIS ENDS.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS BRUISE. I AM  
16 THE FORMER CHAIR OF THE TJCAC BOARD MEMBER SPEAKING ON BEHALF  
17 OF THE BOARD OF THE SOUTH BEACH NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION I  
18 WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THE WORK THEY HAVE DONE IN THIS  
19 PRESENTATION. DTX SHOULD HAD BEEN CLASSIFIED AS I LEVEL ONE  
20 PROJECT AND MTC SHOULD FRONT LOAD THE TIRCP FUNDING  
21 ENDORSEMENTS TO INCLUDE DTX TO ENSURE OPPORTUNITIES TO SECURE  
22 FEDERAL FUNDING. IT WAS ENVISIONED TO BE A MULTI-MODAL  
23 STATION, BRINGING PASSENGERS TO THE URBAN CORE. FEEDBACK HAS  
24 BEEN PROVIDED MANY TIMES TO THE HIGH SPEED RAIL TEAM CALTRAIN  
25 AND MANY OTHER VENUES THAT THE CURRENT DESIGN AT FOURTH AND





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 SOUTHEAST STATION RIGHT IN THE HEART OF NEIGHBORHOODS WASN'T  
2 READY FOR PREPANDEMIC SERVICE LEVELS AND PASSENGER VOLUMES OF  
3 CALTRAIN AND SERVICE RECOVERY, BURSTING AT THE SEEMS AND NOT  
4 BEING ABLE TO HANDLE ANTICIPATED VOLUMES OF PASSENGER,  
5 PEDESTRIAN, AND BIKES, AND SO ON. PLEASE CONSIDER DTX AS A  
6 LEVEL ONE PROJECT. THANK YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS MELISSA  
9 HERNANDEZ. MS. HERNANDEZ, ARE YOU THERE?

10

11 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. THANK YOU. AND GOOD MORNING VICE CHAIR  
12 PAPAN AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSIONS. MY NAME IS MELISSA  
13 HERNANDEZ AND AS VICE CHAIR OF THE TRI-VALLEY SAN JOAQUIN  
14 VALLEY REGIONAL RAIL 30 AND MAYOR OF THE CITY OF DUBLIN I'M  
15 CALLING TO SUPPORT THE PRIORITIZATION OF THE VALLEY LINK  
16 PROJECT AND THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION  
17 ADVANCEMENT POLICY. VALLEY LINK IS READY, VALLEY LINK IS COST  
18 EFFECTIVE AND VALLEY LINK MEETS MTC'S LEVEL TWO ELIGIBILITY  
19 AND COMPETITIVE FOR STATE FEDERAL FUNDS. SO WE URGE TO YOU  
20 PLACE SUPPORT TO STAFF RECOMMENDATION, AND ALSO, WE WANT TO  
21 THANK ALL COMMISSIONERS TODAY FOR THEIR TIME AND FOR THEIR  
22 WORK THIS AFTERNOON. THANK YOU.

23

24 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS CHARLIE  
25 LAVERY. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **SPEAKER:** CHARLIE LAVERY WITH OPERATORS ENGINEER UNION I WANT  
3 TO RECOGNIZE THE SERVICE OF THE COMMISSION. I WANT TO SPEAK IN  
4 SUPPORT OF ELEVATING THE PRIORITY AT DTX LEVEL ONE SO WE CAN  
5 LEVERAGE MATCHING STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING. FROM A LABOR  
6 PERSPECTIVE, THIS IS THE TYPE OF PROJECT THAT WE'RE SO PROUD  
7 TO BE PART OF, CREATING A WORLD CLASS LONG AWAITED HIGH SPEED  
8 RAIL CONNECTION THAT MITIGATES CLIMATE CHANGE AND FROM A JOBS  
9 POINT OF VIEW, THERE IS A POSSIBILITY OF A RECESSION LOOMING.  
10 THIS TYPE OF PROJECT IS RECESSION PROOF. THE TRANSIT CENTER  
11 PROVIDED OVER 20,000 JOBS. WE'RE LOOKING AT ANOTHER 20,000  
12 JOBS WITH THE DTX AND THE ALIGNMENT SO REALLY URGING THE  
13 COMMISSION TO ELEVATE THIS PRIORITY OF THE DTX. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JOHN  
16 ARRANTES. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

17

18 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSION CHAIRS, AND MEMBERS. JOHN,  
19 CHAPTER PRESIDENT OF SEIU1021 HERE TO SPEAK IN SUPPORT OF  
20 BETTER'S CORE CAPACITY PROGRAMS. FACILITATING THE REGION'S  
21 FUTURE ECONOMIC RECOVERY THESE PROJECTS WELL UNDERWAY WOULD  
22 INCREASE TRAIN FREQUENCY AND RELIABLE BY INVESTING IN THE  
23 STATE OF ART TRAIN CONTROL SYSTEM AND EXPANDING ITS FLEET FOR  
24 ADDITIONAL NEW RAIL CARS AND PROVIDING SAFE RELIABLE  
25 SUSTAINABLE SUPPORT. BART NEEDS ADDITIONAL ANY ADDITIONAL





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 FUNDING IN ORDER TO ADVANCE THE PROJECTS, IN ADDITION TO  
2 INCREASING THE TIRCP AUGMENT ONE TO AVOID DELAYS AND  
3 ADDITIONAL FUTURE COST. WITHOUT RESPONSE FALLING SHORT AND  
4 IMPACTING TRANSIT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR HARD WORK.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN.

7

8 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. ADINA LEVIN WITH  
9 FRIEND OF CALTRAIN AND FRIENDS OF DTX WANTING TO SPEAK FAVOR  
10 OF INCLUDING IN THIS ALLOCATION THE FUNDING TO COMPLETE  
11 CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION. IT WAS MENTIONED ABOUT THE  
12 CONNECTION BETWEEN CAPITAL FUNDING, THE NEXT ITEM ON THE  
13 AGENDA, IF CALTRAIN DOES NOT GET THE CAPITAL FUNDING HERE IT  
14 WILL NEED TO BORROW THAT WILL DIG THE OPERATING HOLE MORE DEEP  
15 AND THAT WILL PUT MORE BURDEN ON WHAT THIS COMMITTEE IS GOING  
16 TO TALK ABOUT IN THE NEXT AGENDA ITEM AND ALSO I'M SUPPORTING  
17 THE COMMITMENT TO DTX TO ENABLE IT TO QUALIFY FOR FEDERAL  
18 FUNDING. THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS VERONICA  
21 VARGAS. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

22

23 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS MY NAME IS VERONICA  
24 VARGAS. AS THE CHAIR OF THE TRI-VALLEY, REGIONAL RAIL  
25 AUTHORITY I'M CALLING TO SUPPORT THE PRIORITIZATION OF THE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 VALLEY LINK RAIL PROJECT AND THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION  
2 COMMISSION MAJOR PROJECT ADVANCE POLICIES. AS MAYOR PRO  
3 TEMPORE, I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THE SIGNIFICANT FUNDING  
4 COMMITMENTS THIS ACTION INDICATES A STRONG FINANCIAL  
5 COMMITMENT FROM THE SAN WHAT COOP SIDE OF THE PROJECT BUT IT  
6 ALSO SERVES TO UNDERScore OUR COMMITMENT TO BOTH ENVIRONMENTAL  
7 AND ECONOMIC SUSTAINABILITY OF THIS PROJECT. THE CITY OF TRACY  
8 APPROVALS OF THE 200 ACRES OF LAND TO VALLEY LINK SUPPORTS A  
9 FINANCIAL IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RAIL PROJECT ALSO SUPPORTS A  
10 BOLD VISION OF THE MEGA REGIONAL GREEN HYDROGEN, INTEGRATION  
11 OF HYDROGEN PRODUCTION AND IN USE OF HEAVY TRAFFIC OPERATORS  
12 WE ENCOURAGE TO YOU SUPPORT.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU.

15

16 **SPEAKER:** MY PLEASURE. THANK YOU.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT SPEAKER IS ERIC SCHOTTMEIER.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** FROM THE MID 80S TO THE EARLY 90S I WAS CAL TRAINS  
21 FIRST PLANNING MANAGER, BACK THEN THE EXTENSION OF CALTRAIN  
22 WAS CONSIDERED A REGIONAL PRIORITY. SINCE THAT TIME, MANY  
23 OTHER PROJECTS, GOOD PROJECTS HAVE BEEN PLANNED, FUNDED, AND  
24 IMPLEMENTED, NONE OF WHICH WERE AS BENEFICIAL OR AS IMPORTANT  
25 AS THE DOWNTOWN EXTENSION IS. NOW YOU'RE BEING ASKED TO, BY





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 PLACING IN TIER TWO, TO DO THE SAME PASS OVER AGAIN. CALTRAIN  
2 BUSINESS PLAN FORECAST 230,000 RIDERS A DAY, GIVEN THE  
3 EXTENSION AND THE ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT AND THE FREQUENCY  
4 THAT WOULD ALLOW. NO OTHER REGIONAL PROJECT CAN PROMISE THAT.  
5 I URGE YOU TO ELEVATE THE CALTRAIN TIER ONE PRIORITY. THANK  
6 YOU.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT SPEAKER.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK TODAY. I'M THE BART  
11 BOARD PRESIDENT AND SPEAKING IN SUPPORT OF THE BART'S CORE  
12 CAPACITY PROGRAM APPRECIATE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. AND LIKE  
13 MY COLLEAGUES I'M ASKING FOR IT TO BE MOVED TO AUGMENT ONE.  
14 WE'RE IN THE MIDST OF DOING THIS PROJECT. IT IS OUR MOST  
15 IMPORTANT PROJECT TO INCREASE CAPACITY AND TO IMPROVE  
16 RELIABLE, AND DUE TO THE PANDEMIC, THE COSTS HAVE GONE UP, AND  
17 WITHOUT BEING ABLE TO CLOSE THE FUNDING SHORTFALL, WE'RE  
18 LIKELY GOING TO HAVE TO DEFER RENEGOTIATE CONTRACTS WHICH WILL  
19 LEAD TO EVEN FURTHER COST INCREASES AND PUT THE PROJECT AT  
20 RISK. THIS PROJECT IS SO IMPORTANT TOLL FULL REGION AND TO SO  
21 MANY OF THE OTHER PROJECTS THAT ARE BEING CONSIDERED FOR  
22 FUNDING SUNS BART CONNECTS TO SO MANY OTHER AGENCIES. SO,  
23 THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.

24





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS CALLER  
2 LAST FOUR DIGITS 3993. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS SAL CRUISE,  
5 PRESIDENT OF THE AMERICAN FEDERATION STATE COUNCIL OF  
6 MUNICIPAL EMPLOYEES LOCAL 393 REPRESENTING SUPERVISOR AND  
7 PROFESSIONAL STAFF AT BART SPEAKING IN SUPPORT OF BART'S CORE  
8 CAPACITY PROGRAM, DUE TO UNPRECEDENTED ESCALATION OF COST AND  
9 MATERIALS AND LABOR BART IS SEEKING ADDITIONAL STATE TIRCP  
10 CYCLE SIX FUNDING. WITHOUT FUNDS TO CLOSE FUNDING SHORT FAULT  
11 PROJECT RUNS RISK OF NEEDING TO DEFER OR RENEGOTIATE CONTRACTS  
12 WHICH WILL LEAD TO SIGNIFICANT COST INCREASES FURTHER PUTTING  
13 THE PROGRAM AT RISK AND IMPACTING THE REGION'S ABLE AND  
14 CAPACITY TO FUND OTHER PRIORITIES. PLEASE CONSIDER INCREASING  
15 THE ENDORSEMENT FOR BART AND AVOIDING SIGNIFICANT DELAYS AND  
16 ADDITIONAL COST. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND CONSIDERATION.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT UP IS TIFFANY RODRIGUEZ. PLEASE  
19 MUTE YOURSELF. NEXT SPEAKER GERALD COFFIN. PLEASE UNMUTE  
20 YOURSELF MR. COFFIN.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** YES MY NAME IS GERALD COFFIN. I'M A PROFESSIONAL  
23 ENGINEER ALSO AN ENGINEER. I HAVE BEEN INVOLVED IN THIS  
24 PROJECT FOR A LONG TIME AND HAVE HISTORY TO SHARE WITH YOU.  
25 FIRST APPROVED IN 1999 BY A HUGE MAJORITY OF SAN FRANCISCO





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 VOTERS, AND AROUND 2003 THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT KICKED IN SOME  
2 MONEY, AND LATER THE OBAMA ADMINISTRATION PUT IN ANOTHER 400  
3 MILLION JUTTING FOR THE TRAIN BOX AND SPECIFICALLY TO INVOLVE  
4 ITSELF IN THAT. BUT THE SIZE OF THAT BUILDING, I THINK ONE  
5 COMMISSIONER ALLUDED TO IT, BUT IN IT, AN ENORMOUS BUILDING,  
6 AND IT COULDN'T HAVE BEEN BUILT FOR JUST A RELATIVELY LOW  
7 RIDERSHIP AC TRANSIT SYSTEM, 13,000 RIDERS A DAY IS ALL THAT  
8 WAS COMING ACROSS THE BAY AT THAT TIME. SO PHASE ONE HAD A LOT  
9 TO DO WITH PHASE TWO. PHASE TWO OUGHT TO BE ELEVATED TO LEVEL  
10 ONE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, SIR. AND WITH THAT, MADAM  
13 CHAIR, WE HAVE NO ADDITIONAL SPEAKERS AT THIS TIME. OR, EXCUSE  
14 ME. ONE JUST RAISED THEIR HAHN. DO YOU WANT TO TAKE THAT ONE  
15 IN

16

17 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** YEAH. SURE. LET'S DO IT.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** HOWARD WONG. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK  
20 THIS, IS YOUR TIME.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. I'M HOWARD WONG MEMBER OF THE TJCAC MEMBER  
23 OF THE SIERRA CLUB SAN FRANCISCO EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE AND BOARD  
24 OF [INDISCERNIBLE] OF TOMORROW, ALL OF THESE ORGANIZATIONS  
25 HAVE SUPPORTED THE PRIORITIZATION OF DTX. AS AN ARCHITECT AND





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 PLANNER, I LOOK AT ALL THE TRANSPORTATION PROJECTS IN THE  
2 REGION. AND I SEE DTX AS KIND OF THE PRIMARY PRIORITY BECAUSE  
3 IT WOULD BE THE HEARTBEAT OF A REGIONAL TRANSIT SYSTEM. IN  
4 TERMS OF WORLD IMAGINARY, WHEN YOU THINK ABOUT TRANSPORTATION,  
5 YOU THINK ABOUT THESE GREAT HUBS, AND I THINK DTX WOULD HELP  
6 CREATE THAT IMAGINARY FOR THE WHOLE REGION AND DRIVE FUTURE  
7 FUNDING. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE TWO FINAL SPEAKERS,  
10 MADAM CHAIR. RICHARD HEDGES, FOLLOWED BY DEVON RYAN. GO AHEAD.

11

12 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE SO MANY OF THESE PROJECTS THAT  
13 ARE SO IMPORTANT I WANT TO TALK ABOUT ONE, CALTRAIN  
14 ELECTRIFICATION. IT WAS A VIEW I HAD IN THE LATE '60s AND  
15 EARLY '70s WOULD RING THE BAY WITH ELECTRIFIED TRANSPORTATION,  
16 NOT SPEWING DIESEL AS CALTRAIN HAS IN THE PAST IT'S SO  
17 IMPORTANT TO FULLY FUND THE CALTRAIN EXTENSION OF  
18 ELECTRIFICATION TO SAN FRANCISCO, I HOPE WE CAN FIND THE FUNDS  
19 DO THAT. I UNDERSTANDS OTHER PROJECTS ARE VERY IMPORTANT. BUT  
20 I'M HOPING WE SEE THE DAY WHERE BART AND CALTRAIN COMPLETELY  
21 RING THE BAY AREA WITH ELECTRIFIED TRANSPORTATION. THANK YOU.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MR. HEDGES. THE NEXT SPEAKER  
24 IS DEVON RYAN.

25





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **SPEAKER:** HI COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF CAN YOU HEAR ME?

2

3 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO THANK STAFF AND COMMISSIONERS FOR WORK ON  
6 THIS. WE UNDERSTAND IT'S TOUGH. THIS IS DEVON RYAN CALTRAIN  
7 GOVERNMENT AFFAIRS I'M CALLING IN TO REITERATE CALTRAIN'S  
8 REQUEST FOR THE FULL 410 FOR THE MTC PRIORITIZATION. AND THE  
9 REASON IS THAT WE ARE SO CLOSE ON THIS PROJECT. WE WOULD BE  
10 DONE. ANY REMAINING FUNDS THAT WE MANAGE TO GET FROM THE  
11 FEDERAL GOVERNMENT, WE WOULD HAPPILY RETURN TO THE TIRCP  
12 PROGRAM. CALTRAIN IS FACING SERIOUS CASH FLOW ISSUES STARTING  
13 BEGINNING OF THE YEAR 2023 AND THIS WOULD AVOID US HAVING TO  
14 IMPACT OPERATIONS AND SERVICE MAJOR ISSUES AND REALLY BENEFIT  
15 ALL THREE COUNTIES IN THE REGION AND COME TOGETHER ON A  
16 TREMENDOUS PROJECT OF NATIONAL SIGNIFICANCE IN WE CAN GET THIS  
17 FULLY FUNDED THROUGH THE STATE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MADAM CHAIR, I'LL FOLLOW YOUR  
20 LEAD, ADDITIONAL HANDS KEEP GOING UP. SO.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LOOK. WE'LL JUST GIVE IT  
23 ANOTHER -- WE'RE GOING STOP AT THESE LAST TWO. OKAY? NO MORE  
24 AFTER THAT.

25





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY.

2

3 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THEY HAD THEIR SHOT. JUST DO THE LAST  
4 TWO.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** TIFFANY FOLLOWED BY VAL. GO AHEAD AND  
7 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** HELLO. FIRST I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE STAFF AND  
10 COMMISSIONERS FOR THEIR WORK ON THE PHASE TWO BART PROJECT.  
11 I'M CALLING ON BEHALF OF SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY ASSOCIATED  
12 STUDENTS. OUR CAMPUS COMMUNITY HAS BEEN WAITING FOR THIS  
13 PROJECT FOR A LONG TIME AND IT'S EVEN CRITICAL NOW MORE THAN  
14 EVER AS COSTS CONTINUE TO RISE IN THE BAY AREA THIS PROJECT  
15 WOULD BENEFIT OUR MOST VULNERABLE COMMUNITY INCLUDING STUDENTS  
16 BUT IT WOULD PROVIDE FAST RELIABLE DIRECT ACCESS FROM SAN  
17 FRANCISCO TO DOWNTOWN SAN JOSE. WE ARE CURRENTLY PILOTING THE  
18 BAY PASS AND IT'S BEEN TRANSFORMATIVE FOR OUR STUDENTS IT'S A  
19 PROGRAM THAT WILL BE LONG-TERM IN THE FUTURE AND EXPANDED TO  
20 OTHER COLLEGES AND ORGANIZATIONS AND WOULD BE IMPACTFUL. THE  
21 PROJECT INITIATIVES ARE FOR STATE AND FEDERAL FUNDING IS  
22 NEEDED SO IT DOESN'T IMPACT LOCAL TRANSIT BUDGETS AND REDUCE  
23 SERVICE. THANK YOU.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NEXT SPEAKER.





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING. VAL, BART CHIEF PLANNING AND  
3 DEVELOPMENT OFFICER. I WANT TO THANK STAFF, THERESE, ALIX,  
4 THERESA, AND KENNETH. I KNOW IT'S A DIFFICULT TASK YOU DID LAY  
5 OUT A TRANSPARENT PROCESS AND APPRECIATE ALL THE ENGAGEMENT  
6 YOU DID. YOU MET TWICE WITH THE TRANSIT GENERAL MANAGEMENT.  
7 THE TIRCP FRAMEWORK IS KEY FOR BART RIDERS FUNNELED FOR CORE  
8 CAPACITY INVESTMENT BE INCLUDED IN AUGMENT ONE THIS HAS TO DO  
9 WITH THE CAL STIP GUIDELINES FOR THE UPCOMING RUNAWAY FOR FUN  
10 INCLUDED IN STATE BUDGET MONEY FOR THIS ROUND WE WOULD BE  
11 INELIGIBLE FOR FUTURE ROUNDS OF TIRCP FUNDS FOR THIS  
12 INVESTMENT IT LEVERAGES TIRCP FUNDING AND WE APPRECIATE YOUR  
13 CONSIDERATION. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT OVER  
16 TO YOU MADAM CHAIR.

17

18 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. AND I APPRECIATE EVERYBODY'S  
19 PARTICIPATE TODAY. WE KNOW HOW SIGNIFICANT ALL THESE PROJECTS  
20 ARE AND ALL THE HARD WORK THAT STAFF HAS DONE HERE AND WE HAVE  
21 THROWN A LOT MORE AT STAFF TODAY. MR. CANEPA, I DO SEE OUR  
22 CHAIR PEDROZA HERE. AND IF YOU DON'T MIND, HEAR FROM HIM, THAT  
23 WOULD BE GREAT.

24





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **ALFREDO PEDROZA:** SURE. THANK YOU CHAIR PAPAN. THANK YOU FOR  
2 STEPPING IN AS CHAIR IN A VERY ROBUST MEETING. COMMISSIONER  
3 RABBIT KNEW WHAT HE WAS DOING. I APPRECIATE ALL THE DIALOGUE  
4 AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. I COMMISSIONER PAPAN YOU PROVIDED  
5 SOME DIRECTION BUT LET'S GIVE STAFF A CHANCE TO LOOK AT  
6 FEEDBACK THEY HEARD TODAY WE HAVE OPPORTUNITY TO TALK ABOUT  
7 THIS AT THE COMMISSION. I THINK THERE WERE POINTS WELL MADE  
8 BUT I REALLY THINK MOVING FORWARD WITH WHAT WAS PRESENTED TOO,  
9 GIVING OUR STAFF TIME TO LOOK AT IT, COME BACK WITH ANY  
10 MODIFICATIONS THAT WE LOOK AT, IF THERE ARE ANY, I THINK WE  
11 JUST HAVE TO SEE THROUGH THE PROCESS BUT ACKNOWLEDGE THE  
12 CONCERNS THAT WERE EXPRESSED TODAY THAT ARE REAL. AND IF THERE  
13 IS OPPORTUNITY TO THE MOVE A PROJECT FURTHER ALONG WHERE IT'S  
14 MERITED AND CLEAR, WE JUST NEED TO UNDERSTAND THE TRADEOFFS TO  
15 DO THAT WITHOUT UNDERSTANDING THE TRADEOFFS I DON'T THINK PUTS  
16 THE COMMISSION IN A GOOD SPOT TO HAVE THAT DELIBERATION. I  
17 WANT TO ENCOURAGE US TO STAY THE COURSE INCORPORATING  
18 EVERYTHING WE HEARD TODAY. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA. GREATLY  
21 APPRECIATE IT. AND I DO SEE TWO OTHER COMMISSIONERS HERE.  
22 AGAIN, THE STAFF HAS PUT IN A LOT OF WORK HERE, AND I THINK --  
23 OH, NOW THE COMMISSIONERS HANDS ARE FLYING UP HERE. SO, WE  
24 NEED, TO I GUESS, GO THROUGH COMMISSIONER HAHN HERE. I THINK  
25 THAT'S AN OPPORTUNITY. BUT I DID WANT TO ASK THERESE, IF WE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 CAN, TRY TO INCORPORATE, WHAT WOULD THAT DO TO THE TIME  
2 SCHEDULE FOR OUR RECOMMENDATIONS FOR OUR ENDORSEMENTS TO THE  
3 STATE IN

4

5 **THERESE MCMILLAN:** WELL, AS I THINK KENNETH POINTED OUT IN HIS  
6 PRESENTATION, CERTAINLY THE APPLICATIONS FOR THE BIG TIER,  
7 EXISTING PROGRAMS, IS DUE NOVEMBER 15TH. WE DON'T HAVE A LOT  
8 OF TIME. IF THE COMMISSION IS WEIGHING IN WITH A  
9 RECOMMENDATION TO THE STATE ON THIS TIRCP IF THEIR CONCLUSIONS  
10 TO BE AT ALL EFFECTIVE BY THE END OF THE MONTH BY THE  
11 COMMISSIONERS. I THINK THAT'S WHAT YOU ARE ASKING?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** LET ME GET THROUGH OTHER COMMISSIONER  
14 COMMENTS. COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

15

16 **DAVID CANEPA:** GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND I AGREE WITH  
17 CHAIR PEDROZA. I DO THINK THAT THAT IS WISE. I DO THINK THAT'S  
18 A GOOD APPROACH. THERESE, YOU KNOW, I'M JUST CURIOUS, IF YOU  
19 CAN GET BACK TO US. I REALLY WANT TO UNDERSTAND ABOUT THE  
20 CONTINGENCY FUNDING, IN AUGMENT TWO, WHICH I BELIEVE  
21 PRIORITIZES COMPLETE PROJECTS, AND GETS INTO REVENUE SERVICE.  
22 I BELIEVE IT'S ABOUT \$100 MILLION. I MAY BE WRONG. BUT I WANT  
23 TO KNOW HOW THAT FUNDING SOURCE CAN BE USED. MY PRIMARY  
24 CONCERN, AND, SORT OF, ADVOCATING FOR THE ELECTRIFICATION  
25 FUNDING IS THAT IF THOSE STATE AND FEDERAL DOLLARS DO NOT COME





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 -- IS THIS PROJECT, YOU LOOK AT ALL THE PROJECTS, THEY'RE ALL  
2 WONDERFUL PROJECTS, BUT THE CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT  
3 IS REALLY GOING TO HAPPEN MUCH, MUCH SOONER THAN THESE OTHER  
4 PROJECTS. A LOT OF THESE OTHER PROJECTS ARE SEVERAL YEARS OUT,  
5 MAYBE LONGER. AND SO WHAT I WOULD JUST ENCOURAGE STAFF TO DO  
6 IS TO HELP ME -- AND MAYBE THIS IS A SPOT WE CAN LAND WHERE  
7 EVERYONE IS ABLE TO KEEP THEIR PROJECTS AND MAKE SURE THAT  
8 THEY'RE ABLE TO ADVOCATE FOR THEIR SPECIFIC PROJECTS, BUT I'M  
9 INTERESTED IN THE CONTINGENCY FUNDS AT BEING A BACKSTOP, SOCAL  
10 TRAIN ELECTRIFICATION, IF WE DON'T GET THOSE STATED FEDERAL  
11 DOLLARS, THAT WE COULD USE THOSE DOLLARS FOR CALTRAIN  
12 ELECTRIFICATION. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

13  
14 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** MOVING ON. CHAIR MILEY.

15  
16 **NATHAN MILEY:** THANK YOU. I DON'T HAVE ANY PROBLEM WITH DTX,  
17 BUT THE POINT OF THE MATTER IS, IF DTX IS MOVED TO LEVEL ONE,  
18 VALLEY LINK IS MORE QUALIFIED AS A LEVEL ONE PROJECT, SO, IN  
19 CONSIDERATION OF DTX TO MOVE TO LEVEL ONE, I WANT THE SAME  
20 CONSIDERATION TO BE GIVEN TO VALLEY LINK. AS I SAID, I HAVE NO  
21 PROBLEM WITH DTX. BUT THE QUESTION IS, I DO SUPPORT WHAT THE  
22 CHAIR IS SUGGESTING. IT'S JUST VERY PROBLEMATIC FOR ME, AS AN  
23 ALAMEDA COUNTY SUPERVISOR, REPRESENTING MY CONSTITUENCY AND  
24 THE WORK THAT'S BEING DONE ON VALLEY LINK, THE OBLIGATIONS OF  
25 VALLEY LINK TO BE A LEVEL ONE PROJECT, AND HAVE VALLEY LINK





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 PUT IN A POOR POSITION TO ADVANCE DTX AT THE EXPENSE OF VALLEY  
2 LINK. SO ANY CONSIDERATIONS THAT ARE GIVEN FOR DTX, THOSE SAME  
3 CONSIDERATIONS FEED TO BE GIVEN TO VALLEY LINK, AND I WILL --  
4 AND BUT KNOW, WE CAN HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE CALL IN, TOO, AND  
5 WE'LL DO THAT IF NECESSARY. I JUST APPRECIATE THE WORK STAFF  
6 HAS DONE, THE RECOMMENDATION STAFF PUT BEFORE US TODAY IS VERY  
7 MEASURED AND CONSIDERED, AND I THINK THEY WISH WE COULD HOLD  
8 TO THAT RECOMMENDATION, AND SECURE UP TO THE FULL COMMISSION  
9 AND HAVE TAKE INTO FULL CONSIDERATION THE POINTS THEY HAVE  
10 HEARD TODAY. ONCE AGAIN VALLEY LINK IS MORE QUALIFIED LEVEL  
11 ONE PROJECT THAN DTX.

12

13 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MILEY.  
14 COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ AND THEN COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

15

16 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK ALL SPEAKERS. I THINK  
17 IT WAS HELPFUL TO GET EVERYBODY'S PERSPECTIVE. AND SUPERVISOR  
18 MILEY, I UNDERSTAND ABOUT HOW MUCH ORGANIZING WE WANT TO DO TO  
19 GET TO OUR POINT ACROSS. I WANT TO COMMENT ON TWO BROAD ISSUES  
20 AND ONE IS THAT I FULLY APPRECIATED JASON BAKER'S POINT ABOUT  
21 HOW MUCH INVESTMENT SANTA CLARA COUNTY HAS BEEN MAKING TO  
22 BRING BART TO SAN JOSE AND SANTA CLARA CANYON AND ALL THE WAY  
23 INTO THE CITY OF SANTA CLARA AND IT IS TRUE THAT WE HAVE  
24 CONTINUED TO TAX OURSELVES DRAMATICALLY TO MAKE SURE WE CAN  
25 GET THAT PROJECT DONE AND I THINK WHEN COMMUNITIES DO THAT I





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THEY GET REWARDED FOR THAT KIND  
2 OF INVESTMENT AND I APPRECIATE THAT POINT ALSO EXTEND TO  
3 CALTRAIN AND PROBABLY TO SOME DEGREES TO ALL OF OUR PROJECTS  
4 BUT JUST TO THE BROAD INVESTMENT. THE SECOND THING, PART OF  
5 THE REASON I'M SO FOCUSED ON BOTH BART TO SAN JOSE AND  
6 CALTRAIN, I'M CONCERNED THAT THERE ARE SO MANY PROJECTS THAT  
7 REST ON THOSE TWO PROJECTS BEING COMPLETED, AND I JUST -- THE  
8 REASON I WAS EMPHASIZING, AND I APPRECIATE, GINA, YOUR  
9 EMPHASIS ON THIS, AS WELL, IS THAT WE DO -- IN ALL OF THESE,  
10 IF WE THINK OF OURSELVES AS A NINE BAY AREA REGION IT'S REALLY  
11 IMPORTANT TO THINK ABOUT WHAT CONNECTIONS WHAT TO DO. THE  
12 POINT YOU RAISED GINA, THE THREE COUNTY BENEFIT IS AN  
13 IMPORTANT ONE IT RELATES TO BART IN GENERAL IT'S THE MOST  
14 ADVANCED TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM WE HAVE IN THE ENTIRE BAY AREA  
15 AS IT RELATES TO BEING ABLE TO MOVE PEOPLE FROM POINT A TO  
16 POINT B AND JUST THE VOLUME OF PEOPLE WE CAN MOVE. SO I DO  
17 REALLY RECOGNIZE THAT STAFF HAS A TOUGH JOB. I'M GOING TO  
18 WEIGH IN JUST TO SAY THAT I WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE GET BART  
19 TO DIRIDON AND FINISH CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION TO KEEP MOVING  
20 US DURING THESE CHALLENGING TIMES. THANK YOU.

21

22 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** ABE-KOGA AND WORTH AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN  
23 GET ON HERE.

24





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I WANT TO ADD MY THOUGHTS  
2 TO STAFF FOR THE TREMENDOUS WORK BEING PUT INTO THIS PROCESS.  
3 ESPECIALLY I APPRECIATED THE CRITERIA THAT WAS OUTLINED IN  
4 TERMS OF WHAT THAT WAS USED TO PUT THE PROJECTS ON THE VARIOUS  
5 LEVELS. I GUESS IN PAST CONVERSATIONS, I DIDN'T REALLY HAVE A  
6 REFERENCE AND THIS HAS PUT IT ALL TOGETHER. SO, THAT'S BEEN  
7 SUPER HELPFUL FOR ME. AND, SO, I DO SUPPORT WHAT HAS BEEN  
8 PRESENTED TO US. YOU KNOW, OF COURSE, I'M GOING TO SAY, TOO,  
9 THAT MY TWO PRIORITIES ARE CALTRAIN ELECTRIFICATION AND THE  
10 BART EXTENSION TO SAN JOSE, FOR THE REASONS COMMISSIONER  
11 CHAVEZ AND SOME SPEAKERS, OUR COMMUNITY HAVE TAXED THEMSELVES  
12 AND WE HAVE COMMITTED FUNDING. SO IT MAKES SENSE TO CONTINUE  
13 TO MOVE THOSE FORWARD. AND I JUST WOULD LIKE TO SEE PROJECT TO  
14 COMPLETION AS SOON AS WE CAN. AND IN THAT REGARD, I HAD A  
15 SIMILAR QUESTION TO COMMISSIONER CANEPA, I SAW IN THE TABLE,  
16 UNDER AUGMENT TWO, THERE IS A POINT TO MEGA PROJECTS  
17 CONTINGENCY, WOULD THAN USEABLE TO SUPPLEMENT THE CALTRAIN  
18 PROJECT SHOULD WE NEED TO DO SO? THANK YOU.

19

20 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. AS LONG AS I'M -- RIGHT BEFORE WE  
21 GET TO COMMISSIONER WORTH HERE -- I THINK WE'RE HEADING IN A  
22 DIRECTION HERE BUT IT WOULD BE GREAT IF STAFF COULD ACTUALLY  
23 DEFINE THE CONTINGENCY AMOUNT MAYBE PRIORITIZE IT TO COMPLETE  
24 PROJECTS. STAFF IS DOING A WONDERFUL JOB BUT THAT MIGHT BE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 HELPFUL TO FILLING A GAP AND MOVING AHEAD HERE. OKAY.

2 COMMISSIONER WORTH AND THEN I THINK WE NEED TO CONCLUDE.

3

4 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH MADAM CHAIR. FIRST OF ALL,

5 I'LL BE BRIEF. I ALSO WANT TO SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION

6 THAT'S BEEN PRESENTED TO US TODAY. IT IS A HUGE CHALLENGE. YOU

7 KNOW, IN THE BAY AREA, WE HAVE GOT ALL OF OUR COUNTIES, WE

8 HAVE GOT ALL OF OUR PROJECTS THAT ARE HIGH PRIORITY, THAT ARE

9 DIFFERENT POINTS. AND I THINK THAT STAFF HAS DONE A VERY

10 CAREFUL JOB OF BALANCING HOW WE CAN PUT TOGETHER A PORTFOLIO

11 THAT WILL BE THE MOST COMPETITIVE IN THE STATE AND THE FEDERAL

12 GOVERNMENT AND THAT IS ONE OF THE BIGGEST CHALLENGES THAT WE

13 HAVE. AND WE DO HAVE TO SPEAK WITH ONE VOICE. AND I THINK

14 THERESE'S POINT IS A GOOD ONE THAT SAYS THIS PRIORITIZATION

15 ENABLES TO US MAKE THE PRIORITIES, AS OPPOSED TO CHANGING THE

16 LIST, MOVING THINGS AROUND, EXPANDING CERTAIN CATEGORIES

17 BEYOND CAPACITY, AND THEN SOMEBODY IN SACRAMENTO OR WASHINGTON

18 IS MAKING CHOICES. WHICH, I THINK, IN THE LONG RUN IT'S MUCH

19 BETTER IF WE CAN MAKE THESE TOUGH DECISIONS. I REALLY SUPPORT

20 THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. I WANT TO THANK YOU FOR THE

21 ANALYSIS, THE ANSWERS TO THE QUESTION HAVE BEEN REALLY HELPFUL

22 IN TERMS OF UNDERSTANDING SOME OF THE NUANCES. THE OTHER THING

23 I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO SEPARATE THESE PROJECTS WITH WHERE

24 WE KNOW WE ARE RELATIVE TO THE COVID IMPACT ON RIDERSHIP AND

25 THAT IS ANOTHER ISSUE THAT WE DO NEED TO ADDRESS, WHICH WE ARE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 ADDRESSING AND WILL ADDRESS IN A VERY SUBSTANTIVE WAY. SO, I  
2 WOULD BE HAPPY, MADAM CHAIR, TO MOVE THIS -- MOVE -- MAKE A  
3 MOTION TO APPROVE THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION. I THINK ARE THE  
4 ELEMENT OUR CHAIR INDICATED TO TAKE A LOOK AT SOME OF THE  
5 QUESTIONS THAT HAVE BEEN RAISED, AND IS THERE SOME NUANCE. BUT  
6 I AM PRIMARILY SUPPORTING THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION MAKING THAT  
7 MOTION, AT YOUR PLEASURE.

8

9 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. AND I  
10 WOULD JUST LIKE TO CLARIFY. I WOULD BE HAPPY TO SECOND THAT  
11 MOTION. AND I KNOW STAFF IS DOING THEIR DARNEDEST HERE. AND  
12 MOVING FORWARD, WE COULD DEFINE THE CONSTITUENCY, AND NOTE, AS  
13 WAS STATED, THE REGIONAL IMPACT, AND, ALSO, THE ENABLING PART  
14 OF SOME OF THESE PROJECTS THAT WILL ENABLE OTHER ONES TO MOVE  
15 FORWARD HERE. I THINK WE'RE GOING TO HAVE FURTHER DISCUSSION  
16 AT THE FULL COMMISSION. BUT IF WE CAN TRY TO NUANCE THIS IN  
17 SUCH A WAY, IT COULD BE VERY EXCITING. SO, AT THIS POINT IN  
18 TIME, I WILL SECOND COMMISSIONER WORTH'S MOTION AND CALL FOR A  
19 VOTE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR. MOTION BY WORTH.  
22 SECOND BY PAPAN. CHAIR RABBIT IS ABSENT. VICE CHAIR PAPAN?

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** YES.

25





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

2

3 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

6

7 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M GOING ABSTAIN. THANK YOU.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** OKAY. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

10

11 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

14

15 **NATHAN MILEY:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

18

19 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

22

23 **AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

24





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES WITH SIX  
2 AYES, ONE ABSTENTION, AND ONE ABSENT.

3

4 **DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR:** OKAY. THANK YOU EVERYONE. NOW WE GET TO  
5 THE EXCITING CLIFF DISCUSSION. AND WE ARE RUNNING LATE. SO  
6 ITEM 3B, REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE, STATE BUDGET  
7 ADVOCACY FOR TRANSIT OPERATORS. ROLLING WITH STAFF, PLEASE.

8

9 **MELANIE CHOY:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND I BELIEVE IT'S  
10 AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. MELANIE CHOY WITH FUNDING POLICY  
11 PROGRAM SECTION HERE WITH BILL BACON, THE BILLS OF THE  
12 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE UPDATES THAT WAS PRESENTED TO  
13 THE SEPTEMBER JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE PURSUING  
14 REGIONAL LONG-TERM STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS THE LOOMING FISCAL  
15 CHALLENGES FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES, HOWEVER ADDRESSING THE  
16 SEVERITY OF THE TRANSIT FISCAL CLIFF IS MEETING WELL BEFORE A  
17 FUTURE MEASURE WILL BE TAKEN TO VOTERS. THIS MONTH WE'RE  
18 COMING TO THIS COMMITTEE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE  
19 TO PROVIDE CONTEXT ON THE TRANSIT OPERATING FISCAL CHALLENGES  
20 TO INFORM OUR STATE ADVOCACY EFFORTS AS WE PURSUE NEAR-TERM  
21 FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES TO BRIDGE THE TIME GAP UNTIL A MORE  
22 CONTINUOUS STABLE REVENUE IS AVAILABLE. AND SIMILAR TO THE  
23 PREVIOUS ITEM THIS PRESENTATION CONTINUES THE DIFFICULT THEME  
24 OF CHALLENGES WITHOUT NOT ENOUGH -- WITHOUT -- WITH NOT ENOUGH  
25 MONEY. AND ONE THING I WOULD LIKE TO CALL IS THIS WILL BE THE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 FIRST SERIES -- THE FIRST IN A SERIES OF FUTURE DISCUSSIONS ON  
2 THIS TOPIC. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. FISCAL CHALLENGES HAVE BEEN  
3 BUILDING UP OVER TIME RECENT YEARS HAVE EXACERBATED CHALLENGES  
4 EVEN BEFORE PANDEMIC RIDERSHIP WAS CONCERNING, IN 2019 WE  
5 PARTNERS WITH UCLA LUSKIN SCHOOL OF PUBLIC AFFAIRS TO STUDY  
6 THIS TREND AND IN 2019 AGENCIES WERE ALREADY FACING DEFICITS  
7 AND ANTICIPATING LABOR SHORTAGES DUE TO AN AGING WORKFORCE IN  
8 2020 WITH ONSET OF COVID AND STAY-AT-HOME ORDERS AND RIDERSHIP  
9 PLUMMETED OVERNIGHT AND TRANSIT AGENCIES WERE THROWN INTO A  
10 FINANCIAL CRISIS. TODAY AS WE EMERGE FROM THE PANDEMIC DURING  
11 THE REBOUND AGENCIES ARE ADJUSTING TO THE EVOLVING SITUATION  
12 SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES HAVE ADDED TO THE COST CHALLENGES IN TERMS  
13 OF DELIVERING SAME SERVICES AS BEFORE AND LABOR SHORTAGES  
14 CONTINUES TO BE A CHALLENGE. IN THE FUTURE LOOKING AHEAD THERE  
15 UNCERTAINTY IN THE LONG-TERM IN THE NEAR-TERM THERE IS  
16 EXPECTATION THAT A LARGE PERCENTAGE OF COMMUTERS WILL BE  
17 RETURNING 2 TO 3 DAYS A WEEK TO TRANSIT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
18 OVER THE PAST TWO AND A HALF YEARS RIDERSHIP RECOVERY HAS BEEN  
19 SLOW, AND ALL OPERATORS HAVE EXPERIENCED A DROP IN RIDERSHIP  
20 IN MARCH 2020. NOW MORE THAN TWO AND A HALF YEARS LATER THE  
21 TOTAL TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS AROUND HALF OF WHAT IT WAS  
22 PREPANDEMIC OPERATORS THAT SERVE PREDOMINANTLY LOCAL TRIPS  
23 LIKE SFMTA, AC TRANSIT, VTA AND SAMTRANS HAVE EXPERIENCED  
24 STRONGER RIDERSHIP RECOVERY EXCEEDING REGIONAL AVERAGE, BUT  
25 PREDOMINANTLY REGIONAL TRIPS LIKE CALTRAIN, GOLDEN GATE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 TRANSIT, HAVE STRUGGLED TO REGAIN RIDERS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE.  
2 WHILE MANY RIDERS HAVE RETURNED TO THE BAY AREA PUBLIC TRANSIT  
3 IT IS CRITICAL TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE LEVEL OF TRANSIT SERVICE  
4 THAT'S BEING OPERATED TODAY IS BELOW PREPANDEMIC LEVELS. THESE  
5 REDUCED LEVELS OF TRANSIT SERVICE MAKE TRANSIT LESS EFFECTIVE  
6 FOR RIDER PRESIDENCY MAY CONTRIBUTE TO SLOWER RIDERSHIP  
7 RECOVERY. THERE ARE STILL MANY BUS ROUTES IN THE BAY AREA THAT  
8 HAVE NOT BEEN RESTORED OR ARE OPERATING AT REDUCED  
9 FREQUENCIES. SO WHILE MOST OPERATORS ARE PROVIDING ABOUT 80%  
10 OF THEIR PREPANDEMIC LEVELS OF SERVICE IT IS IMPORTANT TO NOTE  
11 THAT FOR RAIL AND FERRY OPERATORS WHICH ALSO HAVE HIGH FIXED  
12 COST, IF THEIR SERVICE IS OPERATING AT ANY LEVEL OF SERVICE  
13 AND MAKES SENSE POWER THEM TO PROVIDE NEAR PREPANDEMIC LEVELS  
14 OF SERVICE, BECAUSE OF THESE FIXED COSTS OF OPERATING  
15 STATIONS, FERRY BOATS AND OPERATING CUSTOMER FACILITIES RAIL  
16 AND FERRY SERVICES WOULD NOT SAVE MUCH MONEY BY REDUCING FERRY  
17 SERVICE LEVELS. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO THE UNEVEN TRANSIT  
18 RIDERSHIP AND WAS LEVELS SHOW FISCAL CHALLENGES FACING BAY  
19 AREA OPERATORS IS MULTIFACETED IN HOW AGENCIES ARE IMPACTED  
20 HOW AGENCIES RESPONDED AND IT REPRESENTS IS REFLECTIVE OF EACH  
21 AGENCY'S UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES. AGENCIES THAT HAVE BEEN  
22 IMPACTED HAVE NOT BEEN IMPACTED IN THE SAME MANNER URBAN AND  
23 RAIL AND FERRY SYSTEMS HAVE BEEN IMPACTED HEAVILY. AND THESE  
24 SERVICES ARE GENERALLY RELIANT COMMUTER DEPENDENT AND HAVE  
25 FIXED COST WHERE SUBURBAN BUS AND SMALL MEDIUM AGENCIES ARE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 AFFECTED BUT NOT TO THE SAME SCALE OF RAIL AND FERRY  
2 OPERATORS. THESE AGENCIES HAVE HAD FLEXIBILITY TO ADJUST  
3 SERVICES AND ANOTHER ASPECT OF THEIR SERVICE AREA IS THEY DO  
4 SERVE A LARGE POPULATION OF TRANSIT RELIANT PASSENGERS.  
5 ADDITIONALLY AGENCIES HAVE TAKEN DIFFERENT APPROACHES IN THEIR  
6 RESPONSE BASED ON UNIQUE CIRCUMSTANCES, AND THERE IS A LOT OF  
7 VARIABILITY IN THE RESPONSE AS WELL AS JUST SITUATIONAL  
8 VARIABILITY. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS, BAY  
9 AREA'S SEVEN LARGE TRANSIT OPERATORS ARE CURRENTLY FORECASTING  
10 A CUMULATIVE OPERATING SHORTFALL OF OVER 2 BILLION. THIS  
11 SHORTFALL WILL START TO APPEAR IN THE NEXT FISCAL YEAR, FISCAL  
12 YEAR '23/'24 AND GROW FROM THERE. RAIL AND FERRY OPERATORS AS  
13 WELL AS SFMTA FACE THE MOST ACUTE FINANCIAL PRESSURE DUE TO  
14 HIGH FIXED COST AS WELL AS FROM THEIR UNIQUE PREPANDEMIC  
15 REVENUE MIX THAT WAS PARTICULARLY EXPOSED TO THE IMPACTS OF  
16 PANDEMIC ON PASSENGER FARES, BRIDGE TOLLS AND PARKING  
17 REVENUES. AND AGAIN THE BAY AREA SMALL AND MEDIUM OPERATORS,  
18 THESE OPERATORS ARE GENERALLY RELIANT ON SALES TAX REVENUES TO  
19 FUND THEIR OPERATIONS AND THEY ARE SEEING GENERALLY A HIGHER  
20 LEVEL OF RIDERSHIP RECOVERY AND THEY HAVE MORE STABLE TAX  
21 REVENUES WHEN COMPARED TO OPERATORS LIKE BART, GOLDEN GATE,  
22 CALTRAIN, WETA AND SFMTA, AND THESE OTHER OPERATORS ALSO FACE  
23 SIGNIFICANT -- ALTHOUGH THESE SMALL AND MEDIUM OPERATORS ALSO  
24 FACE SIGNIFICANT CAPITAL COST PRESSURE THOUGH IN COMING  
25 DECADES AS WE WORK TO TRANSITION TO ZERO EMISSION NEEDS





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 FLEETS. NEXT SLIDE. THAT WAS THE OVERVIEW OF THE SHORTFALL  
2 ENVELOPE, AND IN THE COMING MONTHS WE WILL BE WORKING WITH  
3 TRANSIT AGENCIES TO DELVE INTO THE DIVERSITY AND COMPLEXITY OF  
4 THE FISCAL CLIFF AREAS WE'LL BE ASSESSING ARE LEVELS OF  
5 SERVICE, RIDERSHIP TRENDS LABOR SHORTAGES, IMPACTS SUCH AS  
6 INFLATION SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES, RECOVERY STRATEGIES VARIOUS  
7 ASSUMPTIONS AND BASELINES THAT WILL INFORM FISCAL CLIFF  
8 ASSESSMENT IT IS A MULTI- FACETED ASSESSMENT AND THE BAY AREA  
9 TRANSIT PUBLIC AGENCIES ARE VERY DIVERSE IN THEIR CHALLENGES.  
10 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AND AS WE DEFINE THE OPERATING FISCAL  
11 CHALLENGE WE RECOGNIZE THE INTERDEPENDENCY OF THE OPERATOR  
12 NEEDS WITH OTHER AGENCY NEEDS ESPECIALLY WHEN FUNDING IS  
13 SCARCE ADDRESSING THE OPERATING FISCAL CHALLENGES SHOULD BE  
14 CONSIDERED IN THE CONTEXT OF OTHER INITIATIVES AND FUNDING  
15 NEEDS SUCH AS MAJOR CAPITAL EXPANSION AS DISCUSSED IN THE  
16 PREVIOUS PRESENTATION ITEM. THE STATE OF GOOD REPAIR NEEDS,  
17 ZERO-EMISSIONS BUS TRANSITION, AND SMALL BUT MEANINGFUL  
18 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IMPROVEMENT THESE ITEMS WERE HIGHLIGHTED  
19 BY KENNETH IN THE PREVIOUS PRESENTATION AND VERY MUCH WE SEE  
20 THAT THERE IS A LOT OF LINKAGES BETWEEN ALL OF THE FUTURE  
21 NEEDS IN THIS INTERRELATED MIX OF AREAS. IN DEVELOPING  
22 STRATEGIES WE BROKE DOWN STRATEGIES INTO THREE DIFFERENT  
23 RESPONSE ON THE FISCAL CLIFF. IN 2020 THE NEED RESPONSE WAS  
24 IMMENSE AND THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT PROVIDED MUCH NEEDED  
25 FUNDING OVER \$4 BILLION, AND THE REGION BRINGS THE BLUE RIBBON





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE AND RESPONDED WITH COORDINATION  
2 OPERATIONAL CHALLENGES TO IMPROVE THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE. IN  
3 THE SECOND CAMP RESPONSES AND STRATEGIES IS MORE OF A NEAR-  
4 TERM STRATEGY AROUND A FIVE YEAR HORIZON AND WE WILL NEED TO  
5 SEEK STRATEGIES FOR GAP FUNDING UNTIL LONGER TERM SOLUTIONS  
6 ARE DEVELOPED AND ONE OF THE THINGS WE'RE LOOKING TOWARDS IS  
7 THIS COULD INCLUDE FISCAL YEAR 2023, '24 ADVOCACY AND OTHER  
8 SUPPORTIVE POLICIES. I WILL DIVE INTO THE NEAR-TERM STRATEGIC  
9 IN THE NEXT SLIDE BUT THE LONGER TERM CATEGORIES IS SIX PLUS  
10 YEARS LOOKING AT DEVELOPING MORE RESILIENT FUNDING MODELS  
11 INCLUDES SEEKING NEW FUNDING REVAMPING THE EXISTING FUNDING  
12 MODELS THAT TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE BASED ON AND THEN ALSO  
13 ACTIVELY DOING STRATEGIC SERVICE PLANNING AND JUST BEING  
14 RESPONSIVE TO THE EVOLVING MARKETS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, IN  
15 FOCUSING ON THE NEAR-TERM FUNDING STRATEGY, THE FIVE YEAR, IN  
16 THE MEANTIME STRATEGY, UNTIL A LONG-TERM APPROACH IS  
17 DEVELOPED, WE BELIEVE THAT PURSUES STATE SUPPORT IS PROMISING.  
18 STRAIGHT'S CONTRIBUTION TO VMT REDUCTION IN ALLIANCE WITH  
19 STATE GOALS AND THE FISCAL CLIFF IS NOT UNIQUE TO THE BAY  
20 AREA. WE HAVE THREE POSSIBLE CONCEPTS TO PURSUE IN THIS  
21 ADVOCACY. THE FIRST ONE IS PURSUING OPERATING FUNDS FROM  
22 SOURCES THAT ARE NOT CURRENTLY DEDICATED TO PUBLIC TRANSIT AND  
23 WE WOULD DELVE INTO THIS IN FUTURE MEETINGS FURTHER. AND IN  
24 THE SECOND CATEGORY THAT WE COULD PURSUE IS FUNDING FOR  
25 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE PROJECTS SO THESE INCLUDE INITIATIVES





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1   STEMMING FROM THE TRANSIT TRANSFORM EDUCATION ACTION PLAN THAT  
2   WAS ADOPTED BY THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT RECOVERY TASK FORCE.  
3   AND THEN LASTLY, THE THIRD COMPONENT WOULD BE ASKING FOR  
4   MULTI-YEAR SUPPORT AND NOT JUST A SINGLE YEAR STOP GAP TO AT  
5   LEAST HELP US TAKE US FURTHER INTO AND GIVE US ADDITIONAL TIME  
6   TO DEVELOP THE LONG-TERM STRATEGY. AGAIN THESE ARE PRELIMINARY  
7   IDEAS AND THEY WILL BE FLESHED OUT IN THE COMING MONTHS. NEXT  
8   SLIDE PLEASE. IN TERMS OF ANTICIPATED NEXT STEPS, WE ARE  
9   PLANNING TO COME BACK IN NOVEMBER, DECEMBER WITH MORE DETAILS  
10   ON THE FISCAL CLIFF AND BEGIN DISCUSSIONS ON THE STATE  
11   ADVOCACY APPROACH AND IN JANUARY WE ANTICIPATE DISCUSSIONS TO  
12   CONTINUE AS WELL AS PROVIDE A SUMMARY OF THE OPERATORS SHORT  
13   RANGE TRANSIT PLANS FOR ADDITIONAL CONTEXT TO THIS DISCUSSION.  
14   WITH THIS, THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM, AND THAT CONCLUDES MY  
15   PRESENTATION. BILL BACON AND I ARE AVAILABLE TO ANSWER ANY  
16   QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE. THANK YOU.

17

18   **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU MELANIE. APPRECIATE IT. IT IS  
19   AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM HERE. DO WE HAVE ANY CORRESPOND RELATED  
20   TO THIS, KIMBERLY?

21

22   **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES, MADAM CHAIR, WE DO. WE RECEIVED A  
23   LETTER FROM GENESIS SIGNED BY MARY LAMP E AND FROM MICHAEL  
24   ABRAMSON. I ALSO SEE MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAHN  
25   RAISED, DO YOU WANT TO TAKE THEM NOW?





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** WHY DON'T WE TAKE THEM REAL QUICK. KEEP  
3 IT TO ONE MINUTE THEN MOVE BACK TO THE COMMISSIONERS. BECAUSE  
4 WE ARE OVER TIME.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FIRST IS PETER STRAUSS GO AHEAD AND  
7 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** PETER STRAUSS SAN FRANCISCO TRANSIT RIDERS BOARD FOR  
10 VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION WE APPRECIATE MTC'S URGENT  
11 INVOLVEMENT IN THIS WE NEED TO PROCEED EXPEDITIOUSLY WE ALSO  
12 NEED TO PURSUE MULTIPLE PARALLEL PATHS BECAUSE WE DON'T KNOW  
13 WHAT WILL COME TO FRUITION WE NEED EVERYTHING THAT'S BEEN  
14 EXPLAINED IN TERMS OF SEEKING STATE BRIDGE FUNDING, WE STILL  
15 NEED TO SECURE A REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE AUTHORIZATION IN  
16 2023 WE DON'T KNOW WHICH PATH WILL BE SUCCESSFUL. I WANT TO  
17 STRESS THE URGENCY OF THE FISCAL CLIFF AND TRANSPORTATION'S  
18 MOST URGENT PROBLEMS IT'S NOT HARD TO ARGUE THAT HOUSING  
19 SUPPLY EFFORT ANDS RELATED TO THE HOMELESS ARE NOT MORE  
20 SERIOUS TODAY BUT IF AGENCIES DO START TO GO OVER THOSE FISCAL  
21 CLIFFS THEN TRANSPORTATION WILL BE IN CRISIS MODE AND THAT'S  
22 WHAT WE NEED MTC'S URGENT EFFORTS TO AVERT.

23

24 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU MR. STRAUSS.

25





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. FOLLOWED BY ADINA LEVIN.

2 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ADINA LEVIN WITH THE VOICES FOR  
5 PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION COALITION, THROUGH FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN  
6 AND SEAMLESS BAY AREA WANTING TO REALLY STRONGLY ENDORSE THE  
7 STAFF PROPOSAL TO HAVE A STATE BUDGET STRATEGY TO HAVE A  
8 FISCAL BRIDGE TO ADDRESS THAT FISCAL CLIFF TO KEEP OUR PUBLIC  
9 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM RUNNING WHILE BUILDING THE GROUNDWORK  
10 FOR A REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE TO PROVIDE THAT  
11 STABILITY GOING FORWARD AND ALSO INCLUDE IN THAT STRATEGY  
12 FUNDING TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN TO REGROW TRANSIT RIDERSHIP  
13 AND MAKE THE SYSTEM BETTER THESE ARE ESSENTIAL FOR OUR EQUITY  
14 CLIMATE GOALS AND HOUSING GOALS AS WELL MAKING SURE KEY CAN  
15 DOING IT UNTIL HOUSING IS ADDRESSED AND TO THE PREVIOUS  
16 CONVERSATION OF CAPITAL MODELS OF A TRANSIT SYSTEM WE NEED TO  
17 KEEP THIS RUNNING. THANK YOU.

18

19 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** COMMISSIONERS, IF WE CAN KEEP IT TIGHT  
20 HERE WE HAVE TWO MORE ITEMS, PLEASE. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

21

22 **NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** THANK YOU. I THINK THIS IS INCREDIBLY  
23 IMPORTANT. I'M GLAD WE'RE TALKING ABOUT THIS AND I BELIEVE  
24 THAT METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION HAS AN INCREDIBLE  
25 RESPONSIBILITY NOT JUST TO BUILD PROJECTS BUT TO MAKE SURE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 THE BUSES AND TRAINS HAVE THE MONEY THEY NEED TO OPERATE NOT  
2 JUST IN THOSE PROJECTS BUT IN ALL THE EXISTING TRANSIT  
3 SYSTEMS. I THINK THIS IS ONE WHERE HOPEFULLY A LOT OF THE WORK  
4 THAT WE DID DISTRIBUTING THE FEDERAL FUNDS THAT WE RECEIVED  
5 EARLIER, IN A WAY THAT CENTERS EQUITY, IS GOING TO BE A, SORT  
6 OF, SOMETHING THAT WE CAN DRAW ON AS WE DEVELOP THIS  
7 CHALLENGE. BECAUSE I THINK IT'S REALLY NO LONGER JUST WANT  
8 ABOUT GOING BACK TO WHAT TIMES WERE HIKE BEFORE COVID. I THINK  
9 IT'S REALLY ABOUT USING THIS FUNDING TO CHART A PATH FORWARD  
10 FOR THE REGION'S TRANSIT OPERATORS, WHICH, WHERE WE CAN BRING  
11 THEM INTO SUSTAINABLE FOOTING BUT MOST AS IMPORTANTLY  
12 SUSTAINABLE FOOTING WHERE THEY ARE PROVIDING, SORT OF, SERVICE  
13 THAT SERVES ARE THE LOW-INCOME AND MIDDLE INCOME PEOPLE AROUND  
14 OUR REGION AS NEEDED. AND I WANT TO ADD ONE MORE SPECIFIC  
15 COMMENT WHICH IS I HOPE WE LOOK AT THIS IN A SCENARIO BASIS.  
16 THAT WAS REALLY SUCCESSFUL IN PLANNED BAY AREA. I KNOW TRANSIT  
17 OPERATORS LIKE BART HAVE DONE A LOT OF SCENARIO MANNING. WE  
18 DON'T KNOW WHAT THE FUTURE IS GOING TO BE. SO COMING UP WITH  
19 ONE NUMBER, \$2 BILLION, MIGHT BE SIMPLE, BUT IT DOESN'T GIVE  
20 US THE KIND OF UNDERSTANDING OF THE CHALLENGE AND WHAT WE'RE  
21 TRYING TO SOLVE FOR IS NOT JUST A FISCAL DEFICIT WHICH IS \$2  
22 BILLION, BUT TRYING TO SOLVE FOR WHAT THAT IMPACT IS ON  
23 RIDERS. AND THAT'S SOMETHING I WOULD ALSO LIKE TO BE ABLE TO  
24 TRY AND COME UP WITH SOME QUANTIFICATION FOR SO BECAUSE TRYING  
25 TO FILL A \$2 BILLION GAP AND TRYING TO CONTINUE TRANSIT





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 RELIABLE IS MORE COMPELLING AND SOMETHING WE CAN HOPEFULLY  
2 RALLY ALL THE NECESSARY PEOPLE AROUND IN A MORE POWERFUL WAY.  
3

4 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. I SAW COMMISSIONER SPERING,  
5 BUT HE PUT HIS HAND DOWN.

6  
7 **JAMES P. SPERING:** MADAM CHAIR, REAL BRIEFLY. I'M NOT ON THE  
8 COMMITTEE BUT HOME STAFF IS LOOKING AT SOME OF THE  
9 INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENT SUCH AS BUS PRIORITY IF WE'RE GOING  
10 TO BRING RIDERSHIP BACK WE HAVE GOT TO STREAMLINE THE SYSTEM  
11 AND THOSE INFRASTRUCTURE IMPROVEMENTS NEED TO BE A HIGH  
12 PRIORITY. THANK YOU, MADAM CHAIR.

13  
14 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

15  
16 **AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU MADAM CHAIR. I WANT TO CONCUR WITH  
17 BOTH COMMISSIONERS SPERING AND COMMISSIONER I DON'T HAVE'S  
18 COMMENTS ABOUT NEXT STEPS. I THINK WE NEED TO PURSUE ALL THREE  
19 THAT WERE IN THAT BOX. AND I DON'T -- ONE OF THE THINGS THAT I  
20 THINK WE NEED TO APPROXIMATE GO SECURE ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO  
21 ADDRESS THIS FINANCIAL CLIFF, I DON'T THINK BECAUSE OF THE  
22 DEPENDENCY THAT FOLKS HAVE ON LOCAL TRANSIT, SHIFTING MONEY  
23 AROUND THE REGION IS GOING TO BE ULTIMATUM RATHER EXTREMELY  
24 HARMFUL AS OPPOSED TO SEEKING OUT NEW MULTIPLE YEAR FUNDING TO  
25 GET US THROUGH THIS BUT ALSO BEING ABLE TO INCORPORATE THE





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 RECOMMENDATIONS THAT CAME OUT OF THE BLUE RIBBON TASK FORCE.  
2 BECAUSE I THINK THAT RESTORING RIDERSHIP BOTH LOCALLY AND  
3 REGIONALLY IS GOING TO BE VITAL TO LONGER TERM. THANK YOU,  
4 AGAIN TO STAFF. I KNOW YOU HAVE BEEN UP LATE AT NIGHT WORRYING  
5 ABOUT THIS AS WE ALL HAVE BEEN AND REALLY APPRECIATE THIS  
6 FRAMEWORK FOR MOVING FORWARD COLLECTIVELY. THANK YOU.

7

8 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. AND THANK  
9 YOU TO STAFF, AS WELL. IF THE CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IS NOT  
10 ENHANCED, WE ARE NEVER GOING TO COME OUT OF THIS HOLE. WE ARE  
11 INVEST -- THE BLUE RIBBON COMMITTEES POINTS NEED TO BE  
12 EMPHASIZED THROUGHOUT THIS, OR WE'RE JUST THROWING MONEY DOWN  
13 A BLACK HOLE AND THAT IS NOT GOING TO WORK. WE HAVE JUST GOT  
14 TO PUT THAT OUT UP FRONT. THERE IS A CLIFF, BUT IF PEOPLE ARE  
15 NOT GETTING BACK ON TRANSIT, THERE IS MORE THAN THE REASON --  
16 THERE IS A LOT OF DIFFERENT REASONS HERE. SO, I HOPE THAT THE  
17 CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE IS REALLY THE FIRST STEP, WITH WE KNOW  
18 WHAT'S GOING TO BRING THEM BACK. WE HAVE TO EMPHASIZE THAT.  
19 AND I CAN TELL YOU, HAVING RIDDEN BART RECENTLY, IT'S STILL  
20 NOT GOOD. AND I KNOW THEY COVER SO MANY OTHERS. BUT IF PEOPLE  
21 DON'T FEEL SAFE IS THEY DON'T FEEL COMFORTABLE, IT'S GOING TO  
22 BE A LONG TIME BEFORE THAT RECOVERY HAPPENS. OKAY. THIS IS  
23 INFORMATION ONLY. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON WITH ITEM 4A AND THEN  
24 THERE IS NO FIVE. BUT WE MOVE TO SIX. SO 4A. THANK YOU  
25 EVERYBODY.





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1

2 **KENNETH KAO:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS. THIS IS KENNETH KAO WITH  
3 MTC STAFF. I HAVE THE CTC UPDATE AND I AM BROADCASTING FROM  
4 SAN FROM BECAUSE THE CTC MEETING IS TODAY AND TOMORROW MORNING  
5 I WANT TO PROVIDE A FEW ITEMS RELATED TO THE GUIDELINES AND  
6 EQUITY UPDATES AND FUNDING PROGRAMS COMING UP. THE NEXT  
7 MEETING WILL BE IN DECEMBER IN RIVERSIDE. WITH THAT HAPPY TO  
8 ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS YOU MAY HAVE.

9

10 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** DID WE RECEIVE CORRESPOND ON THIS ONE,  
11 KIMBERLY?

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH  
14 THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED  
15 ON THIS ITEM.

16

17 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** GREAT. NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. NO  
18 COMMISSIONERS. KENNETH, ONE OF THESE DAYS WE'RE GOING TO PUT  
19 YOU UP FRONT. OKAY. I DON'T SEE AN ITEM FIVE. SO CAN WE MOVE  
20 TO ITEM SIX WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT? DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC  
21 COMMENTS IN GENERAL ON BUSINESS OTHER THAN WHAT WE HAVE  
22 DISCUSSED?

23





OCTOBER 12, 2022

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE  
2 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT  
3 SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

4

5 **GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR:** OKAY. I REALLY WANT TO THANK EVERYBODY  
6 FOR YOUR PARTICIPATING TODAY AND STAYING WITH US HERE. WE'RE  
7 GOING TO ADJOURN THE MEETING UNTIL OUR NEXT MEETING ON  
8 NOVEMBER 9TH, 2022. HAVE A WONDERFUL DAY. THANK YOU EVERYBODY.

9 [ADJOURNED]

10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37





*Broadcasting Government*