

**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**
Meeting Transcript



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE**

2 **WEDNESDAY, MARCH 13TH, 2024, 9:45 AM**

3

4

5 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M GOING TO CALL OUR MEETING TO ORDER.
6 THIS IS THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE. AND I'LL BE
7 ASKING STAFF FOR A GAVEL FOR MY NEXT MEETING AS THE CHAIR. I
8 WOULD LIKE TO CALL OUR MEETING TO ORDER. THIS MEETING IS
9 WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE AND COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF
10 THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE
11 THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON
12 THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TO HAVE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED
13 UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. ROLL CALL
14 VOTE WILL BE TAKEN DUE TO REMOTE COMMISSIONER PARTICIPATION
15 TODAY. I'M GOING TO BEGIN OUR MEETING BY ASKING THE CLERK FOR
16 ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM THAT WE DO INDEED HAVE A QUORUM.

17

18 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CHAVEZ.

19

20 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** HERE MILEY?

21

22 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** HERE.

23

24 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ABE-KOGA?

25



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** HERE.

2

3 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY?

4

5 **DINA EL-TAWANSY:** HERE.

6

7 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FLEMING IS ABSENT TODAY. GLOVER?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** HERE.

10

11 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** PRESENT.

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NON-VOTING COMMISSIONER SCHAFF? SCHAFF

16 IS PRESENT. AND COMMISSIONER THAO? THAO IS PRESENT. WE HAVE

17 QUORUM

18

19 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE REQUEST FOR REMOTE

20 MEMBER PARTICIPATION UNDER AB 2449 THIS IS JUST CAUSE FROM

21 COMMISSIONER RONEN. AND WE'RE SO PLEASED THAT YOU ARE HANGING

22 IN THERE WITH US. THANK YOU.

23

24 **HILLARY RONEN:** VERY MUCH APPRECIATIVE THAT I CAN PARTICIPATE

25 AND I'M REQUESTING TO PARTICIPATE REMOTELY UNDER AB 2449



MARCH 13, 2024

1 BECAUSE I'M RECOVERING FROM A KNEE RECONSTRUCTION SURGERY.

2 THERE IS NO ONE PRESENT IN THE ROOM OVER 18.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. YOUR REQUEST IS NOTED AND
5 WE'RE ADDING COMMISSIONER RONEN AS PRESENT FOR THIS MEETING.
6 THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO ITEM TWO, OUR CONSENT CALENDAR.
7 ITEMS 2A THROUGH 2F. ARE THERE ANY COMMISSIONERS THAT WOULD
8 LIKE TO PULL AN ITEM FROM CONSENT? SEEING NONE. I'M GOING TO
9 ASK FOR A MOTION. THANK YOU, MAYOR?

10

11 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER SECOND.

12

13 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. MOTION AND SECOND. I'M GOING
14 TO SEE IF ARE THERE ANY COMMENTS FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

15

16 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** I DO SEE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE
17 WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT.

18

19 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE, IF YOU COULD
20 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

21

22 **SPEAKER:** THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR CINDY CHAVEZ. ALETA DUPREE FOR
23 THE RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM POLLS. I WISH I COULD BE IN-
24 PERSON WITH YOU TODAY. I'M GOING TO TALK ABOUT THE TOPS ITEM
25 NOT SURE HOW TO PRONOUNCE IT, E TOPS ON AIRPLANES. ABOUT THESE



MARCH 13, 2024

1 ALLOCATIONS I FEEL THAT THE CLIPPER IS VERY IMPORTANT. AND
2 IT'S VERY GOOD THAT WE ARE USING SOME OF THESE FUNDS FOR NEXT
3 GENERATION CLIPPER. AND CLIPPER IS NOT JUST THAT IT'S AN
4 EASIER SYSTEM, BUT ONE THING THAT'S OFTEN OVERLOOKED, THIS IS
5 A TOPIC OF LOW CARBON EMISSION, IS THAT BY USING CLIPPER, WE
6 CAN REDUCE THE AMOUNT OF EMISSIONS THAT ARE CAUSED BY VEHICLES
7 THAT HAVE TO TRANSPORT PHYSICAL MONEY FROM THE VEHICLES FROM
8 THE VENDING MACHINE, YOU KNOW, TAKE THEM TO THE VAULT, AND
9 THEN TRANSPORT THAT MONEY TO THE BANK. SO, THIS IS DEFINITELY
10 WELL PLACED. WE WANT TO GET THAT WORD OUT THE FIRST PART OF
11 SUSTAINABLE. AND SMALL OPERATORS ARE VERY IMPORTANT. I DON'T
12 USE THEM OFTEN, BUT I WANT THEM TO BE THERE FOR ME. SO I CAN
13 USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION. AND THIS CLOUD-BASED TRANSIT SIGNAL
14 PRIORITY IS VERY IMPORTANT. I AM IN SAN FRANCISCO QUITE A BIT
15 USING THE FIVE SOMETIMES SO THAT CAN BE VERY HELPFUL TO ME.
16 SO, OVERALL, I THINK WE HAVE A GOOD PROGRAM WITH THE LC TOPS.
17 WHENEVER I HEAR LC TOPS, I THINK OF E TOPS ON AIRPLANES. VERY,
18 VERY IMPORTANT. SO, THANK YOU.

19

20 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THERE IS NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT
21 ONLINE.

22

23 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE THE
24 PUBLIC COMMENT AND I'M GOING GO TO MY COLLEAGUES AND ASK,



MARCH 13, 2024

1 SEEING NO OTHER DISCUSSION ON THIS ITEM, I'M GOING TO ASK FOR
2 A ROLL CALL VOTE.

3

4 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ALL RIGHT, WITH A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER
5 THAO AND A SECOND BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER. CHAIR CHAVEZ?

6

7 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

8

9 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CHAVEZ AYE. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

10

11 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** MILEY AYE. COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA?

14

15 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

16

17 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ABE-KOGA AYE. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

18

19 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN.

22

23 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** RONEN?



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

3

4 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THAO?

5

6 **SHENG THAO:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THAO AYE. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
9 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

10

11 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE GOING TO ITEM
12 THREE MTC RESOLUTION NUMBER 4633 ADOPTION OF THE 2025 REGIONAL
13 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM CYCLE SEVEN GUIDELINES AND KARL
14 THAT MICROPHONE ISN'T WORKING FOR YOU IS IT?

15

16 **SPEAKER:** I'LL DO ALL RIGHT.

17

18 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** GO AHEAD.

19

20 **SPEAKER:** I'LL I'M KARL ANDERSON WITH MTC STAFF ITEM 3A
21 PROPOSES ADOPTION OF 2025 REGIONAL ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION
22 PROGRAM CYCLE SEVEN GUIDELINES. THE STATE ESTABLISHED THE
23 ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM IN 2013 TO PROMOTE ACTIVE FORMS
24 OF TRANSPORTATION LIKE BIKING AND WALKING ATP FUNDING IS
25 DIVIDED INTO STATEWIDE REGIONAL URBAN AND RURAL PROGRAMS FOR



MARCH 13, 2024

1 LARGE METROPOLITAN ORGANIZATIONS MIRRORS GETS DEDICATED
2 PORTION OF ATP FUNDING FOR THE REGION, WHICH STAFF EXPECTS TO
3 BE \$49 MILLION OVER THE NEXT FOUR FISCAL YEARS. MTC
4 RESPONSIBLE FOR DEVELOPING GUIDELINES FOR THE REGIONAL
5 COMPONENT. GENERALLY, MTC'S GUIDELINES FOLLOW CTC'S DRAFT
6 STATEWIDE ATP GUIDELINES. ATTACHMENT ONE TO THE MEMO
7 HIGHLIGHTS CHANGES TO STATEWIDE GUIDELINES. OF NOTE CTC IS
8 EXPANDING THE NUMBER OF METRICS APPLICANTS CAN USE TO QUALIFY
9 IN DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITY. PROJECT APPLICANTS CAN NOW USE TWO
10 NEW METRICS IMPLEMENTED UNDER THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENTS JUSTICE
11 40 INITIATIVES ALSO WHILE STATE GUIDELINES DO NOT DRINK
12 PROJECTS TO HOUSING PRODUCTION APPLICANTS MUST CONTINUE TO
13 HIGHLIGHT CONNECTION TO EXISTING AND PLANNED AFFORDABLE
14 HOUSING DEVELOPMENT FOR LARGE TRANSFORMATIVE PROJECTS AND SITE
15 ANY STRATEGIES THEY MIGHT BE USING TO REDUCE POTENTIAL
16 DISPLACEMENT FROM ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAM INVESTMENTS
17 ATTACH TWO HIGHLIGHTS PROPOSED REGIONAL GUIDELINE CHANGES IN
18 DIFFERENCES IN MTC'S GUIDELINES COMPARED TO STATEWIDE
19 GUIDELINES MTC STAFF RECOMMENDS MAINTAINING REGIONAL
20 DEVIATIONS FROM THE STATEWIDE GUIDELINES SIMILAR TO PREVIOUS
21 CYCLES EXISTING DIFFERENCES, INCLUDE ADDITIONAL SCREENING
22 CRITERIA CONSISTENT WITH THE CURRENT ONE BAY AREA GRANT
23 PROGRAM TRANSIT AGENCY COORDINATION AS NECESSARY GUIDELINES
24 ALSO CONTINUE TO ALIGN WITH REVISED APPROVED ONE BAY AREA
25 GRANT PROGRAM FRAMEWORK WHERE FEASIBLE MTC'S REGIONAL PROGRAM



MARCH 13, 2024

1 CONTINUES TO INCLUDE ADDITIONAL EVALUATION CRITERIA SUCH AS
2 POINTS FOR PROJECTS IDENTIFIED IN COMMUNITY-BASED
3 TRANSPORTATION BALANCE FOR PROJECTS JURISDICTIONS WITH ADOPTED
4 VISION ZERO POLICY DEDICATED BIKE AND PEDESTRIAN SAFETY PLAN
5 INCLUDING ENCOURAGES SPONSORS TO APPLY FOR PROJECTS IN ADVANCE
6 AT COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT EQUITY AND SAFETY GOALS OF PLANNED BAY
7 AREA 2050 IN ADDITION TO THE PREVIOUSLY MENTIONED ITEMS STAFF
8 RECOMMENDS CONTINUING EXISTING REGIONAL POLICIES INCLUDING
9 REQUIRING REGIONAL SUPPLEMENTAL APPLICATION, ADDING TEN POINTS
10 FOR REGIONAL PRIORITIES AND ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTATION
11 COMPLETION USING MTC'S EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES DEFINITION
12 FOR DISADVANTAGED COMMUNITIES AND REQUIRING APPLICANTS THAT
13 REQUEST MORE THAN \$10 MILLION TO PROVIDE SOME DEGREE OF
14 SCALEABILITY PROGRAM FOR THEIR PROJECT. ONCE THE MTC
15 COMMISSIONER ADOPTS REGIONAL GUIDELINES STAFF WILL SUBMIT THEM
16 TO CTC FOR APPROVAL STATEWIDE CALL FOR PROJECTS WILL BEGIN
17 MARCH 21st AND APPLICATIONS WILL BE DUE ON JUNE 17TH. I WANT
18 TO NOTE STAFF RECOMMENDS NO LONGER CONDUCT SEPARATE STATE
19 APPLICATION EVALUATION PROCESS FOR REGIONAL PROGRAM AWARDS
20 LESSONS LEARN VALUABLE FEEDBACK FROM PARTNERS OVER CYCLES
21 GREATER CONFIDENCE STATES SCORING PROCESS RECOMMENDS USING
22 SCORES PROVIDED BY STATE'S EVALUATION PROCESS APPLICATION TO
23 SERVICE THE BASELINE FOR PROJECTS AWARDS WITHIN OUR REGIONAL
24 PROGRAM STAFF WILL CONTINUE THE SUPPLEMENTAL QUESTIONS IN THE
25 REGIONAL SUPPLEMENTAL APPLICATION FORM ONCE EVALUATION PROCESS



MARCH 13, 2024

1 WE WILL RETURN TO THE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
2 WITH PROGRAMMING RECOMMENDATIONS IN EARLY 2025 TO BE AN
3 AMENDMENT OF THIS RESOLUTION. NEXT HIGHLIGHTING A FEW ITEMS OF
4 INTEREST THAT ARE SEPARATE FROM THE GUIDELINES FIRST JANUARY
5 2023 APPROVED UP TO \$300 MILLION IN FUNDING IT CONTINUE ACTIVE
6 TRANSPORTATION TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE DESIGN ASSISTANCE GRANT
7 WRITING GRANT APPLICATION SUPPORT PROJECT EVALUATION
8 DOCUMENTATION COMMUNICATION AND PROCUREMENT FOR QUICK BUILD
9 MATERIALS FOR APPLICANTS IN ATP CYCLE 7 AND 8 RELEASE CALL FOR
10 INTEREST LAST AUGUST MTC RECEIVED 60 APPLICATIONS FROM 32
11 JURISDICTIONS MTC ABAG STAFF EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS TO
12 PROVIDE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR THE ATP PROJECT IN 18
13 PROJECTS IN ALL COUNTIES SELECT CONSULTANT WORKING CLOSELY
14 WITH STANCE RECIPIENTS TO IMPLEMENT LESSONS LEARNED AND
15 APPLICATIONS AHEAD OF APPLICATION DEADLINE SECOND GOVERNOR'S
16 JANUARY STATE BUDGET PROPOSAL FISCAL YEAR 2025 CURRENTLY
17 INCLUDES \$200 MILLION REDUCTION TO ATP IF PROVIDING FY25
18 BUDGET WITH THIS REDUCTION CTC WILL LIKELY DECREASE
19 PROGRAMMING CAPACITY FOR CYCLE SEVEN AND POTENTIALLY CYCLE
20 EIGHT FOR DISCUSSIONS WITH CTC STAFF AND OTHER PROGRAM
21 PARTNERS AROUND THE STATE WILL OCCUR AFTER THE LEGISLATURE
22 APPROVED THE BUDGET THIS JUNE FINALLY NOTE REGIONAL MEASURE
23 THREE INCLUDES \$150 MILLION FOR SAFE ROUTES TO TRANSIT BAY
24 TRAIL PROJECTS AND FUNDS COULD COMPLEMENT ATP PROJECT TO THE
25 REGION ADVANCING ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION GOALS FURTHER



MARCH 13, 2024

1 PROCEEDING PUBLIC OUTREACH TO RM3 STATE TRANSIT PROGRAM
2 ALIGNING WITH STATE CALL FOR PROJECTS MTC STAFF RECOMMENDS
3 ADOPTING GUIDELINES THIS MONTH STAFF RECOMMENDS REFERRING MTC
4 RESOLUTION 4633 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL SMITH MTC'S
5 REGIONAL GUIDELINES TO CTC AND AUTHORIZING CALL FOR PROJECTS
6 UPON CTC'S APPROVAL OF THE STATEWIDE GUIDELINES NEXT WEEK.
7 THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.

8

9 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'LL FIRST SEE IF THERE IS A
10 MOTION FROM ANY OF MY COLLEAGUES UP HERE.

11

12 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** MAY I HAVE A SECOND? SECOND MARGARET HAS
15 SECONDED. I'M GOING TO SEE IF THERE ARE ANY PUBLIC COMMENTS ON
16 THIS ITEM.

17

18 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** I SEE NO MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE OR
19 IN THE BOARDROOM AND I HAVE NOT RECEIVED ANY WRITTEN
20 CORRESPONDENCE FOR THIS ITEM.

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO CLOSE THE PUBLIC
23 COMMENT PERIOD AND I'M GOING SEE IF ARE THERE ANY QUESTIONS
24 FROM MY COLLEAGUES. SEEING NONE. I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A ROLL
25 CALL VOTE.



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** WITH A FIRST BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND
3 A SECOND BY COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. CHAIR CHAVEZ?

4

5 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

6

7 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CHAVEZ AYE VICE CHAIR MILEY?

8

9 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ABE-KOGA?

12

13 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

16

17 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE .

18

19 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** PAPAN?

20

21 **GINA PAPAN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** RONEN?

24

25 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THAO?

3

4 **SHENG THAO:** AYE.

5

6 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
7 PRESENT.

8

9 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I WANT TO THANK THE STAFF FOR
10 BEING RESPONSIVE TO FEEDBACK FROM THE COMMITTEE. THANK YOU.
11 ALL RIGHT. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO 3B MTC RESOLUTIONS NUMBERS
12 MANY, MANY, 4586 REVISED, 4592 REVISED, 4614 REVISED AND 4615
13 REVISED, AND 4635 INCLUDES ALLOCATION OF 49.9 MILLION REGIONAL
14 MEASURE THREE CAPITAL FUNDS CONTRA COSTA COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
15 AUTHORITY BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCE AUTHORITY, WATER
16 EMERGENCY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY SAN FRANCISCO IMPROVE
17 TRANSPORTATION AGENCY AND SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION
18 AUTHORITY. CRAIG, THERE YOU GO.

19

20 **CRAIG BOSMAN:** THANK YOU CRAIG BOSMAN MTC STAFF THIS ITEM
21 PROPERTIES THE RECOMMENDED RM3 CAPITAL ALLOCATIONS FOR THIS
22 MONTH I'LL RUN THROUGH BRIEF LEE INTERSTATE 680 STATE ROUTE
23 INTERCHANGE FOR IMPROVEMENTS FOR CHANGE TRAIL CONNECTION
24 FEASIBILITY STUDY PROJECT 19 CONTRA COSTA TRANSPORTATION
25 AUTHORITY REQUEST \$500,000 TO FUND FEASIBILITY STUDY TO DEFINE



MARCH 13, 2024

1 ALTERNATIVES TO CONNECT IRON HORSE TRAIL AND CONTRA COSTA
2 TRAIL TO PROVIDE ACCESS TO THE PARKING LOT AND PROVIDE PARK
3 AND RIDE ON THE WEST SIDE OF THE 680 INTERCHANGE BY PROVIDING
4 CONNECTIVITY OF TRAILS COMMUTERS WILL BE OFFERED ANOTHER MODE
5 OF TRANSPORTATION REDUCING CONGESTION ON THE INTERCHANGE THIS
6 STUDY IS EXPECTED TO COMPLETE BY MID-2025. NEXT IS I80 EXPRESS
7 LANES IN SOLANO COUNTY TOLL SYSTEM RM3 PROVIDES NOW \$316.7
8 MILLION IN TOTAL FUNDS FOR THE BAY AREA CORRIDOR EXPRESS LANES
9 PROJECT. AS PART OF THE SOLANO I80 EXPRESS LANES PROJECT BAY
10 AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY, BAHFA, IS THE SPONSOR
11 FOR CONCURRENT WORK ON THE TOLL SYSTEM ON THE PROJECT. MTC
12 APPROVED \$31.2 MILLION LETTER OF NO PREJUDICE FOR TOLL SYSTEM
13 CONTRACTS IN 2021, AND PREVIOUSLY ALLOCATED \$14.6 MILLION IN
14 JUNE 2023. THIS MONTH STAFF RECOMMENDS ALLOCATING THE
15 REMAINING \$16.7 MILLION. THE REMAINING AMOUNT WAS ORIGINALLY
16 ASSOCIATED WITH THE SOLANO I80, I680, SR12 INTERCHANGE PROJECT
17 FUNDING PLAN AND WAS TRANSFERRED TO EXPRESS LANES PROJECT IN
18 JANUARY 2024 VIA AN RM3 PROGRAM AMENDMENT. THIRD IS THE WATER
19 EMERGENCY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY, OR RETA, SHORELINE
20 ELECTRICAL PROGRAM. THIS IS UNDER RM3 PROJECT FIVE, THE FERRY
21 ENHANCEMENT PROGRAM. RETA HAS REQUESTED \$840,000 FOR
22 PRELIMINARY ENGINEERING SUPPORT ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW AND
23 PROJECT APPROVALS FOR THE ELECTRIFICATION OF CENTRAL BAY
24 PORTION OF THE SERVICE AREA. THIS INCLUDES ALAMEDA MAIN
25 STREET, SEA PLANE LAGOON, DOWNTOWN SAN FRANCISCO TREASURE



MARCH 13, 2024

1 ISLAND, AND MISSION BAY. PROJECT WILL PROVIDE CHARGING
2 CAPABILITIES FOR ELECTRIC FERRY VESSEL AT BOTH PASSENGER
3 TERMINALS AND MAINTENANCE FACILITIES, ALLOWING CHARGING. AS
4 THE FIRST RM3 FUNDING FOR THE PLAN, TREASURE ISLAND TERMINAL,
5 THE REQUEST MTC RECEIVED A LETTER FROM CITY AND COUNTY SAN
6 FRANCISCO FIRST PHASES WOULD BE SUBJECT TO MTC TRANSIT
7 ORIENTED COMMUNITIES. THIS LETTER IS INCLUDED IN YOUR PACKET.
8 NEXT, WE HAVE SFMTA PRESIDIO YARD MODERNIZATION, UNDER RM3
9 PROJECT TEN MUNI FLEET EXPANSION FACILITIES. SFMTA REQUESTED
10 \$12.6 MILLION FOR PRELIMINARY PLANNING AND ENVIRONMENTAL
11 REVIEW FOR THE PRESIDIO YARD MODERNIZATION UNDER RM3 PROJECT
12 10, THE MUNI FLEET EXPANSION FACILITIES. SFMTA REQUESTED 12.6
13 MILLION FOR PLANNING AND REVIEW FOR THE MODERNIZATION PROJECT.
14 RESULTING IN PARTIAL DEMOLITION AND RECONSTRUCTION OF THE
15 EXISTING TRANSIT FACILITY, WHICH IS OVER 110 YEARS OLD TO
16 SERVICE AN ALL-BATTERY ELECTRIC BUS FLEET IN THE FUTURE. THE
17 NEW FACILITY PROJECTED TO SERVE 215 BATTERY ELECTRIC BUSES.
18 ABOVE THE TRANSIT FACILITY, THE SFMTA PARATRANSIT OPERATIONS
19 FACILITY WILL BE BUILT WHICH IS CURRENTLY OPERATING IN THESE
20 SPACES IN THE CITY. PARALLEL DEVELOPMENTS ARE BEING DRAFTED
21 MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT COMMERCIAL AND 600 UNITS OF AFFORDABLE
22 AND MARKET RATE HOUSING ADJACENT TO THE TRANSIT FACILITY. MEMO
23 NOTES RM3 ALLOCATION GOES TO \$26.8 MILLION PHASE WITH
24 ADDITIONAL PHASE OF FUNDING MADE UP OF \$5 MILLION COMMITTED
25 THROUGH SFCTA PROP L FUNDING AND \$9.2 MILLION IN PLANNED



MARCH 13, 2024

1 FEDERAL GRANT. SHOULD FEDERAL RAISE GRANT NOT BE SECURED,
2 SFMTA WOULD OVER ANOTHER FUND SOURCE, WHICH WOULD INCLUDE
3 ADDITIONAL RM3 ALLOCATION OUT OF SAME POT TO COMPLETE THE
4 PHASE. AND, FINALLY, THE HIGHWAY STATE ROUTE HIGHWAY 92
5 INTERCHANGE AREA IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT, THIS IS RM3 PROJECT 18
6 FUNDED BY SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY. IN MARCH
7 2022 MTC APPROVED \$25,000 LONP FOR THE RIGHT OF WAY FOR THIS
8 PROJECT. SMCTA NOW REQUESTS ALLOCATING THOSE FUNDS CONSISTENT
9 WITH THE LONP AND ADDITIONAL 19.3 MILLION FOR THE CONSTRUCTION
10 PHASE OF THE PROJECT. THIS WILL MAKE MODERNIZATION AND SAFETY
11 IMPROVEMENTS TO SEVERAL PORTIONS OF THE INTERCHANGE AREA,
12 INCLUDING THE WESTBOUND 92 TO SOUTHBOUND 101 LOOP RAMP, THE
13 NORTHBOUND AND SOUTHBOUND 101 TO EASTBOUND 92, SOUTHBOUND 101
14 FASHION ISLAND BOULEVARD OFFRAMP, AND NORTHBOUND 101 AT
15 HILLSDALE BOULEVARD OFFRAMP AND INTERSECTION MODIFICATION.
16 THOSE ARE THE FIVE RECOMMENDED ALLOCATIONS THIS MONTH. AS A
17 REMINDER, AN OVERALL LOOK OF THE RM3 CAPITAL ALLOCATIONS IS IN
18 YOUR PACKET AS ATTACHMENT A. FURTHER DETAIL IN ATTACHMENT B IN
19 THE ALLOCATION RESOLUTION. STAFF RECOMMENDATION IS TO REFER
20 MTC RESOLUTION NUMBERS 4586 REVISED, 4592 REVISED, 4614, 4615
21 REVISED AND 4635 TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. THANK YOU.
22 OUR STAFF ARE AVAILABLE TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS.
23
24 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO SEE IF WE HAVE A
25 MOTION.



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** PAPAN, MOVE APPROVAL.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** PAPAN. DO I HAVE A SECOND?

5

6 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** SECOND, ABE-KOGA.

7

8 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND.

9 LET ME SEE IF THERE ARE PUBLIC COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.

10

11 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** WE DO HAVE A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE

12 WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE COMMENT. ALETA DUPREE PLEASE UNMUTE

13 YOURSELF, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

14

15 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. SHE AND HER,

16 WITH TEAM FOLD. LOTS OF GOOD THINGS IN THIS ITEM. I'M GOING

17 FOCUS ON TWO THAT ARE ESPECIALLY IMPORTANT. SHORE SIDE

18 ELECTRIFICATION IS ESSENTIAL. I DO USE THE WETA FERRIES. AND

19 THE TITLE OF WETA, THAT IS TRUTH IN ADVERTISING, WETA IS AN

20 AGENCY THAT CAN REALLY HELP OUT IF WE HAVE SOME KIND OF PUBLIC

21 EMERGENCY. SO, WE HAVE TO REMEMBER THE IMPORTANCE OF WETA.

22 FERRIES DO PLAY A PART. AND I LOVE THE IDEA OF ELECTRIC FERRY.

23 THIS IS A TECHNOLOGY THAT'S COMING LATER. I HAVE NOT USED

24 ELECTRIC FERRY, BUT THERE IS LOTS OF GOOD RESOURCES ABOUT

25 THAT. SO, THIS IS VIABLE. WE WANT -- I WOULD LIKE TO SEE



MARCH 13, 2024

1 DRAWING SOMEDAY OF THE SPECS, AND HOPEFULLY POWER THIS WITH
2 RENEWABLE ENERGY. SO WE WANT TO KEEP THIS MOVING WITH WETA,
3 AND THIS GOAL AND MUNI PRESIDIO IS ESSENTIAL. I HAVE RIDDEN ON
4 BATTERY POWERED BUSES IN SEVERAL PLACES IN OAKLAND AND I DID
5 RIDE ONE IN SAN FRANCISCO I FOUND ONE AND I ALSO GOT TO RIDE
6 ONE IN NEW YORK CITY WHICH IS RARE, AND AFTER THAT I GOT ON
7 THEIR LEGENDARY HISTORIC ELECTRICALLY POWERED TRANSPORTATION
8 SYSTEM CALLED A SUBWAY. I HAVE BEEN USING IT SINCE 1970. SO WE
9 WANT TO HELP MUNI WITH THIS ELECTRIFICATION. BECAUSE
10 ELECTRIFICATION IS REALLY CHALLENGING, AS FAR AS BEING ABLE TO
11 GET POWER IN AND DEMAND MANAGEMENT BECAUSE OF PEAKS. SO, LETS
12 FUND THIS AND HOPEFUL WE'LL SEE THE DRAWING SOON AND BRING
13 THIS INTO REALITY. THANK YOU.

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THERE IS NO FURTHER PUBLIC COMMENT
16 ONLINE, NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE AND I SEE NO MEMBER WAS THE
17 PUBLIC IN THE BOARDROOM WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE COMMENT.

18

19 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE PUBLIC
20 COMMENT. I'LL SEE IF THERE ARE ANY COMMENTS FROM MY
21 COLLEAGUES. SEEING NONE. I'LL ASK FOR A ROLL CALL VOTE.

22

23 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER PAPAN, SECOND BY
24 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. CHAIR CHAVEZ?

25



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CHAVEZ AYE. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

4

5 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ABE-KOGA?

8

9 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

12

13 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

16

17 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

18

19 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER RONEN?

20

21 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** COMMISSIONER THAO?

24

25 **SHENG THAO:** AYE.



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS
3 PRESENT.

4

5 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO MOVE ON TO ITEM -
6 - THANK YOU, STAFF. I'M GOING TO MOVE TO ITEM 3C, MTC
7 RESOLUTIONS 4625 REVISED AND 4626 REVISED THIS ITEM REVISES
8 FISCAL YEAR 2023, 2024 RM3 OPERATING PROGRAM ALLOCATES FISCAL
9 YEAR 2023, 2024 RM3 OPERATING PROGRAM FUNDS TO SUPPORT EXPRESS
10 BUS OPERATIONS. WELCOME.

11

12 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** THANK YOU. IF THE TECHNICAL TEAM COULD PULL UP
13 THE SLIDES I HAVE A BRIEF PRESENTATION.

14

15 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** GOOD MORNING. RALEIGH MCCOY WITH MTC SPENDING
18 POLICY PROGRAM STAFF, HERE TODAY TO PROVIDE UPDATE ON
19 RESOLUTIONS THAT WOULD APPROVE PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS FOR
20 FISCAL YEAR 2024 FUNDS FOR RM3 EXPRESS BUS SERVICE. AS A
21 RECAP, THE RM3 STATUTE SPECIFIES THAT 16% OF ANNUAL RM3
22 REVENUES WILL GO TOWARD THE OPERATING PROGRAM. IN DECEMBER OF
23 2023, THE COMMISSION ACTED TO APPROVE THE PROGRAMMING FOR THE
24 EXPANDED FERRY SERVICE AND TRANSBAY TERMINAL COMPONENTS OF THE
25 PIE CHART THAT YOU SEE ON THE RIGHT, WHICH IS THE DESCRIPTION



MARCH 13, 2024

1 OF THE RM3 PROGRAM, AND TODAY TURNING OUR ATTENTION TO THE
2 YELLOW SLICE OF THE PIE WHICH CONCERNS FUNDING FOR EXPRESS BUS
3 OPERATIONS. UNLIKE OPERATING SUPPORT FOR THE TRANSBAY TERMINAL
4 OR EXPANDED FERRY SERVICE, THE RM3 STATUTE DOES NOT SPECIFY
5 SPECIFIC FUNDING LEVELS FOR INDIVIDUAL EXPRESS BUS OPERATORS,
6 INSTEAD LEAVING THAT TO MTC TO DETERMINE A METHODOLOGY THAT
7 WOULD DETERMINE FUNDING LEVELS FOR THE VARIOUS ELIGIBLE
8 OPERATORS IN OUR REGION. NEXT SLIDE. SO, THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES
9 THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY FOR DISTRIBUTING THESE FY '24 EXPRESS
10 BUS FUNDS BASED ON REVENUES RECEIVED TO DATE LOOKING AT
11 ESTIMATED 11.5 MILLION FOR THE RM3 EXPRESS BUS COMPONENT FOR
12 THIS FISCAL YEAR AND THE PROPOSED METHODOLOGY FOCUSES ON TWO
13 GOALS, ONE ADDRESSING THE FORECASTED FISCAL YEAR 2025
14 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS DEVELOPED THROUGH THE SB125 PROCESS AS
15 WELL AS PROVIDING FUNDING TO OPERATORS THAT PROVIDE HIGH
16 NUMBERS OF RIDERSHIP FOR EXPRESS BUS SERVICE IN THE REGION. SO
17 MORE SPECIFICALLY, FIRST THE METHODOLOGY ASSIGNS RM3 FUNDING
18 IN FISCAL YEAR '24 TO EACH OPERATOR BASED ON FORECASTED FISCAL
19 YEAR '25 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALL AS A REMINDER THOSE
20 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS DID NOT ASSUME ANY RM3 REFUNDING SO
21 THIS WILL ADVANCE SOME FUNDING FOR THOSE ELIGIBLE OPERATORS
22 ALLOWING THEM TO ROLLOVER CONSERVE FUNDS IN FISCAL YEAR 2024
23 AND ROLL THEM OVER TO ADDRESS SHORTFALLS THAT ARE ANTICIPATED
24 FOR 2025 THEN REMAINING FUNDING WOULD BE DISTRIBUTED AMONG
25 ELIGIBLE OPERATORS REGARDLESS OF ANTICIPATING SHORTFALL BASED



MARCH 13, 2024

1 ON EACH OPERATOR'S SHARE OF REGIONAL PRESS BUS RIDERSHIP AND
2 WHERE AP KIBBLE IN LINE WITH MTC POLICIES AND PROCEDURES FOR
3 REGIONAL MEASURE THREE RM3 FUNDING AWARD SAYS WOULD BE CAPPED
4 SUCH THAT RM2 AND RM3 OPERATING FUNDS THAT OPERATORS RECEIVE
5 DO NOT EXCEED TOTAL COST OF OPERATING THE ELIGIBLE SERVICE
6 LESS FARES. NEXT SLIDE. THIS TABLE HERE HAS SOME REALLY
7 IMPORTANT DATA FOR ELIGIBLE OPERATORS, YOU CAN SEE THEIR
8 FISCAL YEAR '25 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS, THEIR EXPRESS BUS
9 RIDERSHIP NUMBERS, AND RIGHT HAND SIDE PROPOSED FUNDING LEVELS
10 FOR '24 RM3 FUNDS IN TOTAL AND AS A PERCENTAGE. THIS WOULD
11 FULLY TAKE CARE -- FULLY ADDRESS SHORTFALLS PROJECTED FOR AC
12 TRANSIT, LAFTA AND TRI DELTA TRANSIT IN FISCAL YEAR 2025 AND
13 ADDRESS MAXIMUM POSSIBLE FOR SHORTFALL FOR GOLDEN GATE TRANSIT
14 AND NAPA VINE SERVICE WITH REMAINDER OF FISCAL YEAR 25
15 SHORTFALLS TO BE ADDRESSED FOR THOSE TWO OPERATORS AND
16 REMAINING FUNDING DISTRIBUTED ON BASIS OF RIDERSHIP PROVIDING
17 BOOST TO ALL OPERATORS THAT YOU SEE IN THE TABLE MOST NOTABLY
18 AC TRANSIT AND SOLE TRANSIT SOME OF THE LARGEST PROVIDERS OF
19 EXPRESS BUS SERVICE. THIS SLIDE DETAILS CONSIDERATIONS IN
20 GREATER DETAIL IN YOUR MEMO RELEVANT TO THE CONVERSATION TODAY
21 FIRST RELATED TO FUTURE OF RM3 OPERATING PROGRAM FUNDING
22 FISCAL YEAR 24 PROPOSES FOCUSING IN ON ADDRESSING
23 STANDARDIZED SHORTFALLS MAKING GOOD ON THE COMMITMENT MTC HAD
24 MADE TO STATE PARTNERS THAT WE WOULD BE BRINGING REGIONAL
25 RESOURCES TO BEAR TO ADDRESS THIS FISCAL CLIFF. HOWEVER IN



MARCH 13, 2024

1 CONVERSATIONS WITH OPERATORS AND UNDERSTANDING THAT THERE IS A
2 FLUID TRANSIT OPERATOR FUNDING SITUATION MTC STAFF HAS BEEN
3 TRANSPARENT THAT FISCAL YEAR 2024 FUNDING LEVELS DON'T
4 REPRESENT A NEW BASELINE THAT WOULD BE CARRIED OVER INTO
5 FUTURE FISCAL YEARS WE WANT TO BE TRANSPARENT FLEXIBILITY OF
6 FUND TO PUT THEM WHERE THEY ARE MOST NEEDED IN FUTURE YEARS AS
7 WE NAVIGATE FLEW THIS UNCERTAIN TIME. THESE ESCROWED RM3
8 REFUNDS WAS UNDER LEGAL CHALLENGE AROUND \$24 MILLION FOR THE
9 RM3 PROCESS PROGRAM, THIS PRESENTED IMPORTANT POTENTIAL
10 COMPONENT OF THIS \$300 MILLION REGIONAL FUNDING COMMITMENT
11 WE'LL BE RETURNING IN COMING MONTHS WITH ADDITIONAL ANALYSIS
12 AND PROPOSALS HOW TO USE THESE FUNDS MAKING SURE WE'RE USING
13 THEM EFFECTIVELY TO SUPPORT OUR OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDE. TO
14 CONCLUDE THE RECOMMENDATION TODAY'S RECOMMENDATION IS REFERRAL
15 OF MTC RESOLUTIONS 4625 AND 4626 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR
16 APPROVAL AND WITH THAT I'M HAPPY TO TAKE ANY QUESTIONS.

17

18 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M GOING TO SEE IF WE HAVE PUBLIC
19 COMMENTS ON THIS ITEM.

20

21 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE
22 WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT.

23

24 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I SEE YOU HILARY I'LL COME TO
25 YOU FIRST AFTER WE DONE WITH THE PUBLIC SPEAKERS.



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ALETA DUPREE. PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF.
3 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU CHAIR CINDY CHAVEZ AND MEMBERS. ALETA FOR
6 THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. I'M LOOKING TO BUILDING
7 A COMPREHENSIVE EXPRESS BUS NETWORK LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING
8 A MAP. I WOULD LIKE TO SEE AIRPLANE TRANSPORTATION FIGURE INTO
9 THIS. BECAUSE FOR ME TO GET TO AN AIRPORT DOES REQUIRE SEVERAL
10 STEPS DEPENDING WHERE I'M GOING TO. AND WE WANT TO HAVE MORE
11 OPTIONS THAN LESS. SO, WE SHOULD CONSIDER THAT. I LIKE ONE
12 SEAT RIDE, AND I THINK WE SHOULD HAVE AN EXPECTATION OF BUSES
13 BEING ZERO-EMISSIONS, AND ALSO THE BUSES HOPEFULLY HAVING SOME
14 KIND OF UPHOLSTERED SEATS, SUCH AS WHAT YOU WOULD FIND ON SOME
15 OF THE AC TRANSIT VEHICLES THERE ARE THE CRUISER BUSES AND
16 THEN THERE ARE SOME OF THE 40 FOOT BUSES THAT HAVE, BUT REALLY
17 HOW DO WE MAKE THE BEST SPECIFICALLY BETWEEN SAN FRANCISCO AND
18 EAST BAY. AND REALLY THE HARDEST PART THAT WE DEAL WITH IS
19 CROSSING THE WATER. OUR REGION IS DIVIDED BY WATER. SO EXPRESS
20 BUSES ARE REALLY NECESSARY. BECAUSE THE TRAINS DON'T GO
21 EVERYWHERE. YOU HAVE LOTS OF EXPRESS BUSES IN NEW YORK CITY,
22 BECAUSE THE SUBWAY DOES NOT GO EVERYWHERE. AND MAYBE WHEN I GO
23 TO NEW YORK I'LL TRY THOSE, AND I CAN TELL YOU WHAT THAT'S
24 LIKE. SO, LETS GET A MAP WITH THIS SOON. BECAUSE I THINK THIS
25 SOMETHING THAT I WILL USE. THANK YOU.



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. NO OTHER PUBLIC SPEAKER?

3

4 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** NOT ONLINE OR IN THE BOARDROOM, AND NO
5 WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE RECEIVED.

6

7 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. WE'RE GOING TO CLOSE THE
8 PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD. I'M GOING TO GO TO HILARY.

9

10 **HILLARY RONEN:** THANK YOU SO MUCH, CHAIR CHAVEZ. I WANTED TO
11 TALK ABOUT THE FACT THAT MTA IN SAN FRANCISCO NEVER
12 PARTICIPATED IN EXPRESS -- OR NEVER RECEIVED EXPRESS LANE, BUS
13 LANE FUNDING DURING RM2, BECAUSE WE HAD A DEDICATED FUNDING
14 FOR THE T STREET LINE. BUT NOW THAT WE HAVE OTHER LINES THAT
15 ARE ELIGIBLE FOR THE FUNDING, WE WOULD LIKE TO BE CONSIDERED
16 FOR A PORTION OF THIS FUNDING FOR RM3. AND THAT IF WE -- WE
17 UNDERSTAND THAT THIS YEAR IT MIGHT NOT BE POSSIBLE BECAUSE WE
18 NEED TO GET THIS MONEY OUT THE DOOR BY THE END OF THE FISCAL
19 YEAR AND THAT IS A CHALLENGE. BUT WE'RE HOPING FOR NEXT YEAR
20 AND INTO THE FUTURE THAT MTA CAN BE INCLUDED IN RM3 AND JUST
21 WANT TO HEAR FROM STAFF ON THAT REQUEST AND SEE IF THAT'S
22 SOMETHING THAT WE COULD ADD INTO THIS MEMO.

23

24 **RALEIGH MCCOY:** I CAN START AND OTHERS -- YEAH.

25



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **THERESA ROMMELL:** WHY DON'T I GO AHEAD RALEIGH AND ADDRESS
2 COMMISSIONERS QUESTIONS. I JUST WANT TO STRESS THAT THE FISCAL
3 YEAR, 2424, THE CURRENT PROGRAM LIKELY FISCAL YEAR 25 FISCAL
4 YEAR, PROGRAM INDICATORS LONG-TERM EXPRESS BUS RM3 AND WE'RE
5 FOCUSED STARTING THIS CURRENT FISCAL YEAR TRYING TO USE FUNDS
6 TO HELP WITH THE OPERATOR FISCAL CLIFF PUTTING AS MUCH MONEY
7 AS WE DEEM PROPOSED TOWARDS THAT ISSUE. SFMTA ALSO HAS A
8 SHORTFALL IN FISCAL YEAR 2025 WHICH WE ASSUME WILL BE MANAGED
9 THROUGH THE STATE FUNDING THAT WE'LL BE RECEIVING SOON SO I
10 WANT TO STRESS THE DISTRIBUTION BEFORE YOU TODAY IS A ONE OFF
11 YEAR PROGRAM AND IS NOT AN INDICATOR OF FUTURE YEARS MOVING
12 FORWARD HAPPY TO WORK WITH SFMTA TO EVALUATE THE LINES THAT
13 THEY'RE PROVIDING THE SERVICE LINES WHETHER THAT'S A GOOD FIT
14 FOR EXPRESS BUS FUNDING. I WANT TO NOTE EXPRESS BUS AS NOTED
15 WE HAVE SOME PRECEDENT WITH REGIONAL MEASURE TWO SO WE HAVE
16 DONE A LITTLE BIT OF RESEARCH AND KIND OF FRAMING OF WHAT WE
17 BELIEVE IS THE BEST FIT FOR THAT CATEGORY WE'RE HAPPY TO
18 EVALUATE OTHER SERVICES GOING FORWARD.

19

20 **HILLARY RONEN:** GREAT TO HEAR. AND I MEAN ON THE RECORD IF
21 THERE IS ANY WAY TO OFFICIALLY INDICATE THAT IN THE ITEM
22 BEFORE US TODAY THAT WE'RE GOING TO SPEND FOR RECOMMENDATION
23 WITH APPROVAL TO THE FULL BOARD THAT WOULD BE THE MUCH
24 APPRECIATED.

25



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** HILARY, I SUSPECT THERE WILL BE OTHER
2 PEOPLE SAYING WHY NOT MY EXPRESS BUS WHAT I WOULD ASK IS THAT
3 IN THE COVER MEMO THAT COMES TO THE BOARD FOR APPROVAL THAT WE
4 ARE EXPLICIT ABOUT THE NEED TO DO ANOTHER EVALUATION ABOUT
5 EXPRESS SERVICE ACROSS THE BAY. IS THAT OKAY HILARY? BECAUSE
6 THAT WAY IT WILL NOT HAVE US ALL SAY, MINE, BUT ALSO TO MAKE
7 SURE THAT THE PROCESSES WILL BE APPROACHED BY STAFF, WILL BE
8 INCLUSIVE OF TAKING A FRESH LOOK AT THE NEEDS OF EXPRESS
9 SERVICE ACROSS THE BAY AREA. ROAN THAT MAKES SENSE. THANK YOU.

10

11 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANKS, HILARY. ANYBODY ELSE HAVE ANY
12 COMMENTS? I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A MOTION THEN I WANT TO MAKE A
13 COMMENT FOR THIS ITEM.

14

15 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES.

16

17 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I HAVE A MOTION FROM
18 COMMISSIONER GLOVER, AND A SECOND FROM -- (LAUGHTER)

19

20 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AND THAT INCLUDES YOUR --

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YEAH. WITH THAT LANGUAGE, AND A SECOND
23 FROM COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. AND HERE IS THE ONLY THING THAT I
24 WANT TO RESPOND, I REALLY APPRECIATE THAT WE ARE IN AN
25 EMERGENCY SITUATION AND WE MADE A COMMITMENT TO OUR STATE



MARCH 13, 2024

1 LEGISLATIVE PARTNERS THAT WE WERE GOING TO LEAN IN HARD AND
2 MAKING SURE WE'RE MAKING A CONTRIBUTION AND I APPRECIATE
3 YOU'RE INCLUDING THAT IN THE 300 MILLION THAT WE ANTICIPATED
4 BEING OUR PORTION OF BEING ABLE TO FILL THAT WHOLE OURS BEING
5 MTC. THE ONE COMMENT I WANT TO MAKE, THAT I HOPE MY, YOU KNOW,
6 THAT THIS RESONATES WITH MY COLLEAGUES IS THAT AS PART OF THE
7 EVALUATION OF THE GOING FORWARD FOR A NUMBER OF SUBCATEGORIES
8 WHERE WE'RE GOING ON HAVE TO MAKE EXCEPTIONS THIS YEAR, THAT
9 WE HAVE A MECHANISM FOR LEVEL SETTING WITH THE BOARD, BUT ALSO
10 THE AGENCIES WE'RE INTERACTING WITH. AND THE REASON IS THAT I
11 AM A BIT CONCERNED THAT IN THIS PARTICULAR SITUATION, THAT
12 WE'RE NOT JUST DEALING WITH THE STRUCTURAL DEFICIT ISSUE, THAT
13 WE'RE ALSO DEALING WITH A RESPONSIBILITY IN WHO IS RESPONSIBLE
14 FOR WHAT ISSUE, AS IT RELATES TO THIS PARTICULAR ALIGNMENT AND
15 THE RELATIONSHIP WITH BART. AND, SO, IF YOU -- YOU KNOW, AND,
16 AGAIN, I DON'T HAVE A JUDGMENT ABOUT THAT, I REALLY DON'T, BUT
17 I THINK WE HAVE TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE ARE STRUCTURAL
18 CHANGES THAT ARE BEING DESIRED, AND HOW OUR INVESTMENT AS MTC
19 PLAYS INTO THOSE STRUCTURAL RELATIONSHIPS. BECAUSE THEY'RE
20 MEANINGFUL AND IMPORTANT. AND AS YOU ARE WORKING TO MAKE SOME
21 CHANGES AT THE STATE LEGISLATIVE LEVEL, THOSE TWO THINGS COULD
22 BUMP INTO EACH OTHER IF WE'RE NOT CLEAR ABOUT WHAT STRUCTURAL
23 ISSUES THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH THAT ARE FINANCIAL, AND WHAT
24 STRUCTURAL ISSUES THAT WE'RE DEALING WITH THAT ARE OPERATIONAL
25 AND THIS OVERLAPS WITH BOTH. DOES THAT MAKE SENSE TO STAFF?



MARCH 13, 2024

1 YES. AGAIN, LEVEL SETTING. I'M NOT SURE THE RIGHT MECHANISM, I
2 DON'T HAVE AN OPINION ABOUT THAT BUT I WILL LEAVE THAT TO YOU.
3 I THINK WE NEED TO BE TRANSPARENT WITH THE BOARD ABOUT WHAT
4 PROBLEMS WE'RE TRYING TO FIX AS EACH OF THESE COMES FORWARD.
5 ALL RIGHT. COMMENTS FROM MY COLLEAGUES? SEEING THAT I'LL ASK
6 FOR ROLL CALL VOTE.

7

8 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER SECOND BY
9 COMMISSIONER ABE-KOGA. CHAIR CHAVEZ?

10

11 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

12

13 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** CHAVEZ, AYE. VICE CHAIR MILEY?

14

15 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

16

17 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ABE-KOGA?

18

19 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

20

21 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

22

23 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** YES.

24

25 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** PAPAN?



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

3

4 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** RONEN?

5

6 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

7

8 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THAO?

9

10 **SHENG THAO:** AYE.

11

12 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THAO AYE. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY
13 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

14

15 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU. I'M GOING TO MOVE ON TO AGENDA
16 ITEM 4A, MTC RESOLUTIONS 444 REVISED, 4510 REVISED AND THIS
17 ITEM UPDATES TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROCESS AND CRITERIA
18 PROGRAM 77.6 MILLION IN FTA FORMULA REVENUE FUNDING FOR FISCAL
19 YEAR 2021 AND 2022 THROUGH FISCAL YEARS 2023, 2024 FOR TRANSIT
20 OPERATOR STATE OF GOOD REPAIR. AND RALEIGH, THANK YOU FOR THE
21 LAST REPORT. WELCOME MARGARET.

22

23 **MARGARET DOYLE:** GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS I'M TRANSIT CAPITAL
24 PRIORITIES PROGRAM MANAGER HERE WITH MTC STAFF FOR TRANSIT
25 CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROGRAM POLICY AND PROGRAMMING. NEXT SLIDE



MARCH 13, 2024

1 PLEASE. OVERVIEW FOR TODAY TRANSIT CAPITAL PRIORITIES PROGRAM
2 OR THE TCP FUNDS BASIC CAPITAL REQUIREMENTS TO ACHIEVE AND
3 MAINTAIN STATE OF GOOD REPAIR. POLICY WHICH IN PLACE
4 RESOLUTION 444 IS IN PLACE TO ENSURE THAT THESE LIMITED
5 FEDERAL FORMULA DOLLARS GO TO PROJECTS SPLIT INTO POLICY
6 UPDATE ON THE PROGRAMMING UPDATE PROPOSE UPDATES FOR POLICY
7 REGARDING FUNDING FOR BUSES ROUTINE UPDATES BASED ON 2020
8 CENSUS DATA AND FIXED GUIDEWAY MAINTENANCE PROJECTIONS FROM
9 PLANNED BAY AREA. ADDITIONALLY PROGRAMMING ITEM RESOLUTION
10 4510 WILL PROGRAM FOR FUNDING FOR 0-EMISSION BUS
11 INFRASTRUCTURE AND FIXED GUIDEWAY STATE OF GOOD REPAIR AS WELL
12 AS OTHER PROGRAMMATIC UPDATES. NEXT SLIDE. IN ORDER TO PROGRAM
13 VEHICLE REPLACEMENTS INTO TCP STAFF INCORPORATES INTO THE
14 POLICY APPROVED BUS PRICE LIST WITH PRICING FOR VEHICLE
15 OPERATORS MIGHT PURCHASE AND ALLOCATION OF FEDERAL FUNDS PER
16 VEHICLE REQUESTS FOR FUNDING CANNOT EXCEED THE PRICES THAT ARE
17 LISTED IN THE BUS PRICE LIST HOWEVER IN THE LAST YEAR BUS
18 PRICES HAVE BEEN IMPACTED BY INFLATION GREENHOUSE GAS FASTER
19 THAN THE PROGRAM AND PARTICULARLY IMPACTING PRICE OF 0-
20 EMISSION VEHICLES. THIS MAKES BOTH THE REGION'S ABILITY TO
21 MAINTAIN TRANSIT STATE OF GOOD REPAIR AND TO TRANSITION TO AN
22 ALL 0-EMISSIONS FLEET MUCH MORE CHALLENGING. OF THE THESE HIGH
23 BUS COSTS ARE DUE TO GENERAL PANDEMIC ERA INFLATION AND SUPPLY
24 CHAIN ISSUES AS WELL AS ISSUES SPECIFIC TO BUS PURCHASES WHICH
25 INCLUDE A NUMBER OF LIMITED MANUFACTURES TECHNOLOGY



MARCH 13, 2024

1 TRANSITIONS UNDERWAY AND COST OF BUS CUSTOMIZATION. RISING
2 COST OF BUSES IS OF CONCERN BOTH REGIONALLY AND NATIONALLY.
3 RECENTLY ANNOUNCED FISCAL YEAR 2024 FEDERAL DISCRETIONARY BUS
4 PROGRAMS WHICH ARE THE LOW AND NO EMISSION GRANT PROGRAM AND
5 BUS AND BUS FACILITIES GRANT PROGRAM ARE PLACE NEW PRIORITY ON
6 EFFORTS TO REDUCE BUS COST THROUGH LARGE JOINT PROCUREMENTS OR
7 PROCUREMENTS OF STANDARDIZED BUS MODELS. DUE TO FACTORS WE
8 PROPOSE UPDATE TO OUR POLICY ON ALLOWABLE FUNDING AMOUNTS FOR
9 VEHICLE PROCUREMENTS IN THE REGION. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE
10 CURRENT BUS BAN PRICE LIST IN THE POLICY WAS DEVELOPED BY THE
11 SUBTRANSIT FINANCE WORKING GROUP IN 2019 THROUGH 2020 FOR
12 FISCAL YEAR 2021 THROUGH 2025 THE PRICE LIST HAS NOT KEPT UP
13 WITH THE RATE OF INFLATION ON BUS PRICING. STAFF RECONVENED
14 THE FINANCE WORKING GROUP TO ANALYZE PROCUREMENT DATA ON
15 CURRENT BUS PRICING TO UNDERSTAND REAL COST OF BUS PRICE TODAY
16 UPDATE WOULD INCORPORATE INTERIM POLICY FOR FISCAL YEAR 2022
17 THROUGH 2024 ALLOWING FOR 20% HIGHER TCP PER BUS AND ALLOWING
18 FOR DEVELOPED USE IN UPCOMING FISCAL YEARS 2025 THROUGH 2026
19 PROGRAM INTERIM PROPOSAL IN LINE WITH COST INCREASES THAT
20 WE'RE SEEING IN REMAINING MANAGEABLE FOR PROGRAM ACCOMMODATION
21 TODAY'S ACTION WILL APPROVE INTERIM POLICIES AND INCLUSION OF
22 THE TCP PROGRAM AND FUTURE PROGRAMMING ACTIONS WITH ADDITIONAL
23 FUNDS TO BUS PROCUREMENT COOS STARTING AS EARLY AS APRIL. NEXT
24 SLIDE. IN ADDITION TO THE BUS PRICE LIST THERE ARE OTHER
25 POLICY CHANGES PROPOSED TODAY INCLUDING UPDATE TO FIXED



MARCH 13, 2024

1 GUIDEWAY CAPS BASED ON PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 PROJECTED FIXED
2 GUIDEWAY NEEDS BY OPERATOR FIXED GUIDEWAY CAP LEVELS
3 REFLECTING UPDATED SHARES. FTA HAS INCORPORATED 2020 CENSUS
4 DATA AND REDRAWN THEIR MAPS FOR USE FOR FORMULA FUNDS SO NOW
5 THE CONCORD AND LIVERMORE UCAS HAVE CHANGED SHAPE AND ARE NOW
6 DIVIDED AT THE ALAMEDA CONTRA COSTA CAN'T LINE WHICH CHANGES
7 ELIGIBLE OPERATORS IN EACH UVA. FINALLY TWO MINOR POLICY
8 UPDATES RELATED TO TIMELY USE OF FUNDS UPDATING EXISTING FIXED
9 GUIDEWAYS TIMELINE DATES FOR NEXT CYCLE FUNDS WHICH WILL FOCUS
10 GRANTS EXECUTED IN FEDERAL FISCAL YEAR 2022 AND PRIOR SECOND
11 INCORPORATING A NEW POLICY TO ENSURE TCP PROGRAMMING IS PUT
12 INTO GRANTS COINCIDING WITH FTA GUIDELINES. NEXT SLIDE. IN
13 ADDITION TO THE POLICY UPDATES TODAY'S ITEM PROPOSES
14 PROGRAMMING UPDATES IN FISCAL YEAR 2022 THROUGH 2024TCP
15 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE SET \$16.5 MILLION TO BUS
16 OPERATORS FOR ZERO-EMISSIONS INFRASTRUCTURE INCLUDING CHARGING
17 TECHNOLOGY AND FACILITY EXPENSES ASSOCIATED WITH TRADITION TO
18 ZERO-EMISSIONS BUSES \$23.7 MILLION FIXED GUIDEWAY CAP FUNDS
19 FOR RAIL REPLACEMENT TRAIN FERRY FIXED GUIDEWAY CONNECTORS AND
20 STATE OF GOOD REPAIR PROGRAMMING OTHER AND PROGRAMMING
21 INCLUDES \$83.1 MILLION TO VTA WHICH REPROGRAMS \$42.5 MILLION
22 TO THEIR CURRENT PROGRAMING ADDITIONAL \$40.6 MILLION FROM
23 UNPROGRAMMED BALANCES INCLUDES \$15.3 MILLION FOR LIGHT RAIL
24 VEHICLES AND REMAINING \$67.8 MILLION FOR STATE OF GOOD REPAIR
25 PROJECTS VTA STRATEGY OF PILOTING LIGHT RAIL VEHICLES ALLOWS



MARCH 13, 2024

1 THEM TO TEST NEW TECHNOLOGIES BEFORE COMMITTING TO FULL
2 PROCUREMENT WHICH WOULD REPLACE ENTIRE FLEET WHICH WILL BEGIN
3 TO REACH ENDS OF USEFUL LIFE IN 2031. ADDITIONALLY TODAY'S
4 ACTION DESIGNATED \$1.4 MILLION OUT OF THE \$13.8 MILLION SET
5 ASIDE FOR THE BLUE RIBBON TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION PLAN
6 SPECIFICALLY TO MAPPING AND WAYFINDING. NEXT SLIDE. STAFF
7 RECOMMENDS REFERRAL OF MTC RESOLUTION 4444 REVISED AND 4510
8 REVISED TO THE COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL. A BUDGET YIELD FOR
9 FEDERAL TRANSIT FUNDING FOR FISCAL YEAR 2024 IS RIGHT AROUND
10 THE CORNER SO WE ANTICIPATE COMING BACK TO THIS COMMITTEE
11 SHORTLY TO UPDATE THE 2024 APPORTIONMENTS TO MATCH ACTUALS.
12 AND STAFF WILL ALSO RETURN TO THIS COMMITTEE IN THE COMING
13 MONTHS FOR ANY ADDITIONAL PROGRAMMING RELATED TO THE BUS PRICE
14 LIST UPDATE OR OTHERWISE. THANK YOU. HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY
15 QUESTIONS.

16

17 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION.
18 AND I WANT DO COMMENT HOW MUCH I APPRECIATE -- AND I THINK MY
19 COLLEAGUES DO TOO -- THE SLIDE, BECAUSE IT HELPS FOLLOW THE
20 CONVERSATION BETTER. SO, WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO SEE IF WE
21 HAVE ANY PUBLIC COMMENCE ON THIS ITEM.

22

23 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** WE DO, CHAIR. WE HAVE ONE COMMENTER
24 ONLINE. ALETA DUPREE, YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

25



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, CHAIR CINDY CHAVEZ. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE
2 RECORD, SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. THANK YOU FOR THE
3 OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. THIS IS A REALLY WEIGHTY ITEM, AND I
4 HAVE BEEN FOLLOWING THIS I REALLY APPRECIATE THE EMPHASIS ON
5 BOTH ZERO-EMISSIONS AND STATE OF GOOD REPAIR. AS I HAVE GONE
6 ABOUT DIFFERENT AGENCIES WHEN BUS PURCHASES ARE CONSIDERED,
7 NOT JUST HERE IN THE BAY AREA, BUT I'M SEEING IT AROUND THE
8 COUNTRY. I DO SEE AGENCY COLD FEET. AND YES I PRICES OF
9 EVERYTHING IS GOING UP AND IT SADDENS ME WHEN I CONJECTURE
10 THAT IT SEEMS EASIER TO PUT IN AN UNDER GROUND FUEL STORAGE
11 TANK AND FUEL ISLAND THAN IT IS TO PUT IN ELECTRIC CHARGING
12 INFRASTRUCTURE WITH ITS APPROPRIATE POWER SUPPLY I HOPE I'M
13 WRONG IN THAT CASE, AND I HOPE THAT THIS PROGRAM WILL HELP
14 DRIVE-THRU OUR FUNDING AGENCIES TO GO FORWARD AND BUY THESE
15 ELECTRIC BUSES, HYDROGEN, ET CETERA, BECAUSE WHEN YOU BUY A
16 BUS, YOU'RE BASICALLY STUCK WITH IT FOR 12 YEARS. AND, SO, I
17 HOPE WE CAN USE THE WEIGHT OF THIS PROGRAM TO PUSH THIS WORK
18 FORWARD. BECAUSE I DON'T WANT US TO BE LEANING BACK ON THE
19 WAYS OF THE PAST. AND I DON'T KNOW WHAT THE TIMELINE IS OF BUS
20 MANUFACTURES TO GET ELECTRIC BUSES OFF THE LINE, BUT I THINK
21 THEY ARE MOVING PRETTY QUICKLY. BUT THIS SHOWS THAT WE'RE
22 DIRECTING FUNDING IN THE DIRECTION THAT I WANT TO SEE IT GO.
23 BECAUSE I DON'T WANT ELECTRIC BUSES TO BE A NOVELTY FOR ME. I
24 WANT TO BE ABLE TO COME AND VISIT YOU AND SAY THAT I RIDE AN
25 ELECTRIC BUS WITHOUT EVEN THINKING ABOUT IT. THANK YOU.



MARCH 13, 2024

1

2 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THANK YOU. SORRY.

3

4 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** SORRY. YOU'RE IN CHARGE. GO AHEAD.

5

6 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THERE IS NO WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
7 RECEIVED AND NO ONE IN THE BOARDROOM.

8

9 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** I'M GOING TO CLOSE THE PUBLIC COMMENT.
10 I'M GOING TO ASK FOR A MOTION FROM MY COLLEAGUES.

11

12 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** GLOVER MOVES APPROVAL.

13

14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** MOTION FROM COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND A
15 SECOND FROM ABE-KOGA. ANY DISCUSSION ON THE MOTION? I JUST
16 WANTED TO SHARE ONE ISSUE WITH MY COLLEAGUES, AND THAT IS AS
17 VTA WAS LOOKING AT OUR BUDGET AND LOOKING AT THE NEED FOR
18 THESE ELECTRIC VEHICLES AND THE INVESTMENTS AND LOOKING AT THE
19 FEDERAL POLICIES, WHICH I REALLY LIKE, THE BUY AMERICA POLICY
20 AND ALL OF THAT, AND NOT SEEING ENOUGH EXPANSION IN THE
21 MANUFACTURING AREA IS ONE ISSUE THAT IS A BIG CONCERN SO THE
22 ONE REQUEST I ASKED OUR STAFF TO CONSIDER IN PARTNERSHIP WITH
23 ALL OF YOU WAS TO DO SOME, SORT OF, A PUBLIC HEARING WITH OUR
24 SENATOR, NOW THAT'S AHEAD OF TRANSPORTATION, SENATOR CORTESE
25 TO HAVE A ROBUST DISCUSSION ABOUT THE IMPLICATIONS OF



MARCH 13, 2024

1 EVERYTHING FROM THE SUPPLY CHAIN TO THE CAPACITY FOR
2 MANUFACTURING, AND THEN ONE OTHER ISSUE THAT I KNOW WE CAN'T
3 TACKLE ON OUR OWN, NONE OF THESE CAN, FRANKLY, BUT IS ALSO
4 LOOKING AT ENERGY AVAILABILITY. AND I THINK THAT'S ACTUALLY AN
5 ISSUE THAT WE DON'T HAVE A REGIONAL BODY THAT IS TAKING A LOOK
6 AT IT. I TRIED TO TALK THE AIR DISTRICT INTO PLAYING THAT
7 LEADERSHIP ROLE WHEN I SERVED ON THEIR BOARD. BUT BECAUSE WE
8 DON'T HAVE THAT AND WE'RE INVESTING HEAVILY IN SO MANY
9 DIFFERENT TYPES OF TRANSIT VEHICLES, IT MAY MEAN THAT WE NEED
10 TO THINK DIFFERENTLY ABOUT HOW MUCH OF THE FLEETS ARE ELECTRIC
11 VERSUS HYDROGEN VERSUS OTHER THINGS THAT WE'RE THINKING ABOUT
12 THAT IN A REGIONAL WAY I SHARE THAT BECAUSE I THINK THE IDEA
13 OF MAKING AND EDUCATING ALL OF OUR AGENCIES AND OUR BOARDS NOT
14 JUST WHAT THE SHORTCOMINGS ARE BUT REALLY HELPING US START
15 THINKING ABOUT HOW WE CAN RESOLVE THIS WILL BE A BENEFIT, I
16 THINK IT WOULD BE A VALUABLE REGIONAL DISCUSSION. ROLL CALL
17 VOTE

18

19 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FIRST BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND SECOND
20 ABE-KOGA. CHAVEZ?

21

22 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** YES.

23

24 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** MILEY?

25



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **V. CHAIR, NATE MILEY:** YES.

2

3 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ABE-KOGA?

4

5 **MARGARET ABE-KOGA:** AYE.

6

7 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** FLEMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

8

9 **FEDERAL D. GLOVER:** AYE.

10

11 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** PAPAN?

12

13 **GINA PAPAN:** YES.

14

15 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** RONEN?

16

17 **HILLARY RONEN:** AYE.

18

19 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THAO?

20

21 **SHENG THAO:** AYE.

22

23 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THAO AYE. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY

24 ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

25



MARCH 13, 2024

1 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE
2 TO ITEM FIVE, AND THIS IS A PUBLIC COMMENT OR OTHER BUSINESS.
3 I'LL ASK THE CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT
4 ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ITEM, BY 5:00 YESTERDAY. AND I WOULD ASK
5 IF THERE ARE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY
6 TELECONFERENCE WITH GENERAL COMMENTS NOT RELATED TO AN ITEM ON
7 TODAY AGENDA, PLEASE USE THE RAISED HAND FEATURE TO SAY SO
8 NOW.

9
10 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THANK YOU CHAIR. WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE
11 WAS RECEIVED FROM SAN FRANCISCO BAY FERRY. AND WE DO HAVE ONE
12 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC ONLINE WHO WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE COMMENT.

13
14 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU.

15
16 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** ALETA DUPREE, IF I CAN UNMUTE YOURSELF.
17 YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.

18
19 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU, AGAIN, CHAIR CINDY CHAVEZ, AND MEMBERS,
20 FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE
21 AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. LOTS OF GOOD THINGS GETTING DONE TODAY
22 AND I LIKE WHEN WE GET OUR WORK DONE VERY GOOD AT GETTING OUR
23 WORK DONE SO THANK YOU FOR THAT. I STATE TO YOU THE IMPORTANCE
24 OF COMMITTEE WORK AND COMMITTEE WORK IS REALLY AT THE HEART OF
25 EVERYTHING WE DO COMMITTEE WORK ALLOWS US TO SHARE MORE DEEPLY



MARCH 13, 2024

1 OUR THOUGHTS AND IDEAS AND VISION OF WHAT WE FEEL, WANT, AND
2 NEED SO THAT WAY WE CAN PREPARE FOR THE FINAL LEVEL OF
3 DECISION-MAKING AT THE BOARD LEVEL. AND I SHARE WITH YOU MY
4 FEELINGS, AS I AM SURE YOU HAVE GOTTEN TO HEAR ABOUT WANTING
5 TO BUILD ZERO-EMISSIONS SYSTEMS, ABOUT STATE OF GOOD REPAIR,
6 ABOUT A SENSE OF EQUITY, MAKING SURE WE SUPPORT THINGS SUCH AS
7 REDUCED FARES ON TRANSPORTATION. AND CLIPPER, ESPECIALLY, THAT
8 OFFERS MANY BENEFITS. AND, SO, HOW DO WE KEEP DOING THIS? THIS
9 TYPE OF WORK SHOULD NEVER BE ABOUT HERDING CATS, BUT WE ALL
10 REALLY WANT TO GET TO -- DO NOT HAVE A LONG-STANDING
11 CALIFORNIA INCUMBENCY. BUT MY EXPERIENCE WITH PUBLIC
12 TRANSPORTATION IS VERY LONG INDEED, STARTING IN 1970 ON THE
13 LEGENDARY AND HISTORIC NEW YORK CITY SUBWAY IN THE STATION OF
14 34th STREET AND 8TH AVENUE IN MANHATTAN; THAT'S WHERE IT BEGAN
15 FOR ME. AND I WANTED MORE OF THAT. NOW I GET TO HAVE THAT IN
16 CALIFORNIA. IT'S MY HOPE THAT AS THE WEATHER SUBSIDES, THAT I
17 WILL GET TO SHARE AND HEAR MORE ABOUT THIS COMMITTEE WORK. BUT
18 ALLOCATING THIS MONEY -- WHY IS MY CLOCK CLOSING? PLEASE GIVE
19 ME A WARNING WHEN MY TIME IS UP. ANYWAY, I THINK MY TIME IS
20 ABOUT TO END. SO, I THANK YOU, AND I LOOK FORWARD TO A FUTURE
21 MEETING. APPRECIATE IT.

22

23 **CLERK, CARSIE BONNER:** THERE IS NO OTHER MEMBER ONLINE THAT
24 WOULD LIKE TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT, AND NO ONE IN THE
25 BOARDROOM.



MARCH 13, 2024

1
2 **CHAIR, CINDY CHAVEZ:** THANK YOU COLLEAGUES. AND THANK YOU FOR
3 THE MEETING. AND I REALLY WANT TO THANK STAFF FOR THE
4 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF WORK. I HAVE ONE ANNOUNCEMENT AND THAT IS
5 ON MARCH 23rd AT SAN JOSE STATE UNIVERSITY WE WILL BE HOSTING,
6 MYSELF, AND ACTUALLY MTC IS ONE OF OUR SPONSORS, TO HOST A
7 WOMEN'S POLICY AND LEADERSHIP SUMMIT. I CAN'T REMEMBER WHAT
8 YEAR THIS IS. BUT ALIX, WHEN YOU CAME AND SPOKE AT ONE OF OUR
9 FIRST ONES, WE WERE PROBABLY AT THREE OR 400 WOMEN, THIS YEAR
10 WE'RE GOING TO BE AT A THOUSAND WOMEN THAT ARE PARTICIPATING
11 AND THERE ARE A NUMBER OF SPEAKERS THAT ARE GOING TO BE
12 SPEAKING OUT ABOUT THE PUBLIC POLICY RELATED TO
13 TRANSPORTATION. BUT ALSO GETTING WOMEN ENGAGED IN CHOOSING
14 AREAS THAT THEY WANT TO BE INVOLVED IN FOR BOARDS AND
15 COMMISSIONS AND OTHER THINGS. I WANTED TO SAY THANK YOU, AND,
16 ALSO, WE WILL, THROUGH THE STAFF, SEND OUT AN INVITATION TO
17 ANYONE WHO WOULD LIKE TO ATTEND. BECAUSE IT STARTS AT NINE AND
18 GOES UNTIL FOUR IN THE AFTERNOON. AND IT WILL BE A FASCINATING
19 DAY. THE EMPHASIS THIS YEAR IS ON WOMEN LEADERSHIP AND WOMEN
20 IN SPORTS LEADERSHIP. SO, A NUMBER OF OUR HONOREES ARE
21 STARTING, YOU KNOW, AND OUR KEYNOTE SPEAKERS ARE FROM BFC, AND
22 ONE OF THE MOST WINNING HIGH SCHOOL WOMEN'S OR GIRLS
23 BASKETBALL COACHES IN THE COUNTRY WILL BE ONE OF OUR
24 PRESENTERS AS WELL. SO WE LOOK FORWARD TO SEEING ANY OF YOU
25 WHO WOULD LIKE TO ATTEND. ITEM SIX IS ADJOURNMENT AND OUR NEXT



MARCH 13, 2024

1 MEETING WILL BE HERE WEDNESDAY APRIL 10TH AND I LOOK FORWARD
2 TO SEEING YOU ALL. THANK YOU, ALL. [ADJOURNED]
3



NTT

Broadcasting Government