METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

Meeting Transcript

METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION

BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 22, 2023 9:45 AM

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: IT IS STILL MORNING. I'M GOING TO CALL TO ORDER THE BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE AND FINANCING AUTHORITY. MY NAME IS CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA, ALONG WITH V. CHAIR, NICK JOSEFOWITZ, OUR VICE CHAIR. PLEASE PLAY THE ANNOUNCEMENT. [RECORDED MEETING PROCEDURES ANNOUNCEMENT] THIS MEETING WILL BE CONDUCTED AS A HYBRID MEETING A ZOOM WEBINAR LINK HAS BEEN PROVIDED AS WELL AS ACCOMMODATIONS FOR IN-PERSON ATTENDANCE. THIS MEETING IS ALSO BEING WEBCAST ON THE METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION WEB SITE. COMMISSIONERS AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATION BY ZOOM, WISHING TO SPEAK, SHOULD USE THE RAISE HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR 9, AND THE CHAIR WILL CALL UPON THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER. IT IS REQUESTED THAT PUBLIC SPEAKERS STATE THEIR NAMES AND ORGANIZATION, BUT, PROVIDING SUCH INFORMATION IS VOLUNTARY. WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENTS RECEIVED AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5 P.M., YESTERDAY, WILL BE POSTED TO THE ONLINE AGENDA AND ENTERED INTO THE RECORD, BUT WILL NOT BE READ OUT LOUD. A ROLL CALL VOTE WILL BE TAKEN FOR ALL ACTION ITEMS. PANELISTS AND ATTENDEES SHOULD NOTE THAT THE CHAT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

FEATURE IS NOT ACTIVE. IN ORDER TO PARTICIPATE, PLEASE MAKE SURE YOUR APPLICATION IS UP TO DATE.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU IT TEAM. WE'RE GOING TO MOVE TO ROLL CALL.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR PEDROZA?

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: HE HAD TO STEP OUT.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN?

EDDIE AHN: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?

DAVID CANEPA: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAVEZ?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: EL-TAWANSY? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER FLEMING? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GIACOPINI?

DORENE M. GIACOPINI: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: GLOVER?

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOULTON PETERS?

STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD:

JAMES P. SPERING: HERE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THAO IS ABSENT.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: CHAIR'S REPORT. NONE. CONSENT CALENDAR. ITEMS 2A THROUGH THREE B. DISCUSSION ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR? SEEING NONE. PUBLIC COMMENT?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I HAVE KYLE BAKER WITH A HAND RAISED.

SPEAKER: KYLE BAKER CUSTOM ONE JUST WANT TO SAY HELLO GOOD MORNING TO EVERYONE THANK YOU FOR READING MY COMMENTS HAPPY TO BE HERE AT THE MTC HYBRID MEETING AND SITTING AND LISTENING TO EVERYTHING THAT'S TRANSPIRING THIS AFTERNOON. THAT'S ALL I HAVE TO SAY.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU MR. BAKER. SEEING NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED MR. CHAIR.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: LOOKING FOR A MOTION AND SECOND TO APPROVE THE CONSENT CALENDAR.

DAVID RABBITT: SO MOVED, RABBITT.

CINDY CHAVEZ: CHAVEZ SECONDS.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: SECOND BY CHAVEZ. ROLL CALL VOTE, PLEASE?

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PEDROZA?

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN?

EDDIE AHN: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER FLEMING IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

FEDERAL GLOVER: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY.

NATHAN MILEY: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER MOULTON-PETERS?

STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES, WITH ABSTENTION TO 3A.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER NOACK?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SUE NOACK: YES, WITH ABSTENTION TO 3A, AS WELL.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RONEN?

HILLARY RONEN: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: SPERING?

JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES WITH TWO ABSTENTIONS FOR ITEM 3A.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ITEM 4A RESOLUTION 46, INFRASTRUCTURE, RECOMMENDING ESTABLISHING STANDING COMMITTEE ASSIST THE BAY AREA INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING AUTHORITY BUSINESS BY PROVIDING

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BY DETAILED REVIEW AND RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE AUTHORITY OF MATTERS RELATED TO TOLLING. LISA KLEIN WILL PRESENT.

LISA KLEIN: GREAT. GOOD MORNING COMMISSIONERS; YOU'RE RIGHT, IT IS STILL MORNING. BETTER THAN THE LAST TIME I WAS HERE. I'M LISA KLEIN DIRECTOR OF FIELD OPERATORS AND ASSET MANAGEMENT SECTION HERE AT MTC. THIS IS A PROPOSAL THAT I SHARED INFORMATION FOR LAST MONTH WE FINE TUNED IT AND ARE SEEKING YOUR APPROVAL TODAY. COULD I HAVE THE BROADCASTING TEAM BRING UP THE DECK, PLEASE? I SHOULD HAVE MENTIONED THAT EARLIER. THAT IS GOOD TIMING. ALL RIGHT. YOU CAN GO TO THE NEXT SLIDE? SO, JUST, YOU KNOW, A LITTLE BIT OF CONTEXT. IN APRIL OF LAST YEAR, THE BAIFA BOARD WAS RECONFIGURED SO THAT IT MATCHES THE MTC, THE COMMISSION BOARD. THAT WAS TO BE ABLE TO BETTER SERVE A PORTFOLIO THAT INCLUDES ON THE ONE HAND REGIONAL TOLLING COORDINATION, WHICH IS INCLUDES BUT IT'S NOT EXCLUSIVELY RELATED TO EXPRESS LANES IMPLEMENTATION AND OPERATION OF BOTH MTC'S EXPRESS LANES WHICH IS A CONTINUING ROLE AND FOR 37 WHEN TOLLING IS AUTHORIZED ON THAT ROAD. AND THEN THIRDLY FOR REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION FINANCING, SUCH AS THE PLANNED BART CAR FINANCING. WE ARE RECOMMENDING TODAY, TWO STANDING COMMITTEES TO ADDRESS THOSE TOLLING RULES. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THE FIRST ROLE RELATES TO THE REGIONAL TOLLING COORDINATION, OR SEAMLESS TOLLING AND THE GOAL HERE IS TO REALLY PUT THE CUSTOMER FIRST. IT'S AKIN IN MANY WAYS TO THE NETWORK

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

MANAGEMENT DISCUSSION ALTHOUGH THE MECHANISM IS A LITTLE DIFFERENT HERE AS SUCH IT IS REALLY A REGIONAL MATTER WITH POLICIES THAT DO SOMETIMES CROSS EXPRESS LANES ON THE BRIDGES. ADVISORY FORUM TO DISCUSS HOW OPERATORS CAN COORDINATE POLICIES DISCOUNTS, EQUITY, TOLL VIOLATION POLICIES, THAT WOULD BE APPROVED AND CARRIED OUT BY REGIONAL TOLL OPERATORS. IN ADDITION, THIS IS A FORUM FOR TOLL NETWORK PLANNING WHICH MAY IN THE FUTURE INCLUDE MORE WIDESPREAD TOLLING SUCH AS ENVISIONED IN PLANNED BAY AREA 2050 TO REDUCE GREENHOUSE GASSES AND OF COURSE THIS WOULD BE DONE IN CLOSE COORDINATION WITH REGIONAL TRANSIT AND IN PARTICULAR EXPRESS BUS PLANNING. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. THIS SLIDE IS ONE I HAVE SHOWN MANY TIMES. I USE IT BECAUSE IT'S AN ILLUSTRATION OF HOW COMPLICATED THE TOLLING POLICY LANDSCAPE IS. POLICIES SOMETIMES ALIGN AND SOMETIMES THEY DON'T, AND, SO, YOU KNOW, THE GOAL LEER IS REALLY TO BETTER UNDERSTAND -- FOR BAIFA TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THAT. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. THE SECOND ROLE, IN TOLLING, IS DELIVERING AND OPERATING LANES WHERE BAIFA HAS THE RESPONSIBILITY FOR TOLLING AND THAT STARTS WITH MTC'S EXPRESS LANES IN SOLANO, CONTRA COSTA, AND ALAMEDA COUNTIES, SHOWN IN COLOR ON THIS MAP. AND THIS IS REALLY THE NUTS AND BOLTS OF, YOU KNOW ADOPTING POLICIES FOR THOSE LANES ENGAGE CONTRACTORS TO BUILD AND OPERATE THEM AND DIRECTING USE OF TOLL REVENUE. NEXT SLIDE PLEASE. AS FOLKS KNOW, BAIFA IS PURSUING AUTHORITY FOR TOLLING ON THE INTERIM PROJECT ON STATE ROUTE 37. AND WHEN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

APPROVED, BAIFA'S RESPONSIBILITIES THERE WOULD REALLY MIRROR THE RESPONSIBILITIES FOR EXPRESS LANES. NEXT SLIDE, PLEASE. SO, THIS SLIDE SUMMARIZES THE RECOMMENDED COMMITTEE STRUCTURE. AGAIN, IT PRESENTS TWO -- TWO COMMITTEES, TWO STANDING COMMITTEES THAT ADDRESS THOSE TWO ASPECTS OF TOLLING. ON THE LEFT IS A PROPOSED REGIONAL TOLLING POLICY COMMITTEE THAT WOULD HANDLE THE COORDINATED PLANNING AND POLICY, AND WE ARE RECOMMENDING THAT THAT COMMITTEE INCLUDE REPRESENTATION FROM EACH COUNTY, BECAUSE THE FOCUS IS ON SEAMLESS TOLLING FROM THE CUSTOMER STANDPOINT, NOT THE OPERATOR STANDPOINT. THAT'S A SLIGHT ADJUSTMENT FROM THE PROPOSAL WE DESCRIBED LAST MONTH. AGAIN, WITH REPRESENTATION FROM EVERY COUNTY. AND THIS COMMITTEE, WE ENVISIONED WOULD MEET MAYBE 3 TO 6 TIMES A YEAR IT IS NOT A MONTHLY KIND OF A TOPIC. [LAUGHTER] WE BELIEVE. THE NEXT COMMITTEE SHOWN IN THE MIDDLE IS THE NETWORK AND OPERATIONS COMMITTEE. THIS IS THE COMMITTEE THAT WOULD FUNCTION MUCH LIKE THE BATA OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE RELATED TO THE, YOU KNOW, OPERATION, DAY-TO-DAY OPERATIONS OF THE MTC EXPRESS LANES NETWORK TO START AND STATE ROUTE 37 WHEN TOLLING IS AUTHORIZED THERE. ON THIS COMMITTEE WE'RE RECOMMENDING THAT EACH COUNTY THAT'S IN THOSE FACILITIES, IF YOU WILL, WOULD HAVE A SEAT ON THE COMMITTEE. SO THAT WOULD INCLUDE THE THREE COUNTIES IN THE MTC NETWORK, AGAIN, SOLANO, CONTRA COSTA, AND ALAMEDA. AND THEN ULTIMATELY WHEN THE 37 IS AUTHORIZED, THE THREE REPRESENTATIVES -- THREE DIGITAL REPRESENTATIVES MARIN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SONOMA AND NAPA, IN THE INTERIM, HOWEVER, UNTIL THAT TIME, WE ARE PROPOSING THAT THE CHAIR WOULD HAVE THE ABILITY TO APPOINT THREE AT-LARGE REPRESENTATIVES. THIS COMMITTEE WOULD LIKELY MEET MONTHLY. CALSTA PROPOSES A NON-VOTING MEMBER ON BOTH COMMITTEES BECAUSE IT'S SUCH AN IMPORTANT PARTNERSHIP. I WENT THROUGH THESE LAST TIME, IT, SORT OF, EMPHASIZES THE POINT YOU WANT TO ADVANCE THE SLIDE PLEASE, THE BROADCASTING TEAM, YOU KNOW, THAT THERE ARE MATTERS AT THE TWO TOP MATTERS, TOLL VIOLATION PENALTIES, AND, YOU KNOW, TOLL SCHEDULES, AND DISCOUNTS, THAT HAVE A SEAMLESS TOLLING ANGLE. WE WANT TO UNDERSTAND HOW THOSE FIT INTO THE BROADER CONTEXT SO THOSE WOULD RUN THROUGHOUT REGIONAL TOLLING COORDINATION COMMITTEE. THE NEXT TWO EXAMPLES ARE FINANCIAL MATTERS RELATED, SPECIFICALLY, TO MTC'S EXPRESS LANES. CONTRACTURAL MATTERS AND THOSE WOULD RUN THROUGH THAT NETWORK OPERATIONS COMMITTEE. AND LASTLY WE ENVISIONED THAT THE BART CAR FINANCING WOULD RUN DIRECTLY TO THE BAIFA BOARD NOT RUN THROUGH [INDISCERNIBLE] THAT CONCLUDES MY PRESENTATION. STAFF IS RECOMMENDING APPROVAL THE RESOLUTION 46 TO ESTABLISH THOSE STANDING COMMITTEES. IF APPROVED TODAY THEN THE CHAIR COULD APPOINT COMMISSIONERS TO THOSE COMMITTEES AND THEY COULD MEET IN APRIL.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU LISA. COMMISSIONERS? COMMISSIONER NOACK?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SUE NOACK: I APOLOGIZE, BEING NEW. I DON'T KNOW WHAT CHANGES WERE FROM THE LAST MEETING TO THIS, THE CHANGE IN THE FIRST COMMITTEE. IS THAT BEING DONE BECAUSE THEY'RE ANTICIPATING TO BE MORE TOLLING BROADER IN THE BAY AREA? OR -- I'M GUESSING THAT. LET'S PUT IT THAT WAY.

LISA KLEIN: YEAH IT'S A COMBINATION OF FACTORS. THE ORIGINAL PROPOSAL WAS TO HAVE A REPRESENTATIVE FROM EACH AUTHORIZED TOLLING ENTITY AND THAT WAS A LITTLE BIT AWKWARD THIS IS A LOT SIMPLER APPROACH AND WOULD RESULT IN EIGHT REPRESENTATIVES, YOU KNOW. WE THINK THE NEW PROPOSAL FROM EACH COUNTY, ONE MEMBER OF ALL COUNTIES DRIVING THE EXISTING POOL, RIGHT, THE GOLDEN GATE BRIDGE, BATA BRIDGES, AND EXPRESS LANES, AND EVENTUALLY 37. AND IN ADDITION THERE IS POTENTIAL MORE WIDESPREAD TOLLING AS WE WORK THROUGH RECOMMENDATION SUPERVISOR THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.

SUE NOACK: THANK YOU.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER SPERING?

JAMES P. SPERING: LISA THANK YOU FOR ALL YOUR WORK ON THIS AND THE OUTREACH. WE ENDED UP IN A GOOD PLACE. THE QUESTION I HAVE FOR OUR EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR, A LITTLE OFF OF THIS SUBJECT, ARE WE PURSUING TOLLING ON WEEKENDS AND HOLIDAYS? YOU KNOW, WHEN I

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

LOOK AT SOLANO COUNTY, AND ALL THE TRAFFIC THAT WE'RE GETTING THAT'S GOING TO TAHOE, COMING AND GOING ON THE WEEKENDS, A LOT OF THAT TRAFFIC IS DIVERTING INTO OUR LOCAL STREETS AND ROADS, AND WE'RE REALLY STARTING TO SEE AN IMPACT ON THAT. YOU KNOW, AS YOU KNOW, OUR EXPRESS LANES ARE UNDER CONSTRUCTION RIGHT NOW. I REALLY THINK THAT WE NEED TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THAT OPPORTUNITY TO HELP PAY FOR THE EXPRESS BUS SERVICE AND MANY OTHER OPPORTUNITIES. BUT IT'S JUST, A REVENUE SOURCE THAT I THINK SHOULD BE PURSUED. AND ONE THAT IMPACT IS HAVING A SERIOUS IMPACT ON OUR LOCAL STREETS AND ROADS IN SOLANO COUNTY.

ANDREW FREMIER: COMMISSIONER, ANDREW FREMIER, EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR. YOU AND I HAVE TALKED ABOUT THIS OVER THE YEAR AND I ASSURE YOU WE'RE EVALUATING FIRST THE QUESTION OF WHETHER OR NOT THE WEEKENDS AND THREE PLUS WORK IN SOLANO COUNTY AN ASSUMPTION THAT WE DO AND SO WE'RE DEFINITELY PURSUING THAT ULTIMATELY CALTRANS HAS SOME AUTHORITY TO TELL US WHAT WE CAN DO BUT WE ARE AGGRESSIVELY TAKING A LOOK AT IT BECAUSE WE AGREE TO PURSUE THAT FROM DAY ONE.

JAMES P. SPERING: THANK YOU.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ANY COMMISSIONER COMMENTS? SEEING NONE. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE PUBLIC COMMENT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. I SEE COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI'S HAND RAISED.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER?

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: THANK YOU. I WAS FEELING NEGLECTED. THE QUESTION FOR LISA, AT THE END OF HER PRESENTATION, ON SLIDE EIGHT AROUND THE BART CAR FINANCING SHE SAID THAT THE PLACE WHERE IT SHOULD BE ON THIS COMMITTEE AS OPENED TO SOMEWHERE ELSE, AND THE SOUND CUT OUT SO I DIDN'T HEAR WHERE ELSE SOMEWHERE ELSEWHERE THIS WAS NOT BEING RECOMMENDED.

LISA KLEIN: SURE HAPPY TO RESPOND THROUGHOUT CHAIR. THE WAY IT WOULD WORK THE BART CAR FINANCING WOULD GO DIRECTLY TO THE FULL BAIFA AUTHORITY AS OPPOSED TO ONE OF THE TWO PROPOSED STANDING COMMITTEES. AND THAT'S LONG BEEN THE CASE FOR THE TRACK RECORD TO BART -- [INDISCERNIBLE].

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: THANK YOU. I MISUNDERSTOOD IT BECAUSE THAT'S WHAT I DIDN'T HEAR WHAT YOU SAID AT THE END. THANK YOU FOR THAT CLARIFICATION.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU. FIRST BY COMMISSIONER SPERING. SECOND BY COMMISSIONER NOACK. ROLL CALL VOTE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR PEDROZA?

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: VICE CHAIR JOSEFOWITZ?

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: STEPPING OUT.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. AHN?

EDDIE AHN: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CANEPA?

DAVID CANEPA: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: DUTRA-VERNACI?

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: FLEMING IS ABSENT. GLOVER?

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MAHAN? IS ABSENT. MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS?

STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK?

SPEAKER: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RONEN? SPERING?

JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. PROCEED TO ITEM 4B EXPRESS CARPOOL CHECK SMART PHONE APP. STAFF PROVIDING UPDATE ON STATUS OF THE 680 CONTRA COSTA EXPRESS LANES CARPOOL VERIFICATION SMART PHONE PILOT INCLUDES OUTREACH VERIFICATION, PHASE ONE OF THE PILOT ALLOWING CARPOOLING PARTICIPANTS TO ENROLL IN A PILOT USING EXPRESS 680 CONTRA COSTA EXPRESS LANES WITH APP REGISTERED LICENSE PLATE AND FASTRAC. SARAH BURNSWORTH PRESENTING.

SARAH BURNSWORTH: GOOD MORNING. IF I CAN GET THE SLIDES PLEASE? GIVEN THE TIME I WILL PROVIDE AN ABBREVIATED REPORT. MORE DETAIL IS PROVIDED IN THE STAFF MEMO AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS AFTER THE PRESENTATION. I'LL COVER THREE ITEMS RELATED TO THE EXPRESS CARPOOL CHECK SMART PHONE APP PILOT FIRST HOW THE APP WORKS AND HOW WE HAVE EVOLVED IN OUR APPROACH TO THE PILOT. WHAT MAP SCALED DEPLOYMENT WOULD LOOK LIKE AND RECOMMENDATION FOR APPROVAL OF THE PHASE ONE PILOT ON THE 680 PRESS LANES. ONE IN 5 CARPOOL LANE USERS ARE VIOLATING OCCUPANCY REQUIREMENTS ARE CLOGGING UP LANES AND REDUCE EFFECTIVENESS FOR CARPOOLS AND TRANSIT, WE HAVE EXPLORING SMART PHONE APP IS TO SEE WHETHER IT COULD BE A VIABLE WAY TO ENSURE COMPLIANCE WITH THE EXPRESS LANES OCCUPANCY RULES

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

OPPORTUNITIES WITH VERIFICATION, POSSIBLE SCALE REDUCTION OPPORTUNITIES FOR PUNITIVE APPROACH, INCENTIVE VERIFICATION BASED APPROACH AND COMPLIANCE WITH RULES AND POSSIBILITY PHASING OF SWITCHABLE TRANSPONDER. BEFORE WE CAN EXPRESS POSSIBILITIES THE QUESTIONS WE'RE TRYING TO ANSWER WITH THIS PHASE ONE PILOT IS DOES CARPOOL VERIFICATION WORK? NEXT SLIDE. I'LL WALK YOU THROUGH THE BASIC OF HOW THE APP WORKS WITH THE PILOT TO GIVE AN IDEA OF THE USER EXPERIENCE STEPS TAKEN, LIGHT BLUE STEPS DONE BEFORE THE START OF THE TRIP RIGHT THREE SCREENS DARKER BLUE STEPS COMPLETED WHEN PARKED AT THE END OF THE TRIP. NO ACTIONS REQUIRED DURING THE TRIP AND THE APP FEATURES CANNOT BE ACCESSED WHILE VEHICLE IS IN MOTION. STARTING AT THE FAR LEFT BEFORE DRIVING THE USE CLICKS THE START CARPOOL BUTTON AT THE BOTTOM OPENS THE VERIFICATION CAMERA IN THE SECOND SCREEN CAMERA USED TO DETERMINE NUMBER OF REAL FACES AND PROXIMATE GEOMETRY OR OUTLINE UTILIZES OPTICAL SENSOR NO IMAGES ARE CAPTURED AS PART OF THE PROCESS. THIRD SCREEN VERIFICATION READY TO GO AP RUNS IN THE BACKGROUND, THE USER IS PROMPTED TO REVERIFY END OF THE CARPOOL FOURTH SCREEN CAMERA AGAIN OPENS CONFIRMS NUMBER OF FACES. LAST SCREEN CARPOOL CREDIT GRANTED AND ANY FACIAL GEOMETRY INFORMATION IS ERASED CARPOOL CREDIT REFERS TO PILOT INCENTIVE WHICH IS AN AMAZON GIFT CARD. ON THE NEXT SLIDE I'LL TALK ABOUT HOW THE APP USES FACIAL GEOMETRIES FOR THIS PILOT. FACIAL GEOMETRY USED TO CONFIRM CARPOOL OCCUPANTS AT THE BEGINNING ARE THE

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SAME AT THEN OF THE TRIP TO PREVENTION POSSIBILITY OF CHEATING THE SYSTEM RECOGNITION SENSITIVITY AROUND USE OF FACIAL GEOMETRY AND IMPORTANCE OF PRIVACY CONTROLS INCLUDING BEING CLEAR AND DIRECT WITH USERS AND SIGN UP PROCESS ABOUT THE TECHNOLOGY DATA PRIVACY AND PROTECTION. NEXT SLIDE. THIS SHOWS HOW FASTRAK IN THE APP STORE SIMILAR INFORMATION FASTRAK STORES SWITCH SETTINGS THE APP STORES NUMBER OF VERIFIED PEOPLE AND REALNESS MATCH PROBABILITIES. THE PILOT WILL NOT BE USED TO COLLECT TOLLS OR ACCESS ANY TOLL RELATED PENALTIES. NEXT CHANGED HOW WE APPROACHING THE PILOT INCORPORATING EQUITY INTO THE PHASE ONE PILOT WE HIRED AN EQUITY CONSULTANT TEAM CENTERING AROUND EQUITY AND RECEIVING FEEDBACK ON THE PILOT APPROACH APP ITSELF AND PLAN APPROACH AND EVALUATION WE PRESENTED TO MTC'S POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE TO HEAR THEIR THOUGHTS AND QUESTIONS ABOUT THE PILOT. AND ONE WAY THAT WE HAVE ADJUSTED OUR PLANS IS TO OPEN THE PILOT ENROLLMENT TO USERS WITHOUT A FASTRAK ACCOUNT AND THIS IS TO INCREASE ACCESS TO CARPOOLING IN EXPRESS LANES WHICH IS SOMETHING WE HADN'T PREVIOUSLY CONSIDERED FOR THE PILOT. NEXT SLIDE. ONE OF THE QUESTIONS THAT COMES UP IN DISCUSSIONS ABOUT VEHICLE OCCUPANCY DETECTION TECHNOLOGY AND APP TECHNOLOGY IN PARTICULAR IS WHAT THE BIGGER PICTURE MAY LOOK LIKE SO WE HAVE DONE SOME THINKING ABOUT WHAT DEPLOYMENT OF THIS TECHNOLOGY MOOT THE MIGHT LIKE LOOK AT SCALE THIS SLIDE SHOWS FULL DEPLOYMENT FIRST BOX LEFT IN GREEN SHOWS

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CURRENT PHASE ONE PILOT FOCUSED ON HOW WELL THE APP WORKS TO VERIFY CARPOOLS OUTREACH TO A DIVERSE GROUP OF PARTICIPANTS INCLUDING EQUITY PRIORITY COMMUNITIES. TO TEST THE TECHNOLOGY AND USER ACCEPTANCE OF THE TECHNOLOGY. ALL OTHER BOXES BLUE TO THE RIGHT REPRESENT A POSSIBLE FUTURE APPROACH TO ABOUT YOU FULL DEPLOYMENT OF THE TECHNOLOGY. NOTING PHASE TWO WOULD BE A HEAVIER LIFT TO COMPLETE IN DEPTH EVALUATION DEVELOPMENT OF POLICIES ON EQUITY, PRIVACY, ACCESSIBILITY, USE OF BIO METRIC DATA AND TACKLE INTEGRATION WITH THE REGIONAL CUSTOMER SERVICE CENTER THE APP COULD BE DEPLOYED AS AN OPTIONAL ALTERNATIVE TO THE FLEX TAG IN LANES ACCESS CARPOOL AND DETERMINE WHETHER THE APP IS A VIABLE REPLACEMENT FOR FASTRAK RECOGNIZING LARGER QUESTIONS APP DRIVEN ENVIRONMENT FOR TOLLING AT SCALE AND REPRESENTS BROADER EFFORT TO MAJOR POLICY LEGISLATIVE INTEROPERABILITY QUESTIONS AND CONSIDERATIONS. RECOMMENDATION FOR APPROVE OF THE PHASE ONE INCENTIVE BASED PILOT SMALL SCALE PILOT ON THE 680 CONTRA COSTA EXPRESS LANES FOR APPROXIMATELY SIX MONTHS AIMING FOR 500 VOLUNTEERS WHO WILL AWARDED AMAZON GIFT CARDS FOR THEIR PARTICIPATION WITH A TARGET OF 30% PARTICIPATION IN PRIORITY EQUITY COMMUNITIES AGREEMENT TO ADDRESS PRIVACY AND USE OF DATA AND PILOT EVALUATION WILL INCLUDE USER FEEDBACK FROM SURVEYS AND FOCUS GROUPS AS WELL. NEXT SLIDE. THESE ARE NEXT STEPS AND ESTIMATED TIMELINE FOR THE PILOT. THE PILOT COULD BE CONDUCTED AS EARLY AS APRIL OF THIS YEAR AND POST PILOT EVALUATION WOULD BE COMPLETED IN

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SEPTEMBER OF THIS YEAR. SO THANK YOU. AND I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER QUESTIONS.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. I THINK I WAS PART OF ONE OF THE WORK GROUPS LOOKING AT THIS EARLY ON AND I THINK THE PRIVACY CONCERNS ARE GOING TO BE UNIVERSAL THAT WE LEARN AS WE GO BUT COMMISSIONERS OPPORTUNITY IS LOOKING AT THE TECHNOLOGY AND APPLICATION IN OTHER WAYS, LEARNING FROM THIS I THINK IS GOING TO BE REALLY VALUABLE. I THINK THIS IS WHY THIS PILOT IS PRETTY EXCITING AND WE'RE GOING TO LEARN FROM IT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. COMMISSIONER PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. THIS IS VERY EXCITING HERE. I DO AGREE WE NEED TO BE CAREFUL WITH OUR SAFEGUARDS AS FAR AS IDENTITY AND STUFF. I DON'T THINK WE GOT AN ANSWER TO THE FAMILIES HERE. WHEN YOUR CAR SEAT FACES THE OTHER WAY. HOW CAN -- IF THEY ARE A PART OF THE PILOT PROGRAM, WILL THERE BE SPECIAL CONSIDERATIONS? BECAUSE IT'S HARD ENOUGH BEING A FAMILY AND YOU HAVE A WHOLE BUNCH OF LITTLE ONES BACK THERE, THEY DO WANT TO TAKE CREDIT, TRYING TO --

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ABSOLUTELY. I AGREE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

GINA PAPAN: [LAUGHTER] YEAH, WE WANT TO, YOU KNOW, SEE HOW THAT PLAYS OUT, AS WELL. SO DO WE HAVE AN ANSWER FOR THAT YET?

SPEAKER: YES THAT'S PART OF WHAT WE'LL BE MEASURING FOR THE PILOT TARGETING 10% OF FAMILIES OF PARTICIPANTS WITH CHILDREN. AND IN TERMS OF THE VERIFICATION FOR THOSE WITH CHILDREN WITH REAR FACING SEATS, THE APP IS INTENDED TO VERIFY THE OCCUPANTS PRIOR TO THE TRIP. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, WHILE YOU'RE GETTING INTO THE VEHICLE.

GINA PAPAN: SO JUST HOLE THEM UP. GOT IT. OKAY.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: IT'S A PILOT. [LAUGHTER] COMMISSIONER NOACK?

SUE NOACK: WHAT HAPPENS IF YOU START OUT AND YOU HAVE FORGOTTEN TO DO THAT INITIAL VERIFICATION AND YOU GET INTO THE TOLL LANES?

SPEAKER: I THINK, WELL, FOR THE PILOT, AT THIS POINT THEY'RE JUST -- YOU WE WANT RECEIVE THE CREDIT FOR THAT TRIP.

SPEAKER: SO, IF YOU FORGET YOU JUST AREN'T GOING TO GET -- BUT YOU'RE NOT GOING TO GET A VIOLATION, EITHER, NECESSARILY?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SPEAKER: CORRECT. THERE WOULD BE NO VIOLATION. USERS WITH FASTRAK ACCOUNTS WOULD SET THEIR TAGS AS THEY USUALLY WOULD BECAUSE THERE IS NOT THE CONNECT FROM THE BACK OFFICE THEY'RE TESTING THE APP ON TOP OF THE NORMAL PROCEDURE.

SPEAKER: BUT THE GOAL IS TO GET RID OF THAT? RIGHT? THE GOAL IS TO ELIMINATE THE FASTRAK AT SOME POINT? THEN YOU'RE JUST -- THEN YOU HAVE GOT A VIOLATION PROBLEM.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YEAH, AND I THINK PART OF IT, COMMISSIONER, WE'RE TRYING TO FIGURE OUT THE FACE RECOGNITION TECHNOLOGY, IS IT RELIABLE, TRIED AND TRUE.

SPEAKER: I REALIZE THAT. THIS IS JUST THE PILOT. I'M JUST --

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THINKING AHEAD.

SPEAKER: YEAH, GO AHEAD. AND FORGET -- I --

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: AND PART OF IT IS WE'RE GOING TO IDENTIFY THOSE ISSUES WHERE FOLKS ARE JUST CREATURES OF HABIT AND I THINK THAT'S PART OF WHAT WE'RE TRYING TO KEEP THAT DATA SET.

SPEAKER: I AM HAPPY WE'RE TRYING.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

DAVID CANEPA: GREAT IDEA. SARAH THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION. ARE THERE ANY OTHER ORGANIZATIONS THAT HAVE USED THIS TECHNOLOGY, OR ARE WE FIRST TO RUN A PILOT LIKE THIS?

SPEAKER: SURE. THE CHALLENGE OF CARPOOL CHEATING IS A PROBLEM YOU SEE STRUGGLES WITH ACROSS THE NATION EXPLORING TECHNOLOGY TO ADDRESS THE PROBLEM IS IN THE EARLY STAGES IN TERMS OF TECHNOLOGY THERE WAS A PILOT IN UTAH AND ALSO FLORIDA OTHER STATES ARE INTERESTED IN EXPLORING APP TECHNOLOGIES. TEXAS USES A DIFFERENT APP KARMA TECHNOLOGY FOR VERIFICATION IN THEIR LANES AS WELL.

DAVID CANEPA: GREAT THAT GIVES US OPPORTUNITY TO, SORT OF, UNDERSTAND WHAT OTHERS ARE DOING, AND SHARE BEST PRACTICES AND FOR THEM TO SHARE, YOU KNOW, WHAT THEY HAVE LEARNED. BUT I THINK IT'S GREAT. I KNOW WHEN IT COMES TO APPS AND MY LIFE, AND I AM SURE ALL OF OUR LIVES HAVE DRAMATICALLY CHANGED AND IT'S GOTTEN EASIER, RIGHT, WITH TECHNOLOGY. AND SO I'M REALLY GLAD THAT WE'RE MOVING IN THIS DIRECTION. I REALLY THINK IT'S POSITIVE AND LOOKING FORWARD TO SEEING WHAT HAPPENS AFTER THE PILOT.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER CANEPA. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

JAMES P. SPERING: THE GOAL IS TO GET THE VIOLATORS OUT OF THE CARPOOL LANE. THAT'S OUR GOAL. AND SARAH, THANK YOU. GREAT PRESENTATION. THE REASON IS THE ISSUE HAS TO BE ADDRESSED AND I USE MY COUNTY, THE EXPRESS BUSES IF WE CAN'T GET TO BART OR GET THE EXPRESS BUSES INTO SAN FRANCISCO IN A MUCH BETTER TIME SAVING THAN DRIVING, BY, ALONE, YOU KNOW, WE DON'T REALLY GET PEOPLE OUT OF THOSE CARS. IT'S EXTREMELY IMPORTANT. AND I THINK THE NUMBER OF VIOLATORS IS MUCH HIGHER THAT'S WHAT'S BEING PROJECTED SOMETIMES THERE IS TEN CARS IN A ROW THAT HAVE ONLY ONE PERSON. I APPLAUD STAFF ON THIS WE HAVE WORKED HARD WITH THE CHP ON THIS ISSUE AND THEY REALLY STRUGGLE WITH IDENTIFYING THOSE VIOLATORS. SO THIS TECHNOLOGY, I THINK, IS GOING TO HELP US BRIDGE SOME OF THOSE AREAS WHERE WE'RE REALLY FALLING SHORT IN THE COURSE OF VIOLATORS. THANK YOU.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU COMMISSIONER SPERING. KIMBERLY DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC?

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WE ACTUALLY HAVE TWO MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: GO THEIR FIRST THEN WE'LL GO TO THE PUBLIC.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WE HAVE COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI FOLLOWED BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER.

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: THANK YOU VERY MUCH, KIMBERLY, AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH, CHAIR PEDROZA. SO, I UNDERSTAND THE GOAL OF THIS, AS JIM SPERING JUST OUTLINED FOR GETTING THE VIOLATORS OUT OF THE TOLL LANE BUT MY CONCERN -- AND THIS IS A PILOT PROGRAM THAT'S GREAT BECAUSE IT WILL WORK FOR A LARGE SEGMENT OF OUR POPULATION. HOWEVER, AS I SAT HERE LISTENING TO THIS, I THOUGHT ABOUT MY FRIENDS THAT DON'T HAVE SMART PHONES. THEY HAVE THE SENIOR CITIZEN FLIP PHONES THAT ARE ONLY USED FOR TELEPHONES. SO, I DON'T KNOW IF THERE HAS BEEN THE CONVERSATIONS -- AND MY CONCERN, OF COURSE, WAS IT SAYS TO BE ABLE TO ELIMINATE FASTRAK. SO, I DON'T KNOW THAT THAT'S GOING TO BE ENTIRELY POSSIBLE. BECAUSE YOU HAVE THOSE THAT DON'T WANT TO HAVE ANY KIND OF PHONE OR HAVE THE SENIOR CITIZEN FLIP PHONE, NOT DO ANYTHING BUT ABLE TO TALK. ANYWAY I'M JUST POINTING OUT THOSE ISSUES BECAUSE I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S BEEN DISCUSSED AS WE MOVE FORWARD IN THIS ENVIRONMENT. THANK YOU.

SPEAKER: SURE. AND I CAN RESPOND TO THAT. SO THE ISSUE WITH ACCOMMODATING THOSE, POLICIES TO ACCOMMODATE THOSE WITHOUT

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

SMART PHONES THAT'S SOMETHING THAT WOULD BE ADDRESSED WITH PHASE TWO SUCH AS ALLOWING USE OF A TAG OR OTHER SUCH DEVICE THAT WOULD BE CONSIDERED DURING THAT PHASE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: THANK YOU. THIS IS REALLY EXCITING. I THINK WE ARE GOING TO LEARN SO MUCH FROM THIS PILOT, THAT IT'S GOING TO GIVE US SOME OPPORTUNITY TO REALLY IDENTIFY WHAT THE NEEDS ARE. AND I'M HAPPY TO MAKE A MOTION TO MOVE THIS FORWARD.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: WE'RE GOING TO PUT YOU DOWN, COMMISSIONER GLOVER, FOR MOVING IT.

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: OKAY.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: ALL RIGHT. DO WE HAVE ANY OTHER COMMISSIONERS?

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: WE HAVE RANDI KINMAN AND THEN WE HAVE SEVERAL MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: OKAY.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: MS. KINMAN?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

RANDI KINMAN: THANK YOU. ONE OF THE QUESTIONS THAT I STILL HAVE IS [AUDIO DISTORTION] FOR FAMILIES, WHO ARE TRANSPORTING KIDS AND MAYBE, AND WILL DO THE HUSBAND AND WIFE SCENARIO WITH THE CHILD IN THE REAR FACING SEAT AND WHEN YOU GET TO THE END OF ONE PERSON'S ROUTE AND DROP THEM OFF, THE ABILITY TO HAVE A SAFE DROP OFF SPOT WAS IMPORTANT TO OUR COUNCIL. BECAUSE WE'RE USED TO DOING THAT. SO I JUST WANT TO PUT THAT IN THE HOPPER. THE OTHER THING THAT HASN'T BEEN ADDRESSED IS, THIS INFORMATION, I CAN'T -- ON ANY OTHER APP, WHICH I GIVE PEOPLE MY INFORMATION FOR SOMETHING, I HAVE A COPY OF WHAT'S HAPPENED AND WHAT GOES ON, AND SO IT WOULD BE, EVEN WHILE THE DATA OR THE PICTURES DISAPPEAR FROM THE WORK END OF IT, FROM MY OWN PERSONAL CONCERN, IS HAVING IT WORK ON MY END AND BEING ABLE TO HOLD ON TO IT FOR A LIMITED AMOUNT OF TIME, JUST IN CASE IT, SOMEHOW, THERE'S A GLITCH IN THE SYSTEM AND MY CAR IS INCORRECTLY TAGGED. HAVING A VEHICLE THAT I DIDN'T OWN, THAT HAD A LICENSE PLATE SIMILAR TO MINE THAT KEPT GETTING BRIDGE TOLLS, THAT'S KIND OF IMPORTANT TO HAVE. IT'S GOING TO BE AN INTERESTING THING TO DEBUG, AND I WOULD APPRECIATE IT IF WE COULD TRANSFER OR AT LEAST SEND FAIR MEETING TO THE EQUITY AND ACCESS SUBCOMMITTEE, THE ANALYSIS OF THE OTHER PILOT PROGRAMS THAT TOOK PLACE IN OTHER STATES SO THAT WE CAN DO AN APPLES TO APPLES COMPARISON. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. AND I SEE COMMISSIONER GLOVER'S HAND WENT UP. DO YOU WANT TO GO AHEAD AND TAKE HIM THEN GO TO THE PUBLIC.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: COMMISSIONER GLOVER DID YOU HAVE MORE COMMENTS?

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: I'M SORRY. I JUST DIDN'T LOWER.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. FROM MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WE HAVE ALETA DUPREE, FOLLOWED BY VINAY PIMPLE. I'LL SHARE MY SCREEN.

SPEAKER: THANKS CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD SHE AND HER. I THINK THIS CAN WORK. I USE BIO METRICS APPS ALL THE TIME. A FEW WEEKS AGO I WAS IN LOS ANGELES AND I PAID FOR SOME GROCERIES WITH MY HAND PRINT AND IT WAS CONTACTLESS. I JUST SCANNED MY HAND. AND, SO THIS, IS EVOLVING. AND, OBVIOUSLY NOT EVERYONE IS GOING TO HAVE THAT TECHNOLOGY. BUT WE DO NEED TO DO THIS WORK TO ADVANCE THE CONVERSATION. BECAUSE THERE ARE MANY WHO DO. AND WE CAN DO IT IN A WAY WHERE WE DON'T LEAVE ANYBODY BEHIND, BY NOT MAKING -- PHONES SHOULD NOT BE THE ONLY WAY. WE STILL HAVE PLASTIC CLIPPER CARDS. SO, I USE THIS BIO METRICS WITH CONFIDENCE. AND I THINK OTHERS CAN ENJOY IT TOO. THANK YOU.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. VINAY PIMPLE FOLLOWED BY VEDA FLOREZ.

VINAY PIMPLE: HELLO. I SIT ON THE POLICY ADVISORY COUNCIL WHERE WE GOT A MUCH LONGER REPORT ON THIS. AND I'M REALLY SO PLEASED TO SEE HOW EXCITED ALL OF YOU, COMMISSIONERS ARE, BECAUSE OF THE REACTION ON THE COUNCIL WAS ACTUALLY QUITE DIFFERENT. AND I THOUGHT IT WAS -- IT'S A VERY THOUGHTFULLY DONE APP. A COUPLE OF THINGS THAT ATTRACTED ME ABOUT THIS IS, YOU KNOW, IT REALLY MINIMIZES THE INTERACTION WITH LAW-ENFORCEMENT FOR LEGAL COMPLIANCE PURPOSES. YOU KNOW? IT'S LIKE FRICTIONLESS LEGAL COMPLIANCE, WHICH I THINK IS ALWAYS BETTER THAN INTERACTING WITH LAW-ENFORCEMENT.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: TEN SECONDS.

VINAY PIMPLE: MORE LONG-TERM, I REALLY WOULD LIKE TO SEE APPS LIKE THIS USED TO PROMOTE CARPOOL, SO, TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE TO OPT IN AND FIND OUT HOW THEY CAN CARPOOL WITH OTHER PEOPLE AND I THINK THIS IS POTENTIAL FOR THAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. VEDA FLOREZ?

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

VEDA FLOREZ: GOOD AFTERNOON COMMISSIONERS. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE PRESENTATION. I'M VEDA FLOREZ, PART OF THE PUBLIC ADVISORY COUNCIL FOR MARIN COUNTY. AND I WANTED TO BRING UP A SCENARIO OR TELL YOU A LITTLE STORY. SO MY NIECE LIVES IN UTAH WHERE THEY HAVE THIS APP AVAILABLE AND IT WAS INTERESTING BECAUSE SHE HAS SMALL CHILDREN. SO THEY'RE SITTING IN THE BACK SEAT SHE HAD TO ACTIVATE THE APP HERSELF AND WHEN SHE LIFTED UP THE CELL PHONE, SHE GOT A TICKED TICKET. SO I'M NOT SURE HOW THIS FACTORS IN WITH ONE ADULT DRIVER AND CHILDREN IN THE BACK CONSIDERED TO BE A CARPOOL AND THE SAFETY ROUTE FOR USING AN APP FOR THE DRIVER AND ALSO TO WORK WITH LAW-ENFORCEMENT SO IT'S JUST A LITTLE CONSIDERATION FOR YOU TO LOOK AT. AND THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR CREATING THIS VERY INTERESTING APP. AND I AM SURE WILL DO A WEALTH OF GOOD FOR THE MTC COMMISSION.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED MR. CHAIR.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: BRING IT BACK TO THE COMMISSION. MOTION BY COMMISSIONER GLOVER AND I'LL GLADLY ENTERTAIN A SECOND. SECOND ENJOY SPERING. ROLL CALL VOTE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: CHAIR PEDROZA.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: JOSEFOWITZ IS ABSENT. ABE-KOGA IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER AHN?

EDDIE AHN: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER CANEPA?

DAVID CANEPA: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER CHAVEZ?

CINDY CHAVEZ: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER DUTRA-VERNACI?

CAROL DUTRA-VERNACI: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER FLEMING?

VICTORIA FLEMING: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER GLOVER?

FEDERAL D. GLOVER: YES.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER MAHAN? COMMISSIONER MAHAN IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER MILEY?

NATHAN MILEY: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER MOULTON PETERS?

STEPHANIE MOULTON-PETERS: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: NOACK?

SPEAKER: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: PAPAN?

GINA PAPAN: YES.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RABBITT?

DAVID RABBITT: AYE.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: RONEN? IS ABSENT. COMMISSIONER SPERING?

JAMES P. SPERING: AYE.

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: COMMISSIONER THAO IS ABSENT. MOTION PASSES UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: THANK YOU, KIMBERLY. AND, SARAH, THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION. YOU HEARD SOME EXCITEMENT. WE HAVE SOME QUESTIONS AND WE WANT SOME INFORMATION BACK. BUT OVERALL VERY EXCITED ABOUT THIS NEW TECHNOLOGY AND SEEING WHAT WE CAN LEARN FROM IT. MOVING TO ITEM FIVE, PUBLIC COMMENTS. DO WE HAVE ANY MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC THAT WISH TO PROVIDE PUBLIC COMMENT?

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING. ALETA DUPREE'S HAND IS RAISED. GO AHEAD AND UNMUTE YOURSELF MISS DUPREE, YOU HAVE ONE MINUTE.

SPEAKER: THANKS CHAIR ALFREDO PEDROZA. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. LOTS OF GOOD MEETINGS TODAY. YOU KNOW, I LOVE A GOOD PUBLIC MEETING. AS A SPEAK GENERALLY ABOUT BAIFA HOW DO WE GET PEOPLE EXCITED ABOUT THE WORK OF BAIFA? THE ROADS NEED TO BE PAID FOR. BECAUSE I GREW UP IN PLACES WHERE ROADS WERE POCK MARKED WITH POT HOLES. IT DOESN'T DO MUCH GOOD NOT ONLY DOES IT TAKE A LOT OUT OF YOUR KARR BUT IT'S VERY UNSAFE FOR CARS, TWO WHEELED VEHICLES, AND PEDESTRIAN. I BELIEVE IN THE IMPORTANCE OF ADVANCING THE COORDINATION

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

BECAUSE I THINK ANYBODY CAN PARTICIPATE REGARDLESS OF THEIR STATION IN LIFE. I KNOW PEOPLE WHO ARE LOW-INCOME WHO HAVE THREE SMART PHONES. SO THIS IS REAL. AND I ASK THAT WE NEVER PRESUME ANYONE INCAPABLE, BECAUSE WE CAN ALL LEARN NEW THINGS. THANK YOU.

CLERK, KIMBERLY WARD: THANK YOU. I SEE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS RAISED MR. CHAIR.

CHAIR, ALFREDO PEDROZA: MOVING TO ITEM SIX ADJOURNMENT THE NEXT MEETING OF THE ARE AUTHORITY IS TO BE HELD WEDNESDAY MARCH 22ND, 2023 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER 375 BEALE STREET. THIS MEETING IS ADJOURNED. COMMISSIONERS WE HAVE ONE FINAL QUICK MEETING. [ADJOURNED]

This transcript was prepared from television closed captioning and is not certified for its form or content. Errors and omissions within this transcript have likely occurred. This document is provided as a convenience only and is not an official record of any action taken.

Broadcasting Government