

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MARCH 25, 2024

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE
MONDAY, MARCH 25TH, 2024, 12:45 PM**

CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH: I'M GOING TO CALL TO ORDER THIS MEETING OF THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE. THIS MEETING IS BEING WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND WE WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UP BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. WALLY, CAN WE DO ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM A QUORUM?

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. CHAIR HURSH?

CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR MULLIGAN?

V. CHAIR, DENIS MULLIGAN: PRESENT.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER SERGEANT FOR BOUCHARD?

SPEAKER: HERE.

CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER CHAN?



MARCH 25, 2024

1

2 **APRIL CHAN:** HERE.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CHURCHILL?

5

6 **BILL CHURCHILL:** HERE.

7

8 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** CUMINS?

9

10 **EDDY CUMINS:** HERE.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** BOCKELMAN FOR MEMBER PREMIER?

13

14 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** HERE.

15

16 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** RICHARDSON FOR MEMBER GONOT?

17

18 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

19

20 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** ROSSI FOR MEMBER HALLS?

21

22 **SPEAKER:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER MILLER?

25



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **KATE MILLER:** HERE .

2

3 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** MEMBER POWERS?

4

5 **ROBERT POWERS:** HERE .

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** TUMLIN?

8

9 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** HERE .

10

11 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WEGENER?

12

13 **CHRISTY WEGENER:** HERE .

14

15 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE QUORUM. THANK YOU. HURSH: THANK

16 YOU, MADAM CLERK. I'LL FOREGO ANY FORMAL COMMENTS UNDER THE

17 CHAIR'S INTRODUCTION. THANKS, EVERYBODY, FOR BEING HERE.

18 THANKS MTC FOR THIS INCREDIBLE FACILITY. WE LOOK FORWARD TO AN

19 EXCITING FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE UPDATE. I KNOW WE'RE

20 RUNNING A LITTLE BIT BEHIND THE POSTED MEETING START TIME.

21 WE'LL MOVE TO AGENDA ITEM THREE, THE CONSENT CALENDAR,

22 CONSISTS OF AGENDA ITEM 3A, MEETING MINUTES OF JANUARY 22ND,

23 2024. DO WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND?

24

25 **ROBERT POWERS:** MOTION .



MARCH 25, 2024

1

2 **CHRISTY WEGENER:** I'LL SECOND.

3

4 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** MOTION BY POWERS, SECOND BY WEGENER. IS
5 THERE ANY MEMBER THAT WOULD LIKE HAVE COMMENTS ON THIS MOTION?

6

7 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE MEMBERS ONLINE WITH THEIR
8 HANDS RAISED, THERE IS NOTHING IN WRITING, AND THERE ARE NO
9 ONE IN THE ROOM ON THIS ITEM.

10

11 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** I'LL CALL FOR THE VOTE. ALL THOSE IN
12 FAVOR ACKNOWLEDGE BY STATING AYE. (AYES)

13

14 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
15 PRESENT. THANK YOU. GETS US TO 4A ON THE REGULAR CALENDAR, THE
16 CLIPPER BAY PASS PROJECT UPDATE. I BELIEVE MR. BACON AND MR.
17 EISEMAN -- BUT I SEE MISS REEVES THERE TOO. I'LL HAND IT OVER
18 TO STAFF.

19

20 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THANK YOU, MR. CHAIR. WE HAVE A PRESENTATION
21 TO PULL UP, PLEASE. GOOD AFTERNOON, TASK FORCE MEMBERS. MIKE
22 EISEMAN HERE FROM BART, JOINED BY CLIPPER BAY PASS PROGRAM
23 MANAGER RYAN REEVES, AND, ALSO, VERY HAPPY TO WELCOME BACK
24 DEPUTY DIRECTOR BILL BACON FROM HIS FAMILY LEAVE, JUST IN THE
25 NICK OF TIME. WE CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. TODAY'S



MARCH 25, 2024

1 ITEM FOCUSES ON CLIPPER BAY PASS. WE'LL ASK THE TASK FORCE TO
2 CONSIDER ACTION TO ENDORSE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE EXISTING
3 BAY PASS PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT. AIM TO BUILD ON THE EARLY
4 SUCCESS OF BAY PASS WITH NEXT STEPS FOR PHASE ONE PARTNER AS
5 WELL AS ADDITIONAL FLEXIBILITY TO CONTINUE STRENGTHENING PHASE
6 TWO OF THE PILOT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN A MOMENT BILL WILL
7 COVER THE FIRST ITEM WHICH IS CRITICAL AND TIME SENSITIVE. AS
8 YOU ARE AWARE THE PHASE ONE PILOT IS SCHEDULED TO SUNSET JUNE
9 30TH. STAFF PROPOSAL TO PERMIT AND FUND TRANSITION TO MAINTAIN
10 AND STRENGTHEN THOSE INSTITUTIONAL PARTNERSHIPS. I'LL WALK
11 THROUGH OUR PROPOSALS FOR ADDITIONAL FLEXIBILITY REQUESTED FOR
12 THE PHASE TWO PILOT. THOSE INCLUDE AUTHORIZATION FOR THIS TASK
13 FORCE TO INCREASE THE SCALE OF THE PHASE TWO PILOT THROUGH
14 FUTURE ACTION UNDER CERTAIN CONDITIONS. AUTHORIZATION TO
15 DEPLOY CLIPPER BAY PASS FOR LIMITED EVENT SPECIAL EVENT USES
16 AND AUTHORIZATION TO INCLUDE SAN FRANCISCO AIRPORT IN THE
17 PHASE TWO PILOT. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS YOU KNOW, THE
18 PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT IS AN INTER-AGENCY AGREEMENT ENDORSED
19 BY THIS TASK FORCE IN NOVEMBER AND SCHEDULE SIGNED BY MTC AND
20 ALL OPERATORS ON CLIPPER. SOME AGENCIES TOOK BOARD ACTION AND
21 SOME AGREED USING EXECUTIVE AUTHORITY. THE PA DEFINES THE
22 OPERATIONAL AND FINANCIAL TERM COVERING BOTH PHASE 1 AND 2 OF
23 THE BAY PASS PILOT INCLUDING AGENCY REIMBURSEMENT FOR TRIPS
24 TAKEN. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AMENDING THE AGREEMENT WILL HAVE TWO
25 STEPS. THE FIRST IS TODAY. YOU CONSIDER THE PROPOSALS, IF YOU



MARCH 25, 2024

1 APPROVE YOU ENDORSE AND DIRECT STAFF TO SEEK OPERATOR
2 APPROVAL. NEXT EACH PARTICIPATING OPERATOR WOULD SIGN THE
3 AMENDED AGREEMENT. IT WOULD BE UP TO EACH AGENCY TO DECIDE
4 WHETHER BOARD ACTION IS NEEDED. WE HAVE INCLUDED IN TODAY'S
5 PROPOSALS ALL THE FLEXIBILITY THE PROJECT TEAM BELIEVES WILL
6 BE NECESSARY FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE PILOT. WE DON'T
7 ANTICIPATE FURTHER AMENDMENTS TO THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT.
8 NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. TAKE IT AWAY, BILL?

9

10 **WILLIAM BACON:** THANK YOU, MIKE. GOOD AFTERNOON, CHAIR HURSH
11 AND TASK FORCE MEMBERS. BILL BACON WITH THE PROJECT TEAM AND
12 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT STAFF. I'M GOING TO DISCUSS STATUS
13 UPDATE OF THE FIRST PHASE OF THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PILOT AND
14 PROJECT TEAM PROPOSED NEXT STEPS TO ADVANTAGE CLIPPER BAY PASS
15 AT PARTNER INSTITUTIONS FOR THE FIRST PHASE. NEXT SLIDE
16 PLEASE. AS MOST OF YOU ARE FAMILIAR THE FIRST PHASE OF CLIPPER
17 BAY PASS PILOT LAUNCHED IN SUMMER OF 2022 AT SAN FRANCISCO
18 STATE, SAN JOSE STATE, UC BERKELEY, SANTA ROSA JUNIOR COLLEGE
19 AND A DOZEN MID-PEN AFFORDABLE HOUSING COMMUNITIES. THIS PHASE
20 WAS LAUNCHED AS A TWO YEAR PILOT THROUGH THE SUMMER AT THE
21 EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS AND THIS FALL AND AFFORDABLE HOUSING
22 COMMUNITIES. THE FIRST RUN AS A RANDOMIZED CONTROL TRIAL AT UC
23 BERKELEY AND SAN JOSE STATE, AND SAN FRANCISCO STATE.
24 IMPORTANT IN DELIVERING PROOF OF CONCEPT OF HOW TRANSIT AGENCY
25 INSTITUTIONAL PASS MIGHT WORK HERE IN THE BAY AREA AND



MARCH 25, 2024

1 CRITICALLY SERVE GROWING RIDERSHIP BY OVER 40% THUS FAR IN THE
2 PILOT AND IMPROVE ACCESS FOR USERS. FIRST PHASE HAS BEEN
3 SUBSIDIZED, THE FOUR AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS IN REGIONAL
4 FUNDS WHICH HAVE BEEN USED TO DIRECTLY TO REIMBURSE TRANSIT
5 OPERATORS FOR FULL ADULT CASH FARE FOR EACH TRIP TAKEN USING
6 CLIPPER BAY PASS. FUNDS SUPPORTING FIRST PHASE ONE OF THE
7 PILOT ARE GOING BACK TO CLIPPER OPERATORS. HOWEVER BECAUSE
8 USAGE OF CLIPPER BAY PASS HAS FAR EXCEEDED THE PROJECT TEAM'S
9 ALREADY AMBITIONS RIDERSHIP ASSUMPTIONS, WE'RE ON TRACK TO
10 CONCLUDE THE TWO-YEAR PILOT LATER THIS YEAR, APPROXIMATELY ONE
11 AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS OVER BUDGET. FINALLY, THE CLIPPER
12 BAY PASS PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT WHICH ALL TRANSIT OPERATORS
13 ENDORSED DOES NOT DEFINE A CLEAR PATH FOR THE PHASE ONE
14 INSTITUTIONS TO BUY INTO THE CLIPPER BAY PASS PROGRAM APART
15 FROM AROUND THE TERMS OF THE PHASE TWO PILOT WHICH HAS LIMITED
16 ON OVERALL CLIPPER BAY PASS SALES THAT SOME OF PHASE ONE
17 INSTITUTIONS FROM PARTICIPATING. NEXT SLIDE. RECOMMENDATION ON
18 THE PROJECT TEAM IS BRIDGING BEFORE THE TASK FORCE THIS
19 AFTERNOON WHICH I'LL DISCUSS OVER THE NEXT COUPLE OF SLIDES
20 GOAL OF FULLY DEPLOYING CLIPPER BAY PASS ACROSS THE PHASE ONE
21 INSTITUTIONS THROUGH THE FINANCIALLY SUSTAINABLE SELF-FUNDED
22 MODEL PROJECT TEAM RECOMMENDING THAT THE PHASE ONE PILOT BE
23 EXTENDED TO ALLOW FOR TRANSITION PHASE FOR ONE YEAR, ALLOWING
24 THE ESTABLISHMENT OF NECESSARY FUNDING MODEL FOR EACH
25 INSTITUTION INTERESTED. THE CHARTS ON THE SLIDE DEMONSTRATE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 OUR GOAL IS TO GO FROM THE PHASE ONE RANDOMIZED CONTROL PILOT
2 WHICH YOU CAN SEE ON THE LEFT THAT COVERED A PORTION OF THE
3 POPULATION AT EACH INSTITUTION TO COVERING THE ENTIRE
4 POPULATION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE PHASE ONE INSTITUTIONS ARE
5 INTERESTED IN PURCHASING CLIPPER BAY PASS FOR THEIR ENTIRE
6 POPULATIONS BUT NOT ALL ARE READY TO DO SO BEFORE THE END OF
7 THE PHASE ONE PILOT THIS SUMMER. AND THE PARTICIPATION
8 AGREEMENT DOES NOT DEFINE A CLEAR PATHWAY APART FROM THE PHASE
9 TWO FRAMEWORK FOR THE 120,000 STUDENTS AND RESIDENTS FROM THE
10 FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS TO BUY INTO THE BAY PASS PROGRAM. THE
11 PROJECT TEAM IS RECOMMENDING THAT THE CLIPPER BAY PASS
12 PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT BE AMENDED TO PERMIT PHASE ONE
13 PARTNERS TO PURCHASE CLIPPER BAY PASS FOR STUDENTS AND
14 RESIDENTS AS SOON AS THEY'RE READY. ACCOMPLISHED UNDER THE
15 SAME GENERAL TERMS AS THE PHASE TWO PILOT IT. WE'RE ALSO
16 SEEKING AMENDMENT TO THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT TO ALLOW FOR
17 A ONE YEAR TRANSITION PHASE FOR THOSE EXISTING PHASE ONE
18 INSTITUTIONS, WHICH WOULD ALLOW THE EXISTING PASS HOLDERS AT
19 EACH INSTITUTION TO CONTINUE TO ACCESS THE SERVICE. TO THIS
20 POINT, I ALSO WANT TO ANNOUNCE THAT THE PROJECT TEAM IS
21 EXCITED TO LET THE TASK FORCE KNOW THAT SAN FRANCISCO STATE
22 UNIVERSITY STUDENT GOVERNMENT, LAST WEEK, ENDORSED A PROPOSAL
23 TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE PROCESS OF GATHERING STUDENT INPUT TO
24 PROVIDE THE CLIPPER BAY PASS FOR THEIR ENTIRE STUDENT
25 POPULATION PAID FOR OUT OF EXISTING STUDENT FEE REVENUE THOSE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 STEPS PROCEED AS UNIVERSITY STAFF COMMUNICATED TO THE PROJECT
2 TEAM AND AS THE TASK FORCE AND TRANSIT OPERATOR SUPPORT
3 AMENDMENT TO THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT THEN ALL 25,000 SAN
4 JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY STUDENTS WOULD HAVE ACCESS TO THE
5 CLIPPER BAY PASS STARTING THIS YEAR IN THE FALL. NEXT SLIDE. I
6 WANT TO FOCUS ON HOW THE PROJECT TEAM IS PROPOSING TO FUND THE
7 PHASE ONE TRANSITION THIS YEAR AS WELL AS ENSURE FUNDS ARE
8 AVAILABLE TO REIMBURSE OPERATORS FOR FULL ADULT CASH FARE FOR
9 ALL TRIPS TAKEN USING CLIPPER BAY PASS DURING FIRST TWO YEARS
10 OF THE PILOT. BASED ON HIGH LEVELS OF USAGE OVER TWO YEARS THE
11 PROJECT TEAM CONSERVATIVELY EXPECTS THAT AN EXTEND SAID
12 TRANSITION YEAR WOULD COST UP TO \$2 MILLION IN TOTAL. AS I
13 MENTIONED EARLIER, BECAUSE BAY PASS USAGE DURING PHASE ONE HAS
14 EXCEEDED THE PROJECT TEAM'S AMBITIOUS RIDERSHIP ASSUMPTIONS
15 WE'RE CURRENTLY ON TRACK TO CONCLUDE THIS YEAR WITH A \$1.5
16 MILLION SHORTFALL. IN ORDER TO FUND THIS APPROXIMATELY THREE
17 AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS TOTAL FUNDING NEED TO CREATE THAT
18 TRANSITION YEAR AND FULLY REIMBURSE OPERATORS, THE PROJECT
19 TEAM IS RECOMMENDING THAT THE TASK FORCE SUPPORT MTC
20 ALLOCATING THREE AND A HALF MILLION DOLLARS IN STATE TRANSIT
21 ASSISTANCE POPULATION BASED FUNDS, WHICH ARE ALREADY SET
22 ASIDE, BUT NOT YET ALLOCATED TO SUPPORT REIMBURSEMENTS TO
23 TRANSIT OPERATORS FOR REGIONAL FARE PROGRAMS, INCLUDING
24 CLIPPER BAY PASS AND CLIPPER START IN THE CURRENT FISCAL YEAR
25 '23/'24. IF THE TASK FORCE ENDORSES, THE MTC WILL CONSIDER



MARCH 25, 2024

1 WILL CONSIDER TAKING ACTION TO APPROVE THIS FUNDING LATER THIS
2 SPRING. BEFORE I TURN IT BACK TO MIKE, GO FORWARD ONE MORE
3 SLIDE, THANK YOU. I'LL WALK US THROUGH A TIMELINE OF HOW THE
4 PROPOSE TRANSITION WOULD WORK. FIRST, IF THE TASK FORCE
5 ENDORSES THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT AMENDMENTS TODAY THE
6 PROJECT TEAM WILL LOOK TO FINALIZE AMENDMENT LANGUAGE AND
7 SHARE THAT WITH TRANSIT OPERATOR STAFF FOR CONSIDERATION AND
8 APPROVAL BY EACH OPERATOR OVER THE NEXT FEW MONTHS. THE PILOT
9 WOULD END AND TRANSITION KICKOFF FOR EXISTING PARTICIPANTS. NO
10 NEW STUDENTS OR RESIDENTS WOULD BE ENROLLED IN CLIPPER BAY
11 PASS DURING THIS TRANSITION. ANY PHASE ONE PARTNERS INCLUDING
12 SAN FRANCISCO STATE READY TO MOVE INTO A PURCHASED CLIPPER BAY
13 PASS CONTRACT FOR THEIR ENTIRE COMMUNITY WILL BEGIN TO HAVE
14 CONTRACTS EXECUTED FOR THEIR COMMUNITY AND OVER THE PERIOD
15 BETWEEN THIS FALL AND NEXT SPRING THE PROJECT TEAM WOULD
16 CONTINUE TO WORK CLOSELY WITH PHASE ONE INSTITUTIONS TO
17 SUPPORT IDENTIFIED FUNDING PROPOSE WITH THE GOAL OF BRINGING
18 CLIPPER BAY PASS TO THE ENTIRETY OF THE PHASE ONE INSTITUTION
19 POPULATION BY NEXT SUMMER. I'LL TURN IT BACK TO MIKE.

20

21 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** THANK YOU BILL FOR THE DISCUSSION OF PHASE
22 ONE. I'LL PRESENT OUR PROPOSALS DEALING WITH PHASE TWO OF THE
23 PILOT STARTING ON THE NEXT SLIDE. ONE MORE PLEASE. BEGINNING
24 HERE WITH A RECAP OF PHASE TWO, YOU WILL RECALL THAT UNLIKE
25 PHASE ONE PHASE TWO IS DESIGNED TO BE FUNDED BY CUSTOMER



MARCH 25, 2024

1 INSTITUTIONS FROM THE START BUILDING ON PROOF OF CONCEPT
2 DELIVERED IF PHASE ONE LAUNCHED TWO IN JANUARY 3RD EMPLOYERS
3 AND 8,000 EMPLOYEES. 117 TRIPS MADE IN JANUARY AND FEBRUARY
4 DELIVERING NEW RIDERS STABLE REVENUE AND IMPROVED CUSTOMER
5 EXPERIENCE A REAL-WORLD DEMONSTRATION OF OUR ABILITY TO WORK
6 TOGETHER FOR THE BENEFIT OF RIDERS. WE HAVE A PIPELINE OF
7 INTERESTED COMPANIES AND WE PLAN TO ON-BOARD THEM ON A ROLLING
8 BASIS UP TO EXISTING PAP OF TEN INSTITUTIONS AND 20,000
9 INDIVIDUALS. WHILE THE AGREEMENT GOVERNING THIS EFFORT WAS
10 JUST ENDORSED IN NOVEMBER 2023, WE'RE LEARNING AS WE GO AND
11 THERE ARE A FEW AREAS WHERE FLEXIBILITY WOULD HELP US CONTINUE
12 TO STRENGTHEN THE PROGRAM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. WE'LL RUN
13 THROUGH THE PROPOSALS FIRST A PIPELINE AND INTERESTED
14 INSTITUTIONS. INCLUDING EMPLOYERS, AFFORDABLE HOUSING
15 PROPERTIES AND UNIVERSITIES, HOWEVER THE PILOT IS LIMITED TO
16 TEN INSTITUTIONS AND 20,000 PASSES. ANY ADJUSTMENT REQUIRES
17 ACTION BY ALL PARTICIPATING AGENCIES. OUR RECOMMENDATION IS
18 NOT TO CHANGE THESE CAPS TODAY BUT ADJUST THE PROCESS FOR
19 POTENTIALLY CHANGING THEM IN THE FUTURE IF CONDITIONS WARRANT.
20 IN THIS PROPOSAL, THE PA WOULD BE AMENDED TO GRANT THE TASK
21 FORCE THE AUTHORITY TO DIRECT PM TO INCREASE PILOT CAPS
22 PROVIDED STAFF CAN DEMONSTRATE ADEQUATE BACKSTOP FUNDS AND
23 RISK MANAGEMENT. PM TEAM WILL ADDRESS REVENUE, PROJECTIONS,
24 AND RISK ANALYSIS IN FUTURE PROPOSALS TO INCREASE CAPACITY.
25 NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. EMPLOYERS AN SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL



MARCH 25, 2024

1 AIRPORT ARE EXISTING INSTITUTIONAL PARTNERS OF BART, HOWEVER,
2 EMPLOYERS AT SAN FRANCISCO AIRPORT ARE NOT PERMITTED TO JOIN
3 THE PHASE TWO PILOT UNDER THE CURRENT PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT
4 TERMS BECAUSE SFO IS LOCATED IN SAN MATEO COUNTY. THE
5 RECOMMENDATION TO AMEND PA TO ALLOW EMPLOYERS AT SFO TO
6 PARTICIPATE IN PASS BECAUSE OF THEIR STATUS AS AN EXISTING
7 INSTITUTIONAL PARTNER. CURRENT INTEREST IN CLIPPER BAY PASS IS
8 FROM THE SFO AIRPORT COMMISSION FOR THEIR APPROXIMATELY 1500
9 EMPLOYEES. I WANT TO STRESS GEOGRAPHIC LIMITATIONS ARE A
10 CRITICAL PIECE OF ORIGINAL PA AS WE SEEK TO DEVELOP THIS
11 PROGRAM, WHILE MANAGING RISK FOR ALL PARTICIPATING AGENCIES.
12 REQUESTED ONE TIME CARVE-OUT TO INCLUDE THE ONE INSTITUTIONAL
13 PARTNER NOT ELIGIBLE FOR INCLUSION IN THE EXISTING PA. WE
14 WOULD MAINTAIN THE EXISTING GEOGRAPHIC LIMITATIONS AND
15 REQUIREMENTS IN ALL FUTURE CASES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. IN THE
16 PAST, OUR REGION HAS SOLD ALL AGENCY PASS TO CERTAIN SPECIAL
17 EVENTS. I WANT TO RECOGNIZE THE CLIPPER TEAM FOR BRINGING
18 TOGETHER THE TECHNOLOGY PLATFORM, THE AFTA CONFERENCE. THEY
19 HAVE DONE A GREAT JOB DEVELOPING THAT BUT FACED LIMITATIONS,
20 WHICH IS NEED TO COME TO AGREEMENT WITH ALL PARTICIPATING
21 AGENCIES ON A CASE BY CASE BASIS. SO WE'RE RECOMMENDING HERE
22 IS THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT BE AMENDED TO ALLOW THE SALE OF
23 CLIPPER BAY PASS TO UP TO TEN SPECIAL EVENTS. AGENCIES WOULD
24 BE REIMBURSED FOR TRIPS TAKEN UNDER SAME TERMS AS THE PHASE
25 TWO PILOT, AND WOULD AUTHORIZE THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 TO SELL ADDITIONAL SPECIAL EVENTS AFTER REPORT BACK FROM THE
2 PROJECT TEAM. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, WE'LL CONCLUDE HERE WITH
3 A SUMMARY OF THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENT AMENDMENTS PROPOSED
4 FOR TASK FORCE ENDORSEMENTS. IT INCLUDES CRITICAL AND TIME
5 SENSITIVE AMENDMENT'S ALLOWING THE PHASE TWO PARTNERS WHO ARE
6 READY TO PURCHASE BAY PASS AFTER THE PILOT SUNSETS AND FUNDING
7 A TRANSITION PERIOD FOR THE REMAINING INSTITUTIONS. IT ALSO
8 INCLUDES THREE SPECIFIC AREAS OF FLEXIBILITY FOR PHASE TWO.
9 THESE AIM TO BUILD ON SUCCESS AND CONTINUED LEARNING AS WE GO.
10 WE PROPOSE THE TASK FORCE CONSIDER TAKING ACTION TO ENDORSE
11 PROPOSALS AND DIRECTING STAFF TO PREPARE AMENDMENTS FOR AGENCY
12 APPROVAL. BACK TO THE CHAIR.

13

14 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** EXCELLENT PRESENTATION. IT'S A GOOD
15 PROBLEM TO HAVE WHEN WE HAVE MORE CUSTOMERS THAN BUDGET.
16 BEFORE I ASK FOR A MOTION, I WANT TO REMIND THE TASK FORCE
17 THAT WE'RE BEING ASKED TO ENDORSE THE RECOMMENDATIONS THAT
18 WERE JUST ON THAT FINAL SLIDE BUT LET'S FIRST SEE IF WE HAVE
19 ANY PUBLIC COMMENT BEFORE I GO TO THE TASK FORCE MEMBERS.

20

21 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** WE HAVE ONE PERSON IN THE ROOM HERE.
22 ALETA DUPREE, SHE WILL COME TO THE PODIUM AND THEN WE HAVE
23 ALSO SOME ONLINE AFTER THAT.

24



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR MIKE HURSH AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE
2 FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. THIS IS GOOD NEWS.
3 I MEAN, YES, WE ARE OVER BUDGET, BUT I CALL IT A HAPPY
4 PROBLEM. PEOPLE LIKE THIS AND IT DOESN'T SURPRISE ME. I WISH I
5 KNEW SOME PEOPLE WHO ARE DOING IT SO THEY COULD DESCRIBE THIS
6 TO ME AND I COULD TAG ALONG WITH THEM ON THE BUS OR THE TRAIN
7 TO SEE IT IN ACTION. BUT, YES, IT'S WORKING, AND I THINK THIS
8 IS GOING TO HELP REDEFINE HOW PEOPLE PAY FARE. YES, HOW WE PAY
9 FARE. WHETHER IT BE MONTHLY, OR PERHAPS WE'LL HAVE SOME KIND
10 OF A DAY PASS OR A WEEKLY PASS PRODUCT. I THINK IT WOULD
11 SUMMER MAKE THINGS EASIER FOR ME. HOPEFULLY WE'LL HAVE SOME
12 PRICING OUT SOON. MAYBE I'LL HAVE TO FILE A PUBLIC RECORDS
13 REQUEST FOR THAT. I DON'T KNOW IF THE TERMS ARE STILL -- ARE
14 OR ARE STILL CONFIDENTIAL. BUT IN BERKELEY, I RIDE THE 36 IN
15 BERKELEY. I SEE A LOT OF STUDENTS GETTING ON THE BUSES ONTO AC
16 TRANSIT. AND I'M HAPPY ABOUT THAT. I LIKE HAVING MORE PEOPLE
17 ON THE BUSES AND TRAINS; IT GIVES PRESENCE. AND THE BIG
18 PROBLEM IN OUR COMMUNITY IT'S NOT LACKING IT'S LACK OF PARKING
19 SPACES IT'S TOO MANY VEHICLES, TOO MANY VEHICLES THAT ARE
20 BURNING GASOLINE AND DIESEL AND PRODUCING EMISSIONS AND YET
21 OUR TRAIN AND BUS FLEETS ARE GETTING CLEANER. SO, I GUESS I
22 WOULD LIKE TO SEE SOME ANIMATION, OR IF I COULD BE IN A ROOM
23 WITH PEOPLE WHO ACTUALLY DO THIS AND SAY LET'S GO ON A RIDE,
24 SEE HOW IT ACTUALLY WORKS. MAYBE I'LL SPEND \$40 ON THE EASY
25 TRANSIT PASS IN LOS ANGELES AND GET A FEEL FOR IT. BUT IT'S A



MARCH 25, 2024

1 GOOD PROBLEM TO HAVE. WE CAN SOLVE IT AND FIND THE MONEY.

2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. NEXT UP IS ADINA LEVIN.

5 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.

6

7 **ADINA LEVIN:** GOOD AFTERNOON. I'M SPEAKING FOR SEAMLESS BAY
8 AREA AND WANTED TO EXPRESS A LOT OF ENTHUSIASM. THIS IS REALLY
9 A SPECTACULAR SUCCESS SHOWING THAT AGENCIES IN WORKING
10 TOGETHER ARE ABLE TO REALLY SIGNIFICANTLY INCREASE TRANSIT
11 RIDERSHIP AND IMPROVE MOBILITY FOR PEOPLE. WHEN OUT AND ABOUT
12 TALKING ABOUT TRANSIT, YOU HEAR SECOND AND THIRD HAND ABOUT
13 PEOPLE WHO USE BAY PASS, AND THEY LOVE IT. THIS IS A GREAT
14 SUCCESS TO BE ABLE TO TELL. AND WE HAVE PREVIOUSLY SHARED A
15 JOINT LETTER WITH MULTIPLE EMPLOYERS AND TRANSPORTATION
16 MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATIONS ENCOURAGING USING THAT HIGHLIGHT AND
17 LEARNING FROM THE PILOT IN ORDER TO EXPAND IN A WAY THAT WORKS
18 FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES AND HELPS TRANSIT RIDERS, WHILE THE
19 PEOPLE WHO SIGN THAT LETTER DID NOT LOOK AT THE DETAILS OF
20 THIS STAFF REPORT AND EXPRESS ANY OPINION ABOUT THESE
21 PARTICULAR DETAILS, THERE IS JUST AN OVERALL DESIRE TO HAVE
22 THE AGENCIES AND MTC WORK TOGETHER, LEARN FROM THE PILOT, TO
23 BE ABLE TO INCREASE AND ROLL OUT. AND, SO, SPEAKING FOR
24 SEAMLESS, WE WOULD VERY MUCH LIKE TO ENCOURAGE TAKING THESE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 STEPS TO CONTINUE AND INCREMENTALLY EXPAND THIS GOOD PROGRAM.
2 THANK YOU.

3

4 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO WRITTEN COMMENTS
5 RECEIVED FOR THIS ITEM, AND NO MEMBERS IN THE BOARDROOM WITH
6 PUBLIC COMMENT AND IN THE ATTENDEE SPACE, NO MEMBERS WITH
7 RAISED HANDS FOR PUBLIC COMMENT AT THIS TIME.

8

9 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU TO THE TASK FORCE I'LL START
10 TO MY RIGHT. KATE?

11

12 **KATE MILLER:** SHOULD I PROBABLY KNOW THE ANSWERS TO THESE
13 QUESTION BUT I DON'T. ON THE SCHOOLS YOU'RE WORKING WITH IS
14 THAT OPEN TO BOTH STUDENTS AND STAFF OR JUST STUDENTS?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** AT PHASE ONE EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS IT'S JUST
17 STUDENTS.

18

19 **KATE MILLER:** I KNOW A LOT OF PEOPLE -- IF YOU ASK STAFF, YOU
20 KNOW, IF THE SCHOOL WILLING TO WORK WITH US, SHOULDN'T WE TALK
21 TO THEM AT THE SAME LEVEL OF CONSIDERING THE SFO REQUEST? AND
22 MAYBE YOU HAVE --

23

24 **WILLIAM BACON:** WE'RE VERY OPEN TO WORKING WITH THE PHASE ONE
25 INSTITUTIONS IF THEY WANT TO PURCHASE IT FOR THEIR STAFF.



MARCH 25, 2024

1 CONVERSATIONS TO DATE ARE FOCUSED ON STUDENTS BECAUSE OF THE
2 FUNDING MECHANISM AND FOR THE MOST PART STUDENTS COULD SELF-
3 FUND PURCHASE OF CLIPPER BAY PASS WHEREAS THE EMPLOYER SIDE
4 TENDS TO BECOME BENEFITS NEGOTIATION OFTENTIMES REPRESENTED
5 STAFF.

6

7 **KATE MILLER:** OKAY THANK YOU.

8

9 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** MR. POWERS WERE YOU TRYING TO MAKE A
10 MOTION?

11

12 **ROBERT POWERS:** I WOULD LIKE TO MAKE A MOTION TO MOVE THE FULL
13 SUITE OF STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS THAT MR. EISEMAN AND MR. BACON
14 HAVE JUST WALKED THE COMMISSION THROUGH.

15

16 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** SECOND, TUMLIN.

17

18 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** MOVED BY POWERS. SECOND TUMLIN. BACK TO
19 TASK FORCE FOR QUESTIONS OR COMMENTS. GREG?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** YES. THANK YOU. NUMBER ONE, THIS HAS BEEN A
22 PHENOMENAL SUCCESS. SO, THAT'S, I THINK, IS GREAT NEWS. I'M
23 CURIOUS ABOUT -- AND IT DOESN'T HAVE TO BE SPECIFICS, JUST THE
24 TIMING OF HOW WE COMMUNICATE WITH THE PHASE ONE PARTICIPANTS
25 AND HOW WE'RE -- WHAT WE DO TO SORT OF, ENGAGE THEM TO SEE THE



MARCH 25, 2024

1 BENEFITS SO THEY ARE ANXIOUS TO GET INTO PHASE TWO? I SPEAK
2 MAINLY ABOUT SAN JOSE STATE. THE TIMING IN WHICH WE HAVE GOT
3 TO BE IN FRONT OF THEM, PROVIDE THEM THE BENEFITS SO THEY SEE
4 WHAT'S GOING ON, AND DO WHAT'S NECESSARY TO MAKE THEM AND
5 ALLOW THEM TO SEE THE BENEFITS.

6

7 **RYAN REEVES:** SURE. THIS IS RYAN REEVES. YEAH. WE'RE IN EARLY
8 DISCUSSIONS WITH THE PARTNERS ABOUT WHAT THAT WOULD LOOK LIKE
9 IF THIS ACTION MOVES FORWARD. THERE IS A PRETTY LONG TIME FOR
10 THE UNIVERSITIES TO HAVE STUDENTS TAKE REFERENDUM PROCESS
11 ABOUT A YEAR IN LENGTH SO IF THIS IS ENDORSED, THEN WE'LL
12 CONTINUE ALONG THAT PATH IN THOSE CONVERSATIONS WITH STUDENT
13 GOVERNMENT TO MAKE SURE THERE IS INFORMATION AVAILABLE.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** STAY OUT IN FRONT OF THAT. JANUARY GET'S HERE QUICK,
16 AND THAT'S THE TIME FRAME FOR SAN JOSE STATE I WOULD LIKE TO
17 SEE THEM FULLY ENGAGED IN THAT CONVERSATION. THE OTHER THING,
18 JUST CLARIFY FOR ME, PHASE ONE, PHASE TWO, SAN FRANCISCO STATE
19 UNIVERSITY AND THE OTHERS. SO, NOW SAN FRANCISCO STATE GOES
20 INTO PHASE TWO, IT'S FULLY FUNDED FROM THEIR PERSPECTIVE,
21 BECAUSE EVERYBODY IS PARTICIPATING. WHEREAS PHASE ONE, IS ONLY
22 STILL GOING TO BE ORIGINAL PARTICIPANTS IN PHASE ONE; CORRECT.

23

24 **WILLIAM BACON:** THAT'S RIGHT. SO, IF THESE PARTICIPATION
25 AGREEMENT CHANGES WERE ENACTED AND SAN FRANCISCO STATE MOVED



MARCH 25, 2024

1 FORWARD, THEN THE STUDENT POPULATION THEY WOULD HAVE THE BAY
2 PASS.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** AND THAT CHANGES THE DYNAMIC. AS FAR AS NUMBERS.
5 OKAY. I UNDERSTAND WHY THEY WOULD. AND THEN ONE LAST
6 CLARIFICATION, BECAUSE IT'S STILL A PILOT, THERE IS STILL
7 ANTICIPATION OF SOME BACKSTOP BEING NECESSARY EVEN ON PHASE
8 TWO EVEN THOUGH IT'S MORE A FULLY FUNDED APPROACH. CORRECT?

9

10 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** RIGHT. ACTUALLY, I JUMPED IN FRONT OF YOU,
11 BILL, WHEN THIS IS A FUNDING QUESTION.

12

13 **WILLIAM BACON:** SURE. THANK YOU. UNDER PHASE TWO, THE GOAL OF
14 THE PROGRAM IS FULLY SELF-FUNDED. SO, CONTRACTS THAT WE'RE
15 ENTERING INTO WITH EMPLOYERS ARE PAYING COST AND TO DATE WE
16 HAVE THREE CRACKS UCF, MENLO PARK AND ALAMEDA TRANSPORTATION
17 MANAGEMENT ASSOCIATION. AND WE CAN REPORT TO YOU, ALL, THAT
18 RIGHT NOW, THAT WE'RE MAKING MONEY OFF OF THOSE CONTRACTS. SO,
19 WE ARE NOT NEEDING BACKSTOP FUNDING AT THE MOMENT. BUT TASK
20 FORCE AND STAKEHOLDERS FELT IT WAS IMPORTANT BECAUSE PHASE TWO
21 IS A PILOT AND THERE IS A LOT OF UNCERTAINTY ABOUT USAGE AND
22 DIFFERING TRAVEL PATTERNS BECAUSE OF THE PANDEMIC, THAT THERE
23 BE BACKSTOP FUNDING AVAILABLE TO REIMBURSE OPERATORS SHOULD
24 THE PRICE THAT WE SELL IN EACH CONTRACT BE INSUFFICIENT.

25



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** OKAY.

2

3 **WILLIAM BACON:** SO, WE'RE -- AGAIN, WE'RE LEARNING. AS MIKE
4 SAID, WE'RE LEARNING AS WE'RE GOING, BUT TRYING TO BE CAUTIOUS
5 IN TERMS OF PRICING, WHICH HAS DOWN SIDES, TOO, AT TIMES BUT
6 SO FAR WE'RE SUCCESSFUL.

7

8 **SPEAKER:** UNDERSTOOD. THANK YOU.

9

10 **SPEAKER:** I'M INTERESTED TO UNDERSTAND HOW THIS WILL WORK FOR
11 SANTA ROSA JUNIOR COLLEGE DURING THE TRANSITION PERIOD. SINCE
12 A TWO YEAR SCHOOL I ASSUME MOST OF THE ORIGINAL STUDENTS WILL
13 HAVE GRADUATED. WILL THERE BE AN OPEN ENROLLMENT PERIOD FOR
14 THEM? OR HOW WILL THAT WORK OUT?

15

16 **WILLIAM BACON:** GREAT QUESTION. I DON'T THINK WE'RE
17 ANTICIPATING ENROLLING ANY NEW STUDENTS AT THE PHASE ONE
18 INSTITUTIONS SO AGAIN IT'S, SORT OF, CLOSING -- THE DOOR
19 CLOSED AND THERE IS A DIMINISHING NUMBER OF STUDENTS AT EACH
20 INSTITUTION. RYAN COULD SPEAK TO THIS TOO. WE HAVE HAD
21 DISCUSSIONS WITH SANTA ROSA JUNIOR COLLEGE ABOUT HOW THEY
22 COULD BUY INTO THE PROGRAM SHOULD THE PARTICIPATION AGREEMENTS
23 MOVE FORWARD. WE'RE VERY INTERESTED IN GETTING ALL OF THE
24 PHASE ONE INSTITUTIONS ON BOARD. SO I THINK WE'LL CONTINUE TO
25 HAVE DISCUSSIONS WITH THEM. WE HAVE ALSO HAD DISCUSSIONS WITH



MARCH 25, 2024

1 YOUR STAFF AT SMART AS WELL ABOUT INSTITUTIONS IN MARIN AND
2 SONOMA COUNTY.

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANKS.

5

6 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THANK YOU. I'M VERY STRONGLY SUPPORTIVE OF
7 THIS RECOMMENDATION TO MAKE SURE WE HAVE A PROPER TRANSITION,
8 FOR PHASE ONE AND WE HAVE FLEXIBILITY FOR PHASE TWO. I HAVE
9 TWO QUESTIONS TO MAKE SURE WE'RE NOT LIMITING OURSELVES
10 BECAUSE THIS IS WIDELY POPULAR. I DON'T WANT US DO AN
11 AMENDMENT AND THEN IMMEDIATELY FIND WE UNDERSOLD THE VALUE.
12 SO, I GUESS TWO QUESTIONS. FOR THE RECOMMENDATION ON PHASE ONE
13 AND WHAT YOU JUST NOTED ABOUT SAN FRANCISCO STATE, WHEN THEY
14 TRANSITION, THAT'S NOT GOING TO COUNT AGAINST THE CAP FOR
15 PHASE TWO, CORRECT? BASED ON THIS AMENDMENT? OR IS IT COUNTY
16 AGAINST COUNTING PHASE TWO. MEANING 13,000 PEOPLE DON'T COUNT
17 AGAINST THE 20,000.

18

19 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** CORRECT THE PROPOSAL IS SEPARATE FROM THE
20 EXISTING 20,000 CAP.

21

22 **ALIX BOCKELMAN:** THAT GIVES ME CONFIDENCE. IN TERMS OF THE TEN
23 SPECIAL EVENTS HOW DID YOU COME UP WITH THAT AND DO WE THINK
24 THAT'S GOING TO BE ENOUGH GIVEN THAT I HAVE ALREADY GOTTEN A
25 FEW CHECKS ABOUT PEOPLE ARE INTERESTED. SO, I JUST WANT TO



MARCH 25, 2024

1 MAKE SURE. SHOULD WE HAVE IT BE 15? MAYBE 20? THOSE ARE MY FEW
2 QUESTIONS. THANK YOU.

3

4 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** I THINK WE WERE LOOKING FOR A NUMBER THAT WAS
5 BIGGER THAN ONE. AND SMALL ENOUGH THAT GAVE THIS GROUP
6 CONFIDENCE THAT WE WERE GONNA COME BACK AND CHECK IN AT AN
7 APPROPRIATE TIME BUT WE'RE CERTAINLY OPEN TO MORE RUNWAY.

8

9 **JEFFREY TUMLIN:** I WOULD LIKE TO FOLLOW UP ON THE LAST
10 QUESTION. THERE ARE 200 EVENTS EVERY YEAR AT THE CHASE ARENA.
11 EVERY ONE OF THOSE EVENTS COMES WITH A FREE ALL DAY MUNI PASS
12 THAT'S YOUR EVENT TICKET THERE ARE BETWEEN 20 AND 30 EVENTS
13 NOW AT THE SAN FRANCISCO MOSCONE CENTER. THOSE EVENTS ALL WANT
14 ONE BAY PASS I'M WONDERING WHY IS THERE ANY LIMIT AT ALL FOR
15 SPECIAL EVENTS THAT ARE SHORT-TERM AND THEREFORE LOW RISK AND
16 A LOT OF EAGERNESS. SIMILARLY, I CAN UNDERSTAND, GIVEN THE
17 COMPLEXITY OF SETTING UP EMPLOYER PROGRAMS THAT HAVE TO LAST,
18 AT LEAST, A FULL YEAR, I CAN UNDERSTAND WHY WE WANT SOME LIMIT
19 THERE IS BUT I'M ALSO CONCERNED FOR A PROGRAM THAT'S PAYING
20 FOR ITSELF, SHOULDN'T WE ADD MORE CAPACITY TO BE ABLE TO
21 IMPLEMENT IT? AND, SO, QUESTION ONE IS, WHAT'S STANDING IN THE
22 WAY OF EXPANDING THIS MORE RAPIDLY? AND RELATED TO THAT, WOULD
23 STAFF BE INTERESTED IN AN AMENDMENT TO THE MOTION THAT MIGHT
24 EXPAND THOSE GAPS?

25



MARCH 25, 2024

1 **MICHAEL EISEMAN:** CERTAINLY. IF THE TASK FORCE WERE TO MAKE
2 THAT AMENDMENT, STAFF WOULD NOT OBJECT. THE RATIONALE ON THE
3 ORIGINAL CAP WAS JUST TO LIMIT THE SCALE OF THE PILOT IN A WAY
4 THAT WE WERE ABLE TO LINE UP THE BACKSTOP FUNDING AND THE RISK
5 ANALYSIS WITH NUMBERS WITH THE CAP, IN ORDER TO DEMONSTRATE
6 THAT WE WERE NOT GOING TO OVERSHOOT OUR FUNDING TOO MUCH, AND
7 VERY LIKELY. HAVING SAID THAT, AS BILL MENTIONED, WE'RE
8 TRACKING PRETTY WELL SO FAR. AND, YOU KNOW, FLEXIBILITY IS
9 HELPFUL. SO, LEAVE IT TO THE TASK FORCE.

10

11 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** I BELIEVE VICE CHAIR MULLIGAN HAS A
12 QUESTION OR COMMENT?

13

14 **DENIS MULLIGAN:** I COMMENT. MOSCONY CENTER IS NOT A PROBLEM FOR
15 FERRY OPERATOR BECAUSE THERE IS REGULARLY SCHEDULED SERVICE TO
16 THE FERRY BUILDING BUT CHASE CENTER ORACLE PARK COULD BE
17 PROBLEMATIC, AND 750 TICKETS SO PEOPLE HAVE PASSES, 1,000
18 PEOPLE WALK UP SO COULD BE A PROBLEM. SO LOGISTICS STUFF ON
19 THE FERRYBOAT SIDE WE NEED TO KNOW OFFLINE KIND OF TALK
20 THROUGH THAT WE DON'T HAVE EXPECTATION PROBLEM.

21

22 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** SAM?

23

24 **SPEAKER:** I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. MIKE
25 YOU MENTIONED MANAGING RISK SFO MANAGING RISK WITH REGARDS TO



MARCH 25, 2024

1 INCLUSION OF SFO WITHIN THE SAN MATEO SANTA CLARA COUNTY THREE
2 MILE ZONE RUNS ALONG CALTRAIN CORRIDOR I THINK MOST PEOPLE ARE
3 AWARE JUST PUT IT OUT THERE CALTRANS FAREBOX REVENUE FROM
4 PANDEMIC WAS ABOUT 71% AND GO PAST REVENUE HAS BEEN ON AVERAGE
5 ABOUT 1/3 OF OUR FARE REVENUE AS HIGH AS ONE HALF, \$15 MILLION
6 IS WHAT WE HAVE THIS YEAR AND PROJECT INTO THE FUTURE JUST
7 MAKING SURE, WITH THE ADDITION OF SFO UNDERSTANDING THAT BART
8 DOES HAVE PAST INSTITUTIONAL RELATIONSHIP WITH SFO WE HAVE
9 SOME CONCERNS WE APPRECIATE YOUR COMMENT MIKE PM TEAM DOESN'T
10 ANTICIPATE FURTHER AMENDMENTS TO THE PA AND WE WANT TO MAKE
11 SURE THAT IT'S CLEAR THAT CALTRAIN HOPES OVER THE NEXT TWO
12 YEARS THAT WE DON'T SEE FURTHER CHIPPING AWAY OR WHATEVER THE
13 CHECK THE TERM MIGHT BE OF THE ORIGINALLY AGREED UPON ZONE AND
14 A LOT OF THAT IS REALLY JUST THE INTEREST OF STABILIZING THE
15 PILOT, AND MAKING SURE WE FIND SOME STABILITY THERE. CALTRAIN
16 IS SUPPORTIVE OF INCLUSION OF SFO WE HOPE THE BART TEAM WILL
17 CONTINUE TO BE PROACTIVE IN TERMS OF OUR WORK ON BOTH SCHEDULE
18 AND STATION IMPROVEMENTS, AT MILLBRAE, WHICH IS OUR ONE
19 CONNECTION POINT AND IS REALLY OUR ONE CONNECTION POINT TO THE
20 AIRPORT AS WELL FROM THE CALTRAIN SIDE THAT REALLY MATTERS A
21 LOT TO BOTH CALTRAIN STAFF AND OUR CUSTOMERS. WE ALSO JUST
22 WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE FINANCIAL MODEL, AND THE PRICING
23 MODEL, AS WE MOVE FORWARD REMAINS TRANSPARENT AND THE PM TEAM
24 IS REALLY -- GETS OUT THERE EARLY SO WE CAN BETTER UNDERSTAND
25 HOW THAT MODEL IS WORKING AND HOW IT'S GOING TO HOLD. BUT THAT



MARCH 25, 2024

1 BEING SAID JUST WANT TO SAY CONGRATULATIONS TO THE TEAM
2 BECAUSE THE PHASE ONE RESULT SHOWS THAT PEOPLE ARE USING THAT
3 AND THAT MEANS THAT HUMAN BEINGS ARE USING MORE TRANSIT. AND,
4 LIKELY, CONSIDERING THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT STUDENTS AND
5 PEOPLE WHO LIVE IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING, THIS PROGRAM IS LIKELY
6 CHANGING LIVES. AT THE SAME TIME, JUST LAST BIT FROM CALTRAIN
7 IS JUST THE FINANCIAL RISK THAT CALTRAIN FINDS ITSELF IN ALSO
8 COULD REALLY IMPACT OUR ABILITY TO PROVIDE SERVICES TO HUMAN
9 BEINGS, AS WELL. SO WE'RE SUPPORTIVE OF THE AMENDMENTS TODAY,
10 AND JUST WANTED TO REITERATE THOSE FACTS AND THANKS AGAIN TO
11 THE PM TEAM. OTHER MEMBERS OF YOUR STAFF HERE ON THE DAIS WHO
12 HAVE ALSO BEEN A PART OF THESE CONVERSATIONS OVER THE PAST
13 YEAR AND A HALF. SO, THANK YOU

14

15 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU, SAM. OTHER QUESTIONS OR
16 COMMENTS FROM THE TASK FORCE? APRIL?

17

18 **APRIL CHAN:** YES. THANK YOU. I'M VERY SUPPORTIVE OF THE STAFF
19 RECOMMENDATION BUT JUST HEARING A COUPLE OF MY COLLEAGUE'S
20 COMMENTS, AND I'M ALSO SUPPORTIVE OF MAYBE EXPANDING SOME OF
21 THE PILOTS THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, FOR EXAMPLE, THE SPECIAL
22 EVENTS BUT HEARING WHAT DENIS ALSO SAID, I GUESS MAYBE IS
23 THERE SOMETHING THAT WHEN WE'RE CONSIDERING -- I KNOW THERE IS
24 SOME KIND OF CRITERIA YOU'RE GOING TO BE PUTTING TOGETHER AS
25 WE'RE CONSIDERING WHAT SPECIAL EVENTS, IN TERMS OF SIZE,



MARCH 25, 2024

1 GEOGRAPHIC LOCATION, AND MAYBE CONSULTATION WITH SOME OF THE
2 SYSTEMS MIGHT BE OVERWHELMED, OR DO THEY HAVE THE CAPACITY TO
3 CARRY THE NUMBER OF PASSENGERS, INCLUDING THAT AS YOU'RE
4 WORKING INTO THE PA, I THINK THAT WOULD BE VERY APPROPRIATE. I
5 WANT TO COMMEND THE TEAM IN TERMS OF SELECTING, I THINK,
6 CURRENTLY, THE THREE POSSIBLY NOW FOUR WITH SFO IN TERMS OF
7 THE TYPES, THE HEALTH CARE, WITH UCSF THAT'S HUGE, AND IN
8 TERMS OF CONNECTING A LOT OF THE -- YOU KNOW, FROM VARIOUS
9 PARTS OF THE BAY AREA, COMING INTO THE CITY TO WORK, SO, I
10 THINK JUST KIND OF CONTINUING THAT, SORT OF, THE DIRECTION,
11 MAKING SURE THAT WE'RE REALLY LOOKING AT THE TYPES OF
12 INSTITUTIONS THAT, YOU KNOW, WE'RE GOING TO BE PARTNERING WITH
13 AND SEEING THE TYPES OF ORGANIZATION THAT WE'RE SUPPORTING AND
14 MAKING SURE THAT WE INCREASE THE RIDERSHIP. SO, I JUST WANT
15 TO, YOU KNOW, KUDOS TO THE TEAM.

16

17 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** ANYBODY ELSE? I HAVE A COUPLE. WELL, A
18 COMMENT, AGAIN ON THE SPECIAL SERVICES, AS SOMEBODY THAT
19 STARTED UP, THE GIANTS, WHICH AT THE TIME BACK THEN WAS
20 LEVI'S, AND CONTEMPLATED THE A STADIUM. I AM NERVOUS ABOUT
21 SPECIAL EVENTS SERVICE WITH THE CAVEAT THAT PHASE TWO IS SELF-
22 FUNDED PAYS FOR ITSELF I WOULDN'T OPPOSE, BUT REALLY
23 APPRECIATE VICE CHAIR MULLIGAN'S COMMENTS, A LOT OF THE
24 SPECIAL SERVICE IN MY CAREER IS DONE OVERTIME IS EXPENSIVE AND
25 SOMETIMES DIFFICULT TO FILL WITHOUT JEOPARDIZING REGULAR



MARCH 25, 2024

1 SERVICE. SO, I WOULD WARN US TO MOVE FORWARD CAREFULLY IF WE
2 WANT TO DO THAT. THERE IS A MOTION AND SECOND. IF THERE IS
3 GOING TO BE A FRIENDLY AMENDMENT NOW WOULD BE THE TIME DO IT.
4 NOT HEARING ONE. WE'LL REMIND US THIS IS AN ACTION ITEM. WE'RE
5 ENDORSING ALL OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS ON THE FINAL SLIDE OF THE
6 PRESENTATION. ALL THOSE IN FAVOR? (AYES))

7

8 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** OPPOSE? ABSTENTION? GOOD JOB. THANK YOU
9 VERY MUCH. THAT GETS US TO AGENDA ITEM FIVE, I BELIEVE. PUBLIC
10 COMMENT FOR ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA.

11

12 **CLERK, WALLY CHARLES:** THERE ARE NO PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED IN
13 WRITING. THERE IS NO ONE WITH THEIR HAND RAISED, AND NO ONE IN
14 THE ROOM WITH A CARD. THANK YOU.

15

16 **CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH:** THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. THAT BRINGS US
17 TO ADJOURNMENT. AGENDA ITEM SEVEN. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE
18 FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE WILL BE HELD AT A TIME AND
19 LOCATION TO BE ANNOUNCED. WE'RE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

20



NTT

Broadcasting Government