METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY & ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE

FRIDAY, JANUARY 27, 2023 9:00 AM

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU SO MUCH. IS THERE AN ANNOUNCEMENT THAT WE NEED TO RUN? [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] DUE TO COVID-19, THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A ZOOM WEBINAR PURSUANT TO THE PROVISIONS OF ASSEMBLY BILL 361 WHICH SUSPENDS CERTAIN REQUIREMENTS OF THE BROWN ACT. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEBSITE. THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON COMMISSIONERS, PRESENTERS, STAFF, AND OTHER SPEAKERS, BY NAME, AND ASK THAT THEY SPEAK CLEARLY AND STATE THEIR NAMES BEFORE GIVING COMMENTS OR REMARKS. PERSONS PARTICIPATING VIA WEBCAST AND ZOOM, WITH THEIR CAMERAS ENABLED, ARE REMINDED THAT THEIR ACTIVITIES ARE VISIBLE TO VIEWERS. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFOATBAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. IF AUTHORS OF THE WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK, THEY ARE FREE TO DO SO. THEY SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO GET THE FULL ZOOM EXPERIENCE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. ROLL CALL?

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. DID YOU WANT TO FIRST READ THE OTHER ANNOUNCEMENTS? OR DO YOU WANT ME TO GO AHEAD AND DO THE ROLL CALL FIRST?

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: WHAT'S THE -- [INDISCERNIBLE] ANNOUNCEMENT?

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: DO YOU WANT ME TO READ IT?

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: SURE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THE GOVERNOR'S EMERGENCY PROTOCOLS WILL BE SUNSETTING FEBRUARY 8TH, 2023. WHICH MEANS THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL RETURN TO IN-PERSON MEETINGS AS WAS THE PRACTICE BEFORE THE PANDEMIC.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

STARTING MARCH 24TH, 2023, THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING WILL BE IN-PERSON. AS BEFORE, YOU WILL BE COMPENSATED FOR YOUR TRAVEL COST AND REFRESHMENTS WILL BE PROVIDED. FOR THOSE CONCERNING ASSEMBLY BILL 2449, MORE GUIDANCE AROUND THIS WILL BE PROVIDED AT FEBRUARY'S MEETING. KEY POINTS. THE PUBLIC CAN STILL PARTICIPATE REMOTELY IN KEEPING WITH THE HYBRID FORMAT. THE PUBLIC WILL STILL BE ABLE TO SUBMIT WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT BY 5:00 P.M. THE DAY BEFORE THE MEETING TO THE ADDRESS PROVIDED ON THE WEB SITE, INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. 375 BEALE STREET IS OUR HEADQUARTERS, WE CURRENTLY DO NOT OFFER ANY ALTERNATE OR SATELLITE LOCATIONS FOR CONDUCTING BUSINESS. THANK YOU, IN ADVANCE, FOR MAKING THE ADDITIONAL EFFORT TO SERVE ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE. AS WE COMPLY WITH PUBLIC TRANSPARENCY RULES, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING YOU IN-PERSON AFTER SUCH A LONG TIME APART. OR IN SOME CASES, FOR THE FIRST TIME. MASKS ARE STILL REQUIRED AT OUR SAN FRANCISCO HEADQUARTERS.

KY-NAM MILLER: WALLY --

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU.

KATHLEEN KANE: KATHLEEN KANE, GENERAL COUNSEL FOR MTC AND RELATED ENTITY. I WANT TO PING IN HERE AND I KNOW IT'S UNUSUAL

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

I APPRECIATE THE RETURN TO IN-PERSON CAN BE DIFFICULT PARTICULARLY FOR PEOPLE WHO MAY NOT HAVE DONE THAT PRIOR TO COVID, SO STORY THOSE WHO ARE NEW MEMBERS OR THOSE WHOSE CIRCUMSTANCES MAY CHANGE MAKING IT DIFFICULT TO COME INTO 375 BEALE. MY OFFICE WILL WORK WITH YOU DIRECTLY TO ADDRESS BARRIERS SO YOU CAN PARTICIPATE, WE UNDERSTAND THE BARRIERS AND FOR THOSE WHO ARE TRANSIT IT DEPENDENT, WE WILL BE COMING OUT WITH MORE FORMAL GUIDANCE THROUGH ALL OF OUR COMMITTEES THROUGH THE MONTH OF FEBRUARY BUT I WOULD LIKE TO HAVE AN OPEN CHANNEL ON AN INDIVIDUAL BASIS TO HELP YOU THINK THROUGH WHAT WE NEED DO TO HELP YOU SO YOU CAN PARTICIPATE BECAUSE WE REALLY APPRECIATE YOU GIVING YOUR TIME IN THIS WAY, BOTH TO THIS COMMITTEE AND AS A WHOLE. KY-NAM YOU CAN SEND OUT MY CONTACT INFO FOR THOSE WHO HAVE CONCERNS SO WE CAN ENSURE EVERYONE CAN PARTICIPATE FULLY. THANK YOU. AND SORRY TO HIJACK YOUR MEETING.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: NO NEED FOR APOLOGIES. I APPRECIATE YOU BEING ON BOARD WITH US THROUGH THE TRANSITION. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE ANNOUNCEMENT. LET'S GO AHEAD WITH ROLL CALL.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHAIR ESUF?

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: PRESENT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR MARKHAM?

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: PRESENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER FITZGERALD?

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER HANKERSON?

DWAYNE HANKERSON: PRESENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER ORANTES? MEMBER ORANTES IS ABSENT. PIMP?

VINAY PIMPLE: PRESENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: SCOTT?

TERRY SCOTT: PRESENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WELTE?

FRANK WELTE: HERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WILSON?

WALTER WILSON: PRESENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER WONG?

HOWARD WONG: PRESENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. WE HAVE QUORUM, WITHOUT THE ALTERNATES.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND BEFORE WE BEGIN WITH THE FORMAL AGENDA, I JUST WANTED TO MAKE A QUICK ANNOUNCEMENT THAT I WILL EVENTUALLY HAVE TO HOP OFF AROUND 10:30 JUST WANT TO GIVE EVERYONE A HEADS UP ABOUT THAT. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR NOVEMBER 30TH, 2022. IT'S AN ACTION ITEM. DOES ANYONE WANT TO PUT FORWARD THE MOTION?

SPEAKER: [INDISCERNIBLE].

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: DO I HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE MINUTES?

WALTER WILSON: I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE THE MOTION TO APPROVE THE MINUTES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU.

WALTER WILSON: WILSON.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: IS THERE A SECOND?

TERRY SCOTT: SECOND.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: MOTION BY WALTER, SECOND BY TERRY. IS THAT CORRECT?

TERRY SCOTT: YES.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MOTION BY WILSON, SECOND BY SCOTT?

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: YES. IS THERE ANY DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM BY MEMBERS? I DO NOT SEE ANY HANDS. IS THERE ANY PUBLIC COMMENT?

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM. THERE IS NOBODY WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED, AND THERE WAS NOTHING IN WRITING.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHAIR ESUF?

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: AYE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR MARKHAM?

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: AYE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER FITZGERALD?

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: AYE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER HANKERSON?

DWAYNE HANKERSON: AYE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER ORANTES? MEMBER ORANTES IS ABSENT. MEMBER PIMPLE?

VINAY PIMPLE: YES.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER SCOTT?

TERRY SCOTT: AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER WELTE?

FRANK WELTE: NO.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER WILSON?

WALTER WILSON: YES.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER WONG?

HOWARD WONG: AYE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT. THANK YOU.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU SO MUCH. AND WITH THAT --

WALTER WILSON: EXCUSE ME -- DIDN'T SOMEBODY SAY NO?

KY-NAM MILLER: YES. IT WAS A NO VOTE BY MR. FRANK WELTE.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU FOR THAT. WE'LL HAVE THAT IN THE RECORD. MOVING TO ITEM TWO, OUR T-TAPS UPDATE. I'LL PASS IT OVER TO DRENNAN.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DRENNAN SHELTON: THANKS. I'M HERE FOR YOUR REGULAR MONTHLY UPDATE. ON THE ACTIVITIES WE HAVE GOING AROUND THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN ACCESSIBILITY ITEMS. A QUICK REMINDER OF WHAT THOSE ITEMS ARE, THE MOBILITY MANAGER THE DESIGNATE AND COORDINATE BETWEEN TRANSIT AGENCIES AND OTHER SERVICES IN THE COUNTY. ACTION 22 IS THAT WE WILL FUND ADDITIONAL SUBREGIONAL ONE-SEAT PARATRANSIT RIDE PILOTS AND DEVELOP COST SHARED POLICIES FOR JURISDICTIONAL PARATRANSIT TRIPS. ACTION 29 INTEGRATE ADA PARATRANSIT SERVICES ON CLIPPER AND NEXT GENERATION SYSTEMS. ACTION 24, IDENTIFY KEY PARATRANSIT CHALLENGES AND RECOMMEND CHANGES. AND ACTION 25 IS OUR TOPIC TODAY. WE ARE GOING TO ADOPT MORE STANDARDIZED ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR PROGRAMS THAT BENEFIT PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES, NAMELY, ADA PARATRANSIT. SO, AS I HAVE PREVIOUSLY REPORTED TO YOU, WE HAVE BEGUN ACTION -- WORK ON ACTION 25, THE STANDARDIZATION OF PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES. AND THE GOAL FOR THIS ACTION IS TO MAKE STRIDES IN CREATING A MORE STANDARD AND THEREFORE A MORE EQUITABLE APPROACH TO DETERMINING ADA PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY ACROSS THE REGION NO DOING SO WE HOPE THAT WE WILL INCREASE THE ACCURACY ELIGIBILITY PROCESSES AND HOPE TO BE ABLE TO SAFEGUARD ADA PARATRANSIT FOR RIDERS WHO TRULY NEED THAT SERVICE. I AM TRULY LUCKY TO HAVE RICHARD WEINER FROM NELSON NYGAARD WORKING ON THIS WITH ME. HE TRULY IS AN EXPERT IN THIS AREA. HE HAS MORE THAN 35 YEARS OF EXPERIENCE WORKING WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THIS VERY ARENA IN PARATRANSIT COMPLIANCE. SO TODAY I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO RICHARD AND HE'S GOING TO GIVE YOU A SUMMARY OF RESEARCH FINDINGS. SO, FIRST HE'S GOING TO SUMMARIZE FOR YOU THE RANGE OF PROCESSES IN THE BAY AREA THAT ARE OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE CURRENTLY USING TO DETERMINE ADA PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY. AND, SECOND, HE IS GOING TO SUMMARIZE THE BEST PRACTICES FROM AROUND THE COUNTRY, AND SO WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO RICHARD.

RICHARD WEINER: GREAT. THANK YOU. I LIKE THE INTRODUCTION. SO, YEAH. I'M GOING TO TAKE ABOUT 5 TO 7 MINUTES ON EACH OF THOSE TWO SECTIONS THAT DRENNAN JUST MENTIONED. AND WHAT I WILL DO, IS I'LL PAUSE FOR QUESTIONS, MAYBE JUST DO A FEW QUESTIONS AFTER THE FIRST SECTION, AND I THINK THERE MAY BE QUITE A FEW QUESTIONS. AND THEN WE CAN HAVE AN OPEN DISCUSSION AFTER THE SECOND. AND I'M MINDFUL OF THE FACT THAT THERE IS PROBABLY QUITE A RANGE OF FAMILIARITY AND KNOWLEDGE ABOUT WHAT THE ADA SAYS ABOUT PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY. SO, PLEASE DO ASK ME ANY QUESTIONS AND I'LL TRY TO ANSWER THEM AFTERWARDS. SO, LET ME JUST JUMP RIGHT IN. AS FAR AS THE DOCUMENTATION OF WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE BAY AREA, WELL, AS I'M SURE ALL OF YOU KNOW, THERE BE PROBABLY MORE TRANSIT SYSTEMS IN THE BAY AREA THAN ANY OTHER REGION IN THE COUNTRY. IT'S VERY BALKANIZED AND THIS IS REFLECTED IN THE PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES AS WELL. AND THE EFFECT OF THAT IS PEOPLE HAVE DIFFERENT CHANCES OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BEING FOUND ELIGIBLE, DEPENDING ON WHICH SYSTEM THEY'RE APPLYING TO AND THAT'S ONE OF THE THINGS WE WANTED TO TRY TO ADDRESS AS PART OF THIS ACTION PLAN. IN ORDER TO DOCUMENT WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE BAY AREA, I WAS ABLE TO ACTUALLY INTERVIEW REPRESENTATIVES OF ALL THE SYSTEMS IN THE BAY AREA, WHICH WAS GREAT. AND I WILL JUST TELL YOU SOME OF MY KEY FINDINGS. FIRST OF ALL, IT'S NO KEY SURPRISE THERE IS A BIG RANGE IN THE WAY THAT PARATRANSIT PROGRAMS ARE SCREENED. THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA ARE ALL THE SAME THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY, AND I CAN SPEAK TO ELIGIBILITY OF PEOPLE, WITH EXPLANATION AFTERWARDS. SO IT'S NOT THE ISSUE OF DIFFERENT ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA TO THE FACT THAT THIS IS APPROACHED IN DIFFERENT WAYS. THE PROCESS THAT'S USED VARIES CONSIDERABLY. SO YOU HAVE, PARTICULARLY FROM SMALL SYSTEMS WHICH RELY SIMPLY ON PAPER-BASED APPLICATION, COMPANIONSHIPS THE CASE FOR MANY SOCIAL SERVICE AGENCIES BEFORE THE ADA, TO THE PARTICULAR LARGE AGENCIES THAT INCLUDE IN-PERSON ASSESSMENT WHICH IS CAN BE JUST INTERVIEWS OR INTERVIEWS IN WHAT'S KNOWN AS A FUNCTIONAL ASSESSMENT IN WHICH THE PERSON PARTICIPATES GOING THROUGH A SERIES OF STEPS THAT MIMIC WHAT IT TAKES TO RIDE A BUS OR A TRAIN. PART OF THE REASON FOR THE CONSIDERABLE RANGE IN APPROACHES IS RESOURCES. IT TAKES MORE MONEY, AND SO THEREFORE THE LARGER ENTITIES ARE IN A BETTER POSITION TO DO FUNCTIONAL ASSESSMENTS. BUT ALSO THERE ARE POLITICAL AND HISTORICAL REASONS FOR THE DIFFERENCES. SOME OF THE THINGS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THAT I FOUND IS THAT -- PROBABLY NO SURPRISE THAT DURING THE COVID PERCENTAGE OF APPLICATIONS DROPPED SUBSTANTIALLY. ONE OF THE KEY MEASURES OF AN EFFECTIVE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS IS GIVEN THE FACT THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT INDIVIDUALS'S ABILITY TO RIDE A BUS, OR TRAIN, WHICH INVOLVES MANY DIFFERENT SKILLS, THERE ARE A LOT OF PEOPLE WHO CAN RIDE THE BUS SOMETIMES BUT CAN'T AT OTHER TIMES, THAT SHOULD BE ELIGIBLE FOR PARATRANSIT AND THOSE THAT SHOULD BE GIVEN DETERMINATION OF CONDITIONAL ELIGIBILITY. GENERALLY SPEAKING 20 TO 30% OF PEOPLE CONSIDERED TO BE ELIGIBLE IS CONSIDERED TO BE GOOD PRACTICE. WHILE IN THE BAY AREA THE VAST MAJORITY OF SYSTEMS DON'T FIND PEOPLE CONDITIONALLY ELIGIBLE IN THOSE PERCENTAGES ONLY FOUR OF THE 18% I SPOKE TO HAVE OVER 20% CONDITIONALS, ONLY TWO COULD ACTUALLY APPLY THE NET EFFECT OF THIS IS SOMEBODY CAN APPLY FOR PARATRANSIT ELIGIBILITY IN THE BAY AREA BETWEEN INCENTIVE AND 100% CHANCE THEY'RE GOING TO BE GRANTED ELIGIBILITY AND IN EFFECT THEY'LL BE GIVEN CONSIDERATION FOR TRIPS. IN WHICH THE UNLIMITED FUNDING, AND FIXED SERVICES MEETING EVERYONE'S NEEDS AND PRIOR TRANSFERS MEETING EVERYONE'S NEEDS, THAT WOULDN'T BE THE CASE, PARATRANSIT PROGRAMS ARE EXTREMELY INCONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE AND IT'S NOT SERVING THEIR NEEDS THERE'S A NEED TO HAVE A PROCESS THAT'S MORE ACCURATE TO ENSURE THAT PEOPLE, AS DRENNAN SAID, TO SAFEGUARD THE SERVICE QUALITY FOR PEOPLE WHO REALLY DON'T HAVE A CHOICE. THOSE WHO CANNOT RIDE FIXED ROUTE SHOULD BE GIVEN ADA COMPLIANCE AND USE A FRIENDLY SERVICE AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IT'S HARD TO DO THAT WHEN YOU HAVE A LOT OF PEOPLE RIDING OR WHO COULD ACTUALLY RIDE THE BUS FOR SOME OF THEIR TRIPS. THE WHOLE APPROACH IN THE COUNTRY IS TOWARDS WHAT'S CALLED MOBILITY MANAGEMENT. AND THAT'S SOMETHING DRENNAN MENTIONED, AND WE NEED TO INTEGRATE THIS TASK WITH THAT ONE, WHICH IS REALLY TAKING A HOLISTIC VIEW OF PEOPLE'S TRANSPORTATION CHOICES AND NOT JUST LIMITING IT TO PARATRANSIT. SO, SOME PLACES, WHEN SOMEBODY APPLIES TO PARATRANSIT, THEY USE THAT AS AN OPPORTUNITY TO TALK ABOUT ALL THE OPTIONS THAT ARE AVAILABLE IN A COMMUNITY. THE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS IS USUALLY CONTRACTED OUT. IT'S NOT DONE BY IN-HOUSE STAFFING. AND IT COSTS ANYWHERE FROM $70 TO $330 PER ASSESSMENT IN THE BAY AREA. THE 330 IS, YOU KNOW, FAIRLY SMALL SYSTEMS THAT, YOU KNOW, THAT ONLY HAVE A SMALL NUMBER OF APPLICATIONS WHICH IS WHY IT'S EXPENSIVE PER APPLICATION. $70 IS PARTICULAR OF THE LARGEST SYSTEMS. THE AMOUNT OF MONEY SPENT ARRANGES FROM ABOUT A MILLION DOLLARS IN SANTA CLARA COUNTY. VTA TO ABOUT $30,000 IN SOME OF THE SMALLER ONES IN THE NORTH BAY. OTHER ITEMS I INCLUDED IN THE INVENTORY OF WHAT'S HAPPENING IN THE BAY AREA INCLUDE, HOW DO THEY DO CAP OF TRAVEL ASSESSMENTS. HOW DO THEY HANDLE ASSESSMENTS LIKE PEOPLE WITH COGNITIVE OR PSYCHIATRIC, OR SEIZURES THOSE KINDS OF THINGS WHICH ARE NOT READILY APPARENT WHEN YOU CAN'T MAKE THAT DETERMINATION BY SEEING SOMEBODY IN AN INTERVIEW. AND THEN APPEALS, HOW ARE APPEALS HANDLED IN SEVERAL DIFFERENT SYSTEMS. THAT'S A LOT OF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INFORMATION IN SEVEN MINUTES. BEFORE I TALK ABOUT WHAT'S CONSIDERED TO BE BEST PRACTICES IN OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY, SHOULD WE TAKE TWO OR THREE QUESTIONS NOW? IT'S UP TO THE CHAIR.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: I THINK WE CAN SAVE QUESTIONS FOR THE END. I ALSO WANT TO REMIND EVERYBODY THAT WE'RE DISCUSSING THE FINDINGS. IT'S NOT YET THE RECOMMENDATIONS SO WE HAVE A CHANCE TO PROVIDE INPUT ON RECOMMENDATIONS AT THE TIME IT'S PRESENTED TO US. JUST WANTED TO GIVE EVERYONE A HEADS-UP. LET'S GO AHEAD AND SAVE QUESTIONS FOR THE END.

RICHARD WEINER: THANK YOU FOR THE REMINDER ABOUT RECOMMENDATIONS AT THE END. THERE HAS BEEN QUITE A BIT OF RESEARCH OVER THE 30 YEARS, SINCE THE PASSAGE OF ADA, SOME STUDIES WENT THROUGH THOSE AND PULLED OUT THINGS THAT WERE MOST RELEVANT TO THE BAY AREA AND LESSONED LEARNED AND THE MANUAL DEVELOPED EARLY ON FOR ADA IS STILL CONSIDERED TO BE THE MANUAL THAT'S USED FOR ELIGIBILITY SCREENS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY AND USED FOR HUNDREDS OF THOUSANDS OF ASSESSMENTS THEN THERE WAS A GUIDE PRODUCED BY DISABILITY RIGHTS EDUCATION DEFENSE FUND, DREYFUS AND SPONSORED BY THE FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION ON DIFFERENT TOPIC AREAS AND SPECIFICALLY FOCUSED ON ELIGIBILITY. THEN I HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO FOLLOW UP WITH FOUR OF THE EXEMPLARY TRANSIT AGENCIES THAT I'M AWARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF AND THAT I HAVE WORKED WITH OVER THE YEARS IN CHICAGO, SEATTLE, SAN DIEGO, AND AUSTIN. IN WHAT'S CONSIDERED TO BE BEST PRACTICE IN THE INDUSTRY IS IN-PERSON ASSESSMENTS FOR A VARIETY OF REASONS, WHICH ARE CAN ELABORATE ON. BUT THESE AREN'T ALWAYS FEASIBLE FOR FINANCIAL REASONS, AND IN SOME CASES, YOU KNOW, THERE ARE A FEW SMALL SYSTEMS, FOR EXAMPLE, IN THE NORTH BAY, THAT SAY WE CAN PROVIDE ALL THE SERVICE TO EVERYBODY WHO APPLIES, SO WHY WOULD WE SPEND MONEY ON, YOU KNOW, HAVING MORE ACCURATE IN-PERSON ASSESSMENT THAN PAPER APPLICATIONS. AND THAT'S TOTALLY LEGITIMATE, BUT THIS'S NOT THE CASE FOR MOST SYSTEMS IN THE BAY AREA. MOST ARE STRUGGLING TO MEET THE NEEDS OF PEOPLE WHO NEED IT, AND FINANCIALLY IT'S OBVIOUSLY VERY EXPENSIVE. THE COST PER TRIP FOR SOMEONE ON PARA TRANSIT IS BETWEEN 8 AND 10 TIMES AS MUCH AS FIXED ROUTE. SO, FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE IN A VERY LOOSE PROCESS, GET ELIGIBILITY, AND MAYBE RIDE ON A SUBSCRIPTION BASIS EVERY DAY, IT COSTS 10 TO $15,000 FOR THAT ONE PERSON. AND THEY MAY HAVE BEEN ABLE TO TAKE THE TRIPS ON FIXED ROUTE SO WE TAKE THAT INTO ACCOUNT. AND THE ADA IS CONSIDER CLEAR, IT SAYS THAT THE PROCESS, THAT ELIGIBILITY SHOULD BE STRICTLY LIMITED TO PEOPLE WHO MEET CERTAIN CRITERIA. THEY USE THE WORD STRUCTURALLY IN THE EXPLANATION THEY SAY PARATRANSIT WAS NEVER MEANT TO BE THE PRIMARY TRANSPORTATION MODE FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES IT WAS MEANT TO BE A SAFETY NET. SO, KEEP THAT IN MIND WHEN THINKING ABOUT WHAT IT MEANS TO HAVE AN ACCURATE ASSESSMENT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WHAT -- THE EXEMPLARY SYSTEMS HAVE FOUND, IS HAVING PEOPLE COME IN PROVIDES AN OPPORTUNITY TO TALK ABOUT AND TO EDUCATE THEM ABOUT WHAT ACCOMMODATIONS THERE ARE ON BUSES. MANY PEOPLE WHO ARE MY AGE, YOU KNOW, HAVEN'T RIDDEN A BUS IN 40 YEARS. AND, SO, THEY DON'T KNOW -- THEY THINK THEY CAN'T RIDE A BUS, BUT THEY'RE NOT FAMILIAR WITH ALL OF THE ASSESSABLE ACCOMMODATIONS AND THERE IS OPPORTUNITY WHEN YOU MEET FACE-TO-FACE WITH SOMEBODY TO TALK ABOUT THOSE. I MENTIONED THE TOPIC GUIDE, SOME OF THE THINGS THAT CAME OUT OF THERE, DON'T DENI ELIGIBILITY BASED ON DISABILITY TYPE, NOT A MEDICAL ASSESSMENT TO THE DISABILITY OF HOW YOUR DISABILITY PRISONS YOU FROM RIDING TRANSIT. THEY STRONGLY RECOMMEND APPLYING ELIGIBILITY CONDITIONS AS I MENTIONED BEFORE AND RECOGNIZE THAT JUST PEOPLE SOMEBODY RIDES THE BUS DOESN'T MEAN THEY SHOULDN'T BE ELIGIBLE FOR PARATRANSIT TRIPS. AND YOU NEED TO CONSIDER THE WHOLE SYSTEM I HAVE SEEN SYSTEMS WHERE THEY FIND OUT WHERE THE PERSON LIVES LOOK AT THE PATH OF TRAVEL TO THE BUS STOP AND IF IT'S ACCESSIBLE, AND DETERMINE ELIGIBILITY, THEY DON'T LIMIT BY TRIP PURPOSE. DENIAL IS VERY -- DID NOT VARY MUCH BASED ON APPLICATION OR IN-PERSON ASSESSMENT SOMEWHERE AROUND 7% BUT THIS IS INTERESTING IN THE BAY AREA IT'S MUCH LOWER THAN THAT, BASICALLY SOME SYSTEMS JUST GIVE IT TO EVERYONE. IT RANGES FROM ZERO TO 5% OF THE TEN SAMPLE SYSTEMS I LOOKED AT. THERE ARE FEW THAT GO HIRE BY AND LARGE THE PERCENTAGE IS QUITE LOW IN THE BAY AREA. AND THE RANGE OF CONDITIONAL VARIES

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CONSIDERABLY IN PARTS OF THE COUNTRY BETWEEN 11 AND 28%. I'LL SKIP OVER SOME OF THE THINGS TO TALK ABOUT SOME OF THE MOST RELEVANT. THERE IS A REALLY IMPORTANT DISCUSSION IN ONE OF THE REPORTS, AND IN OUR REPORT, ACTUALLY, WHERE I TOOK FROM THE REPORT SAYING WHAT -- YOU KNOW, BECAUSE PEOPLE SAY, IT'S SO EXPENSIVE TO DO THIS ASSESSMENT. BUT IT'S INCONVENIENT. AND THE ARGUMENT IS MADE THAT IT DEFINITELY IS INCONVENIENT TO HAVE SOMEBODY COME IN AND GIVE UP THREE OR FOUR HOURS OF THEIR DAY TO DO THIS ASSESSMENT, BUT THEY'RE ONLY DOING THAT ONCE EVERY THREE YEARS AND IN MANY CASES ONLY ONCE IN THEIR LIFETIME BECAUSE THEY MAY BE FOUND YOU AUTOMATICALLY RECERTIFIED WHEN ELIGIBILITY COMES UP. SO THEY JUST SEND IN UPDATED INFORMATION. THEY DON'T HAVE TO COME IN. SO GIVEN THE COST OF THIS IS CONSIDERED NOT TO BE AN UNREASONABLE EXPECTATION. AND THERE IS NO QUESTION THAT IF YOU LOOK AT THE, EVEN, YOU KNOW, WHEN IT'S A MILLION DOLLARS, HAVING MORE ACCURATE PROCESS, GIVEN THAT THERE MAY BE SOME PEOPLE WHO ARE COSTING 10 TO 15,000 A YEAR, MULTIPLE THAT BY 500 PEOPLE OVER MANY YEARS YOU CAN SEE WHY THAT MIGHT BE VERY EXPENSIVE. AND I'LL SAY THAT THE MOST SUCCESSFUL ELIGIBILITY PROCESSES ARE THE ONES WHERE THE SYSTEM HAS REAL ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS. COUNTY METRO IN SEATTLE, ABOUT 25 YEARS AGO, DECIDED THEY WERE GOING TO CREATE OPPORTUNITIES FOR PEOPLE TO USE SERVICES OTHER THAN PARATRANSIT. SO THEY HAVE SHUTTLE SERVICES THAT FEED INTO MAIN STREET MAIN LINE SERVICE. OR THEY WILL WORK WITH COMMUNITY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GROUPS TO PROVIDE THEIR OWN TRANSPORTATION, AND HAVE REALLY GOOD TRAVEL TRAINING AND ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO RIDE FIXED ROUTE. AND AS A RESULT, THEIR REGISTRATION BASE, WHICH IS AT ABOUT 30,000 IN 2007, HAS DROPPED TO AROUND 12,000 BECAUSE PEOPLE DON'T FEEL THE NEED TO USE PARATRANSIT IN THE SAME NUMBERS. AND THAT REALLY IS THE GOAL TO MAKE SURE THAT PEOPLE INVESTIGATOR OPTIONS. AND SOME OF THAT HAS BEEN HAPPENING IN THE BAY AREA. I CAN GIVE SOME EXAMPLES. BUT I THINK I'LL STOP THERE AND JUST OPEN IT UP FOR QUESTIONS.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. I SEE WALT ERR HAS HIS HAND RAISED.

WALTER WILSON: THANK YOU. THAT WAS A GREAT REPORT. I HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS. THE 10 TO 15,000 YOU TALKED ABOUT WAS THAT ANNUALLY? TEN OR $15,000?

RICHARD WEINER: I DON'T REMEMBER -- 10 TO 15,000, PER PERSON? IS THAT WHAT YOU'RE REFERRING TO?

WALTER WILSON: YES.

RICHARD WEINER: 10 TO $15,000 PER PERSON FOR A SUBSCRIPTION RIDER. YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WALTER WILSON: I'M CURIOUS. THE PARATRANSIT WAS NOT DESIGNED AS A PERMANENT MODE OF TRANSPORTATION, WHAT THEN WAS THE PLAN OPTION TO PARATRANSIT? I MEAN, WHAT ELSE IS THERE? WHAT HAD THEY INITIALLY PLANNED, IF THE PARATRANSIT WAS NOT DESIGNED AS A PERMANENT FORM OF TRANSPORTATION FOR SOME PEOPLE? WHAT WAS THE OTHERING OPTION, I GUESS.

RICHARD WEINER: THANKS FOR THE QUESTION. YEAH, THE WHOLE THRUST OF THE TRANSPORTATION PIECE OF THE ADA WAS TO MAKE FIXED ROUTE SERVICES AS ACCESSIBLE AS POSSIBLE. SO YOU KNOW, PROBABLY 50 YEARS AGO, MOST BUSES DIDN'T HAVE LIFTS OR RAMPS. THEY DID NOT HAVE ENUNCIATED [INDISCERNIBLE] FOR CERTAIN PEOPLE FOR VISUALLY IMPAIRED, ET CETERA, THERE HAVE BEEN MASSIVE INVESTMENTS IN THAT, BUT STILL NOT GREAT. IT WAS NOT AS CONVENIENT FOR MANY PEOPLE. BUT THAT WAS THE MAIN FOCUS WAS TO PUT MONEY INTO FIXED ROUTE TRANSIT SO PEOPLE WOULDN'T HAVE TO USE PARATRANSIT.

WALTER WILSON: SO THEN, WHAT ABOUT FOLKS -- I KNOW PEOPLE WHO USE PARATRANSIT HAVE TO USE IT. MOST I KNOW OF, WHEN THEY GO TO DOCTORS APPOINTMENTS. I'M CURIOUS TO THE IMPACT OF COVID WHAT IT'S BEEN ON INCREASING THE USE OF PARATRANSIT.

RICHARD WEINER: RIDERSHIP DROPPED SIGNIFICANTLY DURING COVID IN THE FIRST PERIOD, FOR SOME REASON FIXED ROUTE RIDERSHIP

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DROPOUT SIGNIFICANTLY IN MANY CASES 50% OF WHAT IT HAD BEEN BEFORE, AND IN THE FIRST MONTH OR TWO, PEOPLE WEREN'T GOING OUT EXCEPT THEY HAD A LIFELINE TYPE MEDICAL APPOINTMENT. BUT IT'S CERTAINLY GROWN AND IT VARIES FROM SYSTEM TO SYSTEM. BUT GENERALLY SPEAKING FROM WHAT I HAVE SEEN AROUND THE COUNTRY, IT'S BACK TO MAYBE 50 TO 70% OF THE PREVIOUS RIDERSHIP PRECOVID. BUT WE HEARD FROM ONE OF THE PROVIDERS THIS WEEK THEY'RE AT AROUND 90%. SO IT'S GETTING THERE, AND OBVIOUSLY IT'S MORE EXPENSIVE FOR THOSE TRIPS. SO, ANYWAY, I HOPE THAT ANSWERS YOUR QUESTION.

WALTER WILSON: IT DOES. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. I SEE CHRISTINE HAND RAISED.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU. I'M CURIOUS ABOUT A COUPLE OF THINGS. NUMBER ONE, GIVEN THAT, YOU KNOW, UNDERSTANDING THAT PARATRANSIT WAS NEVER FORESEEN AS ALTERNATIVE TO FIXED ROUTE. IT WAS JUST A SAFETY NET, AS YOU MENTIONED. THERE ARE MANY OF US THAT HAVE PERMANENT DISABILITIES THAT WILL NEVER GO AWAY. I AM CURIOUS TO KNOW, WHEN YOU TALK TO THESE DIFFERENT AGENCIES, YOU HAVE EVER EXPLORED THE QUESTION WHY IT WAS, FOR EXAMPLE, FOLKS WITH PERMANENT DISABILITIES WERE REQUIRED TO HAVE AN ADDITIONAL EVALUATION? THE DISABILITY DOESN'T -- WELL, A LOT OF DISABILITIES DO NOT CHANGE. HOWEVER, MY POINT BEING, THERE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IS A DISABILITY THAT IS THERE AND PERMANENT. SO, THE CONCERN THAT I OFTEN HEAR FROM MY CONSTITUENTS ARE THAT, ONE, I HAVE A PERMANENT DISABILITY WHERE THEY ARE ACKNOWLEDGE BACK TO ME TO DO ANOTHER EVALUATION, AND, TWO, CAN THIS BE STREAMLINED. BUT, YOU KNOW, WE'RE TO THE POINT, JUST MAKING IT MORE USER FRIENDLY FOR THE CONSUMER. FOR INSTANCE, YOU GET A LETTER FROM ELIGIBILITY THAT MAY SAY SOMETHING TO THE EFFECT OF, YOU ARE PROVISIONALLY LIMITED TO X NUMBER OF RIDES, DEPENDING ON WEATHER RELATED, SCARES PEOPLE, PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES WHERE BEING IN THE SUN OR SHADE FOR TOO LONG IS DETRIMENTAL. WE HAVE ONE-SEAT BEHIND, YOU KNOW, WITH MULTIPLE PICK UPS IS SUPER CRITICAL TO A LOT OF PEOPLE RATHER THAN FIXED ROUTE.

RICHARD WEINER: YOU TOUCHED ON A FEW DIFFERENT TOPICS. LET'S SEE IF I CAN ANSWER THEM SEPARATELY. FIRST OF ALL, TO YOUR POINT, FROM WHAT I HAVE NOTICED JUST FROM WORKING IN DIFFERENT AREAS IN THE BAY AREA, DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES, THE ISSUE YOU BRING UP ABOUT MAKING IT EASIER WHEN SOMEBODY'S ALREADY CERTIFIED WHY SHOULD THEY HAVE TO COME BACK AGAIN EACH TIME IS SOMETHING I HAVE HEARD A LOT OF AND THAT IS GOING TO GET PREFACED AGAIN. TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS, BECAUSE THAT HAS TO BE DONE WITH A LOT OF INPUT. THAT IS A REAL ISSUE, AND FRANKLY, OTHER PARTS OF THE COUNTRY ARE WAY AHEAD OF US. TO THE ORDER OF CERTIFICATION OR RECERTIFICATION IN DIFFERENT PLACES, AND THE BEST PRACTICES IF SOMEBODY'S BEING OFFERED ASSESSMENT AND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OPPORTUNITY TO TALK WITH THE ELIGIBILITY ASSESSOR IT'S CLEAR THAT THE DISABILITY IS NOT GOING TO CHANGE TO THE POINT WHERE IT WOULD MAKE IT EASIER FOR THEM, OR TO NOT ACTUALLY RIDE FIXED ROUTE. THERE IS NO REASON FOR THEM TO COME BACK AGAIN. AND MANY SYSTEMS, IF NOT MOST SYSTEMS AROUND THE COUNTRY, HAVE IMPLEMENTED A PARTICULAR DESIGNATION FOR THAT SO WHEN A PERSON HAS THAT ASSESSMENT THERE WILL BE A CHECKMARK SAYING THAT IF THE ELIGIBILITY TERM IS THREE YEARS, AT THE THREE YEAR MARK THEY WILL SEND THEM A POSTCARD AND SAY CAN YOU PLEASE UPDATE CHANGES TO YOUR ADDRESS, IF YOU'RE USING DIFFERENT KINDS OF MOBILITY DEVICES, WE NEED TO KNOW THAT SO WE CAN SERVE YOU PROPERLY, ALL ON A ONE PAPER. SO WE'RE HOPING THIS STUDY WILL ADDRESS THE ISSUE THAT YOU ARE RAISING.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I CAN ASK A LAST QUESTION, THEN I'LL SHUT UP?

RICHARD WEINER: YES, SURE. GO AHEAD.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I AM CURIOUS, HAVE YOU LOOKED, EVEN, TO OTHER COUNTRIES TO SEE WHAT THEY'RE -- IF THEY HAVE PARATRANSIT AND WHAT THEIR PARATRANSIT SYSTEMS ARE DOING?

RICHARD WEINER: YEAH. I HAVE DONE A FAIR AMOUNT OF WORK IN CANADA, AS WELL, AND AM ALWAYS INTERESTED IN WHAT'S HAPPENING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IN OTHER COUNTRIES. HOW I CAN SAY THIS AND BE POLITICALLY ASTUTE? AS I SAY TO MY CANADIAN CLIENTS, WE ALWAYS LOOK TO CANADA TO BE MORE PROGRESSIVE THAN THE U.S. IN MOST THINGS BUT WHEN IT COMES TO DISABILITY ACCESS THE U.S. IS REALLY KIND OF AHEAD. AND THAT'S BECAUSE OF THE DISABILITY RIGHTS MOVEMENT IN THIS COUNTRY BEING MUCH STRONGER. AND IN CANADA, ALL OF THESE KINDS OF THINGS ARE NOT BASED ON FEDERAL LAW, THEY'RE BASED ON HUMAN RIGHTS COURT CASES, SO IT'S NOT NEARLY AS EFFECTIVE. SO EVEN THOUGH I DO KNOW WHAT'S HAPPENING IN OTHER PLACES, FRANKLY WHAT'S HAPPENING OVER HERE IS CONSIDERED TO BE MORE PROGRESSIVE.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: OKAY.

RICHARD WEINER: AND THE ORDER OF RESEARCH CLEARLY IS THE CASE THAT'S BEEN A LONG TIME COMING AND THE SYSTEMS ARE, SORT OF, CATCHING UP. BUT THAT A VERY IMPORTANT POINT.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: THANK YOU. I WAS CURIOUS.

RICHARD WEINER: AND THE OTHER QUESTION, I WANT TO CLARIFY, YOU SAID THE FARE FOR PEOPLE, THEY LIMIT PEOPLE TO AN CERTAIN NUMBER OF TRIPS BASED ON WEATHER AND THAT SORT OF THING. JUST TO BE CLEAR, YOU CAN'T PLACE ANY LIMITS ON THE NUMBER OF TRIPS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I KNOW. BUT WHAT I'M SAYING IS THE LETTER ITSELF SCARES THE CRUD OUT OF THEM, LIKE YOU SAID, THINKING SOMETHING IS WRONG. BUT I DO TRY TO HELP THEM UNDERSTAND, LIKE, NO, NO, NO, THEY'RE JUST LETTING YOU UNDERSTAND THAT YOU HAVE GOT THIS SERVICE, DON'T WORRY ABOUT IT. BUT LEGALLY, THEY HAVE TO SAY IT THIS WAY.

RICHARD WEINER: IT'S TRUE. IT'S NOT THE NUMBER OF TRIPS, BUT THE TRIPS ARE LIMITED IN SOME CASES BY THE ELIGIBILITY CONDITION. AND THE THAT'S CONSIDERED TO BE A GOOD PRACTICE. FOR EXAMPLE, NIGHT VISION; IF SOMEBODY HAS BARRIERS TRAVELING AT NIGHT BECAUSE OF LOWER VISION, THERE IS NO REASON WHY THEY SHOULDN'T BE ABLE TO RIDE THE BUS AT 3:00 IN THE AFTERNOON. SO, IN THAT PARTICULAR CASE, IF SOMEBODY IS CONDITIONALLY ELIGIBLE BASED ON NIGHT VISION, THEY WILL GET ALL THE TRIPS THEY REQUEST AFTER 5:00, THEY TRY TO BE AS CONSERVATIVE AS POSSIBLE EVEN AT 4:00, AND ALL OTHER TRIPS TO RIDE ON FIXED ROUTE. THAT'S WHAT'S BEHIND THE CONDITIONS. AND WITH THE WEATHER IT'S TRICKY, AND DISTANCE, THERE ARE A WHOLE LOT OF THEM. BUT IT'S BEEN 30 YEARS OF EXPERIENCE AND HOW TO IMPLEMENT THEM. AND SOME SYSTEMS ENFORCE THEM MORE THAN OTHER MUCH MORE SYSTEMATIC. IT'S NOT BASED ON NUMBER OF TRIPS. THEY CAN TAKE ANY NUMBER OF TRIPS UNDER THOSE CONDITIONS. I UNDERSTAND EDUCATING PEOPLE IN THE COMMUNITY IS SO IMPORTANT,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND, HOPEFULLY, THAT'S GOING TO BE ONE OF THE THINGS THAT COMES OUT OF THIS.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: YEAH. THANK YOU.

RICHARD WEINER: THANKS. I'M READY FOR THE NEXT QUESTION.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: I SEE HOWARD'S HAND IS RAISED.

HOWARD WONG: HELLO.

RICHARD WEINER: HI.

HOWARD WONG: VERY IMPORTANT PRESENTATION. I THINK YOUR REPORT AND STUDY OPENS WITH SOMEWHAT OF AN INTRODUCTION THAT SAYS THE INTENT OF AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT AND WHAT MOST DISABILITY ADVOCATES WANT IS INDEPENDENT LIVING THAT CREATES AN ENVIRONMENT WHERE THE DISABLED, THE SENIORS, ARE LIVING AS NORMAL CITIZENS, AND NOT NECESSARILY EVEN NEEDING PARATRANSIT. THAT PARA-- THAT THE ELIMINATION OR MINIMIZING THE NEED FOR PARATRANSIT BY HOW WE DESIGN OUR STREETS, OUR TRANSIT, OUR PUBLIC AREAS AND ACCESS TO 59 THINGS IN OUR SOCIETY IS THE GOAL. SO FOR MANY IN SAN FRANCISCO, PARATRANSIT IS NOT EVEN NECESSARILY DESIRABLE. BECAUSE ASIDE FROM THE COST, YOU KNOW, YOU HAVE TO MAKE RESERVATIONS A DAY OR SO IN ADVANCE. IT'S NOT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INDEPENDENT LIVING. AND EVEN IF BUSES HAVE LOW FLOOR BUSES OR RAMPS OR PLATFORMS OR, YOU KNOW, EVEN ENOUGH SEATING, IT'S JUST NOT A SIMPLE THING TO ACCESS. SO THAT THERE IS A LOT ONE CAN DO TO IMPROVE OPERATE DESIGN AND STREET DESIGN. SO, I WOULD, YOU KNOW, SUGGEST THAT THERE BE SOME KIND OF INTRODUCTION THAT THE GOAL REALLY IS TO MINIMIZE THE NEED FOR PARATRANSIT.

RICHARD WEINER: GREAT. TOTALLY ON BOARD WITH WHAT YOU JUST SAID. THAT IS VERY CONSISTENT. AND I THINK WHAT YOU ARE SAYING IS REALLY IMPORTANT. BECAUSE IT SPEAKS TO SOME OF THE OTHER ACTIONS, THE OTHER TASKS IN THIS ACTION PLAN, WHICH IS TO INTEGRATE ELIGIBILITY WITH OTHER THINGS IN TERMS OF MAKING THE ENVIRONMENT MORE ACCESSIBLE, BUT, ALSO, THIS MOBILITY MANAGEMENT TASK WHICH IS REALLY INTENDED TO LOOK AT OTHER ISSUES AND TO MAYBE BARRIERS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES. WHY THEY'RE HAVING TO USE PARATRANSIT WHEN THERE REALLY ARE OTHER THINGS THAT SHOULD BE OFFERED TO THEM. YOU KNOW, FOR EXAMPLE, IN PITTSBURGH, THEY'RE VERY, VERY INNOVATIVE, AND, SO, I JUST WILL GIVE AN EXAMPLE FOR THE WOMAN WHO RUNS THE PROGRAM OVER THERE, THEY FOUND SOMEBODY WHO HAS TO RIDE PARATRANSIT, BECAUSE THE BUS STOP THAT'S NEAR HER HOME IS NOT ACCESSIBLE. SO THEY WORK WITH THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT TO PUT IN AN ACCESSIBLE BUS STOP THERE AND THE WOMAN NOW RIDES A BUS AND SHE WOULD RATHER BE RIDING A PARATRANSIT BUSINESS AND THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AGENCY MADE THE CALCULATION FOR THE CITY THAT IT WAS WORTH SPENDING WHATEVER IT COSTS TO MAKE THE BUS STOP ACCESSIBLE RATHER THAN HAVE THAT PERSON RIDE PARATRANSIT. THEY'RE VERY LIMITED. THANK YOU FOR THE QUESTION. I'LL GO TO THE NEXT QUESTION.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: BEFORE WE GO TO THE NEXT QUESTION, THERE MAY BE AN ALTERNATE THAT SHOULD BE BUMPED UP TO A PANELIST. I'M NOT SURE IF THAT'S ALREADY BEEN DONE. BUT JUST WANTED TO BRING THAT UP. IF WE CAN MOVE TO TERRY'S QUESTION.

TERRY SCOTT: THANK YOU. MY QUESTION RELATES TO, IS THERE AN ADEQUATE PROCESS TO ACCOMMODATE ADA CITIZENS WITH SERVICE ANIMALS?

RICHARD WEINER: ARE YOU ASKING THAT IN THE CONTEXT OF ELIGIBILITY PROCESS?

TERRY SCOTT: YES. ARE THERE ANY RESTRICTIONS THAT WOULD APPLY TO A DISABLED PERSON WITH A SERVICE ANIMAL? ARE THERE ANY THAT YOU ARE AWARE OF?

RICHARD WEINER: NO. THERE ARE POLICIES THAT HAVE BEEN DEPEND BY THE USDOT ON ALLOWING PEOPLE ON BUSES WITH SERVICE ANIMALS, AND CERTAIN DESIGNATIONS BUT THERE IS NO LIMITATION BEYOND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THOSE. AND IT DOES USUALLY COME UP IN THE ELIGIBILITY PROCESS. USUALLY WHEN PEOPLE ARE ACKNOWLEDGE PEOPLE ARE ASKED TO BRING THEIR MOBILITY DEVICE THAT THEY MOST COMMONLY USE F THEY USE A SERVICE ANIMAL, OBVIOUSLY THEY WILL COME WITH A SERVICE ANIMAL. THAT'S TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT.

TERRY SCOTT: THANK YOU.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. WE'LL MOVE TO THE NEXT QUESTION, WHICH IS DWAYNE.

DWAYNE HANKERSON: THANK YOU. I HAVE A COUPLE OF COMMENTS. I'M A MEMBER OF THE PARATRANSIT COORDINATING COMMITTEE FOR SOLANO COUNTY, AND THIS IS ACTUALLY ONE OF THE CONVERSATIONS IN THE LAST MEETING. AND IT SEEMS THAT, FOR THIS AGENCY, THE SDA AGENCY, THEY HAVE INCLUDED ADDITIONAL TRANSPORT FOR THE COMMUNITY. ONE IS THEY PROVIDE, IF YOU QUALIFY, THEY PROVIDE YOU A CARD, AND THE CARD, YOU CAN RIDE THE, IN THE CAB CAP, FOR A DISCOUNTED PRICE, AND THE OTHER IS, THEY HAVE A COMMUNITY-BASED ORGANIZATION, AND THIS ORGANIZATION HAS VEHICLES THAT CAN FIT UP TO FOUR PEOPLE WITH SERVICE ANIMALS AND WITH THEIR EQUIPMENT. AND THEN MY OTHER COMMENT IS ABOUT TECHNOLOGY AND THE ASSESSMENT. I THINK THAT MAYBE IT SHOULD BE CONSIDERED, WHEN YOU GUYS TALK ABOUT IT IN YOUR MEETING. THAT IF A PERSON HAS MOBILITY ISSUES, CAN THE ASSESSMENT BE DONE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OVER ZOOM, OR, LIKE, OVER A PHONE CALL? A VIDEO PHONE CALL? THAT WAY THEY DON'T HAVE TO SPEND THE TIME TO LEAVE WHERE THEY ARE, AND WHERE YOU ALREADY HAVE MOBILITY ISSUES AND GO TO A PLACE JUST FOR THEM TO TELL YOU QUALIFY. AND A LOT OF TIMES WHEN WE MAKE OUR PLANS AND LOOK AT THE LAWS WE DON'T THINK ABOUT THE END USER, BECAUSE IN ONE OF THE MEETINGS I WENT TO, THE PARATRANSIT COORDINATING COMMITTEE, ONE OF THE MAIN COMPONENTS WAS [AUDIO DISTORTION] MOVING IN A MORE POSITIVE DIRECTION, IS THAT WHERE THE LAW ACTUALLY, BEING ABLE TO ALLOCATE GRANTS AND FUNDS WHERE ACTUAL PROGRAMS ALLOW THAT.

RICHARD WEINER: THANK YOU. I DON'T KNOW IF IT WAS JUST MY COMPUTER, BUT YOUR LAST COMMENTS, YOU CUT OUT. YOU EITHER PUT THOSE, OR SOMEBODY ELSE PUT THEM -- I HEARD THE WORD POSITIVE, BUT COULD YOU JUST REPEAT THE LAST POINT YOU MADE AND I'LL ADDRESS THE EARLIER ONES.

WALTER WILSON: OKAY MY LAST POINT WAS, WHEN WE HAVE MEETINGS, WE ANALYZED THE WAY WE ALLOCATE THE MONEY. WE DON'T THINK ABOUT THE END USER, WE THINK ABOUT A GOOD PLAN, AND THEN THE PARATRANSIT COORDINATOR WITH FTA, AROUND BEING LATE OR ON TIME, SO, THOSE ARE THE MAIN COMPLAINTS. IS THAT, YOU KNOW, I GOT THE SERVICE, YOU KNOW, I CAN DO WHAT I NEED TO DO, BUT IF THE BUS DOESN'T SHOW UP, WHAT HAPPENS IS, LIKE, USER PROBLEMS. AND TAKEN INTO ACCOUNT, THAT EVEN WITH THE BEST PLAN, THERE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MAY NEED TO BE, LIKE, A BACKUP PLAN, MAYBE A PHONE NUMBER YOU CAN CALL. IF YOU GUYS ARE TALKING ABOUT THIS WITH THE REGIONAL COORDINATOR, AND MAYBE THE REGIONAL COORDINATOR'S MISSION COULD BE THAT WHEN A RIDE IS MISSED, LIKE, WE KNOW WHAT TIME YOU NEED TO GET TO YOUR APPOINTMENT, AND WE'LL HELP YOU GET TO YOUR APPOINTMENT. THAT TO ME IS MORE OF A CONCERN FOR A PERSON THAT HAS TO USE THIS SERVICE THAN JUST THE SERVICE, THAT NOT ONLY DO I USE THE SERVICE BUT I WILL MAKE IT TO MY APPOINTMENT ON TIME, SO THAT'S KIND OF PART OF SOCIETY, IS THAT THE WAY THE LAW IS WRITTEN OR SOMETHING WE CAN DISCUSS FOR OURSELVES TO MAKE THE DECISION? OR AM I KIND OF OFF?

RICHARD WEINER: NO. OKAY GREAT. THANK YOU. LET ME START WITH YOUR LAST POINTS. THANKS FOR REPEATING IT. ABSOLUTELY, THAT'S THE WAY THE LAW IS WRITTEN. SOME OF THE SERVICE QUALITY ISSUES THAT YOU MENTIONED, LIKE, HAVING TO WAIT FOR VEHICLES AND NOT BE SITTING ON THE VEHICLE FOR A LONG TIME, THOSE ARE ALL THINGS THAT ARE ABSOLUTELY ADDRESSED IN THE ADA, THERE IS SOMETHING CALLED SERVICE CRITERIA WHICH TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE REQUIRED TO MEET, AND THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO HAVE, IF SOMEBODY IS SUPPOSED TO BE PICKED UP AT A CERTAIN TIME, IF THE WINDOW IS 15 BEFORE TO 15 AFTER, AND THEY COME HALF AN HOUR LATER, YOU CAN ONLY DO THAT A CERTAIN NUMBER OF TIMES BEFORE THE FTA WILL GIVE THE TRANSIT AGENCY A HARD TIME ABOUT IT, AND THEY'RE SUPPOSED TO COLLECT STATISTICS, WHICH I KNOW THEY DO IN SOLANO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COUNTY, BUT ABSOLUTELY, END USER IS PRIMARY IN THE WAY THE LAW IS WRITTEN. THAT IS A SEPARATE ISSUE FROM ELIGIBILITY. ONLY EXCEPT FOR THE FACT THAT HAVING MORE ACCURATE ELIGIBILITY MEANS THAT THE REGISTRATION BASE IS NOT GOING TO BE OVERWHELMED OF PEOPLE WHO COULD ACTUALLY DRIVE THE BUS IT MAKES IT MORE DIFFICULT FOR THE PARATRANSIT PROVIDERS TO MEET ALL THEIR SERVICE CRITERIA. IT'S A BALANCING ACT. YOU WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE PEOPLE RIDING HAVE A CHOICE AND THEY DON'T -- GET QUALITY SERVICE. TO YOUR EARLIER POINT YOU MENTIONED THE PEOPLE WITH MOBILITY CHALLENGES, DOING IT OVER ZOOM OR ON THE PHONE NOT HAVING TO COME IN. IF SOMEBODY IS RIDING PARATRANSIT, IF THEY'RE GOING TO BE FOUND ELIGIBLE THAT MEANS THEY'RE ABLE TO RIDE PARATRANSIT. WE ASK THEM TO COME IN ONCE A YEAR OVER EVERY THREE YEARS. FOR MANY PEOPLE THEY'RE BEING ASKED TO COME IN ONCE IN THEIR LIFETIME. AND IF THEY'RE NOT ABLE TO COME IN, THEY WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO RIDE PARATRANSIT ANYWAYS. SO, THE ASSUMPTION IS IF SOMEBODY IS APPLYING FOR PARATRANSIT, THEY CAN RIDE PARATRANSIT TO COME IN AND ASKING THEM TO COME IN ONCE IN THREE YEARS IS NOT TOO MUCH OF A BURDEN. IN TERMS OF WAS SERVICES, YOU MENTION THE INTERCITY TAXI SERVICE IN SOLANO COUNTY, SOLANO COUNTY IS QUITE AHEAD OF SOME OF THE OTHER COUNTIES IN TERMS OF HAVING A MOBILITY CENTER WHERE PEOPLE CAN DO MORE OF A ONE-STOP-SHOP AND FIND OUT ABOUT THE TAXI PROGRAM, LIKE YOU MENTIONED. THEY CAN FIND THAT OVER THERE. AND AS YOU MAY KNOW, IN SUISUN CITY NOW, THEY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CUT BACK FIXED RATE SERVICE WHICH MEANS THEY DON'T HAVE TO PROVIDE PARATRANSIT SERVICE. SO FTA CAME UP WITH ALTERNATIVE SERVICE CALLED MICRO TRANSIT SERVICE WHICH IS HOPEFULLY WILL PROVIDE THE SAME LEVEL OF SERVICE TO PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES AS FAR AS PARATRANSIT HAS, SO EVEN THE REQUIREMENT TRYING TO MEET THE MOBILITY NEEDS. THEY ARE TRYING TO DO OTHER THINGS IN SOLANO COUNTY TO MEET THOSE NEEDS. SO, THANKS FOR THE COMMENTS THAT YOU MADE. AND I DO NOT SEE ANY OTHER -- ARE THERE ANY OTHER SPEAKERS? THERE IS A PANEL -- YEAH.

WALTER WILSON: YEAH. MY HAND IS UP.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: GO AHEAD, WALTER, AND THEN WE'LL MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

WALTER WILSON: OH, YEAH. SO, THIS IS AN INTERESTING DISCUSSION. FOR ME, FIRST, I HAVE A QUESTION HERE, HOW MANY PEOPLE IN THIS ROOM HAVE RELIED ON PARATRANSIT? PLEASE. LET ME KNOW. HOW MANY PEOPLE IN THIS ROOM RELY ON PARA TRANSIT CURRENTLY? NOBODY? NOBODY IS HERE TO REALLY SPEAK ABOUT THEIR OWN EXPERIENCES. WHILE WE'RE HERE WE'RE TALKING ABOUT SOMETHING THAT'S IMPACTING OTHER PEOPLE. THAT'S MY CONCERN. WE HAVE A TENDENCY OF DOING THAT A LOT IN THESE PUBLIC MEETINGS AND TRYING TO SAY WHAT'S BEST FOR OTHER PEOPLE WHO AREN'T HERE. AND SO FOR ME TO SAY, THE CONVERSATION ABOUT REDUCING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THE USE OF PARATRANSIT TO OTHER ALTERNATIVE MEANS. AT THE END OF THE DAY I DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT MEANS. I DON'T KNOW THE QUALITY OF LIFE OF LIFE IMPACTS WILL BE TO THE PEOPLE WHO USE THIS SERVICE. AND I KNOW MY MOM WAS USING IT BEFORE SHE PASSED AWAY IN SAN FRANCISCO, TO HOWARD WONG'S STATEMENT, SHE WOULD HAVE DISAGREED WITH THE WHOLESALE, THAT IT WASN'T NECESSARY IN SAN FRANCISCO. BECAUSE IT WAS AN IMPORTANT PART OF HER LIFE IN TERMS OF JUST GETTING GROCERIES AND OTHER BASIC THINGS BECAUSE SHE WAS HIGHLY DEPENDENT UPON THE PARATRANSIT PROGRAM THERE. SO, I WOULD CHALLENGE EVERYONE HERE TO SAY, OKAY, IF THERE ARE ALTERNATIVES TO PARATRANSIT, WHAT IS THE LONG-TERM IMPACT OF THE QUALITY OF LIFE OF PEOPLE WHO ARE IMPACTED BY THESE ALTERNATIVES, AND ARE THE ALTERNATIVES BETTER. AND AT THE END OF THE DAY IS IT JUST ABOUT COST OR IMPROVING QUALITY OF LIFE FOR PEOPLE? BECAUSE THAT'S THE MOST IMPORTANT ASPECT HERE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

RICHARD WEINER: YOU ASKED THE QUESTION, AND, I DON'T KNOW -- PEOPLE -- I DON'T KNOW IF THE RAISED HANDS WERE -- I THINK THERE ARE SOME PARATRANSIT RIDERS IN THIS ROOM.

CHRISTINE FITZGERALD: I WAS JUST GOING TO SAY, I AM A PARATRANSIT RIDER. THIS IS CHRISTINE.

VINAY PIMPLE: I AM ALSO. VINAY.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FRANK WELTE: FRANK WELTE, AS WELL.

RICHARD WEINER: BUT YOUR POINTS, WALTER, IS WELL TAKEN. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE NOT SPEAKING FOR PEOPLE WHO AREN'T PART OF THE CONVERSATION. AND YEAH, THE GOAL ABSOLUTELY IS IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF LIFE, AND IF I COULD PARAPHRASE MR. WONG, I THINK WHAT YOU WERE SAYING IS, MAYBE IN CONTRAST TO OTHER CITIES, WHERE THERE ISN'T SO MUCH TRANSIT, PEOPLE MAY FIND OTHER ALTERNATIVES LIKE TAXIS OR OTHER OPTIONS OR EVEN FIXED ROUTES. BECAUSE THERE ARE SO MUCH MORE FIXED ROUTES OUTSIDE OF MANHATTAN, THAT THERE ARE OTHER OPTIONS HERE. SO, IT'S NOT THAT PEOPLE DON'T NEED PARATRANSIT IN SAN FRANCISCO, ABSOLUTELY THEY DO, AND YOU GAVE THE EXAMPLE OF YOUR MOM, ESPECIALLY PEOPLE WHO HAVE TO CARRY GROCERIES AND THAT, SORT OF, THING AND TO HAVE TO TAKE IT ON THE BUS OR STREETCAR IS INCONVENIENT. THERE WILL ALWAYS BE NEED FOR PARATRANSIT IN SAN FRANCISCO I THINK THE POINT BECAUSE THERE ARE OTHER OPTIONS THERE IS LESS OF A NEED AND THAT'S WHAT WE SEE IN THE NUMBERS, IT'S ABSOLUTELY CLEAR IN SAN FRANCISCO. THEY HAVE A SMALLER REGISTRATION BASE THAN MANY CITIES OF THE SAME SIZE POPULATION BECAUSE PEOPLE DO USE OTHER MEANS. BUT THAT'S NOT TO SAY THAT PARATRANSIT ISN'T A CRITICAL NEED FOR SOME PEOPLE AND FOR SOME TRIPS.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DRENNAN SHELTON: LET ME, RICHARD, JUMP IN HERE. THIS IS DRENNAN, MTC STAFF, I WANT TO SAY IT AGAIN, I HAVE SAID IT BEFORE, WE DO TAKE SERIOUSLY THE MANTRA, "NOTHING ABOUT US WITHOUT US." WE'RE NOT AT THE RECOMMENDATION STAGE THIS IS PURELY RESEARCH BEST PRACTICES THAT WE'RE PRESENTING TODAY. SO YOU CAN BE ASSURED THAT WE WILL BE SPEAKING WITH RIDERS. WE WANT RIDERS TO TRUST IN THIS PROCESS. WE WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS, THE CHANGES THAT WE PROPOSE ACTUALLY IMPROVE THE SERVICE, NOT, NOT TAKE AWAY FROM THE SERVICE. SO, I JUST WANT TO REITERATE THAT.

RICHARD WEINER: YEAH. THANKS DRENNAN. YEAH, AND THE GOAL IS NOT TO CUT COSTS. REALLY, THE GOAL IS TO A MORE ACCURATE PROCESS THAT MEETS PEOPLE'S NEEDS, MEETS THEIR MOBILITY NEEDS THAT ARE MOST APPROPRIATE TO THEIR ABILITIES, THAT'S, YOU KNOW, MASK PEOPLE TO THE MODE THAT'S MOST APPROPRIATE FOR THEIR ABILITIES, MODE, I MEAN, PARATRANSIT OR TAXI, ET CETERA. SO, THAT IS THE GOAL.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: THANK YOU. I SEE ANNE OLIVIA'S HAND RAISED, AND VINAY, I SEE YOUR HAND RAISED, FEEL FREE TO KEEP IT UP IF YOU HAVE A QUESTION OR COMMENT, BUT IF IT WAS TO ANSWER WALTER'S QUESTION, GO AHEAD AND LOWER YOUR HAND IF YOU DON'T HAVE A COMMENT. GO AHEAD ANNE OLIVIA.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ANNE OLIVIA ELDRED: THANK YOU. I AM NOT A PARATRANSIT RIDER. I WANT TO MAKE THAT CLEAR. I RAISED MY HAND BECAUSE I HAVE A QUESTION. I HAVE A REALLY GOOD GIRLFRIEND WHO IS A PARATRANSIT RIDER, AND HER DISABILITY ISN'T ALWAYS PRESENT. SHE HAS A CONDITION THAT COMES ON KIND OF RANDOMLY, AND SEEMINGLY WITHOUT EXTERNAL MOTIVATION. IT'S NOT A THING THAT HAPPENS WHEN IT GETS DARK. WHEN IT HAPPENS SHE IS IN TROUBLE AND SHE RELIES ON PARA TRANSIT GOING TO HOSPITALS EVEN THOUGH IT TAKES ALL DAY LONG AND IS REALLY PHYSICALLY UNCOMFORTABLE. THESE THINGS HAPPEN AND I'M CURIOUS ABOUT STEPS YOU'RE TAKING FOR FOLKS WHO HAVE CONDITIONS LIKE MEDICAL ONSET CONDITIONS OR FOR THINGS THAT ARE -- I MEAN IT IS A PERMANENT DISABILITY, IT JUST ONLY AFFECTS HER SOMETIMES, AND THEN I'M ALSO CURIOUS IF YOU ARE LOOKING AT BEST PRACTICES, IN OTHER CITIES AND I'M WONDERING -- AND APOLOGIES IF YOU COVERED THIS, THE SOUND DROPPED OUT FOR ME FOR A SECOND SO I HAD TO DO SOMETHING WITH MY HEADPHONES TO MAKE IT LOG BACK ON -- BUT, I'M WONDERING, HER EXPERIENCE IS THAT THERE ISN'T A CITY THAT DOES PARATRANSIT VERY WELL, SO I'M WONDERING WHAT OTHER BEST PRACTICES THAT YOU'RE LOOKING AT BESIDES THINGS THAT ALREADY EXIST, LIKE, WHICH ADVOCACY GROUPS THAT YOU ARE TALKING ABOUT WHAT BEST PRACTICES SHOULD BE EVEN IF -- OR COULD BE -- EVEN IF THEY AREN'T IN PRACTICE YET? AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION, AND I DO HAVE A LOT OF FAITH IN THE STAFF

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND WHERE THEY'RE COMING FROM. SO I'M JUST CURIOUS AS TO THOSE ANSWERS.

RICHARD WEINER: THANK YOU FOR THOSE QUESTIONS. AS FAR AS YOUR FRIEND THAT YOU DESCRIBED, THIS IS AN IMPORTANT DISTINCTION ADA ALLOWS FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE CONDITION ELIGIBLE, WHICH MEANS THEY CAN TAKE SOME TRIPS FIXED ROUTE AND SOME PARATRANSIT, THE EXAMPLE I GAVE BEFORE LIKE NIGHT VISION THAT DECISION IS MADE WHEN SOMEBODY REQUESTS A TRIP AT 3:00 THE TRANSIT AGENCY WILL SAY THAT TRIP IS NOT ELIGIBLE BECAUSE YOU CAN -- THERE IS SOMEBODY WHOSE MIC IS ON. GREAT. SO, THAT'S BEEN CONSIDERED TO BE, AND IN MANY KINDS OF THOSE TRIPS IN THE CURRENT ELIGIBILITY HOWEVER THERE'S A CATEGORY CALLED VARIABLE CONDITIONAL ELIGIBILITY, AND THAT'S EXACTLY THE SITUATION THAT YOU DESCRIBED OF YOUR FRIEND AND IN THOSE SITUATIONS IT'S NOT THE TRANSIT AGENCY THAT DECIDES, IT'S THE INDIVIDUAL THEMSELVES THAT DECIDES, I KNOW THAT I CAN'T RIDE THE BUS TODAY, I COULD HAVE DONE THIS TRIP YESTERDAY BUT TODAY I CAN'T BECAUSE OF MY DISABILITY, AND THEN THEY LEAVE IT UP TO THE INDIVIDUAL. THAT PERSON REQUESTED THE TRIP, AND WHEN THE CALL TECH SEES THEY HAVE A VARIABLE CONDITION THEN THEY GIVE THEM THE TRIP THERE IS NO QUESTIONS ASKED AT THIS POINT. SO IT ABSOLUTELY TAKES INTO ACCOUNT PEOPLE WITH VARIABLE CONDITIONS. SO I HOPE THAT ADDRESSES THAT ONE. AS FAR AS BEST PRACTICES, YEAH, I MEAN, THIS STUDY IS PARTICULARLY FOCUSED ON BEST

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

PRACTICES AND ELIGIBILITY, AND THAT'S WHAT WE'RE DOING. BUT I WILL SAY, WHEN YOU SAY THAT, WHEN YOUR FRIEND SAYS THAT THERE ARE NO SYSTEMS THAT PROVIDE VERY GOOD PARATRANSIT, I THINK WE NEED TO LOOK AT WHAT THE ADA MINIMUMS REQUIRE. BECAUSE THERE ARE THINGS THAT ARE IN THE ADA WHICH ARE REALLY INCONVENIENT FOR PEOPLE. SO SOMEBODY MAY THINK, THAT'S NOT A GOOD PARATRANSIT PROGRAM, BUT THAT COULD BE AN EXCELLENT PARATRANSIT PROGRAM IN TERMS OF COMPLYING WITH THE ADA. BUT THE ADA, AND THE BIGGEST ISSUE, IS SAME DAY SERVICE. YOU KNOW? FOR MANY PEOPLE, FOR MOST PEOPLE IT'S VERY INCONVENIENT THAT YOU HAVE TO CALL UP TO 5:00 OR 4:00 THE DAY BEFORE THAT'S SUPER INCONVENIENT COMPARED TO RIDING THE BUS. SO PEOPLE PERCEIVE THAT AS NOT BEING A GOOD PARATRANSIT PROGRAM BUT IN FACT THE PROGRAM COULD BE DOING AN EXCELLENT JOB IN TERMS OF MEETING THE ADA REQUIREMENTS. THE OTHER ONE IS, WHY SHOULD I HAVE TO WAIT UP TO 30 MINUTES WHEN SOMEBODY IS TAKING A BUS. WELL, THERE IS A DIFFERENCE IN THE WAY THAT PARATRANSIT OPERATES, AND YOU KNOW THEY HAVE TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT DIFFERENT THINGS THAN YOU WOULD WITH FIXED ROUTE AND THERE IS A REASON WHY ADA ALLOWS PARATRANSIT PROGRAMS, 20 OR 30 MINUTES WINDOW TO PICK UP. BUT, FOR THE USER, THAT IS INCONVENIENT AND I CAN IMAGINE SOMEONE SAYING IT'S NOT A GOOD PARATRANSIT PROGRAM. SO, I JUST WANT TO CLARIFY THAT THERE IS A DIFFERENCE BETWEEN A PROGRAM NOT BEING DEAD GOOD BECAUSE THEY'RE NOT COMPLYING WITH THE ADA, AND THERE IS CERTAINLY PLENTY OF THOSE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

INCLUDING THE AREA OR PROGRAM NOT BEING GOOD EVEN WHEN COMPLIANT BUT THE USER EXPERIENCE OF THIS BEING LESS THAN GOOD QUALITY. I HOPE THAT ANSWERS THAT QUESTION. DO YOU WANT TO CALL --

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: GENAY?

RICHARD WEINER: GENAY?

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: YEAH. GENAY, DO YOU STILL HAVE A QUESTION? IF NOT, WE CAN GO TO FRANK.

FRANK WELTE: FIRST, I JUST WANT TO THANK YOU, ALL, FOR THE WORK YOU ARE DOING ON IMPROVING THE ELIGIBILITY SYSTEMS AND MAKING THEM, SORT OF, MORE CONSISTENT THROUGHOUT THE BAY AREA. THIS'S GOING HELP A LOT OF PEOPLE. AND WE SHOULDN'T HAVE TO GO THROUGH NINE DIFFERENT REGISTRATION PROCESSES FOR OUR PARATRANSIT HERE IN THE BAY AREA, JUST BECAUSE THERE HAPPEN TO BE NINE COUNTIES. I MEAN, WHEN I NEED TO GET FROM POINT A TO POINT B IN ANOTHER COUNTY IT NEEDS TO BE CONSISTENT. I HOPE WHEN WE'RE ALWAYS CLEAR WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THE FEDERAL ADA REQUIREMENTS THAT THOSE ARE FLOORS, NOT CEILINGS OF SERVICE. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, YES, THE FLOOR FOR ADA IS THAT, THAT THEY CAN REQUIRE A 24-HOUR RESERVATION. THAT'S NOT A CEILING. THAT'S A FLOOR. IN OTHER WORDS, THEY CAN'T MAKE YOU WAIT A WEEK. I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

THINK THEY HAVE, AT LEAST, WITHIN 24 HOURS, TO MAKE A RESERVATION, BUT IF THE RESOURCES ARE AVAILABLE SO THEY CAN PROVIDE SAME DAY RESERVATION THEY SHOULDN'T SAY THAT'S AUTHORITY TABLE BECAUSE THE ADA QUOTE SAYS WE CAN'T. ACTUALLY THEY DON'T SAY WE CAN'T YOU JUST DON'T GO BEYOND THAT POINT WE SHOULD ALWAYS REMEMBER THAT WHEN WE TALK ABOUT THE ADA REQUIREMENTS THEY'RE MINIMUM AND WE SHOULDN'T TAKE OTHER THINGS OFF THE TABLE BECAUSE THEY GO BEYOND THE MINIMUMS IF WE CAN FIND THE RESOURCES FOR IT. THE SECOND THING IS, I DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WHATEVER ELIGIBILITY REGIME THAT WE PUT INTO EFFECT, THAT IT HAS A PRETTY GENEROUS AND ACCESSIBLE APPEAL SYSTEM. BECAUSE I JUST -- OVER THE YEARS I HAVE ENCOUNTERED SO MANY PEOPLE WHERE THEY WERE DENIED AND IF YOU ACTUALLY KNOW THIS PERSON, YOU KNOW PERFECTLY WELL THEY REALLY NEED PARATRANSIT EVEN IF THEY DON'T FIT INTO SOME BOX AND THERE NEEDS TO BE THAT LEVEL OF REVIEW BUILT INTO THE SYSTEM SO THAT SOMEBODY WHO -- IF YOU KNOW THEM, YOU CLEARLY KNOW THAT THEY NEED IT, ISN'T JUST BEING KICKED OUT BECAUSE THEY DON'T FIT IN A BOX.

RICHARD WEINER: GREAT. THANK YOU. YOU MADE THREE EXCELLENT POINTS THERE. FIRSTLY, LET ME SAY, WHEN WE TALK ABOUT NINE DIFFERENT PROCESSES, ACTUALLY IT'S EVEN MORE THAN NINE, BECAUSE SOME COUNTIES HAVE MULTIPLE PROCESSES, DEPENDING ON WHICH CITY YOU'RE IN. IT'S EVEN WORSE THAN THAT. BUT YEAH,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

YOU'RE RIGHT. WE WANT TO HAVE SOME CONSISTENCY. AND YOUR POINT ABOUT FLOWER NOT CEILING. YEAH, I, SORT OF, TAKE IT FOR GRANTED BUT WE ABSOLUTELY SHOULD REITERATE THAT. AND, YEAH, I BELIEVE THAT THE SYSTEMS THAT HAVE MORE ACCURATE PROCESSES ARE THE ONES WHO ARE OFFERING SERVICE THAT EXCEEDS THE FLOORS. AND SO THOSE GO HAND AND HAND. LIKE, KING COUNTY METRO, THEY WENT 30,000 DOWN TO 11,000 BUT THEY PROVIDE MORE OPTIONS FOR PEOPLE THAT GO BEYOND MINIMUM ADA, SO THAT'S WHAT YOU WANT TO HAVE OUT OF THE PROCESS. IT BEARS REMINDING WE HAVE THIS CONVERSATION. TO THE APPEALS, THERE ARE NOT THAT MANY APPEALS IN THE BAY AREA BECAUSE NOT MANY PEOPLE ARE ELIGIBLE, IT'S PROPORTIONATELY A SMALL NUMBER AND IN MY EXPERIENCE MOST APPEALS COMMITTEES WEIGH IN FAVOR OF THE APPLICANT. IT'S REALLY UNUSUAL, I'LL NOT SAY IT DOESN'T HAPPEN, BUT IT'S NOT UNUSUAL -- IT'S FRUSTRATING FOR ME SOMETIMES BECAUSE SOMETIMES COMMITTEES OVERTURN DETERMINATIONS OR DENIAL ON CONDITIONAL BECAUSE THEY WANT TO BE NICE TO THE CONSUMER AND IT'S FRUSTRATING FOR ME WHEN STAFF PUT ALL THIS ENERGY AND ASSESSMENT JUST TO SEE THE ROUTINELY OVERTURNED. IT'S CONSIDERED TO BE A GOOD MEASURE -- LET ME SEE IF I CAN GET THIS RIGHT -- THAT USUALLY ABOUT 20 TO 30% OF THE DETERMINATIONS ARE OVERTURNED. SO THE MAJORITY OF THEM WILL STICK. BUT IT COULD GO IN EITHER DIRECTION. YOU DON'T WANT IT TO BE 100% OVERTURNED, AND YOU DON'T WANT IT TO BE 0% OVERTURNED, BECAUSE THAT WOULD NOT BE A GOOD USE OF THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

COMMITTEE. SO, GENERALLY SPEAKING -- AND, AGAIN, I'M SURE YOU KNOW PEOPLE WHO SHOULD HAVE GOTTEN IT, AND TECHNICALLY SPEAKING, THEY CAN SUBMIT ANOTHER APPLICATION -- BUT, YOU KNOW, IT'S A PAIN FOR SOMEBODY TO HAVE TO GO THROUGH THAT. SO, YEAH, BUT, AGAIN, I THINK THE MOST IMPORTANT POINT YOU MADE WAS ABOUT THE FLOOR AND NOT A CEILING, THAT'S ON THE TABLE.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: VINAY?

VINAY PIMPLE: YEAH, I JUST WANT TO START OUT WITH MY EXPERIENCE OF DOING THIS. I FIRST STARTED WITH CLIPPER CARD BECAUSE I DIDN'T KNOW ABOUT RTC, SO, A COUPLE OF PHONE CALLS TO CLIPPER, THEN THEY TELL ABOUT RTC, A FEW MORE CALLS TO RTC, YOU GET THE CERTIFICATE, THE CERTIFICATE REQUIRES A MEDICAL CERTIFICATE, SO YOU TRY TO FIGURE OUT SOMETHING FROM THE DOCTOR, THEN YOU DO IT, THEN YOU FILE IT, AND THEN THEY ASK YOU TO COME THERE, THEN YOU GO THERE. I THINK I GOT IT FOR ONE YEAR. I DON'T THINK IT WAS THREE YEARS AT THE TIME. AND, SO, I JUST THOUGHT THE PROCESS WAS DESIGNED TO HUMILIATE ME, NOT HELP ME. SO, AGAIN, I DEPARTMENT GO THROUGH THIS RIGMAROLE FOR AN EXTRA YEAR. SO, YOU KNOW THAT IF IT'S FOR THREE YEARS IT'S MORE HELPFUL, AND JUST SO YOU KNOW, I HAVE BEEN BLIND SINCE I WAS TEN YEARS OLD. BUT WHAT I WANT TO SAY IS IT'S OFTEN NOT JUST GOING TO THE GOING TO THAT ONE APPOINTMENT. IT MEANS FILLING OUT A BUNCH OF, OFTEN, PAPER FORMS, WHICH, IF YOU ARE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BLIND, YOU NEED ASSISTANCE FROM SOMEBODY, OFTEN WHEN GOING TO DOCTORS VISITS AS WELL. MY SUGGESTION WOULD BE, IF IT'S POSSIBLE TO DO THAT, FOR THOSE PEOPLE WHO HAVE -- LET'S SAY, WHO ARE DEPARTMENT OF REHAB CLIENTS, YOU COULD HAVE SOMEBODY IN THE FORM SAYING, CAN YOU WAIVE WHATEVER SO WE CAN CONTACT THE DEPARTMENT OF REHAB TO FIGURE OUT YOUR ELIGIBILITY? OR WHICHEVER OTHER ORGANIZATION, WITH WHOM THE PERSON IS MOST LIKELY TO HAVE BEEN PREVERIFIED. SO, THAT WOULD JUST -- AND, PERSONALLY, WHAT I WOULD IDEALLY LIKE IS TO JUST -- FOR YOU TO JUST TALK WITH REHAB, GET THEIR ADDRESSES, AND JUST SEND IT TO PEOPLE, BECAUSE EVERYWHERE ELSE WE ARE TALKING ABOUT HOW WE WANT TO DO OUTREACH TO PEOPLE, FIND OUT ABOUT OUR PROGRAM, BUT WHEN IT COMES TO PARATRANSIT, SUDDENLY YOU'RE NOT DOING ANY OUTREACH. LET PEOPLE COME US AND JUMP THROUGH HOOPS. WHY DON'T WE GO TO REHAB AND SAY, HEY, CAN WE SEND THIS TO YOUR CLIENTS OR YOU CAN SEND THIS TO YOUR CLIENTS THROUGH US, THROUGH YOU, SO YOU SEND IT TO THEM. SO THEY CAN AUTOMATICALLY, THOSE WHO ARE CLEARLY ELIGIBLE, AUTOMATICALLY GET THEIR PARATRANSIT CARDS?

DRENNAN SHELTON: VINAY, THIS IS DRENNEN SHELTON, MTC STAFF. I JUST WANT TO CONFIRM THAT YOU'RE TALKING ABOUT RTC ELIGIBILITY?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

VINAY PIMPLE: WELL, WELL -- OKAY, SO, THE PROBLEM WAS WITH RTC, YES. YOU KNOW? AS FAR AS PARATRANSIT GOES, I HAVE GONE THROUGH RICHMOND PARATRANSIT WHERE EVERYTHING WAS NICE AND HELPFUL.

DRENNAN SHELTON: AND THAT IS NOT AN ADA PROGRAM. THAT'S A CITY-BASED PROGRAM.

VINAY PIMPLE: YEAH.

DRENNAN SHELTON: SEPARATE FROM THE TRANSIT AGENCIES. BUT, I THINK ALL OF --

VINAY PIMPLE: USED TO BE PARATRANSIT -- AGAIN, I DID LOOK INTO IT, IT JUST SEEMED REALLY UNCOMPLICATED -- I MEAN, COMPLICATED, AND UNHELPFUL, SO, I DECIDED NOT TO BOTHER WITH IT.

DRENNAN SHELTON: YEAH. I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT WE ARE DEALING WITH RTC ELIGIBILITY PROCESSES SEPARATELY FROM THIS ONE. BUT WE ARE ALSO DOING THAT. AND I THINK EVERY COMMENT YOU MADE ABOUT ELIGIBILITY PROCESSES, IN GENERAL, APPLIES, AND IT'S, SORT OF, A CONSUMER'S VIEWPOINT OF LESSONS LEARNED THAT WE SHOULD REALLY TAKE HEED WHEN WE ARE DEVELOPING RECOMMENDATIONS. SO, THANKS FOR THAT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

VINAY PIMPLE: THANK YOU.

RICHARD WEINER: TO YOUR POINT OF CONTACT AND REHAB, WHEN WE GET TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS STAGE ONE OF THE CHOICES IS, DO YOU ASK APPLICANTS TO HAVE A MEDICAL WAIVER, OR A MEDICAL VERIFICATION. MEDICAL WAIVER IS, LIKE YOU JUST SAID, GIVE ME THE CONTACT INFORMATION FROM DEPARTMENT OF REHABILITATION, AND I GIVE YOU PERMISSION TO CONTACT THEM AND GET INFORMATION. MEDICAL VERIFICATION ACTUALLY INVOLVES GOING TO YOUR DOCTOR OR HEALTH CARE PROVIDER, GETTING THEM TO FILL OUT THE FORM, SENDING THE FORM IN WITH YOUR APPLICATION. IT'S CONSIDERED TO BE MORE ONEROUS, IF YOU WILL, FOR THE APPLICANT. SO, THAT'S ONE OF THE DECISIONS WE'LL NEED TO MAKE. AND I WILL POINT OUT THAT FOR THE PERSON WHO IS DOING THE ASSESSMENT, IT IS MORE ACCURATE TO ACTUALLY HAVE THAT INFORMATION BEFORE THEY COME INTO THE INTERVIEW. BECAUSE THERE MAY BE THINGS -- EXCUSE ME -- I NEED TO TAKE A COUGH DROP IN A SECOND -- THERE ARE THINGS THAT THEY CAN FIND OUT, ON THE MEDICAL VERIFICATION, BEFORE THE PERSON EVEN COMES IN, AND IT MAKES FOR A MUCH MORE INFORMED INTERVIEW.

VINAY PIMPLE: SURE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RICHARD WEINER: BUT THE EXAMPLE YOU'RE GIVING THAT'S REALLY A MEDICAL WAIVER, AND I THINK THAT WOULD PROBABLY ADDRESS THE ISSUE YOU'RE RAISING, WHY NOT JUST CONTACT THEM, AND THEN THE PERSON MAY NOT NEED TO COME IN. THANK YOU.

VINAY PIMPLE: THANK YOU.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: WALTER, I SEE YOUR HAND RAISED, THAT'S GOING TO BE THE LAST COMMENT BEFORE GOING TO PUBLIC COMMENT. GO AHEAD.

WALTER WILSON: THANK YOU, AGAIN, RICHARD. SO, I'M -- I WOULD LIKE TO ASK A QUESTION. IN THE PARATRANSIT WORLD, I SUSPECT -- AND MAYBE I'M WRONG -- BUT THE MOST EXPENSIVE FORM OF PARATRANSIT IS WHEN AN INDIVIDUAL BRINGS, YOU KNOW, A VEHICLE TO ONE PERSON, TO TAKE THEM TO ONE APPOINTMENT. WOULD THAT BE CORRECT?

RICHARD WEINER: THAT IS CORRECT.

WALTER WILSON: AND THIS CONVERSATION IS ABOUT ALTERNATIVES TO THAT. NOW YOU SAID EARLIER IT HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH THE FINANCES EVEN THOUGH YOU DID TALK ABOUT HOW MUCH IT COST PER YEAR. BUT I THINK THAT'S PROBABLY ONE OF THE DRIVING FORCES BEHIND THIS IS HOW, YOU KNOW, TO PROVIDE THOSE ALTERNATIVES TO

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FOLKS, BUT AT THE SAME TIME, ALSO REDUCE THE COST. BECAUSE ANYTHING OTHER THAN THAT, LIKE THE MINI SYSTEM YOU TALKED ABOUT, IN SEATTLE AND OTHER PLACES, I PRESUME FROM A COST STANDPOINT JUST MAKES BETTER SENSE. AND TO SAY THAT THE COST FACTORS ARE NOT PART OF IT IS -- I DON'T THINK IT'S ACCURATE, ACTUALLY. BECAUSE I THINK THAT'S ONE OF THE DRIVING THINGS. BECAUSE PARATRANSIT IS VERY EXPENSIVE. VERY EXPENSIVE. IT'S LIKE HAVING YOUR OWN PRIVATE UBER SYSTEM, QUITE FRANKLY, AND YOU SEE WHAT A BILLION DOLLAR INDUSTRY THAT IS. SO, I JUST WANTED TO REITERATE, BECAUSE YOU HAD SAID THE FINANCES, ECONOMICS HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH IT, AND I THINK IT HAS A LOT TO DO WITH IT.

RICHARD WEINER: I'M SORRY. IF I SAID THAT IT HAD NOTHING TO DO WITH IT -- IT'S NOT --

WALTER WILSON: YOU SAID IT ABOUT SAVING MONEY.

RICHARD WEINER: THE GOAL, ACTUALLY SAVING MONEY, USING MONEY IN THE MOST EXPEDITIOUS WAY OR EFFICIENT WAY IS ABSOLUTELY ONE OF THE GOALS. BUT IT'S -- I THINK THE POINT I WAS TRYING TO MAKE IS THAT THE GOAL OF THIS IS NOT TO KEEP PEOPLE OFF OF PARATRANSIT, I THINK IT'S TO SAVE MONEY. THAT'S NOT THE GOAL. BUT TO HAVE PEOPLE RIDE SERVICES THAT ARE CHEAPER TO PROVIDE, AND STILL MEET THEIR NEEDS GIVEN THEIR DISABILITY, YES, THAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IS A GOAL. YEAH, YOU'RE RIGHT, IF THEY CAN PROVIDE THE SERVICE MORE CHEAPLY, IN ANOTHER MODE, IT'S ABSOLUTELY ONE OF THE GOALS THAT WOULD COME OUT OF THIS PARTLY IT'S SO THEY CAN PROVIDE THE SERVICE TO PEOPLE WHO ABSOLUTELY DON'T HAVE A CHOICE, GET THE SERVICE THEY NEED.

WALTER WILSON: I APPRECIATE THAT. THIS HAS BEEN VERY EDUCATIONAL ESPECIALLY FOR ME WHEN YOU TALK ABOUT PROVIDING SERVICE FOR PEOPLE AT THEIR LEVEL OF DISABILITY, AND I THINK THAT'S HOW, WHERE IT'S COMING FROM, I APPRECIATE THAT INFORMATION. BECAUSE I NEVER THOUGHT OF THAT FROM THAT PERSPECTIVE. AND I THINK THAT HELPS PEOPLE WITH INDEPENDENT LIVING. I CAN APPRECIATE THAT. SO, THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

RICHARD WEINER: GREAT. THANK YOU.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: VINAY, DID YOU HAVE SOMETHING TO ADD? I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE GIVE YOU A CHANCE. ALL RIGHT. IF THERE ARE NO MORE HANDS RAISED, LET'S GO TO PUBLIC COMMENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE IS ONE HAND RAISED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. I'M GOING TO PUT UP THE CLOCK. SHARE THE CLOCK. MADAM CHAIR, WOULD YOU LIKE TO GIVE ONE MINUTE OR TWO MINUTES?

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: LET'S DO ONE MINUTE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: OKAY. ONE SECOND. I'M SWITCHING. I'M SORRY TO MISPRONOUNCE YOUR NAME. ARE YOU READY TO SPEAK?

SPEAKER: YES. I AM. I HAD A QUESTION ABOUT THE SIMULATION OF PUBLIC EMERGENCY. I HAVE A FRIEND -- I HAVE A FRIEND IN A WHEELCHAIR WHO COULD NOT GET ANY PUBLIC OR PARATRANSIT. THERE WAS AN EVACUATION HERE IN SONOMA COUNTY, DURING A FOREST FIRE. IT'S A SITUATION WHERE YOU RESERVE IN ADVANCE. IT WAS A PUBLIC EMERGENCY, AND THE SHERIFF TOLD US TO MOVE, AND HE WAS UNABLE TO GET HELP IN ANY WAY. AND I WONDER HOW A LOT OF PEOPLE'S THOUGHTS ARE ABOUT HOW TO DEAL WITH THIS. THANK YOU.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE IS NO OTHER PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

RICHARD WEINER: I CAN BEGIN TO RESPOND TO THAT, AND DRENNEN OR OTHER PEOPLE WANT TO WEIGH IN. IT'S NOT REALLY THE TOPIC FOR TODAY'S MEETING. YOU KNOW?

DRENNAN SHELTON: RICHARD, WE WENT WON'T ADDRESS IT. IT'S NOT ON THE TOPIC.

RICHARD WEINER: THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHAIR, ILAF ESUF: OKAY. WE'LL MOVE TO THE NEXT ITEM. THANK YOU VERY MUCH DRENNAN AND RICHARD FOR THE HELPFUL PRESENTATION THESE ARE EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. WE'LL HAVE DISCUSSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS NEXT TIME. FOR NUMBER FIVE WE'LL HEAR ABOUT THE CLIPPER CARD ACQUISITION FEES AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO DAVID TO PRESENT THIS ITEM.

DAVID WEIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MY NAME IS DAVID WEIR, I'M WITH THE -- I'M WITH MTC, AND I HAVE BEEN WITH THE CLIPPER -- WORKING ON THE CLIPPER PROGRAM EVERY SINCE I JOINED MTC ABOUT 14 YEARS AGO. SO, TODAY I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE AN ANALYSIS THAT HAS RECENTLY BEEN DONE RELATING TO THE POTENTIAL DIFFERENCE OF THE CARD ACCUSATION PIECE BETWEEN PLASTIC AND MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS. AND I HOPE EVERYONE IS FAMILIAR WITH THE CLIPPER PROGRAM, SO, I WILL NOT SPEND TIME TRYING TO DESCRIBE THE CLIPPER PROGRAM IN ANY OTHER DETAIL OTHER THAN WHAT WE'RE COVERING IN THE TOPIC. THE MOBILE CLIPPER CARD WAS INTRODUCED TO THE PUBLIC IN THE SPRING OF 2021 AS ALTERNATIVE TO CLIPPER CUSTOMERS TO THE PLASTIC CLIPPER CARD. IN THE SUMMER OF 2022, MTC CONTRACTED FOR AN MALLS OF THE EQUITY IMPACTS OF DIFFERING CARD ACQUISITION FEES, OR PLASTIC, COMPARED TO MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS. THIS KIND OF MALLS IS REQUIRED -- WAS REQUIRED BY THE TITLE SIX OF THE 1964 CIVIL RIGHTS ACT. AND FOR THOSE THAT ARE NOT FAMILIAR WITH THAT, TITLE SIX OF THE CIVIL RIGHTS ACT OF 1964 PREVENTS PEOPLE FROM DISCRIMINATION BASED ON RACE, COLOR,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AND NATIONAL ORIGIN AND PROGRAMS RECEIVING FEDERAL FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE. THIS SPECIFIC ANALYSIS THAT MTC CONDUCTED WAS TO DETERMINE WHETHER THERE ARE EITHER DISPARITY IMPACTS ON WHAT THE TITLE SIX CIVIL RIGHTS ACT REFERS TO AS MINORITY POPULATIONS, BUT FOR THE PURPOSES OF THIS POPULATION I'M GOING TO REFER TO THEM AS PEOPLE OF COLOR POPULATIONS, OR DISPROPORTIONATE BURDENS ON LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS IF A LOW OR EVEN DOWN TO ZERO FEE IS CHARGED TO GET A MOBILE CLIPPER CARD, COMPARED TO THE FEE TO GET A PLASTIC CLIPPER CARD. I DO HAVE A POWERPOINT PRESENTATION THAT HIGHLIGHTS THE FINDINGS OF THAT ANALYSIS AFTER DESCRIBING THE HISTORY AND POLICY OF CARD ACQUISITION FEES FOR BOTH PLASTIC AND MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS, AND I APPRECIATE WHOEVER IS NOW DISPLAYING THE PRESENTATION. LAST POINT I WANT TO MAKE BEFORE WE GET INTO THE SLIDES IS THAT THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. I CERTAINLY WELCOME YOUR QUESTIONS, FEEDBACK, AND COMMENTS, BUT WE'RE NOT LOOKING FOR A RECOMMENDATION FROM THIS SUBCOMMITTEE AT THIS TIME. SO IF WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE? FIRST OF ALL, HISTORY AND BACKGROUND OF CLIPPER CARD ACQUISITION FEES FOCUSING ON THE PLASTIC CLIPPER CARD. THE CLIPPER PROGRAM CHARGES CUSTOMERS A CARD ACQUISITION FEE FOR A NEW ADULT CLIPPER CARD. THAT CARD ACQUISITION FEE HAS BEEN $3 SINCE 2012, AND THERE IS TWO -- AT LEAST TWO GOOD REASONS FOR CHARGING A CARD FEE. IT CERTAINLY COST CLIPPER TO OBTAIN PLASTIC CARDS, SO A FEE HELPS OFFSET THOSE COSTS, AND A FEE DISCOURAGES CUSTOMERS FROM THROWING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

AWAY A CARD AFTER USING IT ONLY ONCE OR JUST A FEW TIMES. AND I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT NEW YOUTH, SENIOR, RTC, AND CLIPPER START CARDS THAT ARE AIMED AT LOW-INCOME PEOPLE ARE FREE, AND HAVE ALWAYS BEEN FREE, AND WILL CONTINUE TO BE FREE. NEXT SLIDE. IN 2021, LIKE I SAID, AT THE START OF MY REMARKS, THE CLIPPER PROGRAM INTRODUCED THE MOBILE CLIPPER CARD, AND TO ENCOURAGE ADOPTION OF THAT NEW MOBILE CARD, THERE HAS BEEN NO FEE FOR NEW ADULT MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS. AND AS A RESULT, THE USE OF MOBILE CARDS IS INCREASING IN ALL FARE CATEGORIES. AND, FOR EXAMPLE, AS OF NOVEMBER 2022, 28% OF ALL ADULT CLIPPER CARDS USED WERE MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT THE MOBILE CARD IS NOT THE SAME AS THE CLIPPER MOBILE APP. SOMETIMES PEOPLE GET THOSE TWO THINGS CONFUSED, BUT THERE IS A DIFFERENCE. YOU CAN USE THE CLIPPER MOBILE APP TO ADD VALUE TO YOUR CLIPPER CARD, WHETHER IT'S PLASTIC OR MOBILE, BUT IT'S NOT THE MOBILE CARD ITSELF THAT YOU USE TO TAG OR TAP ON TO BUS VALIDATOR, OR A BART FARE GATE TO ACTUALLY TAKE THE TRIP. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THERE ARE CONSIDERATIONS, BOTH FOR WHETHER TO CHARGE A FEE FOR NEW MOBILE CARDS, AND THERE IS ALSO VALID CONSIDERATIONS TO NOT CHARGE A FEE FOR NEW MOBILE CARDS. A MOBILE CARD FEE DOES DEFRAY A COST INCURRED BY THE CLIPPER PROGRAM FOR ISSUING MOBILE CARDS. MOBILE CARDS ARE NOT FREE FOR THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT. ALSO, CHARGING A FEE FOR MOBILE CARDS IS CONSISTENT WITH CHANGING A FEE FOR PLASTIC CARDS. SO EVERYBODY IS TREATED EQUALLY. ON THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OTHER HAND, THERE ARE VALID REASONS TO NOT CHARGE A FEE FOR MOBILE CARDS. AS I SAID, IT ENCOURAGES THE USE OF MOBILE CARDS. WE THINK MOBILE CARDS ARE -- CAN BE VERY CONVENIENT FOR OUR CUSTOMERS. IT LEAVES THE NEED TO OBTAIN PLASTIC CARDS. WE HAVE BEEN FACING VERY DIFFICULT SUPPLY CHAIN ISSUES TO GET ADDITIONAL PLASTIC CARDS. AND, ALSO, MOBILE CARDS CAN BE VERY HELPFUL IN TERMS OF FULFILLING DEMAND WHEN SPIKES FOR SPECIAL EVENTS OCCUR. YOU KNOW, HOPEFUL FUTURE VICTORY PARADES BY OUR BAY AREA SPORTS TEAMS, FOR EXAMPLE, CREATE A GREAT DEMAND FOR TRANSIT SERVICES, AND THEREFORE PAYING FOR THOSE TRANSIT TRIPS. ALL RIGHT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY. THAT'S -- THAT'S THE BACKGROUND AND HISTORY AND CURRENT SITUATION. SO, NOW I'M GOING TO GET INTO A LITTLE BIT OF INFORMATION ABOUT THE ANALYSIS, ITSELF, THAT'S BEEN CONDUCTED. AS I SAID, DURING THE SUMMER AND FALL OF 2022, MTC CONTRACTED FOR AN ANALYSIS OF THE EQUITY IMPACTS OF SITTING DIFFERENT FEES OF PHYSICAL VERSUS MOBILE CARDS. MTC INCLUDED TRANSIT AGENCY STAFF, INCLUDING TITLE SIX SPECIALISTS AT AC TRANSIT AND BART IN THIS EFFORT. STAFF AT THE FEDERAL TRANSIT AGENCY DID CONFIRM THAT MTC, THAT TITLE SIX REQUIRES SUCH AN ANALYSIS, AND, SPECIFICALLY, THAT ANALYSIS WAS TO DETERMINE WHETHER THERE ARE DISPARATE IMPACTS ON PEOPLE OF COLOR POPULATIONS, OR DISPROPORTIONATE BURDENS ON PEOPLE OF LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS, IF A LOWER FEE CONTINUES TO BE CHARGED TO GET A MOBILE CLIPPER CARD COMPARED TO THE $3 FEE TO GET A PLASTIC CLIPPER CARD. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ALL RIGHT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

IN SUMMARY OF THE FINDINGS OF THIS ANALYSIS: FOR PEOPLE OF COLOR POPULATIONS, THERE IS NO DISPARATE IMPACT. AND THAT IS BECAUSE AN ACTUAL FACT, THE POPULATIONS THAT I AM SHORTHAND REFERRING TO AS PEOPLE OF COLOR ACTUALLY USE THE MOBILE CARD AT A HIGHER RATE THAN WHITE CUSTOMERS. FOR LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS, IT'S A LITTLE MORE COMPLICATED. THERE IS SOME DISPROPORTIONATE BURDEN BUT NOT AN EXCESSIVE AMOUNT. WHAT I MEAN BY THAT IS THAT EACH OF THE BAY -- LARGE BAY AREA TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE ESTABLISHED THRESHOLDS BY WHICH THEY MEASURE DISPROPORTIONATE BURDEN, AND MOST OF THOSE THRESHOLDS ARE SET AT ABOUT 15%. SO, IN SHORTHAND, WHAT THAT MEANS IS THAT THE ADDITIONAL BURDEN ON LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS CAN BE UP TO 15% MORE THAN THE BURDENS ON NON-LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS. BUT, THE ANALYSIS FOUND THAT IN THIS INSTANCE, PROVIDING FREE MOBILE CARDS -- I SHOULD SAY -- IS NOT ENOUGH OF A DISPROPORTIONATE BURDEN THAT IT BECOMES PROBLEMATIC. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ALL RIGHT. AND, SO, BASED ON THE FINDINGS OF THIS EQUITY ANALYSIS, THE CLIPPER PROGRAM COULD, IF WE CHOSE TO, CHARGE A FEE OF UP TO THE SAME PRICE AS FOR PLASTIC CLIPPER CARDS WITHOUT VIOLATING THE TITLE SIX RESTRICTIONS. BUT, CURRENTLY, THE MOBILE ADULT CLIPPER CARD REMAINS FREE FOR A LIMITED TIME AND NEW PLASTIC ADULT CLIPPER CARDS COST $3. ULTIMATELY IT'S UP TO THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD, OUR GOVERNING BODY, WHICH IS MADE UP OF GM'S, OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS, SEVERAL TRANSIT AGENCIES, AND, ALSO, THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR OF MTC TO MAKE THE DECISION

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

ABOUT WHAT OUR CARD ACQUISITION FEE POLICY IS. THE CLIPPER EXECUTIVE BOARD CONTINUES TO ASSESS THE SITUATION AND IS TRYING TO BALANCE THE GOALS OF ENCOURAGING MOBILE CARD USE, YET, WE ALSO HAVE TO ENSURE THAT THE CLIPPER BUDGET STAYS WHOLE. BECAUSE, AS I SAID, WHETHER YOU ISSUE PLASTIC OR MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS, THERE IS A COST TO THE CLIPPER PROGRAM. AND WE WOULD HAVE TO IDENTIFY FUNDING TO COVER THE COST OF MOBILE CARDS. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. ALL RIGHT. AND THIS SLIDE HAS MY CONTACT INFORMATION. AS I SAID, MY NAME IS DAVID WEIR. MY E-MAIL IS DWEIR@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV. I ALSO WANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE, AND I THINK HE IS HERE AS ONE OF THE PARTICIPANTS, AS WELL, MICHAEL BRINTON WHO IS ALSO ON THE MTC STAFF. AND MICHAEL, I'LL PUT OUT SPOT. I DON'T KNOW IF YOU WANT TO ADD ANYTHING TO WHAT I SAID, IF NOT, WE'LL GO STRAIGHT TO QUESTIONS, EITHER WAY.

MICHAEL BRINTON: THANK YOU, DAVID. NO. WE CAN GO STRAIGHT TO QUESTIONS. I MEAN, ULTIMATELY, I GUESS THE ONLY THING I WOULD SAY, AS DAVID PRESENTED IN HIS PRESENTATION, WE DID FOLLOW ALL OF THE STEPS REQUIRED BY TITLE SIX TO DO THE FAIR EQUITY ANALYSIS AND TO ANALYZE THE DATA TO ENSURE THAT ACCORDING TO THE GUIDELINES OF FTA THAT THERE WERE NO DISPARATE IMPACTS OF THE FREE MOBILE CLIPPER CARD. SO, ARE THE THAN THAT I'M AVAILABLE TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT YOU MAY HAVE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. SO, I SEE THAT WE HAVE FRANK WITH HIS HAND RAISED. WE'LL START THERE.

FRANK WELTE: YES. I APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT YOU ALL DID ON THE TITLE SIX ANALYSIS. BUT THERE IS ANOTHER AREA OF LAW THAT YOU SHOULD HAVE CONSIDERED, AND THAT WAS TITLE TWO OF THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT. AND I NOTICED THAT YOU DID NOT REPORT ON ANY ANALYSIS SPANNING TO DIFFERENT RESULTS FOR PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES VERSUS PEOPLE WHO ARE NOT DISABLED. FOR EXAMPLE, IN MY CASE, I HAPPEN TO BE A BLIND USER OF THE CLIPPER MOBILE CARD, AND I CAN TELL YOU THAT IT TOOK A LITTLE BIT OF EFFORT TO GET THAT SET UP ON MY SMART PHONE. AND I KNOW A LOT OF FOLKS WOULD NOT HAVE BEEN ABLE TO DO THAT. AND THAT'S PROBABLY ALWAYS THE CASE WITH PEOPLE WHO HAVE COGNITIVE DISABILITIES WHO MAY NOT INHABIT USING SMART PHONES. I HOPE THAT WAS AN AREA OF ANALYSIS AND THAT YOU CAN RETURN TO THAT BECAUSE REMEMBER TITLE SIX REQUIRES NON-DISCRIMINATION AND TITLE TWO REQUIRES NON-DISCRIMINATION ON SERVICES BY CITY, COUNTY, AND STATE GOVERNMENTS.

DAVID WEIR: OKAY. I APPRECIATE THAT COMMENT, FRANK. THIS ANALYSIS WAS -- YOU KNOW, AS I SAID, WAS NARROWLY FOCUSED ON THE QUESTION OF THE FEES TO OBTAIN EITHER A PLASTIC OR A MOBILE CARD, BUT WE WILL TAKE WHAT YOU HAVE SAID UNDER ADVISEMENT, AND GO FROM THERE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MICHAEL BRINTON: FRANK, I BELIEVE YOUR TOPIC, THE ISSUES YOU ARE RAISING ARE MORE ABOUT THE OVERALL DIGITAL CARD AND MOBILE APP VERSUS WHAT WE'RE -- WHAT WE FOCUSED ON HERE LIKE WHAT DAVID SAID WHICH WAS PROVIDING THE MOBILE CARD FOR FREE.

FRANK WELTE: WHAT ABOUT THE POINT THAT THERE IS STILL AN EQUITY ISSUE FROM A DIFFERENTLY ANGLE THAN YOU WERE LOOKING AT THAT NEEDS TO BE CONSIDERED.

MICHAEL BRINTON: YES, SIR. UNDERSTOOD.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. I SEE THAT HOWARD HAS HIS HAND RAISED.

HOWARD WONG: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I THINK, OBVIOUSLY, WHAT THE OBJECTIVE IS TO INCREASE TRANSIT RIDERSHIP BY MAKING IT EASIER TO ACCESS ALL OUR TRANSIT MODES. I WOULD SAY THAT IN THE NEXT FEW YEARS, AT LEAST, YOUNGER PEOPLE WOULD PROBABLY BE MUCH MORE, YOU KNOW, ATTUNED, OR ADAPTED TO MOBILE CLIPPER CARDS. AND IN REGARDS TO THE LARGE NUMBER OF PEOPLE OF COLOR USING, PRONE TO USE THE MOBILE APP, I WOULD PROBABLY THINK THAT THAT'S BECAUSE A LARGE NUMBER OF YOUNGER PEOPLE -- ESPECIALLY ASIANS -- OR MAYBE ALL PEOPLE OF YOUTH -- ARE VERY ATTUNED TO MOBILE APPLICATIONS. SO, THAT'S SOMETHING TO KIND

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OF DECIPHER IF YOU HAVEN'T ALREADY. THE OTHER THING IS THAT I WONDER IF THERE IS A WAY OF LOOKING AT IT AS NOT EITHER/OR PLASTIC VERSUS MOBILE, BUT JUST HAVING A TECHNOLOGY WHERE MOBILE IS JUST -- OR PLASTIC CARD IS MERELY A PHYSICAL EMBODIMENT OF THE MOBILE SYSTEM IT'S ACTUALLY ONE SYSTEM, AND YOU HAVE A CHOICE BUT IT'S NOT EITHER/OR, THAT IT'S ACTUALLY THE SAME TECHNOLOGY. I THINK, JUST AS AN EXAMPLE, I WAS IN MEXICO CITY LAST YEAR, OR NOT TOO LONG AGO, AND THE THEIR CLIPPER CARD, OR EQUIVALENT, WHICH IS THAT, IS A -- SEEMS TO BE AN UNIFORM THING IN THEIR SYSTEM, WHERE THEIR RIDES ARE FIVE OR SIX PESOS, OR SUBWAY, OR BUSES, 25 OR $0.30, AND THE CARD IS EASY TO GET. IT HAS AN INITIAL CHARGE. IT'S, LIKE, YOU KNOW, A VERY SMALL DOLLAR, SO THAT PEOPLE AREN'T GOING TO THROW AWAY THE CARD. BUT THE CARD IS JUST TAPPED ON TO A SCREEN. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF YOU CAN USE THE PHONE, ALSO, BUT THIS CARD ACTS AS THE ENTIRE REGION OF 400 SQUARE MILES, WITH 20 MILLION PEOPLE. SO, YOU MIGHT WANT TO LOOK AT SYSTEMS LIKE MEXICO CITY AND SEE WHAT THEY'RE DOING BECAUSE IT SEEMS TO WORK. THEIR RIDERSHIP, TRANSIT MODE SHARE IS HUGE, OVER 40% TRANSIT MODE. SO, I THINK THERE ARE EXAMPLES IN THE WORLD WHERE THEY, YOU KNOW CREATE A CLIPPER-TYPE CARD THAT SEEMS TO WORK.

DAVID WEIR: CERTAINLY, HOWARD, I MEAN, YOU TOUCHED ON MANY THINGS. YOU KNOW? WE INTRODUCED THE NEW MOBILE CARD PRECISELY

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BECAUSE WE WANTED TO RESPOND TO THE MODERN TECHNOLOGY AND THE DEMANDS OF OUR, AND DESIRES OF OUR CUSTOMER BASE. MANY OF WHOM ARE VERY TECHNOLOGICALLY SAVVY, AND PEOPLE RELY ON THEIR MOBILE PHONES FOR, YOU KNOW, VIRTUALLY EVERYTHING. AND, SO, WE'RE GIVING, CURRENTLY GIVING PEOPLE A CHOICE. IF THEY'RE COMFORTABLE WITH THE PLASTIC CARD AND THEY FIND IT'S BENEFICIAL TO THEM, THEN THEY CAN CONTINUE TO DO THAT. IF THEY WOULD RATHER HAVE A CARD ON THEIR MOBILE PHONE, THAT'S AN OPTION. AS PART OF THE NEXT GENERATION CLIPPER SYSTEM WE'RE GOING MANAGE THE CAPABILITIES OF THE ABILITY TO MANAGE THEIR -- GIVE PEOPLE THE ABILITY TO MANAGE THEIR ACCOUNTS IN REALTIME. AND, SO, I THINK THE FUTURE IS VERY BRIGHT. AND WE HAVE INCORPORATED OR ARE GOING TO INCORPORATE INTO THE CLIPPER SYSTEM MOST IF NOT ALL OF WHAT YOU KIND OF JUST DESCRIBED IS GOING ON IN MEXICO CITY, AND ELSEWHERE THROUGHOUT THE U.S. AND AROUND THE WORLD. SO, I APPRECIATE THE COMMENTS.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: IS THERE ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION BY MEMBERS ON THIS ITEM?

DAVID WEIR: I SEE A HAND UP.

WALTER WILSON: HI DAVID THAT WAS A GREAT REPORT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE UPDATE AND INFORMATION. I JUST WANT TO SAY THAT. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

DAVID WEIR: THANK YOU, WALTER. APPRECIATE THAT.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. SO, I ACTUALLY HAVE A FEW QUESTIONS. I WANT TO START OUT WITH MAKING -- SO, MOSTLY, PEOPLE OF COLOR HAVE BEEN USING THE MOBILE CARD, BUT IT'S FREE RIGHT NOW TO SIGN UP. CORRECT?

DAVID WEIR: THAT'S CORRECT.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. SO --

DAVID WEIR: WHAT I WANT TO CLARIFY IS THAT PERSONS OF COLOR ARE USING THE MOBILE CARD IN A HIGHER PERCENTAGE THAN WHITE POPULATIONS.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY.

DAVID WEIR: I WOULDN'T SAY THAT THE MAJORITY OF ANY POPULATION IS USING THE MOBILE CARD OVER THE PLASTIC CARD.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. SO, I DO WANT TO NOTE THAT IT IS FREE RIGHT NOW, SO THAT SHOULD BE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION. AND THAT MAY BE WHY A LOT OF FOLKS ARE USING THE MOBILE CARD RIGHT NOW. AND THEN I ALSO WANT TO POINT OUT THAT TWO THINGS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CAN BE TRUE AT THE SAME TIME. SO, YOU TALKED ABOUT HOW IT DOESN'T, CHARGING FOR THE MOBILE CARD WILL HAVE SOME IMPACTS FOR LOW-INCOME PEOPLE, BUT MAY NOT IMPACT PEOPLE OF COLOR. SO, SOMEONE CAN BE A LOW-INCOME PERSON, OF COLOR, SO, LIKE, WAS THAT TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION? LIKE THAT INTERSECTIONALITY, WITH YOUR ANALYSIS?

DAVID WEIR: THE ANALYSIS COMPARED EACH -- I'LL SAY GROUP -- SEPARATELY. CERTAINLY THERE WOULD -- IT WAS LOOKING AT OVERALL POPULATIONS. CERTAINLY, I THINK, ON AN INDIVIDUAL BASIS, PEOPLE WOULD FALL IN -- COULD FALL INTO BOTH CATEGORIES. CERTAINLY, THAT'S ACKNOWLEDGE SAID. BUT WE WEREN'T -- WE WEREN'T TAKING ANY SAMPLE OF ANYBODY. SO, I WOULDN'T -- WE DON'T KNOW WHO. WE WERE JUST LOOKING AT OVERALL PROPORTIONS AND PERCENTAGES. AND WE FOLLOWED THAT. WE FOLLOWED WHAT TITLE SIX REQUIRES TO DO. AND, MICHAEL, DO YOU WANT TO ADD ANYTHING TO THAT?

MICHAEL BRINTON: YEAH. I MEAN, THERE IS TITLE SIX AND ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE. AND THEY'RE TWO DISTINCT -- THEY'RE VERY MUCH RELATED, BUT AS IT'S DEFINED IN TITLE SIX, THE TITLE SIX PROGRAM INCLUDES A NICE COMPARISON SIDE BY SIDE OF TITLE SIX VERSUS ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE. DISPARATE IMPACT, LOOKING AT TITLE SIX PROTECTED GROUPS, IT IS TITLE SIX. ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE IS THE INCOME-BASED ANALYSIS. SO, WE FOLLOW THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GUIDELINES OF TITLE SIX. WE DID SURVEYS. WE LOOKED AT HOW THE OVERALL IMPACT OF THE ZERO DOLLAR FEE, WE LOOKED AT THRESHOLDS OF THE TRANSIT OPERATORS FOR THE IMPACTS OF FARE EQUITY OR FARE CHANGES. BUT, NO, WE DID NOT GO TO THAT DEEP OF A LEVEL WHERE WE TRIED TO SEE IF THERE WAS OVERLAP BETWEEN THE TWO DIFFERENT GROUPS. IT'S A GOOD POINT OF MANAGE THAT CAN BE CONSIDERED OR NEEDS TO BE THOUGHT ABOUT AS WE PLAN OUT THESE SYSTEMS. ULTIMATELY, AT THIS POINT, SINCE THE MOBILE CARD IS FREE AND THE PLASTIC CARD, AT LEAST AT THIS POINT IN TIME, AS FAR AS I KNOW, ISN'T GOING AWAY. SO, THERE REALLY WAS NO CHANGE TO THE EXISTING CUSTOMER BASE, EXCEPT THEY NOW HAD A FREE OPTION TO HAVE AN ALTERNATE. NOW, IF THERE IS --

DAVID WEIR: YEAH. I WOULD SAY, MICHAEL, WE HAVE NO PLANS WHATSOEVER TO GET RID OF THE PLASTIC CARD. I WON'T SAY WE NEVER WILL DO THAT. BUT IT'S --

MICHAEL BRINTON: [LAUGHTER] AS IT STANDS RIGHT NOW, THE CONCLUSION OF THE ANALYSIS KIND OF SUPPORTS THAT ALL WE HAVE REALLY DONE IS GIVEN A FREE ALTERNATIVE AT THIS POINT. NOW, IF AT ANY POINT IN THE FUTURE THERE IS A DIFFERENT TAKE ON FEES OR THE COST OF THE SYSTEM, THERE WILL BE HAVE TO BE FUTURE ANALYSIS DONE AS TO THE OVERALL IMPACTS OR POTENTIAL IMPACTS. BUT RIGHT NOW, AT THE ZERO DOLLAR LEVEL, THERE, ON AVERAGE,

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

WHEN YOU DO THE MATH, THE OVERALL CONSUMER BASE IS BETTER OFF WITH THE FREE MOBILE THAN THEY WERE WITHOUT THE FREE MOBILE.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. THANK YOU. AND, YEAH, I JUST THINK THAT SHOULD BE TAKEN INTO CONSIDERATION. BECAUSE THERE ARE FOLKS THAT ARE IN MULTIPLE DIFFERENT CATEGORIES. SO, YOU KNOW, WITH THE DIFFERENT ANALYSIS, I JUST THINK THAT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE. IS THERE ANY FURTHER DISCUSSION BY MEMBERS? WILL THE CLERK INFORM US WHETHER THERE PUBLIC COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM? YOU'RE ON MUTE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ON THIS ITEM, THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED. AND WE HAVE ONE PERSON WITH A HAND RAISED. ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE GIVE ME ONE MOMENT TO PUT UP THE CLOCK. AND DO WE -- MADAM CLERK, DO WE DO ONE MINUTE OR TWO?

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: WE CAN DO TWO MINUTES.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: OKAY. THANK YOU.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU, TO THE CHAIR. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD; SHE AND HER. VERY IMPORTANT TOPIC. VERY NEAR AND DEAR TO ME. I HAVE BEEN USING CLIPPER SINCE IT STARTED IN 2010. I WISH I HAD DONE THE TRANSLINK BEFORE THAT. AND I HAVE A REDUCED FARE MOBILE CARD. I THINK THERE IS A CASE TO CONTINUE THE FREE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

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

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHERS WITH PUBLIC COMMENT WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. SO NOW WE CAN MOVE TO, FIRST OF ALL, THANK YOU, DAVID, FOR THE PRESENTATION. AND NOW WE CAN MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM SIX, WHICH IS NEW BUSINESS. THIS IS TIME WHEN MEMBERS CAN BRING UP NEW BUSINESS FOR DISCUSSION OR ADDITION TO A FUTURE AGENDA. NO NEW BUSINESS? OKAY. HOWARD?

HOWARD WONG: WE'RE ALL VERY, YOU KNOW, OBVIOUSLY, LOOKING FORWARD TO GREATER USE OF CLIPPER CARDS AND INTEGRATION AND COORDINATION OF PUBLIC -- OF REGIONAL TRANSIT, AND, YOU KNOW, APPRECIATE ALL THE GOOD WORK THAT'S GOING ON, BUT WE HAVE TO KEEP IN MIND THAT IN THE YEAR OR TWO, THE FISCAL CLIFF THAT FACES ALL OUR TRANSIT AGENCIES, NOT ONLY EM PERILS SERVICE FOR SENIORS, AND DISABLED, AND FOR ALL RIDERS, COULD HAVE AN IMPACT ON ALL PROGRAMS THAT WE ARE WORKING ON AND HAVE BEEN REVEALING AND SEEING. I THINK WE MIGHT WANT TO START HAVING A LITTLE BIT OF AN OVERVIEW OF THE POTENTIAL FISCAL CLIFF IMPACTS ON TRANSIT. AND IN SOME WAYS, I THINK THAT IT ACTUALLY MAKES THESE PROGRAMS OF CLIPPER, GREATER CLIPPER USE, AND EASES OF USE, THE EASES -- THE OVERALL SIMPLICITY OF USE OF TRANSIT, THE COORDINATION OF TRANSIT AGENCIES IS ACTUALLY MORE IMPORTANT DURING A FISCAL CRISIS THAN EVER BEFORE. SO, YOU KNOW, I THINK FISCAL, THE IMPENDING FISCAL PROBLEMS NEEDS TO BE LOOKED AT AS SOON AS WE CAN. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: THANK YOU. IS THERE ANY OTHER NEW BUSINESS THAT PEOPLE WANT TO ADD? OKAY. IS THERE ANY MEMBER -- WILL THE CLERK INFORM US OF WHETHER ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS WERE RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM?

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED FOR ITEM SIX, AND THERE IS NO HANDS RAISED.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. SO, WE'LL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM SEVEN, WHICH IS PUBLIC COMMENT AND OTHER BUSINESS. THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. I WILL NOW ASK THE CLERK TO READ THE NAMES OR ORGANIZATIONS OF ANY GENERAL WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY INTO THE RECORD. I WOULD ALSO ASK THAT IF ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATE BY TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM ON TODAY AGENDA, PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON YOU TO SPEAK. WHEN CALLED UPON, UNMUTE YOURSELF OR DIAL NINE OR STAR SIX.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE HAS BEEN RECEIVED FROM RICHARD BUCKLEY HUGHES, THE COMMENTS HAVE BEEN POSTED ONLINE, AND DISTRIBUTED TO ALL SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBERS. WE HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED. GOING TO SHARE THE CLOCK, AND THEN ASK THEM TO SPEAK.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU, AGAIN, TO THE CHAIR. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. AS I SPEAK, GENERALLY, AND WHEN I LOOK AT EQUITY, I IMPRESS ON YOU THE IMPORTANCE OF HELPING TO INFLUENCE PEOPLE IN LEADERSHIP POSITIONS WHO OFTEN SEEM TO BE HIGH BOUND BY THE OLD WAYS AND HOLDING BACK. AND WE MUST NEVER PRESUME PEOPLE INCAPABLE OF LEARNING NEW THINGS. SO, HOW DO WE HELP PEOPLE TO ENGAGE MORE EASILY WITH THESE NEW COST EFFICIENT PROGRAMS SUCH AS CLIPPER AND FASTRAK? AND HOW DO WE HELP PEOPLE WHO ARE OF VERY MODEST MEANS TO BE ABLE TO GET THEIR FREE SMART PHONES. AND I, AS A PERSON WITH DISABLED -- WITH DISABILITIES, USE MY PHONE A LOT BECAUSE IT HAS MANY TOOLS THAT MAKES IT EASIER FOR ME AS A PERSON WITH DISABILITIES TO BE ABLE TO NAVIGATE THE WORLD. AND, SO, I -- I WOULDN'T SAY I'M MORE CAPABLE THAN THE NEXT PERSON, BUT WHAT I HAVE DONE FOR MYSELF IS HAD AN OPEN MIND TOWARD NEW THINGS THAT I HAVE FOUND TO BE HELPFUL. SO, IF I THINK THAT YOU ALL ARE SHOWING AN OPEN-MINDEDNESS TOWARD LEARNING AND PRACTICING NEW THINGS AND I THINK THAT YOU CAN HAVE A STRONG INFLUENCE ON THOSE WHO MAY NOT UNDERSTAND, AND HOW DO WE ALL OVERCOME OUR DISCOMFORTS WITH THINGS, SUCH AS THE 80 OR SO% THAT HAVE SMART PHONES BUT ARE YET AFRAID TO USE THEM TO PAY FOR THINGS, I THINK IT'S A FEAR THAT SHOULD BE HOPEFULLY EASILY OVERCOME. THANK YOU.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. ZENO, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: THANK YOU. I RAISED THIS ISSUE EARLIER IN THE MEETING, BUT IT WAS NOT ON TOPIC. SO, I WOULD LIKE TO ADDRESS IT AGAIN. THIS IS ABOUT ACCESS TO PARATRANSIT IN THE CASE OF A PUBLIC EMERGENCY WHEN IT IS NOT POSSIBLE TO MAKE A RESERVATION IN ADVANCE. AND MY CASE IS ACCESS DURING AN EVACUATION OF A FOREST FIRE HERE IN SONOMA COUNTY. IT WAS IMPOSSIBLE TO GET PARATRANSIT. IT WAS UNCLEAR HOW THE SYSTEM WAS ORGANIZED. AND I WOULD LIKE MTC TO ADDRESS THIS ISSUE IN LIGHT OF INCREASING DANGER OF THIS NATURE IN OUR AREA. THANK YOU.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO MORE PUBLIC COMMENTS WITH THEIR HANDS RAISED. THANK YOU.

V. CHAIR, GENAY MARKHAM: OKAY. WITH THAT WE WILL MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM EIGHT, WHICH IS ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE WILL BE FRIDAY FEBRUARY 24TH, 2023 AND 9:00 A.M. ANY CHANGES TO THE SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTICED TO THE PUBLIC. THIS MEETING OF THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

Broadcasting Government