METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COMMISSION Meeting Transcript



1	PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE
2	WEDNESDAY, MARCH 08, 2023, 9:45 AM
3	
4	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GOOD MORNING, EVERYONE AND WELCOME TO THE
5	PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING OF MARCH 8TH,
6	2023. GREAT TO SEE EVERYONE IN-PERSON. I WANT TO CALL THE
7	MEETING TO ORDER AND WITH VICE CHAIR PAPAN SITTING NEXT TO ME.
8	THE MEETING IS BEING BROADCAST ON THE MTC WEB SITE. MEMBERS OF
9	THE PUBLIC PARTICIPATING BY ZOOM WISHING TO SPEAK SHOULD USE
10	THE RAISED HAND FEATURE OR DIAL STAR NINE AND I WILL CALL UPON
11	THEM AT THE APPROPRIATE TIME. TELECONFERENCE ATTENDEES WILL BE
12	CALLED UPON BY THE LAST FOUR DIGITS OF THEIR PHONE NUMBER.
13	MADAM CLERK PLEASE CALL THE ROLL.
14	
15	CLERK OF THE BOARD: RABBITT?
16	
17	CHAIR, DAVID RABBITT: HERE.
18	
19	CLERK OF THE BOARD: VICE CHAIR PAPAN?
20	
21	GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: HERE.
22	
23	CLERK OF THE BOARD: ABE-KOGA?
24	
25	MADCADET ARE-KOCA: HERE



1	
2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: CHAVEZ?
3	
4	CINDY CHAVEZ: HERE.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: COMMISSIONER EL-TAWANSY IS ABSENT.
7	COMMISSIONER GLOVER?
8	
9	FEDERAL D. GLOVER: HERE.
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: MILEY? IS PRESENT JUST STEPPED AWAY FOR A
12	MOMENT. RONEN?
13	
14	HILLARY RONEN: HERE.
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: QUORUM IS PRESENT.
17	
18	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: MOVING ON TO THE CONSENT CALENDAR SEVEN
19	ITEMS THIS MORNING 2A THROUGH 2G. I'LL LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES
20	FOR QUESTIONS OR CONCERNS ON THE CONSENT CALENDAR THIS
21	MORNING? SEEING NONES. MOTION TO APPROVE?
22	
23	CINDY CHAVEZ: MOTION.
24	
25	GINA PAPAN: SECOND.



1	
2	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: MOTION BY CHAVEZ SECOND BY PAPAN. ANYONE
3	OPPOSED TO THAT MOTION? NOT HEARING ANY NAYSAYER. THAT MOTION
4	IS UNANIMOUSLY APPROVED BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
5	
6	CLERK OF THE BOARD: BEFORE WE DO THAT MR. CHAIR.
7	
8	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: OH, I THOUGHT I HAD THAT RIGHT.
9	[LAUGHTER]
10	
11	CLERK OF THE BOARD: JUST ABOUT. I CAN'T RECALL YOU ASKED FOR
12	PUBLIC COMMENT, AND I JUST FORGOT?
13	
14	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: YES. [LAUGHTER]
15	
16	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I GOT IT WRONG. DID YOU IT
17	RIGHT.
18	
19	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: NO I ACTUALLY DIDN'T CALL FOR PUBLIC
20	COMMENTS. [LAUGHTER] IS THERE PUBLIC COMMENT?
21	
22	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU.
23	
24	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: IS THERE ANYONE FROM THE AUDIENCE TODAY
25	THAT WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM?



1

2	CLERK OF THE BOARD: THERE ARE NO MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WITH
3	THEIR HAND RAISED, AND THERE WAS NO PUBLIC COMMENT SUBMITTED
4	ON THIS ITEM.
5	
6	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU FOR REMINDING ME. WE ALL HAVE
7	TO GET BACK INTO THE SWING OF THINGS.
8	
9	KATHLEEN KANE: I'M SORRY BECAUSE OF THE BROADCAST NATURE OF
10	THINGS COULD WE THROUGH THE CHAIR HAVE AN AFFIRMATIVE VOTE NOT
11	JUST ARE THERE ANY NOS ON THE MOTION, PLEASE?
12	
13	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: IS EVERYONE IN FIVER OF THE MOTION THAT
14	WAS PRESENTED?
15	
16	SPEAKER: AYES.
17	
18	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: I'M GOING TO SAY MOTION PASSES
19	UNANIMOUSLY BY ALL MEMBERS PRESENT.
20	
21	KATHLEEN KANE: ALL RIGHT.
22	
23	DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: MOVING ON TO ITEM 3A MTC RESOLUTION 3989
24	REVISED 4202 REVISED AND 4505 REVISED INCLUDES VARIOUS
25	REVISIONS, INCLUDING OBAG THREE PROGRAMMING CAPACITY BY \$9



MILLION TO REFLECT HIGHER FUNDING AMOUNT UNDER FEDERAL 1 INFRASTRUCTURE INVESTMENT JOBS ACT AND THE PROGRAMMING 2 3 PROJECTS ON THE OBAG THREE COUNTIES AND LOCAL PROGRAM CONTINGENCY LIST \$15.3 MILLION TO VARIOUS PROJECTS WITHIN THE 4 5 TRANSIT PERFORMANCE INITIATIVES PROGRAM AND CHANGING BIKE FUNDING \$15.9 MILLION FOR MTC'S BAY WHEELS E-BIKE EXPANSION 6 7 PROJECT. 8 NICK JOSEFOWITZ: I NEED TO RECUSE MYSELF FROM THIS ITEM. THANK 9 10 YOU. GOODBYE. 11 SPEAKER: THOMAS PLANNING POLICY PROGRAM STAFF 3A RECOMMENDS 12 VARIOUS REVISIONS TO THE ONE BAY AREA GRANT PROGRAM MTC 13 EXCHANGE PROGRAM MOST SIGNIFICANT RECOMMENDATIONS IN THIS ITEM 14 RELATE TO PROGRAMMING ADDITIONAL CAPACITY TO PROJECTS ON THE 15 16 OBAG THREE COUNTY LOCAL PROGRAM CONTINGENCY LIST AS YOU MAY RECALL THE COMMISSION APPROVED THIS CONTINGENCY LIST AND 17 FRAMEWORK IN JANUARY TO PRIORITIZE FUTURE CAPACITY SUCH AS 18 SOURCE ADDITIONAL CAPACITY \$9 MILLION ANTICIPATED FEDERAL 19 HIGHWAY FUNDS WHICH STAFF RECOMMENDS ADDING TO THE OBAG THREE 20 PROGRAM THIS MORNING THE LAST TRANCHE OF FUNDS STAFF EXPECT 21 OVER THREE YEAR PERIOD TO INCREASE APPROVED COUNTY LOCAL 22 PROJECT AWARDS, REDUCTIONS AND RECEIVED GRANT AWARDS, REVISED 23

AWARD AMOUNTS REFLECT REMAINING NEED TO DELIVER PROJECTS TWO

PROJECTS RECOMMENDED ALAMEDA COUNTIES BOULEVARD PHASE THREE

24



- 1 LAFAYETTE CLASS ONE PATH IN TOTAL STAFF RECOMMENDING
- 2 PROGRAMMING JUST OVER \$15 MILLION IN ADDITIONAL CAPACITY TO
- 3 FIVE PROJECTS ON THE COUNTY LOCAL CONTINGENCY LIST USING TIERS
- 4 AND FRAMEWORK PREVIOUSLY APPROVED INCLUDE MTC WEST OAKLAND
- 5 LINK SFCTA YERBA BUENA ISLAND PATH MULTI-USE GUIDEWAY PROJECT
- 6 STATE ROUTE 29 OPERATIONAL IMPROVEMENTS AMERICAN CANYON,
- 7 STREET SCAPE AND WALNUT CREEK SAFE ROUTES TO SCHOOL
- 8 INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECT STILL REMAINING PROJECTS ON THE
- 9 CONTINGENCY LIST AS ADDITIONAL CAPACITY BECOME AVAILABLE IN
- 10 ADDITION TO THIS PROGRAMMING STAFF RECOMMENDS ADDITIONAL
- 11 ACTIONS INCLUDING PROGRAMMING JUST OVER \$15 MILLION TO
- 12 REGIONAL OBAG TWO FUNDS FOR THE TRANSIT PERFORMANCE
- 13 INITIATIVES TPL PROJECTS WHICH WERE PREVIOUSLY APPROVED BY THE
- 14 COMMITTEE, FUNDING SOURCE FOR THE BAY WHEELS BIKE EXPANSION
- 15 PROJECT AND APPROVED LAST MONTH FROM OBAG THREE CMAQ FUNDS
- 16 EXCHANGE FUNDS AND STAFF RECOMMENDING REFERRING OBAG TWO OBAG
- 17 THREE AND EXCHANGE PROGRAM RESOLUTIONS TO THE COMMISSION FOR
- 18 APPROVAL.
- 19
- 20 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: THANK YOU THOMAS. APPRECIATE THAT. I'LL
- 21 LOOK TO MY COLLEAGUES AND I KNOW OUR VICE CHAIR COMMISSIONER
- 22 PAPAN HAS A QUESTION.
- 23
- 24 GINA PAPAN, V. CHAIR: THANK YOU VERY MUCH. SO, AGAIN, LOVE THE
- 25 PROGRAMS. WE HAVE COMMITTEE HEARINGS, WE HAVE ALL KINDS OF



- 1 THINGS THAT BRING THESE PROJECTS TO US HERE. WHAT WE NOTE
- 2 PREVIOUSLY, AND SOMETIMES WE DON'T SEE AS AN ITEM GOES FORWARD
- 3 IS THIS FUNDING IS RESTRICTED TO CERTAIN AREAS AS FAR AS BAY
- 4 WHEELS AND WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE MORE EQUITY IN THE
- 5 DISTRIBUTION OF FUNDS AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE MAKE
- 6 A PUBLIC RECORD WHENEVER WE MOVE ITEMS FORWARD HERE
- 7 PARTICULARLY IN THE LAST ITEM THAT WE HAD ON THE REAP, THERE
- 8 WERE SOME VERY SIGNIFICANT THINGS NOTED BY THE COMMISSIONERS
- 9 TODAY, AND I THINK IT'S IMPORTANT WHEN WE MOVE THINGS FORWARD
- 10 HERE, GREAT, LET'S GET THE FUNDING OUT, BUT LET'S MAKE A
- 11 RECORD THAT WE WOULD LIKE TO SEE A LITTLE MORE EQUITY AS THE
- 12 PROJECTS MOVE AHEAD AND ADDITIONAL FUNDING MAY BECOME
- 13 AVAILABLE. I THINK THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT THERE. AND THEN,
- 14 TOO, BEING ON THE CONTINGENCY LIST. [LAUGHTER] WE HAVE THE
- 15 ADELINE PROJECT FOR STREET SCAPE IMPROVEMENTS NEAR THE ADELINE
- 16 SCHOOLS WHICH SERVES COMMUNITIES IN NEED THERE IN NORTH FAIR
- 17 OAKS AREA OF OUR DISTRICT. SO CLOSE, I REALLY HOPE THAT WE CAN
- 18 GET TO THE CONTINGENCY LIST AND FINISH SOME PROJECTS HERE THAT
- 19 WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL. AGAIN, THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE
- 20 PRESENTATION, AND MOVING FORWARD.
- 21
- 22 SPEAKER: THANK YOU VICE CHAIR. WE CAN CERTAINLY COME BACK ON
- 23 THE BIKESHARE, THERE WILL BE FUTURE PROGRAMMING ACTIONS ON
- 24 THAT PIECE AND ON THE CONTINGENCY LIST WE'RE EARLY ON IN THE



50 YEAR OF THE PROGRAM AND IT'S LIKELY THAT ADDITIONAL 1 2 CAPACITY WILL BECOME AVAILABLE. 3 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT. THANK YOU VERY MUCH. ANYONE ELSE 4 5 HAVE OUESTIONS COMMENTS OR CONCERNS ON THIS ONE? I'LL TURN TO THE CLERK FOR PUBLIC COMMENT. 6 7 8 CLERK OF THE BOARD: I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN WRITING BUT WE HAVE ONE MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC, ALETA DUPREE. YOU WILL HAVE TWO 9 10 MINUTES. 11 SPEAKER: GOOD MORNING AGAIN CHAIR DAVID RABBIT AND MEMBERS. 12 ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, SHE AND HER. FEELING TONGUE TIED 13 HERE. BAY WHEELS IS VERY IMPORTANT. THANK YOU FOR BRINGING IT 14 15 UP. IT'S BEEN A WHILE SINCE I HAVE USED IT. HOPE TO USE IT 16 WHEN THE WEATHER CLEARS IN THE BAY AREA, SOON HOPEFULLY. BUT BAY WHEELS IS DOING A LOT OF THINGS TO HELP PEOPLE IN EQUITY 17 PRIORITY COMMUNITIES LIKE MYSELF. I WAS JUST GOING OVER THE 18 PRICING SCHEME. MONTHLY MEMBERSHIP IS \$29 A MONTH. THAT CAN 19 GET ME A LOT OF BAY WHEELS. AND IF THIS CAN HELP GET MORE OF 20 THE ELECTRIC BIKES ON THE ROAD, THROUGHOUT THE WHOLE SYSTEM, 21 WOULD BE VERY HELPFUL TO ME. BECAUSE I AM OLDER. I JUST HAD A 22 BIRTHDAY YESTERDAY, AND I CAN STILL GET ABOUT, BUT THOSE 23 ELECTRIC MOTORS HELP ME OUT. SO HEAVY BIKES. AND I SEE WHERE 24

THERE IS A PAYMENT CARD, WHICH IS VERY HELPFUL. BECAUSE NOT



- 1 EVERYBODY HAS SMART PHONES, AND WE WANT PEOPLE WHO DON'T HAVE
- 2 SMART PHONES TO BE ABLE TO PARTICIPATE IN THE ELECTRONIC
- 3 PAYMENT SPACE, AS WELL. AND IT WORKS WITH LYFT. AND YOU CAN
- 4 BUY LYFT GIFT CARDS. SO, IT'S A GOOD PROGRAM. AND I'M LOOKING
- 5 FORWARD TO SEEING WHAT THE NEXT STEPS OF YOUR ALLOCATIONS WILL
- 6 BE. BUT I DO THINK THAT BAY WHEELS IS ESSENTIAL FOR -- IT'S AN
- 7 ESSENTIAL PART OF MANY PARTS HELPING PEOPLE TO NAVIGATE THE
- 8 BAY AREA. BIKES ARE GOOD, BECAUSE I CAN SIT ON THEM, AND THOSE
- 9 BIG BIKES ARE FAIRLY COMFORTABLE. THOSE MOTORS REALLY HELP ME
- 10 OUT. ELECTRIC BIKING IS PART OF EQUITY. I ASK YOU PASS THIS.
- 11 THANK YOU.

12

- 13 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
- 14 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.

15

- 16 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: GREAT OF THE BRINGING IT BACK TO THE
- 17 BOARD LOOKING FOR A MOTION TO APPROVE THE REFERRAL OF MTC
- 18 RESOLUTIONS 3989 REVISED 4202 REVISED 4505 REVISED TO THE
- 19 COMMISSION FOR APPROVAL.

20

- 21 GINA PAPAN: APPROVED WITH HOPEFULLY SOME NOTES IN THE FUTURE.
- 22 THANK YOU.

23

24 CINDY CHAVEZ: CHAVEZ SECONDS.



DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: MOTION BY PAPAN, SECOND BY CHAVEZ. AND 1 2 I'LL ASK, ARE WE ALL IN FAVOR OF THAT? [LAUGHTER] 3 SPEAKER: AYES. 4 5 6 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: WE ARE UNANIMOUSLY AFFIRMATIVE WITH ALL 7 MEMBERS PRESENT. 8 KATHLEEN KANE: THANK YOU. 9 10 DAVID RABBIT, CHAIR: ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU FOR THAT. MOVING ON, 11 OUICKLY, AGENDA ITEM FOUR FOR US, PUBLIC COMMENT. I'LL ASK THE 12 CLERK TO LIST ITEMS RECEIVED UNDER PUBLIC COMMENT ASSOCIATED 13 WITH THIS ITEM AT INFO@BAYAREAMETRO.GOV BY 5:00 P.M. YESTERDAY 14 15 INTO THE RECORD. 16 CLERK OF THE BOARD: THANK YOU. I HAVE RECEIVED NOTHING IN 17 WRITING, AND ALETA DUPREE'S HAND IS RAISED. PLEASE UNMUTE 18 YOURSELF. YOU WILL HAVE TWO MINUTES. 19 20 SPEAKER: THANK YOU CHAIR RABBITT. ALETA DUPREE FOR THE RECORD, 21 SHE AND HER, AS I SPEAK GENERALLY, AS I THINK PROGRAMMING AND 22 ALLOCATIONS WHICH IS BASICALLY DISPENSING OF MONEY, I SHARE 23 WITH YOU MY GENERAL FEELINGS ABOUT PROGRAMMING AND 24

ALLOCATIONS. WHAT IS IT THAT I WANT? AND I THINK MANY WOULD



- 1 AGREE WITH ME, IT IS A BAY AREA THAT HAS A MORE SEAMLESS USER
- 2 FRIENDLY AND MULTI-MODAL SYSTEM OF TRANSPORTATION. I'M NOT
- 3 AGAINST CARS. I'M THINKING ABOUT RENTING AN ELECTRIC CAR. I
- 4 WOULD LIKE TO TAKE IT OUT ON INTERSTATE 15. CARS ARE GREAT FOR
- 5 GOING OUT ON THE HIGHWAY. BUT FOR BEING IN A DENSE COMMUNITY
- 6 SUCH AS SAN FRANCISCO OR OAKLAND OR BERKELEY, I WANT TO BE
- 7 ABLE TO WALK AND USE SMALL MICROMOBILITY VEHICLES IN A SAFE
- 8 SPACE. AND, ALSO, FOR MY LONGER TRIPS, TO USE PUBLIC
- 9 TRANSPORTATION. THAT'S THE VAST MAJORITY OF HOW I GET AROUND,
- 10 WHETHER IT BE ON THE TRAIN SUCH AS BART OR CALTRAIN OR WHETHER
- 11 IT BE ON MANY BUS SYSTEMS. TO BE ABLE TO HAVE MORE SUSTAINABLE
- 12 SYSTEMS, BUSES THAT RUN ON ELECTRICITY INSTEAD OF FUEL, SAME
- 13 FOR THE TRAINS. SO I CAN BREATHE BETTER. I WAS OVER IN THE WAR
- 14 IN IRAQ AND PROBABLY BREATHED ALL KINDS OF THINGS THAT AREN'T
- 15 VERY GOOD FOR YOU. I CAN'T SAY MUCH MORE ABOUT IT. IT'S TOO
- 16 HARD. I DO SEEK A MORE FRIENDLY TRANSIT ENVIRONMENT AS A
- 17 PERSON WHO HAS DISABILITIES, AND LIVE IN AN EQUITY PRIORITY
- 18 COMMUNITY. SO, I APPRECIATE THE WORK THAT YOU DO BUT I THOUGHT
- 19 I WOULD TAKE THIS TWO MINUTES TO SHARE A LITTLE BIT MORE ABOUT
- 20 MYSELF. THANK YOU.
- 21
- 22 **CLERK OF THE BOARD:** THANK YOU. THERE ARE NO ADDITIONAL HANDS
- 23 RAISED, MR. CHAIR.



1	DAVID RABBIT,	CHAIR:	THANK	YOU.	ALETA	THANK	YOU	FOR	YOUR

- 2 SERVICE. HAPPY BELATED BIRTHDAY. THE NEXT MEETING OF THE
- 3 PROGRAMMING AND ALLOCATIONS COMMITTEE IS SCHEDULED TO BE HELD
- 4 AT THE BAY AREA METRO CENTER BUILDING WEDNESDAY APRIL 12TH,
- 5 2023. THANK YOU. WE ARE ADJOURNED. [ADJOURNED]

6





Broadcasting Government