METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL
2	MONDAY, MARCH 25 TH , 2024, 11:30 AM
3	
4	
5	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: I WOULD LIKE TO CALL TO ORDER THIS
6	MEETING OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL. THE
7	MEETING IS WEBCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. COUNCIL MEMBERS AND
8	MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM AND WISHING TO
9	SPEAK SHOULD RAISE THEIR HAND USE THE RAISE YOUR HAND
10	FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL ON THEM AT THE
11	APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON
12	BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. SO, WITH THOSE
13	CHAIR ANNOUNCEMENTS HERE, NOW MADAM CLERK WHY DON'T WE DO A
14	ROLL CALL AND CONFIRM THAT WE HAVE A QUORUM.
15	
16	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: CHAIR POWERS?
17	
18	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: HERE.
19	
20	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: VICE CHAIR CHAN.
21	
22	V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: HERE.
23	
24	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER SERGEANT FOR MEMBER BOUCHARD?
25	



1	MEMBER	SERGEA	NT: HERE	•				
2								
3	CLERK,	WALLY	CHARLES:	MEMBER	RICHARDSON	FOR	GONOT?	RICHARDSON
4	IS NOT	HERE Y	YET. MEMB	ER HURSI	H?			
5								
6	MICHAEL	HURSH	HERE.					
7								
8	CLERK,	WALLY	CHARLES:	MEMBER	MULLIGAN?			
9								
10	DENIS M	ULLIGA	N: PRESE	NT.				
11								
12	CLERK,	WALLY	CHARLES:	MURPHY				
13								
14	SEAMUS	MURPHY	: HERE.					
15								
16	CLERK,	WALLY	CHARLES:	MULLIGA	AN?			
17								
18	DENIS M	ULLIGA	M: HERE.					
19								
20	CLERK,	WALLY	CHARLES:	MURPHY	?			
21								
22	SEAMUS	MURPHY	: HERE.					
23								
24	CLERK,	WALLY	CHARLES:	TUMLIN	?			



1	JEFFREY TUMLIN: HERE.
2	
3	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: MEMBER WHELAN?
4	
5	NANCY WHELAN: HERE.
6	
7	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE QUORUM. THANK YOU.
8	
9	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU, MADAM CLERK. ITEM NUMBER TWO
10	IS JUST A SIMPLE WELCOME. I WOULD LIKE TO WELCOME US ALL. EVEN
11	THOUGH THIS IS NOT MY HOUSE HERE. THIS IS THE CEO FROM MTC'S
12	HOUSE. BUT WELCOME TO EVERYBODY TO MTC WHO IS HOSTING THESE
13	NEXT THREE MEETINGS HERE. SO, ANDY I WANTED TO THANK YOU AND
14	MTC FOR BEING THE HOST AND GRACIOUSLY NAVIGATING OUR
15	ATTENDANCE AT THESE THREE MEETINGS HERE. SO, THANK YOU FOR
16	THAT. ITEM NUMBER THREE MADAM CLERK, CONSENT CALENDAR ITEM IS
17	AN ACTION ITEM, AND THESE ARE THE MEETING MINUTES FROM OUR
18	JANUARY 22ND MEETING. FIRST, LET ME SEE IF WE HAVE A MOTION.
19	
20	DENIS MULLIGAN: SO MOVED. MULLIGAN.
21	
22	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: MADAM CLERK, WE HAVE A MOTION BY
23	MULLIGAN AND SECOND FROM HURSH. HAVE WE RECEIVED ANY PUBLIC
24	COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, EITHER IN PERSON OR VIRTUAL.



CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: NO PUBLIC COMMENT ONLINE, AND NO ONE IN 1 2 THE ROOM, AND WE HAVE NOT RECEIVED ANYTHING IN WRITING. 3 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU. ANY COUNCIL MEMBER WISH 4 5 TO COMMENT ON THE MEETING MINUTES FROM 22 JANUARY? I'M NOT SEEING ANY. WE HAVE A MOTION AND SECOND. WILL ALL THOSE IN 6 7 FAVOR ACKNOWLEDGE BY STATING AYE? (AYES) 8 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: ARE THERE ANY OPPOSED? MADAM CLERK, THIS 9 10 ITEM PASSES UNANIMOUSLY. WHICH BRINGS US TO THE REMAINDER OF THE AGENDA FOR THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL MEETING HERE, 11 AND WE HAVE THREE OR FOUR ITEMS HERE. THESE ARE ALL 12 INFORMATIONAL ITEMS, AND LOOKING FORWARD A VERY ROBUST 13 DISCUSSION, BOTH FROM OUR PRESENTERS AND OUR COMMITTEE MEMBERS 14 15 HERE AND FROM THE PUBLIC. SO, THE FIRST ONE IS ON THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES, AND I'M GOING TO TURN THIS 16 OVER TO DIRECTOR CHOY TO KIND OF LEAD THIS DISCUSSION OFF. 17 MELANIE? 18 19 MELANIE CHOY: THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. MELANIE CHOY, MTC 20 21 STAFF. BEFORE I HAND IT OVER TO ALLISON AND HANNAH TO GIVE THE PRESENTATION, WHAT I WANT TO DO IS FRAME THE DISCUSSION FOR 22 TODAY ON THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES. WHAT YOU WILL SEE TODAY ARE 23

DRAFT METRICS OR MEASURES FOR YOUR FEEDBACK AT A FUTURE MONTH.

THERE WILL BE AN ACTION ITEM ON THIS. BUT TODAY IT'S REALLY AN

24



- 1 INITIAL PRESENTATION OF THESE MEASURES SO WE CAN SOLICIT YOUR
- 2 FEEDBACK, BUT, ALSO, THE FEEDBACK OF THE PUBLIC AS WELL. THE
- 3 MEASURES ARE A STARTING POINT. IT'S A CENTRAL PLACE FOR US TO
- 4 HAVE ALL OF THESE REGIONAL METRICS, DATA PERFORMANCE METRICS
- 5 PRESENTED ANNUAL ONE PLACE. OUR INTENT IS TO STAND UP THIS,
- 6 HAVE THE DATA COLLECTED IN A COHESIVE PLACE AND OUR
- 7 OPPORTUNITY WITH RMN PERFORMANCE MEASURES IS TO BRING
- 8 DIFFERENT PIECES TOGETHER AND GIVE THE OVERALL BIG PICTURE OF
- 9 THE SYSTEM. THIS IS OUR INITIAL EFFORT AS STARTING TO PULL AND
- 10 PIECE THE DIFFERENT DATA SETS TOGETHER IN ONE PLACE. THE ADDED
- 11 LENS WITH THIS METRIC IS ADDING THE INDIVIDUAL RIDER PRINCIPLE
- 12 TO THE DATA METRICS. THAT'S ONE OF THE ADDED COMPONENTS THAT
- 13 WE'RE BRINGING INTO THE METRICS TODAY. AND THEN THIS LEADS ME
- 14 TO A SECOND POINT WHICH IS THAT THESE METRICS ARE NOT INTENDED
- 15 TO BE SOLELY A REFLECTION OF JUST ONE MODE, ONE AGENCY, BUT
- 16 REALLY TO TELL US HOW THE SYSTEM IS PERFORMING OVERALL AND
- 17 GIVE US THAT INSIGHT ON OVERALL TRANSIT AND EVENTUALLY THE
- 18 INTENT IS TO LOOK AT THE BROADER SYSTEM, OUR TRANSPORTATION
- 19 SYSTEM AND HOW TRANSIT IS PERFORMING WITHIN THAT BROADER
- 20 TRANSPORTATION NETWORK. SO, ONE OF THE ITEMS THAT WE ALSO
- 21 WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT IS THAT EVERY DATA POINT IS A NUMBER. SO,
- 22 ALONG WITH US REPORTING THESE DATA METRICS WE HOPE TO PROVIDE
- 23 CONTEXT ALONG WITH THE DATA THAT'S BEING REPORTED AND
- 24 RECOGNIZING THAT NOT EVERYTHING IS FULLY WITHIN OUR CONTROL,
- 25 BUT IT'S REALLY THINKING THROUGH WHAT IS HAPPENING, UNDERLYING



- 1 THE DATA AND THEN ALLOWS US TO START THINKING THROUGH
- 2 DIFFERENT WAYS OF TACKLE SOMETHING OF THESE CHALLENGES, OR TO
- 3 DO MORE OF WHAT IS WORKING. THE THIRD POINT I WANT TO MAKE IN
- 4 FRAMING THIS PRESENTATION IS ON EVOLUTION OF THE MEASURES. WE
- 5 LIKELY WILL NOT GET IT RIGHT THE FIRST TIME BUT WE'RE
- 6 COMMITTED TO IMPLEMENTING THE INITIAL SET OF MEASURES AND
- 7 MAKING STEP WISE CHANGES AS WE MOVE FORWARD. AND ADJUSTMENTS
- 8 ARE INEVITABLE AS WE BEGIN WORKING THROUGH THE DATA AND
- 9 PREPARING ALL OF OUR REPORTS. THESE INITIAL METRICS ARE BASED
- 10 ON OUR CONFIDENCE AND BEING ABLE TO REPORT THIS FOR THIS FIRST
- 11 SET. HOWEVER IN THESE DISCUSSIONS THAT HAVE LED UP TO WHAT
- 12 YOU'RE BEING PRESENTED WITH TODAY WE DID TOSS AROUND A LOT OF
- 13 OTHER MEASURES. SO THOSE LIST OF MEASURES WE HAVE IN OUR BACK
- 14 POCKET FOR THE EVOLUTION OF THESE METRICS AND WE WILL CONTINUE
- 15 TO HAVE DISCUSSIONS WITH ALL OF YOUR STAFF AND OTHER GROUPS AS
- 16 WELL TO DEVELOP AND EXPAND OUR MEASURES. I'LL HIGHLIGHT THIS
- 17 HAS BEEN COLLABORATIVE. WE'RE WORKING WITH YOUR AGENCY AND
- 18 STAFF AS WELL AS OVER THE LAST THREE MONTHS, AT LEAST THREE
- 19 MONTHS IF NOT MORE. WE DON'T WANT TO DO THIS WORK WITH THE
- 20 BLINDERS ON AND STAKEHOLDER INPUT IS VALUABLE IN BRINGING AN
- 21 ANGLE THAT WE MAY NOT SEE OURSELVES WORKING ON THIS FIRSTHAND.
- 22 THESE METRICS WERE DEVELOPED, AGAIN WITH YOUR STAFF. AND
- 23 ANOTHER THING I'LL CALL OUT WHEN WE HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THE
- 24 METRICS FOR THE RNM AND FRAMEWORK ITSELF, WE RECOGNIZE THERE
- 25 IS A LOT OF OTHER METRICS AND PERFORMANCE MEASURES BEING



- 1 PROPOSED OUT THERE IN MANY OTHER VENUES AND THERE ARE A LOT OF
- 2 LINKAGES AND DUPLICATION OF EFFORT AND THIS IS ONE THING WE
- 3 WANT TO MAKE SURE TO BUILD OFF ON FOR EXAMPLE, SB125
- 4 PERFORMANCE MEASURES BUT ALSO LOOKING FORWARD INTO FUTURE
- 5 MEASURES THAT MIGHT BE CONTEMPLATED SO WE CAN HAVE SYNERGIES
- 6 BUT ALSO NOT DUPLICATE EFFORTS AS WELL. WITH THAT I'LL TURN IT
- 7 OVER TO ALLISON TO BRING UP THE PRESENTATION.

- 9 ALLISON QUACH: THANK YOU, MELANIE. IF THE TECH TEAM COULD
- 10 BRING THE PRESENTATION UP. GOOD MORNING COUNCIL MEMBERS MY
- 11 NAME IS ALLISON Q WITH MTC. IF WE CAN MOVE TO THE SECOND
- 12 SLIDE, PLEASE? THIS FRAMEWORK WAS SHOWN TO YOU ALL AT THE
- 13 DECEMBER MEETING FOR INFORMATION. AND THIS IS THE FRAMEWORK
- 14 THAT HAS BEEN ANCHORING OUR DEVELOPMENT OF THE PERFORMANCE
- 15 MEASURES. A LOT OF THIS IS ROOTED IN THE RNM MISSION WHICH IS
- 16 TO DRIVE TRANSFORMATIVE IMPROVEMENT AND THE CUSTOMER
- 17 EXPERIENCE FOR REGIONAL BAY AREA TRANSIT, REALLY FOCUSING ON
- 18 REGIONAL OUTCOMES FOR RIDERS AND BENEFITS TO THE RIDER OF ALL
- 19 OF THE WORK THAT WE'RE DOING. MELANIE KIND OF ALLUDED TO THIS
- 20 IN THE INTRODUCTION BUT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT THAT THE
- 21 PERFORMANCE MEASURES WILL BE USED TO ASSESS THE SUCCESS OF THE
- 22 FRAMEWORK IN DELIVERING OUTCOMES FOR RIDERS. WE'RE NOT JUST
- 23 LOOKING AT THE METRICS, ALONE, BUT WHAT WE'RE REALLY GOING TO
- 24 BE USING THIS DATA FOR IS TO CONTINUOUSLY IMPROVE UPON THE RNM
- 25 FRAMEWORK AND TRANSIT FOR RIDERS. PERFORMANCE MEASURES WILL



- 1 CONSIST OF A COMBINATION OF BOTH QUANTITATIVE AND QUALITATIVE
- 2 MEASURES, AND I ALSO WANT TO REITERATE THAT WE HAVE A
- 3 COMMITMENT TO EVOLVE THESE MEASURES OVER TIME AS NEEDED. NEXT
- 4 SLIDE PLEASE. THIS IS OUR PROPOSED APPROACH FOR ESTABLISHING
- 5 REGIONAL NETWORK PERFORMANCE MEASURES. WHAT WE'RE BRINGING TO
- 6 YOU TODAY IS A NEAR-TERM APPROACH FOR THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES
- 7 WHICH WILL EVOLVE OVER TIME INTO THIS LONG-TERM VISION THAT'S
- 8 SHOWN ON THE RIGHT HERE. OUR INITIAL APPROACH IS TO REPORT ON
- 9 INITIAL MEASURES THAT USE DATA THAT ARE READILY AVAILABLE TO
- 10 MTC AND TO THE OPERATORS SO THAT THIS PERFORMANCE MEASURE
- 11 FRAMEWORK CAN BE QUICKLY STOOD UP. FOR EXAMPLE, THIS MEANS
- 12 THAT WE'LL WORK WITH EXISTING DATA AND REPORTING THAT
- 13 OPERATORS ALREADY PREPARE FOR NATIONAL TRANSIT DATABASE OR
- 14 OTHER REQUIREMENTS AS WELL AS SOURCES OF REGIONAL DATA THAT WE
- 15 HAVE READY ACCESS TO, FOR EXAMPLE, CLIPPER DATA AND 511. MTC
- 16 AND, KIND OF, RNM STAFF WILL TAKE THE LEAD ON COMPILING DATA
- 17 AND PREPARING PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR YOU IN QUARTERLY ANNUAL
- 18 REPORTS, BUT WILL BE WORKING IN PARTNERSHIP WITH YOUR AGENCY
- 19 STAFF IN DEVELOPING PERFORMANCE MEASURES. WHAT WE ENVISION IN
- 20 THE LONG-TERM IS REALLY A ROBUST SET OF MEASURES THAT PROVIDE
- 21 A HOLISTIC STORY ABOUT REGIONAL TRANSIT AND REGIONAL NETWORK
- 22 MANAGEMENT EFFORTS. AND, YOU KNOW, THIS MAY INCLUDE A
- 23 CENTRALIZED AND STREAMLINED DATA COLLECTION AND REPORTING
- 24 PROCESS WHERE WE'LL WORK TOWARDS DEVELOPING CONSISTENCY IN
- 25 DATA DEFINITIONS, ESTABLISHING TARGETS, POTENTIALLY DEVELOPING



- 1 INTERACTIVE DASHBOARDS TO VISUALIZE AND KIND OF MORE BROADLY
- 2 SHARE HOW WE'RE DOING IN TERMS OF TRANSIT IN THE REGION. NEXT
- 3 SLIDE. SO, THIS SLIDE SHOWS KIND OF HIGH-LEVEL SUMMARY OF OUR
- 4 TIMELINE FOR THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES AS IT RELATES TO YOUR
- 5 COUNCIL -- YOUR WORK PLAN. SO, WHAT WE HAVE BEEN DOING OVER
- 6 THE PAST FEW MONTHS IS WORKING WITH OPERATOR STAFF TO DEVELOP
- 7 THESE INITIAL MEASURES. WE HOPE TO ADOPT THESE INITIAL
- 8 MEASURES IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS. AND THEN OVER THE
- 9 COURSE OF THE NEXT YEAR, WE'LL BE WORKING TO COLLECT AND
- 10 DEVELOP THE REPORTS FOR THE DATA. AND WE WILL ALIGN THOSE
- 11 ANNUAL REPORTS WITH THE FISCAL YEAR AND USE WHAT WE ARE
- 12 PREPARING TO INFORM YOUR NEXT YEAR'S WORK PLAN FOR FISCAL YEAR
- 13 2025 TO 2026. AND THROUGH THE THIS PROCESS, WE'LL BE
- 14 EVALUATING AND REFINING THE METRICS. SO, THE NEXT FEW SLIDES
- 15 SHOW OUR PROPOSED APPROACH AND SOME PROPOSED INITIAL MEASURES
- 16 FOR THE PERFORMANCE MEASURES, AND I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO
- 17 HANNAH TO SHARE THOSE.
- 18
- 19 HANNAH LINDELOF: I'M HANNAH, STRATEGY POLICY MANAGER AT BART.
- 20 PROPOSED CATEGORIES ORGANIZED INTO TWO TYPES PROVIDE INSIGHT
- 21 INTO THE EXPERIENCE OF THE RIDER ESSENTIAL TO THE MISSION OF
- 22 THE RNM COUNCIL AND SHOULD ALSO HELP US TO TELL THE STORY OF
- 23 THE IMPACT AND BENEFITS OF THE ACTIVITIES THAT WE'RE DOING FOR
- 24 RIDERS. THESE MEASURES CAN ALSO HELP IDENTIFY POTENTIAL
- 25 OPPORTUNITIES FOR MOVEMENT AND CAN IN THAT WAY GUIDE UPDATE TO



- 1 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AS WELL AS THE RNM COUNCIL
- 2 ANNUAL WORK PLAN. THE TYPE-2 MEASURES ON THE RIGHT HAND SIDE
- 3 OF THE SLIDE PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO HOW WELL TRANSIT OPERATIONS
- 4 AND THE RNM FRAMEWORK ARE WORKING TO DELIVER ON THE ACTION
- 5 PLAN AND THE COUNCIL WORKPLAN. HOW WELL STRUCTURES ARE
- 6 FUNCTIONING TO DELIVER WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO DO. NEXT SLIDE.
- 7 THIS SLIDE AND TAKES THE OUESTIONS ON THE PREVIOUS SLIDE AND
- 8 TRANSLATES INTO A DESCRIPTIVE CATEGORY FOR THE TRANSIT RIDER
- 9 MEASURES RIDER EXPERIENCE AS WELL AS METRICS THAT OUTLINE
- 10 RIDER BENEFITS FROM SPECIFIC RNM ACTIVITIES. TYPE-2 LOOKS AT
- 11 RNM AND TRANSIT OPERATIONS WHICH CONSISTS OF WORKPLAN
- 12 ACHIEVEMENTS AND ASSESSMENT OF THE RNM'S CAPABILITIES AND
- 13 NEEDS AND OVERVIEW OF REGIONAL TRANSIT OPERATIONS. NEXT SLIDE,
- 14 PLEASE. ALL RIGHT. SO, THIS IS SLIDE SEVEN, OUTLINING ALL OF
- 15 THE TYPE-1 TRANSIT RIDER OUTCOME PROPOSED METRICS. AS NOTED
- 16 EARLIER, THESE ARE INITIAL MEASURES PROPOSED FOR NEAR-TERM AND
- 17 THAT WILL BE EVOLVED OVER THE COURSE OF OUR WORK AS OUR
- 18 CAPABILITIES EVOLVE. I'M NOT GOING TO READ EACH ONE, AS YOU
- 19 HAVE THEM BEFORE YOU, BUT I'M GOING TO MAKE A COUPLE OF KEY
- 20 OVERARCHING POINTS. WITHIN THE RIDER EXPERIENCE CATEGORY, OUR
- 21 FOUR SUBCATEGORIES FOR RIDERS, RELIABILITY, CONNECTIVITY,
- 22 EQUITY, AND SAFETY AND COMFORT. FOR EACH OF THESE
- 23 SUBCATEGORIES, WE HAVE IDENTIFIED METRICS THAT CAN BE MEASURED
- 24 USING EXISTING DATA SOURCES AND ELEMENTS THAT WILL BE MEASURED
- 25 BY FEEDBACK FROM A REGIONAL RIDER SURVEY. SO, WE CAN HEAR



- 1 DIRECTLY FROM RIDERS IN HOW WE'RE DOING IN THOSE AREAS. SOME
- 2 WORK HAS BEGUN TO ESTABLISH A REGIONAL CUSTOMER SATISFACTION
- 3 SURVEY AND WE'LL LIKELY RETURN LATER THIS YEAR FOR YOUR
- 4 FEEDBACK ON THAT. ALL THESE AREAS ARE IMPORTANT TO MEASURE TO
- 5 TELL A HOLISTIC STORY ABOUT THE RIDER EXPERIENCE ON TRANSIT
- 6 BUT IT'S ALSO IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE THAT THERE ARE MANY
- 7 FACTORS OUTSIDE THE CONTROL OF OPERATORS AND MTC THAT WILL
- 8 AFFECT PERFORMANCE. TO THE EXTENT FEASIBLE STAFF WILL
- 9 INCORPORATE THIS INTO THE REPORTING. I'LL ALSO NOTE THAT THE
- 10 FOCUS HERE IS NOT TO SCRUTINIZE LOCAL SERVICES BUT TO ASSESS
- 11 TRANSIT AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL. TO THAT END, STAFF WILL
- 12 CONTINUE TO REFINE DETAILS ON HOW DATA WILL BE REPORTED, FOR
- 13 INSTANCE, HOW WE AGGREGATE AND DISAGGREGATE DATA BY MODE OR BY
- 14 SERVICE TYPE IN ORDER TO TELL A MEANINGFUL STORY. THE SECOND
- 15 TABLE ON THE SLIDE I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT OUTLINES MEASURES
- 16 FOCUSED SPECIFICALLY ON THE BENEFITS TO RIDERS FROM RNM
- 17 ACTIVITIES. THESE MEASURES WILL BE TAILORED TO EACH PROGRAM OR
- 18 INITIATIVE TO BE ESTABLISHED AS EACH INITIATIVE ADVANCES. SO,
- 19 THIS TABLE WILL CONTINUE TO EVOLVE AS INITIATIVES MOVE
- 20 FORWARD. FOR EXAMPLE, AS THE WORK ON ACCESSIBILITY, WHICH
- 21 YOU'LL BE HEARING ABOUT IN THE NEXT ITEM MOVES FORWARD, WE'LL
- 22 SEE METRICS ADDED TO THE TABLE SPECIFICALLY RELATED TO THAT
- 23 WORK. WITH THAT, I'M GOING TO PASS IT BACK TO ALLISON TO TALK
- 24 ABOUT THE TYPE-2 MEASURES.



- 1 ALLISON OUACH: THANK YOU HANNAH. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. TYPE-2
- 2 RNM TRANSIT OPERATIONS MEASURES ARE MEASURES THAT PROVIDE
- 3 INSIGHT INTO THE STATE OF REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT AND
- 4 TRANSIT OPERATIONS IN THE REGION. AND THIS IS THE CATEGORY OF
- 5 MEASURES THAT WE WILL USE TO ASSESS HOW EFFECTIVELY THE RNM IS
- 6 DELIVERING ON THE TRANSIT TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN AND
- 7 REGIONAL NETWORK MANAGEMENT COUNCIL WORKPLAN. SO, THIS
- 8 CONSISTS OF SEVERAL CATEGORIES OF MEASURES. THE FIRST,
- 9 WORKPLAN ACHIEVEMENT, WILL BE REPORTED ON BOTH OUARTERLY,
- 10 BEGINNING THIS MONTH, AND ANNUALLY ALONGSIDE THE REST OF THE
- 11 SUITE OF PERFORMANCE MEASURES. THEN OTHER MEASURES IN THIS
- 12 CATEGORY PROVIDE INSIGHT INTO THE OPERATIONS OF THE RNM. IT'S
- 13 OUR CAPABILITIES, RESOURCE NEEDS, ET CETERA. AND, FINALLY,
- 14 REGIONAL TRANSIT OPERATIONS ARE CAPTURED HERE. AND I WANT TO
- 15 NOTE THAT THESE ARE INCLUDED UNDER TYPE-2, BECAUSE THEY DON'T
- 16 NECESSARILY REFLECT -- DIRECTLY REFLECT THE RIDER EXPERIENCE
- 17 IN THE SAME WAY THAT THE MEASURES UNDER TYPE-1, THAT HANNAH
- 18 JUST COVERED, DO. FINALLY, I WANT TO NOTE THAT AS PERFORMANCE
- 19 MEASURE REPORTING EVOLVES, THIS CATEGORY MAY EVOLVE TO INCLUDE
- 20 OTHER BENEFITS FOR THE REGION THAT WE HAVE DISCUSSED SUCH AS
- 21 VMT REDUCTION AND MODE SHIFT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. AND THEN
- 22 THIS IS THE FINAL SLIDE. SO, TODAY, WE'RE SEEKING FEEDBACK ON
- 23 THE APPROACH AND PROPOSED INITIAL MEASURES. AS YOU CAN SEE ON
- 24 THE LEFT HAND PART OF THIS SLIDE, OUR CURRENT SCHEDULE IS TO
- 25 RETURN TO THIS BODY IN APRIL WITH REVISED MEASURES FOR



- 1 ENDORSEMENT, SEEK ADDITIONAL FEEDBACK FROM THE RNM CUSTOMER
- 2 ADVISORY GROUP, AND THEN BRING PERFORMANCE MEASURES TO THE RNM
- 3 COMMITTEE IN MAY FOR ADDITIONAL DISCUSSION AND FORMAL
- 4 ADOPTION. MOVING FORWARD, MTC AND OPERATOR STAFF WILL WORK TO
- 5 COLLECT AND ANALYZE DATA. AND THIS WILL INCLUDE SCOPING OUT OF
- 6 THE REGIONAL TRANSIT RIDER EXPERIENCE SURVEY, AND WE ALSO
- 7 ANTICIPATE ONGOING COORDINATION WITH STATE EFFORTS AROUND
- 8 TRANSIT. THANK YOU.

9

- 10 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION, ALLISON
- 11 AND HANNAH. AND LET ME JUST THEY THINK BOTH OF YOU. VERY
- 12 THOROUGH, VERY THOUGHTFUL SET OF SLIDES HERE FOR US TO
- 13 CONSIDER AS WE MOVE FORWARD. LET ME TURN TO MADAM CLERK.
- 14 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM, EITHER PERSON OR IN VIRTUAL

15

- 16 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. WE HAVE ONE SPEAKER. ALETA DUPREE.
- 17 HOW MUCH TIME WOULD YOU LIKE TO ALLOW? TWO MINUTES?

18

19 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: TWO MINUTES, MA'AM.

20

21 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: OKAY.

- 23 SPEAKER: THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING CHAIR BOB POWERS, SHE AND HER
- 24 FOR THE RECORD WITH TEAM FOLD A GOOD PRESENTATION, LOOKING
- 25 FORWARD TO SEE WHAT THIS IS GOING TO LOOK LIKE. DATA CAN BE



- 1 OBTAINED IN MANY WAYS. WE CAN DO SURVEYS. CAN'T SAY I HAVE
- 2 EVER DONE A BAY AREA SURVEY, BUT I HAVE DONE QUITE A FEW FOR
- 3 MTA IN NEW YORK THEY ASK LOTS OF QUESTIONS SO SURVEYS ARE A
- 4 GOOD WAY TO SUPPORT. USING THE AUTOMATED SYSTEM, I WOULD
- 5 SUPPORT USING CLIPPER DATA AND I WOULD LEND MY CLIPPER
- 6 ACTIVITY TO YOU SO SEE WHAT I'M DOING. OF COURSE IT WILL BE
- 7 ANONYMIZED. BUT THAT SHOULD HELP, AND I'M NOT WORRIED WHAT
- 8 PEOPLE THINK ABOUT WHERE I GO. IT'S ABOUT GETTING DATA TO SEE
- 9 WHAT WE'RE DOING. BUT HOW ABOUT PERFORMING BECAUSE MUCH OF
- 10 WHAT I SAY ABOUT MY EXPERIENCES WITH YOU ON YOUR VARIOUS
- 11 SYSTEMS IS VERY SUBJECTIVE. YOU KNOW, I CAN SAY TODAY I HAD A
- 12 GOOD RIDE ON BART. I HAD A GOOD QUICK RIDE ON AC TRANSIT AND
- 13 ENJOYED MY MUNI TRIP AND USED LONG ESCALATORS, BUT THERE WILL
- 14 BE OTHER DAYS WHERE WE'RE STUCK IN THE TUNNEL FOR TEN MINUTES,
- 15 OR THE BUS BROKE DOWN, OR THERE IS POLICE ACTIVITY. HOW DO WE
- 16 CAPTURE THAT? AND HOW CAN WE MAKE SURE THAT OUR DATA IS
- 17 ACCURATE BECAUSE OF THE SUBJECTIVITY OF IT? PEOPLE ARE MORE
- 18 LIKELY TO VENT AND COMPLAIN THAN TO COMPLIMENT. PEOPLE ARE TEN
- 19 TIMES MORE LIKELY TO COMPLAIN THAN COMPLIMENT. IT'S TEN TIMES
- 20 HARD TORE GET A NEW CUSTER THAN KEEP ONE THAT'S EXISTING. I'M
- 21 LOOKING FORWARD TO REFINING THIS DATA AND MAKING IT AS USER
- 22 FRIENDLY AS WE CAN SO WE CAN GET MORE FROM IT FROM THE PEOPLE.
- 23 THANK YOU.



1 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: ADINA LEVIN, PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU
2 HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK.

- 4 SPEAKER: HELLO. GOOD MORNING. ADINA LEVIN, CHAIR OF THE
- 5 CUSTOMER ADVISORY GROUP, SPEAKING FOR MYSELF. AND I KNOW THAT
- 6 THIS ITEM IS GOING TO BE COMING BEFORE US IN THE NEAR FUTURE,
- 7 AND I EXPECT THAT PERSONALLY, AND I DO HOPE THAT THE GROUP AS
- 8 A WHOLE WILL HAVE THOUGHTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS THAT CAN HELP
- 9 TO REFINE THIS REALLY EXCELLENT START, SET OF KPIS, METRICS,
- 10 AND ONE OF THE THINGS THAT'S REALLY GRATIFYING TO SEE IS HOW
- 11 THE MTC AND TRANSIT AGENCIES ARE WORKING TOGETHER,
- 12 COLLABORATIVELY, TO PUT THIS TOGETHER, AND I THINK THAT IS
- 13 SOMETHING THAT WILL ALSO BE HELPFUL IN COMMUNICATING AND
- 14 EXPLAINING TO TRANSIT AGENCY BOARDS. THERE ARE SOME BOARDS
- 15 WHERE THEY ARE LOOKING AT POSITIVE CONVERSATIONS SAYING THIS
- 16 IS AN EFFORT FOR MTC TO MICRO MANAGE EVERY LITTLE ELEMENT OF A
- 17 TRANSIT AGENCY OPERATION AND IT'S CLEARLY DIFFERENT FROM THAT
- 18 SO THIS IS THAT COMMUNICATION WILL BE HELPFUL. A COUPLE OF
- 19 SPECIFIC COMMENTS ABOUT TERMS BEING ABLE TO HAVE OVERALL
- 20 PICTURE WITH STANDARDIZED DATA ABOUT THINGS LIKE TRANSIT
- 21 RIDERSHIP AROUND THE REGION I'M GLAD THAT MODE SHARE WAS
- 22 MENTIONED AND THAT WILL BE, AND VMT, AND THAT WILL BE OVERALL
- 23 HELPFUL THING FOR THE REGION AND FOR THE REGION CONTRIBUTING
- 24 TO THE STATE GOALS. I DON'T THINK I SAW TRAVEL TIME AND SPEED.
- 25 THAT IS ANOTHER THING. THERE IS A LOT OF VARIABLES, BUT



- 1 KEEPING TRACK OF THAT IS HELPFUL. AND, LASTLY, IN TERMS OF
- 2 ORGANIZATION, IT'S NOT JUST ABOUT GETTING THINGS DONE, BUT
- 3 ABOUT HAVING GOALS FOR THE ORGANIZATIONAL EVOLUTION, AND WE
- 4 CAN TALK MORE ABOUT THAT AT THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT CUSTOMER
- 5 ADVISORY GROUP. THANK YOU.

6

- 7 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
- 8 ONLINE AND THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.

9

- 10 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.
- 11 LET US HEAR FROM THE COUNCIL MEMBERS HERE. I'M GOING TO START
- 12 TO MY RIGHT. MICHAEL?

- 14 CHAIR, MICHAEL HURSH: I GUESS TWO COMMENTS. I AM CONCERNED
- 15 THERE IS NO SPECIFIC CALL-OUT FOR ACCESSIBILITY MEASUREMENT.
- 16 GREAT PRESENTATION, BY THE WAY, AND YOU'RE VERY CLEAR THAT
- 17 IT'S AN ATTEMPT TO MEASURE THE OVERALL SYSTEM. BUT I WORRY AS
- 18 WE FOCUS ON THAT, IF WE DON'T SPECIFICALLY CALL OUT A
- 19 PERFORMANCE MEASURE ON PARA TRANSIT, ACCESSIBILITY, I KNOW
- 20 CONTRA COSTA IS WORKING ON THE ONE SEAT RIDE, SO NOTHING DUE
- 21 TODAY, BUT I WOULD LIKE, WHEN IT COMES BACK TO SEE,
- 22 SPECIFICALLY HOW WE'RE GOING TO MEASURE ACCESSIBILITY AND THE
- 23 EFFECTIVENESS OF OUR PARATRANSIT NETWORK. AND THEN IT JUST
- 24 OCCURRED TO ME LAST WEEK, AND I APOLOGIZE, I KNOW STAFF HAS
- 25 BEEN WORKING ON THIS, I READ AN ARTICLE ABOUT THE THREE LARGE



CANADIAN TRANSIT AGENCIES ASKING TO ACCESS GOVERNMENT FUNDING 1 2 TWO YEARS EARLIER THAN PLANNED. I BELIEVE THAT IS IN A VACUUM 3 DOESN'T TELL THE COMPLETE STORY WE NEED TO MEASURE DISTANCE SO I APPRECIATE THAT KPIS ARE FOCUSED ON OUR TYPICAL TRANSIT 4 5 KPIS, I WOULD ASK THAT WE -- I DON'T WANT TO BE AS MACRO AS WE HAVE BEEN IN THE MIDDLE OF A PANDEMIC BUT CERTAINLY FACING 6 SUPPLY CHAIN INFLATION DRIVEN IMPACTS ON THE TRANSIT NETWORK I 7 8 WOULD LIKE TO BE INCLUDED IN FUTURE REPORTS. THANK YOU. 9 10 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: 11 SPEAKER: THIS IS ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS WE'LL BE 12 DOING FROM THAT PERSPECTIVE I WOULD LIKE TO DRILL DOWN AND GO 13 INTO DETAIL ON TIME PERFORMANCE. 14 15 16 NANCY WHELAN: IT'S THE MOST IMPORTANT THING TO RIDERS. AND WE HAVE IT LISTED HERE COMING FROM EXISTING DATA SOURCES IF YOU 17 COULD TALK MORE ABOUT WHERE THAT IS COMING FROM AND HOW YOU 18 LOOK AT THAT FROM A SYSTEM WIDE PERSPECTIVE? 19 20 MELANIE CHOY: I'M GOING TO ALWAYS DEFER, I'LL START AND IF 21 ALLISON OR HANNAH WOULD LIKE TO ADD. WE'RE LOOKING AT DATA 22 23 THROUGH GTF SYSTEMS AND ALSO IN ADDITION TO THAT IN TERMS OF AUTOMATIC DATA FEEDS AND OTHER DATA SOURCES WE'RE LOOKING AT 24

PULLING FROM ARE YOUR DATA PERFORMANCE METRICS COLLECTED



1	ACROSS AGENCIES. ONE OF THE CHALLENGES WE HAVE WITH ON TIME
2	PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR THE TARGETS FOR EACH AGENCY ARE
3	SLIGHTLY DIFFERENT SO IN TERMS OF FIGURING ON YOU HOW TO PULL
4	ALL INFORMATION TOGETHER AT THE REGIONAL LEVEL IS ONE OF THE
5	CHARGES WE'LL BE NAVIGATING THROUGH AS WE WORK ON PULLING THE
6	DATA TOGETHER AND TRYING TO PULL OUT ELEMENTS THAT MAKE SENSE
7	AND ALSO TELL US INFORMATION TO INFORM AND GUIDE US IN TERMS
8	OF MANAGING THE SYSTEM. ONE WAS THE THINGS THAT WE ARE VERY
9	MINDFUL IS THAT DATA MIGHT BE REPORTED FOR DATA PURPOSES WE
10	WANT TO MAKE SURE IT'S INFORMATIVE AND HELPS US THINK THROUGH
11	HOW TO MANAGE THE SYSTEM RATHER THAN JUST A PRESENTATION OF A
12	LIST OF ON TIME PERFORMANCE METRICS. I CALL OUT CONSISTENCY OF
13	DATA SETS AND HOW IT'S MEASURED AND ONE OF THE THINGS WE WILL
14	HAVE TO LOOK AT IN THAT LENS AND THE SYSTEM IN TERMS OF
15	METRICS THERE WILL BE ROLLED UP REGIONAL METRIC BUT THIS ONE
16	IN PARTICULAR BY DISAGGREGATION BY CORRIDOR OR BY MODE BY
17	AGENCY. ALLISON DO YOU HAVE ANYTHING TO ADD?
18	
19	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: BILL THEN DENIS.
20	
21	BILL CHURCHILL: GREAT PRESENTATION. COUPLE OF THINGS I
22	APPRECIATE THE DYNAMIC THOUGHT PROCESS IN METRICS BEING
23	DEVELOPED OVER TIME AND THAT'S AN IMPORTANT FUNCTION WHY WE
24	RECOGNIZE THERE IS GOING TO BE IMPROVEMENT AND A MOVING
25	TARGET. JUST ON TIME PERFORMANCE, ALONE, I KNOW AT COUNTY



- 1 CONNECTION WE EXPERIMENT A LOT ON DATA SOURCES AND DIFFERENT
- 2 TECHNOLOGY, AND FIND THAT ONE TECHNOLOGY CAN BE FAR BETTER
- 3 THAN ANOTHER ONE AND SUDDENLY ALL OUR PERCEPTION OF ON TIME
- 4 PERFORMANCE HAS CHANGED DRAMATICALLY AND TO THE EXTENT THAT
- 5 STAFF FROM THE OPERATORS CAN HELP INFORM MTC STAFF MOVING
- 6 FORWARD IN UNDERSTANDING THOSE METRICS, WE WOULD BE HAPPY TO
- 7 DO THAT. THE OTHER THING IS ON TIME PERFORMANCE BY METRIC AND
- 8 TYPE CAN BE VERY DIFFERENT. FOR EXAMPLE, THERE MAY BE A ROUTE
- 9 WHERE THE STOPS IN BETWEEN A NODE, YOU DON'T WANT TO BE ON
- 10 TIME, YOU WANT TO BE A LITTLE LATE SO THAT A BUS ISN'T WAITING
- 11 AND BLOCKING UP TRAFFIC. IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND SOME OF
- 12 THOSE IDIOSYNCRASIES. THE ONLY OTHER COMMENT I WANTED TO MAKE.
- 13 ALETA'S COMMENT MADE ME THINK ABOUT THIS. ONE OF THE THINGS WE
- 14 DO AS A GROUP WITHIN THE REGION AND WE PROVIDE MUTUAL AID AND
- 15 SUPPORT EACH OTHER AT A VERY PROFOUND LEVEL AND TO UNDERSTAND
- 16 THE PERFORMANCE OF THE SYSTEM AS A WHOLE, THERE MAY BE SOME
- 17 WAY THAT WE SHOULD THINK ABOUT CAPTURING THAT. AND JUST ONE
- 18 EXAMPLE MIGHT BE BUS BRIDGES. I KNOW AC TRANSIT, COUNTY
- 19 CONNECTION ARE CONSTANTLY PROVIDING BUS BRIDGES TO PROTECT THE
- 20 SYSTEM AS A WHOLE, AND SOMEHOW, IT WOULD BE GOOD IF WE ARE
- 21 INFORMING THE PUBLIC IN THE REGION AT HOW WELL WE'RE DOING
- 22 THAT AND WHAT THAT REALLY MEANS. AND I KNOW THAT TAKES
- 23 DIFFERENT SHAPES AND DIFFERENT FORMS IN DIFFERENT AREAS OF THE
- 24 BAY AREA. SO, THAT WAS JUST ONE THING I THINK I WOULD THROW
- 25 BACK TO BE THOUGHTFUL OF AND SEE IF THERE IS A WAY TO CAPTURE



THAT. I'M NOT SURE WHAT THE BEST WAY WOULD BE THOUGH. THANK 1 2 YOU. 3 DENIS MULLIGAN: THANK YOU. I WOULD LIKE TO THANK STAFF FOR THE 4 5 FABULOUS PRESENTATION ALL THE GREAT WORK YOU HAVE DONE AND THE WORK YOU WILL CONTINUE TO DO AS WE GO ON THIS JOURNEY. I WOULD 6 LIKE TO THANK THE TWO PUBLIC COMMENTERS FOR THEIR THOUGHTFUL 7 8 COMMENTS. I WOULD LIKE TO ECHO THE COMMENTS OF ALL THOSE TO MY RIGHT, TO MY COLLEAGUES. WE DO BUS BRIDGES FOR SMART WHEN THEY 9 10 HAVE PROBLEMS AND WE DO BUS BRIDGES WHEN A FERRY GOES DOWN, WE HAVE BUSES PICK PEOPLE UP. TO HAVE A SEAMLESS SYSTEM, THERE IS 11 A LOT OF WORK THAT GOES ON LIKE THAT, RIGHT NOW, TODAY, WHERE 12 WE STEP UP IN. DURING THE PANDEMIC MARIN TRANSIT PUT MORE 13 SERVICE OUT THERE ON 101 TO HELP US, AND WE DON'T TELL OUR 14 15 STORY. SO, NANCY AND EDDY AND I KNOW WE DO SOMETHING, BUT IF 16 WE DON'T TELL THE PUBLIC IT'S LIKE PROVERBIAL TREE FALLING IN THE MIDDLE OF THE FOREST. SO, I WANTED TO THANK STAFF. 17 18 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: SEAMUS, AND THEN ANDY. 19 20 21 SEAMUS MURPHY: GREAT PRESENTATION. COMPREHENSIVE SET OF MEASURES. I NOTICED TRAVEL TIME WAS MISSING. THERE IS A LOT OF 22 MENTIONS OF THE IMPROVEMENTS IN TRAVEL TIME THAT WE'RE GOING 23 TO GET WHEN WE IMPLEMENT MAPPING AND WAYFINDING, WE IMPLEMENT 24

TRANSIT PRIORITY THAT WE TALK ABOUT WAIT TIMES AND TRANSFERS



SOMETHING WE WOULD LIKE TO LOOK AT TO PRESUMABLY IMPROVE 1 OVERALL TRAVEL TIME. I THINK THAT'S TOO IMPORTANT A METRIC TO 2 3 NOT HAVE HIGHLIGHTED AS A PART OF THIS EFFORT. PRESUMABLY THE GOAL HERE IS TO LOOK AT THESE METRICS AND IDENTIFY WAYS TO 4 5 IMPROVE UPON THEM SO WE CAN INCREASE THE MARKET OF TRANSIT RIDERS AROUND THE REGION. AND THOSE RIDERS ARE REALLY GOING TO 6 CARE ABOUT TRAVEL TIME AND IF THE PASS IS ANY INDICATION THAT 7 8 TRAVEL TIME IS AN INSTRUMENTAL POINT, IT'S A KEY PART OF THEIR DECISION WHETHER THEY TAKE TRANSIT OR DECIDE TO DRIVE. I WOULD 9 LOVE TO SEE MORE ABOUT THAT HERE. 10 11 ANDREW FREMIER: THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. MAYBE BUILDING ON 12 MEMBER WHELAN'S POINT ABOUT HOW IMPORTANT THE RESULTS ARE HERE 13 FOR SUCCESS. I DO WORRY ABOUT THE TIMELINE IN NOT GETTING 14 15 INFORMATION OUT THERE, ABOUT PROGRESS ANY SOONER HERE. EVEN IF 16 AT END OF '25 IF I'M READING THIS RIGHT IS THE FIRST CRACK AT PRODUCING SOME THINGS SEEMS TO ME WE SHOULD BE DOING BETTER 17 THAN THAT TO AFFECT SOME OF THE WORK COMING UP. I'M ALSO 18 INTERESTED IN, AND MAYBE IT'S EMBEDDED IN TYPE-2 REGIONAL 19 TRANSIT OPERATIONS AROUND PERFORMANCE BUT WE'RE DOING A LOT 20 21 EVER EXPERIMENTATION WITH CLIPPER START, CLIPPER BAY PASS BENEFITS. I KNOW THE FERRIES AND OTHERS ARE PROVIDING REDUCED 22 FARES AT TIMES TO INCREASE RIDERSHIP. I THINK WE REALLY NEED 23 TO BE AWARE, AS WELL, ABOUT HOW WE'RE DOING ON REVENUE 24

RECOVERY IN COMPARISON TO RIDERSHIP. JUST SO WE HAVE A GOOD



- 1 HANDLE ON HOW TO MANAGE SOME OF THESE PROGRAMS AND ITEMS THAT
- 2 ARE INTENDED TO MOVE MORE PEOPLE, BUT MAY NOT GENERATE THE
- 3 SAME AMOUNT OF REVENUE. WE NEED TO BE AWARE OF IT, I WOULD
- 4 SAY. BUT THANK YOU FOR THE REPORT.

5

- 6 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANKS ANDY. I'M GOING TO PASS ON THE
- 7 VICE CHAIR JUST FOR A SECOND. WE'LL DRAWBACK. I'M GOING MY
- 8 LEFT. JEFF THEN SAM.

- 10 JEFFREY TUMLIN: THANK YOU FOR THE GREAT STAFF WORK ON THIS.
- 11 I'M EAGER TO TAKE IT FURTHER. HERE ARE SOME COMMENTS. FIRST OF
- 12 ALL I'M SO GLAD THAT YOU'RE FOCUSING ON THE RIDER AND WHAT
- 13 MATTERS FOR OUR RIDERS. AND WHILE I ALSO AGREE THAT GENERALLY
- 14 SPEAKING CONSISTENCY IS A GOOD THING, CONSISTENCY IS NOT GOOD
- 15 WHEN IT FAILS OUR RIDERS. AND A GOOD METRIC WHERE THAT
- 16 PRESENTS CHALLENGES IS METRIC OF RELIABILITY WHERE ON TIME
- 17 PERFORMANCE MAY WORK ALTHOUGH IT HAS A WHOLE SET OF CHARGES
- 18 FOR OTHER AGENCIES IT'S THIS TABLE, FOR MOONEY, WE HAVE
- 19 ABANDONED SCHEDULES ON ALL OF OUR HIGHEST RIDERSHIP LINES THE
- 20 GREATEST BENEFIT WE HAVE GIVEN TO OUR RIDERS IS FOCUSING ON
- 21 HEADWAY RATHER THAN SCHEDULE. ONE THING TO THINK ABOUT AS
- 22 YOU'RE DEVELOPING, IS HOW DO YOU ACCOMMODATE DIFFERENT METRICS
- 23 FOR DIFFERENT TYPES OF SERVICES BUT BE ABLE TO PULL ALL OF THE
- 24 INFORMATION TOGETHER AND SCALE IT TO CONSISTENCY --
- 25 CONSISTENTLY. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, YOU CAN TAKE A WHOLE VARIETY OF



- 1 DIFFERENT DATA SETS AND MAP IT ALL AT A REGIONAL LEVEL IN GIS
- 2 AND COLOR CODE PERFORMANCE, WHERE EACH COLOR IS, YOU KNOW,
- 3 CORRELATED, SCALED APPROPRIATELY TO THE DIFFERENT WAYS OF
- 4 MEASURES FOR OTHER AGENCIES, BUT THAT WE CAN SEE BOTH AT A
- 5 LOCAL SCALE AND REGIONAL SCALE, HOW IS THE SYSTEM PERFORMING.
- 6 I WOULD ALSO AGREE WITH MY OTHER SPEAKERS, IS THAT DELAY IS A
- 7 CRITICAL METRIC. MY FAVORITE METRIC OF TRANSIT DELAY IS
- 8 TRANSIT SPEED BY LINE SEGMENT AS A PERCENTAGE OF ROADWAY SPEED
- 9 LIMIT. SO, RATHER THAN COMPARING TRANSIT SPEED AGAINST DRIVING
- 10 SPEED WHERE IT'S OKAY FOR TRANSIT TO BE YOU STUCK IN
- 11 CONGESTION, AS LONG AS EVERYONE ELSE IS IN CONGESTION, IN
- 12 ORDER TO ACHIEVE OUR GOALS WE NEED TO MAKE SURE THAT TRANSIT
- 13 IS NOT STUCK IN CONGESTION. SIMILARLY I THINK THERE ARE MANY
- 14 OF US HERE WHO FEEL LIKE THESE METRICS ARE GOING TO BE
- 15 WEAPONIZED AGAINST US, AND WE'RE GOING TO BE BLAMED FOR
- 16 PROBLEMS OUTSIDE OF OUR CONTROL. UNIQUELY, WETA, BART, AND
- 17 MUNI, WE HAVE CONTROL OVER OUR OPERATING ENVIRONMENT, OTHERS
- 18 HERE DO NOT. SO AS WE THINK ABOUT TRANSIT ACCOUNTABILITY
- 19 MEASURES LET'S ALSO BE SURE THAT WE'RE HOLDING MTC, THE BAY
- 20 AREA TOLL AUTHORITY, CALTRANS, AND MUNICIPALITIES WHO ARE
- 21 RESPONSIBLE FOR TRANSIT DELAY LET'S MAKE SURE WE'RE HOLDING
- 22 THEM ACCOUNTABLE AS WELL. THEN I HAVE A LOT OF OTHER THINGS TO
- 23 SAY BUT I'LL PASS DUE TO TIME.

24

25 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: SAM?



1	
2	SPEAKER: ON BEHALF OF MYSELF AND DIRECTOR BOUCHARD I WANT TO
3	EXPRESS THANKS TO THE TEAM MELANIE AND ALLISON AND HANNAH
4	STAFF OPERATORS WHO HAVE CONTRIBUTED HERE IT CAN'T BE ONLY MTC
5	IN THE PROJECT BUT OPERATORS AND BOTH IN TERMS OF HUMAN BEINGS
6	THAT WE SERVE, BUT ALSO TO OUR BOTTOM LINE IT'S TELLING AND IS
7	VERY POSITIVE THAT THERE HAS BEEN SO MUCH INPUT AS FOR FROM
8	OPERATORS. I THINK THE BIGGEST CONCERN, AND I THINK IT'S BEING
9	ADDRESSED AND IT'S IN THE WORKS, JUST WANT TO STATE IT FOR
10	CALTRAIN IS THAT THE EXISTING DATA SOURCES, WHICH HAS COME UP
11	FROM A COUPLE OF OTHER COMMENTERS THEY MAY NOT EXIST FOR ALL
12	OPERATORS. GTFS, THERE ARE GAPS BETWEEN CURRENT AND FUTURE
13	CAPABILITIES AND CALTRAIN THE GAPS ARE BEING CLOSED BUT IT'S A
14	SITUATION WHERE WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE NOT PENALIZING
15	PEOPLE FOR DATA THEY DIDN'T CURRENTLY HAVE THOUGH WE'RE MAKING
16	THOSE INVESTMENTS. AND A BIT OF NUANCE SAID WORK MOVES TOWARD
17	THE ACTION THINGS LIKE SCHEDULE EFFORTS. ANOTHER GOOD EXAMPLE
18	OF MEASURE REQUIRING MORE DEFINITION BECAUSE IT'S QUALITATIVE
19	WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE GIVING OURSELVES A REPORT CARD
20	BASED ON THINGS WE DON'T HAVE FULL CONTROL OVER WE WANT TO BE
21	ABLE TO TELL AN HONEST STORY TO OUR CUSTOMERS AND IN OUR
22	COMMUNICATIONS. THEN AGAIN DETAIL ON WHAT'S BEING MEASURED
23	REGIONAL TRANSIT OPERATIONS KPIS, IS A GOOD WAY TO REVIEW
24	OPERATOR METRICS AGAINST EACH OTHER BUT ALSO MAKING SURE
25	THAT'S UNDERSTOOD ARE WE MEASURING INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS OR ARE



- 1 WE TAKING TEMPERATURE OF THE REGIONAL NETWORK AS A WHOLE? I
- 2 WANT TO SAY THANK YOU ON BEHALF CALTRAIN AND THE EXECUTIVE
- 3 DIRECTOR BOUCHARD FOR THE WORK THAT'S BEEN DONE AND THE FOCUS
- 4 ON THE CUSTOMER AND HUMAN ELEMENT OF THIS WORK. THANK YOU.

5

6 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: VICE CHAIR, APRIL CHAN.

- 8 V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. I WANT TO THANK
- 9 STAFF FOR PUTTING THAT TOGETHER. I KNOW IT'S REALLY A TEAM
- 10 EFFORT. AND I MAY ACTUALLY REPEAT SOME OF THE THINGS I HAVE
- 11 HEARD BUT SAYING IT DIFFERENTLY. WE WANT TO REPORT PROGRESS
- 12 AND THAT'S WHY WE'RE PUTTING A LIST OF MEASURES TOGETHER THAT
- 13 THEY'RE HOPEFULLY, RIGHT NOW THEY'RE READILY AVAILABLE. I
- 14 HEARD ANDY SAYING, HEY, WE CAN PUSH THIS OUT SOONER, LET'S DO
- 15 SO. BUT I THINK IT WOULD BE REALLY GOOD IF WE COULD ALSO PUT
- 16 TOGETHER A RUNNING LIST OF MEASURES THAT MAYBE WE DON'T
- 17 CURRENTLY HAVE SUCH AS TO WE MAYBE NEED TO ESTABLISH A PROCESS
- 18 FOR COLLECTING THEM IF WE BELIEVE YOU THAT SUCH MEASURES WILL
- 19 HELP US CAPTURE THE INFORMATION THAT WE HOPE WE CAN GET. SO,
- 20 AT LEAST PUT SOMETHING IN PLACE, KIND OF FIGURE IT OUT. THE
- 21 OTHER THING IS, ONCE WE COLLECTED THE DATA, JUST WANT TO MAKE
- 22 SURE THAT THE TEAM, ALL OF US REALLY HAVE THE CAPABILITY TO
- 23 ANALYZE THE DATA. I DON'T KNOW WHAT IT TAKES, LIKE, I KEEP
- 24 HEARING ABOUT THE DATA SCIENTISTS, YOU KNOW, DO WE HAVE THE
- 25 APPROPRIATE RESOURCES THAT ACTUALLY REALLY KIND OF GETTING TO



- 1 THE HEART OF WHAT THE DATA TELLS US. AND I'M GOING TO MAYBE TO
- 2 WHAT SAM SAID, I PUT THAT DOWN, WE'RE COLLECTING THE DATA FROM
- 3 EACH OF THE INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS, IS THIS MEASURING HOW THE
- 4 INDIVIDUAL OPERATORS ARE DOING MAYBE BASED ON PROGRAMS THAT
- 5 THEY HAVE PUT TOGETHER? IS THAT REALLY MEASURING THE
- 6 EFFECTIVENESS OF WHAT WE'RE PUTTING TOGETHER ON THE RNM. AND I
- 7 THINK IT'S GOOD EITHER WAY BECAUSE IT'S GOOD TO KNOW. BECAUSE
- 8 IF THAT'S SOMETHING WE CAN LEARN AT ONE OPERATOR AND BE
- 9 TRANSLATED TO OTHER OPERATORS BECAUSE OF THE OPERATING
- 10 ENVIRONMENT OR THE WAY WE OPERATE AND IT'S GOOD THAT WE HAVE
- 11 SHARE THAT EXPERTISE OR EXPERIENCE, I THINK THAT'S GOOD, AS
- 12 WELL. Y. AND I DON'T KNOW IF THE PERFORMANCE MEASURE RIGHT NOW
- 13 HELP US TO KIND OF COLLECT INFORMATION ABOUT, YOU KNOW, THE
- 14 RIDERS THAT WE MAY HAVE LOST AND THEN THE NEW RIDERS, I DON'T
- 15 KNOW THAT ANY OF THAT WILL HELP US AND TELL US THAT
- 16 INFORMATION. SO, I THINK TO THE EXTENT THAT'S SOMETHING THAT
- 17 YOU CAN KIND OF LOOK INTO AND MAKE SURE WE CAPTURE SOMEHOW,
- 18 MAYBE NOT IMMEDIATELY, BUT THAT'S SOMETHING THAT YOU CAN TAKE
- 19 INTO CONSIDERATION, THAT WOULD BE GREAT. THANK YOU
- 21 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU. A COUPLE OF COMMENTS FROM THE
- 22 CHAIR. FIRST, THANK YOU. I THINK, MELANIE, YOU AND ALLISON AND
- 23 HANNAH HAVE DONE A NICE JOB ON THIS INITIAL SET OF PERFORMANCE
- 24 METRICS THAT ARE IN FRONT OF THE COUNCIL HERE. IT'S A
- 25 DIFFICULT TASK. YOU HAVE HEARD A LOT OF, YOU KNOW, FROM JEFF



- 1 AND FROM APRIL, AND FROM SAM, IT -- THERE IS A LOT OF DATA
- 2 THERE. YOU KNOW? AND HOW YOU PULL IT APART AND REASSEMBLE IT
- 3 AND TELL THAT STORY TO THE PUBLIC YOU KNOW, AND TO ANDY'S
- 4 POINT, SOONER RATHER THAN LATER IS A GOOD THING. RIGHT? AND,
- 5 SO, BUT YOU HAVE DONE A NICE JOB HERE. I APPRECIATE THAT THIS
- 6 IS A LIVING DOCUMENT. RIGHT? AND GETTING SOMETHING GOING AND
- 7 THAT WE CAN ALL AGREE ON IS VERY IMPORTANT. AND I KNOW THAT
- 8 MELANIE, YOU AND ALLISON AND HANNAH HAVE SPENT A LOT OF TIME
- 9 WITH ALL OF OUR STAFFS AND GETTING US TO THIS POINT. SO, JUST
- 10 THANK YOU FOR THAT. YOU KNOW, I SHOULD KNOW THE ANSWER, AND I
- 11 DON'T KNOW, AND I DO NOT LIKE ASKING QUESTIONS I DON'T KNOW.
- 12 BUT I'M NOT SURE HOW THIS EFFORT IS BEING CROSSWALKED TO
- 13 SB125. I REALLY DON'T. AND MAYBE IT'S SOMETHING I SHOULD KNOW.
- 14 ANY ADVICE THERE, MELANIE, OR HANNAH?
- 15
- 16 MELANIE CHOY: IN TERMS OF SB125 THERE ARE METRICS THAT ARE
- 17 SPECIFIC TO SB125 THEN AN ADDITIVE COMPONENT IN TERMS OF MTC
- 18 TAKING FINANCIAL ACTIONS (LAUGHTER) AND SO THOSE METRICS THAT
- 19 WERE ADOPTED AS PART OF THE COMMISSION, WE HAVE TAKEN A LOOK
- 20 AT AND TAKEN A SCAN OF THOSE PERFORMANCE MEASURES AND
- 21 DISTILLED ELEMENTS OF THOSE TO THE ONES THAT OVERLAP WITH THE
- 22 METRICS IN THIS WORK. SO IT IS DISCRETE IN TERMS OF THE 125
- 23 METRICS IN TERMS OF THE FUNDING APPROVALS FOR THAT PURPOSE. IN
- 24 TERMS OF LOOKING AT THE SYSTEM, WE TRIED TO MAKE SURE THAT IF
- 25 THERE ARE SOME OVERLAYS OF ELEMENTS, SUCH AS, I THINK,



SCHEDULE COORDINATION IS ONE OF THEM, THIS WE ARE PULLING 1 FORWARD. ANOTHER ONE HAS TO DO WITH SAFETY? IS THAT RIGHT? 2 3 (LAUGHTER) SAFETY. THERE'S SOME MEASURES THAT WE'RE PULLING FROM AND USING THE APPROACH UNDER SB125 INTO THIS PROCESS. BUT 4 5 THE DIFFERENCE IS, THAT IS FOR FUNDING. AND SO WE DISTILLED 6 ELEMENTS THAT SEEMED RELEVANT FOR THIS PURPOSE, WHICH IS 7 LOOKING AT THE SYSTEM OVERALL. 8 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: BETWEEN THE THREE OF YOU, THE ONE SLIDE 9 YOU HAD ON THE TIMELINE, YOU HAD A BASIC KIND OF TIMELINE, IT 10 WOULD BE INTERESTING IF I COULD -- WE COULD SEE THAT OVERLAY 11 ON THE TIMELINE FOR SB125. BECAUSE THERE IS PUTTING AND TAKES. 12 AND SB125 IS MORE THAN JUST ABOUT FUNDING, RIGHT? IT'S ON THE 13 SUPPLY SIDE. IT'S ON THE DEMAND SIDE. ANYWAY, IT GOT MEANING 14 15 AS I'M ON SB125 I SHOULD TIGHTEN UP IT UP A LITTLE BIT HERE 16 AND I DON'T HAVE A GOOD FEEL THAT HOW COORDINATED OR HOW I SHOULD PUSH, YOU KNOW, ON SB125, TO GET THEM MORE COORDINATED 17 WITH US. SO, ANYWAY, I JUST PUT THAT OUT THERE FOR YOU TO 18 THINK ABOUT. I'M GOING TO BE THINKING ABOUT IT AS WELL. AND I 19 DO APPRECIATE THE WOW THAT YOU HAVE APPROACHED THIS, COMING AS 20 AN INFORMATIONAL ITEM, NON-THREATENING, YOU KNOW, HERE IS 21 WHERE WE ARE AS A REGION, AS A GROUP, ON THESE PERFORMANCE 22 METRICS WE'RE GOING TO COME BACK WITH AN ACTION ITEM AFTER YOU 23 HAVE TAKEN EVERYBODY'S TEMPERATURE HERE. I DO APPRECIATE THAT 24

VERY THOUGHTFUL APPROACH, MELANIE. OTHER COMMENTS FROM FINAL



- 1 COMMENTS FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS, COUNCIL MEMBERS? OKAY. NOT
- 2 SEEING ANY, MELANIE. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE ON TO AGENDA ITEM
- 3 NUMBER, WHAT WE'RE CALLING 4B, AND THIS IS ENTITLED THE
- 4 ACCESSIBILITY INITIATIVES UPDATE. AND I'LL CROSSWALK IT BACK
- 5 TO MIKE HURSH'S COMMENT, DURING THE LAST ITEM, MELANIE, AND I
- 6 KNOW YOU AND I HAVE HAD A LONG DISCUSSION IN MY OFFICE ABOUT
- 7 MOBILITY AND TRANSPARENCY ON MOBILITY, AS IT RELATES TO BAY
- 8 AREA TRANSIT. SO, I'M GOING TO TURN THIS OVER TO YOU, MELANIE,
- 9 TO KICKOFF.

- 11 MELANIE CHOY: GREAT. THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. MELANIE CHOY,
- 12 MTC. AND BEFORE I BEGIN THIS PRESENTATION, DRENNEN SHELTON,
- 13 WHO OVERSEES THIS WORK, UNFORTUNATELY SHE WAS NOT ABLE TO BE
- 14 HERE TODAY. SO, I WILL KICKOFF THE PRESENTATION. AND DRENNAN
- 15 HAS BEEN WORKING ON OUR TRANSIT ACCESSIBILITY AND PARATRANSIT
- 16 WORK ON THE ACTION PLAN ACCESSIBILITY. SHE IS OUR LEAD FOR
- 17 MTC. I WOULD LIKE TO INTRODUCE OUR CO-PRESENTER ON THIS ITEM.
- 18 HE IS THE COUNTY CONNECTIONS DIRECTOR OF ADA AND SPECIALIZED
- 19 SERVICES, JOHN SANDERSON. JOHN IS JOINING US TODAY, NOT JUST
- 20 AS A PRESENTER TODAY, BUT HE'LL SERVE AS THE TRANSIT AGENCY
- 21 LIAISON ON THE ACCESSIBILITY ITEMS FOR THE ACTION PLAN WORK.
- 22 SO, WE'RE EXCITED TO BE EXPANDING OUR PARTNERSHIP MODEL HERE.
- 23 AND ALSO OUR TRANSIT AGENCY JOINT COLLABORATION. AND JOHN
- 24 BRINGS A WEALTH OF EXPERIENCE AND KNOWLEDGE FROM THE REGION IN
- 25 THIS PARTICULAR WORK, AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO PULLING HIM INTO



- 1 ALL THE ACCESSIBILITY WORK. SO, I WILL KICKOFF THE
- 2 PRESENTATION, THE FIRST FEW SLIDES, THEN HAND IT OFF TO JOHN
- 3 TO FINISH THE PRESENTATION. THANK YOU FOR THE SLIDE DECK. NEXT
- 4 SLIDE, PLEASE. UNDER THE ACTION PLAN, OUR FOCUS ON THIS
- 5 PRESENTATION, THIS IS AN INFORMATION ITEM. WE WANT TO PROVIDE
- 6 INITIATIVES ON THE ACTION PLAN, IN FUTURE MEETINGS LATER. THIS
- 7 YEAR WE PLAN TO COME BACK WITH SPECIFIC ACTIVITIES ON THESE
- 8 ACTIONS BUT TODAY IS A BROAD OVERVIEW OF WHAT THESE ITEMS ON
- 9 THE ACTION PLAN AND SCOPE OF THESE PROJECTS. UNDER THE ACTION
- 10 PLAN THERE ARE FIVE RELATED ACCESSIBILITY INITIATIVES
- 11 IDENTIFIED. THESE ARE DISTINCT NEAR-TERM INITIATIVES TO TACKLE
- 12 AND THESE STEM FROM OUR 2018 COORDINATED PUBLIC TRANSIT AND
- 13 HUMAN SERVICES PLAN WHICH IDENTIFIES THE TRANSPORTATION NEEDS
- 14 OF INDIVIDUALS WITH DISABILITIES, OLDER ADULTS AND PEOPLE WITH
- 15 LOW-INCOMES. AND, SO, THE 2018 DOCUMENT PROVIDES STRATEGY FOR
- 16 MEETING THESE NEEDS. AND WE HAVE HEARD FEEDBACK THAT THERE IS
- 17 MORE WORK TO BE DONE THROUGH A NUMBER OF MEETINGS AND FORUMS.
- 18 THERE HAS BEEN COMMENTS THAT THERE ARE MORE FAN FIVE
- 19 INITIATIVES AND WE ACKNOWLEDGE THAT, THESE ARE INITIATIVES WE
- 20 WANTED TO TACKLE OFF IN THE NEAR-TERM. AND SO THE OTHER
- 21 ELEMENT OF ACCESSIBILITY IS THAT IT CROSSES ALL INITIATIVES.
- 22 WHILE WE HAVE IDENTIFIED SPECIFIC INITIATIVES IN THE ACTION
- 23 PLAN, MAPPING, WAYFINDING, FARE INTEGRATION WORK, THERE IS AN
- 24 ACCESSIBILITY COMPONENT WE'RE TRYING TO THREAD THAT OUT AS
- 25 THOSE INITIATIVES ADVANCE. AND TAILORED TO THE ACTIVITIES IN



- 1 THOSE INITIATIVES. THAT'S ANOTHER THING I WANTED TO CALL OUT,
- 2 IT'S MULTI-DIMENSIONAL IN TERMS OF THE ACCESSIBILITY SPACE. IN
- 3 TERMS OF THE OVERVIEW, I'LL PROVIDE AN OVERVIEW AND, IN
- 4 PARTICULAR, ITEM NUMBER 22, JOHN IS GOING TO GO OVER THAT ONE
- 5 IN A LOT MORE DETAIL. UNDER ACTION 21, THIS IS WORKING ON
- 6 MOBILITY MANAGEMENT IN EACH COUNTY AND IDENTIFICATION OF
- 7 MOBILITY MANAGER. AND A MOBILITY MANAGER WILL FUNCTION AS A
- 8 LIAISON WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES AND PERFORM OTHER MOBILITY
- 9 MANAGEMENT FUNCTIONS. SO, WE HAVE ONLY STARTED THINKING AND
- 10 KICKING THIS OFF. WE HAVE BEEN DEVELOPING STAKEHOLDER LISTS IN
- 11 PREPARATION FOR COUNTY BASED MEETINGS TO ENGAGE IN DECISIONS
- 12 ON IDENTIFYING THE ENTITY THAT IS BEST SUITED WITHIN EACH
- 13 COUNTY TO SERVE AS THE MOBILITY MANAGER. SO, THESE
- 14 CONVERSATIONS ARE PLANNING TO TAKE PLACE LATER IN 2024, AND
- 15 WE'RE REALLY KICKING THIS OFF BY CALLING STAKEHOLDER GROUPS AS
- 16 NECESSARY TO CONVENE THESE MEETINGS. UNDER ACTION 23 WE'LL SEE
- 17 IN THE NEXT GENERATION OF THE CLIPPER SYSTEM ROLLED OUT TO
- 18 TRANSIT AGENCIES. SO CUSTOMERS WILL BE ABLE TO USE CLIPPER TO
- 19 PAY FOR THEIR PARATRANSIT TRIPS. THIS IS ONE ENTERING INTO
- 20 NEXGEN CLIPPER THIS IS ONE OF THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE SYSTEM
- 21 WHAT THIS ACTION ITEM DOES IS IT CREATES AN API, SO, A
- 22 COMMUNICATION BETWEEN THE NEXGEN SYSTEM WITH EACH INDIVIDUAL
- 23 TRANSIT AGENCY PARATRANSIT SOFTWARE. SO THAT WAS THE MISSING
- 24 LINK SO THIS ACTION ITEM WAS REALLY FOCUSED ON BRIDGING THAT
- 25 LINK FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES. AND, SO, THIS WILL BE -- ONCE THE



- 1 API IS DEVELOPED, IT WILL BE TESTED ON SF PARATRANSIT, AND
- 2 THEN FOLLOWING THE TESTING PHASE, THIS IS PLANNED TO ROLL OUT
- 3 TO THE REST OF THE REGION, AND CURRENTLY THE API IS WITH
- 4 TRAPEZE, AND WE KNOW THAT THERE IS OTHER SYSTEMS OUT THERE, SO
- 5 WE'RE WORKING WITH TRANSIT AGENCIES TO NAVIGATE THIS SO IT CAN
- 6 BE A SMOOTH TRANSITION ONCE THIS IS ENABLED -- OPERATIONALIZED
- 7 IN NEXGEN CLIPPER. UNDER ACTION 24, MTC AND TRANSIT AGENCIES
- 8 AND OTHER STAKEHOLDERS ARE WORKING TO IDENTIFY THE TOP
- 9 PARATRANSIT CHALLENGES AND RECOMMEND REFORMS. SO WE HAVEN'T
- 10 BEGUN WORK ON THIS ACTION, BUT WE EXPECT TO BEGIN WORK ON THIS
- 11 OVER THE SUMMER AND THIS WILL COME OUT OF OUR UPDATED
- 12 COORDINATED PLAN. THESE ACTIONS CAME OUT OF THE 2018
- 13 COORDINATED PLAN. THIS YEAR WE'RE WORKING ON UPDATING THE
- 14 COORDINATED PLAN AND COMING OUT OF THE UPDATED COORDINATED
- 15 PLAN FOR 2024 WE ANTICIPATE ON KICKING OFF THESE DISCUSSIONS
- 16 FROM BASING OFF OF THE 2024 COORDINATED PLAN EFFORT. AND THEN,
- 17 LASTLY, UNDER ACTION 25 WE'RE EVALUATING RECOMMENDATIONS FOR
- 18 STANDARDIZING THE ELIGIBILITY PRACTICES FOR PARATRANSIT. AND
- 19 THE CLIPPER ACCESS REGIONAL TRANSIT CONNECTIONS PROGRAM,
- 20 THAT'S THE RTC CARD. MTC AND THE TRANSIT -- AND THE REGION'S
- 21 TRANSIT AGENCIES HAVE BEEN WORKING ON THIS ACTION, AND DRAFT
- 22 RECOMMENDATIONS ARE ANTICIPATED TO COME TO THE CUSTOMER
- 23 ADVISORY GROUP IN THE NEXT MONTH OR SO, AND THEN SUBSEQUENTLY
- 24 IT WILL BE BROUGHT FORWARD TO THIS GROUP FOR FEEDBACK, AS
- 25 WELL. AND WITH THAT I'M GOING TO TURN IT OVER TO JOHN FOR THE



1

MARCH 25, 2024

NEXT SLIDE TO TAKE A DEEP DIVE ON ACTION 22, WHICH IS THE ONE

2 SEE THE RIDES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. 3 JOHN SANDERSON: THANK YOU MELANIE AND GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE. 4 5 JUST A OUICK RECAP OF THE STATUS OUO AS IT STANDS NOW. AS WITH FIXED ROUTE TRIPS THAT CROSS JURISDICTIONAL BOUNDARIES BETWEEN 6 TRANSIT OPERATING AGENCIES PARATRANSIT RIDERS MAKING THOSE 7 8 SAME CROSSINGS FROM ONE AGENCY SERVICE AREA TO ANOTHER ARE USUALLY REQUIRED TO TRANSFER FROM ONE VEHICLE TO ANOTHER AT A 9 LOCATION SOMEWHERE ALONG THE BORDER. BETWEEN BAY AREA TRANSIT 10 AGENCIES THESE TRANSFER TRIPS GENERAL ACCOUNT FOR ABOUT 10% OF 11 OUR OVERALL TRIP DEMAND BUT TRIPS HAVE VERY, VERY 12 DISPROPORTIONATE IMPACT ON BOTH OUR SYSTEM AS WELL AS ON THE 13 CUSTOMERS THEMSELVES. BASICALLY TRANSFER TRIPS TEND TO BE 14 15 EXHAUSTING AND UNCOMFORTABLE FOR THE RIDER AND THEY'RE 16 CHALLENGING AND RESOURCE INTENSIVE FOR THE PROVIDER. FOR THE

- 20 ARE OVERALL EFFICIENCY WHEN YOU COME BINE TWO OPERATORS
- 21 SPENDING. WE CURRENTLY HAVE TWO ONE-SEAT RIDE PILOTS IN THE

CONTEXT OF ONE SEAT RIDE TRANSPORTS CUSTOMER FROM ONE AREA TO

THEIR DESTINATION IN ANOTHER AREA THE BOUNDARY STARTS TO LOOK

APPEALING FROM THE CUSTOMER PERSPECTIVE BUT ALSO IN TERMS OF

- 22 BAY AREA THAT UTILIZE VERY DIFFERENT APPROACHES IN CONTRA
- 23 COSTA COUNTY AND ALSO OUR FRIENDS IN LAFTA IN THE CENTRAL AND
- 24 EASTERN ALAMEDA COUNTY, WE HAVE A DEDICATED ONE SEAT PROGRAM
- 25 COVERED BY AN MOU BETWEEN ALL FOUR PARTICIPATING AGENCIES

17

18



- 1 OPERATED BY A SINGLE CONTRACTOR. PROGRAM COSTS ARE THEN SHARED
- 2 BETWEEN THE PARTNER AGENCIES BASED ON THE SHARE OF MILES AN
- 3 HOURS THAT EACH TRIP OCCUPIES WITHIN EACH SERVICE AREA. IN
- 4 SONOMA COUNTY WE HAVE TWO OPERATORS THAT ARE PROVIDING ONE
- 5 SEAT RIDES WITHOUT FORMAL COORDINATION WHERE EACH AGENCY
- 6 ESSENTIALLY PROVIDES ONE SEAT RIDES TO THEIR OWN CUSTOMERS
- 7 THAT LIVE IN THEIR OWN SERVICE AREA AND IT'S PRETTY SEAMLESS
- 8 THAT WAY. NEXT SLIDE. WE KNOW FROM EXPERIENCE THERE ARE GAPS
- 9 BETWEEN PARATRANSIT SERVICE CRITERIA THAT WERE ESTABLISHED BY
- 10 ADA AND REAL-WORLD NEEDS OF A LOT OF OUR CUSTOMERS IN THE BAY
- 11 AREA. THE PURPOSE OF THIS NEW PILOT PROGRAM UNDER ACTION 22
- 12 WILL BE TO EXPLORE AND BRIDGE THE GAP TESTING ADDITIONAL
- 13 CONCEPTS PROVIDING ONE SEAT SERVICE WITHIN SPECIFIC POCKETS
- 14 AROUND THE REGION CRUCIALLY THE PROJECTS UNDER THIS PROGRAM
- 15 WILL BE NARROW AND SPECIFIC IN SCOPE WILL NOT SERVICE OUTSIDE
- 16 OF SERVICE PARAMETERS OF GEOGRAPHIC AND BE GEARED TOWARDS
- 17 LESSENING BURDEN OF TRANSFER TRIPS FOR BOTH RIDERS AND TRANSIT
- 18 OPERATORS. NEXT SLIDE. AT THE LAST MEETING OF THIS BODY,
- 19 DIRECTOR CHOY REPORTED TO YOU THAT MTC AND TRANSIT AGENCY
- 20 STAFF HAD OUTLINED SOME ADDITIONAL CONCEPTS FOR DELIVERING ONE
- 21 SEAT RIDES ALSO MTC STAFF CONDUCTED INFORMATION GATHERING
- 22 SESSIONS WITH VARIOUS MEMBERS OF PARATRANSIT COORDINATING
- 23 COUNSELS FROM AROUND THE REGION AND CONCEPTS HAVE BEEN
- 24 IDENTIFIED AND RECEIVED ADDITIONAL INPUT THREE CORE COMPONENTS
- 25 ARE IN FRONT OF YOU THAT WE THINK DESERVE FURTHER EXPLORATION



- 1 FIRST CONCEPT IS LIMITED USE BY BOTH PARATRANSIT AND GOLDEN
- 2 GATE CERTAINLY APPLIES TO OTHER CASES AS WELL. THIS SCENARIO
- 3 HAS SOME ADA PARATRANSIT GEOGRAPHIC TIME BASED OBLIGATION THAT
- 4 EXTENDS INTO A NEIGHBORING AGENCY'S SERVICE AREA, THAT THEY
- 5 HAVE A LINE THAT GOES ACROSS THE BORDER. THIS MAKES SENSE
- 6 WHERE THERE IS A LOT OF EXISTING TRIP DENSITY BUT ALSO CARRIES
- 7 THE RISK THAT PARATRANSIT VEHICLES COULD ENDS UP BEING TAKEN
- 8 OUT OF SERVICE FOR AN UNPREDICTABLE PERIOD OF TIME AS TRANSFER
- 9 TRIPS DO NOW IF A TRIP GOES ACROSS A BORDER. AND HOW THE COST
- 10 OF CROSS BORDER TRIPS SHOULD BE SHARED BETWEEN OPERATORS.
- 11 SECOND INVOLVES ONE OR MORE PARATRANSIT OPERATORS WORKING WITH
- 12 A NON-DEDICATED THIRD PARTY SUCH AS TAXI COMPANY OR TNC
- 13 SIMILAR TO HOW INNER CITY TAXI VOUCHER PROGRAM WORKS IN SOLANO
- 14 COUNTY NOW. THE ADVANTAGE THERE IS IT'S EASIER TO PROVIDE
- 15 SERVICE WITHOUT PRESCHEDULING BUT THE PITFALL IT'S HARD TORE
- 16 GUARANTEE AVAILABILITY OF SERVICE WHEN NEEDED AND EXTREMELY
- 17 DIFFICULT TO ENSURE EQUIVALENT FACILITATION SERVICE TO
- 18 CUSTOMERS WHO USE WHEELCHAIRS. THIRD MODEL IS IN LIMITED USE
- 19 BY SAMTRANS AND WESTCAT IN THIS SCENARIO ONE AGENCY PROVIDES
- 20 SERVICE ACROSS A BORDER INTO ANOTHER AGENCY'S SERVICE AREA BUT
- 21 ONLY TO VERY SPECIFIC LOCATIONS OR FOR VERY SPECIFIC TRIP
- 22 PURPOSES. THE ADVANTAGE HERE IS THE ARRANGEMENT IS RELATIVELY
- 23 EASY TO EXPLAIN AND ADMINISTER. SO, AS DISCUSSED PREVIOUSLY
- 24 THIS LIST IS INTENDED AS A JUMPING OFF POINT FOR FURTHER
- 25 DISCUSSION RATHER THAN BUNCH LIST FOR THE PILOT PROGRAM THAT



- 1 WE'RE HOPING TO START. ALSO IMPORTANT TO BEAR IN MIND BECAUSE
- 2 OF ALL THE POTENTIAL PILOT PROJECTS EXCEED THE MANDATED
- 3 SERVICE CRITERIA WE CAN PLACE LIMITS ON THE SERVICES OFFERED
- 4 TO KEEP COSTS MANAGEABLE AND TO TEST FOR SPECIFIC VARIABLES.
- 5 POTENTIAL LIMITS COULD INCLUDE TRIP PURPOSE, PILOT AREA, OR
- 6 OPERATING HOURS, NUMBER OF TRIPS PER RIDER, CHARGING PREMIUM
- 7 FARES, SCHEDULING WITHOUT REGARD TO THE TWO-HOUR ADA TRIP TIME
- 8 NEGOTIATION, ET CETERA. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. SO, AS WE SAID, THE
- 9 IDEA OF THE PILOT PROGRAM WILL BE TO TEST NEW CONCEPTS FOR ONE
- 10 SEAT SERVICE THAT ARE NOT ALREADY INCLUDED IN THE CONTRA
- 11 COSTA, LAFTA, OR THE SONOMA PILOTS. THE PILOT PROJECTS WILL
- 12 RUN FOR AT LEAST 12 MONTHS EACH AND SINCE THE PRIMARY GOAL OF
- 13 THE EXERCISE IS TO REDUCE THE TRANSFER TRIP BURDEN ON BOTH
- 14 CUSTOMERS AND ON OPERATORS, WE INTEND TO FOCUS OUR EFFORTS ON
- 15 AREAS WITH PROVEN CROSS BORDER DEMAND SO WE'LL BE COMING
- 16 AROUND TO EACH OF YOUR AGENCIES TO ASK FOR SPECIFIC TRANSFER
- 17 TRIP DATA TO HELP US MAKE THE CALL ABOUT WHERE THOSE PROJECTS
- 18 ARE NEEDED. MTC HAS SET ASIDE A MILLION DOLLARS IN FUNDING TO
- 19 SUPPORT THREE PILOT PROJECTS AS PART OF THIS PROGRAM. AND HAS
- 20 FURTHER APPLIED FOR A CALTRANS PLANNING GRANT TO SUPPORT
- 21 RIGOROUS EVALUATION OF THE PILOT RESULTS ONCE THAT DATA COMES
- 22 BACK. WE HOPE TO HAVE THE PILOT PROJECT PROPOSALS READY TO
- 23 SHARE WITH YOU BY THE END OF THE SPRING AND WE EXPECT TO FIND
- 24 OUT ABOUT THE CALTRANS GRANT EARLY IN THE SUMMER. SO, WITH
- 25 THAT, I THANK YOU. AND WE'RE HAPPY TO TAKE YOUR QUESTIONS.



1 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT PRESENTATION, JOHN, 2 3 AND THE INTRODUCTION, MELANIE. MADAM CLERK, PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM? EITHER IN-PERSON OR VIRTUALLY? 4 5 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT. ONE PERSON 6 HERE IN THE ROOM. ALETA DUPREE, AND I WILL SET THE TIMER. AND 7 8 THEN WE HAVE, ALSO ONLINE, A COUPLE OF PEOPLE. 9 SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS, AND MEMBERS. ALETA 10 DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. VERY GOOD 11 PRESENTATION. IT'S IMPORTANT WE TALK ABOUT PARATRANSIT. DON'T 12 HEAR ABOUT IT MUCH. AND PARATRANSIT SHOULD NEVER BE AN 13 AFTERTHOUGHT. WE HAVE TO KEEP THIS FRONT AND CENTER. I HAVE 14 15 NEVER USED PARATRANSIT. I DON'T QUALIFY FOR IT. BUT I KNOW 16 SOME WHO DO. CERTAINLY THE INTEGRATION WITH CLIPPER IS ABSOLUTELY ESSENTIAL. IT IS ABOUT EQUITY AND HAVING 17 CONSISTENCY ACROSS THE BOARD. IT CAN BE HARD FOR A PERSON WHO 18 IS OF A PARATRANSIT OUALIFYING DISABILITY TO HAVE TO GO TO 19 BANK OR A STORE TO GET MONEY. ESPECIALLY IF THE WEATHER IS BAD 20 OUT, OR IF THEY'RE NOT FEELING WELL, AND THEN YOU HAVE TO 21 COUNT OUT THAT MONEY AND PAY FOR THE PARATRANSIT, ESPECIALLY 22 IF THE FARE IS VARIABLE, WHEN CLIPPER WILL ALLOW SOMEONE WHO 23 HAS A PARATRANSIT DISABILITY WHO CAN RECEIVE PAY THROUGH 24

DIRECT DEPOSIT, I HAVE DIRECT DEPOSIT, ACTUALLY, HAVE FOR 35



1	YEARS, HAVE DIRECT DEPOSIT THEN BE ABLE TO MAKE TRANSFERS INTO
2	THE CLIPPER ACCOUNT FROM THEIR CHECKING ACCOUNT, INTO CLIPPER,
3	AND BE READY TO PAY THE FARE UPON BOARDING THE PARATRANSIT
4	VEHICLE. THERE IS A LOT OF NEW THINGS. I'M TRYING TO IMAGINE
5	WHAT LONG DISTANCE PARATRANSIT IS LIKE. IF YOU ARE GOING FROM,
6	SAY, ANTIOCH, TO SAN FRANCISCO AIRPORT ON PARA TRANSIT, WHAT
7	WOULD THAT BE LIKE? HOW MANY STOPS WOULD IT MAKE? HOW MANY
8	TRANSFERS? I MEAN, WE WANT TO REDUCE OUR TRANSFERS. I CAN ONLY
9	IMAGINE WHAT IT'S LIKE HAVING TO DO A TRANSFER IN THE RAIN, OR
10	ON A REALLY HOT DAY. IT GETS HOT OUT THERE IN THE NORTH AND IN
11	THE EAST AND THE SOUTH FROM HERE. WE CAN'T IT FEELS LIKE A
12	BUBBLE IN HERE SOMETIMES, WHEN IT'S NICE AND COOL. SO WE HAVE
13	TO BRING PARATRANSIT TO THE FOREFRONT AND MAKE SURE WE
14	INTEGRATE THIS SO PARATRANSIT USERS CAN HAVE A FRIENDLY
15	EXPERIENCE. THANK YOU
16	
17	CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS WARREN
18	CUSHMAN. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES TO SPEAK. PLEASE UNMUTE
19	YOURSELF. WARREN CUSHMAN: CAN YOU HEAR ME?
20	
21	SPEAKER: YES WE CAN. THANK YOU.
22	
23	WARREN CUSHMAN: HELLO MEMBERS OF THE COMMITTEE. MY NAME IS
24	WARREN CUSHMAN, COMMUNITY RESOURCES FOR INDEPENDENT LIVING. I

WANT TO SPEAK, TODAY, ABOUT PARATRANSIT AND THE IMPORTANCE OF



- 1 HAVING A COMMUNITY, AND A PART OF THE DISCUSSION AS WE MOVE
- 2 FORWARD, REGARDING PARATRANSIT PIECES WE HAVE HEARD TODAY.
- 3 REGARDING ONE SEAT RIDE, THERE ARE A LOT OF FACTORS WE HEARD
- 4 TODAY AROUND ONE SEAT RIDE. DIFFERENT CRITERIA, DIFFERENT
- 5 METRICS THAT WILL BE LOOKED AT IN TERMS OF CHOOSING WHICH
- 6 PILOTS ARE GOING TO MOVE FORWARD AND HOW ALL THAT WILL BE PUT
- 7 TOGETHER. I WANT TO SPEAK TO THE NEEDS OF THE COMMUNITY TO BE
- 8 A PART OF THAT DECISION-MAKING PROCESS. WITH REGARD TO THE
- 9 IMPORTANCE OF THE PARATRANSIT CONNECTING WITH THE CLIPPER
- 10 PROCESS, THAT'S VITAL. RIGHT NOW THERE ARE MANY PARATRANSIT
- 11 SYSTEMS THAT ARE NOT CONNECTED TO THE CLIPPER PROCESS. THAT
- 12 NEEDS TO CHANGE. WITH REGARD TO THE MOBILITY MANAGER, AGAIN,
- 13 THE COMMUNITY NEEDS TO BE A PART OF THAT DISCUSSION. DEPENDING
- 14 ON WHICH MOBILITY MANAGER IS CHOSEN, THAT COULD BE SOMETHING
- 15 THAT IS POSITIVE TO THE COMMUNITY, OR NOT POSITIVE TO THE
- 16 COMMUNITY, BASED ON HOW EVERYTHING COMES TOGETHER. AND, SO, MY
- 17 THEME TODAY IS TO BE SURE AS ALL THESE PROCESSES MOVE FORWARD,
- 18 THE COMMUNITY NEEDS TO HAVE MORE THAN JUST ONE WAY OF WEIGHING
- 19 IN. AND WITH THAT, I THANK THE COMMITTEE FOR MY OPPORTUNITY TO
- 20 SPEAK. THANK YOU.
- 21
- 22 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER IS ADINA LEVIN.
- 23 PLEASE UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.



- 1 ADINA LEVIN: HELLO. GOOD AFTERNOON. AND LIKE PREVIOUS
- 2 SPEAKERS, I'M GLAD TO SEE THAT THIS IMPORTANT TOPIC IS WITHIN
- 3 YOUR PURVIEW AND ENCOURAGE KEEPING THAT FRONT AND CENTER.
- 4 ALONG THE LINES OF THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER AND ENDORSING
- 5 EVERYTHING THAT MR. CUSHMAN SAID, IN ADDITION TO THAT, WITH
- 6 BETTER WORK AND SUPPORT FOR CLIPPER, STANDARDIZING ELIGIBILITY
- 7 ACROSS DIFFERENT AGENCIES IS EXCELLENT. AND THEN, BEYOND THAT,
- 8 I BELIEVE THAT WITH THE CLIPPER PROGRAM, ITSELF, THEY'RE
- 9 POTENTIALLY LOOKING AT OTHER WAYS OF EASING ELIGIBILITY AND
- 10 QUALIFICATIONS. FOR EXAMPLE, IF THERE IS A LOW-INCOME PERSON
- 11 THAT IS ON MEDICAL, AND IT'S THE SAME THRESHOLD, THEY SHOULD
- 12 ALSO BE ABLE TO QUALIFY FOR THOSE DISCOUNTS. AND YOU KNOW,
- 13 LIKEWISE, IF SOMEONE IS ELIGIBLE FOR A VARIETY OF BENEFITS
- 14 THROUGH, YOU KNOW, OTHER PROGRAMS, LIKE CAL-FRESH, OR THE VA,
- 15 THERE IS OPPORTUNITY TO TAKE THIS EVEN TO THE NEXT LEVEL. GLAD
- 16 TO SEE ITEM 24 UP IN THE SUMMER IN TERMS OF IDENTIFYING
- 17 ADDITIONAL CHALLENGES AND ADDITIONAL POTENTIAL REFORMS. YOU
- 18 KNOW, AS WE'RE SEEING, AS NETWORK MANAGEMENT, THERE ARE A
- 19 VARIETY OF OPPORTUNITIES TO STREAMLINE WAYS OF WORKING
- 20 TOGETHER, AS PART OF THE STANDARD GENERAL PURPOSE PUBLIC
- 21 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM, AND THERE IS, YOU KNOW, POTENTIALLY
- 22 MORE IN THE ACCESSIBLE TRANSPORTATION. AND, LASTLY, IN TERMS
- 23 OF EQUITY, IT'S NOT ONLY ABOUT PROVIDING DISCOUNTS, BUT
- 24 LOOKING AT WHAT PARTS OF THE SYSTEM MAY HAVE BEEN INACCESSIBLE



- 1 FOR OTHER REASONS THAN COST AND IMPROVING ACCESS TO PUBLIC
- 2 TRANSPORTATION SYSTEM MORE BROADLY. THANK YOU

3

- 4 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
- 5 ONLINE AND THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.

6

- 7 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK.
- 8 COUNCIL MEMBERS? LET ME JUST -- I'M GOING TO DO A VISUAL SCAN
- 9 HERE OVER TO THE RIGHT. ANYBODY? COMMENTS? ADVICE? EPIPHANIES?
- 10 ON MY LEFT HERE? JEFF?

11

- 12 JEFFREY TUMLIN: OUICK ONE. THANK YOU TO STAFF, AARON MCMILLAN
- 13 WHO IS THE ACCESSIBILITY COORDINATOR AT MUNI HAS BEEN VERY
- 14 GRATEFUL TO ALL THE CONVERSATIONS GOING ON, AND I WANT TO
- 15 THANK MY COLLEAGUE MIKE HURSH, WITH WHOM MUNI HAS HAD A LONG-
- 16 STANDING ONE-SEAT RIDE PARTNERSHIP WITH EAST BAY PARATRANSIT.
- 17 WE'RE EAGER TO ADD TO THAT LIST. LIKE BEFORE, WHILE
- 18 CONSISTENCY IS A VALUE, I ALWAYS WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT WE'RE
- 19 PRIORITIZING THE RIDER AND RATHER THAN SETTING SIX
- 20 REQUIREMENTS THAT ARE THE SAME ACROSS AGENCIES, INSTEAD WE
- 21 LOOK AT FLOORS, OR MINIMUM STANDARDS, AND ALLOW THOSE OF US
- 22 WHO ARE INTERESTED IN GOING WELL BEYOND ADA THE REQUIREMENTS,
- 23 THAT WE ARE ALLOWED TO CONTINUE TO DO SO.

24

25 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANKS JEFF. VICE CHAIR?



1	
2	V. CHAIR, APRIL CHAN: MAYBE JUST A QUICK QUESTION. THANKS,
3	TEAM, FOR PUTTING THIS TOGETHER. SO, IT SEEMS LIKE WHAT WE'RE
4	TRYING TO DO IS LOOK FOR, POSSIBLY SOME MORE PILOTS. AND I
5	GUESS MY QUESTION IS, WHAT IS THE TIMELINE AND WHO IS GOING TO
6	BE SELECTING THE PILOTS? IT SOUNDS LIKE IT'S, SORT OF, THIS
7	OPERATOR/MTC TEAM AND THEN BRING THE RECOMMENDATIONS BACK TO
8	THE COUNCIL? I JUST WANT TO CONFIRM THAT?
9	
10	MELANIE CHOY: CORRECT. WE PLAN TO COME BACK LATER THIS YEAR
11	BUT IN TERMS OF DEVELOPING THE PROJECTS THEMSELVES, THE
12	PILOTS, IT'S NOT GOING TO BE A CALL FOR PROJECTS NECESSARILY,
13	BUT REALLY THINKING THROUGH WHAT MAKES SENSE TO TEST OUT AND
14	THERE IS SOME CURRENT DATA COLLECTION BEING DONE BY THE
15	AGENCIES AND JOHN IS WORKING WITH DRENNAN TO GET THE TRIP DATA
16	IN THAT SPACE SO WE CAN DESIGN PILOTS THAT LOOK AT DIFFERENT
17	THINGS. SO, THAT IS THE INTENT IS TO CODEVELOP THE SCOPE.
18	
19	CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: JOHN, THE APPLICATION THAT WE HAVE IN
20	WITH CALTRANS, THE ROADWAY COMPANY, IS THAT IN FOR THE
21	PLANNING GRANT OR THE POST-PROCESS SOMETHING HAVE WE APPLIED
22	FOR THAT GRANT YET?
23	
24	SPEAKER: YEAH.



CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: WHEN DID IT GO IN? DO YOU KNOW? AND WHEN 1 2 IS THE RESPONSE DUE? I'M ASKING JOHN, BUT MELANIE YOU MAY 3 KNOW. SORRY ABOUT THAT. 4 5 SPEAKER: I KNOW WE'RE EXPECTING SOMETIME EARLY IN THE SUMMER. I'M NOT EXACTLY SURE WHEN THE THING WAS SUBMITTED. 6 7 8 MELANIE CHOY: THESE ARE THE ANNUAL CALTRANS PLANNING GRANTS THAT ARE SUBMITTED THROUGHOUT THE REGION AND, IN PARTICULAR 9 THIS YEAR MTC THROUGH -- I CAN'T RECALL WHICH CATEGORY IT WAS, 10 BUT IT WAS THE CATEGORY THAT MPOS PARTNER WITH ANOTHER AGENCY 11 ON SUBMITTING, IT'S THAT PARTICULAR CATEGORY ON TRANSIT, THAT 12 IS THOSE ANNOUNCEMENTS, I THINK, ARE GOING TO BE HAPPENING, I 13 THOUGHT, LATER SUMMER, EARLY FALL. AND WE HOPE THAT THEY -- WE 14 15 -- THE APPLICATION WAS FOR THE EVALUATION COMPONENT OF ONE-16 SEAT RIDE. SO, WE'RE HOPING TO BE ABLE TO EVALUATE THE PROGRAMS THROUGH THAT GRANT. 17 18 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: SO, LET ME JUST PUT SOMETHING OUT THERE 19 FOR YOU TO NAVIGATE. I THINK THIS COUNCIL WOULD BE VERY 20 21 SUPPORTIVE OF A SUPPORT LETTER, WITH OUR SIGNATURES OR OUR --WHAT DO YOU CALL IT? LABELS OR OUR PICTURES? LOGOS. SORRY. 22 THANKS JEFF -- ON THERE SUPPORTING THAT APPLICATION WITH 23 CALTRANS. AND I THINK WE COULD -- WE, MEANING YOU AND JOHN, 24

COULD COME UP WITH THAT LETTER EASILY. I SEE A BUNCH OF HEAD



- 1 NODDING HERE. I SEE NOBODY IN OPPOSITION TO THAT. SO, THAT
- 2 MIGHT BE HELPFUL. OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT. AND THAT COMPLETES
- 3 THIS ITEM. JOHN, WELCOME TO THE FAMILY. AND A VERY NICE
- 4 PRESENTATION. SO, MELANIE, DIRECTOR CHOY, I GUESS THAT BRINGS
- 5 US TO AGENDA ITEM 4C WHICH IS OUR COUNCIL WORKPLAN PROGRESS
- 6 REPORT. AND I AM GOING TO TURN THIS OVER TO FRAME THIS UP WITH
- 7 ALLISON.

8

- 9 MELANIE CHOY: GREAT. THANK YOU, CHAIR POWERS. ALLISON WILL
- 10 GIVE A BRIEF UPDATE THIS MONTH, BUT REALLY WHAT'S IN YOUR
- 11 PACKET IS THE BEGINNINGS OF OUR QUARTERLY REPORTS IN TERMS OF
- 12 OUR ACTIONS ON THE PROGRESS REPORT. AND I'LL TURN IT OVER TO
- 13 ALLISON TO GIVE AN OVERVIEW.

- 15 ALLISON QUACH: ALL RIGHTY. GREAT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, AS
- 16 MELANIE MENTIONED, THIS IS THE FIRST OF WHAT WILL BE QUARTERLY
- 17 PROGRESS UPDATES ON YOUR WORKPLAN. AND THIS PRESENTATION IS
- 18 GOING TO BE A VERY HIGH-LEVEL OVERVIEW, ATTACHMENT A IN YOUR
- 19 PACKET PROVIDES MUCH MORE DETAIL WITH UPDATES ON EACH OF THE
- 20 INDIVIDUAL WORKPLAN ACTIVITIES. WHAT WE HAVE UP HERE RIGHT NOW
- 21 IS JUST A REMINDER OF THE WORKPLAN THAT WAS ADOPTED THAT WILL
- 22 EXTEND THROUGH JUNE 2025. AND THAT WAS ENDORSED AND ADOPTED IN
- 23 DECEMBER. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. OKAY. SO THIS SLIDE IS THE HIGH-
- 24 LEVEL OVERVIEW OF RECENT AND UPCOMING ACTIVITIES. THIS IS
- 25 GROUPED AT THE INITIATIVE LEVEL. BUT AS I MENTIONED,



- 1 ATTACHMENT A HAS MUCH MORE DETAIL ABOUT INDIVIDUAL ACTIONS.
- 2 WE'RE USING A SERIES OF ICONS THAT, AT A HIGH-LEVEL INDICATE
- 3 THE STATUS OF VARIOUS WORKPLAN ACTIVITIES, WHETHER THAT'S IN
- 4 INITIAL DISCUSSIONS AND SCOPING, PLANNING, WORKING TOWARDS
- 5 PILOT AND PROGRAM LAUNCH, OR EVALUATION AND REFINEMENT. AND,
- 6 SO, I'M NOT GOING TO READ THROUGH ALL OF THIS TEXT, BUT WILL
- 7 RATHER GIVE JUST, KIND OF, HIGHLIGHT THE KEY POINTS FOR EACH
- 8 OF THE CATEGORIES. SO, UNDER A KIND OF RNM COUNCIL MANAGEMENT,
- 9 WE WILL BE COMING BACK TO THIS BODY FOR FEEDBACK AS WE UPDATE
- 10 THE TRANSFORMATION ACTION PLAN THIS SUMMER AND MAKE
- 11 ADJUSTMENTS BASED ON HOW THE ACTION PLAN IS PROGRESSING. FOR
- 12 THE FARE INTEGRATION CATEGORY, MUCH OF THE WORK HAS BEEN IN
- 13 EVALUATING AND ASSESSING THE CLIPPER START AND CLIPPER BAY
- 14 PASS PILOT AND IDENTIFYING STRATEGIES TO EVOLVE THESE
- 15 PROGRAMS. AND YOU KNOW, THERE WILL BE AN UPDATE LATER THIS
- 16 AFTERNOON AT THE FARE INTEGRATION TASK FORCE ON THESE
- 17 ACTIVITIES. UNDER CUSTOMER INFORMATION, A LOT OF THE WORK HAS
- 18 BEEN IN PREPARING TO LAUNCH MAPPING AND WAYFINDING PROTOTYPES
- 19 AND TO DEVELOP AN APPROACH FOR WIDER PILOTS. AND STAFF WILL BE
- 20 BRINGING AN UPDATE IN THE NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS ON THIS
- 21 PROJECT. UNDER TRANSIT NETWORK, WE KIND OF HAVE TWO KEY
- 22 ACTIVITIES I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT. THE FIRST IS IN TRANSIT
- 23 PRIORITY IMPLEMENTATION: THE BUS ACCELERATED INFRASTRUCTURE
- 24 DELIVERY, OR BUSAID PROGRAM WILL BE COMING TO THIS BODY IN THE
- 25 NEXT COUPLE OF MONTHS WITH AN UPDATE INCLUDING PROJECT FUNDING



1	RECOMMENDATIONS.	AND	THEN	TRANSIT	2.050	PLUS.	THE	PROJECT

- 2 PERFORMANCE AND NETWORK PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT IS UNDERWAY AND
- 3 STAFF ARE DEVELOPING A DRAFT RECOMMENDED NETWORK, AS WELL. AND
- 4 THIS ITEM WILL BE COMING BACK TO THE COUNCIL IN THE NEXT FEW
- 5 MONTHS FOR FEEDBACK, AS WELL. I'M GOING TO SKIP OVER THE
- 6 ACCESSIBILITY ITEMS, SINCE THE PREVIOUS ITEM WAS AN UPDATE ON
- 7 THAT. AND THEN UNDER FUNDING, WHAT I WANT TO HIGHLIGHT IS THAT
- 8 MTC APPROVED A FUNDING PLAN TO ADDRESS TRANSIT OPERATOR
- 9 FUNDING SHORTFALLS. AND, AS YOU KNOW, REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION
- 10 MEASURE DISCUSSIONS ARE UNDERWAY WITH SENATORS WIENER AND
- 11 WAHAB ANNOUNCING SENATE BILL 1031 LAST WEEK. FINALLY UNDER
- 12 THIS CATEGORY WE'RE LOOKING AT CAP FUNDING AS PROJECTS
- 13 PROGRESS AND THIS WILL BE COORDINATED WITH THE TRANSFORMATION
- 14 ACTION PLAN UPDATE THAT I ALLUDED TO THAT WILL BE UNDERWAY
- 15 THIS SUMMER. THAT CONCLUDES THE UPDATE. HAPPY TO TAKE ANY
- 16 QUESTIONS.
- 17
- 18 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT UPDATE WHERE WE ARE
- 19 WITH OUR WORKPLAN PROGRESS UPDATE AS WE DEVELOP THE WORK PLANS
- 20 I WOULD REMIND US ALL, ALLISON, AND MELANIE, THIS COUNCIL
- 21 ASKED FOR, YOU KNOW, QUARTERLY UPDATES. SO, THANK YOU FOR
- 22 LISTENING AND AGENDAIZING THAT FOR THIS MEETING. MADAM CLERK,
- 23 PUBLIC COMMENT ON THIS ITEM



CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES WE HAVE ONE HAND RAISED. ADINA 1 2 LEVIN, YOU MAY START TO UNMUTE YOURSELF TO SPEAK. AND I WILL 3 PUT THE TIMER UP. 4 5 SPEAKER: HELLO. SO, IT'S GOOD TO SEE THE PROGRESS ON THE VARIOUS DIFFERENT ITEMS. ONE TOPIC I WOULD LIKE TO ELEVATE AND 6 SEE IN FUTURE UPDATES IS AT THE IMPORTANT INTERSECTION OF 7 8 FUNDING AND COMMUNICATIONS. OBVIOUSLY, THERE IS A FAIR AMOUNT OF WORK TO DO IN HASHING OUT SB1031 AND BRINGING THAT ACROSS 9 THE FINISH LINE IN THE LEGISLATURE FOR THE AUTHORIZING 10 LEGISLATION FOR A MEASURE. AND MEANWHILE, WHAT WE KNOW FROM 11 POLLING IS THAT VOTER CONFIDENCE IS EXTREMELY IMPORTANT IN 12 CHANGING AND IMPROVING THE LIKELIHOOD THAT PEOPLE WILL VOTE 13 FOR FUNDING. AND, THEREFORE, HAVING A COMMUNICATIONS PLAN THAT 14 IS PROACTIVELY COMMUNICATING ALL OF THE GOOD THINGS THAT ARE 15 16 OCCURRING, AGENCY BY AGENCY, AND, ALSO, COLLABORATIVELY UNDER THE PURVIEW EVER NETWORK MANAGEMENT IS REALLY IMPORTANT. AND 17 COMMUNICATING THAT GOOD NEWS WILL HELP TO ELEVATE THAT VOTER 18 CONFIDENCE IN COMING UP WITH A COMMUNICATIONS PLAN FOR WHAT 19 THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT WANTS TO HIGHLIGHT AND COMMUNICATE AND 20 EVEN WANTS TO MAKE SURE TO GET DONE IN ORDER TO HIGHLIGHT AND 21 COMMUNICATE WILL BE REALLY HELPFUL IN HAVING A POSITIVE IMAGE 22 23 IN THE PUBLIC FOR THE WAY THAT PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION IS IMPROVING IN ORDER TO INCREASE THAT VOTER CONFIDENCE AND 24

INCREASE THE LIKELIHOOD THAT VOTERS WILL FUND PUBLIC



TRANSPORTATION WHICH IS SO NEEDED FOR SO MANY REASONS. THANK 1 2 YOU. 3 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS 4 5 ONLINE. 6 7 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT, MADAM CLERK. 8 COUNCIL MEMBERS, COMMENTS, EPIPHANIES, CONCERNS? NOT SEEING ANY. VICE CHAIR? OKAY, ALLISON. WELL DONE. I THINK THAT WAS 9 OUR FIRST QUARTERLY REPORT WHERE WE ARE WITH OUR WORKPLAN. SO, 10 THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THAT UPDATE. MADAM CLERK THAT BRINGS 11 US TO AGENDA ITEM NUMBER FIVE WHICH IS OUR DIRECTORS REPORT 12 FROM DIRECTOR CHOY. 13 14 MELANIE CHOY: GREAT. THANK YOU CHAIR POWERS. THIS SHOULD BE 15 16 LESS THAN FIVE MINUTES. FIRST, I WANTED TO HIGHLIGHT -- I WON'T GO INTO ANY OTHER PROJECT UPDATES SINCE THAT HAS BEEN 17 COVERED DURING THIS MEETING. BUT MANY OF YOU RECEIVED A PUBLIC 18 SURVEY FROM CALTRANS SOLICITING FEEDBACK FROM THEIR TRANSIT 19 PLAN. SO I WANTED TO CALL THIS OUT AND FLAG IT FOR ALL OF YOU 20 IN THAT WE'RE COORDINATING WITH THEIR STAFF BOTH ON THE 21 22 TRANSIT 2050+ PROJECT AS WELL AS OUR OWN TRANSIT PRIORITY WORK. THEIR TRANSIT PLAN IS SPECIFICALLY FOR DISTRICT FOUR IN 23 THE BAY AREA AND IT WAS KICKED OFF AROUND THE SAME TIME WHEN 24

WE -- I THINK ABOUT A YEAR AGO WHEN WE STARTED THE TRANSIT



- 1 2050+ EFFORT, AS WELL. THEY'RE FOCUSED ON STATE HIGHWAY
- 2 SYSTEM, AND THEY'RE CURRENTLY IN THIS PUBLIC FEEDBACK PHASE OF
- 3 THE WORK. SO, IN SUBSEQUENT MEETINGS AND IN SUBSEQUENT
- 4 PRESENTATIONS ON TRANSIT PRIORITY, WE PLAN TO BRING YOU AND
- 5 STATE ON SOME OF THE WORK AND COORDINATION THAT IS HAPPENING
- 6 BETWEEN THEIR EFFORT AND OUR EFFORTS. SO I WANTED TO CALL THAT
- 7 OUT FOR YOU. SECONDLY, I AGAIN, WELCOME JOHN SANDERSON, WE'RE
- 8 EXCITED TO HAVE HIM JOIN US IN THIS WORK. BUT I WOULD LIKE TO
- 9 HIGHLIGHT AND ELEVATE AND EXPRESS APPRECIATION FOR ALL OF THE
- 10 UNOFFICIAL STAFF MEMBERS, TOO, THAT WE'RE WORKING WITH AT YOUR
- 11 AGENCIES OF BECAUSE THIS WORK HAS TAKEN A LOT OF FOLKS AND A
- 12 LOT OF ENERGY FROM A LOT OF US. AND, SO, IN ADDITION TO THE
- 13 NAMED LIAISONS AND CO-PMS, WE, VERY MUCH, APPRECIATE BEING
- 14 ABLE TO HAVE ACCESS TO YOUR STAFF AND WORK WITH YOUR STAFF. ON
- 15 ANOTHER EXCITING NOTE, I'M EXCITED TO ANNOUNCE AND
- 16 CONGRATULATE AND WELCOME BILL BACON, WHO IS OUR NEWEST
- 17 ASSISTANT DIRECTOR. WE HAD TWO POSITIONS THAT WE WERE
- 18 RECRUITING FOR, AND BILL BACON STARTED AS OUR NEWEST ASSISTANT
- 19 DIRECTOR. HE WILL BE FOCUSED. HE'LL CONTINUE TO PLAY IN
- 20 INTEGRAL ROLE ON OUR TEAM ADVANCING REGIONAL STRATEGIES, BUT
- 21 IN PARTICULAR WILL CONTINUE TO LEAD FARE INTEGRATION WORK.
- 22 THEN NEXT MONTH, I HOPE TO BRING BACK ADDITIONAL UPDATES.
- 23 WE'RE COLLABORATING WITH MTC WITH OUR TRANSIT PRIORITY STAFF
- 24 AND OTHER SECTIONS AT MTC AND PULLING THOSE STAFF INTO THIS



WORK AS WELL. WE LOOK FORWARD TO GROWING OUR EXPERTISE IN 1 2 WORKING ON RNM. 3 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: THANK YOU FOR THAT REPORT, DIRECTOR 4 5 CHOY. MADAM CLERK, WHY DON'T WE CHECK IN WITH THE PUBLIC 6 COMMENT VIRTUALLY OR IN-PERSON ON THIS ITEM? 7 8 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THERE IS NO PUBLIC COMMENTS IN WRITING THE THERE IS NOBODY RAISED WITH THEIR HANDS, AND THERE IS NO 9 10 ONE IN THE ROOM FOR THIS ITEM. 11 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. THANK YOU FOR THAT. COMMITTEE 12 MEMBERS, COUNCIL MEMBERS, COMMENTARY? OKAY. NOT SEEING ANY. 13 THANK YOU, MELANIE, FOR THAT REPORT. WE'RE ON AGENDA ITEM 14 15 NUMBER SIX. I WILL NOW ASK THE CLERK IF SHE HAS RECEIVED ANY 16 PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANYTHING THAT HASN'T BEEN ON THE AGENDA VIRTUALLY OR IN PERSON. 17 18 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: WE HAVE ONE PUBLIC COMMENTER HERE IN THE 19 20 ROOM, ALETA DUPREE. SHE WILL COME TO THE PODIUM. 21 22 SPEAKER: THANKS AGAIN, CHAIR BOB POWERS AND MEMBERS. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD. SHE AND HER WITH TEAM FOLD. SPEAK 23 GENERALLY. GOOD MEETING TODAY. GETTING LOTS OF WORK DONE 24

TODAY. LOOKING FORWARD TO THE NEXT ONE. SO, THIS CONCEPT STILL



- 1 A BIT CLEAR AS MUD TO ME. BUT IT'S NOT AS MUDDY AS IT WAS WHEN
- 2 WE FIRST STARTED. JUST LIKE FARE INTEGRATION, THIS IS GOING TO
- 3 BE CLEAR OVER TIME. AND, SO, AS I INTERPRET THE WORDS OF
- 4 NETWORK MANAGEMENT, WHAT DOES THIS MEAN? HOW CAN WE TRY NOT TO
- 5 CONFUSE THIS WITH THE GROWING ISSUE OUT IN THE WORLD THAT'S
- 6 BEING RAISED OF CONSOLIDATION? WHICH IS A WHOLE 'NOTHER TOPIC
- 7 FOR ANOTHER TIME. AND WHAT WILL THAT LOOK LIKE? I SEEK AFTER A
- 8 SENSE OF CONSISTENCY. THERE ARE VERY FEW JURISDICTIONS THAT
- 9 HAVE ONE AGENCY THAT REALLY SERVES THE WHOLE AREA. DENVER IS
- 10 ONE. DENVER RTD, BASICALLY DOES IT ALL. CHICAGO, THERE IS TWO
- 11 GROUPS, CTA AND PACE. BUT EVEN IN NEW YORK, YOU HAVE A GROUP
- 12 OF DIFFERENT SYSTEMS. IT'S NOT JUST THE MTA. IT'S NOT JUST NEW
- 13 JERSEY TRANSIT THAT YOU HAVE, SOME FERRIES, AND PATH, AND A
- 14 COUPLE OF OTHER SYSTEMS. AND, SO, THIS IS ABOUT STREAMLINING
- 15 THINGS. WAYFINDING IS ESSENTIAL, TO ME. I THINK BACK TO BEING
- 16 IN THE DENVER AIRPORT WHEN A SIGN WAS MISSING, AND I WAS
- 17 ASKING, "HOW DO I GET THE TRAIN TO THE CITY? THE A-LINE?"
- 18 WELL, THEY SHOWED ME HOW TO GET THERE. SINCE THEN, I AM
- 19 FAMILIAR WITH THE AIRPORT AND HAVE USED THE A-LINE OUITE A
- 20 BIT. BUT NEW PEOPLE ARE DISCOVERING NEW THINGS ON ALL THESE
- 21 DIFFERENT SYSTEMS. NETWORKING IS, HOPEFULLY, JUST THAT,
- 22 BUILDING UP BETTER NETWORK. THANK YOU
- 24 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. NEXT SPEAKER ONLINE IS WARREN
- 25 CUSHMAN. YOU MAY UNMUTE YOURSELF. YOU HAVE TWO MINUTES.



1 2 WARREN CUSHMAN: ALL RIGHT. YOU CAN HEAR ME? 3 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: YES. THANK YOU. 4 5 WARREN CUSHMAN: HELLO MEMBERS. YOU KNOW, ALETA INSPIRED ME TO 6 COME FORWARD -- (LAUGHTER) -- AND SAY A FEW WORDS ABOUT SOME 7 8 OF THESE THINGS. FIRST OF ALL, THIS WHOLE QUESTION OF CONSOLIDATION VERSUS AND/OR COORDINATION THE MTC HAS BEEN 9 GRAPPLING FOR A BIT NOW, YOU KNOW, WITH A BACKDROP OF SENATOR 10 WAHAB AND EMPHASIS ON CONSOLIDATION AND, SORT OF, BRINGING 11 THAT TO THE FORE, AND YOU KNOW, A COUPLE OF MONTHS BACK, THE 12 MTC COMMISSION BEING CLEAR THAT COORDINATION WAS A DIRECTION 13 THE COMMISSION WANTED TO GO. IT'S INTERESTING, I THINK THAT 14 15 THAT DISCUSSION IS REALLY A BACKDROP, IN MY VIEW, TO THIS 16 WHOLE NETWORK MANAGEMENT REALM. I THINK THE TWO DISCUSSIONS HAVE TO BE PAIRED TOGETHER. AND I DO THINK THAT WE NEED TO BE 17 THINKING IN A LARGE WAY ABOUT HOW ALL OF THIS -- ALL OF THESE 18 DIFFERENT PIECES FIT TOGETHER. AND WHAT KINDS OF SERVICE ARE 19 WE REALLY TALKING ABOUT, YOU KNOW, HOW WILL THIS ACTUALLY 20 STACK UP. HOW MANY AGENCIES ARE THERE GOING TO BE AT THE END 21 OF THE DAY? WHAT KIND OF SERVICE ARE WE TALKING ABOUT? IS IT 22 GOING TO BE MORE BUSES THAN RAIL? IS IT GOING TO BE MORE 23 SMALLER KINDS OF TRIPS? ARE WE TALKING ABOUT EVENING AND 24 25 WEEKENDS SERVICE, RATHER THAN COMMUTE TRIPS? I MEAN, THERE ARE



- 1 ALL KIND OF DIFFERENT IDEAS AND WAYS THAT THIS BEING GO. AND
- 2 I'M VERY INTERESTED IN THAT, SORT OF, OVERARCHING DIALOGUE.
- 3 AND ONE THING I WOULD LEAVE YOU WITH IS THAT THE COMMITTEE
- 4 PLAYS A PIVOTAL ROLE IN ALL OF THIS. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE MTC, WE
- 5 HAVE THE ELECTED'S, WE HAVE THE OPERATORS, WE HAVE THE USUAL
- 6 PLAYERS, BUT THE COMMUNITY WILL BE PART OF THIS DISCUSSION.
- 7 I'M VERY HAPPY TO BE ONE OF A NUMBER OF ACTIVISTS IN THE
- 8 COMMUNITY THAT NEED TO BE A PART OF THIS DISCUSSION. KEEPING
- 9 IN MIND THIS WE DO ABSOLUTELY HAVE TO HAVE MORE FUNDING. AND
- 10 BUT KNOW, THAT DISCUSSION IS ALSO MOVING FORWARD. AND JUST A
- 11 REMINDER THAT WE ALSO HAVE AN IMPORTANT HOUSING BOND THAT WE
- 12 NEED TO BE THINKING ABOUT PASSING AT THE END OF THIS YEAR.
- 13 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.
- 15 CLERK, WALLY CHARLES: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO OTHER SPEAKERS
- 16 ONLINE. THERE WAS NOTHING RECEIVED IN WRITING.
- 18 CHAIR, ROBERT POWERS: OKAY. WE'LL CLOSE OFF ITEM NUMBER SIX.
- 19 THAT BRINGS US TO ITEM NUMBER SEVEN, WHICH ADJOURNMENT AND THE
- 20 NEXT MEETING. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE NETWORK MANAGEMENT
- 21 COUNCIL IS SET FOR MONDAY, APRIL 22ND. IT WILL BE AT 11:30 AND
- 22 IT WILL BE OVER AT THE BARR HEADQUARTERS. WITH THAT, THIS
- 23 MEETING IS ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

24

14





Broadcasting Government