METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION
2	BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE
3	WEDNESDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2022 9:35 AM
4	
5	AMY WORTH, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING EVERYONE. I'M AMY WORTH, CHAIR,
6	IT'S MY PLEASURE TO CALL TO ORDER THE MEETING OF THE BAY AREA
7	TOLL AUTHORITY OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE. I'LL ASK THE BROADCAST
8	TEAM TO ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES
9	ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED
10	AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL
11	361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS
12	MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL
13	CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER
14	SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE
15	THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS
16	PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS
17	ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO
18	VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION
19	BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE
20	OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE
21	APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
22	BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED
23	THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT,
24	PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC
25	COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO GOV BY 5 P.M



- 1 YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED
 2 INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF
 3 THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE
- 4 TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL
- 5 UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE
- 6 TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD
- 7 NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE
- 8 FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP
- 9 TO DATE.

10

15

17

19

22

- 11 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: BEFORE WE BEGIN I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE
- 12 BROADCAST TEAM FOR BRINGING THESE MEETINGS TO THE PUBLIC. YOU
- 13 ALL WORK SO HARD LITERALLY AND FIGURATIVELY BEHIND THE SCENES.
- 14 THANK YOU. LET'S CALL ROLL CALL
- 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAIR WORTH?
- 18 AMY R. WORTH, CHAIR: HERE.
- 20 CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.
- 21 GLOVER?
- 23 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.**
- 25 CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY IS ABSENT. PAPAN?



1	
2	GINA PAPAN: HERE.
3	
4	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBIT?
5	
6	DAVID RABBIT: HERE.
7	
8	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RONEN?
9	
10	HILLARY RONEN: HERE.
11	
12	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.
13	
14	AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. NOW MAY I TURN TO
15	COMMISSIONER PAPAN, AS IS OUR TRADITION FOR THE PLEDGE OF
16	ALLEGIANCE FOR BEGINNING OF OUR COMMITTEE MEETING.
17	
18	GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE] "I PLEDGE
19	ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO
20	THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD,
21	INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."
22	
23	AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. ALL RIGHT, OUR NEXT ITEM IS THE
24	COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT, PLEASE?



7

13

16

19

21

23

SEPTEMBER 14, 2022

- 1 CLERK OF THE BOARD: AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE
- 2 FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY
- 3 WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE \$100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A
- 4 MAXIMUM OF \$500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A
- 5 PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH
- 6 MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

8 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. MOVING TO ITEM FOUR IS OUR

- 9 CONSENT CALENDAR. INCLUDES ITEMS 4A THROUGH 4C, AND FIRST I
- 10 WANT TO ASK ARE THERE ANY ITEMS THAT EITHER THE STAFF OR THE
- 11 PUBLIC WOULD LIKE TO HAVE, OR COMMITTEE MEMBERS, REMOVED FROM
- 12 THE CONSENT CALENDAR?
- 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I SEE NOTHING IN WRITING, MADAM CHAIR,
- 15 AND NO HAND RAISED AT THIS TIME.
- 17 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: TERRIFIC. I WOULD MOVE FOR A MOTION TO ADOPT
- 18 THE CONSENT CALENDAR.
- 20 DAVID RABBIT: MOVED.
- 22 MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: SECOND.
- 24 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: MOVED BY RABBIT SECOND BY ABE-KOGA. ROLL
- 25 CALL.



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WORTH?
3	
4	AMY WORTH, CHAIR: AYE.
5	
6	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: ABE-KOGA?
7	
8	MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: AYE.
9	
10	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ IS ABSENT. GLOVER?
11	
	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
13	
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER MILEY IS ABSENT.
	COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
16	CINA DADAN. AVE
17	GINA PAPAN: AYE.
	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER RABBIT?
20	CLERK, KIMBERLI WARD. COPPIESSIONER RABBIT:
21	DAVID RABBIT: AYE.
22	
23	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN?
24	
25	HILLARY RONEN: AYE.



1 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 2 3 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 4 5 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. MOVING TO ITEM 5A, THIS IS A COMMERCIAL LEASE EXTENSION FOR 375 BEALE STREET, SWEETS 200 A, 6 7 THROUGH 300 C, THE BAY AREA HEADOUARTERS AUTHORITY BAHA 8 FASTRAK REGIONAL CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER ESTIMATED AT \$900 9 MILLION. I'LL TURN IT OVER TO MONICA SERENO TO PRESENT. 10 MONICA SERENO: THIS ITEM IS TO EXTEND THE LEASE AGREEMENT 11 BETWEEN BATA AND THE BAY AREA HEADOUARTERS AUTHORITY FOR THE 12 METRO CENTER SPACE CURRENTLY BEING USED FOR THE FASTRAK 13 REGIONAL CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER. BATA'S LEASING SPACE FROM 14 15 THE BAY AREA HEADOUARTERS AUTHORITY ON THE SECOND FLOORS 16 THROUGH CONDUIT FASTRAK COORDINATOR SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF FASTRAK CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER OPERATES OUT OF THIS LOCATION 17 WE'RE HERE TODAY TO REQUEST THAT THE COMMITTEE REFER TO THE 18 AUTHORITY THE REQUEST TO AUTHORIZE THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO 19 NEGOTIATE AND ENTER INTO AN EXTENSION OF THE LEASE AGREEMENT 20 21 BETWEEN BATA AND THE BAY AREA HEADQUARTERS AUTHORITY FOR 22 CONTRACT THROUGH DECEMBER 2022 TO SEPTEMBER 2027. THERE ARE 23 ANY OUESTIONS FOR ME?



- 1 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. THERE ARE ANY OUESTIONS OF STAFF
- 2 ON THIS STAFF REPORT? OKAY. KIMBERLY, MAY I ASK IF THERE IS
- 3 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? I SEE ONE HAND RAISED, I'LL
- 4 LET YOU TAKE THAT ON.

5

- 6 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NO PROBLEM. HOW MANY MINUTES DO YOU WANT
- 7 TO ALLOW?

8

9 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: TWO MINUTES.

10

- 11 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING,
- 12 AND ALETA DUPREE, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE
- 13 YOURSELF, YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

- 15 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR AMY WORTH AND MEMBERS.
- 16 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. IT'S GOOD TO BE BACK
- 17 WITH YOU. THIS IS IMPORTANT. AND IT HAS BEEN A WHILE SINCE I
- 18 HAVE BEEN IN THE MTC BUILDING GIVEN THE PANDEMIC AND SO MUCH
- 19 GOING REMOTE. AND, IN A WORLD WHERE SO MUCH IS DONE THROUGH
- 20 WEB SITES AND APPS, AND WHEN YOU MAKE PHONE CALLS WITH MENUS
- 21 AND TRYING TO BYPASS MENUS, I THINK IT IS DEFINITELY
- 22 REFRESHING WHEN YOU CAN WALK IN THE DOOR AND SEE SOMEONE AND
- 23 TALK TO SOMEONE. AND I THINK THAT IDEA IS RELEVANT TO THE
- 24 FUTURE. IT'S TIMELESS. IT'S WITHOUT TIME. IT'S NEITHER OLD NOR
- 25 NEW. IT IS JUST THERE. SOMETIMES THERE ARE THINGS THAT YOU



- 1 WANT TO FIND OUT ABOUT FASTRAK AND CLIPPER THAT YOU DON'T
- 2 REALLY GET BY LOOKING AT THE WEB SITE, EVEN IF YOU TRY TO
- 3 [INDISCERNIBLE] THE LINES, AND SOMETIMES EVEN WHEN YOU ARE
- 4 DEALING WITH PHONE TREES, SOMETIMES THERE ARE SOME THINGS THAT
- 5 YOU CAN REPRESENT TO AN INDIVIDUAL, SUCH AS YOU TAKE OUT YOUR
- 6 PHONE, OR YOU CAN DRAW SOMETHING, OR WRITE SOMETHING,
- 7 ESPECIALLY, I MET A PERSON A WHILE BACK WHO CAN'T TALK. AND I
- 8 WOULD JUST -- I DIDN'T MEET THEM VERY LONG, BUT A PERSON IN
- 9 THAT SITUATION PROBABLY DOES A LOT OF WRITING. AND THERE IS
- 10 TDD OF COURSE, AND ALL OF THAT. BUT THIS IS IMPORTANT. IT'S
- 11 MONEY WELL SPENT. YES, THERE ARE SOME ACCOUNTING THAT HAS TO
- 12 BE DONE EVEN THOUGH IT'S REALLY ALL IN THE SAME BUILDING AND
- 13 THE SAME HOUSE. SO THIS IS A NO-BRAINER. I HOPE TO SEE THESE
- 14 VERY NICE PEOPLE IN THAT FASTRAK OFFICE FOR A LONG TIME TO
- 15 COME. THANK YOU.

16

- 17 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
- 18 RAISED, MADAM CHAIR.

- 20 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR
- 21 COMMENTS. AND WE WILL BRING THIS, SINCE THERE IS NO FURTHER
- 22 PUBLIC COMMENT, WE WILL BRING THIS BACK TO THE COMMITTEE FOR
- 23 DISCUSSION AND DECISION. SO IS THERE ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION?
- 24 AGAIN, I WANT TO CONCUR WITH THE COMMENTS OF THE SPEAKER. I
- 25 THINK IT'S -- ALL OF OUR PUBLIC EFFORTS TO REACH OUT TO OUR



- 1 USERS ARE SO IMPORTANT, WEB SITE, PHONES, REMOTE
- 2 OPPORTUNITIES, IN-PERSON, IT'S REALLY VERY CENTRAL TO WHAT WE
- 3 DO. SO, THANK YOU FOR THAT -- THOSE COMMENTS. AND LET ME JUST
- 4 SEE IF THERE IS NO FURTHER DISCUSSION. LOOKING FOR HANDS UP. I
- 5 WILL ENTERTAIN A MOTION.

6

7 FEDERAL D. GLOVER: GLOVER WILL MOVE.

8

9 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: OKAY. MOVED BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

10

11 MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

12

- 13 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: SECONDED BY VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA. SO, AGAIN,
- 14 I WANT TO JUST TURN BACK TO THE -- OUR CLERK TO ASK, BEFORE WE
- 15 TAKE THE VOTE, IF WE HAVE RECEIVED ANY ADDITIONAL COMMENTS ON
- 16 THIS ITEM?

17

- 18 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. WE HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING
- 19 WRITTEN FOR THIS PARTICULAR ITEM. THANK YOU.

20

- 21 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU. THEN WOULD YOU BE SO
- 22 KIND TO CALL THE ROLL?

23

24 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: YOU GOT IT. CHAIR WORTH?



1	AMY WORTH, CHAIR: AYE.
2	
3	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR ABE-KOGA?
4	
5	MARGARET ABE-KOGA, V. CHAIR: AYE.
6	
7	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ IS ABSENT.
8	COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
9	
10	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.
11	
12	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER MILEY? IS ABSENT
13	
14	NATHAN MILEY: AYE. AYE. I'M HERE.
15	
16	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER MILEY.
17	COMMISSIONER PAPAN?
18	
19	GINA PAPAN: AYE.
20	
21	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER RONEN?
22	
23	HILLARY RONEN: AYE.
24	
25	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER RABBIT?



1 2 DAVID RABBIT: AYE. 3 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY 4 5 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. 6 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MOVING TO ITEM SIX, 7 8 PUBLIC COMMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS. I WOULD LIKE TO TURN TO OUR CLERK TO ASK TO READ A LIST OF ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC 9 COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM -- ASSOCIATED WITH PUBLIC 10 COMMENT PRIOR TO THE MEETING TODAY. SO, I KNOW WE HAVE 11 RECEIVED THEM FROM THE CLERK, BUT IF YOU WOULD BE SO KIND AS 12 TO IDENTIFY FOR THE RECORD? 13 14 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE WAS ONE LETTER OF 15 16 CORRESPONDENCE TO BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE FROM BIKE EAST BAY MARIN COUNTY BICYCLE COALITION, RICH CITY RIDERS, AND TRACK, 17 THE TRAILS FOR RICHMOND ACTION COMMITTEE. THEY WERE ALL ON ONE 18 LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE. AND I SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC 19 WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. ALETA DUPREE, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO 20 21 UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. 22 SPEAKER: THANK YOU AGAIN, CHAIR AMY WORTH. ALETA DUPREE, SHE 23 AND HER FOR THE RECORD. ALWAYS GOOD TO BE BACK WITH YOU. NOT 24 IN THE BAY AREA RIGHT NOW, BUT I WAS IN THE BAY AREA OVER THE 25



- 1 WEEK. AND I DID STOP BY THE BART CELEBRATION IN THE LATE
- 2 AFTERNOON. HEARD SOME OF YOU WERE THERE. SORRY I MISSED YOU.
- 3 IT WOULD BE INTERESTING, AS MUCH AS I LIKE THE BART HALF OFF
- 4 PROMOTION, SEEING HOW MUCH THIS IS AFFECTING OUR REVENUE, AND
- 5 MAINTAIN THAT AWFUL THESE SYSTEMS ARE COMPLEMENTARY, AND
- 6 SHOULD HOPEFULLY NEVER BE COMPETITIVE. SO, HOW DO WE GET TO
- 7 POOL OF MONEY THAT IS GOING TO USE ALL OF THESE SYSTEMS? JUST
- 8 LIKE IN NEW YORK, YOU HAVE THE SUBWAY, BUT ALSO HAVE MANY
- 9 BRIDGES, THAT BUSES, AUTOMOBILES AND BICYCLES CAN USE AS WELL.
- 10 I'M INTERESTED TO SEE WHAT SEPTEMBER LOOKS LIKE. IN OKLAHOMA A
- 11 I HEARD ON THE CIMARRON TURNPIKE, CIMMARRON, THE STATE ROUTE
- 12 99 INTERCHANGE HAS GONE INTO THE ALL NEW ELECTRIC PLATE TAG
- 13 SYSTEM, AS IN DINNER PLATE PAY, LICENSE PLATE PAY. AND THEY
- 14 WILL BE CONVERTING MORE OF THOSE TOLL PLAZA AS OVER THE REST
- 15 OF THE YEAR. I'M ANTICIPATING WHEN THE LINCOLN TUNNEL, NEW
- 16 YORK AND NEW JERSEY, THAT'S THE LAST OF THE PORT AUTHORITY
- 17 CROSSINGS FOR OVER THE HUDSON RIVER TO GO TO ALL ELECTRONIC
- 18 TOLLING. HOPEFUL THAT'S WILL HAPPEN SOON, IT'S SLATED BY THE
- 19 END OF YEAR. LET'S GET THE WORD OUT ABOUT WHAT WE ARE DOING,
- 20 BECAUSE I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO US GETTING THE NEW EQUIPMENT IN
- 21 THE THREE NORTHERN BRIDGES. THANK YOU.
- 23 CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
- 24 RAISED FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC. BUT I DO SEE COMMISSIONER
- 25 PAPAN DOES HAVE HER HAND RAISED, MADAM CHAIR.



1 2 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THANK YOU. 3 GINA PAPAN: MADAM CHAIR, AND JUST FOR A OUICK NOTE, THE 4 5 FASTRAK AT SFO PARKING GARAGES DOESN'T WORK. I HAVE NOTIFIED STAFF HERE. I GUESS OUR UPGRADE WAS TOO MUCH FOR THEIR SYSTEM. 6 SO, I KNOW HOUR STAFF IS WORKING ON IT, BUT JUST IN CASE 7 8 ANYBODY IS THERE, HOPEFULLY IT WILL BE RESOLVED SOON. IT'S A COUPLE OF TIMES NOW, YOU GO UP TO THE GATE FOR FASTRAK, YOU 9 HAVE TO BACK OUT AND GO TO ANOTHER GATE. I WAS HOPING THEY 10 WOULD TAKE DOWN THE SIGNS AT THE MOMENT UNTIL WE GET IT FIXED 11 BUT I'M NOT SURE IF THAT HAPPENED YET. BUT THEY'RE WORKING ON 12 IT. SO THAT WILL BE GOOD. AND IT SEEMS LIKE A GREAT THING TO 13 HAVE THAT. I HOPE THEY CAN RESOLVE IT SOON. THANK YOU. 14 15 16 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU. ARE THERE ANY FURTHER COMMENTS? TERRIFIC. SO, I KNOW WE'LL WORK ON THAT. I'M 17 WONDERING IF SOMETHING IS GOING ON WITH THE ELECTRONICS AND 18 THESE PARKING SYSTEMS. BECAUSE I HAD ANOTHER THING AT ANOTHER 19 PARKING LOT AT ANOTHER AIRPORT. MAYBE IT'S THE HEAT 20 21 22 GINA PAPAN: ACCORDING, WE'RE TOO ADVANCED FOR THEIR SYSTEM. 23 AMY WORTH, CHAIR: THAT'S THE REASON FOR COORDINATION. THANK 24 25 YOU. KIMBERLY ANY OTHER COMMENTS ON THE PHONE OR ZOOM?



1	
2	CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS.
3	
4	AMY WORTH, CHAIR: GREAT. WITH THAT WE'LL ADJOURN TO OUR NEXT
5	MEETING. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY
6	OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY OCTOBER
7	12TH, 2022, ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED.
8 9 9 10 11 122 133 144 155 166 177 188 199 122 122 123 124 125 126 127 128 129 120 131 132 133 134 135 136 136 136 137 138 138 138 138 138 138 138 138 138 138	[ADJOURNED
37 88	



Broadcasting Government