# METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

## Meeting Transcript

**METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION**

**WEDNESDAY, JUNE 22, 2022 9:35 AM**

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE MY NAME IS ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION, ALONG WITH NICK JOSEFOWITZ VICE CHAIR. WE'RE CALLING THE MEETING TO ORDER FOR JUNE 22ND AT 9:35 A.M. IF WE COULD PLEASE ROLL THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU NTT TEAM. FIRST THANKING COMMISSIONER AHN FOR BEING HERE. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK AND ON ZOOM -- GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONER MILEY. ROLL CALL

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** HE'S EN ROUTE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DAVID CANEPA:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI?

**DORENE M. GIACOPINI:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**SAM LICCARDO:** PRESENT.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** HERE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** HERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. QUORUM IS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S PROCEED WITH ITEM TWO. AND WE HAVE SOME STUDENTS IN THE BOARDROOM THAT ARE HERE WITH COMMISSIONER AHN. I'M GOING TO ASK IF YOU ALL CAN LEAD US IN THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE THIS MORNING. [ PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE ] "I PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE TO THE FLAG OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, AND TO THE REPUBLIC FOR WHICH IT STANDS, ONE NATION UNDER GOD, INDIVISIBLE, WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE FOR ALL."

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** HOPEFULLY COMMISSIONER AHN GETS CREDIT FOR THAT. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM THREE, THE COMPENSATION ANNOUNCEMENT.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AS AUTHORIZED BY STATE LAW I AM MAKING THE FOLLOWING ANNOUNCEMENT. EACH MEMBER OF THE BOARD HERE TODAY WILL BE ENTITLED TO RECEIVE $100 PER MEETING ATTENDED UP TO A MAXIMUM OF $500 PER MONTH PER AGENCY. THIS AMOUNT IS A PROVIDED AS A RESULT OF CONVENING A MEETING FOR WHICH EACH MEMBER IS ENTITLED TO COLLECT SUCH AMOUNT.

**SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO ITEM FOUR. I DO WANT HAVE A FULL REPORT AT THIS POINT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I DO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT WE HAVE HAD SOME BUSY DAYS. WE WERE IN WASHINGTON, D.C. LAST WEEK ADVOCATING OUR REGIONAL PRIORITIES WE ALSO HAD OPPORTUNITY TO GO TO SACRAMENTO THIS WEEK AS WELL. WE'RE SHARING OUR STORY OF REGIONAL PRIORITIES AND THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK AS ONE VOICE FOR REGIONAL PRIORITIES THAT CARRIED A LONG WAY FOR FEDERAL AND STATE DELEGATIONS. I WANT TO THANK EVERYONE WHO CAME TOGETHER ON THOSE PRIORITIES IT RESONATED WITH OUR FEDERAL AND STATE DELEGATION AT THE NEXT MEETING NEXT MONTH WE'LL PROVIDE A MORE DETAILED REPORT. AT THIS POINT WE'RE GOING TO PRECEDE TO ITEM FIVE AND I'M GOING TO ASK RANDI KINMAN FROM THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL TO GIVE THE REPORT.

**RANDI KINMAN:** GOOD MORNING CHAIR AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL MET THIS MONTH, AND OUR FIRST BIG TOPIC WAS TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY, WHICH LED TO A RATHER LENGTHY DISCUSSION, A VERY FULL DISCUSSION. SOME OF THE ISSUES THAT WERE RAISED WAS, WERE THE FACT THAT THE NEW POLICY DON'T INCLUDE AREAS WITHOUT FIXED GUIDEWAYS AND THE PRESERVATION OF WHAT WERE PREVIOUSLY FIXED GUIDEWAYS FOR THE FUTURE USE. MULTIPLE ISSUES WERE BROUGHT UP REGARDING CHILD CARE IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF HOUSING, MIXED USE AND COMMERCIAL AREAS. BECAUSE THE REALITY IS, WE CANNOT REBUILD OUR COMMUNITIES. WE CANNOT REBUILD OUR WORKFORCE, AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE CANNOT GET PEOPLE OUT OF VEHICLES IF WE DON'T HAVE CHILD CARE. IT'S -- AND IT WILL ADDRESS A LOT OF PREEXISTING INEQUITIES TO SOMEHOW MAKE ROOM FOR THAT IN ALL OF OUR POLICIES. THERE WERE A NUMBER OF ITEMS DISCUSSED A NEED FOR COMMITMENT TO BUILD HOUSING ACROSS THE BOARD THAT MEETS THE NEEDS OF DISABLED COMMUNITIES WEATHER WHEELCHAIR ACCESS OR ACCOMMODATIONS FOR VISUAL OR HEARING IMPAIRED. AND TO MEET THE NEED FOR PEOPLE WHO REQUIRED ATTENDANCE. AND IN THE WORDS OF KRISTINE F STATED YOU NEVER KNOW WHEN OR WHY YOU MIGHT NEED THESE ACCOMMODATIONS. OR WHETHER THEY WILL BE PERMANENT OR TEMPORARY. THE COUNCIL UNANIMOUSLY VOTED TO RECOMMEND STAFF TO THE COMMISSION HOUSING DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES, REQUIRING THE DEVELOPMENT OF UNIVERSAL DESIGN GUIDELINES ENSURING THAT ALL HOUSING PROJECTS BUILT, ALL UNITS ALREADY ADAPTIVELY INCLUDE AT ALL LEVELS OF INCOME WE OBVIOUSLY DID NOT DEVELOP RECOMMENDATIONS AS TO HOW, BUT IT SEEMS THAT'S WHAT'S MUCH NEEDED. IT CAN BE EFFECTIVELY DEVELOPED AS WITH ALL OF OUR POLICIES, WHETHER IT'S HOUSING OR LOW-INCOME HOUSING WE NEED TO DEVELOP A CARROT AND STICK APPROACH. SECOND ISSUE WAS LEGISLATION THE COUNCIL VOTED BY A LARGE MAJORITY TO SUPPORT STAFF MOVING FORWARD WITH INVESTIGATING REGIONAL SUPPORT BOTH TRANSIT AND HOUSING. WE DIDN'T BIFURCATE THE TWO ISSUES. WE WANT STAFF MOVING FORWARD ON BOTH OF THESE TO MEET THE DEADLINES THAT ARE REQUIRED FOR ANY FUTURE INITIATIVES ON THE BALLOT. OUR LAST ITEM WAS THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION NETWORK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND THE FIVE YEAR IMPLEMENTATION PLAN, AND I WANT TO THANK KARA OBERG FOR BEING PATIENT WAITING TO THE END OF OUR LENGTHY MEETING. THIS IS A TOPIC THAT I'M PROBABLY GOING TO BUMP TO A DIFFERENT SUBCOMMITTEE SO WE CAN SPEND MORE TIME ON IT AS SHE BRINGS HER PRESENTATIONS FORWARD. AND THAT'S MY REPORT FOR TODAY.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, ANDY, FOR A GREAT REPORT. COMMISSIONERS, ANY QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS? I DON'T SEE ANY IN THE BOARDROOM. KIMBERLY, DO WE HAVE ANYONE VIRTUALLY?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM. HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** TWO MINUTES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THE FIRST SPEAKER IS RICH HEDGES. MR. HEDGES, IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO UNMUTE YOURSELF, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**RICHARD HEDGES:** THANK YOU. RANDI GAVE A GOOD REPORT ON ALL OF OUR DISCUSSIONS. THE MAIN TOPICS THAT REALLY TOOK A LOT OF TIME WERE ACCESS FOR THE DISABLED AND CHILD CARE. CHILD CHAIR, FROM THE VERY BEGINNING OF IT OD WAS PUT ON THE LIST TO SOMETHING THAT'S NECESSARY TO KEEP PARENTS FROM GETTING IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THEIR CARS TO LEAVE THE AREA OF TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES FOR CHILD CARE THAT MEANS THEY NEVER GET ON TRANSIT WHEN THAT HAPPENS. ON DISABLE ACCESS FOR TRANSFER IN COMMUNITIES -- [INDISCERNIBLE] SOMETIME BACK -- HELLO?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I MUTED THE PERSON THAT WAS -- GO AHEAD, MR. HEDGES.

**RICHARD HEDGES:** -- SOMETIME, BACK, I WOULD SAY PROBABLY 15 YEARS AGO, ON THE LACK OF ABILITY ON DISABLE PEOPLE TO LIVE IN SOME OF THE ALREADY TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENTS WE HAD, AND THE LACK OF ACCESS TO MANY OF THE STATIONS. SO, AT THAT TIME, ON PLANNING GRANTS, MTC HAD ACTED. AND, HOPEFULLY WILL DO MORE WORK TO MAKE SURE THAT THE DISABLED HAS ACCESS TO TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. BECAUSE THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT IN ELIMINATING THE NEED FOR ALREADY OVERTAXED DISABLED TRANSPORTATION. THANK YOU.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU, MR. HEDGES. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LET'S PROCEED TO ITEM SIX ON OUR AGENDA, THIS IS THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. I'LL ASK THERESE MCMILLAN TO GIVE THE REPORT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, AND GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. CHAIR PEDROZA MENTIONED OUR TRIPS TO WASHINGTON AND SACRAMENTO, AND I WOULD LIKE TO GIVE A SPECIAL SHOUT OUT TO REBECCA LONG AND GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN FOR PULLING THAT ALL TOGETHER. IT TAKES A BIT OF MUSCLE MEMORY TO GO BACK AND DO THESE IN-PERSON TRIPS. SO KUDOS TO THEM FOR DOING AN OUTSTANDING JOB. SO WANTED TO LIFT THAT UP. WITH RESPECT TO CLIPPER, THE CLIPPER NEXT GENERATION EQUIPMENT IS ROLLING OUT IN THE FIELD TO OUR TRANSIT PARTNERS, SMART IS FULLY EQUIPPED WITH READERS, AND EQUIPMENT IS BEING INSTALLED ON MUNI EQUIPMENT. A LOT OF PROGRESS. ALSO TO NOTE ABAG HELD ITS GENERALLY ASSEMBLY ON JUNE 17TH, 2022. THE DAY INCLUDED A LISTENING SESSION WITH DELEGATES ON A POTENTIAL 2024 REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE WHICH YOU WILL BE HEARING ABOUT MORE AND WAS MENTIONED BY POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL CHAIR KINMAN AS A BIG TOPIC OF CONCERN, AS TO HOW WE PREPARED TO CONSIDER A REGIONAL MEASURE FOR HOUSING, AS WELL AS FOR TRANSPORTATION. AND, I WANTED TO ALSO MAKE A NOTE THAT TONY TAVARES, WHO WAS A FORMER DISTRICT FOUR DIRECTOR. HE WAS THE DISTRICT FOUR DIRECTOR WHEN I JOINED THE AGENCY, THEN HE WAS PULLED DOWN TO TAKE CARE OF LOS ANGELES, DISTRICT SEVEN BUT HE HAS NOT BEEN NOMINATED TO BE HEAD OF CALTRANS. EXCITING NEWS FOR OUR FORMER COLLEAGUE AND A KIND OF WELCOME HOME. HE KNOWS A LOT ABOUT BATA AND THAT WILL BE A PLUS FOR US IN OUR CONTINUING WORK WITH CALTRANS. CONGRATULATIONS THERE. HE'S STILL AWAITING CONFIRMATION, BUT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HOPEFULLY THAT WILL PROCEED A PACE. AND I WOULD LIKE TO END BY SAYING THAT DUE TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF A.B. 361, MTC AND ABAG AND OUR OTHER ENTITIES WILL NEED TO MEET IN AUGUST. AUGUST IS NORMALLY A DARK MONTH BUT WE WILL HAVE TO MAKE PROVISIONS FOR THE ACTIONS RELATED TO 361. WE WORK ON A TIME SO THAT WEEKEND HAVE ONE OR TWO MEETINGS TO ENSURE THAT WE NEED THE 30-DAY MANDATE. SO JUST WANTED TO GIVE A HEADS UP THAT THAT WILL BE A BIT OF A PIVOT FROM OUR EXPECTED -- [INDISCERNIBLE] BACK TO YOU MR. CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. ALSO CONGRATULATIONS TO DIRECTOR TAVARAS, HE KNOWS OUR REGION WELL. AND ALSO TO REBECCA AND GEORGIA, MAKE AN INCREDIBLE DIFFERENCE IN ADVOCATING AND APPRECIATION TO ALL STAFF AS WELL. NEXT ITEM, PUBLIC COMMENTS.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WE HAVE A HAND RAISED FOR THE ED REPORT. WOULD YOU LIKE TO TAKE THAT COMMENT NOW? SORRY. ALETA DUPREE, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA AND MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION. GOOD TO BE BACK. VERY GOOD REPORT ABOUT THE TRIPS TO SACRAMENTO AND WASHINGTON. THAT'S VERY IMPORTANT. I HAVEN'T BEEN TO SACRAMENTO BUT I HAVE BEEN TO WASHINGTON, D.C. A FEW TIMES SO GETTING THE VOICE OF MTC OUT THERE ON THE NATIONAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SCENE IS ESSENTIAL BECAUSE WHEN I GO TO WASHINGTON, D.C., I RIDE TRAINS AND BUSES ET CETERA, AND THAT'S VERY HELPFUL. GOOD INVESTMENT OF TIME AND MONEY. ALSO CLIPPER I'M LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING THIS EQUIPMENT GETTING DEPLOYED. I DON'T KNOW WHEN I'LL BE ON SMART AGAIN BUT I HAVE BEEN USING CLIPPER SINCE ITS INCEPTION A DOZEN YEARS AGO, AND THE READERS ON THE BUSES AND ESPECIALLY THE ONES ON STANDS AT THE CALTRAIN STATIONS ARE REALLY STARTING TO SHOW THEIR AGE WHERE THE BLACK LETTERING IN THE DARK GREEN SCREEN IS PHASING AWAY, AND YOU GET SOME OF THAT BURN IN SO IT'S KIND OF HARD TO VERIFY THE BALANCES AND YOUR STATUS. SO THAT'S VERY GOOD. WE HAVE GOT TO KEEP ON THAT. BECAUSE I DEPEND ON CLIPPER. SO THANK YOU FOR FUNDING NEW EQUIPMENT. SO, AGAIN. YOU KNOW, I LOVE A GOOD EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT. YOU CAN'T GET ENOUGH OF THEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED, MR. CHAIR. THANK YOU FOR THAT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY, FOR THAT. LET'S PROCEED TO ITEM SEVEN, COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. I DON'T SEE ANY IN THE BOARD ROOMS. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANYONE VIRTUALLY?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND WITH THE CHAIR'S PERMISSION. I JUST WANT TO INFORM THE FULL COMMISSION THAT I WAS ONE OF THE DELEGATES ON THE WASHINGTON, D.C. TRIP, AND I JUST HAVE TO GIVE A HUGE SHOUT OUT TO STAFF, ALIX BOCKELMAN, REBECCA LONG, AND GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN. THEY WERE INCREDIBLE. IT WASN'T JUST THE.

**ALOHA DE GUZMAN:** LOGISTICS OF IT. IT WAS THE BACKGROUNDS, WE'RE SO FORTUNATE TO HAVE FOLKS OF THEIR CALIBER WORKING FOR THE COMMISSION. THAT'S MY TWO CENTS. AND SOME OF US SEEM TO BE LOSING SOMETHING ALONG THE WAY I FOUND I LEFT MY WONDERFUL PACKET SOMEWHERE WITH ALL OF THE NOTES SO I'M NOT HAPPY ABOUT THAT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR JOINING US. I WANT TO WORK WITH STAFF TO PROVIDE A COMPREHENSIVE REPORT TO EXPOSE THE ENTIRE COMMISSION TO THE WORK WE DO. IT IS INSTRUMENTAL TO GO UP THERE AND SPEAK AS A REGION OF ONE VOICE AND THE POWER OF WHAT THAT MEANS WHEN WE ARE HAVING TO MAKE THESE TOUGH DECISIONS IN THE BOARDROOM AND THE CHAMBER. IT'S VERY POSITIVE. THANK YOU FOR PARTICIPATING AND I AM SURE WE CAN RECALL ALL THE NOTES YOU TOOK SO THAT WAY YOU CAN FEEL A LITTLE BIT BETTER. THANK YOU COMMISSIONER.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ONE MORE HAND RAISED, MR. CHAIR. VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YEAH. I ALSO JUST WANT WANTED TO THANK STAFF AND GEORGIA AND REBECCA AND ALIX, IN PARTICULAR. IT WAS JUST A REALLY PRODUCTIVE SET OF MEETINGS IN DC, AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT EMERGED, WHICH I THINK EVERYBODY ON THE COMMISSION IS RESPONSIBLE FOR, AND AS WELL FOR HAVING THE IDEA OF PUTTING TOGETHER OUR, SORT OF, REGIONAL FEDERAL STRATEGY. THAT WAS INCREDIBLY WELL-RECEIVED. EVEN MORE SO THAN I THINK SOME OF US MIGHT HAVE EXPECTED. AND, SO, IT WAS VERY PRODUCTIVE.

**CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** NO ADDITIONAL HANDS ARE RAISED M CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THAT. SO LET'S PROCEED WITH OUR CONSENT CALENDAR, THAT INCLUDES ITEMS 8A THROUGH 8J. KIMBERLY ANY PUBLIC COMMENT WITH OUR CONSENT CALENDAR?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. AT THIS POINT, COMMISSIONERS, I WILL ENTERTAIN A MOTION FOR APPROVAL.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**EDDIE AHN:** AHN MOVES TO APPROVE.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FISSION BY COMMISSIONER AHN?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RONEN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. LET'S PROCEED TO OUR COMMITTEE REPORTS. FIRST IS OUR ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE CHAIRED BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. TAKE IT AWAY.

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GOOD MORNING. THE ADMINISTRATION COMMITTEE MET REMOTELY ON JUNE 8TH AND HAS THE FOLLOWING ITEMS TO REFER

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO THE COMMISSION. ITEM NUMBER ONE IS 9A MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4341 REVISED AND 4342 REVISED. IT MODIFIES AND EXTENDS THE CURRENT MEMORANDUM OF UNDERSTANDING FOR MTC EMPLOYEES SALARY AND BENEFITS EFFECTIVE JULY 1ST, 2022, THROUGH AND INCLUDING JUNE 30TH OF 2023. I MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4341 REVISED AND 4342 REVISED.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER GLOVER. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** DUTRA-VERNACI WILL SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WE HAVE A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. SECOND BY COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI. DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM, KIMBERLY?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. SEEING NOTHING IN CHAMBERS LET'S PROCEED WITH ROLL CALL VOTE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ?

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

**DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? COMMISSIONER SPERING?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THE NEXT ITEM WE HAVE BEFORE YOU IS MTC RESOLUTION 4517 WHICH APPROVES THE 2022/'23 FISCAL YEAR OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET. A SUMMARY THAT THIS AND THE RESOLUTION HAVE BEEN UPDATED AND ADDS ONE ADDITIONAL POSITION AS NOTED IN THE UPDATED SUMMARY SHEET. I WOULD MOVE APPROVAL OF MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4570.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** SPERING WILL SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GLOVER AND SPERING MOTION AND SECOND PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. FIRST BY GLOVER, SECOND BY SPERING. LET'S PROCEED WITH THE ROLL CALL.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AT THIS POINT LET'S PROCEED TO OUR NEXT ITEM. ITEM TEN, THIS IS THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. CHAIRED BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT. TAKE IT AWAY.

**DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THE REPORT OF THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE, MYSELF AND GINA PAPAN ARE VICE CHAIR. WE DID MEET REMOTELY ON JUNE 8TH, 2022, AND TODAY WE REFERRED FOUR ITEMS TOTAL TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THE FIRST ITEM IS AGENDA ITEM TEN A MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBERS 4519, 4202 REVISED, AND 4505 REVISED. PROGRAMS APPROXIMATELY $117 MILLION TO SUPPORT IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN INCLUDING $85 MILLION THROUGH THE ADOPTION OF THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN FUNDING FRAMEWORK AND PROGRAM OF PROJECTS AND AMENDMENT OF OBAG TWO. AND 31.6 MILLION THROUGH THE OBAG THREE PROGRAM. AND I DO MOVE APPROVAL OF NUMBERS 4519, 4202 REVISED, AND 4505 REVISED.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. WE HAVE A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT. DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECONDS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I HEARD GLOVER, I ALSO HEARD ABE-KOGA. FIRST BY RABBIT, SECOND BY GLOVER. KIMBERLY, DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ROLL CALL.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN? IS ABSENT. SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WORTH? IS MUTED.

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GREAT. THE SECOND ITEM AGENDA ITEM 10B MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4522, 4523, 4524, 4525, AND 4526. AND THIS ALLOCATED 412 MILLION IN FISCAL YEARS '22 AND '23 FOR THE TDA, STA, RM2, AND THE A.B. 1107 FUNDS TO FOUR TRANSIT OPERATORS, MTC, AND THE TJPA TO SUPPORT TRANSIT OPERATIONS AND CAPITAL PROJECTS IN THE REGION. AND I MOVE APPROVAL OF NUMBERS 4522, 4523, 4524, 4525, AND 4526.

**GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT. SECOND BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. KIMBERLY, ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SEEING NO DISCUSSION ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. SCHAFF?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**DAVID RABBIT:** NEXT ITEM IS MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 4273 REVISED 4505 REVISED 4520, SEEKS APPROVAL OF PROPOSED $19.6 MILLION FUNDING PLAN TO REPAY MTC'S PORTION. CALTRAIN RIGHT OF WAY FUNDS FRONTED BY SAMTRANS AND I MOVE APPROVAL OF 4273 REVISED 45 WHERE ARE FIVE REVISED AND 4520.

**GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** MOTION AND SECOND. PUBLIC COMMENT?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**SPEAKER:** ALETA DUPREE SHE AND HER FOR THE RECORD. THIS IS VERY IMPORTANT. I'M HOPING THIS IS THE LAST STEP IN BEING ABLE TO FINISH THIS. AS I AM SURE SOME OF YOU HAVE SEEN, THE PROCESS WITH CALTRAIN ABOUT GOVERNANCE HAS BEEN QUITE ACRIMONIOUS AND THIS WILL BE A CHANCE, IT FINALLY SEEMS TO ME TO TIE UP ALL THE LOOSE ENDS SO THAT CALTRAIN WITH MOVE FORWARD WITH MANAGING THEIR RIGHT OF WAY. WHEN MONEY IS OWED, IT'S BEST TO PAY IT. AND WHILE THE ISSUES REGARDING MTC ARE QUITE COMPLEX, THE MATTER IS VERY SIMPLE HERE. I ASK THAT YOU PASS THIS SO THIS WHOLE MATTER OF FINANCE OVER THE RIGHT OF WAY CAN BE PUT BEHIND US AND CALTRAIN CAN FOCUS ON RUNNING THE RAILROAD. I ASK YOUR YES VOTE. THANK YOU

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED IS RICH HEDGES. MR. HEDGES GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**RICHARD HEDGES:** TAKING A MOMENT TO THANK MTC FOR GETTING INVOLVED IN THIS AND HELPING FUND IT THIS HAS BEEN GOING ON FOR SOMETIME AND NOW SAMTRANS HAS NOW SIGNED ON TO IT. THIS IS A LONG-TERM ISSUE THAT HAS BEEN SETTLED, I THINK, WITH ENOUGH, LEE WAY FOR EVERYBODY TO ENJOY IT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU DON'T SEE ANY ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED. I SEE COMMISSIONER LICCARDO HAS A HAND RAISED.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. I PULLED IT BACK DOWN.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. OKAY. NO ADDITIONAL HANDS ARE RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANKS. FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT. SECOND BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN. LET'S PROCEED WITH A ROLL CALL VOTE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

**DAVID CANEPA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI? FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**DAVID RABBIT:** FOURTH AND FINAL AGENDA ITEM TODAY FROM THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBER 4505 REVISED THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT OBAG THREE REVISIONS REVISES 42.2 MILLION FOR SPECIFIC PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS IN THE REGIONAL PROGRAM AND 11.8 MILLION IN THE COUNTY AND LOCAL PROGRAM AND INCLUSION OF 7 MILLION IN ADDITIONAL ANTICIPATED REVENUES AS PART OF THE SAMTRANS CALTRAIN RIGHT OF WAY REPAYMENT ARRANGEMENT THAT WE JUST APPROVED AND I MOVE APPROVAL EVER 4505 REVISED.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** SPERING WILL SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER RABBIT SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SPERING. KIMBERLY, ANY PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED ON THIS ITEM.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SEEING NO OTHER COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION LET'S PROCEED WITH A ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

**DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** YES MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU LET'S PROCEED TO ITEM TEN JOINT MTC PLANNING COMMITTEE WITH THE ABAG ADMINISTRATIVE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMITTEE LEGISLATION JOINT MTC LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE, LICCARDO.

**SAM LICCARDO:** OUR COMMISSION MET JUNE 10TH AND WE'RE HAPPY TO REFER A FEW ITEMS TO THE COMMISSION BILL 2594 ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING WOULD LOWER MAXIMUM PENALTIES REQUIRING PAYMENT PLANS PENALTIES CASH PAYMENT OPTIONS AND MINIMUM CUSTOMER SERVICE HOURS OF OPERATION. WE HAVE POINTS OF DISCUSSION SINCE THE MEETING. REBECCA?

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** MR. CHAIR, THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. I'LL DO AN OPENING COMMENT. THEN HAND IT OVER TO REBECCA.

**SAM LICCARDO:** GREAT.

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. AGAIN, THERESE MCMILLAN, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. AS WAS MENTIONED, JUST WANTED TO NOTE THAT AFTER THE COMMITTEE'S CONSIDERATION OF A.B. 2594, ON JUNE THE 10th, ASSEMBLYMAN TING'S STAFF SHARED ADDITIONAL AMENDMENTS FOR CONSIDERATION. WE HAD A NUMBER OF PRODUCTIVE CONVERSATIONS WITH THIS OFFICE, AND CHAIR PEDROZA AND I ALSO HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING DIRECTLY, AND THAT WAS, WE REALLY THANK HIM FOR THAT OPPORTUNITY. THE FORMAL BILL LANGUAGE WAS AVAILABLE ON MONDAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND WE APOLOGIZE FOR THE JUST WANT IN TIME STAFF HAND OUT THAT WAS PREPARED REGARDING 2594, AND REBECCA CAN PRESENT THAT NOW.

**REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU THERESE. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. REBECCA LONG, MTC ABAG STAFF. AS THERESE MENTIONED THERE IS A HAND OUT IN THIS PACKET THAT REVIEWS SOME ADDITIONAL AMENDMENTS THAT WERE REQUESTED AND STAFF IS STILL RECOMMENDING A SUPPORT IF AMENDED POSITION. WE'RE VERY HAPPY TO SEE THAT, YOU KNOW, MANY OF THE AMENDMENTS THAT BOTH BATA AND THE OTHER TOLL AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF MONTHS WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE ARE NOW INCORPORATED INTO THE BILL BUT THERE WERE A COUPLE OF NEW ITEMS THAT ALSO WERE INCORPORATED. SO THE FIRST OF THOSE IS ACCELERATING THE IMPLEMENTATION DATE OF A PAYMENT PLAN FOR BRIDGES. SO, THE BILL REQUIRES PAYMENT PLANS FOR PENALTIES FOR THOSE WITH AN INCOME AT OUR BELOW 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL. FOR OTHER AGENCY, THE EFFECTIVE DATE OF THAT IS JULY 1, 2024, BUT THE NEW REQUIREMENTS MAKE THAT AVAILABLE AS OF JULY 1, 2023 FOR TOLL BRIDGES. WE HAVE BEEN TALKING TO OUR STAFF. WE THINK THIS IS AN AMBITIOUS BUT ACHIEVABLE DEADLINE BUT IT WILL REQUIRE THAT THE COMMISSION AND THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE DISTRICT QUICKLY SOLIDIFY THE PARAMETERS OF THAT PAYMENT PLAN SO WE CAN START-UP DATING THE CONTRACTS AND THE LIKE. THE SECOND ONE IS ACTUALLY REQUIRING THAT TOLL AGENCIES PROVIDE AN OPPORTUNITY FOR A ONE TIME WAIVER OF PENALTIES FOR HOUSEHOLDS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AT OR BLOT 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL FOR PENALTIES THAT WERE INCURRED DURING COVID AND THROUGH THE END OF THIS YEAR. SO THE DATE WOULD BEGIN MARCH 20TH, 2020, THROUGH THE END OF 2022, AND THE CONDITION FOR THAT WAIVER WOULD BE THAT TOLLS, OUTSTANDING TOLLS ARE PAID UP FRONT. SO IT'S REALLY A COMPLEMENT TO THE PAYMENT PLAN, A ONE TIME WAIVER, AGAIN, JUST OF PENALTIES, IF THE TOLLS ARE PAID UPFRONT. SO, AGAIN, WE THINK THAT THOSE, FROM A POLL PERSPECTIVE, THOSE AMENDMENTS ARE REASONABLE. WE DO HAVE A COUPLE OF TECHNICAL AMENDMENT REQUESTS THAT I'LL JUST WALK THROUGH BRIEFLY AND ARE OUTLINED IN THE HANDOUT. THE FIRST IS TO SET AN EFFECTIVE DATE OF THIS WAIVER TO MATCH THE PAYMENT PLAN DATE. SO THAT IT WOULD TAKE EFFECT JULY 1, 2023, WE ARE PLANNING TO, AS YOU ALL KNOW, YOU KNOW, MOVE AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE ON THIS ELIGIBILITY EFFORT TO START PREQUALIFYING PEOPLE TO BE ELIGIBLE FOR A PAYMENT PLAN AND THIS WAIVER, BUT WE REALLY WANT TO MAKE SURE WE DO THIS RIGHT, THAT WE DON'T HAVE A SYSTEM THAT HAS ERRORS AND OUR CUSTOMER SERVICE FOLKS AREN'T WELL TRAINED SO WE DO THINK THAT JULY 1, 2023, IS A GOOD DATE THAT WILL ALSO PAIR NICELY WITH THE PAYMENT PLAN. AND THEN, WE ALSO THINK IT'S APPROPRIATE FROM A, KIND OF, BUSINESS STANDPOINT, TO SET AN END DATE FOR PEOPLE TO REQUEST THIS ONE TIME WAIVER. SO WE'RE RECOMMENDING, BASICALLY, A 15 MONTH WINDOW FOR PEOPLE TO MAKE THAT REQUEST. WE'RE RECOMMENDING AN END DATE OF SEPTEMBER 30TH, 2024. SO, AGAIN FOR PEOPLE TO SAY, YOU KNOW, I CAN PAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MY TOLLS UP FRONT, MY OUTSTANDING TOLLS, BUT I'M REQUESTING A WAIVER FOR THAT PERIOD THAT ONLY EXTEND THROUGH THE END OF THIS YEAR. SO THOSE ARE THE RECOMMENDED AMENDMENTS. AND I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS. I BELIEVE THAT STAFF FROM ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE IS ALSO HERE, BUT I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU, MAYOR LICCARDO.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. BASED ON THE PRESENTATION AND STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION, I MOVE TO SUPPORT IF AMENDED -- SORRY -- I MOVE A SUPPORT IF AMENDED POSITION ON A.B. 2594.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** SPERING SECONDS.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT FIRST BY VICE CHAIR LICCARDO, SECOND BY COMMISSIONER AHN. MARK, ARE YOU ON ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE?

**MARK CHEKAL:** YES, I AM HERE. THIS MARK FOR ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING. HE COULDN'T BE HERE; HE'S IN COMMITTEE THIS MORNING. FIRST I WANT TO THANK MTC STAFF PARTICULARLY THE OPERATIONS TEAM, THE LEGAL STAFF, AND REBECCA LONG FOR WORKING WITH US TIRELESSLY ON THIS LEGISLATION OVER THE LAST EIGHT MONTHS NOW, INCLUDING ON ZOOM'S PHONE CALLS AND IN-PERSON. I THINK YOU ALL ARE AWARE OF THE SIGNIFICANCE OF MORE THAN FAVOR HUNDRED 50,000 PEOPLE WHO HAVE UNPAID TOLLS ON OUR BATA BRIDGES SINCE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

2020, WE WANT TO AVOID PEOPLE NOT BEING ABLE TO REGISTER CARS, HAVING CARS IMPOUNDED AND UNABLE TO REOBTAIN DRIVER'S LICENSES. AS WE LOOK IN THE AREA OF TOLLING IN THE STATE, IT WAS MOSTLY UNREGULATED NOT JUST OUR BRIDGES BUT OUR TOLL ROADS WE HAVE FOR EXPRESS LANES AND THE TOLL ROADS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTY AND STATE THIS IS NOT JUST ABOUT BRIDGES IT'S ABOUT TOLLING IN PARTICULAR. SO WE APPRECIATE THE WORK. I WANT TO SAY THAT THE MOST IMPORTANT THING, I THINK, FOR REBECCA, WOULD BE THAT WE AGREE TO TAKE THE AMENDMENTS THAT SHE AND THE STAFF ARE RECOMMENDING, WITH THE ENDING THAT, IN TERMS OF THE FINE WAIVERS, THAT WOULD BE EFFECTIVE ON JULY 1ST, 2023, THAT MTC WOULD COMMUNICATE THAT, STARTING SOON, THAT THAT WOULD BE AN OPTION, SO THAT FOLKS WHO END UP PAYING EARLIER THAN 2023 WOULDN'T PAY FINES FOR LOW-INCOME, AND THOSE THAT PAY AFTER WOULD BE PAYING THE FINES. THE SECOND WOULD BE, I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY THAT WE ARE TRYING -- WE WILL BE WORKING WITH MTC, AND ALL AGENCIES TO BE SURE THAT PEOPLE THAT ARE UNDOCUMENTED, WHO ARE LOW-INCOME, DO HAVE THE ABILITY TO ALSO HAVE A PAYMENT PLAN AND HAVE FINES WAIVED, UTILIZING, PROBABLY, THE STATE TAX RETURN -- WHO ARE ABLE TO APPLY, AND WE ENCOURAGE THEM TO APPLY -- [INDISCERNIBLE] TAX RETURN, WHICH IS THE RIGHT THING TO DO AND ALSO IT COMES WITH CREDITS SOMETIMES. AND WE AGREE WITH SUNSETTING THE FINE WAIVERS FOR FINES THAT ARE ASSESSED BETWEEN MARCH OF 2020 AND DECEMBER OF 2022. SO I'M HAPPY TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS ON BEHALF OF ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING, THAT WE VERY MUCH APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR PARTICIPATING. AND I WILL BE SUPPORTING THIS MOTION. I BELIEVE, FOR CLARIFICATION, REBECCA, WOULD WE BE CHANGING IT TO SUPPORT SINCE IT HAS BEEN AMENDED TO CONSENSUS?

**REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA. I WOULD RECOMMEND THAT. WE HAVE WORKED VERY CLOSELY WITH MR. CHEKAL AND HAVE HIS WORD THAT THESE AMENDMENTS ARE GOING TO BE MADE SO I YOU THINK WE CAN TAKE A SUPPORT POSITION ON THE BILL I KNOW THAT WOULD BE APPRECIATED AS ITS GOING TO BE HEARD IN THE SENATE TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE NEXT WEEK.

**SAM LICCARDO:** I'LL MAKE THE MOTION ACCORDINGLY.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER LICCARDO. WE HAVE COMMISSIONERS WHO WISH TO MAKE COMMENTS. I WANT TO THANK ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING HE WAS VERY APPROACHABLE WE HAD GREAT CONVERSATIONS IN LEADERSHIP, AND TRYING TO HOSPITAL AND ALSO RECOGNIZING THE CHALLENGES TO THE ORGANIZATION AND THIS IS MEANINGFUL WORK THIS IS A PROGRESSIVE STEP FORWARD IN A RESPONSIBLE WAY. I WANT TO THANK HIM FOR BEING ABLE TO LISTEN TO OUR CONCERNS AND FINDING A WAY TO MOVE FORWARD WITH OUR BAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AREA REGION. AT THIS POINT I'M GOING TO CALL ON DEREK, OUR CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER AND THEN WE'LL KICKOFF DISCUSSION.

**DEREK HANSEL:** DEREK HANSEL, CHIEF FINANCIAL OFFICER. I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT A COUPLE OF THINGS. WE HAVE BEEN INVOLVED FROM THE FINANCE SIDE PRETTY CLOSELY IN REVIEWING THE LEGISLATION AND THINKING ABOUT ITS FINANCIAL IMPACTS AND ABLE TO KIND OF WORK WITHIN THAT. I THINK IT'S HELPFUL TO REMEMBER THAT, YOU KNOW, AS WE MOVE TO ALL ELECTRIC TOLLING, WHICH WE EVENTUALLY ANTICIPATED DOING, IT HAPPENED WAY QUICKER THAN WE THOUGHT IT WOULD, AND WE HAD ALWAYS ASSUMED, FRANKLY, THAT THERE WAS GOING TO BE A MUCH HIGHER USAGE OF FASTRAK WHEN WE DID THIS. AND A LOT OF WHAT WE'RE SEEING IS -- RELATED TO THE FACT THAT HAD HAPPENED EARLIER AND WE MOVED TO INVOICING IN A MUCH HIGHER DEGREE IN OUR BRIDGE CROSSINGS AND FASTRAK INVOICING. WE ALSO EXPERIENCED A HUGE AMOUNT OF REVENUE LOSS ASSOCIATED WITH THE PANDEMIC NORTH OF $600 MILLION TO DATE ABOUT FIVE YEARS WORTH OF REHAB BUDGET JUST TO PUT INTO CONTEXT. WE'RE REALLY TRYING TO BALANCE THE FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY THAT THIS COMMISSION HAS WITH CUSTOMER RESPONSIVENESS. IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE THAT HISTORICALLY REGISTRATION HOLDS HAVE BEEN AN IMPORTANT MOTIVATOR IN ACHIEVING PAYMENT OF TOLLS. ROUGHLY 42% OF THE VIOLATIONS SENT TO DMV, PREPANDEMIC WERE PAID THROUGH THAT PROCESS. AND, REALLY, AS WE MOVE FORWARD WITH OTHER PLANS, THE KEY QUESTION IS GOING TO BE WHAT HAPPENS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WITH CUSTOMER BEHAVIOR AND REVENUE ASSOCIATED WITH THESE INVOICED TOLLS ONCE WE START THESE, YOU KNOW, RESUMING SENDING VIOLATIONS TO DMV FOR REGISTRATION HOLD, AND INSTITUTING A PAYMENT PLAN. THERE ARE TRADEOFFS IN THESE QUESTIONS. THERE IS GOING TO BE REVENUE THAT'S BROUGHT IN THAT WE'RE NOT CURRENTLY CHECK THING, THAT IS INVOICED TOLLS THAT AREN'T BEING PAID THAT MIGHT WHEN A PAYMENT PLAN EXISTS. BUT THERE ARE ALSO INVOICE TOLLS THAT MIGHT BE PAID THAT COULD BE DEFERRED UNDER SOME VARIANCE OF PAYMENT PLANS. PARTICULARLY IF THOSE PAYMENT PLANS DON'T REQUIREMENT PAYMENT OF TOLLS UP FRONT. SO, YOU KNOW, IN SHORT, WE JUST HAVE TO BE VERY CAREFUL ABOUT THE FINANCIAL EXPOSURE THAT WE SEE WITH THESE PLANS. INCREMENTALISM MAY BE OF SOME VALUE HERE IN TERMS OF BEING ABLE TO EXPERIMENT, SEE WHAT HAPPENS, AND MAKING FEWER ASSUMPTIONS AS TO WHAT THAT BEHAVIOR MAY BE, AND ITS CORRESPONDING FINANCIAL CONSEQUENCES FOR THE AGENCY. THANKS.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, DEREK, FOR THAT, KIND OF, FISCAL PERSPECTIVE. AT THIS POINT LET'S PROCEED WITH COMMISSIONER COMMENTS AND QUESTIONS. SEEING NONE IN THE BOARDROOM. KIMBERLY?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THROUGH THE CHAIR, AND THANK YOU, MR. CHECKLE FOR BEING HERE WITH US. I'M CURIOUS -- AND THIS MAY BE A QUESTION FOR OUR STAFF -- DID OUR -- DOES OUR NEW PROGRAM MIRROR THIS LEGISLATION?

**REBECCA LONG:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. YOU KNOW, OUR NEW PROGRAM HASN'T, AS FAR AS 100% LANDED BUT IT DOES MIRROR WITH RESPECT TO ELIGIBILITY. WE HAVE RECOMMENDED THAT IT APPLY TO HOUSEHOLDS WITH INCOME AT OR BELOW THE 200% OF THE FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL SO THAT CRITICAL PIECE DOES MIRROR THE LEGISLATION.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND REBECCA, PERHAPS IT WOULD BE ASKED ANOTHER WAY, WHAT'S DIFFERENT ABOUT OUR PROGRAM RELATIVE TO ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S BILL?

**REBECCA LONG:** WE HAD NOT CONTEMPLATED THE WAIVER SO THAT IS A NEW CONCEPT. AGAIN, THE WAIVER REQUIREMENT AS PROPOSED HERE REQUIRES TOLLS TO BE PAID UP FRONT AND THEN THE PENALTIES WOULD BE WAIVER SO THAT'S NEW. I WOULD DEFER TO OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO SEE IF SHE HAS ANY ADDITIONAL COMPONENTS OF WHAT'S CONTEMPLATED IN OUR OWN EQUITY PLAN?

**THERESE MCMILLAN:** I ECHO REBECCA'S HIGH POINTS. WE HAD PRESENTED ON THE BATA O COMMITTEE SOME DISCUSSION OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RETHINKING AND RECALIBRATING THE STAFF HAD DONE ON THE PAYMENT PLAN THAT WE HAD RECOMMENDED A MEANS BASED APPROACH. AND THAT THE QUALIFYING THRESHOLD BE THE 200% OF FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL. AND JUST AS A REMINDER, THAT WASN'T JUST PULLED OUT OF THIN AIR. IT WAS IMPORTANT TO KNOW THAT WE HAD ALREADY ADOPTED THAT THRESHOLD FOR OUR LOW-INCOME TRANSIT RIDERS WITH RESPECT TO CLIPPER START. IT ALSO ALLOWED US TO BUILD ON A PLATFORM OF BEING ABLE TO SECURE -- TO DETERMINE ELIGIBILITY, AS QUICKLY AS POSSIBLE. ONE OF THE REASONS THAT CLIPPER START HAS BEEN HELPFUL TO THIS AGENCY IS THAT WE'RE ABLE TO MANAGE ALL OF THE CRITICAL ISSUES RELATED TO PII. AND SO, THAT, AGAIN, WAS A VERY IN DEPTH DISCUSSION THAT WE HAD ON WEDNESDAY AT BATA O, AND THAT FOLLOWED LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE CONSIDERATION, TING ALREADY HAD THE 200% FEDERAL POVERTY LEVEL SET OF AMENDMENTS THAT CARRIED OVER. THAT I WOULD SAY COVERED THE CRITICAL CORE AROUND WHICH WE CAN BUILD OUR PROGRAM. AND, AGAIN, WE WERE VERY APPRECIATIVE OF ASSEMBLYMAN TING AND HAS STAFF, MARK, HERE, HELPING US TO CLARIFY HOW WE COULD ALIGN THINKING THAT WE HAVE WITH WHAT HE WAS CONSIDERING IN THE STATE LEG.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THE REASON I ASK THE QUESTION IS THAT I -- MR. CHEKAL WAS THAT WE AND OTHER MEMBERS OF THE BOARD HAVE BEEN VERY INTERESTED IN ACTUALLY WHAT YOU'RE EXACTLY TALKING ABOUT. THE DIFFERENCE IS THAT I AND A FEW OTHERS HAVE HAD A CONCERN THAT OUR APPROACH MAY NOT BE EVIDENCE-BASED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RELATIVE TO GETTING PEOPLE LONG-TERM, ESPECIALLY LOW-INCOME FOLKS TO BE ABLE TO HAVE THE ABLE TO PAY BACK THEIR, YOU KNOW, TO PAY BACK DEBT, AND ALSO TO TAKE ANOTHER LOOK AT HOW WE DETERMINE DEBT. I WAS CURIOUS AS TO WHETHER OUR STAFF WAS MIRRORING WHAT YOU ALL WERE PUTTING FORWARD AS A METHOD OF ALIGNMENT AND THAT'S WHAT PROMPTED THE QUESTION. MR. CHEKAL, I HAVE A QUESTION FOR YOU, AS YOU WERE WORKING ON THIS BILL, DID AGENCIES ACROSS THE STATE RAISE CONCERNS ABOUT BOND CAPACITY, AND BOND HOLDERS AND HOW DO YOU FEEL LIKE YOU'RE ADDRESSING THAT ISSUE IN YOUR BILL?

**MARK CHEKAL:** TO YOUR FIRST QUESTION, I WANT TO SAY THAT REBECCA AND MTC STAFF HAVE REALLY INFORMED HOW WE HAVE WRITTEN THIS BILL. I HAVE TO BE HONEST ABOUT THAT. BECAUSE THIS ALL HAPPENED VERY QUICKLY, AND I I THINK MORE QUICKLY THAN MTC REALLY HAD PLANNED IN HAVING WORKED FOR LARGE STATE AGENCIES. AND YOU SEE, I KNOW HOW SOMETIMES THAT'S HARD. BUTTERY REALLY NEEDED TO DO IT. BECAUSE GOVERNOR NEWSOM GOT RID OF THE TOLL TAKERS IN MARCH 2021, SO WE COULDN'T WAIT ANY LONGER. AND, SO, I THINK THAT THIS IS GOING TO CHANGE OPERATIONS AMONG TOLLING AGENCIES AROUND THE STATE. SO I THINK THAT MTC SHOULD BE PROUD, REALLY, ABOUT HOW WE'RE IMPACTING, PARTICULARLY, SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA -- WELL, NOT JUST SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA, OUR EXPRESS LANES HERE. BUT THE QUESTION ON CAPACITY IS A VERY REAL ONE. AS COMMISSIONER WORTH HAS ACTUALLY EXPLAINED TO ME A

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BIT ABOUT HOW EXPRESS LANES ARE FUNDED ARE OFTEN BANKS THAT LEND MONEY TO BUILD THESE LANES AND IN THEIR FINANCE MODELS, THEY INCLUDE PENALTIES AND FINES AS PART OF PAYING BACK THE DEBT, WHETHER IT BE A BOND OR A BANK LOAN. AND, SO, BECAUSE OF THAT, WE'RE NOT THRILLED ABOUT IT, BUT WE ARE CAPPING FINES AT AN AMOUNT THAT IS, I YOU THINK IT'S $60 FOR A CERTAIN NUMBER OF DAYS, AND $100 AFTER MORE. WHICH ISN'T GOING TO BE WHAT MTC CHARGES, HOWEVER, SOME OF OUR SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA AGENCIES AND EVEN HERE IN THE BAY AREA, ALAMEDA COUNTY, CHARGE VERY HIGH FINES IF YOU HAVE -- USE A TOLL LANE WITHOUT A TRANSPONDER. AND, SO, TO BE -- TO RECOGNIZE THAT THEY DO HAVE FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS, WE'RE SETTING THESE FINES HIGHER THAN, CERTAINLY, I KNOW THAT SOME OF THE ADVOCATES FOR POOR PEOPLE ARE COMFORTABLE WITH. AND I THINK, HONESTLY, GIVEN THE FINANCE MODELS THOSE AGENCIES HAVE, THERE IS REALLY NO OTHER WAY TO DO IT THAN TO DO THAT. DOES THAT ANSWER YOUR QUESTION?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** IT'S VERY HELPFUL AND I HAVE TO SAY THAT I AM OF THE MIND THAT THERE IS PROBABLY MORE FLEXIBILITY THAT'S STILL VERY PROTECTIVE OF ALL OF THESE AGENCIES. AND, YOU KNOW, RECOGNIZE THAT WE NEED TO START SOMEWHERE. AND, REALLY APPRECIATE THE LEADERSHIP OF ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING. I WOULD ALSO JUST ASK THAT OUR STAFF PERHAPS SHARE THE RESEARCH THEY DID LOOKING AT BEST PRACTICES FOR REPAYMENT. BECAUSE I THINK IT'S -- THE STRUCTURE OF THIS DOESN'T NECESSARILY MIRROR BEST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PRACTICE, AND I THINK THERE WOULD BE VALUE IN YOU SEEING, NOT NECESSARILY FOR THIS BILL, BUT FOR FUTURE ITERATIONS. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. CHAIR SPERING THEN COMMISSIONER WORTH

**JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. MARK THANK YOU FOR BEING HERE, AND APPRECIATE ALL THE GOOD WORK OF ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING. THIS IS NEW TERRITORY FOR ALL OF US AND I THINK THERE IS GOING TO BE LESSONS LEARNED AS WE GO ALONG. ARE YOU GOING TO BE RECEPTIVE OF CLEAN UP LANGUAGE AS WE GO THROUGH THIS PROCESS?

**MARK CHEKAL:** ABSOLUTELY. AND IN FACT WE DID COMMIT, ALREADY, TO YOUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND STAFF THAT WE WOULD DEFINITELY DO CLEAN UP LANGUAGE. I DON'T THINK THIS WILL BE THE LAST YEAR WE HAVE LEGISLATION ON TOLLS. AND SO I THINK BOTH OUR MEMBER AND MY COWORKER, TANYA, IN ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE, ARE COMMITTED TO CONTINUING AS WE LEARN. AND AS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ -- I THINK IT WAS -- SAID, THIS IS NEW, WE DON'T HAVE BEST PRACTICES IN SOME OF THESE AREAS. LUCKILY WE HAVE THE CLIPPER START PROGRAM, WHICH I DIDN'T KNOW ABOUT UNTIL THIS BILL AND THAT HELPED INFORM US ON THAT, FOR EXAMPLE. SO, YES, I THINK WE WILL SEE PROBABLY MORE LEGISLATION IN THE YEAR.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. LASTLY, I THINK TO THANK OUR STAFF AND THERESE AND REBECCA. THIS HAS BEEN A DIFFICULT PROCESS WE'RE GOING THROUGH. AND THE COMMISSION HAS TO KEEP FOREMOST IN OUR MIND THAT WE HAVE TO PROTECT THE REVENUE STREAM TO MEET DEBT SERVICE AND MAINTAIN THESE BRIDGES IT AFFECTS MILLIONS OF PEOPLE. I THINK WE HAVE FOUND AN AREA THAT WE HAVE MOVE FORWARD. I THINK IT'S A RESPONSIBLE WAY. AND MTC IS RECOGNIZING THE NEEDS OF LOW AND VERY LOW-INCOME POPULATION IN THE REGION. AND WE NEED TO DO WHAT WE CAN TO HELP RELIEVE SOME OF THAT. BUT PROTECTING THE REVENUE STREAM FOR THE BRIDGES ARE A NUMBER ONE PRIORITY WHICH AFFECTS JUST ABOUT EVERYBODY IN THE BAY AREA. SO, THANKS STAFF. GOOD JOB. AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING'S OFFICE, I THINK THIS IS A GOOD FIRST STEP. AND I SUPPORT THE MOTION.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU. I ALSO WANT TO ADD MY THANKS TO ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING AND MARK CHEKAL FOR WORKING SO CLOSELY WITH OUR COMMISSION, OUR STAFF. YOU KNOW, AGAIN, THANK REBECCA LONG, AND ANDREW FREMIER'S TEAM, AND THERESE ON THIS. BECAUSE THIS IS REALLY VERY FORWARD THINKING LEGISLATION. AND WHAT IT DOES -- AND I THINK ONE OF THE REASONS IT'S SO IMPORTANT IS, IT IS STATEWIDE LEGISLATION AND IT REALLY ADDRESSES ISSUES

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ABOUT EXPRESS LANES IN OUR VALUED CUSTOMERS, PARTICULARLY OUR CUSTOMERS THAT ARE AT RISK FINANCIALLY, AND IT IS A VERY IMPORTANT STEP. AND I APPRECIATE THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER'S UNDERSTANDING OF THE FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF HAVING TO BALANCE, HAVING TO BALANCE OUR IMPORTANT EQUITY PROGRAMS AND OUTREACH WITH THE FISCAL RESPONSIBILITY OF THE FIDUCIARY RESPONSIBILITY OF THESE TOLL OPERATIONS. AND I THINK IT'S ALSO, LOOKING FORWARD, IT'S A VERY GOOD WAKE UP CALL FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA TO RECOGNIZE THE CHALLENGE OF FINANCING TRANSPORTATION INVESTMENTS THROUGH TOLLS. AND I THINK THAT THE WORK THAT THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER IS DOING IN BRINGING THIS TO THE FOREFRONT IS REALLY IMPORTANT. AND, ALSO, APPRECIATE THE PARTNERSHIP WITH THE TOLL AGENCIES AROUND THE STATE TO RECOGNIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF THIS BILL AND WORKING COLLABORATIVELY TO DEVELOP A PROGRAM, I THINK, TO COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ'S POINT, TOO, I THINK AS WE MOVE FORWARD -- AND WE REALLY ARE ON THE FRONT END, CUTTING EDGE OF THESE ISSUES, BECAUSE OUR TOLL OPERATIONS IN THE BAY AND IN CALIFORNIA ARE SO MUCH LARGER THAN OTHER STATES AROUND THE COUNTRY. AND, SO, IT'S A REAL IMPORTANT EFFORT. AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT, AS WE MOVE FORWARD, TO MAKE SURE THAT WE HAVE THE RESOURCES TO DO THE EVIDENCE BASED ANALYSIS OF THE PROGRAMS AS WE MOVE FORWARD. AND, AS YOU KNOW, FROM OUR MEETING LAST WEEK AT BATA OVERSIGHT, WE DISCUSSED IN DETAIL, OUR PLANS FOR DEVELOPING OUR EQUITY PROGRAMS AND MAKING SURE THAT OUR CUSTOMERS WHO ARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AT THE MOST FINANCIAL RISK ARE ABLE TO BE SUPPORTED BY OUR ORGANIZATION. SO, I THINK THAT POINT OF EVIDENCE BASED, WE REALLY ARE CREATING THIS NEW HORIZON IN TERMS IT OF EQUITY AND TOLLING. BUT I REALLY DO THINK, AND AM VERY GRATEFUL FOR THE ASSEMBLYMEMBER AND HIS STAFF WHO ARE WORKING SO CLOSELY WITH OUR STAFF. AND THIS PROCESS. THERE IS -- THIS IS -- THESE ISSUES ARE ITERATIVE. WE START WITH A LEGISLATIVE SESSION, AND I THINK IT'S A GREAT ACHIEVEMENT, AND IT'S VERY IMPORTANT TO GET THIS BILL PASSED. SO, I AM, AGAIN, APPRECIATIVE OF EVERYONE EFFORTS WORKING TOGETHER TO FIND A BILL THAT WILL PASS AND THAT WILL SUPPORT OUR EFFORTS IN TERMS OF EQUITY WITHIN THE BAY AREA, TOO. AND WE HAVE ANOTHER -- WE HAVE AN ITEM LATER ON, A BATA AGENDA WHICH TALKS ABOUT REDUCING THE FINES AND FEES ON ALL OF OUR EXPRESS LANES THROUGHOUT THE REGION. SO I THINK THAT'S AN IMPORTANT INDICATION OF NEXT STEPS OF CONTINUING TO MOVE FORWARD IN THIS ARENA. SO, THANK YOU, AGAIN.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. BACK TO COMMISSIONER LICCARDO THEN WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. I JUST WANTED TO ECHO THE THANKS TO MARK AND FOR ASSEMBLYMEMBER TING FOR THEIR HARD WORK. I HAVE AN UNSTABLE INTERNET CONNECTION BUT THANKS EVERYONE FOR THE HARD WORK AND MAKING THIS HAPPEN.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** KIMBERLY, PUBLIC COMMENT?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I HAVE RECEIVING NOTHING IN WRITING MR. CHAIR. AND I SEE ALETA DUPREE'S HAND RAISED. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA. ALETA DUPREE, FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. THIS IS REASONABLE. IT'S NOT PERFECT, BUT IT'S REASONABLE. THERE IS STILL MORE CLEAN UP LANGUAGE THAT WE NEED TO DO. I HOPE THAT WE HAVE STRIKE A BALANCE ON THIS. ONE THING THEY SEE MISSING FROM THE CONVERSATION IS INTEREST RATES. IT DOESN'T SAY ANYTHING ABOUT INTEREST RATES THAT COULD BE CHARGED. BECAUSE MOST DEBT REQUIRES PAYMENT OF INTEREST. SO THAT HAS TO BE ADDRESSED. HOW MUCH WILL THE RATES BE SET AT. AND OVERALL, IT LOOKS LIKE WHAT WE'RE DOING AT BATA AND WHAT THE STATE BILL IS ASKING IS VERY SIMILAR. AND IT LOOKS LIKE WE, AT BATA, ARE REALLY, ALREADY AHEAD OF THE GAME WITH THE STATE BILL. WE DO HAVE A NETWORK OF HUNDREDS OF CASH PAYMENT LOCATIONS AROUND THE STATE. I THINK IN NOT ALL 50 -- NOT ALL 58 COUNTIES, BUT VERY CLOSE. SO WE'RE ALREADY DOING SOME THINGS. AND, REALLY, WE WANT TO INCENTIVIZE PEOPLE PAYING THE TOLL. WE WANT THE TOLL MONEY. THAT'S WHAT WE PREDICATE OUR BUSINESS ON. AND I THINK THAT WE WILL RECOVER, WHEN ALL IS SAID AND DONE, WITH WHATEVER MONEY COMES IN. THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TOLL EQUIVALENT OF WHAT IS DUE US. IT WILL COME IN A MIX OF DIFFERENT TYPES OF PAYMENTS, BUT WE'LL RECOVER THE TOLL MONEY IN ITS AGGREGATE, WHEN ALL IS SAID AND DONE, I BELIEVE. THIS IS IMPORTANT WORK. IT SETS A REASONABLE 200% POVERTY LEVEL THRESHOLD. IT'S CONSISTENT DOING GOOD WITH PII KEEPING PEOPLE'S DATA SECURE. IT'S NOT PERFECT, BUT WE'LL KEEP WORKING ON IT AND I THINK IT DESERVES A YES VOTE. THANKS.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I SEE ADDITIONAL RAISED HANDS M CHAIR.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU ALETA FOR PARTICIPATING. I ASSURE YOU THERE IS NO INTEREST RATE CHARGE OR THERE WILL BE NO INTEREST RATE CHARGE ON THE PAYMENT PLANS AND I SEE OUR CFO NODDING TO THAT EFFECT. THANK YOU. WITH NO FURTHER DISCUSSION. WE HAD A MOTION AND SECOND THAT WAS A MODIFIED MOTION TO SUPPORT GIVEN THAT WE HAVE REACHED CONSENSUS ON THIS BILL. AT THIS POINT WITH NO FURTHER DISCUSSION. LET'S PROCEEDS WITH THE ROLL CALL VOTE

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YEP.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA?

**DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI? COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY? IS.

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**SAM LICCARDO:** ALL RIGHT. SHALL I MOVE TO ITEM 11B. POTENTIAL REVENUE OPTIONS FOR HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION. THAT DISCUSSES OF COURSE NEXT STEPS IN PURSUIT OF REGIONAL HOUSING BOND AND AUTHORIZATION OF A FUTURE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. IDENTIFICATION BY THE TRANSPORTATION FUNDING OPPORTUNITIES. I MOVE THAT THE COMMISSION ASSIGN RESPONSIBILITY FOR OVERSEEING NEXT STEPS OF THE CONVERSATION ABOUT A NEW TRANSPORTATION REVENUE SOURCES INCLUDING DISCUSSION ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A FUTURE REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION MEASURE TO THE MTC PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE AND THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY VICE CHAIR LICCARDO. DO WE HAVE A SECOND?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** SPERING WILL SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SPERING. COMMISSIONERS, ANY DIALOGUE OR QUESTIONS? I WOULD JUST SAY IN OUR BUDGET VISITS IN SACRAMENTO THE TOPIC ABOUT REGIONAL MEASURES DID COME UP IN OUR STATE DELEGATION. I THINK THIS IS THE RIGHT STEP FOR US TO TAKE. ALL RIGHT, KIMBERLY, PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YES. WE HAVE SEVERAL HANDS RAISED. AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING FOR THIS ITEM. THE FIRST SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN, FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES. MS. LEVIN, ARE YOU THERE?

**ADINA LEVIN:** YES. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. MY NAME IS ADINA LEVIN. I SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, AND CHAIR KINMAN REPORTED HOW OUR GROUP VOTED TO SUPPORT THIS MOVING FORWARD. ALSO, WITH A -- REPRESENTING FRIENDS OF CALTRAIN, AS A GROUP PARTICIPATING IN THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION, WE ARE EXTREMELY SUPPORTIVE AND ENCOURAGING OF THE MTC PICKING THIS HELP YOU, AND MOVING IT FORWARD FOR AUTHORIZING TO PURSUE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AUTHORIZING LEGISLATION FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FUNDING. AS THE COMMISSION KNOWS, THE TRANSIT AGENCIES WILL BE FACING FISCAL CLIFFS IN THE COMING YEAR AS THE FEDERAL RELIEF FUNDING COMES BACK AND TRANSIT RIDERSHIP IS REGROWING MORE GRADUALLY, AND THERE ARE UNDERLYING NEEDS FOR FUNDING FOR FREQUENT SERVICE AND INTEGRATED AND AFFORDABLE FARES. WE ARE GLAD TO SEE MTC TALKING ABOUT A MULTI-STAKEHOLDER PROCESS IN WHICH COMMUNITY GROUPS AND LABOR GROUPS WILL BE INTERESTED IN PARTICIPATING IN, INTERESTED IN THE EXPLORATION OF MULTIPLE FUNDING MECHANISMS INCLUDING PROGRESSIVE FUNDING. I'M ALSO GLAD TO SEE MTC TAKING THE LEAD IN PURSUING BRIDGE FUNDING, IF A TRANSPORTATION FUNDING MEASURE NEEDS TO HAPPEN LATER ON, WE NEED TO MAKE SURE TO CONTINUE AND CONNECT AND COORDINATE AND MAKE AFFORDABLE AND ACCESSIBLE OUR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND A STRONGLY SUPPORT THIS ITEM. THANK YOU.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS VINAY PIMPLE. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**VINAY PIMPLE:** I AM ALSO WITH THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL COUNCIL AND I SUPPORT WHAT ADINA SAID ABOUT THE TRANSPORTATION MEASURE. BUT I ALSO WANT TO TALK ABOUT THE HOUSING MEASURE. IT'S A HUGE BOND. AND WHAT I'M CONCERNED ABOUT AS I ONLY HEAR

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FOLKS TALKING ABOUT WE'LL SEE HOW IT GOES, I DO NOT SEE ANY DISCUSSION ABOUT THE INTEREST RATE AND WHAT IT'S LIKELY TO BE TWO YEARS FROM NOW. INTEREST RATES ARE GOING UP VERY SHARPLY, AND I HAVE PUT GRAPHS AND COMMENTS WHICH SHOW THE INTEREST RATE, WHICH FOR EXAMPLE, IS AROUND 8% TWO THIRDS OF THE MONEY RAISED WOULD GO TO PAYING THE INTEREST RATES. ALMOST 2-THIRDS. SO IT WOULD ALIGN THE POCKETS OF THE BIG BANK MEASURE I DON'T THINK ANYMORE US WANT TO SEE THAT. I HOPE YOU FACTOR THAT IN. THE OTHER THING I WOULD LIKE TO SEE WITH HOUSING IS TREAT HOME OWNERSHIP -- YOU KNOW, EXTEND AFFORDABLE HOUSING TO HOME OWNERSHIP, AS WELL. BECAUSE A LOT OF WHAT I SEE HAPPENING, IN CITIES LIKE MINE, A LOW-INCOME CITY, LIKE RICHMOND, WHERE WE COULD HAVE AFFORDABLE HOME OWNERSHIP, IS THAT BECAUSE OF NEIGHBOR CONCERNS, ET CETERA, THE ONLY HIGH DENSITY HOUSING THAT IS BUILT IS 1500 SQUARE FOOT CON DISPOSE TOWN -- CONDOS AND TOWN HOMES. IF WE PRIORITIZED AFFORDABLE HOME OWNERSHIP IN THE SAME WAY THAT WE PRIORITIZE AFFORDABLE RENTAL HOUSING I THINK IT COULD LEAD TO A LOT OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION. IT SEEMS WE HAD A LOT THAT WAS ENTITLED FOR 9,000 HOUSING UNITS. WE COULD NOT FIND A SINGLE HOUSING DEVELOPER TO BUY IT. IT WAS SOLD TO A WAREHOUSE DEVELOPER.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS EFFREN CARRILLO.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS. EFFREN CARRILLO, HOUSING DEVELOPMENT WITH HOUSING THAT WE ARE A NON-PROFIT AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPER WORKING IN SONOMA, NAPA, DOING MULTI-FAMILY AS WELL AS HOME OWNERSHIP DEVELOPMENTS. WE SUPPORT THE NEXT STEPS TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IN 2024. WE RECOGNIZE THE HOUSING CRISIS IS REAL. RENTS CONTINUE TO SPIKE COST OF LIVING IS EXTRAORDINARY AND WORKING CLASS FAMILIES, SENIORS AND FARM WORKERS ARE FORCED OUT OF OUR COMMUNITIES AND IN SOME CASES HOMELESSNESS. AS SOMEONE WHO GREW UP IN HABITAT FOR HUMANITY HOME WITH THREE YOUNG CHILDREN, RECOGNIZING THE CRISIS. WE'RE PART OF THE COALITION COMMITTED TO PURSUING A BALLOT ON THE MEASURE ENSURING SUCCESS OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING OPPORTUNITIES. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONTINUED LEADERSHIP IN THE HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION CLIMATE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS AMY THOMPSON.

**SPEAKER:** AMY THOMPSON, TRANSPORTATION POLICY ANALYST WITH THE TRANSFORM COORDINATOR ON THE VOICES FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. I WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR MOVING FORWARD IN EXPLORING ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR A TRANSPORTATION REGIONAL FUNDING MEASURE WE STRONGLY SUPPORT A PROGRESSIVE FUNDING SOURCE AS WELL AS ADDITIONAL SOLUTIONS TO SUPPORT TRANSIT AGENCIES AND NOT REACHING THEIR FISCAL CLIFFS I APPRECIATE THE ADVOCACY AT THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STATE LEVEL TO SECURE BRIDGE FUNDING AND I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT STAFF'S PRESENTATION ON THIS MATTER THAT REALLY ARTICULATED TRANSIT AGENCIES NEED FOR OPERATIONS FUNDING. THIS WILL SUPPORT FREQUENT AND RELIABLE TRANSIT SERVICE, WHICH IS REALLY THE BACKBONE INFRASTRUCTURE OF THIS REGION. AND INTEGRAL TO MAKING THE BAY AREA AN AFFORDABLE PLACE TO LIVE AND TRAVEL. AT TRANSFORM WE'RE ALSO IN STRONG SUPPORT OF A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE TO ADVANCE THIS GOAL P THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR WORK TODAY.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAR IS EVENTS SVH.

**SPEAKER:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF THIS IS MATTHEW READ DIRECTOR OF POLICY FROM SILICON VALLEY AT HOME. WE ARE HERE IN SUPPORT OF THIS RECOMMENDATION. AS MANY OF YOU KNOW, THIS HAS BEEN A VERY, VERY HIGH PRIORITY REGIONALLY. OUR ORGANIZATION WAS ACTIVELY INVOLVED AT THE CENTER OF THE CASA PROCESS AND THIS REGIONAL BOND WAS REALLY THE GLUE THAT TIED THE VISION TOGETHER AND SO IT'S VERY EXCITING THAT IT'S MOVING FORWARD BUT IT'S ALSO ESSENTIAL AND WE APPRECIATE YOUR SUPPORT. THIS IS GOING TO HAVE A TREMENDOUS IMPACT HERE IN THE SOUTH BAY. I WON'T GO THROUGH THE DETAILS. EVERYBODY KNOWS HOUSING NEEDS ARE DIRE. IMPORTANTLY WE SEE THIS AS A CRITICAL WAY OF REALLY OPERATIONALIZING THE SUCCESS OF BOTH THE TRANSIT ORIENTED COMMUNITIES POLICY THAT WE'LL BE LOOKING AT AS WELL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AS THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE HOUSING ELEMENT UPDATES THAT ARE CURRENTLY UNDERWAY. WITHOUT THE RESOURCES, WE CAN'T BUILD THE HOUSING IF WE'RE NOT BUILDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, WE'RE NOT RESPONDING TO THE NEED. SO WE ARE COMMITTED TO THIS EFFORT AS IT MOVES THROUGH YOUR PROCESS. BUT MOST IMPORTANTLY, WE ARE STRONGLY COMMITTED TO WORKING TO MAKE SURE THAT THERE IS SUPPORT WHEN THIS COMES TO THE BALLOT. WE ARE A MEMBER OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION, BAHA, WE'RE PLEASED TO BE WORKING AT A REGIONAL LEVEL ON THIS. HOUSING CRISIS IS A REGIONAL CRISIS AND THIS IS A TREMENDOUS FOR US TO RESPOND. THANK YOU.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS GENAE AUBREY. THESE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

**SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING MY NAME IS GENAE AUBREY I'M A SENIOR POLICY MEMBERS, WE'RE AN ORGANIZATION WITH THOUSANDS OF MEMBERS INCLUDING AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPERS AND HOUSING ADVOCATES ALSO A LEADING MEMBER OF BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION. WE DESPERATELY NEED MORE FUNDING AND RESOURCES TO PROVIDE RELIEF FOR BAY AREA RESIDENCES WHO ARE EXPERIENCING HOUSING DISPLACEMENT AND AT RISK FOR HOMELESSNESS. WE BELIEVABILITY THAT A REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE WOULD ADDRESS OUR REGION'S HOUSING AFFORDABILITY CRISIS AT THE HEART OF THE ISSUE. THAT'S WHY WE'RE COMMITTED TO PURSUING THIS REGIONAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HOUSING MEASURE. WE BELIEVE WE CAN ACHIEVE A FUTURE WHERE EVERYONE HAS A SAFE PLACE TO CALL HOME.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS SANGEETA.

**SPEAKER:** HI MY NAME IS SANGEETA AN ORGANIZER WITH SAVE THE BAY. SAVE THE BAY IS PART OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL BAHA COALITION AND WE SUPPORT DIRECTING RELEVANT COMMITTEES AND STAFF TO PREPARE PURSUING REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURES IN 2024 WE BELIEVE THAT A REGIONAL BALLOT MEASURE WILL HELP BUILD CLIMATE RESILIENCE IN THE BAY AREA CURRENTLY HIGH HOUSING COST AND LACK OF SUPPLY HAS RESULTED IN MASS DISPLACEMENT WHICH AFFECTS WORKING CLASS COMMUNITIES OF COLOR DUE TO LACK OF AFFORDABLE DENSE TRANSIT ORIENTED HOUSING THESE DISPLACED COMMUNITIES ARE FORCED TO DRIVE LONG DISTANCES TO REACH THEIR JOBS SO PRODUCING AND PRESERVING MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT AREAS AND PROTECTING LOW-INCOME RESIDENTS OF THESE AREAS FROM DISPLACEMENT WILL BE CRUCIAL CLIMATE ADAPTATIONS FOR THE REGION. SAVE THE BAY SUPPORTS NEXT STEPS OF DIRECTING RELEVANT COMMITTEES AND STAFF TO PROCEED TO PURSUE A 10 TO $20 BILLION REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE IN NOVEMBER OF 2024. THANK YOU.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS JUSTINE MARCUS. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**SPEAKER:** HI. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS JUSTINE MARCUS AND I'M A STALE LOCAL POLICY DIRECTOR WITH ENTERPRISE COMMUNITY PARTNERS WE ARE PART OF THE BAY AREA HOUSING FOR ALL COALITION AND I WOULD LIKE TO ASSOCIATE MYSELF WITH MANY OF THE COMMENTS THAT HAVE BEEN MADE BY MY FELLOW COALITION MEMBERS TODAY. WE ARE IN STRONG SUPPORT OF STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND WANT TO CONTINUE TO EXPRESS OUR ENTHUSIASM AND OUR COMMITMENT AS YOUR PARTNER TO PURSUING A 2024 REGIONAL HOUSING MEASURE. WE KNOW THE NEED IS GREAT TO MEET THE NEEDS OF OUR CONSTITUENTS AROUND THE REGION AND AS LOCAL JURISDICTIONS STEP UP TO MEET THEIR NEW REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION OBLIGATION, THE FINANCIAL RESOURCES THAT WILL NEED TO BE BROUGHT TO BEAR TO MEET THOSE GOALS IS SIGNIFICANT. CONSISTENTLY DEMONSTRATING THAT BAY AREA RESIDENTS ARE SEEING HOMELESSNESS AND HOUSING AS THE TOP CONCERNS FOR OUR REGION, AND WE ARE OPTIMISTIC THAT WILL CREATE A PATH TO SUCCESS AT THE BALLOT IN 2024. WE WOULD LIKE TO RECOGNIZE THAT WHILE OUR FOCUS IS HOUSING, THERE IS SIGNIFICANT FUNDING NEEDS FACING TRANSIT OPERATORS AND WE'RE GLAD TO SEE THAT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION INCLUDES ADDRESSING THESE CHALLENGES AS WELL THROUGH ADDITIONAL ACTION. WE LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO PARTNER WITH YOU TO MAKE THIS EFFORT A SUCCESS AND BRING MUCH NEEDED RESOURCES TO SERVE BAY AREA RESIDENTS MOST ACUTELY IMPACTED BY OUR HOUSING AND HOMELESSNESS CRISIS. THANK YOU

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS KRISTINE FITZGERALD. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

**KRISTINE FITZGERALD:** GOOD MORNING EVERYONE COMMUNITY ADVOCATE WITH SILICON VALLEY INDEPENDENT LIVING CENTER. I SUPPORT THE COMMENTS I ASK THAT WE ALSO CONSIDER LOOKING AT ACCESSIBLE AFFORDABLE HOUSING ALSO MAKING SURE THAT THERE IS AN OPPORTUNITY FOR HOME OWNERSHIP FOR FOLKS WITH DISABILITY WHO ARE ALSO LOW-INCOME. EQUITY IS THERE IN OWNING A HOME, RATHER THAN RENTING. THIS SHOULD NOT BE FORGOTTEN. SO MANY OF US HAVE TO DEAL WITH LOW PRIORITY RATES AS IT IS. THERE SHOULD ALSO BE AN OPPORTUNITY TO ELEVATE OUR STANDING AND OUR ABILITY BY HAVING HOME OWNERSHIP, AS WELL. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS JEN KLOSE.

**SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS AND STAFF MY NAME IS JEN KLOSE, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR FROM HOUSING IN THE NORTH BAY WHERE WE SEE MORE AFFORDABLE AND MORE DIVERSE HOUSING ARE A PART OF THE BAY AREA. WE SUPPORT THE STAFF RECOMMENDATION HOUSING AFFORDABILITY. IN SONOMA COUNTY, LATINOS ARE TEN TIMES MORE LIKELY THAN WHITES TO LIVE IN OVERCROWDED HOUSEHOLDS AND THIS DROVE THE PANDEMIC DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACT. THE CRISIS IS THREATENING THE FUTURE OF OUR NORTH BAY WORKFORCE. JUST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LISTENING TO THE KIDS, 96% OF THE STUDENTS IN SANTA ROSA CALL AFFORDABLE HOUSING THE NUMBER ONE COMMUNITY CONCERN. AND THOSE LOCAL STUDENTS AT ALL INCOME LEVELS REPORT UNCERTAINTY ABOUT THEIR ABILITY TO AFFORD HOUSING AND FACE HOMELESSNESS AND WILL BE FORCED TO CONSIDER RELOCATING. IN THE NORTH BAY POPULATION IS AGING AND YOUNG WORKING AGE FOLKS IS DRAMATICALLY DECREASING. THANK YOU FOR YOUR LEADERSHIP ON HOUSING AND RELATED TO TRANSPORTATION MEASURES THAT TOGETHER CAN BE PART OF A STRONG CLIMATE ACTION PLAN. THANKS.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED.

**SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS ANNE OLIVIA, AND I AM ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL AND THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. SO MANY OF THE SENTIMENTS THAT I WANTED TO SAY TODAY WERE STATED BY OTHER MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE I'M GLAD TO SEE SHOWING UP. I'M NOT GOING TO REPEAT THEM. I WANT TO STRESS THE IMPORTANCE OF A ROBUST STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT PROCESS AND REALLY ENCOURAGE THIS BODY TO INCREASE ENGAGEMENT OF LOW AND VERY LOW-INCOME INDIVIDUALS, INDIVIDUALS WHO LIVE IN THEIR INDIVIDUAL VEHICLES, AND OTHER FOLKS WHO MAY NOT BE ABLE TO LEAVE THEIR CARS FOR A VARIETY OF REASONS WHEN WE LOOK AT WHAT TRANSPORTATION SOLUTIONS LOOK LIKE. AND FROM A PURPOSE PERSPECTIVE MANY OF US ARE GETTING PRICED OUT OF THE BAY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HAVING TO COMMUTE FURTHER AND FURTHER FROM OUR JOBS. WHAT WE DO IS IMPORTANT. AND WE'RE LOSING THE ABLE TO LIVE HERE. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE MY PERSONAL ENTHUSIASTIC SUPPORT FOR THIS, AND THANK YOU FOR THE TIME.

**CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. THE NEXT SPEAKER IS RALEIGH KATZ, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

**SPEAKER:** GOOD MORNING, COMMISSIONERS, ROLLIE KATZ, ASSOCIATION FOR PUBLIC EMPLOYEES A LABOR UNION THAT REPORTS THE MAJORITY OF MARIN COUNTY EMPLOYEES WE ADVOCATE BUILDING MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND WE APPRECIATE YOUR EFFORTS AND SUPPORT YOUR ACTIONS.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. RICH HEDGES.

**RICHARD HEDGES:** I'M SUPPORTIVE OF ALL THE POSITIVE READINGS ON THIS AS WELL AS RAISING FUNDS THROUGH BONDS AND TAX MEASURES TO DO WHAT WE NEED TO DO HERE IN THE REGION. I WOULD SAY TO SAY I AGREE WITH ANNE OLIVIA, FOR SOMEONE LIKE MYSELF WHO HAS DONE THREE TAX MEASURES OF THE POSITIVE SIDE FOR THE CITY OF SAN MATEO AND RAISED THE MONEY TO FUND THEM IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE A BROAD BASED GROUP THAT WILL BE OUT THERE PUSHING THIS BUT ALSO WE HAVE TO KEEP IN MIND THAT 2024 IS THE BEST TIME TO DO IT DURING THE PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION BUT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO KEEP IN VIEW WHAT'S HAPPENING WITH THE ECONOMY. RIGHT NOW IT WOULD BE VERY ENDANGERED TO RUN THIS BECAUSE OF PEOPLE'S SHRINKING 401(K)S AND THE PRESSURE OF INFLATION. SO HOPEFULLY OF THE ECONOMY WILL TURN UP BY THE TIME WE'RE READY TO RUN THIS. IF NOT, WE NEED TO LOOK AT IT VERY CAREFULLY, BECAUSE WE DON'T WANT TO LOSE T THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

**CLERK, FRED CASTRO:** THANK YOU. AND I SEE GEN KLOSE HAS HER HAND RAISED AGAIN.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SINCE SHE ALREADY PARTICIPATED, I THINK THERE WILL BE OTHER OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUBLIC COMMENT.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THEN WITH THAT, MR. CHAIR. NO ADDITIONAL HANDS ARE RAISED FROM THE ATTENDEE LIST. HOWEVER I DO SEE COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ'S HAND IS RAISED.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LET'S GO BACK TO THE COMMISSION. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ, GO AHEAD.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANTED TO JUST ASK, DO WE ALREADY HAVE A -- SOMEBODY WHO IS GOING TO CARRY THE BILL?

**REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** GO AHEAD.

**REBECCA LONG:** THANKS COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ. WE DO NOT. WE HAVE QUITE A BIT OF WORK TO DO THIS FALL TO IDENTIFY THE SCOPE OF THE BILL, REVENUE MECHANISMS, EXPENDITURES, ALL OF THAT, SO THAT'S THE WORK WE'RE GOING TO BE DOING, AGAIN, OVER THE FALL, AND THEN BRINGING TO OUR JOINT LEG COMMITTEE TO GET APPROVAL TO ACTUALLY PURSUE A BILL NEXT YEAR, AND THEN SOMETIME IN THAT WINDOW IS WHEN WE WOULD START REACHING OUT TO OUR DELEGATION TO FIND AN AUTHOR.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** SO IF I'M -- I'M LOOKING AT OUR LEGISLATIVE PACKET TODAY IT REALLY IS TO -- THE ONLY ACTIONS YOU'RE ASKING FOR IS THE ABLE TO DO POLLING AND GROUNDWORK?

**REBECCA LONG:** THAT'S CORRECT, AND TO REFER THAT, KIND OF, OVERSIGHT OF THIS EFFORT TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE, REALLY, TO THINK ABOUT BRIDGE FUNDING. YOU KNOW, BETWEEN NOW AND A REGIONAL MEASURE, AS WELL AS THINK ABOUT THE EXPENDITURE PLAN, AND THEN TO THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE TO OVERSEE THE ENABLING LEGISLATION DISCUSSION.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. THEN JUST ONE LAST QUESTION COULD YOU TALK A BIT ABOUT WHAT BRIDGE FUNDING IS? I READ THE PACKET BUT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT SOUNDED DIFFERENT AS I WAS LISTENING TO SOME OF THE SPEAKERS SO I WANTED TO MAKE SURE I UNDERSTOOD IT.

**REBECCA LONG:** ABSOLUTELY. AND I WANT TO CLARIFY WE'RE NOT TALKING ABOUT FUNDING FOR BRIDGES. I KNOW WHEN I STARTED CARRYING THAT --

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** WRONG ITEM. [LAUGHTER]

**REBECCA LONG:** THE IDEA THERE IS IDENTIFYING WHATEVER FUNDING SOURCE WE MIGHT BE ABLE TO ATTRACT INCLUDING POTENTIALLY STATE BUDGET RESOURCES NEXT YEAR. THIS YEAR THE LEGISLATURE WAS VERY CLEAR THEY WERE NOT OPEN TO OPERATING FUNDING BEING PART OF THE SURPLUS WITH THE GAN LIMIT IT'S MUCH EASIER FOR THEM TO SPEND ON INFRASTRUCTURE BUT THERE IS REAL AWARENESS ABOUT COVID RELIEF FUNDING BEING SENT DOWN MAY NEXT YEAR THEY'LL BE MORE SUPPORTIVE AND OPPORTUNITY LOOKING AT OTHER FUND THAT WE MIGHT BE AVAILABLE FOR ASSISTING WITH OPERATING THOSE ARE TWO PRIMARY OPPORTUNITIES.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** COULD YOU SAY MORE ABOUT THE USE OF FUNDS? THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

**REBECCA LONG:** MY UNDERSTANDING IS CONVERSATION BY MUCH OF THE PUBLIC COMMENT AND WHAT WE HAVE BEEN THINKING ABOUT IN TERMS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF BRIDGE FUNDING IS FOCUSED ON TRANSIT OPERATING FUNDING. A RECOGNITION THAT WITHOUT SOME ADDITIONAL FUNDING IN THE NEXT SEVERAL YEARS MANY OPERATORS ARE GOING TO BE FACED WITH DIFFICULT DECISIONS AS IT RELATES TO NEEDING TO CUT SERVICE, ET CETERA. SO THE BRIDGE FUND THAT'S NEEDED IS GOING TO BE FOCUSED ON TRANSIT OPERATIONS.

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND PART OF IT AND AGAIN A LITTLE BIT OF MY CONFUSION MAYBE I HEARD SOMETHING, MAYBE THE BRIDGE FUNDING THAT THERE WAS NEED FOR BOTH ON THE HOUSING SIDE AND TRANSIT SIDE AS WE'RE LOOKING AT PROGRAMMING. BUT I UNDERSTAND. THANKS FOR CLEARING THAT UP REBECCA. I APPRECIATE THAT.

**REBECCA LONG:** YOU'RE WELCOME.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I WANT TO GO BACK TO PUBLIC COMMENT. WE HAVE SAY BOARD MEMBER IN THE ROOM THAT WISHES TO MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT. JAYNE?

**SPEAKER:** JAYNE KRAEMER, HOUSING. IT COMES OVER TO ME THAT YOU HAVE KIND OF GOT BLINKERS ON IN TERMS OF WHERE YOUR FOCUS OF PERCEPTION IS. YOU SEEM TO THINK THERE IS ONLY ONE WAY TO GET HOUSING BUILT. IT SEEMS TO ME, AT LEAST WHAT I READ IN THE NEWSPAPERS, THAT CONSTRUCTION PERSONS, AT LEAST IN ALAMEDA AND OAKLAND, ARE FULLY EMPLOYED, AND YET WE STILL HAVE AN OVERFLOW

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF NEED OF HOUSING, ESPECIALLY AFFORDABLE HOUSING. NOW, WHY CAN'T PEOPLE WHO LIVE IN APARTMENTS REFURBISH THOSE APARTMENTS WITH THE UNDERSTANDING THAT WHEN THEY GET THROUGH, THEY HAVE THE 50 OPTION TO STAY THERE WHY CAN'T WE ALSO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THOSE GROUPS OF PERSONS WHO HAVE EXPERIMENTED SUCCESSFULLY WITH SMALL GROUPS OF PEOPLE LEARNING HOW TO BUILD THEIR OWN LITTLE NEIGHBORHOOD. I UNDERSTAND THERE IS A CONFLICT BETWEEN THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY AND THE REST OF US, BUT THERE HAS GOT TO BE SOME MEETING GROUND. THERE HAS GOT TO BE SOME TALK THAT GOES BACK AND FORTH AS WE COME UP WITH ALTERNATIVE IS BECAUSE WE HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE STILL ON THE STREET NO MATTER HOW MUCH YOU ALLOCATE TO THE CONSTRUCTION INDUSTRY, AND THE DIATRIBE.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU FOR THE CONVERSATION. I WANT TO SAY, THIS ITEM REFLECTS THAT WE'RE PRIORITIZING HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION AND RECOGNIZING AND ACKNOWLEDGE THERE IS A ROBUST COALITION THAT IS RALLYING AROUND THE NEED FOR HOUSING AND RECOGNIZING THE CRISIS. PRESIDENT ARREGUIN HAS SHOWN GREAT LEADERSHIP IN THAT SPACE. THIS IS A FIRST STEP TO HAVE THOSE CONVERSATIONS TO ADDRESS THE QUESTIONS THAT COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ WAS ASKING VERY DIRECTLY. WE NEED TO CREATE THE PLATFORMS AND OPPORTUNITIES TO HAVE THE CONVERSATION THAT'S WHAT THIS ITEM DOES. SAME WITH TRANSPORTATION. WE ARE NOT WALKING BACK FROM THE FULL DISCUSSIONS WE HAD AT THE TASK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FORCE, BUT WE NEED TO CREATE OPPORTUNITIES TO HAVE THE DISCUSSIONS WITH THE OPERATORS, AND ADVOCATES. I WILL BE SUPPORTING THIS, AND I THANK STAFF FOR CREATING OPPORTUNITY TO BE LEADING IN THESE CRITICAL AREAS. I'M GOING TO GO BACK TO COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA.

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU CHAIR. I AM SUPPORTIVE OF THE MOTION. ONE QUESTION. I WAS LOOKING AT THE PRESENTATION THAT WAS ATTACHED. PAGE THREE IT TALKS ABOUT POLLING THAT WAS DONE IN MENTION OF THE SALES TAX FOR TRANSPORTATION. ARE WE PLANNING TO EXPLORE OTHER TYPES OF REVENUE MEASURES IN ADDITION TO JUST A SALES TAX INITIATIVE?

**REBECCA LONG:** THROUGH THE CHAIR?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**REBECCA LONG:** COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA, THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. YES, WE DEFINITELY ARE. ONE OF THE THINGS THAT IS TRICKY IN TERMS OF POLLING RIGHT NOW IS VOTER ATTITUDE, AS YOU CAN SEE IN THE FIRST BULLET OF THE PRESENTATION IT'S REALLY SOUR UNDERSTANDABLY ON THE ECONOMY, MAJOR CONCERNS ABOUT INFLATION. SO ANY REVENUE POLLING MEASURE WE WOULD NOT EXPECT TO REALLY EXCEED MUCH BEYOND 55%. SO WE'RE NOT ANTICIPATING THAT ANY MECHANISM IS GOING TO GET YOU ABOVE THE TWO THIRDS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THRESHOLD. I THINK WE'RE GOING TO BE TALKING TO OUR POLLSTER ABOUT WHETHER IT'S STILL MEANINGFUL TO ENGAGE RELATIVE PREFERENCE OF DIFFERENT REVENUE MEASURE OPTIONS. AND WE'LL BE TALKING TO KEY STAKEHOLDERS ABOUT WHO THOSE MIGHT BE, BUT DEFINITELY SALES TAX WON'T BE THE ONLY ITEM WE'RE LOOKING AT.

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** I THINK IT WAS VICE CHAIR LICCARDO AND COMMISSIONER SPERING THAT MADE THE MOTION. AT THIS POINT LET'S PROCEED WITH THE ROLL CALL VOTE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CHAIR PEDROZA?

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN?

**EDDIE AHN:** YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

**DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

**CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CONNOLY?

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** FLEMING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

**GINA PAPAN:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. ITEM 11C IS ASSEMBLY BILL 2011 FROM ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS, AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND HIGH ROAD ACT OF 2022, STREAMLINES CERTAIN AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT IN UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL SITES. ELIGIBILITY FOR STREAMLINING SUBJECT TO AFFORDABILITY, LOCATION, OBJECTIVE DESIGN AND LABOR STANDARDS. THE JOINT MTC ABAG LEGISLATION COMMITTEE DID NOT HAVE A QUORUM ON THIS ITEM IT'S NOT A DIRECT REFERRAL THE COMMISSION DIDN'T TAKE ACTION. I WOULD LIKE TO INVITE STAFF TO GIVE AN OVERVIEW OF THE BILL, STAFF RECOMMENDATION, AND I ALSO WANT TO THANK CHAIR WICKS AND THEIR STAFF FOR THEIR OPENNESS TO SUGGESTIONS ON AMENDMENTS. GEORGIA?

**GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** THANK YOU VICE CHAIR LICCARDO. I'M HOPING WE CAN BRING UP OUR PRESENTATION ON THIS ITEM. THANK YOU SO MUCH. PROVIDING HIGH-LEVEL CONTEXT, A.B. 2011 IS A COMPLEMENT TO THE PREVIOUS ITEM, ONE PIECE OF THE PUZZLE TO ADDRESS THE HOUSING AFFORDABLE CRISIS AND 2011 SEEKS TO BRING IN OTHER COMPONENTS OF THE HOUSING PRODUCTION PUZZLE. THE BILL WOULD EXPAND THE VIABILITY OF BUILDING AFFORDABLE UNITS BY OPENING UP MORE LAND OUTSIDE OF ESTABLISHED NEIGHBORHOODS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND IMPORTANTLY PAIRED WITH COMPROMISING ON STRONG LABOR PROMOTIONS THAT ARE TIED. THERE HAVE BEEN HUGE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BARRIERS FOR HOUSING PRODUCTION BILLS FOR YEARS SO THIS 2011 IS WIDELY SEEN AS A VEHICLE FOR BARGAINING TO GET MORE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION WITH STRONG LABOR STANDARDS THAT CAN HELP CREATE A SUSTAINED GOOD PAYING JOBS FOR THE HOUSING WORK. THE COMMISSION HAS SIGNIFICANT POTENTIAL TO ADVANCE OTHER MTC POLICY GOALS INCLUDING GOALS AROUND CLIMATE. THEN CAN WE SWITCH TO THE -- GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'LL START WALKING THROUGH. THIS IS A COMPLEX BILL SO I WANT TO WALK THROUGH A PRESENTATION AND BE AS EXPEDITIOUS AS POSSIBLE. WE ALL KNOW AND WE HAVE HEARD MANY EXAMPLES OF HOW CALIFORNIA IS FACING A HOUSING CRISIS THAT'S PARTICULARLY ACUTE IN THE BAY AREA I WANT TO CALL YOUR ATTENTION TO SOME STATS ON HERE THAT REALLY DEMONSTRATE HOW MUCH THE HOUSING CRISIS HAS BEEN EXACERBATED BY THE COVID-19 PANDEMIC. SO 50% OF BAY AREA RENTERS ARE NOW RENT DRIVEN, AND LESS -- ONLY A QUARTER OF BAY AREA HOUSEHOLDS CAN AFFORD A HOME THAT'S A SIGNIFICANT DROP SINCE THE BEGINNING OF THE PANDEMIC THIS IS A MISMATCH BETWEEN SUPPLY AND DEMAND AND THE STATE HAS IDENTIFIED THROUGH OUR REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS DETERMINATION IN COMING YEARS THE BAY AREA WOULD NEED TO AT ANOTHER 400,000 UNITS AT MINIMUM TO ADDRESS THE MISMATCH. THE PANDEMIC HAS ACCELERATED SHIFT TOWARD E-COMMERCE AND TELEWORK EMBRACING THE IDEA REIMAGINING UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL SPACE CAN TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THIS OPPORTUNITY. MANY CITIES IN THE BAY AREA HAVE BEEN LEADERS ON THAT FRONT. THE DEVELOPMENT POTENTIAL OF THIS IS ENORMOUS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ESTIMATES RANGE, THERE IS QUITE A LARGE RANGE BUT ONE COMPREHENSIVE ANALYSIS FROM URBAN FOOTPRINT IS OPENING UP COMMERCIAL SITES FOR HOUSING COULD RESULT IN ADDITIONAL 2 MILLION FEASIBLE UNITS ACROSS THE STATE AND 80% OF THE STATE'S HOUSING SHORTAGE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] THERE IS POTENTIAL IN THIS SPACE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE TYPE OF TARGETED INFILL DEVELOPMENT AROUND REIMAGINING COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS ACHIEVES MULTIPLE POLICY GOALS THAT ALIGN WITH THE RANGE OF MTC'S GOALS AND ABAG'S GOALS AS IDENTIFIED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050. SO WE DON'T NEED TO DIG INTO ALL OF THESE BUT JUST REALLY HIGH-LEVEL. INFILL DEVELOPMENT CAN HELP COMBAT CLIMATE CHANGE, SUPPORT ECONOMIC REVITALIZATION AND OF COURSE ADDRESS THE HOUSING CRISIS AND HOUSING AFFORDABILITY CHALLENGE IN THE BAY AREA THESE ARE ALL POLICIES THAT ARE EMBEDDED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 IN THE BAY AREA'S LONG RANGE PLAN. ALSO, IN THE MTC AND ABAG 2022 JOINT ADVOCACY PROGRAM, THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND THE COMMISSION GENERALLY SUPPORTED HOUSING PRODUCTION AND SPECIFICALLY SUPPORTED PROPOSALS TO AUTHORIZE HOUSING AS A PERMITTED USE IN CERTAIN COMMERCIAL ZONES SUBJECT TO LOCAL APPROVAL BUT WITHOUT REQUIRING ZONING CHANGES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M GOING TO DIG INTO WHAT A.B. 2011 DOES. A.B. 2011 WOULD PROVIDE THAT IF A HOUSING PROJECT MEETS CERTAIN STANDARDS RELATED TO LABOR, AFFORDABILITY, SITE LOCATION AND DENSITY THAT A DEVELOPER MAY BUILD ON A COMMERCIAL SPACE WITHOUT DAMAGE USE PERMIT OR REZONING REQUIRED AND WITHOUT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DISCRETIONARY REVIEW. CERTAIN PROJECTS WOULD BE DEEMED A USE BY RIGHT AND SUBJECT TO A STREAMLINED ADMINISTERIAL REVIEW. THE NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. UP FRONT, NOTE THAT SINCE THIS PRESENTATION WAS PUT TOGETHER AND THAT THIS BILL WAS PRESENTED TO THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE IN JUNE, THE -- WE HAVE WORKED WITH THE AUTHOR AND CITIES HAVE WORKED WITH THE AUTHOR AND THERE HAVE BEEN NUMEROUS AGREEMENTS THAT REQUIRE UPDATES TO THIS SLIDE. IN GENERAL THE BILL WOULD PROVIDE THAT THERE ARE TWO TRACKS OR SETS OF CRITERIA THAT WOULD BE REQUIRED FOR MIXED INCOME PROJECTS IS THOSE ARE LISTED ON THE RIGHT OF THE SLIDE AND THEN 100% AFFORDABLE PROJECTS WOULD GO THROUGH A DIFFERENT TRACK TO QUALIFY FOR STREAMLINING. IN GENERAL, A GOOD DELINEATION IS THE THRESHOLD IS QUITE A BIT HIGHER FOR, FOR PROFIT DEVELOPERS TO QUALIFY FOR STREAMLINING THAN IT IS FOR THOSE A LOT HARD TORE FINANCE 100% AFFORDABLE PROJECTS. I'M GOING TO FOCUS ON THE LEFT IF A FOR PROFIT DEVELOPER WANTED TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF A.B. 2011 STREAMLINING A WHOLE RANGE OF CRITERIA REQUIRED TO BE MET FIRST A DEVELOPER WOULD BE REQUIRED TO COMMIT TO AT LEAST MINIMUM 15 UNITS WOULD BE DEED RESTRICTED AFFORDABLE UNITS FOR 55 YEARS AND THIS MINIMUM IS EITHER 15% OR IF A LOCATE HAS HIGHER THRESHOLD FOR INCLUSIONARY ZONING THAT THE HIGHER THRESHOLD WOULD APPLY. ON THE LOCATION SIDE THIS IS WHERE THERE HAS BEEN SOME SIGNIFICANT CHANGES IN THE BILL. WHAT THE BILL WOULD REQUIRE IS THAT ON -- A PROJECT MUST BE LOCATED ON A COMMERCIAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CORRIDOR WHICH IS TYPICALLY A 4 TO 6 LANE ROAD AND ON AN URBAN INFILL SITE THAT IS ZONED FOR RETAIL OFFICE OR PARKING EXCEPT IF A SITE IS WITHIN A SPECIFIC AREA PLAN THE SITE MUST ALLOW FOR RESIDENTIAL. SO, THE USE BY RIGHT COMPONENT OF THE BILL WOULD NOT APPLY TO A SITE THAT IS NOT -- YOU KNOW, IN A SPECIFIC AREA PLAN SITE. WHAT THE BILL WAS RECENTLY AMENDED TO DO WAS EXPAND THIS AND ALLOW LOCALS TO CHOOSE ON WHICH SITES WITHIN A COMMERCIAL CORRIDOR TO PERMIT HOUSING. IT ALLOWS A.B. 2011 STREAMLINING WOULD ALLOW HOUSING WHERE IT'S ALLOW IN AN AREA COVERED BY A SPECIFIC PLAN, BY AN AREA PLAN, PRECISE PLAN OR MASTER PLAN. THE OTHER EXEMPTION IN HERE THAT'S IMPORTANT, AND THERE HAVE BEEN NUMEROUS CITIES THAT HAVE WORKED WITH WICK'S OFFICE IS SPECIFICALLY EXEMPTS INDUSTRIAL LAND FROM A.B. 2011 STREAMLINING IN RESPONSE FROM NUMEROUS BAY AREA CITIES IS THE BILL DOESN'T GO FAR ENOUGH TO PROTECT JOBS FOR INDUSTRIAL AREAS. THE BILL IS WORKING ON REFINEMENTS. BUT THE EXISTING AMENDMENTS NEED THE INDUSTRIAL EXEMPTION STRONGER. THE LAST PIECE IS SPECIFICS OR PROJECT CHARACTERISTIC THAT A PROJECT MUST COMPLY WITH THAT ARE RELATED TO SPECIFIC DESIGN -- OBJECTIVE DESIGN STANDARDS, DENSITY, HIKE, ET CETERA. THERE'S A LIST OF THEM THAT ARE LISTED IN ATTACHMENT B, BUT IN SHORT, A MIXED INCOME PROJECT WOULD HAVE TO BE THREE STORIES NO HIGHER, MEDIUM DENSITY PROJECT AND WOULD ALLOW FOR RESIDENTIAL OR MIXED USE. ANOTHER ITEM IS HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS WOULD STILL BE REQUIRED TO MEET LOCAL OBJECTIVE PLANNING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STANDARDS AND COMPLY WITH DESIGN REVIEW PROCESS SO LONG AS THEY DON'T CONFLICT WITH PROVISIONS IN THE BILL, OR PRECLUDE THE DEVELOPMENT OF HOUSING. THIS COMPONENT OF THE BILL WAS ALSO RECENTLY AMENDED TO ADDRESS THE CONCERN THAT COMMISSIONER PAPAN HAD RAISED AT THE COMMITTEE MEETING. SO THERE IS NOW A CLEAR REQUIREMENT THAT A FIRST FLOOR RETAIL REQUIREMENT IS AN OBJECTIVE PLANNING STANDARD THAT'S PROTECTED AND THAT WOULD NEED TO BE FOLLOWED UNDER A BILL. SO, AGAIN, IF A DEVELOPER IS COMING IN AND WANTS TO BUILD AN AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT THAT MEETS ALL THIS CRITERIA AND THE CITY SAYS YOU KNOW, WE ARE REQUIRING THAT THE FIRST FLOOR IS RETAIL AND THE OTHER FLOORS CAN ARE AFFORDABLE HOUSING THE DEVELOPER WOULD HAVE TO COMPLY WITH THE FIRST FLOOR RETAIL REQUIREMENT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I THINK THIS IS HELP IN THAT A.B. 2011 ALSO CONDITIONS STREAMLINING ON, SORT OF, A WHOLE HOST OF OTHER LOCATION FACTORS THAT ARE INTENDED TO TARGET DEVELOPMENT TO INFILL AREAS THAT ARE ACTUALLY SUITABLE FOR DEVELOPMENT. SO, FIRST, IT NARROWS ELIGIBILITY TO URBANIZED AREAS AND THEN SECOND INCLUDING A WHOLE HOST OF EXCLUSIONARY AREAS THAT ARE ENVIRONMENTAL SENSITIVE. THE MAP ON THE RIGHT IS HELPFUL TO VISUALIZE THE EXTENT OF THE GEOGRAPHIES, THE GRAY ON THE MAP AND THE GEOGRAPHIES THAT ARE EXCLUDED UNDER THE BILL WHITE AND PURPLE AREAS ON THE MAP. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. I'M GOING TO SKIP THESE, THIS SLIDE, AND THEN THE NEXT ONE WALKS THROUGH SCENARIOS THAT WE CAN COME BACK TO IF THERE ARE QUESTIONS:

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NEXT SLIDE. ALTHOUGH A.B. 2011 IS WRITTEN WOULD OPEN UP MORE LAND FOR DEVELOPMENT WHICH AGAIN IS A POLICY THAT MTC AND ABAG HAVE BOTH SUPPORTED, IT'S MTC HAD IDENTIFIED A NUMBER OF AMENDMENTS THAT COULD IMPROVE THE BILL AND ALIGN IT MORE WITH A LOT OF THE ONGOING HOUSING PLANNING WORK THAT'S HAPPENING IN BAY AREA JURISDICTIONS. SO, THIS SLIDE HERE SHOWS THE AMENDMENTS THAT WE RECOMMEND. THE FIRST IS THAT WE HAD PROPOSED THAT THE BILL CREATE A NEXUS BETWEEN PROJECT STREAMLINING AND RHNA PERFORMANCE BY ALLOWING MINISTERIAL PROJECT APPROVALS THAT ARE IN THE INTEREST OF EXPENSE BUT ARE NOT KEEPING PACE WITH THEIR RHNA GOALS. ALLOWING LOCALITY TO HAVE AN OPTION TO COME IN ON THEIR OWN BUT IF IT'S NOT KEEPING PACE WITH RHNA THEN THE DEVELOPMENT COULD BE STREAMLINED EVEN FURTHER AND COME IN FASTER TO MEET OUR MINIMUM RHNA GOAL. THE SECOND AMENDMENT IS SOMETHING THAT WE HAVE BEEN TALKING A LOT ABOUT, SO THIS IS THE IDEA THAT WE TALKED AT THE JUNE COMMITTEE ABOUT SUPPORTING SUPPORTING LOCAL PLANNING IN COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS WHERE LOCAL GOVERNMENTS HAVE ALREADY REZONED TO ACCOMMODATE INFILL RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT. THE IDEA TO EXPAND THE PROVISION TO ALLOW LOCAL JURISDICTIONS TO CHOOSE THE AREA WHERE THERE THEY HAVE DONE A LOT OF ZONING WORK IS PLANNING WORK THAT ONLY IN AREAS THAT HAVE BEEN IDENTIFIED FOR SOCIAL FOR RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT SHOULD BE SUBJECT TO A.B. 2011 AND WE'RE PLEASED THAT THE ASSEMBLYMEMBERS AND STAFF HAVE LISTENED TO THE SUGGESTION AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HAVE SIGNIFICANTLY EXPANDED THE LOCAL PLANNING EXCEPTION TO INCLUDE AS I HAD WALKED THROUGH EARLIER A WHOLE RANGE OF TYPES OF LOCAL PLANS THAT DON'T MEET THE STATUTORY THRESHOLD OF A SPECIFIC AREA PLAN SO THAT IS GREAT AND STAFF REALLY FEELS LIKE WHAT THE COMMITTEE HAS ALREADY DONE IS IN LINED WITH THE INTENT OF THIS AMENDMENT. GREAT NEWS. WE HOPE TO CONTINUE WORKING WITH THE AUTHOR'S OFFICE TO REFINE EVEN MORE TO ACCOUNT FOR SOME OF THE REZONING THAT'S ONGOING THAT'S NOT PART OF ONE OF THOSE IDENTIFIED PLANS IN THE BILL RIGHT NOW. THIRD WE ARE RECOMMENDING THAT THE BILL INCLUDE THAT LOCAL GOVERNMENTS RECEIVE CREDIT IN THEIR HOUSING CYCLE FOR COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT AND RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT WE'RE MAKING SURE THAT WE ADDRESS BOTH THE TIMING ISSUE WITH, SORT OF, THE OVERLAP OF ONGOING HOUSING ELEMENT CYCLE WORK AND THE FACT THAT THE BILL IS HAPPENING WHILE THAT WORK IS ONGOING ONE ISSUE WE NEED TO ADDRESS THEN THE TECHNICAL ISSUE THAT HCD HAS BEEN PRETTY STRINGENT ON WHAT HOUSING COUNTS AS MEETING THE REALISTIC DEVELOPMENT CAPACITY STANDARDS SO WE WOULD LIKE TO WORK WITH THE AUTHOR ON PROVIDING DIRECTION TO HCD THAT WHERE LOCALS HAVE DONE THAT REZONING WORK THAT THAT REZONING WORK IN COMMERCIAL CORRIDORS SHOULD MEET THE HIGH THRESHOLD ON REDEVELOPMENT CAPACITY. THOSE ARE THE AMENDMENTS WE'RE PROPOSING AND RECOMMENDING A SUPPORT IF AMENDED POSITION AND THE DIFFERENCE IS THAT WE WOULD RECOMMEND SUPPORT IF AMENDED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WITH AMENDMENTS 1 AND 3, BECAUSE WE -- STAFF ANALYSIS IS THAT TWO HAS ALREADY BEEN REFLECTED INTO THE BILL.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU GEORGIA. VICE CHAIR LICCARDO, I'LL TURN IT BACK TO YOU FOR A MOTION.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. WITH THAT I WOULD MAKE A MOTION TO SUPPORT IF AMENDED.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** FIRST BY VICE CHAIR LICCARDO.

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** SECOND.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** SECOND BY COMMISSIONER SCHAFF. AT THIS POINT, LET'S GO TO COMMISSIONER COMMENTS. COMMISSIONER PAPAN THEN COMMISSIONER CONNOLY.

**GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. AND THANK YOU, GEORGIA FOR CONTINUING TO WORK WITH THE AUTHOR. I AM STILL UNCOMFORTABLE WITH THE LEGISLATION. LOVE, OF COURSE, AMENDMENT NUMBER THREE. BECAUSE THAT'S HELPFUL. WE ARE ALL TRYING TO DO EXACTLY THIS. WE ARE EMBRACING, TRANSFORMING, REIMAGINING UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES. THIS IS BEING DONE, EVEN NOW, IN JURISDICTIONS THROUGHOUT MY REGION. THE CONCERN -- THE PRIMARY CONCERN IS THE LACK OF -- OR JUST, KIND OF, THIS BY USE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BECAUSE YOU'RE DOING AWAY WITH CEQA. YOU'RE DOING -- IT REALLY CONFLICTS WITH A LOT OF OTHER PROPOSALS WE HAVE IN PLANNED BAY AREA HERE. IS THAT IS SPECIFICALLY FOR JURISDICTIONS LIKE MINE. ACCESS TO TRANSIT, A COMMERCIAL BALANCE. MOST OF MY JURISDICTION IS HOUSING JOBS IMBALANCE NOW. AND WE'RE TRYING TO BE SUSTAINABLE. IT BECOMES DIFFICULT WHEN A DEVELOPER COMES IN AND SAYS HEY THIS IS ALL GOING TO BE HOUSING. WE DO PERMITTED USE PROPERTY AND RIGHT NOW 35 IS IN ACTION. THE DEVELOPER HAS COME IN AND SAID, HEY, THIS PERMITTED USE COMMERCIAL PROPERTY IS GOING TO BE ONE 100% AFFORDABLE HOUSING. FINE THAT'S GREAT BUT WHEN THIS KIND OF LEGISLATION COMES IN IT REALLY BECOMES INEQUITABLE IT DOESN'T ALLOW US TO BE SUSTAINABLE INFRASTRUCTURE WATER ISSUES CRUMBLING STREETS RIDES ROADS AND ACCESS WE NEED MORE FIVE AND MORE FLEXIBILITY. SO, AT THIS POINT IN TIME, IN ORDER TO BALANCE OUT ALL OF OUR PRIORITIES BECAUSE YES WE AGREE WE NEED HOUSING WE NEED JOBS WE NEED ALL OF THIS BUT IT DOESN'T PUT ALL THE PIECES TOGETHER IN SUCH A WAY TO REALLY HELP US PROVIDE MORE HOUSING AND ALSO PUT OUR PIECES TOGETHER PARTICULARLY IF IT'S WITHOUT CEQA BECAUSE THAT'S A DANGEROUS SLIPPERY SLOPE HERE AS FAR AS PUTTING PIECES TOGETHER IN OUR JURISDICTIONS. I WOULD SUGGEST AT THIS POINT IN TIME THAT WE JUST TAKE A NEUTRAL POSITION ON THIS BILL AND CONTINUE TO WORK WITH THE AUTHOR HERE BECAUSE IT IS IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE FLEXIBILITY AND MORE INCENTIVE FOR OUR JURISDICTION THIS IS NOT ONE SIZE FITS ALL. WE CANNOT LOOK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AT GOOGLE MAPS AND SAY THIS IS ALL UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL PROPERTY. THAT DOESN'T WORK. WE LEARNED FROM THE TOWN OF COLMA, NOT TO BRING THAT UP AGAIN. [LAUGHTER] BUT WE HAVE TO BE -- THE LOCAL JURISDICTIONS REALLY NEED MORE FLEXIBILITY MORE INCENTIVE TO PROVIDE HOUSING. SO I WOULD HOPE THAT WE JUST STAY NEUTRAL. CAL CITIES IS NOT SUPPORTIVE OF THIS AT ALL. I THINK A NEUTRAL POSITION IS MORE BENEFICIAL. THANK YOU

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER PAPAN. COMMISSIONER CONNOLY THEN ABE-KOGA.

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** THANK YOU, CHAIR. AND AT THE COMMITTEE LEVEL, I FIND MYSELF ASSOCIATING WITH THE REMARKS OF COMMISSIONER PAPAN. I'LL ELABORATE A LITTLE BIT. THIS BILL RAISES THE CONCEPT THAT WE LOOK. AND A CONCEPT THAT WE DON'T LIKE. THE ONE THAT IS GOOD IS THE IDEA OF THE OVERARCHING CONCEPT OF REIMAGINING UNDERUTILIZED COMMERCIAL SPACES: PARTICULARLY, AS AN OPPORTUNITY TOWARD INCREASING AFFORDABLE HOUSING, WHICH WE, WHICH WAS AS WAS NOTED ALL RECOGNIZED NEED FOR A -- YOU KNOW, IN MY JURISDICTION, I'LL REITERATE, THAT WE'RE LOOKING TO ENHANCE THIS VERY CONCEPT OF HOUSING IN COMMERCIAL SPACES, UNDERUTILIZED MALL, FOR EXAMPLE, IN MY SUPERVISORIAL DISTRICT, THE NORTHGATE MALL, THE COMMUNITY EMBRACING MIXED USE NEAR MAJOR TRANSIT THE FIRE MAN'S FUND OFFICE SPACE IN NOVATO PRESENTS ANOTHER OPPORTUNITY TO DO SO. THE PART WE DON'T LIKE,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AGAIN, IS THE TOP DOWN NOTION OF A ONE SIZE FITS ALL APPROACH. BUT, FROM THE STATE, DICTATING HOW THIS SHOULD OCCUR AT THE LOCAL LEVEL. I THINK COMMISSIONER PAPAN HIT IT ON THE HEAD, WE NEED AN APPROACH THAT IS MORE RELIANT ON INCENTIVES AND ASSISTANCE, WHETHER THAT BE FISCAL OR TECHNICAL IN ALLOWING LOCALITY TO COME UP WITH SOLUTIONS THAT MAKE SENSE IN THEIR AREA. I LIKE, ALSO, THE -- SO, THE MOVEMENT TOWARD MORE LOCAL FLEXIBILITY IS GOOD, THROUGH THE AMENDMENT PROCESS. BUT I THINK IT DOES NEED TO GO FURTHER AND BE MORE FOCUSED ON INCENTIVES THAN ASSISTANCE. OBVIOUSLY, WE LIKE THE PART ABOUT PROVIDING RHNA CREDIT FOR ANY UNITS THAT COME ONLINE THROUGH THIS TYPE OF APPROACH. AGAIN, IF IT CAN BE BROUGHT ACROSS THE FINISH LINE IN A BETTER WAY AND NOT FOCUSED ON A MANDATE APPROACH. AND, FINALLY, I KNOW THAT THERE IS STILL SOME SPLIT ON WHERE THIS IS GOING IN TERMS OF A LABOR STANDARDS. I KNOW THAT THE LABOR COMMUNITY IS NOT UNITED ON THIS. SO WE'LL BE LOOKING ALSO AT HOW THAT CONTINUES TO PLAY OUT. SO, AT THIS POINT, I'M A NO, AS WELL, ON THE RECOMMENDATION. AND THAT'S HOW I'LL BE VOTING AT THIS TIME. BUT APPRECIATE THE CONVERSATION.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CONNOLY. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA THEN COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THE OTHER COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS. I'M IN ALIGNMENT WITH MUCH OF WHAT'S ALREADY BEEN SAID. IN MOUNTAIN VIEW, WE'RE DOING A LOT OF THIS ALREADY, AND ONE OF MY BIG CONCERNS IS THE 15% INCLUSIONARY REQUIREMENT HERE, IT'S TOO LOW, I WOULD SAY, BECAUSE THAT'S ALREADY WHAT OUR REQUIREMENT IS. AND I THINK A LOT OF CITIES ARE ALREADY MOVED TO THAT. SO, IF WE'RE GOING TO PROVIDE THE BENEFIT, I THINK WE SHOULD BE ASKING FOR MORE. AND, SO, I WOULD ASK FOR 20% OR MORE IF WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TOWARDS THIS STREAMLINING. THE OTHER ISSUES I HAVE IS THAT WELL AND I APPRECIATE ITEM THREE, I THINK THAT SATISFIES A CONCERN THAT WE HAD, WE ZONED SOME COMMERCIAL PARCELS IN A PRECISE PLAN AREA FOR RESIDENTIAL IN THE FUTURES, WE'RE GIVING FLEXIBILITY. BUT WE HAVE BEEN TOLD THAT THAT WOULD NOT COUNT UNDER OUR RHNA NUMBERS MUCH SO WE'RE HAVING TO, ACTUALLY, LOOK FOR MORE PARCELS, YOU KNOW, FOR HOUSING. AND, SO, AS LONG AS THREE SATISFIES THAT, OR ADDRESSES THAT ISSUE, YOU KNOW, I WOULD DEFINITELY APPRECIATE THAT AMENDMENT. BUT I GUESS THE OTHER -- THE QUESTION I HAD, TOO, WAS, IN TERMS OF RHNA GOALS FOR THE NUMBER ONE AMENDMENT, ARE WE TALKING ABOUT TOTAL RHNA NUMBERS OR ARE WE TALKING ABOUT SATISFYING OR BEING ON TRACK TO SATISFY, YOU KNOW, THE DIFFERENT INCOME CATEGORIES? BECAUSE THAT'S AN ISSUE WE HAVE HAD. LIKE, WE'RE AT 371% OF OUR ABOVE MARKET RATES NUMBERS. BUT YOU KNOW, THE CHALLENGE OF, WE ALL KNOW, THE AFFORDABLE IS, THERE'S JUST NOT THE FUNDING STREAMS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

TO DO THAT. SO I DON'T WANT US -- IF IT'S BY INCOME CATEGORY, I DON'T THINK ANY CITY IS GOING TO MATCH THAT. SO I JUST WANTED TO CLARIFICATION. SO, YEAH, IF STAFF COULD PROVIDE THAT, THAT WOULD BE GREAT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. CAN STAFF RESPOND TO THE QUESTION?

**GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** SURE. WE DON'T SELL OUT IN OUR AMENDMENTS WHETHER OR NOT IT'S PRODUCTION BY ALL CATEGORIES OR RHNA PRODUCTION AS A WHOLE -- NOT RHNA PRODUCTION BUT PERMITTED UNITS AS A WHOLE, I THINK WE'RE OPEN TO FEEDBACK ON WHAT'S APPROPRIATE.

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** OKAY. SO, IN THAT CASE, YEAH, I WOULD ASK THAT WE LOOK AT TOTAL NUMBER. [LAUGHTER] JUST BECAUSE I DON'T THINK ANYONE IS GOING TO QUALIFY IF IT'S BROKEN DOWN BY INCOME. BUT, AT THIS POINT I THINK THERE'S JUST A LOT MORE ISSUES THAT WE WOULD NEED TO ADDRESS. AND, SO, I WOULD ALSO SUPPORT TAKING A NEUTRAL POSITION AT THIS TIME. THANK YOU.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. LET'S GO TO COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI AND THEN COMMISSIONER WORTH.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES, THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA. MY THOUGHTS ON THIS ITEM AS REFLECTED BY SOME OF THE OTHER COMMENTS HERE ARE THE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES. WHILE THE INTENT OF THE BILL IS NOBLE BECAUSE WE KNOW WE NEED MORE HOUSING AND THIS IS AN ATTEMPT TO REACH THAT GOAL, I THINK ABOUT MY OWN CITY, LIKE, I AM SURE IS NOT UNIQUE, AS EXAMPLES, OUR SCHOOL DISTRICT'S ENROLLMENT WAS DECLINING, TORE DOWN ALMOST NEW SCHOOLS AND BUILT HOUSING TO HELP WITH FUNDING SCHOOL ACTIVITY SO AS WE CONTINUE TO INCREASE HOUSING WE'RE GOING TO HAVE UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES POTENTIALLY OF NOT CONSIDERING SCHOOLS, AND THE DETERIORATING OF ROADS, THE CITIES DON'T HAVING THE MONEY BECAUSE INCREASED TRAFFIC CONTINUES TO IMPACT THAT. ONE SIZE CERTAINLY DOES NOT FIT ALL, AND EXAMPLE OF COMING UP WITH OUR CURRENT HOUSING ELEMENT UNION CITY IS LOOKING AT REZONING COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES BECAUSE WE DON'T HAVE THE LANDS TO PUT IT ANYWHERE ELSE. SO, AGAIN, WHILE IT'S NOBLE, I THINK, IN LISTENING TO ALL OF THESE VALID COMMENTS, I WOULD, AS WELL, SUPPORT A NEUTRAL POSITION.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER. COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. FIRST OF ALL, I REALLY WOULD LIKE TO THANK STAFF FOR THEIR INCREDIBLE WORK ON THIS. THIS IS PROBABLY THE MOST THOROUGH REPORT ON A BILL THAT I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

HAVE EVER RECEIVED. AND IT IS A THOUGHTFUL REFLECTION OF THE OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES WITH THIS BILL. SO, I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT. WE WERE UP IN SACRAMENTO ON MONDAY, AND MEETING WITH LEGISLATORS AND HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO SIT DOWN WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS TO TALK ABOUT OUR PRIORITIES FOR BOTH TRANSPORTATION AND HOUSING. LAST WEEK, ON THURSDAY NIGHT, THE EAST BAY DIVISION, LEAGUE OF CALIFORNIA CITIES HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO MEET WITH THE DISTRICT DIRECTOR AND WE HAD OPPORTUNITY TO TALK ABOUT THIS BILL ONE REQUEST WAS THAT WE HAD OPPORTUNITY TO ENGAGEMENT IN DIRECT CONSERVATIONS WITH HER OFFICE IN REGARDS TO THE BILL AND THE NEXT MORNING THAT HAPPENED. AND THE THERE ARE ONGOING CONVERSATIONS RIGHT NOW WITH THE LEAGUE OF CITIES AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS' OFFICE ON AMENDMENTS TO THIS BILL TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE LOCAL CITY'S CONCERNS ABOUT IT. BUT THE CHALLENGES, THE REALITY IS WE'RE NOT PRODUCING AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THIS REGION. IF YOU LOOK AT THE STATE'S STATISTICS AROUND RHNA PRODUCTION OVER THE LAST THREE HOUSING ELEMENTS THE PERCENTAGES ARE DROPPING PRECIPITOUSLY. AND WHILE I COMPLETELY SUPPORT AND HAVE SPENT MANY YEARS ADVOCATING IN SACRAMENTO FOR LOCAL CONTROL, I THINK THAT THERE'S A REAL BALANCE THAT CAN BE ACHIEVED THROUGH THIS BILL. AND ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS WORKING WITH THE LOCAL GOVERNMENT TO ENDORSE THESE AMENDMENTS, I IS REALLY AN IMPORTANT ELEMENT IN IT. WE ALL KNOW THAT, FOR EXAMPLE, WE ALL, CITIES ARE HAVING CHARGES NOW IN DEVELOPING OUR HOUSING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ELEMENTS WITH THE NEW RHNA REQUIREMENTS. AND ONE OF THE ELEMENTS THAT THIS BILL, IMPORTANTLY ADDRESSES IS FOR THE CITIES THAT HAVE CREDIT FOR THE RHNA REZONING THAT THEY ARE DOING IN COMMERCIAL AREAS. BECAUSE ONE OF THE CHARGES THAT MANY OF OUR CITIES ARE GOING TO FACE IS THE ABLE TO HAVE OUR HOUSING ELEMENT APPROVED BY THE STATE BECAUSE OF THIS. AND WE'RE LOOKING IN THE BACK OF EVERY DRAWER TO FIND EVERY PIECE OF LAND TO DO HOUSING DEVELOPMENT. THE OTHER ISSUE IS BECAUSE OF THE COST OF AFFORDABLE HOUSING AT A MILLION DOLLARS A DOOR, THERE IS NOT GOING TO BE A LAND RUSH TO REZONE ALL THE COMMERCIAL PROPERTY IN EVERY CITY. IT IS GOING TO BE A SLOW LABORIOUS PROCESS. WE HAVE WORKED HARD FOR THE MONEY IN CALIFORNIA -- IN THE STATE, TO FUND AFFORDABLE HOUSING, BUT WE NEED TO DEAL WITH THE REGULATORY ELEMENTS OF IT, SO THAT WE CAN BUILD THIS. ONE OF THE AREAS THAT WE TALKED ABOUT IS TEACHER HOUSING. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE A SHORTAGE OF TEACHER HOUSING. DISTRICTS CANNOT HIRE MATH TEACHERS BECAUSE THEY CANNOT AFFORD TO LIVE IN THE BAY AREA. MTC AND ABAG HAVE BEEN REAL LEADERS IN THIS. I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE SUPPORT THIS BILL WITH AMENDMENTS. I THINK THERE ARE OBVIOUSLY -- WE HAVE TALKED ABOUT SOME OF THE LOCAL PROTECTIONS AROUND STREAMLINING WHICH MANY OF THE ELEMENTS ARE ALREADY INCLUDED THERE ARE MORE TO BE INCLUDED AS STAFF HAS INDICATED AND SECOND OF ALL, THE GRAND BARGAIN ON LABOR ISSUES THAT I AM HOPEFUL THE CALIFORNIA LEGISLATURE WILL BE ABLE TO ADDRESS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THIS YOU REMEMBER IS. BECAUSE WE REALLY HAVE TO BE PRODUCING HOUSING. AND I REALLY THINK THAT THERE ARE A LOT OF ACCOMMODATIONS THAT ARE IN THIS BILL. AND, AGAIN MORE TO COME. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE AS LEADERS BOTH IN TRANSPORTATION AND FUNDING AND GRAPPLING WITH THESE ISSUES IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE SUPPORT THIS BILL WITH THE AMENDMENTS THAT ARE INCLUDED IN OUR STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER WORTH. GREAT COMMENTS. LET ME GO TO COMMISSIONER SCHAFF THEN COMMISSIONER LICCARDO.

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** THANK YOU, CHAIR PEDROZA. I -- IT'S INTERESTING, WHEN I LISTEN TO PEOPLE WHO HAVE JUST SAID THEY'RE GOING TO VOTE NO. IT SOUNDS LIKE YOU HAVE SOME ISSUES WITH THE TECHNICALITY OF THE MEASURE, BUT NOT THE INTENT. AND IF THAT IS, INDEED, THE CASE, I WOULD URGE YOU TO ABSTAIN, RATHER THAN VOTING NO. IF YOU, INDEED, DO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE IS A HOUSING CRISIS, AND THAT WE MUST TAKE COORDINATE STEPS AT THIS MOMENT TO ADDRESS IT, THEN I WOULD URGE YOU TO ABSTAIN, RATHER THAN VOTE NO. FROM MY PERSPECTIVE, I BELIEVE THAT ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS DESERVES OUR FULL SUPPORT. SHE HAS VERY BRAVELY NEGOTIATED A NEW PATH WITH LABOR STANDARDS AND ADDRESSING WAGE THEFT AND PREVAILING WAGE IN A WAY THAT ACTUALLY WILL NOT QUASH AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEVELOPMENT. AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SHE REALLY DESERVES OUR SUPPORT FOR HER WORK. I CAN SAY, FROM EXPERIENCE, THAT THIS TYPE OF STREAMLINING IS SOMETHING THAT THOSE OF US WHO HAVE HOMEKEY PROJECTS IN OUR JURISDICTION, SAW THE INCREDIBLE IMPACTS OF. IN OAKLAND, WE HAD AN ABANDONED COLLEGE DORMITORY THAT WE RECEIVED HOMEKEY FUNDING FOR BUT BECAUSE OF THE STREAMLINING THAT NORMALLY WOULD HAVE TAKEN US ONE YEAR TO CONVERT AND GET APPROVAL PROCESS, WE WERE ABLE TO CONVERT, RENOVATE, AND ACTUALLY GET OCCUPIED IN JUST THREE MONTHS WE WERE ABLE TO PROVIDE FAMILIES AND SENIORS WITH A ROOF OVER THEIR HEAD IN TIME FOR CHRISTMAS. IT WAS AMAZING. THIS IS TRULY A UNIQUE OPPORTUNITY FOR US TO SUPPORT HOUSING DEVELOPMENT AND GOOD PAYING JOBS BECAUSE OF THE WAY THAT THIS VERY INNOVATIVE IS IMPRESSIVE PIECE OF LEGISLATION HAS BEEN STRUCTURED. THESE COMMON SENSE AMENDMENTS WHICH MANY OF US PUSH FOR, INCLUDING THE RECOGNITION OF LOCAL CONTROL. LOCAL CONTROL, SOMETHING THAT PEOPLE TALK ABOUT OFTEN WHEN THESE ISSUES COME UP IS BEING RESPECTED BY ALLOWING AREA-SPECIFIC PLANS TO TRUMP, OR SUPERSEDE THIS LEGISLATION. THAT IS HONORING LOCAL CONTROL. AND THAT IS WHY I TRULY BELIEVE IT IS INCREDIBLY IMPORTANT FOR US TO RESPECT THE RECOMMENDATION OF OUR PROFESSIONAL STAFF TO RESPECT THE INCREDIBLE WORK THAT ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS HAS DONE TO ACTUALLY FIND A WAY TO HAVE BOTH AFFORDABLE HOUSING AND GOOD JOBS AND GOOD JOB STANDARDS, AND TO RECOGNIZE THAT IN ORDER TO MEET THOSE RHNA GOALS THAT WE JUST SET FOR EACH OF OUR JURISDICTIONS, WE ARE GOING TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NEED TOOLS LIKE THIS. SO THAT WE CAN ACTUALLY SATISFY THOSE REQUIREMENTS. SO, AGAIN, I URGE PEOPLE TO SUPPORT THE POSITION THAT STAFF HAS RECOMMENDED. AND IF YOU CONTINUE TO HAVE ISSUES WITH, NOT THE GOAL, BUT THE MECHANISM OF THIS LEGISLATION, THEN TO ABSTAIN RATHER THAN VOTE NO. I APPRECIATE EVERYONE'S CONSIDERATION OF MY COMMENTS. THANK YOU.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER. LET'S GO TO COMMISSIONER LICCARDO THEN TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

**SAM LICCARDO:** THANK YOU. I THINK IT'S BEEN A VERY GOOD DISCUSSION, AND APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS ON ALL SIDES, PARTICULARLY OF MOST TWO RECENT COMMISSIONERS, COMMISSIONER WORTH AND MAYOR SCHAFF. YOU KNOW, I HEARD FROM SEVERAL COLLEAGUES THAT, HEY, WE'RE DOING THIS ALREADY. AND I DON'T DOUBT THEIR ACCURACY OR SINCERITY IN MAKING THOSE STATEMENTS, BUT IF IT'S TRUE, THEN YOU GOT NOTHING TO LOSE WITH THIS LEGISLATION. ON THE OTHER HAND IF WE'RE NOT DOING THIS BLUNTLY AS A REGION WE'RE NOT DOING THIS BLUNTLY, AS I A REGION WE'RE FAILING BY HOUSING, FAILING BY A LOT. IT SEEMS TO ME WE NEED TO EM EMBRACE WHAT I SEE AS THE MOST POTENT LEGISLATIVE TOOL WE HAVE SEEN YESTERDAY. I APPRECIATE THAT WE HAVE GOT AN AUTHOR IN CHAIR WICKS WHO IS VERY RECEPTIVE TO THE INPUT OF MY CITY, AND OF OUR REGION, AND I THINK OF MANY CITIES I HAVE ALREADY HEARD FROM SEVERAL COLLEAGUES IN OTHER CITIES THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE'RE ACTIVELY WORKING WITH ASSEMBLYMEMBER STAFF ON REVISIONS TO ENSURE THAT WE REALLY GET TO THE INTENDED OUTCOME. BUT THE REALITY IS, NO MATTER HOW MUCH WE THINK WE'RE DOING ALREADY -- LAST NIGHT I EMERGED FROM A CITY COUNCIL MEETING WHERE WE HEARD UPSET NEIGHBORS OBJECT TO THE FACT THAT THE COUNCIL CONVERTED AN OLD SHOPPING CENTER TO A THOUSAND UNITS OF HOUSING AT 100 UNITS TO THE ACHOR AND WE ALSO APPROVED INVESTING IN CITY FUNDING IN FIVE SEPARATE AFFORDABLE HOUSING PROJECTS ALL LAST NIGHT AND NONE OF THAT IS NEARLY ENOUGH. SO WE'RE ALL DOING A LOT. BUT WE'RE ALL FAILING COLLECTIVELY AS A REGION, UNLESS WE CAN EMBRACE NEW TOOLS THAT IT WILL ENABLE US TO GET THROUGH THE EXTRAORDINARY CHALLENGE WE HAVE. WE ALL FACE THIS CHALLENGE IN OUR REGION THERE ARE OFFSETTING CONCERNS WE HAVE ABOUT THE FISCAL SUSTAINABILITY OF OUR CITIES AND OUR LOCAL CONTROL AND URBAN PLANNING. BUT, THE MORE WE CONTINUE TO CLING TO IS OUTMODED APPROACHES TO HOW WE'RE GOING TO ADDRESS THIS PROBLEM AND REFUSE TO LOOK FOR NEW TOOLS, WE WILL CONTINUE TO DO EXACTLY THE SAME AS WE HAVE DONE FOR THE LAST SEVERAL YEARS, WHICH, I THINK IN THE VIEW OF ALL OF OUR RESIDENTS, HAS LARGELY BEEN A FAILURE. I HOPE WE CAN BE OPEN TO THIS. UNDOUBTEDLY THERE IS MORE TO DISCUSS WITH REGARD TO AMENDMENTS AND UNFORTUNATELY WE HAVE AN AUTHOR WHO IS OPEN TO THE CONVERSATIONS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR LICCARDO. LET'S CLOSE COMMENTS WITH COMMISSIONER SPERING, RABBIT, THEN WE'LL GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. GEORGIA, HAS ABAG TAKEN A POSITION ON THIS BILL?

**GEORGIA GANN DOHRMANN:** ABAG HAS NOT TAKEN A POSITION ON THIS BILL YET. WE DID NOT HAVE QUORUM IN THE LEGISLATION COMMITTEE AND WE DIDN'T END UP BRINGING -- WE'RE BRINGING IT TO ABAG IN JULY.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** I HAVE A CONCERN OF THIS WEIGHING IN AHEAD OF THAT DISCUSSION. WHAT WAS BEING DISCUSSED AT ABAG A LOT OF CONTROVERSY, A LOT OF CONCERN. I WOULD JUST HATE TO SEE -- I GUY WITH BOTH SIDES, THE BIGGER CITIES, I CERTAINLY UNDERSTAND THEIR ISSUES AND CONCERNS AND SOME OF THE OTHER CONCERNS OF THE SMALLER CITIES, BUT YOU KNOW, IF WE GET OUT THE SYNC WITH ABAG, YOU KNOW, I THINK THERE IS ENOUGH PRESSURE THERE, POLITICAL PRESSURE THERE TO, SORT OF, HAVE -- GO FORWARD. AND GETTING CONSENSUS MAKING SURE WE ALL SUPPORT -- I THINK THE BILL IS GOING IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION FOR ME PERSONALLY, BUT WE HAVE GOT TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE THIS BROAD SUPPORT AND I WOULD JUST HATE TO SEE US TAKE THIS POSITION AND THEN ABAG COMING UP WITH SOME OPPOSE POSITION OR ADDING CONDITIONS THAT, YOU KNOW,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WE REALLY HAVEN'T HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO VET OR GO THROUGH. SO, YOU KNOW, I JUST HOW MUCH WE KIND OF FIND SOME MIDDLE GROUND HERE. AND I HATE TO SEE COMMISSIONERS VOTING NO OR ABSTAINING ON THIS BILL. SO, I THINK WE HAVE TO BE MORE UNITED AND GET IN SYNC WITH THE ABAG CONCERNS ABOUT THIS ISSUE. THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** THANK YOU. I SHARE THE CONCERNS EXPRESSED BY COMMISSIONER SPERING REGARDING BUILDING CONSENSUS AND BROAD SUPPORT. AND I WOULD HOPE THAT THOSE WHO HAVE RESERVATIONS ABOUT THIS PARTICULAR BILL, I THINK, I ALSO SHARE WHAT COMMISSIONER LICCARDO SAID, THE TRUTH IS, THE MATTER -- OF THE MATTER IS THAT WE'RE FAILING ON THIS FRONT. AND DOING THE SAME THING OVER AND OVER AGAIN IS NOT GOING TO SOLVE THE PROBLEM. AND I CAN TELL YOU THIS, AS WORKING IN MANY OF YOUR JURISDICTIONS OVER THE COURSE OF 35 YEARS AS AN ARCHITECT IN MANY OF THESE TYPES OF PROJECTS IT'S BECOME INCREASINGLY DIFFICULT MORE EXPENSIVE AND TAKES LONGER WE CAN ALL SAY WE HAVE A HOUSING CRISIS BUT PLODDING ALONG DOING THE SAME THING AND NOT GAINING TRACTION. I THINK THIS BILL IS MOVING IN THAT DIRECTION. LEADERSHIP ON ALL OUR PARTS INCLUDING ABAG IS TO TRY TO BUILD CONSENSUS AND STRONG COMPLAINT FOR THINGS WE CAN DO TO MAKE A DIFFERENCE GOING FORWARD THAT WE CAN GET THESE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

UNITS BUILT. I TAKE THIS PERSONALLY, I HAVE KIDS THAT WOULD BE LOVE TO BE ABLE TO STAY IN THE BAY AREA, AND A FIREFIGHTER OR NURSE, THOSE ARE NOT THE CAREERS ANYMORE UNFORTUNATELY THAT CAN GET INTO THAT HOUSE UNLESS THE PARENTS ARE GIVING THE DOWN PAYMENT. AND I HAVE TOO MANY KIDS TO BE ABLE TO DO THAT. AND I'M NOT ALONE IN THAT. I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT THAT FROM A BAY AREA PERSPECTIVE. OUR COUNTY HAS GONE THROUGH, YOU ALL KNOW, WE HAVE LOST POPULATION DUE TO WILDFIRE AND LOSS OF HOUSING AND NOW WE HAVE AS MANY OF YOU DO A HUGE WORKFORCE ISSUE AND TRYING TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE PROVIDING THOSE JOBS THAT NEED TO TAKE PLACE HERE WITHIN THE COUNTY AND AT THE SAME TIME WE'RE HUSHING PEOPLE FURTHER OUT INTO THOSE BIG LARGER MEGA COMMUTES AND I THINK THIS MOVES US IN THE RIGHT DIRECTION. IT WOULD BE LOVELY TO GET TO CONSENSUS OF COURSE BUT WE REALLY NEED TO THINK ABOUT -- THINK OUTSIDE OF BOX AND DO SOMETHING DIFFERENT BECAUSE WE WHAT WE HAVE BEEN DOING IS NOT WORKING.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** HEART. THANK YOU, COMMISSIONER RABBIT. LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT AND THEN I'LL BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION. DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO MAKE PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE ONE HAND RAISED, MR. CHAIR, AND I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** WE'RE GOING TO GO DOWN TO ONE MINUTE. WE HAVE ISSUE WITH QUORUM.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU MR. CHAIR. I'LL ADJUST THE TIMER. HOWARD WONG IS THE SPEAKER. MR. WONG, GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE ONE MINUTE.

**SPEAKER:** HOWARD WONG, MEMBER OF POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL, SPEAKING AS AN INDIVIDUAL. THERE IS ALREADY EXISTING COMMERCIAL DEVELOPMENT EVEN WITHIN TRADITIONAL APPROVALS. THE STONES TOWN SHOPPING CENTER IN SAN FRANCISCO IS BEING DEVELOPED WITH MIXED USE TWO LARGE PROJECTS BROUGHT BY SAN FRANCISCO GIANTS AND PIER 70 HAVE 40% AFFORDABLE HOUSING REQUIREMENTS FOR THOUSANDS AND THOUSANDS OF UNITS. WHILE WE'RE LOOKING AT THIS LEGISLATION THERE IS PROBABLY OPPORTUNITY TO LOOK AT BEST PRACTICES AROUND THE WORLD WHILE THE UNITED STATES, OUR STATES AND REGIONS HAVE NEGLECTED DEMOGRAPHIC DATA FOR DECADES WE NEED 100% LOW-INCOME HOUSING 100% AFFORDABLE HOUSING.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE FOE ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED MR. CHAIR.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU. LET'S BRING IT BACK TO VICE CHAIR LICCARDO.

**SAM LICCARDO:** I APPRECIATE THE SUGGESTION. LET ME TURN OFF MY VIDEO I'M CHALLENGED RIGHT NOW WITH MY INTERNET CONNECTION. I APPRECIATE THE SUGGESTION OF COMMISSIONER SPERING. I THINK IT -- WHY DON'T I AMEND MY MOTION TO SAY THAT WE WILL -- WE CAN BRING THIS BACK TO RECONSIDER WITH THE MTC BOARD AFTER THE ABAG BOARD HAS WEIGHED IN. BUT, WE SHOULD TAKE A VOTE NOW. TAKE A POSITION AND PERHAPS WE CAN RECONSIDER WHEN OUR COLLEAGUES OF ABAG HAVE HAD A CHANCE TO CONSIDER, AS WELL.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, VICE CHAIR LICCARDO. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF, DOES YOUR SECOND REFLECT THAT MODIFICATION?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** YES. SO, IF ABAG COMES UP WITH A DIFFERENT RECOMMENDATION, THEN THE RECOMMENDATION THAT MTC MAKES TODAY, THEN IT WOULD COME BACK FOR RECONSIDERATION TO MTC SO THAT WE COULD BE ALIGN WITH ABAG TO ADDRESS THE CONCERNS THAT BOTH COMMISSIONER SPERING IS RABBIT RAISED. AND I GUESS, THROUGH THE CHAIR, IS THAT THE KIND OF SPIRIT OF WHAT YOU ALL WERE LOOKING FOR?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THAT'S WHAT I HEARD VICE CHAIR LICCARDO SUMMARIZE IN HIS MOTION. IS THAT CORRECT?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** RIGHT. THEN THE SECONDER APPROVES.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LET ME GO BACK TO FOLLOW UP CONVERSATION, COMMISSIONER SPERING AND COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

**JAMES P. SPERING:** THANK YOU. I THINK THIS IS A GREAT COMPROMISE. AND IT GIVES THE COMMISSIONERS THAT HAVE EXPRESSED CONCERN ABOUT THIS GIVES OPPORTUNITY TO WORK OUT SOME OF THOSE ISSUES. I WANT TO THANK THE MAYOR. I THINK THIS IS A GOOD COMPROMISE FOR US GOING FORWARD.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN AND THEN I'M GOING TO CALL THE QUESTION BECAUSE WE DO HAVE OTHER COMMITTEE MEETINGS. GO AHEAD.

**GINA PAPAN:** THANK YOU. AND I APPRECIATE THE ACCOMMODATION HERE. FOR MAYOR LICCARDO. LOOK, BAY MEADOWS RACE TRACK, TANFORAN MALL, WE ARE DOING WHAT WE SAY WE ARE DOING HERE. AND I WANT TO NOTE, 488 HOUSING UNITS APPROVED IN MY CITY, 2,004 HIGH SPEED RAIL INTERFERING THAT. WHEN YOU VOTE EIR THAT IMPACTS HOUSING THAT WE HAVE APPROVED. THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY. I WILL WORK WITH GEORGIA AND HOPEFULLY WE CAN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WORK WITH THE AUTHOR TO TRY TO GET SOME FURTHER CONSENSUS THIS. THANK YOU.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** ALL RIGHT. LAST CALL, COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** YES. I JUST WANTED THE MOTION RESTATED TO MAKE SURE I UNDERSTAND IT. I KNOW IT WAS CLARIFIED A BIT, BUT I THINK I'M A STILL A BIT CONFUSED ON THE MOTION.

**SAM LICCARDO:** HAPPY TO SUMMARIZE. MOTION IS TO SUPPORT IF AMENDED AND TO RETURN FOR RECONSIDERATION IF THE ABAG BOARD RENDERS A DIFFERENT OUTCOME.

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** OKAY. THANK YOU.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** AT THIS POINT. I APPRECIATE ALL THE COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION. I'M GOING ON CALL THE QUESTION AND ASK FOR ROLL CALL VOTE. MOTION MADE BY VICE CHAIR LICCARDO AND SECOND BY -- [INDISCERNIBLE].

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** CHAIR, IF I CAN QUICKLY FINALIZE. I LOOK FORWARD TO BEING PART OF THE ONGOING DISCUSSIONS. I DON'T BELIEVE IN ABSTAINING ON VOTES SO I'M GOING ON CONTINUE WITH

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MY POSITION BUT LOOK FORWARD TO CONTINUING TO BE PART OF A PRODUCTIVE PROCESS. THANKS.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CONNOLY. ROLL CALL VOTE

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** JOSEFOWITZ.

**NICK JOSEFOWITZ, V. CHAIR:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA?

**MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** ABSTAIN.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER AHN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

**DAVID CANEPA:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER CONNOLY?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**DAMON CONNOLLY:** NO.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

**CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** ABSTAIN.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

**VICTORIA FLEMING:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

**FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER LICCARDO?

**SAM LICCARDO:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER MILEY?

**NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

**GINA PAPAN:** NO.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER RABBIT?

**DAVID RABBIT:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

**LIBBY SCHAFF:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

**JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER WORTH?

**AMY R. WORTH:** AYE.

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. THE MOTION PASSES WITH 11 AYES, TWO NOS, TWO ABSTENTIONS, AND ONE ABSENT. EXCUSE ME -- THREE ABSENT.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND, AGAIN, COMMISSIONERS, THANK YOU FOR A VERY ROBUST CONVERSATION. AND I WANT TO THANK ASSEMBLYMEMBER WICKS. WE HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MEET WITH HER ON MONDAY. SHE IS VERY PRACTICAL AND WANTED TO ADDRESS THE CRISIS BUT WANTS TO DO THINGS RESPONSIBLY. THANK YOU VERY MUCH COMMISSIONERS. VICE CHAIR LICCARDO THANK YOU FOR THAT. WE'RE GOING TO PROCEED TO 13, OUR AGENDA ITEM 13, WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT? ANY GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT?

**CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** I SEE NO RAISED HANDS, HOWEVER THERE WAS ONE WRITTEN LETTER OF CORRESPONDENCE FROM DAN DICER MAN HAS BEEN POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND WAS DISTRIBUTED TO THE COMMISSION.

**ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THAT CONCLUDES PUBLIC COMMENT. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO GENTLEMAN 14 ADJOURNMENT THE NEXT MEETING OF THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION IS SCHEDULED FOR WEDNESDAY JULY 27TH, 2022. REMOTELY OR BY WEBCAST THANK YOU TO THE PUBLIC FOR JOINING US. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

NTT
Broadcasting Government