



METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript



MARCH 27, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY

WEDNESDAY, MARCH 27TH, 2024, 9:45 AM

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. IT'S STILL MORNING. I'M
GOING TO CALL TO ORDER THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY. MY NAME IS
ALFREDO PEDROZA, CHAIR, ALONG WITH NICK JOSEFOWITZ, VICE
CHAIR. ROLL CALL, PLEASE?

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR PEDROZA?

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ.

V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ: YES. HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

MARGARET ABE-KOGA: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER AHN?

EDDIE AHN: HERE.



MARCH 27, 2024

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

2

3 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE.

4

5 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

6

7 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** HERE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT. FLEMING IS ABSENT.

10 COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI?

11

12 **DOREEN GIACOPINI:** HERE.

13

14 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

15

16 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

17

18 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY? MOULTON PETERS?

19 NOACK? PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** YES HERE .

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?

24

25 **DAVID RABBIT:** HERE.



MARCH 27, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER SCHAFF?

3

4 **LIBBY SCHAFF:** HERE.

5

6 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** COMMISSIONER SPERING?

7

8 **JAMES P. SPERING:** PRESENT.

9

10 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO IS ABSENT.

11

12 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. I WON'T SAY WHO STARTED
13 THAT BUT IT GOT US GOING THAT'S WHY WE LIKE IN-PERSON. REQUEST
14 UNDER REMOTE PARTICIPATION A.B. 2449. COMMISSIONER RONEN.

15

16 **HILLARY RONEN:** I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER
17 A.B. 2449 BECAUSE OF KNEE RECONSTRUCTION SURGERY THERE IS NO
18 ONE AROUND 18 PRESENT IN THE ROOM.

19

20 **CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU YOUR REQUEST IS NOTED.
21 EARLIER THIS YEAR STAFF PROVIDED UPDATES ON THE PLAN OF
22 FINANCE AND ASSET MANAGEMENT PROMPTED COMMISSIONERS TO REQUEST
23 DEEPER DIVE INTO THE BATA FINANCES. BATA PLAN OF FINANCE HAS
24 LONG PROJECTED A TOLL INCREASE IN 2027. I WOULD LIKE TO ASK



MARCH 27, 2024

1 THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO GIVE US A SENSE OF WHEN STAFF MIGHT
2 PROVIDE A DEEPER LOOK INTO THE BATA FINANCES.
3
4 **ANDREW FREMIER:** THANK YOU FOR THAT QUESTION, CHAIR PEDROZA. I
5 DON'T USUALLY LIKE TO INVOKE TRAGEDY TO MAKE PINT BUT FOR
6 THOSE WHO FOLLOW THE NEWS THERE WAS A TERRIBLE EVENT IN
7 BALTIMORE THE OTHER DAY BY A SHIP ACCIDENT DOCKING OUT, A VERY
8 SIGNIFICANT STRUCTURE IN THAT HARBOR AND AS A REMINDER WE HAVE
9 HAD SEVERAL OPPORTUNITIES TO EXPERIENCE THAT HERE IN THE BAY,
10 COSTCO BUSAN HIT THE BAY BRIDGE A HANDFUL OF YEARS AGO, OTHER
11 SMALLER HITS HAPPEN AND REHAB, MONEY TO WORK TO MAKE SURE THAT
12 THE BRIDGES ARE PROTECTED AND THE FENDERS AND DOLPHINS THAT
13 ARE PROTECTING THE BRIDGES THAT ARE IN GOOD WORKING ORDER THAT
14 DRIVES THE POINT HOME ABOUT HOW IMPORTANT THE BATA BRIDGE
15 RESOURCES ARE, THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE IS RIGHT THERE WITH
16 THEM. AND I DO APPRECIATE ASKING THE QUESTION AND BRINGING IT
17 FORWARD. AS YOU MENTIONED, DERRICK DID BRING FORWARD THE BATA
18 PLAN OF FINANCE IN JANUARY. WE, ALSO ANTICIPATE USING A GOOD
19 PORTION OF YOUR WORKSHOP TO AGAIN GET INTO THE BATA FINANCE
20 ARENA BECAUSE I THINK IT'S CRITICAL. WE, YOU KNOW, HAVE DONE A
21 GOOD SUMMARY OF THE BROAD FINANCIAL PICTURE, BUT WHAT WE DID
22 IN THAT WORK IS IDENTIFY THAT YOU DO NOT HAVE THE FUNDS TO
23 COVER THE NEEDS THAT WE FORESEE WITH CALTRANS INTO THE FUTURE.
24 THE CURRENT ADOPTED CAPITAL INVESTMENT PLAN SHOWS OVER \$1.8
25 BILLION IN NEED OVER A TEN YEAR PERIOD, AND OUR CURRENT ASSET



MARCH 27, 2024

1 MANAGEMENT WORK THAT WE'RE DOING WITH CALTRANS IDENTIFIES THAT
2 WITH THAT LIKELY GO UP. WE HAVE NOTICED THE TRAFFIC SEEMS TO
3 HAVE STABILIZED OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS BUT IT IS STILL
4 BELOW WHAT IT WAS BEFORE COVID AND THAT JUST MIGHT BE THE MORE
5 NORMAL TRAFFIC PATTERNS THAT WE'LL SEE. TOLL INCREASES ARE
6 SOMETHING THAT YOU HAVE THE AUTHORITY TO APPROVE IF IT'S
7 ASSOCIATED WITH THE CARE AND FEEDING OF THE BRIDGES SO THIS IS
8 AN ITEM THAT WILL DIRECTLY IN FRONT OF BATA AS A
9 RESPONSIBILITY. I DO THINK IT'S IMPORTANT TO NOTE, AS YOU
10 MENTIONED, THAT THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE TOLL INCREASES, YOU
11 KNOW, ARE RELATIVELY SIGNIFICANT, BUT THEY'RE DOING THAT FOR
12 THE SAME REASONS IN A LOT OF WAYS TO TAKE CARE OF THE ASSET.
13 SO, WE DO THINK THAT THIS IS A WORTHY DISCUSSION. WE DO THINK
14 IT'S A SERIOUS ACTION THAT YOU WILL HAVE TO UNDERTAKE AND WE
15 LOOK FORWARD TO WORKING WITH YOU AT THE END OF APRIL IN THE
16 WORKSHOP TO HELP YOU UNDERSTAND IT AND START TO THINK ABOUT
17 WHAT THAT FUTURE MIGHT BE.

18

19 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU CHAIR
20 EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR ON THAT. IT'S GREAT TO PULL UP THAT AD-HOC
21 GROUP WE CREATED, I KNOW VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ WAS ON IT AND
22 COMMISSIONER -- [INDISCERNIBLE] I BELIEVE. ALSO INTERJECT
23 GOING TO NEW YORK AND TALKING TO OUR BANKERS, VERY INTERESTED
24 IN THE PLAN OF FINANCE. I THINK NOT USING WHAT HAPPENED AS AN
25 OPPORTUNITY IT'S SOMETHING WE HAVE BEEN WANTING TO HAVE THIS



MARCH 27, 2024

1 DISCUSSION I APPRECIATE YOU BRINGING THAT UP. ANY QUESTIONS
2 FROM COLLEAGUES? COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

3

4 **GINA PAPAN:** I THINK WE NEED TO GET THAT MESSAGE OUT THERE
5 SOONER RATHER THAN LATER SO WE DON'T HAVE CERTAIN LEGISLATORS
6 THINKING THEY CAN TAG TEAM THE MORE TRANSPARENT WE CAN BE
7 WOULD BE HELPFUL.

8

9 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT.

10

11 **DAVID RABBIT:** YOU MENTIONED GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, WE DID RAISE
12 TOLLS 50 CENTS PER YEAR FOR NEXT FIVE YEARS TO ADDRESS THE
13 \$220 MILLION PROJECTED DEFICIT OVER THAT SAME FIVE YEARS
14 HOWEVER THAT RATE INCREASE AS SIGNIFICANT AS IT IS WILL GET US
15 HALFWAY THERE WITH THE \$139 MILLION DEFICIT WE HAVE NO OTHER
16 AUTHORITY OTHER THAN TOLLS. GOING FORWARD WE WILL REDUCE
17 TRANSIT GOING FORWARD AND FIND OTHER PEOPLE'S MONEY AS WE ALL
18 LIKE TO FIND THROUGH DIFFERENT TRANSIT OPPORTUNITIES SO I JUST
19 PUT THAT OUT THERE BECAUSE I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT. AND JUST
20 BECAUSE THIS WAS FRESH ON OUR MINDS. WHEN THE BRIDGE WAS
21 BUILT, AND THAT COST \$35 MILLION IN TOTAL, ALL THOSE FIVE
22 YEARS AGO. THE TOLL AT THE TIME IN TODAY'S TIME WAS \$11 IT'S
23 ALWAYS BEEN AN EXPENSIVE BRIDGE TO TRAVEL TOLL TODAY IS \$9.25
24 TO 10.25 THEN IT WILL GO UP BY \$0.55 DEPENDING ON THE PAYMENT
25 METHOD IN LINE WITH WHERE IT WAS IN THE 1930S. OF COURSE,



MARCH 27, 2024

1 TODAY IT'S PAYING FOR A PORTION OF THE TRANSIT, BUS AND FERRY
2 THAT IT DIDN'T PAY IN THE 1930S IT WAS PAYING OFF THE DEBT SO
3 THAT'S TAKEN OVER THERE PARTICULAR REVENUE LINE. AND IT'S ALSO
4 PAYING, AS I THINK WAS MENTIONED BY THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR,
5 THE CAPITAL IMPROVEMENTS THAT ARE DESTINED INCLUDING A VERY
6 LARGE MAIN SPAN SEISMIC UPGRADE THE LAST PIECE OF THE SEISMIC
7 UPGRADE FOR THE BRIDGE WE TOOK CARE OF VULNERABLE SECTIONS ON
8 EACH SIDE. THIS IS AN \$800 MILLION ENDEAVOR THAT WILL INCLUDE
9 A SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF BRIDGE TOLL LOCAL MATCH TO PAY THAT'S
10 ON TOP OF THE IS YOU SIDE DETERRENT, THE ELECTRONIC TOLLS
11 THOSE KIND OF THINGS GOING FORWARD IN THE BRIDGE BUSINESS THE
12 WORK NEVER ENDS. I DO APPRECIATE LOOKING INTO IT FURTHER FOR
13 THE STATE MTC STATE BRIDGES THAT WE ARE RESPONSIBLE FOR. I
14 THINK, UNFORTUNATELY, WHAT HAPPENED IN BALTIMORE, YOU KNOW,
15 WITH THE AGING INFRASTRUCTURE THROUGHOUT, YOU KNOW, IS -- WE
16 ARE IN A VULNERABLE SITUATION, AND WE NEED AN INFLUX OF FUNDS.
17 AND I KNOW THE BIG BRIDGE PROGRAM WAS PART OF THAT BUT NEEDS
18 TO CONTINUE TO ADDRESS THOSE. DENIS MULLIGAN SENT OUT AN E-
19 MAIL THIS MORNING THAT I THOUGHT WAS FASCINATING THAT TALKED
20 ABOUT NORTH TOWER OF THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE SITS ON LAND SO
21 THE SHIP WOULD HAVE TO GROUND ITSELF BEFORE IT WOULD HIT THAT
22 ARE. THE SOUTH TOWER ACTUALLY HAS A FENDER. THE FENDER IS 40
23 FEET OUT FROM THE FACE OF THE STEEL TOWER. IT'S TEN FEET THICK
24 AT THE TOP. IF CONCRETE IT'S 27 AND A HALF FEET THICK, 40 FEET
25 DOWN AND IT'S FILLED WITH SANDWICH IT'S VERY MUCH LIKE A



MARCH 27, 2024

1 MODERN HIGHWAY, YOU KNOW, WHATEVER WE CALL THOSE CRASH
2 TENUATORS, BUT AHEAD OF THEIR TIME FOR THE 1930S IT'S
3 SIGNIFICANT AND KNOCK ON WOOD PRETTY ROBUST AND THE BRIDGE IN
4 BALTIMORE DID NOT HAVE THAT PROTECTION WHICH IS A SHAME.

5

6 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** THANK YOU COMMISSIONER RABBIT.
7 SEEING NO FURTHER QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS.

8

9 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** I HAVE ONE.

10

11 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

12

13 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** AND I REALLY APPRECIATE WHAT DIRECTOR RABBIT WAS
14 JUST SAYING. I WAS ALSO VERY INTERESTED IN UNDERSTANDING THE -
15 - HOW FAR AWAY FROM A BRIDGE -- OR ITS IMPLEMENT, CAN YOU
16 SPEND RESOURCES? OR IS IT APPROPRIATE TO SPEND RESOURCES IN
17 AND WHEN YOU DO THE PRESENTATION, I'M JUST REALLY TRYING TO
18 UNDERSTAND HOW IT CONNECTS INTO THE OTHER EXPENDITURES THAT WE
19 MAY MAKE ON A FREEWAY OR ROADWAY.

20

21 **ANDREW FREMIER:** UNFORTUNATELY THAT'S, LIKE A LOT OF THINGS, A
22 COMPLICATED ANSWER. THE BRIDGES HAVE VERY DIFFERENT
23 DEFINITIONS, THE IRONY FOR SAN MATEO IT GOES ALL THE WAY TO
24 THE 880 INTERCHANGE ACROSS TO FOSTER CITY. RICHMOND BRIDGE HAS
25 NO DEFINITION WE HAVE A COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT WITH CALTRANS



MARCH 27, 2024

1 AND WE'RE FOCUSED FROM BRIDGE END TO START AND ASSOCIATED
2 SUPPORT SYSTEMS MAINTENANCE THAT ARE REQUIRED TO KEEP IT IN
3 GOOD ORDER WE HAVE OPPORTUNITIES TO WORK WITH THE STATE BUT SO
4 DOES OTHER PROGRAMMING FUNDS LIKE SHOP ONCE YOU GET OUT INTO
5 THE PLAZAS. IT'S A LITTLE BIT OF YOU HAVE GOT TO DO THE RIGHT
6 THING. THE STATE HAS A LOT OF THE RESPONSIBILITY BUT WHEN WE
7 TOOK OVER ALL OF THE TOLLING FINANCE WITH THE BAY BRIDGE
8 SEISMIC LEGISLATION YOU ALSO TOOK ON ALL KNOW RESPONSIBILITY
9 FOR MAINTENANCE AND OPERATIONS IN PERPETUITY. SO, THE ROLE HAS
10 CHANGED A LITTLE BIT IN 2005 IN TERMS OF RESPONSIBILITIES.

11

12 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

13

14 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. SEEING NO FURTHER
15 DISCUSSION. THIS IS JUST A REQUEST THAT OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
16 WILL COME BACK AND WE'LL HAVE AN IN DEPTH DISCUSSION AND
17 PROVIDE THE PUBLIC OPPORTUNITY TO PROVIDE COMMENT AS WELL.
18 MOVING TO OUR CONSENT CALENDAR. INCLUDES MINUTES FROM OUR
19 FEBRUARY 28TH MEETING.

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN MOVE APPROVAL.

22

23 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** SECOND.

24



MARCH 27, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MOTION AND SECOND. PUBLIC
2 COMMENT.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOTHING IN WRITING NO MEMBER OF THE
5 PUBLIC WITH THEIR HAND RAISED.

6

7 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ROLL CALL VOTE PLEASE.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PEDROZA.

10

11 **ROZA:**CHAIR, ALFREDO ED'

12

13 **V. CHAIR, V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** ABE-KOGA.

16

17 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** AHN?

20

21 **EDDIE AHN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** CANEPA IS ABSENT. CHAVEZ?

24

25 **CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.



MARCH 27, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

3

4 **CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI:** AYE COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT.

5 COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

6

7 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MAHAN IS ABSENT. MILEY?

10

11 **NATHAN MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** MOULTON PETERS?

14

15 **STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** NOACK?

18

19 **SPEAKER:** YES.

20

21 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** PAPAN?

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RABBIT?



MARCH 27, 2024

1

2 **DAVID RABBIT:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** RONEN?

5

6 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SPERING?

9

10 **JAMES P. SPERING:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES

13 UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT. MOVING TO ITEM FOUR.

16 ADJOURNMENT OF THE NEXT MEETING OF THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY

17 --

18

19 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** SORRY. ITEM THREE, PUBLIC COMMENT,

20 GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT.

21

22 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** YOUR SO GOOD. THANK YOU. WE'RE

23 GOING TO GO BACK TO ITEM THREE, PUBLIC COMMENT.

24



MARCH 27, 2024

1 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN
2 WRITING. I SEE ALETA DUPRE'S HAND IS RAISED. GO AHEAD AND
3 UNMUTE YOURSELF, PLEASE.

4

5 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** MY APOLOGIES, ALETA.

6

7 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

8

9 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA, ALETA DUPRE SHE AND
10 HER WITH TEAM FOLD, APPRECIATE THE LEAP SPEAK. THANK YOU FOR
11 THAT REPORT EARLIER I AM PAINFULLY AWARE OF THE TRAGEDY IN
12 BALTIMORE AND HOW DO WE BUILD THE BEST BATA THAT WE CAN WE
13 HAVE A LOT OF RESPONSIBILITIES OF COLLECTING APPROPRIATE FARE
14 REVENUE AND OVERSEEING WORK AND OUR BRIDGE NETWORK AND
15 TRANSFERS TO OTHER PROGRAMS I EMPHASIZE THE IMPORTANCE OF
16 MAKING SURE WE CAN COLLECT THE MONEY SO THAT WE CAN ENSURE
17 THAT WE CONTINUE TO MAINTAIN THESE BRIDGES IN A SAFE AND
18 SATISFACTORY CONDITION. OPERATING A VEHICLE IS A PRIVILEGE NOT
19 A RIGHT. I ASK THAT YOU ADVOCATE EVERYBODY TO FOLLOW THEIR
20 RESPONSIBLE IN PAYING THE APPROPRIATE TOLLS. THANK YOU.

21

22 **CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:** THANK YOU. NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED,
23 MR. CHAIR.

24



MARCH 27, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA:** ALL RIGHT BACK TO ITEM FOUR,
2 ADJOURNMENT. THE NEXT MEETING FOR THE BAY AREA TOLL AUTHORITY
3 IS SCHEDULED FOR FEBRUARY 24TH, 2024. ANY CHANGES TO THE
4 SCHEDULE WILL BE DULY NOTED. MEETING ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]
5



Broadcasting Government